



NEW EURASIA
foundation

THE HOMEOWNERS SUPPORT PROJECT

FINAL REPORT

Agreement No. CA 118-A-00-07-00060-00

**Submitted to:
United States Agency for International Development,
Regional Mission, Moscow**

**Submitted by:
New Eurasia Foundation**

December 20, 2009

Table of contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction	4
Background.....	4
Conceptual Approach & General Strategy.....	4
Project Framework.....	5
Project Achievements.....	5
Observations & Lessons Learned.....	8
Report Overview.....	9

SECTION I INTRODUCTION

A. Background.....	10
B. Goals and Objectives.....	10
C. Implementation Approach and Strategy.....	11
D. Methodology and Techniques.....	11
E. Implementation Phases Highlights.....	15
F. Target Audience.....	17
G. Implementation Team.....	17

SECTION II COMPONENT I.....

A. Objectives by Component One.....	19
B. Elaboration of Methodological Recommendations.....	19
C. Table A.....	20
D. Guidelines Design and Publication.....	21
E. Training Courses Design	22
F. Video Courses Production.....	22
G. Thematic Booklets Design and Publication.....	23
H. Testing and Dissemination.....	23
I. Table B.....	24
J. Component One Main Accomplishments.....	25
K. Impact on the Housing Stock Management Sector by Component One	25

SECTION III COMPONENT II.....

A. Objectives by Component Two.....	27
B. Demonstration Project Concept.....	28
C. Selection of Pilot Territories for Demonstration Projects.....	30
D. Field Investigation.....	30
E. Demonstration Projects Launch.....	32
F. Training and Technical Assistance Activities.....	32
G. Table C.....	34
H. Table D.....	37
I. Housing Management Models Testing.....	38
J. Development of Institutional, Technological and Economic Forms of Collaboration between Local Self-government Bodies and NGOs in the Sphere of Housing Stock Management.....	38
K. Component Two Main Accomplishments.....	40
L. Table E.....	46
M. Impact on the Housing Stock Management Sector by Component Two.....	47

SECTION IV COMPONENT III.....

A. Objectives by Component Three.....	49
B. Information Campaign Launch.....	49
C. Selection of the Key Information Sponsor.....	49

D. The HSP Thematic Web-site.....	50
E. Training Events for Media Specialists.....	50
F. Collaboration with Media Institutions.....	51
G. Table F.....	51
H. Collaboration with Federal and Local Governmental Institutions.....	52
I. Collaboration with the NGO-Community.....	52
J. Conducting Targeted Information Campaign.....	52
K. Advocacy Campaign.....	53
L. Large – scale Events.....	53
M. Collaboration with the International Community.....	55
N. Code of Good Practices.....	56
O. Component Three Main Accomplishments.....	56
P. Impact on the Housing Stock Management Sector by Component Three.....	57

SECTION VI LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....58

Executive Summary

From October 2007 through October 2009 the New Eurasia Foundation (FNE) and its partner, the Institute for Urban Economics (IUE) implemented the USAID's Homeowners Support Project (HSP) under the terms of Agreement No. CA 118-A-00-07-00060-00. This Final Report provides a full review of the HSP's objectives and planned results, main accomplishments, models developed and key lessons learned.

Background

The housing reform launched in 90's has radically changed the ownership structure of the Russian housing stock as well as the roles of all stakeholders. Free privatization¹ stimulated approximately 80% of the total Russian population to become homeowners. Pursuant to the Housing Code homeowners are given rights to independently determine apartment building management requirements and to ensure common property maintenance by using their own funds and mobilizing other available resources. The Housing Code provides also a workable legal framework in support of formation of homeowners associations (HOAs) as effective mechanisms for housing stock management, for collective decision-making regarding management methods of common property in an apartment building, and for promoting democratic values.

The reality of the Russian context reveals many systematic challenges to this process.

Homeowners are often excluded from a decision making process by local governments and managing companies who continue to exercise administrative and financial control of the housing stock. No meaningful information or education campaigns are being offered by the state to provide for common understanding among homeowners of what is intended by the Housing Code and how they can use this instrument. This is the reason why grassroots groups of homeowners and homeowners associations (HOA) are mostly weak and incompetent in Russia. They are often being used as an instrument for manipulation by municipalities and managing companies.

The HSP became especially relevant and timely in light of existing challenges as it provided vast opportunities for the homeowners associations to strengthen their organizational capabilities and practical skills in the sphere of housing management including managing customer and clients' relations that enhanced development of a comprehensive approach to modern housing management in Russia.

Conceptual Approach and General Strategy

The HSP's overall approach has been to rely on competitive market forces to facilitate development, introduction and nation wide dissemination of best practices of a comprehensive approach to modern housing management in Russia while fully exploiting opportunities for interaction among all stakeholders of the housing stock management sphere and empowering homeowners associations to become an independent client ensuring control over the quality of works and services as well as an important institution of civil society in Russia.

The strategic approach has been taken into consideration the distinctive environment as a setting for housing reform implementation - with particular reference to the overall constraints impeding effective collaboration of main subjects within the housing sphere, the progress to date in translating legal framework into effective practices, the maturity of civil society organizations and specifics of civic demand at the local level.

The HSP has been also committed to utilizing a comprehensive approach to regulation of relations within the housing sphere, as well as to introducing flexible methodological tools to assure showcasing regional diversity of practices employed in the housing and utility sectors.

In addition to directly promoting a dialogue between civil society groups and local government officials and improving organizational capacities of civil society organizations, including ability of

¹ In accordance with the RF Law # 1541-1 'About the housing stock privatization in Russian Federation'

homeowners associations, local non-governmental organizations and initiative groups to advocate their interests with local authorities, HSP has been ensured effective integration of efforts to improve capacity of local governments to better plan and manage resources.

While focusing on development of homeowners associations, HSP has been coordinated and sought synergies with organizations focusing on good governance (e.g. Public Councils acting under auspices of the Federal Tariff Agency, Local Governance Commission of the Russian Federation Public Chamber, the RF Ministry of Regional Development, and the Canadian CESO Program), development of thematic alliances and advocacy support (e.g. IREX/Dialogue Program funded by USAID/Russia), and those ones offering networking opportunities for NGOs (e.g. All-Russia Association of HOAs).

Project Framework

The HSP consisted of three interconnected Components, each of which included substantial methodological, training, and informational subcomponents to develop all stakeholders in housing stock management in Russia:

- Component 1: Development and dissemination of detailed guidelines and video courses on procedures of public participation in establishing and operating a homeowners' association;
- Component 2: Demonstration projects introducing complex approach to managing housing stock at the local level;
- Component 3: Organization of information campaigns at the national level advocating for housing reform implementation at the grassroots level.

The main activities accomplished under the Component 1 included:

- Design and dissemination of effective and affordable educational tools for the development of homeowners associations as a democratic instrument of local decision-making and housing self-management; and
- Introduction and test of apartment building management standards as the basis of interaction between homeowners, homeowners associations, managing companies, and local self-government bodies.

The main activities accomplished under the Component 2 included:

- Selection of Project Pilot Territories; and
- Demonstration Projects implying the following activities:
 - (i) Technical assistance to enhance citizen participation, transparency, positive interaction between HOAs, local governments, and managing & communal companies;
 - (ii) Development and introduction of a system of transparent organizational, financial and contractual relations between all the stakeholders at the local level;
 - (iii) Development and demonstration of variable models and approaches to housing stock management leading to improvement in housing services; and
 - (iv) Networking opportunities provided to municipalities, managing companies, service providers, and homeowners associations in order to help them establish effective working relationships.

The demo-projects drew upon the methods and principles elaborated under Component One.

The main activities accomplished under the Component 3 included:

- Information and Advocacy Campaigns.

Sequence of theoretical instruments development, their testing under demonstration projects, practical use in Russian municipalities, and dissemination of the best practices all over the Russian Federation gave a significant impact on the housing reform in Russia.

The HSP's Achievements

By October 2009, the HSP has successfully achieved all results projected for completion by the end of the activity and in several areas had substantially exceeded them.

The Homeowners Support Project was implemented at right time and played an important positive role in the development of housing self-management and local governance in Russia. The HSP contributed

to fostering the development of the housing self-management and the professional community within the housing sphere. The HSP facilitated also effective and mutually beneficial collaboration among the housing management stakeholders. It promoted housing movement in Russia by increasing transparency and integrity in housing policy delivery and housing reform enforcement through engagement and support of non-governmental and civil society organizations to work on maximizing public awareness, acceptance and knowledge in regard to housing rights advocacy in Russia.

The HSP was supported by various stakeholders, including HOAs, housing NGOs, managing companies and service providers, local governments, as well as the Public Councils acting under auspices of the Federal Tariff Agency, Local Governance Commission of the Russian Federation Public Chamber, the RF Ministry of Regional Development, national and regional agencies, which helped developing vertical links and facilitating effective and mutually beneficial collaboration among the project participants.

Some of the HSP's more outstanding achievements include:

Expanding Institutional Capacity of Homeowners Associations: The HSP has founded the All-Russia Union of Homeowners Associations to advocate and advance the interests of homeowners associations and to improve professionalism of their leaders nationally. Today, the Union includes 25 non-commercial organizations from 22 Russian regions. Two more regional unions of homeowners associations were established in the Tver region and the Khakassiya Republic with the HSP's support. The horizontal links that emerged within the non-commercial housing community have facilitated its consolidation and professionalization and supported its systemic collaboration with the state government agencies and the local self-governments. The parties now jointly monitor progress of housing and utility sector reforms, forecast the outcomes of each phase, and respond promptly to negative trends.

Strengthening the Capacity of Civil Society to Influence Federal Housing Policy.

Based on analyses of regional problems, the HSP's experts and partners have made proposals to amend the Russian housing legislation and to incorporate the best practices in the system of governmental activities in the housing stock management. The HSP ensured that twelve municipal acts regulating HOAs and housing management system were adopted in Tver, Nizhni Novgorod and Perm². Thirty nine HOAs and managing companies became the demonstration areas for demo-projects where property owners, as well as leaders of homeowners associations and managing companies from Perm, Tver, and Nizhniy Novgorod have implemented the procedures established by Russian legislation regarding capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings³.

The HSP created public negotiation venues on the base of the Public Board under the RF Federal Tariff Service, the RF Public Chamber Commission for local self-government and the housing policy, and the Public Board under the RF Ministry of Regional Development that are used now to negotiate the interests of homeowners associations, managing companies, and utility service providers. This enables consumers to form a social demand to better coordinating the strategies of collaboration between housing and utility service suppliers and consumers. The residents, in their turn, acquired additional information about possible civic involvement forms and mechanisms they could use to protect their rights. The residents of the pilot territories acquired additional opportunities to exercise their civic rights. The problems addressed to local and federal governments became better formulated by the civil society.

Creation of Favorable Environment for the Market-Oriented Housing Reform Action: The HSP has ensured a complex approach to developing effective economic and social links among all participants in the housing and utility sector: homeowners associations, managing companies, contractors, utility service providers, and government agencies of all levels. The relationships between them are characterized by both commercial and non-commercial aspects with mobile and flexible boundaries, which accounts for the need to acquire knowledge and skills required to manage relations between all participants of the housing stock management process. In partnership with three RF municipalities (Perm, Nizhni Novgorod and Tver),

² See Table E

³ See Section "Component Two Main Accomplishments"

the HSP implemented demonstration projects with the active participation of local communities to improve the quality of management services available to multifamily apartment buildings.

These demonstration projects made it possible:

- to carry out a variety of information activities and training sessions on the development of democratic relations within homeowners associations, between property owners and the homeowners associations, as well as between the managing companies and utility service providers;
- to introduce new mechanisms of organizing and financing capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings, including energy-saving upgrades;
- to apply newly acquired knowledge and skills within the system of management of homeowners associations and managing companies;
- to study successful practices in the management of multifamily apartment buildings and disseminate them in the Russian Federation.

The demonstration projects implemented in the Russian municipalities helped to create favorable conditions for housing stock management improvement. One of the indicators of positive change was an improved socio-communicative environment within the municipalities, which was achieved through the establishment of neighborly relations within apartment buildings, as well as a system of mutual relations between the property owners, homeowners associations, managing companies, and local government.

Other results included the following:

- More active involvement of private businesses in the management of multifamily apartment buildings through improved contractual relations in the provision of housing and utility services;
- Implementation of approaches that ensure organization and execution of capital renovation and modernization of multifamily apartment buildings, using governmental subsidies that guarantee transparency and targeted use of budget funds;
- Improved qualifications of municipal employees, as well as representatives of non-commercial organizations, managing companies, and utility service providers.

“Best Practices” Housing Management Models: The HSP’s housing management models have been designed and implemented with the objective of enabling competitive market forces. Five multifamily apartment building management models were designed and deployed within the framework of the second component:

- I. Development of democratic relations within a homeowners association;
- II. Development of an order for multifamily apartment building management, maintenance and renovation services by apartment owners/homeowners association;
- III. Development of effective relations between managing companies and their clients (apartment owners/homeowners association);
- IV. Development of effective relations between homeowners associations, managing companies, and utility service providers;
- V. Deployment of new mechanisms of organization and financing of capital renovation/energy-saving modernization of a multifamily apartment building.

Each of these models has its own goals and objectives, its own implementation method, and may be implemented as an independent housing reform element designed to ensure effective management of multifamily apartment buildings. At the same time, all of the aforementioned demonstration project models are interconnected and each model creates conditions for implementation of the other models. Thus, implementation of all demonstration project models ensured a complex approach to implementation of the housing stock management reform. Thirty nine HOAs deployed these models in their practices in the pilot municipalities⁴.

Training sustainability and reliability: The HSP has put together a library of methodological, informational, and educational literature on a broad spectrum of residential property management issues, including thirty two methodological recommendations⁵, thirteen practical manuals and guidelines⁶, and six

⁴ See The Code of Best Practices

⁵ See Table A

booklets⁷ on effectively organizing the management of multifamily apartment buildings within a municipality, as well as on the development of normative documents. The HSP has developed also a package of multifaceted training programs⁸:

- “The ABCs of Housing” – for aspiring property owners;
- “Basic Professional Course” – for managers of homeowners associations;
- “Professional Course” – for managers and specialists of housing managing associations and alliances;
- “Housing Management Training Techniques” – for trainers specializing in housing and related issues.

In addition, the HSP produced a series of training films and animated videos on housing management for public broadcasting⁹.

Sustainable training through forty-seven training and informational events attended by 1,984 representatives of homeowners associations, housing managing associations, and municipal governments was held in the cities of Tver, Perm, and Nizhniy Novgorod¹⁰.

Forty seven public trainers have been trained and prepared for further housing management training.

The HSP has effectively promoted real, viable opportunities for housing market development in the pilot municipalities and people with the initiative and capacity to take advantage of those opportunities.

Strengthening of local governance relating to housing management area. The HSP has developed close relationships with key officials of the pilot municipalities concerning housing management issues. The HSP designed recommendations on creation of favorable environment for HOAs operation as well as provided support for elaboration of twelve municipal acts subsequently passed by the City Dumas. Technical assistance and training on housing management and capital renovation was provided to 87 local governments of the Perm, Nizhni Novgorod, and Tver Regions¹¹. The HSP assisted in the conduct of the public-private mechanism of a competition among HOAs in Nizhni Novgorod; in creation of the public-private regular-based negotiation venues concerning collaboration of public utilities’ consumers and suppliers in Perm; and in establishment of the public-private Expertise Committee for supporting HOAs’ involvement into the federal capital renovation program in Tver.

Observations & Lessons Learned

The HSP’s experience has yielded a number of lessons about the Project design and implementation which should be taken into account in design of future efforts to provide technical assistance to housing related programs, including:

Responsiveness and credibility. It was important in the politically charged atmosphere of housing sector reform in Russia to maintain a low political profile initially, while developing market-oriented housing management models. The converse was true of the demonstration projects component. The approach here was to respond to targets of opportunity of importance to clients within the municipal administrations, and to build on the basis of the confidence and credibility thus achieved. The credibility established under the demonstration projects helped in the later phases of introducing policy work in the housing sphere nationally.

Sensitivity to political environment. Although the Russian Federation has mandated the housing reform and stated that it would be supported technically and financially, in fact, political factors put barriers to make this process effective. Rather frequent political replacements of both federal and regional levels officials sometimes prevented the HSP to develop a long-term cooperation with the key

⁶ See Appendix 1

⁷ See Appendix 4

⁸ See Appendix 5

⁹ See Appendix 3

¹⁰ See Tables C and D

¹¹ The list of municipalities is available on request.

federal departments which carried responsibilities for the housing policy in Russia. The last years were famous for numerous political events relating to multilevel elections for legislative and executive bodies. As a rule, the elections process completely involved all levels officials into the political activities leaving the economic ones aside. In light of these constraints the HSP had to demonstrate flexibility and responsiveness to governments' priorities, sensitivities and concerns through the mechanism of the Coordination Council where federal and municipal officials could exercise their expertise in the area of housing management models production.

Reinforcing the replication of the HSP models. The HSP's strategy relied on competitive market forces to replicate and to extend the better housing management practices being implemented by the core group of model homeowners associations from the pilot municipalities in cooperation with other main stakeholders with broad citizens participatory. Nonetheless, the characteristics typical of housing management sphere today in Russia: vertical integration, heavy reliance on federal budget funds in concern with capital renovation, violated rights of consumers, inability to rely on contracts, lack of self-regulating in the housing management sphere, insufficient use of energy efficient technologies, and a dysfunctional credit system, form a profile of adaptation to an exceedingly hostile enabling environment. Improvement of the enabling environment could provide a great impulse for housing system revival and growth. This could be obtained through the logical follow-on to the technical assistance approach followed under HSP.

Report Overview.

This Final Report provides a thorough review of the HSP activity in Russia. The first section reviews the HSP's overall emphasis and objectives, by Component and by Phase, and then outlines the results that were achieved. Sections Two, Three, and Four present the main activities and accomplishments of each Component, as well as detail about the models that have been developed, their impact, and replication and sustainability. Section Five analyses the lessons learned during the conduct of the HSP activity which is to serve as an outline for future strategic discussions about how to maximize the impact of housing development objectives in Russia.

As outlined in the Table of Contents, the Report includes also six tables. Further programmatic detail is provided in seven annexes to this Report.

Background

The social policy reform and the housing policy reform that are currently underway in Russia are based on the deployment of new models and mechanisms of collaboration between the government, businesses, and citizens. This requires that people take a more pro-active civic position and acquire fundamentally new knowledge, especially in the housing sphere. The RF Housing Code has paved the way to housing self-management which affects every Russian homeowner. The necessity to carry out managerial functions has placed homeowners into a challenging situation.

Homeowners associations which deal with fundamental quality of life should enable property owners to exercise their ownership rights in collective decision-making concerning management of common property in an apartment building. Not less important is the fact that homeowners associations can effectively facilitate the development of the housing services market by acting as an independent client and ensuring control over the quality of works and services provided by professional organizations.

The reality of the Russian context reveals many systemic challenges to these processes. Thus, there is lack of efforts to improve the housing legislation and to develop procedures regulating homeowners associations and management of multifamily buildings. No meaningful information or education campaigns are being offered nowadays to provide for common understanding among residents as well as local officials of what is intended by the reforms, and to encourage the former to utilize the provisions in the existing law and other relevant regulations to assert more control over their housing maintenance. Procedures required for competitive selection and execution of contractual relationships with managing companies remain underdeveloped. A significant share of the Russian housing stock is accounted for by decrepit buildings and buildings requiring renovation of varying degrees, whereas apartment owners are responsible for capital renovation of their buildings even though they rarely can afford it financially.

If not properly addressed, these challenges may jeopardize the delineation of organizational and financial responsibilities between municipalities and homeowners, limit the ability of local governments to be effective or responsive to their local population, and wouldn't allow to create necessary conditions to ensure transparent and accountable management of housing stock, which in turn may disengage citizens from their local governments and lead to public frustration.

The Homeowners Support Project was implemented at the right time and played an important positive role in the development of housing self-management and local governance in Russia.

It has become especially relevant and timely in light of establishment of the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Reform¹² which is expected to co-finance capital renovation of apartment buildings and facilitate relocation of residents from decrepit properties on the terms of obligatory HOAs' engagement and support.

Goals and Objectives

The Homeowners Support Project was designed to contribute to building effective and coordinated housing system at the national, regional, and local levels as well as to increasing the number of civil society organizations that work on housing issues and in support of homeowners in Russia through introducing and testing new housing management models, training a cadre of housing professionals and HOAs leaders, improving public awareness of rights and responsibilities under housing laws, and facilitating government-business-citizen collaboration.

¹² Federal Law # 185 FL

The HSP's activities were aimed also to building active collaboration among main stakeholders groups involved in management of housing stock (homeowners, homeowners associations, management companies and service providers, and local authorities).

To achieve the Project's goals the HSP has accomplished the following objectives:

- Design, test, and disseminate housing management models, effective operating practices of HOAs, and housing management policies and procedures to create a favorable environment for their operation;
- Integrate model approaches to housing stock management into the local socioeconomic development processes ensuring broad public participation;
- Improve public awareness of the housing issues at the national, regional, and local level and create conditions for further dissemination of project accomplishments in the Russian Federation;
- Foster the development of the professional community within the housing sphere and promote the housing movement in Russia by facilitating joint efforts of the Russian national association of homeowners associations and its regional chapters.

Implementation Approach and Strategy

The HSP's implementation strategy and approach took into consideration the distinctive environment as a setting for housing reform implementation - with particular reference to the overall constraints impeding effective collaboration of main subjects within the housing sphere, the progress to date in translating legal framework into effective practices, the maturity of civil society organizations and specifics of civic demand at the local level.

The Project implementation strategy has been designed to achieve the envisioned results and ensure their long-term sustainability. The implementing approaches included:

- a broad-based approach to building the constituency for the housing reform through intense information & education campaigns, and advocacy initiatives at the local and national level;
- a results-oriented approach to enhancing the development of homeowners associations through effective collaboration models that are grounded in concrete improvements to housing services and management;
- a synergistic approach to deploying Homeowners Support Project introducing various complementary models of housing stock management, involving empowerment of local expertise and public participation, and leveraging other partners contributions.

The HSP consisted of three interconnected Components, each of which included substantial methodological, training, and informational subcomponents to develop all stakeholders in housing stock management in Russia:

- Component 1: Development and dissemination of detailed guidelines and video courses on procedures of public participation in establishing and operating a homeowners' association;
- Component 2: Demonstration projects introducing complex approach to managing housing stock at the local level;
- Component 3: Organization of information campaigns at the national level advocating for housing reform implementation at the grassroots level.

The HSP had also seven distinct phases addressing the Workplan requirements.

Methodology and Techniques

The project implementation methodology and techniques included complementary and logically interconnected activities and events that engaged representatives of each of the project target groups:

Selection of Pilot Territories. The pilot municipalities were selected through a limited competition among 17 Russian municipalities. These were cities where the FNE's housing educational schools operated as well as those ones which were recommended by the implementing partner. The following selection criteria were used:

- Local authorities willingness to be actively involved in implementation of the demo-projects;
- High level of local managers professionalism and their commitment to allocating time and resources need for cooperation;
- Ongoing municipal programs in support of housing self-management, development of a competitive local utilities markets;
- Level of public activity of local populations;
- Municipal political stability.

Based on the results of the competition three agreements were executed with the governments of Nizhni Novgorod, Perm, and Tver.

Selection of the key information sponsor. To ensure effective and professional coverage of the Project in mass media the FNE conducted a competition to identify key information sponsors. Selection criteria included: publication's profile, experience in large-scale projects coverage, distribution geography, and reading audience. Based on the results of the contest, agreements were executed with an electronic media (www.tsj.ru), a magazine ("ZHKH and Construction"), and an information agency ("Agency on Social Information") which proved to be effective in professional coverage of the HSP events.

Project Management Methods. In order to ensure smooth and consistent implementation of the project activities, the HSP paid particular attention to coordination of efforts among the partner organizations and the Project experts. Clear division of labor and responsibilities among the Project participants were established at the initial stage of the project along with defining precise working algorithms. Regular meetings of the Coordination Board resulted in periodical assessment of the Project progress and in introduction of necessary adjustments. In order to ensure stability and uninterrupted implementation, the HSP has been deployed the teamwork principals based on mutual understanding and responsiveness to new knowledge.

Expert Community Development. Expert support, including but not limited to development and dissemination of guidelines and best housing management practices for various stakeholders, elaboration of model approaches to housing stock management, and conducting public awareness campaign, was invaluable for the HSP. In addition to the experts' team of the Institute for Urban Economics, the HSP involved national and international level experts from the High Economic School, the Academy of Communal Services, the Professional Management Institute, and other scientific institutions as well as the local level experts from the pilot municipalities. It resulted in high quality of the HSP methodological, training and informational products.

Networking Activities. The overall approach to the Project implementation was based on close interaction between homeowners, homeowners associations, managing & public utility companies, and local self-government bodies, building and developing formal and informal associations, creating and improving shared standards, as well as setting higher professional benchmarks. Actual networking and community-building activities included:

- *study tours* which enabled the pilot teams to exchange experiences and to study new forms of deployment of housing policies and management technologies in the course of the demo-projects;
- *large - scale events* included congresses, forums, and public hearings (five instead of two initially planned)¹³: (i) The Congress of the All-Russia Association of Homeowners Associations and Housing Construction Cooperatives; (ii) The Second Congress of the All-Russia Association of Homeowners Associations and Housing Construction Cooperatives; (iii) The Housing Reform Informational Support Forum; (iv) The Public Hearings under the topic "Informational Policies in the Housing Sphere" and held

¹³ The FNE has managed to raise additional funds through collaboration with the Federal Tariff Service.

under the RF Public Chamber Commission on Local Governance and Housing Policies; and (v) the Final Forum on the best practices and lessons learned. All these large-scale events served to better networking, to exchanging of best practices, and to more effective collaborating between main housing management stakeholders both nationally and world-wide.

Demonstration projects. Demonstration projects were implemented in three municipalities, which implied highly competitive selection process. At the preliminary stage the HSP analyzed initial situations in these municipalities, and then it determined the most appropriate for regulation areas. Then a set of recommendations concerning apartment building management models involving active participation of residents for homeowners, homeowners' associations, local governments, and managing companies relevant to specific municipal characteristics was developed. These recommendations were shared with selected pilot municipalities and all interested stakeholders under the public discussions within roundtables, workshops, and public meetings. The next step included practical testing of elaborated housing management models in the selected municipalities through the targeted technical assistance to different groups of stakeholders in the various areas of the housing management and maintenance. The demonstration projects and their results were monitored and evaluated by the project team and outside experts on the basis of indicators and measurable targets stipulated in the monitoring and evaluation plan. The results of the demo-projects were summarized and supplemented with descriptions of best practices and lessons learned in the format of a Case Study.

Methodological and Educational Sequences. The HSP designed a set of methodological instruments, including housing management models, local economic and budgeting process development models, public-private partnership models, practices of successful operation of homeowners associations, as well as other practices required for effective operation of homeowners associations in Russia. They served as the basis for publication of guidelines, and production of video materials for training purposes. This resulted in effective training process.

Strengthening of Informational Infrastructure. The informational infrastructure has been developed in the framework of training the professional cadre among the mass media specialists and the NGOs leaders; nation-wide information campaigns; housing issues coverage in leading Russian housing media outlets; establishment of discussion forum on the Project web-site; development of working relationship with public relations departments of the local governments; e-mailing newsletters through the Association's and Housing Schools' network; regular presentations of the HSP's achievements at the diverse regional and federal specialty forums and conferences; conduct of "housing literacy" radio shows in the pilot territories; advocacy campaigns held under housing celebrations; and allocation/ publication of the HSP's best practices in local, regional, and national mass media outlets. Effective informational infrastructure created under the Project eliminated the shortage of knowledge and practical experiences in the housing management area, provided a broaden access to relevant housing issues related information, promoted collaboration practices among the main stakeholders, and fostered a favorable environment for market development in the housing sphere.

Best Practices Exchange. Results of the demonstration projects and good practices were disseminated nationally. It brought to promote good governance practices and to replicate proved to be successful housing management models throughout the Russian regions.

Advocacy Campaign. The HSP organized five advocacy campaigns aimed at: (i) developing skills required to prepare information requests for local self-government bodies and managing companies; (ii) bridging information gap about housing reform issues, including establishment & development of homeowners associations, apartment building management models, coordination of interests & development of working relations among stakeholders; and promoting housing culture & consolidating local communities by celebrating professional holidays, such as the Utility Worker Day, the Habitat Day, and the International Neighbors' Day.

Publication of the Project Results. FNE has allocated all the HSP's informational, training, and methodological products on the electronic multimedia disks in the format of monograph in the amount of 2,000 copies. The monograph included the library of best practices, summative evaluation of the Project accomplishments, practical recommendations, guidelines, and video training courses. The HSP published also thirteen guidelines in the amount of 7,000 copies, six thematic booklets in the amount of 4,000 copies. In addition five training videos (3 minutes for each) and three animated cartoons (a minute for each) were produced.

Monitoring and Evaluation. To monitor the HSP progress FNE has developed a simple but efficient evaluation mechanism that combined quantitative and qualitative methods: market data analysis, comparative analysis, qualitative studies, on-site trips, review of relevant information, and after-event questionnaires:

Market data analysis. The HSP conducted two surveys in the pilot municipalities. This made it possible to assess the initial situation and to see how it was changed by the end of the Project. The initial survey contained two components: (i) Assessment of forms and methods of the Housing Reform implementation in the pilot municipalities; and (ii) Assessment of the institutional capability of the main housing management stock stakeholders acting in the pilot municipalities. The HSP' research group included part-time academic researchers from the European University at Saint-Petersburg, as well as a number of students and leaders of homeowners associations – volunteers, recruited by local NGOs and trained by researchers.

The research methodology presented efficient mechanism that combined quantitative and qualitative methods: (i) expert interviews, (ii) assessment questionnaires, and (iii) focus-groups. It provided a systematic, organized series of steps that insured maximum objectivity and consistency in assessing the existing housing market. The final survey was conducted through holding 9 focus groups and 25 interviews with the leaders of HOAs, managing companies – the demo-projects participants, as well as with the government officials – coordinators of the demo-projects.

Focus Groups for testing methodological & training materials and guidelines on the pre-publication basis. To assure production of quality products the HSP organized a series of focus groups for testing of recommendations, guidelines, video materials, and thematic booklets with participation of representatives of HOAs, citizens' initiative groups, housing NGOs, management companies & service providers, and local & regional authorities on the pre-publication basis in the pilot municipalities.

On-site trips. Selected municipalities received quarterly based on-site assessment from the Project team. The first assessment trip was important for establishing closer ties with target groups and partners. The assessment trip resulted in a report that included an initial diagnosis and recommendations for further work. As the project developed, the HSP experts made site-visits, measuring positive and negative developments on different stages.

Review of relevant information. To track the HSP's informational coverage, FNE collected copies of publications/newspapers and evaluated them against a set of criteria that included both the quantitative data (amount of informational items) and the qualitative one (relevance, public participation in the housing reform, advocacy of homeowners' rights).

After-event questionnaires. After each training event, the participants were asked to evaluate the organization of the event, its effectiveness and relevance to their work.

Gender Monitoring. In addition to general progress and outcome monitoring, the HSP monitored the gender composition to ensure equal participation of representatives of all gender groups in the Project activities.

The Web-site Operation. The thematic website (<http://tsq-rf.ru>) developed under the Project was used as an effective instrument for providing a wide access to housing information for all interested stakeholders. It was helpful also for evaluation of qualitative and quantitative parameters of the housing reform related problems in various regions of the Russian Federation and the HSP impact on this process.

The HSP Implementation Phases Highlights

During Phase 1 (by December 2007) the first HSP public event was conducted - the Congress of All-Russia Association of Homeowners. This event has become a part of the Forum of Housing Education held on December 13-14, 2007 under the Project "Housing Education Schools Network Development" funded through IREX (USAID). It was aimed at launching an information campaign on the HSP and its' perspective activities related to homeowners' associations operation in Russia.

The number of the Congress participants was almost twice as large as the initially planned – 200 persons. The Congress representatives were presented by homeowners associations, management companies, banks and insurance companies, service providers, NGOs delivering services in the area of housing education, and local and regional governments from 57 municipalities of the Russian Federation. The Congress participants developed a Final Resolution that included a set of proposals aimed at improving housing stock management in Russia. Thirty mass media representatives were watching carefully the Congress events which were covered in thirty two articles published in newspapers, specialized magazines, and web-sites.

During Phase 2 (by March 2008) the HSP team has received a strong support from all main stakeholders groups involved in management of housing stock in the pilot municipalities selected under the limited competition: Perm, Nizhni Novgorod, and Tver (homeowners, homeowners associations, management companies and service providers, and local authorities). Major Project events have been focused on identifying and defining municipal housing market opportunities; potential constraints; and people and cooperative organizations, most capable of assisting the Project. Then the HSP provided technical assistance to stakeholders to elaborate procedures for effective housing management. The Phase 2 highlights happened in course of ceremonies on the execution of cooperative agreements with the heads of governments of the pilot municipalities.

During the Phase 3 (by June 2008) the HSP developed solid, viable models of apartment buildings' capital renovation in the municipalities via technical assistance and training. The Project Team evidently demonstrated that the HSP's set of recommendations on capital renovation of apartment buildings could update and save resources. The HSP prepared housing management stock stakeholders of the Pilot regions to better access and use of technical, technological and financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital renovation. Based on both discussions and practical integrating model approaches into regional practices, the HSP has managed to ensure broad public participation in decision-making process on capital renovation. As a result of the HSP leadership, three Pilot municipalities received highly trained and capable homeowners fully empowered to perform their functions in the field of capital renovation. The foundation was laid for the effective capital renovation programs held in the pilot municipalities in 2009.

During the Phase 4 (by September 2008) the HSP effectively promoted viable models of apartment buildings' capital renovation via technical assistance and public events. Then it provided training for both trainees and trainers to develop a core of housing management professionals which could be sustainable and competitive in developing housing markets in the Pilot municipalities. The HSP assisted also local self-governments by establishing and providing institutional support to housing consultation centers in the pilot municipalities. These centers will continue providing services after the project completion and help to establish good working relationships between local authorities and housing NGOs at the local level.

During the Phase 5 (by December 2008) the HSP put a considerable effort on the training activities corresponding to development of contractual relations between HOAs and management companies. The HSP's training programs have resulted in successful housing management models and procedures by training housing professionals' personnel and homeowners associations' leaders. Technical assistance and networking opportunities were provided also that resulted in establishment of effective working relationships

between HOAs and managing companies as well as in facilitating of government-business-citizen collaboration. The HSP resulted also in improving organizational capacity of the HOAs as well as non-governmental professional unions of managing companies (associations, partnerships, etc.), including abilities to advocate their interests with local authorities, on the one hand, and on the other hand, in improving capacity of local governments to better plan and manage municipal programs in housing self-management. In addition, the Project has fostered the development of professional community within the housing sphere and promoted the housing movement in Russia by facilitating efforts of the All-Russia Association of HOAs in creation of its regional chapters. The Project's highlights and main events were the Second All-Russia Congress of Homeowners Associations held on October 7-8, 2008 in Moscow and the "Regional Housing Markets: Similarities and Differences" section organized by the New Eurasia Foundation within the framework of the Grantmakers East Forum held in Dubrovnik (Croatia) on October 9-10, 2008.

During the Phase 6 (by March 2009) the HSP developed housing management models corresponding to market-based competitive procurement with the objective of enabling the homeowners associations to be more efficient in reducing waste and in improving housing services delivery. Key activities in this area have included developing a set of recommendations and manuals and providing technical tools to target limited resources for housing services effectively, while helping HOAs to conduct a tender for housing services providers. Full-scale recommendations and a model agreement have been developed for HOAs and managing companies to assist in development of effective contractual relations with public utilities suppliers. Intensive technical assistance provided a great impulse for building the basis of confidence and credibility between public utilities' consumers and providers. The HSP resulted also in increasing transparency of housing management services delivery through improving reporting skills of managing companies. Training in the area of annual meetings procedures has been conducted with all the pilot municipalities. The HSP created also a municipal public-private partnership model programs for HOAs support where both municipalities and civil society organizations could leverage their resources and share positive experience. The HSP followed up fostering the development of professional media community within the housing sphere in the pilot municipalities. Sustainable training relationships have been developed with thirty regional media institutions. The Project's highlights were the Housing Reform Informational Support Forum held under the International Exhibition of Housing and Construction devoted to celebration of the Housing and Utility Services Providers' Day on March 18; Public Hearings on public participation in the housing reform held by RF Public Chamber on March 3; and the Round Table "The Federal Housing Strategy for Socially Unsecured Groups of Population" held under the Second All-Russia Forum "Strategy for Housing Construction in Russia" on March 30-31.

During the Phase 7 (by June 2009) the HSP was focused on identifying and defining energy consumption opportunities and potential constraints in regard to the pilot municipalities housing markets. The Project team provided technical assistance to various groups of stakeholders to make the process more efficient. The HSP developed economically viable models of apartment buildings' energy saving on the base of interactive training, and local practices analyses. An overview of the best international practices was done also. Model policies on procedures for procurement of energy efficient services were developed. As a result of the HSP training, technical assistance and networking activities the energy consumption capacity of homeowners associations was improved. The HSP continued also to incorporate democratic principles into the HOAs operation practices. They addressed building routine working communications, development of on-site manager/managing personnel and designing internal regulations for an apartment building (rules, procedures, standards and penalties as applied to collection of fees). The essential part of the HSP's activities was focused on monitoring the HSP progress. The demo-projects received on-site assessment. Interviews with the demonstration projects participants were held to measure the Project's intermediate results and impacts. Best practices were summarized, described, and shared between all stakeholders of the housing management sphere via publication in the specialized federal magazine "The HOA's Chairman", allocation on the HSP's web-site, and electronic mailing of weekly newsletters. Advocacy campaigns initiated by the HSP were conducted at the grass-root level to

improve housing culture and to enhance housing responsibility under the European Neighborhood Day in Russia. The highlight of the Phase 7 happened in course of the Public Chambers Public Hearings held in May. Housing NGOs activists from 57 Russian municipalities discussed and elaborated housing informational policies and procedures which were brought for the RF Ministry of Regional Development consideration.

The Project Target Audience

The HSP target groups were comprised of: (i) pilot territories population; (ii) homeowners associations; (iii) representatives of managing companies and service providers; (iv) local community leaders and NGO activists; (v) territorial public self-government bodies; and (vi) mass media.

The HSP ultimate beneficiaries were comprised of: (i) residents of the pilot territories; (ii) homeowners associations in the pilot territories; (iii) NGOs representing the network of housing education schools and the demo-projects; (iv) representatives of managing companies and service providers in the pilot territories; (v) representatives of local authorities from at least three pilot municipalities; (vi) municipalities of Russia; (vii) federal and local housing experts and trainers; (viii) national associations for support of homeowners and managing companies; (ix) local and regional Mass Media.

The HSP has provided essential opportunities for service providers and management companies through improving access to housing services market. Market access was one of the most difficult challenges due to insufficient legislation and local governments' suspicion about private service providers and management companies. The HSP elaborated clear rules that regulated procurement of housing and communal services. The service providers and management companies have received access to training also. Comprehensive management training resulted in improvement of their knowledge and technical skills to sustain business and in development of effective collaboration with homeowners.

Implementation Team

The New Eurasia Foundation and its partner, the Institute for Urban Economics have been carrying responsibilities for the Project implementation. Having comprehensive knowledge and practical experience in the housing reform related issues each party has been specialized in particular aspects of the housing reform.

The FNE provided leadership and overall Project management that capitalized on the strengths of the Project team and partner organizations. It was responsible for ongoing strategic planning. It ensured also achievement of the Project objectives and adherence to budgets and time schedules; coordinated a wide range of national and pilot territories representatives; forged cross-sectoral initiatives involving various RF governmental institutions, NGOs, and Housing movement organizations to maximize the impact of the Project; provided general control of development of methodology and techniques, guidelines and training courses, and served as the main liaison with the USAID/Russia.

The IUE provided expertise performance. It was responsible for development of methods of analysis and research, methodological guidelines and recommendations, as well as for training and informational activities performance in the pilot municipalities.

The FNE has developed also valid partnership relationship with the RF Federal Agencies and Public Institutions employing housing policy in the Russian Federation such as the Federal Tariff Agency, the Local Governance Commission of the Russian Federation Public Chamber, and the Public Council acting under the auspices of the RF Ministry of Regional Development. These important relations and connections allowed for maximum optimal utilization of substantial professional knowledge addressing the housing related problems, comparative analysis of approaches to reforming in various regions and use the extensive positive experience facilitating higher quality outputs.

In addition, the FNE has managed to involve the most experienced and famous national level experts in the housing sphere into the HSP activities that ensured the high quality of the Project products and their

nation-wide recognition. Building up the expert community that shared the HSP mission and strategy all over Russia was very important as it helped to establish fair norms and rules in support of homeowners' associations' effective operation and to adapt the most effective house stock management tools in municipalities.

Key Personnel included:

Konstantin Shishka	Chief of Party	FNE
Olga Pazyna	Deputy Chief of Party	FNE
Lyubov Belikova	Financial Manager	FNE
Svetlana Petriyчук	Project Coordinator	FNE
Irina Gentsler	Expert Team Manager	IUE
Tatiana Lykova	Expert	IUE
Marina Rumiantseva	Expert	IUE

Objectives by Component One

The main objectives accomplished under the Component One included:

- Design and dissemination of effective and affordable educational tools for the development of homeowners associations as a democratic instrument of local decision-making and housing self-management;
- Introduction and test apartment building management standards as the basis of interaction between homeowners, homeowners associations, managing companies, and local self-government bodies.

Elaboration of Methodological Recommendations

The HSP has designed a set of instruments, including housing management models, local economic and budgeting process development models, public-private partnership models, practices of successful operation of homeowners associations, as well as other practices required for effective operation of homeowners associations in Russia.

Methodological recommendations served as the basis for publication of guidelines, preparation of video training courses, and other materials to be used for training purposes. A series of recommendations¹⁴ addressed the housing management related spheres were developed:

(i) *Establishment and Registration of Homeowners Associations.* Based on the analysis of the current legislation and practices utilized for the establishment of homeowners associations, the HSP identified administrative barriers impeding registration and successful operation of homeowners associations, and selection of apartment building management methods. Detailed recommendations on how to eliminate said administrative barriers and to create a favorable operation environment for homeowners associations were elaborated.

(ii) *Developing Management, Maintenance and Repair System, and Provision of Utility Services.* In order to design comprehensive guidelines addressing the issues of self-organization of homeowners and professional implementation of management functions the HSP analyzed theoretical and practical apartment building management models. Information materials, methodological and practical recommendations for apartment owners addressed the following issues: compilation and description of common property in an apartment building, including the land parcel, as a management object; requirements to management, maintenance, and repair of an apartment building in compliance with technical regulations and norms; assessment of financial resources required to manage, maintain, and repair common property; risk analysis, including property cost changes, associated with application of various management models were developed.

(iii) *Ensuring Professional Management of an Apartment Building.* The HSP developed and test professional quality standards and best apartment building management practices.

Recommendations addressed the following spheres: designing and applying quality standards in management of apartment buildings (including budget design for management, maintenance, and common property repair); competitive procurement (including search for a managing company, selection criteria and procedures); contractual relations among the participants of housing stock management; managing company reporting requirements and performance appraisal/execution of the management contract.

(iv) *Saving Resources in the Housing Sector through Capital Renovation and Modernization.* The HSP developed a set of recommendations to apartment owners on capital renovation of apartment

¹⁴ Table A – List of methodological recommendations, analytical & informational materials

buildings, updating and saving resources, including securing of loans and municipal funding for capital renovations, and to local self-government bodies on how to put together a municipal support program for apartment owners during capital renovation/updating of apartment buildings, and to monitor funds expenditure.

(v) *Internal Relations in an Apartment Building*. Democratic principles for of a homeowner's association operation addressed the following: tenant relations as applied to common property management in an apartment building; building routine working communications and the on-site manager/managing personnel; designing internal regulations for an apartment building (rules, procedures, and penalties as applied to collection of fees); procedures for internal expertise and inspections; external audit of the managing company.

(vi) *Local Governments Collaboration with Homeowners Associations*. The HSP addressed the following issues in its recommendations for local officials: monitoring of apartment building management; a database of available management methods, approaches to select or replace the managing company; municipal property owners role in establishing and operation of a homeowners association; land parcels delineation under apartment buildings; financial support provision to establish and register homeowners associations; support to housing consulting and training centers; dissemination of homeowners association best practices acquired through municipal competitions and other public events.

(vii) *Managing Companies Collaboration with Homeowners Associations, Local Self-government Bodies, and Property Owners in Apartment Buildings*. A set of recommendations that was developed by the HSP allowed managing companies to better understand approaches to: involving homeowners in the decision-making process, including funding of capital renovation projects; developing contract relationship; information sharing on implementation of management plans and funding of current and capital renovation projects.

Table A List of methodological recommendations, analytical & informational materials

#	Name
1	Analytical paper on problems relating to establishment and registration of Homeowners Associations
2	Methodological and practical recommendations on eliminating of administrative barriers impeding registration and successful operation of homeowners associations
3	Informational materials on homeowners associations
4	Methodological and practical recommendations on selection of apartment building management methods
5	Informational materials on selection of apartment building management methods
6	Methodological and practical recommendations on establishment and registration of homeowners associations
7	Analytical paper on apartment building management models
8	Methodological and practical recommendations on compilation and description of common property in an apartment building as a management object
9	Methodological and practical recommendations on management, maintenance, and repair of an apartment building
10	Methodological and practical recommendations on assessment of financial resources required to manage, maintain, and repair common property
11	Methodological and practical recommendations on risk analysis, including property cost changes, associated with application of various management models for homeowners
12	Methodological and practical recommendations on quality standards in management of apartment buildings
13	Methodological and practical recommendations on competitive procurement (including search for a managing company)
14	Methodological and practical recommendations on budget design for management, maintenance,

	and common property repair
15	Methodological and practical recommendations on contractual relations among the participants of housing stock management
16	Methodological and practical recommendations on managing company reporting requirements
17	Methodological and practical recommendations on performance appraisal/execution of the management contract
18	Methodological and practical recommendations on capital renovation of apartment building/modernization of apartment building for homeowners
19	Analytical report on capital renovation/modernization of apartment building
20	Methodological and practical recommendations on formation of a municipal support program for apartment owners during capital renovation, and monitoring of funds expenditure for local authorities
21	Models on capital renovation/modernization
22	Methodological and practical recommendations on democratic principles for homeowners associations operation
23	Methodological and practical recommendations on tenant relations as applied to common property management in an apartment building
24	Methodological and practical recommendations on building routine working communications and the on-site manager/managing personnel
25	Methodological and practical recommendations on designing internal regulations for an apartment building as applied to collection of fees
26	Methodological and practical recommendations on procedures for internal expertise and inspections & external audit of the managing company
27	Methodological and practical recommendations on monitoring of apartment building management, and formation of a database of available management methods, approaches to select or replace the managing company for local officials
28	Methodological and practical recommendations on municipal property owners role in establishing and operation of a homeowners association
29	Methodological and practical recommendations on support provision to establish and register homeowners associations for local officials
30	Methodological and practical recommendations on involving homeowners in the decision-making process, including funding of capital renovation projects for managing companies
31	Methodological and practical recommendations on developing contract relationship for managing companies
32	Methodological and practical recommendations on information sharing on implementation of management plans and funding of current and capital renovation projects for managing companies

Guidelines Design and Publication

Following the development of a series of recommendations the HSP coordinated development and publication of housing management guidelines¹⁵ designed for housing specialists and covering procedures related to establishment and registration of homeowners associations, procurement of services of the managing company, and peculiarities of an apartment building management which included:

1. "Organization and Conducting of an Annual General Meeting of Homeowners" (published);
2. "Organization and Conducting of a General Meeting Addressing Capital Renovation in an Apartment Building" (published);
3. "Establishment and Registration of Homeowners Associations" (published);
4. "Selection of Housing Services Suppliers in an Apartment Building" (published);

¹⁵ Appendix 1 – Housing Management Guidelines

5. "Basic Introduction of an Apartment Building Management. Recommendations for Homeowners" (published);
6. "Energy Saving in an Apartment Building" (published);
7. "Professional Management of an Apartment Building" (published);
8. "Building of Democratic Relations in a Homeowners Association" (published);
9. "Recommendations for Local Government on Homeowners Support and Development" (in electronic format);
10. "Housing Culture and Housing Holidays" (published);
11. "The ABC of Housing" (in electronic format);
12. "Code of Best Practices in the Sphere of Apartment Building Management" (in electronic format);
13. "Housing Movement in the Modern Russia"¹⁶

Training Courses Design

The HSP designed four short training courses¹⁷ (16-20 academic hours each) for local officials, homeowners' association managers, and housing and utility specialists:

- "The ABC of Housing" for aspiring homeowners;
- The Basic Introductory Housing Management Course (for board members, audit commission, chairpersons, accountants of homeowners associations);
- The Advanced Housing Management Course (for professional managers, housing and utility specialists); and
- The Training of Trainers (this course was delivered to local administration officials and to leaders of civil society organizations).

All training courses included detailed training plans, curriculums, methodological aides, and case studies.

Video Courses Production

The HSP planned initially to produce four training videos covering housing stock management issues and including recommendations on their resolution for broadcasting on regional TV. A series of focus groups held in the pilot municipalities as from February 2008, and discussions through experts' meetings conducted as from December 2007 have resulted in changing the production process approach. The new approach considered two spheres for the videos use: (i) visual aids for training purposes; and (ii) social advertising devices for broadcasting on TV.

The HSP created two types of video products:

- Animated cartoons¹⁸ ("Indifferent Neighbors"; "Bureaucrats"; "Poor Management") for the purpose to stimulate homeowners for HOAs establishment; and
- Five training films¹⁹ structured in compliance with the demonstration projects' model approaches, namely:
 1. "Energy Saving in an Apartment Building" (Model 4: Development of Contractual Relations with Public Utilities Providers);
 2. "Establishment and Activities of Homeowners Associations" (Model 1: Democratic Principles for Homeowners Associations);
 3. "Managing Companies. Building of Effective Relations with Clients (homeowners and HOAs) (Model 3: Development of Contractual Relations with Management Companies);

¹⁶ Publication is funded through the FNE Program "Development of the Housing Self-Governance"

¹⁷ Appendix 2 – Training Courses

¹⁸ Appendix 3 – Video Products

¹⁹ Appendix 3 – Video Products

4. “Homeowners in an Apartment Building are the Customers for Housing and Utility Services” (Model 2: Apartment Buildings’ Maintenance and Management Main Principals for Homeowners);
5. “Application of New Mechanisms of Capital Renovation/ Energy Saving Modernization to Housing Stock” (Model 5: Capital Assets Renovation and Modernization).

These videos provide specific information with regard to the role and advantages of HOAs. They were designed to stimulate homeowners to carry responsibilities for the apartment building’s common property maintenance and to provide more incentives for establishment of HOAs.

In order to obtain better marketing ideas and to expand the possibilities of training videos the HSP held five testing events, including a few focus groups and experts’ meetings discussions. It allowed designing a video product fully tailored to the consumers’ requirements.

Thematic Booklets Design and Publication

The HSP designed and published a series of thematic booklets²⁰ with graphical information on housing problems resolution for HOAs.

1. “What has to Know a Homeowner of an Apartment Building about a Homeowners Association?”;
2. “Advantages of a Homeowners Association as an Apartment Building Management Method”;
3. “Homeowners! Let’s Conduct a General Meeting!”;
4. “Professional Management of an Apartment Building Where a Homeowners Association is Established”;
5. “Ten Advices on How to Celebrate the Neighbours’ Day”;
6. “The Day of Housing and Public Utilities Professionals”

Testing and Dissemination

The HSP provided testing for all training, methodological, and informational materials through fifteen focus groups held in the pilot municipalities, and experts’ discussions nation-wide in the forum-format on the pre-publication basis. Once published, said materials were utilized in the course of the demo-projects.

The HSP ensured also wide dissemination of newly produced informational and methodological materials among all the Russian municipalities in hard copy and electronic format via: (i) allocation on the Project website and websites of the Project participants & other interested parties; (ii) handout dissemination at the public events; (iii) presentations held at the RF Ministry of Regional Development and its Public Council, at the Housing Construction and Utility Agency, and other federal, regional, and local official venues; (iv) mailings to all regional governments, representative offices of the Federation subjects in Moscow, municipality unions and boards, the Congress of RF municipalities, the Union of Russian cities, the Union of Small Russian Cities, and the Russian National Association for the Development of Homeowners Associations and Housing Construction Cooperatives; (v) public service announcement on local, regional, and federal television channels; (vi) allocation of stream video on the Project web-site; and (vii) production of a multimedia disk containing all project materials, including electronic versions of guidelines, training plans, and video course²¹.

²⁰ Appendix 4 – Thematic Booklets

²¹ Table B – Summary of Dissemination Activities.

Table B. Summary of Public Events Used as Communication Channels for Distribution of the HSP Methodological and Informational Materials

#	Date	Communication Channel	# of municipalities	Location
1	February 27-28, 08	Workshop "Federal Initiatives under the Housing Reform", Regional Government	167	Kaliningrad
2	April 3, 08	Workshop on professional training of heads of municipalities, RF President's Academy of Government Services (RAGS)	127	Vladimir
3	May 6, 08	Round Table "Housing Stock Management"	150	Пенза
4	May 26, 08	The Second All-Russia Congress "Housing Stock Management". RF Ministry on Regional Development	200	Moscow
5	June 9, 08	Workshop on the capital renovation federal program based on FL #185 for heads of rural administrations	42	Astashkov
6	June 11, 2008	Workshop "Public Communications Management in the area of Tariffs Regulation" for chiefs of regional economic commissions, Federal Tariff Agency	50	Obninsk
7	June 16, 2008	Meeting "Tariff Regulation in the Housing Area", RF Public Chamber Commission on Local Governance and Housing Policy	120	Kaliningrad
8	June 20, 2008	Regional conference "Housing Education. Effective Housing Management", Regional Government	120	Saratov
9	July 24, 2008	Public Hearings "The Role of Civic Organizations in Prevention Strategies Development Against Unfair Competition in the Housing Market" with participation of NGOs, the Local-Government and Housing Policies Commission of the RF Public Chamber	175	Moscow
10	July 25-31, 2008	Annual Summer School, Housing Educational Network of NGOs, IREX, FNE	12	Kaliningrad
12	September 29-30, 2008	Regional Housing Forum, Regional Government	112	Kaliningrad
13	November 25, 2008	Regional conference "Housing Stock Management", Regional Government	123	Abakan
14	December 16, 2008	The Working Meeting on issues addressing effective capital renovation program with the Government	36	Kemerovo
15	December 23, 08	Workshop addressing capital renovation issues for heads of municipalities; Vladimir branch of the Russian Academy of Public Services'	210	Vladimir
16	December 25, 2008	The All-Russia Association of Tenants' workshop addressing tenants' issues for HOAs leaders from 55 municipalities	55	Kostroma
17	January 29-31, 2009	National Housing Education Schools Network working meeting	23	Yaroslavl
18	February 5, 2009	Plenary session on housing reform issues for heads of municipalities	57	Kaluga
19	March 3, 09	Public Hearings on public participation in the housing reform, the RF Public Chamber	57	Moscow
20	March 18, 09	The Housing Reform Informational Support Forum, Public Council of the Federal Tariff Service	107	Moscow
21	March 30-31, 09	Round Table "The Federal Housing Strategy for Socially Unsecured Groups of Population", RF	37	Moscow

	Ministry on Regional Affairs
Total number of municipalities provided with the HSP methodological materials	1980

Component One Main Accomplishments

A Comprehensive Housing Management Library. The HSP has managed to create a comprehensive library of informational, analytical, training, and methodological materials addressed the various aspects of the housing stock management that is comprised of:

- A series of 32 informational & analytical materials and methodological recommendations covering various aspects of housing stock management sphere;
- A series of thirteen guidelines instead of seven initially planned on housing management for specialists that were published in the amount of 9,000 copies;
- Four training courses (16-20 academic hours each) for improving skills of various participants of housing relations ("The ABC of Housing"; Basic Introductory Housing Management Course; Advanced Housing Management Course; and Training of Trainers);
- Six types of booklets, instead of four initially planned, containing graphical information on housing problems resolution were published in the amount of 7,000 copies;
- Two types of video products:
 - Three animated cartoons²² ("Indifferent Neighbors"; "Bureaucrats"; "Poor Management") for the purpose to stimulate homeowners for HOAs establishment; and
 - Five training films²³ structured in compliance with the demonstration projects' model approaches:
 - Model 1: Democratic Principles for Homeowners Associations;*
 - Model 2: Apartment Buildings' Maintenance and Management Main Principals for Homeowners;*
 - Model 3: Development of Contractual Relations with Management Companies;*
 - Model 4: Development of Contractual Relations with Public Utilities Providers; and*
 - Model 5: Capital Assets Renovation and Modernization.*

Innovative Communication Channels. The HSP created and effectively employed innovative communication channels which included: websites allocation; handout dissemination; presentations at the various official venues; mailing; public service announcement on local, regional, and federal radio- and television channels; allocation of stream video on the Project web-site; and production of a multimedia disk containing all project materials, including electronic versions of guidelines, training plans, and video course. This resulted in effective communication and distribution activities.

Impact on the Housing Stock Management Sector

Better Readiness in More Effective Housing Services Delivery. The HSP has delivered a comprehensive package of informational and methodological products to the main housing stakeholders that allowed for their better readiness in providing more effective services in the area of housing management, maintenance, and renovation.

Favorable Environment for Homeowners Associations Action. The HSP's methodological materials and practical recommendations in the areas of capital assets renovation; energy saving; apartment building management & maintenance; selection of housing stock management methods; building contractual relations among main housing stakeholders, and the HOAs' operation were incorporated in

²² Appendix 3 – Video Products

²³ Appendix 3 – Video Products

the municipal practices that resulted in a supportive environment where residents could identify and explore local resources and enhance the performance of existing housing management infrastructure.

Creation of a methodological foundation for effective management of multifamily apartment buildings. Prior to the HSP materials on management of multifamily apartment buildings were in extremely short supply in Russia. The HSP created a methodological foundation that enables Russian homeowners associations to successfully develop and expand their activities. The Project also provided a great deal of methodological support to housing NGOs thereby contributing to the professional growth of their specialists which significantly improved the quality and expanded the scope of information and methodological services provided thereby to homeowners nationwide. Methodological and information materials helped also to improve professionalism of the chairpersons of homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives, specialists of managing companies, and representatives of local self-government bodies.

Objectives by Component Two

The HSP has identified areas of technical assistance in demand of the Project target groups that achieved objectives of increasing citizen participation, transparency, and positive interaction between homeowners associations, local government, and managing companies. These areas included:

- Facilitation of development and introduction of a system of transparent organizational, financial and contractual relations between all the stakeholders at the local level;
- Demonstration of variable models and approaches to housing stock management leading to improvements in housing services.
- Technical assistance and networking opportunities to be provided to municipalities, managing companies, service providers, and homeowners associations in order to help them establish effective working relationships. The demo-projects drew upon the methods and principles elaborated under the Component One.

The principal objective of the Component Two was to bring real changes in the relations between homeowners and within homeowners associations, to ensure professional and responsible interaction between homeowners, managing companies, and utility service providers, to test skills required to develop capital renovation programs, to acquire experience in advocacy of the tenants' rights, and to improve the housing culture through implementing the demonstration projects.

Deployment of the Component Two mechanisms required the local self-government bodies of the pilot municipalities to be prepared to implement demonstration projects designed to deploy a complex approach to housing stock management. It included: (i) local authorities willingness to be actively involved in implementation of the demo-projects; (ii) high level of local managers professionalism and their commitment to allocating time and resources need for cooperation; (iii) ongoing municipal programs in support of housing self-management, development of a competitive local utilities markets; (iv) degree of public activity of local populations; and (v) municipal political stability.

In addition, the Component Two mechanisms required the pilot municipalities to: (i) assist in distribution of the HSP recommendations, manuals, training, and information materials; (ii) participate in the consultations provided to the demonstration project participants; (iii) assist in conducting information and training activities; (iv) participate in information campaigns and public discussions (conferences, "round-table" meetings, dialogues, etc.); (v) monitor and evaluate the outcomes of the demonstration project; (vi) assist and provide technical resources to the local partner NGO (NGOs) to facilitate its advisory, training, and information activities; and (vii) facilitate dissemination of the best experiences through mass media.

The certain requirements were designed for the local government implementing partner – the local NGO (NGOs) which were granted by FNE to carry responsibilities in the following spheres: (i) selection of pilot multifamily apartment buildings, homeowners associations, and managing companies for implementation of demonstration projects' models; (ii) organization and participation in consultations, information and training activities for representatives of the pilot apartment buildings, homeowners associations, managing companies, and utility service providers, as well as interested citizens; (iii) organization and participation in public discussions (conferences, "round-table" meetings, dialogues, etc.); and (iv) participation in the monitoring and evaluation activities corresponding to the demonstration projects outcomes.

The HSP expected that the demonstration project participants (homeowners associations, initiative groups of apartment owners, managing companies) will: (i) implement recommended mechanisms, procedures, rules, and forms; (ii) provide feedback regarding successes and complications in application of recommended mechanisms, procedures, rules, and forms; (iii) facilitate monitoring of the demonstration project; and (iv) participate in training and informational events associated with the demonstration project implementation.

The Demonstration Project Concept

The HSP designed the Demonstration Project Concept that was based on the five multifamily apartment building management models. These models were deployed within the framework of the Component Two:

- I. Development of democratic relations within a homeowners association;
- II. Development of an order for multifamily apartment building management, maintenance and renovation services by apartment owners/homeowners association;
- III. Development of effective relations between managing companies and their clients (apartment owners/homeowners association);
- IV. Development of effective relations between homeowners associations, managing companies, and utility service providers;
- V. Deployment of new mechanisms of organization and financing of capital renovation/energy-saving modernization of a multifamily apartment building.

Each of these models had its own goals and objectives, its own implementation method, and could be implemented as an independent housing reform element designed to ensure effective management of multifamily apartment buildings. At the same time, all of the aforementioned demonstration project models were interconnected and each model created conditions for implementation of the other models. Thus, implementation of all demonstration project models has ensured a complex approach to implementation of the housing stock management reform.

Model 1: Development of democratic relations within a homeowners association:

Model 1 created conditions required for the development of homeowners associations in municipalities with certain dynamics through information and promotion activities as well as introduction of democratic relations into the apartment building management system. Methods and procedures were tested addressing the following spheres: (i) adoption of the decision to establish a homeowners association by apartment owners; (ii) development of democratic principles of internal organization and operation of a homeowners association; (iii) design and application of internal rules and procedures, including procedures ensured collection of fees/payments for housing and utility services; (iv) procedures governing internal reporting, control, and audit, by multifamily apartment buildings/homeowners associations.

At the municipal level the HSP assured adoption of recommendations, provisions, and municipal normative acts regulating the following housing stock management areas: (i) local self-government bodies' assistance in the establishment of homeowners associations and regulation of their operations; (ii) participation of a representative of a municipal property owner in the establishment and operation of a homeowners association; (iii) information exchange between local self-government bodies and homeowners associations.

Model 2: Adopting of executive decisions for ordering services on management, maintenance and renovation by apartment owners/homeowners association:

Model 2 provided mechanisms for practical demonstration of the advantages of the management model under which homeowners, trained in adopting executive decisions on management of their common property elements, act as independent clients ordering professional housing management services. This model approach demonstrated specific examples of improvement of the conditions of multifamily apartment buildings when apartment owners realized their responsibility for the wellbeing of their apartment buildings and adopted decisions on professional management of their apartment buildings by executing contracts with housing management organizations and other contractors. The following activities were held under this Model: (i) training of apartment owners in identifying the housing management goals and objectives, coordinating their interests, and acting as clients ordering housing management services directly or via homeowners associations; (ii) consultation activities for apartment owners/homeowners associations in identifying criteria and procedures required to select housing management organizations/contractors to ensure an optimal ratio between the scope and the quality of housing management services; (iii) introduction and dissemination of a model agreement between homeowners/homeowners associations and

housing management organizations that provided for terms and conditions ensuring transparent and responsible bilateral relations and coordination of the parties' interests; and (iv) testing and dissemination of the sample procedures and documents on each consecutive step in the process of execution and monitoring of management agreements, as well as criteria used to assess the performance of the management company.

Model 3: Development of effective relations between managing companies and their clients (apartment owners/homeowners association)

The Model 3 mechanisms helped to improve sustainability and professionalism of managing companies by encouraging them to operate transparently and responsibly. The following methods and procedures were tested at the level of multifamily apartment buildings in the pilot municipalities: (i) management, maintenance and renovation of common property; provision of utility services; (ii) assessment of financial needs and budgeting for management, maintenance and renovation of common property; (iii) contractual relations between managing organizations and homeowners associations/apartment owners; (iv) reporting requirements of managing companies to homeowners associations/apartment owners; (v) development of effective communications between managing personnel/managing company and apartment owners; (vi) informing of apartment owners on execution of management plans and funding of current and capital renovation projects; (vii) standards of professional management of multifamily apartment buildings.

The recommendations were adopted at the local level in the following spheres: (i) selection of managing companies and assessment of their operations by apartment owners/homeowners associations; (ii) application and dissemination of the standards of professional management of multifamily apartment buildings; (iii) monitoring of management of multifamily apartment buildings; (iv) development of an address base for the selection of the management method; (v) selection or replacement of the existing managing company; and (vi) participation of a representative of a municipal property owner in contractual relations with a managing company.

Model 4: Development of effective relations between homeowners associations, managing companies, and utility service providers

The mechanism helped to improve contractual relations with utility service providers thereby making the business of management of multifamily apartment buildings more attractive for private organizations, including small businesses, and individual entrepreneurs. The following mechanisms were tested at the level of multifamily apartment buildings: (i) development of contractual relations between homeowners associations, managing companies, and utility service providers; (ii) regulation of utility rates; and (iii) development of municipal-private partnerships within the public utility sector.

Model 5: Deployment of new mechanisms on organization and financing of capital renovation/energy saving modernization of a multifamily apartment building.

Model 5 helped to ensure practical compliance with the new federal law regulating the procedure of adoption of decisions on capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings and provision of requisite financial assistance to homeowners by local self-government bodies. The following activities were undertaken under this Model: (i) testing of recommendations on engagement of apartment owners in the process of adoption of executive decisions on capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings and its financing via using their own and borrowed funds, as well as funds provided from budgets of various levels; (ii) ensuring practical compliance of apartment owners/homeowners associations with the new procedure of adoption of decisions on capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings that ensures financial participation of apartment owners and coordination of their interests; (iii) testing of procedure regulating acquisition of bank loans and budget funding required to finance capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings; (iv) assisting local self-government bodies in designing municipal programs of renovation of multifamily apartment buildings and their modernization improving their energy efficiency, and facilitate their participation in regional programs of renovation of multifamily apartment buildings.

Selection of Pilot Territories for Demonstration Projects

On December 19, 2007 the HSP launched a Limited Competition among 17 Russian municipalities. The goal of that initiative was to select pilot territories for demonstration projects. The demonstration projects were aimed at testing municipal models of housing stock management with public participation. The competition considered the peculiarities of the pilot municipalities, based on the system of transparent organizational, financial and contractual relations between all the stakeholders at the local level.

On February 5, 2008 the members of the Project Coordination Council judged this contest meeting the following criteria: (i) local authorities' willingness to create a favorable environment for housing stock management models with homeowners' active participation; (ii) local self-governments' readiness to determine the most appropriate areas for the regulation of housing stock management models and the passing of favorable local acts; (iii) collaboration with local NGOs; (iv) NGOs – local self-governments' partners' proven experience in the support activities for homeowners and homeowners' associations; (v) local self-governments' readiness to contribute funds and resources to demo-projects; (vi) presence of stakeholders with private forms of ownership in the local housing management market; (vii) municipal political stability.

Results of the Limited Competition among Russian municipalities were announced on February 8, 2008. Three municipalities were selected as demonstration projects' pilot territories: Tver, Nizhni Novgorod, and Perm.

Field Investigation

The HSP conducted a comprehensive sociological research "Housing Self-Management in Pilot Municipalities: Legal Norms and Practices" in June 2008. The goal of that research was to assess the initial situation for the HSP housing management models implementation in the Pilot municipalities.

Each group of respondents from every pilot municipalities was comprised of: (i) 9 local governments officials (a chief of the Housing Committee, specialist on work with HOAs of the city administration, and representatives of the Housing Commission of the city legislative body, Property Management Committee, methodological center for HOAs Support); (ii) 5 NGOs rendering services in the area of housing reform support and representatives of the regional Public Chambers; (iii) 10 HOAs chairmen (representing HOAs distinguished by registration dates, and management methods); and (iv) 300 residents of the apartment buildings with HOAs differed in terms of a date of construction, a method of housing management, and a number of residents.

The sociological research was conducted through undertaking the following activities in each of the pilot municipalities:

Quantitative studies: (i) Dissemination of assessment questionnaires in March 2008; (ii) Training of 14 local volunteers recruited for providing the research in March – April, 2008; (iii) Interviewing of 300 homeowners through assessment questionnaires in April, 2008; (iv) Analyzing of 900 assessment questionnaires by academic researchers in April – May, 2008, and

Focus Groups: (i) Three focus groups were conducted with participation of 15 municipal officials in April-May, 2008; (ii) Three focus groups were conducted with participation of 27 representatives of TSHZ, management companies, housing services providers, and NGOs rendering services in the housing education area, in April – May, 2008; (iii) Information provided through focus-groups was processed and explained through theoretical analysis by the Saint Petersburg researchers in the end of May 2008.

The research identified the following system-wide phenomena affecting managerial efficiency of multifamily apartment buildings in the pilot municipalities:

- *Parameters of the system of organizational relations.* Organizational activity of apartment owners depends on the age of the apartment building. Apartment owners residing in recently constructed apartment buildings are more active when organizing housing associations in their relations with management companies and utility service suppliers. Municipal officials believe that apartment owners should perform only control functions, and managerial functions should be performed solely by "professionals": either a specially hired manager or a management company. The leaders of homeowners associations hold an opposite view. They expect apartment owners to be more active in adopting and

implementing decisions, in addition to performing control functions. The municipal officials emphasize that individuals performing managerial functions in the housing sphere are poorly trained and their performance is not efficient. They believe that such a situation is mostly accounted for by the lack of certification/attestation in this field. The leaders of homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives also recognize their need in additional knowledge and housing management skills. The experts and representatives of homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives identify also certain demographic peculiarities: the majority of the leaders of homeowners associations are senior citizens. Young people are reluctant to work in this sphere believing it to lack prestige.

- *Parameters of the system of contractual relations.* The contractual relations between homeowners' associations/housing construction cooperatives and management companies/utility service suppliers are not transparent. Representatives of homeowners associations and specialists²⁴ have a shared opinion on this problem. The specialists believe there are too many unscrupulous housing management companies and the government ought to regulate their activities. Representatives of housing associations are dissatisfied with the fact that municipal authorities tend to interfere with the market relations associated with management of multifamily apartment buildings and provision of utility services (referring to the market's domination by management companies controlled by municipal bodies of power).

- *Parameters of financial relations.* The specialists believe that the most pressing problem has to do with the capacity of apartment owners to raise capital required to meet common needs. They believe that apartment owners are not interested in implementing large-scale projects requiring serious material contributions. Furthermore, they believe that managerial decisions are negatively affected by homeowners' attempts to redistribute internal homeowners association's expenses, as well as the fact that apartment owners have different incomes. The leaders of homeowners' associations/housing construction cooperatives hold a similar opinion.

- *Parameters of the legal base.* The specialists believe that in terms of legal relations the housing sphere is most seriously affected by the fact that municipal housing laws do not comply with the federal housing laws. Federal laws, as a rule, tend to ignore the variability and peculiarities of specific municipalities which is why municipal governments end up adapting federal laws to their respective local conditions. The specialists believe that local laws tend to be adopted on a tight schedule which is why their quality is inferior. The specialists are also dissatisfied with the quality of certain federal laws (including the fundamental codifying act, the RF Housing Code) which they believe contain a lot of contradictions and inaccuracies and fail to envision the social consequences of legislative decisions. The leaders of homeowners' associations/housing construction cooperatives complain about restricted access to legal data required to register a homeowners association.

- *Assessment of the technical condition of the housing stock.* Both the specialists and homeowners associations' leaders estimate that approximately 50%-80% of all multifamily apartment buildings require repairs and renovation to one extent or another.

- *Assessment of information and methodological activities designed to facilitate the development of housing self-governance.* The municipal experts acknowledge that their information activities are insufficient. At the same time, they believe that information and methodological activities implemented by municipal governments are an exceptionally important aspect of the housing reform and ignoring this aspect significantly complicates the development of the housing management sphere. The experts claim that the development of municipal information programs is impeded by the shortage of material resources which restricts the access to mass media. The experts also emphasize the need to conduct education activities as a mandatory addition to information activities. Representatives of non-commercial housing organizations (homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives) also view these two activity areas as most important. Homeowners associations tend to engage in informal networking in an attempt to obtain requisite information about the participants of the housing services market, services' availability and prices, the reputation of certain management companies, etc. The efficiency of information activities conducted for the benefit of the population has been demonstrated to directly depend on the development level of non-commercial organizations. The more actively non-commercial organizations participate in municipal programs, the more accessible is housing information to the population.

²⁴ Municipal authorities and managing companies specialists

- *Assessment of the non-commercial organizations' social activity on the housing market.* The specialists note that non-commercial organizations show little interest in working within the housing management sphere because they believe this field is too complex for non-professionals. Representatives of non-commercial organizations identify information and education activities as their most important activity area. Representatives of non-commercial organizations and local self-government bodies alike emphasize the need in further collaboration: it is a lot more efficient for municipal governments to inform the population of their housing policies via NGOs rather than try and deliver meaningful messages to each resident of a multifamily apartment building.

The conclusions and statements received from the research analysis were used as the foundation for the development of a technical assistance program for the pilot territories.

Demonstration Projects Launch

The common goal of all demonstration projects was to demonstrate that a transparent system of organizational, financial, and contractual relations and effective combination of self-organization of apartment owners and professionally performed housing management functions result in improved conditions of multifamily apartment buildings and better satisfaction of all stakeholders at the local level.

On March 14, 18 and 27, 2008 the HSP Project team paid three visits to Nizhni Novgorod, Perm and Tver accordingly to reach agreements on cooperation with local governments and to launch the demonstration projects. The primary objective of that mission was also to launch the information campaign on the project prospective activities in the pilot municipalities. The mission's program included: (i) introductory working sessions with local governments, demo-projects coordinators and partnering NGOs; (ii) ceremonies on execution of cooperative agreements with the heads of governments of the pilot municipalities; (iii) press-conferences with local mass media; and (iv) information workshops for target groups, which were represented by main stakeholders of the housing stock management sphere in the pilot municipalities.

Training and Technical Assistance Activities

The HSP conducted a comprehensive training program addressing diverse housing stock management issues and targeting the main stakeholders' groups in the course of thirty two training events:

Training in the sphere of capital renovation & modernization. The informational workshops, entitled "Preparation and Conducting of a General Meeting of Homeowners for Taking Decision on Participation in Capital Renovation Programs", were designed to prepare housing management stock stakeholders of the pilot regions to better access and use of technical, technological and financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital renovation. These workshops were focused on specific requirements of two target groups: the non-governmental managing agencies (homeowners associations, initiative groups of homeowners, and management companies) and the municipal ones (local governments officials). 512 participants attended these workshops. Based on both discussions and presentations, the HSP assured trainees to be more active in a decision-making process on common property capital renovation and modernization. The HSP shared also the methodological recommendations and the best international practices on assessment of financial resources required for capital renovation, on budget design for capital renovation, and on formation of a municipal program on capital renovation.

Train-the-Trainers Program. The HSP provided training for 167 trainers to develop a core of housing management professionals which could be sustainable and competitive in a developing housing market under the informational workshops, entitled "The HOA Establishment and Effective Operation" in the pilot municipalities. It was a challenge to select individuals which could be able to

replicate assistance for homeowners and for newly formed HOAs. Each potential trainer should meet the set of selection criteria which included: (i) successful background in the relevant sphere, (ii) effective communication skills, and (iii) in-deep knowledge of the local communities needs. The potential trainers were selected through a closed contest among the leaders of HOAs, TOSes, civic groups' leaders, and specialists of local governments. The trainees received intensive training under the eight-hour course that provided a deep insight on teaching and technological approaches. After TOT, each trainee participated in the HSP followed up intensive/ integrated training courses on a repeated basis until he/she took on a training role.

Homeowners Associations Capacity Building. A comprehensive training in the fields of: (i) selection of apartment building methods; (ii) description of common property as a management object in an apartment building; (iii) management, maintenance, and repair of an apartment building in compliance with technical regulations and norms; (iv) assessment of financial resources required to manage, maintain, and repair common property; and (v) risk analysis, was provided for 163 HOAs, initiative homeowners groups, public trainers, and local governments' officials under the three two-day training sessions, entitled "Basic Principles for an Apartment Building Management". These sessions were aimed at improving organizational capacities of HOAs, including abilities to advocate their interests with local authorities and managing companies.

Building of Democratic Relations within a Homeowners Association. The workshop "Building of Democratic Relations in HOAs" addressed homeowners' relations as applied to common property management in an apartment building, building routine working communications among on-site managers and managing personnel; designing internal regulations for an apartment building (rules, procedures, and penalties as applied to collection of fees); and procedures for internal expertise. It targeted 121 specialists from HOAs, managing companies, and public trainers.

Professional Management of an Apartment Building. The HSP conducted three two-day training sessions targeted 92 specialists of managing companies and housing services providers, entitled "Professional Management of an Apartment Building". The main focus of that training event was to facilitate building links and to establish effective working relationship between managing companies and HOAs as well as to improve the overall quality of management services in the housing sphere. The topics discussed covered the following fields: (i) methods on stimulating homeowners to be active in a decision-making process; (ii) building up contractual relations with homeowners; (iii) housing stock management quality standards; (iv) budget design; (v) reporting requirements; (vi) execution of a management contract; (vii) housing management models and approaches; and (viii) internal expertise & audit.

Professional management of an apartment building approaches were discussed also under the training session focused on energy saving in the housing sector that targeted 176 HOAs, managing companies, mass media, local governments officials, and public trainers. The trainees were given practical recommendations on how to use energy efficient technologies at the levels of both an apartment building and a municipal multifamily apartment building stock. The review of successful international practices was introduced also.

Development of Market Mechanisms in the Housing Sphere. The HSP was focused on facilitating market mechanisms development in the housing sphere. The training workshops, entitled "Selection of Housing Services Suppliers", targeted 110 HOAs, managing companies, local governments' specialists, and public trainers. The trainees were provided with extensive training in the sphere of marketing, clients' relationship management and control, aimed at reducing expenditures on housing services delivery and improving their quality. The major part of training was focused on the specific selection methods of housing services suppliers as it was essential for HOAs and managing companies to be more efficient in the housing stock management.

Reporting Skills Development. Extensive training was provided in the sphere of HOAs' and managing companies' reporting skills development under the series of informational seminars "Preparation and Conducting of an Annual General Meeting of Homeowners" which targeted 93 HOAs and managing companies. This training was aimed at increasing transparency of HOAs' and managing companies' operation activities.

Advocacy Campaign Development. The HSP has assisted in empowering residents – homeowners and their associations – to become prudent owners of housing property strong enough to protect it and to better formulate housing related issues through the informational workshop, entitled "Housing Movements and Campaigns" targeted 45 HOAs leaders. This workshop has become also an effective tool for building mechanisms for negotiation with governments at national, regional and local levels. It promoted housing holidays, such as the European Neighbor Day, the International Habitat Day, and the Labor Day of Housing and Utility Specialists, into the Russian housing culture.

Table C Summary of Training Activities

#	Date	Training event	Trainees	# of trainees	Location
1	May 13, 08	Informational workshop on use of financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital assets renovation	Initiative groups of homeowners leaders; HOAs; managing companies	98	Perm
2	May 14, 08	Informational workshop on use of financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital assets renovation	Specialists of local government bodies	92	Perm
3	May 21, 08	Informational workshop on use of financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital assets renovation	Initiative groups of homeowners leaders; HOAs; managing companies	123	NN ²⁵
4	May 22,08	Informational workshop on use of financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital assets renovation	Specialists of local government bodies	107	NN
5	May 28,08	Informational workshop on use of financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital assets renovation	Initiative groups of homeowners leaders; HOAs; managing companies	58	Tver
6	May 29,08	Informational workshop on use of financial resources through municipal and federal programs on capital assets renovation	Specialists of local government bodies	34	Tver
7	June 24,08	TOT Workshop "The HOA Establishment and Effective Operation"	HOAs leaders, TOS specialists ²⁶ , specialists of local government bodies	45	Perm
8	July 3,08	TOT Workshop "The HOA Establishment and Effective Operation"	HOAs leaders, TOS specialists, specialists of local government bodies	78	NN
9	July 12, 08	TOT Workshop "The HOA Establishment and Effective Operation"	HOAs leaders, TOS specialists, specialists of local government bodies	44	Tver
10	September 24-26, 08	Thematic Seminar "Informational Support of the Housing Reform"	Regional media specialists, public relations departments of the cities'administrations	20	Moscow
11	October 13-14,08	Training Workshop "Basic Principles for Apartment Building Management"	Initiative groups of homeowners leaders; HOAs, specialists of local government bodies, public trainers	87	NN

²⁵ Nizhni Novgorod

²⁶ Acronym for local self-governing territorial institutions

12	October 20-21,08	Training Workshop "Basic Principles for Apartment Building Management"	Initiative groups of homeowners leaders; HOAs, specialists of local government bodies, public trainers	23	Tver
13	October 27-28,08	Training Workshop "Basic Principles for Apartment Building Management"	Initiative groups of homeowners leaders; HOAs, specialists of local government bodies, public trainers	53	Perm
14	October 15-16,08	Training Workshop "Professional management of an apartment building"	managing companies, public trainers	45	NN
15	October 22-23,08	Training Workshop "Professional management of an apartment building"	managing companies, public trainers	22	Tver
16	October 29-30,08	Training Workshop "Professional management of an apartment building"	managing companies, public trainers	25	Perm
17	February 11,09	Training Workshop "Selection of Housing Services Suppliers by HOAs"	HOAs, public trainers, specialists of local government bodies	27	Tver
18	February 19,09	Training Workshop "Selection of Housing Services Suppliers by HOAs"	HOAs, public trainers, specialists of local government bodies	47	NN
19	February 25,09	Training Workshop "Selection of Housing Services Suppliers by HOAs"	HOAs, public trainers, specialists of local government bodies	36	Perm
20	February 13, 09	Informational Seminar "Preparation and Conducting of an Annual General Meeting of Homeowners"	HOAs, public trainers, specialists of local government bodies, and managing companies	23	Tver
21	February 18,09	Informational Seminar "Preparation and Conducting of an Annual General Meeting of Homeowners"	HOAs, public trainers, specialists of local government bodies, and managing companies	39	NN
22	February 27,09	Informational Seminar "Preparation and Conducting of an Annual General Meeting of Homeowners"	HOAs, public trainers, specialists of local government bodies, and managing companies	31	Perm
23	February 13, 09	Training Workshop "The Housing Reform Informational Support"	Regional media specialists, public relations departments of the cities'administrations	11	Tver
24	February 18,09	Training Workshop "The Housing Reform Informational Support"	Regional media specialists, public relations departments of the cities'administrations	16	NN
25	February 27, 09	Training Workshop "The Housing Reform Informational Support"	Regional media specialists, public relations departments of the cities'administrations	19	Perm
26	June 3, 09	Workshop "Professional Management of an Apartment Building"	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, educational institutions, mass media, public trainers	61	Perm
27	June 10,09	Workshop "Professional Management of an Apartment Building"	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, mass media, public trainers	28	Tver
28	June 17,09	Workshop "Professional Management of an Apartment Building"	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, mass media, public trainers	87	NN
29	June 4, 09	Workshop "Building of Democratic Relations in HOAs"	HOAs, local administrations, mass media, public trainers	54	Perm
30	June 9,09	Workshop "Building of Democratic Relations in HOAs"	HOAs, local administrations, mass media, public trainers	27	Tver
31	June 18,09	Workshop "Building of Democratic Relations in HOAs"	HOAs, local administrations, mass media, public trainers	40	NN
32	May 16, 08	Informational seminar "Housing Movements and Campaigns"	HOAs, local administrations, mass media, public trainers	45	Tver
Total number of trainees		1545			

The HSP shared recommendations and training approaches with main stakeholders of the pilot municipalities under the *technical assistance events*. The proposed management models were discussed during 15 roundtable and working meetings with themes included: (i) elaboration of

procedures for capital renovations and housing maintenance; (ii) building contractual relations with management companies and public utilities providers; (iii) exploring opportunities for development of a housing finance infrastructure through grants, subsidies, guaranties and commercial loans, (iv) elaboration of energy saving technologies; and (v) development of municipal programs to render local government support for homeowners associations:

Deployment of New Mechanisms for Capital Renovation of an Apartment Building. Three roundtables, entitled “Problems on Applying the New Mechanisms of Capital Renovation Programs” were held to ensure practical compliance with the new federal law, regulating the procedure of adoption on capital renovation and provision of requisite financial and technical assistance to homeowners by local self-government bodies. They served also to facilitate the HOAs’ participation in municipal programs of multifamily apartment building renovation.

The problems encountered in the course of implementation of the municipal capital renovation programs were discussed also at the Second national conference on management of multifamily apartment buildings by homeowners associations. The discussion was held with support of the “Construction and utility industries and housing policy” section of the Public Board under the RF Ministry of regional development, the Regional development commission of the RF Public Chamber, the Local self-government and housing policy commission of the RF Public Chamber, and the Public Board under the RF Federal Tariffication Service. The conference participants were presented with experiences of homeowners associations which had taken part in regional and municipal capital renovation programs, homeowners support practices, and financing mechanisms used to renovate and upgrade multifamily apartment buildings.

Assistance of Local Government Bodies in Establishment and Support of HOAs. The HSP conducted a series of working meetings with local government officials aimed at improving the existing municipal programs and creating the new ones for the HOAs development and support. The HSP shared recommendations elaborated in the relevant sphere with local governments of the pilot municipalities.

Building of Contractual Relations Between HOAs, Managing Companies and Public Utilities Providers. The HSP discussed regulation areas of utility rates and introduced a sample of a public contract to better serving needs of both customers and consumers. The participants exchanged their opinions on how to settle problems addressing contractual relations between the public utilities suppliers and their consumers, a mismatch between the tariff policy and the market demand. A significant problem arose was the lack of public awareness campaigns which could encourage development of constructive relations between the parties. The public utility supply agreement is peculiar in that consumers are guaranteed protection from being discriminated against by the organization dominating the market. All terms and conditions of the public agreement, including the prices (rates) on services (commodities) are the same for all consumers, except for cases accounted for by specific laws. If a utility service supplier refuses to execute a public agreement for no good reason, the management company or the homeowners association has the right to coerce the utility supplier to execute such an agreement through arbitration court and demand being compensated for the losses sustained as a result of the utility supplier’s refusal to execute the agreement. The utility service supply agreements currently used in the Russian cities do not provide for the liability of utility service suppliers for the quality of their services. Today, the monopolists dictate the terms and conditions for the provision of utility services. It should be noted that regional bodies of power and local self-government bodies play an important role in the development of contractual relations regulating the provision of utility services. These bodies are expected to assist in the negotiation and coordination of the terms and conditions of utility service agreements involving all interested parties, and to ensure that such agreements to provide for the terms and conditions that equally benefit management organizations and utility service providers.

The need to administer a transparent policy regulating relations between utility service suppliers and other participants of the housing market was also discussed in the course of the public hearings on “Ensuring transparent tariffication policies in the housing sphere” held on June 5, 2009 in Voronezh, at the

parliamentary hearings held on May 19, 2009 in Petrozavodsk, at the plenary meeting of the government of Kaluga region on February 5, 2009, and at the meeting of the Public Board under the RF Federal Tariffication Service held on July 30, 2009 and dedicated to the “Standards of information disclosure by natural monopolies and utility service organizations”.

Reporting Requirements for Housing Management Services Providers. A series of working meetings aimed at developing reporting skills of HOAs and managing companies before homeowners was held in the pilot territories. The HSP inspired parties to use transparent mechanisms to assure residents to become more active in housing related policies development.

Energy Consumption. The HSP was focused on identifying and defining energy consumption opportunities and potential constraints addressing the pilot municipalities housing markets under a series of roundtables. Model policies on procedures for procurement of energy efficient services were discussed.

Table D Summary of Technical Assistance Activities

#	Date	Technical Assistance activity	Participants	# of participants	Location
1	June 23,08	Roundtable “Problems on Applying the New Mechanisms of Capital Renovation Programs”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers	90	Perm
2	July 2, 08	Roundtable “Problems on Applying the New Mechanisms of Capital Renovation Programs”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers	35	NN
3	July 7, 08	Roundtable “Problems on Applying the New Mechanisms of Capital Renovation Programs”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers	18	Tver
4	October 17,08	Working Meeting “Establishment and Support of HOAs under Municipal Programs”	local administrations, NGOs	18	NN
5	October 24,08	Working Meeting “Establishment and Support of HOAs under Municipal Programs”	local administrations, NGOs	21	Tver
6	October 31,08	Working Meeting “Establishment and Support of HOAs under Municipal Programs”	local administrations, NGOs	25	Perm
7	February 12,09	Round Table “Contractual Relations between Public Utilities Providers & Consumers”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers, public utilities providers	15	Tver
8	February 17,09	Round Table “Contractual Relations between Public Utilities Providers & Consumers”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers, public utilities providers	26	NN
9	February 26,09	Round Table “Contractual Relations between Public Utilities Providers & Consumers”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers, public utilities providers	48	Perm
10	February 12,09	Working Meetings of Demo-projects Participants “Reporting Requirements”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers	11	Tver
11	February 17,09	Working Meetings of Demo-projects Participants “Reporting Requirements”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers	7	NN
12	February 26,09	Working Meetings of Demo-projects Participants “Reporting Requirements”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers	23	Perm
13	June 2,09	Round Table “Municipal Policies in	HOAs, managing companies, local	25	Tver

		the area of Energy Consumption”	administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers, public utilities providers		
14	June 11,09	Round Table “Municipal Policies in the area of Energy Consumption”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers, public utilities providers	38	NN
15	June 16,09	Round Table “Municipal Policies in the area of Energy Consumption”	HOAs, managing companies, local administrations, NGOs, mass media, public trainers, public utilities providers	39	Perm
Number of participants		439			

Housing Management Models Testing²⁷

The algorithm of implementation of the five demonstration projects’ models on deployment of a comprehensive approach to management of multifamily apartment buildings when utilizing various management methods and effective combination of self-organization of homeowners and professional performance of management functions included the following activities:

- The HSP provided the leaders of homeowners associations and management companies with the opportunity to select any management model and test it on the basis of their respective multifamily apartment buildings.
- The leaders of the NGOs that acted as the FNE’s contractors under the HSP provided methodological and technical support to the demonstration projects.
- The HSP held quarterly meetings to assess the progress of their respective demo-projects and to provide assistance to one another, if necessary.
- The best practices developed in the course of the demonstration projects were described and disseminated throughout Russia.

A total of 39 homeowners associations and management companies from the pilot municipalities took part in the demonstration projects. Their experiences were described and disseminated throughout Russia in the form of the Code of Best Practices.

Development of institutional, technological, and economic forms of collaboration between local self-government bodies and non-commercial organizations in the sphere of management of multifamily apartment buildings

The HSP provided the NGOs of the pilot municipalities with technical and methodological support and facilitated their professional growth which helped to improve the quality and expand the scope of the information and methodological services provided thereby to homeowners and HOAs – the demo-projects participants. The HSP trained NGOs to cooperate effectively with local governments under the housing reform using the institutional, technological, and economic forms of collaboration. As a result of these activities the NGOs played the crucial role in deploying the HSP’s models and recommendations in the course of the demo-projects. They were responsible for selection of apartment building for demo-projects participation and the follow-on training and technical support. In addition these NGOs helped to networking and facilitating market –oriented activities in various spheres of housing stock management.

The Nizhniy Novgorod Best Practices in Deployment of Institutional, Technological, and Economic Forms of Collaboration between NGOs and the Local Government:

- Upon recommendation of the HSP, the government of Nizhniy Novgorod, in concert with the Nizhniy Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations, created a network of five legal support centers for the

²⁷ Appendix 5 – Code of Best Practices

population on the basis of the district administrations. The centers benefit from pro-bono activities of the law school students of the regional subsidiary of the High School of Economics.

- The trainers/consultants trained in the course of the HSP's demo-projects, established a Homeowners' Leaders' Club that worked with the Nizhny Novgorod residents by involving them in housing management activities. The Club actively involved local and regional NGOs (including the HOAs leaders) in education of residents on the basis of the project's information and methodological recommendations. The Club implemented its activities using a variety of venues, including the Local Communities Forum (which was organized in partnership with the Nizhny Novgorod Duma) and panel discussions with broad public participation held on the basis of the district administrations.

-The Nizhny Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations helped to establish partnerships between territorial public self-government boards and homeowners associations thereby expanding the access to the project's information products for the city population. The Union's cooperation with the municipal and regional governments under the Project helped to strengthen the organization's institutional capacity. Thus, it has managed to execute an official cooperative agreement on cooperation in the housing management area with the Housing and Utility Ministry of Nizhny Novgorod region. In addition, the Union's cooperation with the city government in the course of the demoprojects helped significantly to improve the partnership relations between the city authorities and the Nizhny Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations. The Resolution No.2608 of the city government adopted on June 7, 2008, provided the Nizhny Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations with an office space at 4 "B" Beketov Street *to be used free of charge*. The Resolution No.2207 of the Nizhny Novgorod city government adopted on May 26, 2009, appointed the Nizhny Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations as a member of the expert board of the municipal homeowners associations' competition.

- Over the course of the demo-projects the Nizhny Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations became a true partner of the city government in organizing effective management of multifamily apartment buildings. It was authorized to reorganize the housing construction cooperatives and establish homeowners associations in the multifamily apartment buildings managed by housing management companies in compliance with the city government's resolution "On compensating certain registration costs of homeowners associations from the Nizhny Novgorod city budget" (No.4174, September 9, 2008). A total of 16 homeowners associations encompassing 37 multifamily apartment buildings were established in the course of the demo-projects.

- On the Utility Industry Workers' Day the Nizhny Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations received a thank-you letter from the Housing and Utility Ministry and the legislative assembly of Nizhny Novgorod region "... for outstanding professionalism and proactive legal and information assistance in the development of housing self-governance".

The Perm Best Practices in Deployment of Institutional, Technological, and Economic Forms of Collaboration between NGOs and the Local Government:

- A network of information and consultation offices was established in Perm on the basis of 14 territorial public self-government boards. These offices provided consultations to the city residents on the housing, housing management, and utility issues. The network has facilitated the development of the housing movement in the city by encouraging the city residents to participate in the municipal competition of social projects. Abiding by the project's methodological recommendations on improvement of the housing management quality and assisted by the Perm Fund for Support of Homeowners Associations the local project participants designed a number of projects in the housing sphere that won the municipal competition of social projects. The non-commercial partnership "Association of Management Companies" won a 98,249.10 rouble grant to implement the project "Homeowners' participation in management of multifamily apartment buildings: new practices and technologies"; the project "My apartment building – my care! Ordering housing maintenance and renovation services by homeowners using different housing management methods" (with involvement of two homeowners associations and two local housing management companies servicing eight multifamily apartment buildings). The project designed by the "Noviy Yanvarskiy" territorial public self-government board, received a 100,000.00 rouble grant.

-The Perm Fund for Support of Homeowners Associations facilitated the institutional development and provided technical assistance to the following Perm associations of housing management companies: "Association of management companies", "Guild of management companies", and "Housing and utility management companies". On November 25, 2009 the Perm Fund for Support of Homeowners Associations won the right to conduct four methodological seminars on establishment of homeowners associations in the course of an electronic auction commissioned by the Perm regional construction and utility agency. The seminars were conducted in partnership with the "Civic Position" Fund for the specialists of the local self-government bodies of Perm region.

- In the course of the "Perm – Tchaikovsky Civic Dialogue" civic expedition conducted by the Perm Civic Chamber and a group of regional NGOs in the city of Tchaikovsky – the third largest city in Perm region – the Perm Fund for Support of Homeowners Associations conducted an open seminar, "Housing management companies and homeowners associations: homeowners' risks and fears", which brought together 34 participants, as well as the workshop "Homeowners associations and housing management companies: reporting to homeowners".

- The Club of Homeowners Associations' Leader, "Big Ten", established by the Perm Fund for Support of Public Initiatives "Civic Position", brought together 10 leaders of homeowners associations and acted as a resource center for their colleagues and homeowners' initiative groups. The first club of homeowners associations established in the course of the demo-projects, ensured the foundation for the development of the club movement in Perm. Supported by the "Civic Position" Fund, the homeowners association "Sodruzhestvo" prepared a project, entitled as "Good Neighbours", that won the municipal competition of social projects in 2008 and received a 98,000 rouble grant. In the neighbourhood in which "Sodruzhestvo" was located there was not a single venue where the local residents could come together and discuss common housing problems. In order to hold its meetings the homeowners association had to spend its members' funds to rent a space from the neighbourhood school. By now the 140 residents of apartment building No.97 on Marshal Rybalko Street have resolved this problem by renovating the building's basement (50 square meters) using the municipal grant funds. The "good neighbours" have managed to implement a variety of activities to consolidate the local residents (by operating several programs targeted at various age groups) and to improve the condition of the building and adjacent territory. The club movement has already encompassed an entire micro-district – the "Yanvarsky" neighbourhood of the city of Perm.

The Tver Best Practices in Deployment of Institutional, Technological, and Economic Forms of Collaboration between NGOs and the Local Government:

- The HSP's demo-projects' participants established a network of public boards under the city district administrations that brought together the homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives of each particular district. This institution provided access to the HSP's information and methodological resources to the city apartment owners who were looking for solutions for their housing management issues.

- The nongovernmental institutions supporting the development of homeowners associations continue to grow in Tver. Homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives form partnerships with clubs for children and adolescents by holding joint events and activities in the game format designed to facilitate the development of a new generation of responsible homeowners.

- The body of work accomplished in the course of the demo-projects helped to bring together the leaders of the local homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives, promoted a more mature and professional attitude towards the development of housing self-governance, and resulted in the creation of the regional Union of HOAs in the Tver region.

Component Two Main Accomplishments:

Improved knowledge and practical skills in the housing stock management. 1,545 stakeholders improved their theoretical knowledge and practical skills in the various fields of the housing stock management under 32 training events in the pilot municipalities. A core group of public trainers in the

area of housing stock management comprised of 32 HOAs leaders was created in the pilot municipalities. They have managed in turn to hold 57 training events by themselves to train 378 homeowners. 439 stakeholders were provided with additional practically oriented assistance under 15 technical assistance events.

Improved Way of Apartment Buildings Management. Thirty nine HOAs and management companies became the demonstration areas for demo-projects:

- Twenty five HOAs deployed the HSP's recommendations on the development of collaboration between homeowners and the homeowners association board/chairman of the homeowners association board by promoting mutual trust and responsibility among the members of the homeowners association and its governing bodies in the cities of Tver, Nizhni Novgorod, and Perm. They deployed also the HSP's recommendations when designing their charters and bylaws. These homeowners associations tested various methods of active involvement of their members in the planning of their common property management activities and adoption of responsible managerial decisions. They introduced also procedures regulating activities of their governing bodies, including procedures requiring their governing bodies to report the results of their managerial activities to the homeowners association members and all other apartment owners. The best practices were received in the course of eleven HOAs' activities: a HOA # 1, a HOA «Sodruzhestvo», a HOA «Seredinnaya 3», a HOA # 2 (Perm); a HOA «Kol'tsevaya 82», a HOA # 92, a HOA "1 Suvorova" (Tver); a HOA «Gagarin 105», a HOA «Nogina 7», a HOA "Zvezdochka", and HOA # 413 (Nizhniy Novgorod). They were described and included in the Code of Best Practices with respect to the housing management Model 1 approach.

- Thirty three HOAs used the HSP's recommendations on the development and description of common property elements in a multifamily apartment building, negotiation of homeowners' interests in terms of the management of common property elements of a multifamily apartment building, selection of the optimal management system, as well as renovation and maintenance of common property elements. They also designed agreements with contractors on the basis of the project's recommendations. They acted as well-informed customers when ordering housing management, maintenance, and renovation services and used the project-recommended criteria when selecting contractors capable of ensuring the provision of an optimal set of housing management, maintenance, and renovation services. The best practices were received in the course of eight HOAs' activities: a HOA «Bely Dom» (Tver), a HOA «Sosnovka», a HOA "Tbilisskaya 25", a HOA "Lesnoy", a HOA "Kristall", a HOA "Snaiperov 3" (Perm), a HOA "Volzhskie Ogni", and a HOA "Lider 1" (Nizhni Novgorod). They were described and included in the Code of Best Practices with respect to the housing management Model 2 approach.

- Fourteen management companies deployed the HSP's recommendations when assessing their financial requirements and preparing their management budgets, maintaining and renovating common property elements, and developing contractual relations with homeowners. They held regular reporting meetings whereat they informed homeowners on execution of their management plans and financing of current and capital renovation projects. The companies have designed and were using the project-recommended professional housing management standards. The best practices were received in the course of five management companies' activities: a company «Al'ternativa" (Nizhni Novgorod); a company "Permskaya Model' Komforta", a company "Motorostroitel", a company «Prospekt-Eko" (Perm), and a company «REP-17» (Tver). They were described and included in the Code of Best Practices with respect to the housing management Model 3 approach.

- Twelve HOAs deployed the HSP's recommendations on development of effective contractual relations with utility service providers in compliance with applicable legislation that ensures protection of both parties' interests. In addition, they succeeded in using energy-saving technologies in their respective apartment buildings that enabled them to significantly reduce their utility costs. The best practices were received in the course of twelve HOAs' activities: a HOA "ZHSK 1", a HOA "Seredinnaya 3", a HOA "Tbilisskaya 25", a

HOA “Lesnoy”, a HOA “Sodruzhestvo” (Perm); a HOA “Express N” (Nizhni Novgorod); a HOA “Olimp”, a HOA “Studencheski pereulok”, a HOA “Kirova 7”, a HOA “Progress”, a HOA “1a”, and a HOA “Snaiperov 3” (Tver). They were described and included in the Code of Best Practices with respect to the housing management Model 4 approach.

- Fifteen HOAs demonstrated the most effective capital renovation technologies. These organizations fully complied with the HSP’s recommendations on using the newly mandated decision-making procedure regulating capital renovation of multi-family apartment buildings. They managed to find funds to finance capital renovation of apartment buildings. They introduced also the procedure regulating capital renovation of multi-family apartment buildings that ensured compliance with the homeowners’ interests and their financial participation in capital renovation projects. The best practices were received in the course of three HOAs’ activities: a HOA 413 (Nizhni Novgorod), a HOA “Olimp”, and a HOA 92 (Tver). They were described and included in the Code of Best Practices with respect to the housing management Model 5 approach.

Improved Municipal Legal Environment for HOAs Operation. The HSP brought essential positive changes into the municipal housing legislation addressing the HOAs operation spheres:

The City of Tver:

- On November 24, 2008, based on the HSP’s recommendations, the Tver city government adopted a municipal program on capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings in 2008 - 2009. When implementing this municipal program the city government actively cooperated with the non-commercial partnership “Association of organizations for management and servicing of multifamily apartment buildings”. Commissioned by the housing and utility department of the Tver city government, the “Association of organizations for management and servicing of multifamily apartment buildings” became a resource center for the city’s homeowners associations, disseminated the methodological materials designed in the course of the “Homeowners support” project, provided consultations, and implemented information campaigns.

- On April 3, 2008, based on recommendations of the HSP, the head of the Tver city government issued a Resolution No.926 “On eligibility of multifamily apartment buildings for participation in the “Tver municipal program of capital renovation of select multifamily apartment buildings” which explained the participation eligibility criteria of the federal capital renovation program to the city residents and prevented social tension among non-qualifying residents.

- The following acts were adopted based on the HSP’s recommendations: (i) a Resolution No.2654 of the head of the city government of October 3, 2008, entitled “On the procedure regulating the distribution of subsidies received from the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform, the regional co-financing fund, and the budget of the city of Tver among homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, housing committees, and housing management organizations for the purpose of capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings as per RF Federal Law No.185-FZ “On the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform”; (ii) a Resolution No.236-pa of the government of Tver region of August 19, 2008, entitled “On contracting organizations by homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, housing cooperatives, and other specialized consumer cooperatives or management companies contracted by apartment owners in multifamily apartment buildings for capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings using funds provided in compliance with RF Federal Law No.185-FZ of July 21, 2007, “On the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform”, (iii) a Resolution No.238-pa of the government of Tver region of August 25, 2008, entitled “On approving the criteria of eligibility for subsidies made available by the regional fund for co-financing of the costs of the municipalities of Tver region for capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings using funds from the Tver regional budget and the financing made available by the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform”, and (iv) a Resolution No.1045 of the head of the Tver city government of April 9, 2009, entitled “On approving the plan of activities designed to reform the housing and utility industry in the city of Tver and to ensure availability of financing from the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform”.

The city of Nizhni Novgorod:

- Each newly established homeowners association faces the problem of selecting a qualified manager who is able to execute legally impeccable agreements with utility suppliers, put together an expense budget for the current year, keep books, and perform a variety of other functions. In view of this problem, upon a request of the Nizhniy Novgorod city government, the HSP designed a model agreement between a homeowners association and a housing management company. Today, 220 homeowners associations operate on the basis of this agreement model.
- The practice of general homeowners meetings held on a variety of occasions has demonstrated that managing companies benefit from the input provided by residents. It is especially true for multifamily apartment buildings with a large number of apartments. The bylaw on professional managers institution creation was designed with assistance of the HSP. The bylaw regulates the responsibilities of the housing manager and his interaction with the managing company on issues associated with provision of inferior quality services by contractors. The housing manager is selected at a general homeowners meeting.
- Participation in the HSP encouraged the Nizhniy Novgorod city government to look for new ways of developing the city's image and prompted it to design new and interesting ideas. Suffice it to say that a unique municipal program, "Garden City", was fully implemented in 2008 for the first time in Nizhniy Novgorod. The city experienced a genuine beautification breakthrough in 2008: the Nizhniy Novgorod city government increased the total floor area of the flowerbeds up to 100,000 square meters, which is a 10-time increase as compared to 2007. To better comprehend the scale of the program one should consider the fact that the population of the eight micro-districts whose living conditions were significantly improved by the program amounts to 50,000 people.
- Thanks to the HSP's recommendations the head of the Nizhniy Novgorod city government adopted the following resolutions: (i) "On developing of favourable conditions for the establishment and operation of homeowners associations in the city of Nizhniy Novgorod" (No.1371 of March 28, 2008), and (ii) "On providing subsidies from the Nizhniy Novgorod city budget to offset certain costs associated with registration of homeowners associations" (No.4174 of September 9, 2008).

The city of Perm:

- The city of Perm designed a municipal program, "Creating conditions for management of multifamily apartment buildings in Perm in 2007-2009". The principal goal of the program is to facilitate the development of market relations in management of multifamily apartment buildings. Implementation of this program required using innovative technologies and experienced specialists. The HSP supplied the city authorities with both. The management system was reorganized at the level of the local self-government bodies, as well as at the level of service organizations and homeowners in multifamily apartment buildings with the HSP's assistance.
- To improve the efficiency of multifamily apartment buildings the city government, supported by the HSP, designed and adopted a municipal program, "Ensuring efficient management of multifamily apartment buildings in the city of Perm in 2010 – 2012". Its principal goal is to facilitate further development of professional management of multifamily apartment buildings using a variety of methods, including deployment of the models designed in the course of the "Homeowners support" project.
- The city government, the utility sector management department, and the associations of housing management organizations ("Association of housing management companies", "Guild of housing management companies", and "Housing and utility management companies") executed collaboration agreements;
- A hot water and heating supply contract for multifamily apartment buildings was designed on the basis of the HSP's recommendations and took into account the rights and legal interests of utility suppliers and housing management service providers (homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, management companies).
- A new heating supply scheme was designed and is being finalized in Perm. This scheme is designed to alleviate the existing problems by decentralizing the heating supply, changing the thermal power rates, and promoting transparent contractual relations between utility suppliers and consumers. Consultations are underway to determine and introduce individual utility rates in multifamily apartment buildings, design a

methodology for the development and implementation of energy-saving programs in multifamily apartment buildings, and promote energy-saving methods and technologies.

Increased Availability of Capital Renovation Programs' Funds for HOAs.

- The homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives of the city of Tver took an active part in the capital renovation program facilitated by the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform. The Tver city government supported strongly the multifamily apartment buildings that had selected HOAs as a management method. In 2008, 230 multifamily apartment buildings in the city of Tver submitted their applications for capital renovation funding that was made available thanks to RF Federal Law No.185. 74 out of 230 multifamily apartment buildings scored the requisite number of points and were qualified for funding. Those who did not qualify for funding received technical assistance from the specialists of the FNE's subcontractor, a non-commercial partnership, on the basis of the recommendations provided by the HSP.

- A backup list of multifamily apartment buildings for capital renovation was created in Tver thanks to the HSP's recommendations.

- In 2008, the city spent 192.7 million roubles on capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings, including 126 million roubles provided by the Fund. The first instalment provided funding to 21 homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives in the amount of 39.5 million roubles. The second phase of the program benefited another nine homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives. A total of 20 homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives took part in the capital renovation program conducted in the city of Tver in 2009 in compliance with RF Federal Law No.185. The city government spent a total of 114.8 million roubles. Of the 465 multifamily apartment buildings managed by homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives, 50 or 11% received capital renovation financing from the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform. It is more than 13% of the total of 379 multifamily apartment buildings that received financing from the Fund in 2008 - 2009.

- Advised of specific examples of homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives, the Tver city residents learned about their neighbours' participation in the capital renovation program, as well as the difficulties and obstacles they encountered in the course of its implementation.

- The non-commercial partnership "Association of organizations for management and servicing of multifamily apartment buildings", the HSP's subcontractor, has become a part of the Tver city commission responsible for selection of multifamily apartment buildings eligible to participate in the capital renovation program.

- The methodological support provided by the HSP, enabled Nizhniy Novgorod to become one of the 20 municipalities in Russia to be the first to receive financing from the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform. Participation in regional programs enabled the city government to raise an additional billion roubles in 2008. To encourage homeowners to form homeowners associations as per the project recommendations, in 2008 the city government, for the first time in its history, spent 144 million roubles by providing subsidies to homeowners associations for capital renovation of their respective multifamily apartment buildings. This made it possible for 550 multifamily apartment buildings to undergo capital renovation.

Development of effective relations between HOAs, managing companies and public utilities providers

- Today, most citizens are trying to look for ways to cut their utility bills – it is an issue of common concern. The HSP elaborated methodological materials that can be used by managing companies and homeowners associations as a textbook on power efficiency of a multifamily apartment building. Managing companies and homeowners associations learn about new materials and technologies and use them in the respective buildings to reduce their consumption of utility resources.

- The "Fund for Support of Public Initiatives "Civic Position" and the Perm Club of the Leaders of homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives "Big Ten" initiated the establishment of a Working Group that included specialists of a condensing plant holding (TGK-9 and PSK) with the HSP

technical support. The Working Group prepared an “Address to the leaders of homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, and housing committees”, designed a step-by-step instruction that enables consumers to verify their heating bills on account of their accuracy (“Memo for consumers”), and published these materials in municipal and regional mass media.

Deployment of Executive Decisions for Ordering Services on Management & Maintenance by HOAs

- The leaders of homeowners associations often experience serious problems when holding competitions among potential contractors. In 2008 – 2009, thanks to the HSP’s assistance, such competitions were successfully held by thirty three homeowners associations in the pilot cities.

Development of Effective Relations between Managing Companies & HOAs

- Fourteen housing management companies learned how to build effective relationships with homeowners associations and how to execute housing management and maintenance agreements while taking into account the homeowners’ opinions and using the knowledge and experience acquired in the course of the demo-projects.

- The FNE’s recommendations were used to monitor, in concert with non-commercial partnerships of housing management companies, and to assess the housing management quality and rate the housing management organizations operating in Perm. Data was collected and analyzed to the objective to assess the operational efficiency of housing management companies and to enhance the value of the factors that were not legally standardized and approved: reputation, transparency, and focus on development. Homeowners associations contributed to these activities. The project helped to mobilize the housing management companies and leaders of homeowners associations whose professional performance was objectively evaluated. For example, the monitoring results demonstrated that prior to the project the homeowners in Perm were not provided with comprehensive and understandable housing management reports.

- The housing management companies operating in the pilot territories have become more customer-oriented. Commercial companies providing housing management services have come to realize that it is homeowners residing in multifamily apartment buildings who are their customers and they are their conscientious providers.

Networking of Housing NGOs & HOAs

- The project helped to establish 14 information and consultation offices under territorial self-government bodies in the city of Perm. It was planned that the number of these offices will reach 87 by the end of 2009. They all are supplied with information and methodological resources developed in the course of the demo-projects.

- Upon recommendation of the HSP, the government of Nizhniy Novgorod, in concert with the Nizhniy Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations, created a network of five legal support centers for the population on the basis of the district administrations. The trainers/consultants trained in the course of the HSP’s demo-projects, established also a Homeowners’ Leaders’ Club that worked with the Nizhniy Novgorod residents by involving them in housing management activities.

- The Club of Homeowners Associations’ Leader, “Big Ten”, was established by the Perm Fund for Support of Public Initiatives “Civic Position”. It brought together 10 leaders of homeowners associations and acted as a resource center for their colleagues and homeowners’ initiative groups. This Club of homeowners associations established in the course of the demo-projects, ensured the foundation for the development of the club movement in Perm that is accounted for by establishment of three more clubs.

- The HSP established a network of five public boards under the Tver city district administrations that brought together the homeowners associations and housing construction cooperatives of each particular district. This institution provided access to the HSP’s information and methodological resources to the city apartment owners who were looking for solutions for their housing management issues.

Table E Summary of Municipal Acts and Programs Adopted in the Course of Demonstration Projects

#	Municipal Normative Documents	Municipality
1	Resolution No.926 "On eligibility of multifamily apartment buildings for participation in the "Tver municipal program of capital renovation of select multifamily apartment buildings"	The city of Tver
2	Resolution No.2654 "On the procedure regulating the distribution of subsidies received from the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform, the regional co-financing fund, and the budget of the city of Tver among homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, housing committees, and housing management organizations for the purpose of capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings as per RF Federal Law No.185-FZ "On the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform"	The city of Tver
3	Resolution No.236-pa "On contracting organizations by homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, housing cooperatives, and other specialized consumer cooperatives or management companies contracted by apartment owners in multifamily apartment buildings for capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings using funds provided in compliance with RF Federal Law No.185-FZ of July 21, 2007, "On the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform"	The city of Tver
4	Resolution No.238-pa "On approving the criteria of eligibility for subsidies made available by the regional fund for co-financing of the costs of the municipalities of Tver region for capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings using funds from the Tver regional budget and the financing made available by the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform"	The city of Tver
5	Resolution No.1045 "On approving the plan of activities designed to reform the housing and utility industry in the city of Tver and to ensure availability of financing from the Fund for Support of the Housing and Utility Industry Reform".	The city of Tver
6	Resolution № 1256 «About Creation of Favorable Conditions for HOAs Creation and Operation"	The city of Tver
7	Resolution № 3605 "About the Plan on Rendering Assistance for Homeowners in creation and operation of HOAs"	The city of Tver
8	Resolution № 830 "About Privileges to Present Interests of the Municipal Homeowner on the General Meetings of Homeowners in Apartment Buildings of Tver"	The city of Tver
9	Resolution № 168 "About Rendering Privileges on HOAs on Creation and Registration"	The city of Tver
10	Model Agreement on Hot Water and Heating Energy Resources Delivery for the Needs of Apartment Buildings of the Tver City on the Base of Mutual Benefits for both Public Utilities Consumers and Providers"	The city of Tver

11	Municipal program "Garden City"	The city of Nizhniy Novgorod
12	Resolution No.1371 "On developing of favourable conditions for the establishment and operation of homeowners associations in the city of Nizhniy Novgorod"	The city of Nizhniy Novgorod
13	Resolution No.4174 "On providing subsidies from the Nizhniy Novgorod city budget to offset certain costs associated with registration of homeowners associations"	The city of Nizhniy Novgorod
14	Municipal program "Ensuring efficient management of multifamily apartment buildings in the city of Perm in 2010 – 2012"	The city of Perm
15	Resolution N 74 "About the Order on Provision of Municipal Financial Support for Capital Renovation of Common Property of Apartment Buildings"	The city of Perm
16	Resolution N 71 "About Approval of Municipal Target Program on Capital Renovation of the Common Property in Apartment Buildings for 2009 in Perm"	The city of Perm
17	Resolution N 80 "About Approval of Municipal Target Program on Procedures for Rendering Public Utility Resources (heating energy, hot and cold water, electricity, gas) for Consumers in According with Common Counters Data Covering Actual Use of Resources for 2009"	The city of Perm

Impact on the Housing Stock Management Sector by Component Two

Strengthening the operational capacity of HOAs. The HSP strengthened the HOAs by supporting civic initiatives and public activities designed to protect the consumer rights of the citizens of the pilot territories. The HSP designed and deployed special technologies that the consumers and suppliers of housing and utility services could use to effectively coordinate their interests, and supply the key stakeholders with the skills required to interact while avoiding conflicts. The HSP created conditions required to consolidate the civil society in the protection of consumer rights via: (i) summarizing and disseminating the best practices in advocacy of the rights of the consumers of housing and utility services; (ii) deployment of technologies designed to enable the consumers and suppliers of housing and utility services to coordinate their interests effectively, and to train the principal stakeholders of the pilot territories in democratic collaboration skills; (iii) making the relations between the consumers and suppliers more transparent and providing them with a better access to reliable information; (iv) elaboration of a mechanism that ensures an ongoing qualified dialogue between the consumers and suppliers, as well as the local municipalities and state power bodies. The HSP developed also a core of housing management professionals within the HOAs-community which are sustainable and competitive in a developing housing market.

- **Strengthening the institutional capacity of HOAs.** The horizontal links that emerged within the non-governmental housing community have facilitated its consolidation and professionalization and supported its systemic collaboration with the local governments. The parties now jointly monitor the progress of housing and utility sector reforms, forecast the outcomes of each phase, and respond promptly to negative trends. The HSP carefully analyzed complex problems arose in the course of the demo-projects and reported them to the local governments, as well as the public expert boards and commissions that have been established there. Network awareness of rights and responsibilities under housing laws improved under the HSP brought to formulation of clear demands on government-business-citizen collaboration in the format of the RF Ministry of the Regional Development Public Council, the Federal Tariff Agency

Public Council, and the Commission on Regional Development & Local Government acting under auspices of the RF Public Chamber.

Development of public-private partnership. The HSP has put the basis for development of effective government-citizens-business collaboration in the pilot municipalities, and for building regional teams responsible for homeowners' associations' development and support. The HSP developed the capabilities of HOAs and local governments to collaborate effectively and to use resources in the most productive manner that allowed to access additional technical and financial resources.

Building up the expert community. The HSP's methodological materials and practical recommendations as well as a training and technical assistance programs were incorporated in the municipal practices that resulted in a supportive environment in which residents could identify and explore local resources and enhance the performance of existing housing management infrastructure. The HSP's recommendations addressing professional management of apartment buildings were also incorporated in the managing companies' practices that resulted in improving of housing services delivery for HOAs. The development of workable models, extensive training programs and knowledge transfer created a basic personnel reserve of public trainers with the knowledge and skills to carry-on the effective housing stock management programs initiated under the HSP. Building up the expert community in the area of housing management with public participation ensured establishing of fair norms and rules in municipal programs which made them more receptive to public needs.

Market development in the housing stock management area. Representatives of the authorities of the pilot municipalities stated that the leaders of homeowners associations, housing construction cooperatives, and housing management companies have become more professional and homeowners have become more aware of housing management issues. The process of establishment and registration of homeowners associations in the pilot municipalities has become more dynamic. 10% of the multifamily apartment buildings in the pilot municipalities are managed by homeowners associations which are capable to develop contractual relations with managing companies and public utilities providers. The market of housing management services has become truly competitive: 27 housing organizations of various legal-organizational forms operate on this market in Tver, 58 – in Nizhniy Novgorod, and 65 – in Perm. There are examples of positive relations between homeowners and managing organizations and public utilities providers. The Homeowners Support Project has effectively promoted real, viable opportunities for housing market development in the pilot municipalities and people with the initiative and capacity to take advantage of those opportunities.

Objectives by Component Three

The HSP has arranged a public information campaign on homeowners' associations operation that was ongoing for the life of the project. The information campaign was aimed at promoting broad understanding of housing issues through (i) involving journalists in training events and conferences; (ii) providing press releases on the major HSP's accomplishments; (iii) airing of Public Service Announcements (PSAs) & longer educational videos on local and regional television; (iv) organizing a series of advocacy initiatives aimed at developing skills required to prepare information requests & submitting them to local self-government bodies and managing companies; (v) bridging information gap about housing reform issues, including establishment and development of homeowners associations, apartment building management models, coordination of interests and development of working relations among stakeholders; and (vi) promoting housing culture and consolidating local communities by celebrating professional holidays, such as the Utility Worker Day, the Habitat Day, and the International Neighbors' Day.

Information Campaign Launch

On December 14, 2007 the Congress of All-Russia Association of Homeowners took place in Moscow. The Congress has become the first public event under the HSP. It was aimed at launching the information campaign on the HSP's prospective activities related to operation of homeowners' associations in Russia. The number of Congress participants was twice as large as that initially planned – 200 persons. The Congress representatives were comprised of homeowners associations, management companies, banks and insurance companies, service providers, housing NGOs, and local governments from 37 municipalities of the Russian Federation. The Congress Program included various communication forms and channels: the Exhibition of regional methodological and informational materials in the housing education area, plenary sessions and public discussions, the press conference, and presentations of the regional Housing Education Schools as well as the members of the All-Russia Association of Homeowners.

This event addressed also the problem of inferior quality of materials on the housing and utility sector reform published by regional mass media. At the outset of the project the HSP analyzed the contents of eligible materials published by regional mass media outlets, as well as the structure of information media. The HSP has managed also to provide inventory of existing experiences to identify the best regional methodological materials that could be used for guidelines development. It has assessed regional practices in housing self-management, evaluated the regional demand for methodological and educational support, and started building regional teams responsible for homeowners' associations' development in Russia.

The Congress participants developed a Final Resolution that included a set of proposals aimed at improving housing stock management and its information coverage in the mass media in Russia. Thirty mass media outlets were carefully watching the Congress events, which were covered in thirty two articles published in newspapers, specialized magazines, and websites²⁸.

Selection of the Key Information Sponsor.

To ensure effective and professional coverage of the HSP in mass media the FNE conducted a competition to identify the key information sponsors. Selection criteria included: (i) a publication's

²⁸ The Congress's materials that include a list of participant, a program, photos, a final resolution, and publications are available on request.

profile; (ii) an experience in covering large-scale projects; (iii) a distribution geography, and (iv) a reading audience. Based on the results of the contest, agreements²⁹ were executed with the All-Russia Association of HOAs (a portal www.tsj.ru), a magazine (“ZHKH and Construction”), and an information agency (“Agency on Social Information”) which proved to be effective in professional coverage of the HSP events.

The HSP Thematic Web-site

The thematic website (<http://tsg-rf.ru>) was developed to serve for providing a wide access to housing related issues and the HSP’s ongoing activities for interested parties of the Russian Federation. It was helpful also for evaluation of quantitative and qualitative parameters of the housing and utility reform in Russian Federation as well as the HSP’s impact on the process. To promote the Project and to ensure wide access to information, the HSP facilitated also five thematic discussions in a forum format among interested stakeholders serving as information sources for publications in media. Seventy five housing related news were allocated on the web-site in the course of the HSP³⁰.

Training Events for Media Specialists

The thematic seminar, entitled “The Housing Reform Informational Support”, was aimed at developing a core of professional media specialists from the pilot territories in the area of the housing issues coverage. The HSP targeted 20 reform-minded media specialists which were able to apply the knowledge gained from training into practices. It was important also that trainees to be able to provide continuity and leadership after the HSP ended. Three pilot municipalities’ media teams were comprised of: (i) specialists from public relations departments of the local governments, (ii) TV/Radio, and (iii) newspaper/journal outlets. They all met a set of selection criteria that included: (i) a successful background in the housing reform coverage; (ii) availability of publications/broadcasts in the housing area; and (iii) active participation in the HSP diverse events. During the training session the following themes were covered: (i) regional and municipal practices for housing reform informational support; (ii) market-oriented informational models for the housing reform support; and (iii) the housing reform competency increasing. In order to better access the trainees, the HSP used various training methods: (i) a round table, (ii) a brain-storming; (iii) individual and in-group presentations; (iv) analysis of regional publications on housing issues related topics; and (v) a housing management related issues case-study. As a result of the workshop three regional teams of media specialists were prepared to promote the housing reform through sharing the HSP best practices received in the course of the demonstration projects. The HSP has followed up fostering the professional media community within the housing sphere in the course of a series of training seminars, entitled ‘The Housing Reform Informational Support’ on February 17-19, 2009 in the pilot municipalities. These training sessions targeted 46 regional media specialists. The HSP training themes included: (i) marketing analysis; (ii) informational strategies and operational procedures; (iii) in-depth study of housing issues & their structuring, and (iv) quality reporting on the housing reform progress. The participants improved their knowledge in a variety of issues related to the housing and utility sector reform and acquired practical skills required to prepare effective educational and evidential materials on the progress of the housing and utility sector reform for the mass reader. As a result, regional teams consisting of journalists and municipal information policy specialists were created in Perm, Tver, and Nizhny Novgorod to provide information support to the housing and utility sector reform at the local level.

²⁹ The agreements executed with the HSP’s information sponsors are available on request.

³⁰ Available on request.

Collaboration with Media Institutions

The HSP has developed a threefold approach towards collaboration with federal and regional mass media that included: (i) building upon information partnership with federal mass media; (ii) developing working relationship with public relations departments of the regional and local administrations.; and (iii) provision of access to regional mass media through networking of housing NGOs. Such network-based collaboration allowed utilizing media access to highlight homeowners associations' issues. The HSP developed also the distribution list based on the results of federal and regional mass media mapping to disseminate information about the project implementation and accomplishments.

Table F List of Media Outlets Collaborated with the HSP

#	Specialized periodicals designated for the housing and utility sector specialists	Non-specialized regional mass media outlets
1	"ZHKH & Construction" (federal magazine)	"Moskovskaya Sreda" (newspaper)
2	«ZHKH: Magazine for a Manager & a Chief Accountant" (federal magazine)	"Arguments & Facts – Nizhniy Novgorod" (newspaper)
3	«Apartment Building Management" (federal magazine)	«Perm's News" (newspaper)
4	"Housing & Communal Reform" (federal magazine)	"Echo of Perm" (radio)
5	"ZHKH – Info" (federal magazine)	"Regional Perm Radio"
6	"Communal Complex of Russia" (federal magazine)	The Perm Regional TV "GTRK-Perm"
7	"Management & Investments: Construction & ZHKH" (federal magazine)	"Arguments & Facts – Prikam'e" (newspaper)
8	"ZHKH. Technologies & Equipment" (federal magazine)	"New Newspaper" (Nizhniy Novgorod)
9	"Zhilkomaudit" (federal magazine)	"New Times" (Saratov newspaper)
10	"Arbitrazh Practices in ZHKH" (federal magazine)	Informational Agency "Tver-Info"
11	"ZHKH" (federal magazine)	Informational Agency "Info-Press"
12	"News of ZHKH" (federal magazine)	Informational Agency "New Region – Perm"
13	"The Chairman of HOA" (federal magazine)	Informational Agency «IF- Regions»
14	«Affordable & Comfortable Housing" (federal magazine)	Informational Agency «NTA-Povolzh'e"
15	«Housing Accountant» (S-Petersburg magazine)	Informational Agency "Nizhniy Novgorod"
16	«Консьержъ-консультант» (S-Petersburg magazine)	Informational Agency "Birzha Plus"
17	"S-Petersburg's House" (S-Petersburg magazine)	Informational Agency «REGNUM"
18	"Construction & ZHKH News" (Saratov magazine)	Informational Agency "News – NN"
19	"Construction. Architecture. ZHKH of Khakassia" (Abakan magazine)	Informational Agency "Rosbalt"
20	"ZHKH of Ural" (Sverdlovsk magazine)	"Delovoe Prikam'e" (newspaper)
21	"UrFO: Construction. ZHKH" (Sverdlovsk magazine)	Informational Agency "RIA Vremya-N" (NN)
22	"Kvartirny Ryad" (Moscow newspaper)	Saratov regional newspaper
23	"Kons'erzh" (S-Petersburg newspaper)	"Nizhegorodskiy rabochiy"
24	"Construction" (newspaper)	"Tverskaya Gazeta"
25	Information Center of Housing and Communal Reform" http://www.jkh-reforma.ru/news_5599.html	Informational Agency «NEWS-NN»
26		The Perm TV "Vetta"
27		The Tver Informational Agency "
29		Agency on Social Information
30		INTERFAX
31		Informational Agency "Alliance Media"
33		"Tver's Life" (newspaper)
34		Informational Agency RBK http://top.rbc.ru/
38		Informational Agency "REGIONS.ru"
41		Informational Agency "Tatar – Inform" http://www.tatar-inform.ru
42		Informational Agency "The Perm's Neighbors"

Collaboration with Federal and Local Governmental Institutions

The HSP developed effective collaboration with the following official institutions: (i) the Administration of the City of Tver (<http://www.tver.ru>); (ii) the Department of Public Relations of the Nizhniy Novgorod Administration; (iii) the Nizhniy Novgorod Regional Law Information Department; (iv) the Administration of the City of Perm (<http://www.gorodperm.ru>); (v) the Department on the Information Policy of the Tver Administration; (vi) the Regional Information Agency of the Nizhniy Novgorod Region Government; (vii) the Ministry of Energy & ZHKH of Perm Region (<http://www.midural.ru>); (viii) the Public Relations Department of the RF Public Chamber; (ix) the Public Relations Department of the Ministry of ZHKH of the Nizhniy Novgorod Regional Government (<http://www.businesscom.ru>); (x) the Administration of the city of Nizhniy Novgorod (<http://www.admcity.nnov.ru>); (xi) the Administration of the city of Perm, and (xii) the All-Russia Council on Local Governance (<http://www.vsmsinfo.ru>).

Collaboration with the NGO-Community

The HSP collaborated with the FNE Network of Housing Schools which covered its events in their portals (Kaliningrad: <http://kaliningrad.shgp.ru>; Nizhniy Novgorod: <http://nnov.shgp.ru>; Perm: <http://perm.shgp.ru> & www.shgp.ru) as well as with International NGOs: IREX <http://irex-dialog.ru>; "Forum of Donors" <http://www.donorsforum.ru>; The Institute on Collective Action <http://ikd.ru/node/7502>

Conducting Targeted Information Campaign

The HSP supported targeted information campaigns held in the course of the demo-projects:

Perm: The "Association of management companies" and the TV-company "Vetta" conducted a joint information project dedicated to neighbourhood communities and the Day of neighbours, "Our neighbours" that accumulated a bank of success stories about neighbourhood communities in Perm.

The "Civic Position" Fund, together with the "Delovoye Prikamye" weekly, implemented a project designed to provide methodological support to organizations providing services to multifamily apartment buildings. They weekly regularly published the HSP's methodological materials on organizing professional management of multifamily apartment buildings. The project proved to be very successful as witnessed by the large number of readers' letters addressed to the Fund and received by the weekly's editorial board. The "Civic Position" Fund initiated another information project that was implemented in partnership with the "Arguments and Facts" weekly. The permanent rubric created by this periodical, "Ask Vasenin", was very popular among the Perm residents. The hotline with Alexandra Yegorova, the head of the Perm housing education school, available in the printed, as well as the online version of the weekly, helped to identify the most relevant problems encountered for by homeowners associations. The "Civic Position" Fund actively used a variety of information technologies, including online conferencing. The topics of discussion were determined in compliance with the HSP's concept. Thanks to the weekly mailings of the "Homeowners support" project materials to the mass media outlets operating in Perm region the "Civic Position" Fund managed to establish partner relations with the "Zvezda" newspaper which started publishing housing education materials on a regular basis. These electronic mailings also encouraged the Perm regional mass media outlets to actively seek advice from the HSP regarding assessment and methodological substance of their materials on the housing and utility sector reform. For example, the correspondents of the newspaper "Iskra" (Kungur), the newspaper "Iskra" (Lysva), and "Diksy-News" information service (Tchaikovsky) have become the HSP's permanent information customers. The official website of the Perm city administration regularly published information about the "Homeowners support" project activities also.

Tver: The "Association of organizations for management and servicing of multifamily apartment buildings" initiated the production of a series of thematic television shows on the city's housing and utility industry as a

part of the “Reform” rubric of the TV Center’s “Business Tver” program. The show was aired every other week. The “Association” helped also to produce a series of radio shows, “Eliminating housing illiteracy”, in partnership with the Tver State Television and the Radio Broadcasting Company “Tver”. Based on the “Homeowners support” project materials the department of public communications of the Tver city government published a brochure, “Quality of life at the time of the housing and utility sector reform”. The brochure was published in the amount of 999 copies. It was distributed by district administrations among managing companies, homeowners associations, and housing construction cooperatives. The official website of the Tver city administration regularly published information about the “Homeowners support” project activities also.

Nizhniy Novgorod: The Nizhniy Novgorod Union of Homeowners Associations cooperated with the regional radio broadcasting company “GTRK – Nizhniy Novgorod” within the framework of the permanent weekly rubric “Neighbours”. This radio company has broadcasted 22 shows produced on the basis of the “Homeowners support” project materials. The radio shows involved the project experts, leaders of homeowners associations, representatives of housing management companies and municipal bodies of power. Over the course of the “Homeowners support” project the organization received a significant amount of inquiries from journalists seeking information on various housing-related issues. The Nizhniy Novgorod mass media outlets published approximately one hundred articles based on the “Homeowners support” project materials. The newspaper “Den Goroda” founded by the city government has become a reliable partner of the Association. The official website of the Nizhniy Novgorod city administration regularly published information about the “Homeowners support” project activities also.

Advocacy Campaign

Five Advocacy Campaigns were conducted at the level of residents - to improve their housing culture and to enhance their housing responsibility, and at the level of local self-government bodies, managing companies, and service providers - to ensure transparency and accessibility of information required by homeowners and to enhance reporting responsibilities of managing companies and homeowners associations. The HSP supported the implementation of the following advocacy initiatives: (i) a campaign to assess transparency and accessibility of information required to establish and register homeowners associations, as well as accessibility of financial information of managing companies and service providers, and to organize demonstration presentations of annual reports of managing companies and homeowners associations that involved twelve thousand of stakeholders; (ii) presentations, conferences, campaign sticker organized to celebrate professional holidays, such as the Utility Worker Day, the Habitat Day, and the International Neighbors' Day which involved fifteen thousand residents. The goal of these events was to draw attention of all the subjects of housing relations to the condition of the housing environment and the need to bear collective responsibility for the future of our cities, as well as the need to exercise one of the fundamental civic rights - the right to housing³¹.

Large-scale events

The HSP has managed to hold six large-scale events instead of two initially planned:

(i) *The Congress of the All-Russia Association of Homeowners Associations* aimed at launching the information campaign on the HSP’S prospective activities held on December 14, 2007.

³¹ The best practices are described in the Code of Best Practices.

(ii) The RF Public Chamber Session. 175 representatives of stakeholders groups involved in housing stock management as well as the NGO and Media communities from 23 Russian municipalities participated in the Session, entitled “The Role of the Civic Organizations in Prevention Strategies Development Against Unfair Competition Procedures in the Housing Market” conducted by the Local-Government and Housing Policies Commission of the RF Public Chamber and the All-Russia Association of HOAs on July 24, 2008 in Moscow;

(iii) *The Second Congress of the All-Russia Association of Homeowners Associations*. The Congress³² was conducted on October 7 – 8, 2008 on the World Habitat Day as a joint initiative of the New Eurasia Foundation and the Public Chamber of the Russian Federation. It was also supported by the Public councils acting under auspices of the RF Ministry of Regional Development and the Federal Tariff Service; the Institute for Urban Economics, the All-Russia Association of HOAs, the Siberian Coal and Energy Company OJSC SUEK and the MIEL Company. The Congress was aimed at analyzing regional policies and practices in the field of the capital renovation under the Federal program “About the Fund on the Housing Reform Assistance”. A review of grassroots’ strategies, approaches, and lessons learned provided an opportunity to reflect on possible recommendations for future capital renovation policies’ improvement in Russia. The Congress was aimed also at sharing the HSP’s methodological and informational recommendations as well as the best municipal capital assets renovation practices which were tested in Perm, Nizhni Novgorod and Tver among the other Russian municipalities. Three hundred representatives of homeowners associations, non-commercial organizations, regional and municipal governments from 67 municipalities of 50 Russian regions together with federal agencies and the RF State Duma discussed a range of issues associated with capital renovation of multifamily apartment buildings. The Congress participants put together a common Resolution (a list of proposals) addressed to federal and regional agencies. The Resolution determined objectives of non-commercial organizations and homeowners associations as well as recommendations on increasing efficiency of the capital renovation programs in Russia. The HSP has leveraged additional resources that included the MIEL Company’s contribution of \$10,000; the Public Chamber’s contribution of \$8,000; IREX - \$11,000; and the European Union Project “Association of Tenants” -\$10,000. The total funds raised were \$ 39,000.

(iv) The Housing Reform Information Support Forum³³. The Forum was conducted under the International Exhibition of Housing and Construction as a part of a celebration event held under the Housing and Utility Services Providers’ Day on March 18, 2009. The Forum has been arranged as a joint initiative of the FNE and the International “Expo Company”. It was also supported by the Public councils acting under auspices of the RF Ministry of Regional Development and the Federal Tariff Service; and the All-Russia Association of HOAs. The Forum was aimed at contributing to the expert community formation in the sphere of the housing reform informational support in the Russian Federation. It was also objected to share the HSP’s methodological recommendations as well as the best municipal informational practices among the other Russian municipalities. A review of federal, regional, and municipal informational strategies brought to elaboration of new effective information approaches. 103 representatives of homeowners associations, NGOs, governments of all levels and businesses discussed a range of issues associated with the housing reform informational support. The Forum participants put together a common Resolution (a list of proposals) addressed to federal agencies. The Resolution comprised recommendations on increasing efficiency of the housing reform informational support programs in Russia. The Forum has closed a serious of the HSP training events targeted media specialists. The Congress was not included in the HSP approved award budget. No extra USAID budget funds were used. FNE has managed to raise additional funds through collaboration with the Expo Company.

³² The Congress’s materials that include a list of participant, a program, photoes, a final resolution, and publications are available on request.

³³ The Forum’s materials that include a list of participant, a program, photoes, a final resolution, and publications are available on request.

(v) *The Public Hearings under the topic "Informational Policies in the Housing Sphere" held under the RF Public Chamber Commission on Local Governance and Housing Policies.*³⁴ . The Hearings has become a logical continuation of the FNE efforts on developing effective informational policies in the housing sphere. It was conducted on June 24, 2009. The Hearings was aimed at contributing to the government policies formation in the sphere of the housing reform informational support in Russian Federation. 57 representatives of homeowners associations, non-commercial organizations, governments of all levels and businesses from 48 municipalities discussed a range of issues associated with the housing reform informational support. The Hearings' participants put together a common Resolution (a list of proposals) addressed to federal agencies. The Resolution comprised recommendations on increasing efficiency of the housing reform informational support programs in Russia; and

(vi) *The Third Congress of the the All-Russia Association of Homeowners Associations.* Results of the demonstration projects and good practices identified in the course of implementation of demo-projects were presented to promote good governance practices and to replicate proved to be successful housing management models throughout the Russian regions. The Congress³⁵ was organized and conducted at the final phase of the Project on October 23-24, 2009 in Moscow and brought together 200 representatives of homeowners associations, homeowners support institutions, federal, regional and municipal authorities, housing service providers and managing companies, and the expert community from 157 municipalitie

Collaboration with the International Community

The Russian housing policy, which evolves in consideration of the market laws, brings about fundamentally new legal, economic, and technological approaches that are effectively used on the market of housing management services. In this sense, the experiences acquired and tested over the decades by other countries become very relevant. The New Eurasia Foundation has established solid relations with foreign partners to study effective housing stock management models used internationally: the International Union of Tenants (to study technologies on promotion of tenants' rights and interests); the Canadian Executive Service Organization (CESO)(to study self-regulation in the housing stock management sphere); the Estonian Union of Homeowenrs (to study networking approaches), and others.

The HSP's accomplishments resulted in the international community positive perception of the housing regarding issues. The FNE has submitted a proposal for an auction session held under the Grantmakers East Forum (www.gef.efc.be)³⁶ falling under the topic "Regional Housing Markets: Similarities and Diversities". The session was competitively selected by GEF participants, so this fact can serve as a confirmation that this theme and the issues proposed for the discussion are of big interest in CIS. The Forum was conducted on October 9- 10, 2008 in Dubrovnik (Croatia).The FNE's session discussed the role which diverse groups of housing sector stakeholders play in national and regional housing markets to create innovative solutions to existing housing challenges by building a more inclusive society. The presentations were based on the HSP's best practices.

³⁴ The Public Hearings's materials that include a list of participant, a program, photoes, a final resolution, and publications are available on request.

³⁵ The Congress's materials that include a list of participant, a program, photoes, a final resolution, and publications are available on request.

³⁶ The Grantmakers East Forum's materials are available on request.

Code of Good Practices

The HSP has collected the most impressive accomplishments and experiences in the format of a Code of Best Practices³⁷. Technologies reflected in this Code, were replicated in 2,312 municipalities of the Russian Federation and were available on the Project website.

A monograph, including the library of best practices and summative evaluation of project accomplishments was produced at the end of the project along with the multimedia disk containing all practical recommendations and guidelines; model approaches descriptions, and case studies³⁸.

Component Three Main Accomplishments:

Creation of an open information access system. Representatives of all economy sectors (commercial and non-commercial organizations, governmental and municipal structures) and all population groups (housing owners and tenants) participate in the process of management of multifamily apartment buildings. The HSP created an open information access system for all these groups. The HSP designed a *differentiated marketing strategy that took into account the needs of each segment of the housing market* that included: (i) provision the homeowners with the knowledge and practical skills they require when deciding to organize a homeowners association and choosing the housing management method; (ii) explanation to homeowners their rights and responsibilities in respect of common property elements; (iii) engagement of homeowners in management of their multifamily apartment buildings; (iv) education of residents and homeowners in professional performance of housing management functions; (v) development of constructive collaboration among all the housing management stakeholders; (vi) promotion of effective economic collaboration practices ensuring the provision of quality housing management services between homeowners and tenants, homeowners associations, managing organizations and utility suppliers, and local municipalities; (vii) promotion of successful housing management practices combining self-organization of homeowners and professional housing management functions; (viii) protection of the right of homeowners to buy quality housing and utility services; and (ix) popularization of the activities of NGOs supporting the efforts of homeowners and their associations in self-organization and management of multifamily apartment buildings.

Strategic approaches included: (i) production of target informational products meeting informational requirements of each of target groups; and (ii) creation of effective communication channels.

Development of new housing-related communication channels. A broad information campaign conducted at the national and local levels, has employed various communication channels such as the Internet, federal, regional, and local mass media, 'Housing Literacy' programs on the radio, and housing holidays celebrations. A specialized website reflected the project progress and provided online opportunities for collaboration and consultations to all interested stakeholders.

Better informed Russian citizens of the possibilities and mechanisms on participation in the housing reform. More than fifty thousand housing market stakeholders received housing-related information under the HSP various communication channels in the pilot municipalities. 2,312 municipalities of the Russian Federation received the open access for the HSP information products that served to their better understanding of what is intended by the housing and communal reform. The HSP provided for common understanding among residents as well as local officials of how to assert more control over the housing stock management and maintenance. This resulted in creation of necessary conditions to ensure transparent and accountable management of the housing stock and to protect consumers' rights.

Professionalization of information producers and distributors. On the base of comparative analysis the HSP divided all media publications into two distinctive groups: *educational and evidential*.

³⁷ Appendix 5

³⁸ Appendix 6

Educational materials were mostly published in specialized periodicals designated for the housing and utility sector specialists. Their circulation and distribution channels were not designed for the mass reader. The number of such specialized periodicals was rather small.

Non-specialized regional mass media outlets able to reach out to a wide scope of the Russian population mostly tend to publish *evidential materials*. In most cases such materials were published in response to a negative phenomenon affecting the housing and utility sector reform that was presented to the reader as a product of said reform. Such materials distorted the meaning of the housing and utility sector reform designed to create a class of effective homeowners who have the right to manage their own homes. Based on these observations the HSP developed a strategy to provide a maximum access for training for non-specialized regional mass media to be more effective in informational support of the housing and communal reform. Sixty six journalists, information producers and distributors acquired skills required to write articles on housing-related issues, as well as special knowledge required to prepare materials on management of multifamily apartment buildings under the HSP training programs that resulted in two hundred and ninety eight publications in both federal and regional mass media covering the HSP's activities, recommendations, and achievements³⁹.

Creation of federal venues for negotiation and formulation of the social demand on the base of the relevant federal government agencies. The HSP consolidated the civic institutions operating within the housing sphere, improved their professionalism, facilitated their access to information, and supplied them with new operation mechanisms and technologies through *creation of public negotiation venues* that were used to negotiate the interests of homeowners associations, managing companies, local governments, and utility service providers. The HSP enabled housing NGOs to form a social demand that helped to better coordinate the strategies of collaboration between the main stakeholders. Enhanced informational openness of the housing & utility spheres created conditions to exercise civic rights. Thus, the HSP designed new models of prejudicial settlement of legal disputes and provided housing NGOs & HOAs with new negotiation mechanisms to be used in their interaction with main housing stakeholders. Cooperation with federal public and expert bodies (Public Board under the RF Federal Tariffication Service, RF Public Chamber Commission for local self-government and the housing policy, Public Board under the RF Ministry of regional development) brought the regional problems to the attention of decision-makers, better formulate problems to be addressed by governmental strategies and draft legislation, and ensure the provision of feedback from the civil society.

Impact on the Housing Stock Management Sector by Component Three

Improved coverage of housing issues in local press. The HSP improved the quality of information and expanded the readership in regard to the housing reform related issues. The results of the monitoring of regional publications confirmed that the major part of regional mass media was involved into the HSP training activities that ensured the high quality information products and their recognition by local communities. Building up the media expert community that shared the HSP mission and strategy all over Russia was very important as it helped to establish fair norms and rules in support of homeowners' associations' effective operation and to adapt the most effective house stock management tools. It promoted also the housing movement in Russia.

Improved advocacy skills and networking capacities of homeowners associations. The number of civil society organizations that worked on housing issues and in support of homeowners in Russia was increased twice under the All-Russia Association of Homeowners. The All-Russia Association of Homeowners' Associations acting as an independent advocacy NGO and representing the interests of homeowners' associations with regard to maintenance, operation, and renovation issues and including twenty five regional NGOs, served as a networking agent and provided more than

³⁹ Publications are available on request.

57 municipalities of the Russian Federation with training and information services on property management, renovation strategies, and resolution of housing issues.

The housing NGOs and HOAs got the clear vision on their strategies and professional demands for future effective operation. They were able to influence the key decisions in the area of housing policies. Thus, the last initiatives elaborated by the Association, have become the appeals to the Russian Federation Government on establishment of the Committee on Housing Issues at the State Duma and on creation of a target federal information housing program. Network awareness of rights and responsibilities under housing laws improved under the HSP brought to formulation of clear demands on government-business-citizen collaboration in the format of the RF Ministry of the Regional Development Public Council, the Federal Tariff Agency Public Council, and the Commission on Regional Development & Local Government acting under auspices of the RF Public Chamber.

Enhanced public participation in determining municipal development priorities. The homeowners' associations were fully empowered to perform their functions. This resulted in broad public participatory in the housing issues related campaigns at the local level and the housing policy regulation at the federal one through broad discussion in the mass media, involving representatives from the local governments, consumer rights associations, business community, and other public organisations of the country.

Ensuring sustainability of the Homeowners Support Project upon its completion the New Eurasia Foundation communicated and disseminated models and recommendations elaborated and tested within the framework of the project to three thousand of federal and regional authorities, relevant ministries and agencies, regional NGOs and HOAs' associations, and business associations.

Creation of a favourable environment for housing movement in Russia. The HSP created favourable conditions for housing movement in Russia. The positive changes included an improved socio-communicative environment within the municipalities achieved through the establishment of neighbourly relations within multifamily apartment buildings, as well as a system of mutual relations between the property owners, homeowners associations, managing companies, and local self-government bodies. The HSP promoted also the creation of voluntary public associations - consumers of the services of the housing and communal sector that assured accounting for the real value and scope of housing and communal services consumed by the population, establishment of the mutual responsibilities of the producers and consumers of the services of the sector on a contract basis, development of a civilised market, on the attainment of which the state should gradually abolish administrative management of the sector.

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Reinforcing the Replication of the HSP's Models. The HSP's strategy relied on competitive market forces to replicate and to extend the better housing management practices being implemented by the core group of model homeowners associations from the pilot municipalities in cooperation with other main stakeholders with broad citizens participatory. Nonetheless, the characteristics typical of housing management sphere today in Russia: vertical integration, heavy reliance on federal budget funds in concern with capital renovation, violated rights of consumers, inability to rely on contracts, lack of self-regulating in the housing management sphere, rare use of energy efficient technologies, and a dysfunctional credit system, form a profile of adaptation to an exceedingly hostile enabling environment. Improvement of the enabling environment could provide a great impulse for housing system revival and growth. This could be obtained through the logical follow-on to the technical assistance approach followed under the HSP. Therefore, the recommendation is to expand the efforts devoted to developing housing stock management sector in the following areas:

Public Utilities Sector Perspective Development. The Russian utility industry (networks and infrastructure) is the country's most neglected economy sector due to a number of reasons, including obsolete equipment, inobservance of the rules of interaction between consumers and service providers, lack of substantiated service quality criteria, monopolisation, etc. The lack of competition within the utility sector results in constantly growing service rates and negatively affects the industry enterprises in terms of their investment attractiveness. Thus, the Russian utility service consumers are still unable to exert any tangible influence upon the housing and utility industry. Practices of collaboration and discussion of relevant issues between the citizens, local authorities, and representatives of the industry businesses are still poorly developed. It is difficult for the consumers to assess the quality of the utility services they receive due to their technological peculiarities, and enlisting professional help entails additional costs. The businesses which have monopolized the utility industry understand this situation and refuse to play by the rules, which results in a growing social tension, conflicts between the consumers and suppliers, and mass protests. But such actions of monopolists harm also to their business as lead to mass non-payments for utilities from outside citizens.

The mechanisms and practices elaborated and tested in the course of the HSP's demo-projects, can be used as the model approach for these problems solution in the Russian Federation. They include: (i) building of an infrastructure required to support public initiatives designed to ensure collaboration among the stakeholders by creating partnerships (guilds) of responsible suppliers and consumers; (ii) making utility businesses to be more transparent to the consumers by deploying negotiations venues, mediation technologies, and information campaigns; (iii) enabling of utility suppliers to deploy modern technologies and forms of collaboration with consumers, such as customer care standards, client-oriented approaches, etc; (iv) training the principal stakeholders in the types, forms, and technologies of collaboration between authorities, businesses, and NGOs; (v) improvement of the population's knowledge of the operations of utility services providers and regulators of utility service rates; (vi) creation of information resources: regional and municipal websites, brochures, leaflets, as well as publications in municipal and independent press; (vii) assisting the local residents to improve their legal literacy and acquire the skills required to formulate their interests, i.e. the public demand; (viii) NGOs engagement in the solution of local problems; and (ix) creation of federal venues for negotiation and formulation of the social demand on the base of the relevant federal government agencies like the RF Public Chamber and the public boards under the RF Ministry of regional development and the RF Federal Tariffication Service.

Self-Regulation in Housing Stock Management Sphere .The share of small businesses engaged in management of multifamily apartment buildings remains insignificant in terms of the country's economy, and the business as such is still economically inefficient despite all its attractiveness accounted for by a guaranteed demand for housing and utility services. The reasons include unfavorable exterior factors and problems affecting these organizations' institutional development. The multifamily apartment buildings management market has come to be affected by corruptive and quasi-market processes manifested in preservation of political and economic influence exerted by bodies of municipal power. Local self-government bodies ubiquitously offer economic and other advantages to former municipality-owned utility service providers and housing stock operators whose assets still include a significant amount of municipal property. At the same time, local municipal governments create administrative barriers for small and medium-sized businesses thereby preventing them from accessing the housing management market. These problems may be addressed by establishing a self-regulation institute for housing stock management that can help to make the sector economically more attractive for small and medium-sized businesses and to encourage them to be more active on the multifamily apartment buildings management market. The HSP has created a foundation for such a program through strengthening of the existing managing companies' community and development of democratic principles and promotion of openness and transparency in collaboration between the professional community of the housing stock management organizations and consumers and other economy subjects on the basis of professional standards and satisfaction of consumers' demands.

Such a program will help to create favorable legislative and regulatory environment for operation of housing management companies, as well as design industry-specific quality standards to improve the operation

quality of the housing management companies that are members of self-regulating organizations. The program will also create conditions for protection of the interests of small and medium-sized businesses in their relations with bodies of power and other market participants, on the one hand, as well as consumers' interests, on the other hand. Finally, associations of housing management companies (self-regulating organizations) will be established in the form of non-commercial organizations which will facilitate the development of democratic tendencies in the housing sphere.

The program will be serving to curbing corruption and stimulating innovation in problem-solving regarding improvement the business environment for SMEs operating in the sphere of housing management, promoting democratic principles of interrelations between all stakeholders of the housing market, and introducing new legacy self-regulation institutions in the housing management area in Russia.

Energy Efficiency of the Housing Sector. The HSP put essential efforts to assist HOAs, managing companies and local self-governments in designing capital renovation programs with improving energy efficiency approach. It is of crucial importance to continue these activities at the national level to promote energy efficiency in the Housing sector in Russia through providing users with easy access to information and resources related to energy efficiency and deployment of consumer education programs to increase consumer awareness on energy efficient technologies and measures.