

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY

1. Mission or AID/W Office Name USAID/Bogotá, EHRD			2. Project Number 081 A	
3. Project Title Small Farmer Training (ACPO)				
4. Key project dates (fiscal years)			5. Total U.S. funding	
a. Project Agreement Signed 10/76 (FY77)	b. Final Obligation 6/79 (FY79)	c. Final input 2/79 delivered (FY80)	life of project \$120,000 Grant \$ 2,000,000 Loan	
6. Evaluation number as listed in Eval. Schedule	7. Period covered by this evaluation From: 1/77 Month/year		To: 1/78 Month/year	8. Date of this Evaluation Review 12/77 Month/year
9. Action Decisions Reached at Evaluation Review, including items needing further study (Note--This list does <u>not</u> constitute an action request to AID/W. Use telegrams, airgrams, SPARS, etc., for action)			10. Officer or Unit responsible for follow-up	11. Date action to be completed

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

12. Signatures:	
Project Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Signature <i>Hunter Fitzgerald</i>	Signature <i>James Megellas</i>
Typed Name Hunter Fitzgerald	Typed Name James Megellas
Date December 30, 1977	Date December 30, 1977

13. SUMMARY - Summarize in about 200 words the current project situation, mentioning progress in relation to design, prospects of achieving purpose, major problems encountered, etc.

A total of two million dollars of AID Loan and \$120,000 grant funding is being utilized by ACPO to purchase printing equipment and technical assistance. The equipment will be used in Editorial Andes, a revenue producing activity of ACPO, to increase net income, which in turn, will be directed to expand ACPO's social programs for the rural poor. An additional US\$120,000 grant provides for project development, long-term advisors, and short-term consultants. In the first year of the project ACPO planned to begin reforms within its programs, order printing equipment for Editorial Andes, develop a comprehensive evaluation plan, and initiate some needed management changes.

All the equipment required has been put out for bid and 80% of the equipment has been ordered. The necessary alterations and improvements to the Editorial plant have been made to receive the equipment. A management specialist has given general recommendations for the improvement of the operations of Editorial Andes and a well qualified printing expert is on-board and is providing technical assistance for the installation of new equipment and utilization of current facilities.

There is concrete evidence of the improvement in the ACPO training program. A detailed outline of curriculum areas covered and accomplishments to date is included in Section 19 of this report.

2

The financial crisis developed when GOC decided to withhold support earlier than planned. This reduction of funds prompted ACPO to examine its operations and this resulted in the elimination of 125 employees, and cut-backs in its training program.

ACPO developed a technical assistance plan which calls for a long-term Non-Formal Education Specialist, a management consultant, a general curriculum specialist, a radio broadcasting expert, and a specialist to provide a computer feasibility study.

The utilization of technical assistance has been achieved as scheduled and the Mission believes the services provided have been from good to outstanding.

ACPO management is making a special effort to make its activities more relevant to the campesino by querying campesinos about their needs.

ACPO has two complementary AID/W projects which are concurrently being implemented. A Development Project Grant which is designed to develop a capability within ACPO to transfer its program to other countries, and a Grant to Florida State University to evaluate ACPO operations and activities.

Most of the verifiable indicators presented in the project paper are on or ahead of schedule except for the lower number of enrollees due to the financial crisis mentioned above and in Section

16, External Factors. The premature loss of GOC support will lower the number of beneficiaries during the beginning phases of the project; however, the additional income from Editorial Andes will compensate for the short fall later in the project. Even though there have been fiscal problems the project is progressing as designed and the outputs are being achieved as scheduled.

4

14. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY - Describe the methods used for this evaluation, i.e. was it a regular or special evaluation? Was it in accordance with the Evaluation Plan in the PP with respect to timing, study design, scope, methodology and issues? What kinds of data were used and how were they collected and analyzed? Identify agencies and key individuals participating and contributing.

This is a regular evaluation as prescribed in the Project Paper and conforms to the timing, scope, methodology, etc., as outlined.

The project specified that quarterly reports were to serve as the basis for this evaluation. The EHRD staff has worked closely with the ACPO evaluation group and assisted in the format and design of the quarterly report. The quarterly reports have been submitted as required and found acceptable by USAID.

ACPO nominated Mr. Eduardo Nieto as its official responsible for project evaluation. Mr. Nieto attended a USAID sponsored one week seminar in 1976 on project design and evaluation. In June Mr. Nieto was nominated by AID to attend a nine-week project management and evaluation seminar in Costa Rica which was conducted by OIT, AID/W. This training has been very important in making Mr. Nieto a real asset to ACPO and the project.

The Planning and Evaluation Division has carefully collected information on curriculum improvement, instructional training, assignment of personnel, progress on equipment procurement, inputs from long and short-term consultants, amount of cooperation with

5

other agencies, other evaluation findings, i.e., Development Project Grant and the FSU Contract. Considerable time was spent within ACPO on the evaluation plan and in the development of an expanded PERT with which ACPO is currently managing its share of the project.

Monthly and trip reports of the long-term consultants to this project, Wally Hawkins and Alvaro Castilla, were utilized in this evaluation. The Project Manager, Hunter Fitzgerald, and the consultants worked closely with the ACPO staff on analyzing and interpreting all of the information gathered.

With the inputs from the Florida State/ACPO evaluation and the accomplishments of the project it is felt that a real professional evaluation capability is emerging in ACPO.

6

15. Documents to be revised to reflect decisions noted page 1

(Other side):

Project Paper (PP) Logical Framework CPI Network

Financial Plan

PIO/T PIO/C PIO/P Project Agreement

Other

This evaluation brought out ideas for a new project --
A Project Identification Document (PID) will follow.

There have been some changes in the line item budget expenditures within the project as explained in following sections. The Mission has determined that these modifications are within the scope and guidelines of the Loan Agreement and the necessary justifications, explanations, and official documentation, have all been included in the Mission Loan file making it unnecessary to amend the Project Paper or Loan Agreement.

No other revisions appear to be in order as a result of this evaluation.

1

16. Evaluation findings about EXTERNAL FACTORS - Identify and discuss major changes in project setting which have an impact on the project. Examine continuing validity of assumptions.

The major external factor impacting on the Project was that ACPO had anticipated in its original project planning the receipt of two payments from the Ministry of Education totaling approximately \$1,000,000. These monies were to cover program costs of literacy education under MOE responsibility but with ACPO providing the services. In 1976 the Ministry, due to economic budget cuts and other factors, notified ACPO that this assistance would no longer be forthcoming.

The elimination of this income temporarily put Acción Cultural Popular in a very precarious financial situation. The Mission took immediate steps to assist the organization.

The EHRD staff met with ACPO top managers and gave specific recommendations for alleviation of the crisis. Such suggestions as follow were put forward for consideration:

- Carefully review the organizational staffing pattern and identify positions which could be eliminated or combined.
- Redesign budget to balance income and expenditures so that the operating deficit would be eliminated.
- Review all expenditures and retain only those necessary to maintain the program.

8

- Raise the price of the El Campesino newspaper to a more realistic level to cut some of this loss.
- Under the AID Technical Assistance Grant contract a management consultant to assist ACPO improve the efficiency of the organization.

In Section nineteen of this Report the inputs from Mr. William McP. Jones are described. The majority of his recommendations and advice have been implemented in whole or in some cases partially.

The price of the El Campesino newspaper was increased and some questionable activities were dropped. Over 100 employees were eliminated from the roles and considerable reductions were effected in the social training programs. These changes are reflected in the descriptions provided in the other sections of this document.

Consequently the scope and impact of the withholding of MOE funds from the ACPO program was not as severe as was projected in the Project Paper. The Mission expects the fiscal problem to be temporary and predicts that the financial short fall will be made up by the termination of the project by an increase in revenue by Editorial Andes. Beneficial side effects have been noted which resulted from the financial crisis.

9

- There will be less dependence on GOC support.
- ACPO has reorganized and has a stronger management organization.
- Currently more care is being given to identifying realistic priorities and in spending limited resources in a more prudent fashion.

An important assumption for providing inputs in the original plan was that: "Sources of revenues for ACPO will provide sufficient funds for executing the budget at the programming levels."

A reduction of the magnitude described above obviously determines a smaller program but with a stronger organization which will have the potential to meet the programmed goals, purpose, and outputs.

A review of the other important assumptions has found them to still be realistic and valid.

17. Evaluation findings about GOAL/SUBGOAL - For the reader's convenience, quote the approved sector or other goal, (and subgoal, where relevant) to which the project contributes. Then describe status by citing evidence available to date from specified indicators and by mentioning progress of other projects (whether or not U.S.) which contribute to same goal. Discuss causes -- can progress toward goal be attributed to project, why shortfalls?

Goal - The goal of this project is to improve the standard of living of small farmers and those who depend in a relatively direct fashion on the economic activity generated by small farmers.

The Project Paper states that the objectively verifiable indicator for the goal will be an increase in income of those serviced by ACPO of 20% more than those members of the target population not serviced by the program. The ACPO Evaluation Plan calls for the collection, tabulation, and analysis of income data in the next evaluation reporting period.

Under the ACPO/Florida State Grant a series of case studies have been completed which identify a group of indicators. The Florida State analysts who carried out the case studies had difficulty in determining the income indicator. They encountered such problems as:

- Many Campesinos really and truthfully did not know their income.
- Other Campesinos are reluctant to divulge their true income or net worth because of tax reasons.
- Part of the rural economy is on a barter system and goods and services become the medium of exchange instead of cash thus making it difficult to identify actual earnings.

Currently the USAID Non-Formal Education Advisor assigned to ACPO, Alvaro Castilla, is working with Eduardo Nieto on the solution to this problem.

They are attempting to develop a realistic instrument or technique to ascertain true income, and at the same time are discussing the most practical sample techniques and statistical methodology appropriate to this measurement. The results of this effort should be available by mid 1978.

Sub-Goal - The sub-goal of the project is to have small farmers and the rural poor acquire and utilize improved skills disseminated through its program.

The project design included the development of an evaluation plan which would identify verifiable indicators such as:

12

- The introduction of non-traditional crops.
- New technologies utilized.
- Increased use of credit.
- Number of new cooperatives formed.
- Use of other rural services agencies.
- Purchases of related reading material.
- Measures to indicate reaching the target population.

In July of 1976 LA/DR/EHRD contracted the Center for Educational Technology (CET) of the Florida State University to evaluate ACPO. This regional project is designed to examine the institution carefully, produce evaluation studies profiling ACPO, and compile a series of guidelines for use in other countries. This contract which is funded for a little under \$800,000 should provide useful data for the Mission project's evaluation.

The Florida team has completed a two cycle case study project utilizing Colombian experts. They have verified assumed indicators and identified other indicators not predicted prior to the studies. In November and December they worked on measurement instrumentation, sampling procedures, and staff training. Florida State University plans to conduct actual field studies in the Spring and preliminary results should be available next summer.

In view of the above comments it is premature to cite concrete evidence of achievement toward the goal and sub-goal; however, the Florida field studies, when completed, should provide the project with ample information for goal and sub-goal progress and information on several other indicators as well.

By the second anniversary of this project indicators will have been field tested, measured, analyzed, and the results will be reported.

14

18. Evaluation findings about PURPOSE - Quote the approved project purpose. Cite progress toward each End-of-Project Status (EOPS) condition. When can achievement be expected? Discuss causes of progress or shortfalls.

Purpose - The purpose of this project is to improve the quality and to increase the quantity of training opportunities available to small farmers and the rural poor.

A complete explanation of ACPO's fiscal problems is provided in Section 16. Although the withholding of GOC support funds for ACPO reduced the organizational capacity it was able to maintain the operational mechanism. A significant effort has been made by ACPO management to find other donor assistance. There are proposals pending which would enable an increase in field personnel but none yet has formal approval.

The table below illustrates the number of campesino volunteers trained and the original planned figure.

<u>Year</u>	<u>Campesino Volunteers Trained</u>			
	<u>Planned</u>		<u>Actual</u>	
	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>
1975	-	-	412	250
1976	400	200	376	206
1977	550	250	240	228
1978	580	300	-	-
1979	620	320	-	-
1980	640	340	-	-

15

The Training Center in Caldas, Antioquia, was closed from February through September of 1977 in order to economize. The Center was reopened in September and will function all year in 1978 and the actual number trained for 1978 will be appreciably higher.

The key individual in the ACPO program is the Campesino Leader who is the focal point at the grass roots level. The drop in the number assigned receiving some assistance from ACPO is significant to the project.

Leaders Trained and Assigned

<u>Year</u>	<u>No. Trained</u>				<u>No. Paid Emp.</u>				<u>Total Assigned</u>	
	<u>Planned</u>		<u>Actual</u>		<u>Planned</u>		<u>Actual</u>		<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>
	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>		
1975	-	-	57	20	-	-	53	17	-	-
1976	57	20	65	42	50	15	50	15	330	320
1977	60	30	59	30	54	27	40	24	350	130
1978	68	32	-	-	64	27	-	-	370	-
1979	35	35	-	-	69	30	-	-	400	-
1980	37	37	-	-	80	22	-	-	440	-

For calendar year 1978, 150 positions have been budgeted and it is anticipated that another thirty leaders will be assigned to the field during the year making a total of 180. The Mission is of the opinion that with careful resource allocation 230-250 leaders could

be assigned. The project manager will work with ACPO closely in attempting to reach this figure.

The number of supervisors trained was higher than anticipated. This should help improve the overall program.

Supervisors Course - Completed

<u>Year</u>	<u>Planned</u>		<u>Actual</u>	
	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>
1975	12	7	12	7
1976	9	9	9	9
1977	10	10	16	11
1978	11	11	-	-
1979	13	11	-	-
1980	14	12	-	-

17

19. Evaluation findings about OUTPUTS and INPUTS - Note any particular success or difficulties. Comment on significant management experiences of host contractor, and donor organizations. Describe any necessary changes in schedule or in type and quantity of resources or outputs needed to achieve project purpose.

Outputs

This project was designed to assist Editorial Andes become more profitable so that ACPO's social program could be strengthened and expanded. The two tables below illustrate Andes volume and profit figures. It should be noted that none of the new printing equipment is in place and therefore new equipment can neither share the successes nor the failures.

Editorial Andes - Volume of Sales

<u>Year</u>	<u>Planned Volume (Pesos)</u>	<u>Actual Volume (Pesos)</u>
1976	67,400,000	68,324,000
1977	85,000,000	90,000,000*
1978	130,000,000	-

*Projection based on an actual first ten-month volume of 75,088,639.

The exact volume will be available in February.

Editorial Andes - Net Profit

<u>Year</u>	<u>Planned Profit (Pesos)</u>	<u>Actual Profit (Pesos)</u>
1976	18,500,000	13,911,508
1977	21,000,000	21,000,000+*

* Projection based on actual first ten-months profit of 16,815,016.

18

An I.E.S.C. Volunteer, is currently advising and assisting Editorial Andes improve its operation. He believes the original prediction of 130,000,000 pesos sales volume for 1978 is high due to the fact the equipment will be received later than programmed and more time will be needed to develop new markets than was originally planned. He has also introduced the concept of depreciating the plant's equipment which will show less profits for 1978 but assures us this is a much sounder business practice. The actual profits for 1978 will probably be closer to 26,000,000 pesos for the reasons given above.

Significant changes with respect to program orientation are taking place within ACPO. In the revision of the Sutatenza Institute curriculum and other courses of study the ACPO leadership is considering inputs from Campesinos. The original Curriculum Revision Schedule as presented in the Project Paper has been changed by ACPO staff to a more realistic time-table but the final results are all within reach during the life of the project. The first chart below summarizes these outputs by area and the second is a work plan based on staff capabilities:

<u>Year</u>	<u>Number of Areas Revised</u>		
	<u>Planned Orig.</u>	<u>Planned New</u>	<u>Completed</u>
1976	5	-	-
1977	2	1	1
1978	-	5	-
1979	-	1	-

10

Sutatenza Institute

Curriculum Revision Projection, by Percent

		1977												1978	1979	
		Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec.	Jan.
Nutrition 7/31/77-12/15/77	Planned	90	100													
	Completed	90	100													
Responsible Parenthood 9/30/77-3/31/78	Planned	50	50	60	80	100										
	Completed	50	50													
Religion & Ethics 11/30/77-5/31/78	Planned	10	10	20	40	60	80	100								
	Completed	10	10													
Home Economics 1/31/78-7/31/78	Planned	5	5	15	20	30	40	60	80	100						
	Completed	5	5													
Literacy 3/31/78-9/30/78	Planned	5	5	5	5	15	20	30	40	60	80	100				
	Completed	5	5													
Rural Small Farm. Adm. 5/31/78-11/30/78	Planned	5	5	5	5	5	10	20	25	30	40	60	80	100		
	Completed	5	5													
Agri. & Livestock Product. 7/31/78-1/31/79	Planned	0	0	0	0	0	5	10	20	30	40	60	70	80	90	100
	Completed	0	0													

In addition to the outputs described, 190 ACPO Employees received in-service training in 1976 and an additional 220 attended courses in 1977.

Campeños write letters to Acción Cultural Popular for many reasons. ACPO's policy is to answer each and every letter, correcting spelling and grammar. In 1976 20,000 letters, and in 1977 25,000 letters were received and answered.

Another important aspect of the ACPO program is the publication and distribution of meaningful and informative reading materials to the campesino. The table below demonstrates what was planned and achieved in this area:

Publication Distribution

	<u>No. Copies</u>		<u>No. Copies</u>	
	<u>El Campesino</u>		<u>36 Titles of Books</u>	
	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>
1975	-	1,046,038	-	246,012
1976	2,000,000	2,117,625	316,000	251,294
1977	2,050,000	1,948,134	340,000	1,576,297
1978	2,100,000	-	375,000	-
1979	2,150,000	-	440,000	-
1980	2,200,000	-	484,000	-

The substantial increase of library book sales was due to the publication of six new titles and ACPO's participation in the National Book Fair. The slight drop in newspaper sales was due to the price increase already discussed.

Both ACPO and USAID are concerned over the quality of the proposed revisions. A discussion of technical assistance in curriculum is included in the inputs section. The technical advice given in curriculum is critical in assuring a quality product.

The ACPO program reaches a significant number of the target population with its radiophonic schools - Radio Sutatenza. The following two graphics depict enrollments and the number of community volunteers working in the radio education programs.

Enrollment Radio Schools

<u>Year</u>	<u>Planned Enrollment</u>	<u>Actual Enrollment</u>
1975	-	42,881
1976	55,000	96,868
1977	82,000	123,585
1978	120,000	-
1979	170,000	-
1980	200,000	-

Number of Community Volunteers
Radio Schools

<u>Year</u>	<u>Number Planned</u>	<u>Actual Number</u>
1975	-	12,336
1976	15,000	17,080
1977	20,000	21,350
1978	28,000	-
1979	40,000	-

Inputs

1. ACPO's Counterpart - The Project Paper called for a counterpart contribution of US\$820,000. The breakdown of counterpart and actual ACPO expenditures through December 1977 follow:

ACPO Counterpart

<u>Item</u>	<u>Original Project</u> <u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u> <u>1977 Expend.</u>	<u>Planned</u> <u>1978 Expend.</u>	<u>Total</u> <u>1977&1978</u>
Equipment Installation and Building Modifications	\$270,000	352,000	50,000	402,000
Working Capital	150,000	190,000	75,000	265,000
Increased Inventory	150,000	-	180,000	180,000
Program Expansion	<u>250,000</u>	<u>40,000</u>	<u>150,000</u>	<u>290,000</u>
	<u>\$820,000</u>	<u>542,000</u>	<u>445,000</u>	<u>150,000</u>

GRAND TOTAL US\$1,137,000

23

Editorial Andes has completed most of the building modifications which necessitated building office space for the accounting department which had to be moved to new quarters to make room for all of the large printing equipment. Dr. León Morales, Chief of Editorial Andes, did an outstanding job in planning and carrying out these efforts. The plant was not shut down one day and business went on normally.

2. AID Loan - The AID Loan to purchase \$1,863,000 of printing equipment and \$137,000 of technical assistance has been almost fully committed. ACPO found that its Technical Assistance needs would be covered by the Grant. (See #3 this Section) Subsequently ACPO requested and obtained Mission approval for purchase of an additional piece of equipment and newsprint for items in the social program. In 1977 100% of the equipment to be purchased had gone out to bid and subsequently 80% had been ordered. The remaining 20% should be ordered by February of 1978. This is ahead of the planned schedule.

The Capital Development Office commended Mr. León Morales of Editorial Andes for the businesslike and professional manner in which he managed the procurement procedures. The problem areas experienced were in the lack of interest in bidding on the part

24

of U.S. suppliers; the difficulty and red tape in obtaining waivers for non-U.S. manufactured goods; and, the apparent 'could not care less' attitude of some U.S. companies protected under our legislation.

3. AID Grant - The AID Grant for \$120,000 is designed to provide: project development assistance; long-term technical assistance for project implementation; and short-term technical assistance for management and organization, curriculum development, educational materials, instructor training, curriculum area specialists, and evaluation. Due to the Florida State/ACPO Project and the Development Project Grant all of the original technical assistance anticipated was not necessary.

ACPO in cooperation with USAID technicians, developed and submitted a technical assistance plan which was approved by the Mission. The plan using grant funds is summarized below:

25

Technical Assistance Plan

<u>Purpose and Type</u>	<u>Estimated Funding (US)</u>	<u>FY Qtr.</u>	<u>NBR Persons</u>	<u>Length</u>
Project Development Long Term T.A.	23,390	FY 76	1	(28 wks.)
Project Implementation Long Term T.A.	43,610	All FY 77 and FY 78	1 1/4	(104 wks.)
Management and Organi- zation Short-Term T.A.	3,000	3rd Qtr.	1	(2 wks.)
Management and Organization Short-term T.A.	15,000	4th Qtr. FY 77	1	(4 wks.)
Printing Plan Expert Short-term T.A.	10,000	1st & 2nd Qtr.FY 78	1	(16 wks.)
Cardboard Box Market Experts Short-term T.A.	8,500	3rd Qtr. FY 77	3	(8 wks.)
Computer Systems Short-term T.A.	2,500	1st Qtr. FY 77	1	(9 wks.)
Curriculum Specialist Short-term T.A.	12,000	3rd Qtr. FY 78	1	(12 wks.)
Radio Education	12,000	3rd Qtr. FY 78	1	(12 wks.)
TOTAL GRANT FUNDED	120,000			

26

Mr. Alvaro Castilla was contracted as the long-term technical advisor to this project. He has been working with the ACPO staff on curriculum revision planning, liaison, and evaluation. The contractor has submitted satisfactory monthly and annual reports to both entities and the grantee has formally requested that his services be extended until the end of calendar year 1978. Mr. Wallace Hawkins who is working primarily on the Servicio Nacional de Aprendizaje Loan and Grant is working about one-fourth time on the ACPO project essentially in a coordination role and is providing technical assistance in the agriculture area.

Mr. William McP. Jones was contracted for two consultations to ACPO in the areas of management and organization. He first studied the general organizational structure of ACPO and made recommendations for a top level management reorganization and suggestions for improved general business practices. These recommendations have been implemented by ACPO. He returned later to review the lower management echelons and made seventeen recommendations to improve the organization. ACPO is now studying and implementing the suggested reforms.

The original paper box market study in the Project Paper did not contain sufficient market detail. To make certain the proper

27

equipment was going to be procured ACPO contracted a local Colombian firm to execute a detailed market, raw material, and probable competitor study to insure a proper entry into the market. The study shows the market has a demand where ACPO is entering, with a lack of serious competition, and the raw materials are also available in-country.

The entire project is predicated on the ability of Editorial Andes to produce more revenues for ACPO's social programs with the introduction of more and better printing equipment. It was felt that sound technical advice in the printing area would be helpful to the project. Through the International Executive Service Corps, Mr. Frank Gerstle, a retired printing executive, was recruited. He has been working at Editorial Andes two and one half months and will break his four months of service on December 15 and return for the remaining one and one half months in April to assist with the installation of new equipment. He has been providing advice on plant lay out, machine utilization, personnel utilization, sales procedures, staff organization, and business practices. The grantee has reported that Mr. Gerstle is making an outstanding contribution to Editorial Andes.

28

The remainder of the technical assistance scheduled is well within the scope and needs of the project and should be completed on or before schedule.

21

20. Evaluation findings about UNPLANNED EFFECTS - Has project had any unexpected results or impact, such as changes in social structure, environment, technical or economic situation? Are these effects advantageous or not? Do they require any change in plans?

During the first year of the project there have been no unexpected results or impact in such areas as social structure, environment, or the technical or economic situation.

No changes in the original plans are anticipated resulting from unplanned effects.

29

21. CHANGES in DESIGN or EXECUTION - Explain the rationale for any proposed modification in project design or execution which now appear advisable as a result of the preceding findings (items 16 to 20 above) and which were reflected in one or more of the action decisions listed on page 1 or noted in Item 15 on page 2.

No significant modifications in project design are proposed as a result of this evaluation. As explained in the description of inputs, ACPO has found its technical assistance needs to be covered in most part by the Grant. The Loan monies initially planned for technical assistance have been reprogrammed for the purchase of additional equipment for Editorial Andes and some materials and supplies for the social program. These minor changes in execution have been documented, justified, and are part of the official record.

22. LESSONS LEARNED - What advice can you give a colleague about development strategy -- e.g. how to tackle a similar development problem or to manage a similar project in another country? What can be suggested for follow-on in this country? Similarly, do you have any suggestions about evaluation methodology?

Interested colleagues are advised that the Mission believes two lessons have been learned in this experience.

A. It was vital that the implementing agency (ACPO) was a viable organization from the outset complete with competent and dedicated leadership and staff.

B. The design of Regional Projects should be closely coordinated with Mission bilateral projects. The Florida State University Grant and the DPG were both conceived and negotiated by AID/W. Project Management responsibilities for the two regional grants are in Washington and at times do not relate to Mission procedures or objectives. The Mission feels the objectives of these two projects could have been better met under Mission management at much lower costs.

32

23. SPECIAL COMMENTS or REMARKS (for AID/W projects, assess likelihood that results of project will be utilized in LDCs).

This project because of its close relationship to the development project grant and the Florida State evaluation will probably be utilized in other LDCs.

The Mission is of the opinion that, with modifications for local situations, the ACPO program does have application to other countries. ACPO is not only a member of the Latin American Radiophonic School Association but also provides leadership for the Association. This project should reinforce that role because it is improving ACPO's capabilities in helping the small farmer and rural poor.

33

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY

1. Mission or AID/W Office Name USAID/Bogotá, EHRD			2. Project Number 081 B	
3. Project Title Small Farmer Training (SENA)				
4. Key project dates (fiscal years)			5. Total U.S. funding-	
a. Project Agreement Signed 11/76 (FY77)	b. Final Obligation 6/79(FY79)	c. Final input 12/79 delivered (FY80)	life of project \$120,000 Grant \$2,000,000 Loan	
6. Evaluation number as listed in Eval. Schedule	7. Period covered by this evaluation From: 1/77 To: 1/78 Month/year Month/year		8. Date of this Evaluation Review 12/77 Month/year	
9. Action Decisions Reached at Evaluation Review, including items needing further study (Note--This list does <u>not</u> constitute an action request to AID/W. Use telegrams, airgrams, SPARS, etc., for action) NONE			10. Officer or Unit responsible for follow-up	11. Date action to be completed

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

12. Signatures:	
Project Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Signature <i>Hunter Fitzgerald</i>	Signature <i>James Megellas</i>
Typed Name Hunter Fitzgerald/CEHRD	Typed Name James Megellas - Director
Date 12 30/77	Date 12/30/77

PO: GMcCloskey (draft)
CRDO: SRYner (draft)
CONT. JMartin (draft) DD.PSchwab (draft)

UNCLASSIFIED
Classification

34

13. SUMMARY - Summarize in about 200 words the current project situation mentioning progress in relation to design, prospects of achieving purpose, major problems encountered, etc.

A total of \$2,000,000 in AID loan funds are being utilized by SENA to purchase equipment and obtain technical assistance to improve rural mobile training units and those major units which support the rural instructor. An additional \$120,000 in a separate grant provides monies for project development, long term advisors, and short term consultants.

SENA planned to train additional small farmers and provide relevant information in such a manner that their real income level would increase, and that there would be a corresponding increase in their standard of living. During this reporting period, which corresponds to the first implementation period, there is much concrete evidence to show progress in relation to project design and in meeting the projects purpose, which is to increase the quality and quantity of training opportunities available to small farmers and the rural poor.

Even before the formal signing top management initiated profound policy changes foremost of which was SENA sectoral emphasis, traditionally about 60% of the program was for industrial, commercial, and formal apprenticeship training with the remaining 40% being allotted to the agricultural sector which included the rural mobile program. This division of resources was closely in accord with the tax contribution of the respective sectors. In actuality the percentages have almost been reversed and about 60% of SENA's resources are going into the agriculture sector.

35

Prior to the project SENA evaluated itself almost exclusively on the basis of numbers of trainees enrolled and graduated; with relevancy of training, job placement, economic feasibility having secondary importance. Each of the eighteen Regional offices has since undertaken an in-depth study of its area which includes geography, economics, social levels, industrial capability and possibilities, agriculture, and training needs. These profiles will be key factors in determining future activities and resources utilization.

In very close relation to the above effort a new Social Development Division was established, and a whole new approach to identifying rural training needs has evolved. The technique of utilizing socioeconomic studies to establish a rural training program has been incorporated into the system with an accompanying extensive in-service training program tested and in operation. This innovative approach will be described in further detail in Sections eighteen and nineteen.

Overall the project is proceeding as planned in curriculum development, the hiring and training of new instructors, the diagnosis of areas of concentration, with coordination being on or ahead of schedule. SENA took more time than was originally anticipated in developing its Technical Assistance Plan; however, in November 1977 a detailed contract plan which utilizes all available grant and loan funds, was submitted to AID/W for consideration. The project called for equipment to be purchased in three programs. One order for 80% of the equipment was completed in 1977. SENA is now in the process of finalizing the remaining 20% and plans to have it completed in February 1978 and keep this aspect of the project ahead of original plans.

3/0

14. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY - Describe the methods used for this evaluation i.e. was it a regular or special evaluation ? Was it in accordance with the Evaluation Plan in the Project Paper with respect to timing, study, design, scope, methodology and issues ? What kinds of data were used and how were they collected and analyzed ? Identify agencies and key individuals participating and contributing.

This is a regular evaluation as prescribed in the Project Paper and conforms to timing, scope, methodology, etc. as outlined.

The Project specifies that quarterly reports were to serve as the basis for evaluations.

In the first quarter of the calendar year SENA requested permission to submit three reports per year instead of the required four. The reason for this change was that SENA collects all of its other information in this manner. Mission concurred in this request.

SENA nominated Dr. Samuel Monsalve as its representative for evaluation of the project. USAID advisors along with Dr. Monsalve and his staff worked out a suitable plan and reporting format which was subsequently approved by AID management. The study, design, scope, methodology and issues are the same as those stated in the project paper.

Information has been collected on : (A) curriculum improvement (b) instructor training (c) number of instructors assigned, (d) progress on equipment procurement, (e) inputs from long and short term technical advisors, (f) amount of inter agency coordination, and other SENA evaluation efforts.

In addition to the above, monthly, annual, and trip reports of the long term consultant, Wallace Hawkins, were utilized in this evaluation. The project Manager, Hunter Fitzgerald, and the consultant met on a continuing basis with SENA staff at the grass roots level to review project progress and provide technical advice and assistance when required. Appropriate techniques were used on analyzing and drawing conclusions from the various types of data.

15. Documents to be revised to reflect decisions noted page 1
(other side)

Project Paper (PP) Logical Framework

CPI Network Financial Plan

PIO/T PIO/C PIO/P Project Agreement

Other

This evaluation brought out ideas for a new project -
A Project Identification Document (PID) will follow.

No revisions are required as a result of this evaluation.

16. Evaluation findings about EXTERNAL FACTORS - Identify and discuss major changes in project setting which have an impact on the project. Examine continuing validity of assumptions.

One of the major supporters of this project was Doctor Eduardo Gaitán Durán, the Director General, of SENA. Dr. Gaitán planned many basic reforms for SENA which included the goals of this project. In October Dr. Gaitán was promoted to the position of Minister of Mines and was replaced by Dr. Gilberto Echeverri Mejía, formerly the Colombian Ambassador to Ecuador.

Historically, in Colombia, when there is a change at the top of an organization there usually follows a complete personnel reshuffle with new people at the higher administrative levels. This situation is usually accompanied by fundamental project redirection or abandonment.

Dr. Echeverri has gone on record saying that the same general policies and recent reforms will be continued and has not initiated any significant personnel changes. This has been very important in assuring a continued orderly project progress .

40

17. Evaluation findings about GOAL/SUBGOAL - For the reader's convenience, quote the approved sector or other goal, (and subgoal, where relevant) to which the project contributes. Then describe status by citing evidence available to date from specified indicators and by mentioning progress of other projects (whether or not U.S.) which contribute to same goal. Discuss causes -- can progress toward goal be attributed to project, why shortfalls ?

Goal - "The goal of this project is to improve the standard of living of small farmers and those who depend in a relatively direct fashion on the economic activity generated by small farmers."

It is too early in the project to ascertain whether those serviced by SENA will increase their income 20% more than those members of the target population not serviced by the program. As noted above eighteen regional studies have been completed which describe each area and identify general training requirements. These documents set : over all policy, priorities, general resource allocations, and guidelines. Concurrently, over 300 instructors received in-service training related to the institution's new approach to identification of appropriate training.

About forty in-depth micro socio-economic studies were begun during the year with twenty three completed and seventeen still in process. The Mission has worked closely with Regional SENAs throughout the country on about ten of those studies completed and now in the implementation stage. This number is about all that can be covered due to staff limitations; however, limited technical advice and general suggestions

44

were made available to the remainder.

Overall, the progress and the results to date have been from satisfactory to very good with only one project being unsatisfactory. This project provided 373 families with an utterly inadequate 70 sq. m. of unfertile land.

The majority of the pilot projects derived from the previously mentioned micro studies underway have shown significant income increases well over the 20% goal. Both SENA and USAID feel we should wait to draw any conclusions on the raw data obtained so far. For example, in Tolima it appears there will be an increase of about 800% production in a sugar cane project with a corresponding 500% increase in gross earnings. This may be due in part to a very favorable panela (raw brown sugar) market. We are also aware we may be experiencing a classical "Hawthorne Effect".

First indications point to an increase in productivity and spendable income.

Sub-goal - "The sub-goal in this project is that small farmers and the rural poor acquire and utilize improved skills disseminated through programs."

The project design included the development of an evaluation plan which would identify appropriate verifiable indicators such as : (a) The introduction of non-traditional crops, (b) new technologies utilized,

42

(c) increased use of credit, (d) number of new cooperatives formed, (e) use of rural service agencies, (f) purchases of related reading materials, (g) and measures to indicate reaching the target population.

AID technicians and contractors had many inputs into the development of the training and socio-economic design. The first model did not have a significant evaluation component; however, subsequent designs included most of the items listed above. The studies of each project and subsequent reports do contain these indicators.

As the number of studies grew and the information became more voluminous, each report containing over 100 pages of narrative and charts, it became apparent to SENA it had a problem. In its Technical Assistance Plan a consultant was requested to work on this situation. The person is scheduled for the Spring Semester of 1978 and it is planned to have an orderly, simplified reporting and evaluation system in place next year which will bring all of this data into manageable and understandable forms.

It can be reported that the individual studies do show strong evidence of the indicators discussed and that the sub-goal is being attained. The next evaluation will contain this information in detail.

SENA, by Colombian standards, is a large and efficient organization. New approaches and new directions have been decided upon and its staff is going about the business of implementing them. The Mission is of the opinion that what progress has been made by SEN A can in part be attributed to the project. The project with its small staff and limited resources has served as a catalyst, a mover, a motivator, a cajoler, a critic, a friend, devil's advocate, a guider, and a resource to keep the project and SEN A moving forward.

44

18. Evaluation findings about PURPOSE - Quote the approved project purpose. Cite progress toward each End-of-Project Status (EOPS) conditions. When can achievement be expected ? Discuss causes of progress or shortfalls.

Purpose - "The purpose of this project is to increase the quality and quantity of training opportunities available to small farmers and the rural poor."

In the Project Paper the projected enrollments of the SENA Rural Mobile Training Programs were projected as follows :

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>COURSES COMPLETED</u>
1976	150,000
1977	165,000
1978	182,000
1979	200,000

SENA's Annual Report for 1977 shows the following results reflecting a little variation from the planned figures but by 1977 show a number above the projected figure :

<u>YEAR</u>	<u>ENROLLMENT</u>
1976	139,544
1977	174,821

Obviously SENA is completing the quantitative aspects of the agreement but the amount they will influence the qualitative aspects of the projects will greatly depend on the outputs described in the next Section.

First indicators demonstrate that the quality of SENA is improving and with the subsequent influence of other AID inputs, i.e. equipment arrived and in use, and a better trained staff, the program quality will further contribute to the goal and sub-goal of this project.

45

19. Evaluation findings about OUTPUTS and INPUTS - Note any particular success or difficulties. Comment on significant management experiences of host contractor, and donor organizations. Describe any necessary changes in schedule or in type and quantity of resources or outputs needed to achieve project purpose.

Project Outputs

(1) Improved Training Program Curriculum. Improved Methodology and Internal Methodology Completed.

SENA has planned to revise the curriculum in twelve areas listed below. The chart gives a resume of where the revisions stand to date.

<u>Area</u>	<u>Date Scheduled to begin</u>	<u>Date Began</u>	<u>% Completed</u>	<u>Date Completed</u>
Agriculture	1/77	1/76	100%	1/77
Cattle Production	1/76	1/76	100%	12/76
Small Animal Raising	1/76	1/76	100%	1/77
Agriculture Machinery	1/76	1/76	100%	1/77
Handicrafts	4/75	4/75	50%	
Rural construction	1/76	1/76	100%	11/76
Small Business Adm.	1/76	4/76	20%	
Cooperative & Credit	1/76	1/76	100%	12/76
Rural Mechanics	1/76	1/76	40%	
Natural Resources	1/76	1/76	10%	
Small Farmer Adm.	1/76	1/76	60%	
Small Rural Industries	1/76	1/76	30%	

4/6

It is interesting to note that SENA's Technical Assistance Plan was based in large part on the needs of these curriculum revisions. The table below illustrates the areas where it was felt additional outside expertise was required to fill in Knowledge gaps. All of the technical assistance is short term.

<u>Type of T. A.</u>	<u>Funding Level</u>	<u>FY78 Quarter</u>
Beef Production	\$8,000	2
Pasture Production	\$8,000	2
Tomato Production	\$8,000	2
Information Systems	\$15,000	3
Evaluation	\$14,000	3
Nutrition Technology	\$18,000	4
Evaluation Technology Projects	15,000	4
Evaluation Small Business Administration Projects	\$19,000	3 or 4
Finance, Production, Marketing & Organization of Small Businesses	\$15,000	3
Small Farm Crop Production Methods	\$9,000	4

The following actions have been completed to implement the new programs :

1. SENA has hired 292 additional instructors which is 102 more than originally planned.
2. Conducted a National Seminar on the new program
3. Trained over 300 instructors on the new program
4. Started over forty local socio-economic studies to determine needs of small farmers.

47

5. Conducted courses for Small Farm Business Methods in Valledupar, Armenia, Espinal and the Sabana Centers.

(2) In-service and Pre-service Training Programs Designed to Provide New and On-Board Instructors with an Understanding of the New Orientation Completed.

The Social Development Division in conjunction with the appropriate technical divisions developed a teacher's guide and student materials to train key regional senior staff on the implementation of the new program. The project's long-term consultant and project manager visited the first training courses, reviewed the materials, and had inputs at regular intervals throughout the reporting period.

After key individuals were trained at regional levels, they in turn had the responsibility of imparting the new approaches which strongly stress the need for applicability and practicality of skill training. These materials are on file in SENA and can be inspected at any time. USAID found the overall training program to be well executed and found on-site implementation generally was being accepted well.

As already reported over 300 SENA employees have received orientation and training in SENA's new approach which exceed the original 190 trainees planned.

(3) Installed - a system to Evaluate and Adjust Programs to Improve their Efficiency and Effectiveness

46

SENA plans to have this system installed and operating by the end of calendar year 1978. It is understood that many of the parts of the plan are already functioning but pulling all of the information and results together into a workable manageable tool will be a major task for 1978.

Two new Divisions, comprising eleven people, have been established to: (1) evaluate internal effectiveness of SENNA programs across the board; and (2) review the usefulness and practicality of SENNA skills received in terms of the labor market, economic, and social situations in the real world of Colombia.

The preliminary plans submitted to AID in November of 1977 contain the information called for in the Project Paper. This includes : training completed, changes in terms of a better life, production data, socio-economic studies, information on other organization involvement, and concrete data on target group participation.

Project Inputs

(1) SENA Counterpart - SENNA counterparts as specified in the Loan call for \$400,000 in FY/77 and \$900,000 in FY 78. During calendar year 1977 SENNA has actually provided a total of \$2,084,637 as detailed below; \$1,664,000 more than originally committed.

69

A. Instructors (new) Salaries and Benefits

292 Instructors x \$8,500 per year = \$1,482,000

B. Equipment - Vehicles, Audio Visual Supplies
and Equipment, and Local Materials.

Equipment (Col. \$21,744,000) = \$582,637

(2) AID Loan Equipment (\$1,877,000 US) - During the reporting period SENA ordered 80% of the loan equipment. The order included transportation, audio visual, small agriculture, teaching aids, equipment and other related tools.

The Capital Development Office found SENA to be generally quite responsive and professional in the handling of procurement activities. The normal Colombian bureaucratic roadblocks were overcome by constant efforts on the parts of AID and SENA. Early in the process of procurement the SENA Purchasing Division contracted a full time employee who had had experience in international procurement. USAID feels this has greatly expedited the process and eliminated many potential problems.

The first 80% of the equipment should be in-country in February and the remaining 20% should be aboard in May or June keeping the activity ahead of schedule.

(3) Technical Assistance

Grant funds of \$120,000 provided for long term and short term consultants for the development and implementation of the project. In addition \$123,000 of loan funds were reserved for short-term technical experts. The table below describes technical assistance used to date and summarizes what SENA plans for the rest of Fiscal Y 1978.



<u>Purpose and Type</u>	<u>GRANT FUNDED</u>		<u>FY Qtr.</u>	<u>No. Persons</u>	<u>Length</u>
	<u>Estimated Funding</u>				
Project Development Long Term T. A.	23,390		FY-76	1	(28 wks.)
Project Implementation Long Term T. A.	72,610		All FY 77 & FY 78	1	(104 wks.)
Beef Production Short -Term T. A.	8,000		2 Qtr. FY 78	1	(2 wks.)
Pasture Production Short-Term T. A.	8,000		2 Qtr. FY 78	1	(2 wks.)
Tomato Production Short-Term T. A.	8,000		2 Qtr. FY 78	1	(2 wks.)
Total Grant	120,000				

<u>LOAN FUNDED</u>					
Information systems Short - Term T. A.	15,000		3 Qtr. FY 78	1	(20 wks.)
Evaluation- Non-Formal Education Short - Term T. A.	14,000		3 Qtr. FY 78	2	(4 wks. ea)
Nutrition Technology Short-Term T. A.	18,000		4 Qtr. FY 78	1 or 2	(8 wks. ea.)
Evaluate Technology Projects Short-Term T. A.	15,000		4 Qtr. FY 78	1 or 2	
Evaluation of Small Business Admin. Prog. Short-Term T. A.	19,000		3 Qtr. FY 78	1 or 2	(20 wks.)
Finance, Production Marketing and Organization of Small Business Short-Term T. A.	15,000		3 or 4 Qtr. FY 78	1	(10 wks.)

51

<u>Purpose of Type</u>	<u>Estimated Funding</u>	<u>FY Qtr.</u>	<u>No. Persons</u>	<u>Length</u>
Training Systems for Small Business Instructors in SENA Short-Term T. A.	16,000	3 Qtr. FY 78	1	(11 wks.)
Small Fram Crop Production Methods	9,000	4 Qtr. FY 78	1	(3 wks.)
TOTAL LOAN	123,000			

The inputs of the long-term advisor to the project have been carefully monitored by the Mission and SENA. The contractor has submitted satisfactory monthly and annual reports to both entities and the borrower formally requested that his services be extended until the end of Fiscal Year 1978.

The Technical Assistance plan developed by the borrowers has been reviewed and approved by the Mission and will be completed before the end of the next evaluation period.

52

20. Evaluation findings about UNPLANNED EFFECTS. Has Project had any unexpected results or impact, such as changes in social structure, environment, technical or economic situation ? Are these effects advantageous or not ? Do they require any change in plans ?

The project is in its initial stages and unexpected results or impact have not been noted in social structure, environment, technical or economic situation.

The Mission feels there have been some unplanned effects in SENA. For example, indirectly as a result of the project and ideas advanced by its advisors, a new Technology Division was established, with a staff of ten people and a budget of close to a million dollars. The Division is systematizing internal SENA information, data from other Colombian institutions, and will collect appropriate technologies from other countries and international organizations. A computerized data bank will be located in Bogotá with terminals in Medellín, Barranquilla, and Cali making data more available to more people in a shorter time frame.

Dr. Gaitán. the former Director General of SENA, likened SENA to a finely tuned Chevrolet, 1932 model. It was running very well but represented an antique model. The project is having an impact on these attitudes especially in term of introducing SENA staff to current thinking and methods in non-formal education.

It is felt these effects are advantageous but do not require any changes in our current implementation plans.

53

21. CHANGES in DESIGN or EXECUTION - Explain the rationale for any proposed modification in project design or execution which now appear advisable as a result of the preceding findings (items 16 to 20 above) and which were reflected in one or more of the action decisions listed on page 1 or noted in Item 15 on page 2.

This evaluation has not resulted in the need to change either the project's design or execution procedures.

SK

22. LESSONS LEARNED - What advice can you give a colleague about development strategy -- e.g., how to tackle a similar development problem or to manage a similar project in another country? What can be suggested for follow - on in this country? Similarly, do you have any suggestions about evaluation methodology?

Probably the best advice that can be given to a colleague about a development strategy for a similar problem would be to pick a strong functioning organization to implement the project. When you are dealing with a fundamental social problem and trying to increase income and real social benefits almost immediately, choosing a weak or non functioning counterpart organization dooms the project to failure or delays & frustration. The colleague should pick a dynamic doer type of SENA organization to best assure a degree of success.

Since the Colombia AID Mission is in a phase out there is little possibility of further bilateral assistance to SENA; however, AID/W or other Missions, could consider the possibility of utilizing SENA capabilities on a contractual basis in the future.

Based on the AID programming methodology, the evaluation methodology is sufficient. OIT has sponsored courses in Costa Rica and Colombia on this methodology and there are now thirty -five Colombians who have been trained in these methods. If there is an area to be named for future training or emphasis, it could well be sampling and statistical comparisons on data obtained. The methodology could be elevated one or two levels in sophistication making it more meaningful in relation to future management decision making.

55

23. SPECIAL COMMENTS or REMARKS (For AID/W projects, assess likelihood that results of project will be utilized in LDC's).

It is felt that the results of this project will probably be useful in other LDC's. It appears SENA is beginning to reach the rural poor with a significant income increasing program. Some aspects of the project should have application almost directly to other countries.