

PD-ABM-996
90696

EVALUATION OF

GRANT NO. CBS-0007-G-00-2034-00

WITH

INTERNEWS FOR
INDEPENDENT TELEVISION NEWS

FOR DEMOCRATIC PLURALISM INITIATIVES
IN THE
NEWLY INDEPENDENT STATES
OF THE FORMER SOVIET UNION
(PROJECT 110-0007)

31 March 1994

Submitted to

Agency for International Development
Bureau for Europe and Newly Independent States

CONTENTS

ACRONYMS	11
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
1 PURPOSE AND METHOD OF THE EVALUATION	3
2 THE GRANT	5
3 FINDINGS	7
4 MANAGEMENT	16
5 CONCLUSIONS	17
6 RECOMMENDATIONS	18
APPENDIX A LIST OF PEOPLE INTERVIEWED	19
APPENDIX B REFERENCES	20

ACRONYMS

AID	Agency for International Development
DPI	Democratic Pluralism Initiatives
IMC	International Media Center
NIS	New Independent States of the former Soviet Union
USAID	Country or regional mission of the Agency for International Development
USIA	U S Information Agency

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report constitutes a summary of an evaluation of Internews activities that were funded in FY 1992-1994 by AID's Democratic Pluralism Initiatives (DPI) Project No. 110-0007 in the Russian Federation, Ukraine and Central Asia.

Program Summary

Internews was awarded a 2-year grant for \$2,209,280 for the period of June 1992 to June 1994. The purpose of the grant is to aid in the establishment of an independent TV news distribution system in the NIS and to help develop alternatives to the state-controlled monopoly on broadcasting. Internews proposed to develop an electronic mail network among six regional media centers to exchange information and news on regional events; to train television journalists in the production of news; and to train station management in how to develop a commercially viable television station. The grant was later amended to permit Internews to develop four documentaries on important constitutional issues facing the Russian public. The grant was again amended to permit training in campaign and election coverage for Russian stations. Although it was not part of this evaluation, Internews also received a separate grant to establish the International Media Center in Kiev.

The approach that Internews has taken might be called a free market democratic approach -- commercial viability is the key to independent media. Through this uniquely American approach, self-sustaining television is developed without relying on grants and the provision of equipment to every possible station. With a relatively small amount of money, Internews has been able to identify some key constraints in knowledge and skills development and has quickly responded to overcome those constraints.

Findings

The training program developed for broadcast journalists and station managers was well designed, speedily implemented, and achieved its objectives. Internews exceeded their goals for training by more than double. Under the grant from AID, as well as several other sources, they trained 239 journalists from 80 stations. In addition, they held management seminars for 103 people, rather than the 25 as planned.

The first component rapidly evolved from connecting six stations with e-mail to the actual production of a weekly news show, *Local Time*. The show started in February 1993 and has run weekly for one year now. Six regional stations started producing news for the show, that number has grown to 25. Forty stations in Russia, Ukraine, and Kazakhstan now show *Local Time* and since February, 1994, the program is also aired on Ostankino Channel 1, covering the entire NIS. A second local news program--*Windows*--modeled on *Local Time*, was started in Ukraine and has run for 43 weeks, and is now on 18 stations. It is the only news program in Ukrainian and Russian that is seen country-wide. These programs are available to a combined viewing audience of 100 million.

A final output not originally anticipated was the development of networks within the regions of Russia and other NIS countries. There are now networks in Ukraine and Kazakhstan as well as in the Volga Region and Siberia covering 57 stations and 48 million viewers. The formation of independent television networks has increased the viability of individual stations, increased the flow of news across regions and countries, and set up a vehicle for sharing of programming and resources.

Impact

Despite the short time it has been in operation, the impact of the Internews program has been profound and can be seen on several levels: the increase in skills of broadcast journalists, the increase in the diversity of ideas that are presented to the public, the sustainability of independent television, and the strengthened role of independent television in a changing society.

I PURPOSE AND METHOD OF THE EVALUATION

A Background and Purpose of the Evaluation

This evaluation was conducted by Management Systems International (MSI) under IQC No AEP-0085-I-10-3001 00 Delivery Order No 10. It is the first evaluation of a major sectoral component of assistance from the Agency for International Development (AID) to the New Independent States (NIS) of the former Soviet Union. It pertains to a portion of AID's Democratic Pluralism Initiatives (DPI) Project No 110-0007 which was authorized on 10 April 1992 with a life of project funding level of \$25 million and a project assistance completion date of April 1996. Funding for the DPI Project has been increased twice, in February 1993 to \$85 million and in September 1993 to \$160 million. The second amendment also extended the project to 31 December 1996.

The DPI Project was designed to help build political, legal and social institutions critical to the success of democratic and economic reform in the NIS in the wake of the collapse of communism and the Soviet economic system. In its early phase, the Project funded Grants and Cooperative Agreements for U.S.-based nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) to provide technical assistance, training, and some equipment. Grants and Cooperative Agreements are both instruments to transfer funds to provide assistance to the recipient in carrying out a program. A Cooperative Agreement is a relationship in which substantial involvement is anticipated between AID and the recipient during the performance of the proposed activity. This report refers to the recipient organizations generically as grantees.

The DPI Project has five sub-sector components: rule of law, independent media, civil society, governance and public administration, and political process. This latter component is intended to enable individuals and organizations to determine political outcomes in a competitive and fair environment. The Internews grant is a portion of the independent media component.

The overall purpose of the evaluation is to assess the extent to which the grants are meeting the objectives of their agreements, fitting with the general guiding principles of democratic reform and able to adjust to the new strategic priorities, being implemented in an effective and efficient manner, and having an impact on the people, organizations and countries of the NIS.

The overall purpose of the evaluation is to assess the extent to which the grants are meeting the objectives of their agreements, fitting with the general guiding principles of democratic reform and able to adjust to the new strategic priorities, being implemented in an effective and efficient manner, and having an impact on the people, organizations and countries of the NIS.

B Method

In December 1993, AID contracted with Management Systems International (MSI) to conduct field evaluations of the activities of seven DPI Project grantees and desk studies of the activities of two grantees.

The evaluations were conducted by a team of six management consultants: David Read Barker (Team Leader), Cynthia Clapp-Wincek, David Hirschmann, James S. Holtaway, Sally J. Patterson, and Alan Lessik. Four members of the team (Barker, Holtaway, Patterson, and Lessik) divided responsibility for the seven field studies, with three evaluators each taking lead responsibility for two studies and one evaluator taking responsibility for one field study and the synthesis report. The other two members of the team (Hirschmann and Clapp-Wincek) were each assigned lead responsibility for one desk study.

The professional backgrounds of the evaluators are development management, cultural anthropology, political science, and political organizing and opinion research. All four of the field evaluators had previous professional experience in Russia; three of them had worked in Russia within the previous 6 months.

A team planning meeting of the AID project managers, the evaluators, and representatives of the grantees (with the exception of Internews) was held on 4 January 1994. The participants agreed to support the evaluation as a collaborative, candid, constructive, and creative process. The evaluators then interviewed AID officials in Washington, DC, and Internews staff in California. Extensive documentation was gathered and reviewed by the team.

The evaluators visited the Russian Federation from 20-29 January, at which time the team broke into two sub-teams, one of which visited Ukraine from 29 January to 5 February and one of which visited Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan from 29 January to 5 February. The method of the field visits was derived from rapid appraisal techniques, which stress creation of a team, multidisciplinary treatment of data, selective sampling, gathering information through interviews, and conscious efforts to identify biases.

With the full cooperation of Internews, the evaluators structured their itinerary to maximize opportunities to observe significant project activities. Similarly, the Internews provided names of key beneficiaries, who became priority targets for interviewing. Interviews with Russian-speaking informants were conducted in English using professional interpreters. To the extent that logistics permitted, at least two team members participated in interviews with beneficiaries. However, intense time constraints required modifications of the optimal itinerary and interview schedule.

The team interviewed 30 people, who are listed in Appendix A, and reviewed a number of documents, which are listed in Appendix B.

Following the field visits, the team met several times in Washington, DC, to exchange notes. Team members met in-person with AID officials and by phone with Internews staff to present key findings and conclusions informally and to review critical issues.

The team expresses its sincere appreciation for the excellent cooperation and support received from AID officials in Washington, from USAID and U.S. Embassy staffs in Moscow, Almaty, and Kiev, from the Internews staff at headquarters and in the field, and from the numerous beneficiaries of these programs.

2 THE GRANT

A Purpose and Description of the Program

The purpose of this grant is to aid in the establishment of an independent TV news distribution system in the New Independent States (NIS) of the former Soviet Union and to help develop alternatives to the state controlled monopoly on broadcasting

Tight control over the media had been one of the hallmarks of the communist system. The power of television was recognized early as a means for disseminating the government's viewpoint throughout the huge country. This system was controlled by Moscow and centered around Moscow. Local stations were essentially branches of the state television with little local content. Virtually every home in the country has a television set and even the most remote villages were covered by the government signal.

In the democratic opening of the NIS a window of opportunity was created for independent non-governmental television. Local stations were given permission to operate for the first time. In response to this opening literally hundreds of stations began operations in Russia, Ukraine, and Kazakhstan. While virtually all the stations started on a shoestring, with patched together equipment and minimal programming pirated from international satellites, they represented an alternative to the state that had potential to challenge the Moscow-centered control of news.

The Internews Independent Television News Project sought to strengthen the stations ability to operate and to increase their capacity to produce local television news. Its original proposal had these objectives:

- Develop an electronic mail network among six regional media centers. These centers would exchange information and news on regional events. Their linkage would help to create a means for non-Moscow centered news to be discussed and shared.
- Train television journalists in the production of news. Television reporters, producers, and technical people would participate in a 1-week training session that would cover the basics of television reporting, how to develop a story and the practicalities of camera techniques, interviewing, and maintaining viewer interest. In addition, the training would allow journalists from different stations to meet and exchange views.
- Train station management in how to develop a commercially viable television station. A separate 2-week seminar for regional station managers would focus on finances, marketing, advertising, programming, legal issues, and management skills necessary to run a commercial broadcasting station. Under separate funding, 10 station managers from this group would also go to the U.S. for a 1-week intensive study.

The grant was later amended to permit Internews to develop four documentaries on important Rule of Law issues facing the Russian public including the constitutional and separation of powers, rights and duties of citizens, the relationship of the media to government, and the judiciary system. These programs were to use an innovative "hypothetical" technique in which

a group of experts is provoked by a moderator to role-play their responses to theoretical constitutional scenarios. A further amendment allowed Internews to conduct training in campaign and elections coverage for Russian television stations.

Internews received a separate AID grant to establish the International Media Center (IMC) in Kiev. The IMC will house a resource center, provide television and radio production studios for independent media, and serve as a training center. In addition, the IMC will house the national Press and Information Center for all journalists--press, radio, and television. The IMC is intended to become the central gathering place for independent journalists from Ukraine and abroad to gather information, access international databases, and produce programming.

Since this is a separate grant and not a grant amendment, the media center was not evaluated under this work order. However, since the media center is an outgrowth of the original Internews grant, some of its activities related to the first grant will be reported here.

B Country Context and Issues

The Internews Program extends across five countries: Russia, Ukraine, Kazakhstan, Belarus, and Georgia, with the greatest activity in the first three countries. The main office is located in Moscow, with a second office operating the International Media Center in Kiev, Ukraine.

The issues faced by the project are quite similar across these four countries. All of the countries permit independent television, although this appears to be under the most strain in Belarus. The range of sophistication in the stations that Internews works with is similar in each country. Russia, due to its size, has the largest number and the greatest diversity of stations.

C Program Budget and Financial Management

The present budget for the Internews grant is \$2,209,280. The original 2-year grant of \$1,761,320 made in June 1992 was amended in August 1993 by \$447,968. Expenditures, as of March 30, 1994, amounted to \$1,557,530, which appeared to be on schedule for the project. To date, over \$200,000 has been expended on equipment procurement, a process which has gone smoothly without problems or delays.

Financial management of the project is controlled in the Arcata, CA headquarters. A yearly project budget for the NIS is developed and administered directly by the Moscow office to assure that local decision making is not hampered by waiting for routine approvals from Arcata.

3 FINDINGS

A Inputs, Activities, and Delivery Mechanisms

The original grant was signed at the end of June 1992 and within a month the field representative Vincent Malmgren was hired and placed in Moscow. At the same time, Manana Aslamazvam was hired as the regional coordinator for the Moscow area. At the time of the evaluation Manana had been recently appointed as the Executive Director of Internews International in Moscow. Except for the field coordinator all other Internews staff members in Moscow are Russian. Internews does use a number of short- and long-term American consultants to provide training and technical assistance.

An office was quickly established in Moscow. Eventually Internews found and renovated a larger space that could house its television production studio as well as its management offices. Within the first year television cameras, editing, duplication, and production equipment were procured for the media center operations and for use in conducting training.

The three sets of activities outlined above formed the core of the Internews project. However, each activity greatly expanded in scope over time.

E-mail Network

The e-mail network was originally proposed to be a means of communications between six localities in Russia, Ukraine, and Kazakhstan. Each of these locations was to become a media center for the region. The conceptualization for this part of the project changed quite rapidly, as Internews realized much more could be accomplished with the network. Rather than simply establishing e-mail connections between the cities, the project evolved into a weekly television news exchange program. This program, called Local Time, became the first nationally aired local news program in the CIS. Started by six stations, short video news segments would be developed in each city. These would be sent to the Internews production facilities in Moscow where they would be edited into a half-hour news program which was in turn redistributed to the participating stations to be aired.

Journalism Training

The grant proposed that Internews would conduct six 1-week journalism training courses in each of the cities represented in the e-mail network. The grant expected that about 90 people would be trained from 60 television stations. In addition, 25 of the best journalists would participate in a follow-up course in Moscow.

The first courses began immediately after the grant was approved in June and July 1992.

Management Training

The management training seminars began in February 1993. Prior to that event, Internews conducted a needs assessment of the stations to determine the course content and to secure the

appropriate course instructors. The management seminars were held in Moscow where Internews had access to several international broadcasters. At the request of the stations, two additional seminars were developed following the first management seminar on programming and advertising.

The International Media Center

The Internews office and production facilities in Kiev are located in the former state controlled press agency building in downtown Kiev. However, now that the first half of the equipment (valued at \$1.5 million) has arrived for the media center, the center will move to new offices 7 kilometers from downtown. The new site will allow ample space for the set up of the production facilities for the program. The downtown site will continue to be used for the National Press and Information Center. Like the Moscow center, except for the field representative who is an American, all other staff members are Ukrainian.

Prior to the new grant, the center in Kiev functioned as a coordinator for Internews activities in Ukraine. Several trainings have taken place in the country, as well as the production of a weekly news show which is discussed below.

Election Support

After parliamentary elections were called in the Russian Federation, Internews developed a special project to train independent television stations so they could more effectively cover the elections. The elections support included training sessions, on-site technical assistance and equipment.

B Outputs

Local News Production

The first component rapidly evolved from connecting six stations with e-mail to the actual production of a weekly news show, Local Time. The show started in February 1993 and has run weekly for 1 year now. Six regional stations--in Yekaterinburg, Samara, Almaty, Petrozavodsk, Minsk, and Kiev--originally identified for the e-mail network, agreed to put the show together. Presently, 25 stations are participating in the production of news items for Local Time, 15 of which are participating on a weekly basis. In addition, a total of 40 stations in Russia, Ukraine, and Kazakhstan now show Local Time, including Channel 1, the State Television station that covers all of the NIS. An audience of over 100 million people now have access to this program.

In addition, a second local news program--Windows--was started in the Ukraine. Windows started from a core of six stations in the Ukraine and has now expanded to 18. Like Local Time, segments for Windows are filmed by local stations and sent to Kiev for editing into the weekly show. Most of the stations in the network are active participants in providing footage for Windows. Windows has run for 43 weeks now and is the only news program in Ukrainian and Russian that is seen country wide.

Training

Internews exceeded its training goals in its journalist and management training sessions under the grant. See Table 1. They trained more than twice as many journalists as they had expected: 239 in total from 80 stations. In addition, they trained 103 station managers, program and sales managers in two management training seminars and two additional seminars in advertising and programming. In March 1994, they are planning an additional management seminar for 96 station managers and sales managers from 48 different stations. The total number of stations that have participated in training seminars will be 109 after this seminar.

As a follow up to the training, Internews is now sending consultants to spend two to three weeks with eight stations in Kiev, Minsk, Tomsk, Krasnoyarsk, Ekaterinburg, Samara, and Petrozavodsk and Kaluga. These intensive training sessions will enable the better stations to boost their performance in programming, news production, and station management.

Table 1 Training Seminars, as of January 30, 1994

	Number of Seminars		Number of Participants		Number of Stations Represented	
	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual
Journalist Seminars	6	12	90	239	48	80
Management, Advertising and Programming Seminars	1	4	25	103	25	40

Planned based on Grant proposal. Actual: Internews Records

Network Development

An additional output that was not originally anticipated was the development of networks within the regions of Russia and other NIS countries. These networks are groups of local stations that have agreed to join together to share programming, training, and other resources. Unlike American networks, each station is completely independent and participates in the network as a means for expanding its resource base and as a vehicle for news and program production and sharing.

The networks became a natural outgrowth of the original e-mail network envisioned by Internews and the collaborative experience while developing the Local Time and Windows programs. There are now networks in Ukraine and Kazakhstan as well as in the Samara and Ekaterinberg areas as is shown in Table 2. Starting in March 1994, the newest network, Enesei-Sibir, will be the largest in terms of land area as it will cover all of Siberian Russia, east of the Urals. This network will initially include 12 stations and has purchased time on

the Gorizont satellite so that it can distribute programming and facilitate communications among all of its stations

Internews has actively promoted the formation of networks through programs of technical assistance and training. By holding training sessions outside of Moscow, it has introduced station personnel to each other on a regional basis. This has helped to eliminate the isolation felt in individual stations and helped the stations to start to see common regional perspectives on the issues in the news.

Table 2 Regional Networks

Regional Networks	Number of Stations	Number of Viewers
UNIKA - Ukraine	18	30,000,000
Golden Dawn - Kazakhstan	16	6,380,000
Enesei-Sibir - Siberia	12	7,770,000
VEK - Volga/Urals Region	11	5,690,000

The International Media Center

The Center has been awaiting the renovation of its new building and the arrival of its new equipment before formally opening its doors. The new equipment arrived in January, and the Center expects to be up and running in March 1994.

During this time, the Center has started to develop its policies for grant-making and equipment usage. It continues to produce the weekly program, Windows, as well as sponsor the production of several other television documentaries. It works actively with the network UNIKA as well as a local independent press agency, UNIAN.

Elections Support

Internews brought in ten television stations from around the country -- Petrozavodsk, Krasnovarsk, Kaluga, Kazan, Novosibirsk, Tomsk, Ekaterinberg, Vladivostok, Nizhny Novogorod and Samara-- to a workshop in Moscow. At the workshop, two U.S.-based trainers were able to discuss how elections are covered in the U.S., leading into discussions about methods they have used and which they think may work. Because all of the stations were to sponsor debates, formats for debates, the setting of time limits, use of a moderator and the types of questions to be asked were discussed in great detail.

Seven of the ten stations continued their participation in the elections program by scheduling debates and other elections coverage. A few stations held call-in shows, while others experimented with different formats for the debates. Given the large numbers of candidates in some districts (up to 30), innovation was required to provide equal time for each.

After the elections were finished the seven stations that participated were visited by Internews consultants who conducted a technical assessment of the equipment needs of the stations. Based on this assessment the stations would receive cameras and other needed equipment for their studios from Internews. These assessments were going on as the evaluation was taking place and therefore no equipment had been ordered.

C Impact

Despite the short time it has been in operation the impact of the Internews program has been profound. It is helping structure the development of commercially-viable independent television in the NIS. With television in virtually all homes in the NIS, independent television stations are able to offer the only alternative to state controlled television news. As was seen during the siege on the Russian Parliament in October when state news was prevented from broadcasting, independent sources are needed.

Internews was successful in their work in the NIS because of the approach they developed in working with the stations. According to one station manager, this approach had three elements. Internews established themselves as partners with the stations through their training, they expected no revenues from the stations for their assistance and training, and they treated all stations as equals and did not act like a traditional Moscow organization trying to centralize power.

The impact of the Internews project can be traced through several levels. The first is the increase in skills of broadcast journalists. The next level is the effect of these individuals on programming in increasing the diversity of ideas that are presented to the public. The third level is the increased sustainability of independent television. The final level is the impact of the strengthened role of independent television in a changing society.

Increase in Skills of Broadcast Journalists

The first level of impact is the increase in skills of trained broadcast journalists within the NIS. Internews is providing some of the only broadcast journalism training to be found in the country outside of journalism schools. Most of the journalists that are working with independent television are young, energetic people who quit secure jobs with the state television (or never had jobs in television) to set up their own stations. While they have enthusiasm, they often lack professional training or degrees.

Through Internews training, they get practical, hands-on experience in reporting and developing television news stories. In the week-long training, they gain experience in developing, shooting, and producing several stories, some of which have made it onto the Local Time program. They learned new skills in interviewing, news production, editing, camera techniques, production equipment operation and teamwork development. The application of these new skills were evident in the technical process and programmatic changes that the journalists made when they returned home. Examples include the development of reporting teams instead of a lone journalist reporting, interviewing and doing the camera work, the use of more sophisticated camera shots and techniques, letting the video tell the story, rather than relying on straight narration, and developing a news division within the station.

Television journalists who participated in their program come to see themselves as part of a world wide journalistic process. When Internews has brought in internationally known figures from CNN or other American networks to their trainings, the participants feel that they are held to a different and higher standard of professionalism than they were in their previous jobs where they were seen as the mouthpiece of the state. Part of every Internews training focuses on ethical issues that may arise in reporting and asks the participants to struggle with how these ethical dilemmas might be met.

With 239 members of television crews going through Internews trainings from all parts of the NIS, their increased skills and knowledge are multiplied as each crew member returned to his or her home station and shared what they had learned with others at their station. The strategy of Internews has been to focus their efforts outside of Moscow and St. Petersburg, so that a local capability is gained throughout the NIS. This outward approach has allowed journalists to receive training, usually in a local station where they can meet other people with the same interests. With about 100 stations in the same number of cities receiving training, the impact is spread throughout the NIS.

Increase in Diversity of News and Ideas in the Media

The continuous production of both Local Time and Windows, the first for 1 year and the second for 43 episodes to date, has introduced independent local news without a Moscow-centered filter for the first time in NIS. Stories on local politics, environmental, social, and economic issues were essentially non-existent before these programs started. In sharing the news stories on a regional, national, and inter-NIS basis, viewers are able to hear and see what is happening not only in their city but around the NIS. And rather than dry statistics of agricultural production, the mainstay of the former television, these stories promote local interest as well as allow people to make connections between what they see and their local situation.

The networks formed by the stations make this even more available on a regional basis. In Ukraine, the local network UNIKA has been filming a program that they produced on Ukrainian history since the Revolution. Using archival footage, the program has been able to discuss what actually was happening in Ukraine during the past 80 years and how this was different from 'official' history. Other programs developed by the network have included privatization of land in the city, inflation, the division of the Black Sea fleet, AIDS, and a national press club program.

During the Russian elections, television stations produced the first debates among the candidates. Several stations had call-in programs for the candidates and reported that the phone lines were backed up with people trying to call in. Another station reported that partisans of one candidate were so upset that the station persisted in asking "hard" questions of their candidate, that they came down to the station to protest. The station filmed the protest and saw it as an indicator that they were doing their job. The elections broadcast gave stations the chance to learn about how to begin to cover elections and politics in a manner that would be interesting and informative to their viewers. As one station program manager said, 'People learned, in the elections, that free opinions equal independent television. Unlike state television, we tried to attract people to the idea of elections, not to a party or candidate.'

A series of AID funded documentaries exploring aspects of the Rule of Law on Russian television has received high viewership and interest. The first program on the constitution aired just before the December 12 constitutional referendum in Russia. The second program on human rights and the nationalities question in the Constitution aired in January.

The role of TV is to teach the people how to make choices. This statement of the Tomsk program manager sums up the goal of the independent television in the NIS. The democratic process depends on people making choices, choices that until recently were quite limited in the former Soviet Union. Whether they are political, economic, or social choices, the citizens in the NIS are faced with issues that they previously had no voice in or options to choose. Independent TV is one means for helping people to adjust to the new social and economic system that is upon them.

The increase in diversity of ideas comes from the training and support Internews has given to journalists. The young journalists who left the state system to begin independent television stations received training to improve the production of television news. However, improvement of production is not simply a matter of better camera techniques or fancier graphics on programs. The most important changes that have been seen from Internews training have been in the types of stories that are developed and the range of voices that are being expressed. Stories are being done on how local and national news events may affect or be experienced by average citizens. Other stories are starting to be developed that present a range of opinions, not just the opinion of the news broadcaster, as was done previously. Investigative reporting is being developed as a means of developing news, in contrast to simply presenting what might have been said at the government press conference.

Increased Sustainability of Independent Television

The Internews program is predicated on the establishment of commercially viable independent television. None of the television stations or networks is receiving grants or other funding. All funding is self-generated through commercials and program sponsors. Stations are limited, however, unless they can bring in sufficient revenues to cover their operations. According to station managers, Internews has been invaluable in their assistance in getting stations to a better financial footing. In one example, the station manager in Tomsk reported that the Internews training he received allowed him to develop and implement a business plan that made the station stronger financially.

Station managers commented that Internews has taught them development of financial plans, pricing their commercials more appropriately for different markets, and techniques for selling additional advertising. In addition, Internews helped facilitate the development of networks, in which broadcasters could sell programming to other stations.

Financial sustainability directly determines the types and amounts of programming that a station can produce and air. Only those stations on a sound basis, can afford to have significant local programming and local news production. Since most stations broadcast for only a few hours a day, the greater the revenue stream, the more programming can be produced and the longer the station can air. Virtually all stations that have attended the management seminars and received on site technical assistance have seen their revenues and programming grow. In Samara, the

station manager stated that a year ago he was looking for a foreign investor to buy his station. Now that his station is commercially viable, he has had to turn down offers from investors because he has decided to remain an independent voice.

As one station manager said, "If a person switches on the TV, I want it to be my station. If there isn't solid footing, you cannot express yourself." Yet he continued, "commercial success is not the goal. Our challenge is to fill the air with first-rate, high quality programs."

The networks play a key role in increasing self-sustainability through increasing programming. As the number of hours of programming increases, the opportunity to sell more advertising space grows proportionally. The Ukrainian network was able to allow stations to meet new regulations about the number of hours Ukrainian-originated programming had to be aired each week. With stations agreeing to share programming, they were able to meet the guidelines and stay on the air. In addition, through the network, they were able to make financial arrangements with other stations for program sharing. They accomplished this not by selling programming, since few stations have up-front cash to pay out, but by replacing other station's programs and paying a percentage of the revenues generated by commercials during the airing of the program.

The station managers and network people interviewed attributed much of their financial success directly to Internews. Through Internews training and technical assistance, the stations have gained the skills to increase their revenues and thus the quantity and quality of their broadcasting.

Strengthened Role of Independent Television in a Changing Society

The control of sources of information has broadened through independent television. Previously, there was one source of information--the state. Now there are many sources, from each station, as well as from stations and data sources outside of the NIS. And while Internews did not create independent television, it has facilitated its significant and rapid expansion in the NIS, according to station managers.

The influence of independent television is growing despite the level of resources that they can command compared to state television. State television is not unaware of the independents and is challenged by programs like Local Time and Windows. Ostankino, for instance, is starting to meet the challenge by not only broadcasting these programs on its own channels but also by starting to produce its own programming using the same sorts of ideas and techniques.

With the rapid growth of independent television, the ability of the government to completely close the present window of opportunity is lessened. While the station managers agree that the stations and the networks are not yet powerful enough to resist significant government pressure, too much has changed for the government to easily clamp down on these independent voices. As one manager put it, "Unless the tanks come in, there are too many stations, too widely dispersed for the government to stop their activities."

Independent television does not yet have its own unified voice to be heard, although several commentators thought this would emerge in the next several years. With more commercially viable stations and networks, independent television will be able to provide alternatives to the state and to challenge it if independent television interests are threatened.

D Grantee Future Directions

The future plans for Internews are to develop regional media centers based on the center in Kiev. These centers will provide equipment for independent journalists to use to produce their own programming for local television. In addition, the regional centers will greatly increase the network's ability to grow and produce more programming for its members.

4 MANAGEMENT

A Grant Management

Management by Internews

The NIS grant is managed from the Moscow Internews office. The staff have full authority to work within their budget and to schedule training seminars and technical assistance. Work is coordinated with the home office in Arcata, CA for special training sessions in the United States.

No major issues have arisen during the grant management. Despite Internews' inexperience in working with AID, they are a well managed project with few problems. Illustrative of this has been the relatively uncomplicated procurement of equipment both under the original grant and the International Media center grant. To date, about \$17 million of television production equipment had been procured and shipped to Moscow and Kiev without any delays.

The International Media Center is taking its charge to become self-sustaining in 3 years very seriously. It is developing business plans for the use of its facilities and for developing policies and fee schedules for the use of equipment.

Management by AID

AID has maintained a hands-off management approach appropriate to this grant. While this approach has been very workable for this grantee, on occasion there has been some confusion as Internews has forged its independent approach. On occasion, there has been some minor confusion over gaining country clearance when Internews has come into a country on USIA or Soros Foundation money. And since Internews has received some money from USIA and has been involved in some programs with the State Department directly, AID has sometimes felt that it was not properly informed about activities related to these entities.

And as with other grantees, AID/W and the field missions do not always communicate well with each other, sometimes leaving the grantee responsible for talking to Washington and the field. Internews has had to provide the field missions with copies of quarterly reports because they are not regularly received from Washington.

5 CONCLUSIONS

1 Internews was able to quickly set up their office and staff their project in the NIS. The two offices in Moscow and Kiev are primarily staffed by Russians and Ukrainians respectively giving the office a solid grounding in the country.

2 The training program developed for broadcast journalists and station managers was well designed, speedily implemented, and achieved its objectives. Internews was able to train significantly more people than originally proposed and reached a broad coverage in stations throughout Russia, Ukraine, Kazakhstan, and Belarus.

3 The stations that participated in the Internews management training were able to apply the skills learned to their stations and reported increased revenue flow and viability.

4 The two programs arising from the Internews project, Local Time and Windows, have raised the standards of broadcast journalism in the NIS, helped promote increased news production capacity at about 40 stations throughout the NIS, and helped to develop increased viewership for independent television. These programs are available to a combined viewing audience of 100 million.

5 The formation of independent television networks has increased the viability of individual stations, increased the flow of news across regions and countries, and set up a vehicle for sharing programming and resources. Internews encouraged the development of the networks through its promotion of joint program development and through training sessions held in cities around the NIS and inviting other regional stations to attend these sessions.

6 The support and production of documentaries and other news programs around the constitution and elections in Russia has expanded the capabilities of journalists, and promoted independent discussion of ideas.

7 In a very short time, Internews has managed to facilitate the beginnings of an independent alternative to the state controlled television in the NIS.

8 The Kiev International Media Center offers a model for expansion of the Internews program in the NIS, by providing regional centers for television production and the development of independent media.

9 The approach that Internews has taken might be called a free market democratic approach-commercial viability is the key to independent media. Through this uniquely American approach, self-sustaining television is developed, without relying on grants and the provision of equipment to every possible station. With a relatively small amount of money (compared to the amount of money that might be needed to fund the hundreds of stations that exist in the NIS), Internews has been able to identify some key financial and program management constraints at the stations and has quickly responded to overcome those constraints.

6 RECOMMENDATIONS

1 Continue the expansion of its successful training programs to additional stations in the NIS. To do this, Internews should develop a program for reaching down to the next level of stations that are characterized by very low overheads. These stations are inherently more risky, but with the appropriate level of training and technical assistance they will be able to grow.

2 Increase the availability of programming as articulated by the stations and networks. By utilizing its worldwide contact, Internews might be able to broker greater availability of outside programming under terms that bring it within the limited means of the current stations with which it is working.

4 Sponsor a conference to discuss the expansion of the role of stations and networks in developing a lobbying and public information function to monitor government media activities and regulations. While the stations and networks are not yet strong enough to be on equal terms with the government and state-controlled television, establishing a forum for the independent stations is an important goal over the next several years to begin this effort.

5 The media center approach that is being developed in Ukraine appears to be a good model for Internews to experiment with in other NIS countries and regions within Russia. This self-sustaining model should help to increase programming options, permit access to scarce equipment, and help promote independent journalism, away from Moscow. In the context of these centers, special efforts could be made to train independent producers who are not served by current station-oriented programs.

6 Coordinate program efforts with other NGOs to help them gain access to independent media. While it is not Internews' responsibility to secure time for NGOs, it can act as a facilitator between the stations, independent journalists, and NGOs. The development of local programming may be served by coordinating media resources, making contacts, and developing models for increasing NGO access to commercial television.

APPENDIX A LIST OF PEOPLE INTERVIEWED

Internews

Manana Aslamazvan Executive Director
Dora Chomiak IMC Director
Mykola Kniazysky, Electronic Media Division Director
Claudette Lemon Accountant
Helen Malmgren Elections Consultant
Vincent Malmgren, Field Representative
Deborah Mendelsohn NIS Project Director
Dan Wagner Training Consultant

Station and Network Personnel

Oleg Kaciev KTV Almaty
Sergi Malkov, TV-2, Tomsk
Igor Mishin Channel 4 Ekaterinberg
Andrei Vdovin SKaT, Samara
Vasyl Yatsura, UNIKA TV, Kiev
Victor Zima TV-2, Tomsk

USAID

James Norris Mission Director, Moscow
Terry McMahon Mission Director, Kiev
Craig Buck Mission Director Almaty
Jonathan Addleton, Program officer, Almaty
Jeanne Burgeault Project Officer, Moscow
Patricia Buckles, Deputy director, Almaty
Paula Feenev, General Development Officer, Almaty
Ann Nesterczuk, Project Officer, Moscow

AID/Washington

Julie Allaire-McDonald
Paul Ashin, Social Scientist
Nick Beim
Geraldine Donnelly
Jeff Evans
Carlos Pascual
Mary Ann Riegelman
Paul Holmes

APPENDIX B REFERENCES

A Background

- Carruthers Ian and Robert Chambers, Rapid Appraisal for Rural Development *Agricultural Administration* 5 (1981) 407-422
- Diamond Larry Juan J Linz and Seymour Martin Lipset, eds *Politics in Developing Countries Comparing Experiences with Democracy* (Boulder CO Lynne Rienner Publishers)
- Farer Tom J, "Elections Democracy, and Human Rights Towards Union," *Human Rights Quarterly* 11 (1989) 504-521
- Huber Evelyn Dietrich Rueschmeyer and John D Stephens, 'The Impact of Economic Growth on Democracy,' *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 7, no 3 (1993) 71-85
- Kusterer, Ken "On Democratization What is it, how is it encouraged, and how is its progress measured?" The American Univ Department of Sociology, August 1992
- Ponomarev Lev "The Democratic Russia Movement Myths and Reality," *Demokratizatsiya* 1 no 4 (1993) 15-20
- Roberts, Brad ed, *The New Democracies Global Change and US Policy* A Washington Quarterly Reader (Cambridge, MA The MIT Press, 1990)
- Sirovy, Larry, and Alex Inkeles, "The Effects of Democracy on Economic Growth and Inequality A Review,' *Studies in Comparative International Development* 25, no 1 (1990) 126-157
- Sorensen Georg, *Democracy and Democratization* (Boulder, CO Westview Press)
- Yergin, Daniel, and Thane Gustafson, *Russia 2010* (New York Random House, 1993)
- Zlobin, Vasily I, "Is There any Hope for Russian Political Parties?," *Demokratizatsiya* 1, no 4 (1993) 22-30

B Agency for International Development

Building Democracy USAID's Strategy '

Haggard Stephen Democracy and Economic Growth Paper prepared for the Democratic Pluralism Initiative, 15 June 1990

Hansen Gary, 'Designing and Evaluating Democracy Programs State of the Art,' *AID Evaluation News* 1992, No 3 9-10

Hansen Garv, AID Support for Democracy A Review of Experience, Interim Report," Center for Development Information and Evaluation, June 1991

Project Memorandum, New Independent States Democratic Pluralism Initiatives (110-0007), Authorized April 10, 1992, and Amendment No 1 to the Project Memorandum, Approved February 3, 1993

Ukraine U S Technical Assistance Strategy," Discussion Draft 11/9/93

U S Technical Assistance to Russia," Edition 11/13/93

C Internews

Action Plan 1993-1996, International Media Center in Kiev, Internews

Elections Training Project Report, Internal Internews Report, Moscow

Final Training Report, Internal Internews Report, Moscow

Grant Agreement Letters and Amendments

The International Media Center, Internews Publication, Kiev

Internews Newsletter, Arcata, CA, December 1993

Non-Governmental TV Production in Ukraine, UNIKA, Kiev

Non-Governmental Television in Siberia, Trip Report Ekaterinberg to Vladivostok, Internal Internews Report, March 1993

Project of International Independent Television Information Exchange, UNIKA, Kiev

Quarterly Report for Independent Television News for the Former Soviet Union, AID Grant Number CCS-0007-G-00-2034-00, for 30 June - 30 September 1992

Quarterly Report for Independent Television News for the Former Soviet Union AID Grant Number CCS-0007-G-00-2034-00, for 1 October - 31 December 1992

Quarterly Report for Independent Television News for the Former Soviet Union AID Grant Number CCS-0007-G-00-2034-00, for 1 January - 31 March 1993

Quarterly Report for Independent Television News for the Former Soviet Union, AID Grant Number CCS-0007-G-00-2034-00, for 1 April - 30 June 1993

Quarterly Report for Independent Television News for the Former Soviet Union, AID Grant Number CCS-0007-G-00-2034-00, for 30 June - 30 September 1993

Quarterly Report for the International Media Center, AID Grant Number CCN-0007-G-00-3103-00, for 1 July - 30 September 1993