

**USAID/MALI: MONITORING AND EVALUATION
OF FOOD SECURITY AND NUTRITION UNDER PL480**

Submitted to:

David Atwood
USAID/MALI/ADO
Bamako, Mali

Thomas Marchione
AID/FHA/PPM
Washington, DC

December 24, 1991

Field Visit: December 12-21, 1991

Prepared by:

Laura Bailey

Food Aid IQC Consultant
DATEX Inc.
1400 Eye Street NW #750
Washington DC 20006

MALI FIELD VISIT: PERFORMANCE MONITORING OF PL480

The purpose of the site visits under the PL480 Performance Monitoring and Evaluation Study is to provide field-based information on the capacity of USAID field missions and PVOs involved in PL480 programs to collect, analyze, and transmit data through monitoring and evaluation systems which can inform AID/W on progress and performance towards the global PL480 goal of enhanced food security. Specifically the site visit should inform as to the current PL480 activities implemented by AID in the country, the current goals and objectives of those programs, the current mechanisms and systems for monitoring and reporting on the PL. 480 programs, and the context of PL480 in the Missions portfolio and in the PVOs' programs.

I. Objectives and Narrative Descriptions of PL480 Activities in Mali

A. Title II -- World Vision (MCH, FFW, monetization)

World Vision goal is to "enhance food security in the drought-prone 7th Region of Mali by optimizing the use of local human and environmental resources". World Vision's Multi-Year Operational Plan (MYOP) for 90-92 presents a three-pronged development strategy, with each element involving Title II food commodities as one of the resources used. The three elements are:

Development of Irrigated Rice in Region of Gao -- to ensure food grain self-sufficiency in 20 villages in the cercles of Gao and Ansongo. Uses Title II commodities in a Food for Work (FFW) program to build irrigated rice perimeters in the area of Gao.

Menaka Oasis Project -- to train and equip the nomadic peoples of Menaka Cercle to develop an "oasis safety net" mitigating the adverse effects of drought and increasing population pressures, facilitating the return to a sustainable increased quality of life. Monetized Title II commodities to assist in herd reconstitution for nomads, and uses commodities in FFW program for small Sahel regeneration projects such as building earthen dams and erosion protection structures.

7th Region Child Survival Program -- to improve the health & nutritional status of children 0-5 years of age in the 7th Region through enlarging the coverage, expanding services, and increasing effectiveness of Centres de Rehabilitation et Education Nutritionelle (CRENs). Uses Title II commodities in a Maternal and Child Health (MCH) feeding program.

B. Title III -- PRMC

The Title III program in Mali was transformed from a previous Title II-206 program when the new legislation came into effect. For FY 91-92 the program includes rice and wheat (optional) to be sold and local currencies used to promote specific policy reforms. The program goal is to improve food security in Mali through continued improvement in efficient grain trade and distribution, and support activities with a direct link to increased food production. All Title III commodities and resultant local currencies are managed by the multi-donor PRMC (Programme de Restructuration des Marches Cerealieres). The rice is imported and transferred to OPAM, the national grain marketing agency, which sells the rice through free-market invitations to bid, whereas wheat (an option for FY 92) is sold directly to the single wheat mill in Mali.

Objectives and uses for local currency include:

1. Establishment of Market Information System (SIM) to provide timely and accurate information on grain prices, surpluses, and shortages to make grain marketing more efficient and increase access to food.
2. Policy studies.
3. Training of private traders in areas such as storage and accounting.
4. Credit for cooperatives and village associations to complement work by PVOs in increasing local participation in grain markets.
5. Provision of credit to private traders to increase participation and thus decrease volatility in grain market prices.
6. Technical assistance in help improve grain processing methods to support effective market demand for local cereals by reducing preparation constraints.
7. Purchase and transport of emergency grain with contingency funds to respond to problems of drought and local shortages in deficit areas.
8. Improvement of governmental Early Warning System (SAP) to avoid careless free food distribution which hampers private grain trade in deficit regions.

II. Current Monitoring and Evaluation of PL480 in Mali

A. Title II

Title II legislation and AID/W guidance require each PVO participating in Title II programs to prepare and present a Multi-Year Operational Plan which serves as the "document de base" or foundation for the programming and use of Title II commodities. In addition, each PVO prepares and submits an Annual Estimate of Requirements (AER) which addresses the nuts and bolts of which commodities, when, and how much. Finally, each PVO receiving Title II commodities must prepare and submit an annual progress report to AID/W/FFP by December 31st with a copy to the local USAID Mission.

In this Annual Progress Report, the PVO reports on its progress against the goals, objectives, indicators, and benchmarks specified in its MYOP, and also revises the MYOP if substantial program changes are envisaged. Separate annual monetization reports, previously required whenever Title II commodities were sold by the PVO to generate local currency for programming uses, are no longer required, but reporting on monetization activities is expected as part of the Annual Progress Report.

World Vision in Mali is currently revising the MYOP 90-92 which served as the design and programming foundation for its current Title II activities described earlier. The MYOP 90-92 presents three distinct program activities which are supported by Title II commodities, outlining goals, objectives, and indicators for each of the three. Project Managers in the field provide quarterly reports to the World Vision HQ office in Bamako, where these documents are reviewed, and at the end of the fiscal year, this information and quantitative data included therewith is used to prepare the Annual Progress Report. The report is submitted to USAID/Mali/GDO for comment and simultaneously transmitted to the FFP office in Washington via World Vision's US HQ by December 31 each year.

B. Title III

The Title III program is a "transformed" Title II-206 program in which commodities (usually rice, but FY 92 includes an option for wheat) is imported and transferred to OPAM, the national grain marketing agency, which sells the rice through free-market invitations to bid supervised by the multi-donor PRMC (the context for all non-emergency food aid from the donor group). The Sales Agreement governing the FY 91 and FY 92 Title III program specifies the program goals (Sales Agreement Annex A Section A-1.2b), objectives (Section A-6.1c-2), local currency uses (Section A-6.1c-1), and also presents performance indicators (Section A-6.1c-6) for measuring achievement of results. The Sales Agreement specifies that the "recipient agency" (OPAM, supervised by PRMC) will use these indicators to measure achievement, with the "substantive and active participation of the PRMC Technical Committee" (Sales Agreement pg 20 #6.)

However, in actual fact reporting by the recipient agency tends to focus on the "audit issues" -- grain recieved, dates, amounts, condition, tender sales, storage, and local currency proceeds. The annual audit of PRMC accounts is the primary monitoring mechanism, and it does not include the programmatic indicators designed to measure impact and performance.

In the past (under Title II-206), it has fallen to the USAID Mission to use the information funneled to it through the activities funded by local currency -- SIM weekly and monthly reports, SAP monthly reports, policy studies, PRMC reports on lines of credit, etc.-- to assemble and refine any annual reporting on performance under Title III. The Mission anticipates that this will be the same for any future annual reporting required under Title III. The Mission staff involved in management of the Title III program also use information from the sources listed above to measure the impact of Title III in the context of the annual development of the Mission's API.

The Assessment of Program Impact (API) is managed by the Program Office staff at USAID/Mali, and is built upon the second of two semi-annual project reviews (no longer mandatory per AID/W) done yearly (on 3/31 and 9/31). The September project reviews generate performance and impact information which is "built" into sectoral program info, with info from other donors and the government, and from this the API is prepared. The API is due in Washington on October 31 each year.

III. The Mission Context: USAID/Mali Portfolio and the annual Assessment of Program Impact (API)

The performance of U.S. development assistance projects and programs is reviewed by the Mission's Bamako staff in the context of the Africa-wide Assessment of Program Impact (API), a new mechanism created by the Africa Bureau in response to Congress' focus on "people-level impact" when creating the un-tied Development Fund for Africa (DFA). The 1991 API for USAID/Mali features a program goal and subgoal, three strategic objectives, up to three program performance indicators for each of the three objectives, and targets and subtargets for each strategic objective. Quantitative indicators (program performance indicators and subtargets) are presented with a baseline number followed by 1990, 1991, and future targets through 1995. A narrative paragraph follows each of the subtargets and program performance indicators.

USAID/MALI ASSESSMENT OF PROGRAM IMPACT 1991 (SUMMARY OUTLINE)

GOAL: To promote economic growth.

SUB-GOAL: To improve the quality of life.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES:

- 1 Increase private sector participation in economy
3 program performance indicators (1A, 1B, 1C)
5 targets, each with multiple quantitative sub-targets
- 2 Increase incomes in areas of high productive potential
2 program performance indicators (2A, 2B)
3 targets, each with multiple quantitative sub-targets
- 3 Improve delivery of health and educational services
2 program performance indicators (3A, 3B)
2 targets, each with multiple quantitative sub-targets

IV. The Context of Food Security

A. How "food security" fits into the Mission's program and objectives

Although food security is not one of the USAID/Mali Mission's three strategic objectives (appropriately not, since it is unlikely that such an objective is "do-able" by a single donor, and A.I.D. is striving to identify and pursue feasible objectives), food security does appear as sub-target 2.1b, one of three components to target 2.1 "increase agricultural production", which is in turn one of the three mechanisms identified by the Mission in pursuing its strategic objective 2, "increase incomes in areas of high productive potential". Subtarget 2.1b highlights increased food security through reduced intra-annual grain price variation.

B. How PL480 fits into the Mission's portfolio and API context for food security

The Title III program in Mali (summarized earlier) supports multiple objectives in the agricultural sector through PRMC programming of local currency, most of which target improved market mechanisms and increased private sector participation in the grain trade. The Title II program (also outlined earlier) focuses on improving child survival, increasing agricultural productivity, and protecting fragile lands while supporting traditional nomadic lifestyles.

When viewing the PL480 program as one "vector" of the Mission's overall approach to promoting economic growth and improving the quality of life, the specific resources and activities provided through Titles II and III contribute to all three of the Mission's strategic objectives, summarized in the 1991 API:

API Strategic Objective 1: Increase Private Sector Participation in Economy

Program Indicator 1C: Increase trader participation in grain market

Title III local currency finances lines of credit for traders through PRMC and local banks

API Strategic Objective 2: Increase Incomes in Areas of High Productive Potential

Sub-target 2.1b: Food Security -- intra-annual grain price variation reduced

Title III local currency through PRMC finances development and operation of market information system (SIM), lines of credit for traders, early warning system monitoring food situation in each region (SAP), and policy reforms liberalizing participation in grain market

Title II FFW program supports development of village-based irrigate rice perimeters in food-insecure northern regions

API Strategic Objective 3: Improve Delivery of Health and Education Services

Program Indicator 3A: Decrease infant mortality

Title II commodities support PVO (World Vision) Child Survival MCH community-based health and feeding programs targeting children 0-5 and pregnant/lactating mothers, and training health workers

C. How the USAID/Mali PL480 program and API system fit into the draft "systems approach" conceptualization of food security

Title III program affects the following elements in the draft "systems conceptualization" of food security: responsive food emergency relief system; government policy; marketing (information, credit, institutional capacity); sustainable food supply

Title II program affects the following elements in the draft "systems conceptualization" of food security: effective health, nutrition, and child survival system; responsive food emergency relief system; farm inputs (irrigation)