

# BOTSWANA C-TIP ASSESSMENT FINAL REPORT

August 2022

Tasking N046
Contract No. GS-10F-0033M / Order No. 7200AA18M00016

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by NORC at the University of Chicago. The authors' views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

# DRG LEARNING, EVALUATION, AND RESEARCH (DRG-LER) II ACTIVITY

# BOTSWANA C-TIP ASSESSMENT FINAL REPORT

## August 2022

Tasking N046
Contract No. GS-10F-0033M / Order No. 7200AA18M00016

#### **Submitted to:**

Matthew Baker, USAID COR

#### **Submitted by:**

NORC at the University of Chicago Matthew Parry, Program Manager Bethesda, MD 20814 Tel: 301-634-5444; E-mail: parry-matthew@norc.org

#### **DISCLAIMER**

The authors' views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	ACRONYMS	4
1.	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY FINDINGS TYPES AND LOCATIONS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING VICTIM VULNERABILITIES, RECRUITMENT, AND SERVITUDE EXPERIENCES PRIORITY NEEDS OF TRAFFICKING SURVIVORS TIP KNOWLEDGE, ATTITUDES, AND PRACTICES OF GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS RECOMMENDATIONS	1 2 2 2 3 3 4
2. BAC	CKGROUND	5
3. RES	EARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY LIMITATIONS LOCATION AND OCCUPATIONS OF RESPONDENTS	7 8 8
4. TYP	PES AND LOCATIONS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BOTSWANA TYPES OF TRAFFICKING LABOR TRAFFICKING AGRICULTURAL FORCED LABOR FORCED CHILD LABOR SEX TRAFFICKING COMMON TRAFFICKING ROUTES TRAFFICKING ROUTES	9 9 10 11 12 14 15
5. VIC	TIM VULNERABILITIES, RECRUITMENT, AND SERVITUDE EXPERIENCES LABOR TRAFFICKING RECRUITMENT PATTERNS VICTIM VULNERABILITIES SERVITUDE EXPERIENCE SEX TRAFFICKING RECRUITMENT PATTERNS VICTIM VULNERABILITIES SERVITUDE EXPERIENCES	16 16 17 19 20 20 21 23
6. PRIC	ORITY NEEDS OF TRAFFICKING SURVIVORS	24
7. KN	OWLEDGE, ATTITUDES, AND PRACTICES OF GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS KNOWLEDGE ATTITUDES AND PRACTICES	26 26 27
8. REC	PROSECUTION PROTECTION PREVENTION PARTNERSHIP	31 32 32 32
9. REF	ERENCES	34
ANNE	EX I: KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW PROTOCOLS	35

GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS	35
BAR AND RESTAURANT OWNERS	38
FARMERS AND TRUCKERS	39
FRONTLINE OFFICERS	40
LOCAL GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS / COMMUNITY LEADERS / CHIEFS	42
ANNEX II: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL FOR IECS	44
SURVIVOR SURVEY	44

### **ACRONYMS**

C-TIP Counter-trafficking in Persons

DOS Department of State

DRC Democratic Republic of the Congo

DRG Democracy, Human Rights, and Governance

EQ Evaluation Question

IECS Individual Engaged in Commercial Sex

IIECS Interview with Individual Engaged in Commercial Sex

IOM International Organization for Migration

IRB Institutional Review Board
KII Key Informant Interview

LER Learning, Evaluation, and Research

MOJ Ministry of Justice

NORC National Opinion Research Center (NORC at the University of Chicago)

RT Research Team

SADC Southern African Development Community

SI Social Impact

TIP Trafficking in Persons

UNODC UN Office on Drugs and Crime

USAID United States Agency for International Development

#### I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Botswana is a key source and destination country for human trafficking. As an important corridor from poorer countries in Central Africa to South Africa, Botswana is widely believed to be a hotspot for cross-border trafficking in persons (TIP). Botswana is also affected by several types of domestic trafficking, including trafficking into forced labor on cattle farms, trafficking into the sex trade, and trafficking into forced domestic servitude.

Although Botswana passed the Anti-Human Trafficking Act in 2014, the country is only just starting to get a handle on the scale of the problem and implement policies to address it. Botswana has a specialized office within the Ministry of Justice (MOJ) focused on TIP policy, and it has laws that carry adequate penalties. However, because the Government of Botswana does not collect data on TIP and limited systematic research has been done on the topic, little is known about the prevalence or main types of TIP within its borders. This lack of information constitutes a major barrier to designing evidence-based policies and programs to address human trafficking in Botswana.

With this background in mind, this study seeks to address the following questions:

- (I) What are the most common forms of human trafficking in Botswana, and where in Botswana are they occurring?
- (2) How do victim vulnerabilities, recruitment patterns, and servitude experiences vary across the main types of human trafficking in Botswana? What are the reasons individuals become vulnerable to trafficking?
- (3) What are the priority needs of trafficking survivors? What types of programs might help address them?
- (4) What is the current state of knowledge, attitudes, and practices among key government stakeholders in Botswana?

To address these questions, the research team conducted 108 Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) with a wide range of stakeholders, including local government officials, social workers, law enforcement officers, bar and restaurant employees, farmers and truck drivers, NGO officials, and border agents. The research team also conducted 15 interviews with individuals engaged in commercial sex (IECS), four of whom were determined to be victims<sup>1</sup> of trafficking. These interviews were conducted in Gaborone and the border regions of Chobe, Ghanzi, South-East District, North-East District, Southern District, and North-West District. Data from these interviews was coded to identify key themes linked to the evaluation questions.

-

It should be noted that this report uses the terms "victim" and "survivor." The term "victim" highlights that the individual has had a crime committed against them. "Survivor" is a term used to refer to someone who had been a victim of trafficking but is now recovered or on the road to recovery.

#### **FINDINGS**

#### TYPES AND LOCATIONS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Our research revealed that adult labor trafficking, forced child labor trafficking, and sex trafficking all occur in Botswana. Adult victims of labor trafficking were most often trafficked into the agricultural industry, where they were forced to work for little to no pay while having their identifying documents withheld by their employer. Many individuals trafficked for labor in agriculture were brought into Botswana from other countries in the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region. Our findings also revealed many cases of forced child labor, with children being trafficked into the agricultural industry, the construction industry, domestic work, and forced retail work. Cases of forced child labor were more prevalent than adult labor trafficking, a pattern respondents attributed to children being more susceptible and more easily controlled than their adult counterparts. Sex trafficking was the most common type of trafficking of all, according to our data. In each of the study districts, respondents identified sex trafficking as the most common type of trafficking. Victims of sex trafficking were often young women, typically trafficked by older men or relatives.

For forced agricultural labor, cases most commonly occurred in rural areas of Botswana, such as Ghanzi District and Central District, where farms are more commonly located. The same was true for forced child labor within the agricultural industry. Sex trafficking was most common in urban areas like Gaborone, but it was also found in the more populated villages and towns of rural areas.

Across all types of trafficking, respondents reported knowledge of both internal and cross-border trafficking. Within Botswana, it was most common for Batswana to be trafficked from rural areas into more populated urban areas. In regard to cross-border trafficking, victims often either came from or were headed to countries like South Africa, Zimbabwe, Zambia, Malawi, and other SADC countries.

In terms of locations where trafficking has been thwarted and victims rescued, respondents frequently identified border areas with South Africa, Zimbabwe, and Zambia. This includes the land border crossings as well as nearby villages. A small number of traffickers and their victims were also intercepted at Gaborone's international airport.

#### VICTIM VULNERABILITIES, RECRUITMENT PATTERNS, AND SERVITUDE EXPERIENCES

Adult victims of **labor trafficking** are primarily recruited through false promises of high paying jobs and, to a lesser extent, promises of educational opportunities. More research is needed to determine exactly how victims are recruited and by whom. Poverty is the main vector of vulnerability. Forced child labor victims are recruited through promises of a better life, usually given to the parents of the child. Traffickers prey on the parents' poverty and their desire to give their child a better life than they can provide. In these cases, traffickers are likely to be known to the parents – either relatives or acquaintances. The cultural practices of sending a child to live with a more economically well-off relative or family friend allows this type of trafficking to flourish. Children of ethnic minorities within Botswana are particularly vulnerable to being trafficked – also resulting from cultural practices and discrimination.

As with victims of trafficking from other parts of the world, traffickers use many forms of abuse and exploitation to keep victims in place and compliant. These include physical restraints to prevent escape such as locked doors, restricting movement, and violence and threats of violence as well as psychological

control such as isolation, confiscation of phones and identity documents, and stoking fears of being imprisoned or deported. Traffickers take advantage of the victims' lack of knowledge about their rights and their lack of awareness about where to go to report problems. They may also be kept working through delaying payments; letting victims believe that they will be paid soon if they just keep working a little longer. Children may be subjected to the same abuses as adults, but may also be kept compliant through the use of positions of authority and cultural norms of respecting one's elders.

As with adult victims of labor trafficking, victims of **sex trafficking** are also recruited through false promises of high paying jobs and to a lesser extent promises of educational opportunities. They are frequently recruited by relatives as well as neighbors and friends. They are also recruited through social media platforms and are trafficked when deciding to meet online 'boyfriends' in person. While many women are not trafficked into commercial sex, commercial sex is identified as a strong risk factor for becoming a victim of trafficking. Women engaged in commercial sex were targeted by traffickers and indicate that they do not report their cases to authorities due to a lack of trust in government officials.

Victims of sex trafficking are controlled by being kept captive, not being allowed to keep clothing or have cell phones, and through violence or threats of violence. Whether trafficked or not, women engaged in commercial sex also face a range of other abuses on a regular basis, including men refusing to pay for services, being beaten up, humiliated, having their belongings and money stolen, and being left alone in isolated places.

#### PRIORITY NEEDS OF TRAFFICKING SURVIVORS

Services available to survivors of trafficking in Botswana can be classified as immediate assistance, consisting of temporary shelter, basic clothing and food needs, psychosocial support, medical assistance, and some legal services. The primary providers of these services are NGOs and social workers, as well as the Government of Botswana through the Department of Social Protection. For individuals engaged in commercial sex, further assistance in the form of STD and STI testing, counseling, and medical services is available, primarily provided by NGOs. We found no evidence that survivors or IECS were being provided with long-term support in the form of rehabilitation, education, vocational training, or employment opportunities.

While these services constitute valuable forms of assistance, significant gaps persist. Between KIIs and interviews with IECS, only two respondents overall believe that the services currently available adequately meet victims' needs, while 14 respondents highlighted that funding, capacity, and resource constraints pose significant challenges to meeting victims' needs. Respondents also indicate a lack of long-term psychosocial support, informal sheltering, slow legal proceedings, and an overall focus on repatriation as key gaps in fulfilling victims' priority needs.

#### TIP KNOWLEDGE, ATTITUDES, AND PRACTICES OF GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS

Thirty-one percent of government officials reported they had received at least some counter-trafficking in persons (C-TIP) specific training. Although this moderate level of training signals an important first step towards sensitizing government officials to human trafficking, there is still a strong need for additional training, as many government officials reported feeling ill-prepared to handle cases of human trafficking.

Government officials viewed human trafficking as a "serious issue" requiring a serious response. But serious attitudes towards trafficking do not necessarily equate to serious actions. In practice, government strategies to address trafficking were primarily "reactive" rather than proactive, with authorities only acting in response to cases that are reported. But because public awareness about human trafficking and how to report it is limited, comparatively few cases are ever brought to the attention of authorities.

Government authorities and key informants outside of government also reported a number of problematic practices, including failing to investigate potential trafficking cases, disrespecting IECS, being insensitive to their experiences, and charging them with a crime when they report abuse. The police's unwillingness to thoroughly investigate crimes against IECS and their callousness towards victims' experiences are likely to be a significant deterrent to their reporting crimes against them, a critical population in the fight against human trafficking.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

We offer six topline recommendations for the Government of Botswana and its local and international partners:

- Expand training for front line officers and government social workers so they can more effectively identify cases of human trafficking.
- Address negative attitudes of government officials towards IECS and other vulnerable populations that can discourage victims from reporting to authorities.
- Encourage victims to cooperate in judicial proceedings against traffickers by improving the efficiency of the criminal justice system and strengthening victim protection services.
- Expand services for victims to provide comprehensive reintegration support.
- Raise public awareness about how to identify human trafficking and the importance of reporting trafficking cases to authorities.
- Improve inter-agency cooperation and coordination in response to human trafficking.

Additional information and context about these recommendations and how they might be implemented is provided in the main body of the report.

#### 2. BACKGROUND

Botswana is a source, transit, and destination country for human trafficking. As an important corridor between South Africa and poorer countries in Central Africa and those within the Southern African Development Community (SADC), Botswana is widely believed to be a hotspot for cross-border TIP. Botswana is also believed to be affected by several types of domestic trafficking, including trafficking into forced labor on cattle farms, trafficking into the sex trade, and trafficking into forced domestic servitude.<sup>2</sup>

Although Botswana passed the Anti-Human Trafficking Act in 2014, the country is only just starting to get a handle on the scale of the problem and implement policies to address it. Botswana has a specialized office within the Ministry of Justice (MOJ) focused on TIP policy, and it has laws that carry adequate penalties. However, because TIP data collected by the Government of Botswana is limited and minimal systematic research has been done on the topic, little is known about the prevalence or main types of TIP within its borders. Indeed, according to the Counter Trafficking Data Collaborative, a global data hub managed by the International Organization for Migration (IOM) to anonymize and share data on human trafficking, Botswana is among just a handful of countries with no trafficking data whatsoever, and the only country from the South African Development Community (SADC).<sup>3</sup> This lack of information constitutes a major barrier to designing evidence-based policies and programs to address human trafficking in Botswana.

Botswana also has a very limited track record of successfully investigating and prosecuting cases of human trafficking. According to the U.S. State Department's 2021 *Trafficking in Persons Report*, Botswana only investigated thirteen cases of trafficking in 2020, ten of which carried over from previous years. The report states that "[t]he government did not convict any traffickers and identified significantly fewer victims than the previous reporting period," indicating that even several years after the Government of Botswana enacted the Anti-Human Trafficking Act, the country still struggles to effectively enforce the law and bring traffickers to justice. The United Nations has documented shortcomings in implementing the Anti-Human Trafficking Act. During a meeting of the UN Human Rights Committee in late 2021, the committee reviewed documentation and data from Botswana and made observations and recommendations accordingly. In their concluding documentation from this meeting, the committee highlighted the "weak implementation of the Anti-Human Trafficking Act; the very low rate of investigations, prosecutions, and convictions for the crime of trafficking; the lenient penalties given to traffickers; and the low rate of identification of victims." They subsequently recommended that the Government of Botswana make more effort to prevent trafficking, as well as identify, investigate, and prosecute potential cases, something that our findings also support.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> <u>U.S. Department of State 2021 Trafficking in Persons Report.</u> Last Accessed June 7, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Global Data Hub on Human Trafficking. Last Accessed June 7, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>U.S. Department of State 2021 Trafficking in Persons Report.</u> Last Accessed June 7, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> It should be noted that in an <u>article</u> published on March 25, 2022, it was reported that a spokesperson for the MOJ publicly stated "As of January 2022, Botswana had 20 cases of human trafficking registered before the courts, and we have attained four convictions since the enactment of the Anti-Human Trafficking Act (2014)." Last Accessed June 9, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Documentation available under 'Botswana' section of the UN Human Rights Office website. Last Accessed June 7, 2022.

This failure to convict has been an issue in Botswana since the signing of the Anti-Human Trafficking Act, which mirrors the regional trend of surprisingly low conviction rates despite a high prevalence of trafficking throughout Southern Africa.<sup>7</sup> A recent study by the SADC Secretariat reported that in 2016, just a few years after the Anti-Human Trafficking Act was passed in 2014, there still had not been any cases of TIP reported in the country. Due to this, the researchers had to draw conclusions "based on [respondents'] perceived cases of TIP and/or general understanding of TIP," from which they learned that Botswana appeared to be more of an origin country for trafficking victims, rather than a destination.<sup>8</sup> The theme of underreporting and few convictions is evident across the body of research produced on TIP in Botswana, including this study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Stories from UNODC Southern Africa: Third Judicial Colloquium on Human Trafficking (2019). Last Accessed June 7, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> <u>Trafficking in Persons in the SADC Region</u> <u>Trafficking in Persons in the SADC Region: a Baseline Report (2015).</u> Last Accessed June 9, 2022.

#### 3. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Our study was designed to capture the insights and perspectives of a wide range of stakeholders, including local government officials, social workers, law enforcement officers, bar and restaurant employees, farmers and truck drivers, NGO officials, and border agents. Geographically, we focused on Gaborone and the border regions of Chobe, Ghanzi, South-East District, North-East District Southern District, and North-West District.

In each of these locations, local researchers spent at least ten field days recruiting respondents through a mix of convenience sampling, referrals from NGOs, and referrals from respondents ("snowball sampling"). Local researchers provided critical knowledge and understanding of cultural context, as well as bilingual skills in English and Setswana (most interviews were conducted in English). The researchers followed a semi-structured interview protocol when interviewing respondents (Annex I). The interview protocol sought to capture respondents' knowledge of human trafficking on the basis of i) their direct, first-hand experiences, and ii) their second-hand experiences through colleagues, co-workers, friends, or family. In total, we conducted 108 KIIs. In our analysis, we coded the data from these interviews to indicate key themes linked to the evaluation questions, tracking our findings in an excel spreadsheet populated by key quotes, notes, and observations.

We also sought to interview survivors of human trafficking. To recruit survivors for our study, we planned to rely on referrals from the Government of Botswana and NGO service providers and shelters. For government entities, most identified survivors had already been repatriated to their home country, and to protect the survivors, government entities did not grant the research team access to those who remained in shelters. Our approach to access survivors through NGOs was also unsuccessful, because so few trafficking victims access services – despite outreach to more than two dozen NGOs, we identified only a handful of survivors. For the small number of survivors identified through this pathway, concerns about exposing survivors or otherwise endangering them during the interview process were paramount. In one case, the research team successfully identified a survivor through an NGO referral, but the survivor later declined to participate, citing security concerns.

The research team also attempted to access survivors under police protection or being held at the Dukwi Detention Center awaiting repatriation, but authorities declined to grant permission.

In lieu of interviewing survivors of trafficking, the research team relied on interviews with individuals engaged in commercial sex (IECS), a population known to be vulnerable to trafficking. They were recruited to participate in this study through referrals from NGOs and referrals from other respondents. In total, 15 women engaged in commercial sex were interviewed as part of this study. Of these, four were revealed to be survivors of trafficking during the interview, an illustration of this populations' vulnerability to trafficking. The IECS interviews followed a semi-structured protocol designed to gain insights into trafficking based on first and second-hand experiences (Annex II).

We complemented the KIIs and interviews with IECS with a desk review of global, regional, and country-specific literature relevant to trafficking in Botswana. In addition, at the outset of the study and

DRG-LER II TASKING N046 BOTSWANA C-TIP ASSESSMENT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> An additional four women presented some indicators of potential trafficking but did not provide sufficient detail to make a determination.

prior to the start of formal KIIs and interviews with IECS, the research team spoke with representatives from seven governmental and non-governmental organizations working to combat trafficking in Botswana. The purpose of these interviews was to better understand the C-TIP landscape in Botswana and secure buy-in and approval for the study from the relevant authorities.

#### LIMITATIONS

This study is subject to two sources of sample selection bias. The first source of sample selection bias is our reliance on convenience and referral samples for interviews with key informants and IECS. Because this study sought to capture the perspectives of a wide range of stakeholders, we did not have the resources to invest in large, representative samples of each of these groups. As a result, the insights and perspectives reported in this study are not representative of any stakeholder group.

A second and more subtle source of selection bias derives from the fact that victims of human trafficking are a "hidden population," inaccessible not only to researchers but also to many of the informants in this study (e.g., law enforcement). As a result, the first and second-hand accounts of trafficking cases reported in this study are unlikely to be representative of the true population of trafficking cases, most of which go unreported to authorities and undetected by everyday citizens. We view this limitation as largely unavoidable given the hidden nature of human trafficking, but it is an important limitation for readers to keep in mind.

#### LOCATION AND OCCUPATIONS OF RESPONDENTS

We conducted a total of 123 interviews for this study, 54 percent (67/123) of which were female. Respondents were interviewed in six out of ten districts, as follows: South-East District (52/123), North-East District (27/123), Ghanzi District (19/123), Southern District (11/123), Chobe District (13/123), and North-West District (2/123).

Respondents included government representatives such as law enforcement officials, social workers, government officials, and local authorities; NGO employees, IECS, including survivors of trafficking; and individuals who work as truck drivers, farmers, or servers in bars or restaurants. See the table below for the number breakdown of these respondents.

Table 1. Occupations of respondents

Breakdown of Respondents	
Law enforcement	18
Government social worker	12
Social worker	7
Government officials	10
Local authorities / Chiefs	7
NGO workers	17
Bar/restaurant worker	15
Truck and bus drivers	20
Farmers	2
Individuals engaged in commercial sex	15

Breakdown of Respondents	
TOTAL	123

# 4. TYPES AND LOCATIONS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BOTSWANA

#### TYPES OF TRAFFICKING

In this section, we discuss the two dominant types of trafficking in Botswana: labor trafficking and sex trafficking. We identify sub-categories of trafficking and illustrate how these crimes manifest in Botswana. We then proceed to discuss where these types of trafficking most frequently occur in Botswana and the Southern African region.

#### LABOR TRAFFICKING

A large number of respondents reported labor trafficking as a common form of trafficking occurring in their jurisdiction. This encompasses confirmed, perceived, and suspected cases, as determined during data analysis by researchers. According to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000, as amended (TVPA), labor trafficking is defined as "the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage or slavery," and is an overarching category that can be broken down into multiple sub-categories, including forced labor, forced begging, and forced child labor.<sup>10</sup>

Each of these sub-categories were mentioned by at least one KII respondent, with the two most common being forced labor and forced child labor. Forced labor among adults had the highest number of individual victims, with 26 confirmed cases shared by respondents with our research team. Respondents also mentioned certain types of forced labor more than others, including industries like agriculture, domestic work, construction, and retail industries. It should be noted that although someone may be trafficked for labor, this does not preclude them from also experiencing sexual exploitation. Respondents presented several examples of women and girls who were trafficked for labor purposes but also experienced sexual exploitation.

Interestingly, male and female child labor victims were mentioned at similar rates, with the majority of victims falling in the 12 to 15 age range. As victims aged, however, it was found that there were far more cases of adult males trafficked into forced labor than there were adult females. Most adult male victims of forced labor were reported to be in their twenties or thirties, but there were some outliers with much older adult males also found to be victims of trafficking.

It is important to note that for many cases, the specific type of labor was unknown. Many cases described to us were thwarted at the border, prior to victims being exploited, and therefore respondents were unable to know for certain the type of exploitation the victims would have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Review Fact Sheet: Labor Trafficking for additional information. Last Accessed June 8, 2022.

experienced. In these instances, the border guards investigated individuals they suspected of trafficking and stopped the potential victims from onward travel.

#### AGRICULTURAL FORCED LABOR

Of the cases in which the type of labor trafficking was known, the majority of instances mentioned in the KIIs concerned forced labor within the agricultural industry, which encompasses exploitation on cattle ranches and crop farms. Respondents shared information about how common it is for foreigners and poor Batswana to be taken advantage of in rural farming communities. One government official shared a case in which "two guys were exploited in one of the Notwane farms, they were told if you plough this farm you will get one million each. So, they were working, but they never got one million...they will work again, and again, not being paid, until we rescued them. They were also from Pakistan" (KII 02). Another NGO officer shared a case in which "[t]here was a Mosarwa man whose national identity card and belongings were confiscated by the employer just because he wanted to leave the job. He was in his late twenties. He reported to the police but didn't get help. We ended up communicating with immigration officers and he was helped with a new identity card" (KII 67). There was a common theme of agricultural workers traveling from other countries to work in Botswana, where they are unfamiliar with the environment and can be easily exploited.

In addition to the confirmed cases of forced agricultural labor among adults, there were many respondents who, although they could not share any definite cases of labor trafficking, still mentioned that they suspected that this was a pressing issue within the industry. When asked if exploitation or abuse was present in the farming and trucking industry in the area, one bus driver remarked "Abuse has been there for a long time. People have not been paid enough money, salaries are low and they have not been paid as they were promised" (KII 141). Farm owners know that it is possible to take advantage of individuals in this industry who do not have ties or resources they can turn to in the country and use these factors to exploit them.

#### **Locations of Agricultural Forced Labor**

Instances of agricultural forced labor most commonly occurred in rural areas of the country, including in less populated areas such as Ghanzi District, in rural ethnic minority communities, in border areas such as Ramatlabama where farms are generally located, and in ethnic minority communities which are typically located in small villages. Respondents reported that farmers commonly target foreign workers as they are more vulnerable due to their legal status within the country and their economic background. One prosecutor we spoke with who had direct experience with cases of agricultural forced labor stated, "it is farm owners, and people who are looking for cheap labor, especially domestic workers, mostly targeting Zimbabweans" (KII 140). A frontline officer in Ramatlabama provided the following insight:

"[P]eople from Zimbabwe, Malawi, and Lesotho are here working in some of the farms. We go to the farms and check if they have proper documents like work permits, resident permits and passports. There are chances that they might not be paid well. We do operations here from time to time. We go to the farms and check if they have the right documents. Some of these workers face labor exploitation in these farms" (KII 42).

Another respondent shared that their NGO had conducted C-TIP efforts in rural regions like the Central District and Ghanzi District as "that's where we experience a lot of trafficking and various forms of people coerced, moving from one area to the other, being lured over greener pastures" (KII 24).

#### FORCED CHILD LABOR

Forced child labor is another common form of labor trafficking mentioned by respondents. Forced child labor was found in a variety of industries, including agricultural, domestic work, retail, construction, and more, with agricultural labor being the most commonly mentioned form. Respondents reported that in many rural communities, it is a cultural norm for children to leave school and begin working in nearby farms in their early adolescence, around 10-15 years of age. One respondent said "[children] are used by farm owners to perform some duties in the farms" and farm owners "claim that the kids are just helping, they are not actually employed" in order to avoid admitting the fact that they are illegally exploiting children for labor (KII 72). According to our data, the youngest known child labor victim was just seven years old, and the oldest was 18 years old. The majority of child labor victims mentioned in our study were aged 12-16, likely because that is the age at which they become more capable of carrying out the requirements of hard physical labor.

Respondents shared that child labor on farms is common. Many of them stated that often, the parents find work on farms and bring their children with them, at which point they get pulled into becoming a laborer as well. One respondent noted that "there are many farms around Ghanzi and these farms hire parents, and the kids will follow their parents to these farms, and these kids end up working there" (KII 84). While this may not constitute trafficking, per se, often, they are not paid for their work and do not attend school. Other respondents point to children working in agriculture as a cultural practice and note that these children are also sometimes not paid, stating "we have youngsters from outside, we have a case in which a young boy from a neighboring country took care of more than 100 livestock and is not being paid" (KII 02). This is a commonly accepted practice in many rural ethnic minority communities, and individuals raised in this culture often do not see issues with having young children work on their farm.

In addition to forced child labor in agricultural communities, respondents also reported instances of forced child labor in domestic work, in which children were forced by traffickers to complete housework in lieu of attending school, with no compensation. One officer with the Botswana Police Service shared a case of a 15-year-old girl who "was taken from her parents in Tanzania" and was brought to Botswana by a fellow Tanzanian. This trafficker made promises of sending the girl to a good school in Botswana, but "when they arrived in Botswana, the girl was forced to do forced labor, she was working in a very big house, and she was not paid, and she was not going to school" (KII 61). In another, similar case, two children were trafficked under the same pretense, the promise of a better education. In this situation, a Gaborone-based social worker reported "a neighbor informed us that there are kids in a certain household who do not go to school. They are working, washing cars, cleaning the yard, and bathing other kids. The kids were from the Central District in Botswana and were taken under the pretense that they will be attending school in Gaborone. It was a boy and a girl. The boy was 7-years and the girl [was] 11. Their mother was told they will be attending school in Gaborone" (KII 73).

#### **Locations of Forced Child Labor**

Forced child labor occurs in many areas across Botswana, and certain types of trafficking are more common in certain locations. Forced child labor for agriculture, including cattle herding, was, not surprisingly, more commonly reported in rural areas as compared to urban areas, while forced child labor into domestic work was more common in urban areas.

Additionally, it is common for this form of trafficking to occur in ethnic minority communities, such as "Basarwa" communities, as it is culturally accepted (and expected) for children to begin working on farms at a young age. One government social worker based in Ghanzi shared that "[they] go to the farms to search for school going children" as they commonly find young kids there, laboring on the farm without pay in lieu of attending school (KII 65). Another respondent gave more context to this cultural expectation, stating "A lot of human trafficking, especially in Ghanzi, happens to the minority groups (especially "Basarwa"). It is mostly cultural. It is believed that children have to obey what parents say...they are expected to work with the parents at the farms" (KII 24). Though it may be considered culturally acceptable for children to work on the farms, allowing them to do so, without pay and without attending school, violates the rights of the child as defined by the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, Article 28 and 32, which Botswana has ratified.

Respondents also reported cases of children working as domestic workers in urban areas. In these instances, families from rural areas (both within Botswana and from other countries) would send their children to urban areas with family and friends under a misguided belief that their children would have access to better opportunities in a larger city. For example, one NGO employee shared:

"We have children who come from rural areas to the city, usually they will come with a relative who is well off, and as a parent you would think that this relative is going to help your child with going to school only for you to find out that the child is going to be exploited by this well off relative, they will have your child do all their home chores and domestic work for them, exploiting them" (KII 08).

This highlights the general underlying belief among victims or potential victims that cities and more populated areas have the ability to offer them increased access to opportunities. There were also reported cases of children working in retail centers and bricklaying businesses.

### **SEX TRAFFICKING**

Sex trafficking was one of the most common forms of trafficking mentioned by respondents. Sex trafficking is human trafficking as defined above, but for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The UN defines sexual exploitation as "an actual or attempted abuse of someone's position of vulnerability (such as a person depending on you for survival, food rations, school, books, transport or other services), differential power or trust, to obtain sexual favors, including but not only, by offering money or other social, economic or political advantages. It includes trafficking and prostitution."<sup>12</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> In this report we use these terms because they are the terminology used by respondents. We understand that these terms can be seen as offensive, and we use them here only to accurately report what we heard from our respondents.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Please find more on the UN Refugee Agency's definition of <u>sexual exploitation</u>. Last Accessed June 8, 2022.

Examples of sex trafficking were provided to the research team by law enforcement officers, social workers, NGO officials, and IECS. Our interviews indicate that victims of sex trafficking are often young females, both foreigners and Batswana, adults and children, who are lured by false promises made by traffickers offering them the opportunity for a better life. For example, one 24-year-old Motswana woman was lured to the U.S. with the promise of an educational opportunity at a U.S. university, but upon arrival she was forced into the sex trade (KII 07). In another case shared with us by an NGO Official, one Zimbabwean girl was trafficked into Botswana at the age of 14 by neighbors:

"[W]e had victims who were admitted to our Centre as victims, one was a sex slave, and she was I4 years old. She was Zimbabwean and was brought to Botswana by a couple that lived in her neighborhood back home. They convinced her family to bring her to Botswana for better opportunities, however she was turned to a sex slave; men will come in, pay the couple some money and engage in sexual acts with her" (KII 22).

Respondents relayed many examples of sex trafficking of both adults and children. For instance, in one case two women in their twenties were trafficked from Zimbabwe to Botswana "because they were to be used in a brothel" (KII 119). In another case, "a 16-year-old Zimbabwean girl child was trafficked from Mutare, Zimbabwe to Tlokweng, Botswana where she was used as a commercial sex worker. The girl was trafficked by a Zimbabwean woman and was beaten by the trafficker and raped by different men every night" (KII 125).

In addition to respondents providing clear cases of trafficking, many respondents also shared *suspected* cases of sex trafficking. In response to the question "Of all the main types of human trafficking, which do you suspect are occurring in your locality / jurisdiction?" more than thirty respondents specifically mentioned that they suspected that sex trafficking was occurring in their locality/jurisdiction. A village chief provided some context to this, sharing that, "Because the cost of life is very expensive, we usually hear about people who go to the trucks, those who sell their bodies, and some end up being exploited. Usually it is relatives, you will find an uncle being the perpetrator. You will find a father impregnating their own children, people in the village targeting school going children" (KII 123). Respondents indicated that vulnerable individuals seeking opportunities to earn more money or a better life are at risk of becoming victims of sex trafficking, especially women and young girls. It is common for families in the SADC region to send their children to nearby countries to stay with relatives or family friends, and these provide ample opportunities for traffickers to target these individuals.

#### Locations of Sex Trafficking

Instances of sex trafficking – either confirmed, suspected, or perceived – were mentioned by at least one respondent in five of the six districts that our research team travelled to. Sex trafficking was the highest suspected form of trafficking among respondents, many of whom predicted that this crime was frequently occurring in their locality/jurisdiction. Although this form of trafficking did not have the highest number of confirmed cases, sexual exploitation was the most frequently mentioned form of trafficking in terms of confirmed, suspected, and perceived cases, with especially high instances among underage girls. It should be noted that, although respondents we interviewed only referred to females engaged in commercial sex and female victims of sex trafficking, it is likely that there are also male

DRG-LER II TASKING N046 BOTSWANA C-TIP ASSESSMENT FINAL REPORT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Supported by a 1999 paper written by T.T. Langeni titled *Child out-fostering and other factors influencing reproductive behaviour in Botswana's changing society.* 

victims of sexual abuse and exploitation, as well as males engaged in commercial sex, but who are less visible to the research respondents.

Sexual exploitation was evenly reported or suspected by respondents in five out of the six regions, including urban, rural, ethnic minority communities, and in border regions, with police officers, NGO employees, and social workers sharing the most cases. Respondents believed that often times, individuals were brought to these areas by traffickers under the pretense of legitimate employment opportunities, but then were quickly forced into commercial sex upon arrival such as the story of a 16-year-old girl being trafficked from Zimbabwe to Tlokweng under the pretense of working as a maid, but upon arrival she was forced into commercial sex, and her trafficker pocketed the money that clients paid (KII 125).

Respondents also shared that many suspected cases of sex trafficking into or through Botswana were intercepted at the border before they could experience exploitation. In these instances, police and immigration officials looked for groups traveling together (often young women traveling with men) that provided conflicting stories about their route or their end destination. Agents would then review their documentation and speak with each party, determining if it was a legitimate reason for travel or not, and intercepting potential instances of trafficking as warranted.

#### **COMMON TRAFFICKING ROUTES**

While our data produced limited insight on specific trafficking routes, especially as they relate to certain forms of trafficking, there were common themes of victims being trafficked via internal routes as well as cross-border. For example, respondents reported multiple instances of Batswana being trafficked from rural areas into more populated areas, such as coming from Ghanzi or Central District to the South-East District where Gaborone is located. In regard to cross-border trafficking, victims often either came from or were headed to countries like South Africa, Zimbabwe, Zambia, Malawi, and other SADC countries. The paragraphs below expand on these routes in more detail.

Overall, the most common place that traffickers were intercepted was close to a border – both at land borders and airports. These locations are where perpetrators were most often caught, and victims were rescued. One NGO official gave insights into the resources their organization had dedicated to the border areas, stating:

"We do awareness raising, we went around the borders, because they are hotspots, so we had to teach people about human trafficking, so people can be able to detect suspicious activities, for example, children who stay near borders, can be lured into trafficking by people who would use sweets and other nice things, so that they come to them."

It was not uncommon for police to intercept these traffickers before the primary act of trafficking had occurred – catching them based on false documentation or unclear stories – and after questioning the individuals within the group, it became clear to police or border agents that an act of trafficking had just been prevented.

#### TRAFFICKING ROUTES

Respondents describe cross-border and internal trafficking cases in which Botswana is a country of origin (16), destination (33), and transit (11).

As a **country of origin**, respondents indicate that Batswana (citizens of Botswana) are trafficked to South Africa, the United States, Canada, the United Kingdom, Cameroon, and unspecified countries in Asia. Numerous examples of Batswana trafficked within Botswana were also presented, with victims being trafficked from rural to urban areas or vice versa depending on the type of trafficking they were coerced into.

As a **country of destination**, respondents provided examples of people trafficked to Botswana from countries in Africa: The Democratic Republic of Congo, Ethiopia, Ghana, Lesotho, Malawi, Namibia, Somalia, Tanzania, Zambia, and Zimbabwe; and South Asia: Bangladesh (via India) and Pakistan.

Botswana is also used by traffickers as a **transit corridor** to other destinations, with one of the most common destinations being South Africa. Many victims also originate from Zambia and Zimbabwe, and are intercepted in Botswana by law enforcement officials and border agents. Multiple respondents presented examples where immigration agents were able to intercept traffickers and their victims at border crossing stations, in border towns, and at airports. These can be considered cases that were thwarted at the border, prior to victims being exploited. Therefore, the specific type of trafficking cannot be determined. In these cases, the border guards suspected trafficking and stopped the potential victims from onward travel. This underscores the important role immigration and border agents play in the fight against trafficking, which was highlighted by one police officer we spoke with who said, "police should coordinate closely with immigration [officials] to identify and prosecute cases" (KII 36). Another law enforcement official in Gaborone specifically mentioned airports as places where they find a lot of victims, and stated that "human trafficking is encountered frequently in the region," while another NGO official shared "And it's actually happening in a very subtle way, because people are lured to come from away far areas to look for labor, but when they get here, they are exploited" (KII 40, KII 08).

# 5. VICTIM VULNERABILITIES, RECRUITMENT PATTERNS, AND SERVITUDE EXPERIENCES

The findings reported in this section draw on data from two sources: i) women engaged in commercial sex who, in many cases, have experienced trafficking themselves, <sup>14</sup> and ii) law enforcement personnel and social workers reporting on the basis of their direct involvement in trafficking cases and/or their familiarity with cases they were not directly involved in.

#### LABOR TRAFFICKING

#### RECRUITMENT PATTERNS

#### **Adults**

The vast majority of adults recruited for labor were given false promises of high paying jobs, such as in this case of a woman trafficked into Botswana for domestic labor: "A lady worked as a maid. [Her] passport [was] taken from her, she was not paid, her movement was restricted, she could not leave the house on her own, her phones were tapped. She was physically assaulted by the lady of the house, she was not well fed, and she was subjected to inhumane treatment. The lady was from one of the neighboring countries. The victim was promised a good life, she was susceptible to receiving the deal because of her socioeconomic status back home" (KII 26). In this case, as in others, respondents knew very little detail about how the victims learned about these job offers. One mentioned recruitment by an acquaintance, one recruitment by a 'company' doing recruitment in the region, and another of an 'Arab Association' in South Africa which migrants believe will help them find jobs. While adult victims of labor trafficking appear to be primarily recruited through false promises of high paying jobs and to a lesser extent promises of an educational opportunity, more research is needed to determine exactly how victims are recruited and by whom.

#### Forced Child Labor

Respondents indicated that traffickers recruit children by making false promises to parents to send their child to a location with greater opportunity, and to care for the child and support the child to go to school in this new location. The traffickers in these cases are usually family members (four cases) or an acquaintance of the parents (two cases). Four respondents also talked about how children are exploited by their parents' employers in agriculture. The children work alongside their parents, but are not paid and are not sent to school.

All of these methods of recruitment take advantage of cultural practices. While these practices may have developed to provide opportunities for disadvantaged children, traffickers abuse the trust the parents have in these traditions which permit parents to send their child to live with a more economically well-off relative or family friend. For example, this case of a Motswana child trafficked to Cameroon:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Women in prostitution interviewed for this assessment relayed stories of exploitation and abuse that appeared to be cases of trafficking. However, in all but one case, they never reported cases to authorities and therefore the cases were never investigated or charged.

"A young Motswana boy was trafficked to Cameroon. His aunt was married to a Cameroonian national. The boy was taken to attend school in Cameroon. The mom allowed her sister and her [sister's] spouse to take the boy because of better quality education in Cameroon. They were made to believe public schools there had the same quality education like private schools here. Whenever parents called to speak to the boy, they were told the boy is playing and given all kinds of excuses. They couldn't speak to the boy. Months passed and the parents became suspicious. They kept enquiring and went to the immigration and defense department. Authority was informed and investigation was done. It was found that the boy never went to school, he was less than fifteen (15) years old and was working in a brick laying business. The immigration here and in Cameroon helped until he returned home" (NGO 21).

Respondents described many similar cases, including those of Batswana children trafficked within the country and of foreign children trafficked in Botswana. A police officer from Gaborone described a case of a 12-year-old girl who was sent by her family in the DRC to live with another family member in Botswana, who then mistreated her, withheld wages, and potentially tried to marry her off to his friends. A social worker in Ramatlabama (KII 55) described a case of 14-year-old Motswana boy trafficked into cattle herding:

"[The boy] was from the Southern region in Logagane village, he was supposed to be in school but he was working as a herdboy in the cattlepost, the man who had employed him claimed that the boy did not want to go to school. This man was a relative to the boy, he took the boy from the parents under the agreement that he will give the boy's mother toiletry, sugar and clothes... When we talked to him, he did not show any sign of violence, the boy did not question what was happening, he simply respected and submitted to his elders, just took it as one of the duties he had to perform in the family... No violence was experienced by the victim, but obviously the young boy suffered, because he was just a child doing hard labor in the cattlepost, and he was not in school as he was supposed to be at his age. He couldn't leave because of the family situation, he respected the parents and the uncle."

In these forced child labor cases, traffickers prey on the parents' poverty and their desire to give their child a better life than they can provide. See victim vulnerabilities below for more information.

#### **VICTIM VULNERABILITIES**

### Adults

The main reason cited by respondents for why victims are vulnerable to being trafficked is poverty. Poverty is mentioned by 40 respondents of all types – social workers, NGOs, police, officials, and others all believe that poverty is the main vector of vulnerability. This was true in all regions included in this assessment as well. Poverty may not be absolute. Respondents also describe aspirational factors such as victims' desire for better jobs or educational opportunities, which, while related to finances, may not be about poverty per se. Respondents infrequently mentioned other factors which may make people vulnerable to trafficking (or difficult to remove themselves from exploitative situations) such as lack of language skills in the country of destination, fear of police and deportation, illiteracy, etc. While poverty is believed to be the main vector of vulnerability, more research into how victims are recruited may reveal other vulnerability factors that are unknown to this assessment's respondents.

#### Forced Child Labor

Poverty also appears to be a key factor driving vulnerability of children to being trafficked. However, many respondents also see cultural practices as a significant risk for trafficking (by 21 respondents of all types, both genders and in five districts). Specifically, there is a cultural practice in Botswana of sending a child to live with a more economically well-off relative or family friend. Several examples of such situations resulting in trafficking were cited by respondents. A researcher in Botswana found that 32 percent of women had at least one child (aged 0-15) living apart from her. The researcher describes the phenomenon as prevalent in many countries in Africa:

"In many African societies, where the extended family system still exists, it is common practice to send children away to live for some months or years with relatives where they are counted as members of the families where they live... The family, for African peoples, has a much wider circle of members than the word suggests in Europe or North America. In traditional society the family includes children, parents, grandparents, uncles, aunts, brothers and sisters who may have their own children, and other immediate relatives. In Botswana a typical Tswana family is not a nuclear but an extended one. The extended family idea is common particularly in the rural areas." 15

This is illustrated by a case described to the research team by a law enforcement officer in Gaborone:

"The victim was a 15-year-old girl, she was from Tanzania, she was taken from her parents in Tanzania, they were living together in one of the remotest areas in Tanzania, and they were just living in poverty. She was trafficked from Tanzania to Botswana by a Tanzanian man who knew the family, the man seemed to just know the family, and he was better than the family financially. The man had promised the family that she will find school for their young girl in Botswana. However, when they arrived in Botswana, the girl was forced to do forced labor. She was working in a very big house and she was not paid and she was not going to school" (KII 61).

In addition to being trafficked for labor or commercial sex, respondents indicate that it is not uncommon for children sent to live with relatives or acquaintances to be raped by members of the household. One NGO official noted that a lack of knowledge about trafficking allows this cultural practice to continue to flourish, stating "…if I know about trafficking, and that my child may be trafficked, I am less likely to give my child away" (KII 22).

Respondents also discussed vulnerabilities linked to cultural practices among specific ethnic minority groups. In particular, the "Basarwa" are mentioned in five interviews, all either from or referring to the Ghanzi District; the "Baherero" and "Bakgalagdi" are mentioned in one and two interviews respectively, also in the Ghanzi District. The "Bazezuru" are mentioned three times, all in the North-East District and the "Bambukushu" are mentioned once, in the North-West District. Respondents indicated that these ethnic minority children will work alongside their parents in agriculture, but are not paid for their labor and do not attend school. Respondents also mention forced child marriage and imply that discrimination and stereotyping could lead to these children being sexually exploited. Some respondents implied sexual promiscuity amongst ethnic minority children such as one farmer from Ghanzi who stated: "the

DRG-LER II TASKING N046 BOTSWANA C-TIP ASSESSMENT FINAL REPORT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Supported by a 1999 paper written by T.T. Langeni titled *Child out-fostering and other factors influencing* reproductive behaviour in Botswana's changing society. Page 139.

Basarwa children use their bodies to get an income," implying free agency from the child and not recognizing the exploitation of the child in such circumstances (KII 70).

Other vulnerability factors for forced child labor raised by respondents include parental neglect and being an orphan. Parental neglect was mentioned by six respondents (three social workers and three NGOs, in four districts, and both genders). Parental neglect was closely associated with the cultural practice of sending children to live with better-off relatives. It was unclear if the respondents were using the term 'parental neglect' in a legal sense, or if they were expressing their feelings about the parents involved in individual cases. Five respondents (four social workers and one NGO, in three regions, four female, one male) all mention being an orphan as a risk factor for being trafficked. Some implied that they were vulnerable while in the orphanage or home, and others that they are vulnerable upon departure, when they are still young and have no ongoing support system. Two cases involving orphans were described to the research team. In one, a boy was adopted illegally and then mistreated and abused by the father after the mother died. However, there were no clear indications of exploitation, so it is not a clear case of trafficking based on the information provided by respondents. The other case, described by an NGO in Francistown, involves an orphaned child being neglected as well as abused sexually by her uncle: "It is a case of an orphan, eight years [old] and she stayed with her uncle. Her uncle exploited her sexually. The girl was sick and the uncle did not want her to go outside the house or play with others. When food was served, the food was taken [inside to the girl] since she wasn't allowed to go outside. The neighbors noticed and reported to the social workers. The girl is a Motswana. There was coercion because a minor cannot consent to sex. She was not allowed to go outside the house and not allowed to go to school" (KII 89).

#### SERVITUDE EXPERIENCE

Once trafficked, respondents noted that victims are kept in their situation in a variety of ways. In the case of children, this is often through traffickers exploiting their positions of authority over children who fear disobeying an adult. For adults and children alike, respondents also mention withholding identity documents, removing clothing so they cannot venture out in public, physical and emotional violence, forced use of drugs, confiscation of phones, threats of denouncing them to police or immigration authorities, and locking them inside the house or compound and restricting their movements. One government official relayed the case of Batswana who were trafficked to Asia and how they were kept on the company compound at all times: "They [were] put in containers, not eating properly, no language to communicate with people who can help. [Their] movement [was restricted] by way of taking their passports, so once you take their passport and they were also put in a container, within the yard of the company, so all these things were security measures intended to prevent them from leaving" (KII 02).

Many respondents also mention the withholding of payment as a form of control, resulting in victims having no resources to leave as well as staying in the hopes of receiving the payment owed to them. One law enforcement officer described a man who withheld payment to foreign workers and then, when he could no longer hold off paying, reported them to immigration so they would be deported without being paid: "Employers take advantage of foreign workers who entered the country illegally and threaten to report them if they complain...he will try to incriminate them, his aim being to deport them, so his business doesn't have to pay them what is owed to them" (KII 44).

Victims may also face social isolation, forcing them to build emotional dependency on the traffickers. One NGO representative stated that victims tried to contact their traffickers: "Part of it was so bad

| 19

that they even tried to contact back to the smugglers because you know the mentality of the people who have been abused, they feel that they are probably more safe with those guys..." (KII 09). In addition to the above, immigrants may also be controlled by withholding identity and travel documents and taking advantage of victims' lack of knowledge of the language, labor laws, and where to report problems.

#### **SEX TRAFFICKING**

#### RECRUITMENT PATTERNS

Key informants identified several distinct strategies that traffickers used to recruit sex trafficking victims: the Internet, family and acquaintances, job offers, and educational opportunities. Three mentioned online social media platforms. One respondent described a girl who came to Botswana to marry a man she met online:

"A case involved a 17 years old child from Somalia [who] was a refugee in Kenya. She was trafficked from Kenya to Botswana. She was trafficked by a man who was also a refugee here in Botswana at Dukwi. The man was a Somalia national. The man communicated with the girl on Facebook and promised her marriage. He sent the girl money as a form of dowry through Western Union and then organized people to bring the child to Botswana. The child came and they resided in Francistown. The victim (the child) was uncooperative and the case was discontinued" (KII 139).

Victims were also recruited by family members offering to care for a child, such as the case described above of the girl who was prostituted by her aunt, as well as by acquaintances and neighbors. In one case, relayed by a social worker in Chobe (KII 115), two young girls from Zambia (14- and 15-years-old) were being trafficked into suspected commercial sex in South Africa. The trafficker used a young man from the victim's neighborhood to recruit girls. He would tell them about an exciting educational opportunity, but in reality, "he was being used to actively recruit these girls. He was to be paid and they were told that they were going to go to school and would receive an allowance." There was one outlier case in which the traffickers offered to help two victims escape from police after the traffickers set up a fake crime scene and attempted to arrest the young women.

Most of the women engaged in commercial sex interviewed for this assessment entered commercial sex voluntarily at the suggestion of a friend who was already involved in it. However, two of the 15 described elements that were strongly indicative of trafficking and another two described circumstances that were somewhat suggestive of trafficking. The respondents whose entry into commercial sex arguably fits the definition of trafficking were recruited in different ways. One had been talking with a man on Facebook and agreed to meet him, which led to her being trafficked.

"I was recruited by a guy whom I didn't know. He was chatting with me on my fake Facebook account...The guy promised me accommodation... We met, he picked me at the bus rank. He took me to the house where I met the girls. They didn't tell us what was happening. There were nine men, two Batswana and seven foreigners, Nigerians and Zimbabwes [sic]. Clients would come for the service and pay the guys. When we ask about the money the guys would beat us...We were around 30 in total. The guys beat us and gave us drugs... I met the girls where we were kept. There were five Batswana, three from South Africa, two from Namibia and the rest were from Zimbabwe... I tried [to leave] and the guys

saw me. They took me back to the house. The guys told us that when we go outside they are going to kill us. Once you have entered the yard you cannot go outside" (IIECS 01).

Another began drug use after a personal crisis which led to her dropping out of school. She was forced into commercial sex by the wife of her drug dealer:

"I was in Cape Town. It was drug related. I found I was pregnant and my boyfriend said he isn't the one that made me pregnant. I had an abortion. He dropped me in the streets. I met a drug dealer. I started when the wife of the drug dealer dressed me, took me to the streets and told me this is what you should do...I did have reservations. When the drug thing started I was in university. I once had a nervous breakdown and I was brought back home by my parents. My parents are scared of me. They think it is impossible to get back to where things were. So I disappeared, I did not want people to know where I am" (IIECS 02).

A third ascribed her entry into commercial sex to her alcoholism, but also stated in her interview that she "was not free to join sex work but now [she is] free," seeming to indicate that there was some kind of force at the time, but she does not provide sufficient detail to determine if it was trafficking or not. The fourth operates out of a brothel. She also did not provide sufficient details to determine if the arrangement was akin to trafficking or not; she indicated that she has control of her work and income, though she shares that income with the brothel. There were two additional women who stated unequivocally that they had been exploited, but were not comfortable discussing the details.

While two of the 15 women engaged in commercial sex were initially trafficked into commercial sex and an additional four may have been, one cannot extrapolate to the larger community of women in commercial sex because selection of the women interviewed was not random. All of the women interviewed were referred to the research team by NGOs providing assistance to this population. It is not clear how much in common they have with the larger population of people engaged in commercial sex in the country. The fact that the women were all Batswana and all able to establish relationships with the NGOs and were free to come and go to their offices, demonstrates a level of autonomy for these women that women trafficked into commercial sex likely do not have.

#### **VICTIM VULNERABILITIES**

The majority of the women interviewed gave three main reasons for why they entered commercial sex. The most common was a family crisis of some kind that resulted in their sudden need to take on responsibility for other family members – especially children. Eight of the 15 women interviewed (53 percent) described a variety of family crises that led them to commercial sex including the death of a parent, the loss of the family home, or the death of a sibling with children. In most cases, respondents felt they were responsible for taking care of their family and especially younger siblings, nieces or nephews. Three (20 percent) indicated that they were engaged in commercial sex just to earn more money than they could otherwise. They were not impoverished nor responsible for other family members. Two of the 15 (13 percent) indicated that addiction to drugs or alcohol led them into commercial sex (these two are also discussed above as the research team assesses that one was initially trafficked into commercial sex and one may have been, but the women themselves acknowledge they were vulnerable due to their addictions). In these cases, addiction was also combined with poverty and a need to take care of other family members.

Respondents in KIIs identified poverty as the main vulnerability factor, with victims and their parents duped with false promises of employment. One government official from Gaborone told the story of a girl whose family was very poor and couldn't afford the girl's upkeep or school fees:

"A 16-year-old Zimbabwean girl child was trafficked from Mutare, Zimbabwe to Tlokweng, Botswana where she was used as a commercial sex worker. The girl was trafficked by a Zimbabwean woman. [The] woman accompanied the girl to Botswana since she promised her work as a housemaid after the parents gave her permission to go. She became a victim of trafficking because her family was in dire financial difficulties as her parents could not provide appropriate day to day needs for her, and on occasion she could not attend school as the school fees would remain[ed] unpaid. She was trafficked from Zimbabwe. The girl was beaten by the trafficker and raped by different men every night..." (KII 125).

As noted above, KII respondents also found that sex trafficking victims were lured by educational opportunities and through the cultural practice of sending children to live with relatives.

#### Commercial Sex as a Vulnerability Factor

Having established that entry into commercial sex may have been voluntary, involvement in commercial sex itself is revealed to be a vulnerability factor. Two of the IECS interviewed led described situations wherein they were trafficked. They were 'chosen' by traffickers because of their involvement in commercial sex:

"...he took me to Francistown with four other girls, all Batswana, from Gaborone to Francistown, there was a [stag party]. Each one of us was to get 2,500 pula (\$215). So, the guy took good care of us along the road. I think it's because he wanted to have an easy way in the gates and check points. Things started to turn for the worse when we arrived [at the] lodge... they would bring more people every day to have sex with us, they took all our phones, and we couldn't talk to anyone. It seems like the owner and the guy were best friends, so they were organizing the whole thing together. They were paying for all travel expenses, and we spent around almost a week... We were just in towels, naked all day... They had taken our phones, so sometimes they would say, go and meet the client by the reception, put on lingerie; so you will just go there. One of the days, they came in and kicked us out, they gave us 40 pula (\$3) for transport, we had to hike, we didn't even think of going to the police; I think we were still in shock. We talked to a bus conductor, from Mokoka, and she helped us to return back in Gaborone" (IIECS 09).

Another woman described a similar situation:

"Sometimes you agree [to] provide a service to one man, he takes you only to find a group of men at a certain place. They will all have sex with you. I was kidnapped for two days and men used me.

Sometimes they would book a room in a guest house and in the morning you would find them gone.

[Interviewer: What happened in the two days you were kidnapped?] They didn't pay me. The one who

DRG-LER II TASKING N046 BOTSWANA C-TIP ASSESSMENT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Two additional women stated that they experienced exploitation, but did not want to discuss it. Thus, the research team could not assess whether these cases were also akin to trafficking.

brought me there disappeared. They raped me... They locked the house, they took my phone and said if I scream they will stab me. They had knives" (IIECS 03).

In these cases, the women were already working in commercial sex and willingly went along for the work. And while they were held short-term (two days, one week), their treatment by those who recruited and harbored them meets the international definition of sex trafficking. The findings from this research identifies involvement in commercial sex as a strong risk factor for becoming a victim of trafficking. These women were targeted by traffickers and indicate that they do not report their cases to authorities due to a lack of trust in government officials (see more below on reluctance to report).

#### SERVITUDE EXPERIENCES

Although not cases of trafficking, the vast majority of women interviewed faced a range of exploitation while working in commercial sex. Twelve of the 15 (80 percent) described such experiences; the most common being men refusing to pay after receiving services. However, most also reported a host of other abuses such as being beaten up, humiliated, having their belongings and money stolen, and left alone in isolated places with no way home.

Those who were trafficked faced similar abuses, but for longer periods of time. They were also held against their will, weren't allowed to keep clothing or have cell phones, and experienced violence or threats of violence. These abuses were echoed by KII respondents with knowledge of trafficking cases. One law enforcement officer noted the cumulative effect of the abuses on the women's mental health and how this too prevented them from leaving: "I think by being sexually violated, used against their consent, they broke up their spirits, they could not leave or run away" (KII 119). An NGO officer confirmed the abuses suffered by sex trafficking victims, relating the experience of two girls trafficked from Zambia to Botswana: "Physical violence for sure, emotional abuse, because by the time they came here, they were very shaken up. You could see that they were very scared for their life, and they were not even sure that they were safe even when they were here" (KII 09).

Victims of sex trafficking are controlled by being kept captive, not being allowed to keep clothing (to prevent them from leaving) or have contact with family or friends, and through violence or threats of violence. Whether trafficked or not, women in commercial sex also face a range of other abuses on a regular basis, including men refusing to pay for services, being beaten up, humiliated, having their belongings and money stolen, and being left alone in isolated places.

#### 6. PRIORITY NEEDS OF TRAFFICKING SURVIVORS

As mentioned in the Research Design section, the research team's efforts to access survivors of trafficking for the study through governmental and non-governmental service providers proved unsuccessful because few victims are able to access services. Knowledge of service provision and outstanding victim needs discussed in this section is thus largely provided by service providers themselves, as well as IECS.

The primary forms of assistance available to victims of trafficking include temporary shelter, basic clothing and food needs, psychosocial support and counseling, and some legal services, provided primarily by NGOs and social workers. For children, these service providers indicate that they assist children in returning to school and may place Batswana children in boarding schools when necessary. The Government of Botswana also works to temporarily provide shelter and fulfill basic needs through the Department of Social Protection; however, this support is geared towards repatriating victims. Furthermore, respondents mention connecting victims to other service providers for more specialized support after filling victims' basic needs: "We provide psychosocial support, shelter, we provide other basic needs like food, toiletries, etc. We also link victims with other service providers like health facilities" (KII 115).

For IECS, NGOs are the primary provider of services. Such services include STD and STI testing, counseling, and medical services. Although IECS also have access to reproductive health services from government clinics, they prefer to access services from NGOs. Half of those interviewed stated that they received sub-par services at government clinics because they are engaged in commercial sex; they felt mocked and generally disrespected by staff: "In clinics, they judge you, they will ask you why you keep on coming back for tests and condoms. They will tell you that you are not supposed to be doing sex work" (IIECS 06). One woman also expressed dissatisfaction with drug rehabilitation services she received at a government psychiatric hospital: "I went to Sbrana Psychiatrist Hospital. They didn't help; they are understaffed and there is bad management there. I spent most of my time doing nothing there. There is nothing there. People with drug problems can't be helped in Sbrana" (IIECS 02). Notably, one victim of trafficking indicated satisfaction with the services received: "I got counseling every two days from social workers and psychologists. They helped me a lot because I used to isolate myself from people, but I ended up not isolating myself" (IIECS 01).

Despite these efforts to support TIP victims, several gaps persist that leave victims' needs unmet. Only two KII respondents believe that victim needs are currently being met. Respondents note that the ability to provide psychosocial support is inhibited by resource constraints: "We wish we could provide long-term counseling, but we don't have enough capacity" (KII 121). Thirteen KII respondents and one survivor specifically highlight challenges with funding, capacity, and resource constraints as roadblocks to adequately meeting victim needs. Respondents also note a lack of designated victim shelters, often sheltering victims temporarily in hotels: "We still don't have shelter, we end up booking victims in a hotel or a lodge. We should build our own shelters" (KII 66). In some cases, victims are kept at the police station due to lack of alternatives: "Our area is not prepared, I remember during the case I told you about, we didn't even have a shelter, the victims stayed in a police block, and then were moved to a council house" (KII 124). The use of police stations for temporary accommodation was also reported by a victim of trafficking: "We were taken to the police station. We spent three days there, but not in the police cells. After three days we were taken back to our home villages. The police officers and the social workers asked us questions. They treated us well" (IIECS 01). Some government workers mentioned

having designated budgets to establish shelters, yet funds are diverted for more immediate assistance and other uses: "We were also given money to buy a plot for a shelter, but we later decided that it was an expensive and not viable project, we decided to use the funds for immediate and urgent needs of the victims" (KII 116).

Multiple respondents also discussed the problems which arise from the slow pace of the legal process and the effect this has on the victims, with one stating "cases take long and victims need to be reunited with their families. They are kept here for too long" (KII 63). One police officer told of a case that was identified in 2015 but the victim was not returned home until 2021 because the legal case was "ongoing" (KII 61). Some respondents indicated that the focus is on repatriation: "Some needs may not be met and those are when the victim wants us to provide them with something that we can't do. For example, when the victim wants to further their studies. We provide them with the basic needs and want to repatriate them" (KII 63).

Respondents did not describe any support for survivors' economic independence. Not a single respondent mentioned any type of economic empowerment programming for adult survivors. In their Guidelines for Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking in the East Africa, the IOM states that direct assistance includes temporary accommodation, medical services, psychosocial support, education or vocational training, legal assistance and reintegration services. IOM defines reintegration as a process designed "to foster, nurture and strengthen the rehabilitation process of the victim into his/her community or host community to live a normal life." This assessment finds that the focus in Botswana is on the emergency temporary needs of victims. Not a single respondent mentioned that victims, other than young children, are being provided education or vocational training that would support their long-term reintegration and economic independence. Without such support, the underlying factors that left them vulnerable to being trafficked are not addressed and victims can be at risk for re-trafficking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> <u>Guidelines for Assisting Victims in the East Africa Region</u>. Last Accessed June 13, 2022.

# 7. KNOWLEDGE, ATTITUDES, AND PRACTICES OF GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS

#### **KNOWLEDGE**

Many of the government officials we spoke with reported receiving at least some training in C-TIP. Indeed 31 percent (17/55) reported they had received at least some C-TIP specific training. Law enforcement personnel were especially likely to mention their training (61 percent, or 11/18).

The format, depth, and substance of trainings varied considerably across respondents. Several law enforcement officers noted that C-TIP was part of their basic training, while three officers reported that they had received supplemental C-TIP training from Interpol. Government social workers, for their part, commonly cited attending workshops led by the Anti-Human Trafficking Unit in the Ministry of Justice . Several social workers also reported conducting trainings for local chiefs to raise awareness of TIP and encourage them to report suspected cases to the police.

Encouragingly, training appears to be comparatively common in rural districts as compared to Gaborone, with 29 percent of government officials in rural areas mentioning their training compared to 33 percent in Gaborone.

Although these moderate levels of training signal an encouraging first step towards sensitizing government officials to TIP, there is clearly a strong need for additional training. Notably, many government officials reported feeling ill-prepared to handle cases of human trafficking. One such group were prosecutors. Summarizing the sentiment of himself and his colleagues, one prosecutor reported "we haven't been trained properly; we rely on our own reading of the law to advise ourselves, rather than any kind of specific TIP training" (KII 140). The prosecutor went on to report that his counterparts in the judicial branch "are yet to have a sufficient understanding of C-TIP offenses."

Prosecutors also pointed to deficiencies in training of law enforcement personnel. "Investigators are not well-trained in human trafficking... most of them do not know the difference between smuggling and trafficking. Police and immigration do not know how to distinguish between these two types of offenses" reported a prosecutor from Gaborone (KII 136). Affirming this sentiment, one police officer reported that "some officers had been trained on trafficking, but they were transferred," leaving his unit without anyone trained on issues of TIP (KII 35). Another officer in Gaborone emphasized lack of awareness as a major barrier to effective police response, noting that "because my division isn't specifically charged with addressing trafficking, we aren't trained on how to recognize and stop it" (KII 44).

Social workers also emphasized the need for additional training (KII 50, KII 73). When asked what more needed to be done to address human trafficking in their jurisdiction, a social worker replied "more training in human trafficking throughout the Department of Social Protection. There should be people in the Department who specialize in human trafficking and only deal with those cases" (KII 50).

Perhaps unsurprisingly given the lack of TIP training, many government personnel exhibited fundamental confusion over what constitutes TIP during our interviews. The conflation of smuggling with human trafficking was especially common in our interviews. For example, in response to the question, "Are you familiar with any specific instances of human trafficking?" a prosecutor relayed a case involving a young teen from Somalia who came here willingly to marry an older man, but later had a falling out. The case

involved statutory rape, but not trafficking (KII 139). Another common confusion involved cases of child smuggling or irregular adoption. For example, a social worker from Gaborone relayed a case involving a 15- or 16-year-old girl sent from Botswana to Zimbabwe by her Zimbabwean father, without the consent of her Motswana mother (KII 62). Yet because the case did not involve exploitation, it was not a case of trafficking. Similar instances of child smuggling related to custody disputes or irregular adoption were conflated with human trafficking in at least six interviews involving police officers and social workers from Gaborone, Ramatlabama, Kasane, and North-West District (KII 37, KII 42, KII 63, KII 66, KII 116, KII 135). Sexual exploitation was also conflated with human trafficking on at least one occasion (KII 55).

#### ATTITUDES AND PRACTICES

There was broad consensus among government officials that human trafficking is a "serious issue" requiring a serious response from government. For example, when asked what their role is in the fight against human trafficking, most officials replied by emphasizing the seriousness of the issue and affirming their commitment to proper procedures. As one law enforcement official expressed, "our role in the fight against human trafficking is to protect life, apprehend offenders, and bring them to justice... if we are to identify a suspected case, we must thoroughly investigate" (KII 38). Respondents also unanimously agreed that "more needs to be done" to address this important issue, particularly through greater awareness and resources to combat trafficking and support survivors.

But our interviews also made clear that serious attitudes towards trafficking do not necessarily equate to serious actions. To the contrary, we found that government practices vary in the degree to which they are reactive versus proactive. In addition, we identified a third and smaller category of neglectful and potentially negligent responses to trafficking.

#### **Proactive Versus Reactive Practices**

Because human trafficking is a hidden activity, government officials need to adopt proactive strategies. As one social worker described, without proactive strategies "we struggle to identify cases of human trafficking... people do not report and trafficking is difficult to detect because it comes in different forms and traffickers are usually covert" (KII 61).

But law enforcement respondents were divided in the degree to which they characterized their response as proactive rather than reactive. On the one hand, several officers emphasized the importance and effectiveness of their proactive strategies to address human trafficking. "We ensure that we proactively detect human trafficking," explained a police officer stationed near the Ramatlabama border (KII 42). "We question people, we search cars that cross the border, we conduct operations, and we remain vigilant." In the North-East District, an officer described the practice of using roadblocks to detect human trafficking: "we do roadblocks, and in those roadblocks, we look for certain signs, for example, people being escorted, restricted communication, or not having travel documents" (KII 100). And in Ramokgwebana, an officer noted the use of citizen informants to detect cases of human trafficking (KII 96).

But overall, these proactive C-TIP policing strategies appear to be the exception rather than the norm. In response to our question about recent cases that have occurred in their jurisdiction, the modal response of officers was that there have not been any cases in recent memory, even in border regions

known to be "hotspots" for human trafficking, such as Ghanzi, Chobe, and Ramokgwebana. The modal officer also indicated the absence of any proactive strategies to detect human trafficking. Instead, the police rely almost entirely on tips and reports from the community.

Social workers were also divided in the degree to which they adopt proactive versus reactive C-TIP practices. Although nearly all social worker respondents touted the importance of proactive strategies, particularly the use of community outreach to sensitize residents about how to report cases and the type of support available to survivors, only a minority reported actually engaging in such outreach. Speaking in general terms, a social worker based in Gaborone described how she and her colleagues "do the rounds in the area, we talk to the people, and we try to involve the village leadership so that information flow more easily, and so that people will talk to us whenever they see suspicious activities that might be trafficking" (KII 166). In Masunga, a social worker described how the North-East District Council had trained all social workers, councilors, and chiefs in human trafficking in hopes of equipping them with the knowledge they need to remain vigilant and report suspected cases to the authorities (KII 98).

Although at least three other social workers also reported participating in community outreach and Kgotla meetings to raise awareness of trafficking, far more common were instances of social workers emphasizing the absence of outreach and the need to do much more to encourage people to come forward. For example, when the research team asked a social worker in Chobe to describe what was being done to raise awareness of human trafficking, the social worker replied "Nothing is being done right now. Only once in a while will the police touch on it in the Kgotla... we need more public education, so that people can identify these cases" (KII 124). Another Chobe-based social worker observed that "we do not have a plan, and honestly there is nothing going on right now" with respect to human trafficking (KII 115). This respondent went on to note the need for more public outreach through Kgotla meetings and public gatherings.

The combination of limited public outreach and predominantly reactive policing strategies implies that few cases are brought to the attention of government authorities, further complicating efforts to access what is already a difficult population to reach with government services.

#### **Problematic Practices**

Although relatively rare considering the total body of evidence collected, our interviews did identify a small number of problematic practices by the police. One of these problematic practices is the failure to fully investigate cases of labor exploitation of foreigners who may have been victims of trafficking. In the South-East District, for example, a commanding officer reported that his unit "does not respond that much" to cases of labor exploitation on farms known to rely on foreign workers (KII 120). He continued, "we all know that Zimbabwean guys come to work on this side, but earn very little, and some of them have their papers confiscated by their employers, and some may be exposed to human trafficking." Rather than an issue for his unit to investigate, the officer reported that the Department of Labor has primary responsibility over the issue. In another example from the Ramokgwebana region, the officer noted that when they encounter foreigners working illegally on farms under adverse conditions, they charge the foreigners for illegal immigration but do not investigate whether they were victims of trafficking (KII 96).

In addition to failing to investigate potential cases of trafficking linked to forced labor, the police also appear to maintain a callous attitude towards cases of sexual exploitation. In one example that was revealed through our interviews, an NGO counselor from Francistown reported that the police were reluctant to help her client, an underage girl from a minority community who had been raped. Rather than aggressively investigate the case, the police viewed the case as a tribal matter linked to Zezuru cultural practices.

When police do investigate cases of sexual exploitation, they often display insensitivity to the victims' experiences. Asked about the procedure that women engaged in commercial sex must go through when reporting cases of abuse or rape, a social worker from Gaborone explains the typical experience:

"First of all, you have to narrate your story to the police officers who will be assisting you to tell them what happened to you. It is not an easy thing. When you get to the police station you will find another policeman and you narrate your story. He will take you to another one who will assist you and you will narrate your story. Sometimes you have to go through three, four, five people before your case is actually heard. You explain what you went through to different people only to get help from the fifth person and mostly the cases are usually taken lightly when individuals present themselves as sex workers because the community has this believe that female sex workers are objects" (KII 21).

Taken together, the police's unwillingness to thoroughly investigate crimes against IECS, a critical population in the fight against human trafficking and the police's callousness towards their victimization experiences are likely to be a significant deterrent to them reporting crimes.

Reluctance to report crimes to the police was a major theme in our interviews with IECS. Of the 15 women we interviewed, 12 experienced some kind of crime victimization (including violence, rape, and theft), but only two reported their cases to the police. When asked why they wouldn't report cases to the police, respondents frequently cited the failure of the police to take their cases seriously. As one victim of rape put it, "why would you bother going to the police? They don't pay attention. The police don't care" (IIECS 02). Another woman who was raped highlighted the risk that police will charge victims in the sex trade with a crime: "When I went to the police, they told me that I was committing a crime, so you can't report... The police don't want to help me" (IIECS 04). Fear of prosecution was widespread among these respondents, as one explained "I have never reported such cases, because to be a sex worker is a criminal activity, so I fear to report to the police. If you report the police will put you in a jail cell" (IIECS 06). One respondent reported that when IECS report crimes to the police, the police themselves threaten to charge them for solicitation unless the commercial sex worker gives them "a round." While our research team did not probe into the origins of this perception and could not independently verify the accusation, the gravity of the charge compels us to report it here. The women's mistrust is not reserved just for the police. Women engaged in commercial sex reported feeling disrespected by other government workers, especially at health clinics. Their distrust of the police, health care workers, and others seems linked, in many cases, to a general distrust of the government. In discussing service provision, the women said things like their "rights are trampled upon," that the government is "toxic," "abusive," and "mocks" them.

On the other hand, not all IECS respondents reported negative experiences with the police. One woman who was a victim of sex trafficking in Gaborone was rescued by the police and received psychosocial support, medical care, and transport back to her home village (IIECS 01). She reported being treated well throughout her time with the police. Another IECS who was kidnapped and forced to

| 29

have sex with men over a long weekend, reported her case to the police and reports that she was also treated well and received medical care, though the crime was never solved (IIECS 03).

#### 8. RECOMMENDATIONS

We organize our recommendations according to the four 'P's' of counter trafficking: prosecution, protection, prevention and partnership. All recommendations are aimed at the Government of Botswana and its international and domestic partners, including USAID.

#### **PROSECUTION**

- Expand training for front line officers and government social workers to identify cases of human trafficking more effectively. Government respondents expressed a number of misconceptions about trafficking and indicated that they had allowed cases to slip by them unidentified. To address this gap, the Government of Botswana and its local and international partners should invest in training to better identify cases of labor trafficking of adults, both for Batswana and foreigners. The Government of Botswana might also consider including agricultural extension officers (orother officials who assist with or inspect farms) to increase their awareness of child trafficking practices and alert them to how to appropriately respond to incidences of TIP. Training should also sensitize officers and social workers to cultural practices amongst certain ethnic communities that can lead to child trafficking. Research has shown certain training methods may be particularly effective, such as ensuring trainers have relevant first-hand experience, using role-play and other experiential learning methods, and incorporating automated response tools during training to gauge participants' comprehension and understanding. <sup>18</sup>
- Address attitudes of government officials that can discourage victims from reporting to authorities. KII and IECS respondents noted that officials sometimes do not respond to reports of trafficking. Women engaged in commercial sex also expressed fear of police and disrespected by law enforcement and health care professionals. Research suggests that procedural justice training can reduce police abuse and improve officers' attitudes towards citizens. The Government of Botswana and its partners should also consider other methods to improve relationships between government officials and populations vulnerable to trafficking, including those engaged in commercial sex, minority communities, and immigrants. These methods could include stricter oversight of frontline officials and stronger penalties for officers who abuse their authority. The Government of Botswana and its partners should also consider strengthening reporting mechanisms so that complaints from these communities are taken seriously and investigated.
- Encourage victims to cooperate in judicial proceedings. Respondents indicate that the lengthy adjudication process discourages victims from reporting and from sustaining cooperation with authorities during the prosecution process. The Government of Botswana and its partners should continue to invest in reforms to increase the efficiency of the criminal justice system and/or fast-track trafficking cases. The Government of Botswana should provide support for victims to encourage them to cooperate. Support should address the specific concerns of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Evaluation Report: Performance and Ex-Post Evaluation of Criminal Justice Training Program. Last Accessed June 13, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Procedural Justice Training Reduces Police Use of Force and Complaints Against Officers. Last Accessed June 13, 2022.

individuals and might, for example, include transportation from their home to the location of meetings and hearings; lawyers and social workers to assist and accompany victims through the criminal justice process; compensation for loss of income that results from missing work to attend said meetings and hearings, and compensation payments from a victim compensation fund or court mandated compensation from traffickers.

# **PROTECTION**

• Expand services for victims to provide comprehensive reintegration support.

Respondents indicate that victims of trafficking receive basic, emergency support and are rapidly returned home without additional services. To ensure victims are able to fully reintegrate into their communities and to prevent re-victimization, victims should be offered reintegration support, such as educational opportunities, vocational training, and support for finding and keeping a job. These services can be offered once victims are stabilized and ready. They should be continued as needed after victims return home or settle into their chosen community. Given the unique vulnerability to being trafficked of those engaged in commercial sex, it would also be useful to expand these services to those who are interested in finding other employment.

## **PREVENTION**

• Raise public awareness of trafficking. Numerous respondents indicated that communities would be less vulnerable to trafficking if they better understood its risk factors and consequences. Awareness-raising activities should focus on the most vulnerable communities, such as rural communities, small towns, minority communities, and individuals engaged in commercial sex.<sup>20</sup> Messages should be tailored to the community being targeted and should address cultural practices that lead to increased vulnerability to being trafficked. Human trafficking is a hidden crime and law enforcement officials indicate that they rely heavily on reports from the public to identify cases. Therefore, outreach must also aim to increase reporting of cases, which in turn could increase the likelihood that cases of human trafficking are investigated and prosecuted. The public needs to be made aware of the signs of human trafficking and how and where to report any suspicions.

## **PARTNERSHIP**

• Improve inter-agency response to trafficking. While many respondents noted coordination on trafficking cases between police and social workers and sometimes with NGOs, there are also some who indicated a need for more coordination. One way to encourage coordination is to provide trafficking training using a multi-disciplinary model. Local anti-trafficking committees and task forces may also improve the interagency response. It is notable that not a single respondent mentioned the national Anti-Human Trafficking Committee (AHTC). The role of this committee could be strengthened and its work and the importance of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Raising awareness amongst individuals engaged in commercial sex and those who provide services for them should focus on how some of their experiences of exploitation and abuse may actually be human trafficking. They should be informed about how and where they should report these cases, how to preserve evidence, and what services or compensation schemes may be available.

coordination of trafficking cases may need to be more effectively transmitted to working staff.	g-level

# 9. REFERENCES

- Canales, Rodrigo. (2021). Shaping Police Officer Mindsets and Behaviors: Experimental Evidence of Procedural Justice Training. *Unpublished Working Paper*.
- Counter-Trafficking Data Collaborative (CTDC). (2022). Retrieved 10 June, 2022, from https://www.ctdatacollaborative.org/.
- DevTech. (2020). Evaluation Report: Performance and Ex-Post Evaluation of Criminal Justice Training Program. DevTech Systems, Inc: Arlington, VA. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/CJTP-FINAL-REPORT\_3.27.2020\_508-Compliant.pdf">https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/CJTP-FINAL-REPORT\_3.27.2020\_508-Compliant.pdf</a>.
- Isaacs, Katlego. (2022). Gov't crackdowns on human trafficking. Mmegi Online. Retrieved 10 June, 2022, from https://www.mmegi.bw/news/govt-crackdowns-on-human-trafficking/news.
- Langeni, T. T. (1999). Child out-fostering and other factors influencing reproductive behaviour in Botswana's changing society. *Botswana Notes & Records*. 135-142.
- Odera, Tonny M. & Malinowski, Radoslaw L. (2011). Guidelines for Assisting Victims of Human Trafficking in the East Africa Region. International Organization for Migration: Geneva, Switzerland.
- Southern African Development Community (SADC) Secretariat. (2016). Trafficking in Persons in the SADC Region: A Baseline Report. Gaborone: SADC Secretariat. Retrieved 10 June, 2022, from <a href="https://www.sadc.int/files/3514/7505/0085/SADC\_Baseline\_Report\_Low\_Resolution.pdf">https://www.sadc.int/files/3514/7505/0085/SADC\_Baseline\_Report\_Low\_Resolution.pdf</a>.
- UNHCR. (2022). What is Sexual Exploitation, Abuse and Harassment? Retrieved 13 June, 2022, from <a href="https://www.unhcr.org/en-us/what-is-sexual-exploitation-abuse-and-harassment.html#:~:text=Sexual%20exploitation%20is%20defined%20as,by%20offering%20money%20or%20other.">https://www.unhcr.org/en-us/what-is-sexual-exploitation-abuse-and-harassment.html#:~:text=Sexual%20exploitation%20is%20defined%20as,by%20offering%20money%20or%20other.</a>
- United States Department of State. (2021). 2021 Trafficking in Persons Report. Retrieved 10 June, 2022, from <a href="https://www.state.gov/reports/2021-trafficking-in-persons-report/">https://www.state.gov/reports/2021-trafficking-in-persons-report/</a>.
- Unodc.org. (2022). THIRD JUDICIAL COLLOQUIUM ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING. Retrieved 7 June, 2022, from <a href="https://www.unodc.org/southernafrica/en/third-judicial-colloquium-on-human-trafficking.html">https://www.unodc.org/southernafrica/en/third-judicial-colloquium-on-human-trafficking.html</a>.
- UN Treaty Database. United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner. (2021). Retrieved 13 June 2022, from <a href="https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/SessionDetails1.aspx?SessionID=2498&Lang=en">https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/\_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/SessionDetails1.aspx?SessionID=2498&Lang=en</a>.
- U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. (2022). FACT SHEET: LABOR TRAFFICKING.

  Retrieved 13 June, 2022, from <a href="https://www.acf.hhs.gov/archive/otip/fact-sheet/fact-sheet-labor-trafficking-english">https://www.acf.hhs.gov/archive/otip/fact-sheet/fact-sheet-labor-trafficking-english</a>.
- Wood, George, Tom R. Tyler, and Andrew V. Papachristos. (2020). Procedural justice training reduces police use of force and complaints against officers. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 117.18 (2020): 9815-9821. Retrieved 10 June, 2022, from https://www.pnas.org/doi/10.1073/pnas.1920671117.

# **ANNEX I: KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW PROTOCOLS**

## **GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS**

Use this protocol for officials from: local government, Bureau of Immigration Officials, Botswana Defense Force, and the Botswana Police Service, Bogosi

#### **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

terview ID:	
ender:	
own/District:	
rganization/Agency:	
tle/job function:	
terviewer:	
otetaker:	
ate:	

- I. Today I want to talk to you about human trafficking. Human trafficking involves the use of force, fraud, or coercion to obtain some type of labor or commercial sex act. There are many types of human trafficking, including: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor. Are you aware of any cases of human trafficking occurring in [LOCATION]? This could be a case that you worked on, or a case that you witnessed or simply heard about.
  - a. [IF YES]: About how many separate instances of human trafficking are you familiar with?
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General impressions about TIP in Botswana" section.
- 2. OK, now I want to ask some questions about the most recent instance of trafficking that you're familiar with. Speaking about the most recent incident:
  - a. Can you describe for me what happened? Who was the victim (nationality, gender, age, etc.)? Where were they trafficked from and to? How did the case come to your attention?
  - b. What was the reason they were trafficked? What types of exploitation did they experience while they were being trafficked? (prostitution, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity).
  - c. How did the victim(s) become lured into trafficking What factors led to them become a victim of trafficking? Where was the victim trafficked from?
  - d. What forms of coercion or violence did the victim experience while they were being trafficked? In what ways was the victim(s) controlled or prevented from leaving?
  - e. What is the status of the victim now? If they managed to escape, how did they do so? If they are still being trafficked, what factors are preventing them from leaving?
- 3. Are there any other cases of trafficking that you're familiar with?
  - a. [IF YES]: Repeat questions 2a 2f, above, for one more case of trafficking.
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General Impressions about human trafficking in Botswana"

## GENERAL IMPRESSIONS ABOUT HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BOTSWANA

- I. What is [respondent's organization]'s role when it comes to human trafficking? If this something that [respondent's organization]'s encounter frequently in this region? What services does your organization provide to victims of human trafficking?
- 2. Of all the main types of human trafficking, which do you suspect are occurring in your locality / jurisdiction? As a reminder, the main types of trafficking are: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor.
  - a. For each type of trafficking they suspect is occurring:
    - i. What factors are causing this trafficking to occur? What kinds of actors are organizing this activity?
    - ii. What types of services are available for victims of trafficking? In what ways are there needs being met?
    - iii.ln what ways are they not being met? What are the primary gaps in assistance?
- 3. Have you received any specific training on issues of human trafficking?
- 4. What processes, if any, in place for screening victims/immigrants/residents for signs of human trafficking?
- 5. What are the primary challenges you face in identifying or investigating cases of human trafficking? Can you describe any proactive measures that have been put in place to identify or investigate suspected trafficking cases?
- 6. What, if anything, is being done in your locality to raise awareness of human trafficking in the community? What more do you think should be done?
- 7. Is there anything else you want to tell me about your organization's work to combat human trafficking in Botswana?

## **CONCLUSION**

- I. Thank you for taking the time to meet with me today and for sharing your experiences and insights. Is there anything that you were expecting me to ask about, but I didn't? Is there anything else you would like to tell me about human trafficking before we close?
- 2. Are there any other people, organizations or agencies you think we should speak to learn more about human trafficking?

## **NGOS & SERVICE PROVIDERS**

## **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

Interview ID:		
Gender:		
Town/District:		
Organization/Agency:		
Title/job function:		
Interviewer:		
Notetaker:		
Date:		

## **INTRODUCTION**

- I. Today I want to talk to you about human trafficking. Human trafficking involves the use of force, fraud, or coercion to obtain some type of labor or commercial sex act. There are many types of human trafficking, including: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor. Are you familiar with any specific cases of human trafficking? This could be a case that you worked on, or a case that you witnessed or simply heard about.
  - a. [IF YES]: About how many separate instances of human trafficking are you familiar with?
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General impressions about TIP in Botswana" section.
- 2. OK, now I want to ask some questions about the most recent instance of trafficking that you're familiar with. Speaking about the most recent incident:
  - a. Can you describe for me what happened? Who was the victim (nationality, gender, age, etc.)? Where were they trafficked from and to? How did the case come to your attention?
  - b. What types of exploitation did they experience while they were being trafficked? (prostitution, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity).
  - c. How did the victim(s) become lured into trafficking What factors led to them become a victim of trafficking? Where was the victim trafficked from?
  - d. What forms of coercion or violence do you suspect the victim experienced while they were being trafficked? In what ways was the victim(s) controlled or prevented from leaving?
  - e. What is the status of the victim now? If they managed to escape, how did they do so? If they are still being trafficked, what factors are preventing them from leaving?
- 3. Are there any other cases of trafficking that you're familiar with?
  - a. [IF YES]: Repeat questions 2a 2f, above, for one more case of trafficking.
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General Impressions about human trafficking in Botswana"

## GENERAL IMPRESSIONS ABOUT HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BOTSWANA

- I. What is your organization's role when it comes to human trafficking? Is this something that your organization encounters frequently? What services do your organization provide to victims of human trafficking? What services do you wish your could provide but don't have enough capacity or resources?
- 2. Of all the main types of human trafficking, which do you suspect are most common in this region? As a reminder, the main types of trafficking are: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor.
  - a. For each type of trafficking they suspect is occurring:
    - i. What factors are causing this trafficking to occur? What kinds of actors are organizing this activity?
    - ii. What types of services are available for victims of trafficking? In what ways are there needs being met?
    - iii.In what ways are they not being met? What are the primary gaps in assistance?
- 3. What, if anything, is being done in your locality to raise awareness of human trafficking in the community? What more do you think should be done?

- I. Thank you for taking the time to meet with me today and for sharing your experiences and insights. Is there anything that you were expecting me to ask about, but I didn't? Is there anything else you would like to tell me about human trafficking before we close?
- 2. Are there any other people, organizations, or agencies you think we should speak with to learn more about human trafficking?

## **BAR AND RESTAURANT OWNERS**

## **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

terview ID:	
ender:	
own/District:	
Organization/Agency:	
itle/job function:	
terviewer:	
lotetaker:	
Pate:	

- 3. Are you aware of any FOREIGNERS working in the bars and restaurants around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these foreign workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not paid as they were promised, or maybe their documents are being held by their employer. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
    - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 2. Are you aware of any people from a different region in Botswana working in the bars and restaurants around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not paid as they were promised, or maybe their documents are being held by their employer. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
  - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 3. Are you aware of any SEX WORKERS working in the bars and restaurants around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not being paid, or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation? [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
  - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 4. Are you aware of any CHILDREN working in the bars and restaurants around here?

  a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these child workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not being paid, or maybe they aren't allowed to go to school. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]

- b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 5. Have there been any efforts to raise awareness of these types of abuses amongst bar and restaurant owners and staff?
- 6. What more do you think could be done to prevent such cases or to identify and report them?

- 7. Thank you for taking the time to meet with me today and for sharing your experiences and insights. Is there anything that you were expecting me to ask about, but I didn't? Is there anything else you would like to tell me about forced labor / human trafficking before we close?
- 8. Are there any other people, organizations or agencies you think we should speak to learn more about human trafficking?

## **FARMERS AND TRUCKERS**

# **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

nterview ID:
Gender:
own/District:
Organization/Agency:
itle/job function:
nterviewer:
Notetaker:
Date:

- I. Are you aware of any FOREIGNERS working in the [FARMS / TRUCKS] around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these foreign workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not paid as they were promised, or maybe their documents are being held by their employer. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
  - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 2. Are you aware of any people from a different region in Botswana working in the [FARMS / TRUCKS] around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not paid as they were promised, or maybe their documents are being held by their employer. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
  - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 3. Are you aware of any SEX WORKERS working in the [FARMS / TRUCKS] around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not being paid, or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation? [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
  - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?

- 4. Are you aware of any CHILDREN working in the [FARMS / TRUCKS] around here?
  - a. [IF YES]: Are you aware of any situations in which these child workers have been abused? For example, maybe they are not being paid, or maybe they aren't allowed to go to school. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
    - b. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 5. Have there been any efforts to raise awareness of these types of abuses in the [FARMER / TRUCKER] community?
- 6. What more do you think could be done to prevent such cases or to identify and report them?

- 7. Thank you for taking the time to meet with me today and for sharing your experiences and insights. Is there anything that you were expecting me to ask about, but I didn't? Is there anything else you would like to tell me about forced labor / human trafficking before we close?
- 8. Are there any other people, organizations or agencies you think we should speak to learn more about human trafficking?

## FRONTLINE OFFICERS

(From the Bureau of Immigration, Botswana Police Service, Botswana Defense Force and for use with staff/officials at asylum and detention facilities)

## **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

Interview ID:	
Gender:	
Town/District:	
Organization/Agency:	
Title/job function:	
Interviewer:	
Notetaker:	
Date:	

- Today I want to talk to you about human trafficking. Human trafficking involves the use of force, fraud, or coercion to obtain some type of labor or commercial sex act. There are many types of human trafficking, including: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor. Are you aware of any cases of human trafficking occurring in [LOCATION]? This could be a case that you worked on, or a case that you witnessed or simply heard about.
  - a. [IF YES]: About how many separate instances of human trafficking are you familiar with?
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General impressions about TIP in Botswana" section.
- 2. OK, now I want to ask some questions about the most recent instance of trafficking that you're familiar with. Speaking about the most recent incident:

- a. Can you describe for me what happened? Who was the victim (nationality, gender, age, etc.)? Where were they trafficked from and to? How did the case come to your attention?
- b. What was the reason they were trafficked? What types of exploitation did they experience while they were being trafficked? (prostitution, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity).
- c. How did the victim(s) become lured into trafficking What factors led to them become a victim of trafficking? Where was the victim trafficked from?
- d. What forms of coercion or violence did the victim experience while they were being trafficked? In what ways was the victim(s) controlled or prevented from leaving?
- e. What is the status of the victim now? If they managed to escape, how did they do so? If they are still being trafficked, what factors are preventing them from leaving?
- f. What types of services do you think this victim most needs to help him/her recover?
- 3. Are there any other cases of trafficking that you're familiar with?
  - a. [IF YES]: Repeat questions 2a 2f, above, for one more case of trafficking.
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General Impressions about human trafficking in Botswana"

## GENERAL IMPRESSIONS ABOUT HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BOTSWANA

- 1. Are you aware of any FOREIGNERS you come across/housed here who faced exploitative work environments? For example, maybe they are not paid as they were promised, or maybe their documents are being held by their employer. Or perhaps they are being forced to work long hours, or they face threats and intimidation. [Other abuses: Movements restricted? Sexual assault?]
  - a. [IF YES]: Can you describe some of the cases of abuse that you're aware of?
- 2. What is [respondent's organization]'s role when it comes to these types of cases or cases of human trafficking? If this something that [respondent's organization]'s encounter frequently in this region? What is your role if and when you identify a suspected case of trafficking?
- 3. Of all the main types of human trafficking, which do you suspect are occurring in your locality / jurisdiction? As a reminder, the main types of trafficking are: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor.
- 4. Have you received any specific training on issues of human trafficking?
- 5. How are cases of trafficking generally identified? [Probe to understand if law enforcement uses proactive techniques such as under-cover investigations or if they wait for cases to be reported to them.]
- 6. Can you describe any proactive measures that have been put in place to identify or investigate suspected trafficking cases? What more do you think could be done to identify more cases?
- 7. Please describe any challenges you face in investigating cases of human trafficking. What more do you think could be done to successfully investigate human trafficking cases?
- 8. Please describe any challenges you face in prosecuting cases of human trafficking. What more do you think could be done to successfully prosecute human trafficking cases?
- 9. Is there anything else you want to tell me about your organization's work to combat human trafficking in Botswana?

- 5. Thank you for taking the time to meet with me today and for sharing your experiences and insights. Is there anything that you were expecting me to ask about, but I didn't? Is there anything else you would like to tell me about human trafficking before we close?
- 6. Are there any other people, organizations or agencies you think we should speak to learn more about human trafficking?

## LOCAL GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS / COMMUNITY LEADERS / CHIEFS

## **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

nterview ID:	
Gender:	
own/District:	
Organization/Agency:	
itle/job function:	
nterviewer:	
Notetaker:	
Date:	

- 1. Today I want to talk to you about human trafficking. Human trafficking involves the use of force, fraud, or coercion to obtain some type of labor or commercial sex act. There are many types of human trafficking, including: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor. Are you familiar with any specific cases of human trafficking? This could be a case that you worked on, or a case that you witnessed or simply heard about.
  - a. [IF YES]: About how many separate instances of human trafficking are you familiar with?
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General impressions about TIP in Botswana" section.
- 2. OK, now I want to ask some questions about the most recent instance of trafficking that you're familiar with. Speaking about the most recent incident:
  - a. Can you describe for me what happened? Who was the victim (nationality, gender, age, etc.)? Where were they trafficked from and to? How did the case come to your attention?
  - b. What types of exploitation did they experience while they were being trafficked? (prostitution, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity).
  - c. How did the victim(s) become lured into trafficking What factors led to them become a victim of trafficking? Where was the victim trafficked from?
  - d. What forms of coercion or violence do you suspect the victim experienced while they were being trafficked? In what ways was the victim(s) controlled or prevented from leaving?
  - e. What is the status of the victim now? If they managed to escape, how did they do so? If they are still being trafficked, what factors are preventing them from leaving?
- 3. Are there any other cases of trafficking that you're familiar with?
  - a. [IF YES]: Repeat questions 2a 2f, above, for one more case of trafficking.
  - b. [IF NO]: Skip to "General Impressions about human trafficking in Botswana"

#### GENERAL IMPRESSIONS ABOUT HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN BOTSWANA

- 4. What is being done in your community to combat human trafficking? Is this something that you encounter frequently?
- 5. Of all the main types of human trafficking, which do you suspect are most common in this region? As a reminder, the main types of trafficking are: sexual exploitation, forced labor, forced begging, forced marriage, forced criminal activity, and forced child labor.
  - a. For each type of trafficking they suspect is occurring:
    - i. What factors are causing this trafficking to occur? What kinds of actors are organizing this activity?
    - ii. What types of services are available for victims of trafficking? In what ways are there needs being met?
    - iii.In what ways are they not being met? What are the primary gaps in assistance?
- 6. What, if anything, is being done in your locality to raise awareness of human trafficking in the community? What more do you think should be done?
- 7. What, if anything, is being done in your locality to identify cases of human trafficking in the community? What more do you think should be done?

## **CONCLUSION**

- 8. Thank you for taking the time to meet with me today and for sharing your experiences and insights. Is there anything that you were expecting me to ask about, but I didn't? Is there anything else you would like to tell me about human trafficking before we close?
- 9. Are there any other people, organizations or agencies you think we should speak with to learn more about human trafficking?

# ANNEX II: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL FOR INDIVIDUALS ENGAGED IN COMMERCIAL SEX

## SURVIVOR SURVEY

## Before the survey be sure to do the following:

- I) Find a private location in which to conduct the interview, out of ear shot of others, but somewhere where the survivor will feel safe. Ideally you will use a private space provided by the organization which referred us to the survivor. If such a space is not available, you should find a suitable space. Have water and tissues available. If possible, have a counselor known to the survivor standing by.
- 2) Offer the respondents the option to have someone in the interview with them a family member, a friend or someone from the organization which referred us to the survivor. Make sure the respondent knows that this is optional. The questions are personal and they may prefer to be alone with the interviewer.
- 3) Review the informed consent form and answer any questions the respondent has.
- 4) Prior to asking the survey questions, give the respondent their phone credit compensation and have them sign a receipt.
- 5) Prefill as much of the form as possible in advance with information provided by the referring organization. For those questions, you can confirm the information with the respondent rather than asking them to tell you the details again.

# **DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION**

terview ID:
ge:
ender:
own and district:
ace of origin (City and Country):
rimary occupation:
ighest level of education:
terviewer:
otetaker:
ate:

- 1. Tell me a little about yourself. [This is just an ice breaker prompt if needed with neutral questions like: What do you like to do with your free time? What kind of music/movies do you like?]
- 2. Do you recall how you learned about the opportunity that led you here [replace 'opportunity' with whatever the person was offered that led to their trafficking]? [Probe for: where they were when they learned about the opportunity; who first told them about the opportunity, who recruited him/her; how did they know that person? Where were they supposed to go what was the intended destination?]

- 3. What kind of opportunity were you offered? Do you remember what about the offer was interesting/appealing to you? Did you have any reservations about the offer? [The purpose of the question is to understand victim vulnerabilities so probe carefully here. If focus of response is on money, probe a little into the family's living situation; if response is not clear probe to see what they were looking for or hoping for by accepting the offer.]
- 4. Before leaving home, do you recall if you discussed the offer with anyone? What can you tell us about those discussions? [As above, the purpose of the question is to understand victim vulnerabilities so probe carefully here you do not want to make the person feel that it was their fault because they did not do enough to check out the offer or the recruiter].
- 5. How did you arrive at your current location? What was your journey? [Probe for: where did they stop or stay along the way, what was their mode of travel and who did they travel with? Was the same person "in charge" the entire time, or were they handed off to new people? If there were long stops along the way (e.g. a week or more), ask what they did in those places and if they experienced any abuse or servitude.]
- 6. If you recall who arranged and paid for your travel expenses, could you tell us a little about that? [probe for how they were expected to repay these expenses if they were paid by someone else.]
- 7. Once you arrived at your destination, what was your daily routine there? [probe for living conditions, where did you sleep? How many other people slept there? How much contact were you allowed with others there or with family or friends back home. Who decided what or when you ate meals? What did you do with your 'free' time?]
- 8. How did you manage to get away from the people exploiting you [substitute with the names of the individual if the respondent has provided those names during the interview]? [Probe for: how did they escape the control of their trafficker? Was their case ever brought to the attention of the authorities, and if so, how? If yes, probe about their experience dealing with the authorities- how well s/he was treated, his or her wishes respected, etc.]
- 9. Since leaving the situation, can you tell us a little about the services you have received? [Probe about who provided services gov't, NGO, etc.; how the services have helped and if there are additional services needed which s/he has not gotten and why.]
- 10. I'm going ask about some experiences that sometimes happen to people who have been exploited in their search for better opportunities. These questions may be upsetting, we can stop at anytime.

Have you experienced any of the following abuses since departing from your home?

- Not being paid for labor or services provided
- Paid less than promised
- Your pay given to someone other than you
- Your movements restricted
- Food restricted or withheld
- Medical care withheld
- Your ID or passport held
- Forced to work long hours
- Forced to do work other than what you were originally told you would do
- Physical threats or abuse to yourself
- Threats to your loved ones
- Verbal assault
- Sexual assault
- 11. That is the end of my questions. Is there anything else you wanted to tell me before we conclude the interview?

12.	Do you have any questions for me? [At the end of the interview, provide respondent with a copy of the consent form, which has the contact information of the research team in case they would like to follow-up. If they appear to be in need of assistance, provide them with the contact information of the relevant authorities and service providers].

# U.S. Agency for International Development

1300 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, D.C. 20523