



**WORLD LEARNING**

Founded in 1932 as  
The Experiment in  
International Living

PN-ACH-219

Assessment of Civil Society Organizations For a Program of Advocacy Capacity Building  
Task Order #809

**Assessment of Bolivian  
Civil Society, and  
Strategy Recommendations**  
by  
**Richard Oulahan and  
Adam Behrendt**  
Consultants

Democracy and Governance IQC - Civil Society  
United States Agency for International Development  
Center for Democracy and Governance  
Original Contract No AEP-5468-I-00-6013-00  
New Management System No AEP I-00-96-90013-00

Submitted to  
The Democracy Strategic Objective Team  
USAID/Bolivia

Final Version

As Revised on December 28, 1999

World Learning, Inc  
Suite 750  
1015 15th St N W  
Washington, D C 20005  
Tel (202) 408-5420, Fax (202) 408-5397  
Contact person William A Douglas  
bill douglas@worldlearning.org

This report was prepared in connection with a Task Order under World Learning's Democracy and Governance Indefinite Quantity Contract No AEP-5468-I-00-613-00 Strengthening Civil Society Under this contract World Learning provides rapid-response technical assistance to support the civil society programs of USAID Missions and Regional Bureaus

Work contracted under this IQC may include the design, implementation, and evaluation of short-, medium-, and long-term activities in the areas of

- strengthening the capacity of civil-society organizations to manage projects and engage in public-policy advocacy,
- enhancing networking and exchange of information among national, U S , and international civil-society organizations, and
- improving the capacity of independent print and broadcast media to provide the information and policy discussion needed by civil society groups

The goal of Task Order #809, "Assessment of Civil Society Organizations For a Program of Advocacy Capacity Building" was to assess and identify a core group of Bolivian NGOs with the potential to conduct public-policy advocacy, and to advise the USAID/Bolivia Democracy Strategic Objective Team as to whether a new Intermediate Result should be added to the Mission's Democracy SO

In October and November, 1999, World Learning's consultants Richard Oulahan and Adam Behrendt, after reviewing the pertinent literature, conducted an extensive series of interviews with Bolivian NGOs, members of the USAID Mission staff, Bolivian academics, and other persons knowledgeable about the state of civil society in Bolivia The project team also received input from Washington, D C -based specialists on the media and on NGO enabling legislation, to guide their research

This report presents the project team's findings as to the present capabilities and the future potential of Bolivian NGOs in the area of public-policy advocacy, and the team's recommendations to USAID as to how further support for the NGOs can be programmed under the Mission's three present Democracy IRs, and concludes with a recommendation that a new IR focusing specifically on civil society be added by the Mission to its Democracy SO

The final stage of this project will be the preparation of a special report, to be written by Dr Marc Chernick, supported by the project's field researchers, on how the recommendations in this present report can be best applied by the USAID/Bolivia Mission in its future programming in support of Bolivian civil society

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Background</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>2 Purpose and Objectives</b>	<b>7</b>
<i>2.1 Additional Questions For Exploration</i>	<i>8</i>
<b>3 Theory of Civil Society and Democratic Development</b>	<b>8</b>
<i>3.1 Definition of Terms Democratic Development and Civil Society</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>3.2 Relationship Between Civil Society and Democratic Development</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>3.3 Constructing Civil Society...</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>3.4 The Challenge and Importance of Civil Society in Bolivia</i>	
<i>The Civil Society Problem...</i>	<i>10</i>
<b>4 Research Methodology</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>5 Findings</b>	<b>12</b>
<i>5.1 Primary NGOs in Democratic Development – Descriptions, Tables and Matrix</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>Overview of Primary NGOs involved in Democratic Development</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>Democratic Development Capacity of Selected NGOs</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>5.2 A Summary of Relative Strengths and Weaknesses of Bolivian NGOs</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Strengths</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Weaknesses</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Note on Human Resources</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>5.3 Illustrative Case Studies of Selected NGOs</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>Santa Cruz Area</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>CEJIS – The Centro de Estudios Juridicos y Investigacion Social</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>CEDETI – The Centro de Tecnologia Intermedia</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>CIDOB – The Confederacion de Pueblos Indigenas del Oriente Boliviano</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>La Paz Area</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>Fundacion Qullana</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>ERBOL – The Estaciones Radiofonicas de Bolivia</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>LIDEMA – The Liga de Defensa del Medio Ambiente</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>UNITAS – La Union Nacional de Instituciones para el Trabajo de Accion Social</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>Colegios de Abogados</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>5.4 Legal Environment</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>5.5 Potential Intermediaries for NGO Strengthening – Recommendation</i>	<i>19</i>
<b>6 Overall Strategic Considerations For AID/Bolivia</b>	<b>19</b>
<i>6.1 Sustainability, and Leveraging Funding</i>	<i>19</i>

*d*

6 2	<i>Promoting Access to Internationally Financed Development Funds</i>	19
6 3	<i>Working With Fast Growing Urban Areas</i>	20
	<i>Case Study El Alto</i>	20
6.4	<i>Emphasizing the Capacity of Civil Society to Enforce</i>	
	<i>Public/Private Accountability</i>	21
6 5	<i>Linking Institutional Development with Civil Society Capacity Building</i>	22
6 6	<i>Poverty and Economic Development</i>	22
7	<i>Strategies for Incorporating Civil Society Strengthening into Existing I R s</i>	22
7 1	<i>IR 1 – Civil Society and the Administration of Justice</i>	22
7 1 1	<i>The role of Colegios de Abogados and their related organizations</i>	22
7 2	<i>IR 2 – The Relationship of Civil Society to Uninominales, Congress,</i>	
	<i>and Political Parties</i>	27
7 2 1	<i>Unimoninales</i>	28
7 2 2	<i>Political Parties</i>	28
	<i>Recommendations...</i>	29
	<i>CIDEM ..</i>	29
	<i>A Program for Political Parties ..</i>	29
7 3	<i>IR 3 – Civil Society and Municipal Governments – COPES, Citizenship</i>	
	<i>Education and Comites de Vigilancia</i>	30
7 3 1	<i>Include Fast-Growing Urban Areas in DDCP</i>	30
7 3 2	<i>Mancomunidades</i>	31
7 3 3	<i>COPES and Citizenship Education</i>	31
7 4	<i>Cross-Cutting Strategies for other S O s – Health and Environment</i>	31
7 5	<i>Strategies for Addressing Other Sectors – The Media</i>	32
7 5 1	<i>“Playing the Media”</i>	32
7 5 2	<i>More Efficient Use of Radio</i>	33
7 5 3	<i>The Role of USIS in DDCP/USAID programs</i>	34
8	<i>Recommendations to USAID DEMOSOT Civil Society Strengthening Strategies</i>	
	<i>and an IR- 4</i>	34
8.1	<i>Theoretical Framework and Strategies for Strengthening Civil Society</i>	36
	<i>A Regional Capacity Building Network</i>	36
	<i>A Coalition of Democracy Promoting, Advocacy Orientated NGOs</i>	37
	<i>Leadership of a Concerted Effort at Donor Coordination for Civil Society</i>	
	<i>Strengthening</i>	37
	<i>Working To Support And Strengthen Government Initiatives For Civil Society</i>	
	<i>Strengthening</i>	37
8 2	<i>Essential Principles for Successful Capacity Building</i>	37

<b>8 3 Primary Partners and In-Country Intermediaries with</b>	
<i>Capacity Building Potential</i>	39
<i>The special role of institutions of higher education</i>	39
<b>8 4 Primary Clients for Capacity Building</b>	41
<i>Non-Governmental Organizations</i>	41
<i>Indigenous Organizations</i>	42
<i>The Media</i>	42
<i>Women and Women's Organizations</i>	43
<i>The Private Sector and its Associations</i>	43
<i>Organizaciones Territoriales de Base (OTBs) and other Community-Based Organizations</i>	43
<i>Comites de Vigilancia</i>	44
<b>8 5 Methodologies and Mechanisms</b>	45
<i>A two-year NGO-strengthening program</i>	45
<i>Specialized Training</i>	45
<i>Consultation and Technical Assistance</i>	45
<i>Conferences and Seminars</i>	45
<i>Publications</i>	45
<i>Research</i>	45
<b>8.6 Priority Content Areas</b>	45
<b>8.7 Developing a Democratic Political Culture and Conducting</b>	
<i>Citizenship Education</i>	46
<i>Recommendation #1 A Regional Capacity Building Network</i>	46
<i>Recommendation #2 Promote the Creation of A Coalition of Democracy Promoting, Advocacy Orientated NGOs</i>	47
<i>Recommendation #3 Leadership of a Concerted Effort at Donor Coordination for Civil Society Strengthening</i>	47
<i>Recommendation #4 Support And Strengthen Government Initiatives For Civil Society Strengthening</i>	47
<i>Recommendation #5 Promote the Involvement of Civil Society Organizations in the Implementation of Criminal Code Procedures</i>	47
<i>Recommendation #6 Promote political training of women and younger members of political parties, with special attention to poorer areas of the country</i>	48
<i>Recommendation #7 Expand DDCP and Civil Society Support Programs to Include Fast-Growing Urban Areas Such as El Alto and Outer Rings of Santa Cruz</i>	48
<i>Recommendation #8 Promote the development of CSOs' capacity to utilize the media, especially radio</i>	48
<i>Recommendation #9 Promote the capacity of civil society organizations to advocate making open, transparent and competitive the decision-making processes of those development funds which use international financing</i>	48

## 9. Conclusions

ANNEX A: <i>Glossary</i> . . . . .	50
ANNEX B <i>Bibliography</i> . . . . .	53
<i>Primary Documents</i>	53
<i>Secondary Documents</i> . . . . .	56
ANNEX C <i>Interviews and Contacts</i> .. .. .	57
ANNEX D <i>Tables 5 1, 5 2, 5 3, and 5 4</i> . . . . .	65

**WORLD LEARNING**  
**Assessment of Bolivian Civil Society and Strategy Recommendations**

**- Executive Summary -**

**1 Purpose**

The World Learning Assessment Team was requested by USAID/Bolivia to assess (1) whether and how to expand civil society and NGO strengthening activities within its present results packages, and (2) whether DEMOSOT's current three Intermediate Results (rule of law, uninominal representation, and municipal government development) are sufficient to achieve its Strategic Objective, or if a new results package is required to strengthen civil society to engage more effectively in the process of democratic development and to take advantage of the new legal and institutional opportunities

The task included an evaluation of the current capacity, strengths and weaknesses of various NGOs in Bolivia to carry out the work of democratic development, to identify and prioritize needs for civil society strengthening based on an overview of various experiences and actors, and to identify some potential strategies and mechanisms for achieving these goals

**2 Main Findings**

The current political and institutional environment of Bolivia demands a greater role for civil society organizations, both in political as well as developmental processes. The recent reforms have opened up new spaces and created new CSOs and new CSO roles. Given this positive and enabling institutional framework, one of the major challenges is to increase the capacity of CSOs to take advantage of these new spaces and roles and enter into constructive relationships with government at the local, departmental and national levels. The central issue is that civil society organizations should not only put demands on the state – although this must be *part* of the work of any active civil society – but that civil organizations and citizens must constructively engage with the state to achieve political, public administrative and developmental ends, in a democratic and participatory process

**3 Recommendations**

After reviewing the findings, the Assessment Team recommends that USAID Bolivia add an additional Intermediate Results Package (IR) in order to achieve more effectively DEMOSOT's Strategic Objective, "increased citizen support for the Bolivian democratic system" and improvements in the accompanying sets of indicators. This is in addition to measures recommended in the report which heighten CSO participation in IRs 1,2 and 3. The current conditions in Bolivia demand a much higher involvement of civil society with the state at all levels. Therefore, the additional IR would be dedicated to the strengthening of civil society organizations to improve their ability to constructively engage the state and the private sector, as well as to enhance their ability to act as intermediaries between society, political parties and the state

The Results Package might be formulated as follows

- CSOs Effectively Mediate Between Citizens and the State
- CSOs Effectively Lobby Local, Regional and National Public Institutions, Political Parties, and International Financial Institutions
- CSOs Effectively Promote Collaboration Between Municipal Governments, Citizens Organizations and the Private Sector to Achieve Developmental Goals

There are three primary reasons for this recommendation. First, democratic development of the state will not occur in the absence of deep and sustained interaction with civil society (See Fisher 1998, Putnam 1993). While there does exist a vibrant associational life in Bolivia (See Seligson 1998), recent restructuring of the state and the economy have created a vacuum between the state and civil society. Traditional actors, such as the unions, no longer play the key role of intermediaries. Political parties, while improving their degrees of representation, do not serve to mediate and aggregate the interests of the majority of society. A major effort must be made to re-articulate civil society with the new state and political structures. In order for this to happen, civil society organizations must have both sufficient capacity and a certain degree of autonomy.

Second, given the new opportunities for participation and involvement by civil society created by the reduction of the state, decentralization, and other policy reforms, the limiting factor maintaining the exclusion of a large part of Bolivian society is the citizens' own lack of capacity to take advantage more effectively of these opportunities<sup>1</sup>. In order to prevent the increasing disenchantment of civil society with the political system, on the one hand, and misuse of power by the state and private sectors, on the other, it is essential that civil society organizations and citizens have the capacity to constructively engage the state, to assume the new roles and responsibilities granted them under the law, and to represent their interests effectively.

Third, as identified in the previous assessment by Development Associates, one of the main challenges facing Bolivia is that "neither public officials nor private interests consistently observe the rules which have been formally adopted" (DA 1997), and it is important to build

"the necessary institutional capacity to meet the requirements of the modern state. But, such a challenge, while important, is *secondary to assuring the incorporation of new actors, the development of civic values, and the firm establishment of the rule of law*" (Development Associates 1997: 44)

Citizens will continue to lose faith in the democratic system unless they perceive that public officials and the private sector play by the rules. Civil society organizations can play an important role in helping to see that rules are enforced, thereby leveling the playing field between excluded and included groups. USAID can complement its current efforts at rule

---

<sup>1</sup> This was a consistent and verifiable argument presented by almost all parties interviewed, and could be seen as the major theme underlying this assessment.

enforcement in the administration of justice through a concerted strengthening of civil society groups to generate and disseminate information, pressure public and private officials, raise citizen awareness, and organize coalitions

While many other donors, including USAID, are actively strengthening the institutional (state) side of the equation, much less is being done to strengthen civil society organizations, making this an important and timely strategic consideration (Behrendt and Blair 1999) Under IR 3's DDCP program, investments were made in the form of grants to NGOs and CSOs (the FAP program), but this was not an explicit attempt to build capacity, which is what is most needed, but more of an execution and implementation program

### Political Parties

Some parties are moving toward reforming their autocratic structures There are elements in all parties that are thinking seriously about genuine programs, as MNR has done under Ex-President Gonzalo de Lozado **Thus, if at present there is no democratic substitute for political parties, and these parties are showing some signs of wanting to change, then an effort to assist and to speed up party reforms using outside experts and parties with similar experience should be seriously considered** Civil society organizations can assist in these efforts at party and congressional reform

### Specific Strategy Recommendations For USAID DEMOSOT

#### Recommendation #1

- **A Regional Capacity Building Network** If financially possible, USAID should facilitate the creation of a decentralized network of regional capacity building institutions around Bolivia, and provide on-going support These institutions would have the responsibility to work together to provide capacity building, training, research, publications, technical assistance and consultancy, information management, and resource mobilization to NGOs, CSOs, GROs, OTBs, CVs and even municipal governments and private sector associations in their regions These centers of learning could also help to disseminate and replicate the efforts of other AID programs, such as the DDCP project, and should be aware of and closely linked to efforts at strengthening municipal governments They should include public and private universities, NGOs, and private sector organizations

It is important to have a regional focus, given the levels of diversity existent in Bolivia and the need to respond to different conditions in different ways in each area This network of capacity building providers could receive funds from USAID, other international donors, and the government In this way, USAID could use its funds to leverage additional funding from other sources, and create sustainable long-term capacity

#### Recommendation #2

- **Promote the Creation of A Coalition of Democracy Promoting, Advocacy Orientated NGOs** USAID should facilitate the creation of an NGO network dedicated

to democratic development and citizen participation. Akin to other such existing networks as PROCOSI, which focuses on health, or LIDEMA, which focuses on the environment, an NGO network focusing on democratic development would allow for the exchange of information and best practices, through the holding of conferences and seminars. However, the network's *primary mandate would be to serve as a coalition for advocacy efforts with the state and with political parties*. While both AIPE and UNITAS claim to be focused on promoting a democratic society, UNITAS in particular has a mission more directly related to this. Both are in need of strengthening and re-orienting to be able to take on the tasks mentioned above. Small grants could be made available to fund specific campaigns and activities of the coalition as may be appropriate.

#### Recommendation #3

- **Leadership of a Concerted Effort at Donor Coordination for Civil Society Strengthening** USAID should attempt to bring the civil society question to a prominent position with other donors, through the consultative process already in place and through hosting seminars and dialogues with donors, government and civil society organizations on this issue. In this way, support for the regional network and other initiatives might be obtained.

#### Recommendation #4

- **Support And Strengthen Government Initiatives For Civil Society Strengthening** Limited support should be given to the sharing of information with, and provision of training to, the government agencies responsible for civil society strengthening, especially the Vice Ministry for Popular Participation's Community Strengthening program (VMPP), which focuses on OTB's and CV's. This should be done in the context of leveraging support from the World Bank's \$69M PDCR2 program, currently beginning, which aims to channel funds directly to OTBs. This program also has funds for the support of regional training centers (see above).

#### Recommendation #5

- **Promote the Involvement of Civil Society Organization in the Implementation of the Code of Criminal Procedures** As soon as possible, USAID should commence its planned work with the *Colegios de Abogados* and related civil society organizations to build their capacity in the following areas:
  - a The substance of the criminal procedure law. This program would include training, publications and information campaigns with emphasis on practical training in the conduct of oral procedures, discovery and other key elements.
  - b Treating collateral issues implied by the reform with emphasis on ethics. When lawyers have more responsibility for the conduct of investigations and trials, they must govern themselves appropriately.

- c Strengthening the capability of *Colegios* to participate in legal reform and to mobilize their members around training, education, and other issues of importance for their professional well being

#### Recommendation #6

- **Promote political training of women and younger members of political parties, with special attention to poorer areas of the country** This strategy would assist political parties to become more responsive to issues, more internally democratic, and more open to the participation of new (women) and younger members and their ideas. The Team recommends that USAID (1) continue to support the CIDEM's project on *Fortalecimiento de Liderazgos Femininos para el Ejercicio de los Derechos Politicos y Ciudadanos* under the condition of improving classroom presentations and materials, (2) include in the proposed new IR-4 a component for advocacy at the political party and congressional levels, and (3) finance and/or help leverage funds for a significant training effort for younger politicians – especially those from the poorer areas of the country – in political party reform practices within Bolivia

#### Recommendation #7

- **Expand DDCP and Civil Society Support Programs to Include Fast-Growing Urban Areas Such as El Alto and the Outer Rings of Santa Cruz** Any viable approach to civil society and democratic development must contemplate these urban areas. Civil society strengthening activities should focus on developing the role of the *Juntas Vecinales*, strengthening their capacities and activities, and building higher levels of trust within these organizations. These organizations might be linked together by district, as a means for capacity building and exchange. At the same time, a means to link these territorially-based organizations together with functional organizations, such as *gremiales* and other informal sector economic associations, could be a means of developing a more vibrant and effective set of urban civil society actors

#### Recommendation #8

- **Promote the development of CSOs' capacity to utilize the media, especially radio, in the advancement of their democratic development work. Likewise, promote the development of capacity by the media sector to serve objectively as an intermediary between state and civil society**

#### Recommendation #9

- **Promote the capacity of civil society organizations to advocate making more open, transparent, and competitive the decision-making processes of those development funds which sue international financing**

The proposed new IR 4 should encourage CSOs interested in making these funds transparent, competitive and non-partisan to organize the appropriate advocacy campaign and lend political and moral support to it. There is a saying in Spanish that "he who pays

for the party, chooses the music” USAID and the Embassy should give discreet assistance to civil society coalitions which seek to penetrate the perceptions and mind-set of the large international financial institutions which helped set up these funds

#### 4 Conclusion

*If DEMOSOT's S O remains the same, greater citizen seems inconceivable that citizen support for the democratic system, and improvements in the measurable indicators which imply changes in political culture, cannot be achieved through merely continuing to focus on the institutional (supply) side of democratic development This would appear to justify a large, long-term and systematic investment in strengthening civil society through capacity building, citizenship education, political training and other direct interventions*

## **World Learning**

### **Assessment of Civil Society and Strategy Recommendations**

#### *1 Background*

Since 1982, efforts have been under way in Bolivia to establish a true democracy for the first time in the country's history. This challenging task is made difficult by the long-standing relationships of exclusion that have dominated its historical evolution, and by more recent structural and economic changes. On one hand, great progress has been made in creating the basic conditions for democracy, such as fair and free elections and the guarantee of basic human rights, and innovative legal and institutional reforms have been begun which seek the decentralization and deconcentration of power, environmental protection, and integral development. On the other hand, it must be recognized that centuries of authoritarian traditions and the accumulation of power and wealth in the hands of a small white majority cannot be transformed simply by a wave of the policymaker's wand. A deeper process of transforming cultural, social and economic structures is also under way, one that will allow the establishment of a truly open and democratic system for all Bolivians.

While advances in democratization have been proceeding, levels of confidence in public institutions and political parties have shown little tendency to rise. On the one hand, the citizens' expectations of the system have been raised, leading many to express their frustration with continued corruption, unresponsiveness and lack of capacity in the short term. This frustration also stems from a failure to see improvement in their personal economic situation. However, this stems as much from a lack of understanding concerning the new roles and responsibilities of citizens and civil society groups within a healthy democracy, as it does from weak institutional capacity in the government sector.

Bolivian democracy is currently at a crossroads. USAID and other aid agencies must act wisely to invest in areas which are both high-priority short-term needs and likely to produce the greatest long-term results. It is within this context that USAID has commissioned the World Learning Assessment Team to evaluate its current democracy SO and make strategic recommendations.

#### *2 Purpose and Objectives*

The World Learning Assessment Team has been requested to assess (1) whether and how to expand civil society and NGO strengthening activities within its present results package, and (2) whether DEMOSOT's current three Intermediate Results (rule of law, uninominal representation, and municipal government development) are sufficient to achieve its Strategic Objective, or if a new results package is required to strengthen civil society to engage more effectively in the process of democratic development and to take advantage of the new legal and institutional opportunities.

USAID has asked the assessment team to evaluate the current capacity, strengths and weaknesses of NGOs in Bolivia to carry out the work of democratic development, to

identify and prioritize needs for civil society strengthening based on an overview of various experiences and actors, and to identify some potential strategies and mechanisms for filling those needs

## 2.1 Additional Questions For Exploration

In addition to the objectives contained in the Request For Proposal No 99/017, World Learning has been asked by DEMOSOT to make some additional recommendations concerning a number of other issues

- To suggest ways in which CSOs, and especially Colegios de Abogados and popular organizations, can play a greater role than at present in the preparation of the legal profession and the public for the coming changes in the Code of Criminal Procedures
- To recommend whether DEMOSOT should continue to work with uninominal representation under IR2, and whether USAID should examine ideas to help political parties become more open, transparent, and issue-oriented so as to provide a more conducive atmosphere for uninominal representation, and to encourage more civil society participation in the legislative process
- To recommend whether USAID support for CIDEM (a program supporting women's participation in political activities) should be continued and, if so, suggest how it can be more effective in the future
- To suggest, given the demographic trends, how IR3 (municipal development) might address the popular participation needs of urban areas, especially those with the fastest growth rates. Within the same IR, indicate what the mechanisms are for integrating functional organizations into municipal participation structures

Two important themes which will affect the future success of USAID strategy have been incorporated into this assessment (1) What role can the media play in promoting public understanding of civil society organizations, and more effective action by them? (2) Now that Bolivian civil-society groups are developing a wide array of well-devised proposals for development projects, how can those groups get access to the large development funds which international donors have created?

## *3 Theory of Civil Society and Democratic Development*

It is important to state from the outset our assumptions concerning the processes of democratic development and the role of civil society in them. These assumptions are drawn from the current debates in this field and from operational definitions utilized by USAID

### **3 1 Definition of Terms Democratic Development and Civil Society**

Democratic development must be seen as an ongoing process of interaction between the state and civil society, which leads to more responsiveness from government, and more individual and group autonomy at the grass-roots level (Fisher 1998) That is, in addition to the establishment of democratic rules of the game, the rule of law, and respect for human rights, (which would be seen as processes of democratic transition and consolidation - See Linz and Stepan 1996), democratic development should lead to increasing state accountability and transparency, additional opportunities for citizen participation, and an improvement in the levels of good governance (Clayton 1996)

Civil society is seen as comprising all of those non-state actors “around which society organizes itself and which move in and out of the public realm of politics in accordance with their specific needs and agendas of interests” (Hansen 1996) These actors might be divided up into traditional and grassroots associations, intermediate and interest-based groups, and general public-interest organizations They are distinguished from political society, in that their main objective is not to capture control of the state, but to influence the state at different levels

Many theorists posit civil society as the effective counterbalance to state and market, seeing it not as a monolithic entity, but as an aggregation of competing interests, values, and organizational formats Therefore, conceptually it is important to speak of "civil societies" – in the plural – rather than one civil society that shares all interests and structures Actors in civil society may or may not be pro-democracy or pro-public interest, depending on the context (Diamond 1996)

USAID uses a more operational focus on civil society, identifying primarily as civil society those “non-state actors that can (or have the potential to) champion democratic /governance reforms” (Hansen 1996 3) In societies recently emerging from non-democratic forms of government, these organizations act to push for more open systems, rights, and representativeness In systems working to consolidate and deepen democratic processes, these organizations can help to create better governance, more citizen participation in determining public policy and public investments, and to assure that all actors continue to play by the rules In Bolivia, these organizations include NGOs, labor unions, church groups, urban and professional associations, *campesino* organizations, indigenous groups and the media

### **3 2 Relationship Between Civil Society and Democratic Development**

A strong civil society can play an active role in democratic development at a variety of levels and in various ways On a very basic level, it represents a reservoir of potential resources to check the power of the state More specifically

- Civil society organizations can work to make the political system more inclusive and pluralistic They can achieve this through performing a watchdog and advocacy role, helping to analyze public policies, propose legal changes, protect human rights, and generally serve as an intermediary between civic and political interests

CSOs can also assist in assuring that all actors play by the established rules of the game

- Civil society organizations provide a learning and socialization function for individuals which helps the development of a democratic political culture (Putnam 1993) Many theorists (as far back as de Toqueville) argue that participation in an array of associations provides a training ground for the acquisition of democratic skills and values, such as tolerance, respect for the views of others, and an ability to come together to solve common problems (Diamond 1996)
- Likewise, civil society can provide a training ground for future political leaders – as in the cases of union leaders or NGO staff members who enter the political arena

### 3 3 Constructing Civil Society

Donors in many different countries have begun to understand how civil society might best be assisted to develop in ways which are beneficial to democratic development and good governance Many of these are summarized in USAID's Constituencies for Reform Strategic Approaches for Donor Supported Civic Advocacy Programs, and will not be repeated here

### 3 4 The Challenge and Importance of Civil Society in Bolivia The Civil Society Problem

The particular context and juncture in Bolivia present certain kinds of challenges that must be addressed Briefly, these can be summarized as

- **Clientelism** A strong tradition of clientelism exists, with patron-client ties between political society (political parties, the state) and civil society This creates a weak or distorted interface between civil society and political society/state, preventing the exercise of true citizenship and provides only a feeble countervailing power to that of the state Clientelism contributes to the lack of trust and confidence on the part of civil society in parties and public institutions, and this distrust is in turn exacerbated by low levels of performance by, and high levels of corruption in, state institutions
- **Weak linkages between state/political society and civil society** Currently, previous actors such as labor unions which carried out this role are no longer viable, and political parties have yet to reform themselves adequately to fulfill this function or to have a legitimate place in the eyes of the people New actors must have the capacity to fill this void This also involves the creation and strengthening of spaces in which exchange and dialogue between state and civil society can occur, such as forums at the national, regional and local levels, round-tables, and the use of the media
- **Exclusion and a lack of pluralism** In the process referred to above, the previously excluded majority must be able to assume new roles and responsibilities under the developing democratic system Where the majority is

no longer excluded by the formal rules, informal structures and cultural patterns will continue to leave the large majority of indigenous Bolivians and women out of public processes unless the need is addressed for a very fundamental re-orientation of power among groups. This demands a focus on indigenous organizations.

- **Weak and yet developing democratic political culture** There is an urgent need to develop the skills and values of a democratic culture, including tolerance, respect, and an orientation towards collaboration and cooperation (or at least consensus). However, beyond these more traditional aspects of democratic culture, dealt with in the Seligson study, the Assessment Team found that what is lacking is a concept of shared responsibilities which must accompany the concept of rights in any democratic system. *That is, citizens feel that the way to exercise their rights is through making demands on the state for the goods and services of development. What is lacking is a concept that citizens themselves must play an active role in collaborating with the government in order to acquire these goods and services and to improve their communities. This lack translates directly into lower levels of system legitimacy, as the citizens' expectations of what the system can produce have been raised unrealistically.* Hence, developing a democratic culture also entails producing these elements, in addition to things like tolerance.
- **Lack of rule enforcement** There is a need to assure that public and private actors play by the established rules, in order to increase system legitimacy.
- **Lack of previous long-term capacity building for NGOs and CSOs** Despite the large and vibrant civil society in Bolivia, few systematic and concerted efforts at developing its organizational capacity have been carried out, either at the intermediate or at the grassroots levels. While millions of dollars have indeed been invested in these activities, they have lacked follow-up, coherency and sustainability.
- **Weakness of the private sector and its associations** In many cases, it has been proven that private-sector organizations can help the process of democratic development, if the private sector itself is autonomous of the state. In Bolivia, there is an urgent need to develop a sense of democratic citizenship (responsibilities and not just rights) on the part of the formal private sector, so as to be able to enlist its support for existing laws and regulations.

#### 4 Research Methodology

The Assessment Team used a variety of qualitative techniques in order to obtain information and analyze the current strengths and weaknesses of civil society.

- Review of existing documents and secondary materials, such as the Assessment of Bolivian Democracy (Development Associates 1997), notes and preliminary reports.

from AID's D&G assessment of donor support to civil society (Blair, Behrendt, Guttman – MSI 1999), the Seligson surveys, government documents from the Vice-Ministry of Popular Participation, clippings from three of the country's major newspapers (from August through October, 1999), reports produced by the DDCP/CHEMONICS program, reports, books and documents produced by various NGOs and research centers in Bolivia, and research findings of the Bolivian-based researcher (see the Bibliography for a complete list)

- Interviews with USAID and DDCP staff These initial interviews guided the formulation of questions and themes for investigation
- Some initial interviews with major, national NGO networks in La Paz These interviews allowed for additional framing of key issues and identification of key organizations to be interviewed
- Semi-structured interviews with the staffs of NGOs, research centers, movements, associations and universities were carried out While no standardized questionnaires were used, a general framework of questions was utilized to guide this process With key NGOs, the World Learning Institutional Capacity Assessment Tool was utilized as a guideline for some questions concerning organizational capacity, however, time did not permit in-depth assessments of all the different elements To augment the interviews, yearly reports and publications were acquired and reviewed
- Attendance at conferences, seminars and workshops Both researchers attended a number of conferences and workshops related to the topic, where valuable information was gained from participants and participating organizations
- Hosting of meetings and field visits In some cases, meetings with civil society participants were called in order to get a better feel for how NGOs and government agencies were perceived by more grassroots constituencies, visits were also made to some municipalities, and discussions held with *alcaldes*, *consejales* and members of *Comites de Vigilancia*
- Analysis and write up During the interim period of the research, initial reports were written up and shared among researchers and World Learning staff This guided both the first stage of analysis and subsequent research by the team leader, as the Bolivia-based researcher did not perform additional research after the interim period, but did contribute substantially to the analysis of the data and preparation of the report

## 5 Findings

### 5.1 Primary NGOs in Democratic Development – Descriptions, Tables and Matrix

There are currently over 700 registered non-governmental development organizations operating in Bolivia (*Ministerio de Hacienda* 1999) While many of these organizations are

small and somewhat new on the scene, Bolivia does boast an NGO community that has been effective in achieving a variety of goals over the years, both in terms of service delivery to areas in which the state was absent, as well as in the transition from authoritarian rule to more liberal forms of government. The NGO community was often closely associated with grassroots social movements, such as those of labor and indigenous peoples, and some NGOs continue to be so associated today.

Like other actors in society, NGOs have been forced to make some radical changes over the past 15 years due to increasing democratization, privatization, the diminution of the state, and decentralization. While still in a stage of transition, a reduced number of these NGOs have moved increasingly into areas of public policy, municipal development, collaboration with government, facilitating people's participation, and other areas related to democratic development. The Assessment Team has identified a number of the primary NGOs most involved in the area of democratic development and the strengthening of civil society. It must be noted that this is only a preliminary list, limited by geographic and time constraints and there are additional NGOs involved in this kind of work which are not included in the study. The Assessment Team hoped to provide an overview and a general feel for the activities and capacities of these types of organizations.

25 such NGOs have been identified, and are presented in the tables below, divided by geographic area. Some of these are in themselves umbrella organizations representing networks of NGOs. Following the tables, a number of more detailed case studies of different NGOs will be given.

#### *Overview of Primary NGOs Involved in Democratic Development*

Based upon the questions in the SOW and the World Learning Institutional Assessment Tool, the team attempted to identify a number of key issues in understanding the NGOs under study. These included:

- The sectoral focus of the NGO – e.g. health, environment etc
- The operational focus of the NGO – this referred to the kinds of activities which the NGO most frequently undertook to achieve its goals
- The level of operations – whether the NGO worked mostly at the local, regional or national level
- The general organizational capacity of the NGO – in areas such as financial management, planning, governance, and operational management
- The financial backing of these NGOs – the sources of the NGOs' funds
- The number of years in existence – this might serve as a proxy for understanding the relative strength and sustainability of the NGO
- The Quantity of Staff – this serves a proxy for understanding the scope and potential impact of the NGO

#### *Democratic Development Capacity of Selected NGOs*

The team identified a list of activities, while not exhaustive, to use to show the present level of NGO activity, and the areas in which NGOs have the potential to work, or in which their capacity needs to be improved. These included:

- *advocacy of different types*
- *municipal development*
- *citizenship education*
- *political training*
- *negotiation and dialogue promotion*
- *research and publications*
- *use of the media*

A scale of "Frequent-Moderate-Infrequently" was utilized to denote how often the particular NGO is now involved in a certain kind of activity. "High-Moderate-Low" is used to rate the relative level of capacity that the NGO has to carry out a particular activity. Capacity was thought to be based on a number of criteria, such as *a clear statement of goals and objectives, skilled human resources, previous experience and successes, and proposed follow-up activities*.

Annex D contains four tables that summarize the results obtained by using these scales:

Table 5.1 Overview of Primary NGOs – La Paz and Cochabamba

Table 5.2 Overview of Primary NGOs – Santa Cruz and the Beni

Table 5.3 Democratic Development Capacity of NGOs – La Paz and Cochabamba

Table 5.4 Democratic Development Capacity of NGOs – Santa Cruz and the Beni

## **5.2 A Summary of Relative Strengths and Weaknesses of Bolivian NGOs**

While very difficult to do, the Team attempted to render a composite view of the strengths and weaknesses of Bolivian NGOs. Of course, this does not represent the diversity which is always present, and deeper assessments on a case-by-case basis would reveal such diversity.

### *Strengths*

Generally, we feel there are number of areas in which some NGOs are strong. These include service delivery in rural development and health. In popular education and training, NGOs have also produced a cadre of trainers, popular educators and materials throughout Bolivia. We also felt that among most of the established NGOs there was a high level of commitment to social change and social justice. Due the fact that so many NGOs were contracted by the MNR government to implement different components of the LPP, they have gained experience in the area of municipal development and working with OTBs and CVs.

### *Weaknesses*

NGOs in almost all sectors need additional basic organizational development in areas such as management, strategic planning, financial sustainability, and communications/information management. In the political development area, capacity must be developed in the areas of advocacy, coalition building, policy analysis and proposal making, collaborating and forming partnerships, and the ability to play a monitoring ("watch-dog") function. New ways in which NGOs can form much-needed

relationships with grassroots groups ("*bases populares*") and with the state must be developed as well

*Note on Human Resources*

Generally, many people working in the NGO sector have come from different backgrounds, and very few of them have training or preparation specific to the non-profit sector. Most have backgrounds in more technical areas, such as agriculture and health, or in totally non-related areas. This signals the need for the development in the long run of formal education opportunities for both non-profit and public sector training if Bolivia is to obtain the human resources needed.

Of course, we did find that there is a high level of moving back and forth between government and the NGO sector in terms of staff. This also seemed to depend on the political party currently in power. It is not surprising to find many of the people who worked in the Popular Participation Ministry under the previous government currently working on these and related issues in the NGO sector. However, this in itself may not be a negative phenomenon, and is common in many countries.

Table 5.5, which follows, shows the strengths and weaknesses of Bolivian NGOs

Relative Strengths and Weaknesses of Bolivian NGOs  
in the Area of Democratic Development

Strong	Moderate	Weak
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-- Municipal Development</li> <li>- Commitment to Democracy and Social Change</li> <li>- Linkages to Popular Sectors</li> <li>- Focus on Poverty Alleviation</li> <li>- Service Delivery Capacity (Health, Water, Agriculture etc )</li> <li>- Rural Areas</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Networking</li> <li>- Research and Publications</li> <li>- Proposal Making</li> <li>- Collaboration with Local Government</li> <li>- Vision and Mission</li> <li>- Leadership</li> <li>- Training and Materials Development</li> <li>- Use of Technology</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Advocacy</li> <li>- Civic Education</li> <li>- Political Training</li> <li>- Working with the Media</li> <li>- Negotiation/Mediation</li> <li>- Coalition Building</li> <li>- Resource Mobilization</li> <li>- Enforcement of Existing Laws, Use of Legal System, State Accountability</li> <li>- Learning</li> <li>- Organizational and Financial Management</li> </ul>

### 5.3 Illustrative Case Studies of Selected NGOs

In this section, we will give a number of brief case studies of selected NGOs, illustrating the variety in both current capacity and in potential needs. Some, but not all of these NGOs are the ones chosen as potential intermediaries/partners for capacity building activities in the future.

#### Santa Cruz Area

CEJIS – The Centro de Estudios Jurídicos y Investigación Social

This NGO is an excellent example of a strong NGO which performs advocacy at the national level. CEJIS, which has been in existence for 22 years, views itself as a legal support organization, made up mostly of lawyers and sociologists, which aims to serve its clients in society. CEJIS focuses on providing legal and advocacy services to indigenous, peasant and *colono* groups. The organization has been very active in promoting various laws, in criticizing and scrutinizing laws proposed in congress that might affect the interests of its members' clients, and in attempting to see that existing laws are enforced. CEJIS was instrumental in working with lowland indigenous groups such as CIDOB, APG, and CPIB in a campaign to obtain inclusion of a clause regarding indigenous land rights in the new Constitution. The group has been instrumental in the adoption of the forestry law, the biodiversity law, and the water law. CEJIS uses the media, circulates petitions, and lobbies congress at the national level.

CEJIS is also involved in legal education for more grassroots indigenous groups, and prepares simple explanatory materials about the law. It has a well-developed research division, and regularly publishes a political and advocacy-related journal nationally and internationally.

#### CEDETI – The Centro de Tecnología Intermedia

This NGO has excelled in the area of municipal development and in helping to utilize the advances of the popular participation law to assist local people and local producers associations to achieve both participation and development. It has focused on promoting dialogue among different public and private actors, training and capacity building, and mediating between different groups within the municipalities where CEDETI works. In Yapacani, the group was extremely successful in bridging the gaps between the municipal government, local producer associations, part of the strong *campesino* unions, and private interests. The CEDETI director attributes its success to the long-term and sustained presence of CEDETI in the region, its almost daily attempts to problem-solve through dialogue, *and its ability to build trust among different local actors*.

CIDOB – The Confederación de Pueblos Indígenas del Oriente Boliviano

While not strictly an NGO, it is worth mentioning the experience of this organization of indigenous federations as a mass based-organization. It has access and connections to many community-level organizations throughout eastern Bolivia. CIDOB has been

developing its ability to advocate at the national level on behalf of the numerous indigenous tribes of Eastern Bolivia. While it has engaged in many of the tools and techniques of protest, such as marches and blocking of roads, it has also been more open to negotiating with the government and working with other organizations and NGOs to develop concrete proposals. CIDOB has more recently become concerned with the need for political training for its members, so that they can take advantage of the opportunities presented by the LPP, and be elected to positions in municipal governments. This organization is an active and important actor in civil society, but still needs to develop its own internal organizational capacity and human resources.

### La Paz Area

#### Fundacion Qullana

Established in 1995, Fundacion Qullana employs an integral approach to education, municipal development and civic action. It takes high school graduates on a competitive basis from rural areas of La Paz, Potosí and Oruro and offers them a distance learning program in centrally located rural towns on weekends. The Universidad Nur, which is one of the recommended core organizations if an IR 4 is created, coordinates the academic program.

The study program includes academic skills development, regular college subjects, project design, human resources, local municipal development, good governance, indigenous culture and values, and laws which impact rural communities. After graduation, there are follow-up activities and short courses oriented to community and political action.

Of the first graduating class of 368 students, 338 are running for municipal office in their hometowns and villages. Elections are scheduled for December 1999.

The Foundation has European financing for the next three years. One undetermined question is whether the Foundation will continue to encourage its graduates to choose their own political party vehicles or will try to steer them towards the formation of an indigenous political group with the goal of establishing a new political party.

#### ERBOL – The Estaciones Radiofonicas de Bolivia

ERBOL is the program and institutional support center for a network of 40 regional and local radio stations covering the entire territory of Bolivia with news, educational programming and cultural orientation. It comes out of the radio school tradition established in Colombia. It is a natural ally for CSOs, but is not being used as such. (For more information on this, please refer to the section on Media Strategy for USAID and NGOs.)

#### LIDEMA – The Liga de Defensa del Medio Ambiente

The Liga de Defensa del Medio Ambiente was established in 1985 and presently has 28 affiliates working in environmental action and investigation, education, strategic planning for NGOs, ecotourism, appropriate technology and institutional capacity building. It has carried out over 15 major projects with international funding from USAID, the MacArthur Foundation, UNDP, Konrad Adenauer, WWF and others. Its vision: “Un movimiento

ambiental civil, consolidado, que contribuye a que la sociedad boliviana internalice el desarrollo sostenible como una prioridad nacional ”

LIDEMA is just concluding a 4-year project to assist NGOs and other CSOs, including a Prefectura, to build internal capacity for the proper development, administration and execution of their goals and of the funds which support them. All too often, an organization’s technical competence is not complemented by the necessary administrative, planning and human resource competence to ensure that projects are efficiently carried out and that the organization builds long-term sustainability.

Out of 160 CSOs surveyed, LIDEMA worked with 45 on capacity building, with good results in organizational strengthening. Its 4-year experience, supported by the World Wildlife Fund, in building capacity and evaluating the results would be extremely useful to a new IR 4 if one were to be created.

#### UNITAS – La Union Nacional de Instituciones para el Trabajo de Accion Social

Founded in 1976, UNITAS is the longest-standing NGO network in Bolivia, and was instrumental in the transition to more democratic rule. It is actively engaged in various kinds of advocacy at the national level, such as working with the Child Labor and Children’s Rights laws, and with the Land Law. Attempting to represent the views of the *bases populares*, particularly *campesino* and indigenous groups, UNITAS provides information, training and technical support through its member organizations. It also provides a format for dialogues with international donors, including the World Bank and the IDB, and for discussions on policies with the government. This group publishes a number of *revistas*, and has thereby developed an outreach capacity worth noting. UNITAS has recently begun a large-scale program directed at urban areas, and has carried out political training programs for its members, as well as working with political parties to a limited extent.

#### *Colegios de Abogados*

*Colegios de Abogados* are important mechanisms of communication and education for the legal profession and related universities. Of the *Colegios* interviewed, Santa Cruz and Chochabamba were by far the best organized and focused on improving the competence of their members and the legal community in general in dealing with the new laws, and especially, the new Code of Criminal Procedures. They realize that oral court procedures will be the norm for all sectors of the law in the future.

The *Colegios* in provincial cities and far-flung areas such as Beni and Pando are extremely important mechanisms for transmitting the new legal procedures and reforms to the surrounding legal community. More information on the *Colegios de Abogados* is contained in Section 7.

#### *5.4 Legal Environment*

The Team found a legal environment conducive for the functioning of NGOs and other CSOs. None of the organizations interviewed ever raised an objection to the legal environment. Problems with governmental institutions revolve around how foreign funding is to be administered, and by whom. UNITAS, an umbrella organization of national NGOs with a long history in the country, stated that it had supported a proposed law to have foreign NGOs be subject to the same registration requirements as are national NGOs. However, the fact that international NGOs lobbied successfully against the law was not felt to be a problem of any consequence for them today.

### 5.5 Potential Intermediaries for NGO Strengthening – Recommendation (see section 6)

This theme will be addressed at length in section 6.

## *6 Overall Strategic Considerations For AID/Bolivia*

Based on our findings, we recommend that USAID consider the following overall strategic factors in the future development of strategies for strengthening civil society and democratic development:

### 6.1 Sustainability, and Leveraging Funding

The Assessment Team strongly recommends that USAID consider the question of how to utilize its potential support to civil society in a way that enables USAID to leverage funds from other donors, while at the same time assisting civil society organizations to do so as well. Further, USAID needs to implement a civil society support strategy that creates in-country capacity to continue on with civil-society work in a sustainable manner, including the ability to generate funds.

Strategically, this is a possibility, given the ever-growing attention by other donors and the expanding opportunities provided by government reforms in the areas of democracy and citizen participation. Priorities in almost all other areas of development, including health, the environment, and agriculture, are currently converging around the issues of decentralization, participation and governance. This creates major, long-term demands for services, training and technical assistance in the governance and civil society area, for a wide variety of clients. By getting into the game as soon as possible, USAID could stimulate and shape a capacity-building network that could provide services far into the future.

### 6.2 Promoting Access to Internationally Financed Development Funds

There is a growing opinion that stable democratic government will only be possible if poverty eradication programs begin to show results. The Popular Participation Law has redistributed state income to many areas which previously were never consulted on how government revenues should be spent. This has created a new sense of popular participation and initiative which has translated into the preparation of a growing number of feasible

proposals for development projects at the municipal and inter-municipal levels. However, this new sense of developmental power will be frustrated without access to larger amounts of project donations and loans as the small steps being taken now grow into sizeable projects. This is why USAID, the European aid agencies, the IDB, the World Bank and other international donors have helped set up various government distributed funds, such as the *Campesino* Development Fund and the Environmental Fund.

Unfortunately, these funds are not being administered in the way that was planned. In a majority of instances project approval is based on political and non-technical considerations. The second member of this assessment team has helped popular organizations prepare very technically competent projects for FONAMA (an Environmental Fund) which never got more than a few minutes study by this fund. NGOs are finding that their expenditures for projects which were approved, and completed as programmed, are not being reimbursed as promised. For example, the FIS (Fondo de Inversion Social), FDC (Fondo de Desarrollo Campesino) and the Prefectura of Cochabamba owe CEDAGRO US\$110,000 on completed projects, some two years old. Likewise, in Santa Cruz, the Prefectura delayed payment for services in municipal development owed to a local University for over a year.

Our interviews have found that NGOs, Comites Civicos, popular organizations and others have come to understand **and accept** that they will not be the recipients of this project money or of any significant piece of it. This attitude of resignation and passivity is reinforced by a tendency to see the situation almost exclusively as a problem just of one's own organization. This makes the problem appear too large to tackle. When the Team asked why a coalition approach had not been tried as a way to open up access to the funds, the "body language" reply was always just a shrug, as if to say "We have not given it any real thought."

Therefore, IR 3 and the proposed IR 4, should encourage CSOs interested in making these funds transparent, competitive and non-partisan to organize the appropriate advocacy campaign and lend political and moral support to it. There is a saying in Spanish that "he who pays for the party, chooses the music." USAID and the Embassy should give discreet assistance to civil society coalitions which seek to alter the perceptions and mind-set of the large international financial institutions which helped set up these funds.

### 6.3 Working With Fast Growing Urban Areas

Bolivia is quickly becoming an urban country. Statistics today estimate an urban-rural ratio of 52-54% to 48-46%. The declining agricultural economy for *campesinos*, the closing of many major mines, and the present downturn in mineral prices have stimulated a large migration of rural inhabitants to the outer rings of Santa Cruz, and especially to El Alto. Any viable approach to civil society and democratic development must include a focus on these urban areas.

#### *Case Study El Alto*

The team leader took a close look at the situation of El Alto because it is the most prominent example of how present-day urbanization is proceeding, and because the

estimated population of 800,000 projected for the year 2000 will equal approximately 10 % of Bolivia's total population

El Alto has grown from a small suburb of La Paz in 1985 to a city developing its own identity today. It has an estimated poverty rate of 73%, which is high compared to the averages for the whole of Santa Cruz (43%), La Paz (45.5%), Oruro (54.3%), and Trinidad (58.7%). This economic situation is compounded by limited access to basic public services (especially sanitation), an inadequate municipal government structure, a high crime rate, and the fact that over 50% of the population is under 20 years old.

At the same time, the team leader observed many positive signs of progress. Numerous neighborhoods are now permanent, neighborhood committees are growing in number (from 4,000 in 1994 to 7,000 in 1998), and women and youth organizations are receiving funding for their development projects from popular participation funding. NGOs are having a positive impact on the preparation of leaders, the increased level of activities by popular organizations, and the development of community and other projects. There is widespread participation in parent-school committees and while many economic activities provide low returns, people are dynamically pushing ahead to build small industries and service and commercial mini-enterprises.

USAID-supported programs could build on these positive trends to stimulate more popular participation in El Alto. This will counteract the pressures that could create a social explosion and/or chaos, and rapidly bring to the forefront the public's concern with creating greater economic opportunities. An expansion of the DDCP will also encourage the population to be more active in the choice of representatives for public office, thereby lessening the potential for apathy and/or support for extreme demagogues.

Civil society strengthening activities should focus on developing the role of the *Juntas Vecinales*, by creating stronger capacity and higher levels of trust and activities on the part of these organizations. The *Juntas* might be linked together by district, as a means for capacity building and exchange. At the same time, a means to incorporate and link these territorial-based organizations with functional organizations, such as *gremiales* and other informal sector economic associations, could be a means of developing a more vibrant and effective set of urban civil society actors. (Please see the section on IR 4 for more information on a program to help stimulate this citizen action<sup>2</sup>.)

#### **6.4 Emphasizing the Capacity of Civil Society to Enforce Public/Private Accountability**

As mentioned above in Section 3, USAID should think clearly and strategically about the particular phase of democratic consolidation which characterizes Bolivia, and choose its democratic development strategies accordingly. The Assessment Team urges DEMOSOT to include advocacy capacity building as part of its interventions, but to focus more on the ability of civil society to enforce the many good laws already on the books as opposed to

---

<sup>2</sup> Information provided by INFORCO, Estrategia de Desarrollo Municipal Para El Alto, Nov. 1999, Foro Urbano, Ciudad El Alto, Nov. 1998, and Centro de Promocion de la Mujer Gregoria Apaza"

only pushing for additional reforms of the system. For example, the forestry law provides fairly ample powers to local governments and indigenous peoples. What is lacking is the power to assure that public officials, and in particular, the private sector, play by the rules to utilize natural resources in a sustainable and just way. (See the case study in section 5 of CEJIS for a prime example of an organization carrying out this kind of work)

### **6.5 Linking Institutional Development with Civil Society Capacity Building**

It is *absolutely essential* that efforts to implement a possible new IR 4 be made in close coordination with existing IRs, particularly with IR 3 and the DDCP project. This is because, as mentioned in the section on theory, the democratic development of state institutions and civil society are intimately related processes and must be seen as dynamically linked. For example, as new institutional opportunities are created, civil society organizations must develop the knowledge and ability to access them and help assure accountability and transparency – this in turn helps to develop additional institutional capacity etc. Likewise, training and capacity building efforts need to be carried out in tandem, so that public and civil actors have a chance to learn about the responsibilities and roles of each. This will help to overcome opposition and conflict, in order to develop more collaborative and cooperative relationships. Hence, rather than having separate institutions that do training and capacity building, say, one for municipal governments and one for civil society, it would be advisable that the actual institution carrying out the work be the same (or at least that the work be closely partnered).

### **6.6 Poverty and Economic Development**

There is an increasing feeling among Bolivian citizens that, unless democracy can be translated into economic development at a micro-level (i.e. their level), the democratic system lacks legitimacy. (This is shown by a series of national surveys). Therefore, support to civil society should contemplate developing the abilities of civil society organizations to work in tandem with government and the private sector to produce higher levels of local and regional economic development. This implies improving capacity for negotiation, conflict resolution, project development and management, strategic planning for long-term development, advocacy for productive investments, and developing economic self-sufficiency.

## **7 Strategies for Incorporating Civil Society Strengthening into Existing IRs**

### **7.1 IR 1 – Civil Society and the Administration of Justice**

#### **7.1.1 The role of Colegios de Abogados and their related organizations**

The USAID AOJ program has a CCP implementation plan running until 2005. In 2000 it will begin to reach out to the *Colegios de Abogados* and related organizations in a more systematic manner. At present the program has sent members of several *Colegios* for training in Puerto Rico as a first step in the process of creating a cadre of trainers for civil society.

The following section reports what leaders from different *Colegios* told Team members at one point in time November of 1999 Their projections on what the state of lawyer preparedness in June 2001 may be is based on their present, very limited participation in the official implementation process An effort to include the *Colegios* in a systematic form, as AOJ is projecting, will greatly increase opportunities for preparing the private legal profession and will be welcomed by the *Colegios* They overwhelmingly expressed their desire to play an active role in the reform process

There is real concern that when the criminal code procedure reform becomes fully operational in 2001, the majority of lawyers may still be ignorant of its content and its practices This fear was expressed over and over again by *Colegios de Abogados* (El Alto, La Paz, Cochabamba, and Santa Cruz), the national chapter of the *Sociedad de Ciencias Penales*, and several women lawyers of different ages and experience within the legal profession What is involved is a transformation from the civil code mentality of written procedures and little physical interaction with the litigants to an understanding of a faster system that relies heavily on investigation and court room advocacy by prosecutors and private attorneys and participation by publicly-selected jurors

“More than 70% of the lawyers in El Alto do not know what this reform is about today ” (Dr Yecid R Gozalvez, President of the Colegio de Abogados de El Alto)

“Few are studying the changes taking place We need to motivate our members ” (Dr Gaston Ledezma Rojas, newly elected President of the Colegio de Abogados de La Paz)

“There is a reluctance to let go of the old system Many, many lawyers are afraid of the oral system ” (From the conversation with women lawyers in Cochabamba)

The *Colegios* in Cochabamba and Santa Cruz are preparing the most systematic campaign, within their human resource and financial limitations, of training for their members in oral procedures and the techniques of criminal justice The newly elected officers in La Paz are just beginning to think about this problem El Alto is a question mark, even though the President is well aware of the problems this change will bring The President of the *Sociedad de Ciencias Penales*, Dr Edgar Montana, could not point to an effort in this direction on the part of the national chapter, which he leads, or by one of its local affiliates The *Sociedad* has worked on the level of informational workshops and short courses for university law students and professors, private attorneys and members of the court system

Many of those interviewed did not appear to see how this change in legal procedure creates an opportunity to make their organizations more relevant and necessary to the membership This concept of institutional building around important questions facing members will need to be stressed in any program with the *Colegios*

While many of the people interviewed seemed to think that the public institutions were doing quite a lot to train their personnel (the judges interviewed were positive in this sense),

the active *Colegio* of Cochabamba did not feel that public institutions were as yet clear on what this reform requires. “*Cuando hablamos con la Fiscalia, sentimos que no tiene claro el proceso*” The President of the Santa Cruz *Colegio* also pointed to a need for improving public training for court staff. He noted that there is a large number of newly appointed judges in Santa Cruz who, in his opinion, still lack sufficiently complete knowledge of the new criminal code procedures.

All of the institutions interviewed, including the *Association de Magistrados* of La Paz and Cochabamba, did agree that a much larger effort was needed to help private attorneys make the transition from the old to the new. They agreed that the *Colegios*, the *Sociedad de Ciencias Penalistas*, and the universities were the private institutions most suitable to lead this effort. They all thought that *Colegios* and international organizations could team up to speed the transformation process.

At present, the *Colegio* in Cochabamba is transforming its top floor into an auditorium with a big TV monitor and video taping equipment. The auditorium will be used for training in the practical skills needed for the oral system (other *Colegios* will use the facilities of universities). Cochabamba has sponsored several short seminars on the techniques of investigation and cross-examination, including an eight-month course on the oral system in which 70 members took part and a 45-day seminar in the evenings on criminal investigation. In the year 2000, Cochabamba will offer a much larger number of programs to members. A great deal of emphasis will be placed on learning the practical skills required by the new system.

The most astute observers (from Cochabamba and Santa Cruz) mentioned that the human resources problems of the courts are a great hindrance to the implementation of the new system. Judges are complaining that the atmosphere being created by the *Consejo de Adjudatura* is dispiriting and not conducive to creating the level of initiative that will be required of magistrates to assure proper implementation of the new system. Also, there is a fear that the better private attorneys will be less interested in becoming judges.

Programs with the *Colegios* could deal with two subject matter groupings:

- d. The substance of the criminal procedure law. This would include training, publications and information campaigns.
- e. Collateral issues involved with the reform, with emphasis on ethics. When lawyers have more responsibility for the conduct of investigations and trials, they must govern themselves appropriately. Assisting this outcome will require all the effort possible from *Colegios* and their related structures. A program of capacity building for *Colegios*, especially the less developed ones, is in order.

From the conversations, a general outline emerged on how outside organizations and the *Colegios* could coordinate their efforts. These ideas, which originated with the interviewed lawyers, could be useful during the Mission's planned programs for working with the *Colegios*.

Colegio	Outside Organization(s)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Planning of programs In La Paz the president proposed that this programming could be undertaken by one of the committees which the <i>Colegio</i> was setting up in November, 1999</li> <li>• Getting outside the major cities The Santa Cruz <i>Colegio</i> has affiliates in Montero (35-40 members), German Busch (30) and Camiri (40) with their own offices <i>Colegios</i> in the Beni, Pando and other far-flung places provide a central point for getting all in the legal profession involved in training</li> <li>• Communication with and invitation of members Creating expectation and interest In La Paz the <i>Colegio</i> is set to begin a weekly radio program Its producer is Dr Ruben Dario Flores (Tel 331058 &amp; 322396), a collaborator with the WL Assessment Team He is interested in working closely with USAID and others</li> <li>• Use of members with experience and knowledge of specific subjects Dr Edgardo Montana Prado, President of the <i>Sociedad de Ciencia Penales</i>, is active in training efforts</li> <li>• Trade publications, such as the <u>Revista Boliviana de Ciencia Penales</u> issued by the <i>Sociedad de Ciencias Penalistas</i>, which are reasonably priced The cost of publications and courses can be a problem for many lawyers</li> <li>• Awarding of diplomas, and in general giving status to the workshops, training courses, and more formal education programs Keep the price of these as low as possible Many lawyers are not in</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concentrate on local <i>Colegios</i> and their related organizations, as this is where specific action will take place Work with the interested <i>colegios</i> on the development of a systematic program in which the member goes from lower levels of knowledge to the practice of oral argumentation</li> <li>• International experts, esp from Latin America, including Puerto Rico Assistance in developing the practical training in oral and forensic skills development Training the trainers and regular presenters in local programs</li> <li>• Publications</li> <li>• Audio-visual materials Excerpts from well-known cases of oral argument (such as the O J Simpson trial and the Pinochet case in London) would pack the legal professional into training sessions and stimulate much greater interest than exists at present</li> <li>• Funding for special conferences</li> <li>• Giving programs international prestige, to encourage participation and the interest of the media</li> <li>• International visits by Bolivians to countries with the oral system (would require very strict criteria for selection)</li> <li>• Work with <i>Colegios</i> on getting the media to make the reform and its implementation process well-known Perhaps USIS could help with ideas</li> <li>• Seek to interest national and foreign correspondents to write on the subject Obtain help from USIS</li> <li>• Encourage the re-issuing of <u>NuevoCodigo de Procedimiento Penal</u> and any other important publications in</li> </ul>

<p>very good financial shape</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Work with the universities, with special attention to the study of the Code of Criminal Procedures and its application</li> <li>• Look for ways to coordinate programs with public institutions</li> <li>• Develop a media plan (using ideas outlined in the media section)</li> <li>• Inform members that in the not-too-distant future, the entire legal system will operate under the oral procedures</li> <li>• Lobby the <i>Ministerio of Justicia y Derechos Humanos</i> to republish, at cost, the book <u>Nuevo Código de Procedimiento Penal, 1999, Comentario e Indices</u> in a less expensive edition, for wide diffusion among lawyers and university students</li> <li>• Members of <i>Colegios</i> would be asked to promote this and other publications</li> </ul>	<p>cheaper editions by the Ministry of Justice at cost, so as to reach a wide audience in the legal profession and universities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Encourage ERBOL and its networks in their work with the <i>Colegios</i> and related organizations</li> </ul>
--	---

### 7.1.2. The Role of NGOs and Popular Organizations

Time did not permit the Team to investigate and interview the NGOs which specialize in legal processes, with the exception of the *Centro de Estudios Juridicos e Investigacion Social* (CEJIS) and the *Centro de Estudios para el Desarrollo Laboral y Agrario* (CEDLA). Among other activities, CEJIS works with indigenous groups in Santa Cruz, Beni and Pando. CEDLA worked on the idea of a chapter relating to human rights in the new penal procedures. CEDLA has a very high reputation with the Congress, the media (it is a constant source of information and opinion for the newspapers) and popular organizations which represent small and micro businesses, labor and others. Both could be very helpful in proposing strategies to promote public education on the Criminal Code reform procedure.

Because of time limitations, the team targeted the *Federacion de Trabajadores Gremiales de El Atlo* for interviews on the role of popular organizations in the implementation of the Popular Participation Law and the criminal procedure changes. The Federation represents over 50,000 small *comerciantes* (the informal commercial sector) in a semi-organized way. Its 200 local affiliates have memberships of between 150 to 2,000 each. Their function is to oversee clean-up of market areas, protect the interests of members in relation to the municipality, maintain reasonable relationships with the neighborhoods in which they operate, assist in the implementation of public works, promote cultural and sporting activities, and participate in civic and cultural festivals. They readily agree that education on business, legal, and civic matters should become a major initiative for the Federation and its active local organizations. The Federation has a small radio station that could use popularly-oriented materials on civic affairs.

In a meeting with many local chapter secretary-generals and the Federation's top elected officers, the team was told that knowledge of laws was minimal and that a serious effort to help the secretary-generals become much more knowledgeable of the legal framework in criminal, popular participation, contraband, and municipal law would be important for the development of the organization and its members. One proposed idea was that selected secretary-generals become trainers. A system of prizes (invitations to special events, etc.) rather than money could be used to recognize their activities. The secretary-generals are the key to opening up access to the thousands of members that meet on a monthly or weekly basis in local chapters.

### 7.2. IR 2 – The Relationship of Civil Society to Uninominales, Congress, and Political Parties

“Political parties are the cornerstone of democracy and serve a function unlike any other institution. Parties link citizens to their government and to one another by providing avenues for participation in public policy. Parties that effectively debate public policy issues and that are representative and accountable contribute to the strengthening of a democratic society.”  
(National Democratic Institute)

### 7 2 1 *Uninominales*

The question of whether IR2 should be continued in its present form is beyond the scope of this assessment. At present, DDCP is undertaking a program to answer this question, important parts of this effort have yet to be carried out.

The Team recommends that DDCP contact CEDLA, which at its own initiative is tracking the individual records of all elected representatives, the process of legislation, the public hearings set to begin this month, and other activities in the lower and upper houses. Discussions should focus on how DDCP can work with CEDLA to make this data a useful instrument in the advocacy campaigns of municipalities and CSOs and in DDCP's assessment of future activities with the *uninominal* deputies.

What has become clear in our investigations is that *uninominal* congressmen are not semi-independent from their political parties or their congressional environment. In fact, they are very much subservient to these. CEDLA characterizes them as *diputados de segunda*.

Another conclusion is that the *uninominales* and their constituents have so little experience with joint consultation and the idea of representation that there is no adequate way for each to judge which one is keeping its side of the bargain. While a DDCP survey (Feb 1999) quotes *uninominales* as saying that they maintain a working relationship with municipalities, only a few of the municipalities interpreted this relationship as a working one.

### 7 2 2 Political Parties

The *Encuesta sobre Democracia y Valores Democraticos* (Corte Nacional Electoral, 1999) showed political parties and congress at the bottom of all public opinion polls. In addition, Culver and Ferrufino, in their study "Los Diputados Uninominales", took the political parties to serious task, which provoked Hugo Carvajal, president of the lower house, to acknowledge in his response many of the problems raised in the study, but also to question whether certain interpretations went to an illogical extreme. Carvajal and others pointed to overwhelming support for the five principal parties at election time in addition to the steps parties are taking to democratize their structures.

Some parties are moving toward reforming their autocratic structures. There are elements in all parties who are thinking seriously about genuine programs, as the MNR is doing under its Chief, Gonzalo de Lozado. **Thus, if at present there is no democratic substitute for political parties, and these parties are showing some signs of wanting to change, then an effort to assist and to speed up party reforms using outside experts and/or contacts with other parties with similar experience should be seriously considered.**

This is all the more important in light of the challenge Bolivia and other Latin American governments are facing. "*En contra de lo que piensa mucha gente, la importancia de los partidos es mayor que la que tenia antes. Tienen ahora la responsabilidad de dirigir un*

*nuevo Estado, mucho mas complejo que el anterior, en un escenario de reorganizacion territorial y de fragmentacion social interna, a la cual se debe anadir un marco internacional extremadamente competitivo y exigente” (Gustavo Fernandez Saavedra “Sistema de Partidos y Agenda de Gobernabilidad”, 1997)*

### Recommendations

The Team recommends that USAID (1) continue to support the CIDEM's Fortalecimiento de Liderazgos Femininos para el Ejercicio de los Derechos Politicos y Ciudadanos Project on the condition that it improve classroom presentations and materials, (2) include in an IR-4 a component for advocacy at the political party and congressional levels, and (3) finance and/or help leverage funds for a significant training effort for younger politicians – especially those from the poorer areas of the country – in political party reform practices within Bolivia

### CIDEM

The CIDEM project is fulfilling a training need for women party leaders to better understand the issues of globalization, governance, leadership, and advocacy with a focus on gender. The facilitators know their material and work hard at making the classes as participatory as possible. Experience has taught CIDEM that it must condense the amount of materials it presents and improve the effectiveness of its overheads. Yet, more needs to be done in this regard. There also seems to be a need for more facilitators, so that if one is not available, there is another to take her place.

The project will need a second phase for follow-up with the participants in their places of residence and more local training programs. CIDEM believes that a national convention of the 125 leaders to review their work and to craft a minimum platform on political matters relating to women is needed, USAID should seriously consider such a request. It should also require CIDEM to review the quality of presentations with short-term, outside expertise, and provide funding for CIDEM to meet with organizations from the core group of IR4. Core organizations can help CIDEM take a hard look at its program, based on their expert experience and knowledge.

### A Program for Political Parties

Bolivian political parties can become more open to, and interrelated with, larger sections of the population by looking at the experiences of other political parties, analyzing the obstacles to better communication and understanding, making their programs more relevant to the needs of people, especially the more micro-economic needs, and permitting local selection of party candidates by the membership instead of by imposition of the local or regional party chief.

A Bolivia-centered training program, set up and administered by international and local trainers in consultation with parties, the Germans, and others, could be directed at younger political leaders of the parties that wish to enter the program. In order to insure selection of leaders from all of Bolivia, the program could require that 50% be from poorer urban and

rural areas. Effective political party change will open more avenues of participation and opportunity to the poorer areas of the country. Training 100 leaders per year for at least three to four years, along with regular follow-up activities, would create a cadre of political leaders implementing modified and new forms of political action and would give the parties a full-time presence and real interchange with local populations in non-election periods. Party leaders would grapple with the issues being discussed because of their involvement and participation in the selection of participants, course debates, evaluations, and use of this trained cadre for party purposes.

### **7.3 IR 3 – Civil Society and Municipal Governments – COPES, Citizenship Education and Comites de Vigilancia**

Because of the linkage between OTBs, Comites de Vigilancia, and municipal governments, the assessment team recommends that civil society strengthening activities within this local context remain under the auspices of IR 3 and the DDCP project. Of course, these efforts would be complemented by IR 4 activities, and should be managed and guided by the experiences and perspectives of those already working at this level.

#### ***7.3.1 Include Fast-Growing Urban Areas in DDCP***

For reasons explained in section 3.2, the team strongly recommends that DDCP take a serious look at working in El Alto with the new municipal government, if possible. The municipality requires a total overhaul of its planning, administrative and auditing system. Gregoria Apaza and the other NGOs can help the DDCP project reach the OTBs and the active functional organizations working on community improvement and economic development projects.

Besides establishing administrative order and financial transparency in the municipality, the newly-elected mayor and municipal council will have to focus on creating a more enabling atmosphere for the growth and establishment of businesses and other economic activities in El Alto. High poverty rates must be reduced in order to interest citizens in the political system and in popular participation. In addition, the tremendous local capacity for generating self-employment business opportunities should be aggressively supported. An increased income encourages formal education at higher levels and for longer periods, provides resources to take vocational education courses, enables improvement in housing facilities by individual owners, reduces family stress and the possibility of marital break-ups, and instills a greater sense of community purpose on the part of citizens. Producing employment opportunities is a must for EL Alto's youth population (50%).

Many economic opportunities could be created if there were an aggressive municipal policy in favor of creating better structures for economic growth. *“Ademas es absolutamente necesario consolidar la propuesta que El Alto sea la primera ciudad industrial del pais y se puede convertir en una maquina exportadora. Sin que el gobierno municipal haya dado normas de atraccion de capitales, el capital privado ha llegado a El Alto”* (Consejal Teofilo Choque, Foro Urbano, Nov 1998)

During our conversations, many informed sources described the planning process being carried out under Father Sebastian Obermeyer for El Alto's Municipal Development Plan as constituting merely "social charity", rather than growth and development. The sources emphasized that the improvement of basic municipal structures in the poorest neighborhoods lacked an aggressive economic component. They also cautioned that public works projects, to be successful, require decisive community involvement. The "social charity" approach only makes El Alto more attractive to rural and mining families as a migration destination, especially at a time when mineral prices are low and mining cooperatives, which employ between 30,000 and 50,000 members, are not accessing credit and technical assistance from any significant source. In an environment scarce in resources, access to better living conditions requires significant involvement and investment by the community itself.

An urban-based strategy for the DDCP project must take into consideration the lack of economic opportunities in medium-sized towns in Altiplano provinces (La Paz, Oruro, and Potosí). If these areas can expand their economies, some of the migration pressure can be taken off El Alto and Santa Cruz.

### *7.3.2 Mancomunidades*

This mechanism is rapidly developing as a major framework of municipal cooperation in order to achieve collaborative goals. The obvious problem is that there is no civil society counterpart to the *mancomunidad* process. USAID must assure that its civil society strengthening component helps to either strengthen existing CSOs and NGOs to work with these new entities, or to create new parallel structures (such as a federation of *comites de vigilancia*) to ensure the inclusion of civil society in the decisions and processes occurring at this supra-municipal level. NGOs and NGO networks could be trained to work better at the regional level, forming loose networks according to the particular *mancomunidad* in which they carry out their operations. Where solidified, the *mancomunidad* itself could provide a mechanism through which citizenship education and some civil society strengthening could be carried out.

### *7.3.3 COPES and Citizenship Education*

DDCP has been developing and working with the concept of COPES, a sub-committee of the Comité de Vigilancia, which would both incorporate the non-territorial functional groups from civil society as well as create a mechanism to carry out more citizenship education activities. Such activities are extremely important at the local level. However, caution should be given to emphasizing only the theoretical or conceptual aspects of citizen education – in the real world people learn values by doing and interacting with one another. Ample opportunity should be made for these kinds of citizenship development activities. In addition, any future program of citizenship education in an IR 4 should draw heavily from the experience of these DDCP efforts.

## **7.4 Cross-Cutting Strategies for other S O s – Health and Environment**

DEMOSOT's SOs and programs are integrally related to other areas of USAID action and vice-a-versa. For example, health and environmental service-delivery NGOs must participate in the policy consideration of national budgets, municipal development plans, areas of emphasis (more hospitals or primary care), interest and form of public institutions in working with NGOs, and the very difficult task to get government, CSOs, and the population to focus on the implementation of newer laws.

The new forestry legislation gives civil society a role in overseeing the use and misuse of natural resources. Unfortunately, there have been very few instances in which CSOs have taken advantage of this new power. This is then an argument in favor of an IR 4 which will encourage and build skills in accountability and advocacy. An IR 4 also opens up a new avenue of support to BOFOR, which could train CSOs in the technical aspects of ensuring accountability in forestry management.

USAID-assisted NGOs, such as PROCOSI and LIDEMA, do have limited experience in advocacy. LIDEMA helped write the Environmental Law and lobbied in support of it. It is working with its 28 affiliates to change the culture of automatic criticism towards any government initiative to one of proposing feasible alternatives and supporting good initiatives, no matter where they come from. This is the case today with the questions of water and biodiversity.

An IR 4, plus programs to encourage more issue-oriented political parties, better quality uninominales and the greater involvement of women in politics (IR 2), will provide capacity building and advocacy support to all interested CSOs presently supported by USAID. These, in turn, will channel an improved organizational capacity and knowledge of advocacy toward the solution of practical problems affecting the population's quality of life. Advocacy is most effective, and gathers the most support, when it is directed at a closely-felt need of those involved.

## 7.5 Strategies for Addressing Other Sectors – The Media

### 7.5.1 "Playing the Media"

One of the most frequent conclusions from our observations is that very, very few NGOs have a sense of the difference between "playing the media" and public relations. Public relations constitutes trying to get an institutional message out to the media as the institution sees it. Often the message is not of interest to the media, and then the NGO is required to place a "campo pagado." The problem is that paid announcements are expensive and tend to be a one-shot deal, plus CSOs do not have a big budget for publicity. Also, how many readers or listeners really pay attention to paid announcements? Very few!

Of all the NGOs, CEDLA is the most effective with the media by far. Why? First, it has reliable information on economic, employment and business themes, and most importantly, it knows how to give the information to the press in a form which is easily transferable to their format. CEDLA knows that a reporter will not spend time in its library looking for information as one leading NGO suggested to the press, so it makes sure that it has a ready

quantity of good information on hand when a reporter calls. In its field it is always ready to help a story. So when a newspaper needs filler, there is always CEDLA to fall back on. This is "playing the media".

Also, there is another beneficial result from getting one's information and opinion out in the media on a continual basis. CEDLA believes that the economic data show a clear picture of disconnect and discrimination between macro-economic policies and the financial and employment necessities of the worker and small business owner. Therefore, when CEDLA is invited to give information and opinions, it continually asks the reader or listener to evaluate the effects of public policy on the little guy.

In conclusion, CSOs will need to rethink their relationships with the media and take the time to learn the media's needs and ways of operation. In this way they will become a continual source of news and public interest stories. The media can play a key role with CEDLA and consultants in teaching these skills to NGOs.

Preparing a web page which is media friendly (i.e., shows them what information is available and from whom to get information quickly) could be important if the NGOs would regularly update its contents and keep reminding the media of its instant access qualities. Reporters could be asked to e-mail questions that they will need answered in the near future. NGOs can now send clear verbal reports through the Internet.

#### *7.5.2 More Efficient Use of Radio*

Because of USAID's emphasis on reaching poorer rural areas and women, the team selected radio as its target from the media to investigate. The findings: neither NGOs, popular organizations, or DDCP/USAID have seriously tried to take advantage of the multiple opportunities which radio allows for getting development and participation-oriented messages to the public in a systematic form.

Bolivia has the ERBOL radio network of 40 radio stations (regional and local) whose twin purposes are building democracy and stimulating development in cultural, social, economic and political terms. ERBOL also feeds programs to the very powerful Radio FIDES which has repeaters and affiliates throughout the country (see map). Various of ERBOL's affiliates integrate radio communications into larger efforts of training, organizing and development projects such as ACLO in Potosí and the IRFA-CRUZ in the Santa Cruz countryside. ERBOL points out that while good communications are important, a media strategy is only one component of a successful development strategy.

The map lists the functions ERBOL performs for members. Some of these are production of cultural and educational programs, news and important information concerning the nation and international affairs, institutional strengthening and preparation of human resources of affiliates, and coordination of a communications strategy among affiliates based on its two objectives and the values of the Catholic Church.

DDCP is just beginning to use the ERBOL system for educational purposes and needs to ask itself the following questions about this effort: Is it a large enough effect to make it

worthwhile (the importance of repetition)? Is its emphasis too technical? Does it use drama? Is that drama at a level which captures the listeners' attention and makes them want to tune in next time, as we did in the 1950s with "Johnny Dollar, Insurance Investigator"?

The Team recommends that DDCP, USAID and NGOs begin a series of conversations with ERBOL on the radio and its public reach and how both sides can work together to further each other's goals. ERBOL indicated to the Team Leader a willingness to explore greater coordination with DDCP, USAID and NGOs.

### *7.5.3 The Role of USIS in DDCP/USAID Programs*

Recent events, as in the small case of the Luis RICO CD, have shown that the programs of DDCP/USAID can be furthered by closer coordination between USIS and DDCP/USAID. If this cooperation was at a more strategic level than seems to be the case today, USAID could use the expertise of USIS and, in many cases, the sources which USIS can draw on to insure a more complete communications component in its programs.

Successful businesses quickly learn that it is not always how many direct customers they personally know that is most important. Often the key is knowing who can open access for the business to these potential customers. For example, in the case of the Luis RICO CD, which promotes democratic ideals and practices through Bolivian rhythms, perhaps it would be possible to interest stores in marketing the CD at cost (plus a small mark-up for the store) so as to stimulate the public to buy it and thus to ensure the recuperation of funds for continued production of the CD. This would require the assistance and understanding of music industry executives, especially Miguel Dueri of Discolandia. USIS deals with Dueri on a regular basis and could set the stage for this promotion effort towards, not the public, but the people who select what goes to the public and who create the atmosphere which influences what people want to buy.

## *8 Recommendations to USAID DEMOSOT Civil Society Strengthening Strategies and an IR 4*

After reviewing the findings, the assessment team recommends that USAID Bolivia add an additional Intermediate Results Package (IR) in order to achieve more effectively DEMOSOT's Strategic Objective, "increased citizen support for the Bolivian democratic system", as indicated by the accompanying sets of indicators. The current conditions in Bolivia demand a much higher involvement of civil society with the state at all levels. Therefore, the additional IR would be dedicated to the strengthening of civil society organizations so as to improve their ability to engage the state and the private sector constructively, as well as to enhance their ability to act as intermediaries between society, political parties and the state.

The Results Package might be formulated as follows:

- CSOs Effectively Mediate Between Citizens and the State
- CSOs Effectively Lobby Local, Regional and National Public Institutions, Political Parties, and International Financial Institutions

- CSOs Effectively Promote Collaboration Between Municipal Governments, Citizens Organizations and the Private Sector to Achieve Developmental Goals

There are three primary reasons for expanding USAID's programs with civil society. First, democratic development of the state will not occur in the absence of deep and sustained interaction with civil society (See Fisher 1998, Putnam 1993). While there does exist a vibrant associational life in Bolivia (See Seligson 1998), recent restructuring of the state and the economy have created a vacuum between the state and civil society. Traditional actors, such as the unions, no longer play the key role as intermediaries. Political parties, while improving their degrees of representativeness, do not serve to aggregate the interests of the majority of society and mediate conflicting interests. A major effort must be made to re-articulate civil society with new state and political structures. In order for this to happen, civil society organizations must have both sufficient capacity and a certain degree of autonomy.

Second, given the new opportunities for participation and involvement by civil society created by the reduction in the scope of the state, decentralization and other policy reforms, the limiting factor explaining the exclusion of a large part of Bolivian society is the NGOs' own lack of capacity to more effectively take advantage of these opportunities<sup>3</sup>. In order to prevent the increasing disenchantment of civil society with the political system, on the one hand, and the misuse of power by the state and private sectors, on the other, it is essential that civil society organizations and citizens have the capacity to constructively engage the state, to assume the new roles and responsibilities granted them under the law, and to assist in the development of a more democratic culture.

Third, as identified in the previous assessment by Development Associates, one of the main challenges facing Bolivia is that "neither public officials nor private interests consistently observe the rules which have been formally adopted" (DA 1997), and the nation faces the necessity of

"building the necessary institutional capacity to meet the requirements of the modern state. But, such a challenge, while important, is *secondary to assuring the incorporation of new actors, the development of civic values, and the firm establishment of the rule of law*" (Development Associates 1997: 44)

Citizens will continue to lose faith in the democratic system unless they perceive that public officials and the private sector play by the rules. Besides working for an improvement in the justice system, civil society organizations can play an important role in helping to see that rules are enforced, thereby leveling the playing field between excluded and included groups. USAID can complement its current efforts at rule enforcement in the administration of justice through a concerted strengthening of civil society groups to generate and disseminate information, pressure public and private officials, raise citizen awareness and organize coalitions.

---

<sup>3</sup> This was a consistent and verifiable argument presented by almost all parties interviewed, and could be seen as the major theme underlying this assessment.

There is evidence which suggests that, in many cases, sustained effort by NGOs to negotiate, mediate, and provide technical assistance to citizen groups as they interact with local or national governments can have a major impact, not only on producing favorable outcomes for these groups, but at the same time on helping to transform and develop a more democratic political culture of consensus, respect and tolerance. Supporting key NGOs which can do this may contribute more to the development of democratic culture than traditional citizenship education (Fisher 1998, Betancourt 1999)

While many other donors, including USAID, are actively strengthening the institutional (state) side of the equation, *much less is being done to strengthen civil society organizations, making this an important and timely strategic consideration* (Behrendt and Blair 1999). Under the IR 3 DDCP program, investments were made in the form of grants to NGOs and CSOs (the FAP program), but this was not an explicit attempt to build capacity - it was more of an execution and implementation program. *If DEMOSOT's S O is to remain the same, it seems inconceivable that citizen support, and improvements in the measurable indicators which imply changes in political culture, will be achieved through merely continuing to focus on the institutional (supply) side of democratic development. This would appear to justify a large, long-term and systematic investment in strengthening civil society through capacity building, citizenship education, political training and direct interventions*

### **8.1 Theoretical Framework and Strategies for Strengthening Civil Society**

How can USAID best go about this process of strengthening civil society? What are the most appropriate kinds of interventions, given the context and situation in Bolivia? Some of the team's recommendations will be found in section 8, addressing how civil society strengthening might be incorporated into existing IR's 1,2 and 3

Potential Strategies For Achieving IR 4 –

#### **A Regional Capacity Building Network**

USAID should facilitate the creation of a decentralized network of regional capacity building institutions around Bolivia, and provide on-going support. These institutions would have the responsibility to work together to provide services in the areas of capacity building, training, research, publications, technical assistance and consultancy, information management and resource mobilization to NGOs, CSOs, GROs, OTBs, CVs and even municipal governments and private sector associations in their region<sup>4</sup>. These centers of learning could also help to disseminate and replicate the efforts of other AID programs, such as the DDCP project, and should be aware of and closely linked to efforts at strengthening municipal governments. They should include public and private universities, NGOs, and private sector organizations. The program should also contemplate formal

---

<sup>4</sup> In the Philippines a similar set of capacity building institutions was developed as part of the decentralization and democratic development process there – which USAID has supported quite substantially. See the GOLDE project, and "Breaking Ground Model for Capability Building of LGU and NGO/PO in Local Governance" (1994) PBSP, Philippines

academic programs for the development of human resources in the non-profit and public sectors

It is important to have a regional focus, given the diversity in Bolivia and the need to respond to different conditions in different ways in each area. This network of capacity building providers could receive funds from USAID, other international donors, and the government. In this way, USAID could use its funds to leverage additional funding from other sources, and create sustainable long-term capacity.

#### *A Coalition of Democracy Promoting, Advocacy Orientated NGOs*

USAID should also promote the creation of an NGO network dedicated to democratic development and citizen participation. Akin to other such existing networks as PROCOSI, which focuses on health, or LIDEMA, which focuses on the environment, an NGO network focusing on democratic development would allow for the exchange of information and best practices, and holding conferences and seminars for dialogue. However, *their primary mandate would be to serve as a coalition for advocacy efforts with the state and with political parties*. While both AIFE and UNITAS claim to be focused on promoting a democratic society, UNITAS in particular has a mission more directly related to advocacy for democracy. Both are in need of strengthening and re-orienting, to be able to take on the tasks mentioned above. Small grants should be made available to fund specific campaigns and activities of the coalition.

#### *Leadership of a Concerted Effort at Donor Coordination for Civil Society Strengthening*

USAID should attempt to bring the civil society question to a prominent position with other donors, through the consultative process already in place and through hosting seminars and dialogues on this issue with donors, government, and civil society organizations. In this way, support for the regional network and other initiatives might be obtained. It would appear that a number of donors are already moving in the direction of additional support for civil society organizations, but are unsure of their own strategies and approaches (e.g. the Dutch, and the World Bank).

#### *Working To Support And Strengthen Government Initiatives For Civil Society Strengthening*

Limited support should be given to share information and provide training to the government agencies responsible for civil society strengthening, especially the Vice Ministry for Popular Participation's Community Strengthening program (VMPP), which focuses on OTB's and CV's. This should be done in the context of leveraging support from the World Bank's \$69M PDCR2 program, which is administered by the GOB and is currently beginning. It aims to channel funds directly to OTBs for project implementation. This program also has funds for the support of regional training centers (see above).

### *8.2 Essential Principles for Successful Capacity Building*

Strengthening civil society through capacity building demands a certain attention to conceptual frameworks derived from past experiences both in Bolivia and elsewhere. Training, technical assistance and direct funding have often produced very little impact on increasing the capacity of CSOs. This is most usually due to the following reasons:

- Individual training courses are offered in a piecemeal, fragmented manner, to many different groups, with little coordination or concentration
- Training is often offered in isolation, with little follow up, technical assistance or support in applying new concepts and skills
- An individual, rather than an institutional/organizational focus, is employed
- Donors fail to work with local partners and build sustainable in-country capacity building capability
- A strategic vision is lacking of what capacities really need to be developed and how this can be done
- A system of is lacking of regular assessment to track and measure impacts and make adjustments
- Specialized educational and training institutions, such as universities, are under-utilized, and there is a failure to link capacity building to formal accreditation
- High turnover within client organizations is common

In order to address these issues and to overcome these obstacles, the following principles are recommended as guidelines for capacity building and civil society strengthening strategies

**a) A Clear Conceptual Framework for Capacity Building**

It is essential that there be a clear understanding of what capacity building actually entails, and comprehension of learning and change processes. Capacities must be based upon a clear understanding of the roles which the individuals or organizations are expected to play. Each capacity should be seen as having four central components: knowledge, skills, attitudes, and qualities. Most programs focus only on the knowledge and skills, and forget the essential importance of transforming and creating the necessary attitudes and qualities needed to actually apply new knowledge or skills in practice.

**b) A Long-Term and Systematic Approach.**

Almost all the persons interviewed commented that Bolivia does indeed have a plethora of training activities available – but that these efforts are often uncoordinated, fragmented, and not part of a coherent program, and therefore they lead to very few measurable results. Any USAID supported program should consider making a serious investment over time, support a limited number of intermediate organizations over a sustained period, and provide follow-up and support activities as well as training. Of course, these activities should be developed over time on the basis of smaller pilot programs.

**c) Working Through Local Partners for Sustainability**

Local partners provide an existing institutional base to support local knowledge and access, and a better chance of long-term sustainability. This is not to imply that start-up

activities, training, technical support and other inputs are not needed to first strengthen the capacity of these partners

**d) Combining Capacity Building with Assessment and Evaluation**

It is essential that capacity building efforts be measurable. A system of self-assessments and external review should be an integral part of capacity building efforts, to provide goals and incentives and to validate functioning strategies

**e) An Approach Emphasizing Learning and Exchange**

The capacity building approach should provide ample opportunities for learning and exchange among participants, through networking, information sharing, and building upon the skills and strong suits of different organizations

**f) An Appropriate Concern for the Cultural Context**

Efforts to build capacity should emphasize the context, roles and needs. It should also seek to build upon existing cultural strengths, especially in the case of indigenous organizations and grassroots groups

**8.3 Primary Partners and In-Country Intermediaries with Capacity Building Potential**

Our review indicates the importance of noting that there are a number of institutions and organizations with tested experience and potential to serve as instruments and agents of a larger capacity building process. These national organizations and their experiences should not be overlooked, as this can result in higher costs, less efficiency, and a lack of sustainability. Rather, several of the most successful strategies and methodologies for capacity building currently being utilized should be researched, and then supported or adapted as needed.

This approach has two advantages. One is that working with partners will help to develop and improve the long-term capacity of these organizations to contribute to capacity building in a more sustainable way in the future. Secondly, it takes advantage of local experience and knowledge to be more effective in implementing programs.

**The special role of institutions of higher education**

It is important to mention that in the past the primary capacity building institutions in society – universities – have been overlooked. This has been due to the fact that most public universities have been overly political, inefficient, corrupt and low in quality. However, it is important to note that Bolivia currently has a number of well-managed, well-respected private universities, and certain institutes and centers within several of the public universities which are capable of contributing significantly to long term capacity building and research efforts.

Institutions with potential as partners or providers of capacity building services –

- **Universidad Nur** A private university recognized nationally and internationally for the excellence of its programs, Nur has been dedicated to development and capacity building since its inception. In addition to academic programs which promote a focus on development, including the only nationally certified program in municipal governance for municipal government staff, Nur also provided a one-year NGO strengthening program through USAID/PROCOSI in 1993-1994, as well as providing this kind of training to voluntary and private sector organizations on demand. It has an internationally recognized Center for Participatory Methods (DPID), which has carried out numerous programs and projects for strengthening grassroots organizations (with CARE and the World Bank), and for enhancing the capacity of NGOs and government agencies to work in a participatory fashion. This center regularly carries out training programs.

In addition, Nur has pioneered a transformative, distance education program, specifically designed to raise the capacity of local people and communities to engage effectively in development through participation and education. This program has been executed in Bolivia (with support from FIS) and Ecuador (with support from the World Bank), and its methodology could be expanded on a large scale to increase the capacity of local organizations and populations to engage with municipal governments. The Universidad Nur is currently discussing this possibility with various government agencies.

- **LIDEMA** (the national environmental defense league – made up of 37 NGOs) has developed and implemented a one-year capacity building program for NGOs that work in the environmental and other sectors, funded by the WWF. The program has built capacity in over 45 Bolivian NGOs over the last three years. LIDEMA has developed materials and has access to trainers, but lacks a system of evaluating and assessing the capacity of NGOs as they go through the process. It should be noted that LIDEMA was able to carry out the program for a total cost of around \$250,000.
- **IFRA** (Radio Santa Cruz, a member of ERBOL) has a long-standing radio-based distance education program that covers the entire Santa Cruz department, in both urban and rural areas. Besides literacy programs and functional post-literacy programs, it has done education concerning the various new laws (LPP, INRA), and believes that much more could be done in terms of legal education (LPP, Penal Code Procedures etc.) through its system, but LIDEMA lacks the necessary resources. Bilingual programs and materials are provided.
- **PROCESO** is a medium-sized NGO that has an established history in working with capacity building and education programs in several indigenous areas, using some excellent strategies and methodologies. It has also worked with youth groups and women in political education in urban Santa Cruz. PROCESO could provide the expertise for getting into schools and urban areas. Bilingual programs and materials are provided.

- **Other Universities** – The Universidad Mayor San Simon in Cochabamba has offered numerous courses and masters programs related to governance, management of NGOs and other useful development-related topics. Likewise, the Universidad Mayor San Andres and the Catholic University in La Paz have programs, staff, materials and facilities which offer some major potential for collaboration in capacity building efforts – but are more focused on masters-level education (re program of FLACSO)
- **Fundacion Qullana** (See the case study above in Section 7) This organization, although relatively young and small, has great potential to reach large numbers of indigenous people with formal, long-term and systematic training programs, including political training. These types of programs should be carefully considered as part of the menu of activities for the strengthening of civil society
- **AIPE, UNITAS, PROCOSI, and Coordinadora de la Mujer** All of these major NGO networks have the capability to help promote, coordinate and assess the needs of their member organizations for capacity building efforts, and should be included in the capacity building networks for these reasons. The relative advantages of each network should be sought out and utilized
- **International NGO/PVOs** Large international NGOs should also be considered as initial partners in the capacity building network, particularly during the pilot stages of its development. For example, CRS has worked with capacity building in the past and currently has a strong proposal for strengthening the advocacy capacity of selected NGOs in development. Such a proposal could provide a starting point and pilot program for capacity building in the area of advocacy. Groups such as World Learning, or PACT International, which specialize in capacity building for civil society, should also be considered

#### **8.4 Primary Clients for Capacity Building**

##### ***Non-Governmental Organizations***

- It is extremely important for NGOs to be able to assume new roles and responsibilities within the new democratic and decentralized framework. The new roles which these organizations must play are primarily
  - to act as mediators between the state and civil society at all levels,
  - to advocate for the enforcement of existing laws, or for changes in them, if necessary,
  - to conduct citizenship education programs,
  - to support popular organizations so that they can participate effectively within new institutional frameworks,
  - to facilitate communication and consensus building concerning development priorities and processes

These new roles for NGOs will require them to expand beyond the types of service delivery activities they have previously carried out

- Essential capacities for these roles would include the abilities to
  - create consensus and to build coalitions at the local level,
  - advocate at the local, national and political-party levels,
  - perform public policy analysis,
  - strengthen linkages between community groups and leadership,
  - effectively facilitate the participatory planning process at the local level,
  - provide political training,
  - establish networks,
  - channel information between civil society organizations and community-based organizations
  
- In order to carry out these activities, long-term organizational development is called for (i.e. in organizational and financial management, resource mobilization, strategic thinking, monitoring and evaluation, etc)

### *Indigenous Organizations*

- These organizations need to be able to represent the special interests and needs of their constituents, both within the political process, and in the public administration and development process. They can serve as mediators between local indigenous civil organizations and the state
  
- In order to do this, capacity building in representation, political participation, consensus and coalition building, negotiation, and engagement with local and national governments, as well as general organizational development, is needed. Special focus should be given to development of transparent relationships with the bases and moral leadership development

### The Media

- The media have been consistently perceived as among the most trusted institutions in Bolivian society. Regardless of the problems and difficulties, freedom of press is established, and the media sector has become one of the main watchdogs on the government, and a major channel which mediates between state and society
  
- Capacity building is needed in the areas of
  - specialization of roles,
  - development of expertise to report on democratic processes in a way which strengthens them,
  - provision of timely and useful information to civil society organizations (such as on the voting patterns in congress etc ),
  - understanding the laws and aiding in their effective dissemination,
  - focusing more on the local level
  
- Attitudes of confrontation also must be overcome so that the media do not just criticize the state and thereby contribute to lowering public confidence in the state's capacity

- Promotion of fora in which discussions concerning the role of the media in democracy should accompany capacity building efforts

#### Women and Women's Organizations

- Given that parties must have 30% participation of women, there is a huge need for political education and training for women, as well as a strategic opportunity to work with political parties
- Other needed types of capacity building would involve programs similar to those recommended above for the OTB and CBO groups

#### The Private Sector and its Associations

- Training should be provided to private sector companies and associations, to help them think about their role in democratic development and basically to sensitize them to the potential benefits of the democratic system for business. Obviously these groups often oppose democracy and inclusion of less powerful groups – so there is a need to facilitate their seeing the potential benefits of change and inclusion, as well as to learn to follow and utilize the new legal environment

#### Organizaciones Territoriales de Base (OTBs) and other Community-Based Organizations

- Local popular organizations need to become more actively involved as key actors in the local development process through accessing the opportunities inherent in the LPP. Both organizational capacities and individual skills are needed. Essential requirements are the abilities to
  - identify and represent community member interests,
  - participate actively in, and negotiate with, municipal governments, in areas including fiscal control and development planning,
  - build coalitions with other local and national organizations,
  - in some cases (re PDCR2) design and implement small-scale development projects
- It is also extremely important for these organizations to receive political training in how to deal with parties, to understand the importance of collaboration versus conflict, to go beyond shopping lists of demands on the state to strategic understandings of development and to income-generating strategies, and to perceive their role as one based on collaboration and problem-solving as actors and not as subjects
- Special attention should be paid to the *Juntas Vecinales*. As mentioned above, there is a need to focus on civil society development in urban areas. Providing special training and support to the *Juntas Vecinales* (and the possible federations of JVs by district) should be considered. Working with other kinds of associations, such as the *gremiales*, should also be part of the urban strategy

### Comites de Vigilancia

- These organizations need to develop capacities specific to their function of overseeing municipal operations. They need to be able to communicate and represent the interests of their districts, and gain the capacity to understand strategic directions for local development.

## 8.5 Methodologies and Mechanisms

The regional network proposed above could use a variety of methodologies and mechanisms to provide Bolivia's NGOs with training, follow-up, technical assistance and support.

### A two-year NGO-strengthening program

This would be a systematic program of assessment, training and technical assistance based on the identified needs of NGOs in a particular area. It would be a modular program, utilizing 3-day workshops, distance education techniques employing the Internet, a series of guided practical applications, yearly self-assessments and benchmarking of capacity development, and the provision of technical assistance. These elements are detailed below.

- **Needs Assessment.** A needs assessment would be done with selected core NGOs, identified based on certain entry criteria, and on their willingness to make a signed commitment to continue in the program. Baseline assessment data would be utilized in shaping the program and setting goals.
- **Training Workshops.** These would be 3-5 day workshops at which several members of each institution would be selected to attend on a rotating basis. The workshops would be given at the facilities of the providing institution or in other rented facilities. A core group of trainers of the member organizations of the regional network would first be identified and trained.
- **Distance Education Support.** The Internet could be used to provide information, have virtual discussions with participating members, and to exchange drafts of written documents.
- **Practical Applications and Support Groups.** The program could demand that participants return to their organizations and immediately apply new concepts and skills to some practical problem within or external to the organization. These applications would be carried out with the aid of learning groups formed to utilize the experiences of national and international organizations.
- **Self-Assessments and Evaluations.** Each participating NGO could be asked to self-identify desired and current competency areas, and then make assessments of its capacity, based upon these criteria, to use as a yearly benchmarking system to measure progress and needs. Such assessments from various

participating NGOs could be sued to see how their collective capacity to carry out various tasks is advancing

- **Technical Assistance** Specialists could provide consultative services to address specific problems and needs of participating NGOs

#### Specialized Training

This would involve the provision of special courses based on specific and current needs

#### Consultation and Technical Assistance

The proposed regional network would have the capacity to provide specialists in various areas to assist NGOs with organizational problems, and with program content in such areas as advocacy programs and educational curriculum development

#### Conferences and Seminars

The network could be responsible for hosting conferences and seminars at which NGOs and CSOs could share experiences and help to shape future agendas

#### Publications

The network could publish support materials and research findings, to aid NGOs and CSOs in improving their democratic development activities and in providing support to other organizations

#### Research

The network would be responsible for collaborating with other institutions in carrying out needed research in these fields. The NGOs could access other available forms of external funding in order to help finance such research

### **8.6 Priority Content Areas**

Based on the review of the strengths and weaknesses of Bolivian NGOs and other CSOs, some of the priority areas in which capacity building is needed are

- Various areas related to advocacy – such as goal definition and clarification, the gathering and dissemination of information, the identification of strategic partners and allies, the development of strategies for action, and the mobilizing of support,
- The capacity to create and maintain coalitions,
- Moral leadership (Service and Values-Based Leadership)
- Utilization and training of the media
- Networking
- Negotiation and mediation skills
- Public policy analysis
- Political training and legal education
- Citizenship education
- Organizational and financial management
- Enforcement of laws and accountability of the state

- Strengthening grassroots and mass relationships
- Use of information technology

### **8.7 Developing a Democratic Political Culture and Conducting Citizenship Education**

This topic deserves some treatment under a separate heading. In addition to the capacity building programs for NGOs, an IR 4 should contemplate additional efforts to either work directly in the creation of a democratic culture, or do so through capacity building efforts with other organizations. Developing a democratic culture implies strengthening such values as tolerance, respect, and the concept of unity in diversity. Some of these values do exist at the community level in Bolivia, especially with indigenous peoples, and as such these pre-existing values should be seen as a basis from which to build. NGOs and other organizations can help to develop programs of citizenship education in the short term – but in the long run such programs must be integrated into and adapted by the formal education sector.

More important is the issue of how to implant the concept of citizenship in a society where it has never really existed. There is an urgent need to develop the concept of the complementary and shared roles which must be played by the state, civil society and the private sector for democracy to work and for development to occur. Programs which provide citizens, local governments, and private sector organizations with opportunities to work together and develop the skills and the values needed for the emergence of such a consciousness must be identified and supported (See the case of CEDETI for one such experience).

## **9 Conclusions**

The recommendations of the Assessment Team are summarized below.

### ***Recommendation #1 A Regional Capacity Building Network***

USAID should facilitate the creation of a decentralized network of regional capacity building institutions around Bolivia, and provide on-going support. These institutions would have the responsibility to work together to provide capacity building, training, research, publications, technical assistance and consultancy, information management and resource mobilization to NGOs, CSOs, GROs, OTBs, CVs and even municipal governments and private sector associations in their regions. These centers of learning could also help to disseminate and replicate the efforts of other AID programs, such as the DDCP project, and should be aware of, and closely linked to, efforts at strengthening municipal governments. They should include public and private universities, NGOs, and private sector organizations.

It is important to have a regional focus, given the levels of diversity existent in Bolivia and the need to respond to different conditions in different ways in each area. This network of capacity building providers could receive funds from USAID, other international donors, and the government. In this way, USAID could use its funds to leverage additional funding from other sources, and create sustainable long-term capacity.

*Recommendation #2 Promote the Creation of A Coalition of Democracy Promoting, Advocacy Orientated NGOs*

USAID should facilitate the creation of an NGO network dedicated to democratic development and citizen participation. Akin to other such existing networks as PROCOSI, which focuses on health, or LIDEMA, which focuses on the environment, an NGO network focusing on democratic development would allow for the exchange of information and best practices, through the holding of conferences and seminars to promote communication. However, *the network's primary mandate would be to serve as a coalition for advocacy efforts with the state and with political parties.* While both AIPE and UNITAS claim to be focused on promoting a democratic society, UNITAS in particular has a mission more directly related to this. Both are in need of strengthening and re-orienting to be able to take on the tasks mentioned above. Small grants should be made available to fund specific campaigns and activities of the coalition as may be appropriate.

*Recommendation #3 Leadership of a Concerted Effort at Donor Coordination for Civil Society Strengthening*

USAID should attempt to bring the civil society question to a prominent position with other donors, through the consultative process already in place and through hosting seminars and dialogues with donors, government and civil society organizations on this issue. In this way, support for the regional network and other initiatives might be obtained.

*Recommendation #4 Support And Strengthen Government Initiatives For Civil Society Strengthening*

Limited support should be given to the sharing of information with, and provision of training to, the government agencies responsible for civil society strengthening, especially the Vice Ministry for Popular Participation's Community Strengthening program (VMPP), which focuses on OTB's and CV's. This should be done in the context of leveraging support from the World Bank's \$69M PDCR2 program, currently beginning, which aims to channel funds directly to OTBs. This program also has funds for the support of regional training centers.

*Recommendation #5 Promote the Involvement of Civil Society Organizations in the Implementation of Criminal Code Procedures*

As soon as possible, USAID should commence its planned work with the *Colegios de Abogados* and related civil society organizations to build their capacity. Programs with the *Colegios* would assist them to build their capabilities in the following areas:

- The substance of the criminal procedure law. This program would include training, publications and information campaigns.
- The treatment of collateral issues implied by the reform, with emphasis on ethics. When lawyers have more responsibility for the conduct of investigations and trials, they must govern themselves appropriately.

*Recommendation #6 Promote political training of women and younger members of political parties, with special attention to poorer areas of the country*

This strategy would assist political parties to become more responsive to issues, more internally democratic, and more open to the participation of new (women) and younger members and to acceptance of their ideas. The Team recommends that USAID (1) continue to support the CIDEM's project on Fortalecimiento de Liderazgos Femininos para el Ejercicio de los Derechos Politicos y Ciudadanos, under the condition of improving classroom presentations and materials, (2) include in the proposed new IR-4 a component for advocacy at the political party and congressional levels, and (3) finance and/or help leverage funds for a significant training effort for younger politicians – especially those from the poorer areas of the country – in political party reform practices within Bolivia.

*Recommendation #7 Expand DDCP and Civil Society Support Programs to Include Fast-Growing Urban Areas Such as El Alto and Outer Rings of Santa Cruz*

Any viable approach to civil society and democratic development must contemplate these urban areas. Civil society strengthening activities should focus on developing the role of the *Juntas Vecinales*, strengthening their capacities and activities, and building higher levels of trust within these organizations. These organizations might be linked together by district, as a means for capacity building and exchange. At the same time, a means to link these territorial-based organizations together with functional organizations, such as *gremiales* and other informal sector economic associations, could be a means of developing a more vibrant and effective set of urban civil society actors.

*Recommendation #8 Promote the development of CSOs' capacity to utilize the media, especially radio, in the advancement of their democratic development work. Likewise, promote the development of capacity by the media to serve objectively as an intermediary between the state and civil society*

USAID should include in its capacity building efforts the key institutions of the Bolivian media. Working through universities to adapt and create additional curricula for communications majors, hosting conferences and events on ethics in the media, and supporting media associations could be included as part of this strategy.

**Recommendation #9: Promote the capacity of civil society organizations to advocate making open, transparent and competitive the decision-making processes of those development funds which use international financing**

The proposed new IR 4 should encourage CSOs interested in making these funds transparent, competitive and non-partisan to organize the appropriate advocacy campaign and lend political and moral support to it. There is a saying in Spanish that "he who pays for the party, chooses the music." USAID and the Embassy should give discreet assistance to civil society coalitions which seek to penetrate the perceptions and mind-set of the large international financial institutions which helped set up these funds.

To conclude, if DEMOSOT's S O remains the same, greater citizen support for the democratic system, and improvements in the measurable indicators which imply changes in political culture, cannot be achieved through merely continuing to focus on the institutional (supply) side of democratic development. This would appear to justify a large, long-term and systematic investment in strengthening civil society through capacity building, citizenship education, political training and other direct interventions.

- ACLO - Acción Cultural Loyola
- AIPE - Asociación de Instituciones de Promoción y Educación
- AMDECRUZ - Asociación de Municipios de Santa Cruz
- APCOB - Apoyo para el Campesino-Indígena del Oriente Boliviana
- CEDETI - Centro de Tecnología Intermedia
- CEDLA - Centro de Estudios para el Desarrollo Laboral y Agrario
- CEDEGRO - Centro de Desarrollo Agropecuario
- CERES - Centro de Estudios de la Realidad Económica y Social
- CEJIS - Centro de Estudios Jurídicos e Investigación Social
- CIDEM - Centro de Información y Desarrollo de la Mujer
- CIEC - Centro Interdisciplinario de Estudios comunitarios
- CIPCA - Centro de Investigación y Promoción del Campesino
- C P M G A - Centro de Promoción de la mujer Gregoria Apaza
- CRP - Centro de Reporteros Populares
- CRS - Catholic Relief Services - USCC Programa de Bolivia
- CSO – Civil Society Organization
- CV – Comité de Vigilancia
- DDCP – Desarrollo Democrático y Participación Ciudadano
- ERBOL - Educación Radiofónica de Bolivia
- ELFEC - Empresa de Luz y Fuerza Eléctrica Cochabamba S A
- FAP – Fondo de Apoyo a la Participación
- FDC – Fondo De Desarrollo Campesino
- FIS – Fondo de Inversión Social

FLACSO – Latin American Social Sciences Organization

FONAMA – Fondo Nacional para el Medio Ambiente

GRO – Grassroots Organizations

GRSOs- Grassroots Support Organizations

IFRA – Instituto Radiofónica Fe y Alegria

ILDIS - Instituto Latinoamericano de Investigaciones Sociales

INFORCO – Instituto de Formación de Mano de Obra y Capacitación

INIDEM – Instituto de Investigación y Desarrollo Municipal

LIDEMA – Liga de Defensa del Medio Ambiente

LPP – Ley de Participación Popular

MASRENA - Proyecto de Manejo Sostenible de los Recursos Naturales en Santa Cruz

OTB – Organización Territorial de Base

PROAS - Programa de Asesoramiento en Estrategias (PAED), Descentralización (PROADE) y Desarrollo Organizacional (PRO-D O )

PADER COSSUDE - Promoción al Desarrollo Económico Rural

PDCR2 – Proyecto de Inversión Rural Participativa (World Bank)

PLATINA - Instituto de Planificación

PROCESO – Servicios Educativos

PROCOSI – Programa de Coordinación en Salud Integral

REDESMA - Red de Desarrollo Sostenible y Medio Ambiente

SID - Estrategias para el Desarrollo Internacional (Strategies for International Development)

TIERRA - Taller de Iniciativas en Estudios Rurales y Reforma Agraria

UNITAS - Unión Nacional de Instituciones Para el Trabajo de Acción Social



## Annex B

### *Bibliography*

#### *Academic References*

- Clayton, Andrew 1996 *NGOs, Civil Society and the State Building Democracy in Transitional Societies* Oxford INTRAC
- \_\_\_\_\_ 1994 *Governance, Democracy and Conditionality What role for NGOs?* Oxford INTRAC
- Diamond, Larry (ed) 1994 *Political Culture and Democracy in Developing Countries* Boulder Lynne Rienner
- Fisher, Julie 1997 *Non-Governments NGOs and the Political Development of the Third World* West Hartford Kumarian Press
- Hann, Chris and Elizabeth Dunn 1996 *Civil Society Challenging Western Models* London Routledge
- Grindle, Merilee (ed) 1997 *Getting Good Government Capacity Building in the Public Sectors of Developing Countries* HHD, Cambridge, MA Harvard University Press
- Linz, Juan and Alfred Stepan 1996 *Problems of Democratic Transition and Consolidation* Baltimore Johns Hopkins University
- Putnam, Robert 1993 *Making Democracy Work Civic Traditions in Modern Italy* New Jersey Princeton Press
- Reilly, Charles 1995 "Public Policy and Citizenship " In Charles Reilly (ed ), *New Paths to Democratic Development in Latin America The Rise of NGO-Municipal Collaboration* (p 1-27), Boulder Lynn Rienner

#### *Primary Documents*

- Almaraz Ossio, Alejandro 1999 *Analisis Comparativo de la Propuesta de Modificacion del Reglamento de la Ley INRA* Elaborada por la Comision Tecnica de la CAN Areas de publicaciones CEJIS Santa Cruz -Bolivia
- Arias, Ivan 1999 *Municipio Productivo Promocion Economica Rural, Aprendiendo de la realidad municipal* PODER/COSUDE La Paz Bolivia
- Corte Nacional Electoral 1999 *Encuesta sobre Democracia y Valores Democraticos* La Paz, CNE

- Center for Democracy and Governance June 1999 *The Role of Media in Democracy a Strategic Approach* Washington, DC 20523-3100
- CEDLA 1998 Foro Urbano Ciudad del Alto "Por una ciudad para la vida, segura y equitativa" Mesa Redonda "Pensando la ciudad de El Alto" El Alto, Noviembre de 1998
- Carvajal Donoso, Hugo 1999 *Apuntes sobre la Democracia desde la Política* La Paz Bolivia
- CEDETI, Provincias Ichilo y Sara 1999 *Fortalecimiento de la Gestión Participativa Municipal con enfoque de Género* Santa Cruz -Bolivia Agosto de 1999
- CEDETI 1999 *Memoria Decenal 1988 -1999* Santa Cruz Bolivia
- Culver William W Y Ferrufino Alfonso 1997-99 Noche Parlamentaria "Los Diputados Uninominales", Un desafío a la democracia boliviana
- DDCP 1999 *Evaluación de Necesidades Nexos entre diputados uninominales, municipios y ciudadanía* La Paz
- DDCP 1999 *Plan de Trabajo 1999 Nexus Entre Diputados, uninominales, municipios y ciudadanía* La Paz
- DDCP 1999 *DDCP Fortaleciendo a los municipios un experiencia para replicar* La Paz
- DDCP 1998 *Segunda Autoevaluación Anual del Proyecto DDCP* La Paz DDCP
- Document Presented by the Government of Bolivia 1999 *Bolivia Towards the 21<sup>st</sup> Century, Progress report* 12<sup>th</sup> Consultive Group (Paris, June)
- Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, PNUD, Fundación Milenio *Agenda Nacional de Gobernabilidad Democrática* Edición bajo el cuidado de Carlos F Toranzo Roca, 1997
- Gabriela de Guzman y Luis Antonio Cabrerizo B *Diagnóstico Institucional de la red AIPE*
- INFORCO *Resumen Ejecutivo Estrategia de Desarrollo Municipal para El Alto*
- IRFA Radio Santa Cruz 1994 *Ifacruz Memoria '94* Santa Cruz - Bolivia
- PROCOSI *Memoria Institucional 1988 - 1998*
- Jutkowitz, Joel et al 1997 *Strategic Assessment of Bolivian Democracy* Wash, DC Development Associates

Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung Noche Parlamentaria "Proyecto de ley de Partidos Politicos"  
La Paz - Bolivia

LIDEMA Habitat "Experiencias Exitosas" La Paz - Bolivia Enero-Febrero de 1998 No  
50

Ley de Partidos Politicos 1999 Ley No 1983 de 25 de Junio de 1999

Mamani Lopez, Cancio Inkilkuna Cuatro Caminos o Metodos Movimiento Cultural  
Qullana La Paz-Chukiyawu Marka, 1998

NDI Reports, Fall 1999 *Emerging Democracies Forum*

Rojas Ortuste, Gonzalo 1995 *Democracia en Bolivia Hoy y Manana*, Enraizando la  
Democracia con las Experiencias de los Pueblos Indigenas CIPCA cuadernos de  
investigacion No 41 La Paz Bolivia

Republica de Bolivia 1999 *Nuevo Codigo de Procedimiento Penal* Ministerio de Justicia  
y Derechos Humanos, La Paz Bolivia

O'Neil, Kathleen et al 1998 "Social Capital in a Multi-Ethnic Society" Paper presented at  
the Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association

Orellana H Rene 1999 *Proteccion y Conservacion de la Biodiversidad, Analisis  
comparativo de normas vigentes y proyectadas, propuesta indigenas y acuerdos de  
negociacion* CEJIS

Presidencia, H Camara de Diputados 1999 *Proyecto de Ley de Asociaciones y  
Fundaciones* La Paz

UNITAS Pasado y Presente La Paz - Bolivia

Shannahan, Kelly 1999a Interviews with Diputados Uninominales DEMOSOT/USAID  
Bolivia

\_\_\_\_\_ 1999b *Project Evaluation of El Fondo de Apoyo a la Participacion*  
DDCP/USAID

Subsecretaria de Asuntos de Genero Proyecto de Formacion Politica y Ciudadana de la  
Coordinadora de la Mujer Fundacion La Paz 1997 Modulos de Capacitacion  
Politica Para Mujeres Lideres

Seligson, Mitchell 1998 *The Political Culture of Democracy in Bolivia* 1998 La Paz  
USAID

Ticona Rojas, Albo 1995 *Votos y Wiphalas, Campesinos y pueblos Originarios en  
Democracia* CIPCA cuadernos de investigacion No 43

- VMPP 1999 *Lectura de los Datos del Voto Constructiva de Censura* La Paz
- VMPP 1999 *Situacion de las demandas de congelamiento de los recursos de Coparticipacion Tributaria Gestion 1997-1998* La Paz
- VMPP 1998 *Participacion Popular Una evaluacion - aprendizaje de le Ley, 1994-1997* La Paz
- VMPP 1999 *Lineamientos de la Estrategia de Fortalecimiento Municipal Y Comunitario* La Paz PRODEMU
- Vladimir Terceros Martinez, Ex-Dirigente de la C O B “Una Propueta para la Reforma y Modernizacion de la Central Obrera Boliviana” Mesa Sindical Democratica
- World Bank Proyecto de Inversion Rural Participativa 2 (PDCR2)* Power point presentation

Secondary Documents (publications by various Bolivian Institutions and authors)

- Calla Oretga, Ricardo and Calla Oretga Hernando 1996 *Partidos Politicos y Municipios Debate Politico, No 2* La Paz, ILDIS
- CID “Sociedad Civil y Gobierno Local”, *Autodeterminacion Analisis historico – politico y teoria social* Julio 1994, No 12 La Paz
- CICDA Municipalizacion y Desarrollo Rural *RURALTER* No 16/17, 1998
- ILDIS 1994 *Participacion Politica de las Mujeres en Democracia* La Paz
- Garcia Linera, Alvaro 1999 “Ciudadania y Democracia en Bolivia 1900-1998 ” *Ciencia Politica*, Ano IV, Vol 4
- Teresa Zegada, Maria 1998 *La Representacion Territorial de los Partidos Politicos en Bolivia* Debate Politico, No 6 La Paz, ILDIS
- Verdesoto, Luis and Ardaya Gloria 1997 *Inventando la Representacion* Debate Politico No 4 La Paz, ILDIS
- Universidad Mayor San Andres 1999 “Proceso Democratico Boliviano,” *Ciencia Politica*, IINCIP, Ano IV, No 4 (Special Issue of the Political Science Journal of the UMSA)

**ANNEX C**

***Interviews and Contacts***

**Team Leader's Schedule of Interviews and Contacts**

**First Trip:**

Monday Oct 4<sup>th</sup>

Morning – Adam Behrendt

2 30 pm

*USAID - Adam Behrendt, Jose Garzon, Maggie Morales*

Tuesday October 5<sup>th</sup> (Richard and Adam)

9 15am

**CHEMONICS DDCP**

Tom Rielly (Dir) and Cecilia Bonadona (Coordinadora de la FAP – Fondo de Apoyp a la Participacion – NGO grant program) Tel 787332 Av Hernando Siles #5169

3 00 pm

**Fundacion Qullana**

Dir Cancio Mamani Lopez and Geronimo

Tel 330636 Dir Calle Pisagua #700, entre Ingavi and Armenia

Weds October 6<sup>th</sup> (Adam and Richard)

9 00 am

**LIDEMA (Environmental Umbrella Network)**

Veronica Lopez Aguilar (Coordinadora Capacitacion –WWF)

Tel 419393 Dir Av Ecuador No #2131 entre Aspiazu y Guachalla en Sopocachi

11 00 am

**UNITAS**

Leonor Araco Lemaitre (Dir)

Tel 413175 Dir Calle Crespo #2256, entre Guachalla and Rosendo Gutierrez, Sopocachi

2 30pm

**PROCOSI (USAID funded umbrella network of health NGOs)**

Oscar Borda, Gerente Technico He is in charge of training and capacity building

Tel 416061, Dir Av 20 de Octubre #2164, entre Guachalla and Aspiazu

4 15 pm

**AIPE (the other main umbrella network for NGOs in Bolivia)**

Director Alfonso Camacho Pena

Tel 413272 Direccion C Macario Pimilla #525, Casi esquina Ascarrunz (Sopocachi)

Thursday, October 7<sup>th</sup>

9 00 am

**CEDLA** (Center for studies on Labor and Rural Labor),  
Javier Gomez Aguilar  
Tel 412429 Dir Av James Freyre#2940, esquina Munoz Cornejo

12 00  
**VMPP Fortalecimiento Comunitario**, (the vice ministry of Popular Participation)  
Marcelo Rengel (Dir)  
Tel 419078 Dir Av Ecuador #2186, piso 4, cerca esquina Guachalla

3 00pm  
**Coordinadora de la Mujer** (umbrella network of womens NGOs)  
Diana Urioste (Dir)  
Tel 356291 Dir Calle Aspiazu #382, piso 3, entre Av 6 de Agosto y 20 de octubre

4 30 pm  
**CIPCA Nacional**  
director Hugo Fernandez  
Tel 322797 Dir Av 20 de Octubre #1703, esquina Calle Capitan Castillo

Friday October 8<sup>th</sup>  
Meeting with Dr Ruben Dario Flores  
Meeting with Arturo Crespo of INFORCO

*Saturday October 9*  
Visit to **Calamarca, Provincia Aroma, Dpto. De La Paz**  
Meeting with 41 campesinos + indigenous leaders

**Sunday October 10**  
*INFORCO*  
Arturo Crespo, Director,  
tel 331033

**Interation Trade Secretariat of the Telecommunications Industry**  
Carlos Gamarra, International Representative in Bolivia  
tel 211-312

*Monday October 11*  
Yacid Gonzalez  
**Asociacion de Abogados de la ciudad del Alto**  
Telef Celular 012-47207

**Federacion de Trabajadores Gremiales de El Alto**  
Secretario General, Juan Melendres, telef 844974 - 384016

Dr Prudencio Penaranda Espejo, Abogado Presidente de la **Asociacion de Magistrados de La Paz** Oficina calle Genaro Sanjines, Telef 328416 - 377040 (Int 126), casilla 13492

Bufete calle Figueroa No 688, Telef 340913 La Paz Bolivia

*Tuesday October 12*

Visit to **Machacamarca, Oruro** Municipality + Mining Cooperatives

Alcalde, Juan Elo Rate 019-888586 Machacamarca

Hipolito Rojas G , Presidente del Consejo de Administracion de la Cooperativa Minera  
"Unificada Ltda " Con sede en Machacamarca

Rodolfo Yucra, Consejal del Municipio de Machacamarca

Sergio Vasquez, Tesorero de la Coop Minera Unificada

*Wednesday October 13*

*Educacion Radiofonica de Bolivia ERBOL*

Jorge Aliaga M , Secretario Ejecutivo Calle Ballivian 1323 4to Piso,

Telef (591-2) -354142 - 324619 -324768 Fax 391985 Casilla 5946

E-mail agencia-erbol@megalink com La Paz- Bolivia

Lic Gloria Aguilar Perales, Vice Presidenta **H Consejo Municipal de La Paz**

Telef 379102 - 378950 Domicilio 792089 Casilla Postal 3503 Fax 0811-5524

E-mail gloag@ceibo entelnet bo

Ana Quiroga , Directora Centro de **Promocion de la Mujer "Gregoria Apaza"**, El Alto

**TIERRA Taller de iniciativas en estudios rurales y reforma agraria**

Miguel Urioste F de C Director Edif Multicentro torre b of 401 Rosendo Gutierrez esq

Arce Fono-Fax 432263 - 430145 domicilio 791320

E-mail tierraong@kolla net / casilla 8155 La Paz - Bolivia

**Radio Salesiana F. M. 86.7**

Roger Enriquez Montalvo, Director Calle Batallon Colorados No 11 /

Telef - Fax 314479, La Paz-Bolivia

*Thursday October 14*

*Friedrich Ebert Stiftung*

**Instituto Latinoamericano de Investigaciones Sociales**

Carlos F Toranzo Roca, Coordinador Areas Politica y Economica/ Ave 6 de Agosto,

Pasaje Pascoe No 3/ Telef 431083 -430259/ Fax 431227/ Casilla 8745 - 12960/

E-mail ildis@ceibo entelnet bo - toranzo@datacom-bo net La Paz - Bolivia

**LEDESMA, Red de Desarrollo Sostenible y Medio Ambiente**

Venonica Lopez and Heleen Weeda, Av Ecuador # 2330, Piso 2 / Telef 415324/ Fax

414726/ E-mail heleen@cebem com / casilla 9205 La Paz - Bolivia

**CIDEN Centro de Informacion y Desarrollo de la Mujer/**

Lic Margarita Salinas Borja, Directora Ejecutiva + Jimena Machicao/

Av VillZON No 1970 piso 2 of 4/

Telefs (591-2) 315249 - 364646/ Fax 392111/ Casilla 14036 La Paz Bolivia/ E-mail

cidem@caoba entelnet bo/ cidem2@ceibo entelnet bo

*Federacion de Cooperativas*

Executive Committee, Federacion Nacional de Cooperativas Mineras (Fecomín), La Paz

Dinner

Ronald Terceros Martinez

El alto-Río Seco Plan 12 No 7214 Telef 860024 - 861050 - 012-79217 - 012-79216

Jose Luis Harp

Secretario de Funciones del MNR

Gonzalo Hidalgo

Secretario de Relaciones Internas del MNR

Arturo Crespo

Dr Ruben Dario Flores

Juan Jose Diez De Medina, Presidente de la **Confederacion Nacional de Juntas Vecinales** de Bolivia Calle 9 No 600 Bajo San Antonio/ Telef 2-32462 La Paz

*Friday October 15*

*USAID*

*Second Trip*

*Wednesday November 3*

Horas 9 30 a m con el Señor Jose Coco Pinello, **Ex-Director de Unitas/** Lugar Hotel Ritz

Tom Reily **DDCP**

*Thursday November 4*

Senor Hugo Carvajal, Presidente **Camara de Diputados,**

Juan Melendres, Secretario Ejecutivo **Gremiales de El Alto**

Dr Gaston Ledezma, Presidente **Colegio de Abogados** En su propia of , calle Indaburo No 1062

*Friday November 5*

**SID Strategies for International Development**

Lic Jose Baldivia U , Director Nacioal/ 6 de Agosto 2376/ telef 352071, Fax 330090/ Casilla 9358 La Paz - Bolivia E-mail Sid@ceibo enelnet bo

Kate Marie Byrnes, **Agregada de Prensa/Embajada Americana,** telf (591-2) 432621, Fax 433006/ E-mail kbyrnes@usia gov/ Casilla 425, La Paz - Bolivia

Performance of Luis Rico

*Saturday November 6*

Visit to El Alto with Arturo Crespo y Ronald Terceros

*Monday November 8*

With Trade Unions, leaders from El Alto  
Vladimir Terceros Martinez Telef 861050  
Tito Flores Nina/ Calle 25 de Octubre No 2145 / Telef 862229  
Maximiliano Siacara Apaza Telef 052-71976

Dr Guillermo Bedregal/ Fernando Guachalla No 424 , ed1 Los Andes 4-A/ Telef 391944-39992434/ Telefax 591-2-391002 / Direccion Postal 6651 La Paz Bolivia

Dr Edgar Montano Pardo Ex-Viceministro de Derechos Humanos **MINISTERIO DE JUSTICIA Y DERECHOS HUMANOS** And **Presidente de la SOCIEDAD BOLIVIANA DE CIENCIAS PENALES**, tel 372830 and 315047

Tuesday November 9

Unable to fly to Sucre Wasted day at Cochabamba airport

Dr Marco Garcia, President, Colegio de Abogados de Cochabamba **ELFEC, Empresa de Luz y Fuerza Electrica Cochabamba S A C** , Asesor Legal/ Av Heroínas 0-0686/ Casilla 89/ Central telefonica 125/ Fax 591-42-59427/ Telef 59401, Cochabamba-Bolivia  
E-mail sedlex@comteco entelnet bo

*Wednesday November 10*

**President, Asociacion de Magistrados de Cochamba**

Dra Marlene Pino de Teran, Vocal de la Sala Social y administrativa Corte Superior de Justicia/ of Calle Jordan esq San Martin/ Fax 259096/Telef 230436/Domicilio 241810 Cochabamba

**CEDEAGRO Centro de Desarrollo Agropecuario/**

Martha Garcia, Directora/ Casilla 650/Telef 49713/ Suipacha No 216, Cochabamba - Bolivia

**CERES, Centro de Estudios de la Realidad Economica y Social /**

Humberto Vargas R Pasaje Warisata No 1, Av Circunvalacion entre Av Santa Cruz y Potosi/ Telef 591-42-93148 - 93149/ Fax 591-42-93145 -A A 949/ E-mail torhum@albatos cnb net Cochabamba

*Thursday November 11*

*CIDEM Seminar for women politicians*

*Asamblea Permanente de Derechos Humanos*

Presidente Father Dederico Aquello, S I Telef 254137 - 252835

Dr Hugo Montero Lara, Secretario General and Veronica Ramos, Esteban Arce No 0576,  
Galeria "Los Angeles" 2do Patio of 5/telefax 252835 / Casilla No 5697/ E-mail  
apdhc@albatros cnb net/Cochabamba

**COMITÉ CIVICO DE COCHABAMBA,**

Ing Mauricio Barrientos F , Presidente

Plazuela Colon S-472/ Telefs 255753 - 251278/Fax 223300/ Casilla 3872 Cochabamba -  
Bolivia

*Friday November 12*

**CIDEM Seminar** (Cochabamba)

**Seminar on training** (Santa Cruz)

Tuesday November 16

Dr Juan Carlos Saavedra, Presidente del **Colegio de Abogados**, Santa Cruz Telef 343-  
008

Friday November 19

Presentation of first Assessment Report draft to USAID

**List of Interviews and Contacts for the Bolivia Based Researcher**  
**- Santa Cruz Region -**  
**Adam Behrendt**

**Interviews (La Paz- See list of team leader)**

- USAID
- DDCP
- Fundacion Qullana
- LIDEMA
- UNITAS
- AIPE
- PROCOSI

**Interviews and site visits (Santa Cruz)**

***CIPCA***

Maria Eugenia Moscoso, Directora / Av 26 de Febrero No 652/Telefs 521884-527366/Fax 532338 /Casilla 3522 /Domicilio 430575 Santa Cruz – Bolivia

**IFRA (Radio Santa Cruz)**

Padre Francisco Flores, Director

Pedro Quatro, Coordinador

Calle Mario Flores esp Guenda, Telef 591-3-531817, Fax 591-3-532257, Casillas 672 y 3213, Santa Cruz-Bolivia

***Universidad NUR***

Lic Duncan Hanks Av Cristo Redentor No 100/ Telef 363939 Fax 331850/Casilla 3273/E-mail [dhanks@nur.bo](mailto:dhanks@nur.bo)

***CEDETI Centro de Tecnologia Intermedia***

Dir Ana Cristina Betancourt Av Melchor Pinto No 211 Telef 341663, Fax 560168, Casilla 4901, E-mail [cedeti@emdartec-bo.com](mailto:cedeti@emdartec-bo.com) Santa Cruz bolivia

**Mancomunidad de Gran Chiquitania (Group of Municipal governments)**

Julio Mandonado - Gerente

**AMDECRUZ (association of Municipal Governments of Santa Cruz)**

JorgeP Colombo Zambrana, Presidente /Av Omar Chavez Ortiz, Edificio Prefectura Bloque B 2do Piso /Telef 0976-2877/Telefax369271 Santa Cruz bolivia

**Dr Carlos Hugo Molina (CEPAD)**

Casilla 2641, Telefono(591-3) -341551/Fax 360501/ E-mail [chmolina@roble.scz.entelnet.bo](mailto:chmolina@roble.scz.entelnet.bo) Santa Cruz Bolivia

**PROCESO**

Jose Reyes Rios (Dir) and Augusto Jordan  
Calle Cuyabos No 201, Telef 466007, Fax 460862, Santa Cruz-Bolivia

**CEPAC Centro de Promocion Agropecuaria Campesina**

Dir Weyden Abastoflor, telef 536331  
Calle Churuyuqui No 130, Telef 537331, Fax 524419, Casilla 3488, E-mail  
[cepac@bol.healthnet.org](mailto:cepac@bol.healthnet.org), Santa cruz - Bolivia

**CEJIS Centro De Estudios Juridicos e Investigacion Social**

Alejandro Alaraz Ossio, Director Ejecutivo  
Rene Oreltalana Halkyer, Sociologo  
Leonardo Tamburini, Abogado  
Calle Alfredo Jordan No 79 /Telef 532714- 533809 /Fax 535169/Casilla 2419/ E-mail  
[cejis@scbbs-bo.com](mailto:cejis@scbbs-bo.com)

**Casa de la Mujer**

Miriam Suarez  
Juan Castellon  
Av Hernan Sanabria (ex Centenario) esq 3er Anillo, Telef 521803, Fax 521451, Casilla  
5744, E-mail [ksamujer@roble.scz.entelnet.bo](mailto:ksamujer@roble.scz.entelnet.bo) Santa Cruz – Bolivia

**APCOB Apoyo para el Campesino-Indigena del Oriente Boliviano**

Graciela Salgado  
Calle 4 Ojos # 80, Casilla 4213, Telef 591-3-542119 – 539954, Fax 591-3-542120, E-  
mail [apcob@mitai.nrs.bolnet.bo](mailto:apcob@mitai.nrs.bolnet.bo), Santa Cruz Bolivia

**CIDOB - Confederacion de Pueblos Indigenas del Oriente Boliviano**

Vice-Presidente Marcial Fabricano  
Nicolas Montero  
Barrio San Juan, Telef 498494 - 485929

**Comite de Vigilancia de San Julian**

**Consejales de San Julian**

**Local producers association and promoters – San Julian**

**Local unit of the MNR – Barrio 19**

**Departamental Unit of the Ministry of Indigenous Affairs – Santa Cruz VMAI**

**ANNEX D**

**Tables 5 1, 5 2, 5 3, and 5 4**

**Table 5 1**

**Overview of Selected NGOs - La Paz and Cochabamba**

<b>NGO</b>	<b>Sectoral Focus</b>	<b>Operational Focus</b>	<b>Level of Operations</b>	<b>Organizational Capacity</b>	<b>Financial Backing</b>	<b>Years in Existence</b>	<b>Quantity of Staff</b>
<b>Fundacion Qullana</b>	Municipal Dev Civic Part	Education Political action	Altiplano with emphasis on La Paz	Medium	Europe, Have \$ for next 3 years	4	5 plus teaching staff
<b>LIDEMA</b>	Environment	Organ Dev Lobbying Networking Projects	National	High	Many international sources, including USAID	14	15, 28 affiliated organizations
<b>PROCOSI</b>	Health	Nutrition Reproductive Integrated health prog Epidemiology	National	high	USAID and other	8	n a , 24 affiliated organizations
<b>AIPE</b>	Rural dev Gender Capacity build	Municipal Dev , Investigation Agriculture	National	High	Europe, Canada, US and U N	15	17, 37 affiliated organizations
<b>CEDLA</b>	Labor, small business, Employment issues Economic analysis	Economic analysis, employment generation, micro enterprise, Training	National	High	Europe	14	n a
<b>CIPCA</b>	Rural dev	Ag production Investigation Popular education Ag credit	La Paz, Santa Cruz and Cochabamba	High	Europe	18	n a
<b>ERBOL</b>	Social Communication through radio	Education, Cultural orientation Tech ass To network of 40 radios	National	High	Europe Catholic Church Has a small project with DDCP	19	n a

<b>Gregoria Apaza</b>	Gender	Violence Gender-dev Econ growth Local dev Leadership training	El Alto, targets women, youth and the general population in District 6	Moderate to high	Europe	15	33
<b>CERES</b>	Econ & social investigation	Municipal dev And investigation, University students, Campesino organization	Cochabamba	Was not enough time to judge	n a	n a	n a
<b>UNITAS</b>	A network of 40 NGOs	Rural dev Local dev Institutional building, Political advocacy, Labor	National	Moderate to high	Mostly European – Dutch, Danes, Germans, Swiss, French	23	n a
<b>CIDEM</b>	Gender	Women's issues, Political training, Advocacy	National	Moderate	USAID Europe	17	n a
<b>Colegio de Abogados Sta Cruz</b>	Law	Laws, judicial training, defense of lawyers	Sta Cruz, offices also in Camiri, Montero & German B	n a	Dues, It has a very modern headquarters	n a	

**Table 5 2**  
**Overview of Selected NGOs - Santa Cruz and Beni**

NGO	Sectoral Focus	Operational Focus	Target Population	Level of Operations	Organizational Capacity	Financial Backing	Years in Existence	Quantified Staff
<b>CEJIS</b>	Law Education	Advocacy Research Publications	Indigenous Campesinos Colonos	Regional National	High	European Donors (HIVOS, DANIDA)	20	15
<b>CEPAD</b>	Governance Decentralization	Training	Municipal Gov NGOs	Local National	Medium	AID, other NGOs	2	3-4
<b>CIPCA</b>	Agriculture Production Rural Development Municipal Dev	Training Technical Assistance	Campesinos	Regional	High	European Donors (HIVOS, DANIDA)	21	20
<b>IFRA-Cruz</b>	Basic Education Information	Distance Education	Rural Population Youth	Regional	High	Christian Aid Swiss Holand European Com	23	??
<b>CEDETI</b>	Agricultural Tech Institutional Strengthening Production	Tech Assistance Training	Campesinos Municipal Gov	Regional	High	Holanda GTZ DIAKONIA FIS - DDCP	10	23
<b>CEPAC</b>	Food Security Municipal Development Production	Mediation Intervention Tech Assistance	Campesinos Municipal Gov	Regional	Medium	Holland - Den CARITAS - CRS USAID -FIS - FONAMA	7	36
<b>PROCESO</b>	Education Training Civic Ed	Training Education Materials Dev	Indigenous Women Youth	Regional Urban Santa Cruz	High/ Medium	UNICEF IBIS NED & DDCP DIAKONIA	11	17
<b>UNUR</b>	Education Training Extension Development	Education Research Publications Seminars	All	Regional	High	Auto-Sustainable FIS Different NGOs and Donors	12	120

<b>Casa de la Mujer</b>	Gender Social Work -Legal Education Institutional Development	Interventions Training Technical Assistance Research	Women	Regional	Medium/ Low	HIVOS Swiss	4	17
<b>APCOB</b>	Institutional Strengthening Environment	Training Research Technical Ass	Indigenous Peoples	Regional	Medium / Low	Holanda European Com	8	12
<b>Man – comunidad Gran Chiquitania</b>	Planning Municipal Collaboration	Technical Ass Training	Municipal Gov	Regional	Medium/ Low	VMPP DDCP	2	7
<b>CIDIBENI (Beni)</b>	Environment Human Rights Legal	Training Research Technical Ass	Indigenous Peoples	Regional	High/ Medium	European NGOs (WWF)	?	20
<b>CIEC (Beni)</b>	Education Environment	Training Materials Dev	Indigenous Campesinos Urban Areas	Regional	Medium	Various Donors DDCP	8	6 (Beni)
<b>Estacion Biologica Beni</b>	Environment Production	Research Training Tech Ass	Indigenous Peoples	Regional	Medium	Nature Conservancy IUCN	8 (?)	?

**Table 5 3**  
**Democratic Development Capacities of Selected NGOs - La Paz and Cochabamba**

NGO	Advocacy (State)	Advocacy (pol Parties)	Municipal Development	Civic Education	Political Training	Mediation Negotiation	Research Publication	Media
<b>Fundacion Qullana</b>	Infrequent Low	Infrequent Low	Moderate Moderate	Frequent Moderate	Frequent Moderate	--- ---	Infrequent Low	Infrequent Low
<b>LIDEMA*</b>	Moderate High	--- ---	--- ---	Moderate High	Moderate High	Frequent High	High High	Medium Medium
<b>PROCESO*</b>	Medium Moderate		Infrequent Moderate	Moderate Moderate		Moderate/Freq High	Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate
<b>AIPE*</b>	Frequent Moderate	Infrequent low	Freq High	Freq High	Moderate Moderate	Frequent High	Frequent High	
<b>UNITAS*</b>	Moderate Moderate	-- ---	Moderate Moderate	Moderate ?	Moderate ?	Frequent High	Frequent High	Moderate Moderate
<b>CIPCA</b>	Moderate Moderate		Frequent High	Moderate Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Frequent High	? ?
<b>CIDEM</b>	Moderate Low	Moderate Moderate			Frequent High	? ?	? ?	Medium Low
<b>ERBOL</b>			Moderate Moderate	Freq High			Frequent	High High
<b>Georgia Apaza</b>	Moderate ?		Freq High	Freq High				? ?
<b>CEDLA</b>	Freq High	Freq Moder	? ?	Moderate ?	Moderate ?	Frequent High	Frequent High	Frequent High
<b>ILDIS</b>	Freq Moderate		Frequent High	Moderate Moderate	Frequent Moderate	Frequent Moderate	Frequent High	?? ?
<b>CERES (Coch)</b>	Infrequent Moderate		Frequent High	Frequent Moderate	? ?	Freq High	Freq High	Moderate Moderate

Col Abogados Sta Cruz	?			?	?	Have a project	High High	High ?
--------------------------	---	--	--	---	---	----------------	--------------	-----------

- These are networks or umbrella associations of NGOs. The ratings do not reflect the individual capacities of member organizations – rather they are an assessment of the capacity of the umbrella organization itself. It must be noted that some of these (AIPE) do not execute projects but play more of a coordinating role.

For democratic development capacity, a scaling of Frequent-Moderate-Infrequently was utilized to denote how often the particular NGO is involved in a certain kind of activity. High-Moderate-Low is used to rate the relative level of capacity that the NGO has to carry out a particular activity. Capacity was thought to be based on a number of criteria, such as *a clear statement of goals and objectives, skilled human resources, previous experience and successes, and proposed follow-up activities*.

**Table 5 4**  
**Democratic Development Capacities of Selected NGOs - Santa Cruz**

<b>CEJIS</b>	Frequent High	--- ----	Infrequent Low	Moderate Moderate	Moderate (Indigenous) High	Frequent High	Frequent High	Moderate Moderate
<b>CEDETI</b>	Infrequent Low	--- ---	Frequent High	Infrequent Moderate	Infrequent (Women) Low	Frequent High	Infrequent Moderate	Infrequent Low
<b>CEPAD</b>	Moderate Moderate	--- ----	Frequent High	--- Low		Frequent High	Infrequent Low	
<b>Casa de la Mujer</b>	Moderate Low	Infrequent Low	Moderate Moderate	Infrequent Low	Moderate (Women) Low	Moderate Low	Moderate Low	Infrequent Moderate
<b>CIPCA</b>	Infrequent Moderate	 ---	Moderate Moderate	Infrequent Moderate	Moderate (campesinos) Moderate	Moderate Moderate	Frequent High	Moderate Low
<b>CEPAC</b>	Infrequent Low	---- ----	Frequent High	--- Low	Moderate (Campesinos) Low	Frequent High	Moderate Moderate	Infrequent Low
<b>PROCESO</b>	Infrequent Low	---- ----	Infrequent Low	Frequent High	Frequent High	Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate	Infrequent Low
<b>APCOP</b>	Moderate Low	---- ----	Moderate Low	Frequent Moderate	Frequent (Indigenous) Moderate	Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate	Moderate Low
<b>UNUR</b>	Infrequent Low	---- ----	Moderate High	Moderate High	Infrequent High	Infrequent Moderate	Frequent High	Moderate Moderate
<b>CIDOB</b>	Frequent Moderate	Moderate Low	Moderate Low	Moderate Low	Frequent Moderate	Frequent High	Frequent Moderate	Moderate Moderate

<b>Mancomida d Gran Chiquitania</b>	Moderate  Moderate	----  -----	Frequent  Moderate	Infrequent  Low	Moderate (Municipal Off) Moderate	Frequent  Moderate	Infrequent  Moderate	Moderate  Moderate
---	--------------------------	-------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------	---	--------------------------	----------------------------	--------------------------

Notes Advocacy 1 refers to the ability to lobby national and local governments, advocacy 2 refers to lobbying political parties

For democratic development capacity, a scaling of Frequent-Moderate-Infrequently was utilized to denote how often the particular NGO is involved in a certain kind of activity High-Moderate-Low is used to rate the relative level of capacity that the NGO has to carry out a particular activity Capacity was thought to be based on a number of criteria, such *as a clear statement of goals and objectives, skilled human resources, previous experience and successes, and proposed follow-up activities*