



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

Palestinian Authority Capacity Enhancement Project

Gender Integration Strategy

October 2011

Palestinian Authority Capacity Enhancement Project

Gender Integration Strategy

**By Jamie Hausch and
Seba Abu Dagga**

SUBMITTED BY CHEMONICS INTERNATIONAL
October 2011

Contract No. DFD-I-06-05-00219-00

DISCLAIMER

This report is made possible by the support of the American People through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID.) The contents of this report are the sole responsibility of Chemonics International, Inc. and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States Government.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	1
A. Background	3
B. Major Gender Considerations, Challenges, and Recommendations	7
<i>PIR 1: Improved Delivery of Key Services by Targeted PA Ministries and Institutions that Result in Immediate Tangible Benefits to Citizens.....</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>PIR 2: Enhanced and Sustainable Institutional Capacity of PA ministries and Institutions.....</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Task 3: Strengthening Public Administration Programs.....</i>	<i>20</i>
C. Conclusion	21
ANNEX I: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR GENDER-SENSITIVE INDICATORS	23
ANNEX II: STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES 5 AND 9 FROM THE CROSS-SECTORAL NATIONAL GENDER STRATEGY: PROMOTING GENDER EQUALITY AND EQUITY 2011-2013	24
ANNEX III: SELECTED STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS	26
ANNEX V: SELECTED DOCUMENTS	27

Executive Summary

Over the last three years, the efforts of the Palestinian Authority Capacity Enhancement (PACE) project have resulted in significant improvements in the transparency, accountability, and capacity of the five target ministries in the Palestinian Authority (PA) — the Ministry of Public Works and Housing (MOPWH), Ministry of Finance (MOF), Ministry of Interior (MOI) Civil Affairs Directorate, Ministry of Transportation (MOT), and Ministry of Telecommunications and Information Technology (MTIT). Through the development and implementation of operating procedures manuals, renovated service centers, and re-establishment of units and service providers like the Palestine Post, PACE has also improved the efficiency, effectiveness, and responsiveness of public services.

While PACE has taken steps to incorporate gender into project initiatives, it has not developed a comprehensive gender strategy to integrate gender throughout project components and activities. Because PACE is committed to maximizing project benefits for both men and women, this strategy was developed to provide recommendations to assist project staff in mainstreaming gender throughout project activities, work planning, and monitoring and evaluation during a possible extension period for the project.

The purpose of the PACE Gender Strategy is to help guide the PACE staff in discussion with counterparts, stakeholders, and other donor projects during the work planning and implementation process. It was developed using a gender lens, based on findings and input derived from desk research and in-country discussions with ministry staff from the five target ministries (including deputy ministers, Gender Unit (GU) staff, and other high-ranking staff); the General Personnel Council (GPC), the body in charge of implementing the Civil Service Law which governs the personnel policies and other regulations within the civil service and thus the ministerial staff; and CSOs with gender missions (a list of all of these meetings and contacts can be found in Annex 3). Understanding what efforts have been undertaken to mitigate gender inequities in the Palestinian Authority (PA) and the remaining gender issues articulated by ministry staff and Gender Units, the GPC, and gender-focused CSOs enable us to make preliminary recommendations that address the cause of these gender issues while working towards PACE's goal to create a more competent public administration and provide more effective, efficient, and responsive services to the Palestinian people. In addition to discussions with ministry staff and relevant stakeholders, preliminary research was conducted through a review of gender-focused publications related to the Palestinian public sector, namely the *National Development Plan 2011-2013: Establishing the State, Building Our Future* (National Development Plan) and the *Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy: Promoting Gender Equality and Equity 2011-2013* (National Gender Strategy).

The PACE Gender Strategy describes gender considerations, constraints, and challenges identified within the five target ministries and the public services they provide. Though the PA has established the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MOWA) and created GUs to mainstream gender throughout ministerial policies, plans, and programs and mandated that the government and ministries adopt gender responsive budgeting (GRB), our research and findings suggest that the civil service and public services still face gender inequities within

budgeting, policies, plans, services, and facilities. For example, the Civil Service Law (which governs the personnel policies for ministerial staff and is currently being amended) contains gender discriminatory policies. Women’s decision-making power and ability to influence these and other gender inequities in policies and planning is limited — only 29.4%¹ of public sector employees are women, with the majority (91.2%) concentrated at the lower levels (see figure 1-1).² GUs are not fully mobilized, and there is minimal understanding or practice of gender mainstreaming or GRB within the five target ministries. Capacity building opportunities for GUs and ministry staff are limited, and there is little gender-related or sex-disaggregated data collection or monitoring and evaluation. The deficiencies regarding the GUs can be attributed to lack of budget, staff, and political will, which is rooted in misconceptions about gender and its relevance to the work of the five ministries. This is also evidenced by the fact that GUs are often excluded from work planning and budgeting. The lack of gender mainstreaming results in public services and facilities that often do not reflect and serve the unique needs of both Palestinian men and women. Despite gender mainstreaming and GRB being required practices within the government and ministries; it is unclear if PA universities intend to include relevant coursework in their public administration programs. For example, Birzeit University’s Public Administration program is already established and, while gender mainstreaming is offered as an elective course, GRB is not offered. Overall, the civil service and universities lack a strong commitment towards and capacity for gender mainstreaming and GRB.

Given these challenges, our recommendations focus on capacity building in the form of gender-related technical assistance and training. High ranking officials must be gender sensitized so that they understand the importance of gender and how it impacts ministry staff and service delivery, allowing them to more effectively advocate for the implementation of gender mainstreaming and GRB within their ministries. GUs, technical staff, and individuals in human resources (HR), planning, monitoring and evaluation, and finance departments of the five target ministries must be given training and practical experience in gender mainstreaming and GRB so that they can effectively apply it to their personnel policies, planning, monitoring, budgeting, and public services. Only through awareness raising and capacity building can we increase commitment towards gender, the mobilization of GUs, and the utilization of gender mainstreaming and GRB in both the civil service and public services. To prepare civil servants for this work, universities should ensure that gender mainstreaming and GRB training are included in their coursework.

Because of the fluid nature of the PA’s status as a self-governing body and because of the additional information that will be gained during the work planning and implementation process, this strategy should be reviewed and modified according to the needs of USAID, the ministries, and public.

1 Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women’s Affairs and UNWomen. “Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy: Promoting Gender Equality and Equity 2011-2013.” 2011. p. 32.

2 Riyada Consulting and Training. “Women’s Economic Empowerment in the West Bank, Palestine.” October 2010. P. 47

A. Background

Despite the PA's Declaration of Self-governance in 1994³, Palestinian Basic Law, the Palestinian Women's Bill of Rights, and various other treaties and conventions that forbid gender-based discrimination and call for gender equality, equity of the sexes, and equal citizenship of males and females, Palestinian women still face gender inequality in the public and private sectors. For example, some aspects of the Penal Code and criminal procedure treat men and women differently, in particularly related to "morality" offenses. Honor crime also remains a major issue, with 29 women murdered in the name of 'family honor' between 2007 and 2010.⁴

Some aspects of the Personal Status Law also reinforce gender inequality, providing differential treatment to both women and men. For example, some provisions of the law dictate that women must be obedient to their husbands and that only men may exercise polygamy and have the right to initiate divorce. Several Arab states including Algeria, Tunisia, Morocco, and, to a lesser extent, Egypt have adopted amended versions of Personal Status Laws to increase gender equality and remove discriminatory provisions, for example by allowing women to initiate a form of "no-fault divorce" or Khula'.⁵ The PA is currently studying similar amendments to personal status laws to increase gender equality. The PA is also embarking on efforts to conform local law to the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), as part of efforts to prepare for eventual statehood and join major international human rights conventions.

Patriarchal cultural norms, traditional gender roles, and inequitable laws also sometimes impede women from advancing to high-level decision making in the public and private sector and have resulted in a gender inequitable workforce and public services that do not fully take into account the needs of both male and female citizens. Men make up the vast majority of the Palestinian workforce, with the overall rate of women's participation at 15.4% in 2009. Women between the ages of 15 and 24 years of age have the lowest levels of employment, which may be attributed to early marriage, women's reproductive role, their engagement in education, and high levels of unemployment among Palestinian youth of both sexes. Overall, 60% of women in the workforce work in the informal sector, meaning they do not receive the benefits covered by the Labor Law, such as maternity leave, annual leave, and job security. As noted in the Palestinian Authority's *Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy: Promoting Gender Equality and Equity 2011-2013* (hereafter referred to as the National Gender Strategy),

The social perception of women's role in society and the lower daily wage earned by women compared to that earned by men for the same work are both discouraging factors to women seeking employment and should not be overlooked. In 2007, the daily wage for women was estimated at NIS 72,

³ The Oslo Accords, officially called the Declaration of Principles on Interim Self-Government Arrangements or Declaration of Principles (DOP).

⁴ Women's Center for Legal Aid and Counseling. "Women Without Names; Report on Femicide in the Name of Honor in Palestinian Society 2007-2010." 2010. p. 10 and 24.

⁵ UNDP. "Arab Human Development Report." 2006. p. 83.

compared to NIS 85 for men. Gaps in Palestinian labor laws and the lack of decent working conditions also influence women's low participation in the labor market (ILO, 2008, cited in National Gender Strategy).⁶

Figure 1-1. Women Holding Leadership Positions in the Public Sector⁷

Job Title	Palestinian Territories				Both
	Male	% Male	Female	% Female	
Minister	18	78.3%	5	21.7%	23
Deputy Minister	28	93.3%	2	6.7%	30
Assistant Minister	88	95.7%	4	4.3%	92
Director General A3	88	87.1%	13	12.9%	101
Director General A4	536	89.6%	62	10.4%	598
Director (A,B,C)	4,280	81.5%	971	18.5%	5,251
Employees Grades 1-10	28,384	68.8%	12,883	31.2%	41,267
Other	574	75.5%	186	24.5%	760
Total	33,978	70.6%	14,121	29.4%	48,099

The GPC reported that by 2008, women accounted for 29.4% of public sector workers — higher than the percentage of women employed in the labor market.⁸ While women have made great strides in the political and social spheres of the PA, with some rising to the ranks of minister (five of the 23 ministers are women), evidence of gender inequities is present in the relatively low-level positions held by the majority of women in the public service. Presently, 91.2% of the women employed in the public sector hold lower level positions thus limiting their decision-making power and influence within the ministries (see figure 1-1 above).

In 2003, the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MOWA) was established and endorsed by the Prime Minister, with the mandate to ensure coordination and harmonization of gender mainstreaming throughout ministries and government bodies. In 2005, women's units (renamed GUs in 2008) were created. The GUs are housed in 24 ministries (four or five ministries do not have GUs, including MTIT) for the purposes of contributing to and monitoring gender mainstreaming throughout ministerial policies, plans, and programs. Finally, in 2009 the Council of Ministries decreed that the government and ministries adopt gender-responsive budgets (GRB).⁹

What is Gender Responsive Budgeting?

“Gender-responsive budgeting (GRB) is government planning, programming and budgeting that contributes to the advancement of gender equality and the fulfillment of women's rights. It entails identifying and reflecting needed interventions to address gender gaps in sector and local government policies, plans and budgets. GRB also aims to analyze the gender-differentiated impact of revenue-raising policies and the allocation of domestic resources and Official Development Assistance.”

⁶ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. p. 28.

⁷ Op. cit., Riyadh Consulting and Training. “Women's Economic Empowerment in the West Bank, Palestine.”

⁸ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. p. 32.

⁹ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. p.9.

Though the PA and MOWA have made significant efforts to integrate gender into ministries' planning, budgeting, and monitoring and evaluation, many challenges and inequities remain in policies, laws, and services. These challenges are noted in the National Gender Strategy and were confirmed during our meetings with ministry staff, the General Personnel Council, CSOs, and implementers of public service development programs. For example, gender discriminatory policies exist in the Civil Service Law, which governs the personnel policies of ministry staff. Also, though the Council of Ministers' decisions have established GUs and called for the use of gender mainstreaming and GRB, there is a lack of will to implement both to the fullest extent. GUs are understaffed with inadequate budgets and lack the necessary skills in gender mainstreaming and GRB. Capacity building opportunities for GUs and ministry staff are limited and there is little gender-related or sex-disaggregated data collection or monitoring and evaluation of data. GUs are not engaged in work planning and budgeting or unable to contribute in a meaningful manner, and as a result, public services and facilities associated with the five target ministries are not gender sensitive or equitable.

Despite gender mainstreaming and GRB being required practices within the government and ministries, gender mainstreaming is not a required course in Birzeit's Public Administration program and a GRB course is not offered. Other universities throughout Palestine are still in the process of developing their Public Administration programs and, while many have departments of gender and/or women's studies, it is unclear whether gender mainstreaming and GRB will be offered or required courses within the program.

Most PA ministries have sparingly applied gender mainstreaming to their services and facilities, but there has been some progress. Ministry officials and heads of strategy development teams from the MOI, Ministry of Education and Higher Education, Ministry of Labor, Ministry of Youth and Sports, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of National Economy, and MoPAD have all worked with MOWA to identify gender issues and develop sectoral strategies and interventions.¹⁰

The commitment by the PA and donor community to support gender integration and to mitigate these aforementioned gender inequities in the civil service and public service is significant. This commitment is evidenced in the PA's *National Development Plan 2011-2013: Establishing the State, Building Our Future* (National Development Plan) and *Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy: Promoting Gender Equality and Equity 2011-2013* (National Gender Strategy) produced by the PA's Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. The National Development Plan describes gender equality as a "cross-cutting strategy" which "provides significant input into government policy" and states that the social policy agenda includes "targeted efforts to address disparities in service delivery based on gender [...]".¹¹ The plan concludes that there is still much to be done in the way of creating a gender equitable society and that there must be an increase in the proportion of women in leadership positions in the public sector.¹² To address gender inequities, the National

¹⁰ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. p. 10

¹¹ Palestinian National Authority. "National Development Plan 2011-2013: Establishing the State, Building Our Future." April, 2011. ps. 24, 33, and 39.

¹² Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority. p. 39.

Development Plan includes three policy commitments in relation to the empowerment of women:

- Complete a comprehensive review and amendment of all legislation to ensure that women’s equal rights are codified in the law of Palestine,
- Ensure that all our public institutions abide by a policy of, and implement plans based on, zero tolerance for discrimination and violence perpetrated against women,
- Provide dedicated funding for ongoing, independent research to monitor society’s progress towards achieving gender equality.¹³

The National Gender Strategy also seeks to address these challenges and has developed nine strategic objectives, policies, and interventions that aim to bridge the gender gap and enable women to enjoy full citizenship rights. In particular, Objectives 5¹⁴ and 9¹⁵ (see Annex 1 for full text of the objectives) fit within PACE’s scope of work and have influenced the framework of this strategy.

The National Development Plan, the National Gender Strategy, and current efforts by the GPC and an intergovernmental committee to amend the gender inequitable policies of the Civil Service Law indicate the PA’s recognition of the gender considerations, constraints, and challenges within the public sector and their commitment to reform and gender equity. Within this Gender Strategy, we outline how the PACE project can implement activities, trainings, and other interventions to support the PAs efforts to mitigate gender inequities within the civil service and public services.

Ministries are Key to Gender Equality in the PA

“All ministries have an important role to play in bridging gender gaps. Successful strategic plans...should address the root causes of gender gaps ...To do so requires the investment of capacities and efforts...at all governmental ...levels, to ensure women’s participation in the preparation, drafting, implementation and evaluation of different sectoral plans and strategies.”

- **National Gender Strategy, p. 10**

¹³ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women’s Affairs and UNWomen. p. 39

¹⁴ “To facilitate women’s active political involvement and to activate their role in decision-making”.

¹⁵ “To mainstream gender concerns and issues in the work of Palestinian government ministries”.

B. Major Gender Considerations, Challenges, and Recommendations

Below we describe the existing gender considerations, constraints, and challenges as they relate to PACE's intermediate results (PIR) one and two and Task 3, Strengthening Public Administration Programs, which will be added to the project scope of work for the possible extension period. PIR 3 is not addressed in this strategy, as it was primarily associated with the project's concluded grants component. Because of its relevance and importance, many of the policies, recommended interventions, and indicators from Objective 5 and 9 of the National Gender Strategy have been incorporated into this and the following section, "Recommendations for Gender-Sensitive Indicators".

Reinforcing information from secondary sources in the previous section, representatives from ministries, the GPC, and CSOs note that there is a lack of women in high-level decision-making roles. Most are in lower positions, many of which are "secretarial" in nature. Additionally, the ministry staff report limited gender training, resulting in misconceptions about gender and the importance of implementing GRB and gender mainstreaming in the civil service and public services. Where they exist, they confess they have limited practical experience and training to do so. Misconceptions regarding gender and its relevance to the civil service and public services, combined with ministry staffs' limited capacity to mainstream gender into the planning and budgeting, are the root causes of the constraints and challenges detailed within this section.

Following each identified constraint and challenge are recommendations suggesting possible interventions, activities, and trainings. Central to our recommendations are capacity building activities, primarily technical assistance and training. While many of the activities and trainings outlined below specify women as the target participants and audience, men should also be engaged and involved. GUs, high-level officials in the ministries, technical staff, and individuals in the HR, planning, monitoring, and finance departments of the five target ministries must be gender sensitized and given training and practical experience in gender mainstreaming and GRB. Only through awareness raising and capacity building can we increase the five ministries' commitment to reducing and eliminating gender inequalities, the mobilization of GUs, and the utilization of gender mainstreaming and GRB in both the civil service and public services. Gender must also be part of the coursework in Public Administration programs at universities if present and future civil servants are to be gender sensitive and have the necessary skills and practical experience to mainstream gender and apply GRB.

It should be noted that the recommendations outlined below are a "menu" of recommended activities and initiatives. It is understood that all of these recommendations cannot be implemented; instead, PACE and USAID are encouraged to pick and choose from this "menu" based on the project's priorities, timeframe, and budget. The recommendations are intentionally written broadly (e.g., "support gender mainstreaming training for ministry technical staff") with the understanding that PACE and USAID will decide on specifics (i.e. "support gender mainstreaming training for the Ministry of Public Works and Housing's

technical staff”) based upon feasibility, sustainability, and interest and commitment from the ministries and stakeholders. To aid in the prioritization of activities and initiatives, recommendations are labeled as “*ongoing*” where PACE is currently working on similar initiatives or “*new*” when the recommendation is an entirely new initiative.

PIR 1: Improved Delivery of Key Services by Targeted PA Ministries and Institutions that Result in Immediate Tangible Benefits to Citizens

KRA 1.1 Infrastructure Improvements

Limited Decentralized Services

Renewing driver’s licenses, accessing mail, obtaining identification cards and passports, and many other public services provided by the five target ministries require citizens to visit service centers or ministry offices. Many of these offices are located in cities and not easily accessible to citizens living in rural villages. This is especially true if they have limited access to public transportation or have to travel through checkpoints. The distance and time-consuming nature to access a public service center is particularly problematic because many women cannot (due to cultural or social reasons) or prefer not to be away from their homes for long periods of time (due to household and childcare responsibilities). The distance to service centers is also a constraint for men, who are often the family breadwinners and are not able to or cannot afford to take leave from work to travel to service centers. Even when service centers or ministry offices are located nearby, citizens may have to travel to other locations because of where they are registered or where they have accessed the services in the past. For example, ministry officials indicate that if an individual’s car is registered in one licensing office, they must return to that same office to renew their license. Limited access to these service centers means citizens’ ability to benefit from public services is limited.

Recommendations

The PACE project has already been working to decentralize service centers and ministry offices by strengthening staff capacity and improving IT infrastructure to allow citizens access to the same services at any branch office or service center. PACE should, to the extent possible, continue these efforts to decentralize public services through capacity building and IT procurement.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Continue improving and decentralizing processes and procedures and linking IT systems so as to allow ministries and service centers to provide the same service at any location (integrate within PACE’s *ongoing* procurement and refurbishment efforts)

Limited Consideration of Gender in Some Citizen Service Centers and Government Offices

Many public facilities and government offices do not account for gender considerations in design and infrastructure. For example, information gleaned from meetings suggest that many public facilities (such as post offices, driver’s licensing centers, and tax collection offices), as well as the ministries and branch offices, do not have separate toilets for men

and women or the toilets are not clearly labeled. This is not customer friendly, particularly to women, given the cultural context. While this may seem like a minor oversight, not having access to a toilet or having to share one with men is uncomfortable, unhygienic (especially for menstruating or lactating women), and a potential security issue for women. The absence of designated women’s toilets sends a message to women that public services are not for them and do not take their needs into consideration. To improve public opinion and equitably serve the needs of both men and women, this is an issue that should be rectified.

Recommendations

PACE has contributed to gender equity in its refurbishment work; however, there has been limited systematic consideration of gender in planning. For example, PACE provided queuing systems to renovated services centers, which had the added benefit of ensuring that no citizens (men or women) received preferential treatment. Moving forward, PACE should, whenever possible, carefully take into account gender considerations in refurbishment and renovation, note any potential unintended consequences, and plan accordingly so as to maximize gender equity. Ministries, branch offices, and public-service facilities ought to have separate restrooms for men and women that are clearly labeled. PACE could support the procurement and installation of such signs and, to the extent possible, install additional toilets as part of future office refurbishment work.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Equip bathrooms with “men” and “women” signs and, if practical, construct men’s and women’s bathrooms where only one bathroom exists (integrate into PACE’s *ongoing* refurbishment and renovation activities)
- Continue installation of queuing systems which prevent preferential treatment for either sex (integrate into PACE’s *ongoing* installation of queuing systems)

KRA 1.2 Process and Procedural Improvements

Limited Capacity of Ministry Staff to Implement Gender Mainstreaming

With a few exceptions, GUs are the only staff within the five target ministries who have received any gender sensitization or mainstreaming training. Trainings were conducted by MOWA, UNESCO, International Labor Organization (ILO), and other CSOs. While the trainings laid a good foundation, they were not comprehensive and gave participants limited opportunities to practice with real-world applications. Additionally, these trainings were on general concepts of gender mainstreaming and not sector specific. A more sector-specific focus would have helped participants identify specific gender issues within the scope of their ministry and the public services it provides.

Having limited training in gender mainstreaming, GUs have been unable to produce sophisticated gender strategies and have only been able to provide minimal gender input into policies, procedures, and service delivery. Additionally, GUs have few opportunities to provide input, as they are excluded from work planning and budget planning. The MOI is an exception to this finding—it adopted a policy mandating GU participation in work planning sessions.

In meetings, some GUs pointed out that it was difficult to provide gender mainstreaming input or GRB input because they are not technical or finance experts (e.g., “I’m not a road engineer, so I don’t know what gender issues exist in building roads. The road engineers should know how to mainstream gender in their work.”). Conversely, technical, planning, and other staff felt it was the responsibility of the GUs to handle all of the gender mainstreaming. While it is the mandate of the GUs to make sure gender is mainstreamed within their ministry, it should be noted that they are not expected to do *all* of the gender mainstreaming and be technical and planning specialists. Individuals in these other departments must have some capacity to mainstream gender so that they can work in concert with the Gus, who can assist them in providing public services that are gender-sensitive and equitable.

Several ministry staff commented that they did not understand the relevance of gender with regard to the public services provided by their ministry. For example, they were unaware of what gender constraints and inequities existed in public transportation services or income taxation. They see them as gender neutral, meaning that gender is not relevant to the process or outcome of public services. Without clear understanding of the gender constraints related to their public services, technical, and planning staff are unable to address gender constraints and mainstream gender into their processes, procedures (and corresponding manuals), and service delivery.

When gender considerations are identified, it is generally ad hoc. For example, the Head of the MOT GU identified and contributed to World Bank research that found that more than 25% of women only use public transportation when the driver is known to their family, thus limiting women’s use of these public services. The report provided recommendations to address these gender considerations, which the GU Head passed along to the Department of Public Transportation. Though there are a few examples where ministries are identifying and addressing gender inequities in service delivery, overall, there is no consistent application of gender mainstreaming. Because of this lack of capacity of the GUs and technical staff and those in the planning departments of the ministry, few gender considerations make their way into policies, procedures, plans, and public services. As a result, many gender inequities exist in public services, their delivery, and public access to them. Also because of their limited gender training, staff also have limited capacity to assess laws (related to the public services they provide) from a gender perspective, which prevents them from identifying and recommending amendments to gender discriminatory laws.

Public surveys and complaints received by ministries are ways in which ministries receive feedback about customer satisfaction of the services they provide. From this data, one may find there are gender issues or constraints that are unique to men or women and develop strategies and mitigate these issues. For example, if surveys showed a common complaint from women that they are being told by passport agency employees that only men can apply for passports for their children (which is not in accordance with the law), this would indicate a gender issue in public service delivery in need of change.

Currently, there is little to no gender analysis of public surveys and feedback and complaints received by ministries. Additionally, there is little to no collection of relevant gender and sex

disaggregated data in public surveys. Without gender related data and analysis of customer feedback, ministries lack key information needed to mainstream gender and create solutions for gender constraints and inequities in public services.

Recommendations

Though PACE has held numerous trainings to build the capacity of ministry staff, assisted in the production of procedural manuals and work plans, and aided ministries in improving the efficiency and effectiveness of services, these activities were conducted without a gender strategy in place and included limited consideration of gender. Moving forward, PACE could support gender sensitization training for planning and technical staff so that they have an introduction to gender and are able to recognize gender issues and constraints within their

ministries' public services. Once these individuals have been gender-sensitized, sector specific gender mainstreaming training or technical assistance could be provided to GUs, planning, and technical staff so that they can effectively address gender constraints and considerations specific to the services provided by the ministry. With their enhanced knowledge of gender, GUs should create a gender strategy for their ministries as a meaningfully contribute to the planning process. The four ministries who have not already done so should amend their policies so that GUs are required participants in the ministries' work planning sessions.

Producers and Facilitators of Gender-Sensitization and Mainstreaming Training Courses

- Chemonics International Inc
- MOWA
- Birzeit University
- UNWomen
- ILO
- UNESCO
- Devtech Systems, Inc.

MOWA is finalizing their current work plan which includes plans to conduct ILO Participatory Gender Audits of the PA ministries. The gender audit “considers whether internal practices and related support systems for gender mainstreaming are effective and reinforce each other and whether they are being followed. It establishes a baseline; identifies critical gaps and challenges; and recommends ways of addressing them, suggesting possible improvements and innovations.”¹⁶ This audit could be conducted in coordination with PACE and used to identify gender constraints in operating procedures manuals as well as service delivery. Using the findings and recommendations from the audit and the skills they obtain from the gender sensitization and mainstreaming training, the technical and planning staff should review and revise work plans and procedural manuals to ensure that processes are in no way gender discriminatory. Revised manuals and any supporting documents should also be revised so that they use language which is gender neutral so as to not reinforce stereotypes. For example, “wazeer/a” should be used for the word for “minister” as opposed to using the masculine “wazeer” and feminine version “wazeera” of words. Some ministries, like the Ministry of Interior, have begun this process and have already met with MOWA to identify gender issues and develop sectoral strategies and interventions.¹⁷

¹⁶ International Labour Office. “ILO Participatory Gender Audit.” p. 2.

¹⁷ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women’s Affairs and UNWomen. p. 10

The findings and recommendations from the gender audit combined with the skills gained from the gender mainstreaming training will give ministry staff the tools to identify gender inequities not only in their policies, procedure, and service delivery, but in the laws that govern the services they provide. Ministries should be encouraged to assess these laws and provide recommendations for their amendment.

Finally, PACE has been working with ministries to strengthen their complaints departments and the way they collect data and customer feedback. To ensure that women (and other citizens who might feel uncomfortable or embarrassed) are encouraged to lodge complaints, ministries accept feedback from the public in the form of emails, faxes, phone calls, and written letters. PACE could assist ministries to develop public service campaigns to further encourage citizens, especially women, to provide customer feedback so that they can improve public services. PACE could assist in the development of public surveys so that they capture relevant gender related and sex disaggregated data. PACE could also assist in the gender analysis of public survey data and citizen feedback and complaints to determine if there are gender inequities, constraints, or considerations in public services. PACE could then assist GUs, planning departments, and technical staff to develop and implement appropriate strategies to address these gender issues and improve public services. By analyzing public feedback from a gender perspective, ministries will be better informed as to how they should mainstream gender into their policies and delivery of services to all citizens.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Support gender sensitization and sector specific gender mainstreaming training and/or short-term technical assistance for planning departments and technical and GU staff (*new*)
- Assist GUs in producing a gender strategy specific to their ministry (*new*)
- Assist ministries' technical staff and planning departments to identify gender considerations and constraints in public services and produce a revised work plan (which incorporates strategic interventions and activities to address considerations and constraints) and revised procedural manuals which are gender sensitive (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* production and publication of procedural manuals)
- Encourage the four remaining ministries to adopt a policy which requires the meaningful participation of GUs in the work planning process (*new*)
- Assist ministry staff to produce and submit a list of laws and policies which are gender discriminatory and corresponding recommendations for amendment to MOWA (*new*)
- Assist complaints departments and public surveys to collect sex-disaggregated data and analyze information from a gender perspective (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* work to establish and improve complaints departments and collection of public surveys)
- Assist ministries to develop public service campaigns to further encourage citizens, especially women, to provide customer feedback to improve public service (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* work to establish and improve complaints departments and collect public surveys)

- Assist GUs, planning departments, and technical staff to develop and implement activities or interventions which mitigate the gender inequities in service delivery identified through gender analysis of customer feedback (*new*)

Limited Public Awareness of Women's Rights Related to Public Services

The PA has made considerable efforts to amend gender discriminatory laws. In the recent past, only men were able to claim children as dependents and receive government allowances. Recent amendments to the law now allow single or widowed women or women heads of household to claim these allowances, too. Unfortunately, not all women are aware of their rights and, as a result, sometimes do not request specific services or could victims to civil servants who do not implement laws accurately.

Additionally, some public service procedures unique to women are complex and lack of explanatory informational materials, causing inefficient service delivery. For example, if a woman wishes to keep her maiden name after she weds; there is an extensive process that she must undergo to ensure that Israel recognizes her by her maiden name and not her husband's surname. Despite the complexity of the procedure, the Ministry of Interior reports there are no brochures or posters to inform women of this process thus preventing or delaying women from exercising their rights and fully enjoying efficient public services.

Recommendations

PACE has helped ministries produce numerous posters and brochures to help aid citizens in understanding various public procedures so that they are aware of services available and how to go about receiving them in an efficient manner. Thus far, there have been few, if any, materials produced that are aimed specifically at raising awareness of women's rights to public services or informing them of processes for services unique to women. Posters and brochures, coupled with other multi-media awareness campaigns- such as radio spots, billboards, or PSAs- could be developed to aid women in understanding their rights to public services (so that they are empowered to demand them) and the processes by which to obtain them. These information materials will have the added bonus of mitigating incorrect practices and procedures by public service providers within the five ministries. With their rights clearly visible on posters, brochures, and in media campaigns, public services will become more transparent thus encouraging service providers to put women's rights into practice as dictated by law.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Produce brochures, posters, and other informational materials which explain public service processes which are unique to women (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* communication campaigns and consider potential new targets)
- Implement a public awareness campaign (e.g., radio spots, billboards, PSAs) to raise awareness of women's rights to public services (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* communication campaigns and consider potential new targets)

PIR 2: Enhanced and Sustainable Institutional Capacity of PA ministries and Institutions

KRA 2.1 Increased PA Knowledge and Skills for Performing Core Government Functions

Limited Gender-sensitivity in the Civil Service Law and HR Policies Resulting in a Lack of Women in High-Level, Decision-Making Positions

While it is laudable that five of the 23 PA ministers are female, Figure 1-1 shows that just under 30% of all public servants are women and fewer than 11% of public servants at the director general level or higher are women. As noted in the introductory section of this strategy, most women occupy lower, administrative positions in the civil service.

Concentrated at the lower levels, women have limited opportunities to influence policy and contribute to decision making. Simply having a few women in high-level, decision making positions does not automatically ensure gender equality or the application of gender mainstreaming or GRB. In conversations with ministry staff, there was the misconception that if there existed a female minister or deputy minister, or if they “did not discriminate” when choosing to hire or promote a women or man, then this translated to a gender equitable ministry. This line of thinking is flawed, as women in these positions may not have the capacity to mainstream gender or apply GRB, may hold traditional beliefs that restrict women’s ability to exercise her civil rights, or may not actively participate in decision making despite their rank.

Currently, HR staff and new hires within ministries have not and do not receive gender sensitization, anti-discrimination or sexual harassment training. As a result, ministry staff lacks a clear understanding of gender sensitivity, gender discrimination, and harassment. Without a clear understanding of what these terms mean, staff may be unwittingly engaging in such behavior with impunity.

For example, in some parts of Palestinian society, patriarchal social and cultural perceptions and behavioral norms mean that women are not encouraged to be outspoken or take on leadership roles. Men may be perceived to be better decision makers and as a result, may be more likely to be promoted into leadership roles. During a survey conducted in 2008, male and female public sector employees were asked if they agree that more women should join senior positions (directors general and deputy ministers). A total of 41.8% of men and 22.9% of women said “no”.¹⁸ While a majority of ministry staff do not espouse these beliefs, they are still held by some individuals, contributing to an environment that is not supportive of women and may result in gender discriminatory employment, incentives, and behavior. As a result, women may avoid engaging in or actively contributing to decision-making opportunities and/or possibly turn down opportunities for advancement to avoid potentially hostile or unsupportive work environments.

¹⁸ Palestinian National Authority Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics. “Report of Key Finding of the Survey of the Gender Attitudes of the Public Sector Employees at the Ministry of Ramallah and Al Bireh.” November 2008. p. 12.

During meetings to develop this Gender Strategy, female ministry staff reported that some women are asked during interviews if they are married, plan to marry, have children, plan to have children, etc., and that they believed that their answers may negatively impact their chances for employment or promotion. Because of the costs associated with maternity leave, reduced hours for new mothers, and their potential to leave the ministry altogether to marry and raise families, respondents argued that some women face discrimination in employment or promotion within the civil service. While the GPC does have policies regarding promotion and advancement of employees, these are open to interpretation. As a result, ministry staff report that women are sometimes passed over for promotion and only informally promoted, but nonetheless given additional tasks, without the corresponding title or pay.

Social and cultural beliefs held by both men and women in the ministry have also contributed to women being relegated to low levels within the ministry. Findings during our meetings with ministry staff reveal that women staff within the ministries are sometimes excluded from capacity building training programs because they require an overnight stay (which many female staff cannot or prefer not to do because of household and childcare responsibilities), are in countries that do not permit women's participation (e.g., Saudi Arabia), or because their supervisors would prefer to invest in male employees since women may potentially leave their positions to be wives and mothers (as noted above). The MOI has taken steps to include women in training by adopting a policy that all training programs be held in the ministry offices. While this is a commendable attempt to ensure women's participation, it does not resolve the issue of supervisors not allowing female staff to attend because of social or cultural perceptions about women, their reproductive role, and familial obligations. With limited access to these capacity building training programs, women have limited opportunities for advancement.

The Civil Service Law, the law which governs the personnel policies within the civil service, is currently being reviewed for amendment. MOWA provided the Law Amendment Committee (responsible for drafting and approving any amendments) a list of recommended amendments to rectify gender discriminatory policies within the existing law. In its current state, the Civil Service Law contains many gender discriminatory policies which must be enforced within the HR departments of the ministries. While it is possible that these and other gender discriminatory policies will be amended, there is no guarantee. Fortunately, HR departments do have flexibility in their interpretation of the law and could create HR policies that interpret the law with the greatest gender equity possible. Given their lack of gender related training, however, HR departments have limited capacity to create such gender equitable policies.

Recommendations

In order for there to be a balance in power, women and men within ministries must have access to leadership and capacity building opportunities, have equal opportunities for promotion and advancement, and work in an environment that nurtures gender equality and penalizes gender discriminatory promotions and behavior. PACE or ministries themselves might also consider surveys of ministry employees to identify impediments to gender equality and advancement of women into leadership posts.

To support a transparent and equitable work environment, PACE has worked with ministry HR departments and helped them to create job descriptions and incentives manuals which outline policies for raises, promotions, and increased responsibility. PACE could complement these efforts by supporting gender sensitivity and gender mainstreaming training for HR staff. PACE could coordinate with MOWA during their gender audit of the HR policies within ministries. Specifically, the HR department's personnel manual must be audited to determine if the Civil Service Law is being interpreted in a gender-sensitive manner. The personnel manual must then be revised as needed to make sure that it is gender sensitive. The findings and recommendations from this audit, combined with the skills learned in the gender sensitivity and gender mainstreaming training, will enable HR staff to revise current incentive manuals and policies to ensure that they are gender sensitive. Ministries could also adopt and enforce remedial and disciplinary policies for individuals who are guilty of gender discrimination with regards to hiring, terminations, promotions, and trainings. Revised manuals and any supporting documents should use language which is gender neutral so as to not reinforce stereotypes. For example, "wazeer/a" should be used for the word for "minister" as opposed to using the masculine "wazeer" and feminine version "wazeera" of words.

To make sure all ministry staff is aware of the revised HR policies regarding gender discrimination, staff must be informed through internal trainings or memos, which are complemented with gender sensitization, anti-discrimination, and sexual harassment training to help build a tolerant and accepting work environment and mitigate instances of gender discrimination and harassment. Moving forward, policy information, gender sensitization, anti-discrimination, and sexual harassment training should be covered in new hire orientations so that all new staff is aware of the ministries' policies regarding these issues. Some argue that these topics have not been covered by HR departments because they are culturally sensitive for Palestinians. However, it should be noted that the ILO confirmed that they have facilitated similar gender based violence trainings in the Ministry of Labor without backlash. To ensure sustainability of such trainings, GUs, training department staff, and/or HR staff could receive a training of trainers (ToT) course in gender sensitization, anti-discrimination, and sexual harassment so that in the future, they can provide this training to ministry staff during new hire orientations. To complement these trainings and help ensure that supervisors are creating equitable working environments for both their male and female supervisees, supervisors ought to receive a management/leadership training which includes a module about gender sensitive management.

Both men and women should be encouraged to build their skills and improve their performance to advance their careers within the ministries. HR departments can support such an environment by encouraging supervisors to approve leadership and capacity building training opportunities for both male and female employees and adopting and enforcing clear policies and procedures for promotion and advancement. The Public Administration to be courses supported by PACE will target students and professionals and are therefore a continuing education opportunity that women (and men) within the ministry should be encouraged to tap into to increase their capacity.

The COE program offers another opportunity for capacity building. COE teams are seen as motivated, responsible, results-driven employees with valuable leadership skills, especially COE team members who take on the role of criteria leaders. PACE has established the COE team recruitment process as equal opportunity involving an application process open to all employees. In the past, women have been encouraged to apply to be COE team members, and this should continue during future recruitment cycles.

To ensure women's access, courses and training should be held at times and locations that are convenient to both men and women and avoid overnight stays or trips to restrictive countries that have excluded women from past capacity building opportunities.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Assist or coordinate with ministries to survey ministry employees to identify impediments to gender equality and advancement of women into leadership posts (*new*)
- Support gender sensitization, mainstreaming, anti-discrimination, and sexual harassment training and training of trainers (ToT) for HR departments (and / or training department staff or GUs) (*new*)
- Assist HR departments to revise HR policies and personnel and incentive manuals so that they use a gender sensitive interpretation of the Civil Service Law so that they are gender equitable with regard to training, hiring, promotion, and termination policies (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* work with HR departments and their manuals)
- Assist ministry HR departments to create, adopt, and enforce policies against gender discriminatory practices and sexual harassment (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* work with HR departments)
- Assist in the revision of the new hire orientation manual and training to include gender sensitization, anti-discrimination, and sexual harassment and an overview of the revisions to the personnel and incentives policies (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* development of new-hire orientation manuals and training)
- Assist HR to revise the new-hire orientation training to cover gender sensitization, anti-discrimination, and sexual harassment and the revised personnel and incentives policies (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* work with HR departments and their manuals)
- Support management and/or leadership training with a gender sensitive management module for supervisors. (*new*)
- Encourage male and female ministry staff to take PACE-supported Public Administration courses and gain leadership experience as COE team members and criteria leaders (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* work with universities and COE team recruitment efforts)

Lack of Commitment and Mobilization of the Gender Units

Despite a decision by the Council of Ministers to establish GUs and to implement gender mainstreaming and GRB, there is a lack of commitment by the ministries and no method of enforcing these mandates. As a result, the gender units are not fully mobilized in the five target ministries. Some staff hold titles within the gender unit, but in practice are fulfilling

other positions in the ministry and thus only dedicating a few hours per month towards their GU job responsibilities. Some ministries have organizational charts which show multiple vacancies in the GUs. In MTIT, there is no GU, and the MOF GU is not formally recognized as part of the ministry, but merely as a separate reporting entity. Part of the lack of dedication to the GUs may be because of misconceptions about the GU held by staff. Several staff members within the ministries felt that the GUs were gender-negative as they were emphasizing that women had special needs and issues. There seemed to be little understanding that gender issues also include men's constraints. The lack of official GU staff, hours dedicated to GU work, and lack of support for and understanding of GU mandates are preventing full mobilization of the GUs.

Recommendations

As previously mentioned, the GPC is planning to adopt policies which disallow an employee to be tasked with duties outside of their SOW for longer than six months without an appropriate change in position, title change, promotion. Should this be enforced, this may improve the situation for GU staff and allow them to dedicate their time to their GU work and mandates. If this policy is not implemented or enforced by the GPC, PACE could work with the five target ministries to adopt a similar policy to support the staffing and mobilization of GUs.

The GPC also reports that they are planning to require all ministries to create organizational charts which tie each position to ministry strategic objectives. As the GUs are a directive of the Council of Ministers, there should be no doubt how the GUs support the strategic objectives to mainstream gender and ensure GBR. PACE could support the ministries in creating such organizational charts so as to hold ministries, like the MTIT, accountable for staffing and mobilizing the GUs.

Finally, the GPC explained in our meetings that they will be asking HR departments to report existing personnel gaps, as the GPC has identified numerous personnel ready to fill such gaps. Already, PACE has worked with the HR departments to create and utilize a recruitment forecasting tool to identify personnel staffing needs. PACE could support the HR department's utilization of the recruitment forecasting tool and assist staff in identifying both vacant GU positions and situations where GU staff hold multiple positions, so that those positions can be filled by new staff and GU staff can focus on their responsibilities.

In order for the GUs to be fully mobilized, there must be enforcement by the GPC, commitment from high level officials within the ministries, and enough manpower and level of effort to carry out GU mandates. The aforementioned initiatives planned by the GPC should hold ministries accountable for staffing and mobilizing the GUs. PACE could assist ministries to implement these initiatives whether or not the GPC follows through with these plans.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Assist ministries in adopting the (GPC) policy that employees not work in positions or conduct tasks outside their SOW for longer than six months without a change in position, title, or promotion. (*new*)

- Assist the ministries in the creation of organizational charts which include GUs and tie them to strategic objectives (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* efforts to assist HR and ministry staff in the creation of organizational charts)
- Encourage the MTIT to establish a GU (*new*)
- Assist the HR departments to utilize the recruitment forecasting tool to identify gaps, especially in GU staff, and submit staffing needs to the GPC (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* efforts regarding the recruitment forecasting tool)

Limited Application of GRB and Gender Mainstreaming in Finance and Monitoring Departments

Monitoring and finance staff in the five target ministries have limited or no training in gender-sensitive M&E or GRB, respectively. As a result, few gender indicators exist and there is little collection of gender related or sex disaggregated data. Ideally, finance department staff should have a deep understanding of GRB so as to utilize GRB, but they have little experience or training in GRB. GUs should have a basic understanding of GRB so that they can provide input to finance departments when reviewing budgets. Despite the Council of Ministers' mandate that governments and ministries adopt GRB, there is only limited use of GRB by inside ministry finance departments or the MOF.

Recommendations

PACE could coordinate with the MOWA gender audit of the ministries monitoring plans and budget. Additionally, PACE could support monitoring departments' receipt of gender sensitization and gender mainstreaming training. Finance departments and GU's receipt of gender sensitization and GRB training could also be supported by PACE. MOWA is finalizing their work plan and has plans to provide the Ministry of Finance with GRB training. PACE could coordinate with MOWA and afterwards assist the Ministry in revising its budget to reflect GRB.

Using the findings from the audit and the skills they obtain from the trainings, finance departments would be able to apply GRB during the budgeting process. Similarly, the monitoring staff should revise their monitoring and evaluation plan and corresponding indicators so that they are gender sensitive, include sex disaggregated data, and measure if the civil service and public services are contributing towards gender equity.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Support gender sensitization and gender mainstreaming in M&E training for the monitoring departments in the ministries (*new*)
- Support gender sensitization and GRB training for the Ministry of Finance (if not provided by MOWA) and the other four target ministries' finance departments, and GUs (*new*)
- Assist the monitoring departments in the ministries to revise their monitoring plans to include the collection of gender sensitive indicators and gender disaggregated data (*new*)
- Assist the finance departments to revise their budget using GRB (*new*)

Lack of Consideration of Gender Issues in the Centers of Excellence (COE)

Discussions with ministry staff revealed that gender issues have received little consideration in COE team training and have not been part of the Transformation Action Plans, which is a lost opportunity for ministries to initiate gender reform. Perhaps because COE teams have had little to no gender training, they did not identify obvious gender issues that fell within criteria areas. For example, the finance departments are not (or are only minimally) utilizing GRB. During the self assessment, this should have been identified as an issue in the Finance criteria, flagged as an issue requiring change, and incorporated in the Transformation Action Plan.

Recommendations

COE teams were given several training courses on topics like communication, change management, and team building throughout the COE program cycle. Moving forward, information about gender considerations and the Council of Ministers mandates regarding gender mainstreaming and GRB should be added to the COE trainings. COE teams should be instructed how to address gender-related dynamics and issues during their assessments. Gender cross cuts all five criteria areas: people, knowledge, leadership, processes, and finance. COE teams must learn to identify these gender gaps during the assessment process and develop solutions in their Transformation Action Plans. Once GUs, HR, or training staff have taken gender sensitization courses, they may be able to contribute to new gender modules in the COE training and could be encouraged to participate as COE team members. PACE can play a supportive role by encouraging, coordinating, and assisting in these efforts. The COE program is intended to build ministry capacity to identify areas for improvement and implement solutions on a path towards excellence. This is a key opportunity for the identification and remediation of gender issues within ministries.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Assist in revising the COE self-assessment training to include information about how to identify potential gender issues during the self-assessment process (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* COE team training courses)
- Assist in revising the COE transformation action plan training to include information about possible solutions to gender issues within ministries (integrate into PACE's *ongoing* COE team training courses)
- Encourage the GU staff to participate in COE and in development and facilitation of COE team gender training modules

Task 3: Strengthening Public Administration Programs

Lack of Commitment from Universities Regarding Whether to Include or Require Students to Take Gender Mainstreaming and GRB Courses in Public Administration Degree Program

In discussions with universities about their plans to develop public administration programs, it was unclear whether or not they planned to offer or require gender mainstreaming or GRB courses. It was also unclear whether they currently offer or intend to offer night, weekend or online courses.

Recommendations

Some of the universities have gender departments. Birzeit University has such a department and offers gender mainstreaming as an elective course in their public administration program, but indicated that it does not have a GRB course or cover such material. Moving forward, Birzeit and other universities should be encouraged to adopt gender mainstreaming and GRB courses, cooperating with other local and international universities or CSOs. PACE also could encourage university partner(s) to adopt policies that mandate gender mainstreaming and GRB courses for students enrolled in their Public Administration programs. As all ministries have been mandated by the Council of Ministers to implement gender mainstreaming and GRB within ministries, students should be required to pass such courses to ensure that they are properly prepared for work in the public sector.

These courses, once in place, could possibly serve in place of the gender sensitization, mainstreaming, and GRB training previously mentioned for planning, technical, monitoring, and HR staff. It is recommended that PACE work with these universities to ensure Public Administration courses be offered in the afternoons (as civil servants' workdays end in mid-afternoon) and / or weekends, and / or assist them in the development of online courses to accommodate the busy schedules of ministerial staff and to ensure maximum participation of female ministry staff who may have limited availability due to household and family obligations. Night courses should be avoided as they may exclude women who have limited mobility after dark and family responsibilities. Such courses are essential for the continuing education of ministry staff and accessibility should be maximized by whatever means possible.

Possible Activities and Initiatives

- Assist university partners(s) in adopting (from other universities or CSOs) gender mainstreaming and GRB courses (*new*)
- Encourage university partner(s) to adopt a policy to make gender mainstreaming and GRB courses mandatory (versus elective) courses for Public Administration students (*new*)
- Encourage universities to maximize female enrollment through the offering of afternoon, weekend, and / or online courses (*new*)

C. Conclusion

This gender strategy makes every effort to lay out objectives concerning gender and address how interventions that address gender concerns could be integrated throughout the project's existing and new components and activities. Project technical staff is urged to continue in-depth discussions with USAID, ministry staff, including the gender units and other stakeholders; conduct mini-assessments; and complete a deeper review of the literature to confirm observations and refine activities to determine their feasibility and sustainability. The feasibility of many of the recommendations above partially relies on MOWA conducting gender audits and GPC implementing several policy changes and initiatives. Should MOWA and GPC plans not come to fruition (possibly because of budget or capacity issues), it is still possible to implement these recommendations. If MOWA does not move forward with their plans to conduct gender audits, PACE could work with ILO, or

possibly the State Audit and Administrative Control Bureau, to conduct the recommended gender audits, or engage gender STTA to work with ministry staff to audit and revise their policies, procedures, and corresponding manuals. PACE could also continue efforts to strengthen HR and other internal policies within the five target ministries if the GPC is unable to move forward with government-wide efforts.. Either way, the desired result is that these gender-focused interventions increase gender equity within the PA ministries and result in gender-sensitive service delivery to the Palestinian people, thus maximizing project benefits for both men and women.

ANNEX I: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR GENDER-SENSITIVE INDICATORS

It is highly recommended that the project develop and implement gender sensitive data collection and sex disaggregation in its M&E system to better monitor the project's efforts to mainstream gender and increase gender equity within PA ministries and institutions and public services. Below are three areas of recommendations:

Area 1: Sex-Disaggregated Data Collection

The project disaggregates most data collected by sex, but does not include disaggregated analysis of results, which would enrich reporting with an additional level of detail, give more insight into the make up the project's beneficiaries, and provide project management with additional information to make sure that the design and implementation of activities are gender sensitive and equitable.

At a minimum, the project should provide analysis of beneficiaries, training participants, trainers, COE team members, and citizens benefiting from improved offices and services disaggregated by sex, including additional analysis of the citizen satisfaction data already collected.

The project may also consider other disaggregation attributes, such as age and locality, to the extent feasible.

Area 2: Gender Sensitive Indicators

In order to comply with the USAID ADS regarding the usage of gender sensitive indicators, it is recommended that the project add one or two gender indicators in its PMP to reflect gender development. To do so the project should assess — especially in the extension period — if gender is adopted as new objective or result. Suggested indicators might include:

- # of procedural manuals gender audited and revised to be gender sensitive
- # of offices/service centers renovated or refurbished with consideration towards gender

Area 3: Mainstream Gender in the Design of M&E Tools and Activities

It is also recommended that the project mainstream gender into the design and implementation of M&E tools and activities (such as public surveys to collect customer and employee feedback, interviews, and focus groups). Data collected from these activities should be analyzed using a gender lens to identify any unique responses amongst men and women that would indicate gender inequities or constraints affecting targeted partner ministries and/or citizens.

ANNEX II: STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES 5 AND 9 FROM THE CROSS-SECTORAL NATIONAL GENDER STRATEGY: PROMOTING GENDER EQUALITY AND EQUITY 2011-2013¹⁹

Strategic objective 5

To facilitate women's active political involvement and to activate their role in decision-making

Policy:

- a. Taking all legal and other measures to increase women's participation in the political sphere;
- b. Taking appropriate measures to rectify negative effects of cultural and social heritage regarding women's role in society; and
- c. Taking appropriate measures to enhance women's abilities and skills.

Interventions:

- Amending the Political Parties Law, the Electoral Law, the Professional Associations and Trade Unions Law, the Societies Law and the Civil Service Law from a gender perspective;
- Adopting an electoral system that facilitates and supports the election of women candidates to leadership positions;
- Facilitating the participation of female university students in student councils;
- Developing and implementing a media strategy to address the negative cultural and social heritage regarding women's issues and roles in Palestinian society;
- Modifying school curricula to reflect the importance of women's role and participation in the political sphere; and
- Developing and offering training programs for women to build their capacities.

Strategic objective 9

To mainstream gender concerns and issues in the work of Palestinian governmental ministries

Policy:

- a. Seeking the advancement and enforcement of governmental commitment and decisions on gender issues; and
- b. Ensuring that all measures are taken to mainstream gender issues in ministerial planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

Interventions:

- a. Activating the implementation of Council of Ministers' decision No. 08/65/12/CM/SF on gender units;

¹⁹ Op. cit., Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. p. 36 and 38.

- b. Activating the implementation of Council of Ministers' decision No. 01/05/13/CM/SF of 2009 on the adoption of gender-sensitive budgets;
- c. Building the capacity and skills of MOWA, gender units and administrative, planning and executive personnel in the approach of gender mainstreaming; and
- d. Ensuring the provision of sex-disaggregated data.

ANNEX III: SELECTED STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS

Date	Institution	Representative(s)	Contact INFO
Sept. 14	Ministry of Transportation	Lubna Nazal, Director of Training and Development Department	970-2-295-1315
Sept. 14	Business Women Forum	Dowa Wadi, Executive Director	970-2-242 -5612
Sept. 15	Ministry of Interior	Hassan Alawi, Deputy Minister Tahani Kalalwa , Manager of the Human Resources Sub Department. Nehad Wahdan , Head of Gender Unit	970-2-242-9243
Sept. 15	Ministry of Public Work and Housing	Fa'eq Eldeek, Deputy Minister Randa Altaher , Head of Gender Unit Sawsan Abu Dakar, Roads' Engineer	970-2-296-6006
Sept. 15	Ministry of Finance	Masseneh Hakemah, Head of Gender Unit	970-2-297-1693
Sept. 18	Ministry of Telecom and Information Technology	Mahmoud Diwan, General Director of Planning and Policies Department	970-2-242-3401
Sept. 19	Ministry of Transportation	Abeer Alshawa, Head of Gender Unit	970-2-295-1315
Sept. 19	Ministry of Woman's Affairs	Fateneh Waza'efi, General Director of Planning and Policies Department	970-2-240-9960
Sept. 19	General Personal Council	Wael Rimawi, General Director of Planning and Policies Department Wagdi Ziyad, General Director of the Council of Ministries Unit	970-2-297-1757
Sept. 21	International Labor Organization	Rasha Shourfa, Program Officer Rawanda I Madmouj, Entrepreneur and TVET Specialist Hanan Al Jayyousi, Gender Specialist	970-2-627-6749

ANNEX IV: SELECTED DOCUMENTS

Riyada Consulting and Training. "Women's Economic Empowerment in the West Bank, Palestine." Palestinian Businesswomen's Association "ASALA". Research Study. 21 October 2010.

Palestinian National Authority Ministry of Women's Affairs and UNWomen. "Cross-Sectoral National Gender Strategy: Promoting Gender Equality and Equity 2011-2013." 2011.

Palestinian National Authority. "National Development Plan 2011-2013: Establishing the State, Building Our Future." April, 2011.

Palestinian National Authority Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics. "Report of Key Finding of the Survey of the Gender Attitudes of the Public Sector Employees at the Ministry of Ramallah and Al Bireh." November 2008.

Women's Center for Legal Aid and Counseling. "Women Without Names; Report on Femicide in the Name of Honor in Palestinian Society 2007-2010." 2010. UNDP. "Arab Human Development Report." 2006.

UNWomen. "Gender-Responsive Budgeting." 28 September, 2011, <http://www.gender-budgets.org>.