

CARE Ethiopia

Multi-Year Assistant Program/PSNP (HIBRET II)

Annual Result Report Fiscal Year 2010

(Cooperative Agreement FFP-A-00-08-00079)

October 1, 2009 – September 30, 2010

Date of Submission: November 1, 2010



West Harargie, Faiaa knitting group Medicho # 3, Gende Dube village with Community Facilitator, photo taken by: Michael DeVries, TANGO, CARE Ethiopia. (Left to right Amina Hature, Fatuma Ahmed, Nesra Mohammed, Amina Beker, Halima Mohammed, Kediya Ahmed, Kedia Amed, Hindia Ebrahim, Mekia Ture)

Contact

CARE HQ	CARE Country Office
Robert Laprade Senior Director Emergency and Humanitarian Assistance Unit CARE USA Tel. 1-404-979-9224 Email: rlaprade@care.org	Garth Van't Hul, Program Director CARE Ethiopia Tel: +251 11 618 3294, Fax. +251 11 618 3295 Email: gvanthul@care.org.et care.eth@ethionet.et
Kumkum Kashiparekh CARE Atlanta Tel. +1-404-979-9155 Fax. +1-404-589-2625 Email: kashiparekh@care.org	Bena Musembi, Chief of Party CARE Ethiopia Tel: +251 11 618 3294 Fax. +251 11 618 3295 Email: BMusembi@care.org.et care.eth@ethionet.et

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page #</i>
1. Introduction: Annual Food Aid Program Results	1-11
2. Success Stories	11-12
3. Lessons Learned	12
4. Attachments:	12
A. Indicator Performance Tracking Table;	
B. Detailed Implementation Plan;	
C. Standardized Annual Performance Questionnaire;	
D. Tracking Table for Beneficiaries and Resources;	
E. Expenditure Report;	
F. Monetization Tables;	
G. Baseline Survey, Mid-term or Final Evaluation Reports	
H. Supplemental Materials; and	
I. Completeness Checklist	
<u>Tables</u>	
Table-1: Planned PW and DS Beneficiaries and Amount of Commodities	2
Table-2: Actual PW and DS Beneficiaries and Amount of Commodities	3
Table-3: Contingency Beneficiaries and Amount of Commodities	6

LIST OF ACRONYMS

CF	Community Facilitator
CI	Chronically Ill
DA	Development Agent
DMFSS	Disaster Management and Food Security Sector
DPP	Disaster Prevention Preparedness
EDAC	Ethiopia Development Assistance Consortium
EWS	Early Warning System
FFP	Food for Peace
FTC	Farmer Training Center
FFW	Food for Work
FSTF	Food Security Task Force
FY	Financial Year
GOE	Government of Ethiopia
HIBRET	Household Income Building and Rural Empowerment for Transformation
IR	Intermediate Result
JEOP	Joint Emergency Operation Plan
MBL	Master Beneficiary List
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MIS	Management Information System
MFI	Microfinance Institutions
MLVP	Market-led Livelihoods for Vulnerable Populations
MOARD	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
MT	Metric Ton
NRM	Natural Resource Management
PASS	Payroll and Attendance Sheet System
PIM	Program Implementation Manual
PW	Public Works
PSNP	Productive Safety-Net Program
REST	Relief Society of Tigray
SWC	Soil and Water Conservation
SO	Strategic Objective
VS&L	Village Savings and Loans

1. Introduction: Annual Food Aid Program Results

This annual results report documents HIBRET II's progress from October 1, 2009 to September 30, 2010. During this reporting period, the project focused on strengthening our government counterparts' and community members' capacities to implement PSNP, improving program quality, scaling-up key interventions, and utilizing lessons learnt to enhance project performance.

The project contributed to the achievement of National Food Security Program's objective by directly supporting 68,170 households. Key achievements include:

- Strengthened community resiliency to shocks e.g. through the protection of vulnerable households assets, especially livestock and agricultural produce;
- Empowering the most vulnerable community members, particularly women, through effective livelihood diversification interventions; and
- Ensuring project sustainability by effectively enhancing the capacities of Woreda and Kebele government officials and community members.

CARE Ethiopia transitioned from an ad hoc project-based programming approach to a long-term strategy, aimed at achieving lasting impact at broad scale. Accordingly, the chronically food insecure rural women's impact group, the umbrella program for the USAID funded - HIBRET II, Results Initiative (RI) and PSNP-Plus projects - was designed. As part of this initiative, an Appreciative Inquiry¹ exercise was conducted in West Haraghe and Dewe, Afar Region, to identify and assess CARE Ethiopia's approaches and value-added to the food security of its targeted impact groups and review operational obstacles. Key findings of this exercise are incorporated into this report.

What is a Program Approach?

CARE defines a program as a coherent set of interrelated activities, done by CARE and others, that involves a long-term commitment to specific marginalized and vulnerable groups to achieve lasting reductions in the underlying causes of poverty and social injustice.

CARE Ethiopia is working with the following impact groups, over the next 15 to 20 years:

- Chronically food insecure rural women in highland areas;
- Pastoralist school-aged girls; and
- Resource poor female youth in urban and peri-urban areas.

In operationalizing the program approach, the HIBRET team consistently coordinated with the Joint Emergency Operation Plan (JEOP), PSNP-Plus and RI staff e.g. by sharing Community Facilitators (CFs) to implement activities.

It is noteworthy that our assumption, at project design, that working areas will remain politically stable during this year's election and throughout the project areas, held true. Planned project activities were not interrupted during the election period. However, the presence of our government counterparts prior to the elections was inadequate. Another assumption that held true was that Ethiopia would not experience a major disaster, during the implementation period.

The sections below outline the key results achieved by the project during this period:

¹ The Appreciative Inquiry report is annexed as part of Attachment H – Supplemental Materials.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE (SO) 1: Community resilience to periodic shocks strengthened²:

Implementation commenced with the community action planning process, involving targeted communities and both Woreda and Kebele Food Security Task Forces (FSTF).

Intermediate Result (IR 1.1): Household assets protected.

Activity Result 1: Distribution of Resources for Direct Support (DS) and FFW.

The project mastered the cash/food mix distribution model, introduced in FY09, and successfully collaborated with the Woreda and Zonal officials to institute the Payroll and Attendance Sheet System (PASS) and Client Card systems. The Appreciative Inquiry exercise indicated that beneficiaries value the food aid because it allows them to build assets by mitigating the distress selling/consumption of livestock and agricultural produce. Key achievements include:

- 235,143 individuals (124,776 males/110,367 females) FFW beneficiaries received 10,125.55MT of commodities.
- 26,486 individuals (10,084 males/16,402 females) DS beneficiaries received 1,169.55MT of commodities.

Both the FFW and DS achievements were lower than the FY10 PREP planned beneficiaries due to the annual retargeting process that resulted in the adjustment of the numbers. Distribution is also on-going in some of the extended woredas. Another reason is the incomplete distribution of food in Fantale, due to:- i)Delays in the Woreda officials providing the MBL and payment lists to CARE Ethiopia, due to an elongated retargeting process; and ii) further compounded by the Woreda officials stopping the food distribution process mid-way, due to reports that the FFW activities had not being completed. During this process, the CARE Ethiopia team from the Awash field office held numerous meetings with the Woreda officials to initiate action. When this approach was not fruitful, the project solicited the Oromia Region’s Food Security Bureau’s support. The Region’s Food Security Coordinator worked with the Fantale Woreda officials to expedite the food transfers. CARE Ethiopia kept the USAID local mission updated.

Table 1: Planned number of PW and DS Beneficiaries by Woreda (by Woreda and Number of Months of Transfer) for FY10 PREP

Zone	Name of Woredas	# of Planned Beneficiaries			# of Planned months of transfer
		PW	DS	Total	
East Hararghie	Grawa	36,214	4,209	40,423	3 months
	Kurfachele	17,449	2,400	19,849	3 months
	Bedeno	27,334	531	27,865	3 months
	Haramaya	18,483	1,517	20,000	3 months
	Kombolcha	14,200	964	15,164	3 months
West Hararghie	Chiro	23,241	1,505	24,746	3 months
	Gemachis	22,327	2,063	24,390	3 months
	Doba	25,881	3,165	29,046	3 months
	Miesso	41,100	10,274	51,374	3 months
	Tulo	13,437	1,751	15,188	3 months
East Shewa	Fentale	13,311	821	14,132	3 months
T o t a l		252,977	29,200	282,177	

² This SO was revised, based on feedback from AED and FFP (this was referred to in the FY09 ARR page 1).

Table 2: Actual Number of PW and DS Beneficiaries Reached (by Woreda and Number of Months of Transfer)

Zone	Name of Woredas	# of Actual Beneficiaries Reached			# of Actual Months of Transfer
		PW	DS	Total	
East Hararghe	Grawa	35,863	4,261	40,124	3 months
	Kurfachele	17,512	2,335	19,847	3 months
	Bedeno	24,278	933	25,211	3 months
	Haramaya	18,088	1,909	19,997	3 months
	Kombolcha	13,930	1,212	15,142	3 months
West Hararghe	Chiro	21,793	1,264	23,057	9,287 bene 3 months, 2679 bene. 2 mths and 1091 bene 1 mth
	Gemachis	21,326	2,000	23,326	17,727 bene. 3 months, 3300 bene. 2 mths & 2299 bene 1 mth
	Doba	25,429	2,821	28,250	25323 bene 3 mths, 701 bene. 2 mths & 2226 bene 1 mth
	Miesso	41,294	8,794	50,088	26252 bene 2 mths & 23 836 bene. 1 mth
	Tulo	14,268	904	15,172	2 month
East Showa	Fentale	1,362	53	1,415	1 month
		235,143	26,486	261,629	

- Instituted the Payroll and Attendance Sheet System (PASS) and Client Card systems,** declared mandatory by the Government of Ethiopia (GOE) and donors. These new systems strengthened the accountability and transparency of the food/cash distribution process, by enhancing the triangulation between the various systems and empowering beneficiaries. The project team created a common understanding of the two systems amongst key implementers by organizing a workshop in collaboration with Grawa and Kurfachale Woreda Disaster Prevention and Preparedness (DPP) Offices. A total of 72 (48 males/24 females) Government Development Agents (DAs), and CARE Ethiopia Community Facilitators (CFs) attended the training and developed a solid understanding of the key issues in the revised PIM in East Haraghe. Another training on the PASS software was held for 43 (15 females/28males) East and West Haraghe representatives (i.e. key CARE Ethiopia and Government staff) in December 2009. Topics included software installation, registration system, and data entry, management and reporting.
- Effective collaboration with the Zonal and Woreda government officials to implement planned activities in accordance with the revised Program Implementation Manual (PIM).** This process included a series of planning and review meetings, aimed at developing a common understanding of the PIM and making appropriate implementation decisions. A key decision reached by the government and CARE Ethiopia staff was to alternate the transfer of cash and food every other month in order to balance the logistical difficulties associated with transferring food. CARE Ethiopia obtained approval from the local USAID mission and Food for Peace (FFP) for this change on January 14 and 15, 2010.
- Strengthened the capacity of commodity staff and enhanced warehouse infrastructure.** HIBRET and JEOP staff coordinated to strengthen synergy between programming and commodity information, while improving the quality of the MBL and Payment Lists by:

- Conducting a 2-day commodity management workshop in November 2009, for 27 (3 females/24 males) East and West Haraghe representatives (i.e. 11 Government counterparts and 16 CARE Ethiopia staff). Topics included donor and CARE regulations, targeting, warehouse management, reporting, and emergency operations;
- Recruiting additional commodity related staff to exclusively manage the MBL;
- Constructing 3 warehouses i.e. East Haraghe - Dire Dawa and Latfo; and West Haraghe – Killiso, as well as maintaining the other warehouses in both field offices. This increased the Country Office warehouse capacity by 1,560 MT.

Challenges/Solutions: **The transfer of resources to beneficiaries was late. The major reasons for the delay include: Implementation of PASS and the Client Card system took longer than expected.** The process was commenced late in our areas of operation. We addressed the Client Card issue by supporting the issuance of Client Cards by: i) mobilizing HIBRET beneficiaries to obtain their client cards, and following up on missing/excluded beneficiaries. For the PASS application, the project in collaboration with the Regional Food Security Coordination office provided backstopping twice, for one week. This included the installation of the revised software version, and trouble shooting to overcome data entry challenges experienced by two Regional government PASS experts in both Zones. These efforts were coupled by both field and Addis project teams holding discussions with Woreda, Zonal and Regional officials, USAID/ALT and the EDAC NGOs to identify solutions. This resulted in the government relaxing the PASS as a pre-condition to distribution. The project is now compliant with the PASS. This situation stretched the distribution process into the rainy season, further delaying the pending transfers due to the impassable roads. This was compounded by the shortage of warehouse space and transport services, as the delay resulted in the simultaneous distribution of JEOP and PSNP commodities.

- **Delays in the preparation of Master Beneficiary and Payment List by the Woredas' and Kebeles' Food Security Task Forces (FSTFs),** who are primarily responsible for PSNP implementation. This undermined planning and timely implementation of this key activity. The Field Office team held repeated meetings with Woredas FSTFs, which resulted in the task force providing overall supervision and follow up to the Woreda Food Security office.

The estimated carryover is 487.52MT (430.75 MT wheat, 16.90 MT oil and 39.87 MT lentils).

IR I.2: Community assets built and improved

The project worked with all the targeted 128 Kebeles to improve the physical infrastructure to mitigate the impact of shocks, by enhancing the quality of created assets. An environmentally sound management training was conducted from January 24 to 28, 2010 in West Hararge, in collaboration with key resource persons from USAID, MOARD and CARE Ethiopia. A total of 23 CARE Ethiopia and Government staff such as DAs and CFs from both Zones, including PSNP-Plus and RI staff participated. The participants gained technical knowledge and practical experience in environmentally sound mitigation and management practices, sound design concepts and principles as well as USAID and PSNP Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) compliance procedures. This has contributed to improved sere



Soil and water conservation structure, East Hararghie, photo taken by: Bena Musembi. CARE. October 2009.

implementation of mitigation measures.

Additionally, six (1 female/5 male) HIBRET and PSNP-Plus project team members along with four Woreda government staff participated in a cross visit to REST project areas in Tigray in December 2009. The purpose of the trip was to learn more about degraded land rehabilitation measures and information tracking regarding mitigation measures. This contributed to improved Community Based Integrated Watershed Development planning and implementation.

An additional Water Resource and Construction Advisor was recruited for East Haraghe and has contributed to the progress highlighted in the section below. One person previously served both zones, which undermined timely planning and implementation. The project increased the number of CFs in order to address key challenges faced in FY09. The CFs and DAs also improved the capacities of about 368 asset management committees to effectively manage the created assets, through on-site capacity building. However, the challenges associated with instituting the PASS and client card delayed the start-up of the public works activities.

- **Activity Result 1: Conserved 659ha of land** through various conservation techniques include SWC measures such as terracing, contour bunds and check dams. **This result surpassed the FY10 set target of 378ha due to early planning and timely implementation.** Another contributing factor is the enhanced capacities of the asset management committees, reinforced by the Woreda PW technical committees' improved supervision. This has contributed to the improved productive capacity of the natural resource base along with the gradual restoration of the water table. For example, the picture on the right shows a community member carrying animal fodder, harvested from an area enclosure initiated by PSNP and now managed by the community's asset management committee. The committee has established and maintained an effective management system. A member of the asset management committee noted that they no-longer purchase animal fodder and roofing materials from other areas, due to the success of their enclosure.



Community member harvesting Animal Fodder: West Hararghie, Chiro Woreda Medicho # 2, Photo taken by: Solomon Tsegaye July 2010

- **Activity Result 2: Constructed/rehabilitated 70% of the FY10 planned human water points**, with about 77,179 households accessing potable water. The target was not reached due to the delay in the start-up of the public works activities, further accentuated by difficulties in transporting construction materials to the sites because of poor roads and heavy rain. The water points have a trained Water and Sanitation (WATSAN) committee. Communities are managing seven of the water points constructed/rehabilitated one year ago. Water points were identified as a critical PW activity by the Appreciative Inquiry; highly valued by communities, especially women and girls, due to the reduced work burden and morbidity. The Inquiry recommended the improvement of engineering designs e.g. multiple-use potable water points.

- **Activity Result 3: Constructed 11 and rehabilitated 15 livestock points, exceeding the FY10 target of 10, which are accessed by about 40,844 livestock.** The overachievement is attributable to the simple and appropriate designs utilized and the Woreda's animal health staff's commitment; providing communities with follow-up support. Environmental mitigation measures employed include the location of sites, at least, 50 meters from the water source.

- **Activity Result 4: Irrigating 24HA of land.** The target of 50 was unmet due to the project's decision to focus on small-scale irrigation such as drip - focused on smaller groups to facilitate effective skills transfer (see page 9 activity result 5).
- **Activity Results 5: Rehabilitated 802km of road, surpassing the FY set target of 676.** The target was surpassed due to the value placed by communities on the access created by the roads to market centers and basic social services like clinics.
- **Activity Result 6: Constructed 114km of road, achieving the set target by 92%.** The target was unmet due to the delays in planning PW activities, which resulted in the construction phase coinciding with the early rains. The hilly and stony topography in both Zones undermined the manual road construction. The project team addressed these challenges by increasing the number of foremen trained and the technical backstopping from the woreda rural road office. The Appreciative Inquiry indicated the quality of roads as wanting e.g. poor drainage systems such as the lack of culverts and recommended that CARE Ethiopia consider using heavy machinery to support the construction process.

IR 1.3. Effective and timely community preparation, mitigation and response to shocks and emergencies

- **Activity Result 1:** 33,298 individuals (18,238 males/15,060 females) contingency beneficiaries received 1,186.23MT. The achievement is higher than the 27,934 target, because an additional 7,938 beneficiaries in Kurfachele woreda were given food, with FFP's approval.

Table 3: Actual Number of Contingency Beneficiaries Reached (by Woreda and Number of Months of Transfer)

Zone	Contingency	Male	Female	Total	Commodity	
West Hararghe	Chiro	3,205	1,276	4,481	280.716	
	Gemachis	2,011	1,896	3,907	73.292	
	Doba	2,963	1,983	4,946	165.839	
East Hararghe	Grawa	3,970	4,085	8,055	380.760	6555 ben.3 months,1300 ben. 2 months & 200 ben. 1 month
	Kurfachele	6,089	5,820	11,909	285.620	4941 ben 2 months & 6968 ben 1month
T o t a l		18,238	15,060	33,298	1,186.226	

- **Activity Result 2: 128 communities instituted disaster early warning and response systems with the project's assistance, achieving the FY set target by 100%** The project collaborated with the Woreda Food Security Office and Disaster Prevention Preparedness (FSDPP) office to enhance the Community Based Early Warning System, which was identified as a potential good practice by the Appreciative Inquiry. The Inquiry commended the simplicity of the system, highlighting its ability to detect distress sales and migration. The project focused on strengthening linkages between the Kebele EW committees and those operating in the sentinel sites, and enhancing data collection and utilization by the Woredas. Accordingly, the capacity of 447 (233 male/ 214 female) Early Warning (EW) Facilitators was strengthened through on-site support and formal training by the CFs and DAs. Community EW facilitators collecting weekly data from their communities on variables like rainfall, crop performance,

community coping strategies and estimated crop yield/loss. The information was reported to the CFs and DAs, who report to the Woreda DPPO. The woreda officials collaborate with the project M&E Officers to follow-up on the reports by monitoring the situation in the villages as well as providing logistical support to link the Zonal and Woreda FSTF to take required action.

Challenges/Solutions: The frequency of reporting lacks consistency, with some facilitators not regularly collecting information as required. The refresher course and increased follow-up by DAs and CFs is aimed at addressing this issue. The effective utilization of EW information by all recipients is another area of improvement - the information collected is mostly used at the Woreda level and below (not effectively utilized for decision making). As such, HIBRET is currently coordinating with other CARE projects such as JEOP to strengthen EW information use and dissemination by improving the existing tools and information utilization mechanisms.

- **Activity Result 3: 1 policy milestone accomplished by Regional Food Security Coordination Offices i.e. the revised PIM, which outlined the key policy issues pertaining to the implementation of PSNP.** The target of 2 was unmet because it was ambitious.

I.R 1.4 Capacity of key government departments enhanced to implement PSNP

The project team collaborated with all levels of the government to plan and implement HIBRET as demonstrated by the previous and following sections of this report. For instance, the support provided to the WFSTF and KFSTF in successfully transitioning to the PASS and client card system. At the Regional and Federal level CARE Ethiopia representatives have: i) provided technical support in the development of the PSNP-PAP PWs guidelines and training materials, by identifying replicable lessons learnt in PSNP; ii) advised the implementation of ESMF by Woredas, and ii) provided technical support in the donor and GoE funded exercise to ensure harmonized support from Development Partners for the new GoE Policy on DRM.

- **Activity Result 1: 100% of the Woredas have functional monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems, achieving the set target.** The project recognizes the need to further strengthen the systems. The ME Officers provided their respective government counterparts with technical assistance to strengthen the woreda M&E systems: i) establishing and operating the commodity PASS software; ii) preparing M&E plans and ensuring synergy with the project management information system (MIS). The project also organized participatory panel monitoring events that involved Zonal, Woreda, community and project staff. During these events, the stakeholders shared their experiences, discussed HIBRET's progress, challenges and possible solutions. The CO Livelihood Advisor and Pastoralists Program Coordinator held a Participatory Rural Appraisal workshop, attended by 33 participants (8 females) including 17 government staff. The training enhanced front line staff's capacity to effectively work with their respective communities to implement sustainable interventions. Some topics included wealth ranking, social mapping, development and use of seasonal calendars. The project also underwent a successful Data Quality Assessment in August 2010 by a consultancy firm hired by FFP.

- **Activity Result 2: 90% of the Kebeles prepared and implemented development plans with quality safety net plans.** The target of 100% was unmet because joint implementation plan development, review and execution between CARE Ethiopia and some Woredas has been slow. Consequently, the project has instituted mechanisms to improve planning and coordination. For example, during the FY11 PREP preparation, the project staff held planning sessions with all the 5 Woreda officials to prioritize activities and use of the capital/administration budget. Further, 25 (23 males/3 females) government representatives, 4 (2 males/2 females) project beneficiaries and

17 (16 males/1 females) CARE Ethiopia staff attended the August 2010, 3-day, project annual review workshop, where implementation experiences and plans were discussed and finalized. Challenges/Solutions: The main obstacle was the limited availability of government counterparts to plan and undertake activities. Still, the project team sustained efforts to dialogue and engage them - proactively seeking them out, even outside office hours.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE 4: Increased agricultural production and productivity

HIBRET, RI and PSNP-Plus teams collaborated to implement activities, with the knowledge generated from the community reflection practices of RI, providing critical information for the targeting process. Some village savings and loans (VSSLs) members borrowed funds and organized into groups e.g. seed production and marketing, to achieve results indicated below.

IR 4.1: Increased agricultural productivity and diversified agricultural production

Based on previous year's experience, activities focused on enhancing the capacities of model farmers and farmer groups, while strengthening linkages with the private sector and research institutions, through formal trainings, on-site technical provision and exposure visits. The implementation of environmental mitigation measures was another key area. The limited access to improved seed was experienced, due to the inadequate suppliers nationwide. This challenge was addressed by strengthening the seed revolving schemes, established during HIBRET I, providing technical support in quality seed selection and multiplication practices. Also, in March 2010, FFP approved³ the use of about \$30,486 monetization funds for the purchase of an assortment of seed, including fruit and tree seedlings. The results achieved are discussed below:

- **Activity Result 1: 18 crop varieties were introduced, exceeding the set target of 3**, due to the effective linkages strengthened with various research centers e.g. Hirna and the Awash Melkasa Agricultural Research centers that provided technical support to the farmers and staff - a good practice from last year. Some of the introduced varieties include maize, haricot beans and sweet potatoes, which are high yielding, drought and disease resistance, and early maturing.
- **Activity Result 2: 63 (37 males /26 females) seed suppliers were strengthened, which is 84% of the set target**. The target was unmet due to the difficulties encountered in identifying appropriate individuals i.e. willing and able to participate in the activity as well as trusted by the communities. This challenge was addressed by collaborating with the PSNP-Plus teams to identify 12 market node operators from the private sector. The operators were trained and equipped with weighing scales by the project, subsequently providing updated crop prices, seeds and other market information the farmers. Farmers prefer weighing their market bound produce at the nodes to avoid being cheated at the market by unscrupulous vendors. The CFs and DAs enhanced the other seed suppliers' capacities to produce quality seed through the provision of technical assistance in seed bed preparation, seedling management and transplantation.
- **Activity Result 3: 110 farmer seed producing groups, comprised of 1,120 males and 822 females, linked with seed suppliers, achieving the FY set target**. The groups, some operating as revolving schemes, were linked to the seed suppliers mentioned in activity result 3 above through cross-visits and joint meetings. The project provided them with technical assistance in

³ CARE Ethiopia received ETB 405,462.69 (\$30,486) as the final monetization proceeds, following the closure of the Monetization Management Unit. Other EDAC members also received proceeds, following FFP's approval of each NGO's proposed use of the funds.

marketing and post-harvest handling, and supported them to establish systems to loan/sell seeds to farmers in their respective villages. They produced seed like tomato, cabbage and lettuce.

- **Activity Result 4: 48,276 individuals (21,038 and 27,238 females) received short-term agricultural sector productivity training, exceeding the set target of 20,400.** The target was surpassed because project staff employed effective skills transfer strategies: i) held numerous on-site participatory learning sessions, tailored to the needs of the respective farmers; ii) conducted farmer-to-farm cross-visits; and iii) translated the training materials into Afan Oromo. As such:
 - 21,187 of the aforementioned farmers (12,254 males/8,933 females) were trained in improved farming technologies, below the set target of 30,000. **The project did not introduce new technologies, but scaled-up and diversified those introduced last year.** For instance, diversifying to drip irrigation and scaling up the use of improved storage facilities. Accordingly, 435 farmers adopted improved storage facilities, exceeding the set target of 262, and minimizing post-harvest losses.
 - 3,645 (2,450 males and 1,195 females) were trained in extension methodology, which was a key recommendation of the 2009 annual survey, based on the finding that the model farmers were not adequately transferring skills to other farmers.
- **Activity Result 5: Establishment of 13 small scale irrigation schemes irrigating 99HA and surpassing the set target of 10 schemes.** Reasons for exceeding the target include the recruitment of a separate Water Resource and Construction Advisor for E. Haraghe, who enhanced CFs, DAs and farmers' capacities – subsequently increasing the implementation pace and quality. An additional 96 ha was irrigated with drip kits (34ha) and water lifting devices (62ha). This achievement was further reinforced by the construction of 28 water harvesting structures such as ponds at farmer groups' sites and ROTO tanks (FTCs compounds). The community members identified the sites using the environmental screening tools, with support from the DAs as well as provided locally available construction materials (e.g. stones and sand). Inadequate funds to procure irrigation inputs was a challenge addressed by FFP's March 2010 approval of \$9,549 monetization funds to procure drip kits, water pumps and semi-skilled labor.

IR 4.2. Enhanced Capacity of Communities to Effectively Manage and use Natural Resources in a Sustainable Manner

The Appreciative Inquiry indicated good progress in facilitating access to hilltop land for landless groups and enabling access to leased land for asset building groups. Woreda officials have developed a good understanding of the land certification process. Key results achieved:

- **Activity Result 1: 946 landless households accessed improved/reclaimed land, surpassing the set target of 174. About 540 of the households established 49 groups that are managing 129 ha of land** by planting trees, fencing protected areas, establishing SWC structures, and venturing into micro-enterprises such as bee keeping. This achievement surpassed the set target of 25 groups. The two targets were exceeded because of the growing support and understanding of this initiative by Woreda officials. The limited availability of bee colonies and fruit seedlings was a challenge, but was addressed by FFP's March 2010 approval of the purchase of inputs.
- **Activity Result 2: 1,040 landless group members (254 females/788 males) trained in Natural Resource Management (NRM), exceeding the 710 set target.** This capacity building activity included a combination of 5-day training and on-site practical demonstrations. Topics covered were principles of NRM, different types of SWC measures, and technical standards to be maintained along with environmental mitigation measures.

- **Activity Result 3: 32 plans developed to link honey bee, fodder and fruit enterprises with reclaimed land, below the set target of 50.** Enterprises have commenced, especially with the youth e.g. fodder production, fruit tree cultivation, and shoat fattening. However, the target is unmet due to **challenges** encountered in obtaining bee colonies and hives. The project addressed this challenge by: i) coordinating with PSNP-Plus to establish joint colonies, source them from other Woredas and procure materials to construct the hives; and ii) securing additional monetization funds, approved by FFP in March 2010.

- **Activity Result 4: 1,142 farmers using energy saving stoves, surpassing the set target of 517.** This achievement is attributable to the women, who have adopted the stoves effectively demonstrating their benefits to other women visiting them to learn about the devices – especially the less quantity of fuel wood requirement than traditional stoves. Key are the reduced number of days spent fetching fire wood **from daily to once a week**; and reduced indoor pollution from the smoke. These changes have allowed women the opportunity to diversify their livelihoods by spending more time on productive activities such as farming.



Shemsi Sani, using Energy saving Stove, Legal Lencha village Photo by: Solomon Tsegaye, July 2010

IR 4.3. Improved Agricultural Marketing Extension System

- **Activity Result 1: 119 marketing groups were established, exceeding the FY10 set target of 100.** This achievement is attributable to the project identifying committed farmers, which was a key challenge faced last year. Additionally, **81 farmers groups were linked to micro-finance institutions, surpassing the FY10 target of 50.** Effective integration with PSNP-Plus has contributed to the progress realized this year. The assumption at project design that micro-finance institutions will become established and serve CBOs and communities has not held solid, which has undermined the progress in this area.

- **Activity Result 2: 17 traders were using the market information system.** The target was unmet, due to the initial challenges faces in identifying market node operators, who are the key source of information for the farmers. This was addressed through the adjustment of the market node operator's selection criteria experimented last year.

IR 4.4. Institutional linkages and enabling environment created to implement NRM, farming and land-use policies

The results of the key activities undertaken with the landless groups have positively influenced the Woreda level land-use practices, providing evidence based information for policy formulation. Key results include:

- **Activity Result 1: 93% of action plans implemented to improve the capacity of actors engaged in NRM and agricultural production, achieving the set target.** HIBRET staff worked closely with the government counterparts to identify capacity gaps amongst the key stakeholders. Some plans implemented to address key gaps include the trip to REST project areas; capacity building of woreda officials, farmers and landless groups; and the environmental management workshop. The project staff will increasingly take a facilitation role, leaving the DAs to build the capacities of model farmers and other stakeholders to implement PSNP, during the last FY.

- **Activity Result 2: 93ha of land certified by 5 woredas, which is less than the 144 ha target.** Though the pace of land certification has improved, with all the targeted woredas issuing certificates, the limited availability of land undermines the actual amount of hectares certified.
- **Activity Result 3: 1 social protection policy reform revised i.e. Social Development Welfare Reform Policy.** The target was ambitious, because the National Social Protection Platform, which CARE Ethiopia is a member, is working closely with IGAD, UNICEF, WFP and other NGOs to identify gaps and appropriate actions nationally. The process has taken longer than anticipated, which has delayed the reform.

Graduation:

An estimated 3,023 households graduated from PSNP in East and West Haraghe, during this reporting period. The revised PIM clarified some of the key issues e.g. the possibility of beneficiaries earmarked for graduation to stay with the project for an extra year. Still, findings of our operations research activities, undertaken by an intern from the Addis Abeba University indicated that many beneficiaries, though more knowledgeable about the process, do not consider themselves ready for graduation, especially due to their reliance on rain-fed agriculture, which has been erratic of the past years.

2. Success Story

An Empowered Woman⁴

Amina Bekir Oda, divorced, with 9 children, commands great respect in Ketena Sosete Village, Chiro Woreda, West Hararage, Ethiopia. In 2003, when she separated from her husband, who relocated to the Afar resettlement area, she felt like she was starting her life from scratch. However, in 2005 she was targeted to participate in CARE Ethiopia's PSNP project entitled HIBRET⁵ II. She said that targeting at that time was based on a wealth ranking method. So, she was easily identified by her community's food security task force, as she had no assets, except her house.



Amina Bikre Oda in her village West Hararghe

Picture Taken By: Betel Mekbib

The HIBRET food transfers have closed her 5-month plus food gap, previously experienced yearly by her family. Moreover, her participation in one of the village saving and loan groups (VS&L) formed by CARE Ethiopia, enabled her to start saving 15 Birr (about \$1) per week and earn income, through petty trading. Her VS&L savings and petty trade proceeds enabled her to access a rental plot of land, cultivate crops and obtain 1000 Birr (\$75) profit, which she used to purchase an ox. Additionally, as a member of the "Jalla Vegetable Producing Group", she is responsible for selling the group's produce, which earns her 25 Birr (\$2) per sale, amassing about 300 Birr (\$22.5) per vegetable season (3-4 months).

In addition, Amina rented her brother's land for a one time fee of 1,000 Birr (\$75), after he left the village for resettlement. Then she cultivated sorghum and haricot beans, earning 200 Birr (\$15) from their sale every year, which she used to purchase an additional ox for 2500 Birr (\$188). She proudly says "My sorghum and haricot bean harvest are becoming very productive

⁴ Written by Betel Mekbib, intern from Addis Abeba University.

⁵ Household Income Building and Rural Empowerment for Transformation (HIBRET)

because I use organic manure as CARE Ethiopia taught me. Currently, I consider my self as a very empowered and self reliant woman. So, I am not afraid of expressing my thoughts in public gatherings and for this reason. I have become a chairperson of my village's Women's Association and I am enjoying my leadership role that I acquired through my efforts". At last, looking into my eyes, she says 'I have protected my family, and pulled out of the poverty that forced us to experience many tough days in our lives and am able to send my children to school. I believe in myself that I have what it takes to lead the country. For me, nothing can express empowerment beyond this momentous reaching. Big Thanks to CARE Ethiopia!"

3. Lessons Learned

HIBRET has utilized the following lessons learnt to improve project performance:

- The implementation of new systems such as the client card and PASS should be flexible in order to achieve the main purpose of the project. Achieving a balance between timely transfers and enhanced transparency/accountability of the process is also crucial.
- **The periodic strengthening of the appeals committees at the Woreda and Kebele levels safeguards the rights of the most vulnerable people in communities, who have been denied access to project resources. Still it may be more effective to focus on minimizing the exclusion rather than inclusion errors, due to the power dynamics.**
- Subsistence farmers are able and willing to effectively utilize market information systems that are well adapted to their situation. For instance, market node operators that are trusted, accessible, and equipped with simple updated crop prices and weighing scales play an important role in the value chain.
- **The systematic and consistent promotion of empowerment messages to both women and men, while implementing all project activities, is an effective empowerment strategy. The Appreciative Inquiry found the West Haraghe HIBRET II female beneficiaries highly empowered, compared to the Afar, which was attributed to the efficacy of the strategy employed by the project frontline staff e.g. messages were included in training curriculums. Their male counterparts also demonstrated a change in attitude towards women e.g. more appreciation for the contribution of women due to increased skills.**
- Beneficiaries value the food transfers more for their protection of assets than as food. The food reduces the distress sale and consumption of livestock and other household assets. This reinforces the importance of timely and appropriate transfers.
- **Frequent and open dialogue with partners improves transparency and mutual trust. This approach fostered good working relationships with our government counterparts, enhancing the project's ability to achieve expected results.**
- Sustained graduation of beneficiaries from PSNP is possible, but requires more time and effective diversification of beneficiaries' livelihood strategies. Some graduated households have returned to the project, because they succumbed to the shocks after graduation.

4. Attachments:

The following documents are attached:

- A. Indicator Performance Tracking Table;
- B. Detailed Implementation Plan;
- C. Standardized Annual Performance Questionnaire;
- D. Tracking Table for Beneficiaries and Resources;
- E. Expenditure Report;
- F. Monetization Tables; H. Supplemental Materials; and I. Completeness Checklist.