Precipitous Independence: Unprecedented Challenges

The Republic of Kazakhstan

Report of the Volunteer Executive Service Team (VEST) Initiative

May-June 1993

The VEST Initiative is a program of COUNTERPART, Limited

Edited By: Arlene Lear
Director, VEST Initiative

Funded by the United States Agency for International Development, Office of Private and Voluntary Cooperation, Bureau for Food and Humanitarian Assistance
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE VEST INITIATIVE</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VEST TEAM MEMBERS</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE REGIONAL CONTEXT: CENTRAL ASIA AT A CROSSROADS</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Russian Legacy and its Aftermath</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Politicization of Islam</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Crossroads</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAZAKHSTAN &gt; A FACT SHEET</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAZAKHSTAN &gt; PRECIPITOUS INDEPENDENCE: UNPRECEDENTED CHALLENGES</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Survival Mode</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impediments to Private Sector Development</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic Distinction and De-Russification</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Time Bomb</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Health Care Dilemma</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vulnerable Women and Children</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STRENGTHS AND OPPORTUNITIES</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human and Natural Resources: A Spur to Foreign Investment</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential for Microenterprise Development</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The NGO Sector: Signs of Democratic Reform</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Rule of Law: Signs of a Civil Society</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE UNIQUE ROLE FOR US PVOs/NGOs IN PARTNERSHIP WITH KAZAKHSTAN NGOs</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POTENTIAL PARTNERS AND PARTNERSHIP RESOURCES</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTOR OBSERVATIONS</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Law and Non-Governmental Organizations, by Bruce R. Hopkin</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Business in Kazakhstan, by Timothy R. Lyman</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Overview of the Health Sector, by Adrienne Allison</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations on Women in Kazakhstan, by Adrienne Allison</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condition of the Environment and Health of the Population in Almaty, by Dr. Raisa Khalizovna Kadyrova</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental NGOs, by Lynn Richards</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Agricultural Sector: U.S. PVO/NGO Opportunities for Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, by Patrick Ludgate</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications, by Joe Sedlak</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan Cross-Sectoral Observations: A Canadian Perspective, by Roger F. Roy</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. VEST Team Bios</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Kazakhstani NGO Survey Data</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. U.S. Government Grantee and Contractor Representatives</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Contacts: Kazakhstan</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This VEST Initiative report on Kazakhstan is part of a series on the Newly Independent States (NIS) of the former Soviet Union. Other reports in this series are on Russia, Ukraine, and the Central Asian Republic of Kyrgyzstan.

Kazakhstan, with a population of 17.1 million, is one of the Central Asian countries that appears to be moving in the direction of democratic and economic reform. It has a strong, pragmatic and reform-minded leader who understands the tenuous balancing act he is playing in promoting reform ideas such as privatization, pluralism and ethnic tolerance.

Like other Central Asian countries, Kazakhstan is at a crossroads. This vast developing country, home for nearly 1,400 nuclear warheads, has been catapulted into independence by forces beyond its control. Decades of communist rule have virtually extinguished the memory and organizations of civil society. The pervasive disruption of the post-independence era can be an opportunity for exploring new paths of democracy, pluralism, and free markets, as well as shaping cultural identity and institutions.

U.S. government and PVO/NGO assistance can help Kazakhstan bridge the gap between the old and the new by assisting the government in formulating policies and priorities and by capacitating the non-governmental organs of reform -- NGOs and private enterprises. In this way they can facilitate the move toward political stability, pluralism and free economic growth.

"We will clearly need to turn more to U.S. PVOs and NGOs...This is the most cost-effective and empowering way to channel assistance, for it involves greater numbers of everyday American citizens in the work of development. American NGOs and PVOs are the logical partners to work with -- and serve as models for -- the indigenous NGOs and PVOs we are trying to support." J. Brian Atwood, Administrator, USAID, July 14, 1993.

This report is intended as a "snapshot" of conditions and development priorities in Kazakhstan. It is an opportunity for the VEST team to share its findings and offer recommendations to the broader U.S. public and private sectors in order to facilitate the design of appropriate and timely strategies and programs responsive to the challenges of Kazakhstan's post-independence era.

In summary, the VEST team recommends that:

#1 U.S. PVOs and NGOs are uniquely qualified to become a knowledge bridge for Kazakhstan's counterparts -- facilitating dialogue, networking and technical cooperation -- and assisting in the formulation of options and priorities in sectoral activities vital to the improvement of the quality of life and flourishing of democracy and free markets. To that end,

U.S. PVOs and NGOs should establish an in-country presence to help
developing counterpart NGOs model their methods of service delivery and management;

* an NGO service center should be established to facilitate linkages and partnerships, access informational networks, identify appropriate sources of U.S. technical assistance and training, coordinate baseline data on local NGOs, and document successful project and partnership models;

#2 All initiatives which include the development of Kazakhstani NGOs should be cast in terms of building public-private partnerships to meet the emerging needs of a newly independent country;

#3 In the legal sphere, technical assistance be provided with respect to conceptualizing, drafting and implementing legislation governing Kazakhstani NGOs; Consideration be given to the development of a "how to" manual for the formation and administration of NGOs in Kazakhstan; and policy dialogue be initiated on the development of appropriate delineations between the governmental, private for-profit and NGO sectors;

#4 For microenterprise development, the NGO sector itself is the logical place to begin, both as a means of generating funds for NGO activities and as a model for application in the private, for-profit sector. Specific areas for microenterprise development include:

* crafts
* food and clothing
* household items

#5 For crafts development, U.S. PVO and NGO assistance is worth undertaking because of the richness of available resources and traditions and the existing market to the relatively large number of foreigner business people visiting Kazakhstan is underexploited and not dominated by government-owned or controlled competition;

#6 For the development of low-tech, post-harvest food processing, cotton and wool-based textile manufacturing, and cottage industry garment production, small scale credit initiatives, basic business organization, and cost accounting would be very valuable;

#7 For women's health care U.S. PVOs should provide immediate support for local NGOs working in health care placing an emphasis on introducing modern methods of contraception, and women educating other women in a one-to-one approach;

#8 In the public health sector, improved and updated medical practices are critically needed and key leaders should be brought to the U.S. on training and observation tours. Technical assistance and training is needed in the following areas:

* hygiene
* gynecology
* infant and child health
* family-centered maternity care
* family planning;
In the area of environmental health, U.S. PVOs should assist their NGO counterparts and public health officials develop a community-based health education and promotion program utilizing the media, schools, religious organizations and the traditional health infrastructure;

Empowerment of women is essential to the creation of a civil society based on the democratic and equitable principles. Technical assistance and training should be in the areas of:

* reproductive health
* infant and child welfare
* farm labor
* advocacy
* organizational leadership and management

For environmental conservation and management, foreign assistance is crucial to helping environmental NGOs acquire new strategies in program development and fundraising.

Telecommunications should be a high funding priority for the U.S. government because of its importance to the creation of an effective market economy and democratization as well as for facilitating information exchange and dialogue between U.S. PVOs/NGOs and their Kazakhstani counterparts;

In the agricultural sector, U.S. PVOs/NGOs will be needed to strengthen the overall privatization initiatives in the following areas:

* large and small agribusiness development
* input and output market infrastructure development
* extension and domestic trade program support
* regional and domestic trade program support
* public health and other human services
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We wish to give special thanks to our Team Co-leaders Sallie Jones, Chief of the Matching Grant Program in AID's Office of Private & Voluntary Cooperation, FHA Bureau, and Stanley Hosie, Executive Director of COUNTERPART, Ltd.

The Hospitality and collegiality of Craig Buck, USAID Regional Mission Director for Central Asia as well as that of Paula Feeney deserve special note, as does that of the U.S. Ambassador William Courtney -- sharing insights gleaned from on-site experience and encouraging dialogue on the teams findings and recommendations. Particular gratitude also goes to Ed Birgells who cautioned against making assumptions about the currently fluid conditions affecting all sectors of the Central Asian countries visited by the VEST team.

The Task Force on Eastern and Central Europe, Department of External Affairs and International Trade of Canada deserves special thanks for supporting the participation of Roger Roy on the VEST team who made a valuable contribution to team deliberations in addition to providing the "Canadian perspective."

Deep appreciation also goes to FYI Information Resources, in particular their field representatives Sergei Dascalu and Mikhail Nazarchuk who tirelessly worked on behalf of the team in setting up meetings with NGO and government leaders in addition to efficiently and patiently orchestrating the in-country logistics.

There are of course individuals too numerous to list who willingly and graciously shared information and the local perspective on the challenges that face the newly independent Kazakhstan. Among them are included Tom Timberman, President of LOI, Inc., and Christina Leijonhufvud of the World Bank's Central Asia Division. Special thanks to Gala Medvedskaya, COUNTERPART's representative in Almaty who tirelessly assured the completion of the Kazakhstani NGO Survey Data appended to this report.

We also wish to express appreciation to the VEST team members' agencies for the in-kind contribution of their executive staff's time and expertise.

The VEST Initiative is made possible through a Cooperative Agreement between COUNTERPART, Ltd. and A.I.D.'s Office of Private & Voluntary Cooperation. It was conceived and is implemented as a public/private partnership.
The VEST Initiative report on Kazakhstan is part of a series on the Newly Independent States (NIS) of the former Soviet Union. Other reports in this series are on Russia, Ukraine, and the Central Asian Republic of Kyrgyzstan.

The Volunteer Executive Service Team (VEST) Initiative was created as a public/private partnership for rapid response to the challenges facing the Newly Independent States (NIS) of the former Soviet Union. VEST team members are senior executives from U.S. PVOs/NGOs, foundations, associations, the Department of State, USAID, with international representation from Canada.

The goals of the VEST Initiative are to:

- Strengthen the capacity of emerging democracies to create market-based, pluralistic societies;
- Galvanize the talent, experience and energy of America's non-governmental, non-profit organizations to assist the people of emerging democracies meet essential social, health, environmental, agricultural, communications, legal and educational needs;
- Foster linkages and partnerships between U.S. PVOs/NGOs and counterpart nongovernmental organizations in the NIS
- Encourage the U.S. government to further support U.S. PVOs/NGOs as the key agents for change in building healthy democratic civil societies.

The purpose of VEST Initiative reports and debriefing conferences is to share team findings and recommendations with our colleagues -- in the U.S. State Department and Agency for International Development, Congress and the broader community of nongovernmental organizations and academic institutions -- in order to initiate a dialogue about new paradigms for international cooperation in the post-Cold War era. Through this dialogue we hope to be able to explore, clarify and re-define the role for U.S. PVOs and NGOs in promoting and strengthening the public and private institutions within the emerging civil societies of the NIS and elsewhere.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title and Responsibilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sally Jones</td>
<td>Co-Leader, A.I.D., Director of Matching Grant Program, Office of Private &amp; Voluntary Cooperation, Bureau for Food and Humanitarian Assistance (multi-sectoral interests, with expertise in nutrition)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stanley Hosie</td>
<td>Co-Leader, Executive Director, COUNTERPART &amp; member of A.I.D.'s private sector Advisory Committee on Voluntary Foreign Aid, and the Board of Directors of InterAction (NGO institution building)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bruce Grogan</td>
<td>Acting co-leader, Director of Programs, COUNTERPART (environment, NGO institution building) (Kazakhstan only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bryant George</td>
<td>Senior Advisor, Office of Democratic Initiatives, Health and Human Resources (DIHRR), NIS Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adrienne Allison</td>
<td>Vice President, CEDPA (Center for Development &amp; Population Activities) (health/family planning/women's issues)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timothy R. Lyman</td>
<td>Corporate Secretary and General Counsel, Aid to Artisans (crafts/small enterprise/marketing; NGO management and accountability)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joe Sedlak</td>
<td>Director of Government Relations, VITA (Volunteers in Technical Assistance) (small enterprise development and communications -- talking to government and NGOs to determine the best means for effecting electronic/satellite communications between US and indigenous NGOs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iqbal Noor Ali</td>
<td>CEO, Agha Khan Foundation (health &amp; NGO institution building)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lynn Richards</td>
<td>Country Director, ISAR (environment)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bruce Hopkins</td>
<td>President, Institute for International Law and Philanthropy (democratization, NGO sector law and institution building)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roger Roy</td>
<td>Executive Director, COUNTERPART Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Ludgate</td>
<td>Country Director, Winrock International (agriculture) (ex-officio)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arlene Lear</td>
<td>Director, VEST Initiative, COUNTERPART</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

vi
THE REGIONAL CONTEXT:

CENTRAL ASIA AT A CROSSROADS

Up until the 16th century, "Lying at the heart of the Silk Route — the meeting place of East and West - Central Asia was for centuries a center of world commerce and spectacular economic, cultural and political achievements...As the rest of the world entered the modern age, the region slowly lost its glory, power and relevance...Today, the five new countries that comprise formerly Soviet Central Asia — Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, and Turkmenistan — have once again become important actors on the world stage." Nancy Lubin, Fellow at the U.S. Institute for Peace and Associate Professor at Carnegie Mellon University.

"In contrast to most of the republics in the USSR, the five Central Asian Republics did not express any desire to leave the Union; they were quite prepared to sign the treaty of the Union. That is not to camouflage the fact that trends toward independence were developing for years. The precipitous breakup caused an avalanche of problems." Vitaly Naumkin, Deputy Director of Oriental Studies at the Russian Academy of Sciences and President of the Russian Center for Strategic Research and International Studies in Moscow.

Most Central Asian scholars agree that the very social, political, economic and cultural fabric of Central Asia has unraveled since the precipitous breakup of the Soviet Union in December of 1991. The ensuing chaos and frustration have been exacerbated by growing poverty, unemployment and economic inequality; continued rapid population growth; shortage of and competition for vital resources (such as water, arable land, energy and minerals); hyperinflation, rampant corruption, drug trafficking, weakening of law enforcement; ethnic rivalries and tensions; and the growing incapacity of governments to grapple with the enormity of these concurring problems.

Perhaps one of the most destabilizing outcomes of independence has been the disruption of previously existing economic ties between the Central Asian republics and Russia, as well as among themselves. In Kyrgyzstan, for example, the new costs of importing energy from Russia have been traumatic and a contributing factor in the 25% drop in national income during the first seven months of 1992. Hopes of establishing trade and economic links with their neighbors, chiefly Turkey, and hopes of obtaining large-scale economic assistance produced an initial state of euphoria which was quickly followed by disillusionment.¹

"True economic independence for these states seems to be in the interests of the world community, since further economic breakdown would invite a new wave of instability and strife in the region."

¹ Vitaly Naumkin, "Active Leadership, Russia's Role in Central Asia," Harvard International Review, Vol. XV, No. 3 (Spring 1993)
The Russian Legacy and its Aftermath

"Amidst the beauty of the vast steppes and deserts and beside the snow-capped mountains of the Tien Shan range, the Romans of the Twentieth Century built part of their empire. The mixed blessing that the Russian rulers imposed on the Central Asian region is absolutely astonishing. However, the legacy could only be maintained by yearly subsidies from the Soviet Union that totaled some 25 billion rubles when the empire collapsed." Roger Roy, VEST team member, 1993.

The process of Russification of Central Asia began with the Russian conquest in the 1860's, became encapsulated in the Soviet system in the 1930's, and ended abruptly in 1992 with the breakup of the Soviet Union -- leading to the independence of five central Asian republics with a total population of over fifty million people, 35 million of whom are Muslims.

The Soviet Russian legacy still permeates the societies of the two Central Asian countries visited by the VEST team. It is exhibited in the Russian-built elegant opera houses, stylish circus arena buildings, and concert halls in Bishkek and Almaty which still feature talented musicians from Russia, Ukraine and other republics of the newly independent states (NIS) of the former Soviet Union. The marquees offer programs on the music of Tchaikovsky and Rimsky-Korsakov and the latest high wire act of the Moscow circus.

In addition to a relatively well developed infrastructure of roads, airports, aqueducts and central power heating plants, the major cities have well planned public areas with numerous tree-filled parks, with water fountains and thousands of roses in carefully tended gardens, which are well used by the local population for socializing and local outings. The Russians also constructed impressive facilities -- often in multi-colored marble -- to house their local Communist Party headquarters and the People's Congresses. These structures have now been transformed into the offices and meeting places of the new political leaders who have the responsibility to manage and transform the legacy they have suddenly inherited.

"With the collapse of the old system, individuals are reasserting old identities and seeking new ways of defining themselves....Many people no longer know where they fit... 'My children speak only Russian,' lamented a Kyrgyz official,.... 'where do they fit in a world where, overnight, this has become scorned?'" Nancy Lubin.

Perhaps one of the most valuable, and potentially most divisive legacies to be left by the Soviet system are the millions of ethnic Russians, Ukrainians and Germans who moved to the republics due to voluntary or forced migration. Today they represent a cadre of scientists, educators, government officials, technicians and artists which contribute to the economic growth potential of the countries in the region. Conversely, their mass emigration -- in excess of 100,000 by 1992 -- to their countries of ethnic origin, as a result of increasing ethnic tensions and rivalries in Central Asia, is creating a brain drain which could have serious implications for the region's economic and political development.

"Traditional power structures, characterized by strict hierarchies of deference, have survived the Soviet period almost unchanged. Questioning actions of those in authority is still an unforgivable breach of
There still exists a deeply rooted and rigidly applied system of top-down governance which permeates every level -- local, regional, national -- of the vast intact bureaucracy. Such a system squelches motivation and innovative thinking, inhibits creativity and delays decision-making. Just as significantly, Leninist ideology has had a dampening effect on individual initiative resulting in risk-adversiveness among would-be micro entrepreneurs as well as complacency on the factory floor.

Under Soviet rule, the Central Asian republics became a patchwork of horizontally integrated production capacity, which prevented any single country from establishing a vertically integrated production system -- cultivation of raw materials, processing, production, marketing. The interconnectedness of the Soviet economic system -- set up to exploit resources of the Central Asian republics and to prevent any one of them from becoming economically self-sufficient -- has had a devastating impact on the newly independent republics' ability to become economically independent.

The Politicization of Islam

"Central Asia has a population of approximately 50 million, of whom 35 million are Muslims...during the second half of the seventh century Islam became one of the chief elements of self-definition for nomads and settled peoples alike...Ten years ago, after some six decades of oppression, harassment and relentless anti-religious propaganda, knowledge of Islam had been undermined to such an extent that for the great mass of the population it survived only in the form of a few rites of passage and of the awareness (though not always the observation) of dietary laws prohibiting the consumption of pork and alcohol. Yet today, a year after the collapse of the Soviet Union, Islam has already become a significant political force in the newly independent (Central Asian) republics..." Shirin Akiner, Director of the Central Asia Research Forum at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

According to the Central Asian scholar, Shirin Akiner, the sudden dissolution of the Soviet Union in December 1991 produced a psychological trauma that devastated the population as much as the economic collapse, due in part to the close intertwining of Soviet and national identity for the vast majority of the population. According to Akiner, Islam filled, to some extent, the ideological vacuum that ensued and has become a political tool or label by which former Soviet functionaries can now gain renewed legitimacy.

Shirin theorizes that "political Islam" -- a cloak for extreme nationalism -- is distinct from Islamic fundamentalism which for most of Central Asia has been diluted by 70 years of Soviet secularism. His concern is that the western preoccupation with the supposed threat of fundamentalism has effectively given the regional governments carte blanche to silence all opposition.
In a recent article in the Harvard International Review, Central Asian scholar, Nancy Lubin recommends: "Instead of magnifying a potential Islamic threat, for example, it would be useful to understand in what ways Islam may play a constructive role in Central Asia in the midst of upheaval and change, and in what ways other factors may trigger unrest." In this regard, Islamic humanism and cultural values positively complement ideas of pluralism and civil society.

The Crossroads

"Democracy is not only a formal set of institutions but also a culture. Without the customs and practices that define democratic behavior -- what Alexis de Tocqueville called "the habits that freedom forms" -- new and nominally democratic institutions can revert to being storefronts for closed, authoritarian, aggressive societies. Citizens of formerly communist nations understand this. They had constitutions, courts, congresses, and elections -- all the apparatus of democracy. They simply had no leaders who behaved democratically..., "

The Central Asian countries, in a post-Soviet period are at a crossroads. The Soviet legacy has all but obliterated the rich cultural heritage and economic power of the region during the 16th century. Decades of communist rule have virtually extinguished the memory and organizations of civil society. The pervasive disruption of the post-independence era can be an opportunity for exploring new paths of democracy, pluralism, and free markets, as well as reshaping cultural identity and institutions.

Two of the Central Asian countries that appear to be moving in the direction of democratic and economic reform are Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. Both have strong and pragmatic reform-minded leaders who keenly understand the tenuous balancing act they are playing in promoting reform ideas such as privatization, pluralism, and ethnic and religious freedoms in the face of tenacious opposition from "old guard" bureaucrats and "new guard" chauvinists.

Nursultan Nazarbayev, the Kazakh President, has tried to protect Russian interests and pride. He has pushed privatization to the degree where it will encourage foreign investment, but not topple all the vested interests all at once, and has supported a constitution which elevates the NGO sector to historical status. Askar Akayev, the Kyrgyz President, is openly supportive of ethnic and religious freedoms, the value of the NGO sector in promoting civil society, and an open and free press. For cynics who would say that these two leaders have mastered the vocabulary of reform, not the deed, they might reflect upon the words of President Nazarbayev:

"The overhasty destruction of the old when the new has not yet been built usually leads to economic chaos and decline, which discredits the new, democratic idea."

U.S. government and PVO/NGO assistance can help these two emerging democracies bridge the gap between the old and the new by providing a knowledge bridge which will help these governments formulate policies and priorities, capacitate the non-governmental organs of reform -- NGOs and private enterprises -- and move these societies toward political stability and free market economic growth.

2 Civil Society -- East and West, Vol. 1, No. 1, June 1993; Center for Civil Society International (CCSI), Seattle, Washington.
THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN: A FACT SHEET

Capital: Almaty; population 1.2 million.
Size: 2.7 million sq. km., second largest republic after Russia, 12% of the former USSR.
Location: borders Russia, China, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, and the Caspian Sea.
Population: about 17.1 million (1979), average annual growth rate 1%, about 60% in urban areas. There has been
a notable outflow of residents (between 1989 to 1991 (282,000).
Official Languages: Kazakh (35%), Russian (55%), others (10%)
Ethnic Groups: Kazakhs (40%), Russians (38%), Germans (5%), Ukrainians (5%), Uzbeks (2%), Tatars (2%),
and significant numbers of Uighurs, other Central Asians and Koreans.
Main Religions: Sunni Islam and Orthodox Christianity.
Education: virtually universal access to schools; tracks to Professional academies, universities, and vocational
schools.

Economy

Currency: Ruble.
Major Agricultural Products: grain, sugar beet, tobacco, mustard, fruits, meats and fish; cotton, wool, and
natural rubber.
Major Industrial Products: Mining (coal, wolfram, petroleum, natural gas, iron, copper, and zinc, etc.), iron
and steel production, chemical products, agricultural machinery.
Natural Resources: copper, gold, mercury, uranium, antimony.
Trade: external to CIS was $1.3 billion in 1991. Extensive US-Kazakh Commercial Agreements include: The
Bilateral Trade Agreement (as of February 18, 1993) providing Most Favored Nation (MFN) Status; Bilateral
Investment Treaty; The Double Tax Agreement which limits tax liability. Additional support from USDA and the
US Trade and Development Program.
Privatization: laws regulating business found in its Constitutional Law, and in the decree on "Independent Foreign
Investment" policy which defines: main principles of foreign investments, free economic zones, currency
regulation, and Republic concessions. Following the liberalization of price controls on January 6, 1992, prices rose
10 times higher than their March 1991 level.

Politics

Political Facts: proclaimed independence December 16, 1991, and was associated with the Commonwealth of
Independent States from the beginning; recognized by U.S. government and admitted to the UN. The Constitution
was adopted on January 28, 1993.
Political Institutions: unicameral Supreme Soviet with 365 deputies elected in 1991; president elected by popular
vote in 1991 for a 4 year term; the Cabinet of Ministers executes government policy; there are 3 major political
parties, although smaller parties continue to multiply.
Human Rights and Freedoms: The president supports freedom of religion, the ethnic rights of all citizens, and
a free press.
Political Leadership: Nursultan A. Nazarbaev, President; Sergey Tereschenko, Prime Minister.
Military: National Guard in existence; in the process of creating a national army; full participants in the joint CIS
Military force; the Minister of Defense oversees military operations.
Security and Cooperation in Europe, World Bank (MIGA, IDA), EBRD, and Economic Cooperation Organization.
Kazakhstan has agreements with OPIC, EBRD, World Bank (MIGA, IDA), IMF and EXIM. It has observer
status at GATT.

Sources: The Embassy of the Republic of Kazakhstan; Center for International Health Information/ISSSTI (1992), "USAID Health Profile -
Kazakhstan"; UNICEF/WHO Collaborative Mission Report (1992), "Independent Republic of Kazakhstan". (For complete information, see
bibliography.)
KAZAKHSTAN

PRECIPITOUS INDEPENDENCE: UNPRECEDEDNTED CHALLENGES

"After 70 years of Soviet rule, the Kazakh people, descendants of Turkic tribes and the great Mongol hordes that once ruled over Russia, have reclaimed their sovereignty." (National Geographic, vol. 183, no. 3, March 1993).

Kazakhstan declared its independence in December of 1991; in early 1992 Nursultan Nazarbayev, the Kazakh Communist Party Leader, was elected President by popular vote.

Azimbay Ghaliyev, a Kazakh scientist calls this "a time rich in hope and full of doubt." This vast developing country, with a total population of 17.1 million, and home for nearly 1,400 nuclear warheads, has been catapulted into independence by forces beyond its control.

Its people did not seek independence. Independence has meant the painful withdrawal of economic benefits derived as being part of the USSR. The Soviet economic system which linked ore-rich Kazakhstan with factories in Russia and Ukraine -- has broken down and no new system has been devised.

Independence also means that there will be no Soviet help for victims of nuclear testing or the staggering aftermath of resource exploitation directed by Moscow. "In spite of wide public concern for environmental deterioration, often the most elementary action steps have not yet been taken. Communities seem to be more paralyzed than mobilized by the ecological issue."3

A Survival Mode

The challenges faced by most Kazakhstanis are those of mere survival: fearful about diminishing purchasing power in the face of hyperinflation reaching 2,000 percent/year, and lower wages and pensions that can’t keep up with the pace of inflation. They are also apprehensive over evident cutbacks in health care services, education, day care for children of working parents, and services to the elderly. Government health care clinics are open, but operate with little or no medicines or supplies, day care centers have begun to charge fees for service provided, and many elderly are dying from neglect and starvation. There is also an increase in street crime among teenagers as well as truancy from school, as they desperately seek to supplement reduced family income by any means.

According to a 1992 UNICEF/WHO Collaborative Mission Report: "There is so far no effort to re-allocate social support to focus on those most in need in spite of excellent data on

---

household economic status, income and assets. Urban families are often more vulnerable than rural ones, and resources saved in the past are already exhausted. Nearly all income is expended on food and dietary quality is deteriorating."

**Impediments to Private Sector Development**

As detailed later in this report, the Soviets left an attitudinal and structural legacy which permeates the entire commercial environment of Kazakhstan and creates serious impediments to the development of the private sector, but small enterprise development in particular. Leninist ideology coupled with the semi-colonial status of Kazakhstan prior to the break-up of the Soviet Union -- fueling the raw material and macro-production needs of a vast empire -- resulted in risk-adversiveness and a limited acumen for identifying and capitalizing on prospective business opportunities that would be the "life-blood" of microenterprise. In addition, government control and influence over raw materials, credit, transportation, and distribution channels; hesitancy of the new private banks to risk dealing with small business; usurious interest rates when they do; the limited nature of limited markets; and lack of a stable currency -- further dampen the environment for micro and small business development.

An archaic communications system further hinders the capacity of businessmen and the rest of the population to have easy and reliable access to global information and internal exchanges. As pointed out by VEST team member Joe Sedlak:

"Kazakhstan, about the size of Alaska, has close to 17.1 million people. There are fewer than 600,000 phones in the entire country... The average wait for a phone is 10 years in the capital... Individuals can expect to pay 383,000 rubles (about $300 -- close to 2 years' income for the average person) plus installation costs... The government is under a variety of internal and external pressures to choose between communications and other competing sectors for very limited resources."

**Ethnic Distinctness and De-Russification**

"Exploration of ethnic distinctness, made possible first by glasnost and then by Kazakhstan's independence, has already led to a situation where many of the formerly dominant ethnic Russians wonder about their position in the new economic order, where some ethnic Kazakhs ask themselves why the ethnic Russians even remain in the republic, and where the remaining ethnic groups are all too easily ignored entirely." Timothy Lyman, Esq., VEST Team Member, 1993.

Newly independent Kazakhstan is the most "Russified" of the Central Asian Republics. More than 6.5 million Kazakhstanis are ethnic Russians. Russian culture, language, and architecture are immediately recognizable upon entering the capital of Almaty.

The Russification of Kazakhstan began in the 1700's with the encroachment of the Cossacks, followed by the forced settlement of Russians, Ukrainians, Germans and other ethnic groups during the 19th century and the Second World War. During the 70 plus years of Soviet domination, the Moscow-based Communist leadership exploited Kazakhstan's natural resources, blanketed vast regions with nuclear fallout, and imposed draconian agrarian policies -- bitter
memories still exist among Kazakhs. "Stalin’s forced farm collectivization program beginning
in 1929 which killed millions from famine, and over Khrushchev’s Virgin Lands Program which
violated 60 million acres of pasture."

The de-Russification of Kazakhstan has manifested itself in a number of overt, though
paradoxical, ways. The official language is now Kazakh, although President Nazarbayev was
savvy enough to approve the use of Russian as the language of international communication.
Most high government officials are now Kazakh, although trained and groomed in the old Soviet
bureaucracy. Kazakh culture is promoted in the National Art Museum and souvenir shops, but
Soviet statuary is still displayed in public parks and gardens. The spelling of the capitol has
been changed from the Russian version "Alma-Ata" to "Almaiy", though the former is still more
frequently used. Russian street names have been replaced with names of Kazakh heroes, but
Lenin’s picture still hangs in many government offices.

Ethnic Russians shared concerns with VEST team members about their future and their
children’s future in Kazakhstan. They expressed anxiety about having to learn Kazakh,
competing for limited jobs against Kazakhs, diminished quality of education and research
capability due to plummeting resources and the "brain drain," and a gnawing fear that those who
don’t leave now will be forced to leave at some future date. It is difficult to predict whether the
latter fear is warranted. What is certain is that the ethnic Russians are acting on their fears:
migration statistics show that from 1989 to 1991 there was a net outflow of 282,000 residents,
of which 77,000 were Russian.

It must be remembered, however, that Kazakhs do not represent the majority of the population,
but, at just 40 percent of the population, constitute only a majority among minorities. Russians
account for 39 percent, with Germans, Koreans and other Central Asians comprising significant
minorities.

Among Kazakhs themselves conflicting ethnic interests and local political structures have to
appear, principally within the framework of the three tribes or clans which define Kazakh
society. Many observers attribute this increasing factionalism to a shrinking economic pie and
more freedom to promote the self-interest of oneself, one’s family or one’s clan.

Environmental Time Bomb

"At the present time, the protection of the environment in the republic of Kazakhstan is a very acute
problem. Many large cities have become hostages of the destructive actions of industry and aviation
transport. Among these, Almaiy holds a special place...Approximately 300 thousand tons of harmful
substances are thrown into the air of Almaiy..." Dr. Raisa Khalizovna Kadyrova, Director, Institute
of Hygiene and Occupational Diseases, Almaiy.

"A major effort and infusion of capital will be needed to deal with the environmental degradation caused by years of neglect under the Soviet system. Apart from the enormous clean up costs that will be required to overcome the Russian environmental legacy, a whole new government system will be needed to monitor the environment and regulate polluters in the public and private sectors." Roger Roy, VEST Team Member, 1993.

A recent U.S. Peace Corps report points out that between 1949 and 1962 nearly 200 atomic and nuclear bombs were exploded above ground in the northeastern corner of the country around nuclear testing sites of Semipalatinsk and Ust/Kamenogorsk, and that nearly twice as many underground tests have been conducted since then. Environmental devastation is widespread and particularly visible in the Aral Sea Basin where between 1960 and 1987, the level of the sea decreased by more than 40 feet in depth, 40 percent in surface area and 66 percent in volume. This has resulted in an extreme increase in salination killing fish and with them the fisheries and a modest fish processing industry.5

"The sea, which had supported three million people, no longer supports any. Current predictions suggest that it will disappear completely by the year 2005." Friedemann Mueller, Chairman, the Environmental and International Politics research group.

Air pollution is obvious in industrial areas where 59 percent of the population resides. "Radiation exposure is said to be widespread due to extensive nuclear tests and uranium mining. Evidence of environmentally induced cancers, congenital anomalies and other health effects suggest an increase in these conditions which may exceed Western rates by 30-40 percent." (UNICEF/WHO Collaborating Mission, 1992)

The Health Care Dilemma

"The medical infrastructure created by the Soviet system included a huge network of clinics and hospitals which provided free, accessible care to all...Although the underlying principle of Soviet socialized medicine was equality of care and universal access, the reality is a multi-tiered, highly stratified system of care and facilities." Adrienne Allison, VEST Team Member 1993.

"Many physicians seem unexpectedly open to understanding and adopting new technologies. They recognize the severity of the challenges they face. They know their skills need updating and seek opportunities for training...Their fatigue and open honesty are very moving. Others have invested too much for too long in a system that did little to encourage questioning and reasoning." Adrienne Allison.

While the medical infrastructure is highly comprehensive and reaches even the most remote areas, the quality of care within the system varies greatly. In all hospitals and clinics, knowledge and practices required to control infection are weak. Pharmaceutical supplies, which formerly came from Hungary, have stopped and there are critical shortages of anesthetics, antibiotics,

drugs, and vitamins.

Old practices, often based on misconceptions or lack of knowledge, continue. Abortions, the most common method of family planning, equal the number of live births (or may exceed them due to incomplete reporting). Physicians consider reliance on abortion as a leading cause of poor health and infertility among women.

The post-independence Kazakhstani government's policy on family planning appears divided and inconsistent. For example: Large families (e.g. with seven or more children) are esteemed by many Kazakhs as an integral part of their traditional culture with its historic if loose ties to Islam. The government encouraged this by creating a system of incentives to promote large families. The present government recognizes that high fertility rates contributed to higher female and infant mortality rates for the Kazakh population. Now the current family planning policy promotes birth spacing through public education via the media, but it is also working on a "decree for social protection for large families" which would guarantee an allowance equal to the current minimum wage for the increasing number of newly unemployed women who have four or more children. The bottom line is that every mother still gets a gold ring for producing 12 children.

Vulnerable Women and Children

"Seventy years of legislated equality has not raised the status of women to equal that of men in Kazakhstan. Soviet policy and the Soviet constitution clearly stated that women possessed equal access to education, employment, remuneration and political participation. In actuality, this equality has never been achieved. The change that was externally decreed has never been internalized by either men or women." Adrienne Allison, VEST team member, 1993.

As the economic situation in Kazakhstan deteriorates, so does the economic and health status of women. Industries can no longer afford the bloated employment patterns associated with the Soviet period. Women are the first to be fired in a shrinking economy where men are considered indispensable to the running of government, the factory and the farm. In the rural areas, women do most of the menial farm labor, and still play their traditional and expected roles of nurturing wife and mother. Anemia is common, with 50 to 80 percent of women in many areas, and all women in the Aral Sea region being anemic. Economic stress is named by government officials as a significant factor in the increased number of divorces -- one in every three marriages.

The children are also suffering. The number of abandoned children has increased since independence. Infant mortality rates are thought to be rising -- from 25.9/1000 live births in 1970 to 44.1/1000 in 1990. There seems to be a very high number of children who suffer from birth injuries which may in part be due to archaic birthing practices.
STRENGTHS AND OPPORTUNITIES

Human and Natural Resources: A Spur to Foreign Investment

Kazakhstan is rich in human and natural resources. Educational levels are very high, there are more than 90 different minerals, and huge exploitable oil reserves on a par with the U.S. and Libya. Almaty, the nation’s capitol is a rich cultural center with fifteen institutions of higher learning, one opera house, and seven theaters. It is teeming with foreign businessmen anxious to make deals for joint ventures in the hopes of exploiting the vast array of potentially marketable resources.

The presence of foreigners, especially those investing in the country for the long term, will most likely be a catalyst for improvements in the telecommunications sector. There are several telecommunications projects being planned which will provide the country with access to global communications networks. Although these developments may not impact people at the village level for years to come, NGOs operating out of Almaty and near sites of large joint ventures will most likely benefit from newly installed telecommunications facilities.

Potential for Microenterprise Development

In spite of the Soviet attitudinal legacy mentioned earlier, the VEST team witnessed evidence of an element of "can do", an openness to share information, willingness to take risks (especially among independent environmental groups), pragmatism and a capacity to work together to get things done.

"The observations of the VEST team indicate that despite all impediments, microenterprise will be critical to the development of a market economy in Kazakhstan and to generating employment and income for millions of Kazakhstanis for whom the government and government-run enterprises are no longer able or willing to provide. Microenterprise remains the "lowest-tech" way to begin the necessary processes of market conversion in the current chaotic economic and political situation, and it is a sphere in which the potential for positive "spill-over" effect and teaching by example is great."

The NGO sector is an area in which there already exists great acceptance of the concept of microenterprise. It is also an area where an organizational "infrastructure" is already in place, however underdeveloped. The concept of charitable and social projects supported by microenterprise is both a vehicle for the financial sustainability of the NGO, and a means of inculcating the concept of private philanthropy in the entrepreneur.
The NGO Sector: Signs of Democratic Reform

"As elsewhere in the NIS, one encounters in Kazakhstan the absence of clearly understood vocabulary to describe and discuss such concepts as philanthropy, charity, nonprofit organizations, non-governmental organizations, and the like... We concluded in Kazakhstan that the term "NGO" seemed generally the best of the available imperfect choices..." Bruce Hopkins, VEST Team Member 1993.

The lack of clear sectoral definition of the term NGO in Kazakhstan will no doubt frustrate U.S. PVOs and NGOs seeking to develop counterpart relations with any of the Kazakhstani NGOs. When asked to describe the sectoral categories of their 2,000 registered NGOs, officials in the Ministry of Justice and Almaty City Administration listed political parties, mass movements, youth and sports clubs, charitable organizations, trade unions, and any other category of association described as a "public organization" under their constitution. To complicate the issue further, the distinction between non-governmental and private defies definition at this point since many NGOs are headed by ministerial officials wearing two hats. In addition, many so-called private "institutes" are clearly connected to government structures, supplement government services on behalf of the government, yet have greater freedom to develop and deliver services than if they were wholly government controlled.

At this time, it is also difficult to differentiate NGOs along sectoral lines, with the exception of the environmental groups and charitable organizations providing social services to vulnerable groups such as pensioners and handicapped children. It should be noted, however, that "non-governmental" health and welfare societies serving women and children, and headed by strong, articulate and capable women, have been running assistance programs for years with government support.

"A matter of some importance to have in mind when considering the nexus between microenterprise development and the development of the NGO sector in Kazakhstan, is the fact, as already observed, that the only apparent governmental 'subsidy' available to charitable organizations is the tax exemption accorded to earnings from commercial activities that are donated to an NGO." Timothy Lyman, VEST Team Member 1993.

Given the lack of a culture of private philanthropy, and the very limited potential for creating it under existing economic conditions, the distinction between the private commercial sphere and the charitable and philanthropic sphere also lacks clarity. Many, if not most, non-profit NGOs owe their very existence to the largesse of private enterprises that receive a tax deduction for their donation. If the private enterprise is wholly owned by the "non-profit", then neither entity is taxed. It is not difficult for a Westerner to view this concept with skepticism -- i.e. according tax exemption to a wholly commercial enterprise because its profits benefit a charitable

6 In this regard, "It may be worth pointing out that these values, concepts and practices (of philanthropy, charity, volunteerism) did exist in the pre-Soviet, largely Muslim institutional patterns. These traditional patterns could be encouraged so that they may contribute to the creation of civil and social structures." Iqbal Noor-Ali, VEST Team Member, 1993.
organization --. However, one must keep in mind that up until the late 1950's this concept was practiced in the U.S. until Congress legislated against it.

"The concept of supporting charitably-focused indigenous NGOs by microenterprise suggests an excellent place to begin work on the development of microenterprise in Kazakhstan." Timothy Lyman, VEST Team Member 1993.

As discussed in Timothy Lyman's report on microenterprise under the SECTOR OBSERVATIONS section of this report, the NGO sector offers a potentially hospitable arena in which to develop microenterprises as income generators for NGO purposes. It also offers future opportunity for the many NGO women leaders to become entrepreneurial models for novice business women.

When VEST team members shared with Kazakhstani NGO leaders the numerous examples of U.S. NGOs active in promoting microenterprise, they immediately saw the benefits to the survival of their own organizations, and expressed interest in learning more about transacting business. This approach to institutional survival could also help ensure the development of a privately supported social service sector to fill the void left by significantly diminished government services.

U.S. NGOs seeking to work with Kazakhstani NGOs are advised to take into consideration the VEST team's observation that there seem to be three dominant categories of NGOs. What might be characterized as "old guard" organizations -- in most cases quasi-governmental -- existed for some time before the break-up of the Soviet Union and were sanctioned by and closely connected to those with power and influence under the old order. The benefits they derived from State support included salaries and buildings. They practiced the precept of "don't forget old friends", which binds them in the current changing environment. Among this group are included, to a greater or lesser extent, the Children's Fund, Friendship Society, Peace Fund, and many ethnic societies. The present cachet of such organizations, and even their financial security, depends in large measure upon the degree to which their traditional supporters continue to occupy positions of influence.

A second class of organization may be termed "survivalist", and tends to be organized around the protection of specific groups in the general population against specific perceived threats. These are generally grass-roots groups, supported primarily by voluntary labor and small financial contributions from members. This group includes pensioners and some environmental groups (as discussed in the SECTORAL OBSERVATIONS section of this report). Most of these groups lack a paid staff, office space and regular funding. There are a significant number of women leaders in this category of NGO. Should they succeed in designing and managing income generating activities for their fledgling organizations, with external technical assistance and training, it is conceivable that they could become role models for future women entrepreneurs, as discussed in other sections of this report.

A final group may be characterized as "power seekers" and includes a wide variety of groups that were not powerful under the old regime, but have hopes of gaining influence in the new
order. This group includes political parties, some environmental groups and religious NGOs.

Many of the Kazakhstani NGOs with which we met appeared to straddle the boundaries between these general classifications, possessing attributes of more than one category. The boundaries appeared important, nonetheless, particularly between "old guard" organizations and groups of the other types. Many "survivalists" see themselves as advocates for disenfranchised and otherwise powerless groups, and openly express mistrust with respect to groups perceived as being "connected" with people in power.

The Rule of Law: Signs of a Civil Society

"Kazakhstan has begun the long road of establishing one of the central tenets of a modern civil society, which is the rule of law." Roger Roy, VEST Team Member 1993.

"Apparently unique throughout the CIS is the fact that the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan makes provision (in Chapter 10) for "public organizations." This country may be the only one in the world that has elevated its law on NGOs to formal constitutional law status." Bruce Hopkins, VEST Team Member 1993.

As discussed in the 1992 VEST report -- "A New Era for Development: Time for a Paradigm Shift, Russia and Ukraine" -- recovery of the institution building capacity of civil society is the central transition issue in a society giving birth. Although Kazakhstan cannot now be called a civil society, the legal infrastructure for civil society in being put in place.

There are, however, caveats. For example: the new constitution states that the "state provides enforcement of legal rights and legal interests of public organizations." It states further that the "interference of state organs and their officials into the activity of public organizations is unlawful,"; the one caveat, however, is that it also declares "unlawful" "interference of public organizations into the activity of state organs and their officials." If we accept the definition of civil society as "a society that pre-supposes the existence of a space in which individuals and their self-created associations compete with each other in the pursuit of their values: free from the monolithic power of, for example the state or religion," how the law is applied will say more about the potential for civil society in Kazakhstan than the letter of the law itself.

In a sense, Kazakhstan's commitment to democratic reform and the promotion of a civil society will be, in great measure, judged by whether it can allow the NGO sector to flourish as an independent and free voice in the society; viewed at the very least as a constructive opposition force, and at the very best as an important instrument for fostering a civil society based on voluntary action and exchange of ideas.

---

THE UNIQUE ROLE FOR U.S. PVOs/NGOs

IN PARTNERSHIP WITH KAZAKHSTANI NGOs

"Private Voluntary Organizations are necessary as important agents of change within a democratic political structure. Such organizations can formulate options and points of view which over time can be infused into the political process. Given serious resource constraints, concepts and priorities need to be fashioned in such areas as health, the needs of the elderly, roles for women, and environmental concerns. Participation of voluntary organizations is necessary to help analyze options and to advocate priorities to ensure that the decision process is inclusive and thoughtful." Malcolm Lovell, VEST team member, 1992

As mentioned in the first VEST report on Russia and Ukraine, U.S. PVOs/NGOs have a demonstrated and unique capability to tap local and global knowledge and resources, respond to problems rapidly and creatively, link diverse resources and partners, and maintain the flexibility needed in changing circumstances.

U.S. PVOs/NGOs represent a wealth of expertise and experience in areas of demonstrated need in Kazakhstan: 1) building sustainable charitable and non-profit service organizations, 2) fundraising and grantmaking, 3) human resource and small enterprise development, 4) environmental resource management and 5) agricultural extension services. They operate on the very principles that are the underpinning of a civil society -- individual worth, civic consciousness and voluntarism, and democratic participation and governance.

U.S. PVOs also have extensive experience working with U.S. and host government officials on policy and planning issues. They can, therefore, play a facilitating role for information exchange and policy dialogue between their NGO counterparts and their government officials at all levels. This would have particular importance in the environmental sector where advocacy for pollution controls is seen as adversarial by a government striving for industrial growth.

The experience of the VEST team in Kazakhstan has dramatized the importance of encouraging U.S. PVOs and NGOs, the cornerstone of American civil society, to play an active role fostering the values of civil society in their working relationships with Kazakhstani counterparts. They must, however, always be conscious of the fact that their counterparts have been steeped in more than seven decades of conditioning under State paternalism. The concepts and values Americans associate with free market economic activity and democracy are now, unfortunately, being associated with the economic and social disruption of their everyday lives.

In developing partnerships and linkages with Kazakhstani NGOs, the first requirement is to recognize that they will be working as equal partners, with mutual trust, understanding and respect. Additional prerequisites for good partnership development are:

* An understanding by the U.S. partner of the attitudinal legacies left over from seventy five years of Soviet rule
* An understanding by the U.S. partner that the climate for microenterprise
development in Kazakhstan differs from that in both the U.S., and elsewhere around the world

* Mutual investment in the development and implementation of joint projects

* An awareness on the part of the Kazakhstani partner of the peculiar and volatile aspects of the emerging NGO sector in Kazakhstan and its relationship to the government

* An awareness on the part of the U.S. partner of the complex and fast-changing ethnic dynamics. The ethnicity of Kazakhstani counterparts will seldom, if ever, be irrelevant to effective cooperation, even in the case of multi-ethnic organizations

* Awareness by the U.S. partner that the sole use of the Russian language for conducting their activities may create a barrier to good relations

A cautionary note:

U.S. PVOs/NGOs need also to be aware of the current situation in Kazakhstan regarding registration as a foreign NGO as discussed in Bruce Hopkin's observations on the law under "SECTOR OBSERVATIONS." Although the Kazakhstani government has stated its welcome of U.S. organizations operating for the purpose of "capacity building," they have specifically requested that such activities not "embarrass either the U.S. government or the government of Kazakhstan."
RECOMMENDATIONS

#1 PARTNERSHIP DEVELOPMENT

U.S. PVOs are uniquely qualified to become a knowledge bridge for Kazakhstani counterparts - facilitating dialogue, networking and technical cooperation -- and assisting in the formulation of options and priorities in sectoral activities vital to the improvement of the quality of life and the flourishing of democracy and free markets

* networking, linkages, partnerships and creative alliances with Kazakhstani counterparts should be fostered and nurtured and supported by private and public donors;

* internship opportunities should be explored, and supported by public and private donors;

* grants for Kazakhstani NGO institutional development and capacity building should be a high priority for private and public donors;

* women's groups, established societies and emerging NGOs all need capacity building, with particular focus on management, fundraising, accounting and strategic planning;

* an NGO service center should be established to facilitate linkages and partnerships, access informational networks, identify appropriate sources of U.S. technical assistance and training, coordinate baseline data on indigenous NGOs, document successful project and partnership models.

# 2: MODELLING OF THE PUBLIC/PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

All initiatives which include the development of non-governmental organizations should be cast in terms of building public-private partnerships to meet the emerging needs of a newly independent country.

# 3: LAW

1. Technical assistance is urgently needed with respect to the conceptualization and drafting of further legislation regulating the formation and governmental oversight of Kazakhstani NGOs.

2. Governmental officials, NGO leaders, and their private advisors would all be well served
by the development of a legal "how to" manual for the formation and administration of NGOs in Kazakhstan. Involving all these parties in the development of such a manual would have the additional benefit of establishing or re-enforcing lines of communications between these parties -- something that is vital to all in the current fast-changing environment.

3. Policy dialogue is needed, generally, on the development of appropriate delineations between the governmental sector, the private for-profit sector and the NGO sector. Clearly, the objective of such dialogue need not simply be the recreation of the sectoral delineations observed in the United States or other Western democracies.

4. Additional seminars are needed for lawyers and non-lawyers. The latter are hungry for information about the appropriate ways to form and foster NGOs. The group of the former needs to be bolstered, so that the NGO sector in Kazakhstan can receive independent legal advice to enhance and increase its members.

#4: MICROENTERPRISE

1. A logical place to begin microenterprise development projects is within the NGO sector itself, both as a means of generating funds for NGO activities and as a model for eventual application in the private for-profit sector.

An existing organizational infrastructure is already in place and NGO volunteers are committed to their causes which makes the prospects for the success of related microenterprises greater than microenterprises spurred only by the ordinary private sector motivations.

2. A logical place to being fostering NGO-connected microenterprise is with the tourism/foreigner market for crafts, following some effective product development and improvement of merchandising.

U.S. NGO assistance to craft development projects is worth undertaking because of the richness of available resources and traditions, it is a low-infrastructure activity that can be started easily on a small scale, and because the existing market to the relatively large number of foreigners visiting Kazakhstan for business reasons in underexploited and not dominated by government-owned or controlled competition.

3. Non-craft microenterprise for local consumption is also possible, especially production of small-scale post-harvest food and textiles, household items and clothing.

Many local needs are not locally satisfied. A coordinated strategy, however, would be required, since alternative sources of raw materials, transportation and marketing channels would all be necessary to avoid dependence on inherently undependable
4. Work is needed on a practical strategy for export, since local markets for crafts and other microenterprise products are presently small and can be anticipated to be slow in developing.

5. Cooperation might be possible between U.S. NGOs providing extremely small-scale credit in order to assist artisan and cottage producers who are unable to work the current chaotic credit system due to lack of connections.

6. Small-scale credit initiatives, and basic business organization and cost accounting training would be extremely valuable in the development of low-tech, post-harvest food processing, cotton and wool-based textile manufacture and cottage industry garment production.

7. Another sphere in which opportunities for women micro-entrepreneurs seems promising is the NGO sector itself. As already observed, the NGO sector offers a potentially hospitable arena in which to develop microenterprises as income generators for NGO purposes. Women already hold leadership positions with many NGOs, particularly those of the "survivalist" type, and as leaders in NGO-supporting commercial activities would offer valuable role models to other women interested in microenterprise.

#5: HEALTH

Women's Health

The Private Sector

1. U.S. PVOs should provide immediate support for local groups working in health care. There are several women's groups with good leaders which are interested in women's health issues. It is essential to introduce modern methods of contraception as broadly and quickly as possible, given current rates of maternal mortality and infertility. Women need to educate other women about the benefits of contraception and to provide counselling and access to contraceptive services. This one-to-one approach will help dispel mistrust created from years of indoctrination through mass media, which included misinformation about oral contraceptives.

2. Guidelines should be sought to develop approaches for alleviating nutritional anemia through oral iron supplementation. Breastfeeding should be supported through women-to-women counselling and education campaigns.

3. U.S. PVOs should introduce approaches to health care which educate women, and encourage them to be more responsible for their own health. This approach will help
them move from being passive recipients to informed participants in their own health care.

**The Public Sector**

1. In the public sector, improved medical practices are critically needed. From hygiene to obstetrics, gynecology, infant and child health, all areas need technical assistance to update current practices. Key medical leaders should be brought to the U.S. on training and observation tours to learn more about "family centered" maternity care, (which includes rooming-in, breast-feeding on demand etc.), family planning, including depoprovera, IUD insertion, etc., and post-abortion contraceptive counselling and other aspects of women's health care.

2. PVOs, in collaboration with the Republican Scientific Research Institution on Maternal and Child Health, staff of physicians, midwives, counsellors, etc. should review the beliefs, attitudes and practices about contraception, and work with clients, develop guidelines for the introduction of contraceptive services in the private sector.

3. U.S. PVOs should encourage strengthened collaboration between NGOs and the public health sector to maximize the potential for service delivery at the community level.

4. Women-to-women counselling and service delivery will be required to build confidence in and generate demand for modern methods of contraception. The one to one approach is necessary to help off-set decades of top-down misinformation promulgated by the former government.

5. Post-abortion counselling on appropriate alternative contraceptive approaches should be available at all centers offering abortion services.

6. Breastfeeding should be encouraged through all public health channels. Fears about insufficient breastmilk need to be overcome. Education on the benefits of breastfeeding needs to include information on other sources of milk, potential contamination and reliability of supply. Women living in highly contaminated areas need more information on the potential contamination of breastmilk and other supply sources.

**Environmental health**

In order to reduce the impact of environmental pollutants on the health status of people living in industrial areas and those exposed to nuclear radiation U.S. PVOs should assist their NGO counterparts and public health officials develop a community-based health education/promotion program utilizing the media, schools, religious organizations and the traditional health infrastructure.
1. U.S. PVOs need to identify and begin working with potential counterparts, concurrently delivering services and supporting their progress in institution building. PVOs should establish an in-country presence to help nascent local organizations model their methods of service delivery and management on those of the PVO.

2. The centrally controlled, top down system of service delivery in many sectors is well entrenched. There is no counter-balancing community-based, non-governmental organization. U.S. PVOs need to work in partnership with emerging local organizations to identify priority issues, to transfer institution building skills, and to model democratic approaches to governance.

3. Under the former Soviet regime, many societies were formed to assist families with many children, families with handicapped children, handicapped mothers with normal children etc. These need to be strengthened as institutions and helped to become financially more secure if they are to become viable service providers working in the private sector. These established NGOs need assistance in strategic planning to help them move ahead, and develop new approaches to respond to changing circumstances.
WOMEN'S ISSUES

Empowerment of women -- in the areas of reproductive health, infant and child welfare, micro and small enterprise development, farm labor, advocacy, organizational leadership and management -- is essential to the creation of a civil society based on the democratic and equitable principles.

1. For microenterprise

One possible sphere of microenterprise development in which women and men appear to operate on more equal footing is small-scale private trading. This sphere, though still embryonic, is burgeoning, at least in urban areas. The development of this sphere of commercial activity presents a variety of opportunities to aspiring women entrepreneurs.

2. For women’s leadership

The capacity of the independent sector to address social issues needs to be actualized. Emerging women leaders and women’s organizations need to develop partnerships with international women’s groups to help them to learn to organize themselves around priority causes. These causes should respond to women’s expressed priorities, and will likely include the need for community services and access to employment.

Women’s groups need technical assistance to help them understand basic concepts of profit and loss, and to support the establishment of small enterprises. Access to credit is a necessary follow-on to an initial understanding of the costs of time, space, equipment, etc. Emerging NGOs will need assistance in developing their organizational skills, including training in management and supervision, book-keeping, strategic planning, etc.

3. For reproductive health

Women’s health status is compromised by almost total reliance on abortion as the principle method of family planning. There is a compelling need for peer counselling so that women understand and are empowered to ask for the health services they need. The top-down approach to family planning needs to be counterbalanced by women generated, community-based, demand for alternative methods of contraception. Commodity distribution needs to be carefully designed to ensure that sources are seen as being medically responsible, reliable and that are independent of the government and offered by non-government organizations.
ENVIRONMENT

1. International cooperation presents a great opportunity to bolster the strength of the NIS conservation movement and find solutions for many environmental problems. Foreign assistance is crucial to the success of conservation activities in the NIS, especially during this time of economic crisis. The effectiveness of this assistance, however, will remain questionable unless some misunderstandings and unfounded expectations on both sides are resolved, and truly equitable partnerships are established between in-country conservation groups and their counterparts aboard.

2. Large projects should not be initiated until a group has proven its abilities and accountability through successful completion of a small project. Any initial projects should be suggested by the local group and not by the American partner.

3. Today, most conservation organizations are unprepared for the challenges introduced by capitalist realities and need careful assistance during the transition period. Facilitating this transition by helping conservation institutions acquire new strategies in program development and fundraising is a task of the highest priority in the contemporary conservation movement of the NIS.

AGRICULTURE

1. In an effort to strengthen ongoing Kazakhstani government efforts to institute policy and institutional reforms, U.S. PVO/NGO agricultural program support is needed for technical assistance and training for the following areas:

   * large and small agribusiness development
   * input and output market infrastructure development
   * extension and training
   * regional and domestic trade program support
   * public health and other human services

2. U.S. PVOs/NGOs will be needed to design and implement agricultural development programs which can strengthen the overall privatization initiatives already in place by helping to establish institutional and technical development programs to replace those no longer effective. These new programs could bridge the gap, and coexist with state enterprises, between state-directed and market-oriented agricultural production.

   * a field-based, regional approach would provide the most effective model and would strengthen complementary technical assistance being provided by a large number of foreign assistance programs at the national level.

   * this de-centralized approach would also increase the overall absorptive capacity for
technical and financial assistance of the agricultural sector by helping to establish model farms/ranches and agribusinesses, regionally based financial and marketing institutions and associated social welfare concerns.

#10: COMMUNICATIONS

1. The local NGO community needs inexpensive communications systems in order to grow and be effective in helping the country move more definitely towards democracy and a market economy.

2. Based on the importance of telecommunications to successful democratization and an effective market economy, the U.S. should make the development of this sector a high funding priority.

   * This priority should include proper consideration for alternative communications technologies such as digital radio and low earth orbiting satellites as tools that are almost instantly available to connect offices and projects within and between countries.

3. There is a great need for improved communications between local NGOs and between U.S. PVOs working in-country, as well as communications between U.S./Kazakhstani counterparts.

4. U.S. PVOs and NGOs need to learn more about Kazakhstan and potential counterpart partners. In-depth baseline data about their issues, organizations, membership and relevant laws and regulations governing the NGO sector must be collected.

5. U.S. PVOs with experience and expertise in communications and information technologies are needed for training in computers, information management systems, information dissemination, and local value added services.
This preliminary list is meant to be illustrative of the NGO sector and represents the organizations met by VEST team members. Contact names and addresses are in Appendix IV. Additional organizations, included in the section "Kazakhstani NGO Survey Data" (Appendix II), were obtained during an NGO Management Seminar.

**Almaty City Administration. Department on Relations with NGOs**
The primary purpose of this department is to provide support and assistance to NGOs in Almaty.

**Almaty City Ecology Center**
This organization is headed by a husband and wife team -- Marat A. Chimbulatov and Svetlana Nikitichna Mitrofanakay -- dedicated to a modern approach to environmental health which relates environmental conditions to health, demographics and economic and social development. In 1990 the Center received 3 million rubles from the government, and in 1992, 10 million rubles for the purpose of environmental assessments of soils, water and air. With these funds the Center has produced maps which clearly show the concentrations of certain harmful elements like heavy metals near their sources and around town. The data has been publicized through television and newspaper articles and presented to the city's Ecology Committee. Due to the economic situation, a lack of government funding has halted continued probing and prevented the establishment of a monitoring program. The organization's link to the government, by virtue of Mr. Chimbulatov's job as the city's Chief Ecologist and Chairman of the Committee on Ecology, has made it suspect among many in the local green movement; however, its work in the area of environmental health is impressive.

**Artists Union**
The Union represents professional artists. Its charter calls on it to support its members through a variety of programs and mechanisms, including advocacy, financial support and social activities. The Chairman of the Union is a former Kazakh People's Deputy, a nationally renowned artist, and a professor of arts and sculptor.

**Association for Ecological Enlightenment**
This 5-member unregistered NGO primarily supports the work of Aleksander Mikhailovich Panchenko, one of its leaders who has been independently running an environmental education program in local schools and kindergartens for almost 30 years. In addition, the group is interested in organic agriculture and general environmental problems.

**Biosphere**
This 10-member NGO established in 1988 is mainly composed of elderly people deeply concerned about the impact of the metal industries in Leninogorsk on the population. Fighting an industrial oligarchy, wholly employed by a lead zinc processing plant and other similar industries, they are trying to gather information and conduct research into the level of pollution in the area. They have an active media campaign and organize protests when possible; however, the city administration is a constant barrier and one factory has threatened to sue them.

**EKOM**
EKOM is Kazakhstan's oldest registered environmental NGO. The group has been extremely dynamic and innovative, pioneering new ways of using the press in campaigns against building apartment complexes on wetlands, and other environmentally hazardous projects. It is ahead of its local counterparts in fundraising. Several members are involved in small businesses, including EkoProm, an environmental technology corporation, and give generously to the group: The group is Slavic and has close ties to Slavia, a socio-political force in northern Kazakhstan associated with the Progressive Democratic Party.

---

Special appreciation goes to ISAR for their assistance in identifying many environmental NGOs.
Ecofund of Kazakhstan
This 20-member environmental NGO was established in 1988 and was formerly one of the largest environmental groups in Kazakhstan, receiving funding from the government for research and educational projects. It is, however, an organization in transition. It is reportedly diminishing in size and influence despite new sources of funding and excellent foreign contacts.

Eco-Union "Tablrait" and Green Party
The Union is an ambitious undertaking to create a large infrastructure of businesses, banks, and other institutions to support the Green Party, which like the Union is not very developed. Primarily focused on the threat to human health of Sor-Bulak, an overflowing sewage lake north of Almaty, this NGO has assembled detailed alternative plans to resolving the issue, which unfortunately do not involve reducing water waste in the city.

The Friendship Society
Established in 1947, the Friendship Society, headed by Zhibek Amirkhanova, is one of the oldest and largest "old guard" NGOs in Kazakhstan. During the Soviet period it was part of a network of Friendship Societies existing throughout the union for the purpose of establishing linkages and friendly relations with foreign NGOs. Its main objectives are to 1) promote Kazakhstan abroad, 2) host foreign delegations, 3) draft joint projects, 4) student exchange, and 5) promote city linkages (i.e. Sister Cities--Almaty and Tucson, Arizona). It has historically been subsidized by the central government in Moscow, is still housed in a baronial setting supported by the government. Its society is still well connected to people of influence in the public sector. However, its mission to promote linkages and partnerships with U.S. NGOs is very genuine and its capacity to be helpful is real.

Fund in Support of Ecological Education
The fund is another fast growing NGO in Kazakhstan. Each year they sponsor a science/ecology fair for students throughout the country and send the winners to Europe to participate in a larger competition. In addition, in collaboration with Danish partners, they manage a long-term project named "Sun City", an ecological compound outside of town which could support model educational, agricultural, and social projects associated with ecology and sustainable development.

Green Movement
This 30-member organization has been in existence since 1988. It is based in Djambul, the eastern region of the country. Its chair, Aleksander Pavlovich Zagribelni, has travelled to the United States and participated in the 1991 Rio Earth Summit. The group's paper "Oasis," reported extensively on industrial pollution and then, unfortunately, was forced to closed, having insulted the industrial leaders of Djambul. Despite these obstacles, short versions of the paper have appeared in the Russian environmental newspaper, "Spasenie," and the group continues to work.

Green Salvation
This five-member environmental NGO was established in 1990 and is involved in a variety of activities focused on environmental economics, forests, information exchange and sustainable development. Current undertakings include the School for Young Managers sponsored by the EEC, teacher training workshops, an ecological fair, and a cartographic project. The accomplishments are impressive given the fact that all five people are working on a voluntary basis.
Republican Publicity Information Agency

privately owned advertising agency also publishes a well-researched weekly newspaper titled "Business" which provides data on investment opportunities, laws governing the business community, and current data pertinent to the information needs of the commerce, trade, and banking sectors. It is a very valuable resource to entrepreneurs at all levels. The agency is headed by a dynamic and risk-taking woman, Olga Alexandrovna Filippova whose business acumen and dedication to serving the business community are truly commendable. The agency is supported through private corporate donations, advertisers, and newspaper sales. Its greatest challenge is access to reliable and free information. The fact that it is women-owned creates additional obstacles.

Intercollegiate Ecology Council

This 10-member NGO is more like a family than an organization. It is composed of professional educators concentrating on younger children and dedicating vacation time to inculcate ecological principles in them which have then been carried over into their academic and professional lives.

Karaganda Regional Ecology Center

This 10-member organization is trying to combine the motivation of an NGO with the power of a scientific institution. Its talented group of biologists studies biodiversity and ecology issues in central Kazakhstan.

Lop Nor-Semipalatinsk Ecological Committee

Lop Nor has one of the largest bases of support of any NGO in Central Asia. Officially a part of the environmental NGO Nevada-Semipalatinsk, it plans to splinter off in the near future. The groups focus is the threat caused by continued testing at the Chinese nuclear testing ground near Lop Nor in Eastern Turkestan, the Uighur homeland. Accordingly, much of the group's support comes from the Uyghur communities in Central Asia. With increasing international attention and more scientific information about the problem, the group is expanding rapidly and now has affiliates in Chilik, Bishkek, Tashkent, and soon in Djambul.

Memorial Movement

This movement was originally one of the most radically progressive Soviet-wide NGOs demanding that victims of Stalin's repression be rehabilitated. Its activities are now concentrated on issues of human rights and social justice.

Ministry of Justice, Department on the Affairs of Non-Governmental and Religious Organizations

The department handles the registration of both non-profit and religious organizations, as well as what is described as the "control over non-profit organizations." The Kazakhstani Constitution provides the guiding framework within which this office operates.

The "Pensioners Movement "Generation" ("Pokolenie")"

Headed by a committee of several dynamic and highly committed women who themselves are pensioners, this organization has a membership numbering in the thousands. The membership includes pensioners from a broad spectrum of society. They have substantial data to corroborate that pensioners are being seriously impacted by the current cutbacks in government social services and hyperinflation, which is causing a dramatic drop in their standard of living. The Movement has been quite successful in promoting the plight of the pensioners through the media. With its large membership list, experienced leadership, and extensive outreach among the elderly, the Movement would be an excellent partner to a U.S. PVO/NGO seeking to improve the lives of pensioners in Kazakhstan.

Nura

Nura focuses on industrial and mining problems, including the introduction of environmentally safe technologies and research into the impact of industrial pollutants on the health status of the population.
The Republican Center for Women and Children
Although the "non-governmental" status of this organization is questioned by some, its mission to assist women and children appears genuine.

Social Democratic Party
This small but growing political and social party is reportedly not yet registered but is nonetheless active in eleven regions of the country and has more than 300 members. Their platform emphasizes a "moderate" approach which places priority on human rights. It also believes that "evolution is better than revolution" and prefers a mixed economy to either a state-controlled or free market economy.

Union of Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises of Kazakhstan
After the collapse of the state-controlled, centralized supply and distribution system, there developed "unions of enterprises" which are run by former state functionaries, grouped together under another name, but perform the same monopolistic functions. Although groups such as these should be viewed with caution by U.S. NGOs, their potential for reform should not be ruled out.
SECTOR OBSERVATIONS

* The Law and Non-Governmental Organizations
* Small Business
* Health
* Women’s Issues
* Environmental Health
* Environmental NGOs
* Agriculture
* Communications
* Cross Sectoral: A Canadian Perspective
Introduction

A lawyer concerned for the welfare of nonprofit organizations and their constituencies throughout the world is, when visiting Kazakhstan, struck by two seemingly inconsistent facts. One is the intense interest in creating and sustaining nonprofit organizations in that country, albeit in the absence of much specific law. The other is the considerable use of nonprofit organizations in that country; the absence of specific legislation for the establishment of these entities has not slowed the impetus for development of a nonprofit sector there.

Unlike some of the other countries visited by the VEST team (principally Russia and Ukraine), there is not much of a private bar in Kazakhstan focusing on nonprofit organizations. (This basically requires representatives of these organizations to relate to the government on their own.) One explanation for this is that the Kazakhstani lawyers remain rather subservient to the government. As one government official told us, when it comes to challenging the government, the nation's lawyers are "pussy cats."

Terminology

As elsewhere in the Commonwealth of Independent States, one encounters in Kazakhstan the absence of clearly understood vocabulary to describe and discuss such concepts as philanthropy, charity, nonprofit organizations, non-governmental organizations, and the like. As the earlier VEST delegation to Russia and Ukraine had occasion to observe, our own well-developed "independent sector" in the United States also lacks a single term that describes perfectly what we mean when we are discussing institutions outside of government that organized for the benefit of the general public rather than to serve private interests. Three terms commonly used in the United States, "private voluntary organizations" ("PVOs"), "non-governmental organizations" ("NGOs"), and "nonprofit organizations," may each be under-inclusive, depending on the specific attributes of the organization in question.

As the earlier VEST delegation discovered, we concluded in Kazakhstan that the term "NGO" seemed generally the best of the available imperfect choices, although it proved necessary frequently to use additional modifying phrases to get our thoughts across clearly. The term NGO is generally used below to refer to both U.S.-based and Kazakhstani organizations. However, where reference is made to organizations registered under (or to be registered under) the Kazakhstani Law on Public Organizations or the Law on Religious Organizations, the terms "public organization" and "religious organization" are used.
Scope of Inquiry

During the VEST team's visit to Kazakhstan, attention was given to the existing and prospective systems of law that relate to NGOs. Inquiries were made in four areas, both with republic-level and local-level governmental authorities and with representatives of indigenous NGOs and their advisors:

1. The existing regulatory environment for NGOs (such as registration requirements);
2. The existing tax system as it affects NGOs;
3. Prospects for change in the regulatory environment for NGOs; and
4. Prospects for change in the tax system as it affects NGOs.

Legal Framework for Formation and Operation of NGOs

The Republic of Kazakhstan enacted a Law on Public Organizations in September of 1991. The law allows for the formation of NGOs in the Republic of Kazakhstan, and describes the powers of the government to regulate the formation of such organizations and their operation. The law predates the independence of Kazakhstan and the adoption of the Kazakhstani Constitution, but remains the basic legislation governing formation and operation of NGOs in Kazakhstan. A separate Law on Religious Organizations, adopted in December of 1991 and after the independence of Kazakhstan, governs the same matters with respect to religious organizations.

The Law on Public Organizations covers organizations of the following general types: "political parties, mass movements, trade unions, women's organizations, veterans' groups, scientific organizations, sports organizations, organizations for disabled persons, youth and children's organizations, other voluntary organizations, creative unions, foundations, organizations [sic], and other organizations of the citizens of Kazakhstan." These broad, and in some cases vague, categories are not defined further in the law. The Law on Religious Organizations covers all types of organizations connected with religion and worship. Some confusion surrounds the question of registration for a single organization formed both for the purpose of religious worship and to accomplish charitable objectives.

Under the Law on Public Organizations, NGOs can be formed by any ten persons, by the filing of the following with the Ministry of Justice: the charter of the organization; a copy of the minutes or "protocol" of the organizational meeting of the organization; a list of the ten or more persons initiating the organization (together with their addresses and telephone numbers); and any other data that may be necessary to prove qualification for registration under the Law on Public Organizations. The Ministry of Justice has up to two months in which to respond to an application for registration. The procedures for registering a religious association are similar, except that there is an additional requirement that the
initiators of the association be over the age of 18, and the Ministry of Justice has only one month in which to respond to the application for registration.

The Ministry of Justice interprets the Laws on Public Organizations and Religious Organizations to require any organization existing within the territorial jurisdiction of Kazakhstan to organize formally and register with the Ministry of Justice under one or the other of these laws. At the moment, however, the laws do not provide specific sanctions or any enforcement mechanism with respect to an organization that fails to register.

Officials of the Ministry of Justice told VEST team members that an organization denied registration may amend its charter to correct the defect preventing registration and then reapply. However, if the defect preventing registration was the type of purely technical problem correctable by such an amendment (as opposed to a substantive problem such as, for example, an organizational purpose determined by the Ministry of Justice to be illegal), the Ministry of Justice would be likely to try to take care of the problem through discussion with the organization and amendment of the charter during the initial registration process instead of denying the application for registration. Amendments to an organization's charter after registration require re-registration (although Ministry of Justice officials informed us this process would not be required in the case of "purely technical changes").

The Law on Public Organizations sets forth in only the most general terms the matters that must be covered in an organization's charter. The law does not require any particular governance structure (such as a minimum number of directors or specific officers), although an organization's charter must explain how the organization will be governed.

In addition to handling the registration of NGOs, the Ministry of Justice is also charged with supervising the operation of NGOs to assure compliance with the provisions of their respective charters. Ministry of Justice officials, however, informed us that in practice little such oversight is exercised because of insufficient resources and no effective monitoring system. The Public Prosecutor, a position akin to that of an Attorney General under U.S. law, has responsibility for assuring that registered public organizations comply generally with the laws of the Republic. The Ministry of Economics and Finance governs matters with respect to the funding of public organizations, and had jurisdiction over tax matters also prior to the creation of the new office of Tax Inspection, discussed below.

According to Ministry of Justice officials with whom we spoke, there is no prohibition against an NGO engaging in activities that result in earned income, whether or not such activities are related to the charitable purposes of the organization. Any NGO engaging in such activities, however, would be required to form a subsidiary organization for such purpose, and follow the registration procedures and other laws and regulations appropriate to
private, for-profit enterprises in Kazakhstan. This would include, among other things, registration of the NGO’s business subsidiary with the City Administration for the area in which its office is located, and compliance with the taxation requirements discussed below.

The actual experiences of both indigenous NGOs and small businesses in the registration of new entities, as recounted to VEST team members, suggests that the systems for registration and application of eligibility criteria do not yet operate entirely smoothly or consistently. It should also be stressed, however, as noted above, that the organizations applying for registration often do not have adequate counsel, there being few lawyers from the private bar who specialize in advising public organizations.

Apparently unique throughout the CIS is the fact that the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan makes provision (in Chapter 10) for "public organizations." This country may be the only one in the world that has elevated its law on NGOs to formal constitutional law status.

The constitution states that public organizations include political parties, "mass movements," professional and arts organizations, religious organizations, and "other organizations of citizens." It states that the "state provides enforcement of legal rights and legal interests of public organizations." It also states that the "interference of state organs and their officials into the activity of public organizations is unlawful," as is "interference of public organizations into the activity of state organs and their officials."

The legislation on public organizations enacted in 1991 (1) defines public organizations, (2) states the general statutory law based on the constitutional law provisions, (3) states the goals of this law, (4) provides for the creation of these organizations, (5) states the principles underlying the activities of public organizations, (6) provides for the types of public organizations, (7) provides special rules for political parties, mass movements, and unions, (8) contains rules for the formation of public organizations, (9) states the required contents of the charter of a public organization, (10) provides for the registration of public organizations, (11) address the matter of liquidation of public organizations, (12) provides for the rights and property-holding of public organizations, and (13) the basic responsibilities of public organizations.

The Ministry of Justice supervises the activities of NGOs that function nationwide. It is empowered to employ sanctions when the law is violated, such as monetary penalties and an injunction on program activities for up to six months; often, a warning is issued first. Kazakhstan is divided into 19 regions. If an NGO operates in more than one-half of these regions, it is subject to the national law. Otherwise, it is subject to registration at the local level. There is a separate law for religious organizations.

---

9 It was not clear to the VEST team that NGOs with business activities actually observe the requirement of a separately formed commercial subsidiary or what difference the failure for form a subsidiary makes in actual practice, since the laws on the formation of legal entities generally would appear to permit the formation of a subsidiary with an identical charter and membership.
Information derived during the visit was that 341 non-governmental organizations have been registered with the Ministry since September 1, 1991; 80 of these are charities. Over 2,000 NGOs have been registered locally. To date, 26 religious organizations have been registered. In Almaty, 467 NGOs have been registered since April 1, 1993. The delegation was advised that the "philosophy" underlying the regulation of NGOs by the Ministry is one of providing assistance to them, rather than placing regulatory burdens in their way. This "philosophy" is based on the above-quoted constitutional law provisions. The team was advised that there is "every opportunity" for U.S.-based charities to operate in Kazakhstan.

The most common means by which NGOs receive their funding is by means of business activities. Some contributions are received from corporations and individuals. The government can provide some support. (The law requires self-sufficiency by NGOs.)

There are no restrictions on lobbying or political activities by NGOs. However, the constitution states that "public organizations cannot be created if their activities promote or practice racial, national, social or religious hatred, or class exclusiveness which leads to forceful disobedience of constitutional order and ruin territorial unity of the republic." There is separate provision in the law for the formation and operation of political parties. A party may be formed by as few as 3,000 citizens. Although foreigners can generally participate (such as by being members) in the activities of NGOs, this is not the case with respect to political parties.

The Ministry of Justice has the authority to audit NGOs. Some organizations were, during the time of the VEST trip, said to be under "heavy investigation" for a seeming lack of charitable programs.

In this connection, it should be noted that U.S.-based nonprofit organizations are able to register in Kazakhstan, and perform their charitable and other activities there. Some of these activities are what may be called "capacity building" activities, that is, activities designed to provide assistance for indigenous NGOs. The extent of these activities under the law is, at best, unsettled. For all of its robustness, the nonprofit sector in Kazakhstan has a rather fragile relationship with its government; the latter, after all, is not used to these forces. One aspect of this matter is clear: particularly at this time, U.S. NGOs in Kazakhstan should avoid doing anything that would embarrass the Kazakhstani government (or, for that matter, the U.S. government).
Technical Cooperation Provided by VEST Initiative

Members of the VEST team provided the following types of technical assistance and cooperation:

1. We met with various individuals representing (or seeking to create) NGOs in Kazakhstan. They raised a variety of legal issues (one of the most prevalent was the ability of NGOs to compensate directors, officers, and employees), which were addressed principally from the U.S. point of view. Our perspective on our law as it relates to their questions provided help and triggered considerable discussion as to how Kazakhstani laws might address the point.

2. We met with a few lawyers in Kazakhstan with an interest in NGOs and discussed various aspects of the law with them. (As noted, these individuals were hard to come by.)

3. We participated in conferences and a seminar, providing technical cooperative assistance in that fashion. The principal seminar that was held in this regard was particularly well-attended. (One aspect of the burgeoning nonprofit sector there was evident when the two lawyers in the delegation were repeatedly asked to tell those assembled the "real reason" we were there; lawyers volunteering time to help NGOs remains, literally, a foreign concept.)

In all of the above settings, the VEST team encountered generally quite a receptive attitude towards the sharing of experience in the regulation and administration of the NGO sector, and considerable interest in specific information about the legal and regulatory climate for NGOs in the United States. Lawyer-to-lawyer consultations indicated a particularly strong interest in the development of mentoring relationships to facilitate the development of a legal framework for the organization and administration of indigenous Kazakhstani NGOs.

Recommendations

The following recommendations focus specifically on the development of law and administrative systems applicable to the emerging Kazakhstani NGO sector:

1. Technical assistance is urgently needed with respect to the conceptualization and drafting of further legislation regulating the formation and governmental oversight of Kyrgyzstani NGOs. Many of the concerns expressed by governmental officials with respect to the inadequacies and vagaries of the current legal framework certainly will require legislative attention; the manner in which these changes are undertaken will have profound implications for the further development of the NGO sector in Kazakhstan.
2. Governmental officials, NGO leaders, and their private advisors would all be well served by the development of a legal "how to" manual for the formation and administration of NGOs in Kazakhstan. Involving all these parties in the development of such a manual would have the additional benefit of establishing or reenforcing lines of communications between these parties -- something that is vital to all in the current fast-changing environment.

3. Policy dialogue is needed generally on the development of appropriate delineations between the governmental sector, the private for-profit sector and the NGO sector. Clearly, the objective of such dialogue need not simply be the recreation of the sectoral delineations observed in the United States or other Western democracies.

4. Additional seminars are needed for lawyers and non-lawyers. The latter are hungry for information about the appropriate ways to form and foster NGOs. The group of the former needs to be bolstered, so that the NGO sector in Kazakhstan can receive independent legal advice to enhance and increase its members.

NGOs in Kazakhstan are tax-exempt organizations. There is an individual income tax, but no charitable contribution deduction. However, there is a charitable contribution deduction for gifts from corporations, up to two percent of the amount given.

A lawyer from the West is bemused to find that Kazakhstani NGOs are funded principally by business activities, rather than contributions, grants, and/or dues. The present state of affairs there is much like the legal environment in the U.S. in the middle of this century. (The U.S. Congress, in 1950, created a law containing the "feeder organization" concept (see below) and the scheme of taxation of unrelated business income, to discourage commercial activity by nonprofit -- particularly charitable -- organizations.) Given the economic base in Kazakhstan at this time, this approach to the funding of nonprofit programs seems unavoidable. Nonetheless, the Western bias serves up the hope that the country of Kazakhstan will prosper and enable the NGOs there to rely less on commercial enterprise for funding and more on contributions, grants, and the like.

Kazakhstani law contains what is known in U.S. law as the "destination-of-income test," which is that a business that is created by an NGO and feeds all of its net income to that NGO does not have to pay an income tax, in that all of its funds paid to the NGO are fully deductible. As noted above, these organization rely heavily on business activities for their funding. The law encourages separate enterprises for these for-profit activities.

36
I.

Background

There is a wide-spread, if not general, belief with respect to the former Soviet republics and other recently post-communist states, that small-scale non-governmental commercial enterprises are critical to the task of democratization, and social and economic development. In Kazakhstan, not only do United States and other Western development experts and policymakers declare their interest in developing the microenterprise sector, but also some Kazakhstani policy-makers (or at least policy-influencers), both inside the government and (at

10 A few words are in order about terminology. On the ground in Almaty, one notes immediately that the terms used to describe the small-scale nongovernmental commercial enterprise sector and the activities of that sector are not always carefully or consistently employed. Is "small business" the same as "microenterprise" in the mind of the average informed Kazakhstani? The U.S. development professional accustomed to considering closely such questions of linguistic precision quickly realizes that these distinctions are all at a level of refinement simply impractical for the environment, at least at present. I noticed that translators, for example, often used such terms interchangeably, even after our having attempted to discuss nuance together. This provides insight also into the mind-set of the VEST team's audience when we were visiting the various enterprises, institutions and individuals with whom or which we discussed this general topic.

For purposes of my observations here, I have chosen to use "microenterprise" exclusively instead of "small business." The former term covers more, and therefore I find it better suited to the task of describing the chaos of different possible forms of organization and approaches to raising capital encountered throughout Kazakhstan's emerging private sector. The GEMINI Project in its Draft Field Summary on Kazakhstan noted the following apparently distinct possible forms of private sector enterprise in the relevant registry, none of which appeared to have a well developed legal or even popular definition: limited partnerships, small enterprises, small private enterprises, auction companies (joint stock), brokers, associations, collective enterprises, cooperatives, corporations, concerns, and joint ventures. See K. Angell, J. Boomgard, M. Malhofra and R. Rodriguez, Draft Field Study, A Strategy for Developing Small Private Business in Kazakhstan, Development Alternatives, Inc., October 1992.

To complicate terminology matters further, Kazakhstan's somewhat equivocating movement towards privatization of former government enterprises has led to a dizzying array of entities that are not clearly either privately or government owned or controlled. I have used the terms "private" and "nongovernmental" to denote only organizations in which neither government ownership nor legal control exceeds fifty percent.

For the VEST team members perhaps the most difficult terminological task lay in communicating what we meant, and understanding what our counterparts meant, by the term "nongovernmental organization" or even "nonprofit organization." The lack of clear sectoral definition is something that the broader U.S. nongovernmental organization ("NGO") community will have to take into consideration in a myriad of ways when becoming involved in Kazakhstan, as I discuss further below.
least arguably) outside of it.

The U.S. non-governmental organization ("NGO") sector might well consider itself in a good position to analyze and help supply the technical and material assistance needed to give a healthy thrust to the development of the private microenterprise sector in Kazakhstan. Considerable attention has been addressed recently to the question of adapting successful microenterprise development techniques from other parts of the globe for use in the United States. In 1992, the Self-Employment Learning Project of the Aspen Institute produced a directory of U.S.-based microenterprise programs that identified over 100 such programs, providing a broad range of both technical assistance and small-scale credit to stimulate microenterprise as an employment- and income-generator. Warren Weaver Fellow Jacqueline Novogratz has recently produced a thoughtful and thorough study examining the potential of such microenterprise programs as a community revitalization intervention.

Despite apparent consensus on the importance of microenterprise in Kazakhstan, the VEST team's observations and the recent analytical data with respect to the potential of microenterprise development programs from the U.S. suggest some substantial barriers to the establishment of partnerships between U.S. NGOs and indigenous groups in Kazakhstan aimed at fostering the development of the microenterprise sector. A number of these barriers merit particular mention:

1. The recent U.S. scholarship on microenterprise development programs suggests that the presence of a number of key factors in any given situation enhances the likelihood of success of such programs, and in Kazakhstan the VEST team noted the conspicuous absence of several of these factors. Kazakhstan has little of the established micro-entrepreneurial traditions common to the "informal sectors" of many developing countries, leading to increased need for entrepreneurial training. Competition from the "formal sector" of the economy, still dominated by the government, reduces opportunities for the development of a robust microenterprise sector from roots

---


13 Jacqueline Novogratz has identified five "contextual reasons" conditioning the success of microenterprise development programs patterned after the pioneering Grameen Bank model in Bangladesh. These include: the preexistence of a large and fairly sophisticated "informal sector"; isolation of would-be micro-entrepreneurs from competition from the formal sector; long-standing traditions of small-scale trading, reducing training costs; absence of a well-developed welfare system or system of access of credit for would-be micro-entrepreneurs, leaving few options other than microenterprise; and high pricing of conventional business development credit that limits the potential for working capital growth. Novogratz, Hopeful Change, supra at 10.
in the "informal sector." Also important is the keen recollection of would-be micro-entrepreneurs of the well-developed social welfare system that, until the break-up of the Soviet Union, filled the gap that "informal sector" income fills in many developing countries.

2. Beyond the absence of certain factors that have been linked with success of microenterprise development programs elsewhere in the globe, the fostering of microenterprise in Kazakhstan is hindered by the fact that the lacking inputs are so numerous and so wide-ranging. This means that microenterprise development strategies must be designed to supply a variety of technical and material assistance, rather a single missing element. 14

3. Certain attitudinal legacies of Kazakhstan's position within the old Soviet system also impede microenterprise development. The various dampening effects of leninist ideology on individual economic initiative are perhaps obvious to many. A subtler attitudinal legacy of the old economic order is the widespread economic risk-adverseness of would-be micro-entrepreneurs. The semi-colonial status of Kazakhstan prior to the break-up of the Soviet Union has also affected the attitudinal climate for microenterprise development. Would-be micro-entrepreneurs face difficulty identifying promising opportunities for the development of the type of small-scale local markets that would be the life-blood of microenterprise in part because their prior economic experience is exclusively with fueling the raw material and macro-production needs of a vast empire.

4. Kazakhstan's semi-colonial position within the old Soviet Union is also linked to another (and more abstract) potential dampener on the development of microenterprise. Kazakhstan's unique history of forced settlement and resettlement of different ethnic groups has left a patch-work of tremendous ethnic diversity, with roughly even numbers of ethnic Russians and ethnic Kazakhs comprising somewhere close to 80% of the total. Exploration of ethnic distinctness, made possible first by glasnost and then by Kazakhstan's independence, has already led to a situation where many of the formerly dominant ethnic Russians wonder about their position in the new economic order, where some ethnic Kazakhs ask themselves why the ethnic Russians even remain in the republic, and where the remaining ethnic groups are all too easily ignored entirely. The problem of "brain drain" from the migration of ethnic Russians concerns some government policy-makers, as do the prospects for and dangers of radical ethnic and religious "nationalism." The instability of the situation and uncertainty as to government's longer-range response are barriers to investment in all sectors and at all levels of the economy, including the microenterprise level.

14 This is the conclusion of the GEMINI Project's Draft Field Summary in Kazakhstan, and it is borne out by the VEST team's observations.
5. The greatest complex of barriers to the development of microenterprise in Kazakhstan may well be continuing government control and influence over raw materials, credit, transportation, and distribution channels. Privatization of macro-economic institutions has been slow and often only partially accomplished where it has been attempted. Furthermore, even wholly private, large-scale economic institutions, such as, for example, the new private banks, are not necessarily receptive to the needs of would-be micro-entrepreneurs, preferring to work with each other and large-scale foreign investors and expressing doubt about the economic viability of small-scale economic ventures.

6. A final potential barrier to partnerships focused on microenterprise development between U.S. NGOs and indigenous groups stems from the continuing lack of clear sectoral definition in Kazakhstan. Not only is there difficulty in identifying which entities can truly be said to be "non-governmental," but clarity is also lacking as to the distinction between the private commercial sphere and the charitable and philanthropic sphere. The issue of "private inurement" (the channelling of benefits from the operation of charitable and philanthropic organizations to specific involved individuals) is identified by some leaders of the emerging indigenous NGO sector as one that must be addressed, but to date it has not received much attention. Against this backdrop, the concept of NGOs that exist for the purpose of fostering business (even if only small business) is confusing to many. Some view the concept with skepticism, assuming that NGO assistance for commercial activities really means misuse of charitable resources to advance the interests of un-needy individuals involved.

Despite the significance of the above and other barriers to microenterprise development in Kazakhstan, there are also a number of factors worthy of consideration as opportunities for the development of the sector. Among these are the following:

1. Education levels are very high among would-be micro-entrepreneurs. This suggests that while training needs may be greater than in countries with well-established entrepreneurial traditions, the needed training may also be more easily accomplishable than in environments where basic education is lacking.

2. Groups with which the VEST team met generally demonstrated strong commitment to their objectives, whether economic or social, suggesting a higher likelihood that projects undertaken will be followed through upon. This impressed VEST team members particularly in the case of some of the newly emerging NGOs, which may themselves turn out to be surprisingly fruitful prospects for demonstration projects in microenterprise development as discussed further below.
3. Though Kazakhstanis may lack well-developed entrepreneurial traditions, both past and present experience has led to a pragmatic attitude among many groups that will continue to be helpful to them in adjusting and responding to their fast-changing environment. Such pragmatism may prove of greater value to would-be entrepreneurs in the short range than many "rules" of microenterprise development that might be borrowed from the experience of other countries.

4. A possibly important "opportunity" for microenterprise development in Kazakhstan stems paradoxically from the same lack of clear sectoral distinction between the governmental, private nonprofit, and private for-profits spheres identified above as a potential barrier to partnerships focused on microenterprise development. This lack of distinction is particularly evident in the prevalence of the use of small-scale commercial activity as a primary means of raising funds to support indigenous NGOs. This practice is fostered by tax rules that allow essentially unlimited income tax deductions to commercial enterprises for moneys donated to NGOs and that would allow NGOs to operate essentially tax-free wholly owned commercial subsidiaries. The linking of a charitably focused NGO and a microenterprise operated to fund the NGO creates a potentially hospitable environment for individuals to learn microenterprise development skills while at the same time advancing the charitable purposes served by the NGO.

The observations of the VEST team indicate that despite all impediments, microenterprise will be critical to the development of a market economy in Kazakhstan and to generating employment and income for millions of Kazakhstanis for whom the government and government-run enterprises are no longer able or willing to provide. Microenterprise remains the "lowest-tech" way to begin the necessary processes of market conversion in the current chaotic economic and political situation, and it is a sphere in which the potential for positive "spill-over" effect and teaching by example is great. The concept of supporting charitably-focused indigenous NGOs by microenterprise suggests an excellent place to begin work on the development of the microenterprise sector in Kazakhstan. The NGO sector is an area in which there already exists great acceptance of the concept of microenterprise. Moreover, it is an area where an organizational "infrastructure" is already in place, however underdeveloped. Finally, the concept of charitable and social projects supported by microenterprise creates the opportunity to leverage participants' commitment to the social goals of the NGO to bolster their investment in the economic goals of the microenterprise.
II. Findings

A. About the VEST Team’s Methods

The observations set forth here with respect to the microenterprise sector in Kazakhstan and possibilities for partnership between U.S. NGOs and Kazakhstani groups to foster microenterprise development are based on conversations with smaller-scale entrepreneurs, Kazakhstani government officials, a variety of Kazakhstani NGOs, representatives of U.S. NGOs that already have begun program activities in Kazakhstan, and representatives of USAID and the United States Embassy in Almaty. We also visited public markets, galleries and stores where private merchants sell privately produced wares. We focused particular attention on artisanry and crafts, because this has been an area of proven potential for income generation from microenterprise in other countries, because it is an area in which microentrepreneurs have already established a visible market presence in Kazakhstan, and because the Republic enjoys a variety of long and rich cultural traditions to be drawn upon in developing and trading in crafts through microenterprise.

B. The NGO Sector

The VEST team discussed with U.S. Ambassador to Kazakhstan [William Courtney] our observation that many NGO leaders remained closely tied to the state-owned enterprises (commercial, industrial, educational) where they had held positions of influence prior to independence. The Ambassador noted that this phenomenon, while it may suggest to westerners at least the potential for conflict of interest, nonetheless provides for an important learning and proving ground for different types of leadership skills that will prove necessary under the new economic order. The emerging NGO sector itself can benefit from the knowledge, skills and connections of those who occupied the upper echelons of the old order.

As observed in the introductory sections of this report, the non-profit sector in Kazakhstan presents a logical place to try pilot microenterprise development projects, because of the tax exemption on business income of NGOs, among other reasons. The high caliber of personnel available in the nascent NGO sector -- including the influential figures from the old order now searching for a new place and purpose -- offers a further reason to consider fostering microenterprise development through NGOs. U.S. partner NGOs can play a valuable communicative role, bringing together groups of the disparate types discussed in the introductory sections of this report around issues of shared concern, and helping groups of all the different types to engage in policy dialogue with the government.

C. Women’s Issues

Soviet-era rhetoric about economic and social equality of the sexes notwithstanding, business activity in Kazakhstan -- including microenterprise -- retains a marked sexual division of labor. A newly created private firm that we visited developing handcrafts for tourist sales
and export illustrates the situation common to many new small businesses. The firm’s management team includes only men, because, we were told, these are the individuals with access to raw materials and markets. The artisans themselves include both men and women, but few tasks are performed by both sexes. Instead men operate machinery and engage in the traditionally male arts of wood carving and silver-smithing, while women execute the intricate hand-painting and finishing of products.

One possible sphere of microenterprise development in which women and men appear to operate on more equal footing is small-scale private trading. This sphere, though still embryonic, is burgeoning, at least in urban areas. The development of this sphere of commercial activity presents a variety of opportunities to aspiring women entrepreneurs.

Another sphere in which opportunities for women micro-entrepreneurs seems promising is the NGO sector itself. As already observed, the NGO sector offers a potentially hospitable arena in which to develop microenterprises as income generators for NGO purposes. Women already hold leadership positions within many NGOs, particularly those of the "survivalist" type, and as leaders in NGO-supporting commercial activities would offer valuable role models to other women interested in microenterprise.

D. Prerequisites for Creating Good Partnerships

Perhaps the most basic prerequisite for good partnerships between U.S. and Kazakhstani NGOs aimed at fostering microenterprise development is an understanding on the part of the U.S. partner of the respects in which the climate for microenterprise development in Kazakhstan differs from the microenterprise development climate both in the United States and elsewhere in the developing world. Both the barriers to and opportunities for microenterprise development discussed in the background paragraphs of this report section distinguish the task of microenterprise development in Kazakhstan from the same task in other environments. An understanding of the attitudinal legacies left over from seventy years for Soviet rule are particularly important.

Another factor that U.S. NGOs will need to bear in mind is the general lack of familiarity that potential Kazakhstani partner NGOs will have with the traditions and motivations that drive charitable activity in the United States. This lack of familiarity has a tendency to breed mistrust of our motives, whether the Kazakhstani partner is an "old guard" group, a "survivalist" group, a "power seeker" group, or possesses attributes of all three. We must

15 For example, a large government owned department store in downtown Almaty previously left virtually vacant due to the breakdown in distribution channels between the republics of the former Soviet Union now houses a myriad of independently owned and operated trading counters hocking apparel, household goods, crafts, tools, bootleg video tapes and audio cassettes, and variety of services such as sewing machine repair and jewelry engraving. Similarly, along roads leading out of the capital informal produce and food product markets have sprung up selling various privately farmed and produced goods.
convince "old guard" organizations that we are not a threat to them if they become partners in the development of a robust, independent NGO community. We must convince the "survivalist" and "power seeker" groups that we exercise policy judgment independent of our own government and that we will not allow ourselves nor encourage our Kazakhstani partners to become simply unquestioning proponents of either our government's policy objectives or theirs.

In general, the emerging Kazakhstani NGO community still requires substantial education about the possibilities for a healthy, independent, yet ultimately mutually supportive relationship between government and both the private and NGO sectors. Teaching this understanding is a basic prerequisite of effective partnerships, and the VEST Initiative made good progress towards this objective. Government institutions in Kazakhstan, too, generally lack sufficient understanding of the relationship between a vital and independent NGO sector and its government, although we saw some hope of teaching such understanding.

Besides an awareness of the peculiar and volatile aspects of the emerging NGO sector in Kazakhstan and its relationship to government, potential U.S. partner organizations will need to be attentive to the complex and fast-changing ethnic dynamics at play in the Republic. The ethnicity of participants in Kazakhstani NGO partner organizations will seldom, if ever, be irrelevant to effective cooperation, even in the case of multi-ethnic organizations. It is unclear how long U.S. NGOs active in Kazakhstan will be able to rely on the use of the Russian language as a "lingua franca" for conducting their activities without being identified in at least some minds as allied exclusively with the ethnic Russian sector of the population.

**Most Useful Forms of Assistance to Central Asian Counterparts and Potential Partners and Partnership Resources**

Despite a number of important obstacles, assistance to the development of artisan production and marketing holds significant promise. To be sure, crafts will have limited potential for fostering microenterprise for some time to come, because of the limited nature of potential markets. Large scale tourism will be a long time in developing, and export will be extremely difficult until currency exchange and banking affairs stabilize. U.S. NGO assistance to craft development projects is worth undertaking nonetheless for a number of reasons: because of richness of available resources and traditions;¹⁷ because it is an

---

¹⁶ This is understandably hard for many groups to believe, given the importance of U.S. government funding to NGOs. The VEST team members found, however, that candor about the tensions some U.S. NGOs feel on the issue of maintaining policy autonomy while accepting governmental funding went a long way to convincing Kazakhstani groups of our sincerity and independence.

¹⁷ The list includes: exquisitely painted tiny wooden figurines, carved accessories, combined turned and carved wooden and metal-plated accessories, fur hats and other fur accessories, silver and silver-substitute jewelry and table accessories with locally mined semi-precious stones based on ancient traditions, carpets and other wool and camel-hair weaving, and various items of ethnic significance with souvenir potential such as working folk-instruments, dolls, miniature replicas of features of nomadic life, and toys.
Inherently low-infrastructure activity that can be started easily on a small scale; and because
the existing market to the relatively large number of foreigners visiting Kazakhstan for
business reasons is presently underexploited and not dominated by government-owned or
controlled competition.

Many existing craft items would be vastly more marketable immediately to foreigners with
relatively minor product redesign assistance, which would also help ready products for
eventual export potential when the currency and banking situation has stabilized. Other new
products, both for immediate sales to foreigners and eventual export, are promising, based
on strong ethnic traditions, high skill and quality levels, and local availability of appropriate
materials without the need for substantial imports. 18

A U.S. craft product development specialist could work with any of a number of existing
small craft enterprises 19 and individual artisans on design and production changes that
would enhance marketability.20 The resulting products could be sold through NGO-
connected stores and galleries.21 Both the stores and galleries and the artisan groups
themselves would be in the market for a variety of microenterprise-related technical
assistance:

1. Effective merchandising for the foreigner market is an area of great need, and any
partner able to offer merchandising assistance to the microenterprise sector, whether
NGO-connected or independent retailers, could be useful.22

2. Even though optimal factors are missing for a Grameen Bank model small-scale credit
program, cooperation might well be possible between U.S. NGOs providing
extremely small-scale credit in order to assist artisan-producers who are unable to

---

18 Ethnically-inspired fashion apparel is a possibility. Aid to Artisans has been successful in other
countries with strong surviving traditions of ethnic attire, with exchange programs bringing U.S. fashion
designers to work with indigenous designers and small-scale clothing producers.

19 The VEST team visited, for example, the production facilities of Kazcommerse-Zhebe, Ltd., a
promising small artisans’ enterprise and workshop producing a variety of high quality small wooden items and
traditional Kazakh jewelry.

20 Aid to Artisans could be an appropriate partner for such a project.

21 The Central State Museum of the Kazakhstan Republic subleases commercial space to a variety of
private craft dealers. A social service NGO such as, for example, the League of Pensioners “Generation,”
might advantageously open a small store there. The Artists’ Union of Kazakhstan owns a large gallery space
which it hopes to develop as an income-generator for the organization and its individual artist-members who
have been left entirely without markets for their work. The space would be another appropriate location for
a fine crafts outlet.

22 An example would be advise from The Museum Store Association of America on the use of the
Union of Artists gallery space or the retail spaces at the Central Museum.
work the current chaotic credit system due to lack of connections. The concept of "credit circles" could be valuable to re-instill values of collective enterprise in the market context.

3. Basic business organization assistance and cost accounting training would be invaluable, since virtually no one in Kazakhstan has experience in market-driven business planning and product pricing.

These latter types of technical cooperation would also be appropriate to microenterprises other than those focused on crafts. Post-harvest production development, for example, is both a vital need in the agricultural sector in Kazakhstan and an area of substantial microenterprise development potential. Small-scale credit initiatives, basic business organization, and cost accounting training would be extremely valuable in the development of low-tech, post-harvest food processing, cotton- and wool-based textile manufacture and cottage industry garment production.

III. Recommendations: Opportunities for Action
That will Make a Difference

From the observations above regarding the potential for microenterprise development in Kazakhstan, the following specific recommendations emerge:

1. A logical place to begin microenterprise development projects in Kazakhstan is within the NGO sector itself, both as a means of generating funds for NGO activities and as a model for eventual application in the private for-profit sector. The full panoply of microenterprise development technical and material assistance available through U.S. NGOs is needed. The GEMINI Project's suggested strategy of choosing specific organizations to work with on all aspects of microenterprise development so as to set an example for others to follow is particularly promising in the NGO sector. This is because an existing organizational infrastructure is already in place and because of the commitment of NGO volunteers to their causes (which makes the prospects for the success of related microenterprises greater than microenterprises spurred only by the ordinary private sector motivations).

23 The Trickle-Up Program is only one of a number of U.S.-based, internationally active small-scale credit facilitators that might be appropriate partners for such a project. The work of ACCION, while focused to date on the Americas, would appear potentially adaptable to use in Kazakhstan.

24 Such training might be available through volunteers from Volunteers In Technical Assistance or the International Executive Service Corps, or through Aid to Artisans in cooperation with a U.S. business school such as Yale or Wharton with which Aid to Artisans has worked on such projects in the past.

25 Appropriate U.S. partners for microenterprise development focused on post-harvest production might be Techno-Serve or the Institute for Social and Economic Development.
2. A logical place to begin fostering NGO-connected microenterprise is with the tourism/foreigner market for crafts. Although general tourism development is longer-range prospect for Kazakhstan, Almaty is presently visited by many foreign business people, most of whom could be convinced to buy crafts following some effective product development and improvement of merchandising.

3. Non-craft microenterprise for local consumption is also possible, since many local needs are not locally satisfied. Small-scale post-harvest food and textile production, and production of household items and garments are all possible. A coordinated strategy, however, would be required, since alternative sources of raw materials, transportation and marketing channels would all be necessary to avoid dependence on inherently undependable government-owned or controlled sources.

4. There exists a possible opportunity for U.S. NGOs to help bridge a gap between the Kazakhstani government and emerging indigenous NGO community and between different sectors of the indigenous NGO community.

5. Work is needed on a practical strategy for export, since local markets for crafts and other microenterprise products are presently small and can be anticipated to be slow in developing.
All key indicators show a worsening health situation. Between 1987 and 1989, the maternal mortality ratio rose by 33 percent to 53.1 per 100,000 live births. The Ministry of Health now estimates that the maternal mortality ratio reached 67 per 100,000 by the end of 1992. Similarly, infant mortality rates are thought to be rising - from 25.9 per 1000 in 1970 to 44 per 1000 in 1990.

Women attribute their declining health to poor food and rising environmental pollution. Anemia is common, among 50 to 80 percent of women in many areas, and all women in the Aral Sea region are anemic. Economic stress has increased the number of divorces, now one in three marriages, and also contributed to a sharp increase in the number of abandoned children.

Knowledge and attitudes about physical handicaps reflect a Soviet heritage. We were told that physically handicapped adults can bear normal children. We were also told that the number of handicapped children increased from 47,000 in 1990 to 51,000 in 1991. This data may reflect an emerging awareness that handicapped children exist and are no longer hidden from society. There seems to be a very high number of children who suffer from birth injuries. We were told that one child in ten is 'defective'.

It is extremely difficult to import pharmaceuticals because duty is now charged on all imported goods. Moreover, banking transactions are very slow, taking at least two months. One Ministry of Health official described sending 800 million rubles to Moscow to buy medicines and the money vanished without a trace. Because the prevalence of encephalitis is very high in May and June, and the country had no gamma globulin, the Ministry this time sent a staff member to Moscow with 200,000 rubles to purchase gamma globulin. As of the end of May, this person had not returned.

As in other countries, the Soviets created an extensive system of milk kitchens to ensure adequate nutritional levels for infants and young children. The milk supply system has collapsed. Following a USAID-sponsored conference on breast feeding in Almaty in January, many physicians who attended now give strong vocal support to exclusive breast feeding on demand for the first five or six months of infancy. A few recognize the relationship between breastfeeding on demand and the benefits to the baby and mother of rooming-in while in the hospital. For most, however, the old system of feeding every three and a half hours on schedule is still firmly entrenched.

Many physicians seem unexpectedly open to understanding and adopting new technologies. They recognize the severity of the challenges they face. They know their skills need
updatina and seek opportunities for training in the state. Their fatigue and open honesty are
very moving. Others have invested too much for too long in a system that did little to
encourage questioning or reasoning.

Medical Infrastructure

The medical infrastructure created by the Soviet system included a huge network of clinics
and hospitals which provided free, accessible care to all. Each of the 19 oblasts (regions) has
a hospital in which family planning clinics have recently been established. Oblasts are
divided into a total of 250 rayons (districts) each with a central hospital serving 70,000 to
100,000 population. There are 220 maternity hospitals and 686 women’s consulting centers
in the rayon level. Each oblast has a Chief Nurse and a council of nurses and midwives.
There are approximately 15,000 midwives in the country.

The system is highly controlled. There are official specifications of exact periods of
hospitalization for every medical problem. Prescribed recovery periods are closely followed.
The average hospital stay is reported to be 15 days (compared to 5 days in the U.S.). There
is an extremely low ratio of patients to doctors, midwives and nurses.

Although the underlying principle of Soviet socialized medicine was equality of care and
universal access, the reality is a multi-tiered, highly stratified system of care and facilities.
Special facilities, particularly in Almaty, are far superior to those found elsewhere.

While the infrastructure is highly comprehensive and reaches even the most remote areas, the
quality of care within the system varies greatly. In all hospitals and clinics, knowledge and
practices required to control infection are weak.

Old practices, often based on misconceptions or lack of knowledge continue. The one
exception to this appears to be the Republic Scientific Research Institute on Maternal and
Child Health. We saw women who had been flown in from rural areas because of potential
birth complications, waiting for C-sections. Babies were rooming in with their mothers, a
few of whom were breast-feeding. The overall approach to maternal care seemed exemplary
- a source of change and modernization for the rest of the country. The contrast between
their approach to maternal care and that practiced in Maternity Hospital #2 was marked.

In Almaty, Maternity House # 2, a hospital which serves the entire city, accepts the most
difficult obstetric cases. With 160 beds, it is staffed by 37 physicians and 244 nurses. Here,
12 to 14 percent of deliveries are by C-section, well above the over-all average for Almaty of
5 percent. When the team asked the director of the hospital, Dr. Ludmilla Odarchenko,
about the basic health status of the women and newborns, Dr. Odarchenko became very
cautious. On our brief tour through the hospital, we observed several donated incubators, but
no fetal monitoring equipment. Sanitary conditions were consistent with those in other
hospitals. Although this is a resource for the entire city, we did not observe anything other
than traditional Soviet-style medicine being practiced.

Pharmaceutical supplies, which formerly came from Hungary, have stopped and there are critical shortages of anesthetics, antibiotics, drugs, and even vitamins and folic acid. While supplies of gloves are severely depleted, supplies of syringes are adequate because of recent humanitarian assistance shipments. Previous acute shortages of measles and BCG vaccines have been eased through support from the U.S. and UNICEF. (There is a high level of confidence that more humanitarian assistance will be forthcoming in the last quarter of 1993, but we were unable to obtain assurances that this was true.)

Women's Health

Only 28 percent of women are said to have ever practiced family planning while 15 percent are current users. The IUD is the most common method used although there are strong complaints about Russian-manufactured IUDs. IUDs and oral contraceptives are available in pharmacies, but most women are uninformed or quite negative about them. Because demand is so limited, supplies are always available. As recently as five years ago, the pill was characterized by governmental propaganda as a Western invention with unhealthy side effects for both women and children.

Abortions, the most common method of family planning, equal the number of births (or may exceed them due to incomplete reporting). Women, who do not consider them harmful, report having a life-time average of at least five abortions. Physicians consider reliance on abortion as a leading cause of poor health and infertility among women. It is difficult to estimate the real number of abortions for two reasons: incomplete data due to abortions performed outside government clinics, and the definition of "abortion" itself. The current definition, which does not conform with WHO definition, includes deaths of fetuses between 22 and 28 weeks. There seems to be general support for making other contraceptives available, but there is little if any demand.

In 1989 the total fertility rate for Kazakhs was 3.58, compared to 2.24 for Russians in Kazakhstan. These data help to explain what appears to be a very divided and inconsistent approach to a general population policy. Historically, and at the macro level, the former Soviet government was very pronatalist and encouraged high birth rates by promoting various incentives for large families. Mothers with twelve or more living children were rewarded with a gold ring. Newly married couples under thirty years of age were given a loan to help them start a family. With each birth, the loan was reduced, and completely forgiven after the third birth. Families with four children under seven also received a bonus. Clubs were started for parents of 'families with many children'. These parents still consider it the duty of the state to help them because they have so many children.

The "families with many children" are generally Kazakh families. Their high fertility levels reflect their traditional culture and the historic if loose ties to Islam. Fifteen percent of these
families have seven or more children. The former Soviet government was concerned about the rapid growth rates of so-called Islamic peoples. The current government recognizes that high fertility rates directly contribute to higher female and infant mortality rates for the Kazakh population than found in the Russian population. The government has now begun to place information about birth spacing on television, and in newspapers and local journals.

In Almaty, the Supreme Soviet is placing special emphasis on developing assistance strategies for "large families", those with four or more children. They are working to enact "a decree for social protection for large families" which will guarantee an allowance equal to the current minimum wage for the increasing numbers of newly unemployed women who have four or more children. (Unemployed women with fewer than four children would not be covered by this legislation.) The number of large families has declined from 196,000 to 186,000 in the past five years, a fact government officials attribute to economic difficulties.

Non-Governmental Organizations

There are strong links between the Supreme Soviet and several long established health and welfare societies relating to women and children. The societies are headed by strong, articulate women who have a clear sense of the problems they confront and their priorities. Many of their priorities were unrealistic but upon questioning they seemed to recognize that we were interested in practical strategies to improve services and outreach.

These societies had been running assistance programs for years, with government support. Recently, they have begun to work with international assistance programs. One group reported that they had been asked to distribute food and clothing from European donors to needy families in the city and outlying areas. They found the costs of distribution within the country were prohibitive - they could not afford the cost of gasoline - they stopped distribution. Other European and U.S. organizations had sent food and clothing but it was "only enough to make the people who sent it happy, and not enough to make any difference" in Almaty.

Recommendations

Non-Governmental Organizations

a. U.S. PVOs need to identify and begin working with potential counterparts, concurrently delivering services and supporting their progress in institution building. PVOs should establish an in-country presence to help nascent local organizations model their methods of service delivery and management on those of the PVO.

b. The centrally controlled, top down system of service delivery in many sectors is well
entrenched. There is no counter-balancing community-based, non-governmental organization. U.S. PVOs need to work in partnership with emerging local organizations to identify priority issues, to transfer institution building skills, and to model democratic approaches to governance.

c. Under the former Soviet regime, many societies were formed to assist families with many children, families with handicapped children, handicapped mothers with normal children, etc. These need to be strengthened as institutions and helped to become financially more secure if they are to become viable service providers working in the private sector. These established NGOs need assistance in strategic planning to help them move ahead, and develop new approaches to respond to changing circumstances.

d. Women’s groups, established societies, and emerging NGOs all need capacity building, with particular focus on management, fundraising, accounting and strategic planning.

Women’s Health

1. The Private Sector

a. U.S. PVOs should provide immediate support for local groups working in health care. There are several women’s groups with good leaders which are interested in women’s health issues. It is essential to introduce modern methods of contraception as broadly and quickly as possible, given current rates of maternal mortality and infertility. Women need to educate other women about the benefits of contraception, and to provide counselling and access to contraceptive services. This one-to-one approach will help dispel mistrust created from years of indoctrination through mass media, which included misinformation about oral contraceptives.

b. Guidelines should be sought to develop approaches for alleviating nutritional anemia through oral iron supplementation.

c. U.S. PVOs should introduce approaches to health care which educate women, and encourage them to be more responsible for their own health. This approach will help them move from being passive recipients to informed participants in their own health care.

2. The Public Sector

a. In the public sector, improved medical practices are critically needed. From hygiene to obstetrics, gynecology, infant and child health, all areas need technical assistance to update current practices. Key medical leaders should be brought to the U.S. on training and observation tours to learn more about “family centered” maternity care, (which includes rooming-in, breast-feeding on demand, etc.), family planning,
including depoprovera, IUD insertion, etc., and post-abortion contraceptive counselling and other aspects of women's health care.

b. PVOs, in collaboration with the Republican Scientific Research Institution on Maternal and Child Health, staff of physicians, midwives, counsellors, etc. should review the beliefs, attitudes and practices about contraception, and work with clients, to develop guidelines for the introduction of contraceptive services in the private sector.

c. U.S. PVOs should encourage strengthened collaboration between NGOs and the public health sector to maximize the potential for service delivery at the community level.

d. Women-to-women counselling and service delivery will be required to build confidence in and generate demand for modern methods of contraception. The one to one approach is necessary to help off-set decades of top-down misinformation promulgated by the former government.

e. Post-abortion counselling on appropriate alternative contraceptive approaches should be available at all centers offering abortion services.
OBSERVATIONS ON WOMEN IN KAZAKHSTAN

Adrienne Allison
Vice President
Centre for Development and Population Activities (CEDPA)

Status of Women

Seventy years of legislated equality has not raised the status of women to equal that of men in Kazakhstan. Soviet policy and the Soviet constitution clearly stated that women possessed equal access to education, employment, remuneration and political participation. In actuality, this equality has never been achieved. The change that was externally decreed has never been internalized by either women or men.

Employment

Employment patterns are similar to those that were found elsewhere in the former Soviet Union. Official data on occupations present data for the percentage of women in the total work force by sector, rather than the percentage of all women employed. Observation and unofficial documentation show women dominate the professions which are poorly paid. Most high level government officials seem to be male, with prominent female positions reserved for those few which are related to culture, youth and foreign relations. In agriculture, which employs the largest percentage of the total work force, approximately half of all workers are women, yet they are almost always employed as hand laborers, particularly in planting and harvesting. Men fill higher status roles, driving machinery, operating equipment and administering the farms. Even within the ranks of physicians and engineers, women occupy lower status, more poorly paid positions.

Among women, there seems to be a strong awareness of roles that are appropriate for women and those that are appropriate for men. It seems to be important to women that, within each professional structure, men are accorded a higher status with more prestige.

As the principles of a market economy are being rapidly introduced to a shrinking and disrupted economy, existing bloated employment patterns are being streamlined. Women’s rights in the workplace, originally designed to make employment more compatible with childrearing, now pose an increasingly heavy financial burden on industries newly concerned about the health, not of women, but of their own "bottom line". Unemployment is particularly severe for women because, in their efforts to lower costs women are the first to be fired. In Kazakhstan, 70 percent of those now unemployed are women.

Women who do work continue to receive legal and material support in their role as mothers. The latter included 112 days of maternity leave at full pay and an additional three years with half pay and a guarantee of returning to the same job they previously held.
The Social Structure

In rural areas, where the majority of Kazakhs live, women's lives are shaped by customary values and practices dictated by their traditional societies. Cut off from the formal teachings of Islam, these societies depended upon the preservation of traditional practices as the sole means of demonstrating respect for their faith. Within this agrarian context, the role of women is primarily to produce and nurture the next generation. A combination of limited education, early marriage, and early and frequent childbearing support high birth rates and associated poor health. In 1989, total fertility rates (TFR) in Kazakhstan were 3.6 for ethnic populations contrasted to 2.2 for Russian women living in Kazakhstan.

The influence of Islam on women's lives reportedly has increased over the past five years. Islamic women's activist groups have begun to press for government concessions to make the republics more Islamic. Islam has the advantage of seeming fresh, untried, and drawn from local roots. It offers a potential improvement in the lives of women. In Kyrgyzstan's rural areas, some male leaders have begun to demand separate schools for girls and boys.

Both countries have lowered the legal age of marriage to seventeen years but, in rural areas, women are often married in arranged marriages before their sixteenth birthday. In southern Kyrgyzstan, the groom pays a bride price. The bride's family, in turn, is expected to provide the wife with all her clothing and the necessary household goods. Because of this enormous outlay, many rural fathers try to spend as little as possible on their daughters' education and upbringing. They also try to have their daughters contribute as early as possible to the family's direct income because that contribution will be lost as soon as they marry.

In urban centers, where Russians are predominantly found, educated women have careers of their own but these are secondary to the careers of their husbands and their roles of being a good wife and mother. The higher the socioeconomic status of the family, independent of ethnicity, the more the husbands share the housework. The economic crisis is seen as the primary cause in the increase in divorce rates, now one out of three marriages, and an increase in the numbers of abandoned children.

Women In Almaty

Before we left, Kamal Almanova, a consultant with the Supreme Soviet, very thoughtfully arranged for us to meet with a group of women leaders working on issues related to children or legislation affecting women and children. Interestingly, there did not seem to be any organized group working on women's health issues, a finding which indicates how much education is needed in this regard. These women leaders were energetic and visionary, highly valuable attributes in this transitional society. They were open and enjoyed hearing about programs other than their own. They did not appear to have worked together ever
before, and they clearly found our discussion a useful forum. Many of their responses indicated a need for further, careful follow-up.

The founder of the City Consulting Center on Working with Abnormal Children started the program just one year ago. Before then, she said that there seemed to be no recognition of the numbers of children that were handicapped or of their potential to benefit from special programs. Within the past year, the Center has been given office space by the city administrator. They have organized teachers and developed a curriculum. The program apparently receives no state support. Instead, commercial structures (businesses?) and charitable donations support ninety percent of the program and parents contribute the remaining ten percent. It is not clear if they recognize the true costs of such a program. When we asked what additional help they would like, if any, they mentioned computers, but later realized that other equipment might be more useful.

The Society for Families with Many Children, founded three years ago, is designed to raise the status of large families - those with four or more children under age eighteen. In Almaty, there are more than 20,000 families in this category. Mothers, who cannot work outside their homes because of their domestic responsibilities need to earn income while at home. They asked for assistance in procuring raw materials for knitting and sewing items which could then be sold through a small shop. They also asked for other income-generating skills including book-keeping and accounting. In May, 1993, a law was passed which increased the benefits for these families. They now receive a 50 percent reduction in their rent and have free public transportation.

Mothers of Invalid Children have also organized themselves to help their children. There are more than 2500 invalid children under age 16 in Almaty suffering from respiratory, diabetic and cardiac disorders as well as from dysfunctional central nervous systems. With assistance from the Mercy Corps, they bought some equipment for a former Youth Pioneers building outside Almaty. The building itself needs renovation. Factories which used to make the special equipment they need have shut down, and it is now available only from Hungary.

The Almaty's Women's Committee, created 7 years ago, was founded to improve legislation that affects women. Now they would like to develop an institute to help women become entrepreneurs, increase access to credit, and secure a fifty percent tax reduction for all women. They would like to create an educational center for children to teach vocational skills and to provide day care.

As we listened to these women leaders, we were impressed by their energy and their sense of the possible. They have many aspirations and plans to improve their situations. Tlakhan Azizova, head of the demography department at the Institute of Labor had a thorough and realistic grasp of the problems confronted by these organizations. Throughout our meeting, she gave factual data on the extent of specific problems in Almaty.

Each of these groups needs assistance. Some have a better grasp of the possible than others.
They seemed quite capable of helping each other to address problems constructively, but they did not appear to have had the opportunity to do so. This opportunity for interaction should be encouraged.

Each program needs to be carefully reviewed by its members, working with technical assistance in the form of a resource person if possible. Each organization would benefit from more institutional strengthening and strategic planning. All groups need financial and material resources.

**Women's Health**

Both ethnic groups and Russians living in these countries rely on abortion as their primary means of limiting fertility. Russians, because of their lower fertility rates, have a higher number of abortions than other women. However in the rapidly deteriorating economic climate, all women are more anxious than ever to postpone or terminate childbearing. Because there is very little knowledge about alternatives to abortion, abortions have risen as sharply as the birth rates have fallen. Although governments have begun to support family planning openly and clearly, women seem to be extremely cautious about government information. This is a very logical response to 70 years of government efforts to manipulate birth rates. (For additional information, see separate reports on health).

Women appeared to be more responsive to woman-to-woman discussions. We were able to talk privately with our interpreters and some Russified Kazakhs. They accepted abortion as part of their lives, and they had serious concerns about the health effects of other methods, particularly contraceptive pills. They were intrigued that American women rely on oral contraceptives yet do not appear to have masculine secondary characteristics, a consequence they relate directly to the oral contraceptives.

**Women as Leaders**

Although their support systems are still in place, they are quickly being eroded by the shifting and deteriorating economic situation. Government health clinics are open, but operate with little or no medicines or supplies and, so far, only sporadic supplies of vaccines. Child care centers have begun to close or charge fees for services provided. Women are keenly aware of changes in these aspects of their lives. Some have begun to talk about organizing alternative approaches to meet the needs created by the growing vacuum in services. These women, future leaders within the private sector, are on the verge of beginning to develop alternative approaches.

Other women are very concerned about social conditions which undermine the status of women, such as bride price, domestic violence, and inequitable employment practices. They speak about these injustices openly and persuasively, but they have only just begun to
recognize that they now are free to advocate and organize for changes to improve the quality of their lives.

**Recommendations**

1. The capacity of the independent sector to address social issues needs to be actualized. Emerging women leaders and women's organizations need to develop partnerships with international women's groups to help them to organize themselves around priority causes. These causes should respond to women's expressed priorities, and will likely include the need for community services and access to employment.

2. Women's groups need technical assistance to help them understand basic concepts of profit and loss, and to support the establishment of small enterprises. Access to credit is a necessary follow-on to an initial understanding of the costs of time, space, equipment, etc. Emerging NGOs will need assistance in developing their organizations skills, including training in management and supervision, book-keeping, strategic planning, etc.

3. Women's health status is compromised by almost total reliance on abortion as the principle method of family planning. There is a compelling need for peer counselling so that women understand and are empowered to ask for the health services they need. The top-down approach to family planning needs to be counterbalanced by women generated, community-based demand for alternative methods of contraception. Commodity distribution needs to be carefully designed to ensure that sources are seen as being medically responsible, reliable and that are independent of the government and offered by non-government organizations.

4. All initiatives which include the development of non-governmental organizations should be cast in terms of building public-private partnerships to meet the emerging needs of a newly independent country.
At the present time, the protection of the environment in the republic of Kazakhstan is a very acute problem. Many large cities have become the hostages of the destructive actions of industry and aviation transport. Among these Almaty holds a special place.

Approximately 300 thousand tons of harmful substances are thrown into the air of Almaty. Automobile transport, the main pollutant, contributes 56.8%. Factories of thermal energy hold second place for their contribution in polluting the atmosphere. Numerous large industrial complexes (such as the Porshen factory, a heavy machine building plant, and the industrial complex of building materials, the organization Asfaltobeton) which practically are all placed in suburban areas also exert influence on the pollution of the atmosphere. Everything listed aggravates the climactic and geographical conditions, because Almaty is located in a basin on the foothills of Zailiiskii Alatai: nearly 300 calm days a year have been observed and they have poor ventilation.

The basic pollutant substances are gas products and heavy metals. In excess of the maximum allowable concentration (PDK) are: carbon dioxide - 1.5 time, nitric oxide - nearly 2 times, formaldehyde - 3 times, benzophenathrene -7 times, lead oxide - 2 times.

The city holds third place in the republic for overall air pollution.

All these factors unfavorably affect indicators of the health of the inhabitants of the city.

The number of cases of illness registered in Almaty in the past years on average for 1000 residents was 1152.8, and the primary incidence of illness was 724.6.

A noted growth of infant mortality in the early neonatal period owing to an increase in death from so-called perinatal reasons and congenital defects of development has affected the instability of overall indicators of infant mortality. (1980 - 25.1%, 1985 - 30.4%, 1989 - 19.5%. 1990 - 22.9%)

The first results of a retrospective analysis of incidence of illness by established diagnosis from data of official statistics for the past 12 years shows that Almaty holds first place in the republic for total average levels of incidence of illness. Thus, the average total indicator for the city of Almaty was 39441.1 per 100 thousand of the population; for the republic it was 21111.8. This is higher than the average republic level by 86.8%. In total, out of 81 studied groups of illnesses, illnesses exceeding the average republican indicators in Almaty made up 66.2%.
There is a significant distribution of the following in Almaty:

**Among adults and teenagers:**

1. Chronic pharyngitis, nasal pharyngitis and sinusitis, the average level of which is 292.1 for 100 thousand of the population and exceeds the average republic level by 249.8%.
2. Ischemic heart disease - 142.3 and 81%
3. Contact dermatitis and other forms of eczema - 596.9 and 53.6%
4. Hypertension diseases - 239.0 and 19.7%
5. Chronic diseases of the tonsils and adenoids - 208.1 and 35.7%
6. Gallstone diseases and cholecystitis - 138.2 and 98.6%
7. Gastritis chr. - 126.5 and 25.0%
8. Diabetes - 94.8 and 45.8%
9. Stomach ulcers and ulcers of duodenum intestines - 82.0 and 34.6%
10. Myocardial infarctions - 70.5 and 96.9%

**Among children under 14 years old:**

1. Chronic diseases of the tonsils and adenoids - 1271.6 and 205.5%
2. Chronic pharyngitis-sinusitis - 31.9 and 43.0%
3. Iron-deficiency anemia 334.7 and 47.5%
4. Cholecystitis - 264.0 and 368.1%
5. Harmful anomalies of the heart - 80.3 and 87.2%
6. Rheumatism - 69.0 and 12.6%
7. Children's cerebral palsy - 26.6 and 83.4%
8. Bronchial asthma - 56.2 and 239.0%
9. Viral hepatitis - 1296.1 and 42.6%

Even more data about the changing level of illness of the population is appearing. The existing levels of air pollution is causing an increase in the general sicknesses of children up to 2.2 times, and for certain illnesses up to 8 times. This includes mostly organs for breathing, an increase in upper respiratory infections, sinusitis, pharyngitis, laryngitis, tonsillitis reaching peak levels in the fall and spring seasons. In the past years, according to data of VTEK, the Working Physician’s Expert Commission, the level of people going out on disability dropped from 17.5 in 1988 to 15.8 in 1990 per 10 thousand people.

To improve the air quality of Almaty in the past years many planned hygienic-technical measures were implemented. Small boilers were liquidated. Electric power plants (TETs) and individual housing of the majority of the city have gone to gas heat, and auto transport has gone to using high quality, ecological, clean gas. The area of greenery in the city has been increased. Other technological, technical and hygienic measures of action have also been taken in the area surrounding the city.
ISAR (formerly the Institute for Soviet-American Relations) has begun an environmental outreach and grant giving program in Central Asia for non-governmental organizations. The purpose of this program is providing information, facilitating international contacts, providing funding and funding information and general assistance. ISAR has been working in Central Asia, with an office in Almaty, since November 1992. This report is more a reflection of the organization's accumulated experience on the environmental sector than a general trip report. If any additional information is needed, please contact ISAR's Almaty or Washington, DC office.

Kazakhstan, like other former Soviet republics, offers a wide spectrum of non-governmental organizations (NGOs). There are grassroots NGOs which operate independently from the government and which, in addition to their environmental concerns, are working to develop a democratic, civil society. This type of group most closely resembles the Western notion of a non-governmental, nonprofit organization, however, most of these groups lack a paid staff, office space and any regular financing. For these reasons, Western NGOs are often hesitant to enter into partnerships with such groups but, in fact, it is just this type of group with which Western organizations should be working. They are the most independent of the currently existing environmental organizations, and in most cases the most reliable and most dedicated to reform.

Many other groups that are formally registered as non-governmental organizations with the Ministry of Justice are, in reality, quasi-governmental. As the governments in each republic are restructured, many government officials, frightened they may lose their jobs and their control over government resources, create non-governmental organizations to serve as a personal escape hatch. Groups founded for this reason try to pass themselves off to visiting foreigners as appropriate NGO partners, but since their real interests are in maintaining the status quo, they have little interest in playing the reformist or watchdog role so important to NGOs in the West. The problem is particularly acute in Central Asia where the line between government and non-government is fuzzy and ill-defined.

Another cautionary for potential Western partners is that many groups tend to misrepresent their histories and activities when speaking with foreigners, thus it becomes all the more important for US groups to be careful with whom they choose to work. The goals and practices of some groups can be actively destructive to democratic development particularly when their leaders are out for personal or political gain or use their influence to create problems for other groups.

Other NGOs that are registered as social organizations are really more commercial than nonprofit in nature. While all local NGOs must find some way of becoming self-sustaining,
such profit-based groups would not by any stretch of the imagination be considered NGOs in the West. In the former Soviet Union, however, the government or some other commercial organization often establishes such operations to serve as tax shelters.

By choosing to call itself an environmental organization, each one of these groups in some measure helps to raise public awareness about the ecological problems of the region, however Western assistance will obviously be much more effective if steered to those groups which are most likely to work honestly and committedly towards the goals of environmental protection and democratic reform.

Cooperative efforts between Western non-governmental organizations and their counterparts are attracting increased funding from public and private sources. Although usually entered into with the best of intentions, such collaborations often prove disappointing to both sides. Eugene Simonov, a recent graduate of the Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies and program coordinator of the Socio-Ecological Union's Biodiversity Conservation Center, analyzes the source and nature of the problems from the in-country point of view in a recent issue of ISAR's journal Surviving Together. Simonov's comments are based on his experience in the conservation movement, but they can be applied equally to other areas of cooperation.

"Certain alarming trends are developing as more and more cooperative projects are established between foreign and in-country conservation groups in the former Soviet Union (FSU). International cooperation presents a great opportunity to bolster the strength of the FSU conservation movement and find solutions for many environmental problems. Foreign assistance is crucial to the success of conservation activities in the FSU, especially during this time of economic crisis. The effectiveness of this assistance, however, will remain questionable unless some misunderstandings and unfounded expectations on both sides are resolved, and truly equitable partnerships are established between in-country conservation groups and their counterparts aboard. The ways in which the conservation movement in the FSU are organized are often unfamiliar to the foreigner and do not fit well into the western notion of "non-governmental organization.

"Historically, most successful conservation activities have been carried out by non-governmental associations of volunteers. Most conservation NGOs concentrated on the 'substance' of their work and gave little attention to organizational development as such. There were no constituencies or donors to report to, no superiors or subordinates and no competitors. The notion of 'fundraising' did not exist since organizational activities were sustained by voluntary work, which was indirectly subsidized by the state, because non-demanding occupations allowed people to volunteer their time.

"Today, most conservation organizations are unprepared for the challenges introduced by capitalist realities and need careful assistance during the transition period. Facilitating this transition by helping conservation institutions acquire new strategies in program development and fundraising is a task of the highest priority in the contemporary conservation movement of the FSU. Domestic environmental NGOs will have to compete for
funding with their more experienced international counterparts and will have to fulfill the sophisticated requirements of donors for applications and reporting.

"The majority of foreign conservation NGOs involved in the region has no previous experience in the region. The paradigm of "international environmental assistance" was designed in the developing countries, which have very different socio-economic and political conditions. This has resulted in the following problems:

1. Newcomers frequently prefer to establish their own separate projects, disregarding whether of not something similar has already been pursued by domestic organizations. Although "indigenous expertise" is touted, little attempt is made to incorporate new and current projects in the conservation field. Instead of enhancing and developing in-country capabilities, foreign environmental groups sometimes do the work that can be more effectively done by their domestic professionals.

2. Foreign groups are often unable to identify reliable in-country partners. Virtually all institutions in the FSU are desperate to get foreign assistance. Many organizations that propose to do conservation work have no intention of carrying out practical work in the field, although some will form NGOs as a means to obtain foreign funding.

3. Due to their desperate financial situation, conservation groups in the FSU will accept almost any partnership arrangement offered by a foreign counterpart. Being financially insecure, domestic groups are hesitant to criticize proposals made by their foreign partners. This reluctance denies the foreign partner vital feedback on a proposed project.

4. Domestic groups often see greater advantage in the side benefits of projects (i.e. improved transport capabilities such as helicopters or equipment left in-country) than in the project itself. An in-country organization may consider a project worthwhile simply are inherently inefficient because the time and energy spent on the project are not seen as particularly useful by the domestic partner. This type of cooperation fosters a parasitic and irresponsible attitude toward international aid on the part of the domestic conservation community.

5. There is a growing tendency among foreign organizations to establish in-country NGOs that mimic western organizational models. Such groups are often the least effective in terms of producing actual conservation results. The establishment of such an NGO also threatens a brain drain from domestic conservation institutions due to the fact that foreign groups have much greater financial resources to offer specialists.

6. Governmental agencies in the FSU often prefer to deal with foreign NGOs rather than domestic ones. Such agencies look on foreign organizations as a potential source of revenue, thus domestic NGOs become competitors for funding. In addition, since domestic NGOs play a watchdog role over government, government bodies are quite naturally more comfortable dealing with the less well-informed western NGOs. By
negotiating solutions directly with governmental representatives, foreign NGOs can inadvertently undermine the role of domestic NGOs, most of which have more comprehensive information and experience in domestic conservation affairs than the visiting foreigner.

7. Perhaps the most alarming trend of all is that the above-mentioned factors have begun to foster a cynical attitude toward international environmental assistance among domestic conservationists. Such assistance is becoming associated with inefficient expenditures and inequitable distribution of authority and resources. Domestic conservationists have come to expect that foreign organizations will seek to dominate, subordinate and patronize in-country groups, rather than establish equal partnerships."

Kazakhstan Environmental Groups

Perhaps the best introduction to the environmental movement and environmental groups in Almaty, is the following piece, written by Sergei Kuratov of Green Salvation, translated and edited by ISAR. Kuratov has been involved in the movement for the last ten years.

The green movement in Kazakhstan was born in 1987, with the group "Initiative" in Almaty. Under the aegis of the green movement gathered people interested in nature protection and activists from other spheres. The reason for this is that the green movement was both more or less recognized by the power structure and also was almost the only form of non-governmental social activity that was not controlled directly by the government, such as the trade unions, the Soviet Women's Committee, the Society for Nature Protection and other similar organizations.

In 1988, against the background of a general surge in social and political activity, greens were able to raise their concerns throughout the country. This was facilitated by their active participation in supporting people living in regions suffering from ecological degradation and catastrophes. In part, active support for the demands of the people of the village of Zarechni, located not far from Almaty, who were suffering from a breach in the containment pond where sewage water from the city was collected, significantly strengthened the Almaty group "Initiative" and allowed it to gather around itself a force of greens. The resulting centripetal force led to the formation in the summer of 1988 of the Almaty ecological association, "Green Front," whose membership included the leaders and activists of many future environmental groups: Marat Chimbuletov, Mels Elusizov, Victor Zonov, and others.

The reason for the first dissension in "Green Front" was a lack of clarity and understanding in the goals and orientations of various groups belonging to the association and likewise the completely unecological values and positions of a significant group of activists. There appeared in the group a very politicized wing, which together with new NGOs formed the Almaty "People's Front." This action immediately elicited a negative reaction from the partocrats of the republic and inspired a wave of repression from the administrative organs and the KGB, and harsh articles in the press.
Nevertheless, 1990 was the year of greatest success for the greens. In 1990, despite the fact the greens began to exhibit an aversion to centralization, they fared well in elections and managed in Almaty alone to win five deputy seats. This same year, "Nevada-Semipalatinsk" was formed which made it the largest Kazakhstan organization focusing on environmental and human rights issues.

1991 brought with it new problems as the process that was transforming the ecological movement into a compliant opposition became more and more obvious. The effort by many green groups and concerned specialists to try to influence the formation of nature protection legislation fell apart. Programmatic discrepancies and differing views on strategy and organizational principles between greens became insurmountable and led to the disintegration of both "Green Front" and the socio-ecological association, "Initiative." Activists from these organizations formed a number of small NGOs such as "Tabigat," "Green Salvation," and "Ecofund."

In their activities, the greens encountered yet another barrier- a new law about registration of social groups. As a result of the passing of this law and the inevitable red tape which it engendered, several groups remain unregistered to this day. The process of bureaucratizing "Nevada" meant that more and more often former party members and Soviet workers were appearing in its ranks. As a result scores of extremely authoritative workers left the organization.

1992 was a year of change for the greens. Although the process of internal delimitation of various groups continued and affected even "Nevada," from which split the "Lop Nor-Semipalatinsk" movement, the desire to combine forces appeared anew and even resulted in the formation of a Green Party. Despite the fact that the formation of the party, which was undertaken by the Ecological Union "Tabigat," does not seem well-founded, the links between many groups were strengthened and the idea of coordinating actions between groups in various Kazakhstan cities took root. Concurrently, the movement made an effort to clean itself up and create more serious linkages with democratic, not necessarily ecological, organizations in order to work together on common problems.

The prospective development of the green movement in Kazakhstan will be determined by social and economic factors which at present are not hinting at the establishment of a democratic society which values human rights and has a developed market economy.

ISAR views communication and information exchange as priorities for Western support. In addition, ISAR believes that large projects should not be initiated until a group has proven its abilities and accountability through successful completion of a small project. Any initial projects should be suggested by the local group and not by the American partner. ISAR has been involved in such small projects with Green Salvation, the Fund in Support of Ecological Education, the Ecofund of Kazakhstan, and the Lop Nor-Semipalatinsk Ecological Committee.

Groups most ready to enter partnerships with Western counterparts are Green Salvation and the
Fund in Support of Ecological Education. Partnerships with these two groups could offer promising opportunities for projects in the fields of environmental education, organic agriculture and information dissemination, perhaps through a center for the environmental community. These two groups stand out because they have already proved their financial accountability, technical expertise, peer respect and ability to work with and support the efforts of other groups.
The agricultural sector: U.S. PVO/NGO opportunities for Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan

Patrick Ludgate
Country Director
Winrock International

Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan are generally believed to be the most Western oriented nations in the Central Asian region. Both of these countries have been among the first former Soviet Union (FSU) countries to start a transformation toward market economies. Each has a president that has moved rapidly to reorganize the structure of their agricultural economies and are both faced with significant challenges for reform from institutional, behavioral, and economic viewpoints. These problems have been compounded by the near hyperinflation rate of 2500%/year and the reduction in volume and value of the overall trade levels and terms of trade between Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan and the Russian Federation, their major trading partner. However, progress toward the privatization of state assets remains the focal point of their economic reform programs. Well articulated PVO/NGO programs in many development sectors in the economy, as well as in the social development structure, can effectively bolster this socioeconomic and political reform process by establishing and supporting a variety of linkages with counterpart groups particularly at the oblast (state), rayon (regional) and district levels.

Shift Toward Privatization

The move toward privatization in Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, although rapid with respect to the other Central Asian republics and Russia, has not been greeted with a large amount of enthusiasm on the part of the general public due to the perceptions on a national, regional and family levels of the perceived and actual disruptions that these changes have had, and will bring. The general perception is that marketization of the agricultural sector means a lower standard of living, as well as unemployment, high food prices, and an alarming increase in the crime rate, all unusual in the FSU. There exists also, two overriding general perceptions of the populace at large and seem quite intensive in the agricultural sector: (1) that socio-political and economic changes are occurring too rapidly, and (2) the common people are not likely to benefit directly from these changes. Most people perceive that only the well-placed business, political and military officials are likely to benefit from the shift to market oriented production systems., as these groups have traditionally controlled the entire economic system.

The privatization policies for the agricultural sector instituted by Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan will, in the long-run, facilitate the transition of the state owned agricultural enterprises to be either profit oriented enterprises or restructured as farm cooperatives owned by its members or private enterprises. However, it is important to note that the overall initiatives toward privatization are met with different levels of support between rural and urban regions. The urban dwellers have enthusiastically supported the privatization of housing and have started many small businesses, particularly in the service and retail sectors. However, the workers on the
state and collective farms have been notably less enthusiastic about establishing themselves as private farmers and processors due to several critical factors including: the removal of the economic safety net provided through collective production, limited choice as to the land they can select and the resource mix they can use in an agricultural enterprise, the lack of financial and marketing infrastructure and skills to obtain financing and market products outside the state structures.

There are two additional constraints that require consideration by prospective PVO/NGOs operating in these two countries in regard to well-instilled attitudes and work ethics. The combination of a very limited "I can do it myself" mind frame and work habits instilled over the past several decades that discouraged an individual's or family's work ethic toward internalizing the benefits of extra work for their own benefit. Consequently, private farms and agribusiness are not likely to bring forth a significant increase in agricultural production and productivity in the very near future unless there is a substantial increase in the institutionalized support services for the overall agricultural sector, (for example -- extension services, marketing co-ops and banking services) as exemplified in Western countries.

**U.S. PVOs/NGOs Role in Agricultural Development**

Both of these countries have experienced drastic declines in GDP over the past two years and it is reflected in steep declines in the agricultural sectors. Privatization in the agricultural sector remains a focal point for initially stabilizing, and then, increasing overall agricultural production and productivity. However, Kyrgyzstan is severely limited in the amount of good agricultural land it possesses; whereas in Kazakhstan, good agricultural land remains one of its most valuable resources.

Despite the substantial challenges, these two governments have begun to institute effective policy and institutional reforms. In an effort to strengthen these efforts, PVO/NGO agricultural program support is needed for technical assistance and training for the following areas: large and small agribusiness development, input and output market infrastructure development, monetary and financial policy reform, legal and institutional reform, agricultural university and research institute restructuring, extension and training, regional and domestic trade program support, public health and other human services.

PVOs and NGOs will be needed to design and implement agricultural development programs which strengthen the overall privatization initiatives already in place by helping to establish institutional and technical development programs to replace those institutions no longer effective or which never existed. These programs are needed as soon as possible in order to bridge the gap, and coexist with state enterprises, between state directed and market oriented agricultural production. A field-based, regional approach would provide the most effective model for this development assistance and would strengthen complementary technical assistance being provided by a large number of foreign assistance programs at the national level. This decentralized approach would also increase the overall absorptive capacity for technical and financial assistance of the agricultural sector by helping to establish model farms/ranches and agribusinesses, regionally based financial and marketing institutions and associated social welfare concerns.
Improving telecommunications in Kazakhstan and between Kazakhstan and other countries is critical to facilitating the country's participation in the world economy. Improved communications will permit access to the kinds of information that will result in improved economic, health, environmental, agricultural, enterprise development and other sectors of the country.

The government of Kazakhstan, like that of other emerging CIS countries, is under a variety of internal and external pressures to choose between communications and other competing sectors for very limited financial resources. However, strong interest by foreign interests in Kazakhstan's wealth of natural resources, will "force" the improvement of communications more quickly than the country might anticipate.

General Assumptions

Before discussing specifics about telecommunications in Kazakhstan and how they can facilitate communications between PVOs, NGOs, and other sectors, several general observations about Kazakhstan's telecommunications seem useful.

- Kazakhstan, like other CIS countries is experiencing a collapse of almost everything at the same time, including telecommunications. Priorities are changing almost daily.

- The Ministry of Communications in Kazakhstan is new and inexperienced, and still trying to define its authority and functions.

- Telecommunications equipment throughout Kazakhstan is old and continuing to decay rapidly, and, because of economic conditions, the country can't afford much better.

- Privatization laws in Kazakhstan are new and generally untested. There is not yet an established private sector, and competition hasn't yet penetrated the telecommunications sector.

- There is little awareness yet of the importance of faxes, working phones, and other communications to successful business development in Kazakhstan.

- Currency exchange is a major problem in Kazakhstan, and in the telecommunications sector.
• Kazakhstan has almost no experience in writing and enforcing telecommunications regulations.

• Kazakhstan has little experience in establishing or regulating telecommunications tariffs.

• There has not yet been a thorough national technical or economic analysis of the telecommunications systems in Kazakhstan, even though a number of joint ventures have been formed.

• There are very few computers in Kazakhstan, and little awareness of the value of electronic-mail at high levels in government, even though it is a growing phenomenon in the country.

• Fax machines are still rare in Kazakhstan.

• It will be many years before the rural areas of Kazakhstan have telecommunications available to them since the principal focus will be on the capitol and other urban areas.

• Options to telephone communications can be of great value to Kazakhstan, but there is little awareness of wireless communications other than voice radio. (One such option is VITACOMM, VITA’s digital packet radio and low earth orbiting satellite system.)

Kazakhstan

Kazakhstan, about the size of Alaska, has close to 16.5 million people. Yet there are fewer than 600,000 phones in the entire country. About 350,000 of them are in the capital city, Almaty (population of nearly 2 million), and fewer than 3,000 of those permit direct international dialing. The other two high population centers, Dzhambul and Chimkent, have a combined population of about 1 million, with most of the remaining phones between them. The density of phones in urban areas is about 16 units per 100 persons; in rural areas the density is less than 1 unit per 100 persons. Of the approximately 6.5 million people employed in Kazakhstan, the communications sector employs about 93,000.

The Almaty Director of Communications, whose jurisdiction is limited to Almaty, informed me that the average wait for a phone is 10 years in the capital. Individuals can expect to pay 383,000 rubles (about $300 - close to 2 years income for the average person) plus installation costs for a phone, if the phone lines are already in place. If there are no phone lines, then it will take longer, and cost between 700,000 and 1,000,000 rubles, plus installation costs. There may be preferential treatment for new businesses wishing to open an office in Almaty. He was aware that, because of Kazakhstan’s potential wealth, many foreign companies have expressed interest in locating in Almaty or other cities.

The Deputy Minister of Communications described his country’s goal for a "phone in every
home," but provided no detail or rationale for it. (A more realistic goal might be having a phone or information center in every village of 100 people.) He seemed generally uninformed about digital radio and low earth orbiting satellite systems. Once he learned that the Minister of Communications of Kyrgyzstan was sponsoring a demonstration of VITA's digital radio communications in his country he said that he would also welcome such a system in Kazakhstan.

I visited with the president and officers of Arna-Sprint, a joint stock company created by the Ministry. I learned that they intend to sell their services primarily to the government and large corporate sector since small businesses and individuals could not afford their services. In addition to fixed fees for registration, there are monthly fees and lease charges for modems and software. A "virtual private line" to the US would cost about $7,000 for installation, plus traffic charges.

I also visited the offices of Relcom ("reliable communications"), a Moscow-based commercial electronic mail company expanding its network rapidly in Kazakhstan; there are already about 12 host stations in the country. It seems that whoever has access to a computer, modem, and a phone line is trying to join the network that can connect individuals and firms in Kazakhstan to the rest of the world. However, the costs of Relcom prohibit most people from joining the network.

Fax and electronic-mail are relatively new in Kazakhstan. There are very few fax machines, and the bad phone lines and infrastructure are prohibitive for e-mail. Several of the hotels in Almaty can place international calls for about $3.00 per minute; but it may take several hours to get through. An average one page fax costs about $6.00.

There are several telecommunications projects already in the works in Kazakhstan. For example, Teletas, Turkey's second largest telecommunications equipment manufacturer (39% owned by France's Alcatel) plans to install a 2,500 line digital public exchange in each of the five Turkish-speaking former Soviet republics. Earth stations will connect the five networks to the Turkish gateway exchange via an Intelsat satellite, and from there to the rest of the world. The plans include expanding the exchanges to 30,000 lines each. (Teletas also plans to open a joint-venture called Komtel to make phone equipment in Kyrgyzstan.)

The German DBP Telekom has signed a letter of understanding with the Ministry of Communications in Kazakhstan to build and operate local, long distance and international networks, including packet switching and possibly mobile communications.

While there is almost no awareness of electronic-mail by people within the Ministry; Relcom, an e-mail network based in Moscow, is growing rapidly within the country - wherever there are working phone lines, modems and computers. In a visit to a franchise owner in Almaty, I saw a map with 12 host locations in Kazakhstan. This firm was very interested in exploring alternative ways to get into international e-mail networks, including digital radio systems.
Implications and Suggestions for PVO and NGO Communications

Except for Almaty, and the other principal cities in Kazakhstan, telecommunications will not be a practical reality in villages and other rural areas in the short term. Nevertheless, because of the wealth of natural resources in Kazakhstan, depending on where the privatized industries and new mining and drilling sites are located, telecommunications might spread more quickly to other areas of the country. PVOs and NGOs will have to pay attention to these developments and find a way to share facilities or capabilities with the new customers. In the meanwhile, PVOs and NGOs have limited options: use the current system, or use complementary systems such as digital radio.

NGOs in Kazakhstan seem to be generally unaware of each other's existence, even though many have the same agenda. There are definitely "old line" networks, and "new line" organizations. Regardless, the NGO community needs inexpensive communications systems in order to grow and be effective in helping the country move more definitely towards democracy and a market economy.

There is great need for improved communications between local NGOs just for conservation of human resources alone, even though telecommunications may not be a useful tool for a while. There is also a need for improved communications between PVOs working within the same country. The VEST team was pleased that the PVOs themselves recognize this and seem to be working well together in Kazakhstan.

U.S. PVOs need to learn more about Kazakhstan and their local counterparts. There should be a study identifying all the NGOs, and collecting data about their issues, their organization, their membership, and all other relevant data such as current laws and regulations. The VEST team compiled as much information as possible during a one week visit to each country, but much more remains to be done. Of course, just having a list isn't the final goal of such an activity. Hopefully, working relationships can be established and joint ventures undertaken.

Based on the importance of telecommunications to successful democratization and an effective market economy, the U.S. should make the development of this sector a high priority in its funding plans. This priority should include proper consideration for alternative communications technologies such as digital radio and low earth orbiting satellites as tools that are almost instantly available to connect offices and projects within and between countries.

U.S. PVOs with experience and expertise in communications and information technologies can be very helpful in the redevelopment of the CIS countries. There is great need for training in computers, information management systems, information dissemination, and local value added services.
Economic Restructuring

Kazakhstan will need substantial assistance from the international community over the next few years in order to overhaul the centrally planned economy inherited from seventy years of Soviet rule.

The country has now entered a world where its low wages will simply not be enough to give it the competitive edge required to succeed in the global marketplace. The four tigers of Asia - Hong Kong, Singapore, Taiwan and Korea - fought their way into foreign markets by developing a strategy aimed at creating a highly productive and competitive workforce. This was accomplished through the successful marriage of intensive industrial training and low wages. Kazakhstan, by following a similar strategy, can strengthen its efforts in creating a market-oriented economy. Canada and other Western countries have an important role to play in helping Kazakhstan to build their capacity to compete in the growing transnational economy.

Canadian Technical Assistance

Canada began its technical assistance program to former regions of the Soviet Union by placing emphasis on facilitating the transition to democracy and market-based economies. The intensive round of meetings we held with Kazakhs from all walks of life, convinced me that Canada can make an important contribution through capacity building activities in a number of economic sectors.

Canadians can provide assistance through their world class technology and expertise in the fields of environmental protection, agriculture, financial services and telecommunications. Much of this assistance can be delivered through managerial and other types of training programs. Canada can help develop Kazakh managerial competence in such areas as quality control, process technology, industrial design, efficiency and competitiveness in the agri-food sector and international commodity marketing.

Much of the above training can be supplied through creative partnerships forged by Canadian Non-governmental Organizations (NGO's), and the private and public sectors. In addition, Canada's Volunteer-Sending Agencies (VSA's) have a key role to play in funding and recruiting volunteer-specialists to provide training in the specialized skill requirements of Kazakhstan. The VEST Mission was repeatedly told by Kazakhs how anxious they were to
learn English. Canadian VSA's can assist with this type of training activity as well.

Canadian and international NGO's have a major selling job ahead of them with respect to what NGO's actually do, and why it is important to build an NGO sector in Kazakhstan. The concept of the NGO or the non-profit organization is very new to most Kazakhs, and not everybody understands or is easily convinced that NGO's can strengthen and improve their economy and society in general. It is difficult to explain, for example that in Canada and the U.S.A., the non-profit sector provides hundreds of thousands of jobs for adult volunteers. We also need to stress to Kazakhs that this activity impacts on almost every sector of the society, making a valuable contribution to the national economy.

Exchange programs to Canada for Kazakh NGO's and government officials could help to communicate the raison d'etre for NGO's as well as show our successes and failures with volunteerism and non-profit sector activities.

An Area of Strategic Importance

Kazakhstan is geographically positioned on the famous Silk Road in a region of growing strategic importance to the world. Kazakhstan can help set the tone for economic and political renewal for the other newly independent republics of the CIS in Central Asia. This is important to maintaining peace and security in the region. We must not forget that the Silk Road linking the newly independent republics of Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan and Tajikistan once served as the stage for widespread espionage and political intrigue in the 19th Century. At that time, Russia and Great Britain were the key players who took advantage of weak local economic and political systems. Today, future potential rivalry is likely to be played out by China, Iran, Pakistan, Turkey, Russia and the U.S.A. if republics like Kyrgyzstan fail to succeed in their efforts to bring about economic and political renewal.

Kazakhstan and its neighbors face a number of destabilizing elements that may threaten the peace and security of the region. These include the loss of a well-educated and skilled work force of Russians who are emigrating to other countries in the area because of deteriorating living conditions caused by massive unemployment and a collapsing social security net. Another flashpoint is the scarcity of water in the region, symbolized by the rapid drying up of the Aral Sea.

Kazakhstan faces a major environmental catastrophe if an agreement is not reached with its neighbors on shared water resources. Another problem is that population along the Silk Road is projected to increase by 3.5% a year, which means a doubling of Central Asia's population in the next 15 years. This will place great pressure on the now fragile health care and education systems and increase already high unemployment to unacceptable levels. Clearly, none of the complex problems outlined above can be solved by Kazakhstan working alone.
The international community has a pivotal role to play in helping Kazakhstan make a successful transition to democracy and a market-based economy so it can effectively meet the many challenges ahead. Canadians can build bridges to Central Asia through the technical assistance programs of our government and the NGO and VSA community, and most important of all, by joint ventures and international trade with our private sector.

In short, a new era of peace and prosperity along the Silk Road can only happen if international rivalry is replaced by international cooperation and goodwill.
APPENDICES

I. VEST Team Bios

II. Kazakhstani NGO Survey Data

III. U.S. Government Grantee and Contractor Representatives

IV. Contacts: Kazakhstan
APPENDIX I

VEST TEAM BIOS

SALLIE JONES, Co-Leader

Sallie Jones has managed the Matching Grants Program for AID's Office of Private and Voluntary Cooperation (PVC) since February 1991. She came to PVC in November 1988, worked briefly as a project manager for matching grants, then moved to the Child Survival Unit as Deputy Coordinator. Prior to her work in PVC, Ms. Jones spent ten years with AID's Office of Nutrition, where she worked with a broad range of implementers and issues, directing projects to alleviate undernutrition in developing countries.

Since its inception in 1974, the Office of Private and Voluntary Cooperation within the Bureau for Food and Humanitarian Assistance has been the focal point within AID for strengthening partnerships in development with U.S. PVOS and cooperative development organizations. Through its three primary functions of grant administration, public outreach and information exchange, PVC is committed to supporting long-term sustainable development. PVC conducts six competitive grant programs, in addition to the provision of technical program support for those programs. It also supports the Advisory Committee on Voluntary Foreign Aid which will soon publish a new report that looks at priorities and issues facing the AID/PVO partnership in the decade ahead.

STANLEY HOSIE, Co-Leader

Stan Hosie is the Co-Founder and Executive Director of COUNTERPART. Mr. Hosie has negotiated and overseen more than $20 million in U.S.A.I.D. grants since 1976 for projects in the areas of micro-enterprise development, sustainable natural resource management, child survival, primary health care, small-scale agriculture, and local institutional development. Since the inception of the COUNTERPART family in 1965, Stan Hosie has promoted the establishment and strengthening of indigenous partner NGO's in all of the organizations development programs, thereby ensuring local ownership and sustainability of project activities. Mr. Hosie is a past member of A.I.D's Advisory Committee on Voluntary Foreign Aid and is a member of the Board Of Directors of Interaction.

Since its founding in 1965, COUNTERPART has demonstrated a unique capability and strong track record in building supportive, catalytic partnerships with local governmental and non-governmental institutions in emerging democracies. Its central organizational purpose--of supporting the creation and development of strong local institutions capable of meeting local and regional needs--has never changed. COUNTERPART is now in the process of creating a Counterpart Service Center in Kiev, Ukraine to promote the development of a vibrant, effective non-governmental sector as a critical element in the creation of a civil society.
BRUCE GROGAN

Mr. Grogan is the Vice President for International Programs for COUNTERPART. He is responsible for the design and implementation of long-term strategies and programs focusing on the complete range of integrated development activities, including the negotiation of strategic alliances between international organizations. He holds two Masters degrees from Yale University, one in environmental science and the other in public health. Mr. Grogan’s professional experiences reflect an integrated approach to development and include positions with the United States Peace Corps, Partners of the Americas, private sector interests such as the Weyerhaeuser Company and Pacific Telesis, and numerous consulting assignments. Mr. Grogan holds a faculty appointment in the Yale School Of Public Health as a Lecturer in sustainable development.

BRYANT GEORGE

Bryant George is currently a Senior Advisor to the NIS Task Force in the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID). As a retired Senior Foreign Service Officer, he has had a broad range of experience in all aspects of urban community development, humanitarian relief and development, NGO institutional strengthening, and USAID/host government/private sector coordination.

As part of the United States’ effort to work with the New Independent States (NIS) of the former Soviet Union as they make the transition to democracy and a free market economy, the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) established a Task Force in April 1992. To coordinate and implement these programs, USAID provided $235 million in its own FY 1992 funds. An additional $417 million for the NIS projects has been authorized by the U.S. Congress for FY 1993 under the Freedom Support Act.

ADRIENNE ALLISON

Adrienne Allison is Vice President of the Center for Development and Population Activities (CEDPA) responsible for strategic planning and program development. Before joining CEDPA, Ms. Allison was with the United States Agency for International Development (A.I.D.) for nine years as project manager with the Office of Population, the Office of Food and Voluntary Assistance and later the Bureau for Africa. Before leaving A.I.D., she developed the HAPA grants program to assist U.S. PVOs (Private Voluntary Organizations) to develop responsive AIDS education and prevention programs throughout Africa. In 1988, while assigned to the Presidential Commission on the HIV epidemic, she organized and wrote the report on the International Hearings.

CEDPA, founded in 1975, is a non-profit international development agency. CEDPA’s mission is to empower women at all levels of society to be full partners in development. CEDPA’s initiatives include AIDS education, family planning, maternal and child health, environment, literacy, nutrition and small business projects. CEDPA’s 5 year, $15.8 million ACCESS to Family Planning Through Women Managers project focuses on women-to-women delivery of non-clinical contraceptives in Africa and Asia.
TIMOTHY R. LYMAN

Timothy R. Lyman is Corporate Secretary and General Counsel to Aid To Artisans. He is a lawyer in private practice with the New England-based law firm of Day, Berry & Howard. His legal practice focuses on the representation of non-profit organizations and governmental entities. His clients include schools, colleges, private foundations, international private voluntary organizations and other charitable and voluntary organizations, as well as the State of Connecticut and various local governments.

Aid To Artisans, Inc. is a nonprofit organization dedicated to creating employment opportunities for artisans across the world. By providing funding for materials, help in product design, training, and a crucial link to the U.S. marketplace, ATA puts a structured program in place and sets an important process in motion. This process creates income, and ultimately a better quality of life, for artisans throughout the world. An essential part of Aid To Artisans is to provide small grants to groups of craftspeople. They are used to provide tools, finance training and, most effectively, to create "material banks".

JOSEPH F. SEDLAK

Mr. Sedlak has extensive experience in assisting the development of small business, especially in energy, agriculture and communications. As the Director of Government Relations for Volunteers in Technical Assistance (VITA), he is responsible for developing new programs, and raising funds especially for VITA's low-earth orbiting satellite communications program. As the director for VITA's Eastern and Central Europe program he helped create the Foundation for Austrian Economic Development, and has led several technical assistance missions to Poland to assist in the development of small business.

Volunteers In Technical Assistance (VITA) is a non-profit U.S. organization of 5,000 technical, scientific and business volunteers created in 1959 to provide technical information to improve people's lives and economy. VITA has managed programs in many countries, and currently manages an information service that responds to more than 2,000 questions a month. VITA's communications system, when fully operational by the end of this decade, will provide an infrastructure that will facilitate small business development in many countries and in many sectors.

IQBAL NOOR ALI

Iqbal Noor Ali joined the Aga Khan Development Network's Industrial Promotion Services in 1979 as Chief Executive Officer, where his responsibilities included the development of small-scale enterprises for recent immigrants to North America. For the last 24 years, he has been closely associated with a variety of institutions in North America. He joined AKF USA as its Chief Executive Officer in 1984, where he is responsible for overall management of AKF USA's programs. He works closely with the development community in the United States and serves on the Board of Directors of the International Development Conference and on the Council on Foundation's International Committee.

Aga Khan Foundation U.S.A. is part of an international network of private, non-denominational development agencies that promote creative and effective solutions to selected problems in health, education and rural development, mainly in the poorer countries of Asia and Africa. The Foundation's International Strategy for the 1990s attempts to integrate the cross-cutting concerns of institutional strengthening of NGOs, human resource development, community participation, women in development and the environment into all its program areas in health, education and rural development.
LYNN RICHARDS

Lynn Richards serves as in-country representative for ISAR’s Seeds of Democracy program in Alma Ata. Lynn has led the US team working to establish an environmental electronic mail network in the former Soviet Union. In cooperation with the Socio-Ecological Union (SEU) she organized and instructed e-mail training courses for Soviet environmentalists in Bryansk, Ryazan and Krasnoyarsk, Russia in 1991 and 1992, which added 60 new e-mail stations to the environmental network.

ISAR, a US nonprofit organization founded in 1983, has been working to enhance the capabilities of nongovernmental environmental groups in the Soviet Union since 1990. With funding from the US Environmental Protection Agency, ISAR and the SEU established an International Clearinghouse on the Environment with offices in Washington and Moscow to facilitate the exchange of information and specialists. With grant money from the National Endowment for Democracy, ISAR has established an electronic mail network that links over 60 environmental groups in 13 of the 15 former republics. ISAR recently embarked on a program to provide small grants to environmental NGOs in 12 republics and has set up new offices in Kiev, Ukraine and Alma Ata, Kazakhstan.

BRUCE R. HOPKINS

Bruce R. Hopkins, a lawyer in private practice with the law firm of Powers, Pyles & Sutter, Washington, D.C., specializes in the areas of corporate law and taxation, with emphasis on the representation of nonprofit organizations. His clients include charitable and educational organizations, associations, colleges, universities, hospitals, other health care providers, religious organizations, professional societies, and private foundations. He serves many nonprofit organizations as general counsel; others use his services as special tax and/or fund-raising counsel.

The Institute for International Law and Philanthropy (IILP) was organized for the purpose of assisting emerging democracies in Eastern Europe and the Newly Independent States (NIS) of the Former Soviet Union to create the legal foundation for a functioning non-governmental sector in those countries. However, the IILP is prepared to offer its programs for the benefit of other nations.

ROGER F. ROY

Roger F. Roy, Executive Director of COUNTERPART CANADA has over twenty years of experience in project management, marketing and planning and evaluation for the private non-profit sectors. Mr. Roy has served as the Executive Director of the World University Service of Canada (WUSC) where he reorganized this NGO and its program focus both in Canada and overseas to meet the changing needs of the university community and Third World countries. For several years, he served as a Board Member and Chairman of the Education Committee for the Canadian Council for International Cooperation (CCIC). As a special assistant to a Minister of National Health and Welfare, he was responsible for the Minister’s interface with health and social development groups across Canada. Mr. Roy’s private sector experience began as a marketing director of Hawker Siddeley Canada Inc. and the Urban Transportation Development Corporation and was then asked to be the Director of Marketing and Promotions for Canada’s Pavilion at Expo 86 and its theme of transportation and communications. Mr. Roy continues to act as a Special Advisor to the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) in New York and its Bureau for Program Policy and Evaluation.

The mandate of COUNTERPART CANADA is to engage in international development assistance activities in Russia, Ukraine, Kazakhstan and the Pacific Island Nations of the South Pacific and Vietnam.
PATRICK LUDGATE

Patrick Ludgate is the Chief of Party for Winrock International's Special Initiative for the NIS -- the Farmer-to-Farmer Program. Dr. Ludgate provides overall leadership to this program and coordinates the activities in the three field sites: 1) Alma Ata, Kazakhstan, 2) Moscow, Russia, and 3) Tashkent, Uzbekistan. Dr. Ludgate has held several related positions, including two years with the U.S. Peace Corps. Dr. Ludgate holds a Ph.D. from Colorado State University.

The mission of Winrock International Institute for Agricultural Development is to reduce poverty and hunger in the world through sustainable agricultural and rural development. Winrock International helps people of developing areas to strengthen their agricultural institutions, develop their human resources, design sustainable agricultural systems and strategies, and improve policies for agricultural and rural development. Winrock International administers the Farmer-to-Farmer program for AID/PVC in collaboration with the National Association of Wheat Growers Foundation.

ARLENE P. LEAR

Ms. Lear is COUNTERPART's Director for Special Projects and manages COUNTERPART's Volunteer Executive Service Team (VEST) Initiative, a public/private partnership supported by A.I.D.'s Office of Private & Voluntary Cooperation, FHA Bureau. Ms. Lear has more than 15 years experience with AID funded projects, and has expertise in program development, negotiation, evaluation, and liaison activities. In 1983, Ms. Lear developed and negotiated the agreement for a $5 million AID-funded PVO Umbrella Project in Africa. The project purpose was to expand and strengthen indigenous PVO's long-term capability to implement projects in three sectors critical to the local economy: agriculture, health, energy. This project is considered by AID to be one of several "PVO umbrella project" models.
APPENDIX II

KAZAKHSTANI NGO SURVEY DATA

The NGOs surveyed participated in an NGO Management Seminar in Almaty in May 1993. The contact information on this list supplements the contact list information in Appendix IV.

The Almaty City Uigur Cultural Center
Almaty, Vinogradov St. 85, Rm. 129
Phone: (3272) 654641

Main Goals of Organization: Revival and development of the Uigur culture, traditions, and language.

Main Types of Activity: Studying the ancient history and culture of the Uigur people; children's courses in the Uigur language, contributing to the improvement of international relations in Kazakhstan.

Sources of Funding: Voluntary contributions.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Contacts with Uigurs living in the U.S.

The Charitable Fund for the Promotion of Business Undertakings by Orphans and the Protection of their Rights—the Private Professional School for Orphans and Children from Poor and Large Families
Almaty, Begalin St. 87
Phone: (3272) 231159

Main Goals of Organization: To provide children with professions, bank accounts, and apartments.

Main Types of Activity: Training (in sewing, knitting, constructing, modelling, embroidery, cooking, typing, business furniture making, wood carving, ceramics production, agriculture, etc.)

Sources of Funding: Crediting, self-financing, raw materials supplied on easy terms.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Contacts with analogous NGOs in order to receive technical and technological assistance; cooperation in the field of training.

"Chernobyl" Union of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Almaty, Vinogradov St., 85, Rm. 415
Phone: (3272) 633900

Main Goals of Organization: Rehabilitation, medical services, and care for those who participated in the liquidation of Chernobyl and victims of the accident. Aid and medical care for the victims' families.

Main Types of Activity: Manufacturing furniture; decoration of offices; woodworking (carving to be done at home for those unable to work full-time).

Sources of Funding: Donations, voluntary contributions.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Searching for partners willing to sell goods on credit, direct contacts with public organizations, second-hand goods trade.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Main Goals of Organization</th>
<th>Main Types of Activity</th>
<th>Sources of Funding</th>
<th>Desired Areas of Cooperation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Ecological Fund of Kazakhstan</td>
<td>&quot;Bringing people into a healthy state,&quot; assistance in overcoming the republic’s ecological crisis.</td>
<td>Scientific (ecological mapping, ecological investigation various areas, working out the physical aspects of ecological activities, search for alternative types of energy, solving ecological and social problems related to the current environmental &quot;crisis,&quot; treating people with non-traditional diagnostic methods and treatments, involvement in trade and production activities.)</td>
<td>Self-financing.</td>
<td>Search for partners; information about the activities of foreign ecological NGOs; publishing children’s books (on environmental awareness); joint arrangement of ESL courses in Almaty; waste collection in the cities (equipment for collection and processing); trade activities; formation of joint ventures; training in handling and raising of charitable ecological funds; establishing joint offices in the US and Kazakhstan on ecological problems, health care, and small businesses; creation of an information bank (on ecological problems in Kazakhstan, on technology and equipment available in developed countries, on NGOs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Flamingo&quot; International Creative Organization</td>
<td>Popularization of the culture and art of the peoples of Kazakhstan.</td>
<td>Charitable activities. Production, commerce, and other activities not forbidden by the laws in force.</td>
<td>Self-financing, attraction of sponsors.</td>
<td>Contacts with women's organizations (including women's business NGOs); cooperation in the field of culture and education (e.g. arrangement for the exchange of exhibitions of creative works, organization of exhibitions in the U.S); contacts with NGOs and GOs that support creative people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intergovernmental Association of Uigurs</td>
<td>To further the revival of the Uigur culture, traditions, and language; to assist the people of the Sintzian-Uigur Autonomous Region, China (the historical native land, Fast Turkistan) to preserve their uniqueness, their cultural and traditional ethno-demographic structure, and to meet the requirements of the UNO Commission on human rights.</td>
<td>Holding anniversary celebrations, festivals, days of culture, amateur’s competitions educating youth, searching for sponsorship for publishing activities.</td>
<td>Voluntary contributions from the Uigur population of Kazakhstan, sponsors who are interested in the solution of specific problems.</td>
<td>Search for partners and concentrations of Turkic-speaking peoples.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Main Goals of Organization</td>
<td>Main Types of Activity</td>
<td>Sources of Funding</td>
<td>Desired Areas of Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Plume&quot;</td>
<td>Cooperation with similar centers in other regions, popularization of Armenian history, art, and culture through the mass media. Improvement of ethnic relations in Kazakhstan.</td>
<td>Teaching the Armenian language and traditions.</td>
<td>Membership fees, donations.</td>
<td>Cooperation with similar NGOs in Los Angeles, in particular, and California, in general.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Meylirman&quot; Charitable Organization</td>
<td>Aid to single elderly, poor, disabled, orphans, large families, socially unprotected people.</td>
<td>Free delivery of food (to single bed-ridden patients); one-time-only financial aid; club for pensioners, supplying indigents with second hand clothing, arranging and paying for the medical treatment of orphans.</td>
<td>Transfers of resources of small businesses, other organizations, cooperatives; voluntary contributions.</td>
<td>Locating partners for charitable activities; interchange of experience; contacts with sponsors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Party &quot;People's Congress of Kazakhstan&quot;</td>
<td>Achievement of civil peace, international accord and economic prosperity in Kazakhstan.</td>
<td>Political agitation, propaganda; participation in seminars of international organizations; taking part in drawing up bills about the Supreme Soviet, elections, political parties; arranging regular conferences of all the parties and public organizations on pressing problems of the republic.</td>
<td>Self-financing, sponsors' assistance, individual donations.</td>
<td>Joint seminars on preparing for election campaigns; consultations on training political workers and sociologists on public opinion studies, etc. (for the information and analysis center to investigate the democratization of the Party).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Pokolenie&quot; (&quot;Generation&quot;) Pensioners Movement</td>
<td>Social and legal protection of pensioners.</td>
<td>Rendering social and legal assistance to the elderly; joining the pensioners in struggle for their constitutional rights during the transition period by pickets, appeals to the press, submitting well-grounded protests to the legislative and executive bodies; organization of the pensioners' labors; mutual aid.</td>
<td>No financial backing; work performed on voluntary basis.</td>
<td>Studying the legalities of pension-granting in different countries as compared to Kazakhstan; joint activities against discrimination against the elderly through the UNO committee for Human Rights; establishing joint ventures and charitable activities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"Shalom" Jewish Cultural Center
480002, Almaty, Zhilbek Zholy St., 10/20
Phone: (3272) 309404

Main Goals of Organization: Revival and development of Jewish culture, National, cultural, and religious unity among Kazakh Jews.

Main Types of Activity: Planning and implementing programs aimed at the protection and use of the Jewish language as the primary language among Jews. Implementing cultural and educational programs, studying the history, culture and art of the Jewish people, reviving the handcraft industries of Kazakh Jews. Protection of Jews' rights, honor, and dignity; withstanding anti-Semitism in all forms. Cultural and educational programs in Almaty.

Sources of Funding: Membership fees, drawing sponsors for festivals.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Cooperation in the spheres of education, culture, medicine, and religion. Family

Society of Greeks of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Almaty, Vinogradov St. 85, Rm. 425
Phone: (3272) 621088

Main Goals of Organization: Revival of the national culture, traditions, and language.

Main Types of Activity: Organizing Greek language courses for all interested. Assisting Kazakhstani Greeks in obtaining documents to tour Greece.

Sources of Funding: Membership fees, self-financing.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Contact with Greek Americans, exchange of tourists.

Tatar-Bashkin Social and Cultural Center
490012 Almaty, Vinogradov St. 85, Rm. 431
Phone: (3272) 220790

Main Goals of Organization: To revive and preserve the national culture and distinctness of the Tatar-Bashkir population of Kazakhstan.

Main Types of Activity: Maintaining business and cultural ties with similar centers in other countries; contributing to the improvement of international and ethnic relations in Kazakhstan.

Sources of Funding: Voluntary contributions, concerts, small businesses.

Desired Areas of Activity: Locating partners for joint venture formation; adoption of methods of analogous organizations.

"Turan" Azerbaijan Cultural Center
Almaty, Vinogradov St. 85, Rm. 411
Phone: (3272) 694169

Main Goals of Organization: Friendly relations between all Turkic peoples; studies of the history, culture, traditions, and language of Azerbaijan peoples.

Main Types of Activity: Clubs for children (chess, sculpture, study groups on national traditions, Azerbaijan language); amateur talent activities for adults; commercial activities.

Sources of Funding: Membership fees, sponsors, voluntary contributions by organizations and individuals.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Locating partners.
Main Goals of Organization: Revival and preservation of Ukrainian culture, language, and traditions.

Main Types of Activity: Sunday school for adults (study of the Ukrainian language); amateur talent activities (teaching children and adults Ukrainian songs and dances); information about Ukraine; study of the history and national liberation movement of Ukrainians in Kazakhstan.

Sources of Funding: Membership fees, voluntary contributions, income from small businesses established by the center.

Main Goals of Organization: Promotion of Kazakhstan science and culture. Establishing Slavic theater. Establishing training and educational centers for children and teenagers (music, theater, fine arts, health).

Main Types of Activity: Charitable activities; arrangement of festivals, art exhibits, T.V. programs; participation in establishing scientific and production laboratories; service work (cafes, saloons, shops), lottery arrangements.

Sources of Funding: Voluntary contributions.

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Contacts with similar centers in the U.S., establishing joint ventures; commerce.

"Zhardem" ("Help") International Charitable Fund
480099, Almaty, Furmanov St. 274/8
Phone: (3272) 647449

Desired Areas of Cooperation: Establishing joint scientific and production labs for manufacturing medicines from venom, locating partners to form a joint venture monitoring an oil-pipe-line ("know-how" is available); contacts with NGOs and individuals interested in restoring Christian churches and cathedrals in Kazakhstan and Russia.
APPENDIX III

United States Government Grantee and Contractor Representatives

American Bar Association
Karen Widess
Tel: 7-3272-6763-56
Fax: 7-3272-6763-56

International Executive Service Corps
Susan Johnson
Clifford Liddon
Tel: 7-3272-5062-46,6150-11
Fax: 7-3272-5062-46

International Republican Institute
Erick Kugler
Tel: 7-3272-5062-33
Fax: 7-3272-5062-33

ISAR
Lynne Richards
Country Director
Eric Sievers
Assistant Program Director
Tel: 7-3272-6942-18
U.S.:
1601 Connecticut Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20009
Tel: 202-387-3034
Fax: 202-667-3291

National Democratic Institute
John Ritchotte
Tel: 7-3272-6017-54
Fax: 7-3272-6017-54

Volunteers in Overseas Cooperative Assistance
Mark Levenson
Tel: 7-3272-6319-91
Fax: 7-3272-6319-91

International City Managers Association
Joseph Grassie
Tel: 7-3272-6737-03
Fax: 7-3272-3302-43

Winrock International
Patrick Ludgate
Tel: 7-3272-2614-79
Fax: 7-3272-6368-04

U.S. Treasury Department
Nils Larson
Tel: 7-3272-4783-42

WeissA
Susan Welsby
Tel: 7-3272-3264-34

International Research & Exchanges Board
Reef Altoms
Tel: 7-3272-6113-14, 61-29-13

American Council of Teachers of Russian
Heather Bealick
Fax: 7-3272-6113-14

Mercy Corps International
Lowel Ewert
Tel: 7-3272-6778-47

U.S. Department of Agriculture
Kenneth Gray
Tel: 7-3272-6325-44

87


APPENDIX IV

CONTACTS IN KAZAKHSTAN

Alma-Ata City Ecology Center
Svetlana Nikitchina Mitrofantsky
Director
Marat A. Chimbualatov
Chair, Committee on Ecology
74-a Ablay-chan
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6270-03, 6392-54 (Marat)
Tel: 7-3272-6920-73 (Svetlana)

Alma-Ata, City of
Arthur Schiller
Dept. of Communications
Room 301
City Administration Building
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6224-37

Alma-Ata City Production Association
FARMATSIYA
Zuriyat N. Sybankulova
Director General
15, Pushkina St.
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-3362
3388-67, 3943-89

Alma-Ata, City of
Nurlan Bulanbaev
Chairman of City Administration
Dept. on Relations with Non-Profits
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6259-47

Alma-Ata, City of
Ulan Baijoner
Head of City Dept. of Justice
Business/Non-profit Relationships
84 Venogradova ul. Frionaya
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6925-50

Alma-Ata, City of
Makzan Burnadurov
First Assistant
Dept. of Business and Entrepreneurship
City Administration Building
Room 224, 2nd Floor
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6227-97, 6283-27

Alma-Ata, City of
Tlakan Aizova
Director
Demography Department
Alma-Ata City Administration
Main Institution of Labor
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Phone: 62-93-26

Alma-Ata, City of
Nurlan Souleymenov
Oblakhana St.,
74 a, 2nd Floor, 220
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6241-19, 6235-91

Alma-Ata Women’s Committee
Alevtina Moiseeva
Deputy Chairman
Kalaskas Murtazina
Secretary
Alma-Ata Women’s Committee

ARNA-SPRINT
Murat A. Abdrahmanov
President
Panfilova Str. 129
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 8327-250-6075, 638936
Fax: 8327-250-6074, 638864
AItNA-SPRINT
Askar B. Ilmaghazov
Leading Specialist
Sales and Marketing
Panfilova Str. 129
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 8327-250-6075, 638936
Fax: 8327-250-6074, 638864

ARNA-SPRINT
Askar S. Yezhanov
Acting Director
Sales and Marketing Department
Panfilova Str. 129
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 8327-250-6075, 638936
Fax: 8327-250-6074, 638864

Artists Union
Andrei Vishnyakov
Secretary
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6343-23

Association of Ecological Enlightenment
Uralisk
Sergei Pavlovich Churlin
Alekander Mikhailovich Panchenko
Western Kazakhstan
Tel: 331122-539-65, 228-35
E-Mail: sococo@glas.apc.org

ASTANA-HOLDING
Mukhtar K. Ablyazov
President
302 r., 67a, Tole By St.
480091, Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-269-6340
Fax: 7327-269-6530

Biosphere Club
Valdimir Pavlovich Karmanov
Chair
Lyubov Andreevna Ganzhina
Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-32368-33-517

Caravan Corporation
Joel Antal
Senior Privatization Advisor
4350 North Fairfax Dr., Ste. 500
Arlington, VA 22203
Tel: 703-243-1700
Fax: 703-243-0471

Central State Museum of Kazakhstan
Ryehan I. Kosmambetova
Director
480090, Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Samar-1 44
Tel: 7-3272-6425-80, 6422-00

Centre on Work with Abnormal Children
Maira Suleeva
Director
City Consulting and Rehabilitation
166, Kurmangazy
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Phone: 48-93-58 (h) or 43-24-13 (o)

Business Assistance
Ruslan I. Karapatsinski
Interpreting/Translating Services
Miscellaneous Computer Services
96 Karinina St., Apt. 14
480100 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-262-1206
Fax: 7327-247-0391

Stanislav V. Urzhumanov
Vice President
Chairman of the Executive Committee
65/69 Nauryshai Batir Str.
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-692-001
Fax: 7-3272-535-117
Telex: 251218 TOTAL SU

Caravan Business Centre
Antonina N. Solovyova
Interpreter
9/11
Chaikovsky St.
480003, Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-3997-63, 3284-20

Carana

Ryehan I. Kosmambetova
Director
480090, Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Samar-1 44
Tel: 7-3272-6425-80, 6422-00

Centre on Work with Abnormal Children
Maira Suleeva
Director
City Consulting and Rehabilitation
166, Kurmangazy
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Phone: 48-93-58 (h) or 43-24-13 (o)
Congress of the Entrepreneurs
Bolat B. Djamishev
Deputy Chairman
Executive Committee
65/69 Nauriszal Batyr St.,
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-269-2001
Fax: 7327-233-5117
Telex: 251218 TOTAL SU

COUNTERTPART CANADA
Roger Roy
Executive Director
1940 Westover Road
North Vancouver, B.C.
Canada V7J 3J3
Tel: 604-987-4296
Fax: 604-987-4217

Department on Social Defense of Population
Zaure Mukhamedkarimova
Director
Phone: 7-3272-6233-24, 6384-48

Development Alternatives, Inc.
Robert Otto
Vice President
7250 Woodmont Ave., Suite 200
Bethesda, MD 20814
Direct Dial: 301-718-8262
Tel: 301-718-8699
Telex: 424822 DAI UI
Fax: 301-718-7968

Development Alternatives, Inc.
Carol A. Finnegan
Regional Marketing Manager
Eastern Europe/NIS
7250 Woodmont Ave., Suite 200
Bethesda, MD 20814
Direct Dial: 301-215-7016
Tel: 301-718-8699
Telex: 424822 DAI UI
Fax: 301-718-7968

Dr. Lumilla Odarchenko
Maternity House #2

Ecocenter of Alma-Ata
Murtaz Chembulaev
Senior Ecologist
Lenina St., 74 Kirova Corner Lenina
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6270-03

Ecofund of Kazakhstan
Lev Ivanovich Kurlapov
Victor Zonov
Co-Chairs
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6774-59
Tel: 7-3272-5785-80
E-mail: ecostan@glas.net.org

EKOM
(Ecology and Public Opinion)
Nikolai Stapanovich Savukhin
Valeri Pavlovich Galenko
Pavlodar, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3182-7596-31 (W)
Tel: 7-3182-7267-75 (H)

Friendship Society, The
Zhibek Amirkhanova
Chairman
Kurmangazy St., 4
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6299-22

Fund in Support of Ecological Education
Zharas Takenov
Chair
Gulmira Djamanova
Deputy Chair
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-4129-91, 2948-20

FYI Information Resources
Sergei Dascalu
Project Manager
a/ya 2797 Dnepropetrovsk 320094
Ukraine
Tel: 7056-241-7730
Fax: 7056-241-7730
Telex: 127476 PTB SU

FYI Information Resources
Jonathan Halperin
President
1413 K St., NW, 10th Floor
Washington, D.C. 20005
Tel: (202) 682-2394
Fax: (202) 682-2399

Green Movement
Aleksander Pavlovich Zagribelini
Chair
Djambul, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3262-2524-83
Green Salvation
Sergei Georgievich Kurato
Chair
Artem Borisovich Salin
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: (Kurato) 7-3272-6789-06
Tel: (Salin) 7-3272-2677-57

Grover C. Harris, JR., Ph.D.
Poultry Consultant
617 Edna St.
Fayetteville, AK 72703
Tel: 501-442-6182

IFRA Republican Publicity Information Agency
Valentina Alexandrovna Filippova
Director
90 Mechnikova St., 1st floor
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6724-17
Fax: 7-3272-3082-80

Intercollegiate Ecology Council
Galina Kurmasheva Ergazina
Aleksander Pisarov
Karaganda, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3212-5659-12
Tel: 7-3212-5807-94
E-Mail: Kruisilbond@rrastak.msk.su

International Physicians for the Prevention of Nuclear War
Marat Temirhanovich Sagimbaev
Karaganda, Kazakhstan
Tel: 73212-7420-88

International Center of Business Cooperation
Gala Yu. Medvedskaya
Interpreter
Karl Marx St., 18
480016 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-233-2971, 322146
Fax: 7327-233-2975

Karaganda Regional Ecology Center
Igor Michaelevich Budov
Director
Khalilulla Isenov
Karaganda, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3212-7337-06 (W)
Tel: 7-3212-5770-01 (Budov)
Tel: 7-3212-7210-20 (Isenov)

Kazakhstan, Republic of
Dr. Raisa Kadyrova
Institute for Hygiene and Professional Diseases
Ministry of Health
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan

Kazakhstan Republic of
Yuri D. Nilov
Deputy Minister
Ministry of Communications
480091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
134 Bogenbai Batyr St.,
Tel: 7327-262-5340
Fax: 7327-263-7210

Kazakhstan Association of Women Invalids that have Children
Bibigul Imangazina
President
109,116 Baizakov Street
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-5361-82

Kazakhstan, Republic of
Viktor K. Khrapunov
First Deputy Mayor
Alma-Ata City Administration
74A, Abilai-khan av.,
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-262-2797
Fax: 7327-263-6479
Telex: 251214 KWESG

Kazakhstan, Republic of
Mugulsum M. Amirova
Deputy Head
Ministry of Justice,
Atieke Bi St., 67
48091 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-262-4572
Fax: 7327-254-1869

Kazakhstan, Republic of
Kazyken Bazylov
Deputy Minister
Ministry of Communication of Kazakhstan
134 Bogenbay batur st.,
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
T: 7327-262-7019
Fax: 7327-263-7210
Post Telephone and Telegraph
Mr. Basabarov
Director
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-3364-35

Republican Scientific Research Institute on Maternal and Child Health
Dr. Tamara Chuvakov
Dr. Magrifa Sharifkanova

Social Democratic Party
Ludmila Alexseyeva Igashova
Press Secretary

Tagibat (EcoUnion and Green Party)
Mels Hamsaevich Elusizov
Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-6317-17, 2139-93

U.S. Agency for International Development
Regional Mission for Central Asia
Craig Buck
Director
James Ahn
Controller
Mike Curtis
A/EXO
Edward W. Birgells
Project Officer
Paula Feeny
General Development Officer
Lynn Dunn
Private Sector Officer
Tel: 7327-263-9267
Fax: 7327-269-6490

Unity of Families with Many Children of Alma-Ata
Kulbara Pautova
Chairman
Kazken Dykanbaeva
Deputy Chairman
33,3 Pushkin Street
480004 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Phone: 73272-3345-05 (o), 5323-22 (h)

University of Dublin
Paul Healy
Dept. of Computer Science
Trinity College Dublin 2, Ireland
Tel: +353-1-7021535, 7021765
Fax: +353-1-6772204
e-mail: phealy@cs.tcd.ie

Volunteers in Overseas Cooperative Assistance (VOCA)
Mark Leverson
Country Representative, Kazakhstan
SAIKES Business Center
Suite 27
75 Lenina St.
480021 Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7327-263-1991
Fax: 7327-263-1991

Winrock International Inst. for Agricultural Development
Kazakh State Academy of Management
Kenneth A. Clatfelter
Food Scientist
81, Saina St., 480084, Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-2614-79
Petit Jean Mountain
Morrilton, Arkansas 72110-9537
Tel: 501-727-5435
Fax: 501-727-5242

Winrock International Inst. for Agricultural Development
Kazakh State Academy of Management
Ben I. Schlegel, DVM
Veterinarian
81, Saina St., 480084, Alma-Ata, Kazakhstan
Tel: 7-3272-2614-79
Petit Jean Mountain
Morrilton, Arkansas 72110-9537
Tel: 501-727-5435
Fax: 501-727-5242

World Bank, The
Christina E. Leijonhufvud
Country Officer
Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan
Europe and Central Asia Desk
Tel: 202-473-8146
Fax: 202-477-3372

World Bank, The
Bo Dahlborg
Training Management Specialist
Human Resources Division
Europe And Central Asia Department
1818 H St., NW
Washington, DC 20433
Tel: 202-472-2285
Fax: 202-667-3291
BIBLIOGRAPHY


