

PD-AAN-735

SUDAN REGIONAL FINANCE AND PLANNING PROJECT

3RD QUARTERLY REPORT

SEPTEMBER 1983

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
GENERAL SURVEY	1
REGIONAL REPORT -- KORDOFAN	6
OVERVIEW	6
PICKING UP THE PIECES	6
PROJECT SPONSORED ACTIVITIES	8
OUTLOOK	13
REGIONAL REPORT -- EQUATORIA	15
APPENDIX I - KORDOFAN WORK PLAN	
APPENDIX II - EQUATORIA WORK PLAN	
APPENDIX III - ECONOMIC CONSIDERATIONS IN DECENTRALIZATION POLICY	

GENERAL SURVEY

The conceptual approach to implementing the SRFP Project has been transformed with the accession of Dr. Osman Mohamed Osman to the position of Project Director. Whereas the previous project director maintained close personal control over project activities, the new director has introduced a much more decentralized mode of operation.

In a series of meetings the Project Director, the USAID Project Manager and the Chief of Party agreed on the following guidelines:

1. The share of project resources earmarked for the former Southern Region will be made available to all three of the new regions of the south. Thus far the rate of project implementation has been lagging behind resource potential. The new policy, therefore, is to finance acceptable work plans of Upper Nile, Equatoria and Bahr El Ghazal, as well as Kordofan, as they are offered for consideration.

2. Work plans are to be accompanied by realistic budgets and time frames for the proposed activities. As these proposals are approved, project funds will be transferred from the DRLD to the regional project directors. Uses of project funds are to be accounted for against project outputs. Bills, invoices and other evidence of payment are to be provided the DRLD in support of quarterly financial reports. The proposed work plans for Equatoria and Kordofan are included in this report. Because of the recent redivision of the south and the continuing process of dividing equipment and personnel among the three new regions, planning departments in Bahr El Ghazal and Upper Nile are not yet sufficiently organized to develop work plans. Contacts have been made, however, and it is expected that work plans will be forthcoming from both regions for the January - June 1984 period.

3. The responsibility for initiating training plans, research proposals and model projects will lie with the regional planning departments. Under the former highly centralized procedures, insufficient freedom of action was allowed regional decision makers, and consequently implementation suffered. In accordance with the official policy of decentralization, the new policy is to devolve responsibility to the lower levels of government.

4. Official correspondence between the central project director and regional directors will be transmitted only through official GOS channels. Copies of official correspondence may be transmitted through USAID/DAI or other channels for information purposes only.

5. Local institutions, such as the Development Studies Research Center, and the Institute of Accountancy Studies in Khartoum, and the Regional Accountancy Training Center in Juba, will be provided contracts to produce courses designed by regional project directors and their advisors to meet regional training needs. One of the outputs of the SRFP Project is the strengthening of such institutions and the collaboration in training envisioned for them provides a useful vehicle for this purpose.

In a series of August and September meetings in Khartoum, Osman, Eighmy and Edens discussed and confirmed these principles with Andrew Lado and Gino Gama of Equatoria, Said Abu Kambal, Kordofan Regional Director of Planning, and technical advisors Miller and Toder.

Administrative Appointments in the South.

In August several key appointments were announced in the new regions. Those most directly related to the SRFP Project in the Ministries of Finance and Economic Affairs are:

<u>Position</u>	<u>Equatoria Region</u>	<u>Bahr El Ghazal Region</u>	<u>Upper Nile Region</u>
Director General	Andrew Lado	Valerio Nuer	Pal Gack La
Director of Planning	Gino Gama	Isaac Makur	Mark Nyikon
Director of Finance	John Russie	John Buong	--

It should be noted that most of these are acting appointments.

Taking Stock

The SRFP Project began implementation in November 1981, and with the ending of the third quarter of 1983, the present DAI contractors are about to enter their third year. It should be worthwhile, therefore, to review the state of progress achieved thus far and to assess the actions needed for a successful conclusion. Listed below are the primary inputs of the project, as well as their stage of utilization and output achievement as of September, 1983.

Inputs

1. Funding		<u>LOP Obligation</u>	<u>Disbursed</u>	<u>Balance</u>
GOS Project Account	LS	7,800,000	212,966	7,587,034
DAI \$ Account	\$	1,993,164	818,513	1,174,651
DAI LS Trust Fund	LS	360,000 (25 months)	271,219	88,781

2. Technical Assistance (person months)		<u>LOP</u>	<u>Utilized</u>	<u>Balance</u>
Long Term Advisors		130	60	70
Short Term Advisors		20	1	19

Outputs

1. Training		<u>LOP</u>	<u>Utilized</u>	<u>Balance</u>
Master Degree Cands.		12	0	12
Short Term US Courses		12	0	12
DSRC Diploma Course (on Economic Devel.Planning)		x	8	x
Workshops & Courses		x	4	x
Trainees		200	94	106
Training Institutions upgraded		x	0	x

2. Research and Projects	<u>LOP</u>	<u>Completed</u>	<u>In Progress</u>	<u>Balance</u>
Economic Base Studies	x	0	0	x
Project Opportunity Studies	x	6	0	x
Project Design and Assessment	x	1	1	x
Model Projects Funded	x	0	1	x

X=quantities not specified in Agreement.

A perusal of these data reveals that implementation thus far is uneven. Local training, excluding project workshops and the DSRC diploma courses, has been proceeding and indications suggest that target levels of these types of training activity should be fulfilled in due course. On the other hand, the potentials for overseas training and short-term advisory services are seriously underutilized. Also lagging are the economic base studies needed for regional development programming. These must be contracted at once if they are to contribute to the project's broader development goals. While work is being done in project preparation, and one project, the Kheiran Agriculture Project, is being implemented, the pace needs to be accelerated.

Actually there are grounds for optimism in several areas. At the close of the third quarterly reporting period substantial progress was made in work plan preparation in Equatoria and Kordofan. In the first weeks of the fourth quarter, substantial funds were transferred to the regions and steps were taken to expand the DAI trust funds to their full 36-month level of LS497,000. Steps also were taken to prepare several candidates for study abroad. While the details of these developments will have to be reserved for the next quarterly report, there are strong indications that the rate of implementation will accelerate in the months ahead.

The third quarter, therefore, should be seen as a period of reorganization, during which the work rules and understandings needed by the central and regional levels of government, USAID

and the contractor staff for advancing the project were reached and established. At this stage it is plausible to conclude that, given the new cohesion, most of the planning component goals are still attainable in the time remaining. The major exception likely will be model projects. Experience is showing that well designed and tested production projects are time consuming to prepare. Implementation is a demanding process. The purpose of the model projects component is to provide the local and regional levels of government with direct experience in the project cycle. However, given the staffing problems at the regional and area council levels of government, it is unlikely that model project potentials will be realized unless new approaches are tried. Greater popular participation in self help, social service projects at the rural council level of government might provide a viable alternative to the present top-down, bureaucratically controlled approach. Experimental steps in this direction should be taken.

REGIONAL REPORT
KORDOFAN REGION
SEPTEMBER 30, 1983

OVERVIEW

The third quarter of 1983 was a period of reorganization and rethinking of the means necessary to carry out the planned activities of the RFPP. Unlike several earlier false starts, the principal parties including the Regional Government, Central Government, USAID and DAI Advisors were able to sit down in an atmosphere of mutual respect and candor to discuss past shortcomings in project organization and management and agree upon a new way of operating. Unfortunately not a great deal was accomplished in carrying out project activities. By the close of the quarter however, a program covering the period October through December 1983 had been agreed upon and a detailed plan developed covering this period as well as the first half of 1984. If the new arrangements agreed upon for transferring responsibility for identifying, initiating, and implementing activities in training, research, and project development to the regional government can be made to work, then the program proposed should enable project objectives to be gradually realized.

PICKING UP THE PIECES

While the dust was still settling in Khartoum following a change in project directorship, the Minister of Finance for Kordofan Region together with his Director of Planning requested a meeting with USAID, the new GOS Project Director, and the DAI Planning Advisors. The regional government wanted to make its views clear regarding the project, what they expected from it, and how, given past difficulties, they wanted to see it executed. The meeting was useful as it demonstrated the interests and expectations that are now shared by all of the parties concerned.

With the impending departure of Saeed Abu Kambal, Director of Planning for Kordofan Region, for a two-month short course in the United States at EDI (World Bank) all parties were eager to reach consensus on new operating procedures and the tentative outlines of a program for the last quarter of 1983. Meetings in early September brought together the USAID Project Officer, Tom Eighmy, Osman Mohamed Osman, Project Director, Saeed Abu Kambal, David Edens, Contractor Chief of Party, and Miles Toder, Kordofan Advisor. USAID had the opportunity to clarify its position on the types of activities it would like to see, how funds should be used, and how it would like to see the project operate. This provided a useful framework for the representatives of the regional and central governments to work out a mutually acceptable list of activities for project sponsorship and to begin to work out a sharing of responsibilities and obligations that would in the short term enable the project to function. Of far greater consequence, such an agreement concerning central-regional relationships would more precisely define the operational role of each in the process of development planning. Following the meetings in early September a detailed activities program covering areas of training, materials and equipment support, research, and finance of development projects was prepared by the Kordofan Planning Advisor (see Appendix 1). The program deals with activities proposed for the remaining three months of 1983 and looks ahead to the first half of 1984. The program expands upon several of the ideas on project sponsored activities agreed to by the regional and central governments. Included is a budget and timetable which makes apparent the necessary resource commitments in terms of time, energy, manpower, and money required to execute planned activities. It also suggests which persons or organizations should be responsible for the various tasks that are to be accomplished. The proposed activity program encompassed a longer time period than just the last quarter of 1983.

There are good reasons for looking as far ahead as June 1984. Training, in the past, was viewed as a series of individual short

courses each virtually unrelated to the other. Objectives were expressed in quantitative terms - simple numbers of persons "trained" - and considered a success if merely they were carried out, preferably as close to budget as possible. The gap between such objectives and those of the project as a whole, namely building of capacity in regional planning, was large. It is necessary to think of training as a continuous process in which specific needs are identified, based upon the talents of individuals and the jobs they are supposed to perform, and an integrated program of on-the-job training, workshops, seminars, and short courses is formulated. Such a program cannot be designed by looking ahead only three months, just as it cannot be executed in one or two magical short courses. It requires thinking ahead and a systematic step by step approach where the skills, methods, and approach to problem solving and planning are taught, built upon and then applied under supervision.

Given the amount of project time that has already gone by, thought has to be given to what the best use of resources might be in the little time remaining. This is another reason to look ahead beyond the next quarter and see how the advisors' presence could best be used toward achieving project objectives. Establishing a continuous program of training and orientation for new staff, and professional development for existing staff is absolutely necessary if the process of regional planning is to become and remain a significant factor in public and private decision making. Whether or not it is possible to do this in the time remaining is uncertain. Careful use of the remaining months of advisory services can only help.

PROJECT SPONSORED ACTIVITIES

During the third quarter several project sponsored activities did continue, albeit at a rather slow pace. The following is a summary of progress during the quarter:

1. The Kheiran Project, the only development project to have been designed, reviewed, and financed using currency from the development fund continued to crawl along. Several significant obstacles prevented much progress and threaten to invalidate many of the assumptions used in calculating cost and project benefits. The problem of ordering, procuring, and transporting necessary inputs such as cement and fertilizer seem insurmountable. The regional government continues to struggle with the logistical difficulties with no end in sight. The other significant roadblock is the fact that money to pay for various inputs was not forthcoming from Khartoum as needed. Poor communications, confusion about documentation, and insufficient follow up are all contributing factors. Meanwhile the critical season prior to the planting of vegetable crops when labor would have been available for well construction and excavation has been lost. Disputes over payment of incentives to Sudanese working closely with the project has further eroded whatever enthusiasm that may have remained.

On the bright side, using cement borrowed from one of the cooperative regional ministries, enough concrete blocks have been made to line the inside of the first of twenty wells that will be constructed. Excavation will begin shortly. A system then has been established to mass produce the needed concrete blocks and to supervise well construction. Once funds are received and cement delivered then so long as labor does not become a constraint, well siting and construction should be able to proceed at a satisfactory pace. The government has taken delivery of the engines and pumps for irrigation and is presently modifying them to operate under conditions found in the Kheiran area. While the winter planting season will almost certainly be missed, perhaps a high value summer crop could be the first produced from the newly established vegetable gardens.

2. Money available from the US Embassy Self-Help Fund has been virtually the only source for creating and maintaining the type of visibility that satisfies politicians and people in the region. While the projects undertaken tend to be small (under LS10,000)

the time from submission of a proposal to receipt of funds and start-up of activities is relatively short. Aside from the impact that the projects themselves have, they have been useful as training exercises - especially in problem identification, solution design, development of proposals, consideration of recurrent costs, and assigning priority for staff in the Department of Planning as well as in the other regional ministries. Recent experience in implementing and monitoring such small scale projects has likewise been excellent for staff in the ministries and will prepare them to work with larger and more complex development projects. During the third quarter funds were received to establish a poultry farm near el Obeid, and two proposals, one for the rehabilitation of a dispensary and the other for an addition to a district hospital were developed and submitted to the Embassy for consideration. Several other ideas were being developed including an animal traction demonstration project for a village in South Kordofan, and establishment of a nursery for fruit tree seedlings. The effect of the fund cannot be overstated. Government departments which before were engaged primarily in administrative and clerical functions have now begun to show interest in development activities. A number of bright and talented Sudanese civil servants have emerged who can be considered as likely candidates to staff project planning units now being started in the regional ministries. Ties between the Department of Planning and the line ministries are being established as each defines their role in the design, execution, and monitoring of these small projects. The fairly recent interest taken by USAID in the Self-Help Fund in terms of review of proposals and assistance in follow-up and movement of funds has made these results possible.

3. A proposal for the first activity to be financed under the research portion of the RFPP was drafted, reviewed, and as the quarter came to a close, undergoing final revision. A joint Clark University/University of Khartoum team came to el Obeid in August as part of the design effort behind the Ag. Marketing and Extension project being planned for Kordofan. After interviewing

officials and examining the type of information available the team proposed two types of surveys - one a general overview of the natural resources of the region, and a more detailed survey of two districts (one each in a zone of sandy soils and clay soils). Since resource surveys were contemplated early on as activities to be sponsored by the RFPP and the need for such information for planning purposes is in fact great, the Regional Minister of Finance and Director of Planning both saw the proposal developed by the consultant team as something that should be considered for funding through the resources of the RFPP.

While everyone agrees that there is a need for such a survey, and that it would be a wise use of project funds, agreement as to how to carry it out is far from being reached. The Kordofan Planning Advisor has met with various department directors concerning their views of the proposal, the type of information that they need, methodology for data collection and analysis, modes of presentation and organization of information, and how such a survey could best be carried out. Besides the differing views of USAID, the Central Government, and the Regional Government concerning how such a survey should be done, there are many different ideas including legitimate but rather unrelated objectives that people at the regional level are trying to achieve (such as provide work and incentive payments to their poorly paid staff in the hope of delaying their flight for the Gulf). All of these divergent views and hidden agenda are now being reconciled into a proposal which will be submitted by the regional government for further discussion with the DLRD.

4. The process of assisting in recruitment and staffing of the Planning Department continued throughout the period. Four posts were filled with recent graduates in economics and business. A person for a position as an agricultural economist was selected and is expected to join the department in the middle of October.

While generally inexperienced, the new staff appears very energetic, willing to work hard, and highly motivated. All seek the opportunity for training and to work under the supervision of more experienced professionals. Many have foregone incentives and allowances paid at their previous place of employment and have made substantial sacrifices joining the department. A support staff including typist, driver and clerk have also been assembled. With additional training and supervision these people will greatly facilitate work of the department.

5. While most formal training activity has ground to a halt, two initiatives on the part of the Planning Director and Planning Advisor have begun to take shape. Given the name "Seminar Series," two programs have been conceived which will draw almost exclusively on local resources and talent - using little if any project funds. First, and as of this writing already started, is a seminar entitled "Introduction to Micro-computers." The purpose is to acquaint interested civil servants with the operation and possible application of this technology in their own work. The ten participants come from all of the regional ministries and include economists, statisticians, and engineers. Meetings are held once each week and the group is broken into two sections so as to give everyone hands-on experience. The computer and software is provided by DAI and the Kordofan Planning Advisor, and the Advisor leads the seminar at his home in the evenings.

The second seminar which will meet once a month will explore different topics in regional planning and development. Different individuals will be asked to lead each session in which problems relating to their work in the region will be presented and discussed. The intent is to develop a support group of people interested and working on development problems to act as a counterweight to forces of anti-intellectualism, stagnation, bureaucracy and despair within the civil service.

OUTLOOK

The quarter just ending brought to light several problems which must be considered in thinking about project sponsored activities in the time remaining. Among them are:

1. The future of the Planning Department depends upon the strength of one man, the current director Saeed Abu Kambal. During his absence while attending a short course in the United States, very little progress was possible in getting the department organized and functioning. The new staff requires constant supervision and guidance and the department itself needs a strong advocate for it to begin to play a significant role as an adjunct to the decision making process. In the absence of the director, despite the good intentions of the new staff, the department stagnates and falls into the same all too familiar pattern of inaction seen in many other government departments.
2. The still poorly defined operating relationship between civil servants at the regional and national levels will make the process of building capacity and that of actually doing development planning work a difficult and frustrating exercise. As long as the region is dependent upon the central government for resources, including those provided by foreign donors, it is difficult to see how any of the presumed benefits of "decentralized" planning and administration can be realized. Granted the intent of all concerned is that of regional autonomy and development within the framework of national goals and objectives. The present institutional arrangements designed to ensure such an outcome appear counterproductive.
3. Poor conditions of service and less than satisfactory work space will continue to hamper efforts at building up a well staffed and functioning department. The staff are far better off than their Khartoum colleagues in terms of housing, transport and the general quality of life. Their low salary and relative isolation

from advancement opportunities and possibility for overseas training will always be an incentive to migrate to the Gulf as soon as the opportunity comes. Presently the staff is crammed into a noisy and small office in which it is very difficult to work. Payment of incentives for specified tasks considered beyond the ordinary functions expected of government employees could greatly improve their personal finances. Redistribution and better use of office space within the Ministry of Finance could solve the present problem of overcrowding. A far more serious problem is that of the low morale and feelings of futility expressed by young Sudanese working in the regional ministries. Changing social, political, and economic conditions have brought about feelings of anger and resentment. Under these circumstances it is rather unrealistic to speak seriously of institution and capacity building.

4. The Director General of the regional Ministry of Finance and Economy has been transferred. While the outgoing director was never particularly involved, or for that matter interested in the Department of Planning (not to mention the RFPP), it is unknown who will replace him and to what extent that person will want to be involved in project activities.

The program of activities proposed through June 1984 is based on assumption that some of these problems could and would be overcome. Given their number and degree of difficulty, it will take a good deal of dedication from all of the parties involved to show that regional planning can benefit the people of Kordofan.

REGIONAL REPORT
EQUATORIA REGION
SEPTEMBER 30, 1983

The third quarter of 1983 saw virtually no project activity in the south. The three new regions of Equatoria, Bahr el Ghazal and Upper Nile came into being on July 1 when the former government of the Southern Region ceased to exist. The reallocation of manpower and equipment to the new governments was not completed by the end of the quarter. This transition period brought normal government operations to a standstill during the months of July and August and for much of September. Project activities anticipated for this time period were indefinitely postponed and ultimately cancelled. A joint Kordofan-Southern Region workshop had been proposed for July and a planning seminar was to be held in Yambio in September. Neither took place.

The confusion brought about by the government reorganization was compounded by the absence of key Sudanese project personnel. The Acting Director General of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning/Juba spent six weeks in Khartoum attending to matters related to the reorganization. As the former Director of Planning, he is the only high-level administrator in his ministry with working knowledge of the project. The new Minister was also occupied in Khartoum and was not met by the Technical Advisor/Juba until late October. The new Director of Planning also spent more than a month in Khartoum as the Equatoria Region's representative on the committee responsible for dividing the resources of the old government into three. He returned to Juba in mid-October. Obviously these key ministry officials had a formidable job of organizing their resources and had little time to attend to project activities. Finally, the Juba Advisor was absent for almost one month with hepatitis and for another three weeks while on home leave.

The two counterparts of the Juba Advisor were selected by the Project Director as candidates for master's degree programs in the U.S. During the general government malaise they spent considerable time in applying to various universities and in arranging to take the required TOEFL and GRE examinations, both of which are scheduled for late 1983. A third planner was enrolled at the Development Studies and Research Center of the University of Khartoum for the Diploma Course in Planning. The five participants in this course sponsored by the project last year finished their studies and returned to their respective ministries. Of the five two were reassigned to Upper Nile Region, one to Bahr el Ghazal, and two returned to the Ministry of Regional Affairs and Administration in Juba.

The Juba counterparts had the opportunity in August to meet with the new Project Director in Khartoum, discussing the draft work plan and exchanging ideas on many project concerns. Fortunately the Acting Director General and the Acting Director of Planning were also able to spend some time with the Project Director. Although the work plan was not finalized in this quarter, the long term prospects of implementing the project successfully were greatly enhanced by the ability of these new people to meet and agree on project strategies. Of particular importance was the commitment made by the Project Director that upon receipt of the Work Plan for July - December 1983 funds would be released to the Project Account in Juba for the implementation of activities as scheduled.

Planning staff were reassigned to the new regions on the basis of tribal affiliation. Many of the more senior planners have gone to BEG and some to Upper Nile, so that Equatoria is left with a very young and inexperienced staff. Other than the positions of Director and Deputy Director, there are three levels based on the number of years of experience. New people, usually B.Sc. holders in Economics, are hired as assistant inspectors of

planning. After two years they may be promoted to inspector of planning, and in two more years to senior inspector of planning. These promotions are not automatic. Equatoria has one senior inspector, and several planners who have enough time to qualify for that position. One of these is in a Master's program in Population Studies at the University of Michigan, and will not return for another year. A second has been seconded to a private development agency and will be available in January. A third inspector of planning is one of the counterparts of the Juba Advisor and is expected to enter a Master's program sometime next year. The fourth inspector is the acting head of the Department of Statistics, the position previously held by the acting director of planning. Of the six assistant inspectors of planning, one is attending the Diploma course in Planning at the University of Khartoum and will be there until September next year. Three have only been recently hired, leaving two assistant inspectors with some experience. One of these is the other candidate for the project supported Master's program. The Department of Statistics has five assistant inspectors of planning.

It is obvious that the Directorate of Planning/Juba has a very small number of experienced people. Planned training activities will probably take two of these people away for two years, perhaps starting early next year. Two people now in training will be gone for another year. One seconded planner will return in January. It appears that 1984 will be more difficult than 1983 in terms of qualified planners available to carry out the mission of the Directorate of Planning.

Although the Directorate of Planning in Bahr el Ghazal is not yet functioning, they are fortunate in having the most senior staff of the three regions. The Director is not known to this Advisor, but the Deputy Director (a position not staffed in Juba) is the former Deputy Director of the Directorate in Juba. He may be going for a Master's degree program in the near future,

sponsored in part by the U.N. There are five senior inspectors of planning, two inspectors, and one assistant inspector on the current roster. It is not known whether more positions will be filled. Upper Nile has two senior inspectors and two assistant inspectors. They would seem to need a much larger staff but no contact has been made to ascertain their plans.

One of the major issues faced by all the donor agencies with the reorganization is how they will function vis-a-vis the three governments instead of one. It is the intention of this project to continue to provide training opportunities for planners from all three regions, although other project activities will be concentrated in Equatoria. It is impossible for one advisor to cover the entire south. Officials in Bahr el Ghazal have strongly expressed their desire to be included in all project activities, and have endorsed wholeheartedly the idea of placing a second project advisor in Wau on a permanent basis.

APPENDIX I

KORDOFAN WORK PLAN

KORDOFAN REGION

October-December 1983 Work Program & January-June 1984 Advance Program of Project-sponsored Activities.

TRAINING

Name of Activity: #T1. Workshop in Needs Identification and Project Management

Description: This follows the broad overview provided to District Council officials in May of issues surrounding regional planning and development and their role in the planning process. The workshop is organized to expose them to the skills and techniques they will find useful in performing their jobs. Emphasis will be placed on the early critical stages of problem assessment and the formulation of solution strategies. This will include critical thinking about cause-effect relationships, use of quantitative and qualitative measures of problem severity, definition of clear and realistic objectives or statements of purpose and the use of a systems based approach to designing solutions with a high potential for effectiveness and feasibility. In addition the role of district officials in project execution and management will be explored with attention given to the various approaches and techniques available to guide progress toward achieving intended results and introducing modifications in projects as changed conditions warrant.

Timing: 5-24 November 1983, allowing for 18 days of work.

Participants: Two administrative officers from each of nine districts. One observer from each regional ministry (preferably individuals who will be participating in the project planning units that are just beginning to be established).

Organization and Execution: The workshop will be designed and organized by the Department of Planning, Regional Ministry of Finance with the assistance of the Kordofan Planning Advisor. Most of the sessions on Needs Identification will be conducted by the Planning Advisor with assistance from individuals in the regional government familiar with how projects are currently identified and with project management experience. Given the fact that these topics will be presented at a fairly basic level it is felt that no outside lecturers or organizations need to be involved. In a future workshop however, the assistance of the Management Development Center (Ministry of Health, Khartoum) should be solicited to explore the possibility of using and applying more sophisticated programming techniques including PCRT, MBO, and Critical Path Method.

Name of Activity: #T2. Introduction to Regional Planning and Development for Department Directors in the Regional Ministries.

Description: To realize improvements in project planning and implementation as well as the formulation and execution of a coordinated development strategy for the region, it is essential to reach department directors who serve both as technical experts and administrators. By and large these people are not trained in economics, finance, or planning, but rather in specializations within the fields of agriculture, engineering, veterinary sciences, education, medicine, law, and public administration. Their participation in the planning process is essential given the need for their training and familiarity with the region at several critical junctures in the project planning cycle, plan making, and implementation. The objective then of this short course is to define their role in the planning process, convince them of the benefits accruing from their participation, and provide guidance in the form of concepts, methods, and techniques to enable them to participate.

Timing: It is proposed that this course run from 3-15 December 1983 for a total of 12 working days. Because of the heavy load of responsibilities that these people have it is not possible to take them completely away from their duties with the regional government. It is suggested that there be two sessions each day, one from 8-10 in the morning, and an evening session from 7-9. This will reserve the best hours of the day for course sessions, while leaving time for the department directors to attend to the affairs of their respective ministries.

Participants: Department Directors from all five regional ministries for a total of approximately 20 participants.

Organization and Execution: The Department of Planning, Regional Ministry of Finance will assume overall responsibility for course organization and execution. Development of the syllabus will be done by the contractor chief of party together with the Development Studies Research Center at the University of Khartoum. The Kordofan Planning Advisor will be consulted during syllabus preparation based upon his knowledge of existing skill levels and objectives. The DSRC will be asked to design and present lectures on various topics included in the course program. The Kordofan Planning Advisor and the Director of Planning will participate as lecturers to supplement the presentations of the DSRC.

Name of Activity: #T3. On the Job Training: Project Design, Analysis and Monitoring.

Description: One of the functions which the Department of Planning has assumed is providing assistance with the design of development projects, performing analysis of anticipated benefits and costs, and monitoring progress on projects being implemented. Several

projects, at various stages in their "life cycle" are currently being tracked with the department's portfolio expanding rapidly to include both public sector and private sector project activity. The work needed to be done on such projects offers an excellent opportunity for training in methods and techniques of a very practical nature. In addition such on the job training enables the department's staff to immediately and effectively fill a large void which has existed concerning effective use of development funds. While more formal training including theory and hard analytical skills will be desirable in the future, great progress can be made by working at a fairly basic level with actual projects. The experience gained through on the job training will serve as excellent preparation for more formal course work in project planning.

Timing: This activity is to continue through the entire period October through June.

Participants: Professional level staff of the department of planning plus individuals working with project planning units being established in the other regional ministries.

Organization and Execution: On the job training will be provided by the Kordofan Planning Advisor, the UNICEF Planning Advisor under the auspices of the Zonal Development Program, and by outside experts who from time to time may be brought in to perform an analysis, feasibility study, or an evaluation of a development project. Projects included in this on the job training program will be of four separate varieties - those financed (or proposed for financing) from 1) the region's development budget, 2) the development fund provided by the Regional Finance and Planning Project, 3) the American Ambassador's Self-Help Fund, and 4) the UNICEF projects fund. These projects will form the core of the workshop portion of the short course planned for early 1984 in project planning. The short course will be designed to address the issues that come up in the process of on the job training, allow further development of skills and techniques necessary for project analysis and critically examine the usefulness of conventional approaches to project planning in the Sudanese regional context.

Name of Activity: #T4. Short Course in Project Planning.

Description: A course of instruction intended to acquaint individuals from the regional ministries who will be participating in the work of the project planning units with the concept of "project cycle." The emphasis will be placed on the following aspects: 1) design including problem identification, purpose expansion and generation, and specification of detailed solution sets; 2) technical analysis of alternative solutions from the point of view of effectiveness and feasibility; and 3) project implementation, monitoring and modification. Also attention will be given

to the role of the development project in an overall regional development strategy and as an integral component of the broader process of planned change. The outcome of the course is to have provided the orientation and some of the essential skills and common perspective necessary for the operation of project planning units in the regional ministries.

Timing: Course will be divided into three units - a series of theoretical and methodological sessions (3 weeks); directed field investigation in which project ideas will be developed (4 weeks); review and critique of project proposals (2 weeks). The course would begin in early February 1984 and be concluded by mid April.

Participants: Three officials from each of the four regional ministries plus two from the Department of Planning.

Organization and Execution: As the teaching of project cycle is something that has been done by universities, institutes, and development organizations, it is preferable to employ a well developed and tested syllabus already available making appropriate modifications where needed. DAI/Washington will be requested to gather and submit for review and consideration several such institutional packages to the Regional Ministry of Finance and the DLRD (Khartoum). The program that is selected will be either conducted by instructors recruited locally or if it seems appropriate by outside consultants expert in delivering training in this area of project planning. The Department of Planning with the assistance of the Kordofan Planning Advisor will integrate the syllabus selected with a program of directed field investigation which will allow for application of the materials presented in the lecture sequence. Likewise the final section consisting of a review and critique of project proposals resulting from the field exercises will be organized and conducted by the Kordofan Planning Advisor.

Name of Activity: #T5. Seminar Series - a. "Planning for Regional Development" b. "Introduction to Micro Computers"

Description: These two series are intended to be informal evening gatherings of interested persons to discuss in the first case issues that arise from the various planning activities of the regional government and in the second case gain familiarity with the micro computer hardware and software and explore possible applications to planning work in the region. Both series will utilize almost exclusively locally available resources including articles, documents, and other readings brought to Kordofan and available through the region's evolving documentation center, as well as the training and experience of people in various fields who are living and working in El Obeid and are interested in either leading or participating in such seminars.

Timing: Seminars will begin in the middle of October and depending upon the level of interest will continue through June 1984. The seminars on Planning and Regional Development will be scheduled once each month with advance distribution of reading materials, notes, or outlines to persons interested in attending. Introduction to micro-computers will meet once each week with the exception of the one week each month when the other seminar meets. Saturday evenings will be designated as the meeting date for both of the seminar series.

Participants: Maximum number of participants for seminar on Planning and Regional Development is 10. Maximum number of participants for Introduction to Micro Computers is 6.

Organization and Execution: Both seminars will be organized by the Department of Planning on consultation with the Kordofan Planning Advisor. Programming of topics for the Planning and Regional Development seminar will be done jointly by the Director of Planning and the Planning Advisor and invitations will be extended to various people in the regional government, as well as visiting officials from Khartoum and foreign consultants working in the region to conduct sessions. The micro computer seminar will be led by the Planning Advisor with support as needed from the DAI/Washington home office.

Name of Activity: #T6. Formal Short Courses Outside of Sudan

Description: Functional short courses of instruction in methods and techniques of planning analysis must be identified, their programs examined and assessed against the training needs of the Department of Planning. If courses are found that offer a cost effective way of providing the training and broadening of the Sudanese professionals engaged in planning work, then the process of application, gaining acceptance and funding should be undertaken.

Timing: By December 1983 a list of short courses and summary of their offerings should be provided by DAI/Washington for review by the DLRSD, Department of Planning, and expatriate advisors. If the decision is made that any program offers opportunities for meeting the professional development needs of planning technicians not otherwise available, the process of application and funding should start in early 1984 with a view toward spring or summer starting dates.

Participants: Participants should be selected based upon their potential and abilities as demonstrated through their involvement in on the job training and locally held workshops and short courses. A clear understanding should be reached concerning their

planning work with the regional government after completion of their training outside of Sudan. Arrangements must be made to reassign their duties while absent from their positions and care taken to ensure that all functions taken on by the Planning Department can be continued while foreign training is in progress. If more than one person is to receive overseas training it will be advisable to phase their participation so as not to reduce the already limited manpower available.

Organization and Execution: Given its extensive experience in the area of training, DAI/Washington has been requested to put together a selective catalogue of short courses dealing with planning thought and practice relevant to developing countries. Establishment of the suitability and appropriateness of such courses for Sudanese working in Kordofan Region will be the responsibility of the project director, director of planning, and expatriate advisors. Selection of candidates, development of a plan for integration of trained individuals into the region's planning process, and submission of applications will be the job of the director of planning in consultation with the Kordofan Planning Advisor. Responsibility for financial arrangements including tuition, living expenses, and travel will be handled by the Project Director in Khartoum.

Name of Activity: #T7. Skills Workshop: a. "Technical Writing and Report Preparation" b. "Presentation Techniques"

Description: Perhaps one of the most essential but frequently overlooked skills needed by planners are in the area of communicating the results of their research and analysis to other people responsible for making decisions. For this reason a workshop covering both written and audio-visual techniques for presenting findings and recommendations which usually take the form of projects and plans will be offered. Many programs of instruction are available to choose from and it is proposed that a one week program be organized for each workshop, relying on already existing materials including texts and exercises used by universities and other training institutes. Since mastery of these skills comes only from frequent practice and supervision it is proposed that a carefully designed program of follow-up be established for all participants in which they will be encouraged to employ the concepts and techniques in their own work and receive feedback and criticism to enable them to further develop their communications skills.

Timing: Technical Writing and Report Preparation - one week in April 1984. Presentation Techniques - one week in May 1984.

Participants: Professionals from the Department of Planning and all project planning units in the regional ministries. About 20 participants.

Organization and Execution: An experienced and competent instructor in technical writing with an emphasis on the social sciences should be employed to develop a syllabus and lead the workshop.

25

Similarly, one instructor in the use of oral and audio-visual techniques for presentation of technical information should be also employed to do the same for the workshop on presentation techniques. The development of the syllabus should be done in consultation with the Kordofan Planning Advisor who will be responsible for supervising the important follow-up phase in which the participants will be expected to apply and perfect these communications skills.

MATERIALS AND EQUIPMENT SUPPORT

Activity: #M1. To assist in establishing a documentation center the following will be provided using funds from the Regional Finance and Planning Project:

1. Ten steel file cabinets
2. Ten bookcases
3. One photocopy machine along with a year's supply of chemicals
4. A fund for acquisition of books, publications, and for other expenses in establishing the collection

File cabinets will be purchased in El Obeid and can be delivered immediately. Bookcases will be built by local carpenters in El Obeid and can be delivered 30 days from placing the order. As for the photocopy machine and acquisition of books, publications and journals it will be necessary for the DLRD to assist in procurement and making arrangements for training of a technician from El Obeid in routine maintenance of the equipment. Arrangements will also have to be made in establishing a safe and fast way of bringing in literature and sending it on to El Obeid. The Department of Planning will submit requests for specific books, reports and publications as its needs become more apparent.

The regional government will provide a room adequate to house the collection with sufficient space and furnishings to allow government officials to make use of the documents. While professional staff from the Department of Planning will be involved in the initial start up and organization of the collection, a clerk will be appointed and given training in management of the documentation center. Policies and regulations will be established by the Department of Planning covering access and use of materials with provisions made for continued growth of the collection in the future. A target date of mid November is suggested for opening of the center.

Funds for local purchase of equipment should be transferred to El Obeid in October so that all equipment is in place by the middle of November. The room should be designated and made available by the regional government in October so that any necessary maintenance can be carried out including cleaning, painting, installation of new locks, and improvement in lighting. Photocopy machine should be set up and ready for use by mid-October

to allow a head start in reproducing many of the documents available locally but in private hands. An inventory and annotated bibliography is in progress, being conducted by the Department of Planning to identify locally available materials. Once the selected documents are photocopied they will form the initial core of the center's collection.

Activity: #M2. Aside from equipping the documentation center, equipment support of a more general nature has been requested for the Department of Planning. In particular, calculators, and typewriters have been mentioned as important for the Department's work. These items along with the others requested many months ago should be available to the department by the end of the year.

RESEARCH

Activity: #R1. The primary and perhaps only activity to be undertaken during this period will be a natural resources survey. It is anticipated that a proposal from the regional government will be finalized in late September and submitted to the DLRD for review and comment. By early November the concerns of all parties should have been reconciled and the process of selecting an institution to conduct the survey begun immediately. A target date of early January 1984 is suggested as the beginning of the work - depending of course on how long it takes to identify an executing institution and finalize an agreement. The survey covering the entire region is viewed as a prelude to more intensive investigations focusing on specific districts about which little is known concerning natural resource endowment. These additional studies are being considered for funding by a new USAID Agricultural Sector Project currently in the design stage.

Activity: #R2. Using the experience gained in designing, organizing and carrying out the natural resources survey, a similar investigation will be proposed to assess man-made resources concentrating on such infrastructure items as schools, roads, communications, water supply, health care facilities, housing, and the pattern of human population settlement. Finally a survey of human resources aimed at identifying the condition of the people - their health, education, life styles, skills, economic pursuits, patterns of movement, preferences and wants will also be considered and a proposal developed. These two proposals should be submitted for review and funding in April 1984 so that work can begin early in the next planning period starting in July 1984.

PROJECTS

Activity: #P1. The Kheiran Vegetable Production Project will continue to be implemented with all inputs purchased and delivered to the production units by the end of the year. Depending upon when the excavation and construction of wells are completed some

units will be able to plant a winter crop. However, it is expected that most will begin with a necessarily smaller summer crop. A continuing process of offering technical advice to farmers will take place throughout the period and accompanying the horticulturalists on field visits will be planners from the Department of Planning to begin monitoring of projects impacts and evaluation of the scheme.

Activity: #P2. The Rashad Transportation Infrastructure Project proposal first brought to light almost one a half years ago will be revived and investigated in some detail. It is suggested that this project be used as one of the case studies for field investigation in conjunction with the short course in project planning to begin in February 1984. Participants from the Ministries of Agriculture and Housing and Public Utilities would concentrate on this project with the objective of coming up with a sound, well considered proposal to be financed by the Regional Finance and Planning Project development projects fund with implementation to begin in April 1984.

Activity: #P3. During this period another project proposal should be identified and work begun on the necessary design and analysis tasks. Suggestions should be entertained from District Council officials - particularly after their attendance at the workshop in Needs Identification and Project Management in November and from the Project Planning Units in the regional ministries as they begin to gear up and start operations. This project proposal should be completed by the end of June and considered for funding in the following planning period from July 1984.

EQUATORIA REGION

WORK PLAN JULY - DECEMBER 1983

With the Division of the Southern Region into three new regions as of July 1, 1983, the Regional Finance and Planning Project will concentrate its activities in Equatoria for the remainder of 1983. It is hoped that project activities will be initiated in the other regions as they are able to organize their new governments and determine what their needs are. The activities planned for Equatoria, together with the implementation schedule and budget, are described herein.

TRAINING

The formal training activities will be initiated during this Work Plan period. Nominations for Master's Degree programs at universities in the United States have been approved for two candidates from the Regional Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning. These candidates are scheduled to take the required English (TOEFL) and Graduate Record examinations in November and December respectively. Funds are needed to pay for their transportation to Khartoum and living expenses there while taking the tests. The candidates will also apply to several universities in the States for admission into relevant planning and/or economic development programs. This activity will be continuous but intermittent throughout this plan period. A third staff member of the Directorate of Planning has been enrolled at the Development Studies and Research Center of the University of Khartoum. He will take the Diploma Course on Economic Planning for a duration of nine months. Funds are needed for his travel to Khartoum, living expenses there, and the course fees.

An informal, on-the-job training program will be conducted in the Central Ministry of Finance for three staff members of the Directorate of Planning in Juba. They will be assigned to work with relevant Central Ministry officials for a period of two months in order to gain an understanding of procedures and policies which relate directly to their assigned positions in Juba. Funds are required for their transport to and from Khartoum and for their subsistence while there. This activity is expected to start on or about November 1.

RESEARCH

In order to assist those officials at both the regional and local government levels who are responsible for submission of project proposals for funding by the Regional Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, a Project Preparation Guide will be produced. It will contain explanations and give examples of the forms and procedures used by the Ministry in evaluating the proposals, with particular reference to project budgeting and the allocation of funds. Funds for this activity are needed for the reproduction and distribution of the Guide.

As the first step in a long-range goal of improving the Planning library/reference center, funds are requested to purchase periodicals and publications to be specified.

In view of the many personnel changes resulting from the creation of the new regions, it is necessary to evaluate the staff and organization of the Directorate of Planning. This activity will be conducted by the Planning Director and the Technical Advisor and will enable a rational in-house training program to be initiated in the next Work Plan period. No expenditure of funds is anticipated.

There are many ongoing projects in the region which have not been monitored for some time. These projects will be visited in the course of a three-week period to determine their implementation stages, current requirements and recent financial history. This activity will provide an excellent opportunity for on-the-job training in project evaluation while at the same time suggesting potential projects for funding under the Model Project element of the SRFPF. Expenses incurred will be for vehicle rental, fuel and per diem. Two or three Inspectors of Planning will be involved in this work, at times to be accompanied by the Technical Advisor.

Although there are many studies and reports of various kinds which have been produced in the past ten years, it has been observed that many of these have been of little use to the Directorate of Planning. Frequently they contain original data which has probably been obtained at great expense. In order to accurately assess the data needs of the Directorate of Planning, it is necessary to conduct a document search and review of relevant reports with recommendations as to their reliability and suggested use. It is expected that a consultant who is both familiar with development issues in the south and who can critically evaluate such reports will be needed for two to four weeks. Funds requested are for consultant fees.

MODEL PROJECT

In the March planning workshop a project was suggested for funding under the Model Project element of the SRFPF. It was entitled "Food Production for Juba Town" and was suggested by the Chairman of the Juba Central Area Council. In order to determine whether this broad problem area does indeed have potential for meeting the funding requirements, basic studies are needed for the identification of a specific project and for the preparation of a project proposal. This work will be conducted by an interministerial study group and is expected to be completed by early December. Funds are needed for vehicle rental, fuel, per diem, and report production expenses. Assuming that this work will be completed in a timely manner, funds are also requested for the first stage of implementation of the project.

PROCUREMENT

During the last work plan period a list of supplies and equipment needed by the Directorate of Planning was submitted to the Project Director. Funds are now needed to purchase these items, almost all of which are available in Juba. Pro Forma invoices will be provided listing these items and their costs.

In order to alleviate the chronic and severe shortage of vehicles necessary to conduct the day-to-day business of the Directorate, funds are needed for three activities. The first is the repair and maintenance of several vehicles which are now in the possession of the Directorate but have not been roadworthy for some time. The second involves the purchase of new Suzuki(s) which can be purchased with Sudanese pounds with the assistance of the NCA (Norwegian Church Aid) as was done recently. Third is the purchase of five motorbikes, also with local currency and available in Juba.

WORK PLAN BUDGET

TRAINING

15,300

Testing for M.Sc.Candidates	3,500
DSRC Course	3,800
Central Ministry of Finance	8,000

RESEARCH

34,750

Project Preparation Guide	25,000
Periodicals and Publications	2,750
Monitoring of Project Implementation	4,500
Review and Analysis of Existing Studies	2,500

MODEL PROJECT

95,000

Basic studies for the identification of a project and proposal preparation	20,000
Phase One implementation	75,000

PROCUREMENT

132,500

Office supplies and equipment	80,000
✓ Purchase of new vehicle(s)	20,000
✓ Repairs/maintenance of existing vehicles	20,000
✓ Purchase of five motorbikes	12,500

TOTAL

277,500

ACTIVITY . JULY . AUGUST . SEPTEMBER . OCTOBER . NOVEMBER . DECEMBER .

TRAINING

Testing of MSC
Candidates

DSRC Course
Central Ministry

RESEARCH

Project Preparation
Guide

Purchase of Periodi-
cals & Publications

Manpower Evaluation

Project Monitoring

Review of Existing
Studies

MODEL PROJECT

Studies & Proposal

PROCUREMENT

Supplies

Vehicles

62

APPENDIX III

ECONOMIC CONSIDERATIONS IN
DECENTRALIZATION POLICY

David G. Edens

ECONOMIC CONSIDERATIONS IN DECENTRALIZATION POLICY

Decentralization means that several levels of government have the authority to raise revenue, to supply present goods and services to the public, and to invest resources in order to increase the supply of future goods and services. This dispersal of authority and responsibility implies that diverse levels of government exert influence on the distribution of income and wealth and the stability of the economic system, in addition to the more obvious influence on the allocation of resources. In the Sudan, the main levels of government involved in these processes are the national or central government, nine regional governments and scores of area, rural and village councils representing local interests.

The present legal basis for this dispersal of authority is the result of a long evolutionary process. The Local Government Ordinance of 1951 established a framework of local councils to finance and deliver local services, but the development of autonomous government under this legislation was abridged in 1960 with the Provincial Administration Act. This legislation established Provincial Councils to which the administrative center of gravity tended to shift. Provincial authority was further strengthened by the Local Government Act of 1971 which expanded their planning, executing and coordinating powers. But since the 1950s a perception has existed that the system did not work as it had been intended. The presence of dissatisfaction at each stage of the process led to the legislation and reform establishing the next stage. This groping process was repeated in the Regional Government Act of 1980 and the Local Government Act of 1981. Together these acts provide the new regionalism which attempts to balance authority and responsibility between national, regional and local levels of government. While the general outline of the new system has been provided in the legislation, operational details are as yet unclear.

2/5

Aside from the political issues implied in this devolution of power, certain economic questions will have to be answered if the new system is to work and endure. These questions are, first, what is the most efficient allocation of financial and administrative responsibility among the three levels? Second, what is the most efficient distribution of actual or potential tax sources among them? And third, what is the most efficient locus of responsibility for planning public sector projects?

THE BENEFITS AND COSTS OF DECENTRALIZATION

A basic assumption made in this paper is that the more centralized are finance and planning responsibilities, the more standardized will be the pattern of goods and services rendered the public and the more inflexible and insensitive to local conditions will be the planning process. Conversely, the less centralized the responsibilities, the more diverse will be the pattern of goods and services supplied and the more flexible and attuned to local preferences will be the planning process. It is presumed here that in a large and geographically diverse country, such as the Sudan, with a relatively small, scattered and ethnically diverse population, decentralization in principle is a good thing because it promises a relatively effective means for meeting the distinctive and particular needs of diverse localities and regions.

Against these presumed benefits, however, must be weighed some distinct disadvantages or costs. In a decentralized administrative system there is a tendency to waste resources through excessive duplication of administrative facilities, personnel and functions. There is also the danger of waste of resources through fragmented, inconsistent and contradictory public decision-making. In addition, serious costs may arise through the loss of economies of scale when similar activities are undertaken on a piecemeal basis by numerous local or regional authorities. Also, local needs may go unsatisfied for a number of reasons when finance depends on local taxation.

Skill shortages are reflected in a low tax collection capability. Local or regional authorities may be inhibited in levying new taxes by fear of negative location effects. A mobile population tends to move to lower tax regions. Finally, social needs may far exceed available resources when the tax base rests on local agricultural activity.

THE DISTRIBUTION OF RESPONSIBILITY

The foregoing considerations point to the calculations needed to determine the most desirable distribution of responsibility among the three levels of government. The goal of decentralization policy should be to distribute responsibility among the levels of government in such a way as to maximize the net benefits of decentralization to society. This means, in practice, assigning each level of government the responsibility for those services it can supply more efficiently in relation to other levels of government. The term "efficiency" is used here in the sense of benefits over costs. Although used in the context of economic resources, the meaning could be expanded to include political costs and benefits as well.

At the national level, the authorities by necessity will have to be responsible for goods and services that are essentially public in character. A pure public good is one whose benefits are so diffuse that they are consumed by all members of society, and whose benefits cannot be isolated and sold discretely to individual purchasers. The classic example of a pure public good is national defense. All members of society benefit from national defense and there is no way that increments of it can be isolated, packaged and sold in markets to particular beneficiaries. Firms will not undertake to produce it because there is no way they can recoup their costs, and lower levels of government will not do so because they cannot get tax beneficiaries outside their jurisdictional boundaries to pay for it. The benefits of defense are

31

internal to the nation but external to any subset of the nation, so that the provision of national defense will not be produced if not undertaken by national authorities using national resources.

Other services of similar collective nature, best done at the national level, include international relations, foreign trade policy, national development policy, macroeconomic policy in general, and the supply of interregional transport and communications. In the Sudanese context, a case can also be made for national health and literacy programs from which the nation as a whole will benefit.

At the regional and local levels responsibility for services should in principle be given to the jurisdiction within which the benefits accrue. For example, if it can be demonstrated that the benefits of a project in a particular council area will be consumed entirely within that jurisdiction, then there is a strong case for making the provision of this particular service the responsibility of the area council rather than the regional government. There may be, however, complicating circumstances which weigh against this conclusion. Suppose for example, we are considering health or education services. In these kinds of activities there are likely to be substantial economies of scale. For technical reasons, it may be socially more efficient to provide health or education services on a regional basis, bring consumers to regional centers, rather than trying to provide numerous small centers at the area council level. Otherwise, if left to the area councils, the desirable amount of service might be too expensive to provide.

Furthermore, at the area council level the lack of trained manpower represents a serious constraint on the efficient supply of services. From the social view point, any service should be supplied up to the quantity at which marginal social costs of the service are equal to marginal social benefits. If shifting functions to the regional level that might otherwise be done at the area council level lowers marginal cost relative to marginal benefit,

28

then the shift should be made, at least temporarily until the capacities of the area councils can be improved through specialized training and improved public education. But if this is done care should be taken to devise institutional arrangements that ensure that regional authorities will be sensitive to the needs and project ideas arising at the area council level. Without this link, some of the flexibility and diversity of services promised by decentralization would be lost.

THE DISTRIBUTION OF PUBLIC RESOURCES

Let resources follow responsibility. It is clear that once public responsibilities have been assigned to the various levels of government, available resources should be linked to them, for otherwise the assignment of responsibility is meaningless.

At the present time central government transfers account for 60 to 90 percent of total regional revenues. Thus the new regions are heavily dependent on the central government for their sustenance. There is also evidence that local government outlays constitute an increasingly heavy burden on the already overstretched national purse. (See Table 1). According to World Bank figures, payments to local government represented 11 percent of central government expenditures in 1970/71, and by 1980/81 they had risen to 22 percent of total spending. During the 1970s, these transfers grew at a compound rate of 31 percent a year, as compared with an overall growth in central government total spending of 22.8 percent. This increasing call on the Sudanese central treasury is one of several factors contributing to the problems of expanding deficits, increasing inflation and worsening balances of foreign payments. These transfers now exceed the cost of the armed forces and are nearly as large as total development spending.

The existing process of grantsmanship seems to have an inherent bias toward disappointment and unfulfilled expectations. What follows is an exposition of the process that is based on the premise that the participants behave rationally and that it is the structure of the process itself that causes some very undesirable results.

TABLE 1. THE COMPOSITION OF CENTRAL GOVERNMENT
ACTUAL EXPENDITURES, 1980/81

	<u>EXPENDITURES (LS)</u> (MM)	<u>PERCENT SHARES</u>
CURRENT EXPENDITURES	902.0	73.3
ECONOMIC SERVICES	43.3	3.5
SOCIAL SERVICES	60.5	4.9
REPAYMENT OF LOANS	75.0	6.1
ARMED FORCES	150.8	12.3
LOCAL GOVERNMENT	265.8	21.6
GENERAL ADMINISTRATION	306.6	24.9
DEVELOPMENT EXPENDITURES	289.0	23.5
OTHER	40.0	3.2
TOTAL EXPENDITURES	1231.0	100.0

SOURCE: World Bank, Sudan: Investing for Economic Stabilization and Structural Change (Statistical Annex, Part II, 1982), Table 5.4.

The present system is a loosely structured process in which the participants try to maximize their utility positions. Utility is assumed to be a function of a subjective mix of power, status, income, loyalty to agency and service to constituent interests. Revenues budgeted at the regional level are the region's forecast of its own internally generated revenues, plus expected central transfers. Budgeted regional expenditures are the expected costs involved in fulfilling stated goals and pleasing local constituencies (tribes, townships, etc.). Budgeted expenditures are inflated in order to express unsatisfied regional needs when negotiating budget support with the central authorities. A region's own revenue estimates are unrealistically enlarged in order to nourish the hope of the central authorities that tax effort and fiscal control are being improved at the regional and local levels. Actual

grant revenues may fall short of commitments because they are largely a function of fiscal conditions at the national level. In an era of runaway inflation and financial insufficiency some degree of shortfall is probable.

Specific outcomes of the process are influenced by the particular mix of motives brought to the negotiations by the principals. Although their mix of motives doubtlessly is complex, central government negotiators have an interest in using their power to grant or withhold resources to extract commitments from regional negotiators to increase tax effort and to improve financial management so as to achieve greater financial self sufficiency in the long run.

As for regional negotiators, all of the specified utility variables are served by the simple goal of maximizing grant resources. Power, income, status, agency achievement and constituent acclaim all vary directly with the size of this income stream. Since taxes are a source of constituent discontent, regional politicians may be assumed to measure success in terms of their ability to expand services without increasing taxes. Tax effort concessions made to central authorities may be thought of as prices paid by regional authorities for additional grant income.

In practice the central government usually comes nearer to fulfilling its grant commitments than do regional governments in raising their own revenues. The central government benefits from established institutions and procedures, and it has the power to create money as well. As an illustration of regional shortfall, cumulative own tax revenue commitments for the years 1975-80 in the former southern region were LS 57.1 million, whereas actual collections were only LS 29.5, a 48 percent shortfall. The non-tax shortfall for the period was even greater. Actual cumulative non-tax revenues were LS 10.4 million, while forecasted receipts for the period were LS 29.9 million. Thus the shortfall was 65 percent of expectations. This situation is not confined to the south. In Kordofan, for instance, forecasted regional revenues

were LS 11.6 million for 1981/82, but only 6 million were actually collected in 1981/82.^{1/}

The grants process can be used to explain the tendency of regional authorities to include revenue estimates in their budgets that they have no realistic hope of collecting. As long as regional officials believe they can increase their grant receipts by making inflated own revenue commitments they will do so.

The use of budgets that bear little relation to reality creates confusion and leads to an excess of actual expenditures over actual receipts. In day to day financial management, the continuous cash shortfall encourages the "borrowing" of funds earmarked for particular budget chapters or line items and using them to satisfy more urgent needs elsewhere. When it becomes necessary to make the payment for which the borrowed funds were intended, funds are drawn from a third source to cover the shortage. In effect, funds are borrowed from source A to pay B because the funds obligated to B have already been borrowed to pay C, and so on. Since budget spending obligations always far exceed available resources, the authorities are perpetually under pressure to find more money by juggling accounts. It is for this reason that capital funds find their way into current account and less money is transferred to the area council level of government that was budgeted for it. Another result is the tendency of payments to local vendors and contractors to be continuously in arrears. This leads to loss of confidence in government, compensatory overcharging by local merchants and popular disillusionment with the idea of economic progress as an obtainable goal.

If this interpretation is valid, the grants process is a major cause of fiscal laxity and confusion at the lower levels of government. While it is rooted in rational bargaining behavior, its unstructured format leads to undesirable results. Improved

^{1/} Southern Regional Ministry of Regional Administration, Police and Prisons, Seminar on Decentralization (December 1981), p.58, and Kordofan Regional Ministry of Finance, El Obeid.

efficiency in regional and local government will not be achieved unless the grants process is either reformed or abandoned.

Indications are that the authorities are now moving to reduce dependence on grants by shifting a portion of the national tax base to regional control to permit them to finance more of their own activities directly. It has been announced that, beginning in fiscal 1983-84, personal income taxes, business income taxes and excise tax collections are to be under the control of regional authorities. The proceeds are to be offset against the grant each region otherwise would have received. These new arrangements imply that henceforth a major portion of regional resources will be provided by their own tax revenues and that dependence on the grants process will be substantially reduced. Personal income taxes and business profits taxes account for virtually all of Sudan's direct taxes. In 1980/81 they, plus excise taxes, amounted to LS 180 million. (Table 2.) This represented 23.5 percent of central government revenue and 68 percent of the local government transfer.

As a means of reducing dependence on the existing grants process, this change can only be applauded, although certain new problems are introduced. For one thing there will be a considerable equity problem. Table 3 shows that, on a per capita basis, the direct tax proceeds are heavily concentrated in the Khartoum region. Business profits taxes account for approximately three quarters of direct tax proceeds, so that the spatial distribution of enterprise, as well as profitability and the rate of tax, determine the regional shares in these revenues. Darfur and the southern regions will be seriously disadvantaged unless revenues are redistributed through transfers.

Secondly, tax rates should be applied uniformly throughout the country. Otherwise there would likely be some shifting of taxed resources from higher rate regions to lower rate regions. In cases where the elasticity of the tax base with respect to the rate of tax is greater than one, an increase in the rate will cause a decline in revenues, rather than an increase.^{2/}

^{2/} Elasticity: $\frac{\% \text{ change in value of the base}}{\% \text{ change in the rate of tax}}$

TABLE 2. THE COMPOSITION OF CENTRAL GOVERNMENT
ACTUAL REVENUES, 1980/81

	REVENUE (LS MM)	PERCENT SHARES
TAX REVENUES	608.1	79.2
DIRECT TAXES	115.0	15.0
INDIRECT TAXES	493.1	64.2
EXPORT TAXES	81.0	10.5
IMPORT TAXES	245.1	31.9
EXCISE TAXES	65.0	8.5
OTHER TRADE AND MISCELLANEOUS TAXES	102.0	13.3
NON-TAX REVENUES	160.0	20.8
TOTAL REVENUES	768.1	100.0

SOURCE: World Bank, Sudan: Investing in Economic Stabilization and Structural Change (Statistical Annex, Part II, 1982), Table 5.3.

TABLE 3. CENTRAL GOVERNMENT DIRECT TAX COLLECTIONS
ACCORDING TO REGIONAL SOURCES, 1981/82

REGION	DIRECT TAX (LS M)	1982 POPULATION (M)	PER CAPITA DIRECT TAX
NORTHERN	3500	1070	3.271
EASTERN	8200	2133	3.844
CENTRAL	9300	3993	2.329
KHARTOUM	113600	1723	65.932
KORDOFAN	4200	2988	1.406
DARFUR	2500	2986	0.837
SOUTHERN	1519	5795	0.262

NOTE: 1982 population estimates are that 1983 Census figures discounted one year by the population growth rates for 1973/83 recorded in Table 4.

SOURCES: Direct tax estimate for the South is from Ministry of Regional Administration, Police and Prisons, Southern Region, Seminar on Decentralization (Juba: Southern Region, December 1981), p. 47. All others are from John F. Due, Strengthening the Revenue Systems of the Central Government and Kordofan Region of the Sudan (Khartoum: Report to USAID, 1982), Table 6.

44

There is some evidence that suggests that, unless care is taken to keep rates uniform among regions, inter-regional shifts in resources could be a problem in the Sudan. Table 4 shows that the Sudanese population is capable of considerable mobility. In northern Sudan there is a strong nomadic tradition, and in Eastern, Kordofan and Darfur regions the nomadic share of the population is still substantial. Furthermore, a review of population growth rates over the post-independence years reveals that major population shifts have occurred.

In the third world at large, natural rates of population growth are rarely more than 3.4 percent a year or less than 2.0 percent a year. Applying this range to the Sudan by assuming that in no region are natural rates in excess of 3.4 or less than 2.0, it is clear from Table 4, that the Northern Region, with growth rates of only about one percent a year, has been experiencing a steady drain of population since independence. Net emigration from the Central Region occurred in the 1973-83 period. Emigration from Kordofan until 1973 was followed by immigration thereafter. In the 1973-83 period, Darfur experienced net immigration, most likely from Chad. In general, Khartoum has been the chief recipient of immigrants.

Turning to the South, the very large population shifts evident there are largely attributable to civil strife. Emigration and negative growth in Equatoria and Upper Nile during the 1956-73 period was followed by immigration and high growth in the postwar years.

In general, there is enough evidence of population mobility to suggest that regional taxes on agricultural production, herds, and property, other than real estate, will be increasingly costly to collect at the margin, and that shifting of taxed resources among regions could be a problem unless standard rates are universally applied and effectively maintained.

Finally, there is the problem of deficient administrative capacity at the lower levels of government. In general, central

45

TABLE 4. POPULATION ESTIMATES (M)

<u>REGION</u>	<u>1956</u>	<u>% OF TOTAL</u>	<u>1973</u>	<u>% OF TOTAL</u>	<u>1983</u>	<u>% OF TOTAL</u>
NORTHERN	824	8.1	964	6.5	1083	5.3
EASTERN	941	9.2	1572	10.6	2208	10.6
CENTRAL	2070	20.3	3804	25.6	4013	19.5
KHARTOUM	505	4.9	1150	7.8	1802	8.8
KORDOFAN	1762	7.3	2203	14.9	3093	15.0
DARFUR	1329	13.0	2181	14.7	3094	15.0
EQUATORIA	903	8.8	758	5.1	1406	6.8
BAHR EL GHAZAL	991	9.7	1388	9.4	2266	11.0
UPPER NILE	889	8.7	799	5.4	1600	7.8
TOTAL	10214	100.0	14819	100.0	20565	100.0

	% NOMADIC 1983	ANNUAL COMPOUND GROWTH RATES		
		1956-73	1973-83	1956-83
NORTHERN	4.6	0.9	1.2	1.0
EASTERN	25.3	3.1	3.5	3.2
CENTRAL	6.1	3.6	0.5	2.5
KHARTOUM	4.9	5.0	4.6	4.8
KORDOFAN	25.3	1.3	3.5	2.1
DARFUR	15.2	3.0	3.6	3.2
EQUATORIA	-	-1.0	6.4	1.7
BAHR EL GHAZAL	-	2.0	5.0	3.1
UPPER NILE	-	-0.6	7.2	2.2
TOTAL		2.2	3.3	2.6

SOURCES: 1983 figures are from a preliminary report on the April Census results.

1956 and 1973 data are from Ministry of Finance and National Economy, Economic Survey, 1978/79.

government officials are more efficient tax collectors than are regional officials. Although the same regional and district tax offices that collected direct taxes before the reform will continue to do so, they will now be under regional control. This means that in time they will tend to take on the standards and norms of other associated regional agencies. This factor points to declining tax effort and receipts. On the other hand, regions will be authorized to retain 60 percent of future increases in collections and this will provide an offsetting incentive to maintain efficiency and increase effort. Although the balance of forces is presently unclear, the transfer of resources and responsibility from the center to regional authorities could in the end be successful if collection efficiency is maintained, rates are kept uniform, and budget administration in general is improved.

Even so, it is unlikely that the grants process can be abandoned entirely. Regional needs far exceed the tax resources now available and the gap between them continues to grow as population expands, existing facilities deteriorate and production grows by fits and starts. Improving administrative capacity at the lower levels of government will be a long term and laborious process. Any attempt to improve interregional equity and to achieve a more balanced state of development will require some sort of transfer system. In the next section a grants formula is offered for purposes of illustration and discussion.

A GRANTS FORMULA

There are several elements any formula for allocating financial resources among regional governments will have to include. These essentials are:

1. A procedure for determining the total amount of resources to be transferred. This could be specified as a target in economic plans, as a percentage of central government revenue or as a residual left over after higher priority needs were met.
2. A specification of the criteria to be used in allocating the sum to be transferred among the regional governments, and the

weight to be attached to each criteria. The criteria most commonly used are population and per capita income. The usual assumption is the greater the population to be served, the greater will be the resources required, other things being equal. But in large and diverse countries, regional conditions are usually not equal. A region can have a relatively large population and at the same time have a higher per capita income, and in such circumstances the high income reduces the case for subsidization on the basis of population alone. Thus the formula will be such that a given region's allocation will vary directly with its population and inversely with its per capita income.

Additional criteria are often included to meet special needs and circumstances. In the case of Sudan, it is appropriate that the formula be designed to provide incentives that reward tax effort and development effort. In effect, the central government would reward those who strive to help themselves. In this exercise revenue effort is measured in terms of revenue collected per LS 1000 regional income. Development effort is gauged in terms of actual development spending per LS 1000 of actual total expenditures.

Equations. To develop a grants formula embodying these criteria, it is necessary to specify an equation for each criterion:

1. Population and per capita income:

$$A_i = g_1 \frac{P_i (1.0 - 0.5Y_i/Y_t)^2}{\sum_j P_j (1.0 - 0.5Y_j/Y_t)^2}, \text{ where } A_i \text{ is the grant allocation}$$

based on population and per capita income of the i^{th} region. In the numerator P_i is the population of the i^{th} region, Y_i is the per capita income of the i^{th} region and Y_t is the per capita income of the nation. The denominator is the sum of this expression for all of the regions.

$g_1 = G(W_1)$, where G is the total grant to be allocated and W_1 is the weight assigned to population and per capita income.

48

2. Revenue effort: $A_i = g_2 (R_i / \sum R_j)$ where A_i is the allocation received by the i^{th} region. The numerator is the revenue collected by the i^{th} region per LS 1000 of regional income and the denominator is the sum of all such revenues collected by all regions. $g_2 = G(W_2)$, where G is the total grant to be allocated and W_2 is the weight assigned to revenue effort.
3. Development effort: $A_i = g_3 (D_i / \sum D_j)$, where A_i is the allocation based on development effort received by the i^{th} region. The numerator is the development expenditure of the i^{th} region per LS 1000 of regional government expenditures and the denominator is the sum of all such expenditures by all regions. $g_3 = G(W_3)$, where G is the total grant to be allocated and W_3 is the weight assigned to revenue effort.

Combining these elements provides:

$$A_i = g_1 \frac{P_i (1.0 - 0.5 Y_i / Y_t)^2}{\sum P_j (1.0 - 0.5 Y_j / Y_t)^2} + g_2 \frac{R_i}{\sum R_j} + g_3 \frac{D_i}{\sum D_j}$$

An Application. To apply the formula it is necessary to provide some assumed values. Therefore consider the following assumptions:

1. Three regions: A, B and C.
2. Weights: $W_1 = .80$; $W_2 = .10$ and $W_3 = .10$.
3. Conditions:

Region	Population	Per Capita Income	Revenue per LS 1000 of Regional Income	Development Expenditure per LS 1000 of Regional Expenditure
A	938,000	160	58	99
B	838,000	170	14	149
C	4,000,000	240	9	120

4. Total grant to be allocated: $G = \text{LS } 130,000,000$

Results. Applying the formulas the following LS distribution is obtained. (LS M)

Region	Population & Per Capita Income	Revenue Effort	Development Effort	Total Allocation
A	26,228.8	9,308.6	3,497.0	39,034.4
B	21,746.4	2,247.0	5,263.7	29,257.1
C	56,024.8	1,444.4	4,239.3	61,708.5
Total Allocation	104,000.0	13,000.0	13,000.0	130,000.0

The application of this formula, or some variant of it, would provide much needed objective standards to the grants process. It would greatly reduce if not eliminate the importance of negotiation and the destructive bargaining tactics associated with it. It would provide a high degree of predictability. All parties could forecast the outcome, so that budgets and spending plans could be made in a timely and orderly fashion. Regional officials would have incentives to keep accurate financial records, to improve tax effort and efficiency and to set aside funds from current spending for capital formation. Most of the data needed except regional income is either being generated by government operation or subject to estimation without much difficulty. The lack of regional income and product accounts is the only serious obstacle. The scope of the national accounts section would have to be expanded, but otherwise there is no reason why a formula approach could not be employed at the present time.

DECENTRALIZED PLANNING

Given a distribution of administrative responsibility according to the principle of maximum social benefit, as proposed in an earlier section of this paper, it would be most convenient if the optimum

distribution of planning responsibility were simultaneously determined. In an ideal state this might be the case, but in reality there is no necessarily close connection between delivering goods and services to the public and establishing the instruments required to produce them. The skills needed to maintain output in an ongoing concern are very different from those required to plan future output, design projects, assess profitability, implement projects, etc. The skills required by the project cycle are scarce and must be utilized to maximum advantage. At the same time popular participation in the development process should be accommodated and encouraged.

At the national level, planning responsibility should continue much as it is at present. The agenda of national planners should include defining national goals and objectives, and estimating the resources available for achieving them. A national development strategy for the long run and macroeconomic policies for short run tactical purposes should continue as part of the national agenda. Central government authorities should also be responsible for projects whose outputs are of the nature of public goods, or which generate direct or indirect effects that spill over at least one set of regional boundaries. The center should continue with its three year investment programs for such projects. To maximize the returns from scarce human resources, an expert consultative group of national planners might be designated to serve as short term consultants to regional and local governments on planning issues.

At the regional level, planning responsibility should include the specification of a development strategy based on regional comparative advantage and a consistent set of norms and targets to be attained. It should be their responsibility to ascertain that regional goals are consistent with national goals and priorities. Regional authorities should also specify a set of criteria for regional projects that is consistent with regional goals and resource balances. But beyond these fairly obvious tasks it is difficult to be specific about planning responsibilities.

At both the regional and local levels of government the lack of trained personnel represents a serious constraint on project preparation and management. At present, a highly refined division and specialization of labor is impossible. Given the prevailing skill shortages, what is needed is a planning policy based on flexibility in the use of regional manpower and a high degree of cooperation between planners at different levels of government. Since the capability of area and rural councils varies widely within regions, there can be no rigid prescription as to the planning functions at each level of government. In some cases rural and area councils can play a major role in project preparation; in other cases most planning functions will have to be performed on their behalf by higher authorities.

As a general principle a bottom-up approach is preferable to a town-down approach in rural planning and should be followed whenever possible. The benefits of decentralization in the form of a pattern of goods and services supplied that conforms to local tastes and preferences are more likely to be achieved with a bottom-up approach. Furthermore, in cases where officials and politicians are lax in their financial stewardship, public scrutiny can serve to increase official accountability. As grass roots interest in local government projects grows, pressure on local officials to account for their actions and uses of funds increases. Tax payers are more willing to pay their fair share when they can see the connection between their taxes and the desired public benefits which they have had a hand in planning. Mass participation thus contributes to better administrative performance. Accounts are more likely to be discussed and published. Successful politicians will tend to be those who are willing to bear public scrutiny. Thus devices and arrangements that serve to increase contact between officials and their clientele should be built into planning institutions.

To recapitulate, at the lower levels of government there is a need to economize in scarce planning and management skills, and at the same time there is a need to encourage popular involvement in the planning process. A tentative and experimental step toward a workable distribution of responsibility may be derived from the useful distinctions between "hard" and "soft" projects and between low and high technology projects. Hard projects are infrastructure, agricultural and industrial projects which produce tangible products and so lend themselves to quantification, the measurement of expected costs and benefits, internal rates of return and the like. Since hard projects tend to absorb the preponderance of available capital funds, the conventional tests of efficiency and viability should be performed on such projects, and the more efficient chosen for funding in the hope of avoiding gross waste. These projects fall naturally in the sphere of planning specialists at the regional level. Soft projects, on the other hand, more reasonably may be left to popular determination. Soft projects are those whose benefits are more difficult to measure and evaluate. They consist largely of health, education, nutrition and rural development. Conceptually, values can be attached to improved health, greater literacy and the like, but in the present context it is so difficult that the results would not be very meaningful. Therefore, popular input can be greater in soft project fields. Appraisal can be limited to judgments about the qualitative cost effectiveness of alternative projects.

The terms low and high technology are used here in a very broad sense to capture the distinction between not only level of technology embodied in capital equipment and the proportions of capital and labor combined in the production process, but also between multi versus single product output, and single sector versus integrated development programs. The presumption is that the techniques involved in designing, appraising, implementing and operating projects involving modern technology, multiproduct outputs and integrated complex projects or programs will be more demanding than in the case of traditional technology, labor

intensive, single product, single sector projects. In the latter, grass roots participation in preparation, appraisal and implementation should be relatively large. The former should be left for the most part to regional experts. These cadres are assumed to be conversant with development issues and the project cycle, and to be prepared to serve as hosts for more skilled short term consultants that may be called in as needs arise.

In the project identification and evaluation stages of the project cycle, popular participation should be given a prominent place, irrespective of the hardness or complexity of the project in question. Through this means the public would become more knowledgeable in development matters, the lessons learned from the evaluation of completed projects would tend to be embodied in new projects, the pattern of production would tend to conform to local desires and officials would be given an incentive to improve their performances.

There are many possible permutations by which regional government, area councils and rural councils might be arranged in descending order of responsibility in reference to the various stages of the project cycle, hard or soft projects, and high or low technology content. The matrix in Table 5 is not intended to be definitive, but only to depict in a general way how responsibility for planning might be distributed according to these distinctions among the lower levels of government in the Sudan.

In view of the massive shift of responsibility toward the lower levels of government that devolution is causing, the issues raised in this paper are important and deserve careful consideration of all involved in the process. To shift responsibility to ill prepared regional and local government invites administrative chaos and massive waste of resources. The task at hand is to find ways to minimize these short run losses and exploit the benefits inherent in a decentralized economy in the long run.

54

TABLE 5. A DISTRIBUTION OF PROJECT RESPONSIBILITY

STAGES OF THE PROJECT CYCLE	SP	SP	HP	HP
	LT	HT	LT	HT
IDENTIFICATION	RC AC RG	AC RG RC	RG AC RC	RG AC RC
PREPARATION	AC RG RC	RG AC RC	RG AC	RG AC
APPRAISAL	AC RG RC	RG AC RC	RG AC	RG AC
IMPLEMENTATION	AC RC RG	AC RG RC	RG AC	RG AC
EVALUATION	RC AC RG	AC RG RC	RG AC RC	RG AC RC

LEGEND

PROJECT TYPES: SP - SOFT PROJECTS
 HP - HARD PROJECTS
 LT - LOWER TECHNOLOGY
 HT - HIGHER TECHNOLOGY

AGENCIES RESPONSIBLE: RG - REGIONAL GOVERNMENT
 AC - AREA COUNCILS
 RC - RURAL COUNCILS

55