

11'
17
PD-AAW-387
1978-5298

Executive Summary

This document reports the findings of a mid-term evaluation of an AID Matching Grant to the US YMCA International Division. The three-year grant for \$980,000 a year was made in October 1978 and is in two roughly equal parts, for institution building and for project support. The primary purpose of the grant is to improve the quality of life of poor people in Asian, Latin American and African Less Developed Countries.

The evaluation was conducted at the request of AID by International Division personnel assisted by a consultant retained to make specific case or country studies. These studies are incorporated in the body of the report. Following this summary is a more detailed presentation of observations and recommendations and a short statement of personal observations by the consultant. The body of the evaluation report follows these summary statements.

The World Council of the YMCA in the Declarations of Nottingham (1969) and Kampala (1973) committed the institution to increased efforts in community development for the purpose of improving the social and economic conditions of poor people in developing countries. The YMCA has since moved into social and economic development with admirable enthusiasm and dedication and generally successful results.

The results measured by the number and effectiveness of development projects at the national and local levels are particularly impressive. Although many in number, they tend to be small

in scale, community centered, volunteer-staffed, and locally managed. They have reached the very poor and especially the children and youth. By any measure of economic efficiency they are most frugal.

Funds expended for institutional support at the national and local levels also have produced marked results in the number and quality of development personnel employed. Typically these appointments are in the capacity of national development director, or project director. At the area organization level (Asia Area Committee, Africa Alliance, Latin American Confederation), however, the results have been spotty and in general less impressive. While the Latin American Confederation receives high marks for competence and support of national development programs, the Asia and Africa groups do not, and some of the analysis in the following report is devoted to improving their performance. Institutional support funds expended in the International Division have financed the salaries of liaison representatives to two of the area organizations, an essential function, and certain central office personnel in New York. Too much may have been used for New York salaries, but this is being changed in 1981.

By and large, support to the national movements from the area organizations and the World Alliance has been in training programs and project funding assistance. Staff of the three area organizations have spent a significant part of their time

conducting development and leadership training programs. These have been general and motivational and seem to have accomplished their objective. But the time has come for more technical and case-oriented training and for this purpose YMCA personnel at the area organization and World Alliance levels must themselves be better trained in development practice.

Although that part of the Matching Grant funds designated for institution building has been expended on schedule, or perhaps a bit ahead, the project funds have been underutilized. This is due largely, but not entirely, to resentment in some countries of the AID audit provision in the document of understanding required to be signed by sub-recipients. Although the work could go forward under the present DOU requirements, expenditures would be slower than planned and unbalanced among nations. A happy resolution of this issue would greatly facilitate project financing.

It has become clear to those who made this evaluation that there is need to strengthen the YMCA's worldwide organization for development at the higher levels. The strength and vitality of the YMCA derive from local autonomy and popular volunteerism. It has a weak and constrained hierarchy, largely depending on local units for support. Attitudinal variations within the institution from country to country are sometimes extreme, particularly with reference to the development process. These factors increase the difficulties of mounting coherent development activities. They should be offset with more qualified development personnel and more clearly defined general policies to guide the regional, national and

local units in their development activities. Specifically, to become a fully mature agency of social and economic development the YMCA requires further internal growth and strengthening in five dimensions: policy, organization, management systems, education and communications.

The evaluation report traces the use of AID funds to determine their effectiveness in strengthening the institution for development work and their utilization for project support. The conclusion arrived at is that the institution has been most strengthened at the national level and the funds so used have had impressive results. At higher levels the results have been spotty, but promising. Project funds, to the extent they have been utilized, have been wisely and frugally used and with very few exceptions appear to have accomplished their objectives.

YMCA MATCHING GRANT EVALUATION REPORT FINDINGS —
OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Since the Nottingham (1969) and Kampala (1973) declarations, which accelerated the involvement of the YMCA worldwide movement in social and economic development programs, deep and pervasive changes have been taking place at all levels of the institution. Although many of these changes have not been consistent in substance, method or intensity around the YMCA world, they are motivated by a common philosophy and purpose: "to improve the social and economic conditions of poor people in developing countries". An overview of YMCA development programs reveals both strengths and weaknesses, in addition to significant regional and national differences in ideology and approach.

difficulties

While the YMCA has moved into socio-economic development with admirable enthusiasm and dedication, it has perhaps bitten off too quickly more than it can chew well, for, in many respects development work is more demanding of the institution than more traditional YMCA programs. It is generally agreed that the strength and vitality of the movement derive largely from local autonomy, indigenous leadership and popular community-based volunteerism. It has a weak and constrained hierarchy, largely depending on local units for support. Attitudinal variations within this large and diverse movement are sometimes extreme, particularly with reference to the development process. These factors increase the difficulties of mounting coherent development activities. This is not to argue that the YMCA is the wrong organization to take on development work.

Quite the contrary. The YMCA is a community development agency and has a rich history of promoting "human development". It goes to development work naturally, like a duck to water.

Development Work at the National and Local YMCA Levels

The strongest single impression one derives from this ^{Commitment} ~~evalu-~~ ~~ation~~ process is that the national and local YMCAs are committed to social and economic development and have mounted extensive development programs. The nature of these programs is quite different from country to country, in response to local needs and opportunities. The Case Studies support this impression. In the Philippines the work has centered on community self-help programs, especially related to agriculture, physical infrastructure, and cottage production. In Kenya the central theme has been village child-care centers and handicraft and vocational training. In Colombia the majority of projects relate to remedial education at the elementary and high school level and to family services.

Some general judgements can be made regarding the ^{Projects} quality of the eighteen projects and programs financed by the MG and examined individually in the text of this report (see "Modified Logical Framework" review of country programs and projects). The projects are small in scale and generally benefit, both directly and indirectly, a large number of people for a relatively small amount of money. Local contributions and the use of local resources are prevalent.

The projects are spread out often involving several localities (e.g., villages, branch Y's) under one project. Maximum community concensus and participation in regard to decision making and implementation characterize these projects. The projects suffer most from the poor quality of local management systems including

project planning and design, record keeping, adequate quantifiable baseline data to permit evaluation and increase possibilities for repeating the project, etc. (Management and information collection functions will be examined further in other sections of this report.) Projects with economic incidence, both MG and non-MG supported projects, have a good record of continuing, becoming self-sustaining, and often spreading (for example: Bangladesh, India, Ghana, Kenya, Senegal, Philippines, Costa Rica, etc.).

The MG projects reflect the areas of program concentration stated in the MG proposal: youth employment, concept testing, increasing human resources and indigenous management capacity. To address the concern for improved local management many of the national as well as area projects are oriented to short term workshops, seminars, and programs involving training and education for development for both laymen and staff. Although differing from country to country the type of projects include the following: non-formal and formal education for adults, youth, and children (pre-school); literacy training; health and nutrition; community organization; vocational training and related job creation programs; cottage industries; small enterprise development; youth cooperatives; rural development - gardening and generally small livestock production; refugee rehabilitation and resettlement work; development planning, feasibility and market studies, etc.

The projects function in both urban and rural areas seeking participants from among the poorest of the poor, the disadvantaged and neglected. The projects and programs financed by the MG have generally achieved their stated objectives, have contributed to the MG purpose of expanding the YMCA worldwide development program,

and have certainly contributed to the local YMCAs reputation and impact in meeting the needs of the local community.

Many of the YMCA's development programs and projects have been started in the last four or five years and have shown substantial growth over that period. In many cases they are outgrowths of earlier YMCA activities. Traditionally the YMCA has operated "human development" programs, and this experience has provided the underlying motivation and entree to launch more vigorous socio-economic development programs. The network of local YMCA community institutions existed. The traditional YMCA organization, relying heavily on volunteerism, was well suited to the participatory nature of community development work. Voluntary Development Committees were formed (members of the YMCA Board of Directors, elected by the membership, serve on YMCA committees) to make the development policy that YMCA professional staff carry out. The growth of national development departments and the employment of full-time development personnel resulted largely from the availability of DPG and MG funding. The people at this level, the national and local development officers, are key to the total process and are among the most able and dedicated. The creation of the Africa Alliance, the Asia Area Development Fund, and the four sub-regions or zones of the Latin American Confederation, coincided with, and were fundamentally motivated by the national movements' need for development programs and services. The YMCA commitment to development was stated in general terms at the World Council meetings in Nottingham and Kampala. The process of institutional growth toward development has also been stimulated by a number of external social, economic, and political factors which must of course effect a "people participatory" agency such as the YMCA (e.g., the N.I.E.O./North South Dialogue, etc.).

factors

AID

which

Three Area Organizations

The three major area organizations studied — The Asia Area Committee, The Africa Alliance, and The Latin American Confederation differ from each other in more ways than not. (The Caribbean, Middle East and Southern Europe were not studied by the consultant.) All three areas seem ambivalent about their authority and responsibility relationships to the World Alliance as against the national movements. The Asia Area Committee states that it is a creature of the World Alliance. The Africa Alliance says it is a creature of the African national YMCAs and represents them to the World Alliance.

The Latin American Confederation, founded in 1914, prior to the World Alliance, is well established and strong in human and financial resources. There are no OPGs in Latin America, and the U.S. YMCA finds little need for a full-time Liaison Representative. Monitoring and evaluation of field projects is conducted through field visits and by maintaining communication with the LAC development offices and directly with the national movements receiving U.S. YMCA support. The LAC is constituted from and respected by the national movements and has a long history of achievements. The Case-Study in this report also reflects the LAC's level of sophistication and capability to undertake and backstop development programs.

*grew from
fractured
movements
1914
bottom up
is present
in 1914*

The Asia Area Committee represents a wide range and diversity of national movements, and is now in the process of restructuring its staff and procedures to better serve the scope of the YMCA movement in Asia. There are four OPGs operating in Asia, and

the U.S. Liaison Representative has been indispensable in providing direct technical support, field evaluations, training, funding source relations, administrative resources, and so forth, to these and a number of other country programs.

The Africa Alliance is newly born and depends almost entirely on non-African support for survival. Although this is understandable, caution should be taken to avoid an ongoing dependency by developing a plan for how and when a greater percentage of essential operating costs can be financed from within Africa, at African scale, and from non-U.S. sources. Yet for development work the Africa Alliance requires more resources. The U.S. Liaison Representative, one of the two AA staff, serves only East Africa and is relatively new to the field of development work.

These differences in area organizations largely reflect the history of the YMCA throughout the world and the relative level of socio-economic development of these areas.

Operational Support to the National Movements

By and large, the major support received by the National movements from the area organizations and the World Alliance has been of two kinds: training programs and project funding assistance. Since the World Council made its commitment to development, practically every training program for mid and upper-level professional YMCA personnel in the third world has had development on the agenda and a very large number have been devoted to development exclusively. Staff of the three area organizations have spent a significant part of their time conducting development and leadership training programs at their own headquarters and in the field. National development directors

have in turn preached development at workshops and conferences in their countries. There is no doubt that the word has effectively reached all levels of the YMCA that they are to extend themselves in development activities.

On the average, however, these training programs have been general and motivational rather than specific, technical or case-oriented, how-to-do-it, workshops. They are fine as far as they have gone, but the time has come for more specific help. The short-term workshops or weekend seminar approach to development training is simply no longer adequate to provide the development theory and conceptual base, the specialized technical skills or financial and operational management skills needed for YMCA development programs which continue increasing in scope, number and complexity. By now there are many case histories of successful YMCA development programs that could be drawn upon for teaching materials. More comprehensive education for development could be organized with careful selection and design of curricula and with a clear and relevant application to current YMCA field work. As Fernando Llossa, the LAC director for development put it, "our development programs are going at 100 kilometers per hour, and our training programs at 20 kilometers per hour".

The area organizations, and especially the LAC, and the World Alliance have extensive contacts with funding organizations, both public and private, in the wealthier nations and they have frequently forwarded national proposals to these funding sources for consideration. In some cases they have rewritten the proposals and represented the national YMCA with the funding organization. They have been quite successful in this work especially in countries such as Germany, Canada, Sweden, Holland and Norway.

In addition to brokerage the World Alliance provides operational support through the following functions: providing relevant information; convening groups; facilitating communication; representing the YMCA world movement; and coordinating common efforts.

In addition to the need to upgrade existing training programs the World Alliance may be looked to for leadership in elaborating or synthesizing a YMCA development theory, policies, or principles; and strategically related to this an information network which monitors institutional growth in development, a means for determining YMCA development issues occurring in the field, and a plan to standardize evaluation methodologies and possibly data collection techniques. Furthermore, the communication function of the World Alliance could be improved by upgrading the quality of publications with a greater focus on practical aspects of development work; by providing a greater volume of referral and reprint services (updating the library); and bringing current such publications as the 1977 "YMCAs of the World" which offers an excellent country by country overview of YMCA programs. Several useful development publications have been produced by the W.A. (e.g., "The Development Kit", "Focus on Development" in the World Communique, and so forth).

In addition to support received directly from the World Alliance and through area structures, the national YMCAs of Asia and to a lesser extent Africa, have received development program assistance from the U.S. YMCA International Division Representative. The work of the Liaison Representative, outlined earlier in this report, is the kind of practical managerial and

technical assistance the smaller national YMCAs and local units need. The Liaison Representatives are part of the Operational Support Services of the U.S. Intermovement Support and Development Assistance Unit. Although there is currently no representative stationed in West Africa this position was filled until 1980 by Moses Perry who continues to backstop projects in Africa as part of his larger headquarters function for this unit. Steve La Vake also served as a Liaison Representative to Senegal directing a major development project cooperatively sponsored with the Government of Senegal and financed largely by AID (\$1.7 million OPG for V.T.C.). Jim Poole continues to provide liaison and development assistance services in East Africa. The Operational Support Unit through field visits and communication provides a range of financial and program management support services involving project design, specific evaluation exercises and project redirection, financial administration including audit and arranging for independent audit as appropriate, technical support and information referrals.

There is no doubt that the YMCA should improve and increase the technical backstopping it provides the national and local units from the World Alliance, area offices and the U.S. International Division. Upgrading training programs, providing useful technical information and contacts, and making specialists and consultants available as needed are some avenues for future improvements.

A View From the Summit

At this point it may be useful to review AIDs contribution to the overall world YMCA program. Through the DPG and the MG,

AID has contributed in a well targeted fashion to the process of institutional growth toward a YMCA worldwide development program. Due to the many direct and indirect inputs, the total expenditures for ymca development programs and services from a worldwide perspective can only be approximated. For 1980 such an overview demonstrating the relative impact of AID funding can be estimated as follows:

- | | |
|---|--------------|
| 1) U.S. Intermovement Support and Development Assistance Unit (to national, area, and W.A.) | |
| a. World Service | \$968,987 |
| b. Matching Grant | 747,693 |
| 2) U.S. International Division (total: including full amount for partially related functions) | \$7,000,000 |
| 3) U.S. National Board of YMCAs (including non-development related functions/30% estimated in support of International Division) | \$21,000,000 |
| 4) World Alliance: Estimated amount for program only through W.A. books i.e. from major donor movements or directly transferred from donor agency (direct international donor agency funds to YMCAs only partially included. See W.A. section of report). | \$2,559,344 |
| 5) AID through DPG (total \$1,578,000); MG (to date \$1,291,447); and through OPGs (funds obligated to u.s. YMCA as grantee from 1972 to present - see exhibit in annex). | \$6,299,480 |

These global figures do not include indigenous sources from developing countries nor local YMCA cash or in-kind participation which is a significant amount. Despite dramatic development program growth the MG has funded a relatively small amount of the total. AID funds have funded a relatively small amount of the total. AID funds have contributed largely to the essential and prerequisite institution building specifically in terms of human resource development and management capability. The U.S. YMCA MG program is particular underspent in the area of country programs and projects, while the "Worldwide Network" and expenditures for institutional support are slightly overspent. There are several reasons for this imbalance as detailed elsewhere in this report.

In the most general terms the evaluation finds that the MG program must be made leaner at the top. For example, the MG should finance only those functions, and the percentage of those functions, which relate directly to overseas development programs. Likewise, other "network" functions involving the areas must directly and effectively trace support to specific country benefits. It is at the national and local YMCA level that development takes place, and where the YMCA is the strongest. All MG resources must, in the end, benefit the national YMCA movement ^(No!) and local projects. MG funds for specific country programs and projects must be unlocked in all the areas, and both the area structures and World Alliance must provide leadership and organizational management if Worldwide Network support is provided and if the YMCA is to have a coherent program relating this support to national and local YMCAs and "improvement in the quality of life for poor people in Asia, Africa and Latin America."

A Major Obstacle

Consultations, correspondence and reports are among the means which can be cited to verify and underscore what is perhaps the single most important obstacle affecting all the areas and preventing the full MG expenditure on country programs and projects. Many national movements have refused to sign the "Document of Understanding" required for the MG because of the AID right to audit provision governing "subrecipient" grants. Following are quotes from the October 24 letter to the AID administrator from the Chairman of the YMCA Intermovement Support and Development Assistance Committee (complete letter in annex):

"The National Board of Young Men's Christian Associations requests that A.I.D. agree to delete that portion of the terms of its matching grant which reserves to A.I.D.'s Auditor General and to the Comptroller General the right to conduct audits of subrecipients from the National Board." (p.1)

"The subrecipients are all private, independent national or local YMCAs in various developing countries. They are in turn grouped loosely in regional associations, and they are, like the National Board, members of the independent world-wide YMCA movement headquartered in Geneva. Most have strong objections to any agreement which would authorize their operations to be audited or evaluated by the United States Government. Members of A.I.D.'s staff have heard directly the strength of these objections, most recently at a Honolulu conference of Asian YMCAs" (p.1)

"The National Board has learned that it cannot carry out the intent of the matching grant with the present audit clause intact. Although it might be able, without being imprudent, to expend most of the funds intended for subgrants by limiting such subgrants to those YMCAs willing to accept the present audit clause, the result would skew the program towards relatively few YMCAs in one or two regions and defeat the worldwide objectives both of A.I.D. and of the National Board." (p.3)

Although the possibility of an AID audit of this type is slight, the principle remains, and in a sensitive area serves as a red flag for many national movements. Consequently, area organizations are reluctant to interpret and promote the MG program to member movements. Related to the right to audit provision is AID's evaluation and monitoring of subrecipients which involves the same principle. AID's direct involvement with management functions for the MG program should, in our opinion, be

minimized and consist primarily of reviewing reports and of site visits. Favorable resolution of this question would greatly increase MG support to country programs and projects.

A Plan to Further Strengthen the Institution

There is a need for further institutional strengthening of the YMCAs worldwide development effort, especially at the higher levels of the organization, with qualified development personnel and for more clearly defined general policies to guide the regional, national and local units in their development activities. Specifically, to become a more effective agency for social and economic development the YMCA requires internal growth and strengthening in the following five dimensions: 1) theory, 2) organization, 3) management, 4) education, and 5) communication.

1) Theory of Development:

The Nottingham and Kampala statements provide a very broad declaration of intention regarding development programs, but they do not contain the principles or rationale to support a structured theory of action. Is there, or should there be, a YMCA style of development? What, really, is the meaning of development in the YMCA? How does "human development" relate to social development, and to political action? At the national level one can infer, from observing the programs launched, a set of underlying principles in operation which would include the concepts of: self-help, eventual self-support, community representation and participation, replicability, starting small, people orientation, broad-based and comprehensive in scope - "the whole person" and

the entire village - consistency with national development plans and objectives, and so forth. The concept of urban-rural integration for development, as used in the YMCA, requires further delineation. Does this mean rural and urban exchanges, rural-urban linkages, urban to rural extension, all of the above?

Should not these and other YMCA ideas be pulled together into a structured theory, illustrated and explained? Once again, the World Alliance could provide leadership in meeting this important challenge.

2) Organization and Planning for Development:

There is a need for a clear concept of how best to structure the YMCA from the World Alliance to the local level to achieve its development purposes. The DPG and MG have sought to integrate development programs within the mainstream of YMCA programming. This should not imply however, that the specific needs of development work be diluted or in any way ignored. In this regard the use of outside personnel, particularly for training and specific projects, should be considered. The US ID must also review its relationship to the development organization and evolution of the area offices.

Financial planning for support of the development effort seems to be lacking. What will happen to externally supported staff and other essential institutional costs when the support period ends. Institutional planning is needed both at the area level (e.g., Africa), and for many movements receiving general support through the World Service program of the Intermovement Support and Development Assistance Unit.

3) Management Systems for Development:

With respect to development programs, the YMCA should establish better systems for planning, defining objectives, record keeping, evaluation, reporting, and financial and legal management. There should be handbooks on these subjects and more and better training programs at all levels.

Data collection systems need to be improved, especially at the World Alliance and area levels, to provide mutually acceptable standards for gathering and exchanging information. Regular and more specific reports should be required as a condition for funding salaries at the area level. Within the US ID project management methods should be standardized and consistent regardless of the donor. Allocations of any type should have a project period or specific time frame, and should have progress indicators and be evaluable. Program financial planning should be required to prevent perpetual dependence on outside funding.

A greater effort is needed to determine the accumulated effect or trend of country programs and general progress in the field of development. Current reports from national/local YMCA and area representatives provide quantifiable data. However, these numbers should be synthesized or capsulized for easy status report reference of project progress and be marked over time and verified by field visits. Measuring the growth of development might be facilitated by a simple Activity Progress Report Form and by using consistent progress indicators which collect that data indicative of the whole, such as the following:

- A) Time accounting or number of person/days area staff have spent on development;
- B) Number of projects with comparison to total expenditures, and number of participants;
- C) Number of projects replicated;
- D) The community perception of the YMCA programs.

This process will collect the type of data needed for an impact evaluation at a country level, or a policy or institutional evaluation at a headquarters level. Such comprehensive evaluation exercises need to be undertaken periodically, and are particularly useful at the juncture, beginning or end, of a major grant period, World Council meeting, and so forth. Such an evaluation would examine in detail the organizational, planning and management systems for development programs which this report mentions.

4) Education for Development:

The volume of development activities in the YMCA has outgrown the competence of many of the development personnel. The gifted amateur will soon have to be replaced or trained to become a development professional. Not every YMCA secretary is qualified to conceive and manage development programs. Specific education is needed at all levels and should begin at the top. As mentioned earlier in this report, training and education for development are prerequisite and key to increased institutional capacity for development work. Specialized technical skills, financial and operational development management skills, and a more comprehensive program of education for development are required to meet the current and growing YMCA demand for these skills.

Not unrelated to education for development is "Development Education" or the need for increased involvement of the U.S. YMCA constituency directly in the development process. Training programs offer the forum and the skills for building two-way development or partnership relations. A vast amount of development case materials is accumulating in the national and local YMCAs. This can be brought to the training sessions for analysis and laboratory material. Development secretaries who have learned some lessons the hard way could pass these on to others.

5) Communication:

Finally, communications are essential both within the movement and with the outside world. Even within a country it is not uncommon for one major YMCA not to know what the other YMCAs are doing. Improvement in communication facilities is particularly needed at the World Alliance and area levels. Upgrading the quality and distribution of a regular medium to inform the movement of its own development activities and promote feedback would be useful. Other forms of communication also need further study (e.g., films, television, and so forth). The YMCA needs to better inform itself and the world of its development achievements.

Recapitulation of Observations and Recommendations

(1) Relationship to and performance of the Areas:

Each area is distinct and therefore no sweeping generalization can be made. The LAC development program and management capabilities are strong, and with favorable resolution of the "AID right to audit" question, and development of a still stronger working relationship with the U.S. YMCA(s), a significant expansion of the Intermovement Support and Development Assistance program, including the MG, can be anticipated. The A.A. requires additional support in terms of financial resources directed toward development, and upgrading of staff development management skills. A new relationship with the AAC and AYDF should be explored which enables those national movements seeking U.S. YMCA technical and financial support to effectively receive it. Each of the areas need to focus still more attention on the practical development services and benefits they are providing national and local YMCAs;

(2) Training:

Education for Development and operational management training programs need to be specialized, more comprehensive and generally upgraded across the board - particularly for national development directors and regional staff;

(3) The World Alliance should be looked to for leadership in articulating a YMCA development philosophy and policies, a more effective information network, practical technical support services and relevant development publications;

(4) AID counsel, review, site visits and general cooperation must continue in a manner that avoids direct AID involvement in YMCA program management or specific areas of U.S. YMCA responsibility, e.g. subrecipient relations including audits and field evaluations;

(5) The level of MG support to U.S. YMCA "Operational Support" functions must be limited and applied only to the extent that these functions are related to the purpose and development objectives of the MG. Institutional or "impact" evaluations must be conducted periodically in an effort to determine the accumulated effect of the U.S. YMCA development program over time. Project review, financial planning, and data collection system should be improved. World Service or general intermovement support allocations need a more "evaluable" purpose and specific time frame to avoid creating possible ongoing institutional dependencies. Recipients, of any type of support, not strictly adhering to agreed upon conditions should not continue receiving support; and donor responsibility related to this "support" should be as equally distributed as possible in the true spirit of "cooperation".

(6) General improvement in hardware and software communication systems, and publications particularly at World Alliance and regional levels, is clearly needed.

Consultant's Observations

Although the consultant collaborated in writing the preceding general paper on the Evaluation Report Findings and concurs in the observations and recommendations made there, he felt the need to present some additional personal and subjective observations in a separate statement. Nothing here contradicts what was written above; differences, where they exist, are in emphasis and in the strength of impressions. The consultant's view is from the outside looking in and, although less panoramic than that of the International Division staff, it focuses sharply on specific issues and experiences.

The purpose of the case studies by the consultant was to establish the degree of improvement that has taken place in the capability of indigenous YMCAs in developing countries to launch and manage development programs and to measure the institutional strengthening of the relevant area offices in their support of these development activities. The consultant was asked also to trace the impact of AID funding in this process of growth and change.

Three countries and three area offices were visited: The Philippines and the Asia Area Committee; Kenya and the Africa Alliance; Colombia and the Latin American Confederation. Reports of these visits are included in full in the Matching Grant Evaluation Report. In each evaluation, whether country or area, the consultant sought information about three essential indicators: personnel (number and qualifications of persons

involved in development work); budget (amount of funds expended on development relative to total expenditures); programs (number and magnitude of development programs and projects). First-hand information was gathered about these matters by site visits and interviews. Based on the studies, the consultant ventures certain general observations.

1.) The YMCA definition of "development" is not the same as that of AID. There are differences on two levels. The more general use of the term development in the YMCA means institutional growth, or expansion of the movement — increase in the number of YMCA units, in their budgets, programs, participants and members. Since it is usually argued that expanding and strengthening the YMCA movement in developing countries must precede increased involvement of indigenous YMCAs in social and economic development programs, some of the DPG and MG funds have been used in support of executives engaged in development work of this broad definition. At another level, a second YMCA definition of development means "human development" in the fullest sense, both social and personal. This definition includes the AID concept of equitable social and economic growth to improve the living conditions of poor people, but goes beyond it to include the concept of balanced individual growth — physical, mental and moral. Society is after all the sum of its individuals. Under this definition of development athletic facilities can hardly be excluded (although none have been funded under the DPG or MG).

One can argue indefinitely the merits of pursuing development under these various definitions and AID may feel that it wishes to support the YMCA in all its "development" work in poor countries,

but while ambiguities remain, grant evaluations such as this cannot be fully conclusive. In the observations that follow the consultant is using the AID definition of development.

2.) The consultant is deeply impressed by the vigor and extent of development programs at the national and local levels in the three countries visited. The case studies speak for themselves. So much is being accomplished with so little! Most of the programs are of fairly recent origin, having been started since the World Council's call to the worldwide movement to engage in social and economic development.

3.) The consultant is equally impressed with the suitability of the YMCA as a community development organization. It has all the qualifications for success in this work: village and rural units, indigenous management, popular voluntary support, community leadership, non-political, no church affiliation, and the habit of frugality.

4.) Paradoxically, there seems to be no relationship in the cases studied between the quality of national development efforts and assistance from the area offices. In two of the three countries studied, The Philippines and Kenya, the area offices have been of little assistance to the development efforts. The very impressive development programs of these countries owe virtually nothing to their area offices. On the other hand, in Latin America one can clearly trace the beneficial influence of the Confederation on Colombia's development efforts. There is no doubt that the Asia Area Committee and the Africa Alliance are weak links in the worldwide organization.

5.) The US YMCA International Division liaison representatives to the area offices have generally had a hard time of it. The Latin American Confederation does not want a liaison representative and probably doesn't need one. The Asia Area Committee does not want a representative either, but the national YMCAs of the area badly need one. They have had a very able representative for the past ten years or so and many of the development achievements of Asian YMCAs have been accomplished with his help, despite the Asia Area Committee. The Africa Alliance both welcomes and needs a liaison representative, in fact it needs two of them, one for East Africa and one for West Africa, but the present representative is ineffective.

6.) Too little of the Matching Grant money is reaching the national and local YMCA levels, either in salary support for development personnel, or in project sub-grants. As concerns salary or institutional support, too much has got stuck in the International Division in New York. Less spent there would mean more for liaison representatives and national development secretaries.

7.) Failure to use the available project money has been blamed on the DOU and the AID auditing clause. No doubt this is a real issue, especially in Latin America, but there are other reasons too. In Asia it has been partly due to reluctance in the staff of the Asia Area Committee to see program funding from the outside over which they would not have complete control. To some extent the staff of the AAC has used the DOU to conceal other motives.

In Africa, weakness in the Alliance is, in the consultant's opinion, more responsible for the dearth of MG projects than the DOU.

8.) Despite critical comments about two of the area offices, the consultant's impression of the YMCA as a development agency is most favorable. The area offices are really a very small part of a gigantic worldwide organization dominated by national movements, not by the hierarchical structure. The real action is at the national and local levels and it is most impressive.

9.) The task before the International Division and AID now is to get the Matching Grant project money flowing. Two changes would help in this. First is to resolve the DOU and auditing issue. Second is to strengthen the role of the International Division's liaison representatives in Asia and Africa. The ID is a competent management unit capable of taking on more direct responsibilities for MG projects. Its liaison representative in Asia may have to go around the Asia Area Committee. In Africa there should perhaps be two liaison representatives with prime responsibility for fostering new projects. Funds for ID liaison representatives might be found by cutting back support to the Asia Area Committee and the Africa Alliance until they pull their acts together.

10.) In strengthening the role of the International Division in operating the Matching Grant it is suggested that ID insist on regular time and activities reporting by the liaison representatives and any area office personnel funded by the MG. Care should be

taken to see that these activities are development related by AID's definition. Frequent visits should be made to hold these persons under firmer discipline.

11.) It is the consultant's opinion, all things considered, that the US AID need not be concerned about the effective use of its Matching Grant funds. The worldwide YMCA is committed to community development, good at doing it, and getting better. The DPG and MG funds have had an important influence on the YMCAs ability to launch and manage development projects. If the MG project money flows more freely in 1981, we should see many impressive new projects started, especially in Africa and Asia.

As in any worldwide organization that respects local autonomy, the YMCA has shown and will continue to show occasional inconsistencies and points of weakness. But these minor flaws are all but negligible compared to the dedication of its personnel and its abiding commitment to human development.
