

M/L PD-AAA-558-A1
636
A265

Oct 3/79

Proj. 6250610
PN -

6250613
6250966
6880002
6880201
6880203

AUG

688-22-130-002
625-11-190-610
625-11-130-613
688-12-130-201
688-12-130-203
625-11-995-906

Examination
of
AID-Financed Livestock Activities in Mali

Audit Report Number 3-688-76-21

Issue Date December 11, 1975

Area Auditor General Africa
Agency for International Development

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALI

Table of Contents

	<u>Page No.</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. SUMMARY	1
III. STATEMENT OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	2
Sector Goals	2
AID/Host Government Agreements	3
Central Veterinary Laboratory Project	3
General	3
Planning	4
Training Malian Staff	5
Construction	6
Monitoring	7
Loan Repayments	8
Livestock I and Livestock II Projects	9
Completed Activities	9
CDO/Bamako Staffing	9
IV. BACKGROUND AND SCOPE	10
EXHIBIT A - Financial Status of Projects	
EXHIBIT B - Contractor Personnel	
EXHIBIT C - Synopsis of Completed Activities	
EXHIBIT D - Acronyms Used in Report	
EXHIBIT E - List of Recommendations	
Distribution of Report	

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALI

I. INTRODUCTION

Within Mali, AID-financed livestock activities include two recently concluded projects pertaining to studies and surveys of the livestock sector; a loan for constructing and equipping the Central Veterinary Laboratory (CVL); a grant to provide technical assistance and engineering services to the CVL; and two recent grants (Livestock I and II) to improve beef cattle production and marketing, and assist post drought recovery and medium-term expansion of the livestock sector. AID has provided about \$13.3 million for these activities. AID bilateral assistance to the Government of the Republic of Mali (GRM) is monitored by a recently opened Country Development Office (CDO) located in Bamako, Mali. We examined the active projects to determine if AID funds were being used for intended purposes, and to identify conditions which could adversely affect project implementation.

II. SUMMARY

Our most significant findings pertained to the Central Veterinary Laboratory (CVL) project, which was authorized in November 1963. Initially AID's inputs to this activity were limited to a loan to assist the GRM in constructing and equipping a veterinary laboratory in the vicinity of Bamako. Subsequently AID agreed to also provide grant funds for technical advisors. At the time of our review, most of the originally planned construction had been completed; but some additional construction authorized in June 1972, which should have been completed by February 1974, had not yet been finished. CDO/Bamako was following-up with both the GRM and AID's regional engineers to resolve the remaining problems associated with construction.

Training a Malian staff to operate the CVL is essential if the CVL is to develop into a viable institution. At the time of our review, a training schedule had not yet been established. In addition, the CVL was insufficiently staffed with a total of nine professional personnel, including four expatriates. CDO/Bamako stated they did not consider it possible to have sufficient Malians trained to operate the CVL without expatriate assistance by the scheduled termination of AID financing in 1978. We recommended that, in conjunction with the GRM, CDO/Bamako ensure that plans were made to continue expatriate staffing beyond the termination of AID financing until sufficient Malians could be trained (see page 5).

Also of significance on the CVL project were:

- The Grant Agreement lacked a detailed project description, a comprehensive work plan, and detailed financial responsibilities of the GRM.

- The latest in-depth evaluation of the CVL was a Project Appraisal Report as of December 1972.

We recommended that (a) CDO/Bamako ensure that the in-depth evaluation scheduled for the CVL project during FY 1976 take place, and (b) after completion of that evaluation, take appropriate action to reach agreement with the GRM on a comprehensive project description and workplan, detailed budgets, and financial responsibilities of the GRM for the remaining life of AID financing (see pages 7 and 8).

From records available at the AID Controllers offices in Dakar and Bamako, we were not able to determine whether the GRM was current on interest payments or principal repayments. We recommended the AID/W Controller's office forward applicable documentation to CDO/Bamako in accordance with established AID procedures (see pages 8 and 9).

We also noted that delays by AID/W in filling two livestock management positions (authorized in July and November 1974) had placed an undue hardship on CDO/Bamako in monitoring the two livestock grants approved in FY 1975. One of these positions was filled in November 1975; and we were advised that a technician had been nominated for the other position, and was currently in language training (see pages 9 and 10).

During the audit, written comments on our findings were provided to CDO/Bamako; and an exit conference was held with applicable personnel prior to our departure. Upon completion of our draft report, it too was provided to CDO/Bamako. Their comments, where applicable, have been incorporated into the final version of this report.

III. STATEMENT OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Sector Goals

The broad objective of AID in providing financing to the Malian livestock sector is to improve rural income for those associated with livestock and animal husbandry. According to the Development Assistance Plan there are three critical problems to which AID resources should be addressed:

- Increase the quantity of meat and dairy products for both the domestic and export markets.
- Increase the production of meat and dairy products in such a manner to conserve resources, and where possible reclaim areas that have suffered environmental degradation.
- Increase the number of Africans trained in fields of work related to the livestock industry.

The objectives of the active projects are compatible with the sector goals, and are complementary to each other. However, as noted on page 5 of this report, difficulties have been encountered in the past on training sufficient Africans in livestock related activities.

AID/Host Government Agreements

Grant Agreements are being used for each of the active livestock projects in Mali. These Grant Agreements include many of the provisions and covenants typically found in a Project Agreement; however, the Grant Agreements did not include the degree of project description, U.S. financial budget, or host government budget usually found in a typical bilateral obligating document.

The Grant Agreement for the Central Veterinary Laboratory project (dated June 27, 1974 for \$290,000) does not include a description of the scope of work to be implemented. It also does not identify the commodities to be purchased; and does not stipulate the numbers of participants to be trained, or the type of training to be given. Either an amendment to the Grant Agreement or some other documentation signed by both AID and the Host Government should be completed to include all pertinent matters of the project (see Recommendation No. 3, page 8).

The funds provided for the Livestock I and Livestock II activities were authorized under a special provision of the FY 1974 Foreign Assistance Act. These funds were made available to enable AID to implement assistance programs for the drought stricken Sahel area in a timely manner. In order to proceed promptly, the design process for certain AID financed projects was less detailed than for the usual AID financed projects. It was recognized by the highest levels of AID management that certain phases of the Livestock I and Livestock II projects were experimental, and contained innovative approaches. The Action Memorandum for the Administrator requesting approval for the Livestock II project stated that because the style of execution of this project was stressing GRM leadership in executing and evaluating the experimental methods proposed, AID would need the flexibility to refine the design and implementation plans of the program on the basis of continuing GRM/AID collaboration.

Central Veterinary Laboratory Projects

General

Under Loans Nos. 688-H-003 and 003A, AID provided financing to the GRM for constructing and equipping the Central Veterinary Laboratory (CVL), located in the vicinity of Bamako. When the project was authorized in November 1963, it was envisaged that the CVL would be a source of production of vaccines to combat the major diseases affecting livestock in Mali and other neighboring countries, including production of vaccine for the West

Africa Rinderpest Control campaign jointly financed by AID and the European Development Fund. Prior to the opening of CDO/Bamako, this project was monitored by AID's Regional Development Office located in Dakar, Senegal (RDO/Dakar) and AID's Regional Economic Development Service Office for West Africa (REDSO/WA) located in Abidjan, Ivory Coast.

The project was plagued with problems from the start. In June 1972, when the CVL was at last scheduled for final acceptance by the GRM, it was found that (a) numerous construction deficiencies had to be corrected, (b) the equipment was to a large extent faulty and/or improperly installed, as well as insufficient to meet the needs of the CVL, and (c) various ancillary facilities were still required -- fencing, staff housing, improved water supply, and communications. Moreover, the GRM was unable to fully staff and support the CVL once it became operable. The early stage problems have been discussed and reported in prior audit reports, and have for the most part been resolved.

In response to the needs of the CVL, AID (a) provided a U.S. direct-hire Veterinary Advisor, funded under RDO/Dakar's technical support costs, and (b) authorized the use of unutilized loan funds to build the ancillary facilities, and finance the services of a maintenance training specialist. In FY 1973, grant project No. 625-11-190-610 was started on a temporary basis to continue the services of the veterinary advisor, and perform a crash program of repair and rehabilitation at the CVL.

In FY 1974, it was determined that grant assistance should continue through FY 1978 to achieve the CVL's present objectives of (a) becoming a dependable and adequate source of supply of veterinary vaccines for protecting Malian cattle against major animal diseases, and (b) undertaking applied research and testing to improve vaccine quality and provide research for the Malian livestock industry. To this end, AID is financing technical services, participant training, consumable commodities and spare parts, and certain local costs. In addition, during the Sahel drought emergency, AID authorized the use of \$200,000 of Special Sahel Recovery and Rehabilitation funds to procure laboratory equipment and supplies for the CVL.

Planning

AID has been providing technical assistance to the CVL since July 1971. The failure to prepare annual work plans for the CVL was previously reported in Audit Report No. 73-037, dated January 19, 1973. The applicable recommendation of A.R. No. 73-037 was closed in August 1973 based upon the RDO/Dakar's position that a recent Project Appraisal Report "represents as valid a statement of the CVL's future work plans as available to date." We found, however, that annual work plans, including a time phased plan for replacement of the expatriate professional staff, had not been prepared (see Recommendation No. 3, page 8)

Training Malian Staff

It was contemplated that AID would finance five years of academic training and 20 man-months of short-term training for Malian CVL technicians, starting in FY 1974. The Non Capital Project Paper (PROP) states:

".....one of the first orders of business in implementing the project will be to establish a training schedule which will identify positions for which training is required, taking into account potential trained personnel returning from Europe, and establish target dates for completion of training."

Training a Malian staff for the CVL is essential to progressively build the CVL into a full Malian institution -- capable of performing its intended role as a production, research, diagnosis, and training facility. However, a training schedule has not been established.

To date, the CVL has been able to propose only the Director of Vaccine Production, a U.S.-educated doctor of veterinary medicine, for one year of U.S. academic training commencing in December 1975. During the later part of our review, CDO/Bamako advised us that the Project Manager was trying to arrange for short-term training for three Malians with various U.S. suppliers of scientific equipment.

The CVL was provided with more than two years of engineering training services under an AID financed GRM/ORT (Organization for Rehabilitation through Training) contract. These services were extended for an additional two years under an AID direct contract in view of the excellent work of the ORT technician. However, it should be noted that initially it was felt that engineering assistance would be needed for only two years, but AID is now committed to provide four years of engineering assistance.

The CVL is insufficiently staffed with a total of nine professional personnel, including four expatriates -- a fact that militates against sending any of its Malian staff abroad for extended periods. So far the CVL has been able to attract only a few young professionals returning from training abroad. CDO/Bamako stated that they did not think it was possible for sufficient Malians to be trained in time to operate the CVL without expatriate assistance by the scheduled termination of AID financing in 1978.

Recommendation No. 1

CDO/Bamako should, in conjunction with the GRM, ensure that plans are made to provide the CVL with expatriate staffing beyond the termination of AID financing until sufficient Malians can be trained.

Construction

On the basis of an "Amended Project Definition" drafted by REDSO/WA, Loan No. 688-H-003 was amended in June 1972 to authorize additional items considered essential for the successful operation of the CVL:

- Installation of Double Security Fencing.
- Expansion of Water Supply Capacity.
- Installation of Internal Telephone System (this was eventually financed by the GRM).
- Construction of four housing units for the CVL staff, including site development, roads and utilities.

In June 1973, with the concurrence of REDSO/WA, the GRM awarded a contract for construction of four housing units and security fencing to a local firm -- Mali Travaux. In November 1974, REDSO/WA informally obtained from the GRM a copy of a proposed amendment to the Mali Travaux contract, which increased the original contract by Mali Franc (MF) 11,079,780 (about \$28,000) to a new total of MF 89,694,890 (about \$225,000). The increase was attributed to changes in quantities and in materials installed. At that time Mali Travaux had a second amendment in preparation in the amount of some MF 10 million (about \$25,000) to cover the costs of electricity and water connections to the housing units.

A REDSO/WA internal memorandum of January 1975 contained the following comments by one of REDSO's engineers:

"4. A study of the Amendment, which has apparently not been acted upon by GRM, nor officially referred to AID, shows many discrepancies as compared to the basic contract and many new line items, including new unit prices, which are not justified nor explained. Where new line items are added, no reduction (credit) has apparently been given for the items deleted.

5. There appear to be many discrepancies, inconsistencies and irreconcilable claims in the Amendment No.1 to the Mali Travaux contract. So when I next met with (a GRM and an AID official), I asked if he were going to submit this Amendment to A.I.D. He said he did not want to do it until he had informal advice as to whether it might be approved. I told him I would bring the matter to the attention of the REDSO/WA Legal Officer and Contracts Officer, and (the AID official) agreed to follow up for CDO, although he claimed not to have a copy."

In May 1975, REDSO/WA cabled to CDO/Bamako that a REDSO engineer would inspect on-site any additional items that were added to the contract, in order to determine why they were required and whether they would be financed by AID. From our review in Bamako, we were unable to ascertain whether REDSO/WA had performed the above examination. In the meantime, the GRM had approved the amendment and submitted a copy to CDO/Bamako. After receipt of this amendment, CDO/Bamako (a) advised the GRM that AID was liable for financing only such amendments as have been approved by AID, and (b) requested REDSO/WA to provide financial and engineering expertise to determine to what extent, if any, the amendments to the GRM/Mali Travaux contract are eligible for AID financing.

According to the CVL Project Management Plan prepared by REDSO/WA in October 1972, all construction work should have been completed by February 1974. Due to the slow bureaucratic processes of the GRM, occasional shortages of construction materials, and the distribution of implementation and monitoring responsibilities among four USG organizations in different geographical locations (RDO/Dakar, REDSO/WA, AID/W and American Embassy/Bamako) lengthy delays ensued. At the close of our audit the following items were still pending:

- Resolution of water supply -- after drilling a deep well proved unsuccessful, the CVL now plans to build a water tower and underground tank.
- Completion of interior fencing.
- Water and power connections to staff housing.

To cover completion of the water supply system, AID/W recently approved an extension of the loan terminal disbursement date through January 31, 1977.

Monitoring

The latest Project Appraisal Report (PAR) for the CVL project was prepared by RDO/Dakar as of December 31, 1972. We are aware that there have been a number of reviews and discussions of the CVL project, notably the "Issues Paper" prepared by AID's office of Central and West Africa Regional Affairs (AFR/CWR) in October 1973 as a basis for the current PROP, but no subsequent PARs were prepared.

The PROP establishes the following guidelines for project evaluation:

"The Project Manager, the Veterinary Advisor and the Director of the CVL will develop an evaluation system for the project which will serve to identify project progress, suggest appropriate modifications or actions and assure the GRM and AID

that all needed and agreed to steps have been and are followed. Evaluations should be carried out on an annual basis. Other donors should participate as appropriate. Principal attention should be given to (a) meeting vaccine production targets (b) improvement in vaccine quality and (c) development of Malian staff. They should be coordinated with evaluations of the Mali Livestock Project if the latter is approved."

The annual reports prepared by the Project Manager have assisted in identifying progress and problems; however, we do not believe they constitute the type of systematic evaluation envisaged in the PROP. We were advised that an in-depth evaluation is scheduled by CDO/Bamako for FY 1976.

Recommendation No. 2

CDO/Bamako should ensure that an in-depth evaluation of the CVL project is completed during FY 1976. ✓

Recommendation No. 3 ✓

Upon completion of the in-depth evaluation of the CVL, CDO/Bamako should take appropriate action with the GRM (for the remaining period of AID financing for the CVL) to reach agreement on a meaningful project description, a detailed comprehensive work plan with benchmarks, a detailed budget pertaining to AID inputs, and the financial responsibilities of the GRM.

Loan Repayments

From our review at the Regional Controller's office in Dakar and at CDO/Bamako, we were unable to determine whether the GRM was current in interest payments and principal repayments on Loan No. 688-H-003. We were also unable to ascertain the most current status of loan disbursements. Since April 1971, AID/W has been sending Notices of Payment Due and Statements of Disbursements directly to the GRM. In the absence of any recent AID/W originated follow-up telegram on this situation, we surmise that the GRM must have been current in loan payments. Nevertheless, with the establishment of a CDO in Mali and a Regional Controller in Dakar, we believe that all offices concerned should follow the loan financial servicing pattern established for AID overseas operations. ✓

Recommendation No. 4

SER/CONT/FM/LD should forward to CDO/Bamako for record and/or action, as applicable (a) Statements of Loan Disbursements, (b) Status of Loan Disbursing Authorizations (Report W-743/1), and (c) Notices of Payment Due.

Livestock I and Livestock II Projects

At the time of our review, detailed plans had not yet been finalized for either the Livestock I or Livestock II projects.

In May 1975, contract employees of Experience Incorporated (EI) arrived in Mali to initiate implementation of Livestock I activities. At the time of our audit, EI personnel had made field visits to the proposed sites of the various project activities. Our discussions with personnel of EI and CDO/Bamako indicated that adequate attention was being given to developing plans for implementing Livestock I, and that consultations were being held with appropriate GRM officials.

The Grant Agreement for Livestock II was signed June 30, 1975. Implementation of this project had not yet begun at the time of our review.

Completed Activities

We made a brief review of two recently completed projects, which had been monitored by RDO/Dakar prior to the establishment of CDO/Bamako. These were:

Livestock Survey (Project No. 625-11-130-613)

Studies and Surveys (Project No. 625-11-995-906)

A synopsis of the results of these activities is presented in Exhibit C.

CDO/Bamako Staffing

The recently opened AID office in Mali has been hampered by AID/Washington's delays in filling approved personnel positions.

Funds for Livestock I were obligated in August 1974, and for Livestock II in June 1975. The authorized life of project funding for these two projects totals \$13.9 million. To assist in the management of these activities, the position of Livestock Project Manager and Livestock Officer were authorized in July 1974 and November 1974, respectively. Although TDY

assistance was provided by AID/W for about eight weeks in early 1975 and six weeks in the summer of 1975, the result of not having permanent employees in these two technical positions placed an undue hardship on CDO/Bamako in monitoring livestock activities.

A Livestock Officer arrived in Mali in November 1975, and CDO/Bamako advised us that a Livestock Project Manager had been nominated and was currently in language training.

IV. BACKGROUND AND SCOPE

Background

From 1968 through 1974, AID assistance to Mali was regional in nature, and administered by the Regional Development Office in Dakar, Senegal. Through a recently opened Country Development Office in Bamako, Mali, AID is now providing bilateral assistance to the Government of the Republic of Mali. Most of AID's current assistance to Mali has been provided with funds appropriated specifically for the Sahel area, and is directed toward improving the livestock sector.

AID has sponsored various livestock studies in the Sahelian area. Included are a contracted study by the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, and "in house" studies for the FY 1975 Development Assistance Program and the FY 1976 Field Budget Submission. Some of the major conclusions of these studies were:

- The Sahel area offers vast potential for livestock production.
- The recent drought caused losses of varying degrees to livestock herds.
- The quantity of livestock far exceeded related capacity of the land, even prior to the drought.
- Any development efforts must consider the total Sahelian area including grazing land, available water, and the customs and cultures of the people.

Scope

We examined the three active AID-financed livestock activities in Mali. The purpose of our review was to determine if AID funds were being used for intended purposes, and to identify conditions which could adversely effect project implementation. We examined project files, held discussions with project and contractor personnel, and reviewed financial data.

This is the initial audit of the two livestock grants (Livestock I and Livestock II). Our audit period was from inception through September 30, 1975 for fiscal data, and through October 31, 1975 for project implementation. The audit period for the CVL project was from the cut-off date (November 30, 1972) of a prior audit (No. 73-037) through October 31, 1975.

One recommendation included in Audit Report No. 73-037, dated January 19, 1973, pertaining to the CVL had been closed. Because an element of the recommendation had not been adequately addressed, we repeated a similar recommendation in this report (see Recommendation No. 3, page 8).

BEST AVAILABLE

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALIFinancial Status of Projects
As of September 30, 1975(In Thousands of U.S. Dollars)

<u>Project Title and Number</u>	<u>Obligated</u>	<u>Expended</u>	<u>Unliquidated</u>
Central Veterinary Laboratory No. 625-11-190-610	\$ 906	\$ 586	\$ 320
Central Veterinary Laboratory No. 688-22-130-002 (Loan Nos. 688-H-003 and 688-H-003A)	1,955	1,670	285
Mali Livestock I No. 688-12-130-201	3,400	311	3,089
Mali Livestock II No. 688-12-130-203	7,000	-	7,000
Livestock Survey No. 625-11-130-613	4	4	-
Studies and Surveys No. 625-11-995-906	72	72	-
Total	<u>\$13,337</u>	<u>\$2,643</u>	<u>\$10,694</u>
Expenditures during prior audit periods		<u>\$1,303</u>	
Expenditures during this audit period		<u>\$1,340</u>	

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALI

Contractor Personnel
December 1, 1972 to October 31, 1975

<u>Name</u>	<u>Position</u>	<u>Arrival Date</u>	<u>Departure Date</u>
<u>AID CONTRACTS</u>			
<u>American CRT Federation</u> (Contract REDSO/WA-75-53, Project 625-11-190-610, Central Veterinary Laboratory)			
Alex P. Ruimy	Maintenance Engineer	3/1/75	*
<u>Near East Foundation</u> (Contract AID/afr-c-1035, Project 625-11-995-906, Studies and Surveys)			
H. Gerber	Agricultural Credit Specialist	9/73	12/73
D. DeTrey	Animal Health Specialist	9/73	12/73
T. Bunch	Range Management Specialist	9/73	12/73
<u>PERSONAL SERVICES CONTRACTS</u>			
<u>A - U.S. Personnel</u> <u>Project 625-11-190-610, Central Veterinary Laboratory</u> <u>Contract AID/afr-c-1086</u>			
Nathaniel Rothstein	Microbiologist	10/20/74	*
<u>Project 625-11-995-906, Studies and Surveys</u>			
W.H.M. Morris ^{1/}	Livestock Sector Consultant	1/73	6/73
J. Dirck Stryker	Livestock Production Consultant	5/73	8/73
<u>B - Local Personnel - CVL</u>			
Christine Coulibaly	Administrative Assistant	12/1/73	*
Mamadou K. Traore	Assistant Maintenance Mechanic	1/1/73	*
Bola Diabate	Driver/Messenger	5/26/72	*

<u>Name</u>	<u>Position</u>	<u>Arrival Date</u>	<u>Departure Date</u>
<u>HOST COUNTRY CONTRACTS</u>			
<u>American OPT Federation</u> (Project 688-22-130-002, Central Veterinary Laboratory - Loan 688-H-003A)			
Alex P. Ruimy	Maintenance Engineer	11/25/72	2/28/75
<u>Experience, Inc.</u> (Contract REDSO/WA-75-52, Project 688-12-130-201, Mali Livestock I)			
Raleigh Yuhas	Team Leader	5/11/75	*
Larry Harms	Credit Specialist	5/11/75	*
Warren Putman	Animal Husbandry Specialist	5/20/75	*
Myron Paine	Feedlot Designer	5/75	7/4/75
James D'Amelio	Livestock and Range Manager	6/1/75	*
Bud Mills	Administrative Specialist	5/75	7/25/75

* On board 10/31/75

1/ Contract data not available

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALISynopsis of Completed ActivitiesStudies and Surveys

In May 1973, AID/W authorized a grant of up to \$185,000 for the design phase of the Mali Livestock Production Project. A related grant agreement was executed in June 1973 between AID and the GRM under Project No. 625-11-995-906. The purpose of the Grant was to (a) undertake design of a program to increase livestock production, provision of meat for urban markets, and exports in the Segou-Niono-Bamako zone, and (b) design a series of studies which would both strengthen the project and facilitate the development by the GRM of a longer term strategy for its livestock industry. To this end, the agreement provided for the following AID inputs:

- A total of 24 man-months of three specialists in agricultural credit, animal husbandry and pasture and forage.
- Short-term consultants, as required.
- Local transportation costs.

AID/W advised the field that the most qualified persons could be obtained at least cost and in a most timely manner by a combination of contract personnel and a direct hire team. Accordingly, three Near East Foundation (NEF) specialists (agricultural credit, animal health and range management) were provided under Contract AID/afr-c-1035; and three direct hire technicians spent three months in Mali (September-December 1973) working on the design of several sub-projects in cooperation with the GRM's Office of Livestock and Meat (OMBEVI). Some of these sub-projects, which had been already pinpointed in preceding surveys, were later included in the Mali Livestock Projects I and II.

We could not locate in the RDO/Dakar files any final evaluation of the work the joint team performed. However, a preliminary review of progress development made in October 30, 1973 by AID/W, REDSO/WA and RDO/Dakar personnel indicated that little progress had been accomplished at that time, with the exception of design of a pilot production area in a tse-tse zone made by two direct hire technicians. Final expenditures under Contract AID/afr-c-1035 amounted to \$50,000.

Other activities financed under this project were (a) a survey on livestock production and distribution in the Malian economy performed by a Dr. Stryker, who submitted a report in August 1973; and

(b) the services of Dr. W.H.M. Morris in cooperation with AID direct hire personnel to prepare strategy papers on the Mali Livestock Sector. Expenditures for these activities amounted to \$8,795 and \$14,000, respectively. From related project implementation documents we assume these services were performed under contract; however, no copies of contracts were on file at RDO/Dakar, nor could we find any performance evaluation reports. We noted that the above-mentioned basic grant agreement called for the GRM to submit such evaluations as well as a project completion report. As far as we could determine, the GRM did not submit any of these documents.

Livestock Survey

This project financed a preliminary anthropological survey in connection with a proposed Mali Livestock ranch near Niuno, Mali. The survey was conducted in August 1972 by Dr. Reyna, from the College of Williams and Mary, Williamsburg, Va. Dr. Reyna submitted a report presenting a series of general conclusions and recommending that an anthropologist be sent to the area starting October 1972, to study in-depth the different ways in which the land was used, especially how extensively it was used for grazing and migration. We understand that studies similar to those recommended by Dr. Reyna have been made in the Doukolomba area under State University of New York Contract AID/afr-c-1045, under Project 698-11-999-365, REDSO/WA Program Support.

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALI

Acronyms Used in the Report

- AID - Agency for International Development
- AID/W - Agency for International Development, Washington Office
- AFR/CWR - Office of Central and West Africa Regional Affairs
- CDO - Country Development Office
- CVL - Central Veterinary Laboratory
- EI - Experience Incorporated
- GFM - Government of the Republic of Mali
- MF - Mali Franc
- OMBEVI - Office of Livestock and Meat
- ORT - Organization for Rehabilitation through Training
- PAR - Project Appraisal Report
- PROP - Non Capital Project Paper
- RDO - Regional Development Office
- REDSO/WA - Regional Economic Development Service Office/West Africa

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALI

List of Recommendations

	<u>Page No.</u>
<u>Recommendation No. 1</u>	5
CDO/Bamako should, in conjunction with the GRM ensure that plans are made to provide the CVL with expatriate staffing beyond the termination of AID financing until sufficient Malians can be trained.	
<u>Recommendation No. 2</u>	8
CDO/Bamako should ensure that an in-depth evaluation of the CVL project is completed during FY 1976.	
<u>Recommendation No. 3</u>	8
Upon completion of the in-depth evaluation of the CVL, CDO/Bamako should take appropriate action with the GRM (for the remaining period of AID financing for the CVL) to reach agreement on a meaningful project description, a detailed comprehensive work plan with benchmarks, a detailed budget pertaining to AID inputs, and the financial responsibilities of the GRM.	
<u>Recommendation No. 4</u>	9
SER/CONT/FM/LD should forward to CDO/Bamako for record and/or action, as applicable (a) Statements of Loan Disbursements, (b) Status of Loan Disbursing Authorizations (Report W-743/1), and (c) Notices of Payment Due.	

AID-FINANCED LIVESTOCK ACTIVITIES IN MALI

Distribution of Report

	<u>No. of Copies</u>
Country Development Officer, CDO/Bamako	5
AA/AFR	1
AFR/CWR	2
AFR/EMS	1
SER/CONT/FM/LD	1
IGA/W	1
AG/GAO/IGA	1
AG/AUD	9
AG/OAS	1
REDSO/WA	2
Controller, RDO/Dakar	1
AG/IIS/Rabat	1
AAG/AFR/Accra	5
AAG/AFR/Nairobi	5

AUDIT REPORT
FLY SHEET

DATE **Dec. 11, 1975**

SOURCE OF REPORT (AAG or AG/AUD Division)
AAG/APR

MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE AUDITED

SECTION I. AUDIT REPORT IDENTIFICATION

1. REPORT NO. 76-21	2. DATE OF REPORT	3. TITLE Mali Livestock Sector	4. PERIOD COVERED FROM As of Sept. 30, 1975 TO	
5. COMPLETION DATE	6. TOTAL FINDINGS	7. TOTAL RECOMMENDATIONS 6	8. TYPE OF AUDIT <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> INITIAL <input type="checkbox"/> INTERIM <input type="checkbox"/> FINAL	9. AUDIT RESPONSIBILITY CONCLUDED <input type="checkbox"/> YES <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> NO

SECTION II. MAN-HOURS AND COST

10. AUDITORS	NAME OF AUDITOR (1)	DIRECT MAN-HOURS				COST FACTOR (6)	COST (7)
		PLANNED (2)	ACTUAL (3)	TRAVEL (4)	TOTAL (3) + (4) (5)		
A. LOCAL							
B. U. S.							
C. SUPERVISORY							
TOTAL							

see attached

SECTION III. IDENTITY OF ACTIVITIES AUDITED

CATEGORY	LOAN NO. PROJECT NO. CONTRACT NO. A.	PROJECT ACTIVITY & NAME OF CONTRACTOR B.	VALUE AUDITED (\$000 or \$ equivalent) C.
11. AGRICULTURE AND NUTRITION (Section 103)	688-22-190-002 (Loan 688-11-003) 625-11-190-610 625-11-190-613	Central Veterinary Laboratory Central Veterinary Laboratory Livestock Survey	380 573 1
12. POPULATION PLANNING AND HEALTH (Section 104)			
13. EDUCATION AND HUMAN RESOURCES (Section 105)			
14. SELECTED DEVELOPMENT PROBLEMS (Section 106)			
15. SELECTED COUNTRIES & ORGANIZATIONS (Section 107) Special Sahel Funds	688-12-130-201 688-12-130-203	Mali Livestock I Mali Livestock II	311 -
16. SUPPORT OPERATIONS AND OTHERS	625-11-995-906	Studies and Surveys	72

PREPARED BY

John L. Kurts

TOTAL

1,340

AID-Financed Livestock Activities in Mali

Direct Man Hours

	Planned	Actual	Travel	Total
Local Auditors:				
E. Oriole	<u>120</u>	<u>168</u>	<u>20</u>	<u>208</u>
U.S. Auditors				
J. Kurts (AIC)		<u>384</u>	<u>10</u>	<u>394</u>
L. Jewell		<u>48</u>	<u>10</u>	<u>58</u>
	<u>220</u>	<u>432</u>	<u>20</u>	<u>452</u>
Supervisory:				
R. Craner	<u>20</u>	<u>77</u>	<u>10</u>	<u>87</u>
	<u>430</u>	<u>697</u>	<u>50</u>	<u>747</u>