

Post BOGOTA	No.	Classification UNCLASSIFIED	Page 1 of	Pages
----------------	-----	--------------------------------	--------------	-------

P R O J E C T E V A L U A T I O N S U M M A R Y

1. Mission or AID/W Office Name USAID/BOGOTA EHRD			2. Project Number 514-11-690-187	
3. Project Title EDUCATIONAL TECHNOLOGY - UNITARY SCHOOLS				
4. Key project dates (fiscal years)			5. Total U.S. funding-life of project	
a. Project Agreement Signed: 6-9-76	b. Final Obligation: 11-2-76	c. Final input delivered: 12/31/78	\$ 452,000.00	
6. Evaluation number as listed in Eval. Schedule (Not scheduled (annual))	7. Period covered by this evaluation From: 6-77 Month/year		To: 10-78 Month/year	8. Date of this Evaluation Review 6-30-79 Month/year
9. Action Decisions Reached at Evaluation Review, including items needing further study (Note--This list does <u>not</u> constitute an action request to AID/W. Use telegrams, airgrams, SPARS, etc., for action)			10. Officer or Unit responsible for follow-up	11. Date action to be completed

12. Signatures:

Project Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
Signature	Signature
Typed Name <i>Neil B. Billig</i> Neil B. Billig, Act. EHRD	Typed Name <i>Neil B. Billig</i> Neil B. Billig, Acting AID Rep.
Date November 28, 1979	Date

13. SUMMARY - Summarize in about 22 words the current project situation mentioning progress in relation to design, prospects of achieving purpose, major problems encountered, etc.

The ProAg was signed by the Ministry of Education and the AID on 6/9/76 and provided a grant of \$452,000 to improve a total of 300 one room schools; 100 each in the department of Boyacá, Cundinamarca and Norte de Santander.

This goal was to be achieved in 30 months. Essentially, this task involved the following major components - teacher training, materials production, supervisor training, curriculum design, community organization and evaluation. The Ministry was to provide all other requirements including the school buildings. At the completion of the project (December 31, 1978) a total of 224 of the projected 300 schools were operational. However, 354 teachers received complete training rather than the 300 programmed. The project made a major impact in training additional teachers.

Notwithstanding the fact that the project fell short of the desired number of schools, significant success occurred in other areas. For example: (1) a rural primary curriculum and student and teaching materials were developed; (2) sufficient teachers and supervisors were trained to administer the project; (3) reference libraries were selected, purchased and distributed; and (4) an evaluation and feasibility study was completed.

In general, this project was successful and served as the basis for the International Development Bank making a grant of half a million dollars to the Ministry of Education to extend this project to several other departments, namely Chocó, Huila, Arauca and Guaviare.

It also has served as a pilot rural primary educational model to the Ministry of Education. Many of its processes and materials are being utilized by other institutionalized projects.

Other international entities such as OEA and UNESCO have highly recommended this project. The only action remaining is for the Ministry of Education to establish the project on a continuing basis by making it a formal division within the Ministry of Education and assigning personnel, materials and budget.

14. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY - Describe the methods used for this evaluation i. e. was it a regular or special evaluation? Was it in accordance with design, scope, methodology and issues? What kinds of data were used and how were they collected and analyzed? Identify agencies and key individuals participating and contributing.

The evaluation referred to in this report is somewhat unusual since it combined the contract for evaluation between the National Education Ministry and Nemequene (Colombian PVO) and the requirements of a formative evaluation of the stages of the implementation of the project.

The evaluation purpose was to analyze the short-term objectives of the system without measuring the long-term goals that can only be verified after the third or fourth year of operation.

A pre and post test was designed to measure improvements and application of the methodology. Direct observation techniques with structured interviews, instruments, attitudinal and opinion questionnaires and tests were used on students, teachers, and parents. The evaluation reports include a Diagnosis Report (Pre-test) a Progress report (formative) and final report (Post-test).

A copy of the Nemequene evaluation report is attached.

The research was carried out by the Nemequene staff, Dr. Aldemar Rojas, and Mrs. Vicky Colbert and Mr. Rodrigo Cabrera of AID Bogotá participated on three occasions in reviewing the reports. Mrs. Vicky Colbert, Project Coordinator was interviewed on three occasions by Nemequene personnel.

15. The different documents do not require revision or change, but the evaluation presented a series of conclusions and recommendations that should be evaluated more completely at a later date. (Final Report pages 101-55 Chapter V).
16. Evaluation findings about EXTERNAL FACTORS - Identify and discuss major changes in project setting which have an impact on the project. Examine continuing validity of assumptions.

The management and administration of this project was done from

the office of Planning in the Ministry of Education, and did not follow the normal administrative channels of the Ministry. This administrative arrangement was considered one of the major reasons of project success.

Everyone associated with the project believes the project would have been doomed to failure if it had been administered by the usual Ministry of Education bureaucracy.

In relation to external factors contained in the log frame only the purpose-related assumptions will be considered since goal related assumptions are still too far in the future.

B. 4. 1. Ministry of Education as well as Departmental secretary's offices will continue giving emphasis to Unitarian Schools.

In general this assumption was fulfilled. The changes in departmental secretaries and in key persons in the Ministry have not affected the project because the new directive personnel have been properly informed and have been actively involved in administering the project.

B. 4. 2. Investigators will have technical competence and will be able of giving practical recommendations.

The capacity of the researchers was not a problem in the evaluation. The researchers were persons with post graduate and doctoral degrees, experienced in rural education programs, who traveled to the rural sector in supervisory and observation visits.

B. 4. 3. There are some good model materials available.

In the Department of Norte de Santander the new one-room school system was extensively tested for two years and found successful. Presently the project can be considered as a model for other sectors of the country.

B. 4. 4. Some successful experimental schools exist.

The creation of an infrastructure for the training of teachers was part of the development of the project. Only existing infrastructure was utilized at the departmental level.

C.4.1. Planned quantity of inputs are available.

The planned inputs were available since the project functioned with international funds. The national counterpart was given thru the grant in salaries, in infrastructure or in departmental or local grants.

C.4.2. Experts will also be available as planned.

In general, it has been possible to obtain the trained personnel required for the project. Personnel selection has been administered at the national level.

At the departmental level there has been some difficulty in retaining teachers in remote areas. However, continued training of replacement teachers in the new techniques has generally remedied the problem.

C.4.3. Training programs will be feasible.

The training program was designed and applied as part of the "new school" project. At the present it is considered an educational model with instructional packages.

D.4.1. GOC will provide required resources.

The Colombian Government has provided the salaries at the national level, plus all the administrative infrastructure and staff. At the departmental level the salaries for personnel were paid and the infrastructure provided. Also, grants for training and school equipment were contributed by the local government.

D.4.2. Inflation will not affect real value of inputs.

Inflation has affected the cost of some inputs such as transportation and traveling costs for personnel, the production of printed material and libraries.

In general, the principal external changes that have affected the development of the program have been selection and geographic shifting of administrative staff. These personnel decisions have been made at a national and departmental level and have often been detrimental to project progress.

17. Evaluation findings about GOAL/SUBGOAL - For the reader's convenience, quote the approved sector or other goal, (and subgoal, where relevant) to which the project contributes. Then describe status by citing evidence available to date from specified indicators and by mentioning progress of other projects (whether or not U.S.) which contribute to same goal. Discuss causes - can progress toward goal be attributed to project, why short falls?

As noted in Block 13, this project purported to make a total of 300 one-room schools available to poor rural children which would provide a quality of education superior to traditional instructional programs.

The project was able to open only 224 schools in the three designated target departments - Boyacá, Cundinamarca, and Norte de Santander. A curriculum which incorporated the educational needs of rural children was designed and approved and textbooks and teachers guides were also written, illustrated, published and distributed. These student texts covered the areas required by the curriculum in the areas of language, arithmetic, social studies and science.

Teachers were recruited and trained in the unique methodology of how to conduct up to five classes simultaneously in one school room.

Supervisors were also trained in each department in order that they could offer assistance to the teachers. Each classroom was equipped with a general reference set of books which contained more than 100 titles. The project also sponsored numerous in-service training sessions.

In summary, the Nemequene evaluation report does not comment on the goals since it did not attempt to measure them; these can only be verified over a longer term. However, partial results and qualitative changes were observed in the four components of the projects (administrative, community relations, curriculum and teacher training).

Specifically, at the childrens level partial results were seen in a more active learning process and a higher achievement score in comparison to regular schools. However, results in skills could not be totally verified.

At the teachers level, as a result of the training sessions, changes in traditional roles and in positive attitudes towards supervisors and work in the rural areas were observed. At the supervisors level the same changes were observed. Traditional authoritarian roles were changed to a more student oriented type, as compared to regular supervisors. Finally, at the community level, parents in the new school program participated more in school events, had more cooperative attitudes and were more satisfied with the school than communities in regular schools.

Although no significant results could be given concerning internal and external efficiency, it was observed that all the schools offered 5 years of schooling, the same as regular schools.

18. Evaluation findings about PURPOSE - Quote the approved project purpose. Cite progress toward each End-of-Project Status (EOPS) conditions. When can achievement be expected? Discuss causes of progress or shortfalls.

The following progress was made toward each of the end-of-project conditions. A relevant curriculum was designed and approved for grades one thru five. Student textbooks in four basic subject areas were written, published, and distributed to all 224 schools.

- The project proposed to train 300 teachers and 70 supervisors.

Although only 224 schools were implemented, all regular primary school supervisors in the three target departments were trained in the New School concepts.

In total, 354 teachers and 78 supervisors were trained. The project also wanted to reduce the repetition rate by at least 10%. The evaluators could not measure this because not enough of the schools have been operational long enough to give a valid indication of this desired output. (See evaluation attached).

The project was not able to institutionalize a viable national administrative mechanism to carry out the program. This project was managed on the GOC side from the office of Planning in the Ministry of Education. However, the Ministry semi-formalized a five person staff and provided them with office space to implement this project.

Original planning didn't take into account the need for personnel. One chief cause for the shortfall in the number of schools is because the project covered such time and space (two years in Boyacá, Cundinamarca and Norte de Santander) that communications, understanding, and transportation, were serious problems. The other shortfalls are miniscule.

On the other hand, the qualifications and dedication of the persons implementing the project at all levels - GOC, Department and vereda-were of extremely high quality. Without them the project could not have succeeded. This qualified and dedicated group encountered logistical and operational problems almost daily, as an example, how to pay teachers per diem at workshops and where to safely store the reference libraries prior to processing and distribution.

In general, the principal success was the application of the four basic components of the project; curriculum design, regional adaptation and implementation in schools, in-service teacher training sessions, library training and distribution, specific administrative procedures and community participating processes.

Although the project has not been institutionalized at a national level. In a formal manner, steps are being taken at the Ministerial level and we hope to see stronger action taken in 1980.

The evaluation of the project and the feasibility study were not final studies. They were primary studies that must be continued in 1980, once the effects and problems of the project have been observed and analyzed.

Presently, continuation of the evaluation and feasibility studies for 1980 are being designed. Financial aid for these studies is being sought.

The principal causes of progress were:

1. For designing an improved curriculum and adequate funds to contract this task.
2. To have contracted with a high level research team and to have had a systematized conception of the model.
3. To have had available top level instructors and sufficient funds to implement the training sessions.

4. To have had a clear teacher-training model easily replicable.
5. To have had a low-cost model library, training sessions, and distribution processes easily replicable.

The causes of the principal problems were:

1. Political departmental selection of teachers and schools that did not meet the technical criteria required by the Central level.
2. Movement and permanent changes of teachers based on political departmental decisions, and migration to the cities caused a permanent drop-out rate of trained teachers and confronted the team with the need to continually train new teachers assigned to the "new school" project.
3. The evaluation and feasibility study were limited to one year, which was insufficient time to obtain valid conclusions of long term goals.

In addition, the feasibility study was changed to a cost and administrative study, in accordance with a decision of the national committee.

19. Evaluation finding about OUTPUTS and INPUTS -
Note any particular success or difficulties.
Comment on significant management experiences of host contractor, and donor organizations.
Describe any necessary changes in schedule or in type and quantity of resources or outputs needed to achieve project purpose.

It was noted in the past PES that project completion might be threatened by the lack of GOC administrative personnel. However, during this report period this input was secured and consequently no problems resulted.

The former evaluation stated that it was premature to try to evaluate the projects output to reduce the drop-out rate. It also stated the same to be true concerning the projects desire to cause a reduction in the repetition rate; however, it is interesting to note that the Ministry of Education did make provision for the semiautomatic promotion of Unitary School students.

The project provided for two long-term advisors. Both advisors completed their assignments and departed country before this evaluation period began. Project officials believe that much of the

success the project enjoyed was due to the flexible timing of the inputs.

As was mentioned before, the fact that the contracts with University of Pamplona and with Nemequene were made, permitted the success of the curriculum design and initial evaluation. The technical assistance of the two North Americans helped to develop the first activity.

The Nemequene evaluation report describes the production process of the childrens material and makes an evaluation of its content. It also analyzes the distribution and use of the libraries and childrens materials in the 4 levels, (2-4). While the evaluation was being implemented the first grade materials were being printed.

8,000 instructional guides and 250 libraries were distributed. In addition, two teachers guides for the first grade were printed, one of 5,000 sets and the other of 1,000.

In this aspect the initial target was surpassed; the fact that there were sufficient funds and that they were well administered were two important positive factors.

20. Evaluation findings about UNPLANNED EFFECTS.
Has the Project had any unexpected results or impact, such as changes in social structure, environment, technical or economic situation? Are these effects advantageous or not? Do they require any change in plans?

The creation of these 224 one room - one teacher schools has had a great deal of favorable publicity. The effect of this publicity helped direct the attention of the International Development Bank to the project which eventually led to a half million dollar grant from the IDB to extend the project to three other departments. It was hoped in the planning stage that the project would be successful in making primary school education available to poor rural children, but just how the project would be expanded and by whom was not noted. No other unplanned effect was revealed through this evaluation.

In some sectors there has been a great interest in being informed about the new school Project (National Seminars, Universities and International Seminars). The project has been invited several times to be presented as a pilot show-case project. Also, Secretaries

of Education Normal Schools, and other Ministry projects such as Concentraciones de Desarrollo Rural and Nucleos Educativos have solicited the participation of the project in their activities. Private institutions such as Federación de Cafeteros have financed some activities.

21. CHANGES IN DESIGN or EXECUTION - Explain the rationale for any proposed modification in project design or execution which now appear advisable as a result of the preceding findings (items 16 to 20 above) and which were reflected in one or more of the action decisions listed on page 1 or noted in Item 15 on page 4.

Since this project is now completed and this is the last evaluation, no changes in design or execution of the present project are suggested.

At the moment there are several alternatives in relation to any future expansion of the project: 1) to intensify work in the departments where it already is or 2) to expand it to other regions. The evaluation results are being considered in this decision. A planning and evaluation team was organized within the project to continue systematizing alternatives. Intensification of supervisory action and assessment will be continued and more attention at the supervisory level will be reinforced with other agents.

22. LESSONS LEARNED - What advice can you give a colleague about development strategy - e.g., how to tackle a similar development problem or to manage a similar project in another country? What can be suggested to follow-on in this country? Similarly, do you have any suggestions about evaluation methodology?

The last PES made nine suggestions to anyone in another country that might be contemplating the design of a similar project. This Mission believes that those nine suggestions continue to be valid. However, the Mission would add another suggestion, and that is to make such a project part of the regular primary school program.

It is necessary to intervene more in the selection of the schools according to the criteria established. It would be ideal to select the schools in a more complete planning process, such as Mapa Educativo (Educational Map). Also it has been very functional to

administer the project in a decentralized manner.

The training model owes much of its success to a three-stage development process: school and community motivation and organization, gradual introduction of curriculum innovations, and implementation of the complete methodology. It is not practical to implement training in just one stage.

Finally, it is necessary to count more upon medium-range plans instead of short range ones.

23. Special Comments

The one-room, one teacher school is not a new idea, not even in Colombia, where the Mission understands a number of previous attempts have failed in the past.

Histories of these attempts are not available in a systematized manner, however, the little evidence available indicates the basic failures. The past experiences of the Unitary Schools enriched the New School Model, which incorporated the positive findings in a selective fashion.

Interested officials from other countries anticipating such a project are highly encouraged to visit Colombia, interview project officials and visit appropriate project sites.

The Mission strongly believes that this project has much to offer developing nations by providing an improved and extended basic education to the rural poor. The basic elements of this project embrace and support the Agencies proposed EHRD strategy.