NOTE: This report reflects project status at time of the precipitous fall of the GVN in April, 1975

REPORT U-446

PAGE 1

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

PD-AAK-651-E

1. PROJECT NO	2. PAR FOR PERIOD	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
730-11-590-350	FY 66 to FY 75	VIETNAM	730-75-TP-1

5. PROJECT TITLE

HEALTH LOGISTICS SUPPORT

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY 66 Ends FY 76	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR
	-	-	4/73

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $2,3700,000	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $ 1,925,000	c. Estimated Budget to Completion After Current FY: $ - 0 -

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency, or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.
URS Systems Corporation	AID/vn-85

12. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) NON	A.I.D.	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE

Item 2 unattributed

LESSONS LEARNED

1. Automated Data Processing systems for developing countries are not essential. The ADP system developed for the Ministry of Health probably was over-sophisticated, however, the MOH has gained greater control over the purchasing, stocking, inventory and issuing of medical supplies and equipment.

2. USAID should have placed greater emphasis on encouraging the local production of pharmaceuticals and other medical supplies and equipment. The potential was there, however the government and private sectors were oriented towards importation of finished products.

Clearance: ASIA/DP: William Lofes

REPLANNING REQUIRED REVISED OR NEW: PADP PIP PROAG PIO/T PIO/C PIO/P

E. DATE OF PROJECT REVIEW: 9/10/75

PROJECT MANAGER TYPED NAME, SIGNATURE INITIALS, AND DATE	MISSION DIRECTOR TYPED NAME, SIGNATURE INITIALS, AND DATE
ASIA/TH: [illegible] A. [illegible], M.D.	ADD/RA/[illegible]: Anthony [illegible] AW 10/31/75

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

AID 1020-25(11)-70 PAGE 2 PAR	PROJECT NO. 730-11-590-379	PAR FOR PERIOD: TO FY 66 to FY 75	COUNTRY VIETNAM	PAR SERIAL NO. 730-75-TP-14

II. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT (CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY, OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY)	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN: UNSATISFACTORY 1	2	SATISFACTORY 3	4	5	OUTSTANDING 6	7	C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X): LOW 1	2	MEDIUM 3	4	HIGH 5
1. URS Systems Corporation (AID/vn-86)					X							X
2.												
3.												

Comment on key factors determining rating: Establishing a full automated data processing system was the primary purpose of the contract. Schedule disruption was, in most cases, caused by factors beyond the control of the contractor. Training of Ministry of Health personnel in the operation and maintenance of the system was not as effective as planned due to demands on time available to the contractor, and by projects with higher priorities, causing long machine 'turn around' time on program testing and debugging. The contract expired on 12-31-74.

4. PARTICIPANT TRAINING	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
				X							X	

Comment on key factors determining rating.
Trainees identified with supply management operations completed long and short term training in the USA and at the US Army Medical Depot, Okinawa, Japan. Participant performance has been commendable and all trainees remain in positions related to the training received.

5. COMMODITIES	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
					X							X

Comment on key factors determining rating: At project termination in FY75, the cumulative commodity ~~xxxxxx~~ component of $77.163 million (AID $61.479; DOD $15.684 including FY75 fund cite) will constitute 87.4% of the $88.287 million (total AID $72.603) total life of project costs. Commodities were adequate to meet normal as well as emergency war-related requirements and were delivered in timely manner through the institutionalized MOH medical supply system.

6. COOPERATING COUNTRY	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. PERSONNEL				X								X
b. OTHER				X								X

Comment on key factors determining rating.
Project leadership and understanding of project purpose is highly acceptable. Personnel turn-over among key personnel accounted for a temporary lag in the accomplishment of certain objectives. Poor wage structure of the GVN, plus promotion restrictions had an adverse effect upon employee motivation.

7. OTHER DONORS NA	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5

(See next page for comments on Other Donors.)

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

1020-25(10-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
GE'S PAR	730-11-500-350	FY66 to FY75	VIETNAM	730-75-TP-1

F. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

CONTINUED

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage, Rate, Amount)					
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY TO DATE	CURRENT FY TO END	FY 76	FY 77	END OF PROJECT
Commodity Managers	PLANNED	3	-	2	-	-	5
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	3	2				
	REPLANNED			-	-	-	5
Ass't Commodity Managers	PLANNED	12	-	8	-	-	20
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	12	0				
	REPLANNED			-	-	-	12
Document Control Clerks	PLANNED	1	-	1	1	-	2
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	1	1				
	REPLANNED			-	-	-	2
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE						
	REPLANNED						

QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	COMMENT:
. Fully automated medical logistics system developed and implemented.	9. Completed. Operational responsibility transfered to GVN/OPM/CC in June, 1974. Computer system developed by URS.
0. Medical equipment maintenance (MEM) system developed and implemented.	10. Completed. Basic & advanced medical equipment maint. training + refrigeration equipment maintenance. 39 lesson plans, 94 manuals, 273 teaching aids in use.
1. Medical equipment maintenance personnel trained.	11. Approx. 500 equipment maintenance men trained, from Saigon and province areas. Approx. 70-75% are on job.
2. Assembled & shipped 8 Impact Hospitals to Provinces	12. Completed 1970. Each assembly contained approximately 800 line items, including major equipment items.
	COMMENT:

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

D 1020-25(10-70) GE 3 PAR	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
	730-11-590-350	FY66 to FY75	VIETNAM	730-75-TP-14

7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

N.A.

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage Rate Amount)					
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY TO DATE	CURRENT FY TO END	FY	FY	END OF PROJECT
Computer programmers	PLANNED	3	-	2	-	-	5
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	3	2				
	REPLANNED			-	-	-	-
Computer Systems Analists	PLANNED	2	-	1	-	-	3
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	1	1				
	REPLANNED			-	-	-	-
Key Punch Operators	PLANNED	4	-	-	-	-	4
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	4	-				
	REPLANNED			-	-	-	-
Participants returned and on board. (US Trng.)	PLANNED	20	-	14	12	2	41
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	23	-				
(continued)	REPLANNED			-	-	-	-

QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	COMMENT
GVN decrees enacted.	1. Presidential Decree #15YT enacted 3/66 establishing MOH Medical Logistics Directorate & logistics system.
Stock accounting systems & storage tech. implemented.	2. Systems established & functioning in 42 provinces & 63 hosp. under GVN/MOH supervision & control.
Basic Indoctrination & Training Manual prepared.	COMMENT 3. Basic manual for training MOH personnel in supply procedures published 3/68 in Vietnamese & English. In use.
MOH personnel trained in hospital medical material.	4. Approx. 4 MOH supply persons from each province health service & city hospital trained 1968-69. 160 trained.
Medical logistics catalog printed & distributed.	5. In 1967 the catalog was prepared of all stockage items, by class in Vietnamese & English. Updated regularly by computer.
Developed reference library.	COMMENT 6. MOH approx. 4200 volumes cross-referenced by mfr. & item.
Consumer credit system developed & implemented.	7. Implemented 1970, system provides annual credit allocation to all health services & hospitals. Now under ADP system.
Storage procedures developed & implemented.	8. Designed & implemented storage procedures at PhuTho and 3 regional warehouses, 1972.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR	PROJECT NO. 730-11-590-350	PAR FOR PERIOD FY66 to FY75	COUNTRY VIETNAM	PAR SERIAL NO. 730-75-TP-1

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged. **2. Same as in PROP?** ☐ YES ☐ NO.

To establish a Ministry of Health (MOH) Medical Logistics system capable of supporting the supply and maintenance requirements of MOH, RVNAF, U.S. and Free World medical personnel assigned to MOH medical facilities. This project was scheduled for termination in FY-76, at which time the Ministry of Health, Directorate of Logistics would take over the complete responsibility for the funding, procurement, storing, and issuing of all medical supplies and medical related equipment needed by the MOH health and hospital system.

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
1. MOH funding all medical and medical related equipment & supply procured for use in the MOH Medical Logistics System.	1. Transition from USG funded procurement was gradual but systematic. Since 1968, GVN procured all vehicle repair parts; since 1971 all refrigeration & air conditioners, including parts. Comparative USAID/DOD - GVN/MOH Funding for Medical Commodity Procurement. (in $ millions). FY/CY — GVN/MOH(US$ equiv.) — USAID/DOD 71 — 1.06 — 16.0 72 — 2.73 — 11.4 73 — 5.18 — 14.1 74 — 6.25 — 6.6 75 — 9.89 — 3.7
2. Ministry of Health, Directorate of Logistics, capable of assuming complete administrative & management responsibilities for operation of the Medical Logistics system. 2.1: An effective organization in being.	2.1: Directorate of Logistics organized, staffed and funded with adequately trained personnel in all sections, including the regional depots. Dir. Log. on board strength if 543 out of 678 authorized positions. New personnel regularly being identified and trained for existing positions.

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

To improve the quality of life and well being of the population and help increase productivity.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

Yes. Achievement of the project purpose will make a significant contribution to the programming goal. The greatly expanded health and hospital system operated by the Minsitry of Health could not provide even minimal health care to the population of Vietnam without a viable medical logistics system. The MOH now has this system in operation, due mostly to the accomplishments of this project.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

4a

B.1.: Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.

2.2: A fully operational ADP system.	2.2: Physical transfer of the ADP system from USAID/ISC to the OPM/CC took place April,1974. Parallel processing and debugging of the system at the OPM/CC was accomplished by June 1,1974. The system was formally accepted by the OPM/CC on June 19, 1974.
2.3 The MOH Directorate of Log. efficiently procuring, receiving, storing & shipping all medical & related items.	2.3: The average # of days procurement time went from 165 in 1971 to 97 in 1974. Receiving,storing,shipping is effectively managed by MOH personnel. Storage practices are of acceptabel standard with rotation of older stock first. Shipping of material has shown marked improvement.
2.4 Dir/Log effectively maintaining medical equipment & vehicles at warehouse.	2.4: Trained medical maintenance personnel are utilized in adequately equipped maintenance shops.
3.: GVN supporting and active program to reduce costs and to minimize foreign exchange expedniture for medical supplies.	3.1: Elimination of non-essential items from the MOH procurement system as a result of reviews performed by a joint USAID/MOH Medical Material Technical committee. 3.2: The MOH/MOD pharmaceutical processing facility is now producing 15-20 items consisting of tablets, injectables and solutions. The MOH is actively encouraging local pharmaceutical manufacturers to produce larger volume and number of items for MOH procurement. The MOH obligated VN$931.1 million in CY73 and VN$1.3 billion in CY74 for local procurement. CY75 local procurement not known at time of departure.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY