MID-TERM PERFORMANCE EVALUATION
Promoting Gender Equality in National Priority Programs Project (PROMOTE)

WOMEN IN THE ECONOMY

May 25, 2017

This report was produced at the request of the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). It was prepared under contract with Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc. for USAID/Afghanistan’s “Services under Program and Project Office for Results Tracking Phase II” (SUPPORT II) project (AID-306-C-12-00012).
This report was contracted under USAID Contract Number: AID-306- C-12-00012: Services Under Program and Project Office for Results Tracking Phase II (SUPPORT II). This Activity was initiated by the Office of Program and Project Development (OPPD) through Dr. Mohammad Sediq Orya, COR/SUPPORT II.

**Assignment Title:** Mid-Term Performance Evaluation for Women In the Economy (WIE)

**Team Leader:** Corinne Jane Griffiths

**Evaluation Start Date:** December 3, 2016  
**Completion Date:** May 25, 2017

**Paul DeLucco, Chief of Party  
Waheed Ahmadi, Deputy Chief of Party  
Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc.  
Kabul, Afghanistan**

**Disclaimer:**  
The views expressed in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID, the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, or any other organization or person associated with this project.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACRONYMS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROJECT BACKGROUND</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION PURPOSE &amp; QUESTIONS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION DESIGN, METHODS &amp; LIMITATIONS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Analysis Process</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Findings</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANNEXES</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex I: Statement of Work</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex II: Survey Instruments and Questionnaires</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex III: List of Critical and Key Documents Reviewed</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex IV: Schedule of Meetings and Sources of Information</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex V: Notes from Key Interviews, Focus Group Discussions, and other Meetings</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex VII: Disclosure of any Conflicts of Interest</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Status of High Value Skills Training .......................... 16
Table 2: Highlights of Aghaez Consulting & AHG Selection Process .......................................................... 20

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: WIE Program Map ...................................................... 10
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACRONYMS</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACE</td>
<td>Afghan Center for Excellence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCI</td>
<td>Afghan Chamber of Commerce &amp; Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AHG</td>
<td>Afghan Holding Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJN</td>
<td>Afghan Jobs Now</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMEP</td>
<td>Activity Monitoring and Evaluation Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMA</td>
<td>Afghanistan Microfinancing Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2B</td>
<td>Business-to-Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDS</td>
<td>Business Development Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSP</td>
<td>Business Service Providers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO</td>
<td>Contracting Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoLSAMD</td>
<td>Department of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and the Disabled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FINCA</td>
<td>Foundation for International Community Assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDA</td>
<td>Global Development Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIROA</td>
<td>Government of Islamic Republic of Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IA</td>
<td>Internship and Apprenticeship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information and Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JRT</td>
<td>Job Readiness Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KMP</td>
<td>Knowledge Management Portal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOP</td>
<td>Life of Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBA</td>
<td>Masters in Business Administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFI</td>
<td>Micro Finance Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoHRA</td>
<td>Ministry of Haj and Religious Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoLSAMD</td>
<td>Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and the Disabled</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MOU Memorandum of Understanding
M-Paisa Mobile Money Phone App (ROSHAN)
NAP National Action Plan
NOVE ONLUS Italian NGO (Support the Unsupported)
PROMOTE Promoting Gender Equality in National Priority Programs Project
PSA Public Service Announcement
PSD Private Sector Development
RSI Rahman Safi International
SearchPath Recruitment Firm
SME Small and Medium Enterprises
SMS Short Message Service, i.e. text message
SOW Statement of Work
STTA Short Term Technical Assistance
TOC Theory of Change
TWG Technical Working Group
USAID United States Agency for International Development
USG United States Government
WIE Women in the Economy
WIG Women in Government
WLD Women’s Leadership Development Project
WfD Workforce Development
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

PROJECT BACKGROUND

In 2015, USAID awarded a five-year\(^1\), $71 million contract (AID-306-TO-15-00062) to U.S.-based international consulting firm DAI for the implementation of *Women in the Economy* (WIE), the economic and business component of *Promoting Gender Equality in National Priority Programs* (PROMOTE) project, the flagship program of USAID/Afghanistan in the promotion of gender equity and women's empowerment through concerted long-term investment.

The primary objective of WIE is to enable educated Afghan women to increase their participation in leadership in the formal mainstream economy by helping them secure employment with advancement potential, and by improving the viability and income growth of women-owned businesses with a ten percent or greater female workforce. WIE is helping women secure employment with advancement potential through internships and apprenticeships and improving the viability and income growth of women-owned businesses.

EVALUATION PURPOSE AND EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The purpose of the mid-term evaluation was to assess the effectiveness of the activities of *Women in the Economy* (WIE) from the program’s inception in July 2015 to October 2016. The findings and recommendations from this evaluation will be used to guide the remaining years of program implementation through June 2019. More broadly, the evaluation will inform USAID programming decisions on approaches to increasing women’s presence and participation in the country’s economy that will lead to women’s empowerment in Afghanistan. The evaluation conclusions are aimed at USAID, PROMOTE, and the WIE program management team. The evaluation questions:

1. To what extent has WIE employment support resulted in employment for the beneficiaries to date?
2. Have WIE strategies and/or activities resulted in more woman-friendly workplaces? If so, which have been the most effective?
3. How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?
4. Identify the program’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as the areas, if any, where WIE can improve results—for example, through collaboration with other PROMOTE components.

\(^1\) A year into implementation, the life span of WIE was reduced to four years.
5. Has the incorporation of technology, e.g., SMS information, “Search Path,” etc., contributed to improved performance and results?

**METHODS USED IN THE EVALUATION**

As suggested in the Statement of Work (SOW), the evaluation team used a mixed-method approach utilizing both quantitative and qualitative analysis through document reviews, Key Informant Interviews (KII), surveys, phone surveys, and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs).

The mixed-method approach allowed for a wide range of consultations with key stakeholders and partners. The evaluation, which took place over a period of six weeks, covered the five key economic regions in which WIE is active: Mazar-i-Sharif, Kandahar, Jalalabad, Herat, and Kabul. The team randomly selected and completed phone surveys with 252 interns and apprentices from a list of 700 randomly selected beneficiaries from all five economic regions.

It is early in the project cycle for a mid-term evaluation; WIE staff are still in the final stages of laying the groundwork for the implementation of some of the long-term program activities and finalizing contracts for several key partners. The number of beneficiaries who have already received WIE support, and the overall impact of the program are, consequently, somewhat limited.

**FINDINGS**

The findings are formulated around the five questions asked by USAID, as discussed below:

1. To what extent has WIE employment support resulted in employment for the beneficiaries to date?

According to the 2016 WIE Annual Report, 237 women were placed in jobs in the first year of implementation - lower than projected in the WIE Activity Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (AMEP) for Year 1, October 1, 2015 to September 30, 2016. It is important, however, to consider the actions WIE management has taken to address the shortfall, notably the creation of a job placement pipeline to identify market demand, employer needs, and specific job opportunities. The pipeline is based on interviews with businesses, Micro-Finance Institutions (MFIs), the healthcare sector, and a general market analysis that prompted several surveys. The WIE Technical Working Group (TWG) completed two surveys, one in Information and Communication Technology (ICT), and a second one that considered females working in the retail sector. A “Medical Services Study” is currently in progress. The “ICT Survey” identified opportunities in Information Technology (IT), media, and telecommunications. The “Female Participation in Retail Sector
Survey” identified opportunities in sales. In addition to the job placement pipeline initiative, staff members of other WIE components are preparing to launch activities linked to SearchPath Afghanistan, Jobs.af, Nove Onlus, Afghan Micro Finance Association, and High Value Skills Training; these activities will overlap with an aggressive marketing campaign to accelerate job placement. It is also important to look at the conversion rate of interns to job placement; a survey of 322 interns reported 22 percent job placement in long-term positions. WIE staff project a conversion rate of 35 percent in 2017.

2) Have WIE strategies and/or activities resulted in more women friendly workplaces? If so, which have been the most effective?

WIE implements a rigorous vetting process for businesses asking to host interns, which has resulted in 98 percent of the interns placed reporting that they work in a women-friendly workplace, as verified by WIE’s monitoring and evaluation (M&E) data. The remaining two percent report dissatisfaction based on a mix of male harassment, access to bathrooms, and overall feelings of safety. WIE has partnered with the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIROA) by co-branding beneficiary registration forms, scholarship applications, and employer data collection with the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and the Disabled (MoLSAMD). The Deputy Ministry of Administration and Finance of the Ministry of Haj and Religious Affairs (MoHRA) has also committed to support WIE by raising public awareness through mosques, conferences, printed articles, and workplace-related activities. WIE’s Technical Services Group (TSG) is working with its partner, Rumi Consulting, in developing a culturally sensitive messaging campaign that will focus on sensitizing businesses and the community at large about the acceptance of women in the workforce without the fear of harassment or their safety threatened. The Theory of Change (TOC) takes time to play out, and with the WIE program being cut by one year, it will be even more challenging to achieve sustainable, measurable impact in the promotion of female-friendly workplaces within the Life of Project (LOP).

3) How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?

It is too soon to assess whether WIE interventions have helped businesses to increase profits or resulted in the hiring of more women. WIE’s M&E team is just now starting to establish financial baselines; according to Rahman Safi International (RSI), WIE’s M&E subcontractor, it takes time to build trust with each business before they will share accurate financials. A weakness in the majority of businesses in Afghanistan is the lack of professional management. Businesses are often family run, and managers often lack the skills to grow businesses to the next level and increase profits. WIE’s Private Sector Development (PSD) component is addressing this issue by linking
businesses with local Business Service Providers (BSPs) such as finance, marketing, tax law consultants, etc., and also offering Master of Business Administration (MBA) embeds. It is a slow process, shifting businesses from a “donor mindset” to seeing the value of paying for outside services while facing a more realistic economy. The PSD component’s ability to capture and communicate success stories from businesses that have benefited from these services will help to accelerate program recognition and results.

4) **Identify project’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as the areas (if any) where WIE can improve results – for example, through collaboration with other PROMOTE components.**

A key strength of the WIE program is its multi-prong approach to increasing women’s participation in the economy by working with a large variety of stakeholders including job seekers, the business community, MFIs, business incubators, schools, and the government. WIE High Value Skills Training is focused on growth sectors of the job market like ICT, media, and health care. The Job Readiness Training (JRT) is practical and culturally sensitive; it prepares women to enter the workforce, empowered to identify and manage job opportunities with confidence. Self-efficacy (Pre- and Post-Training) is monitored by WIE M&E staff. The partnerships with MFIs, involving the training of female loan officers who can in turn assist women-owned business in getting loans will result in more loans to women. The two main obstacles to growing a business to the next level are lack of professional management and access to finance. WIE has organized a strong approach to address these obstacles through links with BSPs, MBA embeds, and loan referral services. Entrepreneurs are the engine of growth and job creation, and WIE has partnered with two business incubators, Aghaez Consulting and Afghan Holding Group (AHG), which provide complementary strategies in the development of entrepreneurs.

WIE management has been challenged in finding qualified candidates for internal staff positions - local and international - which has weakened and slowed progress. Losing a year from the program, while taking on an additional 7,500 beneficiaries through President Ghani’s Afghan Jobs Now initiative, has stretched staff resources and contributed to slower progress in areas like PSD.

WIE’s community outreach and program promotion has also been slow and narrow in its rollout. The entrepreneur incubator concept is strong but narrow in its definition of “entrepreneur.” During interviews with WIE regional staff, it became apparent they were focused on the numbers; getting qualitative feedback has been a challenge for the evaluation team, a challenge which might be linked to WIE’s quantitatively focused M&E approach. Lastly, for a program focused on women, there is weak representation of women in the WIE senior management team; the Chairman of the Technical Working Group (TWG) is a man, which sends a weak signal to the greater community.
WIE’s ongoing collaboration with other PROMOTE components and the Afghan government is active and appropriate. According to the 2016 annual report:

The eastern regional WIE office met with Women in Leadership (WLD) to share information and look at areas to support in each other’s programs. WLD and WIE will support each other by referring applicants who fit the other’s criteria. The Knowledge Management Portal (KMP) team met with Women in Government (WIG) to demonstrate the KMP and discussed the possibility of customizing the same system for WIG. The WIE Eastern Regional Manager held a coordination meeting with the Public-Private Partnership Coordinator for the USAID-funded Chemonics Early Grade Reading project. They agreed to hold regular coordination meetings and to inform their beneficiaries of the WIE program.

5) Has the incorporation of technology (e.g. SMS information, “Search Path”) contributed to improved performance and results?

Since the project’s inception, there has been broad-based use of technology throughout the project. SMS has been essential in overall communications and program messaging within the network of beneficiaries. The use of the M-Paisa (ROSHAN) mobile money transfer service helps WIE manage payments to interns, apprentices, and scholarship recipients in a timely and accurate manner. The recent introduction of a biometrics fingerprinting system already shows evidence of halting fraudulent registrations while providing WIE with the ability to track and monitor beneficiaries throughout the system. The Knowledge Management Portal (KMP), a database-driven web application, incorporates an online registration system for job seekers, interns, and potential employers, providing up-to-date information by district, province, and region to improve job placement opportunities and track M&E reporting. The Muhafiz mobile application, a tool developed by two Code Challenge winners, reports street harassment. Although not an original deliverable, WIE has recognized that the Muhafiz application brings together the use of technology and support for the safety of women going to and from work - key deliverables - and should be marketed accordingly. The on-line SearchPath, when it is implemented, will train, coach, and mentor women through the job search process. The KMP link with Jobs.af will provide the best on-line job search platform for women job seekers.

Conclusions

A relatively low number of women have been placed in jobs to-date through the WIE activity. Since the evaluation took place early in the life of the project, it was critical to identify acceleration points in the program for job placement. The job placement pipeline (High Value Skills Training); functioning partners, e.g. Jobs.af and Searchpath; a focus on PSD; and an aggressive program
setting the age cap for job placement candidates at 30 years prevents WIE from drawing on a larger pool of women with the job and management experience that is in demand. Older women, if placed in managerial roles, would be positioned to accelerate the hiring of younger women, advocate for them, and mentor them within the workplace.

The expected employment of 21,000 women over the life of the activity is unrealistic considering that the Afghan economy is shifting away from donor dependence and has projected GDP growth of only 1.8 percent in 2017 (World Bank). WIE faces daunting targets. The acceptance of women in the workforce relies heavily on GI RoA and cultural acceptance that can only be achieved by sustained efforts over time. The reduction of the project’s period of performance will inhibit its potential for long-term impact on the acceptance of women in the workforce, including fostering women-friendly workplaces.

WIE’s approach of having beneficiary businesses invest their own money into inputs normally provided by donors is both more sustainable and more appropriate considering the decrease in available funding. The expansion of profits and hiring ability of WIE’s beneficiary businesses cannot be assessed until a baseline is recorded. Measuring change will require time since WIE will need to develop trusting relationships before businesses will permit close inspection of their financials.

The WIE project’s key strength is a demand-driven systems approach, designed to establish a sustainable network of partners, e.g., a connected business network; an informed public regarding women in the workforce; professionally-run businesses; a community of entrepreneurs; and, most importantly, a confident trained workforce of women. The result of the project’s work will be the formulation and strengthening of relationships supportive of this purpose that will sustain and scale the impact. Partners like Rumi Consulting, Nove Onlus, and ACE will be linked within their respective areas of expertise to a network of potential clients and users. A trained workforce and support to entrepreneurs should combine to encourage job creation and employment opportunities. The use of technology in the WIE project also allows for agile, robust, project implementation and precise M&E.

The time remaining to the project is a major weakness affecting various components. The timeframe of community outreach and promotion should be reevaluated based on the shortened LOP. The Entrepreneur’s Toolkit, being developed through a subcontract with Thunderbird School of Global Management at Arizona State University, is out of line in both costs and scheduling. The delivery of the Job Readiness Training (JRT) has been weak. Initially, WIE staff
delivered the material, but there was too much emphasis on exam results of potential trainers, and not enough on the more qualitative aspects of their ability to deliver the material in an engaging manner.

**Recommendations**

1. WIE should raise the age cap of job placement candidates from 30 to 35.
2. WIE, the TWG, and Rumi should work together to come up with a more aggressive, multi-layered communication plan to target the business community, from the small retail shop owners to the most sophisticated IT companies.
3. WIE should continue to invest and broaden the certification categories, e.g., construction, agriculture, project management.
4. USAID should prioritize the finalization of the SearchPath Afghanistan GDA.
5. WIE should establish performance indicators for the MBA embed activity.
6. WIE should expand the MBA Corp component to include those with Master’s degrees in technical fields, e.g., IT, electronics, engineering, project planning, etc.
7. The Afghan Center for Excellence should revamp its Job Readiness Training (JRT) to be more engaging and interactive by including guest speakers, such as professional business people or employees as role models, and conduct follow-up of trainers to assess the quality of training delivered.
8. Business incubators should come up with fast track strategies; incorporate global innovation workshops; expand the definition of “entrepreneur” to include micro-entrepreneurs; and move upstream into the universities.
9. WIE should consider a women-to-women networking trade fair Business-to-Business (B2B).
10. WIE should consider employing a micro-franchising model to scale businesses.
MID-TERM PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

PROJECT BACKGROUND

In 2015, USAID awarded a five-year, $71 million contract (AID-306-TO-15-00062) to U.S.-based international consulting firm DAI for the implementation of Women in the Economy (WIE), the economic and business component of Promoting Gender Equity in National Priority Programs (PROMOTE), the flagship program of USAID/Afghanistan in the promotion of gender equity and women’s empowerment through concerted long-term investment.

WIE is one of four task orders under PROMOTE. The purpose of WIE is to enable Afghan women to increase their participation in the mainstream formal economy by securing employment with advancement potential, and by helping women-owned businesses grow. The activity has two primary and complementary objectives:

1. New or improved employment opportunities for educated women between the ages of 18 – 30 years; and
2. Increased income growth and viability for women-owned businesses and/or business with a 10 percent or greater female workforce.

WIE’s design integrates the growth of private sector entities owned by women or who employ significant numbers of women with the development of a cadre of young, educated women with the necessary skills, knowledge and access to enter and advance within the private sector. WIE extends beyond, directly providing market-oriented workforce and business skills technical assistance and training to women. The project strengthens the capacity of local institutions to provide high-quality, affordable, and market-oriented services to female job seekers, women-owned businesses, and businesses that employ significant numbers of women. WIE works in five regional economic zones across Afghanistan, with offices in Kabul, Herat, Mazar-i-Sharif, Jalalabad, and Kandahar. Programmatic activities fall under three major components:

Component 1: Private Sector Development (PSD): i) Professionalizing management (Small and Medium Enterprise (SME) evaluations and referrals to Business Service Providers (BSPs), matching MBA graduates with SMEs); ii) Entrepreneurship Development (Access to Finance (loan referrals), Micro Finance Institution (MFI) training programs, access to finance workshops)

Component 2: Workforce Development (WfD): employment services; internship and apprenticeship program; Job Readiness Training (JRT); and Forward Together Scholarships (technical skills training)
**Component 3: Technical Services:** A cross cutting service responsible for knowledge management, communications and outreach, market analysis and surveys, Technical Working Group collective impact initiative, and monitoring and evaluation (M&E).

The WIE Program Map, Figure 1 below, is a graphic representation of the linkages and specific activities and targets of the project’s three components.
Figure 1: WIE Program Map

Component 1 – Private Sector Development

TARGET BUSINESSES: Women-Owned & = 50% female WIE
- Women-led businesses & WBEs
- Identified by WIE regional staff or
  - Business matrix
- Regional selection committee
- Check references

Entrepreneurs & Start-Ups

Service Providers (SPPs)

Loan Referrals
- WIE links business for loans—directly or through M&A matching round tables

MBA Corps
- Embedded by requested business

Business Incubators
- Two incubators in grant award process:
  - Afghan Business Plan
  - Afghan Holding Group

Evaluation and Referral
- WIE links business with Business Service Providers:
  - Accounting, marketing, ICT

Component 2 – Workforce Development

TARGET JOSECKERS: Educated women aged 18-35 who want a job
- Recruited by WIE regional staff & partners through:
  - High schools, Universities
  - Technical training institutions
  - Women's networks
  - NGOs and other organizations

Job Readiness Training
- Also used as a basic screening tool

Internship and Apprenticeship
- Vetted host companies give women work experience and on-the-job training

Training and Scholarship
- Training in job-specific skills
  - (New On Us, technical training institutions)

Component 3 – Technical Services

Communications and Outreach
- Regular reporting to USAID
- Outreach to stakeholders (Bundu)

Technical Working Group (TWG)
- Woman-led activities led by stakeholders and supported by WIE:
  - Women’s inheritance rights policy
  - Volunteering (private sector, universities, students)
  - Ambassadors for the project
  - Their subgroup stakeholders can apply for a grant for a unique concept
  - Share their networks and pipelines

Market Analysis
- Supports both P5D and WIE by doing market studies:
  - SME & Financial Institutions Survey
  - ICT Survey (workforce requirements)
  - Retail Sales Survey (workforce)
  - Health Sector Survey (workforce)
  - Clothing Analysis for Retail Sector

- Most surveys done by sub-RSF

Knowledge Management Portal
- Helps WIE manage beneficiaries, currently functional for workforce development
- Jobseekers, trainees, interns, and apprentices get a feed from jobs.ac, built by sub-RSF

Monitoring and Evaluation
- Verifies indicators and prepares reporting to USAID, also gives programmatic feedback to management on how to improve activities – done by sub-RSF
EVALUATION PURPOSE & QUESTIONS

Purpose

The purpose of the evaluation is to assess the effectiveness of the Women in Economy (WIE) activity since its inception in July 2015 to-date (October 2016). The findings and recommendations from this evaluation will be used to guide the remaining years of program implementation through June 2019. More broadly, it will inform USAID programming decisions on and approaches to increasing women’s presence and active participation in the country’s economy, leading to women’s empowerment in Afghanistan.

It was critical that the successes and weaknesses of this program be studied and documented and recommendations provided to effect and adjust the implementation of the activity during the remaining years. The evaluation team:

1. Evaluated the design, approach, implementation, and effectiveness of USAID’s support for increasing women’s participation in the country’s economy through WIE and the program’s effectiveness in achieving the expected results; identified program strengths and weaknesses; and assessed the economic opportunities gained by the targeted beneficiary women since the inception of the program.
2. Refined lessons learned on program design and implementation to guide and enhance the second half of the activity.

Questions

The Statement of Work (SOW) had five evaluation questions that formed the basis for this evaluation:

1. To what extent has the WIE employment support resulted in employment for the beneficiaries to date?
2. Have WIE strategies and/or activities resulted in more woman-friendly workplaces? If so, which have been the most effective?
3. How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?
4. Identify program’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as the areas (if any) where WIE can improve results—for example, through collaboration with other Promoting Equity in the National Priority Programs (PROMOTE) components.
5. Has the incorporation of technology (e.g., SMS information, “Search Path”) contributed to improved performance and results?
EVALUATION DESIGN, METHODS & LIMITATIONS

As suggested in the SOW, the evaluation team used a mixed-method approach utilizing both quantitative and qualitative analysis (document review, Key Informant Interviews (KIIs), mini-surveys, phone surveys, and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)). The evaluation methods allowed for a wide range of consultations with key stakeholders and partners in the five economic regions of: Kabul, Kandahar, Herat, Mazar-e-Sharif, and Jalalabad. The evaluation team identified direct and indirect beneficiaries under each of the WIE activities within the three respective components. The interviewees were randomly selected from WIE’s data-base of interns, apprentices, job placements, scholarships, MFIs, and businesses from the five regions. The majority of currently identified partners were interviewed. The total number of key stakeholders, all registered participants in the program, was 1,269, and the sample size, randomly selected, was 472 or 37.1%. Each evaluation tool is linked to one or more of the five key questions.

In each region, the evaluation team met with partners, program beneficiaries, businesses, and organizations that WIE has selected for current and future collaborations. The evaluation team also held consultations with women-owned businesses, businesses with at least 10 percent women employed, interns and apprentices, scholarship recipients, JRT partners, entrepreneur development incubators, and MFIs in each of the regions. Additional meetings were held with key regional staff to better understand their role and challenges in the implementation of the program.

An evaluation design matrix linking evaluation questions to specific data collection approaches and data sources is in Annex V. An activity schedule, as well as the names and contact information of the evaluation team, is in Annex IV.

DATA COLLECTION

Document Review: USAID/Afghanistan’s Office of Gender and the WIE team provided a wide range of documents, including: program descriptions and modifications of all PROMOTE task orders; annual report; quarterly reports; monthly reports; current Activity Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (AMEP); and the WIE subcontractors list. Other program reports, relevant studies, and documents were also reviewed as they became available during the course of the evaluation. The desk review enabled the evaluation team to better understand the program’s goals and objectives and gain insight into some of the program implementation successes, challenges, and constraints. The team was able to determine from the document review if the expected results were met or could be projected to meet the results at the end of the project. Access to program design documents also enabled the team to evaluate substantive WIE program
design issues, from implementation, management capacity issues, or rising challenges in the processes of implementing the project overall. In total, the team reviewed 35 documents (See Annex II Sources of Information.)

**Key Informant Interviews (KII):** The team conducted 14 key informant interviews with a variety of stakeholders and experts directly and indirectly involved with the implementation of the WIE program. (Annex II)

**Focus Group Discussions (FGD):** This method was used to obtain information from WIE beneficiary groups. Focus groups were held in Herat, Jalalabad, Mazar-e-Sharif, Kabul, and Kandahar. FGDs included training recipients; beneficiaries of internships/apprenticeships; scholarship recipients; and job placement recipients. The FGDs were facilitated by two members of the evaluation team selected based on regional familiarity and language skills. In total, 135 beneficiaries participated in FGDs, and the average number of participants per session was 15. Lead questions were developed to guide the conversation and encourage open dialogue. Following the FGDs, participants were asked to fill out a brief survey to gather more quantitative data about each category of participant (Annex I).

**Phone Surveys:** The evaluation team conducted phone surveys of each of the WIE beneficiary groups (i.e. interns, apprentices, and job placement recipients). Prior to conducting phone interviews, the evaluation team ensured that the beneficiary had not already participated in an FGD. Out of the 1,201 person beneficiary list provided to the evaluation team by WIE, the evaluation team randomly selected 700 beneficiaries and successfully reached and surveyed 252 beneficiaries (response rate of 36 percent). The survey covered the five key regions. Surveys were also conducted with MFIs, host business, JRT trainers, and BSPs (Annex I).

**Direct Observation:** Time and security allowed for a few site visits to host businesses and institutions, training venues, and loan referral businesses in Kabul, Mazar-e-Sharif, Kandahar, and Jalalabad.

**WIE Self-assessment:** The evaluation team held a meeting with the WIE management team to verify the program map (Figure 1), actual implementation timeline (Annex IV), and topline constraints and challenges to date. They asked WIE management to provide a consolidated self-assessment based on the five evaluation questions.

**DATA ANALYSIS PROCESS**

To facilitate the data analysis process, the quantitative and qualitative data received from the field was transferred into Excel sheets that consolidated key findings from all regions (Annex V).
LIMITATIONS

The timing of the mid-term evaluation was earlier than normal. Since the WIE project was still laying groundwork for some of the activities the evaluation could only report on strategies in some areas. The evaluation team also had a limited pool of beneficiary businesses to interact with since many were still in the process of being vetted.

Findings, Conclusions, and Recommendations

FINDINGS

1) To what extent has the WIE employment support resulted in employment for the beneficiaries to date?

As of the year end 2016 report, 1,038 women were placed in internships/apprenticeships and 41 in full time jobs. The overall original goal of 2,000 women placed in jobs was raised to 9,500 through President Ghani’s National Program of Employment Creation with a shortened project timeline by one year. However, in the context of the project timeline and the early timing of the evaluation, it is important to consider the job placement pipeline to identify activities that might accelerate these numbers. The pipeline was based on interviews with businesses, MFIs, the healthcare sector, and general market analysis that has prompted several surveys. The Technical Working Group (TWG) completed two surveys, one in Information and Communication Technology (ICT), and a second one that looked at females working in the retail sector. A “Medical Services Study” is also on-going. The objective of the surveys was to identify market demand, employer needs, and specific job opportunities. The ICT Survey identified opportunities in IT, media, and telecommunications. The female participation in retail sector survey identified opportunities in sales.

WIE’s job placement pipeline as of January 2017 included:

- “Female Participation in Medical Services Survey” identified job needs and projected numbers that can then be linked to the High Value Skills Training certification plan.
- “ICT Sector Survey” identified 700 internship and job opportunities.
- “Retail Sector Survey” identified need and led to RFPs issued to train 220 females in sales and to train and place 220 females in Administration and Finance.
- Code to Inspire will train 120 women in computer coding & development.
- Moraa Educational Complex will train and place 200 nurses in jobs.
- **Bano Consulting** will train 150 women in getting an International Computer Driver’s License (ICDL) (High Value Skills Training).
- **Salamati Institute** will train 120 midwives in ultrasound in four regions.
- A computer lab in Kabul Regional Office will train 150 beneficiaries in Microsoft Office & Adobe Creative (High Value Skills Training).

In addition, other WIE components are preparing to launch. SearchPath, Jobs.af, Nove Onlus, Afghan Micro Finance Association, High Value Skills Training, combined with the aggressive marketing of the WIE program, should accelerate job placement. Specifically:

**SearchPath** utilizes a unique career management and job search tool called MyHuntPath that teaches women a head hunter’s approach to the job search and how to proactively find jobs. SearchPath intends to partner with 15-20 women entrepreneurs to lead talent recruitment franchises across Afghanistan. SearchPath projects reaching 25,000 Afghan women in career development. The GDA agreement has been held up for several months but WIE expects SearchPath to be functioning by the first quarter of 2017.

**Nove Onlus** is a training partner focused specifically on skills training. WIE provides job placement services to graduates of their skills training. Nove Onlus projects that it will refer up to 1,200 women for job opportunities.

**Jobs.af** is the largest online job search platform in Afghanistan and will directly feed to the job matching section of the Knowledge Management Portal (KMP). Jobs.af will also assist in educating women on how to find jobs. The partnership benefits Jobs.af in terms of increasing traffic to its portals and it allows WIE to market and reach female job seekers. It is expected to be functioning by the first quarter of 2017.

**The Afghan Micro Finance Association** will facilitate the training and screening of interns for placements in MFIs throughout the country. Women participating in the training will be eligible for internship stipends through WIE’s internship and apprenticeship program or for scholarships.

**High Value Skills Training** is part of the pipeline strategy. The specific skills, noted in Table 1 below, are directly related to the surveys and market studies as previously noted – they are demand driven and almost assure job placement. Additionally, these are fields that tend to be women-friendly, offer long term employment opportunities, and the ability to move up within the profession.

**Marketing of the WIE program** has had a slow start in reaching the business community and beneficiaries which has been a contributing factor to slower job placement.
Table 1: Status of High Value Skills Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High Value Skills Training</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microsoft Certification</td>
<td>Started July 2015 (on-going)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adobe Certification</td>
<td>Started July 2015 (on-going)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banking &amp; Finance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-line Certification</td>
<td>Waiting approval on scholarship payment mechanism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMA</td>
<td>To start February 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFIs</td>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Qtr. 2016 (on-going)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEDIA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roya Film House</td>
<td>Grant Pending</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEALTHCARE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification through Apollo Hospital</td>
<td>Waiting approval on scholarship payment mechanism.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interviews with businesses, host companies, and educational institutions revealed job opportunities for teachers and older, more experienced women in the 30-35 age range. WIE has since tightened the vetting process for all interns, apprentices, and scholarship recipients, as well as contractual agreements with host companies. Initially, some interns were placed prior to the Job Readiness Training.

It was also important to consider the conversion rate of interns to full time employment for job placement. In surveying 322 interns, 22 percent reported converting to full time positions. WIE has aimed to improve this rate by adapting implementation according to lessons learned. JRT is now required to screen interns for their readiness to join the workforce and closer consideration is made for matching an intern to an organization based on the skills possessed and required. Interns per organization are now limited according to the job openings at the organization. WIE projects the conversion rate to improve to 35 percent in 2017.
2) Have WIE strategies and/or activities resulted in more woman-friendly workplaces? If so, which have been the most effective?

WIE’s strategy and activities in improving or fostering women-friendly workplaces is both direct and indirect through collaborations with other PROMOTE components, the Afghan government, and community outreach. WIE is fostering women-friendly workplaces is through proper vetting of host businesses, the selection criteria for BSPs or loan referral services, working with business to create safe transportation to and from work, and targeting sectors of the job market that welcome women into the workplace like IT, media, and healthcare.

WIE’s screening procedures for businesses that want to host female interns has resulted in 98 percent of the interns reporting female-friendly workplaces in FY 2016. The remaining two percent cite issues of harassment and overall safety. Vetting a potential host business includes at least two onsite visits by the caseworker to inspect for any physical safety issues; location of where the intern will be working; access to a bathroom; the location of other women (all businesses with at least 10 percent women); and general location of the business within a neighborhood. Additional visits by the caseworker build trust with the business owner/manager to fully understand the motivation behind wanting to host an intern and monitor intern performance. In one case, it took a couple of visits to a company to uncover the fact that they had a big contract with a quick turnaround time and just needed short term, cheap labor. WIE has subsequently put in place safeguards against the “cheap labor” mindset by limiting how many interns any one business is allowed to host and making sure they adhere to the contract that places educated interns into the host business for the purpose of gaining work experience, additional skills training, and the possibility of a permanent job offering.

The Job Readiness Training is a 20-hour course that prepares beneficiaries for the workplace by training them on how to find a job, how to write a CV, communications, and work ethics. The training also addresses women’s rights in the workplace, how to identify women-friendly businesses, and guard against and respond to unwanted harassment.

Transportation to and from a job can be a safety issue for women. WIE works proactively with host businesses to supplement transportation costs or sometimes negotiates the provisions of company owned or contracted transportation services. WIE also encourages businesses to provide lunch so women do not have to leave the premises during their lunch break.

---

2 According to WIE, a “woman-friendly workplace” is defined as one that has no male harassment, safe location of work space, access to a bathroom, safe location of business, and an overall friendly environment.
The Technical Services component plays a key role in the normalization of women in the workforce as well as sensitizing businesses to the importance of providing a safe work environment. The Muhafiz App, a mobile application for reporting harassment, was developed for WIE's Code Women event. Although not a direct deliverable of the WIE project, it represents the use of technology and addresses a female-friendly work environment, which are both key components of the WIE program. Its use increases community awareness, and reassures families that their female family members are safe at work, school, and/or in the community at large.

3) How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?

Due to the early timing of this performance evaluation, it is too soon to determine if WIE's interventions have increased profits. Baselines are just now being established, and gaining the trust of each business to get accurate financial information will take time. However, by the end of 2016, WIE has begun a number of activities that could lead to increased profits. These include:

- Approved 73 Business Service Providers (e.g., financial services, marketing, and tax law);
- 4 business loans approved for total amount of Afs. 200,000;
- 4 Direct Business Referrals made with BSPs;
- 2 business evaluations were completed (includes financials);
- 7 business evaluations in process as of December 2016 (includes financials); and
- Afghanistan Microfinance Association (AMA) grant in place to facilitate Access to Finance Matchmaking Roundtables (requirement to attend could include the submission of financials to WIE).

According to WIE's reporting, the two primary barriers to business growth for most SMEs are a lack of professional management and limited access to finance – a global challenge for new SMEs. Lowering these barriers is at the core of WIE’s business strengthening activities. In the context of improving profits and hiring more women, current PSD activities focus on business strengthening through more professional management, which is achieved by links with business service providers (e.g., finance, marketing, tax law consultants) and MBA embeds. WIE's process for selecting a business is rigorous, and involves using a business scoring matrix, regional onsite verifications, and on-going evaluations. WIE also looks at the characteristics of the business (market demand) and the owner's commitment to investing in their business to grow it to the next level. All this brings context to the question about profits and the hiring of more women.
4) Identify project’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as
the areas (if any) where WIE can improve results - for example, through
collaboration with other PROMOTE components.

**Key Strengths**

The WIE program is a practical, demand-driven 360 approach that is positioned to leave behind
a sustainable network of partners (e.g., a connected business network, an informed public
regarding women in the workforce, professionally run businesses, a supported community of
entrepreneurs, and, most importantly, a confident trained workforce of women). After face-to-
face interviews with most of the WIE implementing partners and assessing their proposed
strategies, it is apparent they are professional and forward thinking partners that should continue
to work towards increasing women’s participation in the economy, even after the WIE project
has ended.

**Component 1 – Private Sector Development**

As previously noted, the two main obstacles in growing a business to the next level are the lack
of professional management and the lack of access to finance. WIE has developed several
pragmatic and sustainable strategies that address these obstacles: a) links with BSPs; b) embedding
of MBAs in the business to tackle specific challenges; and c) access to finance through Afghan
Micro Finance Association, along with a loan referral program.

There is also a rigorous evaluation and selection process put in place that uses a Business
Evaluation Scoring Matrix and regional onsite verifications by the WIE Case Officer before the
business is selected for assistance. The Case Officer works with the business to determine the
support needed and confirms revenues (data collection point for baseline) to register for the
program. As of FY 2016, 279 businesses were registered. In addition, WIE also hired a consulting
firm to evaluate four businesses to determine what kind of BDS support was needed, and the
Case Officer matched them with the appropriate BDS provider. Seven more businesses are now
being evaluated. By the end of the year (FY 2016), 30 businesses applied for the BSP referrals, 14
were approved, and 2 implemented the recommendations of the BSP. The latter will be important
to track as a possible success story for marketing the WIE program and PSD services.

At the time of the evaluation, the MBA Corp had not been implemented. In theory it is a smart
strategy, however some caution needs to be noted. In reviewing the MBA Corp procedures, a
lot depends on the strength of the mentoring of the business and the MBA and setting realistic
indicators that the MBA and business should agree to.
The BSP concept is pragmatic and fills a critical need in the business community. As stated in WIE's 2016 annual report, “SMEs are managed entirely by family, regardless of qualifications or experience. In an economy fueled by pent-up demand and donor spending, many businesses were able to start and even grow to a reasonable size before running into the limits imposed by lack of more professional management skills and experience.” A critical aspect in evaluating the BSP concept was looking at the time it will take to change behavior on the part of the business by convincing them of the value of the service in which they would invest.

PSD’s two entrepreneur incubators Aghaez Consulting and Afghan Holding Group (AHG) are highly professional companies and complementary partners with different strategies. Aghaez Consulting facilitates Startup Grind and will be setting up an incubator center for about 30 to 40 WIE beneficiaries. Startup Grind is, in their own words:

"............ the largest independent startup community, actively educating, inspiring, and connecting 400,000 founders in over 200 cities. We nurture startup ecosystems in 85 countries through events, media, and partnerships with organizations like Google for Entrepreneurs. The cornerstone of our global community are monthly events featuring successful local founders, innovators, educators and investors who share lessons learned on the road to building great companies. Founded in Silicon Valley, Startup Grind has now hosted 2,000 fireside chats since its founding in 2010. To-date, Startup Grind has helped millions of entrepreneurs find mentorship, connect to partners and hires, pursue funding, and reach new users (Startup Grind)."

The Startup Grind event is held once a month and is divided into two sessions: the first session is a networking opportunity between investors and entrepreneurs, and the second session features a motivational speaker/entrepreneur. According to the CEO of Aghaez Consulting, there are on average about 400 attendees, and 80 to 100 are women. The Aghaez incubator unit will be housed in their offices and will host 30 to 40 entrepreneurs who will be coached and mentored through the process of developing their concepts, along with marketing, financing, and networking support.

AHG will facilitate a pilot project that will mentor and foster 20 entrepreneurs. The term will last six months and focus on understanding marketing, accounting, laws, and taxation. Some of the biggest challenges startups face are financing, government regulations, and a complicated taxation system. AHG services over 700 clients in taxation issues and about 200 in law compliance. Table No. 2 below lays out the criteria for consideration for Aghaez or AHG support.
Another key strength of PSD is their “access to finance” strategy, which addresses a key barrier in growing a business or financing a start-up. WIE and Afghan Microfinance Association (AMA) (grantee) have crafted a two-part strategy to address this barrier. The first part of the strategy is focused on placing interns into a training program at MFIs through a grant provided by WIE. The purpose is to train them in banking (a sector known to be women-friendly) with the goal of advancing some into the position of a loan officer who can in turn work directly with women-owned businesses seeking loans. The second part of the agreement focuses on “women’s access to finance roundtables and workshops.” AMA will hold 38 workshops (20 women per session) over a period of two years. AMA will mentor women through the process of applying for a loan from the application process to the final step. If the application is denied, AMA will help them understand why they didn’t qualify for the loan. Additional “matchmaking workshops” will help a women-owned business develop a relationship with a bank and learn about the types of loan products they are offering and what would fit their needs the best. According to the WIE annual report 2016, “WIE is currently challenging AMA to be more selective in the businesses they invite to workshops and only invite those they think have real potential for growth, and to think about how they can work with those businesses to make them much stronger candidates for loans.”

Component 2 - Workforce Development

The key strength of WfD is that it addresses the root cause of limited female participation in the economy: cultural pressures, security, lack of opportunity, lack of job experiences, and lack of skills of how to find a job and advance in a job.
The WfD strategy is threefold: a) it prepares women to enter the workforce through JRT, b) addresses the lack of on-the-job experience through internships, apprenticeship, and scholarship placements, and c) links women to High Value Skills Training certification programs growing sectors of the economy. In addition, the on-line SearchPath will train, coach, and mentor women through the process of proactively searching for a job, and WIE’s KMP link with Jobs.af will provide the best online job search platform.

Weaknesses

Comparatively, WIE’s strengths outweigh its weaknesses. However, the following are specific points the evaluation team feels WIE should address.

Internal WIE staffing and the inability to find qualified people (local and international) has weakened and slowed results. Urgently needed staff positions have remained unfilled due to security issues and USAID hiring policies, particularly related to local hires that tend to be biased against women. They have lost key staff positions in contracting, procurement, grant management, and WfD. Losing a year from the program and increasing target beneficiaries by 7,500 to be placed within two years, a response to President Ghani’s Afghan Jobs Now initiative, has stressed staff resources and also contributed to slower progress in areas like PSD and community outreach.

WIE’s community outreach and promotion strategy has been slow and cautious. In reviewing the draft of Rumi’s marketing plan, it relies heavily on highly produced communications but seems to fall short on reaching the business community which is the driver of job creation.

The entrepreneur incubator concept is strong; however, the six-month timeline for each cycle of entrepreneur does not fit well with the shortened program timeline. Afghan Holding Group is piloting 20 entrepreneurs and the assumption is lessons will be learned that would address the timeframe issue and its effectiveness in managing that number of entrepreneurs. There is also a heavily reliance on the technology and the retail sector (which is not well defined) and this narrow focus of business sectors is a weakness. The majority of educated women entrepreneurs in developing economies are micro-entrepreneurs, creating businesses in areas such as fashion, graphic design, artisan crafts, and agriculture processing.

The entrepreneur’s toolkit is based on the Harakat Artisans Toolkit developed locally for small artisan businesses. It is well thought-out but needs to be formulated for a wider business audience. Thunderbird has been contracted to provide a business version along with additional teaching and mentoring support through the use of technology. In an interview with the Thunderbird team
via Skype and conversations with WIE management, it is apparent that the proposed timeline and costs are completely out of line.

The JRT curriculum and methodology are good but the delivery of the material has been weak, according to beneficiaries, M&E, regional staff, and the training partner ACE. The ACE senior trainer expressed concern that there was too much emphasis on exam scores and not enough on the qualitative abilities of a trainer to interact in an engaging manner, stating: “many of the best trainers don’t do well in written exams.” Interactive exercises and role playing are essential tools in adult learning. One trainer admitted that she didn’t really want to be a trainer but it was the only job her family would allow her to have, which explained her lack of enthusiasm. Other weaknesses and concerns include the use of male teachers that limit interactions and in some locations are culturally unacceptable; equipment malfunctions; sessions that do not run on time; and age mix in the classroom.

During interviews with WIE regional staff it became apparent that they were obsessed with the numbers, and getting qualitative feedback was a challenge for the evaluation team. There was also some hesitation in speaking negatively about the program and some expressed concerns that M&E was more of an adversarial relationship than a service to assist the team. The latter was discussed by M&E staff at the WIE conference in an effort to foster a more supportive relationship.

Lastly, as a program focused on women, there is a very weak representation of women in the WIE senior management team. That the Chairman of TWG is a man sends a weak signal to the greater community. Although the Chairman of TWG is elected by the other members, it should be challenged by WIE and USAID if TWG is the public face of the WIE program. It sends a confusing message when the main spokesperson for a program focused on empowering women is a man, and it reinforces the challenges of a women trying to find her rightful place in a male dominated society.

**WIE Collaborations with other PROMOTE Components (+ GiRoA)**

According to the 2016 annual report;

The eastern regional WIE office met with Women in Leadership (WLD) to share information and look at areas to support in each other’s programs. WLD and WIE will support each other by referring applicants who fit the other’s criteria. The KMP team met with Women in Government (WIG) to demonstrate the knowledge management portal and discussed the possibility of customizing the same system for WIG. The WIE regional manager (East) held a coordination meeting with the Public-Private Partnership
Coordinator for Chemonics’ Early Grade Reading project. They agreed to regular coordination meetings and to inform their beneficiaries of the WIE program.

Specific examples of collaboration include:

- **WIG**: WIE refers any internship and job opening information and requests from government institutions in the provinces to WIG for action. Though WLD has not completed its portal and has not yet implemented a biometric system to track beneficiaries, WIE is seeking to enroll all interested WLD graduates into the WIE job placement program.

- **Musharikat** has a coalition on property rights. WIE is collaborating with the Ministry of Haj and Religious Affairs (MoHRA) in developing policy and a National Action Plan (NAP) for implementation through educational programs to mullahs/masjids and women’s rights advocates. In the last quarter, the TWG collaborated regularly with MoHRA, WLD, Musharikat, and the Afghanistan Independent Land Authority (Arazi), all of whom are working together to develop the NAP to raise awareness about women’s legacy and inheritance rights policy. Musharikat and WIE will distribute printed material, including the policy, through community outreach activities

- **MoLSAMD** and WIE co-branded beneficiary and employer registration, have a KMP link, have collaborated on outreach, and MoLSAMD housed WIE staff in provincial offices.

- **Ministry of Public Health (MoPH)** has supported workforce development. With a focus on training and placement of female job seekers within the medical technology and health care sector, the WfD component completed the design of a survey to identify skill gaps in this sector. The WfD team drafted a partnership agreement with the MoPH under which the two parties are collaborating to conduct this survey, which will examine female participation in the health sector as well as seek ways to improve the availability of accredited female healthcare workers throughout Afghanistan.

- **Ministry of Labor** helps facilitate applications for jobs and interns.
5) Has the incorporation of technology (e.g., SMS information, “SearchPath”) contributed to improved performance and results?

The use of technology throughout the project has been broad-based. SMS has been essential in overall communications and program messaging within the network of beneficiaries. The use of the M-Paisa (mobile money) helps manage payments to interns, apprentices, and scholarship recipients in a timely and accurate manner. The recent introduction of a biometrics fingerprinting system shows early promise in addressing fraudulent registrations while providing WIE the ability to track and monitor beneficiaries through the system. The on-line Knowledge Management Portal (KMP) manages the data-base, communications, job site links, while tracking M&E results. The Muhafiz mobile application, which reports street harassment, was developed by two Code Challenge winners; it is a promising tool. Although not an original deliverable, WIE has recognized that the application brings together the use of technology and support for women going to and from work - key deliverables - and should therefore be marketed accordingly. The on-line SearchPath will train, coach, and mentor women through the job search process, and WIE’s KMP link with Jobs.af will provide the best on-line job search platform for women job seekers.

Conclusions

A relatively low number of women have been placed in jobs to-date through the WIE activity. Since the evaluation took place early in the project timeline, therefore, it was critical to identify acceleration points in the program for job placement. The job placement pipeline (High Value Skills Training); functioning partners (e.g., Jobs.af and Searchpath); a focus on PSD; and an aggressive program marketing plan, will combine to accelerate job placements through the life of the project and beyond. The rate of internships converting to permanent employment is also expected to increase from 22 percent to 35 percent from 2016 to 2017. The age cap of 30 years for job placement candidates is missing an opportunity to benefit a larger pool of women with job and management experience which is in demand. These older women, if placed in managerial roles, would be in a position to accelerate the hiring of younger women, and advocate for and mentor them within the workplace.

The expected employment of 21,000 women by the end of the project, an official WIE target, is unrealistic considering an economy that is shifting away from donor dependence and a projected GDP growth at only 1.8 percent in 2017 (World Bank). Shifts in cultural attitudes about women in the workforce takes time, and WIE faces daunting targets. The acceptance of women in the workforce also relies heavily on Afghan government and cultural acceptance that can only be achieved by sustained efforts over time. The reduction of the project’s period of performance
will inhibit its potential for long term impact on the acceptance of women in the workforce, including fostering women-friendly workplaces.

The expansion of profits and hiring ability of WIE’s beneficiary businesses cannot be assessed until a baseline is recorded. (Baseline was in planning stage at time of evaluation.) Measuring change will require time since WIE will need to develop trusting relationships where businesses will allow for close inspection of their financials. WIE’s approach of having beneficiary businesses invest their own money into inputs normally provided by donors is a more sustainable and appropriate considering the decrease in available funding.

The WIE project's key strength is a demand driven systems approach that is positioned to leave behind a sustainable network of partners (a connected business network, an informed public regarding women in the workforce, professionally run businesses, a community of entrepreneurs, and most importantly a confident trained workforce of women). The result of their work will be the formulation and strengthening of relationships which are supportive of this purpose and will therefore sustain and scale the impact. Partners like Rumi Consulting, Nove Onlus, and ACE will be linked within their respective areas of expertise and a network of potential clients and users. A trained workforce and support to entrepreneurs should combine to encourage job creation and employment opportunities. The use of technology in the WIE project allows for agile robust project implementation and precise M&E.

The WIE contract has recently been shortened from five years to four years. The short time remaining until the end of the project is a major weakness affecting various components. The timeframe of community outreach and promotion should be reevaluated and revised based on the shortened lifespan of the project. The Entrepreneur's Toolkit, being developed through Thunderbird, is out of line in both costs and timeline. The delivery of the JRT has been weak. Initially WIE staff delivered the material, and there was too much emphasis in exam results of potential trainers and not enough on the more qualitative aspects of their ability to deliver the material in an engaging manner.

**Recommendations**

1. WIE should raise the age cap of job placement candidates from 30 to 35, based on the findings that targets for job placements have been drastically increased, candidates with work and managerial experience are in-demand by the job market, and women in managerial positions could accelerate the hiring of other women.

2. Rumi, WIE, and the Technical Working Group should work together to come up with a more aggressive, multi-layered communication plan to target the business community from the small retail shop owners to the most sophisticated IT companies, based on the
findings that there is a lack of community awareness about the WIE program, most beneficiaries learn about WIE through school or friends, and the current plan falls short in its outreach to the business community.

3. WIE should continue to invest and broaden the certification categories (e.g., construction, agriculture, project management) based on the findings that its High Value Skills Training almost guarantees job placement.

4. USAID should prioritize the finalization of the SearchPath GDA based on the findings that slow movement through the contract phase has delayed its expected contributions to job placement.

5. WIE should establish performance indicators for the MBA embed activity based on the findings that there are currently no plans to measure whether MBAs are getting the necessary job experiences or if businesses are increasing profits as a result of MBA expertise.

6. WIE should expand the MBA Corp component to include those with Master's degrees in technical fields (e.g., IT, electronics, engineering, project planning) based on the findings that high value skills are in demand by businesses.

7. The Afghan Center for Excellence should revamp their Job Readiness Training (JRT) to be more engaging and interactive by including guest speakers (e.g., professional business people or employees as role models) and conduct follow-ups on trainers to observe the quality of the training delivered based on the findings that the delivery of the JRT is weak despite a good curriculum.

8. Business incubators should come up with a fast track strategy; incorporate global innovation workshops; expand the definition of an entrepreneur (to include micro-entrepreneurs); and move upstream into the universities (job centers) based on findings that businesses need time to develop, WIE's period of performance is comparably limited, and the incubators' strategies are better suited for a longer time period.

9. WIE should consider a women-to-women networking trade fair (Business-to-Business, or B2B) based on the findings that WIE has identified a number of businesses, entrepreneurs, MFIs, and BSPs, and that relationship building is key to the sustainability of the project's impacts.

10. WIE should consider employing a micro-franchising model to scale businesses based on the findings that micro franchising is a job multiplier for women wanting to enter the workforce but they are challenged with family and cultural pressures. Micro-franchising can bridge this gap in the distribution chain while creating employment and economic activity; further, micro-franchising can expand to rural and hard-to-reach consumers that have largely been ignored by companies due to high delivery costs and their low purchasing power.
Annexes

ANNEX I: EVALUATION SCOPE OF WORK

GENDER OFFICE
&
OFFICE OF PROGRAM AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT (OPPD)

STATEMENT OF WORK

Mid-Term Performance Evaluation
OF
Promote- Women in Economy (WIE)

I. PROGRAM INFORMATION

| Program/Project Name:       | Women in the Economy (WIE) |
| Contractor:                | Development Alternative Inc. (DAI) |
| Contract #:                | AID-306-TO-15-00062 |
| Total Estimated Cost:      | $71,571,543 |
| Life of Program/Project:   | July, 2015-June, 2019 |
| Active Provinces:          | Kabul, Mazar, Herat, Kandahar and Jalalabad |
| Linkage to Standard Program Structure (SPS): | 2.2: Good Governance, 2.2.2 Public Sector Executive Function 4.6: Private Sector Competitiveness, 4.6.6 Workforce Development |
| Required? | Required - large project (evaluation) conducted to meet the ADS 203.3.1.3 requirement that all large projects are required to be evaluated. |

II. INTRODUCTION

Women in the Economy (WIE) is one of the four major components under the Promoting Equity in the National Priority Programs (PROMOTE). The PROMOTE program is USAID’s flagship program in the areas of gender equality and women’s empowerment with concerted, long-term investment. In line with the broader PROMOTE objective, the purpose of WIE is to enable Afghan women to increase their participation in the mainstream, formal economy by securing employment with advancement potential and by helping women-owned businesses grow. The activity has two primary and complementary objectives:
• New or improved employment opportunities for educated women between the ages of 18 – 30 years; and
• Increased income growth and viability for women-owned businesses and/or business with a 10 percent or greater female workforce

WIE directly contributes to the Mission’s Development Objective (DO2): Gain in Health, Education, and the Empowerment of Women Maintained and Enhanced through Intermediate Results (IR) 2.3: Women’s Equality and Empowerment Increased. In addition, WIE also contributes to the Mission’s Development Objective (DO1): Sustainable Agriculture-led Economic Growth Expanded through IR 1.1 Employment Opportunities Increased.

III. BACKGROUND

When USAID and the international community resumed their work in Afghanistan in 2001, the condition of Afghan women was deplorable. Women were forbidden from working, going to school or leaving their homes without a male relative; female literacy dropped to 5 percent; and life expectancy for women was a mere 44 years.

With the support of USAID, the international community and the cooperation of the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIRoA), Afghan women have achieved remarkable gains: as of 2012, nearly 40 percent of school-aged girls—over 3 million—are enrolled in school, including 165,000 girls in secondary school. An additional 40,000 young women attend public or private universities or technical and vocational training institutes, with more enrolling each year; life expectancy has increased to 64 for both women and men; 27 percent of seats in the Afghan National Assembly Lower House, 22 percent in the Upper House and 17 percent in provincial councils are reserved for women through a quota system; women’s organizations are working to end violence and discrimination against women; and equal rights for women are enshrined in the Afghan Constitution and official Afghan national policy.

When it comes to the economy, Afghan women have considerable presence at the micro-level and a micro-presence at the commercial-level. They are largely stuck at the subsistence, income generating, and microenterprise level, both in rural and urban areas outside Kabul. While statistics vary, only about 450 women own medium-large businesses\(^3\) that are registered with the Ministry of Economy, though it is possible that many more women own businesses that are registered in a male family member’s name, perhaps due to the onerous process to which women are subjected when attempting to register a business. Many other women, estimated at 1,500, own microenterprises that are largely dependent upon donor funding for sustainability. Most business support for Afghan women has been at the micro-level, with training focused on business start-up, basic marketing and bookkeeping. Commercial businesses that have been supported tend to be Kabul-based, with outside Kabul programs focused on home-based, labor intensive basic

\(^3\) PROMOTE IDIQ Contract, pg-21
training in carpet-weaving, handicrafts, tailoring, embroidery, poultry raising, jam making and beekeeping. Some micro-enterprises, such as those supporting saffron growing, processing, packaging and exporting, has potential to reach next level, i.e., a small- or medium-sized enterprise (SME).

To increase the presence of women in the economy, it will require improving women’s business knowledge and skills, developing greater access for women to broader markets and networks (including regional and international) and equipping women with the knowledge, skills, supportive facilities, and mentorships to succeed in the job market. To achieve this, it will also be necessary to help women enter and compete in non-traditional and more productive sectors of the Afghan economy.

In line with these priorities, PROMOTE invests in opportunities that enable educated women (i.e., women between 18 and 30 years of age who have at least a secondary education) to enter and advance into decision-making positions in Afghanistan’s public, private and civil society sectors. This cohort is estimated at over 200,000 strong—and growing fast, with approximately 164,000 girls attending secondary school nationwide. These women represent a valuable source of talent and expertise for the country. Focused on these target groups, PROMOTE has activated a sustainable process leading to a critical mass of new and upcoming generations of Afghan women assuming decision making and leadership roles in mainstream social, political and economic spheres. PROMOTE targets to benefit a minimum of 75,000 women within the targeted cohort through WIE and three other components, as described below—

Component 2: Women’s Rights Groups Organizations and Coalitions (Musharikat): To strengthen women’s rights groups by building their technical gender knowledge, applying their technical gender skills, and combining forces to influence public policies and social practices to benefit Afghan women.

Component 3: Women in Government (WIG): To increase the number of women in professional and leadership positions in government.

Component: 4: Women in Leadership (WLD): To enable Afghan women to acquire and apply leadership skills in public, private and civil society sectors.

Theory of Change:

If Afghan women seeking employment are provided with employment services and related resources, job readiness and technical training, and internship and apprenticeships; and, if Afghan women who are employed are provided with employment services and related resources, professional development and technical training, and mentoring; and, if more Afghan women-owned and businesses with significant numbers of women are established and expanded (through growing economy, capacity improvements and improved access to markets for businesses); and,
if more gender-sensitive policies, regulations and reforms are adopted and workplace environments made more gender-friendly; and, if broader awareness and acceptance of women’s participation in the economy is encouraged; then Afghan women’s participation in, contribution to and leadership in Afghanistan’s economy will increase.

The working area provinces for the WIE activity include Kabul, Mazar, Herat, Kandahar and Jalalabad.

IV. PROGRAM GOALS AND OBJECTIVES

WIE supports young educated women gain new or better opportunities for employment and to help women’s businesses grow from micro to small, small to medium and medium to large. The WIE approach consists of the key elements below:

- Building broad-based support for women’s economic empowerment
- Strengthening existing structures, rather than creating new ones
- Tailoring interventions to reflect specific market and labor opportunities for women in regional economic zones (REZ)
- Leveraging the resources and expertise of actors inside and outside of the local system to enhance scalability and sustainability of activities

WIE extends beyond directly providing market-oriented workforce and business skills technical assistance and training to women. The project strengthens local institutions’ capacity to provide high-quality, affordable, and market-oriented Technical, Vocational, Education, and Training (TVET) and Business Development Services (BDS) to female job seekers, women-owned businesses, and businesses that employ significant numbers of women. WIE also works to foster a socio-cultural environment that enables women’s participation and leadership in the economy, as employees and business owners.

To this end, WIE employs a local systems development approach that relies on the contributions of multiple and interconnected stakeholders at various levels within a system (individual, institutional, and macro environmental) to achieve and sustain development outcomes. The project works to identify and understand actors’ incentives and disincentives for engagement and change, strengthen interaction and collaboration among system participants —women, private sector companies, BDS and TVET providers, educational institutions, associations, and Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIRoA) entities— and work with and through key stakeholders to implement market-driven interventions in the five regions.

The Results Framework (RF) below illustrates WIE objective and performance indicators to program outcomes, which are further mapped to Sub-IRs.
V. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION

The purpose of this evaluation is to assess the effectiveness of the WIE activity since its inception in July 2015 to date (October, 2016). The findings and recommendations from this evaluation will be used to guide the remaining years of program implementation through June, 2019. More broadly, it will inform USAID programming decisions on and approaches to increasing women’s presence and active participation in the country’s economy, leading to women’s empowerment in Afghanistan.

It is critical that the successes and weaknesses of this program are studied and documented and recommendations are provided for effective implementation of the activity during the remaining years. This evaluation should:

1. Evaluate the design, approach, implementation, and effectiveness of USAID’s support for the increasing women’s participation in the country’s economy; the discussion should include the project’s effectiveness in achieving the expected results; identification of strengths and
weaknesses; and an assessment of the economic opportunities gained by the targeted beneficiary women since the inception of the project.

2. Refine lessons learned on program design and implementation to guide and enhance the second half of the activity.

VI. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

Below are questions that will be examined through this evaluation:

1. To what extent has the WIE employment support resulted in employment for the beneficiaries to date?

2. Have WIE strategies and/or activities resulted in more woman-friendly workplaces? If so, which have been the most effective?

3. How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?

4. Identify project’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as the areas (if any) where WIE can improve results—for example, through collaboration with other PROMOTE components.

5. Has the incorporation of technology (eg., SMS information, “Search Path”) contributed to improved performance and results?

VII. EVALUATION DESIGN & METHODOLOGY

Based on the approved SOW from USAID, the contractor will recruit and manage the evaluation team. The evaluation work plan and evaluation protocol drafted by the evaluation team will be reviewed and approved by USAID. The detailed methodology of the evaluation will be designed by the evaluation team in the work plan; this will include presentation of an evaluation design matrix that will explicitly link evaluation questions to particular data collection approaches and data sources. It is suggested that the evaluation team use a mixed-method approach utilizing both quantitative (including non-experimental design) and qualitative analysis (key informant interviews, stakeholder interviews/mini-surveys, and focus group discussions). The evaluation team should develop the best evaluation design methodology in light of the evaluation questions, timeframe, budget, data collection requirements, quality of existing data sources, and potential biases.

The evaluators should utilize several different, yet complementary and inter-related forms of gathering information / data. Below are some suggestions:
**Document Review:** Evaluation team members will review documents throughout the evaluation process including program reports, relevant studies and evaluations and other project documents to ensure that comprehensive and grounded best practices will be identified.

**Key Informants Interview:** The team will conduct one-on-one interviews with a variety of stakeholders involved with the WIE implementation.

**Self-assessment:** The IP will respond to a self-assessment either through a questionnaire or standard interview checklist put together by the evaluation team and approved by USAID before use.

**Expert Opinion Survey:** Utilizing expert opinion is a technique used increasingly in the market system. The Evaluation team, with approval of USAID, can apply this method as well.

**Focus Group Discussions (FGD):** FGD (small group of 6 to 10 people) will be used to lead open discussion through a skilled moderator to gather semi-structured qualitative data.

**Participant Survey:** Depending on the availability of beneficiary contact information, the evaluation team may conduct a survey of the two types of WIE participants to learn about their experiences. A phone survey would be most efficient, but that possibility would be dependent upon whether female participants could be alerted to it beforehand. Checchi has successfully phone surveyed female students before, but recognizes that they can be reluctant to pick up the phone for unknown callers. Methods of reaching out via Viber or Whatsapp might even be explored so that participants are sure of the caller’s identity.

All the methodological strengths and weaknesses should be explicitly described in the evaluation report. Field work should include interviews in the areas with the highest concentration of activities, security permitting. Examples of illustrative questions are provided below with suggested methodologies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Suggested Data Sources</th>
<th>Suggested Data Collection Methods</th>
<th>Data Analysis Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. To what extent has the WIE employment support resulted in long term employment for the beneficiaries?</td>
<td>Project documents (including AMEP, Quarterly and Annual Reports etc…), WIE key partner organizations, DAI staff, WIE staff, beneficiaries</td>
<td>Meeting and interview with IP, key partners, beneficiaries, participant survey</td>
<td>TBD by evaluation team</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Have WIE strategies and/or activities resulted in more woman-friendly workplaces? If so, which have been the most effective?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Evaluation Team</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project documents (including AMEP, Quarterly and Annual Reports etc), WIE key partner organizations, DAI staff, WIE staff, beneficiaries, other stakeholders</td>
<td>Meeting and interview with IP, key partners, beneficiaries.</td>
<td>TBD by evaluation team</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Evaluation Team</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project documents (including AMEP, Quarterly and Annual Reports etc), WIE key partner organizations, DAI staff, WIE staff, beneficiaries, other stakeholders</td>
<td>Meeting and interview with IP, key partners.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Identify project’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as the areas (if any) where WIE can improve results—for example, through collaboration with other PROMOTE components. Identify areas where WIE can improve results through collaboration with other PROMOTE components.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Evaluation Team</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project documents (including AMEP, Quarterly and Annual Reports etc), WIE key partner organizations, WIG team, WLD team, Musharikat team, CORs: WIG, WLD, Musharikat, Gender office director and deputy director, WIE beneficiaries</td>
<td>Meeting and interview with IP, beneficiaries</td>
<td>TBD by evaluation team</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Has the incorporation of technology (eg., SMS information, “Search Path”) contributed to improved performance and results?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Evaluation Team</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DAI staff, WIE staff, beneficiaries, other stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### VIII. EXISTING PERFORMANCE INFORMATION SOURCES

The USAID/Gender team will provide to the evaluation team a wide range of documents on WIE and PROMOTE for review prior to and upon arrival in Afghanistan. Illustrative list of documents for the evaluation team will include:

a) Program descriptions and modifications of all PROMOTE task orders
IX. EVALUATION TEAM COMPOSITION

The evaluation team shall consist of two senior-level independent international experts (with one serving as the evaluation team leader and primary coordinator with USAID) as well as two highly experienced Afghan experts, who can also serve as interpreters. The international experts should have experience in the areas of professional and workforce development for women, particularly in Afghanistan or in neighboring countries, and should have knowledge of Afghanistan’s social, cultural, economic, and political situation. The national experts should have experience with gender equality and women empowerment sector activities and issues in Afghanistan. The national experts should also be proficient in English, Dari, and Pashto. A statement of potential bias or conflict of interest (or lack thereof) is required of each team member. If a participant survey is done, the team should also include sufficient surveyors to collect data.

Evaluation Team Leader (Expat):

The Evaluation Team Leader (TL) will provide overall leadership for the team. S/he should have a Master’s degree in an appropriate field such as business administration, economics, development studies, or other relevant social science subjects with at least six years of international experience, and experience leading evaluation teams. The Team Leader should have extensive experience in conducting both quantitative and qualitative evaluations and preparing reports that are analytical, evidence-based, and well organized. S/he must be familiar with USAID evaluation policy including performance monitoring guidelines, gender policies, project management rules and principles, budgeting and financial analysis, and reporting. Experience in USAID project evaluation in Afghanistan or neighboring countries is preferred. Excellent oral and written skills in English and computing skills in MS Office are required. The TL will finalize the evaluation design, coordinate activities, arrange periodic meetings, consolidate individual input from team members, and coordinate the process of assembling the final findings and recommendations into a high quality document. S/he will lead the preparation and presentation of the key evaluation findings and recommendations to the USAID team and other major partners.

Private Sector And Workforce Development Specialist (Expat):

The person shall possess a Master’s degree in an appropriate field such as business administration, development studies, economics, or other relevant subjects. The specialist shall have at least six
years of international experience, including experience in capacity building and workforce development interventions assessment, and technical and vocational trainings, especially with women. S/he will have significant experience in private sector and business development, particularly with micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs) as well as financial services for businesses. The private sector and workforce development Specialist shall have strong understanding of the gender specific challenges and barriers that affect nascent private sector areas and economy. S/he must have strong knowledge of standard evaluation methodologies, including sampling, interpersonal interviews and focus group discussions and will have significant experience conducting evaluation of projects. Afghanistan or regional country experience is preferred.

**Private Sector Development Specialists (National):**

Two Private sector development specialists will each have a minimum of four years of progressive professional experience in the areas of private sector and business development, particularly with micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs.) This must be in the capacity of either program implementation and/or assessment/evaluation. A master’s degree in business administration, economics, development studies, or a relative discipline is preferred. S/he will have in-depth knowledge about the Afghan economy and associated issues and challenges, specifically regarding women’s employment and women owned businesses. Strong knowledge of activity monitoring and evaluation is required. Excellent communications skills in English, both written and oral, are required.

**X. EVALUATION SCHEDULE**

The estimated time period for undertaking this Evaluation is 124 days of level of effort (LOE), of which at least 112 days should be spent in Afghanistan. The evaluation team is required to work six days a week while in country. Up to two preparation days are allocated for work preceding travel to Afghanistan, and four total travel days are authorized (two days each way). The suggested start date in Afghanistan is o/a November 1, 2016. The team is required to travel to (relatively safe) areas outside of Kabul where program activities are being implemented. At least 30 percent of the consultants' time will be spent outside Kabul visiting WIE sites, and interviewing program beneficiaries. A six-day work week is authorized for this activity.

Illustrative LOE in days:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Remote Prep</th>
<th>Travel</th>
<th>In-Country</th>
<th>Report Finalization Remote</th>
<th>Total LOE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expat Evaluation Team Leader</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
XI. DELIVERABLES AND REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

1. In-briefing: Within 48 hours of arrival in Kabul, the Evaluation Team will have an in-briefing with the OPPD M&E unit and the Gender office for introductions and to discuss the team’s understanding of the assignment, initial assumptions, evaluation questions, methodology, and work plan, and/or to adjust the SOW, if necessary.

2. Evaluation Work Plan: Within three calendar days following the in-brief, the Evaluation Team Leader shall provide a detailed initial work plan to OPPD’s M&E unit and Gender office. The initial work plan will include: (a) the overall evaluation design, including the proposed methodology, data collection and analysis plan, and data collection instruments; (b) a list of the team members and their primary contact details while in-country, including the e-mail address and mobile phone number for the team leader; and (c) the team’s proposed schedule for the evaluation. USAID offices and relevant stakeholders are asked to take up to two days to review and consolidate comments through the SUPPORT II COR. Once the evaluation team receives the consolidated comments on the initial work plan, they are expected to return with a revised work plan within two days. The revised work plan shall include the list of potential interviewees and sites to be visited.

3. Midterm Briefing and Interim Meetings: The evaluation team is expected to hold a midterm briefing with USAID on the status of the assessment including potential challenges and emerging opportunities. The team will also provide the Gender office with periodic briefings and feedback on the team’s findings, as agreed upon during the in-briefing. If desired or necessary, weekly briefings by phone can be arranged.

4. PowerPoint and Final Exit Presentation: The evaluation team is expected to hold a final exit presentation to discuss the summary of findings and recommendations to USAID. This presentation will be scheduled as agreed upon during the in-briefing. Presentation slides should not exceed 18 in total.

5. Draft Evaluation Report: The draft evaluation report should be consistent with the guidance
provided in Section XIII: “Final Report Format.” The report will address each of the issues and questions identified in the SOW and any other factors the team considers to have a bearing on the objectives of the evaluation. Any such factors can be included in the report only after consultation with USAID. The submission date for the draft evaluation report will be decided upon during the mid-term or exit briefing and submitted to OPPD’s M&E unit by Checchi. Once the initial draft evaluation report is submitted, the following deadlines should be followed:

a. Gender office will have 10 working days in which to review and comment on the initial draft, after which point USAID/OPPD’s M&E unit will have two working days to review and consolidate all USAID comments (total of 12 working days). OPPD will submit the consolidated comments to Checchi.

b. The evaluation team will then have five working days to make appropriate edits and revisions to the draft and re-submit the revised final draft report to USAID.

c. Gender office and the M&E unit will have 10 working days after the submission of the second revised draft to again review and send any final comments.

6. Final Evaluation Report: The evaluation team will be asked to take no more than three days to respond/incorporate the final comments from the Gender office and OPPD. The Evaluation Team Leader will then submit the final report to OPPD. All project data and records will be submitted in full and should be in electronic form in easily readable format; organized and documented for use by those not fully familiar with the project or evaluation; and owned by USAID.

XII. MANAGEMENT

Checchi/SUPPORT-II will identify and hire the evaluation team, pending the COR’s concurrence and CO approval, to assist in facilitating the work plan, and arrange meetings with key stakeholders identified prior to the initiation of the fieldwork. The evaluation team will organize other meetings as identified during the course of the evaluation, in consultation with Checchi/SUPPORT-II and USAID/Afghanistan. Checchi/SUPPORT-II is responsible for all logistical support required for the evaluation team, including arranging accommodation, security, office space, computers, Internet access, printing, communication, and transportation.

The evaluation team will officially report to Checchi’s SUPPORT-II management. Checchi/SUPPORT-II is responsible for all direct coordination with USAID/Afghanistan/OPPD, through the SUPPORT-II COR, Mohammad Sediq Orya (msorya@usaid.gov). From a technical management perspective, the evaluation team will work closely with –

- COR for WIE;
- Alternate COR for WIE;
- Director, Gender Office;
Deputy Director, Gender office;
• Monitoring & Evaluation Specialist for Gender office.

To maintain objectivity, OPPD’s Monitoring and Evaluation Unit will make all final decisions about the evaluation.

XIII FINAL REPORT FORMAT

The evaluation final report should be a maximum of 25 pages in length, not including annexes. It should be written in English, using Gil Sans MT 12 point font, single space spacing, and be consistent with USAID branding policy. The report should be structured as follows:

1. Title Page
2. Table of Contents
3. List of any acronyms, tables and/or figures
4. Acknowledgements or Preface (optional)
5. Executive Summary (3-5 pages)
6. Introduction
   a. Description of the project evaluated, including goal and expected results
   b. Brief statement on purpose of the evaluation, plus a list of the evaluation questions
   c. Description of the methods used in the evaluation (such as desk/document review, interviews, site visits, surveys, etc.), the rationale and location for field visits (if any), and a description of the numbers and types of respondents
   d. Limitations to the evaluation, with particular attention to the limitations associated with the evaluation methodology (selection bias, recall bias, unobservable differences between comparator groups, etc.)
7. Findings
   a. Describe findings, focusing on each of the evaluation questions and providing gender disaggregation where appropriate
   b. Evaluation findings should be presented as analyzed facts, evidence, and data and not based on anecdotes, hearsay, or the compilation of people’s opinions
8. Conclusions
   a. Conclusions are value statements drawn from the data gathered during the evaluation process
9. Recommendations
   a. Recommendations should be actionable, practical and specific statements for existing programming and for the design and performance of future programming
   b. Each recommendation should be supported by a specific set of findings
   c. Include recommended future objectives and types of activities based on lessons learned
10. Annexes
    a. Evaluation Scope of Work
b. Methodology description (include **any pertinent** details not captured in the report)
c. Copies of **all** survey instruments and questionnaires
d. List of critical and key documents reviewed
e. Schedule of Meetings and sources of information (If confidentiality is a concern, the team should discuss and agree upon an approach with USAID)
f. Notes from key interviews, focus group discussions and other meetings
g. Documentation of any changes to the SOW or evaluation process
h. Statement of differences (if applicable)

11. One or two page briefer of findings, recommendations and lessons learned (optional)

**XIV OVERALL REPORTING GUIDELINES**

The evaluation report should represent a thoughtful, well-researched, and well-organized effort to objectively evaluate the validity of the project’s hypothesis and the effectiveness of the project. Evaluation reports shall address all evaluation questions included in the statement of work and be written in highly professional English, free of grammatical and typographical error, and with professional formatting. Report body and annexes should be free of personally-identifiable information (PII), unless required by USAID, and any/all information which may compromise the privacy and protection of evaluation participants will be reviewed by USAID for potential redaction/removal. All the findings in the report should be backed with facts and figures and be evidence based.

Any modifications to the statement of work, whether in technical requirements, evaluation questions, evaluation team composition, methodology, or timeline need to be agreed upon in writing by the SUPPORT II COR.
ANNEX II: SURVEY INSTRUMENTS AND QUESTIONNAIRES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE</th>
<th>LOCATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interns and Apprentices</td>
<td>Phone Survey Phone survey and face to face in Herat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interns and Apprentice</td>
<td>Focus Groups Mazar, Herat, Kabul, Kandahar, Jalalabad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New/Improved Employment</td>
<td>Survey Kabul, Herat, Kandahar, Jalalabad, Mazar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Businesses Employing 10% + Women</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women-Owned Businesses</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Host Businesses or Institution</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micro-Finance Institutions</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Service Providers</td>
<td>Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Readiness Training Coordinators</td>
<td>survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIE Self-Assessment</td>
<td>Focus Group Kabul (Senior staff)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

WOMEN IN ECONOMY (WIE) - MID-TERM-EVALUATION
Internship and Apprentice Questionnaire

Name(s) 
Organization(s) 
Position(s) 
Age range 
Location(s) 
Contact details 
Interviewer’s name 
Date

1. Are you beneficiary of: Internship ____ or Apprenticeship ____
2. What is your level of education? ________________________________
3. How did you hear about the WIE Internship and Apprentice training program?
   a) High School/University ____
   b) Friends ____
   c) Social media ____
   d) Word of mouth ____
   e) Other: ______________________
4. Why did you apply for the WIE Program Internship or Apprenticeship?
   a) Need experience to get a job ____

42
b) Help family business _____
c) Want to start my own business _____
d) Other: _______________________________________

5. What kind of challenges have you faced in the job market?
   a) Family Opposition _____
   b) Lack of experience _____
   c) Lack access to specialized education ______
   d) Don’t know how to find a job _____

6. How effective and helpful was the WIE Job Readiness Training?
   a) Not helpful ______
   b) Somewhat helpful _____
   c) Very helpful ______

7. Has the WIE Job Readiness Training resulted in an:
   a) Internships _____
   b) Apprenticeship _____
   c) Job offer _____
   d) Nothing yet _____

8. How would you rank each subject of the Job Readiness Training curriculum by subject
   (1 = Not important / 2= somewhat important / 3= important / 4= very important 5= extremely important)
   a) Job search techniques ______
   b) CV development ______
   c) Mock interviewing sessions ______
   d) Communications ______
   e) Work ethics _____
   f) How to work in a male dominated workplace _____
   g) How to handle harassment _____

9. What other subjects do you feel were missing from the training (list)?
   a) ______________________________________________________
   b) ______________________________________________________
   c) ______________________________________________________

10. Have you improved your work skills from the WIE Internship and Apprentice?
    a) A great deal _____
    b) Moderately _____
    c) Not at all _____
    d) Too early to tell _____

11. Would you consider your work environment to be women-friendly?
    Yes _____ Somewhat ____ No _____

11.1 If No, what can be improved? ______________________________________________________

12. Do you own your own mobile phone? Yes ____ No _____

13. Which of the following technologies do you use:
a) SMS _____
b) Facebook _____
c) Twitter _____
d) YouTube _____
e) Google search _____

14. **Do you have access to a computer?**
   a) Home _____
   b) School _____
   c) Current workplace _____
   d) Family owned business _____
   e) Friends house _____
   f) Internet café _____
   g) Have my own _____

15. **How can WIE make the Internship and Apprentice program more effective to meet the needs of the Afghan women?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FOCUS GROUP LEAD QUESTIONS: Interns and Apprentice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 What kind of challenges have you faced in finding a job?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 How effective was the Job Readiness Training, did it give you confidence and proper tools to get a job?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Are there any subjects you would have liked to have training in that was not included in the job readiness training?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 If you did not take the JRT please suggest what kind of subjects you would like to be trained in?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Would you consider your workplace women-friendly?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Do you think your current position as an intern/apprentice will become a job? If not, if there a future there or somewhere else in the sector with skills you learned in your current job?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 What are the barriers you face in getting a job?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 What kind of technology and social media do you use?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 What is your ideal job? (examples: ITC, healthcare, teaching, fashion, working with kids, start your own business?)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New and/or Improved Employment Supported Women Questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organization(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewer’s name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Are you a beneficiary of a New _____ or an Improved Job _____ under WIE Support?
2. How did you hear about the WIE employment program?
   a) Current job network _____
   b) Professional network _____
   c) High School/University network _____
   d) Friends _____
   e) Social media _____
   f) Word of mouth _____
   g) Other: ___________________
3. What is your level of education/ certifications? ________________________________
4. What is your current job position? ________________________________
5. Are you a WIE scholarship recipient? No ____ Yes ____ If yes in what sector? ______
6) What kind of challenges have you faced in trying to improve your current job opportunities and wages?
   a) Access to extended specialized skills training _____
   b) Lack of experience in the sector/or area of specialty _____
   c) Family demands _____
   d) No opportunity to move up in current job due to structure of business _____
   e) Don’t know how to find a better job _____
   f) Don’t have the skills or confidence to ask for a better position or more wages _____
7) How effective and helpful was the WIE program in improving your current job opportunities?
   a) Not helpful _____
   b) Somewhat helpful _____
   c) Very helpful _____
   d) Did WIE support help you improve your current wages?
   e) No _____
   f) Yes _____
   g) If YES how much of an increase _________ %
6. Did WIE support improve or advance your current job position? No ____ Yes _____
   a. If Yes what was the nature of the advancement _____________________________
7. Would you consider your work environment women-friendly?
   b. Yes ____
   c. Somewhat ____
   d. No _____

8. If the workplace is not women-friendly explain not?____________________________________

9. How would you rank each subject of the Job Readiness Training curriculum by subject (1 = Not important / 2= somewhat important / 3= important / 4= very important 5= extremely important)
   a. Job search techniques ______
   b. CV development ______
   c. Mock interviewing sessions ______
   d. Communications ______
   e. Work ethics ______
   f. How to work in a male dominated workplace _____
   g. How to handle harassment _____

10. What other subjects do you feel were missing from the training?
   a. __________________________________________________________
   b. __________________________________________________________
   c. __________________________________________________________

11. Do you have your own mobile phone? Yes ____ No ____

12. Which of the following technologies do you use:
   d. SMS _____
   e. Facebook _____
   f. Twitter _____
   g. YouTube _____
   h. Google search _____

13. Do you have access to a computer?
   i. Home ______
   j. School _____
   k. Current workplace ______
   l. Family owned business _____
   m. Friends house _____
   n. Internet café _____
   o. Have my own ____

MID-TERM-EVALUATION - WOMEN IN ECONOMY (WIE)
BUSINESSES with 10% + WOMEN

1. What is the nature of your business?
   a) Retailer of goods or a shop owner _____
   b) Technology based _____
   c) Other services _____
   d) Manufacturer _____
   e) Agriculture _____
2. How long have you operated your business? ____
3. What is your target market?
   a) Local ____ b) Regional ____ c) International ____ d. Business to Business ____
4. What is the major challenge faced by your business?
   a. Access to capital ____
   b. Infrastructure (Internet access, electricity, roads ____
   c. Market access ____
   d. Need for more business support to improve sector sales opportunities ____
5. How did you learn of the Women in Economy support offered to businesses?
   a. WIE events or staff ____
   b. TV ____
   c. Radio ____
   d. Newspaper ____
   e. Friends ____
   f. GiRoA ____
   g. Social Media ____
   h. Other ____
6. What kind of Business support did you receive from WIE and how effective was it?
   a. Referral to service providers
      1. Yes helpful ____
      2. Somewhat helpful ____
      3. Not helpful ____
      4. Comment: ____________________________________________
   b. Interns
      1. Yes, well trained and helpful _____
      2. Somewhat helpful _____
      3. Not helpful _____
      4. Comments: ____________________________________________
   c. Apprentice
      1. Yes, well trained and helpful _____
      2. Somewhat helpful _____
      3. Not helpful _____
      4. Comments: ____________________________________________
7. Did WIE Support make your business systems more efficient?
   a) Yes ____
   b) No ____
   c) If no explain: ____________________________________________
8. Did business sales or profits improve due to WIE support?
   a) Too early to tell ____
   b) 5% - 10% ____
   c) 15%+ _____
   d) Other ____
9. Are you satisfied with the support from WIE?
   a) Yes __
   b) No ___
   c) Too early to tell ___
   d) Comment: ____________________________

10. How do you rate the business service/support from WIE?
    a) Good ___
    b) Moderate ___
    c) Not good ___
    d) Comment: ____________________________

11. How many people do you employ?
    a) Before WIE Support: Male _____ Female _____
    b) After WIE Support: Male _____ Female _____

12. If you have hired more women with support from WIE why?
    a) WIE support made it easier to find qualified women ___
    b) Women performed better than expected due to WIE Job Readiness Training ___
    c) Company brought in more women from WIE network ___
    d) Comment: ____________________________

13. Do you have separate facilities e.g. bathrooms and prayer rooms for men & women?
    a) Yes ___
    b) No ___
    c) Comment: ____________________________

14. Do you have a policy against harassment of women employees in your organization?
    a) Yes ___
    b) No ___
    c) If No, do you plan in having one? Yes ___ No ___

15. Does your business provide any other special services to women?
    a) Yes ___
    b) No ___
    c) What? ________________________________

16. Is your business using technology:
    a) Computer ___
    b) Mobile banking _____ (M-Pesa___)
    c) SMS ___
    d) Facebook ____ Do you have a Facebook page for your business? ____
    e) Emails ___
    f) Others: ______________________________

17. Has the use of technology improved the performance of your business?
    a) No ___
    b) Yes ___
    c) If Yes explain how__________________________
18. Do you consider WIE support to women-owned business in Afghanistan important?
   a) Yes ____
   b) No ____

19. How can WIE project improve support for women-owned businesses in the future?
   Explain: _______________________________________________________________

20. Do you think your target market is growing and if so at what rate?
   a) Not growing ____
   b) 5% ____
   c) 10% ____
   d) 15% ____
   e) 20% ____

21. If your market sector is not growing, why not?
   a) Lack of access to capital ____
   b) Infrastructure (Internet access, electricity, roads) ____
   c) Market access and linkages ____
   d) Sector needs support to improve sales/services and opportunities explain:_______

MID-TERM-EVALUATION - WOMEN IN ECONOMY (WIE)
WOMEN-OWNED BUSINESSES

1. Is your business fully woman-owned?
   a. 100% ____
   b. Partially woman-owned ____
   c. If partial what % do you own ____ %

2. What is the nature of your business?
   a. Retailer of goods or a shop owner ____
   b. Technology based ____
   c. Other services ____
   d. Manufacturer ____
   e. Agriculture ____

3. How long have you operated your business? ____

4. What is your target market?
   a. Local ____ b) Regional ____ c) International ____ d. Business to Business ____

5. What is the major challenge faced by your business?
   a. Access to capital ____
   b. Infrastructure (Internet access, electricity, roads ____
   c. Market access ____
   d. Need for more business support to improve sector sales opportunities ____
6. How did you learn of the Women in Economy support offered to businesses?
   a. WIE events or staff ____
   b. TV ____
   c. Radio ____
   d. Newspaper ____
   e. Friends ____
   f. GIRoA ____
   g. Social Media ____
   h. Other ____

7. What kind of Business support did you receive from WIE and how effective was it?
   a. Referral to service providers
   b. Yes helpful ____
   c. Somewhat helpful ____
   d. Not helpful ____
   e. Comment: ____________________________________________

   a. Interns
   a. Yes, well trained and helpful ____
   b. Somewhat helpful ____
   c. Not helpful ____
   d. Comments: ___________________________________________________________________

   b. Apprentice
   a. Yes, well trained and helpful ____
   b. Somewhat helpful ____
   c. Not helpful ____
   d. Comments: ___________________________________________________________________

8. Did WIE Support make your business systems more efficient?
   a. Yes ____
   b. No ____
   c. If no explain: ___________________________________________________________________

9. Did business sales or profits improve due to WIE support?
   a. Too early to tell ____
   b. 5% - 10% ____
   c. 15%+ ____
   d. Other ____

10. Are you satisfied with the support from WIE?
    a) Yes ____
    b) No ____
    c) Too early to tell ____
    d) Comment: ___________________________________________________________________

11. How do you rate the business service/support from WIE?
    a) Good ____
    b) Moderate ____
    c) Not good ____
    d) Comment: ___________________________________________________________________
12. How many people do you employ?
   a) Before WIE Support: Male _____ Female _____
   b) After WIE Support: Male _____ Female _____

13. If you have hired more women with support from WIE why?
   a) WIE support made it easier to find qualified women _____
   b) Women performed better than expected due to WIE Job Readiness Training _____
   c) Company brought in more women from WIE network _____
   d) Comment: ____________________________________________

14. Do you have separate facilities e.g. bathrooms and prayer rooms for men & women?
   a. Yes _____
   b. No _____
   c. Comment: ____________________________________________

15. Do you have a policy against harassment of women employees in your organization?
   a. Yes _____
   b. No _____
   c. If No, do you plan in having one? Yes ___ No _____

16. Does your business provide any other special services to women?
   a. Yes _____
   b. No _____
   c. What? ____________________________________________

17. Is your business using technology:
   a. Computer _____
   b. Mobile banking _____ (M-Paisa _____)
   c. SMS _____
   d. Facebook _____ Do you have a Facebook page for your business? _____
   e. Emails _____
   f. Others: ____________________________________________

18. Has the use of technology improved the performance of your business?
   a. No _____
   b. Yes _____
   c. If Yes explain how ____________________________________________

19. Do you consider WIE support to women-owned business in Afghanistan important?
   a. Yes _____
   b. No _____

20. How can WIE project improve support for women-owned businesses in the future?
   21. Explain: ____________________________________________

22. Do you think your target market is growing and if so at what rate?
   a. Not growing _____
   b. 5% _____
   c. 10% _____
   d. 15% _____
   e. 20% _____

23. If your market sector is not growing, why not?
   a. Lack of access to capital _____
   b. Infrastructure (Internet access, electricity, roads) _____
   c. Market access and linkages _____
24. As a women business owner what are some of your special challenges please comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEAD QUESTIONS: Host Business</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEAD QUESTIONS: Micro-Finance Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. How do you structure your interest on loans? (average %, is it on a scale, repayment time)

5. Do you notice any difference in the payback rates between male-owned or female-owned businesses?

6. Do women work in your institution/bank? If so how many? Do you consider it a women friendly environment?

7. Do you think there is anything government or the business community could do to encourage more employment of women?

8. Do you think micro lending and banking is a good field for women? If yes what could be done to encourage more women to enter into this profession?

9. What is your criteria for giving a loan for established business? Entrepreneurs new start-ups?
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>What kind of technology and social media do you use to promote your company?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Do you work with a micro-finance institution and if you do have you had any problems getting loans in order to invest in your business growth?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LEAD QUESTIONS: Trainers for the JRT**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What qualifies you to be a trainer and were you trained specifically on the JRT curriculum and its delivery?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Do you think the participants are selected correctly? If not explain and recommend.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Would you recommend additional subjects you think are missing or current subjects that need more development?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>What challenges do you think women face in entering the job market? Do you think the JRT addresses those challenges?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>What kind of technology do you use in the training? Does the curriculum address the use of technology sufficiently?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>What else do you think WIE could do to better prepare women for the workforce?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Do you follow up with your trainees? If so in what way?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MID-TERM PERFORMANCE EVALUATION
OF
PROMOTE- WOMEN IN ECONOMY (WIE)
Implementing Partner Self-Assessment

The purpose of this questionnaire is to document Development Alternatives Incorporated’s (DAI) assessment of its own efforts in the Women in the Economy (WIE) project. The bolded questions below are the evaluation questions driving the activity’s midterm performance evaluation. Sub-questions are intended to guide DAI to provide complete responses.

To what extent has the WIE employment support resulted in employment for the beneficiaries to date?

How does WIE define employment?

**Precise Definition(s):**
Total number of people gaining employment or better employment within six months of participation in USG funded workforce development project. Better employment is based on the participant’s perception of whether the employment is better.

As per WIE’s task order “new employment” encompasses employment with a private sector firm or a government entity as well as reported self-employment.

The following questions will be asked at baseline and at annual intervals to determine perceptions of **better employment:**

- What are WIE’s strengths in creating employment opportunities for beneficiaries?
  - WIE strength is the understanding of private sector, and our demand driven approach. We believe in our team and its networks. WIE main objectives are to make sure our placements leads to full time employment.

- Internship & Apprenticeship Services – young women aged 18-30, minimum 8th graduate and having a valid national ID card can benefit from Internship/apprenticeship services. These beneficiaries are placed for a period of ranging from 3 – 9 months to acquire valuable experience, which will later help them secure their first employment. WfD has a target of 9500 internships/apprenticeships across Afghanistan.

- Scholarships – scholarships are designed as high value skills, applicants apply through job portals selecting a specific skill that they want to excel in, these applicants are referred to an institute where 70% of their cost are paid by WIE and beneficiaries must be able to cover the other 30% of the cost, the selected specific technical skills will later on help them get an employment. It worth mentioning that the peak for financial support to WIE beneficiary is 60,000 AFA. The total target to award the scholarships is 1600 across Afghanistan.

- Soft Skills Trainings – WfD team designed a package of soft skills known as job readiness training,
which covers the main topics and is a bridge towards employment. Some of the main topics include resume writing, interview techniques, work ethics etc. Each WIE beneficiary completes 20 hours of job readiness training and the total target for WfD team is to complete 180,000 hours of job readiness trainings.

- Job Placement – WfD team works with employers to understand their requirement for a specific job and places WIE beneficiaries direct on jobs. WIE through Global Development Alliance (GDA) will partner with SearchPath on job placement services which will facilitate job matching. Overall WIE must facilitate 21,000 job placements across Afghanistan. WIE is not only providing internship and apprenticeship services to employers [businesses] but also giving other services that lead to higher sales level; this means, if an intern is placed in a business, the business can sustain the person if it gives good service to the business since the business profitability can be increased through higher sales level.

- How many beneficiaries have been placed in permanent jobs?
  Overall across all regions, 237 WIE beneficiaries have been placed in jobs; some of these WIE beneficiaries have been directly placed in jobs while some of them have completed an internship or an apprenticeship with host employers, approximately 30% of the completed internships have led to job placements, this percentage is expected to increase in the coming months, below is the summary from all the regions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Regions</th>
<th>Job Placements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>West</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>East</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>North</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- How many beneficiaries have been placed in internships or apprenticeships?
  WIE has reached 22.5% of their overall target by placing 2143 interns and apprentices across all regions, the numbers are expected to cross 3000 in the coming three months

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Regions</th>
<th>Total IA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Central</td>
<td>636</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>West</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>East</td>
<td>419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>North</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>South</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Are targets being met and will they continue to be met?
  To date the facilitation of jobs, are not in line with WIE targets, and the duration of the project was set for five years now WIE needs to reach its target in four years. Economic situation and security situation, specifically the recent incident in Kandahar will make it difficult for WIE to achieve its target, it is a target
that was set based on the situation at the time of proposal where economic and political situation was better. WfD team is working to achieve it. We know the targets are ambitious, our main objectives are to make sure our placements leads to full time employment. We are sure the implementation of My Search Path GDA, the scholarship program, and the delivery of soft skills will help WIE to achieve its targets.

- In the beginning of the program internships and apprenticeships were soaring and only in the month of April, 2016, WfD teams across the regions were able to place 500 interns/apprentices. This is where WfD team emphasized more on quality and compiled some policies to ensure quality of the internships/apprenticeships. Whereas now all the internships/apprenticeships are more focused on quality, which is why it is leading to job placements.

- Internship and Apprenticeship targets are being met and will continue to be met. Training hours targets are being met, but only through the volume of Job Readiness Trainings delivered. Technical and Job skills training will contribute more to those targets (and have a greater impact on job placement) once WIE obtains approval for a payment mechanism to disburse scholarship payments.

- Job placement targets are not being met, although the number of job placements is expected to ramp up when USAID approves the SearchPath GDA.

- Are employers satisfied with their new employees?
- Employers are satisfied with their new employees. Internships/apprenticeships aren’t only an opportunity for WIE beneficiaries but also for the employers to develop the kind of employee they require for their business. Therefore, the period of internship/apprenticeships ranges from 3 to 9 months based on the skills an applicant can learn during the period. Employers uses this opportunity and hires the best candidates for their business, they would never hire an intern/apprentice if they were not able to bring improvement in their business.

- Are beneficiaries satisfied with their jobs/internships/apprenticeships?
- Most of these beneficiaries that are placed in jobs have secured their first ever employment, they are ready to put efforts so that their jobs are sustainable. Besides these applicants placed in jobs are now earning and financially assisting their families. So far WfD team has not received any report of turnover of beneficiaries from their jobs.

- What are WIE’s strengths in creating employment opportunities for beneficiaries?
- As discussed above WfD teams have many services such as internships/apprenticeships, high value skills scholarships, job readiness trainings or soft skills training and direct job placements. Most importantly WfD services doesn’t end at the completion of an internship/apprenticeship, WfD team has a target to facilitate 21,000 job placements, WfD team works with beneficiaries to secure them an employment.

- What are WIE’s weaknesses in creating employment opportunities for beneficiaries?
- WIE can identify labor market gaps and upgrade women’s skills to make them more competitive in securing many types of jobs, but cannot address the contracting economy. While the PSD component supports expansion of enterprises already employing women, the 400 or so companies that WIE will assist will not be able to make up for the shortfall in jobs in general. Even
if 400 companies were to add six jobs each on average this would only be 2400 new jobs. In order to support enterprise growth in a sustainable way, leading to more stable “new or better jobs” for women, WIE cannot push businesses to expand too quickly or too much, exceeding their cash flow or management capacity.

- Many of the employers prefer interns/apprentices with a bachelor degree and beneficiaries that hold a bachelor degree often have high expectations and are reluctant to take a low paid internship/apprenticeship which is sometimes challenging. One of the main weaknesses is the economic situation of the country, which is adversely affecting private organization to expand and have more job vacancies.

- Some of the employers were misusing the WfD internship/apprenticeship opportunities and were requesting a lot of interns as a form of subsidized labor. Once the internship/apprenticeship was over they would request more interns, however this has been controlled effectively, WfD has now a cap of 6 interns/apprentices per employer and a near 40% of job placement rate. This has resulted in quality internships/apprenticeships with the job placement rates increasing.

- What opportunities exist to sustain or expand targets and results?
  - The number of beneficiaries registering to WIE is increasing day by day, and the numbers of employers hosting female’s job seekers are also rising which supports expansion of the program, however, the number of new paid jobs in the labor market has been contracting.
  - WIE has signed MoU with Afghan Ministry of MOLSAMD, which has allowed us in reaching for businesses working in the remote provinces of Afghanistan. WIE’s PSD team is also working with private businesses to increase their revenue and the collaboration between WfD team and PSD team to identify more opportunities is another way of reaching the project targets.
  - Opportunities exists in several sectors, such as, Health, ICT, Banking, soft skills, Saffron, and food processing, a through follow up will help WIE reach its targets.

- What threats might prevent targets from being achieved in the future?
  - Some of the main threats include:
    - Cultural sensitivity: Some Afghan families don’t allow their female members of family to work outside of the house.
    - Lack of Private Sector companies and jobs: Afghanistan is lacking a substantial private sector, due to which WIE can’t place more interns or increase the rate of internships/apprenticeships. There is a corresponding shortage of jobs which will make it very difficult to find job placements for 21,000 women.
    - Working Environment: some of the employers fail WIE’s internal vetting process, which means the working environment isn’t suitable for female staff for internships/apprenticeships.
    - Security: security is another big threat towards the expansion of WfD internships and apprenticeships program, some of the provinces are not secure, making it hard to for WIE staff to do outreach sessions or to place beneficiaries.
    - Technology: some of the provinces don’t have an internet connection and beneficiaries are not able enroll with the WIE program, or to apply for jobs online.

- How does WIE define and measure “woman-friendy workplaces”?
  - “Female friendly workplace” is self-defined by WIE beneficiaries. At the completion of an
internship or apprenticeship, or at least 8 weeks into a job placement, beneficiaries are asked if their workplace is female friendly, and why or why not. Most of them indicate a workplace as being female friendly because: Free of harassment, respect to women, some precedent in the place of a business of having female employees, and business is in a safe physical location.

- **What strategies and/or activities does WIE implement to make workplaces “woman-friendly”?.**
- **WIE** has not yet started the gender sensitivity training activity that targets broader education of employers in creating female friendly workplaces, we plan to launch this in March, as we now have better experience with what issues can arise in the workplace and what young women in the workforce view as “female friendly”. It is almost never related to the presence or absence of dedicated female facilities (bathroom, prayer room, etc) or special treatment (transportation) but rather to the way they are treated by colleagues and management, and whether or not there are other females employed in the same facility. Women also placed emphasis on their skills and work ethic being recognized fairly.

- **Currently, in the job readiness training which happens before an intern/apprentice is placed all beneficiaries are educated of their rights during their program. Beside during the outreach sessions with employers WIE staff encourage employer to give more opportunities for women to enhance their capacity to compete with men and diversify their workforce. WfD team has also prepared handouts for employers and beneficiaries which provides complete information regarding the responsibilities and accountabilities of each party in the program.**

- **We have a vetting check list for the entire employer, before we place any beneficiary a WIE employee should have visited the employer and should have made sure that it is save. WIE hired staff from each community, Afghanistan’s community is not very big and our staff would make sure to get an insight about the employer and will complete the vetting check list once we have that insight.**

- **What are the strengths of these activities?**
- These activities assist the WIE beneficiaries to know of their rights while working, examples of successful WIE beneficiaries are shared, and follow up communication is constant with employers to get their feedback on program and improve the bottlenecks. This also helps WIE beneficiaries go avoid harassments, and feel comfortable in the workplace

- **We believe having a friendly workplace is the right of each individual.**

- **What are the weaknesses of these activities?**
  1. Some of the employers still fear to place female interns/apprentices due to cultural sensitivity, men leading in workplace, interns not qualified enough and insecurity
     Women are afraid and will not speak up in some cases we might not be able to know if they have been treated well in an organization, we are trying to provide the required information; changing behavior will not happen over time, it takes time. Specifically working with 9500 interns who are not mature and are not aware of their rights, WIE staff with confidence deliver training and build capacities of beneficiaries, in order to mitigate the risk and prepare them to enter the workforce, however sometimes the situation is not in favor of female because in some cases employers are trying to take advantage of the situation.

- **What opportunities exist to sustain or expand these activities?**
- Regular contacts with employers, expanding the outreach sessions, identifying more potential employers, increasing female participation in the economy through advocacy and ensuring proper women friendly
workplace.

Women in the economy have the chance to work with private sector, the opportunity is in building their capacities and developing their workforce skills to meet the private sector needs. Private sector led businesses are sustainable; as long as the private sector exists it requires a professional workforce. WIE WfD activities will be sustainable as long as they are demand driven.

What threats are there to the sustainability of these results?
- Security is the threat, and some cultural and social habits, some families might not let their daughter to work outside home. Poor private sector leadership, employers not cooperative, cultural and traditional way of thinking and insecurity.

The overall performance of the market economy and political wellbeing.

How successful have the WIE entrepreneurship support interventions been in expanding beneficiary businesses in terms of profit and the hiring of more staff/workers?
- WIE has just started working with businesses and it is too early to measure the impact

How does WIE track expansion of beneficiary business or increases in staff/workers?
- When a business is accepted for a service, they are baselined, then, each 6 months, the difference is being tracked through RSI.

Are expansions of businesses and increases in employees attributable to WIE interventions?
- Yes.

What are the strengths of WIE entrepreneurship support interventions?
- We are defining them in practical ways that can really contribute to actual sustainability of startups. The targets for implement firms are set in a way that they make them to ensure some sustainability finally.

What are the weaknesses of these activities?
- Normally businesses are used to free money, grants and machinery, changing that attitude is giving us a little difficult time.

What opportunities are there to sustain or expand these activities?
- If startups that are graduated through WIE-funded business accelerators can sustain themselves and given good support to them, other startups will know of this services with evidences and begin to come to such incubation centers so that the business incubation centers can charge fee and sustain themselves.

What threats are there to continuing these activities?
- No physical threat. Other threats I don’t see any so far.

What threats are there to the sustainability of the results; will businesses be able to main higher profits and new employees?
- One major focus for WIE is good selection of startups – the real startups and not those that fail half way through. However, the universal fact is that there is some failure rate for such startups.

RS:
- Identify project’s design and implementation strengths and weaknesses, as well as the areas (if any) where WIE can improve results—for example, through collaboration with other PROMOTE
components.

- **What are the strengths of WIE’s design and/or implementation strategy?**
  WIE has a wide network with private sector employers; WIE core value is quality and would prefer to develop sustainable long term employment for its beneficiaries.

- The strengths are the WIE programming will be leveraging other local resources and not directly implementing many of its initiatives on the field.

- **What external opportunities exist for improving results?**
  Better outreach using networks from other PROMOTE and existing organizations, including social media would be nice tool reach out to its stakeholders.

- **Does WIE collaborate with other PROMOTE components? Do they plan to?**
  WIE is collaborating with all other PROMOTE components, sending and taking referrals for jobs and internships to WIG, offering WIE activities (training, scholarships, internship and apprenticeships, and job placement activities to WLD participants, and working with Mushairkat's women’s economic empowerment coalition.

- **What external factors threaten WIE’s implementation or sustainability of results?**
  Security for the WfD work (instability and threats against women working outside the home)
  For WFD, there are free scholarships and free training provided by other donors and projects and they also pay their trainees stipends and transport to go to the trainings (like AWDP and WLD) where WIE is asking beneficiaries to pay 30% of the cost. Other projects beneficiaries are getting free services and also supplemental stipends.

**Market performance for PSD work.**

- Has the incorporation of technology (e.g., SMS information, “Search Path”) contributed to improved performance and results?

- **What technology has been incorporated into the implementation of WIE?**
  The WIE knowledge management portal (KMP), used by staff and beneficiaries, is an example of this. It is a database driven web application that allows jobseekers and employers to register with the project online, and WIE staff to manage which project activities jobseekers are participating in and to track internship, apprenticeships, and job placements. A unique feature of the KMP is a job matching platform developed by DAI that uses machine learning technology to match beneficiary resumes with jobs or work experience opportunities. Machine learning is a type of artificial intelligence that gives software applications the ability to learn without being explicitly programmed. DAI's job matching platform "learns", from program staff doing manual classifications, how to classify jobseekers against vacancies they might be a fit for. The application programming interface does this by remembering which resume keywords occurring with a certain frequency correspond with key words in a job description even when the terms are not an exact match. DAI will use machine learning to help match jobseekers to 21,000 or more jobs, a task that would be impossible if program staff had to manually match CVs with potential job openings. and search applicants for job skills that match new vacancies. This novel use of machine learning also allows the system to operate in Dari, English, or Pashto, and was featured in a BBC podcast.

To introduce women to financial services, WIE is using mobile money to make stipend payments.
to interns and apprentices across the country. Training for over 800 program participants on how to use the M-Paisa mobile money system was conducted in Mazar-i-Sharif, Herat, Jalalabad, Kabul, and Kandahar. M-Paisa is a mobile transfer and payment solution provided by Roshan. The mobile money system allows individuals to send and receive cash and make payments through mobile phones. It is fast, cost effective, and secure.

Mobile banking is a practical way to reach beneficiaries who live in remote areas and may lack access to the formal banking system. Mobile users can securely send or receive funds through short message service (SMS). All users have a Personal Identification Number (PIN) for added security and the service is available in all 34 provinces of Afghanistan.

Having reliable access to financial services is one important aspect of participating in the mainstream economy. Through M-Paisa, mobile users can deposit or withdraw money from their mobile accounts using conventional bank offices, Roshan kiosks or M-Paisa’s 12,000 agents across the country. Features like the Interactive Voice Response (IVR) service which is available in Dari, Pashto and English allows the 70% of the population who cannot read or write to use this platform.

In the long term, mobile money services can provide women across Afghanistan with expanded and affordable access to financial services. This payment system is cheap with each transaction currently costing about one fifth to a quarter of conventional banking costs. Mobile money is increasingly integrated with the conventional banking system (i.e., commercial banks, microfinance institutions), which allows mobile users to transfer money domestically and internationally through their mobile phones. WIE will place 9,500 interns and apprentices by 2018, and it is hoped that they will help raise awareness among other women of the financial services that can be accessed through mobile money. Partnering with jobs.af to advertise scholarships, internships and apprenticeships and other job placements

- **How has SMS information been used in implementation and how has it improved results?**
  The Knowledge Management Portal automatically send SMS to beneficiaries when their applications are received and keeps them informed about their status in the program (scholarship application accepted, etc) using SMS push servers - when they are registered they receive a message, if they are recommended to a program they receive a message, when their stipends are transferred to their account they receive a message. M-Paisa also works through SMS technology, no one else will be able to withdraw the stipend amount of our WIE beneficiary account except for beneficiary herself.

- **How will Search Path be used in implementation and how is it expected to improved results?**
  o Women in the Economy (WIE) developed a concept note for a GDA partnership with SearchPath, one of the top headhunting networks in the world, for the purpose of engaging more than 25,000 Afghan women in career-focused training that will help them find jobs. SearchPath utilizes a unique career management and job search tool called MyHuntPath to teach women a headhunter’s approach to finding their own jobs. The tool will empower women primarily through computer-based personalized training aimed at identification and enhancement of market-oriented skills and interests. SearchPath will partner with 15-20 women entrepreneurs to run talent recruitment franchise organizations across Afghanistan, expanding WIE’s reach and ability to deliver job placement services exponentially.
  o The GDA also aims to create a sustainable model to enable the SearchPath recruitment entrepreneurs to match skilled workers with employers. The WfD team has identified a pool
of potential investment interested in operating SearchPath franchises.

- How will Search Path be used in implementation and how is it expected to improved results?
  - Women are not trained to effectively market their skills to potential employers
  - Qualified women fail to connect with employers who could use their services
  - Limited pathways for women to establish professional small business ventures
  - Limited career counseling resources and NO access to private sector job placement services.
  - Women with limited education and technology access have little to no employment guidance and resources.
  - SearchPath’s vision is to be the world’s premier network of headhunters specializing in talent recruitment and acquisition, professional development services, and distribution channel for human capital outsourcing.
  - MyHuntPath teaches skills that enable Career Empowerment.
  - MyHuntPath will teach women how present and market their job skills.
  - SearchPath will enable 20-40 women to establish ownership and development of small businesses.
  - Low-tech/no-tech version of program will reach women beyond technology infrastructures.
  - Professional job placement services will connect employers with highly qualified candidates.

- **What difficulties have there been in the incorporation of technology?**
  Relatively low levels of digital literacy among WIE beneficiaries and their unfamiliarity with technology. WIE has arranged extensive training through Roshan for beneficiaries to learn how to use M-paisa, for example.

  Another difficulty is the limited access to internet among our beneficiaries, which hampers effective communication and the ability to engage online with them, push online training, etc.
# ANNEX III: List of Critical and Key Documents Reviewed

## Bibliography – Document Review

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Document</th>
<th>Year of Publication</th>
<th>Author(s) &amp; Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Engaging Men In Women’s Empowerment And Rights Achievement: An Explorative Study</td>
<td>April 2014</td>
<td>USAID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Gender Equality and Female Empowerment, USAID Policy</td>
<td>March 2012</td>
<td>USAID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 USAID Evaluation Policy: A Mandatory Reference for ADS Chapter 220</td>
<td>January 2011</td>
<td>USAID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Gender Analysis: Women in Transition (WIT)</td>
<td>December 2012</td>
<td>USAID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Activity Monitoring &amp; Evaluation Plan-Consolidated</td>
<td>November 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 PROMOTE: Women in The Economy (Monthly Report)</td>
<td>February 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 PROMOTE: Women in The Economy (Quarterly Report)</td>
<td>April-June 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 PROMOTE: Women in The Economy (Quarterly Report)</td>
<td>October-December 2015</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 PROMOTE: Women in the Economy Request for Proposals</td>
<td>September 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 WIE PSD Overview</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 WIE MBA Corps – MBA Application Process</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 WIE Entrepreneurs Criteria</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 WIE Annual Program Statement</td>
<td>2016-2017</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 Guideline for Implementation of MF Training Program</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22 PSD Case Officer Scope of Work</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Training Attendance and Self Efficacy Pre and Post-Test</td>
<td>September 2016</td>
<td>ADI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Business Registration Form</td>
<td>September 2016</td>
<td>ADI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 Data Collection Form (Internship/Apprenticeship/ Job Placement)</td>
<td>June 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26 Field Monitoring Report: Kabul Job Readiness Training Report #3</td>
<td>November 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE, RSI Consulting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 Post Internship Questionnaire</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 TWG Technical Advisor Scope of Work</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 Survey - Female Participation in the Retail Sector</td>
<td>September 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE, RSI Consulting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 Survey - Afghanistan’s Information and Communications Technology (ICT):</td>
<td>September 2016</td>
<td>DAI-WIE, RSI Consulting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Job Readiness Training PowerPoint and TOT manual</td>
<td>October 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>LEAD recommendations report to WIE</td>
<td>July 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Rumi Consulting marketing strategy proposal</td>
<td>Draft January 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>DQU report</td>
<td>December 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RUMI CONSULTING DRAFT 6 POINT COMMUNICATION STRATEGY**

PSAs – 5 live action and 2 animated PSAs will be created with the specific purpose of disseminating information about WIE events and/or activities.

TV Series – A 10-episode TV series will be developed around the theme ‘Women in the workplace’. This series will draw from anecdotes shared by WIE beneficiaries as well as Rumi’s own research and intersperse some fact-based information relating to WIE’s work. For example, the lead protagonist could be a beneficiary of a training/apprenticeship program or even MBA corps.

Showcase Video – Rumi will produce two documentaries/short films. The first will be a showcase video on WIE program, featuring some beneficiaries as well as scenes from work-life and live project sites.

Documentary - The second documentary/short film deliverable will be based on the life of the wife of Prophet Mohammed, who was a business-women in her time and seed/mainstream the concept of working women in public consciousness. This can serve as a potent influence to change perceptions about religious barriers to economic participation for both men and women.

TedX Style event – This event will showcase inspiring positive stories of change and will feature beneficiaries/team members from WIE’s programs as well as public figures Afghan women see as role models.

Social Media Content – this will include videos, GIFs, social media banners, infographics, and photo essays on themes/events/activities identified by the WIE Communications team

Communication objectives:

- Raise awareness
- Promote acceptance
- Create an enabling environment
## Snapshot of WIE Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Program MGT</th>
<th>Component 1 - PSD</th>
<th>Component 2 - WFD</th>
<th>Component 3 - TS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>OCTOBER-DECEMBER</strong></td>
<td>Program implementation begins/staff hiring/considerable time spent by management on AJN (7500) initiative/data collection forms/grants manual developed/business networks/ government and donor meetings/offices in 5 regions set up</td>
<td>Business evaluation process/BSP formulated/EOIs and RFPs formulated and issued/access to finance manager hired meeting with MFIs and banks/MBA strategy in development/ Support to entrepreneurship strategy in development/ Founders Institute for entrepreneurs/startup support explored/</td>
<td>career center toolkit formulated/career center EOIs reviewed/Roshan relationship formulated female-friendly workplace and Yaaran initiative/Safe Workplace Campaign formulated/ internship toolkit formulated, to be later developed into internship apprenticeship manual</td>
<td><strong>NOT YET FORMAL COMPONENT</strong> but ICT survey launched</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1st Qtr. 2016</strong></td>
<td><strong>JANUARY</strong> On-going meetings with GIRoA, donors, and USAID components/22 staff hired</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship toolkit reviewed First meeting/meeting with Startup Grind arranged to explore possibility of establishing a business incubation center through this entity</td>
<td>American University meeting/ 16 (9 was placed in January and the other 8 was placed in February) interns place/300 interns registered in the West/25 interns placed 2 placed in jobs in the East/Angiza Employment Center in process (later closed and Kardan subk cancelled)</td>
<td>M&amp;E and biometrics in development/knowledge portal in development/Lapis developing March PSA WIE launch (Lapis subk was never signed, they effectively withdrew from the program because they did not want to disclose their budget/rate information to allow for CO approval of the subcontract)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FEBRUARY</strong></td>
<td>retooling staff for directive from OEG to shorten program and expand internships/apprenticeships/WIE presentation to First Lady/36 WIE jobs posted</td>
<td>EOI issued for BSPs/AIB interested in women in business/SOW for SME Access to Finance Survey was developed</td>
<td>Task order issued for Ghani Afghan Jobs Now +7500, total 9500/ Staffing up for task order/ Code Women Challenge/Forward Together Scholarships launched/WIE participates in 10 day employment services study tour/ICT Survey launched.</td>
<td>First technical working group meeting – Kick Off meeting/ <a href="http://www.promote-wie.com">http://www.promote-wie.com</a> on line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MARCH</strong></td>
<td>Women’s Day launch</td>
<td>Sr. PSD Director recruited/meeting with AMA and AMA expressed interest in conducting Access to Finance Matchmaking roundtables on WIE behalf</td>
<td>Information sessions continue across all regions – this is an ongoing activity. We still do this. Began efforts to ID job placement GDA partner</td>
<td>TWG officially launched-collective impact initiatives/ Code Women winners announced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2nd Qtr. 2016</strong></td>
<td>Kabul regional office established/TWG launched/International Women’s Day Events conducted in Herat and Jalalabad.</td>
<td>Evaluation &amp; Referral BSP activity developed</td>
<td>I^th^ interns placed across 5 regions – Women’s day event/Bio metric registration?</td>
<td>Created Component 3 officially</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### APRIL
EOIs collected from BSPs and vetting conducted. Outreach for Evaluation & Referral activity began. Ramping up IA and job placement activities – interviews with 37 new IA staff, selection under way. TWG one to one meetings with 5 members.

### MAY
Total staff to date 171 PSD Sr. Manager and Manager hired

The training of regional PSD staff began - to train them on the implementation of Evaluation & Referral activity – Sr. PSD Director started travelling to regional offices to give orientation to PSD Case Officers.

SOP Data Collection Interns/Apprentice/job placement issued/24 women placed in jobs/Job Readiness TOT curriculum finalized with ACE/1600 scholarship apps reviewed, lots of issues missing inform etc./intern verifications started. All new IA staff on board

M&E functional, SOP fingerprint registration - Biometric Registration launched/ TWG one to one meetings with 9 members

### JUNE (Ramadan)
SOW for hiring a consulting firm to conduct evaluations of WIE client businesses developed and published/first WIE client business received service from WIE; i.e., first loan referral was made and loan was disbursed to first WIE client/ RFP was published to conduct SME Access to Finance Survey.

new IA staff training, placements in IA program continued. First draft of Job Placement GDA (Search Path) concept note presented to USAID

PSA for beneficiary recruitment completed, airing delayed due to pending USAID approval for website

### 3rd Qtr.2016
1st. business enrolled in Loan Facilitation and Referral activity – first loan referral Mazar

1st job placements – Searchpath GDA partner – Jobs.af signed to share data for job matching

Code Women’s Challenge App developed

### JULY
Contract signed with an evaluation firm to conduct evaluations – first two businesses identified for Evaluation & Referral activity and task order issued/RFP for managing the MBA Corps activity was issued and bids were collected and reviewed/First businesses enrolled in Evaluation & Referrals to BSP activities Service

Problems with some IA placements noted, intensive internship/apprenticeship verifications undertaken (600+). IS program adjustments made as well as improvements to documentation and payment processing. IA staff training refresher

### AUGUST
MOU signed w/MOLSAMDA AJN (7500)
Referral services completed by 2 companies/MBA schools identified guidelines in the works/access to finance survey underway/AMA training program in development

MoU signed with Nove Onlus/ MOU signed with MoLSAMD to support AJN initiative.

Job matching platform featured on BBC podcast/First quarterly meeting of TWG
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SEPTEMBER</th>
<th>2016 Year End</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluations of first two businesses completed and findings were presented to business owners. One of the first recommendations of the evaluations was implemented by first business.</td>
<td>SOP issued for Self-Efficacy Pre/Post-test/Job Readiness Training (JRT) begins across regions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females Participation in The Retail Sector survey/ICT Jobs Bank Survey/Muhafiz Application developed with all functionalities and submitted to USAID for review.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2016 Year End

- **Three Evaluation firms** hired: Afghanistan Center for Excellence (ACE), Aghaez Consulting, Three Dabster Consulting.
- Reached a total of 73 approved Business Service Providers (BSPs).
- 4 business loans approved for total amount of Afs. 200,000.
- 4 Direct Business Referrals made.
- 2 business evaluations completed and are implementing recommendations made to them.
- 7 business evaluations in process as of Dec 2016.
- 2 grants with AMA signed: MFI Training Program (which starts in Dec) and Access to Finance Matchmaking Roundtables activities (starts in Jan 2017)
- Total of 62 trainees already placed within four MFIs in Kabul, Herat and Mazar-i-Sharif.
- Concept notes submitted to establish Business Incubation centers in Kabul
- **Global Development Alliance (GDA) concept note with SearchPath headhunting network finalized**
- WfD provides 21,178 hours of JRT training in 18 provinces reaching total of 1059 beneficiaries.
- Agreement with ACE finalized; ACE completes JRT Training of Trainers (ToTs) sessions with total of 80 participants which will enable program to achieve greater provincial reach through network of Trainers.
- By the end of the year, 237 job seekers who placed into permanent full time jobs.
- By the end of the year, 2143 interns were placed of which 810 completed their 6 month internship, 797 are ongoing. (IA program)
- WfD begins to design a medical tech survey in order to understand gaps and opportunities in this sector
- High Value Scholarship activity launches – Microsoft and Adobe Certification training modules advertised.
- **Women’s Clothing Demand and Supply Survey completed**
- SME Access to Finance Survey completed
- Launch of redesigned WIE KMP
- Launch of formal strategic communications and outreach plan
- Official Launch of Muhafiz Application
- TWG: Advocacy efforts:
  - Women’s Legacy and Inheritance Rights Policy / National Action Plan (NAP)
  - Land Management Law and Land Policy
  - Anti-street harassment awareness raising
  - Media Production technical training concept paper
  - Second quarterly meeting of TWG
  - Orange the world regional event – Advocacy for improved workplace polices
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TASK</th>
<th>FREQUENCY</th>
<th>DATES</th>
<th>RESPONSIBLE</th>
<th>COMMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data collection for 17 performance indicators</td>
<td>Daily</td>
<td></td>
<td>M&amp;E Specialists and Assistants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly performance indicator table (PIT)</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>10th following month end</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarterly PIT</td>
<td>Quarterly</td>
<td>15th following quarter end</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual PIT</td>
<td>Annually</td>
<td>20th following annual end</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regional monitoring visits</td>
<td>Biweekly</td>
<td></td>
<td>M&amp;E Specialists</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager will consolidate reports (5) each biweekly from regions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data cleaning</td>
<td>Biweekly</td>
<td>16th and 30th</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td>Submit to Database Lead at RSI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekly reports</td>
<td>Weekly</td>
<td>Sunday following week</td>
<td>M&amp;E Specialists and Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biweekly reports</td>
<td>Biweekly</td>
<td>16th and 1st</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly reports</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td>5th following monthly period</td>
<td>M&amp;E Advisor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afghan Info submissions</td>
<td>Quarterly</td>
<td>15th following quarter</td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager and M&amp;E Advisor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad-hoc reporting and analysis to USAID</td>
<td>As requested</td>
<td></td>
<td>M&amp;E Advisor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program tracker for interns and apprentices</td>
<td>Biweekly</td>
<td></td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td>Program team notifies M&amp;E about new interns and apprentices to be verified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business tracker</td>
<td>Monthly</td>
<td></td>
<td>M&amp;E Manager</td>
<td>Private Sector team notifies M&amp;E about new businesses to be baselined</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Annex IV: Schedule of Meetings and Sources of Information

## Persons Contacted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kabul Contacts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>WIE Management</td>
<td>Chief of Party</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Sr Work Force Dvt &amp; Mktng Manager</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Technical Advisor</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Deputy Chief of Party-Technical</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Communications and outreach Manager</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Private Sector Development Manager</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Technical Services Manager</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>WIE staff</td>
<td>Regional Team Leader - Central</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>WIE Contractor</td>
<td>Chief Executive Officer</td>
<td>RUMI CONSULTANCY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>WIE Contractor</td>
<td>Chief Operating Officer</td>
<td>RUMI CONSULTANCY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>WIE Contractor</td>
<td>Exective Director</td>
<td>AMA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>WIE Contractor</td>
<td>Research &amp; Communication Manager</td>
<td>AMA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>WIE Contractor</td>
<td>TOT</td>
<td>ACE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Head of Technical Group</td>
<td>Director General of Policy</td>
<td>MoLSAMD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Representative</td>
<td>TECH NATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Khorushan school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Role</td>
<td>Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>HR Officer</td>
<td>FINCA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Head of DBA Department</td>
<td>Mashal University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Business Development</td>
<td>Afghan Holding Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Khorushan School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Afghanistan Nuwen 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Afghanistan Nuwen 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Afghanistan Nuwen 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Afghanistan Nuwen 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Mazar-i-Sharif Contacts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>WIE Staff</th>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>WIE Staff</td>
<td>Sr Regional Manager- North</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>WIE Staff</td>
<td>Workforce Development Case Officer</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>WIE Staff</td>
<td>Provincial Internship</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>WIE Staff</td>
<td>Private Sector Development</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>WIE Staff</td>
<td>Training Coordinator</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Branch Manager</td>
<td>The first Microfinance bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Branch Manager</td>
<td>MUTAHD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Barak Land Clothes Production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Branch Manager</td>
<td>FINCA Afghanistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Women Owned Business</td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Tailor Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Women Owned Business</td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Pickle Production Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Agriculture Services Company (NAASC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>President</td>
<td>Afgan Bano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Host Company</td>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Food Production/Processing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Lawyer</td>
<td>SDBFAO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Finance Manager (job placement interns)</td>
<td>TASSC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Project Manager (job placement interns)</td>
<td>SDBFAO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Kandahar Contacts

1. WIE Staff  
   - Private Sector Development  
   - DAI-WIE
2. WIE Staff  
   - Work Force Development  
   - DAI-WIE
3. WIE Staff  
   - Regional Manager - South  
   - DAI-WIE
4. Host Company  
   - President  
   - Nial Academy
5. Host Company  
   - Representative  
   - English & Computer Academy
6. Host Company  
   - Head of DR  
   - Kandehar Private Hospital Association
7. Host Company  
   - President  
   - Hand-Crafted Products

### Nangarhar Contacts

1. WIE Staff  
   - Private Sector Development Case Officer  
   - DAI-WIE
2. WIE Staff  
   - Regional Manager  
   - DAI-WIE
3. WIE Staff  
   - Trainer  
   - DAI-WIE
4. 10% Owner  
   - Gift to Zest Food Processing
5. 10% Owner  
   - Albadar Diagnostic and Curative Clinic
6. Women Owned Business  
   - Representative  
   - Baidara GYN-OBS Hospital
7. Women Owned Business  
   - Owner  
   - Jam and Pickle Production Company
8. New Improved Employment  
   - MW/job seeker  
   - Rokhan Hospital
9. New Improved Employment  
   - MW/job seeker  
   - Rokhan Hospital
10. New Improved Employment  
    - Job seeker  
    - Ahmad Shah Durani Hospital
11. New Improved Employment  
    - Teacher  
    - Fatimatu Zahra Private School
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Host Company/Company</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Teacher</td>
<td>Fatimatu Zahra Private School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Teacher</td>
<td>Itfaq Private School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Host Company Owner</td>
<td>Nawed Afghan Handicraft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Host Company Owner</td>
<td>Zarghona Curative Clinic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Host Company Owner</td>
<td>Vocational Learning Company</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Herat Contacts**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Host Company/Company</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>WIE Staff Administrator</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>WIE Staff Work Force Development Case Officer</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>WIE Staff Senior Regional Manager-West</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>WIE Staff Training Coordinator</td>
<td>DAI-WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Host Company CEO</td>
<td>Herat Host IT Services Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Host Company Vice Chanceller</td>
<td>Inst. of Higher Educ. Kahkeshane Sharq</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Host Company Admin Officer</td>
<td>Salamat Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Host Company Administrative Advisor</td>
<td>Kimia Specialty Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Interns</td>
<td>Inst. of Higher Educ. Kahkeshane Sharq</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Interns</td>
<td>Inst. of Higher Educ. Kahkeshane Sharq</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Interns</td>
<td>Sehat Hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>New Improved Employment Interns</td>
<td>Aria Apolo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Event Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/12/16</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Travel to Kabul, Afghanistan, Via MECP &amp; Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/12/16</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>Meeting with WIE: PME Team and Techno-Commodity, Site visit to Chuchiki Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15/12/16</td>
<td>Th</td>
<td>Meeting with the Afghanistan Microfinance Association (AMA) &amp; their office in Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18/12/16</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Depart for Herat, Rohina/Friba (Margrafa leaves for family emergency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19/12/16</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Meeting with 2 people who received new program-related employment &amp; 10-15 interns &amp; Apprentices @ Tayada Hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20/12/16</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>Visit 2 new SME businesses @ their offices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21/12/16</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>KABUL: 9:00 AGANET Consulting @ Chuchiki Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22/12/16</td>
<td>Th</td>
<td>KABUL: 9:00 - 11:00 Kabul based beneficiaries of the program to meet @ Chuchiki Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24/12/16</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>KABUL: Meeting notes and data entry from Herat and beneficiary meeting to Erin for phone survey and schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25/12/16</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>KABUL: 9:00 Annual WIE Work Plan Review Conference, Park Star Hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/12/16</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>KABUL: 9:00 Annual WIE Work Plan Review Conference, Park Star Hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27/12/16</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>KABUL: Herat report from Friba and Rohina, Zehra work with Afghan survey team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28/12/16</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>KABUL: Continue with phone survey and data entry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29/12/16</td>
<td>Th</td>
<td>KABUL: Continue with phone survey and data entry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30/12/16</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>KABUL: Continue with phone survey and data entry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31/12/16</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>KABUL: Continue with phone survey and data entry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/1/17</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>Right issues to get started! Meet with regional manager review schedule for the week J Possible meetings to start with Erin!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/1/17</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>MAZAR: (6:30-10:00) 10-15 interns &amp; Apprentices (10:00-12:00) PMI office + lunch (12:00-12:00) PMI office + lunch if possible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/1/17</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>MAZAR: (6:30-9:30) 2 women new program employment (9:45-10:45) Host SME Office + Lunch (9:00-12:00) Host SME Office + Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/1/17</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>MAZAR: (9:00-12:00) Meet with SME + 10% female + lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/1/17</td>
<td>Th</td>
<td>KABUL: 7:00 AM for Kabul</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/1/17</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>DEPART for Jalalabad, UN 12:00, Wasekii/Friba/Rohina (Sanggar Hotel)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/1/17</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>KABUL: (12:00-12:00) WIE self-assessment interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/1/17</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>AL: (9:00-11:00) 10-15 group of interns and Apprentices + lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/1/17</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>KABUL: (11:00-12:00) PINCA &amp; Interns + lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/1/17</td>
<td>Th</td>
<td>KABUL: (9:00-10:00) Afghanistan Holding Group meeting + Chuchiki Office (10:00-12:00) Afghan Commerce for Excellence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/1/17</td>
<td>W</td>
<td>KABUL: (9:00-10:00) Meet with WIE Kabul regional technical manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16/1/17</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>DEPART 11:00 for Kabul (drive 3 hours)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thursday the 12th through 16th, Data entry and prep for USAID exit brief.
## Annex V: Notes from Key Interviews, Focus Group Discussions, and Other Meetings

### COMPONENT 1: Private Sector Development (design – implementation – effectiveness)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation of Businesses</th>
<th>KEY FINDINGS</th>
<th>EVIDENCE FOR FINDINGS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Key characteristics of the business, must demonstrate their viability and owner’s commitment to investing in their business to grow it to the next level. and willingness to hire more women and provide a safe and supportive working environment</td>
<td>• Review of key documents and SOPs a) Business Scoring Matrix b) Business Evaluation Report c) Business Registration Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Three primary issues facing SMEs: a) lack of professional management b) limited access to finance c) support to entrepreneurs</td>
<td>• Scope of Work for Case Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Rigorous evaluation and selection process by using business scoring matrix, regional onsite verifications, and on-going evaluations.</td>
<td>• Qualitative interviews with businesses selected and hosting interns (see survey results)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• PROCESS:</td>
<td>• Field Case Worker monitoring tool defining safe and friendly workplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• WIE PSD Case Officer meets businesses through regular outreach.</td>
<td>• Pearl Horizon business assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Business is put through a Business Evaluation Matrix to make sure it is in the WIE target market.</td>
<td>• M&amp;E - AMEP report update June 2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The PSD Case Officer works with the business to determine most appropriate activities and to determine current revenues. Once the business owner and PSD CO agree on an activity, the business is registered and the application for the activity is completed.</td>
<td>• WIE Monthly, Quarterly, Annual reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Business is approved for and enrolls in an activity.</td>
<td>• M&amp;E business monitoring SOP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• During the course of the activity WIE PSD Case Officer continues to engage with the business client, monitoring service delivery and impact on business.</td>
<td>• Meeting with COP of WIE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• DAI paid to have 4 business evaluated by outside BDS consulting firms in order to identify gaps and needs with the purpose of linking them with a BSP</td>
<td>• DCOP of PSD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- DAI anticipates pre-qualifying multiple BDS firms in October; with a bigger pool of BDS firms to select from for evaluation work, micro-enterprises can also be evaluated, number of evaluations will increase, and it will bring the overall cost of the activity down.
- DAI pays for a consulting firm to evaluate the client business with the intent of making referrals to a vetted list of BSPs. The client business is responsible for engaging the BSP and paying for the service.
- Too early in the program to project long term hiring results for participating businesses but the approach and tools in place to identify, verify, and monitor selected businesses is a solid pragmatic approach in achieving long term employment opportunities for women.
- 279 business met the criteria
- Standard operating procedures (SOPs) are under revision in coordination with PSD for establishing business revenue baselines.
- In August, M&E prepared a presentation for the RIAC and PIAC refresher training to highlight lessons learned in verification. Very strong vetting and monitoring process on the part of WIE regional teams. Identification of need then the monitoring of the BSP is essential in order to avoid the damaging effects a BSP intervention could have on the long term health of the business
- Only additional aspect to the process might be an additional outlook on the sector the business is working in, is it viable and growing or no matter what the BSP it is a possible dead end regarding potential growth and profits, it is a stagnate sector, oversaturated competition?
- WIE Kabul regional manager interview:
- Outreach and finding businesses, Chamber of Commerce done presentations to them to promote WIE project concept, business associations, and exhibitions by sectors.
- Vetting of business to receive interns, he believes should make a couple of visits get to know them and build trust. They follow all the stated vetting procedures but getting to know and build trust with business is important! He found in one instance the company was awarded a big contract and needed quick free labor if he hadn’t not built trust with the owner, he would never have confessed about the contract.
M&E meeting with the business, s/he will inform the program team member who is working with the business about the meeting.

In-person visit should consist of the following (also provided as separate attachment for bringing to site):

Receive name of business from M&E Manager, and M&E Manager only
Inform PSD case officer about your intent to visit, and get the business hours from the case officer.
The visit can be announced or un-announced, and should be during the stated business hours and season of the business.
Upon reaching the business, have a short meeting with business owner or manager available introducing yourself and the purpose of the visit
Bring the business registration form from PSD and “double check” its responses with the owner or senior manager. Any differences should be noted.
At this time a logical review of the data provided on the form can be done, with any questions or discrepancies noted:
For example, if someone says they have 50 female employees but upon visiting the location, there is 1 room and only males available, the M&E specialist should ask where the female employees sit, where the location is, etc. so a visit to that location can be done.
Another example—if this is a manufacturing agribusiness, but there is no evidence of any manufacturing equipment, this should be asked about and responses noted.
Disaggregate employees into full-time and part-time for both male and female, since the registration form only asks for total numbers
It’s also important to have visual verification of female employees, since 10% female employees is a requirement of participation
GPS grid of the business location (this should be taken with any app that logs GPS grid on photo)
Two types of photos required:
employees work area with the employees sitting in it; can be from the back to protect employee identities.
photo of front of business

b) Business Service Providers

- Presently SMEs managed entirely by family, regardless of qualifications or experience. In an economy fueled by pent-up demand and donor spending, many businesses were able to get started and even grow to a reasonable size before running into the limits imposed by lack of more professional management skills and experience
- This is compounded by an unwillingness or lack of

- BSP Registration
- BSP Vetting form (3 recommendations)
- RFP issued for BSP and BDS providers
- Field interviews
- WIE M, Q, and A reports
- SOW PSD Case Officers
understanding of how to engage outside specialists, such as accountants, web designers, marketing specialists, etc

- Major constraint, trouble grasping the concept of selling services without donor handout
- Selection criteria and vetting of the BSP critical, if one business has a bad experience with a BSP word will spread, hard to turn around the concept
- WIE links qualified business service providers with businesses needing services like accounting, marketing, and technical services
- Changing the mindset of the business owner to invest in this service will take time big challenge in the beginning
- The PSD Case Officer works with businesses to identify business service providers (BSPs)
- 96 BSPs in directory? KMP?
- DAI pays for a consulting firm to evaluate the client business with the intent of making referrals to a vetted list of BSPs. The client business is responsible for engaging the BSP and paying for the service *(mentioned in business section)*
- 30 Businesses applied for BSP referrals, 14 approved, 2 implemented the recommendations
- Although it was expected WIE would have to manage the expectations of small businesses accustomed to receiving funding or goods from donor projects, WIE had not anticipated significant challenges in getting Afghan consulting firms to understand the wider market of business service provision and the need for small businesses to outsource some services (accounting, marketing) to other local firms and pay for these services.
- Consulting firms tend to view themselves as being the only business service providers in the market. This made it particularly difficult to solicit good proposals for the PSD component’s evaluation and referral activity.
| c) MBA Corp | ▪ Not yet implemented but overall structure of mentors for the MBA and bridging with business  
▪ One of the issues identified as a barrier to growth for small and medium enterprises (SMEs) is the lack of professional management skills and expertise that are required for a business to grow beyond a certain stage.  
▪ HOW it will work  
▪ MBA Corps will pair recent MBA graduates with private businesses that have identified a specific issue or The MBA graduate will be assigned to the company for a period of six months to one year on a cost- shared basis  
▪ DAI hopes to award a contract to a local firm for matching up MBA graduates with businesses, preparing the MBA graduates for their assignments and then mentoring the MBA graduate in their work with the business.  
▪ Mentoring will be an important aspect of the program to help the business owner understand how to incorporate new ideas into his or her business and to help the recent MBA graduate learn how to be most effective in his or her new role.  
▪ The PSD team has evaluated over 10 business schools with MBA programs in Kabul to prepare for recruitment of MBAs for this activity. The team is finalizing application and enrollment forms for businesses and MBA graduates, as well as the MBA Corps guidelines.  
▪ The MBA graduate will be assigned to the company for a period of six months to one year on a cost shared basis  
▪ MBA’s receive much needed work experience and represent the next generation of business owners  
▪ MBA long term thinking can help the business with strategic planning and assist in investments need for growth including R&D which is often ignored  
▪ Implementation slow will take at least a year after placement in the business to see impact | ▪ WIE M, Q, A reporting  
▪ WIE overall strategy related to professionalizing businesses |
### ii) Entrepreneurship Development

- Signed agreements with two business incubators that provide mentoring, training, and networking with investors.
  - **Aghaez Consulting:**
  - Startup Grind event 2 parts
  - Networking - Once a month event, 200 Afghani per session
  - Kabul 400 attended 80 to 100 were women
  - Brings investor entrepreneurs together for networking
  - Three male entrepreneurs funded over the last year
  - 30 to 40% are women attending as entrepreneurs
  - Trying to get female investors in the future
  - Motivational Speaker - Second session
  - Live streaming on YouTube and Facebook
  - Incubation Center WIE
  - Online registration, 30 to 40 selected
  - They will set the criteria with WIE
  - Generally, how to develop the concept, marketing, financing, networking
  - Trainers from business community, experience in sectors, practical approach.
  - Mentoring them through the process of developing their ideas
  - Challenges: Mind set going to take time, but momentum is moving faster with younger generation. Regarding women, society, financing issue. Younger girls in the business sector slowly moving forward past those challenges, more confident. Gets call from females from banks are trying to open accounts with the banks. Youth get social media, Facebook main tools, product launching, business launching, business debates.
  - Working with WIE: “This is exactly the approach needs this kind of approach needed” in Afghanistan.
  - **CEO Ahmad Fahim of Aghaez** spearheading a group of 6 to 7 business leaders from different sectors meeting regularly to develop a countrywide roadmap for entrepreneurship with the goal of presenting it to the Ministry of Commerce & Industry.

| Interviews with the two business incubators Aghaez Consulting and Afghan Holding Company |
| Aghaez Selection Criteria |
| Skype interview with Thunderbird related to TOOLKIT |
| WIE M, Q, A reports |
▪ **Toolkit**
  Originally developed by Harakat, the Artisan Toolkit is a well-developed guide to starting and running a micro or small artisan based business. WIE’s plan is to revise the toolkit to make it more suitable for other types of businesses. Although the principles taught in the toolkit are generally applicable to all sorts of small businesses, because the examples all feature craft businesses, it is often difficult for people with other types of business to see the relevance to their work. Harakat has given permission to modify the toolkit and WIE is in the process of putting together a team who can do the revisions.
  Once the new version is ready for publication, WIE will distribute it via local NGOs already working with the WIE target market and other organizations working with people interested in starting businesses or who have a micro business they are looking to grow. WIE can flag those who start a business after going through the course and offer them enrollment in other WIE activities that can take their businesses to the next level.
  Would not recommend Thunderbird, too expensive, too much time!!
  Start-ups greatest economic engine in creating employment opportunities, volatility challenges the long term employment aspect Encourage more upstream approach working with the universities and offering creative ideas and global trends in innovation
  Broaden the scope of what is available to female entrepreneurs, franchising, women-to-women services, taxi UBER/Pink Taxi idea. More good packaging ideas including having sales agents (like the pickle lady). Sell and trade within the female social structure. Kid’s party businesses, catering, home based IT work
  Current Incubators seem narrow with a very male point of view
  Strategic partnership with Peace Through Business network.
Mentoring, networking for the purpose of selling, micro lending available. They could be the appropriate incubator for female-owned businesses.

Aghaez and AHG plans to select startups and existing businesses based on the following criteria to align with WIE’s objectives:

- Applicant(s) must be at least 18 years of age by the start of the program.
- Applicant(s) must have good English language skills (speaking, writing and reading).
- It must be the original idea of the applicant(s).
- It must be in start-up phase or have been in operation for less than two years.
- It must be independent and autonomous. It cannot be considered independent or autonomous if they were started under the direction of an existing organization.
- The applicant or applicant’s team must be the primary decision maker for its development and management.
- Applicant(s) must be able to make a full-time commitment to the business development during the first six months of the fellowship.
- Applicant(s) who will be enrolled in a college or university during the time of the fellowship are not eligible.
- Applicant(s) must complete the entire application and submit it along with all required documents before the closing date.
- Partnership (business co-founded and led by two individuals) may apply as long as both founders meet the above eligibility requirements.
- The businesses will primarily be small-sized startups, less than 3 years since starting.
- The businesses will be women-owned, or women will make up 10%+ of their staff.
- The businesses will primarily involve either the technology sector or retail sector.
- The entrepreneurs will have relevant education or sufficient skills/experience.
- If the businesses employ more than 2 individuals, then only the 2 most senior individuals in the company can join the incubator.
- Most importantly, the entrepreneur should have private sector focused ambition, exceptional determination and self-discipline, willing to work long hours and never accept or make excuse.
### iii) Access to Finance

- **WIE Access to Finance Advisor Implemented in Kabul and Mazari Sharif.**
- Established contacts at financial institutions in their regions and developed an understanding of each institution’s products and target market.
- The Case Officers will help their clients compile a package of documents required for a loan request and submit it to the appropriate financial institution.
- One of the difficulties business owners often face is knowing which financial institutions and loan types are best suited to their financing needs and which institutions are most likely to approve their loan application.
- To address this issue the PSD team developed an activity for the PSD Case Officers to make high quality referrals to banks and microfinance institutions.
- The PSD team facilitated three loans: AFA 50,000 working capital loan to Zahra Pickle Production, a woman-owned business in Balkh/ AFA 150,000 to Ms. Farida tailoring business for purchasing sewing machinery/AFA 550,000.00 to Barak Land Clothes Production Company in Mazar-i-Sharif; to purchase machinery. Two more businesses were identified for loan facilitation in Jalalabad and the PSD team is working with the businesses to apply for loans.
- Some question about WIE getting in the way of the male owned business as they have the skills and confidence to and collateral. Perhaps focus for loan referrals, should focus primarily female businesses and female entrepreneurs. Peace Through Business has a $50.0 grant for micro-loans rate is much lower than a bank.
- **AMA - Afghanistan Micro Finance Association**
- Cooperation agreement has been signed to implement TWO strategies:
  - Scholarship/Internships (agreement interns gets stipend through WIE, MFI’s don’t match at this point still being discussed) Process monitored by WIE

| Meeting with Afghanistan Micro-Finance Association |
| Meeting with WIE Access to Finance Advisor |
| Survey of Businesses |
| MFI Interns |
- Women access to finance roundtables and workshops
- MFI's will give short presentation of the kind of loan products they have available. Table of each MFI’s target Contract for 38 workshops max 20 women over two years.
- Identify women entrepreneurs in selected provinces, want to expand their business so they can hire more women. Applications filled out right there
- AMA steps in when the loan in not accepted. Mentor them through the process. Will figure out why she didn’t get the loan. Linking the most important part.
- Tracking all data of loans, will report to WIE
- The objective is to improve the likelihood that these businesses will receive loans through training and matchmaking. Access to Finance Workshop Matchmaking workshop
- The objective of this activity is to help businesses in the WIE target market develop banking relationships that will provide them with access to finance and to help financial institutions learn more about the MSME market.
- One of the difficulties MSMEs face in accessing finance is lack of sufficient information about financial institutions and their loan products to know which institutions are the best match for their borrowing needs, and size and type of business.
- **WIE is currently in discussions with the AMA and is challenging them to be more selective in the businesses they invite to workshops; to only invite those they think have real potential for growth and to think about how they can work with those businesses to make them much stronger candidates for loans.**

**COMPONENT 2: Workforce Development**  
**(design – implementation – effectiveness)**

The WfD Component focuses on providing female job seekers and women already in the workforce with the knowledge, skills, networks, and support facilities to enable them to join the formal workforce or advance into mid to senior level positions. Under this component, DAI focuses on increasing access to employment information, increasing work experience, and improving skills in areas of market demand.
| i) Employment Services | • WIE job matching platform, a database application that is under development and which will facilitate matching of job, internship, and apprenticeship openings with qualified female jobseekers  
| | • American University of Afghanistan (AUAF) to participate in WIE’s internship program and collaborate for job placement.  
| | • Kardan Consulting, a WIE subcontractor, is responsible for establishing a model career and employment service center that will house employment services and a creative lab. This quarter, Kardan focused on finalizing staffing for the Angiza Employment Center which includes Career and Employment Service Specialists. The Employment Center will also support WIE with employer and job-seeker enrollments, career development workshops, and related career advancement services.  
| | • Global Development Alliance (GDA) with SearchPath, one of the top headhunting networks in the world, for the purpose of engaging more than 25,000 Afghan women in career-focused training that will enable them to advance their careers.  
| | • SearchPath will utilize its unique career management and job search tool called MyHuntPath to teach women a headhunter’s approach to proactively find their own jobs.  
| | • The tool will empower women primarily through computer-based personalized training aimed at identification and enhancement of market-oriented skills and interests. INCLUDED IN ENTREPRENEURS SECTION: SearchPath will seek to partner with 15-20 women entrepreneurs to lead talent recruitment franchise across Afghanistan. The GDA also aims to create a sustainable model to enable the SearchPath recruitment entrepreneurs to match skilled workers with employers. The WfD team has identified a pool of potential investors interested in operating SearchPath. | • Monthly/quartely/annual reports  
| | | • Guidelines for Implementing an MFI training  
| | | • SOP Self Efficacy Pre and Post training  
| | | • M&E Data Collection form (interns/apprentice/job placement  
| | | • Kabul Job Readiness Training Report (Nov.2016)  
| | | • Parwan Job Readiness Training Report (Nov 2016)  
| | | • Post intern assessment 8-12 weeks after  
| | | • Females Participation in The Retail Sector (survey)  
| | | • ICT Jobs Skills Bank Survey  
| | | • DQAs  
| | | • RSI Consulting M&E procedures including training steps  
| | | • INTERVIEWS/SURVEYS  
| | | • Interview with Afghan Center for Excellence  
| | | • TWG Chairmen/Advisor  
| | | • Women placed in jobs  
| | | • Phone surveys (interns and apprentices)  
| | | • Roundtables in each of the five regions(interns/apprentice)  
| | | • Host businesses  
| | | • Host MFIs  
| | | • MFI interns  
| | | • Regional case workers  
| | | • Regional Job Readiness Trainers  
| | | • WIE COP  
| | | • WIE DCOP for PSD  
| | | • WIE DCOP for WFD?  
| | | • M&E Reports |
franchises. *The GDA will be finalized in the next quarter.*

- Jobs.af Afghanistan’s biggest job website
- DAI signed a partnership agreement with Jobs.af, a service jointly managed by NETLINKS Ltd. and Cresco Solutions.
- Scope assist educated women in finding job opportunities and successfully compete for jobs.
- Partnership benefits Jobs.af in terms of increasing traffic to its portal, expands the number of vacancy announcements posted by private sector companies, and will increase their revenues.
- In exchange, DAI will have access to job postings on the Jobs.af portal, and a marketing and outreach channel dedicated to female job seekers on the largest job-posting website in Afghanistan.
- The Jobs.af software developers are working with the Knowledge Management (KM) team to identify requirements and it is anticipated that DAI will start to receive the data for job vacancies by early next quarter.
- Kabul University has embedded career and employment centers

### ii) Internships & Apprentices

- Sustainability comes from gaining experience, number one issue for young women entering the workforce, and a global issue for the majority of students it provides a competitive advantage. Temporary internship could result in full time employment offers.
- Drastically expand WIE’s internship and apprenticeship activity to support President Ghani’s job stimulus program.
- USAID’s *Afghan Jobs Now* initiative proposed creating paid apprenticeships for women to Enhance their job skills. Boost the Afghanistan economy by providing Afghan firms with the advantage of temporary subsidized labor. Initiative would also engender a sense of social responsibility across the public and private sectors around the issues of youth and women’s unemployment.
- February 2016, DAI received a task order modification that

- Face-to-face interviews
- Job Readiness Training PPTs
increased DAI’s original target of 2000 internships to 9500 internships and apprenticeships.

- Over the second and third quarters of the reporting period, almost all WIE staff were engaged in re-tooling the program, shortened to four years so that
- DAI hired and trained 37 additional staff, 30 of which were Provincial Internship and Apprenticeship Coordinators.
- The WfD team focused on expanding the pool of qualified candidates for internships and job placements across the regions through an ever intensifying outreach program and information sessions.
- WfD cultivated relationships with employers to serve as host companies for the program’s interns and apprentices.
- In July 2016, USAID and MoLSAMD signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) to support the job stimulus initiative through Women in the Economy. The partnership commits MoLSAMD to assist in conducting outreach at the provincial level to support WIE’s internship and apprenticeship activity
- USAID will fund training, stipends, and program support staffing.
- Banking and MFIs initiative: Increasing the number of women in more senior positions in banking, including commercial lending, is seen as a way to improve access to finance for women-owned businesses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>iii) Job Readiness Training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Training and experience (internships) are the core skills needed to build confidence and provide a competitive advantage in the job market resulting in a sustainable job opportunity. Helps first-time job seekers or those without adequate work experience prepare for an internship or apprenticeship placement, or for getting a job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Job training institutions: Nove Onlus, Afghan Center for Excellence,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The 20-hour course - Effective communication - Job search techniques - Interview skills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Work ethics to help ensure beneficiaries obtain, keep, and excel at their new jobs. Topics important to women working in male dominated workplaces.
- Course content was designed specifically for women entering the mainstream workforce, including how to deal with issues that arise when companies are not set up with facilities for women, workplace harassment, and practical issues like getting to and from work.
- Training Attendance and Self Efficacy Pre and Post-Test SOP Sept 2016
- Training Attendance Register, Self-efficacy Pre and post-test are designed to collect data on trainings conducted by the Women in the Economy program.
- Interview with ACE revealed issues with the trainers, process of selecting trainers and training them needs to be reevaluated. Too theoretical and passive training, needs more interactive skill building for the trainer, introduce more exercise. Some who test well in the vetting may not be the best trainers.
- Roshan relaunched its youth-focused Yaraan initiative. Looking forward, WIE seeks to partner with Yaraan on a number of social and educational programs, such as co-hosting and developing workforce training sessions for young women on skills such as stress management, job hunting, and interviewing.
- TOOLKIT? The WiD team has compiled resources to adapt for a Career & Employment Services Center Toolkit for the Afghan context that includes: career & employment center best practices, model programs, lessons learned, and promising practices for revenue generation.
- M&E (RSI) findings and recommendations
- Equipment a big issue, projectors, lighting, computers
- USAID branding consistent with WIE marketing plan
- On time sessions work ethic principles
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|   | Age mix in each class  
Pre-post testing on tablets not paper  
Training needs to be given with a computer and PPT  
Some issues with spelling and grammar on the PPT based on region and language  
Monitoring of training by regional WIE staff and management  
Pacing of training, allowing for feedback and questions, needs interactive  
Activities  
Female trainers essential, particularly in the South |
|   | Key Point from Interview with ACE (training provider)  
Train the trainers TOT) only in each region. They developed the curriculum development and delivery techniques, 20 hours total over 5 days in 4 hour sessions. They administer the Pre & Post testing in order to select candidates to move on as trainers So far they have trained about 75- 80 with a net of about 60 qualified trainers. Selection of potential trainers is through WIE initial 1400 CVs applied 75 to 80.  
They suggest that additional follow up of trainers be done in order to evaluate their delivery and effectiveness, then coach where needed. Took a long time to finalize the training manual, now a good roadmap. Content signed in June didn’t finish until August finished, training of trainers started signed October finished training the trainers by end December. Average class sizes facility check list, class size ideal for 15 to 20. Obligated to train about 75, but were not held to final selection based on quality of Post-test.  
Initial selection of candidates as potential trainers needs balance between written exam with interpersonal skills.  
Final selection of trainers should be weighted towards interpersonal skills and the ability to deliver the training in an engaging way.  
Review material manual for consistency across all regions.  
  |
| **Some issues with cover letters needing to be more personal and relevant to company applying for job** |
| **Some issues of trainers not able to use Powepoint or a computer?** |
| **Soft skills are missing from the training** |
| **ACE needs to follow up with those they train, observe training a couple of times and coach to improve** |
| **Kabul WIE Regional Manager interview:** |
| **Agrees with the above regarding weight towards the ability to deliver training, not just how they scored on the exam** |
| **What happens once WIE is gone. Recommend build capacity through life of project, then develop exit plan that could turn into a business for the trainers.** |
| **JG- need to get list of technical trainings, far more effective, needs more emphasis and investment** |
| **Teaching an acceptable job choice, some who are training may not like training but it is acceptable to the family and it is all females.** |
| **Barriers for women pretty consistent** |
| **Security in general** |
| **Consistent transportation to and from work** |
| **Family support** |
| **Cultural acceptance (urban areas starting to change and accept, other regions, particularly in the South change will come slowly.** |
| **Transportion is a huge problem, WIE tries to address this by trying to think of everything from communication, transportation, work station in a safe place. 6000 afs to intern business matches average is 3000-20,000 some provide food, transportation, top off cards, they own cars or buses they contract out to a company they know.** |
iv) Scholarship Program

- Forward Together Scholarships are designed to help Afghan women and girls who have a basic education to gain job specific technical skills needed by employers, with the goal of getting a job.
- The AMA submitted a grant concept note to WIE to facilitate and manage the process of screening and placing interns in MFIs – they will be eligible for internship/apprenticeship stipend or scholarships.
- DAI has since modified the scholarship program to liaise directly with training institutions and offer specific technical training scholarships as per the current demand for specific technical skills in the market - healthcare, finance, and software development.
- The scholarship application guidelines clearly state that to qualify for a Forward Together scholarship, the program of training must be short term, technical, and job specific in nature and the applicant has to demonstrate a clear and distinct linkage between completing the training and improving their chances of securing a new or better job.
- DAI initially planned to implement scholarship programs as grants through educational institutions, but a number of drawbacks led DAI to reconsider this approach.

**COMPONENT 3: Technical Services (design – implementation – effectiveness)**

**Communications and Outreach**

- Slow getting the word out, but smart and justified until the foundations was laid, partners were in place, and initial problems identified and corrected.
- Outreach, educated females approach private universities association about 50 to 70 (10 contacted so far) private schools. Demand in Kabul, harder to get into the universities, public system doesn’t have capacity. They are for profit universities. Intern, job placement, and apprentices, huge amount of applications.
- RUMI Consulting communication strategy:
  - PSAs – 5 live action and 2 animated PSAs will be created

**WIE Staff and STTA consultant**
- Rumi Consulting interview
- Rumi Consulting draft marketing plan
- Survey - Females Participating in the Retail Sector
- Survey- ICT Jobs Skills Bank
- Meeting with TWG Chairman
- Meeting with TWG Senior Advisor
- Activity Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (AMEP)
with the specific purpose of disseminating information about WIE events and/or activities.

- **TV Series** – A 10-episode TV series will be developed around the theme ‘Women in the workplace’. This series will draw from anecdotes shared by WIE beneficiaries as well as Rumi’s own research and intersperse some fact-based information relating to WIE’s work. For example, the lead protagonist could be a beneficiary of a training/apprenticeship program or even MBA corps.

- **Showcase Video** – Rumi will produce two documentaries/short films. The first will be a showcase video on WIE program, featuring some beneficiaries as well as scenes from work-life and live project sites.

- **Documentary** - The second documentary/short film deliverable will be based on the life of Bibi Hadija, the wife of Prophet Mohammed, who was a business-women in her time and seed/mainstream the concept of working women in public consciousness. This can serve as a potent influence to change perceptions about religious barriers to economic participation for both men and women.

- **TedX Style event** – This event will showcase inspiring positive stories of change and will feature beneficiaries/team members from WIE’s programs as well as public figures Afghan women see as role models.

- **Social Media Content** – this will include videos, GIFs, social media banners, infographics, and photo essays on themes/events/activities identified by the WIE Communications team

**Communication objectives:**
- Raise awareness of DAI/WIE objectives, activities, progress and impact among target beneficiaries, stakeholders, and the wider Afghan community
- Increase participation in DAI/WIE activities
- Promote acceptance of and support for DAI/WIE activities within and beyond the communities in which the project
works to improve attitudes about women’s participation in the economy

- Create an enabling environment for female participation at all levels of the Afghan economy
- Facebook can be a great way of disseminating information to tap educated young Afghan women.
- Most of these participants also reported a preference for Radio listening in the same time slot. DAI can, therefore, position the television series and PSAs in the evening timeslot to ensure maximum and effective audience reach.
- ‘Forward Together’ Facebook page on its own social media properties. In addition to its own platforms, Rumi recommends WIE work with other institutional partners with a significant social media presence whose network and reach, to ‘piggy-back’ on to ensure wider dissemination and connect. Suggested partners include but are not limited to UN Women, Roshan, 8AM, and Acbar (over 53,000 page likes). WIE could also cross-post on other pages/groups with activities allied to its own program activities - for example, Scholarships in Afghanistan, Jobs in Afghanistan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge Management</th>
<th>Helps WIE manage beneficiaries, currently functional for workforce development (jobseekers, trainees, interns and apprentices) gets a feed from Jobs.af, built by subk RSI for online portal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technical Working Group</th>
<th>Has own activities led by stakeholders and supported by WIE eg. womens inheritance rights policy. Volunteers (private sector, universities, students) Ambassadors for the project Their subgroup stakeholders can apply for a grant for a unique concept Share their networks and pipelines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Market Analysis

- Excellent surveys on retail sector and ICT
- Retail survey highlights: Social awareness through public campaigns could combat general negative attitudes, critical to increasing participation over the long-term.
- Providing training to make women more competitive as salespeople was cited as a way to increase female participation by nearly a third (29%) of business owners.
- Providing training in business development and providing financial assistance to female retailers to enable them to be able to purchase needed supplies and equipment for their small businesses.
- Job placement or internship program should screen potential candidates to ascertain whether they have strong familial support for their desire to work outside the home
- Incubator idea via WIE - With the advent of sites like www.Afghanbazar.com, WIE could provide tech-savvy young women to help new businesses enter the world of online marketing and sales. Piloting such efforts with a few businesses to start ups
## Annex VI: Disclosure of Any Conflicts of Interest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Corinne Jane Griffiths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title:</td>
<td>Business Development Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization:</td>
<td>Checchi Consulting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Position?</th>
<th>Team Lead</th>
<th>Team member</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evaluation Award Number (contract or other instrument)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>USAID Project(s) Evaluated (Include project name(s), implementer name(s) and award number(s), if applicable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I have real or potential conflicts of interest to disclose.</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### If yes answered above, I disclose the following facts:

**Real or potential conflicts of interest may include, but are not limited to:**

1. Close family member who is an employee of the USAID operating unit managing the project(s) being evaluated or the implementing organization(s) whose project(s) are being evaluated.
2. Financial interest that is direct, or is significant though indirect, in the implementing organization(s) whose projects are being evaluated or in the outcome of the evaluation.
3. Current or previous direct or significant though indirect experience with the project(s) being evaluated, including involvement in the project design or previous iterations of the project.
4. Current or previous work experience or seeking employment with the USAID operating unit managing the evaluation or the implementing organization(s) whose project(s) are being evaluated.
5. Current or previous work experience with an organization that may be seen as an industry competitor with the implementing organization(s) whose project(s) are being evaluated.
6. Preconceived ideas toward individuals, groups, organizations, or objectives of the particular projects and organizations being evaluated that could bias the evaluation.

---

I certify (1) that I have completed this disclosure form fully and to the best of my ability and (2) that I will update this disclosure form promptly if relevant circumstances change. If I gain access to proprietary information of other companies, then I agree to protect their information from unauthorized use or disclosure for as long as it remains proprietary and refrain from using the information for any purpose other than that for which it was furnished.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature</th>
<th>[Signature]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>February 3, 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
U.S. Agency for International Development
1300 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20523