

PD-ABU-897

**FOOD MANAGEMENT AND
RESEARCH SUPPORT PROJECT**

FINAL PERFORMANCE REPORT

**International Food Policy Research Institute
2033 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006, U.S.A.**

Funded under USAID Contract No. 388-C-00-97-00028-00

October 2001

A

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. OVERVIEW	1
2. PROJECT PERSONNEL AND ADMINISTRATION	3
3. ADVISORY, ANALYTICAL AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT SERVICES	4
4. FUNCTIONAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS ACTIVITIES	7
5. TRAINING ACTIVITIES	13
6. DISSEMINATION ACTIVITIES	23
7. CONCLUSION	27
ANNEX 1: PROJECT PERSONNEL	29
ANNEX 2: TIME LINE OF MAJOR EVENTS	31
ANNEX 3: LIST OF POLICY MEMOS	42
ANNEX 4: SUMMARY OF POLICY MEMOS	46
ANNEX 5: RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE REPORT ON A NATIONAL COMPREHENSIVE FOOD SECURITY POLICY	54
ANNEX 6: PROJECT WORKING PAPERS AND OTHER PUBLICATIONS	60
ANNEX 7: OTHER FMRSR SEMINARS AND WORKSHOPS	64

I. OVERVIEW

Food security in Bangladesh has been a major concern of the Government of Bangladesh, and a major objective of USAID and other donor assistance to the country, since independence in 1971. Substantial progress has been achieved through increases in rice and wheat production, improvements in infrastructure, improving the efficiency of food delivery in the Public Foodgrain Distribution System, and market liberalization in the late 1980s and early 1990s. Nonetheless, about half of the population of Bangladesh lacks sufficient resources to enable them to consume minimum food requirements for healthy and productive lives.

The Food Management and Research Support Project (FMRSP) of the Ministry of Food, People's Republic of Bangladesh, begun in 1997, was designed to help increase food security in Bangladesh by "effecting improved food management". At the heart of the project were four major food policy activities: advisory services, training, research and dissemination. The International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) in collaboration with the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) of the Ministry of Food implemented the project, along with three project sub-contractors: the Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BIDS), the University of Minnesota and the International Science and Technology Institute (ISTI).¹

The FMRSP began in August 1997 and was originally scheduled to last 3.5 years, until February 2001. The project was subsequently extended twice. The first extension covered the period from March through June 2001, when a follow-on project was scheduled to begin. A second extension was granted through August 2001 because of delays in the planned follow-on project.

Among the major accomplishments of the FMRSP are the following:

- Provided advisory services to the Secretary of Food following a major aman rice production shortfall in December 1997 and during the massive floods of 1998, that destroyed approximately one-fourth of the 1998/99 aman harvest. Government policies of encouraging private sector imports, while increasing food distribution to food-insecure households, helped avert a major food crisis.
- Wrote 53 policy memos on various food policy issues for the Secretary of Food and other policy advisers, covering a range of topics involving the Public Foodgrain Distribution System, rice and wheat markets, international trade and food security.

¹ Technically, the FMRSP contained three components. This document describes the main component: the technical assistance contract with the International Food Policy Research Institute and its sub-contractors. A second component, funded by USAID/Dhaka, provided funds directly to the Ministry of Food for institutional strengthening of the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit. The third component, supported by Government of Bangladesh own resources, covered the office of the Project Director.

- Assisted in the preparation of a major GOB-donor report on comprehensive food security in Bangladesh and a draft of a National Food Policy in 2001.
- Conducted a survey on the impacts of the 1998 floods on household food security, including coping mechanisms adopted by affected households, the effectiveness of government targeted food distribution programs, and medium-term recovery of the households.
- Conducted an evaluation of the Food For Education program involving an analysis of program impacts on school attendance, educational performance, food consumption and nutrition.
- Completed project research papers on price stabilization, private sector trade, effectiveness of targeted food distribution, household food security, public stocks, developments in the livestock and poultry sector, operational aspects of the Public Foodgrain Distribution System.
- Strengthened the capacity of the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit and the Ministry of Food through in-country workshops and seminars, training at the University of Minnesota and on-the-job training.
- Held three major workshops and numerous seminars to disseminate project research and inform policy-makers, researchers and stakeholders of key food policy developments.

Thus, the FMRSP had a major impact on food security in Bangladesh through its support of the Ministry of Food in its handling of major production shortfalls, particularly following the 1998 floods. Impacts of training and research activities are harder to assess, given the complex nature of the policy process and the long lead-time often involved in shifts in policy. Nonetheless, the project has laid the grounds for significant medium-term impact, as well, through its research, training and policy analysis activities.

II. PROJECT PERSONNEL AND ADMINISTRATION

The Food Management and Research Support Project (FMRSP) was implemented by the International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) together with the Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BIDS), the University of Minnesota and the International Science and Technology Institute (ISTI). All four of these institutions worked closely with the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) of the Ministry of Food, as well as with the project's steering committee, chaired by the Secretary of Food.

IFPRI's work was headed in Washington, D.C. by Dr. Raisuddin Ahmed, Director of the Marketing and Structural Studies Division. Dr. Paul Dorosh headed the Dhaka project office as Chief of Party throughout the life of the project. Dr. Carlo del Ninno, the project's Human Resource Coordinator, was also based in Dhaka for 3 and ½ years. IFPRI's research, training and policy advisory work for the FMRSP was also supported by Washington-based researchers, as indicated in the list of Project Personnel in Annex 1.

The Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies played a major role in the research effort of the project, and contributed to local training efforts. Dr. Quazi Shahabuddin, who served as the Marketing Economist, was the team leader for BIDS. Other senior BIDS researchers included Dr. Omar Haider Chowdhury and Dr. K.A.S. Murshid. Several other research fellows from BIDS (shown in Annex 1) participated in the project, as well.

The University of Minnesota was responsible for conducting three three-week long food policy training courses in Minnesota. In addition to their roles in the courses in the U.S., Professors Ben Senauer and Donald Liu each gave lectures at the Dhaka-based annual food policy courses. The International Science and Technology Institute (ISTI) was responsible for study tours and assisting with other dissemination activities.

Mr. M. Abdul Aziz was appointed by the Ministry of Food to serve as Project Director. In addition to his administrative roles, he also took part in the research, training, and policy advisory activities of the project. Throughout the project, the FMRSP staff worked closely with the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) of the Ministry of Food, particularly with Ruhul Amin, Director, Naser Farid, Additional Director and Hajikul Islam, Research Officer.

Finally, during the four years of the FMRSP, there were two successive Contracting Officers responsible for overseeing the activities of the FMRSP for USAID/Dhaka: Mr. Ibrahim Khalil and Dr. S.R. Bhuiyan.

A timeline of major project activities and related events is given in Annex 2.

III. ADVISORY, ANALYTICAL AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT SERVICES

One major activity of the Food Management and Research Support Project (FMRSP) was to provide advisory services to the Government of Bangladesh. Over the four years of the project, the staff produced 53 policy advisory memos together with the staff of the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) of the Ministry of Food. The large majority of these memos were written in response to direct requests of the Ministry of Food, under very tight time constraints (in some cases, as little as two days). The major purpose of these memos, thus, was not to provide a comprehensive analysis of these topics, but to provide timely, practical policy analysis needed for current policy decisions. Many of the issues discussed in the memos, however, became topics of subsequent research working papers of the project.

The topics of the memos were greatly influenced by market conditions and the immediate issues facing the Ministry of Food. From December 1998 through May 1999, most memos dealt with issues related to the 1997-98 aman rice production shortfall. Then, beginning in August 1998, the 1998 floods dominated the policy agenda for nearly a year. Memos during this period covered food aid requirements, assessments of market behavior, options for stock management, procurement and distribution, maintaining incentives for private sector imports of rice, expansion of the Vulnerable Group Feeding program and other flood-related issues. From late 1999 through mid-2001, however, low producer prices, aging stocks and procurement issues, rather than shortfalls, were the major concern.

These memos were the products of a team effort. Dr. Paul Dorosh, Economist and Chief of Party of the FMRSP, wrote the initial drafts of almost all the memos. The FPMU (particularly Ruhul Amin, Director, Naser Farid, Additional Director and Hajikul Islam, Research Officer) made major contributions to the statistical and economic analysis in many of the memos, and along with M. Abdul Aziz, (FMRSP Project Director), Quazi Shahabuddin (BIDS), Mahfoozur Rahman (FMRSP-IFPRI) and Carlo del Ninno (IFPRI) provided important insights on many policy issues.

In all, five bound volumes of policy advisory memos were produced by the project. A full list of the policy advisory memos of the project is given in Annex 3. Summaries of some of the major policy memos are provided in Annex 4.

The Comprehensive Food Security Policy Report

The FMRSP was also actively involved with the Task Force on the National Comprehensive Food Security Policy, formed in August 1999, as a follow-up to discussion held by the Government of Bangladesh and development partners at the Development Forum meeting in April 1999. Dr. Carlo del Ninno, FMRSP-IFPRI, served on the seven-member Core Group, a sub-group of the Task Force that formulated the

scope, goal and strategies of the Comprehensive Food Security Policy and proposed formation of Working Sub-Committees. Project staff, together with the FPMU, played a major role with the draft reports of two working sub-committees created by the Task Force, and drafted the synthesis document on the National Comprehensive Food Security Policy completed in late March 2000, and ultimately finalized by the Joint Task Force on July 27, 2000.

This national comprehensive food security policy expanded the dominant historical focus of food policy discussions, often centered on the estimated “food gap” (the difference between a target level of availability and domestic production) and food aid requirements, to include availability, access and utilization aspects. The final report made ten policy recommendations, including the expansion of the mandate of the Food Planning and Monitoring Committee to include questions of non-foodgrain availability, household access to food and nutrition issues. The recommendations and conclusions of the report are contained in Annex 5.

The policy framework and recommendations of the report were subsequently recast as a National Food Policy statement by the FPMU, and the Ministry of Food and other ministries. This new food policy was approved by a bi-partisan Parliamentary committee in early July 2001, but was not formally adopted by the Cabinet before the Awami-led government stepped down in mid-July 2001.

Other Policy Advisory Services

In addition to the above memos and assistance with the National Food Policy, the project’s policy advisory services included participation in and support to technical committees, and assistance to the Ministry of Food for various presentations in meetings and seminars. The project assisted with a major slide presentation by the Secretary of Food on “The Structure of the Food Economy of Bangladesh” and “Food Policy Issues and Constraints in Bangladesh”, for the Prime Minister on 23 May, 1998. It also helped prepare GOB presentations at the SAARC (South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation) in July 1998, the Paris donors meeting in April 1999, and several international seminars in 2000 and 2001.

Technical support regarding foodgrain tenders was provided by Mr. Mahfoozur Rahman, the FMRSP Program Officer and Private Sector Specialist. Mr. Rahman conducted an assessment of the tenders for foodgrain conducted by the DG Food in 1998, and worked with DG Food officials in formulating internal tenders for 100,000 tons of rice in January 1998. Mr. Rahman also served as a member of the Ministry of Food’s Rice Specification Committee convened by the Joint Secretary of Procurement, 10 November 1998. This latter committee met three times and set specifications for possible future tenders for Thai rice. Recommendations the committee were later adopted by the Special Cabinet Committee on Food Procurement in December 1998.

Finally, the project provided policy advisory services directly to USAID/Dhaka when requested. Many of these requests and discussions were informal, though several

of the more important interactions involved more formal meetings and memos. For example, in October 1998, Dr. Paul Dorosh briefed the U.S. Ambassador, John Holzman, on food markets and food policy in the aftermath of the 1998 flood. Other examples include a February 1999 memo outlining a proposed Indicator of Market Orientation of Food Policy -- the share of private commercial imports out of total non-food-aid foodgrain imports to show the degree of market orientation of government policies to augment domestic supplies -- and analysis and write-up for the Bellmon determination of the effects of food aid on domestic markets.

IV. FUNCTIONAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS SERVICES

Research activities of the project were designed to increase understanding of key food policy issues, and thus provided an essential base for policy advisory services. The project's research activities were organized into annual work plans that were drafted in consultation with the Ministry of Food and USAID, and ultimately approved by the Project Steering Committee. Each work plan provided a set of topics on the basis of which the fieldwork was conducted and the project research papers were written. Researchers then presented these papers at the annual FMRSP Food Policy workshops. (See Annex 6 for a full list of project working papers and synthesis papers.)

First Annual Work Plan: October 1997 through June 1998

The first work plan, covered the period from October 1997 through June 1998, and outlined five major topics for research:

- 1) Analysis of Targeted Food Programs
- 2) National Food Security: Public Foodgrain Stocks and Other Options
- 3) Maintaining Incentives for Domestic Production
- 4) Macro-economic Implications of Food Policy
- 5) Facilitating Exports of Rice

Major field work was involved for two of the studies. For the first study, fieldwork included an investigation of leakages in Vulnerable Group Development (VGD) and Food For Work (FFW) programs in March through May, 1998. The World Food Programme office in Dhaka participated in this research, assisting in the selection of survey sites. Research work on the third topic, Maintaining Incentives for Domestic Production, included a rapid appraisal survey of farmgate prices, paddy production and marketing issues during a period of unexpectedly high rice prices in January 1998.

Among the major findings of the research in the first work plan were:

- In a sample of 10 thanas, leakages in the Rural Development projects were estimated at between 16 and 26 percent; 94 percent of the food distributed in the Vulnerable Group Development program goes to poor women (though not all were official participants in the program). Leakages could be reduced through making more information on RD worker payments and project size public, and through timely cross-checking of project reports (del Ninno, 1999; working paper no. 3).
- The "optimal stock" is not a single magic number, but depends on policy objectives, instruments and constraints. Costs of price stabilization and public stocks can be minimized through relying on international trade to supplement domestic supplies, and using wheat rather than rice for targeted distribution. In the absence of simple mechanisms for purchases and sales, stock rotation

requirements impose a severe constraint on public stock management. (Goletti and Rich, 1998).

- Since liberalization of private sector imports of rice in the early 1990s, the import parity price of rice (equal to the full cost of transporting and marketing imported rice) has acted as a price ceiling for Bangladesh domestic prices of rice in periods of periods of domestic production shortfalls. (Dorosh, 1999; working paper no. 2).
- To promote private sector exports of rice in periods of bumper harvests and low prices, national grades and standards of rice should be upgraded, adequate credit for traders, millers and exporters should be made available, and efforts should be made to remove import levies in importing countries. (Rahman, 2000; working paper no. 4).

Second Annual Work Plan: July 1998 through November 1999

The project's second annual work plan included six major topics:

1. National Food Policy: Objectives and Mechanisms for Food Security
2. Implications of India's Food Policy and Regional Markets for Bangladesh
3. Rice Procurement Mechanisms: Boro 1997/98
4. Public Interventions to Enhance Food Security
5. Procurement Manuals and Evaluation of Tenders
6. Maize Production, Markets and Procurement

The latter two topics, on Procurement Manuals and Evaluation of Tenders, and Maize Production, Markets and Procurement, were chosen in response to formal requests of the Ministry of Food. Three of the studies involved significant fieldwork. As part of the work on Public Interventions to Enhance Food Security (topic 4), a rapid assessment of flood-affected areas was conducted in ten thanas throughout Bangladesh from September through November 1998. Subsequently, in November and December 1998, a survey covering 756 households in seven of the thanas examined household food security following the flood. A second round of the survey was conducted in April and May, 1999. Work on topic 3 included a survey on rice procurement mechanisms in the 1997/98 boro season from September through November 1998 in Rajshahi Division. Finally, in November and December 1998, project researchers conducted a survey of maize farmers, traders and feed millers for topic 6.

Major research findings of the studies undertaken in the second annual work plan included:

- A survey of 757 households in seven flood-affected thanas showed that 56 percent of households received received some kind of transfer averaging 1229 Taka per household). Gratuitous relief transfers (averaging 162 Taka per household) were

well targeted to flood-exposed households; Vulnerable Group Feeding transfers (averaging 308 Taka per household) were well targeted to poor households. (del Ninno and Roy, 1999; working paper no. 9.)

- Private sector imports of over 200 thousand tons per month from July 1998 through April 1999 stabilized rice supply and rice prices in Bangladesh following the 1998 floods. Comparisons with India's export data and analysis of domestic demand suggest that Bangladesh customs data may have overstated the volume of imports in 1998-99 (officially 3.2 million tons) by about 1.0 million tons. (Dorosh, 1999; working paper no. 16.)
- Analysis of India's rice economy suggested that India is likely to continue to export rice in the medium term, given its comparative advantage in rice production. State restrictions on marketing of grains could potentially interfere with export flows to Bangladesh in the future. (Osmani, 1998; working paper no. 10.)
- A survey of 40 rice importers in 1999 showed that delivery time by trucks (20-25 days) much shorter than by rail (115-120 days), most importers sold the rice to wholesalers near the border, neither credit nor storage and transport were major constraints, and that importers felt that exporters often failed to stick to their side of the bargain. (Murshid, 1999; working paper no. 11).
- Performance of GOB international and local tenders for rice could be improved by stipulating that no extension in time of delivery be granted and by increasing the size of the Performance Guarantee Bond to 10 percent. (Rahman, 1999; working paper No. 15.)
- Survey data from the 1998 boro season procurement in Rajshahi district showed that only 10 percent of sample farmers participated in procurement, "unofficial payments" at various stages of procurement were common, and additional drying facilities are needed. (Shahabuddin and Islam, 1999; working paper No. 13.)

Third Annual Work Plan: November 1999 through February 2001

The project's second annual work plan included five broad research areas, and 13 specific topics:

Public Interventions to Increase Household Food Security

1. Household Flood Recovery and Consumption Behavior
2. Targeting Food Assistance
3. Food For Education: Analysis of Household Survey Data and Enrollment Patterns

4. Analysis of Nutritional Trends with HKI data.

Rural Incomes, Employment and Food Prices

5. Co-integration of Rice Prices and Wages
6. Determinants of Labor Participation at the Household Level

Domestic Price Determination and Markets

7. Livestock and Poultry Feed Demand – Implications for Wheat and Maize Markets.
8. Changes in Foodgrain Market Structure

Macro- Economic Policies and the Foodgrain Sector

9. Linkages Between Macro-policy and the Food Sector
10. Long-term Foodgrain Projections, Comparative Advantage and WTO/GATT
11. Implications of Declining Food Aid

Technical Storage and Marketing Issues

12. Chemical Change of Foodgrains in Storage
13. Standardization, Grading, Inspection and Market Development of Rice

Four studies involved major fieldwork. A third round of the household flood survey was conducted in October and November 1999 for topic 1, “Household Flood Recovery and Consumption Behavior”. The cost of this fieldwork was borne in large part by the World Bank Dhaka office. Fieldwork for the Food for Education study (topic 3) began in September 2000 and continued until December 2000. Researchers interviewed poultry producers, feed millers and maize farmers for topic 7 in mid- 2000. Finally, research on topic 12, “Chemical Change of Foodgrains in Storage”, involved setting up storage experiments in 30 government godowns throughout the country, and collecting and analyzing the grain samples from November 2000 through April 2001. (Note that, ultimately, study 4 could not be undertaken because the data was not made available to the project.)

Major research findings of the studies undertaken in the third annual work plan included:

- Data from three rounds of a survey of 757 flood-exposed households indicated that households continued to be adversely affected even one year after the flood. Although average per capita calorie consumption had risen from 2249 in late 1998 to 2526 in late 1999, the percentage of children stunted had risen from 53.4 percent to 56.2 percent. Moreover, in large part because of heavy borrowing just after the flood, 64 percent of households had outstanding debts equal to nearly one month’s average consumption even one year after the flood. (del Ninno and Roy, 2001; working paper no. 23.)
- A survey of schools, traders and households for an evaluation of the Food for Education program showed that FFE has been successful in increasing primary

school enrollment, promoting school attendance and reducing dropout rates. The program has a positive impact on household food security, significantly increasing calorie and protein consumption in beneficiary households. (Ahmed, del Ninno and Chowdhury, 2001; working paper no. 35.)

- A survey of 71 poultry farms showed that maize and wheat accounted for about 45 and 5 percent, respectively, of total feed by weight in commercial layer farms, and 21 and 18 percent of total feed by weight in commercial broiler farms. (Quasem, 2001; working paper no. 30.)
- An analysis of chemical changes of rice in government storage showed generally high quality of grain, with little change in fat content, acid value, peroxide value, reducing sugar or fungus over the five months of the study. (Kabirullah and Rahman, 2001; working paper no. 21.)
- Given a moderate world wheat prices and bumper rice harvests in Bangladesh that reduced demand for wheat, domestic wheat prices fell in the second half of 2000 and private sector imports of non-milling wheat essentially came to a halt. Analysis suggests that if good rice harvests continue and world wheat prices remain moderately high, then net public wheat distribution may need to be cut to levels below the 650 thousand tons in 2000/2001 to avoid reducing domestic prices below import parity and causing price disincentives to domestic wheat production (Dorosh, Shahabuddin, Aziz and Farid, 2001; working paper no. 32.)

Synthesis Papers and Stock Policy: March through June 2001

In the final four months of the main phase of the project, six synthesis papers were written, summarizing the key findings of the project:

1. Dorosh, Paul, Quazi Shahabuddin and Naser Farid. Price Stabilization and the Cost of Food Stocks.
2. Dorosh, Paul and K.A.S. Murshid. Trade Liberalization, Private Sector Imports and National Food Security in Bangladesh.
3. Shahabuddin, Quazi, Paul Dorosh, Abul Quasem and Nabiul Islam Comparative Advantage and Medium-Term Outlook in Bangladesh Agriculture.
4. Rahman, Mahfoozur. Technical Aspects of Food Policy Implementation in Bangladesh: Grades, Standards, Storage and Procurement.*
5. Murshid, K. A. S. and Shahidur Rashid. Market Transition and Price-Wage Dynamics: The Case of the Bangladesh Rice Market.

6. del Ninno, Carlo and Dilip K. Roy. Impact of the 1998 Flood on Household Food Security.

In addition, Dr. Raisuddin Ahmed published a book synthesizing and extending earlier work on rice policy in Bangladesh, *The Retrospects and Prospects of the Rice Economy of Bangladesh*.

Finally, at the request of the Ministry of Food, a paper was written analyzing various options for stock policy. "The PFDS and Foodgrain Stocks: Costs, Benefits and Policy Options" by Paul Dorosh and Naser Farid showed that overall stock levels in recent years have been broadly consistent with the volume of distribution of the PFDS. Aging stocks have led to major losses in value of rice to PFDS recipients, however. Marginal changes in the size of stock would not lead to large changes in the efficiency of the PFDS; instead, improved mechanisms for stock rotation (such as government wholesale market sales) and reduction of leakages could have a much bigger positive impact.

V. TRAINING ACTIVITIES

The Project's Human Resource Plan was developed by Dr. Carlo del Ninno, the the Project's Human Resource Co-ordinator, in consultation with the Ministry of Food and USAID/Dhaka. The plan, approved by USAID/Dhaka in December 1998, outlined a time frame for completing the project's training requirements.

Five major kinds of training activities were described in the plan: 3 annual Dhaka-based Food Policy Courses (about 60 participants in total); 3 annual U.S.-based Food Policy Courses (with 15 participants in total); 3 annual Asian study tours (15 participants in total), 3 annual U.S. study tours (15 participants in total); training in basic data analysis in Dhaka and other sites in Bangladesh; 3 senior policy workshops in Bangladesh; and other Dhaka-based seminars and workshops.

As shown in Tables 1 and 2, local training courses involved 291 people (some of whom took part in more than one activity). Fifteen people participated in overseas training (the U.S.-based food policy course and the Asian and U.S. study tours). With the exception of the U.S.-based food policy course, for which participants were selected on the basis of their performance in the Dhaka-based food policy course, participants were selected by an internal committee of the Ministry of Food. Training involved mainly staff of the Ministry of Food, FPMU or Directorate General of Food, though 34 people from the Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Planning took part in local training, and 6 private sector representatives went on study tours.

A. Dhaka Based Annual Food Policy Course

Each year of the project a three week Food Policy Course was organized by Dr. Carlo del Ninno, the project's Human Resource Co-ordinator and taught by members of the project staff as well as representatives from the Ministry of Food, the Government of Bangladesh.

The course covered a broad range of topics related to food policy including production and farmer constraints, consumption, market demand and supply, international trade, government and private storage, implications of international trade agreements, food aid, government domestic and international procurement and monitoring of world markets. For the second annual course, the list of topics was expanded to include the government policy response to the 1998 flood.

Course lectures were presented each year by Dr. Carlo del Ninno, Dr. Paul Dorosh, Dr. Quazi Shahabuddin (BIDS), Dr. Omar Haider Chowdhury (BIDS), Dr. K.A.S. Murshid (BIDS), Mr. Abdul Aziz (Project Director, FMRSP), Mr. Ruhul Amin (Deputy Chief, FPMU), Mr. Nasser Farid (Assistant Chief, FPMU), Mr. Mahfoozur Rahman (Program Officer, FMRSP), and Mr. Abdur Rouf (Director of Training, DG Food). Dr. Abdul Quasem of BIDS was added as a lecturer for the second year and Mr. Md. Shah Jahan, Joint Secretary of the Ministry of Food lectured at the third annual course.

Table 1: FMRSP Training Activities -- Number of Participants

Local Training

Basic Data Analysis	127
Food Policy Course	66
Senior Food Policy Workshop	50
Basic Computer Training	10
Communication Skills Workshop	23
Technology Transfer Workshops	15

Total Local Training 291

Overseas Training

U.S. Study Tours	15
Asia Study Tours	15
Food Policy Course (U. of Minnesota/IFPRI)	15

Total Overseas Training 45

Table 2: FMRSP Training Activities – Number of Participants by Organization

	Local Training	Overseas Training
Ministry of Food	65	15
Food Planning and Monitoring Unit	36	5
Directorate General of Food	120	15
FMRSP Project Office (GOB)	8	0
Ministry of Planning	11	2
Ministry of Agriculture	23	1
Private Sector	1	6
Other	27	1
Total	291	45

Outside resource persons also played important roles in the courses. During the first annual three-week Food Policy Course, held at the Ministry of Food in March, 1998, Professor Ben Senauer of the University of Minnesota presented some of the lectures on consumption and demand analysis. The second and third courses were both held at the FMRSP-IFPRI office in Dhaka. During the second course, held from April 6 to 26, 1999, Professor Donald Liu of the University of Minnesota was invited to present lectures on consumption, demand analysis, production, markets and trade. Dr. Suresh Babu of the IFPRI Washington D.C. was invited to the third course, held from July 11 to 31, 2000, to present lectures on consumption, demand analysis, production, markets and trade.

B. U.S.-Based Food Policy Course

The project conducted three Food Policy Courses in the United States at the University of Minnesota and the IFPRI offices in Washington, D.C. Each year of the course, five participants were chosen on the basis of their performance during that year's Food Policy Training Course in Dhaka. Courses were taught by faculty and staff of the University of Minnesota, supplemented by additional presentations by IFPRI staff in Washington, D.C.

This course provided an opportunity for the participants to study economic analysis in more depth than was possible in the Dhaka Food Policy Training Course. Topics covered included Food Supply and Demand, Public Food Programs, Spatial Characteristics of Prices and Price Behavior over Time, Government Intervention in Agricultural Markets and International Trade, among others.

C. Asia Study Tours

Three Asian study tours were conducted by the project, in 1998, 1999 and 2000. Study tour destinations and topics were chosen in consultation with the Ministry of Food and the FPMU, and focused on key issues of relevance to Bangladesh food policy.

The first study tour was held from 19 April to 2 May, 1998. Four government officials from the Ministry of Food participated in the tour of Thailand and Viet Nam, along with one private sector businessman (funded by the Agrobased Industries and Technology Development Project (ATDP)) and the study tour coordinator, Ms. Paula Pitman from the International Science and Technology Institute (ISTI). During this trip, the group studied the international rice trade and rice exports from these two countries.

The second study tour was held in India and Myanmar from May 12 to 26, 1999. Four government officials from the Ministry of Food participated, along with two private sector businessmen, and the study tour coordinator, Mr. Golam Robbani, of the International Science and Technology Institute (ISTI). During this trip, the group studied the foodgrain policies, marketing and the potential of rice exports to Bangladesh from these countries.

The third annual study tour began June 18 and continued through July 5, 2000. As part of this study tour, five participants from the Government of Bangladesh and the private sector, along with Mr. Golam Robbani, the study tour coordinator, went to Indonesia and the People's Republic of China to discuss national food policy, foodgrain trade and other issues.

D. U.S. Study Tours

In addition to the three Asian study tours, the project conducted three U.S. study tours. Each of these study tours included time in Washington, D.C. for discussions with staff of USAID/Washington, World Bank, IFPRI and other institutions, and a visit to another site in the United States. In general, GOB participants on U.S. study tours were of the rank of Joint Secretary or Secretary, and were selected by a GOB committee. One private sector representative was included in each U.S. study tour, as stipulated by USAID/Dhaka.

During the first U.S. Study Tour, in July, 1998, a team of four high-level government officials and a member of the Federation of Bangladesh Chambers of Commerce and Industries went to Washington, D.C. and Chicago to study broad food policy issues and the international food grain trade. While in Washington, the team participated in an all-day seminar at the World Bank devoted to Food Policy Issues in Bangladesh, chaired by Professor C. Peter Timmer and hosted by Dr. Isabelle Tsakok, the economist leading a team formulating the World Bank's Rural Development Strategy for Bangladesh. Later, from November 19 to December 3, 1998, the Secretary of Food, Mr. Mahbub Kabir went on an individual study tour to Washington, D.C. to meet with USAID, World Bank and IFPRI officials and to discuss food policy issues.

Three government officials (two from the Ministry of Food and one from the Planning Commission), along with one private sector businessmen participated in the second U.S. Study Tour, July 10 - 24, 1999. The tour included an orientation to food policies and development issues from the perspectives of international organizations and U.S. government institutions, as well as an overview of private grain-marketing systems. Later, Mr. Mahbub Kabir, Secretary of the Ministry of Food, travelled to the U.S. from August 31 to September 25, 1999 where he participated in high-level meetings with UN, USAID and USDA officials and presented a seminar at the IFPRI office.

For the third U.S. Study Tour, three participants (one each from the Ministry of Food, the Directorate General Food and the Federation of Bangladesh Chambers of Commerce and Industries) visited the U.S. from July 24 to August 6, 2000. After visiting Washington, D.C., they travelled to Little Rock, Arkansas, where they visited Riceland Foods, Inc., and northern California, where they attended the International Agricultural Visitors Program at the University of California-Davis.

Two participants in 2000 study tours travelled individually. The first of these, Mr. Mahbub Kabir, Secretary of the Ministry of Food, travelled to Washington, D.C. from May 2-22, where he visited with officials from the IFPRI Washington office, the International Science and Technology Institute, and the World Bank. Later, the final participant in the third U.S. Study Tour, the Joint Secretary of Development, Ministry of Food, Mr. Md. Shahjahan, visited the IFPRI office in Washington, D.C. from September 1 to 20, 2000 to work on food aid issues in Bangladesh and to hold discussions with IFPRI researchers.

Finally, Mr. Nurul Afsar, the Director General of the DG Food attended the USAID workshop at IFPRI Washington, D.C. on November 1-2, 1999 under FMRSP funding. Mr. Afsar was a discussant at the session on "Safety Nets and Liberalization. Case Study: Food Security Decision-Making in Bangladesh", in which Dr. Paul Dorosh presented a paper, Averting a Food Crisis: Private Imports and Public Targeted Distribution in Bangladesh After the 1998 Flood, co-authored with Dr. Carlo del Ninno.

E. Senior Food Policy Workshops

Senior food policy workshops were designed to enable high-level government officials to learn about food policy issues and research findings, and to hold policy discussions. Participants included senior government officials, as well as representatives of the NGO and the private sector.

The first Senior Food Policy Workshop was held in Comilla on May 22 and 23, 1999. The workshop was led by Dr. Carlo del Ninno, Dr. Paul Dorosh and Dr. Quazi Shahabuddin (BIDS) and consisted of six sessions: Program Overview, Price Stabilization and Private Sector Imports, OMS and Other Distribution Programs, Domestic and International Procurement, Food Availability and Food Security in the Medium Term, Wrap-up and Conclusions.

At the second workshop in Chittagong on 8-9 November 2000, presentations were made by Dr. Carlo del Ninno, Dr. Paul Dorosh, Mr. Ruhul Amin (Deputy Chief, FPMU) and Mr. Naser Farid, (FPMU). The sessions addressed Price Stabilization through International Trade; Targeted Interventions and Household Coping Strategies following the 1998 Flood; The Food Gap, Timing of Food Aid and Price Disincentive Effects; Foodgrain Storage, Age of Stocks and Stock Rotation; and Future Directions in Food Policy. The workshop participants also visited the government grain silo at Chittagong port to learn about constraints in shipping and handling of imported grain.

The third workshop was held in Jessore on 5-6 May 2000 and consisted of presentations on various aspects of Food Policy in an Open Economy, Liberalization and Foodgrain Imports: The Evolution and Conduct of the Border Trade with India, Discussion of Border Trade Issues, Price Determination in an Open Economy, and Producer Price Incentives. Presentations were made by Dr. Paul Dorosh, Dr. KAS Murshid (BIDS), and Mr. Naser Farid (FPMU). The workshop participants also visited

the Benapole Customs office, the Port Authority office and the office of a clearing and forwarding agent.

F. Computer Training Courses

The FMRSP project included eight training sessions on the use of computers for food policy analysis, which were conducted by Mr. Aminul Islam Khandaker of IFPRI-FMRSP. The courses were held throughout Bangladesh and were targeted towards field-level government officials. The courses discussed Basic Data Analysis Using MS Excel and consisted of lectures and hands-on training using personal computers.

Two short courses were given in Dhaka, February 1998 and April 4-13, 2001. 25 people attended the first course, and 18 attended the second course. Most of the participants were from the FPMU, the Ministry of Food or the DG Food, but some officials from the Department of Agricultural Marketing (Ministry of Agriculture) and the Planning Commission also took part. In addition, a separate month long course was given in Dhaka for FPMU directors in June 1999.

16 participants from Rajshahi Division attended a training course in Bogra from February 7-17, 2000. 14 of these participants were from the Directorate General Food (DGF) and two were from the Department of Agricultural Marketing (DAM).

In Chittagong, 18 regional government officials attended the workshop held from 14-23 November, 2000, including 14 from the DGF, two from the DAM and two from the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS).

Regional government officials from the Khulna Division were invited to a 10 day training course held from March 21-31, 2001. 12 of the participants were from the DGF and two were from the DAM.

A final computer training session was held in Barisal from May 10-20, 2001. Again, 18 participants attended the workshop including 16 from the DGF and two from the DAM.

G. Technology Transfer Workshops

Several practical tools for policy analysis were developed in the course of the policy analysis work of the project, in close collaboration with the FPMU, particularly Naser Farid, Additional Director.

1. Given the crucial role of private sector trade in stabilizing rice prices, a spreadsheet and figure were developed showing import parity (the unit cost of private sector imports), domestic wholesale prices and monthly private sector imports.

2. Calculations of the age of stock were added to the stock-flow table (spreadsheet) of the Public Foodgrain Distribution System, enabling the Ministry of Food to project the minimum quantity of stock of a given age (in months) under various scenarios of monthly distribution and procurement.
3. A more complete accounting of the value of the PFDS transfers to consumers and producers was developed by calculating monthly market values of stock, procurement and distribution.

In order to train FPMU and Ministry of Food staff in some of these techniques and other methodologies, a series of half-day hands-on Food Policy Analysis Technology Transfer workshops were held at the FPMU beginning in March 2001. In these workshops, participants completed various in-class exercises with personal computers to gain experience actually using the programs and skills taught. Topics included monitoring of the age of stocks, import parity calculations, food subsidies, rice and wheat market partial equilibrium analysis, and analysis of household data using STATA.

Dr. Paul Dorosh, Dr. Carlo del Ninno and Naser Farid, Additional Director, FPMU, conducted the sessions, attended by ten to fifteen FPMU, DG Food and Ministry of Food officials.

H. Additional Training Sessions

In addition to the annual workshops, courses, and study tours, the project offered a number of training sessions to Government of Bangladesh officials.

In January 1998, Suresh Babu, IFPRI Training Co-ordinator conducted a training needs assessment at the Ministry of Food. This assessment, scheduled in the Human Resource Development Plan submitted in December, 1997, involved discussions with numerous government officers about their training needs.

From January 19 - 25, 2000, Mr. Richard Wall conducted a training workshop on effective policy communication skills at the FMRSP-IFPRI office in Dhanmondi. The workshop included lectures on making presentations and summarizing technical material and included opportunities for all participants to practice making presentations to the entire group. 23 people participated in the course, including five people from the Ministry of Food, three from the DG Food, four from the FPMU, and five from BIDS.

On April 11 2000, Dr. Carlo del Ninno, Dr. Paul Dorosh and Dr. Quazi Shahabuddin (BIDS), along with Naser Farid (FPMU) and M. Abdul Aziz (Project Director, FMRSP) conducted a one-day seminar on food policy at the Ministry of Planning at the request of the Secretary of Planning, Abdul Hamid Chowdhury.

I. Long-term Impact and the Expansion of the FPMU

As indicated above, substantial numbers of GOB officials received training in food policy analysis. Unfortunately, few of these individuals were permanent staff of the FPMU (and Ministry of Food personnel are generally rotated to another Ministry within three years).

At the beginning of the project (during the last quarter of 1997), the Ministry of Food staff worked with project staff to develop a proposal to increase the manpower and other resources devoted to food policy analysis within the government. These additional resources were needed if the FMRSP was to achieve one of its major objectives: to develop the institutional capacity of the FPMU to conduct food policy analysis and monitor food markets.

During the first quarter of 1998, the Ministry of Food took two significant steps toward strengthening the FPMU. First, in early February, the Ministry of Food submitted a proposal to the Honourable Prime Minister of the Government of Bangladesh to significantly expand the FPMU. Second, the Ministry of Food made arrangements for long-term training through USAID for the Assistant Chief of the FPMU, Mr. Naser Farid. Mr. Farid went to Williams College in Massachusetts and completed a one-year Masters in Development Economics program, returning to the FPMU in early 2000.

However, the strengthening of the FPMU was hindered by long administrative delays. The proposed expanded FPMU contained significantly more skilled, permanent staff at the level of research officer and above. Prior to the expansion, the FPMU had only three such positions (only two of which were filled); the expanded FPMU had provisions for 18 officers: 1 Director General, 4 Directors, 6 Additional Directors/Assistant Chiefs, 6 Assistant Directors/Research Officers, and 1 Research Investigator. This increase in the number of permanent, skilled positions is essential for building up the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Food to undertake needed food policy analysis.

However, no new staff were added until early 1999 because expansion of the FPMU was slowed by administrative delays within the government. In part, these delays could be attributed to the many urgent relief and rehabilitation activities related to the 1998 flood that occupied the government. It was hoped that USAID/Dhaka would be able to speed the process of final approval and creation of permanent positions in the FPMU through continued expressions of its interest and support of these efforts. The Director General, 3 new Directors and 1 Additional Director/Assistant Chief were eventually posted to the FPMU on deputation in the Spring of 1999 and four other officers were eventually appointed on a permanent basis (one Director, one Additional Director, one Assistant Director, and one Research Investigator).

Nonetheless, there remained nine vacant positions: five at the Additional Director level and four at the Assistant Director level. The Ministry of Food placed a request for

immediate recruitment of several of the Additional Directors and Assistant Directors. Recruitment rules required for recruitment of new personnel were approved by the Ministry of Establishment in November 2000. By the end of the project in June 2001, however, several steps remained before the new positions could even be advertised by the Public Service Commission. As a result, the recruitment of new permanent staff at the levels of research officer and additional director was not completed by the time the FMRSP ended.

The very small number of permanent staff at the FPMU is the major constraint to institutional development and installing a permanent capacity for food policy analysis within the Ministry of Food. The small number of FPMU staff at the end of June 2001, led by a core of several well-trained permanent staff, were able to handle the routine operational analysis required by the Ministry of Food. However, the FPMU remained severely understaffed in terms of capacity to undertake analysis of broader food policy and food security issues, or to handle large-scale emergencies such as the 1998 floods. Adding more permanent capable staff remains the highest priority for building institutional capacity within the Ministry of Food.

VI. DISSEMINATION ACTIVITIES

Dissemination activities designed to make project findings available to policy makers, international organizations, the donor community and other stakeholders included four major project workshops, numerous seminars, presentations at Local Consultative Sub-Groups for Food Security and Agriculture, distribution of written materials, maintenance of a project web-site and other mechanisms.

Project Workshops

The FMRSP held four project workshops: three annual workshops (June 1998, October 1999 and February 2001) and a final synthesis workshop in June 2001. In the first annual workshop, held at the project office in Dhanmondi on June 22, 1998, seven research papers were presented, covering the research results from the first annual work plan, as well as a discussion of the future research agenda for the project.

The second annual FMRSP workshop, "Food Policy and Food Security in Bangladesh: Moving Forward After the 1998 Flood", held on October 18-19, 1999, and inaugurated by The Minister of Food and Agriculture, Ms. Motia Chowdhury. Project researchers presented papers in four sessions: Implication of Rice Imports from India for Bangladesh Food Security; The 1998 Flood, Government Policy and Rural Food Security; Foodgrain Production and Operational Aspects of Public Market Interventions; and National Food Security Policy Options. The final session consisted of a panel discussion on "Bangladesh Food Security: The Way Forward", including Mr. Mahbub Kabir, Secretary, Ministry of Food, among others, as panelists. 121 people attended the workshop on the first day and 72 attended on the second day. The workshop proceedings "Food Policy and Food Security in Bangladesh: Moving Forward After the 1998 Flood", were published in March 2000.

Reports of the third workplan were presented at the third annual FMRSP workshop, "Towards Comprehensive Food Security in Bangladesh: Availability, Access and Nutrition," held in February 2001. The workshop, inaugurated by the Minister of Food, Al Haj Amir Hossain, included presentations by researchers from IFPRI, the Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BIDS) and the Bangladesh Rice Research Institute. presented papers in five sessions: Household Food Security and Targeted Food Programs; Foodgrain Supply and Demand; Foodgrain Markets and Storage; Rural Incomes, Employment and Food Prices; and Macro-Economic Policies and the Foodgrain Sector. The final session consisted of a presentation on the Comprehensive Food Security Policy Report by Mr. Ruhul Amin, Director, FPMU and a panel discussion chaired by Mr. Abu Abdullah, Director General, BIDS, with three panelists: Dr. Tawfiq-e-Elahi Chowdhury, Planning Secretary, Dr. Raisuddin Ahmed, Emeritus Research Fellow IFPRI, and Mr. Joan Fleuren, World Food Programme. Because of two days of hartals, the second day of the workshop was postponed to February 12, 2001, six days after the first session held on February 6. 132 people attended the workshop on the first day and 84 attended on the second day. The workshop's proceedings, "Towards

Comprehensive Food Security in Bangladesh: New Research on Availability, Access and Nutrition” were published in May 2001.

The June 2001, Final FMRSP workshop, “The PFDS, Private Markets and Food Security,” was inaugurated by the Joint Secretary of the Ministry of Food, Mr. Md. Shah Jahan. Researchers from IFPRI, the Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies (BIDS) and the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) presented synthesis discussions summarizing the key findings of the project in two sessions. The first session of the workshop, Foodgrain Availability and Price Stabilization: the Role of the PFDS and Private Markets, presented an overview of findings on markets and food policy, including special sessions on foodgrain stocks. The second session covered targeted food distribution programs and the policy response to the 1998 flood. The final session consisted of a presentation on Strengthening Capacity by Dr. Suresh Babu, Head Training Division, FPMU and Mr. Ruhul Amin, Director, FPMU.

Research Seminars

In addition to the major workshops, the project conducted a series of eight seminars at the Directorate General of Food, the project office and the Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies to discuss research findings (see Annex 7). The project also conducted or participated in several research seminars in Bangladesh and elsewhere. These presentations included:

Bangladesh Economic Association, Dhaka. October 1998. Presentations by Carlo del Ninno and Paul Dorosh on the impacts of the 1998 flood on food security.

“The WTO Round and Food Security for USAID Partner Countries: An Economic Growth Training Workshop”, IFPRI, Washington, D.C. October, 1999. Presentation by Paul Dorosh on trade liberalization and food security in Bangladesh.

RESAL (European Union project) seminar on “Integration of Cash Payment Systems into Food Security Programmes of Bangladesh”, Dhaka. February 27-29, 2000. Paper by Carlo del Ninno and Paul Dorosh, “In Kind Transfer and Household Food Consumption: Implications for Targeted Food Programs in Bangladesh”.

EU-USAID New Trans-Atlantic Initiative meeting on food security issues, Brussels. April 1-3, 2000. Presentation by Paul Dorosh on Bangladesh food policy.

Ministry of Planning, Dhaka. April 11, 2000. Presentation of a synthesis of FMRSP research results by FMRSP staff.

Seminar on Public Policy and Food Markets: Implications for Food Security in Bangladesh, Dhaka. May 29, 2000. Sponsored by IFPRI and the Bangladesh Economic Association.

National Defense College, Dhaka. June 25, 2000. Lecture on World Food Security by Dr. Paul Dorosh.

International Agricultural Economics Association Conference, Berlin. August 2000. Presentation of paper by Carlo del Ninno and Paul Dorosh, "Averting a Food Crisis: Private Imports and Public Targeted Distribution in Bangladesh After the 1998 Flood".

Bangladesh Agricultural University, Mymensingh. March 20, 2001. Lecture by Paul Dorosh on "Trade Liberalization and Food Security in Bangladesh".

Food for Education workshop, Dhaka. May 30, 2001. Presentation by Akhter Ahmed, Omar Haider Chowdhury and Carlo del Ninno on their Evaluation of the Food for Education Program.

Directorate General of Food, Dhaka, June 2, 2001. "Food Policy and the PFDS" workshop by FMRSP researchers.

Collaboration with Other Institutions

In its efforts to develop linkages with other institutions working on food policy in Bangladesh, the project worked together with numerous organizations in Bangladesh.

The FMRSP was actively involved with the Local Consultative Groups on Food Security and Agriculture, making several presentations on food policy and markets, the national comprehensive food security paper, and other issues. During and immediately after the flood of 1998, the project made regular short presentations at the LCG meetings and assisted the WFP in producing a food situation update for several weeks beginning in August 1998. Other work with WFP included a close interaction in the FMRSP study of leakages in WFP programs in early 1998 and discussions on the possibility of fortifying wheat flour (atta) in 2000 and 2001.

The project also collaborated CARE, Bangladesh, participating in a study on monetization of food aid commodities (focusing on vegetable oil) in 1998, and assisting with analysis for the Bellman determination of the effects of food aid on domestic markets.

Project staff members also collaborated with other Bangladesh institutions on a number of other issues. Dr. Carlo del Ninno of FMRSP was a co-organizer of the April 26 - 27, 1998 Conference on Food Based Approaches to Nutrition held at BRAC in Dhaka, as well as a co-editor of the conference proceedings. Beginning in August 1998, Dr. Carlo del Ninno served as chairman of the working group on food security and safety nets for the World Bank's National Nutrition Project. Mahfoozur Rahman of IFPRI served as an adviser to the Government of Bangladesh in early 2001 on the formulation of the Biosafety Act, taking part in several government meetings.

Distribution of Project Output

Information about the project's research and output was available on the project web site through August 2001. Draft and final versions of FMRSP working papers and other publications were distributed at each of the project workshops. In addition, publications were made available at the FMRSP-IFPRI office in Dhanmondi during the course of the project. Copies of all materials were also distributed to the FPMU, the Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies, and USAID/Dhaka. Additional copies of the materials are available from IFPRI Washington, D.C.

VII. CONCLUSION

In summary, the FMRSP met and exceeded its objectives in policy advisory services, research, training and dissemination, due to combined efforts of a dedicated team of individuals from IFPRI, BIDS, the Ministry of Food and other institutions. A final evaluation of the project's impact and performance remains to be done and is perhaps best accomplished after a longer period of reflection. The following assessments, made while the project was underway or only recently completed, however, give an indication of the overall success of the project.

“During this period, the GOB found the performance of the contractor excellent. The Secretary of the Ministry of Food ... [was] highly impressed with the quality, quantity, and timing of the delivered services (particularly, the advisory services). Contractor inputs were mostly used by current GOB policy makers in successfully handling the recent crisis situation in the food sub-sector of Bangladesh.”

USAID Contractor Performance Interim Report for 8/7/97 to 3/31/98

“The quality of technical services and products delivered by IFPRI during this reporting period was excellent. The contractor has demonstrated an exceptional performance and far exceeded the acceptable quality levels described in section E (pages 22-25) of the contract...”

End users were highly satisfied with IFPRI services. The Government of Bangladesh and the local private sector involved in foodgrain trade greatly appreciated IFPRI's work in creating a competitive open market for foodgrain.... Contractor's contributions in LCG subgroup meetings on Food Security and Nutrition, and General Agriculture were highly significant.

USAID Contractor Performance Interim Report for April 1998 to April 1999

What I have done during my last eighteen months in the Food Ministry is maintain a close liaison with Dr. Paul Dorosh and his team [the FMRSP-IFPRI team] and tried to equip myself with professional advice and analysis. Then I have gone over to the policy-making bodies with my professional backing and tried to present these policy options, along with their implications. Whatever policy decisions you have seen in the past come out of those policy-making bodies. My experience is that if you go professionally prepared, your viewpoints are more likely to be accepted than if you go unprepared, and that is precisely what I have tried to do.

Secretary of Food, Mr. Mahbub Kabir, October 1999.²

² Food Policy and Food Security in Bangladesh: Moving Forward after the 1998 Flood. Proceedings of the Second Annual FMRSP Workshop. p.81.

“GOB and other end users were highly impressed with the usefulness of policy advisory services, training, analytical research and information dissemination services delivered by IFPRI. The demand-driven policy advisory memos on foodgrain stocks, market prices and food aid, trade taxes on rice imports, and various other food policy and food security issues helped the Ministry of Food in making appropriate policy adjustments.

USAID Contractor Performance Interim Report for April 1999 to April 2000

Some of IFPRI’s most notable and significant successes include:

- A much better understanding, on the part of government and donors, of the dynamics of food and related issues in Bangladesh;
- Significant development of institutional capacity, both in and outside of government; and,
- The institution of more enlightened, efficient and effective food security policies that have resulted in reduced waste, public financial savings, and – most importantly – countless lives and livelihoods saved.

... The entire IFPRI team acquitted itself in an outstanding manner, and the GoB and entire donor community have come to rely heavily on IFPRI’s analysis and counsel in food policy-related matters.

Letter from Mary C. Ott, Acting Mission Director, USAID/Dhaka to IFPRI Director General, Per Pinstруп- Andersen, July 31, 2001

ANNEX 1: FMRSP PROJECT PERSONNEL

IFPRI Senior Research Personnel

Dr. Raisuddin Ahmed, Division Director, Markets and Structural Studies Division.
FMRSP Project Leader

Dr. Paul Dorosh, Senior Research Fellow. Chief of Party and Economist.* (based in Dhaka, August 1997 – June 2001).

Dr. Carlo del Ninno, Research Fellow. Human Resources Coordinator and Consumption Economist.* (based in Dhaka, August 1997 – February 2001)

Dr. Akhter Ahmed, Senior Research Fellow

Dr. Suresh Babu, Research Fellow.

Marzia Fontana, Research Analyst.

Sanjukta Mukherjee, Research Analyst.

Dr. Shahidur Rashid. Post-doctoral Fellow.

Dr. Lisa Smith, Research Fellow.

Dr. Peter Wobst, Post-doctoral Fellow.

FMRSP-IFPRI Senior Research and Training Personnel

Aminul Islam Khandaker, Project Training Officer

Mahfoozur Rahman, Project Manager and Private Sector Specialist.

Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies

Dr. Quazi Shahabuddin, Research Director.*

Abu Abdullah, Director General BIDS.

Dr. Omar Haider Chowdhury, Research Director.

Dr. Nabiul Islam, Research Fellow.

Dr. K.A.S. Murshid, Research Director.

Dr. M.A. Quasem, Research Fellow.

Dr. Dilip Roy, Research Fellow.

Dr. Binayek Sen, Research Fellow.

University of Minnesota

Prof. Donald Liu

Prof. Ben Senauer

International Science and Technology Institute (ISTI)

Golam Robbani, Dissemination Specialist

Richard Wall, Communications Trainer

Other Consultants

Prof. S.R. Osmani, University of Ulster.

M. Kabirullah. Director (Retired), Bangladesh Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, Dhaka.

Mohammad Baqui. Chief Agricultural Engineer, BRRI.

* AID-designated “key personnel”.

Annex 2: Chronology of Major FMRSP Activities

October - December, 1997

August 7, 1997	Project signed by USAID/Dhaka
August 17, 1997	Chief of Party, Paul Dorosh, arrives in Dhaka
August 26, 1997	Carlo del Ninno arrives in Dhaka
September 4, 1997	Meeting with Secretary of Food to discuss work plan
September 14, 1997	Move into ground floor of temporary office in Lalmatia
October 13, 1997	Discussion of workplan with Secretary of Food
October 27, 1997	AID Approval of the draft workplan for FMRSP
October 29, 1997	FMRSP Steering Committee approves workplan
November 2 - 15, 1997	Francesco Goletti in Dhaka to work on food security stocks
December 1, 1997	Human Resource Development Plan submitted to USAID
December 14, 1997	AID Approval of the Human Resource Development Plan
December 18 - 21, 1997	Rapid Appraisal of Rice Markets in Rajshahi Division
December 18, 1997 - January 1, 1998	Training Course on Basic Data Analysis using MS Excel
December 30, 1997	Project moves into permanent office in Dhanmondi

January - March, 1998

January 12, 1998	AID Approval of K.A.S. Murshid as new macro-economist on the BIDS subcontract
January 12 - 19, 1998	Suresh Babu, IFPRI, in Dhaka to conduct training needs assessment
January 14 - 23, 1998	Rapid Appraisal of Rice Markets

February 2, 1998	Proposal to Strengthen the FPMU presented by Secretary of Food to the Prime Minister; Prime Minister approves.
February 5, 1998	BIDS sub-contract signed.
February 9, 1998	Paul Dorosh presents seminar at USAID on the current rice situation
February 17 - 26, 1998	Second Training Course on Basic Data Analysis
March 1 - 19, 1998	Food Policy Training Course at the Ministry of Food
March 6 - 16, 1998	Prof. Ben Senauer of the U of Minn. in Dhaka to assist with the Food Policy Training Course
March 15, 1998	Ministry of Food requests USAID funding for Naser Farid training
March 17 - April 3, 1998	Raisuddin Ahmed from IFPRI/Washington in Dhaka
March 29 - April 2, 1998	Celeste Regan, Chief Financial Officer, IFPRI in Dhaka
April - December 1998	
April 19 - May 2, 1998	Asia Study Tour to Thailand and Vietnam
April 26 - 27, 1998	Conference on Food Based Approaches to Nutrition at BRAC / Dhaka co-organized by Carlo del Ninno
June 22, 1998	FMRSP First Annual Workshop
June 28, 1998	Naser Farid, FPMU to U.S. for Masters Degree
July 3 - July 18, 1998	US Study Tour to Washington, D.C. and Chicago
August 4 - Sept 30, 1998	Professor S.R. Osmani in Dhaka for work on Bangladesh -India Foodgrain Market Interactions
Sept 13 - Oct 12, 1998	Food Policy Training at IFPRI-DC and University of Minnesota for five trainees.
October 28, 1998	Paul Dorosh briefs U.S. Ambassador John A. Holzman on the current food situation in Bangladesh

Nov 19 - Dec 3, 1998	Secretary of Food, Mr. Mahbub Kabir, on U.S. Study Tour
Nov 28 - Dec 23, 1998	Fieldwork for survey of flood-affected households
December 10, 1998	Paul Dorosh presentation on current food situation to the Local Consultative Sub-Group on Food Security
January - March 1999	
January 25 - 29, 1999	Suresh Babu from IFPRI Washington to Dhaka for impact assessment of previous IFPRI Projects.
February 2, 1999	Note on "Indicator of Market Orientation of Food Policy" submitted to USAID/Dhaka
February 4, 1999	Paul Dorosh seminar at the MOF on "The Determination of Rice Prices in Bangladesh"
February 7 - 17, 1999	Training course in basic data analysis for GOB officials in Rajshahi division, held in Bogra.
February 16, 1999	Paul Dorosh presentation to the Local Consultative Sub-Group on General Agriculture on "The Current Food Situation in Bangladesh"
February 18, 1999	Abul Quasem seminar at the MOF on "Maize Production and Marketing in Bangladesh: An Indicative Exercise"
March 18, 1999	FMRSP Steering Committee Meeting
March 23, 1999	Mahfoozur Rahman seminar at the MOF on "A Preliminary Review of Procurement of Rice and Wheat by International and Local Tenders"
March 31 - April 12, 1999	Raisuddin Ahmed from IFPRI Washington in Dhaka
April - December 1999	
April 6 - 26, 1999	Dhaka Food Policy Course at the FMRSP-IFPRI Office.
April 6 - 16, 1999	Prof. Donald Liu of the University of Minnesota in Dhaka to give lectures in the Food Policy Course.
April 15, 1999	Paul Dorosh delivers lecture at the Directorate General of Food, for the BCS Officers (1 st batch).

April 19 - 21, 26, 1999	USAID financial team conducts review of FMRSP-IFPRI's financial procedures.
April 25 - May 23, 1999	Fieldwork for second round of survey of flood-affected households.
May 12 - 26, 1999	Asian Study Tour to India and Myanmar.
May 22 - 23, 1999	Senior Food Policy Workshop held at the BARD conference center in Comilla.
June 1 - 30, 1999	Computer training at the FPMU for the three new Directors of the FPMU
June 10, 1999	Quazi Shahabuddin and Nabiul Islam seminar at the Ministry of Food on "An Evaluation of Domestic Rice Procurement Program: Boro 1997-98".
June 16 - 17, 1999	Carlo del Ninno and Dilip K. Roy present a paper at the USAID/CARE Lessons Learned Workshop on Bangladesh Floods of 1998 at Rajendrapur
July 11 - 24, 1999	U.S. study tour to Washington D.C, Minneapolis and Chicago.
August 1, 1999	Paul Dorosh lecture to the 2 nd Batch of the 10 th BCS Officers, at FMRSP-IFPRI Office.
August 19, 1999	Fourth Steering Committee Meeting.
August 26, 1999	Paul Dorosh and Carlo del Ninno meeting with Secretary of Food, Mahbub Kobir, and Joint Secretary, Development, Md. Shahjahan regarding project administrative issues.
August 31 - Sept 5, 1999	Basic Computer Training for Participants, US Study Tour, Minnesota, 1999.
August 31 - Sept 25, 1999	Mahbub Kabir, Secretary of Food, to U.S. for study tour and food aid discussions.
September 7 - 16, 1999	Paul Dorosh out of office due to dengue fever.
September 9, 1999	First meeting of the Task Force on the National Integrated Food Security Policy.

September 14, 1999	Ministry of Food presentation at the Mid-Term Review with the Development Partners
Sept 17 - October 8, 1999	U.S. Food Policy Course 1999, University of Minnesota and IFPRI-Washington D.C.
September 29, 1999	KAS Murshid (BIDS) seminar at the Ministry of Food, on "Evaluation and Conduct of the Cross-Border Trade in Rice: A Bangladesh Perspective".
October 5, 1999	Presentation by Raisuddin Ahmed, IFPRI, on "Rice Production in Bangladesh: Constraints, Policies and Prospects".
October 10, 1999	Meeting of the FMRSP Project Steering Committee
October 11, 1999	First meeting of the Core Group on Comprehensive Food Security Policy at the FPMU.
October 18 - 19, 1999	FMRSP Second Annual Workshop, 1999 at IDB Bhaban.
October 27, 1999	Lecture by Paul Dorosh to BCS Training Officers
October 29 - Dec 2, 1999	Data collection for the third round household survey
October 30 - Nov 7, 1999	Paul Dorosh to the U.S. to participate in "The WTO Round and Food Security for USAID Partner Countries: An Economic Growth Training Workshop".
November 14 - 20, 1999	Carlo del Ninno sick with dengue fever.
Nov 28 - Dec 14, 1999	Golam Rabbani, Dissemination Specialist, FMRSP-IFPRI, to Washington, D.C. for consultations with ISTI on the wheat fortification project.
November 30, 1999	Second Meeting of the Task Force on the National Comprehensive Food Security Policy.
December 1, 1999	Brainstorming Session on the Conceptual Foundation of a Comprehensive Food Security Policy at the IDB Bhaban.
December 30, 1999	Meeting with USAID and the Ministry of Food to discuss the need for a new TAPP.

January - March 2000

- January 16 - 28, 2000 Richard Wall, ISTI in Dhaka to conduct Policy Communication Training.
- January 18 - 26, 2000 Training workshop on Effective Policy Communication Skills, held at FMRSP-IFPRI.
- January 25, 2000 First meeting of the NCFSP Utilization Subgroup.
- January 26, 2000 First meeting of the NCFSP Access Subgroup at FMRSP-IFPRI.
- Feb 3 - March 10, 2000 Sanjukta Mukherjee from IFPRI Washington, D. C. to Dhaka to work working on household flood survey data.
- February 8 - 24, 2000 Raisuddin Ahmed, IFPRI, to Dhaka to work on rice production study.
- February 13, 2000 Core group meeting on comprehensive food security.
- Feb 23 - March 18, 2000 Shahidur Rashid, IFPRI, in Dhaka to work on links between wages and rice prices in Bangladesh.
- Feb 25 - March 10, 2000 Akhter Ahmed, IFPRI, to Dhaka to work on public interventions to increase household food security.
- February 27 - 29, 2000 Paul Dorosh and Carlo del Ninno present a paper at the RESAL seminar on "Integration of Cash Payment Systems into Food Security Programmes of Bangladesh".
- February 27, 2000 Core group meeting on the NCFSP.
- March 8 - 19, 2000 Nihal Goonewardene, President, ISTI to Dhaka for meetings with GOB officials and donors.
- March 8, 2000 Akhter Ahmed, IFPRI, seminar at BIDS on "Identifying the Poor through Proxy Means Testing in Egypt: Lessons for Bangladesh".
- March 12, 2000 Shahidur Rashid, IFPRI, seminar at the FMRSP-IFPRI office on "The Wage Price Adjustment Debate in Bangladesh: Does Method Matter?"
- March 13, 2000 Meeting of the Task Force for the NCFSP.

March 14-15, 2000	Per Pinstруп Anderson, Director General, IFPRI to Dhaka for meetings with GOB officials and donors.
March 27, 2000	Meeting with Abdul Halim, Director General of the FPMU to discuss strengthening of the FPMU
April – June 2000	
April 1 - 3, 2000	Paul Dorosh to Brussels, Belgium for workshop on the New Trans-Atlantic Initiative.
April 5 - 28, 2000	Sanjukta Mukharjee from IFPRI Washington, D. C. to Dhaka to work on household flood survey data.
April 11, 2000	Workshop on FMRSP research results for Ministry of Planning officials.
April 24 - May 17, 2000	Marzia Fontana, IFPRI, to Dhaka to work on construction of a social accounting matrix.
April 25 - 26, 2000	Workshop on “Strengthening Development Policy by Looking Within the Household: Linking Agriculture, Nutrition and Health in Bangladesh”, organized by Howarth Bouis, IFPRI.
May 2 - June 8, 2000	Field Survey on Livestock Feed Study by M. Quasem, BIDS.
May 2 - 14, 2000	Lisa Smith from IFPRI Washington, D.C. to Dhaka to work on household coping strategies report.
May 8 - 17, 2000	Peter Wobst from IFPRI Washington, D. C. to Dhaka to work on construction of a social accounting matrix.
May 12 - June 20, 2000	Field Survey on Dynamics of Foodgrain Markets by K. A. S. Murshid, Sr. Research Fellow, BIDS.
May 16, 2000	Paul Dorosh is a designated discussant at the seminar, "WTO 2000 Negotiation and Bangladesh Agriculture" at the Bangladesh International Institute for Strategic Studies.
May 27 - June 17, 2000	Mahbub Kobir, Secretary, Ministry of Food, to Washington, D. C. on U.S. Study Tour.

May 21 - June 2, 2000	Raisuddin Ahmed, IFPRI, to Dhaka to work on rice production paper.
May 25, 2000	Book Launching Ceremony at IDB for <u>Out of the Shadow of the Famine: Evolving Food Markets and Food Policy in Bangladesh</u> .
May 29, 2000	Seminar on "Public Policy and Food Markets: Implications for Food Security in Bangladesh" sponsored by IFPRI and the Bangladesh Economic Association at the IDB.
June 18 - July 5, 2000	Asian Study Tour to Indonesia and the People's Republic of China.
June 25, 2000	Paul Dorosh gives lecture on World Food Security at the National Defence College
June 27, 2000	IFPRI submits a proposal and budget for a four-month project extension to USAID/Dhaka.
July – September 2000	
July 10 - 22, 2000	Suresh Babu, IFPRI, to Dhaka to present lectures in the Third Local Food Policy Course.
July 11 - 31, 2000	Third Local Food Policy Course held at the IFPRI-FMRSP office in Dhaka.
August 2, 2000	Meeting at the Ministry of Food, chaired by the Secretary, Ministry of Food on "Review of the Activities of FMRSP".
August 14 - 18, 2000	Paul Dorosh and Carlo del Ninno present a paper on Bangladesh at the International Agricultural Economics Association Conference in Berlin.
September 1 - 20, 2000	Mr. Md. Shah Jahan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Food, to IFPRI Washington on U.S. Study Tour
September 4, 2000	Paul Dorosh makes presentation on the Current Food Situation at the LCG for Food Security Meeting in Dhaka
September 6 - 22, 2000	Akhter Ahmed, Consumption Economist, to Dhaka to work on Food For Education Survey

Sept 7 - Oct 6, 2000	Food Policy Training Course at the University of Minnesota and at IFPRI Washington office.
Sept 18 - Oct 21, 2000	Fieldwork for survey on Food for Education
September 24, 2000	Draft of National Food Policy statement completed
Sept 29 - Oct 22, 2000	Carlo del Ninno to IFPRI Washington, D.C to work on the analysis of the labour market and real wage determination.
October – December 2000	
Oct 23 - Nov 2, 2000	Raisuddin Ahmed, IFPRI, to Dhaka to work on FMRSP study on Foodgrain Projections and to discuss a follow-on project to the FMRSP.
October 26, 2000	Raisuddin Ahmed, IFPRI, seminar titled “Agricultural Performance under Different Institutional Settings: A Comparative study of Bangladesh and Vietnam” at BIDS.
October 31, 2000	First meeting of the Program Design Committee for a follow-on project to the FMRSP.
November 4 - 5, 2000	Two-day workshop organised by the IFPRI-FMRSP at the BRAC Center, Gazipur to prepare concept paper of the follow-on project to the FMRSP.
November 8 - 9, 2000	Training workshop on food policy for high-level government officials in Chittagong.
November 14 - 23, 2000	Computer training course in Chittagong for field-level government officials.
November 15, 2000	Carlo del Ninno and Paul Dorosh presentation on “Maintaining Food Security at the National and Household Levels: Lessons from the 1998 Flood” at the LCG for Food Security meeting.
November 20, 2000	Second meeting of the Program Design Committee for a follow-on project to the FMRSP.
Nov 21, 2000 - Jan 2, 2001	Carlo del Ninno to IFPRI Washington office for data analysis to participate in IFPRI Internal Review meeting.
December 5, 2000	Third meeting of the Program Design Committee for a follow-on project to the FMRSP.

January – March 2001

- Jan 27 - Feb 7, 2001 Marzia Fontana from IFPRI Washington office to Dhaka to work on linkages between the macro-economy and the food sector
- Jan 31 - March 5, 2001 Raisuddin Ahmed, IFPRI, Dhaka to work on agricultural mechanization paper and to attend FMRSP workshop
- Jan 31 - Feb 16, 2001 Shahidur Rashid and Akhter Ahmed, IFPRI, to Dhaka to work on co-integration of labor and rice markets and Food For Education reports respectively, and to attend FMRSP workshop
- February 6 - 9, 2001 Ashok Gulati, IFPRI, to Dhaka to attend FMRSP workshop and discuss follow-on project with USAID/Dhaka
- February 6 and 12, 2001 FMRSP Third Annual Workshop held in Dhaka
- February 9, 2001 Carlo del Ninno relocates to IFPRI, Washington, D.C. office after 3 ½ as resident Consumption Economist and Human Resource Coordinator.
- March 4, 2001 First technology transfer workshop at the FPMU
- March 7, 2001 Meeting with Tim Anderson, USAID, and other USAID/Dhaka officials to discuss current food policy issues and the follow-on project
- March 12, 2001 Presentation by Ruhul Amin, FPMU, on the Comprehensive Food Security Policy paper at the Local Consultative Group for Food Security meeting
- March 20, 2001 Paul Dorosh to the Bangladesh Agricultural University, Mymensingh, to give lecture on Trade Liberalization and Food Security in Bangladesh
- March 21 - 31, 2001 Computer training course in Chittagong for field-level government officials.

April - June 2001

- April 1-19, 2001 Carlo del Ninno to Dhaka for research on the Food For Education.

April 4-13, 2001	Computer-training course for field-level government officials, Dhaka.
April 22, 2001	FMRSP Steering Committee meeting.
May 5-6, 2001	Third Annual High Level Food Policy Workshop in Jessore.
May 10-20, 2001	Computer-training course for field-level government officials, Barisal.
May 22 – June 11, 2001	Carlo del Ninno to Dhaka for work on the Food for Education report and to participate in the final FMRSP workshop.
May 27-June 6, 2001	Akhter Ahmed (IFPRI) to Dhaka for work on the Food for Education report and to participate in the final FMRSP workshop.
May 30, 2001	Food for Education workshop, BRAC Center, Dhaka.
May 31, 2001	Suresh Babu (IFPRI) to Dhaka to participate in the FMRSP final workshop.
June 2, 2001	FMRSP final workshop held at IDB Bhaban.
June 7, 2001	Seminar on Food Policy and the PFDS, DG Food, Dhaka.
June 24-25, 2001	Workshop on Rice Grading, Storage and Disposal Indicators for Technical Personnel at DG Food.
June 25, 2001	Paul Dorosh leaves Dhaka, re-locating to the U.S.
July-August 2001	
June 25 – Aug 31, 2001	Project closing activities and distribution of printed materials.
August 23-31, 2001	Paul Dorosh to Dhaka to close project office and help arrange for transfer of non-expendable items to the Ministry of Food.
August 31, 2001	Closing date of the FMRSP.

ANNEX 3: POLICY ADVISORY MEMOS AND PAPERS

Food Aid for Bangladesh: Still Needed After All These Years?, (13 November, 1997).

The Scope for Triangular Transactions to Support Farmgate Rice Prices in Bangladesh, (13 November, 1997).

The Current Rice Market Situation and Options for Procurement. 8 January, 1998.

Rapid Appraisal Report on the Rice Market Situation: Preliminary Results. 25 January, 1998.

Ensuring Food Security after the 1997/98 Aman Shortfall: The Current Situation, Lessons from the Past, and Policy Options. 28 January, 1998.

Enhancing Food Security through Policy Analysis and Monitoring: Strengthening the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) in the Ministry of Food. 3 February, 1998.

Food Price Stabilization: The Experience of Other Asian Countries. 4 February, 1998.

Expected Short-Term Prices of Rice. 29 March, 1998.

Open Market Sales and Price Stabilization Following the Aman Shortfall. 29 March, 1998.

Explaining Rice Price Increases in Recent Weeks: Are Markets Behaving Competitively? 20 April, 1998.

Procurement of Maize: Lessons from Indonesia; 26 April, 1998.

Outlook for Boro Procurement and Rice Stocks; 14 June, 1998.

Rice Price Movements After the Boro Harvest: Assessing the Current Situation in the Light of Past Experience; 23 June, 1998.

Food Aid Needs in the Light of the Recent Floods; 10 August, 1998.

Alternative Scenarios for Flood Relief: The Need for Increased Food Grain Supplies by November"; 1 September, 1998.

Procurement Needs and Mechanisms in Response to the Flood Situation; 6 September, 1998.

OMS Sales and the Flood-Damaged Aman Harvest; 14 September, 1998.

India Food Grain Policy and Current Situation; 14 September, 1998.

Some Points for Discussion for the Forthcoming Inter-Governmental Talks Between Bangladesh and India on Issues Relating to Foodgrain Trade; 22 September, 1998.

Relief Needs in the Immediate Post-Flood Period; 23 September, 1998.

Enhanced VGF Distribution: The WFP Proposal and Other Options; 25 September, 1998.

Foodgrain Stocks and Short-term Import Needs; 19 October, 1998.

Current Foodgrain Stocks, Procurement and Distribution: Implications for Flood Relief; 21 October, 1998.

Comments on WFP's Proposal for Distribution of 6 Million VGF Cards; 3 November 1998.

India Food Grain Markets Update (through September 1998); 27 October, 1998.

The Current Market Situation and Short-term Prospects for Rice Prices and Imports; 25 November, 1998.

Options For Rice Procurement; 14 December, 1998.

India Foodgrain Markets Update; 15 December, 1998.

The Current Rice Situation and Government Rice Policy; 15 December, 1998.

Rice Markets Price Trends and Imports; 23 December, 1998.

Implications of Removing the Tariff on Maize Imports; 1 March, 1999.

Ministry of Food Policy in Response to the 1998 Flood; 17 March, 1999.

The Use of Fortified Atta for Distribution in the FFE Program; June 23, 1999.

Public Foodgrain Stocks, Procurement and Distribution under Flood and no Flood Scenarios; 16 July, 1999.

Implications of Additional Food Aid for Domestic Prices; 22 July, 1999.

Wheat Imports In Spite of Bumper Harvests: Some Possible Explanations; 4 August, 1999.

Response to Questions from ERD regarding the Ministry of Food's paper for the September 1999 Donors meeting; 21 August, 1999.

Bangladesh Foodgrain Production, Estimated Shortfall and Needs for Additional Food Aid from the USA; 24 August, 1999.

Public Foodgrain Stocks and Market Prices: Policy Options for a Bumper 1999-2000 Aman Rice Harvest; 18 November, 1999.

Aging Rice Stocks: Options for Increased Rice Distribution; 28 November, 1999.

Aging Stocks and Options for Increased Foodgrain Distributions. 1 December, 1999.

Prospects for Additional U.S. 416b Food Aid for Bangladesh. 1 December, 1999.

Implications of Increasing Trade Taxes on Rice Imports; 3 January, 2000.

Current Food Policy Issues in Bangladesh, Volume IV: Advisory Notes to the Secretary of Food; April 1999 to December 1999; 27 January, 2000.

Foodgrain Production, Procurement and Distribution: Policy Issues; 23 February, 2000.

Implications of Aging Rice and Wheat Stocks; 1 May, 2000.

The 1999/2000 Boro Harvest, Market Prices, and Private Imports; 22 May, 2000.

Benefits and Costs of Additional Boro Procurement; 27 July, 2000.

A Note on the State of the PFDS; 3 October 2000.

Food Aid Levels and Producer Price Incentives: 16 November 2000.

Implications of a 1 lakh Increase in FFW Rice Distribution: 22 February 2001.

Some Observations on Food Aid, Food Stocks and the Public Foodgrain Distribution System; 10 April, 2001.

Implications of a 1 lakh Increase in Wheat Distribution; 3 May, 2001.

Indicator of Market Orientation of Food Policy; 2 February, 1999. (Note to USAID/Dhaka not included in the bound volumes of memos.)

Other Policy Advisory Service Outputs³

Slide presentation by the Secretary of Food on “The Structure of the Food Economy of Bangladesh” and “Food Policy Issues and Constraints in Bangladesh”, presented to the Prime Minister on 23 May, 1998.

Food Security in Bangladesh: Current Policies and Future Plans (Ministry of Food; Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh); 12 April, 1999.

Food Policy and Food Security in Bangladesh; Ministry of Food's paper for the Mid-Term Review with the Development Partners on 14 September 1999 (full paper and summary versions).

Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh. Report of the Task Force on “Comprehensive Food Security Policy for Bangladesh”. July, 2000.

Bangladesh National Food Policy Statement, Draft, 24 September, 2000.

Price Stabilization, Government Intervention and The Need for Development of Agricultural Statistics (Bangladesh Perspective); Presented at Expert Consultation on Development of Agricultural Statistics for Food Policy, Bangkok; By Ruhul Amin (Director, FPMU); 28 June-1 July, 1999.

FAO/AFMA Roundtable Meeting on Cost-effective Public Food Distribution System Toward the New Millenium; Country Paper - The People's Republic of Bangladesh; 15-18 June, 1999 - Hua Hin, Thailand; Presented by A. K. M. Nurul Afsar, DG/Food, MOF.

Bangladesh Country Paper on Food Marketing Policy for Food Security; By: Md. Shahjahan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Food, Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh; Presented at - The FAO/AFMA Regional Seminar; Held in Dalian, China; October 19-24, 1999.

Report of the Program Design Committee for Formulation of a Follow-on Project to the FMRSP (draft report prepared by the Ministry of Food).

Enhancing Agricultural Trade: Next Steps in WTO Arrangements. Bangladesh Country Paper by Md. Shaha Jahan, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Food. Paper presented at the Ninth General Assembly/Twentieth Executive Committee Meeting of AFMA and FAO/AFMA/Nepal Roundtable Meeting on Promoting Regional Trade Among AFMA Member Countries, January 29-February 3, 2001, Kathmandu and Sauraha, Nepal.

³ Documents for which the FMRSP provided technical assistance.

ANNEX 4: SUMMARY OF MAJOR POLICY MEMOS

Policy Response to the 1997/98 Aman Crop Shortfall

In the fall of 1998, a short drought during the critical flowering stage of the aman rice crop led to a surprisingly poor harvest, due to a high prevalence of empty rice husks (chita). Rice prices rose rapidly, even as the aman crop was being harvested, raising fears of impending shortfalls and unstable markets.

“The Current Rice Market Situation and Options for Procurement”, submitted on January 8, 1998, reviewed the available information on aman production and market prices. The memo discussed three major options for procurement of rice: local tenders for rice, commercial imports and government-to-government imports, and recommended a procurement strategy through two or more channels simultaneously, in order to minimize risks. The memo also advocated a transparent food policy that would provide clear signals to the private market and maintain incentives for private trade.

In late January, 1998, in preparation for his meeting with the Prime Minister, the Secretary of Food requested that the FMRSP prepare a memo outlining the rationale for the Ministry of Food’s response to the aman shortfall, as well as various other food policy issues. The 28 January, 1998 memo, “Ensuring Food Security after the 1997/98 Aman Shortfall: The Current Situation, Lessons from the Past, and Policy Options”, describes how Ministry of Food policies of limited imports, open tenders for domestic procurement, and maintaining incentives for private trade enabled the Government of Bangladesh to stabilize prices and build up stocks.

The February 3, 1998 memo, “Ensuring Food Security through Policy Analysis and Monitoring: Strengthening the Food Planning and Monitoring Unit (FPMU) in the Ministry of Food”, outlined an expansion of the FPMU so as to enhance its capability to conduct more in-depth monitoring and policy analysis. This memo was the basis for a subsequent proposal that was formally presented to and approved by the Honourable Prime Minister of the Government of Bangladesh.

In late March, rice prices remained high and there was growing concern that private traders were hoarding or manipulating the market. Two memos were submitted on 29 March, 1998 in response to requests from the Secretary of Food and the Special Adviser to the Prime Minister on Food and Agriculture, channeled through the FPMU. “Expected Short-Term Prices of Rice” examined recent movements in rice prices and compared them with patterns in recent years, as well as with seasonal movements in West Bengal (India). The memo concluded that the increase in prices in February and March appeared to be largely due to normal seasonality, related to the costs of storage. Thus, there was no need for the government to change its policy: prices were expected to fall at the time of the major boro harvest, within six to eight weeks.

The second memo submitted on 29 March, 1998, "Open Market Sales and Price Stabilization Following the Aman Shortfall", summarized the actions by the government up to that point. The memo emphasized the large contribution of private sector imports to domestic supplies in early 1998 and the limited role of Open Market Sales (OMS). The memo recommended a transparent food policy that would provide clear signals to the private market and maintain incentives for private trade, so as not to destabilize markets.

At the request of the new Secretary of Food, Mahbub Kabir (who replaced Abdul Hamid Chowdhury at the end of March), the 20 April, 1998 memo, "Explaining Rice Price Increases in Recent Weeks: Are Markets Behaving Competitively?" was written to address concerns over an increase in the price of rice in March and April, 1998, in spite of large-scale private sector imports of rice. The memo summarized the policies adopted in early 1998 and argued that the number of traders involved and the correspondence between prices at the border and wholesale prices in major markets in Bangladesh indicates that private rice markets were competitive. On the basis of an analysis of the quantity of imports, the observed price increases and alternative specifications of the elasticity of demand, the memo also argued that the aman shortfall was likely significantly larger than the official figures indicated.

Rice prices in Bangladesh fell sharply in early May, 1998 with the onset of the boro harvest. "Outlook for Boro Procurement and Rice Stocks, written 14 June, 1998, analyzed the implications for government stocks of various levels of boro procurement and government commercial rice imports. The memo reported that ample volumes of rice were already being procured in Rajshahi, and that if procurement target levels were attained, public commercial imports could be safely reduced. If stock build-up was desired however, raising the domestic procurement target (and thus supporting domestic producer prices) appeared to be a better option than increased imports. The memo cautioned, however, that the planned 250,000 MTs of OMS sales in 1998/99 would not be sufficient to have a significant effect on market prices in the event of a large production shortfall as in 1997/98.

Policy Response to the 1998 Flood

During the latter part of July and the month of August, floods gradually covered a large part of Bangladesh, causing damage to the aus crop about to be harvested and damaging aman seedlings. "Food Aid Needs in the Light of the Recent Floods", written 10 August, 1998, was an early assessment of the need for increased food aid based on estimated production losses in early August, 1998. At that time, total rice production losses were projected to be 4.5 lakh MTs (3.0 lakh MTs from the aus crop and 1.5 lakh MTs from the forthcoming 1998/99 aman crop). (Within a month, these crop loss estimates were revised upward to 2.2 million MTs.) Based on the low loss estimates of early August, 1998, the memo nonetheless argued that there was a strong case for additional food aid to Bangladesh in 1998/99 of at least 2 lakh MTs of wheat. Such an amount would bring scheduled public imports (food aid and commercial) to 8 lakh MTs, only 70,000 MTs higher than the average public imports of the two previous years. This level of food aid would thus likely not depress wheat prices below import parity levels.

The 1 September memo, "Alternative Scenarios for Flood Relief: The Need for Increased Food Grain Supplies by November", discussed the feasibility of the Ministry of Relief's proposed six lakh metric ton relief program to aid flood victims and rebuild infrastructure. Two scenarios were analyzed: distribution of rice and wheat as proposed by the Ministry of Relief, and a less costly alternative: distribution of wheat alone. In neither scenario were distribution plans for flood relief feasible without substantial rice or wheat imports by early November. The memo suggested that donors be encouraged to expedite food aid shipments, that cash payments be considered as an alternative to distribution in kind, and that government maintain incentives for private sector imports of rice.

The 6 September, 1998 memo, "Procurement Needs and Mechanisms in Response to the Flood Situation," discussed options for government procurement of foodgrains for flood-related distribution. The memo suggested that the government diversify its sources and mechanisms for procurement in order to minimize the risks of failure to acquire adequate quantities of food grain. The performance of local tenders, which enjoyed only moderate success in early 1998, could be improved by reducing the quantity specified in the contracts (reducing the time needed for suppliers to bulk up the rice), and by increasing the bid bond (to increase the cost to traders of default). Once again, the memo urged that incentives for private sector imports be maintained, and that international rice markets, including those in India, be regularly monitored.

"OMS Sales and the Flood-Damaged Aman Harvest", written 14 September, 1998, discussed the impact of OMS (open market sales) on domestic rice markets and suggested a range for the OMS sales price. This memo argued that envisaged levels of OMS sales would not be adequate to offset the expected 1.9 million metric ton shortfall in aman production. Thus, "a prime consideration of all government food policy in the coming months should be to maintain incentives for and help insure the flow of private sector rice imports". In order to avoid the adverse consequences of spurring excessive demand for OMS rice that cannot be met through planned government sales, the memo suggested an OMS price of 13.0 to 13.8 Tk/kg, implying about a 2 Taka/kg subsidy relative to expected import parity retail prices.

Two brief memos were written following a short research trip to India by Professor Siddiqur R. Osmani, Paul Dorosh and Hajikul Islam. The first, "India Food Grain Policy and Current Situation", written 14 September, 1998, pointed out that the Food Corporation of India (FCI) had a large quantity of deteriorating rice stocks and the Bangladesh government should be very cautious about purchases of rice originating from these stocks. The memo also noted that the kharif (aman) harvest was forecast to be very good overall, though West Bengal and Bihar were likely to have lower-than-normal harvests. A more thorough description of various aspects of the Indian rice market and Indian government policy was given in the 22 September, 1998 memo, "Some Points for Discussion for the Forthcoming Inter-Governmental Talks Between Bangladesh and India on Issues Relating to Foodgrain Trade", by Siddiqur R. Osmani. In addition to more detailed discussion of the issues described above, the memo discussed logistical

arrangements of grain deliveries in a possible government-to-government rice shipment and difficulties encountered in transport of rice through West Bengal.

“Relief Needs in the Immediate Post-Flood Period”, written 23 September, 1998 presented the case for cash transfers to supplement direct food distribution. The memo argued that (by late September), supply of food was not a constraint in most communities, or in Bangladesh as whole, as normal communication links had been rapidly re-established after the flood. Rather, lack of purchasing power was limiting purchases of foodgrain by poor households. With the amount of available stocks constraining public food distribution in the short run (the following two months), an increase in cash payments would increase food consumption of the vulnerable poor until stocks permitted a possible switch to food alone at a later point.

Also in late September 1998, the World Food Programme proposed a doubling in the Vulnerable Group Feeding (VGF) program in order to immediately reach more food insecure households. The 25th September memo, “Enhanced VGF Distribution: The WFP Proposal and Other Options” presented an analysis of the feasibility of the proposal in terms of available government stocks. The memo argued that the WFP proposal would draw down wheat stocks to unacceptably low levels at the end of October, to 59,000 metric tons or less. These projections differed from that of WFP because of differing assumptions about 1) the availability of scheduled imports in October (81,000 MTs according to the Ministry of Food, compared with WFP figures of more than 250,000 MTs), 2) other distribution requirements and 3) availability of stock “in transit”. The memo suggested that using both rice and wheat, or substituting some cash for foodgrain, in an expanded VGF program would enable an immediate increase in the number of recipients. In any case, the memo urged that distribution to flood-affected people be increased very soon.

“Foodgrain Stocks and Short-term Import Needs”, written 19 October, 1998, examined the government’s stock positions for rice and wheat. Expected arrivals of food aid and government commercial imports of wheat in late October and early November suggested that government wheat stocks would likely begin to rise substantially in November in December. However, the rice stock position appeared to be more precarious, especially given delays in delivery of recent tenders for commercial rice imports and problems encountered with planned government-to-government rice imports from India. The memo suggested that the government consider importing some rice from Thailand in the next few months to hedge against the possible non-delivery of rice from other sources, and that steps be taken to define the technical specifications for these imports. Finally, the memo pointed out, however, that keeping market prices below import parity through government imports of rice was not feasible and that was crucial to “ensure that private sector imports can supplement domestic supplies without interruption”.

“The Current Market Situation and Short-term Prospects for Rice Prices and Imports”, written 25 November, 1998, was written at the request of the State Minister for Food and Agriculture. In spite of the onset of the aman rice harvest, rice prices had

declined by only 2.7 percent compared with their peak in mid-September, just after the flood. The memo presented data showing that rice prices for most of 1998 had been determined mainly by the cost of importing rice from India (the import parity price). Given the expected poor aman harvest, domestic prices would likely continue to be determined mainly by the import parity price until May 1999. The memo also stressed that private sector rice imports had prevented a large increase in the price of rice to date and it was thus essential that incentives for private sector trade to be maintained. Finally, the memo argued that government rice stocks were sufficient for planned distribution through March even if no additional rice was procured, but that should other tenders fail, imported rice from Thailand remained a viable, though more expensive, option.

“Options For Rice Procurement”, written 14 December 1998, discussed the disappointing performance of international and domestic tenders for rice in recent months. Market prices were now above the winning bid prices of these tenders and it was unlikely that substantial amounts of rice would be procured, though for the most recent tender in early December, the bid price was above current market prices. The memo suggested that changes in the tender procedures: larger bid bonds, smaller sizes of contracts and faster processing of the tenders would improve the performance of future tenders.

“Rice Markets Price Trends and Imports”, written 23 December, 1998 at the request of the State Minister for Food and Agriculture, discussed the impacts of recent increases in transport costs between India and Bangladesh. New regulations in both countries on the size of loads carried by trucks increased transport costs of rice moved from Delhi to Dhaka by an estimated 1.1 Tk/kg in October and November. Thus, in spite of a decline in Delhi prices of 0.9 Tk/kg in November, the import parity price in Bangladesh rose by 0.2 Tk/kg (and the wholesale price of coarse rice in Dhaka rose by 0.14 Tk/kg). The memo suggested that further investigation on the factors influencing Indian rice markets and import parity prices in Bangladesh was needed, particularly with regard to conditions in West Bengal.

Bumper Crops and Household Food Security: April 1999 through June 2001

By the first quarter of 1999, foodgrain markets had stabilized and much of government policy in response to the flood of 1998 was in place. A good boro harvest in May/June 1999 brought to an end an 18 month period where policy was dominated by production shortfalls, high prices and concerns of low stocks. From mid-1999 through mid-2001, the policy focus shifted to problems of supporting producer prices, deteriorating stocks, and issues of access to food and nutrition.

At the request of USAID/Dhaka, Dr. Carlo del Ninno, working with Mr. Mahfoozur Rahman and other project staff, wrote the June 23, 1999 memo, “The Use of Fortified Atta for Distribution in the FFE Program”. The memo describes the current system and discusses the feasibility of distributing about 12 kgs of fortified atta flour, packaged in three two-kilogram bags twice per month, instead of the current program

with 15 kilograms of wheat distributed once per month. The cost of fortifying the wheat flour with vitamin A and iron, and packaging the flour in 2 kilogram bags is estimated at about 2 Taka/kg of flour, assuming a milling conversion ratio of 90 to 95 percent. There appears to be enough local milling capacity for fortification and this seems most feasible at the district or division level. Potential benefits include reduced system leakages because of the standardized packages and additional vitamin A and iron intake of recipients. A number of issues need to be further investigated, however, including the storage life of the flour and the exact quantity and type of fortification to be used.

“Public Foodgrain Stocks and Market Prices: Policy Options for a Bumper 1999-2000 Aman Rice Harvest”, was written on 18 November, 1999 at the request of Mr. Anisuzzaman, Adviser to the Prime Minister on Food and Agriculture. This memo explored stock and price stabilization options given a large expected aman harvest in December, 1999, expectations of low producer prices, and large quantities of aging rice stocks. Projected stocks for end-December were 1.578 million MTs, exceeding the previous record of 1.494 million MTs in July 1988 by 84 thousand MTs. Deterioration of the quality of the rice stock was also a potential problem. With no change in the distribution plan, by the end of April 2000, at least 220 thousand MTs of rice would be more than eight months old.

The memo suggested that rice distribution might need to be accelerated to reduce the volume of aging rice stocks. However, the memo warned that avoiding very low market prices of rice might not be possible, if in deed the aman harvest turned out to be as large as projected. In the event of prices dropping to levels of about 10 Tk/kg wholesale (the estimated export parity price of rice), one option would be for the Government of Bangladesh to encourage private sector exports through assistance of the commercial officers of Bangladesh embassies. In the long-term, if rice surpluses and low rice prices become a recurring problem, effort could be made to development rice export facilities, including adoption of grades and standards for rice quality.

“Implications of Aging Rice and Wheat Stocks”, was written on 1 May, 2000 at the request of the Secretary of Food. This memo examined two major emerging problems for the PFDS: a build-up of aging rice stocks and sharply increasing fiscal costs. The memo presented data on the age and quality of current foodgrain stocks and included projections of the age of stocks under current distribution and procurement plans. Several broad options for stocks and the PFDS were also analyzed including further increases in rice distribution, wholesale open market sales to rotate stocks at minimal fiscal cost, and a shift in composition and size of foodgrain stocks.

The memo, “A Note on the State of the PFDS,” written on 3 October 2000, covered overall foodgrain availability, targeting of the PFDS, and possibilities of a significant expansion in total foodgrain distribution. For 2000/2001, the share of PFDS foodgrain distributed through targeted programs was projected to fall to 75.2 percent (from 84.7 percent in 1999/2000), mainly because of 200 thousand MTs of planned Fair Price Card sales (half rice and half wheat). In principle, recipients of Fair Price Cards are chosen based on legitimate needs. It is possible, however, that this program could

expand to become a permanent ration channel, rather than simply a means to help poor households (and stabilize markets) in periods of high prices. The memo noted, however, that the planned 200 thousand MTs of Fair Price Card sales may not occur. Market prices of comparable quality grain were below the stipulated sales prices of rice and wheat (13.0 Tk/kg for rice and 9.0 Tk/kg for wheat), and no significant sales had taken place.

The memo, "Food Aid Levels and Producer Price Incentives", written 16 November 2000, by Naser Farid, Additional Director of the FPMU, and Paul Dorosh, FMRS-IFPRI, discussed the possibilities that food aid in 2000/2001 is depressing market prices below import parity levels and having a negative effect on domestic wheat production and farmer incomes. Bumper rice harvests (which reduce rice prices and thereby reduce consumer demand for wheat) could reduce demand for privately imported or PFDS wheat to 1.24 million MTs at 1999-2000 world wheat price level, or to about 940 thousand MTs at the higher, five-year average world price level. The memo concluded that, unlike the situation throughout much of the last three years, there is a realistic possibility that food aid inflows, (together with stock draw downs), distributed through the PFDS, could result in price disincentive effects for Bangladesh wheat producers in 2000/2001. If bountiful rice harvests continue and world wheat prices rise, possible price disincentives of food aid (and Ministry of Food commercial imports) could once again become a major food policy issue for Bangladesh.

The memo, "Implications of a 1 lakh Increase in FFW Rice Distribution," written on 22 February 2001 by Paul Dorosh and Ruhul Amin, Director, FPMU, discussed the implications of the proposed 1 lakh MT increase in FFW rice distribution. The memo stated that current and projected foodgrain stocks, coupled with relatively low market prices following the successful 2000/2001 aman harvest, were more than sufficient to permit a 1 lakh MT increasing in rice distribution through FFW from March to May 2001. However, fiscal costs of additional distribution are high -- 140 crore Taka (25.9 million dollars). Moreover, rapid increases in distribution entail increased risk of leakages and diversion of resources that could be embarrassing to the Government. Finally, additional distribution could lower wholesale market prices of coarse rice in March-May 2001 by 4 to 10 percent (0.5 to 1.1 Tk/kg), compared to prices in the absence of additional distribution.

A smaller increase in FFW rice distribution would have proportionately less fiscal costs and market price impacts. Thus, increased distribution, while feasible, could come at a potentially high cost both to the government budget and to farmers, in general. A more moderate increase in FFW rice distribution (of 50 to 70 thousand MTs) would limit the direct fiscal costs and adverse price effects for farmers, while easing the problem of aging stocks. Swapping rice for wheat in various channels would solve the aging rice stock problem at an even lesser fiscal cost, however.

"Implications of a 1 lakh Increase in Wheat Distribution," written 3 May, 2001, discussed the implications of a proposed 1.25 lakh MT increase in wheat distribution in terms of public foodgrain stocks, fiscal costs and leakages. Under then current

distribution and procurement plans, wheat stocks at the end of June 2001 were expected to be 263 thousand MTs, with total stocks of 915 thousand MTs. An increase in wheat distribution by 1.25 lakh MTs over the last two months of the 2000/2001 fiscal year would lower (net) wheat stocks to only 138 thousand MTs and total (net) stocks to 739 thousand MTs. This would bring wheat stocks to dangerously low levels.

The memo also noted that fiscal costs of additional wheat distribution were high – 152.5 crore Taka (28.2 million dollars). Distributing an extra 1 lakh MTs of rice instead of the additional wheat would conserve wheat stocks, but still cost 149 crore Taka (27.6 million dollars). Moreover, rapid increases in distribution of either rice or wheat entail increased risk of leakages and diversion of resources that could be embarrassing to the Government.

ANNEX 5: RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS OF THE REPORT ON A NATIONAL COMPREHENSIVE FOOD SECURITY POLICY

Food security has several components and numerous dimensions. In order to address these complex and inter-related issues, a comprehensive food security policy for Bangladesh, including availability, access and utilization aspects is needed.

Food security discussions and planning unfortunately have often had a much narrower focus, over-emphasizing the estimated “food gap”, the difference between a target level of availability and domestic production. The food gap, however, measures only availability of foodgrains, thus neglecting availability of other foods. Moreover, focus on the food gap has often diverted attention from the other major aspects of food security: access and utilization.

Yet, availability of foodgrains is not always the constraint on food security in Bangladesh. Rather, because of the widespread poverty, access to adequate diets (i.e. households’ insufficient capability to acquire food) and utilization of food (influenced by poor health and other factors) are generally the major constraints on food security.

Policy Recommendations

This report has identified a number of key areas for increasing food security in Bangladesh including:

1. **Incentives for sustained growth in domestic food production**, which are important not only for adequate availability, but increasing rural incomes and access to food as well. Agricultural research and dissemination (for both foodgrains and other food products), investments in irrigation and marketing infrastructure, and appropriate

domestic foodgrain procurement and price stabilization policies are needed, ensuring profitability of efficient domestic production. Macro-economic policy is important here as well, since appreciation of the real exchange rate (an increase in the real value of the Taka relative to other currencies) could make domestic food production less competitive with imported food.

2. Further development of **private markets** to facilitate efficient distribution and storage of food within the country, timely food imports following domestic production shortfalls, and exports of agricultural and small-scale industrial products to increase incomes of the poor.
3. **Emergency preparedness** to alleviate the transitory food insecurity caused by floods, cyclones and other natural disasters that often occur in Bangladesh. **Public foodgrain stocks** equal to three to four months of emergency distribution requirements and a relief system to distribute food, clean water, medicine and other needs should be maintained. This required level of minimum public foodgrain stocks should be reviewed annually to take into account changing conditions in domestic and international markets.
4. Promoting **income growth of the poor** through a labor intensive development strategy coupled with skills enhancement and increased access to capital (through micro-credit programs) for poor households. This income growth is a necessary condition for sustainable access to food by poor households.

5. **Targeted food and non-food interventions** to food insecure people, particularly poor women and children, and destitute, old and infirmed individuals. Targeting is important, here, because of the need to conserve scarce resources and in order to limit potential adverse impacts of foodgrain distribution on producer prices.
6. Strengthening **nutrition education**, particularly for poor, food insecure households, so that household resources are efficiently used for nutrition and health of vulnerable individuals, particularly women and children. Promotion of **diversity in diets** through increased availability of non-foodgrains and nutrition education in order to increase consumption of protein, fats and oils, vegetables and micro-nutrients. Given the weak link between incomes and consumption of micro-nutrients, increases in household incomes without nutrition education are unlikely to result in a major improvement in nutrition.
7. Increased **investments in rural infrastructure and social services**, especially **clean water, sanitation and medical services**, to promote public health, a key component in favorable nutritional outcomes.
8. Further **evaluation of current policies and programs** is needed, along with in-depth analysis to understand the inter-relationships between availability (especially domestic food production), access (sustainable increases in rural incomes), and nutrition.

Operational Recommendations

9. **Re-focus the debate** on food security so that aid and investment for food security does not fluctuate according to the size of the harvests in Bangladesh or the level of stocks in food aid donor countries. Instead of concentrating on food aid levels and food gaps, more attention should be given to alleviating food insecurity of the poor by increasing access to food by the poor through food- and cash-financed programs of skills-enhancement, nutrition interventions, etc. One possibility is that the GOB and development partners could **commit a combination of cash and food to programs targeted to food insecure households** in Bangladesh. The goal of these efforts would be to achieve a measurable improvement in nutritional and health outcomes (reductions in infant mortality, stunting and wasting, micro-nutrient deficiencies) in a specified period of time. A useful step in changing the focus of food security policy would be to construct **food security resource budgets**, (involving an inventory of current and recent projects and programs involved in the various aspects of food security), that would be monitored and updated regularly.

10. Improve **coordination across GOB and development partners' projects** and programs so as to assist the Government of Bangladesh in integrating major elements of its food security programs that are separated by Ministerial and development partner boundaries. Among the major programs are the programs in the Rural Development Strategy funded by the World Bank; the food aid programs funded by USAID, WFP and others; and the National Nutrition Project, also funded by the

World Bank. Since these are large, multi-year programs, there are likely to be large benefits from co-ordinating their activities. There is also a need for co-ordination with GOB development efforts financed by its own funds or those of development partners. This co-ordination need not be done exclusively (or even mainly) at the national level. Instead, local governments (at the district or thana level) might be best-placed to decide how to best integrate these activities operationally, given an overall national food security framework. Participation of NGO's and civil society, at both the national and the local level, might also increase the effectiveness of these efforts.

11. The GOB should consider **expanding the mandate of the existing Food Planning and Monitoring Committee** to monitor and plan overall food security efforts, including utilization and nutrition issues, such as the availability and prices of non-foodgrain commodities, the number and the income levels of poor households, the food consumption gap for calories and other nutrients, and the nutritional status of children. Representatives of related Ministries might be included so that progress on all aspects of food security, in addition to availability and prices, could be discussed on at least a quarterly basis.

12. Finally, **specific targets** need to be set, programs and projects designed, resources committed and institutions mobilized and strengthened to **operationalize** the general policy framework outlined above.

Conclusions

Since Independence, Bangladesh has made substantial progress in increasing domestic production of foodgrains, thus to a large extent overcoming the constraint of insufficient foodgrain (and calorie) **availability**. There is no room for complacency, however. Continued efforts are required to maintain these hard-won gains in availability in the face of continued population growth.

Adequate availability, though, is a necessary, but not sufficient condition for food security. Significant improvements in household food security in Bangladesh can be achieved without major increases in **per capita** foodgrain production or food aid, but such improvements do require a major effort at increasing access to food and utilization of food by poor households. Thus, all aspects of food security must be addressed: greater efficiency of domestic agriculture (and enhanced availability of food, including non-foodgrains); sustained increases in the incomes of the poor (their access to food) and improved food utilization by under-nourished individuals (through education and health care). In this way, it is hoped that all people in Bangladesh will enjoy the food security that they truly deserve.

ANNEX 6: PROJECT WORKING PAPERS AND OTHER PUBLICATIONS

FMRSP Working Papers

1. Shahabuddin, Quazi and Paul Dorosh. Rice Markets in the 1997-98 Aman Season: A Rapid Appraisal Analysis.
2. Dorosh, Paul. The Determination of Rice Prices in Bangladesh: Supply Shocks, Trade Liberalization and Cross-Border Trade.
4. Rahman, Mahfoozur. Turning The Full Circle: Rationale and Mechanics of Rice Exports from Bangladesh.
5. Chowdhury, Omar Haider and Carlo del Ninno. Poverty, Household Food Security and Targeted Food Programmes.
6. Murshid, K. A. S. Fiscal Implications of Food Policy. .
7. Dorosh, Paul. Foodgrain Markets and Policy in the Aftermath of the 1998 Flood.
8. del Ninno, Carlo and Dilip K. Roy. Impact of the 1998 Flood on Labor Markets and Food Security and Effectiveness of Relief Operations in Bangladesh.
9. del Ninno, Carlo and Dilip K. Roy. The 1998 Flood and Household Food Security: Evidence from Rural Bangladesh.
10. Osmani, S. R. Aspects of India's Food Economy and their Implications for Rice Trade between India and Bangladesh.
11. Murshid, K. A. S. Liberalization and Foodgrain Imports: The Evolution and Conduct of the Border Trade with India.
12. Dorosh, Paul and Quazi Shahabuddin. Price Stabilization and Public Foodgrain Distribution: Policy Options to Enhance National Food Security.
13. Shahabuddin, Quazi and Nabiul Islam. The Domestic Rice Procurement Program in Bangladesh—An Evaluation.
14. Quasem, Md. Abul. Maize Production and Marketing in Bangladesh: An Indicative Exercise.
15. Rahman, Mahfoozur. A Review of International and Local Tenders for Procurement of Rice and Wheat.

16. Dorosh, Paul. Trade Liberalization and Food Security in Bangladesh: The Role of Private Sector Imports.
17. del Ninno, Carlo and Paul Dorosh. In-Kind Transfers and Household Food Consumption: Implications for Targeted Food Programs in Bangladesh.
18. del Ninno, Carlo and Paul Dorosh. Averting a Food Crisis: Private Imports and Public Targeted Distribution in Bangladesh after the 1998 Flood.
19. Chowdhury, Omar Haider. Impact of Food for Education Programme: A Review.
20. Afsar, A. K. M. Nurul, Mohammad Baqui, Mahfoozur Rahman and M. Abdur Rouf. Grades, Standards and Inspection Procedures of Rice in Bangladesh.
21. Kabirullah, M. and Mahfoozur Rahman. Chemical Changes in Food Grains in Government Storage.*
22. del Ninno, Carlo and Dilip K. Roy. Determinants of Labor Market Participation in Rural Bangladesh after the 1998 Flood.
23. del Ninno, Carlo, Dilip K. Roy and Sanjukta Mukherjee. Recovering from the Shock of the 1998 Flood: Household Food Security and Nutritional Status One Year Later. (forthcoming)*
24. Shahabuddin, Quazi and Paul Dorosh. Comparative Advantages in Bangladesh Agriculture.
25. Dorosh, Paul, Quazi Shahabuddin and M. Saifur Rahman. Price Responsiveness of Foodgrain Supply in Bangladesh and Projections 2020.
26. Mujeri, Mustafa. K. Poverty Trends and Agricultural Growth Linkages.
27. Fontana, Marzia. Peter Wobst and Paul Dorosh. Macro Policies and the Food Sector in Bangladesh: A General Equilibrium Analysis.
28. Murshid, K. A. S. A Market in Transition? The Case of the Bangladesh Rice Market.
29. Rashid, Shahidur. The Debate over Dynamics of Agricultural Wage and Rice Price in Bangladesh: A Re-examination.
30. Quasem, Md. Abul. Poultry Farms and Poultry Feeds in Bangladesh: Survey Results.
31. Islam, Nabiul. Demand for Poultry Feeds: Implications for Wheat and Maize Production in Bangladesh.

32. Dorosh, Paul, Quazi Shahabuddin, Abdul Aziz and Naser Farid. Food Aid and Producer Price Incentives.
33. Ahmed, Raisuddin. Recent Developments in Mechanized Cultivation: Emerging Issues in the Agriculture of Bangladesh.
34. del Ninno, Carlo and Binayak Sen. Using Household and District Level Data for Geographic Targeting: A Methodological Exercise with Bangladesh Data.*
35. Ahmed, Akhter U., Carlo del Ninno, and Omar Haider Chowdhury. Evaluating the Food for Education Program in Bangladesh.
36. Dorosh, Paul and Naser Farid. The PFDS and Foodgrain Stocks: Costs, Benefits and Policy Options.

Synthesis Papers

1. Dorosh, Paul, Quazi Shahabuddin and Naser Farid. Price Stabilization and the Cost of Food Stocks.
2. Dorosh, Paul and K.A.S. Murshid. Trade Liberalization, Private Sector Imports and National Food Security in Bangladesh.
3. Shahabuddin, Quazi, Paul Dorosh, Abul Quasem and Nabiul Islam. Comparative Advantage and Medium-Term Outlook in Bangladesh Agriculture.
4. Rahman, Mahfoozur. Technical Aspects of Food Policy Implementation in Bangladesh: Grades, Standards, Storage and Procurement.*
5. Murshid, K. A. S. and Shahidur Rashid. Market Transition and Price-Wage Dynamics: The Case of the Bangladesh Rice Market.
6. del Ninno, Carlo and Dilip K. Roy. Impact of the 1998 Flood on Household Food Security.

Other Research Papers

1. Goletti, Francesco and Karl Rich. A Planning Tool for the Management of Foodgrain Stocks in Bangladesh.* June 1998.
2. del Ninno, Carlo. Efficiency of Targeted Food Programs: An Investigation of the VGD and RD Programs.* July 2000.

Data Documentation

1. FMRSP-IFPRI. Bangladesh Household Coping Strategy Survey, (November 1998-December 1999). Data documentation. October 2001.
 2. FMRSP-IFPRI. Food for Education Survey, (October-December 2000). Data documentation. October 2001.
- * Draft Report

April 21, 2001	Rice Market Partial Equilibrium
April 26, 2001	Rice Market Partial Equilibrium (II)
May 10, 2001	Wheat Market and Food Aid
May 12, 2001	Wheat Market Partial Equilibrium
May 17, 2001	Monitoring Domestic Markets
June 9, 2001	Analysis of Household Level Data Using STATA and Statistical Analysis Using STATA