

36968

PD. AAQ - 070 <sup>1</sup>

68

PROJECT ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

June 12, 1984

Date of Report

Industrial and Commercial Job  
Training for Women

Related Project Title

Office of Technical Training  
and Job Development (OFPT)

Grantee

608-147

Project Number

American MidEast Inc. (AMIDEAST)

Contractor

Abdellatif Benabdesselam

Project Officer

August 14, 1978

Project Grant Agreement Date

September: 28, 1979

Contract Date

September 30, 1984

Project Assistance Completion  
Date

Project Committee:

H.J. Peterson	:	D/DIR:	<i>[Signature]</i>
S.R. Nevin	:	RCO:	<i>SW</i>
M.S. Matthews	:	CON:	<i>ABC for</i>
S.W. Rhodes	:	PROG:	<i>[Signature]</i>
C.R. Bowers	:	PHSS:	<i>[Signature]</i>
A. Benabdesselam	:	PHSS:	<i>[Signature]</i>

## I. SUMMARY OVERVIEW OF THE PROJECT

### A. Project Goal

This project was designed to provide "increased opportunity for Moroccan women to secure employment as skilled workers in the industrial and commercial sectors of the economy. This will be accomplished through a targeted skills training program and concentrated job development activities. The implementing Agency is the Labor Ministry's Office of Technical Training and Job Development (OFPPT), which already operates a vocational skills training program for men. The project will assist the GOM in integrating women trainees and workers into this service." (Project Paper).

### B. Project Purpose

This project was to 1) integrate women trainees into the labor ministry's industrial and commercial training centers; 2) provide them with marketable skills; and 3) assist them in job placement appropriate to their training.

### C. Project Inputs

The GOM-OFPPT was responsible for providing: 1) the buildings, the furniture and most equipment; 2) salaries of local instructors; 3) administrative and managerial expenses; 4) dormitory space for some women students; and 5) international travel for participants.

AID has provided the contract services of a qualified administrator, a human resources economist, a social psychologist, a specialist in electricity/electronics technical training, a specialist in drafting technical training, and a commercial training specialist.

AID has also sponsored U.S. participant training for 9 long term, 10 one year and 4 short term participants. Commodities provided by AID included technical training equipment and supplies, and one vehicle for the contract team.

### D. Project Outputs

1) Two pilot centers at OFPPT (Casablanca - Fès) providing job training for women in industrial and commercial skills;

2) A functioning system of job placement and performance evaluation; and

3) Women professionals included on the central headquarters staff at OFPPT.

## II. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

A. The project has been executed under a host country contract with "American MidEast Inc." (AMIDEAST) concluded September 28, 1979, for a three year period for a total contract amount of \$3,000,000. The contract set forth the following objectives:

1. Increase the number of women trainees graduating from OFPPT centers.
2. Carry out a program which will increase the admission of women students in these centers.
3. Provide counseling and orientation to women students during their training and early months of employment.
4. Increase the awareness of trainers and employers of the special needs of employed women.
5. Increase the efficiency of placement services for women students who are graduates of these centers.
6. Initiate a system for evaluation of the on-the-job performance of women graduates.
7. Improve the teaching techniques and subject knowledge of the trainers in drafting, electricity, electronics, commercial accounting and secretarial skills.
8. Provide an initial and complementary lists of training equipment.
9. Purchase materials and the supplies required to implement the project as well as ship and install them in Morocco.
10. Organize and manage the training of the 9 participants in the U.S., so that after the departure of the team they will be able to handle supervisory activities and maintain and expand the project.

Progress against these objectives is discussed below.

B. Summary of AMIDEAST Progress

1. Increase the number of women trainees:

The positive impact of the project in introducing females into new non-traditional sectors is indicated by the following summary of female trainees, trainers and employees enrolled at OFPPT Centers:

Number of Women Enrolled at Various OFPPT Centers

	1979-1980	Grand Total by June, 1984	AID Sponsored Women.
Industrial Sector	49	1656	247
Commercial Sector	460	4423	154
Construction	38	438	259
Tailoring	<u>236</u>	<u>1693</u>	<u>-</u>
Total	783	8210	660

Against a ProAg training target of 435 girls, 660 AID sponsored women have been trained (132 in Fes Center). The data provided by OFPPT show that the total number of women enrolled increased 10 times from June 1980 to June 1984. Although this objective has been met, it is the opinion of the OFPPT Assistant Director that the real success of this project was not only the training and placement of the (project supported) women in non-traditional areas usually reserved for boys, but that because of the project experience, the private sector is now opening its doors to more females to fill industrial/commercial jobs. Therefore, the project appears to have generated new enrollment for women at OFPPT centers in other modern industrial and commercial courses.

2. Carry out program which will increase the admission of women students in the OFPPT centers and their subsequent employability:

Work toward this objectives was to be preceded by a study to investigate the social, cultural and economic constraints affecting admission of women students to OFPPT centers, and their employability after graduation. This project objective was not successful, due to the fact that the psychologist specialist who designed the study based her findings on brief interviews conducted during three weeks in the summer of 1981. The report, moreover, was submitted after a 15 month delay. The report also displayed weaknesses in the quality of data collected which according to OFPPT cannot be interpreted correctly.

3. Provide counseling and orientation to women during their training and early months of employment:

Activities further to this task have included:

a) Outreach pre-training in high schools to sensitize officials and women students to the opportunity to receive technical training and to the employment possibilities open to skilled females.

b) Counseling in Training: The contract psychologist informally monitored academic performance on an on-going basis and participated in semester-end evaluation of trainees;

c) Pre-graduation Workshops: The psychologist and AMIDEAST staff conducted numerous workshops and seminars on how to prepare resumes, interviews, portfolio presentation and how to manage being working wives and mothers. It should be noted that no feedback can be obtained from the students on the value of the counseling and orientation methods established by the psychologist because no systematic follow-up has been attempted for the women graduates who left the OFPPT.

4. Increase the awareness of trainers and employers of the special needs of employed women; and

5. The efficiency of Placement services for the graduate women:

Based on data obtained from OFPPT and AMIDEAST over the past 4 years, an average of 70% of the graduates found jobs. (100% of the women trained in secretarial skills and industrial drafting were

placed by OFPPT last year.) However, it should be noted that, in general, female graduates usually find employment through their own efforts and/or personal efforts of their trainers who have professional relationships in the private sector. OFPPT officials have repeatedly stated that OFPPT is not structured, nor is it within its mandate, to function as an employment office. This activity is the responsibility of the "Bureau de Placement" of the Ministry of Labor. Short of providing placement services, OFPPT has developed three survey programs to be implemented in conjunction with the Ministry of Labor and various agencies and factories in the private sector. One of the three surveys was performed in September 1983. Two others are scheduled for 1984 and 1985. The project-financed computer is being used for this particular purpose. These surveys will identify Industrial and Commercial firms where graduates may have the best job placement opportunities and will also help OFPPT to re-orient the training curricula toward the more promising areas of the labor market.

Although there is no evidence that the three surveys will lead to increasing job placements, the seriousness and professionalism of the OFPPT suggest some optimism that these surveys will be well conducted and may contribute to a resolution of the placement problem. The trainees were asked to give their assessment of their chances of finding employment after graduation. The answers were mostly optimistic and mainly based on the high rate of employment of former graduates in Casablanca, the contacts OFPPT has in the private sector, and also on the credibility of OFPPT as a serious Vocational Education training institution in Morocco.

6. Initiate a system for evaluation of the on-the-job performance of women graduates:

The project psychologist organized seminars in writing application letters, job interview skills, analyzing employment ads, and discussing conditions of employment. Two follow-up surveys were conducted by OFPPT and the psychologist to determine the extent and the status of employment of female graduates. The team members visited some of the employed graduates and discussed their performance with their employers. Although some of the information received was fed back into program development and led to changes in entry level requirements, program adjustments and revision, this important activity was sporadic and was never formalized. OFPPT may still be in position to better collect and analyze these data and to track the employment careers of its graduates. But the magnitude of this effort cannot be underestimated given the fact that data collection in the country remains arduous and requires time.

7. Improve the teaching techniques:

a) Of the trainers

The least successful component of this project is the teacher training. Outside of the thirteen U.S. trained participants who became efficient vocational trainers, a notable deficiency in the quality of teacher training still remains. Although this activity was mentioned in the ProAg as weak and needing more improvement, the impact of the project in this area has been small. The contractor limited the teacher training to short on-the-job training

sessions during which time the teachers worked only with AMIDEAST technical experts. Creative Associates evaluators in May 1983 recommended an extension of the period of training in pre-service pedagogy and teaching methods. Consequently OFPPT has recently extended the duration of on-the-job training to one more year after graduation in order to allow the new trainers to upgrade their skills and reinforce their pedagogical capabilities. This additional one year program includes: 1) basic technical training; 2) on-the-job training in private sector factories for approximately two months and two months of practice teaching in OFPPT shops conducted under the guidance of older trainers. One positive aspect of this activity, however, was the development of the training curricula for the OFPPT centers.

b) Curricula Development

AMIDEAST and OFPPT have significantly improved OFPPT curricula in the fields of drafting, electronics, business education, and secretarial skills. OFPPT is currently updating the curricula inherited from AMIDEAST specialists in order to make them more responsive to the lessons learned from the employment experience of last year's graduates. This revision will be completed by September 1984, the opening of the school year 1984-1985.

8/9. Purchase and delivery of the training equipment:

The selection of equipment has been adequate although there was some delay in the delivery. Some of the OFPPT officials stated that the equipment is well used by the trainees and trainers. Although the trainers state that they use all the project financed equipment, it has been noticed that almost all the electricity sophisticated equipment in both Fes and Casablanca centers as well as a duplicator of blue prints seem still new and have never been or little used. The tools and equipment provided are documented in inventory reports and are stored, maintained and secured in a professional manner. The computer delivered under the project has been used to improve the quality of the trainees' battery of entrance tests and will be used for the coming job placement surveys.

The Project financed American vehicle is no longer operating due to the lack in Morocco of spare parts and maintenance facilities for American vehicles. In retrospect it would have been more appropriate to issue a source/origin waiver for a vehicle more suitable to Morocco.

10. Organize and manage U.S. participant training:

This component of the project can be considered as 80% successful and on target. The reason is that among 23 candidates sent to the U.S. (of which 14 were women), 17 have completed their training, are back in Morocco, and have joined the OFPPT staff as Vocational Education trainers and non-technical staff. One woman married a U.S. citizen and decided to stay with her husband; one has been authorized by OFPPT to do a Ph.D. on her own, which will delay her return by 15 months (ETA August 1985); one other woman left the University and

neither OPFPT nor AMIDEAST knows where she is; and 3 other participants will graduate by August 1985.

The status of the returnees is as follows: 3 long term trainees (women) are working with OPFPT as replacements for three AMIDEAST team members, and ten one year participants are teaching at OPFPT centers and are performing their work efficiently. Four short term training participants are working in OPFPT headquarters as administrative staff.

### III. OTHER ISSUE: Project activities at the OPFPT Fès center:

Two (of the existing 30 regional) OPFPT centers were identified to train project sponsored women: The Center of Ain Borja (a suburb of Casablanca) and the Fes Center--both identified as areas of high job development potential. The Ain Borja Center was expected to recruit and train 270 women, and the Fes Center 165. The Fès Center was also expected to provide rooms and board for 50 women trainees each year for three years. By June 1984 a total of 87 males and only 132 women have been trained at the Fès Center. This represents 80% of the project expectations for that facility. As stated in the final evaluation report (page 47), the reasons for the deemphasis of project activities at this center are still not thoroughly understood. Following several discussions with OPFPT officials, it appears that the de-emphasis of the activities come from:

- 1) The lack of dormitory space for females;
- 2) The lack of publicity to enroll females;
- 3) Remoteness from the center of the city;
- 4) Logistical difficulties for the AMIDEAST team (contractor based in Casablanca);
- 5) The lack of funds due to Moroccan economic crisis.

Given severe budgetary constraints, the director of the Fès center also refused access of women to the dormitories in order to reduce the charges of feeding and boarding.

Fes was originally selected as most representative of a rapidly expanding industrial area where a potential labor market would be opening to girls in various industrial sectors. It appears now that, Fès, confronted like other cities with a national economic crisis did not reach the expected level of industrial development, with a resultant reduction of the chances for women to find jobs.

### IV. LESSONS LEARNED

#### A. Host Country Contract

The host country contracting mode appears to have been an appropriate mechanism to implement this complex project. However a project such as this one, dealing with education/training/equipment, requires extra attention to wording of contract, awarding of contract, planning and timing of project start-up.

1. A number of weaknesses in this project might be attributed to the selection of inappropriate contract team members (i.e., the economist).

2. USAID should ensure that all project activities in the PP and ProAg are clearly and accurately reflected in the HCC. A number of elements described in the PP were not included or not well reflected in the contract, thus permitting various interpretations of work to be performed (i.e., the Fbs Center).

3. Contracts should have clear procurement plans to ensure the equipment delivery in a timely fashion. When a start up is tied to a school year calendar, timely delivery of equipment is essential.

#### B. Participant Training

1. USAID should make provision to ensure the return of participants to the country before the completion of the project.

2. Careful selection of the participants should be done by GOM and the contractor to ensure successful training and their commitment to return to work for the institution. (GOM should provide clear and detailed job descriptions, binding contracts and budgeted positions prior to approval of a participant's training program.)

#### C. Placement Procedure

With respect to in-country vocational education training provided under the project, USAID and GOM should establish a follow-up procedure to determine whether or not trainees have been appropriately placed in positions commensurate to their skills.

#### D. Equipment

When equipment costs are an important component of the total project budget, as is the case in this project, contractor's ability and know-how to conduct the procurement should be closely scrutinized and the procurement agent chosen accordingly (i.e., contractor if capable, AID direct procurement, outside purchasing agency, etc.).

#### V. REPLICABILITY

1. In many developing countries, the tendency is to raise entrance requirements in many vocational education training programs to improve the training quality. This is the case at OFPPT, where the entrance requirements for candidates in electronics and industrial drafting have been raised from four to seven years of secondary school. This change essentially excludes rural women with little formal education, i.e., those who have the greatest need for the project and for whom the project was designed initially.

2. As Project Officer, I personally agree with the Creative Associates evaluators in suggesting that future projects, if any, should be designed for rural women in small rural villages. This might offer solutions to regional unemployment problems and help stabilize the rural-to-urban exodus. It is also recommended that development plans and designs be studied not only with vocational education institutions but also with local rural authorities who are familiar with their specific development problems.

3. For projects being implemented over a several year period by succeeding U.S. Project Officers (four in this specific project), it is highly desirable to involve a local USAID Project Officer from the very beginning of the project. Eventually s/he may be the only person in the Mission capable of ensuring the project continuity and facilitating smooth transition from one U.S. Project Officer to his/her successor.

**INDUSTRIAL JOB TRAINING FOR  
WOMEN**

**PROJECT 0147**

Project Agreement August 14, 1978	Original Authorization \$3,236,000	Present Authoriza \$3,236,000
Initial Obligation.....	\$2,400,000	FY 1978
Amendment No. 1 to the ProAg.....	\$ 600,000	FY 1981
Amendment No. 2 to the ProAg.....	\$ 236,000	FY 1982
De obligation (May 31, 1984).....	\$ 155,000	
	<b>Total.....</b>	<b>\$3,081,000</b>

**Letter of Commitment:**

Letter of Commitment No.1.....	\$2,250,537	Sept. 26, 1979
Amendment No. 1 of the L.C.....	\$ + 78,313	Jan. 31, 1980
Amendment No. 2 of the L.C.....	\$ -0-	Jan. 31, 1980
Amendment No. 3 of the L.C.....	\$ -0-	Sept. 30, 1981
Amendment No. 4 of the L.C.....	\$ +651,150	
Amendment No. 5 of the L.C.....	\$ +220,000	Feb. 10, 1981
Amendment No. 6 of the L.C.....	\$ -200,000	July 06, 1983
Amendment No. 7 of the L.C.....	\$ -0-	Aug. 22, 1983
	<b>Total.....</b>	<b>\$3,000,000</b>

**Host Country Contract:**

American MidEast and Training Services, Inc.

Contract signed: September 26, 1979

Contract Amount .....	\$2,250,537	
Amendment No. 1 .....	\$ + 78,313	Jan. 1980
Amendment No. 2 .....	\$ -0-	Sept. 1980
Amendment No. 3 .....	\$ +651,150	Oct. 19, 1981
Amendment No. 4 .....	\$ +220,000	Feb. 03, 1981
Amendment No. 5 .....	\$ -200,000	June 30, 1981
	<b>Total.....</b>	<b>\$3,000,000</b>