

Unclassified

CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

36p. Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE African Labor Development			2. PROJECT NUMBER 698-0363	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE AFR/RA
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) 698-79-01	
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>71</u>	B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>81</u>	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>82</u>	6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING A. Total \$ <u>10,800,000</u> B. U.S. \$ <u>10,800,000</u>	
			7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION From (month/yr.) <u>1/1/77</u> To (month/yr.) <u>4/30/79</u> Date of Evaluation Review	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION				

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., alrgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Amend project paper to reflect for each activity a more precise statement of "purposes," "outputs," and "inputs." Clarify how these three elements are related.	J. Carson	6/79
2. Design and implement a system for evaluating seminars, workshops, and other training activities to determine their effectiveness.	AALC	12/79
3. Prepare plans and schedules for shifting country specific activities to <u>more extensive</u> local support.	AALC	12/79

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	_____
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	_____

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

A.	<input type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change
B.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or
	<input type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan
C.	<input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

AFR/RA, Jeannette Carson, Project Officer
 AFR/RA, James Washington, Human Resources Dev. Off.
 AFR/RA, James D. Kraus, Asst. Dir. for Program

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature	<i>E. Dennis Conroy</i>
Typed Name	Director, AFR/RA
Date	May 16, 1979

SUMMARY - GENERAL

1. AALC activities examined in the five countries, Ghana, Liberia, Togo, Sierra Leone, and Kenya, are effectively meeting project objectives. Their impact on the long range goals of strengthening free trade unions and increasing popular participation varies, depending on the overriding socio-political and economic factors affecting trade unions in African countries.
2. AALC has displayed considerable resourcefulness and imagination in its activities in view of operational difficulties in one-party states where political constraints limit the role of trade unions.
3. In examining the various activities looked at in the field, it would appear that trade union education activities make the greatest contribution to the labor goals. AALC should consider keeping close watch over these activities to assure a timely phase-out of general workers education activities in favor of more advanced trade union training.
4. AALCs projects relating to cooperatives are generally useful.
5. Relations of AALC staff, Embassies and USAID missions appear to be generally satisfactory. Some problems exist, however, in identification of the USAID/Embassy roles. USAID missions in particular should devote more attention to the monitoring of AALC activities. AID/W can assist in this endeavor by sending out a periodic overview to the field on guidelines governing the AALC program in view of the frequent turnover of mission personnel.

Note: The PES is based on a formal evaluation conducted by Group Seven Associates in Kenya, Ghana, and Togo; and a review of country activities by the Project Officer in Liberia and Sierra.

GHANA

Summary

- A. Labor Education Program - This activity is designed to develop the capacity of the Ghana Labor College to provide effective training to trade union members. This is to be accomplished by enlarging the contents of the Labor College library and holding training seminars.

The evaluation report revealed the following: (1) the planned enlargement of the Labor College library has not occurred and was not likely to occur, even in 1979; (2) a seminar evaluation system needed to generate data to be used to evaluate and improve training effectiveness should be implemented; (3) the labor education program and the physical presence of the AALC representative play a positive role in promoting union effectiveness in Ghana; (4) planned seminars are behind schedule; and (5) the effectiveness of this activity is reaching its stated objectives is restricted. No institutional capacity to provide effective training is being generated.

The following recommendations to improve the program were made:

- 1) "Grantee provide capacitating inputs (e.g., teacher training courses) to correspond to the statement of objective;
 - 2) AALC begin work as soon as possible to specify educational indicators of seminar achievements, both at output and purpose level. This will require a data collection system to provide adequate feedback to the GTUC concerning the performance of seminar graduates;
 - 3) AALC do a small feasibility study in 1979-1980 to determine the potential in upgrading the statistical research component of GTUC to become a full-fledged labor-economic research center."
- B. Labor College Building - This activity is designed to provide new facilities and equip the Ghana Labor College. The evaluation report indicates that: (1) no progress has been made to date on construction of the building nor has ground-breaking begun because of numerous problems which exist regarding the amount of money the architect is to receive as against the amount budgeted for the job. Currently, negotia-

tions are taking place between the trade union and a local architecture firm to reach a compromise regarding construction of the labor college in stages.

Evaluation Methodology - The evaluation was conducted by Group-Seven Associates and was done in accordance with the requirement in the project paper which calls for a comprehensive evaluation of the project to be conducted prior to the conclusion of the third year. The evaluation study involved data collection from mid-November to mid-December 1978. The following points were considered in the review/analysis of the activity:

- (a) The timeliness of outputs.
- (b) The internal logic linking outputs to objectives.
- (c) The impact linking the activity to certain qualitative factors.
- (d) The projection of self-support.
- (e) Conclusions.
- (f) Recommendations.

The evaluators obtained information from the following persons:

1. Secretary General of Ghana Trade Union Congress (GTUC)
2. GTUC, Head of Department of International Affairs
3. GTUC, Head of Research Department
4. Principal of the GTUC Labor College
5. Secretary General of the Maritime and Dockworkers Union
6. Head of Education Department, Industrial and Commercial Workers Union (the largest union affiliated with the GTUC)
7. USAID Director
8. USAID Program Officer
9. USAID Public Administration Specialists (two)
10. U.S. Embassy Political/Labor Reports Officer/Project Liaison Officer
11. AALC/Ghana Representative

External Factors - Ghana is undergoing extreme economic and political conditions at the present time which have a tremendous effect on any type of activity taking place in the country.

<u>Inputs</u> -	AALC technician	12 man months
	Two instructors	24 man months
	Communications and postage	

Due to the inability of the Ghana labor union and the local architects to reach an agreement regarding construction of the labor college, no funds have been expended to date for commodities or equipment.

Outputs -

1. Improved and enlarged library facilities in Labor College.

Progress: This was not attained in 1978.

2. Eighteen seminars are successfully held.

Progress: Twelve seminars were held in 1978.

3. New educational building has been constructed (including classrooms, dorms and kitchen) and focusses attention on role of labor and substantially improves GTUC education program.

Progress: The building has not been constructed to date, however, the present labor college continues to expand its education activities in its effort to provide training in areas of workers needs.

Purpose - The development of the capacity of the Ghana Labor College to provide effective training to trade union officers and members at an elementary, intermediate and advanced level and in specialized areas of trade union concern.

Comment: AALC has been supporting AALC education seminars with the GTUC since the 1960's. Their affiliated membership has grown from 345,047 in 1974 to 550,260 in 1978. The financial position of the GTUC during this period has stabilized, attributed to the attainment of a dues structure of 1 percent of members' wages. Several of the 17 national unions affiliated with the GTUC have initiated their own labor education programs for their members. During 1974 to 1977, 1,167 members were trained in national union-sponsored seminars. The principle of the GTUC Labor College reports that AALC's support has been instrumental in the improvement in their respective programs and services.

- 5 -

TOGO

A. CREDE - Regional Economic Research and Documentation Center

Summary - This activity is designed to create an information center which will provide a base for (a) increasing communication within and between African trade unions and (b) increasing the collection and use of socio-economic data in Central and West Africa by the trade unions in order to deal more objectively with matters concerning labor. CREDE has been in existence since 1972 and has occupied its present quarters for one year.

"Nevertheless, bi-monthly publication (about 20 per year) of African Trade Union News (ATUN) has occurred since 1974. ATUN is essentially a clipping service. About 50 publications are monitored ($\frac{1}{2}$ from Africa, $\frac{1}{4}$ U.S., $\frac{1}{4}$ Europe). Items are selected (and translated) for reprinting based on their general trade union interest and coincidence with AFL-CIO "foreign policy" positions. About 1,000 copies of each issue are printed and distributed (500 in English, 500 in French).

CREDE has also been publishing Labor and Development (LaD) on a monthly basis (10 per year), also since 1974. LaD appears in English and French. The mailing list for each language is about 500. LaD too is mostly reprints, although some "original" material sometimes appears.

Subscriptions to ATUN and LaD are free of charge. The target of 850 recipients has been exceeded, there being 981 names on the mailing list in early December 1978."

"It is difficult to judge how this activity's outputs affect the "qualitative factors." On the one hand, there are a number of testimonial letters from subscribers attesting to the value of CREDE's publications. On the other, there is an indicator of low interest. A readership questionnaire was sent out which resulted in a (poor) 5% response. In 1975, a similar survey produced a 34% response. If the full potential of CREDE were to be achieved, we believe it could have important impact. In our opinion, this has not happened in the six years of its existence, despite the expenditure of nearly \$600,000."

An agreement was signed in January 1977 between AALC and the Organization of African Trade Union Unity (OATUU) whereby OATUU would take over operation of CREDE within five years' time. That document also alludes to a changing function for CREDE from one of communication and documentation to a continuing research training role. The agreement does not refer to any financial understandings of the post-1982 period. The probable political orientation of CREDE under OATUU is unclear to us.

"CREDE performs a useful information collection and dissemination function. Its effectiveness is restricted by personnel staffing problems. Its future is unclear, particularly due to the planned turnover to OATUU control. For example, current emphasis is on the reprint function; the new Director speaks of more substantive publications; the AALC/OATUU communique alludes to a shift towards research training programs."

Evaluation Methodology - The evaluation was conducted by Group-Seven Associates and was done in accordance with the requirement in the project paper which calls for a comprehensive evaluation of the project to be conducted prior to the conclusion of the third year. The evaluation study involved data collection from mid-November to mid-December 1978. The following points were considered in the review/analysis of the activity:

- (a) The timeliness of outputs.
- (b) The internal logic linking outputs to objectives.
- (c) The impact linking the activity to certain qualitative factors.
- (d) The projection of self-support
- (e) Conclusions.
- (f) Recommendations.

The evaluation obtained information from the following persons:

1. Secretary General, CNTT
2. Director of the Workers' Education Center
3. CNTT Secretary of Education
4. Secretary General of the Commercial Workers' Union
5. CNTT Co-op
6. U.S. Ambassador to Togo
7. U.S. Embassy, Deputy Chief of Mission
8. U.S. Embassy, Economic/Commercial Officer
9. USAID Affairs Officer/Project Liaison Officer
10. IDS Junior Officer, USAID mission
11. A representative of another organization providing trade union education assistance to the CNTT
12. Three AALC staff members.

Inputs

Technical Advisor	24 man months
OATUU Counterpart	12 man months
Local Staff	
Commodities: Xerox El. Typewriter, materials and publication costs	

"No changes or problems with inputs except that senior staffing of the Center apparently has been a problem stemming from the fact that there have been five directors in the six years of its existence. Also the evaluators eluded to the fact that morale and cohesiveness among Grantee staff appears to be rather low. The first African senior staff member was appointed in 1978 as Associate Director to understudy the directorship and that it is believed that the new director's, a young American woman, effectiveness will be severely limited due to psycho-cultural factors of age, sex and language."

Outputs -

1. Publication of African Trade Union News twice a month in both French and English with a distribution of 700

Progress: Bi-monthly publication (20 per year) has occurred since 1974. About 50 are monitored ($\frac{1}{2}$ Africa, $\frac{1}{4}$ U.S., $\frac{1}{4}$ Europe). About 1,000 copies of each issue are printed and distributed (500 English, 500 French).

2. Publication of Labor & Development monthly in both French and English with a distribution of 700.

Progress: Published on a monthly basis (10 per year) since 1974. Published in French and English and 500 copies each mailed.

Note: The target of 850 recipients for both publications has been exceeded. Mailing list consists of 981 names.

3. Basic and library research for the publication of various research studies with a distribution of 200 to 700.

Progress: The target number of six research studies has been achieved. Sent in French and English to 981 recipients.

4. Acquire more efficient equipment for the production of the various publications, including a collating machine.

Progress: Following items obtained in 1977-78:

- 1 Olivetti Lexicon 90 typewriter
- 1 Sharpfax SF501 Photocopier
- 1 Satas Automatic Stamping Machine
- 1 Rex Rotary 1050S Offset Printer
- Miscellaneous other machines

Note: Offsets can be produced in color.

5. Two-one week international colloquia on the progress of trade union journalism and methods of socio-economic research, with 10 to 15 participants each.

Progress: One 2-week colloquim on trade union research services held with 12 participants. Second colloquim cancelled and substituted by attendance at Harvard's 3-month Trade Union Program.

6. A series of 1-month on-the-job training programs for 4 African trade unionists with research information responsibilities in their unions.

Progress: This activity did not materialize during 1978. Planned for 1979 for 2 persons from Gabon.

7. Assistance to African trade unions in establishing research and documentation facilities.

Progress: No books, equipment or other aid was donated to trade unions in 1978 to assist them in establishing research and documentation facilities of their own.

Of the outputs listed for 1978, two have exceeded their targets (ATUN and LaD distribution figures), three have reached their target (six studies, maintenance of subscriptions, and equipment acquisition) while three others had partial or complete shortfalls (2 colloquia, OJT, and assistance to trade unions).

Purpose - See Summary.

"The main objective of this activity was accomplished in 1972 with the creation of CREDE. The intent now is to keep it functioning and later to Africanize it.

The impact of this activity is judged by comments from subscribers. A number of testimonial letters attesting to the value of CREDE's publications have been received."

The following recommendations for improvement of the project were made by the evaluators:

"1) OATUU be encouraged to accept gradual fiscal as well operational responsibility for CREDE.

2) A nominal subscription fee be charged for ATUN and LaD so that perceived value to recipients could be gauged.

3) An impact evaluation and/or needs analysis study be carried out to determine CREDE's most appropriate function(s)."

a

B. Trade Union Education

Summary - This activity is designed to create within CNTT the capacity to conduct an effective trade union education program.

"AALC/Togo's funded labor education program in 1978 made up a small part of the CNTT education services provided to members. Additional organizations also provide monies to the CNTT for its education program.

Grantee was instrumental in the 1970 construction of the Workers' Education Center -- three years before the creation of CNTT (the current trade union confederation). Prior to 1977, AALC supported labor education through its International Trade Secretariat (ITS) component and its impact funds. Some of the other organizations which provide funds for the workers' education program include: The World Confederation of Labor (WCL); the Naumann Foundation of West Germany; International Trade Secretariats (ITS's); the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU); and the World Federation of Trade Unions (WFTU). From January through October 1978, thirty-one seminars were held. Nine were organized by CNTT themselves, seven by the Grantee and the other 15 by the other organizations.

Grantee's Labor Education Program, in conjunction with its other activities appears to be well received by the CNTT. It is impossible at this time to judge the training effectiveness of this program because of the lack of an evaluation system."

Inputs

Local hire personnel

Literacy teachers (part-time) - 2 man months

Commodities

Construction of one coop store in Dapaon

In-country training - 7 seminars

3rd country training: Administrative officer 3 man months

Inputs reduced due to budget cuts

Outputs

1. Improved capacity and performance of the full-time and part-time staff of the Workers' Education Center.
2. Majority of current trade union members trained to first level of knowledge of unionism.

Progress: Some union members were trained to first level knowledge of unionism in 1978 in accordance with report that 210 participants attended AALC funded seminars. Basic trade union syllabus is followed which compares with other basic trade union courses.

3. Nine one-week seminars on trade unionism.

Progress: Seven held during 1978.

AALC/TOGO and the CNTT have begun to develop a course evaluation system which would generate information and data to determine the achievement of output targets.

Purpose: See Summary.

"The Secretary General of the CNTT indicated that the present type of AALC labor education assistance (basic seminars) can probably cease in two to three years. He would like these funds moved into the cooperative area. This coincides with its goal to organize the rural sector using consumer cooperatives initially as the organizing tool. Once this is accomplished, CNTT would like to move into producer cooperatives.

Deficient internal logic and lack of an evaluation component limits the effectiveness of this activity. Moreover, the CNTT being closely affiliated to the one political party and the Government, involving the general goal, i.e., "to develop effective, self-managed, democratic and financially self-sufficient trade unions..." becomes questionable."

Of the various qualitative factors the evaluators opinion was that the activity does have some positive effect on the Togo labor movement's viability and effectiveness."

The evaluators recommended that Grantee:

"1) Conform inputs and outputs to the objective (e.g., train trainers, not just trainees), or vice versa.

2) Establish a seminar evaluation system with specific educational indicators.

3) Use feedback to program ensuing seminars.

C. Cooperative Program

Summary - This activity is designed to create within the Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs du Togo the capacity to develop and supervise cooperatives and credit unions.

"The CNTT consumer cooperative store had begun to provide service to its members by 1976 in Lome. Grantee had largely completed its commodity assistance by end of 1977. CNTT planned to expand the physical facility to newer quarters in 1978, though interior work was incomplete at time of evaluation. By the end of 1978, the old store was said to be serving 3,000 members and a small number of non-members, an increase from around 2,000 members a year earlier. Potential membership (5 years) was estimated at 15,000 to 30,000.

AALC plans called for "equipped facilities for CNTT cooperative stores in two northern locations" by end of 1978. CNTT hopes to develop one new store every two years.

\$18,000 of AALC funds, budgeted for two up-country stores was spent on one store only, the one 400 miles north of Lome, at Dapango (Dapaon), which was under construction but not yet in operation by end of 1978. It had been planned to help equip two additional stores.

As far as could be determined, no staff development training program had been formulated by the end of 1978 either by CNTT or by Grantee in preparation for initiating new stores, nor did Grantee's capital assistance hinge on prior or simultaneous manpower training efforts.

Other sponsors, namely the ILO and the Nauman Foundation (German), have provided assistance to the CNTT cooperative program, reportedly in amounts in excess of AALCs financial support.

Head of CNTT considers consumer cooperative development as the number one CNTT priority, as, in his conception, it is prerequisite for later development of producers' cooperatives which he believes of even greater importance.

CNTT institution-building efforts are aided through a training program in Israel, where five to seven participants are sent each year for short-term training, and one in Germany, where two persons have been sent for co-op administrative training (one has returned).

The Lome co-op manager had received two years' education in Moscow, not sponsored by CNTT.

An up-country producer co-op program for women, i.e., in fisheries and rice, is being initiated by CNTT.

The "credit union" part of the Grantee's objectives seems not to be an emphasis of CNTT at the time of the evaluation. Such "credit unions" are considered to be the exclusive responsibility of the Togo Credit Union League.

Source of funds for the co-op project were said to be (1) shares from members, (2) payment from CNTT and (3) income from sales. Gross sales of the Lome co-op for the past year were estimated as 30 million CFA francs, with 80% of gross sales coming from union members and 20% from the public. Total income could not be determined.

A visit to the co-op store in Lome revealed the freezers supplied by AALC were in place, although they were being used as refrigerators, mostly for soft drinks. Prices of key items (rice, oil, sugar), when compared to similar ones in other stores, were substantially lower, suggesting the potential for this low mark-up, nonprofit operation.

Plans for geographic growth of the consumer cooperatives appear to be vague and ad hoc, with very little apparently known within AALC of the parallel efforts by the Naumann Foundation (German) and ILO (through UNDP) to support co-ops. Such other outside efforts would seem to make the planned "capacity building" even more important.

The location of the second co-op (after Lome) at the northern-most city in Togo adds to the logistic problems for collaboration with the Lome center co-op store, and CNTT itself. It is noted, however, that if the two other co-ops (German and ILO), to be located at lesser distances up-country, come to function, this may alleviate uneconomic aspects of the supply and logistical problems, and all the burdens of "fledgling operations."

Inputs - No problems with inputs.

Outputs -

1. The CNTT consumer cooperative store in Lome provides a viable service to its members.

Progress: Very little emphasis has been placed on "creating the capacity." More stress has been placed on physical structures and equipment with little effort to develop a trained, institutionalized expertise.

2. CNTT consumer cooperative stores are developed in the northern regions of the country.

Progress: Plans for geographic growth of the consumer cooperatives are not positive presently. Very little is known within AALC of the parallel efforts by the Naumann Foundation (German) and ILO to support co-ops. The location of the second co-op at the northern city of Togo will cause logistical problems.

Purpose: See Summary.

"Well-run consumer co-ops clearly constitute a valuable secondary service to trade unionists. The existing store in Lome probably generates some rank and file support for the trade union movement. Union involvement with co-ops accomplishes a few other things as well. It legitimizes labor's role in development of the country. It is also a safe activity in milieus in which a union's basic functions (i.e., collective bargaining, grievance procedures, and strikes), are permitted only reluctantly, if at all. It incidentally also channels available time, energy and funds away from the traditional basic trade unionist activities.

If the government and labor movement of Togo proceed in their plans to encourage consumer and producer cooperatives, then it is likely that AID support (through AALC and other programs) would increase before it diminishes. In this connection, it should be noted that there is a shifting emphasis in CNTT toward a greater involvement in the agricultural sector of the country. Likewise, the USAID Mission now includes within its projections agricultural support as a large element. Involvement in the up-country growth of the consumer cooperatives and, later and more importantly, the projected producer cooperatives could be AALC's window to such activities."

The evaluation concludes that:

- "1) The stated inputs and outputs alone will not achieve the stated objective.
- 2) Consumer co-ops are very difficult to organize and run successfully. Therefore, the risks to the U.S. development effort in this activity are more considerable, in our opinion, than the small budget figures would suggest.

The evaluators recommend the following:

- 1) "That AID support for this activity be increased to realize its fuller development potential, or, if this is not done, support should be eliminated because of the difficulties
- 14

and risks in implementing this kind of activity.

- 2) Assuming increased assistance that Grantee (or some other organization) be encouraged to propose appropriate inputs to "create a co-op capacity within CNTT" to assure proper managerial functioning with full control over cash and commodities.
- 3) That the time frame for support be extended until at least 1982, but that action to meet the earlier objective begin now.
- 4) That the AID Mission, which has been given the monitoring role for this activity, consider utilizing the opportunities of that role by seeking ways to support the AALC objective through other actions and programs within the overall AID program not related to AALC activities themselves."

D. French Literacy and English Language Program

Summary - This activity is designed to develop within CNTT the capability of providing an educational program in literacy in French and a second-language capability in English for union members.

"Each of these classes meet for one hour, two nights a week at the Workers' Education Center. There is no tuition cost to the students. Reportedly, many students drop out during the year. As of June 1978, a total of about 100 students were still in class. Assuming that entry enrollments in the two years were comparable, this would constitute about 37% attrition. The teaching method in the Advanced English class observed was very traditional and grammar-oriented. Student interest seemed good in general. Twelve different Advanced English test papers were made available to the evaluators, although class performance on them was not indicated. Half of these tests involved translation skills (English to French and French to English). Observation of one of the French "literacy" classes would indicate that for many of the students present, it was a French class, more than a literacy class. That is, they were learning a new language, rather than to read and write one they already knew orally. The teacher's classroom methods were poor (e.g., using the same text material for those who were learning French as for those who were there to learn reading and writing in French). An independent literacy training program apparently does exist (outside CNTT), called Programme National d'Alphabetization. No audio-visual equipment was in evidence in the classes visited."

15

"Grantee is merely providing funds for this activity. They are not furnishing any training or technical assistance or advice. Grantee has not arranged for the English teacher(s) to receive, free of charge, FORUM (a quarterly publication for teachers of English to speakers of other languages). The U.S. Cultural Center regularly distributes this publication to 300 Togolese English teachers. We do not see therefore how this type of input can be said to develop any kind of capacity within CNTT, as per above-stated activity objective. By the same token, we do not see how the listed output (literacy and language program), largely funded as it is through AID, can logically ever lead to a "purpose level" condition whereby CNTT is providing a literacy training and an English Language Program for its members."

Inputs: No problems with inputs.

Outputs:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Progress</u>
3 classes in French & English	2 Classes each in French and English were held as follows:
	English
	Beginners class 78
	Advanced class 39
	<u>117</u>
	French
	First year class 19
	Second year class 23
	<u>42</u>
	Total 159

Purpose: See Summary.

"The evaluators see this activity contributing to two of the qualitative objectives: progress in secondary services, and increasing union acceptance by workers. Reportedly in 2-3 years, funding will be sought more eagerly by CNTT for cooperative development than for education programs like this one. This activity is a low budget operation with some small development benefits including a modest amount of literacy training."

The evaluators recommend the following:

"That if A.I.D. continues to fund this activity, that Grantee either provide more suitable inputs to achieve the stated objective, e.g., foreign language teaching methods training for the instructors, medium technology audio-visual equipment,

16

and a plan to gradually substitute CNTT funding and/or modest tuition fees for A.I.D. funding; or modify the statement of the objective to conform to the reality of the current input(s)."

E. CNTT Secretariat Development

Summary - This activity is designed to strengthen the administrative capability of the Confederation Nationale des Travailleurs du Togo.

"The activity began in 1977 with the training of two members of the CNTT secretariat in Zaire. The training was in accounting, administration and dues check-off procedures. The plan to send a third member to be trained in industrial relations and collective bargaining, scheduled to take place in Tunisia in 1978, was cancelled owing to "the union situation" in Tunisia. The AALC funds budgetted for this training were expended instead in 1978 to enable a trade union member of a community development survey team to visit housing developments in Colombia, U.S., and Liberia. There are no present plans to reinstitute the plan to train a secretariat member in industrial relations and collective bargaining."

Purpose: See Summary

"The activity appears to contribute to labor movement viability. Self-supported secretariat development occurs continuously, if only through OJT."

The evaluators recommended that AALC continue to seek opportunities for appropriate training of CNTT labor officers to strengthen their administrative capabilities.

Commentary - "The AALC/Togo program budget in FY 1977 was \$25,000 and \$37,000 for FY 1978. The total AID budget for Togo was \$3,500,000 in FY 1977 and \$3,900,000 in FY 1978 (for technical assistance). This means that the program being evaluated is less than one percent of the AID program in Togo. The evaluators commented that this may account for the lack of knowledge and interest in the AALC program by USAID personnel. They found that Embassy personnel were more knowledgeable and appeared to be more interested. "

"Due reportedly to AALC staff shortages which affected a regional program, i.e., CREDE, the AALC representative in Togo had insufficient time during most of 1978 to devote to the trade union education program. It is also apparent that other organizations which provide monies for the workers' education program do so in an advisory capacity, not as deliverers of educational services. The Secretary General of CNTT indicated that in terms of money,

AALC was the 3rd largest provider of funds (arter France and Germany) but in terms of overall importance AALC was 1st -- because of their continuity."

8

SIERRA LEONE

Summary

This activity is designed to develop an effective trade union education capability within the Sierra Leone Labor Congress.

The AALC has been assisting the trade union of Sierra Leone with small impact projects for many years. The organization in 1976 witnessed the merger of the two rival unions in the country, the Sierra Leone Council of Labor and the Labor Congress into one union, the Sierra Leone Labor Congress. AALC agreed to provide assistance in organizing the SLLC department with equipment and supporting services, implementing trade union programs, helping to train a staff who would be capable of organizing and running educational seminars at various levels throughout the country and implementing other programs such as credit unions and cooperatives to help strengthen the union.

The assessment of the effectiveness of the AALC presence in the country by the Embassy official in charge of monitoring the activities was that the AALC representative is basically fulfilling his responsibilities as well as possible considering the many constraints under which he is working. It was pointed out that the SLLC organization is a relatively weak group imbued with many political problems, it is not favored by the government and that AALC is viewed with suspicion by the government. The officer felt that the presence of the AALC representative was essential to the survival of the labor movement.

The AALC representative is experiencing difficulty implementing programs because of the political climate and as a result all activities are behind schedule. Both the education, literacy and cooperative programs are behind schedule. Educational seminars are held upon request of the membership rather than in accordance with a regular planned schedule.

Evaluation Methodology - The evaluation is an annual review of project implementation and is based on an on-site inspection of project activities by the Project Officer in AFR/RA. AID/Embassy, host government and AALC personnel contributed toward the formulation of data.

<u>Inputs</u> -	AALC Advisor	12 man months
	Local hire and Education Officer	12 man months

Outputs -

1. A reorganized SLLC education department established,

19

adequately staffed and equipped.

Progress: Because of existing political upheaval the SLLC has experienced difficulties in dealing with the government. The union supported the students during the recent protests against the government, thereby straining relationships. When SLLC elections came up it was revealed that an opposition slate was favored and perhaps financed by the government. The Government accused two union representatives of financing labor-based opposition to the Government and expelled two officials for alleged political influence. The Government has also investigated similar insinuations concerning the AALC, but they were shown to be unfounded, and the AALC representative was told by the President of Sierra Leone to continue with his program of technical assistance to the SLLC. As a consequence, however, the preoccupation of the SLLC officials with the national elections, and with the suspected interference in the SLLC elections, has reduced the effort that could otherwise have been devoted to trade union matters.

2. A study of educational needs of workers in 8 regions prepared.

Progress: Partially completed. Hope to complete in CY 1979.

3. Ten high level seminars held.

Progress: Eight were held in 1978. A survey revealed that the seminars should be directed toward local union officers rather than to the high level personnel.

4. Membership of SLLC grows by 10%.

Progress: Has not been accomplished. No new dues paying members. Current membership 80,000 with 40,000 dues paying members.

5. Produce course materials for functional literacy program.

Progress: Materials in process of completion by AALC representative. Hope to complete in CY 1979.

6. Train staff in methods of functional literacy programs and curriculum.

Progress: The literacy program is operating as an effective program and training has begun.

20

7. Three coops are organized and staffed.

Progress: One coop has been organized to date, is well stocked and appeared to be functioning effectively.

8. Cooperative Department functioning with 2 trained staff.

Progress: This has been accomplished.

9. Two coop seminars are held.

Progress: None held to date.

Note: There is no SLLC representation on any Government board or commission. The Government has, however, appointed a labor officer to Parliament. The nominee does not have the confidence of the SLLC.

Special Comments - In general, AALC's program of activities appear to have made a significant contribution to the effectiveness of the SLLC and in meeting project objectives. There is some need to restructure the trade union activities to more specialized seminars to meet requirements of collective bargaining. The accomplishments with respect to the broad goals on developing free trade unionism and encouraging popular participation are limited due to governmental restraints under the one-party system. However, AALC presence and assistance has probably opened channels of communication that can have a lasting effect.

It is recommended that the AALC field representative develop an evaluation system for education seminars and a follow-up mechanism for trainers to take place prior to the end of their program. He should also give more time and attention to the development of the cooperatives. They are behind schedule.

21

LIBERIA

Summary

The AALC has been assisting the trade unions of Liberia with small impact projects for many years. The progress has been slow with periods of divisiveness. Within the last few years AALC has provided assistance to specific union activities. The dominant labor movement in Liberia, the CIO, has been split badly by the withdrawal of several key unions and the formation of a rival center, the UWC (United Workers Congress). This group has a young and more energetic leadership whose basic motivation has been subject to some question.

Traditionally, the AALC ties have been with the CIO. An AALC advisor has been present in Liberia since early 1977 with the specific objectives of maintaining good relations with both unions and promoting unity and the growth of an effective united labor movement. The government is strongly urging that the two major factions united, but this is still an unresolved issue in Liberia, with many personal and political implications.

The AALC representative, in the meantime, is experiencing difficulty in implementing program activities. The policy has been to assist with one common program for the labor movement throughout the country. Because of the delays and the lack of assurance as to when the merger will take place, equal programs (on a membership basis) for each of the two national centers is not underway.

There also exists an unfinished headquarters building being utilized by the CIO, which is gradually deteriorating due to lack of maintenance.

Evaluation Methodology

The evaluation is an annual review of project implementation and is based on an on-site inspection of project activities by the Project Officer in AFR/RA. AID/Embassy, host government and AALC personnel contributed toward the formulation of data.

Inputs

Advisory services

9 man months

Local staff

12 man months

Commodities:

10 Vehicles

Office equipment

Audio-visual equipment

In-country training - 2 seminars

Inputs reduced due to budget cuts

22

One observation was made regarding the technical services being provided by AALC. AALC supplies a technician who is responsible for assisting in the promotion of the overall development of the labor movement, the training of headquarters staff and union members in labor methodology, and to attempt to foster unity within and win respect for the labor movement. Mr. Smith appeared to have good rapport with the labor members and the top leaders expressed their confidence in him and praised his valuable assistance. My concern was that he appeared to be quite an irrational person, displaying periods of excessive excitability and emotion. From all indications, however, his behavior did not appear to affect his effectiveness of getting the job done. These findings were innumarated to the AALC Executive Director in New York who assured AFR/RA staff that Mr. Smith had a long history of working successfully with labor programs and was in their opinion one of the most effective AALC staff members. I raised the issue for the record and recommended that it be considered and reviewed in future evaluations. No major problems with local hire personnel, commodities and training seminars.

Outputs

1. Establishment and functioning of a united labor movement.
2. Completion and furnishing of a new trade union headquarters.
3. Successful training of the nucleus of a headquarters staff.
4. A cadre of trained leaders with a basic competence in trade unionism.
5. An education program that has reached 500 members.

Progress

All planned outputs are either behind schedule or have not commenced. Educational program seminars for top leaders such as labor miniters and health officials are being conducted and are planned for 20 participants each from both groups.

The immunization program has not yet begun. The AALC input would consist of providing transportation for participants. There is no indication as to when the program will commence and there exists presently a program of this nature sponsored by the government. It is recommended that this activity be eliminated from the budget. In addition, the proposal to begin a literacy training program in FY 1979 for 100 persons annually is somewhat vague and appears to overlap with the basic educational training currently being provided. I therefore recommend that this line item be eliminated as a separate element and combined with the general education program.

87

In general, even though activities are progressing at a slow pace some progress toward development of free and democratic unions is being realized. I feel, in this connection, that the continued presence of the AALC representative is necessary to provide assistance whenever the merger takes place and in the meantime to provide a tactful avenue for and pressure towards negotiations.

Purpose: To foster unity within the Liberian labor movement; to assist in the creation of effective headquarters staffs, especially in the field of trade union education; to promote the overall development of the Liberian labor movement.

As mentioned under outputs, progress toward achievement of the purpose is progressing slowly, but is being realized.

Due to the delay of the merger between the two dominant unions, negotiations have seriously inhibited the implementation of activities in Liberia.

Special Comments

Recommend that Activity 30-03 - Immunization of Children not be funded in CY 1979 (see comments under Outputs).

It is also recommended that the USAID provide closer monitoring of AALC activities. It was noted that the USAID Officer in charge of this activity was not knowledgeable about some of the AALC programs and events.

KENYA

Summary

Kenya is faced with several major problems. One is keen rivalry between the two largest tribes, the politically dominant Kikuyu (largest tribe and near Nairobi) and the Luo of Western Kenya. Another is rapid population growth, 3.6%, one of the highest rates in the world, accompanied by lagging growth in wage employment, a rapid increase in the width and depth of education of youth, and rising domestic consumption. The population was 14.3 million in 1977, 90% rural, in a country slightly smaller than Texas.

A major problem is that wage employment, estimated at 903,000 in 1977, is not keeping pace with population growth, and real wages have declined an average of 2.2% annually during the past five years.

The unions had a membership total of 257,552 in December 1977. Other constraints are the proportion of wage earners who are public employees--estimated by the Permanent Secretary of Labor at round 500,000, or more than half the wage earners--and the rapid migration from rural areas to Nairobi.

The AALC program in Kenya is handled as a centrally-funded project and represents about one-half of one percent of the size of the AID Mission's program level. This probably accounts for the fact that according to the evaluation, insufficient attention is being given by USAID personnel to the monitoring of AALC activities.

The field review of AALC revealed that its staff seemed to be respected by key officials of the labor movement and the Labor Ministry, perhaps giving AALC more potential influence than is expected for so small an activity. Also, both labor and government seem to appreciate and to prefer the U.S. assistance.

Historically, prior to the merger of the American Federation of Labor (AFL) and the Congress of Industrial Organizations (CIO) in the United States, the AFL had ties with labor leaders in Kenya: mainly with Tom Mboya's Kenya Federation of Labor. In 1960, three years prior to Kenya's independence, the AFL-CIO made available funds for the construction of a building named "Solidarity House." After independence, the GOK dissolved the Kenya Federation of Labor and the Kenya African Worker's Congress. In their place, the Central Organization of Trade Union (COTU) was created. COTU has its national headquarters in the same "Solidarity House." Based upon the GOK's early policy of nonalignment, COTU did not become affiliated with any international trade union organizations, such as the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU), or the World Federa-

tion of Trade Unions (WFTU). In more recent times, COTU has accepted financial assistance for education, mainly on an ad-hoc basis, from the International Labor Organization (ILO), the ICFTU, and national labor movements from both Eastern and Western Europe. Today COTU has program assistance in education from a Swedish based group entitled "Study Circle Programme" and the AALC.

Consideration should be given to more higher level training of labor union officials (beyond the Labor College). The rate of attrition among individuals so trained might discourage greater USAID/AALC participant training efforts. In order to alleviate such a situation, if COTU were offered double the number of such grants for training in the U.S. or third countries, on the basis that COTU would pay international travel and AALC the remainder, COTU would have more incentive to strike a bargain with the individual to stay around for a good number of years upon return.

Evaluation Methodology: The evaluation was conducted by Group Seven Associates and was done in accordance with the requirement in the project paper which calls for a comprehensive evaluation of the project to be conducted prior to the conclusion of the third year. The evaluation study involved data collection from mid-November to mid-December 1978. The following points were considered in the review/analysis of the activity:

- (a) The timeliness of outputs.
- (b) The internal logic linking outputs to objectives.
- (c) The impact linking the activity to certain qualitative factors.
- (d) The projection of self-support
- (e) Conclusions.
- (f) Recommendations.

Evaluators obtained information from the following persons:

1. Secretary General, Central Organization of Trade Unions (COTU)
2. Chairman General, COTU
3. Secretary General, Kenya Local Government Workers' Union
4. Assistant Commissioner for Cooperative Development
5. National Cooperative Development, COTU
6. Head, Foreign Affairs and Co-op Department, Zambia Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU)
7. Central Finance Specialist, Africa Cooperative Savings and Credit Association (ACOSCA)
8. Secretary General, Kenya National Federation of Cooperatives (KNFC)

9. Secretary/Manager, Kenya Union of Savings and Credit Cooperatives (KUSCCO)
10. Provincial Cooperative Officer, Nairobi Province
11. Chairman of KUSCCO
12. Permanent Secretary of Labor
13. General Secretary, Entertainment and Musicians' Union
14. Branch Secretary, Tailors' and Textile Workers' Union, Thika Branch
15. Acting Secretary, COTU Branch Office, Thika
16. Director, Workers' Education Institute
17. Director of Education, Kenya Union of Commercial Food and Allied Workers (UCFAW) (at Limuru during their Shop Stewards' Seminar)
18. Representative of Kenya Federation of Employers
19. AID Project Liaison Officer
20. U.S. Embassy Labor Reporting Officer
21. AID Regional Human Resources Officer
22. AID Housing Consultant
23. AID Regional Director (REDSO)
24. Three AALC Field Representatives

A. Workers Education Institute

Summary - This activity is designed to create within the Central Organization of Trade Unions (COTU) a self-sufficient Worker's Education Institute capable of effectively training trade unionists for leadership and staff roles within the unions.

"There is sufficient public information from the Ministry of Labor, the Industrial Court and the Kenya Federation of Employers, to infer that Grantee's trade union education program probably had a positive impact on COTU's performance in their dealings with the Government and employers.

For the coming program year, it seems to be the consensus among those interviewed that AALC should continue to support the programs/activities it is now funding.

Grantee assistance to the Workers' Education Institute seems to have been a positive influence. Less than rigorous adherence to the stipulated output of staff training has prevented fuller achievement of the objective.

The Grantee's labor education program implemented through COTU's Workers' Education Institute appears to be well received, however, and to be making a positive contribution to Kenya trade unionism. Although hard data are not available, the consensus seems to be that the Grantee's labor education component has been effective. This was indicated by all Kenyans interviewed for this activity."

Inputs:

Advisor	12 man months
Local Staff	60 man months
Secretarial Staff	
15 Seminars	
Construction costs as per 1976 specifications	

Outputs:

- Curriculum Development - Review and revision of existing courses.
- Two additional Stage II courses completed.
- Staff Training - professional training for institute staff in methods and use of materials for Stage III (advanced) courses.

Progress

"In 1978, Workers' Education Institute (WEI) revised its course for the subject "Union Structure"--Levels 1,2,3; the WEI also revised its course for the subject "Labor Economics"--Levels 2,3. WEI obtained some data, material, and supporting information for the following new Level II courses; English as a second language, job evaluation, and time-motion study, but has not yet completed the curriculum development.

Through 1978, Grantee's Kenya representative, based in COTU headquarters with the WEI, reportedly carried out a nonstructured approach towards staff training. Periodic staff meetings were apparently held, at which time WEI staff evaluated prior seminars conducted. Brainstorming produced WEI staff consensus on goals and objectives for the revised Level 2 and 3 subjects "Union Structure" and "Labor Economics." COTU's Education Director and the Executive Council must approve revisions (and new courses), before WEI can include them in their education program.

Originally 15 seminars were programmed for 1978: seven seminars at Level I (of 1 week duration); five seminars at Level II (of 2 weeks duration) and three seminars at Level III (of 3 weeks duration). WEI and AALC completed 14 of these seminars (eight Level I seminars; five Level II seminars; one Level III seminar). Reason given for the short-fall of one and revision of the seminar program were: (a) lack of adequate union support for two of the three planned Level II seminars; (b) financial constraints, i.e. reduced funding and the drop of the dollar (U.S.) exchange rate. A total of 381 trade unionists attended the 14 completed seminars.

A brief analysis of relevant training materials as well as of completed questionnaires, letters, and Level II pre-seminar essays, "My Involvement in Union Activities," constitute indirect evidence that the core trade union education subject matter presented in Levels I, II, and II seminars is quite good. Also, the administrative structure established in the WEI to implement a trade union education program, in particular its pre-seminar procedures, is well conceived and effective considering WEI has a staff of only four Kenyan professionals and one support staff, complemented by the Grantee representative in an advisory capacity.

AALC/Kenya and the WEI use a nonstructured evaluation system, mainly dependent upon the course evaluation and oral feedback. There is insufficient hard data available, however, to measure directly the success of the AALC funded trade union education program due to lack of a structured and systematic evaluation system.

COTU is considering incorporating WEI into its new Labor College and utilizing the present WEI education program (Levels I, II, III) as a recruitment mechanism to select participants for in-depth college programs. It is an education prerequisite that a structured education evaluation system be institutionalized to serve as a formalized mechanism to select Labor College students and to obtain data on the performance of WEI Levels I, II, and III participants within their unions and places of work."

Comment

Of the two curriculum outputs and one staff training output targeted for 1978, only one was partially accomplished, viz. revision of the courses "Union Structure" and "Labor Economics." The second curriculum component was not achieved as planned, although initial materials and supporting information for the following Level II courses: English as a second language, Job Evaluation and Time and Motion Study, have been collected, according to those interviewed.

The staff training output was not attained as stated. Grantee, in conjunction with WEI, did apparently review teaching methods informally.

The specified outputs would definitely contribute to the stated objective. There is a proper recognition here that "creation of a self-sufficient education institute" requires staff training, and that "effective training" needs curriculum review, revision and augmentation. It should be noted, however, that these outputs, though necessary for the objective, are not by themselves enough to create a self-sufficient institution.

The Grantee's labor education program implemented through COTU's Workers' Education Institute appears to be well received, however, and to be making a positive contribution to Kenya trade unionism. Although hard data are not available, the consensus seems to be that the Grantee's labor education component has been effective. This was indicated by all Kenyans interviewed for this activity.

The following recommendations for improvement of the project were made:

"AALC in their 1980 presentation to AID specify how their present financial assistance to COTU's labor education program will mesh with the Labor College and its educational focus. Once this is known, AALC and AID will be in a better position to see the need for support COTU may require to upgrade labor education in Kenya in the next decade.

AALC, in cooperation with COTU's Workers' Education Institute, begin work in 1979 on a structured systematic educational evaluation system. This system should become operational in 1980 and be utilized as a major consideration for the selection of Labor College candidates. The evaluation system should also produce hard data needed to determine the degree of success of the Grantee's educational effort in Kenya.

AALC define and specify exactly what is meant when using terms such as "Training Reports," "Support services necessary," "In-service training methods," etc., for 1979 and in future program submissions to AID."

B. Area Offices for COTU

Summary - This activity is designed to provide each province of Kenya with an office facility for the COTU area officer and a meeting room adequate for the needs of the affiliated unions and educational seminars.

"Seven area offices are planned, one or more in each province, including one reportedly acquired or completed this year. The size of each is estimated at 1,000 sq. ft. While original cost estimate was for an average of about \$10,000 per unit, actual costs will be two times that, or more, because of inflation. The land will be acquired by COTU. Major problems have been encountered in obtaining land titles for the second and third planned offices, causing a delay of more than one year. There are observed signs that the problem is being resolved. The expectation is that AALC will provide the funds for the building and that furnishings will be supplied by COTU or from funds raised locally. Plans have been developed and reportedly tested with one structure. There are two basic plans. Each facility would be used by COTU and as many as 20 trade unions, on a scheduled basis--perhaps 20-30 thousand members. No firm plan of action, spelling out exactly who will do what and who will pay, was available to the evaluators, although there were apparently oral, but rather vague understandings reached."

"The need for the area facilities, modest as projected, is apparent and perhaps long overdue. Observation of only one site suggests that rental facilities would be impractical, unstable and lacking in the necessary prestige. If anything, the plan may be too modest if the units are to accommodate union growth. However, nothing in the plans of action seemed to address the stated "financial self-sufficiency" objective of AALC aided projects. The provision of an area office building, adequately equipped and well maintained and operated, should be a positive step forward for the trade labor movement in Kenya. The overall plan, however, based on brief observation and review does not adequately provide for much more than the physical structures."

The following recommendations for improvement of the project were made:

"That AALC, from the beginning of its support of physical structure, proceed under a firm agreement with COTU, and/or the local area unit organization providing for:

- a) a specific budget for adequate furnishings, together with an approved, planned list of items;
- b) a specific maintenance plan and budget; and
- c) a program for on-site training in office organization and management; one which will set a standard for each office to follow.

That the agreement provide for a gradual phase-down in physical structure support from the second unit to the seventh, substituting instead a greater financial effort (also on a participating basis) in the human development aspects of the area unit operations."

C. Labor College

Summary - This activity is designed to create a capability by December 31, 1984 to provide three-year college trade union education programs for thirty senior labor officials per year, while maintaining a capacity to train 360 to 500 branch officials each year.

"The physical structure was reported to be about two-thirds completed. The site is Kisumu, Nyanzor province, near the shore of Lake Victoria.

Reports and interviews confirm that COTU and the trade unions have provided \$2.5 million for the project. The money comes from a levy on COTU members, above the normal dues check-off.

There are apparently no firm plans as yet for equipping and furnishing the college buildings, either as to financing or content. It is expected that assistance will be forthcoming from various donors, including Sweden (through ICFTU) and AALC.

A staffing pattern of core employees has been projected consisting of a total of 24 employees, including a Co-Director (Head), Deputy Director, eight faculty, librarian and a bursar. The Co-Director's salary is shown at 61,500 shillings (\$8,200) per year; faculty around 35,000 shillings (\$4,700), librarian 18,000 shillings (\$2,400). There is no apparent plan in existence for the identification or selection of administration, faculty, or housekeeping staff, job descriptions, or projection of training plans for any such positions or personnel.

The intention is to utilize a small core staff of professional teachers and to supplement by short-term or occasional use of subject matter specialists who will be drawn from labor, management and the universities.

Present thinking was that the first class would begin in 1980, with a gradual build-up of faculty and program through 1984.

Core faculty is expected to provide for education, economic research, management, general administration, industrial relations. Still unresolved is the issue of whether to have subject-matter specialists as faculty and teach them to teach, or have professional teachers and support and supplement them with outside talent."

Comment

"The objective "To create a capability..." sounds overly encompassing and ambitious to evaluators, unless AID is prepared to accept a major new funding obligation and Grantee is prepared to perform a function which they claim they have not to date, i.e., as technical advisors, making technical inputs.

We see the Labor College as a potentially positive factor acting on the "qualitative" criteria.

This is something of a special case since the capital funds for the building are all coming from local sources. Opportunity to support an institution with elements of financial self-sufficiency from the outset is rare and might be encouraged.

To date, COTU has not finalized its structural and educational policy pertaining to the Labor College. Emphasis is still focused upon completion of the buildings. Therefore, it remains a task for COTU and AALC to negotiate an educational understanding which will give a focus for the future. Until this is accomplished, AID cannot expect a financial projection for the self-sufficiency of the present Workers' Education Institute or of the Labor College.

The Secretary of COTU envisions future AALC help to recruit a labor economist/researcher as well as a lawyer for the Labor College faculty and to assist financially with their salaries. COTU would provide housing.

The Permanent Secretary of Labor stated his belief that AALC's mandate in Kenya would need to be expanded to help establish the structure for the new Labor College as an extension of its present activities. On the other hand, COTU has been informed by the GOK that it approves the concept of a new levy on union members to be used to pay for major operating costs of the new Labor College to begin after the current levy on construction costs is completed.

The principal problem facing the college will likely be the teaching program development and selection of high-level faculty and administrative personnel. Participation in equipping and furnishing is likely to be necessary to allow a donor to have any voice in those two elements of institution building. The danger is that the trade-off will be made without attention to the need to develop both human and fiscal self-sufficiency for the operations. It is important that the budget habit being developed to buy a structure be widened to include all the operational aspects."

✓ 33

The following recommendations for improvement of the project were made:

"If A.I.D. believes the Labor College offers an acceptable way to achieve U.S. objectives, we suggest to AID that any financial assistance for the college be utilized as means for vitalizing an apparently little-developed sense of urgency for making a physical structure into an institution.

It is recommended to the Agency that encouragement be given to creating a "blueprint" for operations, with specifications and timetables, just as was done for the physical buildings without apparent urging by AALC. This is admittedly a more delicate technical assistance function than Grantee has performed heretofore.

We also recommend to AID that high priority be given to staff selection and development procedures, including the "housekeeping" function; low priority to any large scale commodity assistance, in order to keep pressure on the maintenance of the already-established and considerable local budgetary initiative.

Provision of topping-off training awards for study and observation in the U.S. and third countries might be one incentive as part of a package which could include an AALC contribution, on a descending scale, to operation costs. Selection and training of both faculty and administrative personnel needs some nudging, as does planning of building furniture and equipment and curricula."

D. Credit Union Development (Regional)

Summary - This activity is designed to:

- (1) create a capacity within the national trade union centers to develop credit unions and cooperatives among trade union members.
- (2) establish collaboration among trade unions, cooperatives, and the appropriate government departments dealing with cooperatives, in order to better serve the trade union members through their cooperative organizations.

Inputs -

Advisory services	6 man months
Local staff	36 man months (3 people)
Consultancy	
10 seminars (reduced to 7 or 8 due to budget cuts)	
Office equipment	
Subsidy for Central Accounts Office	

34

Outputs -

1. A functioning coop committee in COTU
2. Advanced coop training for staff of three
3. A centralized accounting office in Nyanza
4. Training society leaders in duties of coop committees
5. A COTU coop housing policy

Progress -

"Output 1 has not been achieved. Though proposed in 1975, it has reportedly not been approved by the Secretary General and/or the Executive Council of COTU. Output 2 has not been achieved, although there has been some OJT at the central accounting center. Output 3 was in existence before 1978. The Nyanza Center was established in 1976 or 1977. Output 4 is included in all regular co-op seminars. Output 5 is in existence.

Grantee acts as promoter and facilitator for the establishment of cooperative savings and credit societies among trade union members. More recently, such promotion and facilitation has also been aimed at housing cooperatives for low-income workers.

The promotional work is carried out through seminars and conferences. The participants in the coop seminars are shop stewards and local coop leaders. Seven such seminars were held in Kenya in 1978 (including two on housing coops).

In 1974 there were 159 coop savings and credit societies in existence in Kenya. In 1975, the cooperation between the coop movement and trade unions began. By 1978 there were 530 societies in operation and 100 were awaiting registration.

Of the 530 societies in existence, most have no paid staff. Only about 100 have a paid bookkeeper; 150 others are served by centralized bookkeeping offices. This leaves about 280 societies with actual or potential recordkeeping problems, according to some interviewees and common standards of fiscal responsibility.

Although the societies are insured against loss due to the death of a borrower, the individual member is not insured against loss of his savings due to liquidation, embezzlement or any other number of risks.

Three savings and credit societies have failed in recent years, two of them apparently in connection with the demise of the East African community."

35

The following recommendations for improvement of the project were made:

"The savings and credit societies be set in better order (most specifically, insurance against loss of savings and better bookkeeping services).

That, since Grantee is not technical advisor to KUSCCO or ACOSCA (the credit union associations), perhaps AALC could initially fund an independent and respected auditor who would audit the books of a random (and unalerted) sample of workers' saving societies periodically, to be taken over by COTU after AALC phase-out."