

AIRGRAM

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

UNCLASSIFIED

CLASSIFICATION

For each address check one ACTION | INFO

TO - AID/W TOAID A- 45

DATE REC'D.

DATE SENT

9/14/1979

4044

DISTRIBUTION ACTION

LA
INFO.

2-3-78

PDC

PPC

DS/PO

DIU

FROM - USAID/Port-au-Prince, Haiti

SUBJECT - PES Rural Community Dev. (IACIO) Project No. 0061

REFERENCE - AID 1330-15 & 15A (PES)

- Please distribute attached per reference instructions.
- Mission has no record of prior transmittal subject PES. Final evaluation subject project will be submitted according to FY 80 Mission Evaluation Schedule now being prepared.

JONES

NOTE:

RUN ATTACHMENT
AS PART OF THIS AIRGRAM

STATE-5

PAGE 1 OF 1 PAGES

INITIALED BY	OFFICE	PHONE NO.	DATE	APPROVED BY:
OP/EVAL:JCotten	OP/EVAL	227	9/12/79	A/DIR:AFurman

ADD ADDRESSES
OP/WGRhoads
ADO:ETamari

UNCLASSIFIED

PD-AAJ-675
ISW 1219

'PEJ' 521-78-3

5210060115

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY
Rural Community Development (HACHO)
Project Number 521-0061

July 1978

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY

Mission: USAID/HAFPI	Project Number: Grant 521-0061
----------------------	--------------------------------

Project Title: Rural Community Development (HACHO)

Initial Obligation FY 1968	Final Obligation FY 1979	Completion of Project FY 1980	Total U.S. Funding Grant: \$5,088,000.
----------------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------------------------	---

Period Covered by this Evaluation:
From October 1976 to 31 May 1978

Date of Evaluation Reviews:
24 April - 2 May 1978
26 June 1978

Decisions Reached as a Result of Evaluation Reviews	Officer or Unit Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
1. Establish USAID position on HACHO's future in relation to proposed USAID projects in the Northwestern region.	USAID	September 1, 1978
2. Update basic HACHO agreement to establish HACHO as official coordinating agency for the Northwestern region.	HACHO	September 30, 1979
3. Follow-up official request that Bureau of Nutrition assume financial responsibility for 20 nutrition centers in the Northwestern region.	HACHO	After DSPP evaluation of nutrition centers tentatively scheduled for August 1978.

- | | | |
|---|----------------|---|
| 4. Establish schedule with DSEP for integration of HACHO nutrition center personnel and facilities. | HACHO | October 1, 1978 |
| 5. Follow-up HACHO request to CONADP that Haitian Government provide \$27,500. advance for operational expenses at beginning of FY 1979. | USAID | August 15, 1978 |
| 6. Schedule meeting with representatives of UNICEF Project Integre pour la Rehabilitation du Nord-Ouest (PIRNO), Fonds Agricoles, HACHO, CARE, A.I.D. to discuss coordination of assistance in the Northwestern region. | HACHO | August 1, 1978 |
| 7. Request study of effect of Food For Work on Community motivation in Northwestern region be included in Title II evaluation. | HACHO | Evaluation tentatively scheduled for September 1978 |
| 8. Request services of soil conservationist assigned under Integrated Agricultural Development project. | HACHO
USAID | July 15, 1978 |
| 9. Prepare plan to assure HACHO operating expenses; e.g. under Title III. | HACHO | September 30, 1978 |
| 10. Designate key indicators for end-of-project evaluation of project contribution to goal achievement. | USAID | September 30, 1978 |

Summary

The Haitian American Community Help Organization (HACHO) was organized in 1966 by A.I.D. and CARE to introduce community development projects in Northwestern Haiti. HACHO operations cover an area of 185 sq km inhabited by some 150,000 people. Its present staff consists of 245 employees who fall into the following categories: Administrative, which includes truck drivers and helpers, mechanics, heavy equipment operators as well as office personnel (84); Health (50); Nutrition (35); Agriculture (29); Community Development (38); Crafts (10).

Using the self-help approach to community development, HACHO works with 108 community councils to provide basic public health services, facilities for potable water and irrigation, construction and improvement of roads.

As of May 31, 1978,

- 18 health clinics serve an average 17,000 patients each year.
- 20 nutrition centers provide food for over 1,000 children annually and instruct 600 mothers in nutrition.
- 50 potable water systems have been built.
- 340 ha. are under irrigation following completion of Phase I of an irrigation system on which work continues.
- 24 school rooms which HACHO has constructed serve 1,200 children.
- 225 miles of road connect Anse Rouge, Jean Rabel, Mole St. Nicolas, Bombarde, Baie-de-Henne, and Terre Neuve to increase farm-to-market access in the Northwest.

The most important unresolved problems of HACHO at present are:

HACHO's status as the official coordinating agency for the development of the Northwestern region;

Early appointment of a Haitian Administrator and Assistant Administrator to allow an orientation period before the A.I.D.-Care contract terminates at the end of FY 1979;

Adverse effect on securing qualified personnel for HACHO in absence of Haitian Government salary guarantee;

Present procedure for obtaining Title I funds;

Degree of emphasis to be placed on Food For Work;

Transfer of HACHO health responsibilities to the Haitian Government to permit HACHO to concentrate on community development and increasing agricultural production.

Evaluation Methodology

The 1976 HACHO Phase II indepth evaluation provided recommendations which were incorporated in the FY 1977 revision of the Rural Community Development Project Paper. This evaluation examines these recommendations in terms of the extent to which they have been put into effect by HACHO or are no longer considered valid.

Revisions in the project logical framework are the result of the Phase II evaluation and the quantitative data which the evaluation provided. These, too, are examined to determine the extent to which projections based on the Phase II data are valid and to measure progress toward the end-of-project status.

Participants in the evaluation:

USAID/ADP William E. Garvey, Agricultural Development Officer
Lloyd Clyburn, Assistant Agricultural Development Officer
Elias Tamari, Project Officer

PRM James Wilson, Assistant Program Officer
Lea Knott, Evaluation Officer

HACHO Dr. William Fougere, Director
Timothy Lavelle, Administrator

External Factors

Operationally, the drought of 1977 was the most important of all external factors which affected the project during the period under review. From July 1977 through February 1978, all HACHO personnel-- agricultural agents, community development specialists, coordinators, agronomes, road foremen-- were engaged in moving and distributing 3,000 metric tons of food in the Northwestern region. All scheduled operations came to a halt during this period. HACHO's function became prevention of starvation among the people of the Northwestern region. Its area of operation was extended 40 km to include Bassin Bleu and Gros Morne. The emergency required opening an office in Gros Morne and the addition of 20 new employees.

The most important problem that has emerged as a result of the drought is demotivation of communities to participate in community projects. Those communities which because of the drought received food without the usual contribution of work and materials are not now so easily motivated to participate in community projects.

A Haitian Government decision is becoming increasingly important in view of the fact that the A.I.D. - CARE contract is scheduled to terminate at the end of FY 1979. There are two alternatives if HACHO is to continue to exist:

Regional: That HACHO be designated the official coordinating development agency for the Northwestern region;

Integration into central government: That HACHO's responsibilities be gradually absorbed completely or in part within specific ministries.

The regional alternative has these advantages:

Fonds Agricole, The German aid program in the Northwest, contracts directly with HACHO as the Haitian Government's representative. The salary of the HACHO Executive Secretary is paid by Fonds Agricole and Fonds Agricole contributions to the assistance program in the Northwest are made under this contract.

The USAID project Integrated Community Development is scheduled to begin in FY 1979. HACHO is a candidate for recognition as the official development agency which the project will assist in expanding community development in the Northwestern region.

The HACHO Advisory Board has recognized that HACHO responsibility will increase with the termination of the A.I.D. - CARE contract. The Board has agreed upon a new name for the organization which unofficially recognizes HACHO as the regional development agency for the Northwest: Organisme pour le Developpement du Nord'Ouest (ODNA).

It is unlikely that any of the Ministries will be in a position to absorb HACHO responsibilities by the end of FY 1979.

CONADEP has agreed to assume financial responsibility for HACHO operations, primarily administration. HACHO receives an advance from A.I.D. as an operating fund at the beginning of each fiscal year. The Haitian Government contribution is on a month-to-month basis. The possibility of requesting Title I funds to cover shortfalls in administrative expenses has been discussed; however, Title I funds are reserved for development projects and it is unlikely that such a request would be approved. If HACHO is to continue operations as A.I.D. assistance decreases, the Haitian Government should provide an advance of \$87,500 at the beginning of FY 1979 and continue advances at the beginning of each fiscal year.

The health component consumes a disproportionate amount of the HACHO budget, particularly in view of the reduction in the budget excluding Title I funds:

FY 1977	-	\$700,000
FY 1978	-	\$650,000
FY 1979	-	\$600,000
FY 1980	-	\$450,000

Of these amounts, 45% is allocated to health projects; of the health budget, 33% is allocated to nutrition projects.

HACHO does not have the personnel to design a health strategy for the Northwestern region. Its health program is marginally effective, emphasizing curative rather than preventive medicine. In an attempt to decrease health personnel, HACHO is combining clinics and nutrition centers. Twenty-two auxiliary nurses previously assigned to HACHO clinics have recently been trained in nutrition and are now being assigned to nutrition centers.

Goal

"To improve the quality of life of an estimated 150,000 inhabitants of Northwest Haiti".

The HACHO Phase II evaluation established 1976 as a base year in which for the first time statistical data on various components of the project were available. These data were used as a basis for projections for 1977, 1978 and 1979 in the FY 1977 Project Paper revision.

The validity of these projections were to be tested with data acquired by introducing changes in recordkeeping which were recommended in the Phase II evaluation and which were to be put into effect during the year following the Phase II evaluation.

These changes were not introduced. It is not likely that any changes in recordkeeping will be introduced until HACHO's more pressing problems are solved. Recordkeeping remains an elementary process. There has been no official Haitian administrative insistence on the need for recordkeeping as a data source.

Literacy among many of the personnel responsible for records is of so low a level that only the most elementary system of recordkeeping is possible. The measures of goal achievement in the project logical framework are not valid; the problem of choosing indicators which will measure progress toward this goal remains.

Other organizations and programs contribute toward achieving the goal of this project:

Fonds Agricole is financed by Deutsche Welthungerhilfe, a German voluntary agency, and the Ministry of Cooperation of the Federal Republic of Germany. Fonds Agricole has an extensive food-for-work program in the Northwest. The organization works closely with HACHO on road and irrigation projects. In addition, it has established three nurseries which are expected to produce a minimum of 200,000 seedlings annually.

Fonds Agricole is providing approximately \$543,000 in 1978 which will be used for food, materials, and equipment. The organization began its work in the Northwest in 1976.

UNICEF in December 1977 announced a \$1.2 million two-year program for the Northwest. The program is still in the planning phase.

Under the USAID Integrated Agricultural Development project, Jean Rabel has been selected as its site for watershed development and soil conservation in the Northwestern region.

Purpose

"To develop community councils which are practicing self-help techniques in implementing agricultural, health, community development, and road maintenance projects".

A discussion of the status of each end-of-project indicator follows.

Community Council Contribution of 50% of Project Cost.

Community council: at present contribute an average 15% of project costs. Provision of Food for Work may preclude any higher contribution. Among those community councils which do not request Food for Work, the contribution may reach as high as 50%; however, Food for Work or an equivalent program may remain a requirement for the majority of projects. There is no control of food prices in the Northwestern region where food is usually higher than in the Port-au-Prince area.

Soil Conservation

Erosion control devices and soil conservation methods are to be established on 3,000 ha by the end of FY 1979. The drought has interfered with the introduction of soil conservation practices. Dry wall terracing and reforestation has been introduced on 600 ha in the Jean Rabel watershed. HACHO has designated the areas where soil conservation work should be concentrated; however, before work begins HACHO requires the services of a soil conservationist and mapping of the areas.

Community Councils

There is no present estimate of progress toward reaching the end-of-project status in which 60% of Council members regularly attend meetings, pay dues, and participate in projects. Attendance at Community Council meetings varies with each community. HACHO maintains records of attendance and payment of dues, but these records have not been analyzed to determine percentage of members attending the meetings of the 108 community councils with whom HACHO works.

Maintenance of roads, buildings, equipment, potable water systems is limited. The people of the Northwest live below the poverty line; they have lived in isolation with few facilities until the last few years. The concept of maintenance is not fully understood.

HACHO staff estimates that at least 50% of the community councils now seek further information on self-help community development techniques.

Records are kept of payment of dues at community council meetings but, again, these records have not been analyzed to determine the amount of funds which each community council has in its treasury. There is no present estimate of progress toward reaching the end-of-project status of a minimum of 20 community councils with \$300 in the treasury.

The HACHO Phase II evaluation developed criteria for evaluating community councils as development vehicles. The criteria are presented as indicators which rank community councils on a scale of factors important to development. These indicators offer HACHO the opportunity to acquire data on the contribution to development of each community council with which it works.

HACHO and other organizations working in community development have observed that the interests of community council leaders do not always coincide with those of council members. The interests of the council leaders have prevailed and for the most part continue to prevail. However, there is emerging a change in attitude among council members toward their leaders in which members are beginning to express differences of opinion.

Outputs

HACHO has exceeded its target in promoting self-help community projects to increase agricultural production in hectares under cultivation and in number of people involved. Approximately 3,500 peasant families, or about 19,250 people, are participating in community self-help projects to grow sorghum near Jean Rabel, Anse Rouge, Bombarde and Terre Neuve. Approximately 2,000 ha are now under cultivation.

The first consumer cooperative in the Northwest has been organized in Baie-de-Henne with 39 shareholders who, with the community council, have pledged \$1,444.

HACHO has concentrated on the repair of existing water systems rather than installation of new systems and thus has not met its target for 1977.

HACHO has completed surveys and recruited personnel for the opening of nutrition centers in 20 new communities. As many as possible of these centers will combine clinical medical services with the nutrition program.

Three HACHO projects which are not now a part of the project design as it appears in the 1977 revision of the Project Paper warrant reporting:

The HACHO-CARE crafts project - CANO - is proving a successful commercial venture. The demand for CANO handicrafts far exceeds the supply. Pre-cooperatives for handicraft production have been established in 10 villages. Sales of craft products average \$3,500 per month.

The Nan Vincent experimental farm near Jean Rabel has distributed 114,906 wood-producing and 13,538 fruit-producing trees; it now has a stock of 77,784 seedlings. A HACHO engineer has completed plans for construction during FY 1979 of office buildings and a training and demonstration center at the farm.

A beekeeping project is in process under which 500 hives will be distributed on a loan repayment basis among 100 peasant families in the Jean Rabel region. Title I funds have been requested to provide advisory services of two apiculturists.

Inputs

The most pressing of HACHO's financial problems continues to be uncertainty of provision of Title I funds. A procedure less complicated than the present one is required to permit release of Title I funds.

Under the conditions that prevail in the Northwest, the distribution of Title II Food for Work is a necessity, but its effect on community motivation to grow more food or toward self help in general has not been sufficiently studied. USAID is planning an early evaluation of the Title II program in Haiti. An important part of this evaluation will be a study of the Food for Work program in the Northwestern region.

An eight-month delay in signing the CARE-AID contract covering the period July 1977-January 1979 resulted in delays in vehicle purchases.

HACHO has arranged the local purchase of its medical supplies and there has been no delay in delivery.

Using the training facilities of the appropriate Haitian Government agency, HACHO arranges incountry training courses for its field personnel in community development, reforestation and soil conservation, nutrition, agricultural planning and production, and home economics.

Unplanned Effects

HACHO has focused attention on the Northwest to the extent that other donors are now contributing to the development of a region heretofore considered without potential. USAID is including the Northwest in projects now in process or scheduled to begin in FY 1979.

Competition for technicians which has resulted from this increase in other donor activity in the Northwestern region has made it difficult for HACHO to obtain and keep qualified personnel.

Changes in Design or Execution

The FY 1977 revision of the Project Paper incorporated HACHO Phase II evaluation recommendations. The most important of these is the recommendation that HACHO headquarters be established in the Northwestern region.

HACHO is now in the process of reducing its Port-au-Prince staff - 30% of the technical and administrative staff has been transferred to the Northwest: Gonaives, Jean Rabel, Anse Rouge, Bombarde and Terre Neuve. HACHO plans to retain a Port-au-Prince liaison office which will consist of 13 people.

Lessons Learned

The project reemphasizes the fact that community development is a long-term process, that there are no easy ways of changing long-established life patterns, and that there are no easy solutions to problems which are the result of years of existence at the subsistence level in an inhospitable environment. Recognition of these facts should form an integral part of project planning in community development.

Remarks

The evaluation reviews reveal that the most important of HACHO's problems lie in areas over which AID, CARE and HACHO now have limited control: HACHO's future as a development agency, revision of the present procedure for obtaining Title I funds, Bureau of Nutrition acceptance of financial responsibility for nutrition centers in the Northwestern region, appointment of a Haitian Administrator. Decision on these problems require action at a higher level than Project Officer or CARE Administrator.

The evaluation reviews reveal the difficulty of measuring successes or failures of a project in which the purpose has changed from humanitarian to developmental and in which, because of the conditions that prevail in the Northwest, elements of the humanitarian remain.