

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

PD-ABP-079

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS 93924
2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE. NOT DOT MATRIX TYPE.

IDENTIFICATION DATA

A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit: Mission or AID/W Office: USAID/JAMAICA (Es# _____)	B. Was Evaluation Scheduled in Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan? Yes <input type="checkbox"/> Slipped <input type="checkbox"/> Ad Hoc <input type="checkbox"/> Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY ____ Q ____	C. Evaluation Timing Interim <input type="checkbox"/> Final <input type="checkbox"/> Ex Post <input type="checkbox"/> Other <input type="checkbox"/>
---	---	--

D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following informations for project(s) or program(s) evaluated: if not applicable list title and date of the evaluation report.

Project No.:	Project Program Title:	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost	Amount Obligated to Date
532-0173	Project - Development of Environmental Management Organizations		9/97	\$11.65 million	\$5.589

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved by Mission or AID/W Office Director	Name of Entity Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
Action(s) Required		
Support NRCA to assume lead role in management of protected areas <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discontinue USAID funding to the PIOJ PARC/PMU.</li> <li>• Assist early certification of the NRCA to receive grant funds.</li> <li>• Provide TA &amp; funding to NRCA to assume protected areas management project responsibilities.</li> </ul> Support JCDDT & MBMPT to strengthen park management and revenue generation skills <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Assist early certification of JCDDT and MBMPT to receive grant funds.</li> <li>• Clarify JCDDT project responsibilities with respect to BJCMNP management.</li> <li>• Provide TA &amp; funding to JCDDT to implement specific project responsibilities.</li> <li>• Provide TA &amp; funding to MBMPT to assume full local management and specific responsibilities.</li> </ul> Finalize approach/implement actions to accomplish Protected Area System financial sustainability <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Determine financial sustainability strategy including roles of public/private sectors.</li> <li>• Establish policies/objectives to manage PAS trust fund.</li> <li>• Prepare fund-raising action plan.</li> <li>• Provide TA &amp; funding to implement strategy.</li> </ul> Resolve CDC Institutional Setting, Role in Project <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discontinue USAID funding to CDC pending resolution of CDC future.</li> <li>• Redefine CDC institutional setting, financing arrangements, project role.</li> </ul> Modify/Strengthen Project Management Framework <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Augment NRCA PMU staff/strengthen PMU management of DEMO.</li> <li>• Extend PACD by at least 6 months.</li> <li>• Reduce USAID management of DEMO to a single officer.</li> </ul>	USAID NRCA, USAID NRCA, PCC  JCDDT, MBMPT JCDDT, NRCA, PCC PCC, USAID PCC, USAID  PCC, JNPTF PCC, JNPTF PCC, JNPTF PCC, USAID  USAID CDC, PCC  NRCA USAID USAID	31 March 30 June 31 May  30 June 30 June 30 June 30 May  31 July 31 July 30 Sept. 1 Oct.  31 March 31 July  31 July 31 May 1 July

APPROVALS

F. Date of Mission or AID/W Office Review of Evaluation: (Month) (Day) (Year)

G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary and Action Decisions:

	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Name (Typed)	S. REEVE/G. LEWIS	FRANKLIN McDONALD	JOANN FELDMAN-LAWRENCE	H. Smith
Signature	<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>	<i>[Signature]</i>
Date	6/4/96	24 June 1996		

**ABSTRACT**

**H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)**

The DEMO Project has now completed two and a half years of activity that has focused on strengthening the capability of public and private environmental organizations to manage and provide policy and regulatory oversight of Jamaica's most economically important natural resources. In spite of a slow start-up, most mid-term objectives have been met and considerable project momentum has led the evaluation team to conclude that the project has a good prospect of achieving its principal objectives and project purpose.

**I. DEMO Components (excluding PARC II)**

**A. The Natural Resources Conservation Authority - Key Finding:** The NRCA, with DEMO/Technical Support Service assistance, is off to a good start in its program to becoming a more skilled and effective organization. In particular, the NRCA has realized steady progress in: developing and implementing participatory environmental planning processes; developing environmental regulations; and creating and strengthening internal management. At this point, however, NRCA seems to be heavily reliant on its USAID-funded technical assistance contractor for programming and managing technical activities and developing NRCA products.

**B. The DEMO SITE Component - Key Finding:** The DEMO/NRCA work in Negril to develop a protected area plan has been successful in harmonizing the interests of a diverse group of resource users/stakeholders, and provides a model for public-private NGO collaboration that can be used throughout Jamaica.

**C. The NGO Component of DEMO - Key Finding:** Although it took longer than expected for the National Environmental Societies Trust (NEST) to assume its intended role under DEMO, the organization is now active in providing project planning, strategic planning and proposal development assistance to a large number of Jamaican environmental NGOs. NEST's Executive Director is well-regarded within the NGO community and the NGOs that have participated in NEST training have considered the training to have been well-run and useful.

**II. The PARC II Component of DEMO**

Although PARC II's objectives were exceedingly ambitious and perhaps unrealistic, the overall lack of progress has nonetheless been a disappointment to all involved. A presentation of the project's principal objectives along with a snapshot of progress to date follows.

1. **To develop a sustainable park system by privatizing management, and raising funds to support parks. Not Achieved.**  
There has not been any significant progress made by the PARC II component in establishing a viable and sustainable park system. The Jamaica National Parks Institute (JNPI), which was to have been the managing entity of a financially sustainable national park system has not been created. The Jamaica Conservation and Development Trust (JCDT) has been unsuccessful in its efforts to significantly expand the capital endowment of the Jamaica National Parks Trust Fund (JNPTF) which, in part, was to fund the JNPI. However, the Montego Bay Marine Park Trust (MBMPT), under its own initiative, has created its own trust fund and is taking steps to assume responsibility for its own long-term financial needs.

2. **Strengthening NRCA's park policy making and enforcement capabilities. Not Achieved (under the PARC II component).**  
The NRCA has made important advances in its ability to create and manage a national parks and protected area system, most notably a national policy framework has been developed and is well along in the process of becoming national policy. However, the NRCA's achievements in this area have come primarily as a result of its association with DEMO components other than PARC II.

3. **Expanding the park system to protect other critical areas. Not Achieved.**  
The PARC II component called for the creation of up to two new national parks -- the Cockpit Country and Black River -- once the financial viability of the country's existing two parks could be assured. As discussed under item one, the financial viability of Jamaica's existing two parks has not improved or been assured under the PARC II component, and thus no new parks have been created. There is an initial effort to establish a protected areas management plan for the Black River watershed but it is the NRCA, with DEMO/SITE assistance, that appears poised to take this initiative. The PARC II component did little, if anything, to advance progress on the creation of a park or protected area in Cockpit Country. The PARC II component did not proceed as expected and has accomplished little of consequence. The PARC II component's design was based on the establishment of the JNPI as the central institution that would have been responsible for the management and expansion of a national park system. In retrospect, however, the component's design turned out to be unrealistic. In particular, project design assumptions concerning the JCDT's ability to raise funds to support the system proved to be overly optimistic while, at the same time, the Government of Jamaica never clearly and decisively acted to create the JNPI. Instead of offering direct support for the creation of the JNPI, the NRCA actively pursued a more decentralized approach to the creation and management of a park and protected area system (with assistance from DEMO's SITE component).

**COSTS**

**I. EVALUATION COSTS**

1. Evaluation Team		Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost Or TDY Cost (U.S.\$)	Source of Funds
Name	Affiliation			
David Callihan	MSI		\$102,446	
Michael Lofstrom	MSI			
Alan Moore	MSI			
Bevon Morrison	MSI			
Wilbur LaPage	MSI			

2

2. Mission/Office Professional Staff  Person - Days ( Estimate )  _____	3. Borrower/Grantee Professional  Staff Person-Days (Estimate) _____
---	--

**SUMMARY**

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)

Address the following items:

- |  |                             |
|--|-----------------------------|
| • Purpose of evaluation and methodology used     | • Principal recommendations |
| • Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated.            | • Lessons learned           |
| • Findings and conclusions (relate to questions) |                             |

Mission or Office:	Date This Summary Prepared: April 24, 1996	Title and Date of Full Evaluation Report: USAID/Jamaica - Development of Environmental Management Organizations, March 1996
--------------------	--	--

**Purpose:** Mid-term project evaluation.

**Methodology:** A five person team from Management Systems International conducted the evaluation of the DEMO Project. The full evaluation team spent three weeks in Jamaica during November 1995 concentrating its effort on an analysis of the PARC II component of DEMO. In December 1995, three team members spent an additional two weeks in Jamaica completing analysis of the PARC II Component as well as reviewing the NRCA, NEST and SITE components of DEMO. The team reviewed relevant files and reports, visited all of the organizations involved in the implementation of the DEMO Project, and conducted field visits to the Blue and John Crow Mountain National Park, the Montego Bay Marine Park and the Negril SITE activity.

**Purpose of Activities Evaluated:** The USAID/Jamaica DEMO Project was authorized in September 1992, for the purpose of strengthening public and private organizations "to manage Jamaica's most economically important natural resources." The project's original emphasis included assistance to:

- build the capacity of the Jamaican Government's Natural Resources Conservation Authority;
- strengthen Jamaican environmental NGOs; and
- design and test public-private community-based environmental management activities in four economically and geographically diverse sites: Montego Bay and Negril during the project's first two years, and in the Black River watershed and the Kingston Bay coastal area during the project's final two years.

In October 1993, the PARC II Project Paper Supplement to the DEMO Project (hereafter referred to as the PARC II component) was created to develop a sustainable national park system. This was to be done by privatizing management and raising funds to support parks, strengthening the Jamaican Government's park policy making and enforcement capabilities, and expanding the park system beyond the two national parks that were in existence at the project's inception - the Blue and John Crow Mountains National Park and the Montego Bay Marine Park. (Both of these parks were created under the USAID PARC I Project.)

**Findings and Conclusions: Overall Performance of DEMO, excluding the PARC II Component**

The DEMO Project (excluding PARC II) is making good progress and can be expected to achieve its principal objectives and project purpose. Foremost, these objectives include providing assistance to the Natural Resources Conservation Authority to enable it to assume a leadership role in safeguarding Jamaica's environment - in some cases to be undertaken through policy and regulatory development and enforcement and, in other cases, to be pursued through participatory planning approaches involving a wide range of affected stakeholders. The USAID/DEMO Project's principal accomplishments to date are highlighted below. The project has:

- Assisted the NRCA to develop into an institution able to assume responsibility for the formulation of policies and regulations necessary to guide and oversee the stewardship of Jamaica's environment. This work has included developing guidelines for conducting environmental impact assessments, completing a "State of the Environment Report," installing a computer information system, and assisting the NRCA to develop its own accounting system. Provisions for regulatory enforcement are being developed and will be fully enacted once they are adopted as law - a process that is well underway.
- Assisted the NRCA to develop a "National System of Protected Areas Plan." This includes a proposed national policy for creating and managing protected areas, which is in the process of being adopted as official government policy. The NRCA's protected areas policy paper is expected to be approved by the Cabinet in mid-1996. The protected area establishment procedure proposed in the NRCA's policy document has been successfully tested in Negril (through USAID/DEMO activities), enjoys widespread support by local government and NGOs, and is soon to be applied by the NRCA in the Black River watershed and the Kingston Bay area.
- Provided technical assistance and training that has strengthened the institutional management capabilities of a wide range of Jamaican environmental NGOs. This assistance has principally been undertaken through USAID/DEMO's support to the National Environmental Societies Trust (NEST), a Jamaican NGO membership organization that was established in 1989. NEST's purpose has been to provide technical assistance to NGOs to enable them to develop project design and management skills so they can access grants from the Environmental Foundation of Jamaica. As a result of assistance received from NEST, about a dozen NGOs have been awarded grants from the Environmental Foundation of Jamaica and are currently implementing community-based environmental improvement projects.

Overall, the evaluation team is confident that the DEMO Project (with the exception of the PARC II component) is proceeding as expected and will likely achieve its principal objectives by the project's completion.

**Specific Recommendations to Improve the DEMO Project, excluding PARC II Component****Augment NRCA PMU staff/Strengthen PMU management of DEMO****Findings and Conclusions: Overall Performance of the PARC II Component**

The PARC II Component was to build on the momentum of the PARC I Project but has not performed as per design expectations. Under the PARC II Project:

- new parks have not been created although two were envisioned;
- there are no revenue generation programs in operation at the two existing parks, as were called for under the project agreement;
- the JCDT capital campaign to increase the Jamaican National Parks Trust Fund, to have been largely funded by USAID, was never undertaken;
- the Jamaican National Parks Institute, which was to have helped finance and oversee the management of national parks, was never created; and
- the Conservation Data Center has played no meaningful role in supporting protected area management in Jamaica.

In summary, the PARC II component did not proceed as expected and has accomplished little of consequence. In retrospect, the component's design turned out to be unrealistic. In particular, project design projections concerning the JCDT's ability to raise funds to support a park financing system proved to be overly optimistic while, at the same time, the Government of Jamaica never clearly and decisively acted to create the JNPI. Instead of offering direct support for the creation of the JNPI, the NRCA (for a variety of understandable reasons) actively pursued a more decentralized approach to the creation and management of a park and protected area system (with assistance from DEMO's SITE component).

**The PARC II Component: General Recommendations**

In the view of the evaluation team, the objectives of the PARC II component are still valid and can be achieved over the coming few years. To achieve the component's objectives, however, fundamental implementation and management adjustments will be necessary. In particular, activity should now be concentrated on: strengthening the NRCA's ability to establish, implement and enforce parks and protected area policy; strengthening the park management capabilities of NGOs that are expected to receive NRCA delegation of authority to manage parks and protected areas; and revisiting and/or redesigning the strategy of how to ensure financing will be available to support protected area management in Jamaica.

Future funding needs for the protected area system will be considerable and should come from a variety of sources, including local revenue generation, private sector participation, local endowment funds, bilateral and multilateral funding agencies, and a permanent cash flow source (such as a tourist departure tax). Each protected area and its management entity will require a different mix of these funding sources.

**Specific Recommendations to Improve the PARC II Component**

- Shift PARC II management responsibilities from the PIOJ/PMU to the NRCA.
- Provide direct USAID grant support to the JCDT and the MBMPT to improve their park management and revenue generation skills.
- Prepare the NRCA to take a lead role in the management of parks and protected areas.
- Encourage the JNPTF Board of Trustees to undertake reforms to revise and clarify its mission, organizational structure and operating procedures.
- Resolve institutional setting, mission and financial sustainability of the CDC and discontinue USAID financial support for the CDC until such resolution.

**Findings and Conclusions: USAID Management**

USAID's management of the DEMO Project (other than the PARC II Component) can be characterized as having been effective, collaborative, and helpful. Good working relationships have been established, and close coordination on all project planning and decision-making takes place.

**Specific Recommendations to Improve USAID Management**

- Consolidate project management to one Project Officer responsible for all DEMO activities.
- Review the DEMO logical framework so that its objectives and indicators adequately reflect the changes that will be implemented as a result of this evaluation. In particular, emphasis should be given to indicators that allow USAID to meaningfully track progress in the following two areas: the institutional strengthening of the NRCA and progress towards creating a financially viable Jamaican parks and protected area system.
- Extend the PACD for at least six months to March 31, 1998.