



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

TRAINING FOR PAKISTAN FINAL REPORT

June 2013

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by the Institute of International Education (IIE).

TRAINING FOR PAKISTAN FINAL REPORT

Prepared for the United States Agency for International Development, USAID Contract Number AID-391-C-11-00006.

Implemented by:
Institute of International Education
809 United Nations Plaza
New York, NY 10017-3580
www.iie.org

Submitted by:
Susan Fickling
Director, Participant Training Programs
Institute of International Education
Phone: +1 202-326-7813
Email: sfickling@iie.org

June 2013

Training for Pakistan

Final Report

I. Executive summary

In September 2011, the Institute of International Education was awarded a one year contract to support USAID/Pakistan in developing and managing a participant training project. The contract was ultimately extended to a total of 20 months (September 26, 2011 – May 31, 2013). In that time IIE and our partners, Creative Associates, dTS, and Empowerment thru Creative Integration (ECI), developed and implemented U.S., third country and in-country training programs.

The key responsibilities for each partner were:

- Creative Associates: provide in-country support through provision and management of the field office, field staff, and security.
- dTS: provide support for gender assessment and M&E as needed.
- ECI: provide support for administration of training programs (visa processing, data management), participant debriefings, and manage the in-country training portfolio for the Agriculture Development Objective team.

Training for Pakistan provided support to the following USAID/Pakistan Development Objective (DO) teams: Democracy and Governance, Economic Growth/Agriculture, Education, Health, and Stabilization. The project provided support for achieving all USAID/Pakistan Foreign Development Objectives and contributed to the related DO teams' intermediate results. Training for Pakistan also contributed to USAID/Pakistan's vision of building the capacity of Pakistan's public and private organizations.

USAID/Pakistan required turn-key participant training services that met all requirements of Department of Homeland Security (DHS), Department of State (DOS), and USAID regulations. Training for Pakistan team provided these services through the timely provision of a training needs assessment, design and implementation (participant recruitment, visa processing, travel and logistics) of training programs, monitoring and evaluation, participant follow-up, and data reporting services. During the reporting period, completed and on-going activities conducted by Training for Pakistan in the United States, third countries, and in-country reached 604 total participants (508 male and 96 female participants).

II. Highlights of accomplishments against work plan

A. Operational start-up

USAID granted IIE a Limited Notice to Proceed, effective on August 15, 2011, which allowed IIE and our partner, Creative Associates, to accomplish the major operational startup tasks (such as securing an office and procuring equipment and furniture) before September 26, 2012, the project start date. The Security Plan was finalized in mid-October 2012, submitted to USAID for review, and accepted as submitted.

All field staff were hired at the start of the project except the communications and M&E staff. Once the project was authorized to fill these positions, qualified candidates were difficult to find due to the short remaining duration of the project contract. The M&E position was a particular challenge as the first two staff hired worked approximately one month each. A permanent candidate was recruited in August 2012. To fulfill project objectives in communications, Training for Pakistan was authorized to hire a part-time staff member to fill the Communications Specialist position. The position was filled in April 2012; because the position turned out to be very demanding, the Communications Specialist was converted to a full time staff member in July 2012. In addition, a Communications Assistant was recruited in August 2012 to support the requirements of the project.

B. Technical start-up (fall 2011)

Training for Pakistan commenced start-up tasks on September 26, 2011, with the official start of the project. Accomplishments under each task included:

- Coordination meetings with USAID and stakeholders (contractual, technical, communications, etc.): Coordination meetings with USAID began during Week 2 of the project. Initial and follow-up meetings with the AO teams were completed in October 2011.
- Transfer of three long-term participants to IIE: IIE met with American University (AU) in the last week of September 2012 to begin the transfer of the three scholars to IIE. IIE requested copies of scholar visa documentation and conditions of sponsorship from AU, which were received in the third week of October. Review of the documentation revealed that the participants lacked required USAID documentation and that they were not processed for J1 visas according to the ADS regulations. As the scholars had been given J1 visas from AU rather than from USAID, IIE worked directly with USAID/EEE and the Mission to transfer the scholar's DS 2019s from the AU DS 2019 to USAID's DS 2019. Training for Pakistan monitored the scholars' progress throughout the duration of the project and handled all finances including payment of tuition and stipends.
- Review of ADS 252, ADS 253, and U.S. Visa Compliance: The IIE Project Manager, who was in Pakistan during the first two weeks in October 2011 to assist with project technical startup, conducted a general review of ADS 252, 253, and visa compliance, with the field team.
- Establish stakeholder groups: A stakeholder group was established for each AO area to focus on progress and revisions of the Mission Training Plan.
- Rapid needs assessment and analysis to confirm and identify performance gaps and prioritize training needs to feed into Mission Training Plan: The field team and IIE Project Manager met with AO teams in October 2011 to conduct a rapid needs assessment of each AO area, focused on

determining performance gaps that could be addressed through training (gaps that indicate a need for skills development or knowledge). The project team followed up with the AO teams for additional information and submitted a comprehensive Mission training plan on November 4.

- Review possible backlog of pending training request of USAID/Pakistan and its implementing partners: During the meetings with the AO teams in October 2011, the project team requested information on pending training, or immediate needs for training. This information was included in the Mission training plan, as it was provided to Training for Pakistan. The project team began training program development once the Mission approved the Training Plan.
- Develop Mission Participant Training Plan based on needs assessment and analysis and stakeholder input; submit to USAID within 45 days of award: As noted above, the Mission training plan was developed based on an assessment with the AO teams, and submitted to the COR on November 4, 2011.

C. Administrative on-going

Accomplishments on each administrative task follow:

1. Stakeholder groups meet to review training plan progress and identify training needs that relate to Mission objectives: Training for Pakistan requested stakeholder group meetings over the course of the project; however, for various reasons, the meetings were not held. Training for Pakistan faced the following challenges: bringing together stakeholders who were located outside of Islamabad (Agriculture); and the request to not have a stakeholder group (Democracy and Governance and Education). Under the Health DO, the decision was made for Training for Pakistan to support the Health Services Academy (HAS), as reflected in the training plan. Training for Pakistan worked closely with the Health DO team and HAS, and the stakeholders were in regular communication.

2. Provide on-going technical assistance and consultation to the Mission as specific needs arise; engage STTA and training and logistics providers as needed: The key technical assistance that was requested by the Mission was a **gender assessment**, which was conducted in July 2012. The gender assessment reviewed the USAID Results Framework (RF) and found that the inclusion of gender issues in the current RF was limited to mention of gender equity as one of three cross-cutting objectives. With the exception of the health sector, which focused on maternal and child health, most of the AOs did not specify gender in their results, nor were the indicators disaggregated by gender. Since the Results Framework was being revised and redesigned, it was an opportune moment to fully integrate gender in the updated Results Framework, following the guiding principles laid out in USAID's new Gender Policy launched in March 2012. The full gender report is included as Annex 1.

Gender Assessment Summary of Recommendations: Pre-Training Plan Process – at the level of the USAID Mission

- a. Explicitly reflect gender in the AOs and IRs in the revised Results Framework. Fully integrate gender equality and women's empowerment considerations into the sector specific results and articulate the corresponding indicators in a gender disaggregated manner.
- b. To ensure that the Results Framework fully reflects gender equality and women's empowerment, it is important to undertake the following:
 - An updated, in-depth gender analysis of each sector. This should include not just a review of the persistent gender issues within each sector, but also a thorough

assessment of the HICD gaps that exist and will need to be addressed if the gender issues are to be overcome.

- Develop an overall gender strategy for the USAID Mission assistance program in Pakistan, which should pay attention not just to the gender equality objectives, but also the supportive policies and processes that constitute an enabling environment to facilitate implementation of the strategy.
- Develop gender strategies for each sector, based on, and responding to, the gender analysis mentioned above.
- Develop a gender action plan for each sector, with clearly defined, time-bound targets. This should include gender focused as well as gender integrated activities. It should also include a gender specific capacity development plan which looks beyond numbers to a substantive, need-based response to men and women's capacity building in each sector, and also responds to the need for sensitizing men and women to gender issues in their respective sectoral fields.
- In particular, a future participant training program should undertake a more comprehensive gender analysis of the stabilization component, based on which a holistic gender and stabilization strategy should be developed. This would include an analysis of women's situation in conflict-affected areas across Pakistan, and their role in reconstruction and peace-building efforts.
- Encourage horizontal linkages, to enable cross-sectoral support on gender issues.

c. Revise the Training Request Forms to ensure that they reflect overall sector priorities and the sector specific gender objectives. Revisions should include the following:

- Insert a question/clause in the TR Form that asks how the activity will contribute to the gender equality objective, and which gender issue or gap it is addressing.
- Other questions in the TR form should also integrate gender. In particular, the follow-on activities to include gender considerations, by making it mandatory to show at least one action that contributes to the gender equality objective. This should be accompanied by one or more indicators that will help to measure/track progress towards results.
- In a future PTP, use a human and institutional capacity development approach in the identification of training activities, which holistically encompasses gender issues.
- Participant selection process to ensure that:
 - Criteria for participant selection are gender sensitive, taking into account different contexts, and adjusted where necessary to allow more female participation.
 - A well designed, gender sensitive outreach and communication strategy is developed to ensure wider access to information. This should make use of NGO networks which have greater outreach to the remote areas.

d. Identification of training activities should ensure that:

- TR Forms clearly define the rationale and linkage between the training activity and the AO it is contributing to.
- Gender is integrated in the TORs of sub-contracted projects, such as the HSA Organizational Needs Assessment to include a gender analysis at institutional as well as programmatic levels.
- Briefing of participants reinforces the gender dimension of follow-up actions.
- Gender sensitization trainings are held for participants who have completed their first round of study tours.

- Follow on actions collectively work towards a concrete output, for example piloting a seamless service delivery in one province (GBV), agriculture policies that impact men and women farmers (water management) etc.
- Future training programs focus on gender to ensure more male participation.
- Future programs integrate gender dimensions at the design stage, and subsequently at every step of the training activity process.

Gender Assessment Summary of Recommendations: Training Plan Implementation – by Training for Pakistan

- a. Clearly designate responsibility for gender integration – at all levels. The PTP implementer to have appropriate technical capacity for each sector and cross-cutting objectives.
- b. Introduce the requirement of gender related expertise in the RFP for selecting training programs and service providers, to ensure that customized training programs incorporate gender issues within the curriculum or study tour design.
- c. Develop future training activities such that the PTP implementer is involved in discussions with program partners at the design stage, and a closely coordinated process with all stakeholders is ensured. During this process, the gender capacity of program partner(s) should be assessed and external gender expertise brought in.
- d. Include a gender sensitization session in the Pre-Departure Orientation agenda.
- e. Insert a clause in the Action Matrix that commits participants to a gender focused follow-up action.
- f. For overseas training activities, especially long-term study programs, review the USAID Dependent Policy and recommend revisions that would be more supportive, and accommodative of the practical and cultural constraints faced by women (and men) wishing to avail these opportunities.
- g. Debriefing must include a session on gender equality to sensitize participants to gender issues and focuses their attention to the gender impact of their follow-up actions.
- h. Training providers' reports must include feedback on gender issues covered by the training and feedback on participants' capacity to take it forward.
- i. Training for Pakistan to draw upon the gender capacities of its local partner/IQC holders to ensure that gender issues are integrated in training programs.
- j. A requirement for gender related expertise to be made part of the criteria in the selection of IQC holders, which could then also be used as a resource for gender inputs across projects.
- k. Increase in the number of IQC holders would expand the resource base for the Training Plan implementation.
- l. Consider establishing a network of TRAINING FOR PAKISTAN Alumni, linking all USAID funded participants, with sector-wise groupings, for experience sharing and possible collaboration for collective action.

3. TDY assignments: Staff from IIE and Creative Associates were approved by USAID to conduct administrative visits to Islamabad during the project. The table below summarizes the project administrative assignments:

Name	Dates Traveled	Main Purpose
Susan Fickling IIE Project Director	10/1/11-10/15/11	Project start up
	7/1/12-7/14/12	Launch PhD program, administrative site visit
David Seider Creative Associates	11-29/11-12/12/11	Creative administrative visit, support
Waqas Mahmood Creative Associates Start up and Closeout Specialist	9/4/11-9/15/11	Project start up
	8/28/12-9/22/12	First phase of project closeout
	5/1/13-5/31/13	Field office closeout
Haseena Niazi Creative Associates Finance Manager	6/14/12-6/28/12	Financial compliance support
Bizwork Negussie Creative Field Financial Manager	5/ /13-5/31/13	Project financial closeout
Myles Harrison-Pope Creative Associates Regional Security Manager	9/26/11-10/1/11	Reviews of security platform and guard assessments
	4/19/12-5/1/12	
	9/10/12-9/13/12	
Tighe Flanagan	9/9/12-9/22/12	Support website development and M&E activities

Consultants who traveled to Pakistan to conduct training or assessments included:

Name	Dates Traveled	Activity
Sabira Qureshi	7/1/12-7/15-12	Gender Assessment
Jeffrey Carlson	8/31/12-9/11/12	Election Monitoring Subject Matter Expert

4. Establishment of Training for Pakistan Website: The website was developed and went live in November 2011. It was maintained for the life of the project with additions including success stories and project activities.

D. Interventions implementation and logistics services

1. Participant recruitment and selection

For each training activity conducted by Training for Pakistan, the participants were selected by USAID/Pakistan DO teams. Participant recruitment and selection forms were not developed for project activity implementation.

General criteria for participant selection were developed and included the following:

- Participant has a Valid CNIC (Computerized National Identity Card) for In-country Training
- Participant has a Valid Passport for Third Country and U.S. Training
- GOP Officials should have NOC from their concerned departments and Ex Pakistan Leave approval from the government for Third Country and U.S. Training.
- Participants should have Letter of Consent from their families (when applicable, for example, for youth and women)

Participant criteria included:

- Participant is making steady progress in his/her career
- Participant demonstrates leadership qualities, and/or is considered a potential change agent
- Participant is willing to attend training, actively engage in training, and implement action plan
- Participant has support from supervisor and organization for participant to attend training, and to apply new skills and knowledge upon return

Program criteria included:

- Seeking gender balance
- Seeking geographic representation (if applicable)

Specific participant criteria was established for each training program and listed in the training request.

2. Training program development and implementation

The following sections summarize training programs implemented under Training for Pakistan. The following annexes supporting program development and implementation are included:

- Annex 2 – Mission consolidated training plan
- Annex 3 – Training plan budget segregated by program and training support services
- Annex 4 – Training program training requests and Training Implementation Plans (TIPs)
- Annex 5 – Lists of participants by DO and by gender
- Annex 6 – Pre-Departure outline

a. Project component progress summary

Training for Pakistan provided support to the following USAID/Pakistan Development Objective (DO) teams through participant training programs: Democracy and Governance, Economic Growth/Agriculture, Education, Health, and Stabilization. Table 1 provides a summary of activities conducted under each DO. For all activities, Training for Pakistan conducted pre-departure orientations (PDO) and debriefing sessions for participants.

Table 1

TFP Project Component Progress Summary September 26, 2011 – May 31, 2013				
Training Program	Training Provider and Location	Length of Program	Number of Participants	Male/Female Participants
Democracy and Governance				
1. GAO International Auditor Fellowship Program	United States Government Accountability Office, Washington, DC	4 months	2	2 males
2. Gender Based Violence (GBV) Study Tour	Coalition on Violence Against Women (COVAW), Nairobi, Kenya	15 days	6 from TFP; 7 from Aurat Foundation	TFP Participants: 1 male / 5 females
3. Election Monitoring	Human Resource Learning Center (HRLC), Pakistan	3 weeks	42	29 males / 13 females
4. Raising Awareness on Election Review – Themes and Developments	Various Subject Matter Experts, Pakistan	Series conducted between September-December 2012	233	184 males / 49 females
5. International Anti-Corruption Conference	Transparency International, Brasilia, Brazil	4 days	3	2 males / 1 female
Health				
6. Summer Institute in Reproductive Health and Development	Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland	2 weeks	1	1 female
7. Health Services Academy (HSA) Organizational Needs Assessment	LEAD Pakistan, Islamabad, Pakistan	4 months	8	5 males / 3 females
8. Public Health University Study Tour	B P Koirala Institute of Health Sciences, Nepal	1 week	7	5 males / 2 females
9. Global Flagship Course on Health Systems Strengthening and Sustainable Financing	World Bank Institute, Washington, DC	9 days	5	2 males / 3 females
Economic Growth/Agriculture				
10. Efficient Water Management Study Tour I	Colorado State University, Colorado	10 days	7	7 males
11. Efficient Water Management Study Tour II	International Centre of Excellence in Water Resources Management (ICE WaRM), Australia	10 days	8	8 males

12. Farming as a Business and Exposure to High Efficiency Irrigation Systems	Empowerment Thru Creative Integration (ECI) – local partner of Training for Pakistan	30 days	64	58 males / 6 females
13. Agriculture as a Business Study Tour	Faculty of Agriculture, University of Mataram, Indonesia	6 days	6	6 males
Education				
14. Peshawar University Ph.D. Scholars	American University, Washington, D.C.	4 years – program on-going	3	2 males / 1 female
15. Pre-STEP Ph.D. Scholars	Various universities, USA	4 years – program on-going	26	14 males / 12 females
16. All Children Reading Asia Workshop	Global Partnership for Education, Bangkok, Thailand	1 week	4	4 males
Stabilization				
17. FATA Scholarship Program				
Diploma of Associate Engineers	Various institutes, Pakistan	3 years	58	58 males
Bachelor of Associate Engineers	Various institutes, Pakistan	3 years	39	39 males
Secondary School Certificate	Various institutes, Pakistan	3 years	82	82 males
Local Capacity Building				
Capacity Building in Participant Training and Processing	Empowerment thru Creative Integration (ECI)	6 months	N/A	N/A
Total Participants			604	508 male 96 female

An overview of each project component conducted in cooperation with each USAID/Pakistan DO can be found below.

Democracy and Governance

GAO International Auditor Fellowship Program

Two officials selected from the Supreme Audit Institutions (SAI) of the Auditor General of Pakistan office participated in the four-month International Auditor Fellowship Program conducted by the U.S. General Accountability Office (GAO) in Washington, DC, from March 28 – July 30, 2012. The



program's objective was to strengthen the capacity of audit institutions around the world to enhance accountability and good governance worldwide. The participants learned best practices, models, and structures used by the U.S. GAO and by other SAIs participating in the training. The training providers were pleased with the Training for Pakistan participants' involvement and progress in the program and the participants were also very satisfied. For their capstone project, the fellows completed strategy papers that focused on internal control and included an action plan for the implementation of best practices in Pakistan, including

an electronic filing system that would be available to auditors across the country to reference while on-site during an audit, as well as developing published standards and tool sets for auditors in various departments.

Gender Based Violence Study Tour

Six representatives of stakeholders from all provinces in Pakistan participated in a Study Tour on Gender Based Violence (GBV) conducted by the Coalition on Violence Against Women (COVAW) in Kenya from May 12 – May 26, 2012. The six participants were also accompanied by seven AURAT Foundation staff members who are involved in the USAID Gender Equity Program. The primary goal of the program was to strengthen the capacities of key institutions to address GBV in Pakistan by providing victims of GBV seamless services. The study tour focused on improved access, resources, and processes within key civil society institutions that provide services and expertise in human rights, particularly women's rights, enabling women to be empowered and informed citizens. At the end of the program, the trainees developed an understanding of how to best identify and on GBV victims; protect and counsel GBV victims; handle, mitigate, and prosecute GBV cases through the legal system; rehabilitate GBV victims; and prevent gender based violence. The participants are now working as Master Trainers across Pakistan to promote awareness and teaching best practices in handling GBV cases.

We were not only exposed to modern techniques and methods for election monitoring, but we were also trained as master trainers so that we can go back to our regions and train other observers. This would help in ensuring transparent and fair elections.

- Election Monitoring Training of Master Trainers Participant Feedback

Election Monitoring Training of Master Trainers

The Election Monitoring Training of Master Trainers program, conducted in May and June 2012, trained 42 participants in Pakistan, in collaboration with the Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN), a Pakistani organization established in 2006 to observe the general election and mobilize voters. The program aimed to establish a core of professional trainers to train and develop a large number of election monitoring observers throughout Pakistan, with an overarching goal of helping to create a robust and transparent electoral process in Pakistan. The program consisted of a curriculum development phase

(April 30 – May 4, 2012) and a 10-day training phase (May 28 – June 8, 2012). Participants rated the program highly, and emphasized the importance of the program in facilitating future transparent elections in Pakistan.

Raising Awareness of Election Review – Themes and Developments

The Raising Awareness of Election Review program, conducted in Pakistan, was carried out in collaboration with FAFEN and trained previously trained Master Trainers on developing monitoring curriculum and training material as well as how to create awareness among stakeholders on various election themes. A total of 233 participants participated in sessions held in various locations around Pakistan. As with the Training of Master Trainers program, the overall objective of the Raising Awareness on Election Review program was to help create a robust and transparent electoral process in Pakistan. Sessions were held on the following themes: Disability and Elections, Political Finance, Electronic Media and Elections, Electronic Media and Elections, Social Media and Elections, and Young Voters and Peaceful Elections. Overall, participant feedback was extremely positive, with one participant categorizing the training as “extremely essential.”

International Anti-Corruption Conference

Three participants attended the International Anti-Corruption Conference, hosted by Transparency International in Brasilia, Brazil from November 7 – 10, 2012. Through the conference in Brazil, participants explored how to develop tools, systems and good practices in transparency and accountability; how to mobilize citizens to monitor and report corruption; and how to increase global outreach against corruption. All three participants provided positive feedback on the conference and hoped to implement best practices learned and observed during the training.

Health

Summer Institute in Reproductive Health and Development

Dr. Nabeela Shahid, a medical doctor with a Master's degree in Public Health, attended the Summer Institute in Reproductive Health and Development at Johns Hopkins University in Baltimore, Maryland from June 2 – June 16, 2012. The program focused on enhancing professional competence related to issues in rural health, contraception, maternal, and neonatal health, and family planning. Dr. Shahid's feedback, both during and after the program at Johns Hopkins, was very positive. She expressed eagerness to apply her new knowledge to the needs of her program work at the National Rural Support Program (NRSP) in Pakistan, and reported that she most appreciated the new knowledge she acquired using a host of computer programs and processes.

Health Services Academy Organizational Needs Assessment

The Health Services Academy (HSA) organizational needs assessment, conducted by LEAD Pakistan, started on July 10, 2012. Because HSA is planning to transition from an academy to a fully accredited public health university, the DO/Health approved the request to conduct an organizational needs assessment to identify the steps and capacity building HSA must undertake or acquire in order to meet this long-term objective. The needs assessment was scheduled to conclude on September 14, 2012, and included a foreign expert working with eight HSA staff members on how to conduct a needs assessment. Late in August 2012, however, the Executive Director of HSA was replaced, and this resulted in unforeseen delays in completing the needs assessment on-time. Training for Pakistan and LEAD requested a meeting with the new Executive Director to discuss the interim report and plan next steps. Unfortunately, the meeting did not take place until early October and the needs assessment completion date was extended to December 14, 2012. The Needs Assessment report is included in Annex 10, Final Reports.

[The HSA Public Health Study Tour] was a much needed study tour in order to gain firsthand experience on how a health academy can be smoothly transitioned into a proper university. Now that we are back from the training we are hopeful that the knowledge gained will be added to the curriculum and the courses will be developed accordingly. We also plan to organize workshops and symposiums which will help to strengthen the HSA employees internally as well as to identify contextual factors required for the development of a university.

- HSA Study Tour Participant Feedback

Health Services Academy Public Health Study Tour

As a part of the HSA organizational needs assessment, USAID endorsed a study tour for the trained HSA team to visit a third-country institute which had successfully transitioned to a public health university. The study tour was conducted by B.P. Koirala Institute of Health Sciences (BPKIHS) in Nepal from September 1 – September 7, 2012. The primary focus of the study tour was to strengthen and develop critical capacities and competencies within HSA to advance the Academy into a public health university. The HSA staff and faculty reported that they felt fortunate to observe, listen, and discuss their plans with experts from BPKIHS. Moreover, the HSA staff members took advantage of the opportunity to develop relationships with the administrators and academics of BPKIHS to ensure they have access to their expertise during the HSA transition.

Global Flagship Course – Health Systems Strengthening and Sustainable Financing: The Challenge of Universal Health Coverage

Five participants attended the Global Flagship program at the World Bank Institute in Washington, DC from December 6 – 14, 2012. The course was targeted to mid- and high-level health and finance policy-makers, development partners and other key stakeholders from around the world; it aimed to enable participants to carry out best practices in advocating for and creating health systems focused on universal coverage. The five Training for Pakistan participants reported high levels of satisfaction with the course, stating they were exposed to implementable ideas as relevant case studies. Further, the mix of experts and

practitioners from donor agencies, implementing organizations, and the government, as well as representatives from USAID allowed for vibrant conversations and discussions. Group work and small group sessions were also appreciated by the participants.

Economic Growth/Agriculture

Efficient Water Management Systems Study Tour I

Seven Government of Pakistan (GOP) officials participated in the Efficient Water Management Study Tour – I (EWMSI), conducted by the Department of Agriculture at Colorado State University from June 16 – June 27, 2012. EWMSI was the first in a series of two study tours designed to address the efficient and effective use of water to produce high value crops in Pakistan. The study tour provided participants an opportunity to view several watershed treatments (conservation systems and practices) and irrigation technologies in use in Colorado that can be adopted in Pakistan and focused on areas in Colorado with similar topographical and climatic conditions to areas in Pakistan. Applying lessons learned depends on the particular expertise of the participant; each participant will contribute to a portion of the overall program objective in his own government department.

Efficient Water Management Systems Study Tour II

Eight GOP officials participated in the Efficient Water Management Study Tour II (EWMSII), conducted by the International Centre of Excellence in Water Resource Management (ICE WaRM) in Australia from September 9 – September 20, 2012. EWMSII was the second in a series of two study tours designed to address the efficient and effective use of water and produce high value crops in Pakistan. The study tour focused on gaining new insights into efficient water management policies, techniques and procedures that the participants could apply in their respective positions and provinces. Additionally, looking at the value-chain of vegetables and dairy products from field to market, the tour demonstrated how to enhance production of high value crops and fodder leading to market linkages.

...it is pertinent to mention here that it was a great informative and learning training in Australia. Definitely it will help me, being involved in the policy making process, to contribute in the development of Agriculture sector.

- EWMSII Study Tour Participant
Feedback

Farming as a Business and Exposure to High Efficiency Irrigation Systems

The Farming as a Business program, conducted by ECI in Pakistan, trained 64 extension officers from provincial Ministries of Agriculture. The program consisted of three 10-day training sessions from September 3 – September

26, 2012, and focused on improving on-farm productivity and profitability, product quality, and water management. Participant feedback was overwhelmingly positive. ECI conducted a hands-on training, after which participants reported understanding how to practically implement the training concepts and theories.

Agriculture as a Business Study Tour

Six Government of Pakistan officials attended the Agriculture as a Business Study Tour, hosted by the Faculty of Agriculture, University of Mataram in Mataram, Indonesia from February 2 – 9, 2013. The study tour was an opportunity for both the participants and the training provider to exchange information on policies and processes being implemented in their respective regions and areas of focus. The program included classroom lectures and discussions on case studies and country-specific scenarios, as well as meetings and site visits to a food processing factory, organic farm, and water facility.

Education

Peshawar University Ph.D. Scholars

Three Ph.D. scholars from Peshawar University studying at American University (AU) in Washington, DC were transferred to Training for Pakistan in 2011. Training for Pakistan monitored the scholars' academic progress and handled all finances including payment of tuition and scholar allowances. One scholar graduated from American University in December 2012 with a Ph.D. in Anthropology and returned to Pakistan to teach in the Gender Studies department at Peshawar University. The remaining two scholars are scheduled to complete their programs in 2013. They will also both return to teach at Peshawar University.

Pre-STEP Ph.D. Scholars

Twenty-seven Ph.D. scholars gained admission to Ph.D. programs in education at universities throughout the United States and started their programs in fall 2012. The scholars arrived in the United States in July 2012 and are scheduled to complete their programs by August 2016. The Pre-STEP Ph.D. program was transferred to Training for Pakistan in 2011 after a two-year delay in its implementation. Training for Pakistan reestablished contact with the scholars and placed 27 scholars at U.S. universities for a fall 2012 semester start. One scholar left the program for personal health reasons. Training for Pakistan monitored the Pre-STEP scholars' academic progress and handled all finances including payment of tuition and scholar allowances.

The scholarship program intends to build the capacity of Faculties of Education at Pakistani universities or institutes that were supported under the USAID Teacher Education Project. Upon completion of their Ph.D. programs, these scholars will return to their home institutions to support, refine, evaluate, and recommend standards-based pre-service teacher education programs. In addition, these scholars will contribute to the implementation and management of the two-year Associates degree and four-year Bachelor of Education degree programs that have been designed in Pakistan with USAID support.

The conference was simply awesome. The discussions with country delegates, interaction with experts and joint effort to prepare an action plan all was so enlightening and inspiring.

- All Children Reading Asia Workshop
Participant Feedback

All Children Reading Asia Workshop

Four officials from the Department of Education, Government of Sindh, attended the All Children Reading Asia Workshop in Thailand from September 17 – September 20, 2012. The intensive four-day workshop was designed to address the literacy crisis plaguing Asian countries. The participants from Sindh attended the workshop to enrich their capacities and ability to support the training of their teachers, so that they can be effective in teaching reading to primary school children, and to develop new policies and programs to improve literacy.

Stabilization

FATA Scholarship Program

The FATA scholarship program was part of the FATA Development Program-Livelihood Development (FDPLD) project which closed in March 2012. To avoid interruption of the scholarship component, which closed in March 2013, USAID transferred 179 scholarship awardees (all male) to Training for Pakistan. The FATA Scholarship Program provided opportunities to youth to improve their formal, vocational and technical skills, complete their education and increase their chances of gaining meaningful employment.

The BAE and DAE contracts closed on August 31, 2012. All 39 BAE students graduated and 58 of the 61 DAE students graduated. An achievement certificate award ceremony was organized on July 10, 2012, in Islamabad to celebrate the outstanding performance of the students. Except for one, all SSC students had excelled on their board examination. Dr. Marilyn Wyatt, the U.S. Ambassador's spouse and guest of honor at the ceremony, stated in her address: "Today's ceremony is a significant milestone. These students are the future of Pakistan and their hard work will act as a ray of hope for this country."

The SSC contract expired in March 2013. Training for Pakistan conducted FATA Scholarship Program Closing Certificate Distribution Ceremonies in Abbottabad, Peshawar, Charsadda and Taxilla in early March 2013. Because the Training for Pakistan office in Pakistan were closing on March 31, the ceremonies were held before final examinations. The ceremonies recognized the hard work and dedication of FATA Scholarship Program students who showed exceptional results in the annual Grade 9 board examination. Additionally, the ceremonies commended those institutions that have provided the best services to students and whose students have shown great improvement – academically and socially.

3. Stakeholder groups report

At the beginning of the project, Training for Pakistan and the COR talked to each DO team about forming Stakeholder Groups. Training for Pakistan requested stakeholder meetings over the course of the project; however, for various reasons, the meetings did not occur. In Health, the decision was made for Training for Pakistan to support HSA. Because Training for Pakistan has worked closely with the DO team and HSA, the stakeholders were in regular communication throughout the reporting period and additional meetings were not needed. In Agriculture, stakeholder groups reside and work outside of Islamabad and the project faced great challenges due to security in bringing those groups together. The Education DO requested not to have stakeholder groups. For the DG team, the group consisted of the Director DG office, the COR, and the Training for Pakistan COP. All three were in constant communication and formal stakeholder meetings were not necessary.

E. Data management

Training for Pakistan entered participant data into TraiNet, monitored, and updated data on a routine basis throughout the project. A summary report of Training for Pakistan programs and participants is included as Annex 7. Training for Pakistan also updated PakInfo on a monthly basis.

Training for Pakistan faced several issues with managing contractor data in TraiNet. The data quality efforts began in April 2012 when the Data Quality Manager was hired. Initial tasks included correcting Training for Pakistan data that was distorted due to a change in the Mission IRs. By the time this correction was made, Training for Pakistan lost access to all site IDs. These issues were communicated to Rivera, the TraiNet contractor, and when Training for Pakistan received access to site codes, we were unable to generate reports. This was an ongoing issue that did not get completely resolved until October 2012.

Training for Pakistan reviewed TraiNet data for contractors and contacted them regarding the completeness of their data. In the process, Training for Pakistan received comments from contractors that data quality management was not included as part of their contractual obligation. A data quality management meeting was held on December 27 and 28, 2012, and RIs of several contractors were invited to attend. Staff from the following contractors/projects attended the meeting:

- Health Services Academy
- USAID Deliver project - JSI
- USAID Citizens Voice Project
- USAID Agribusiness Project – ASF

F. Monitoring and evaluation

At the training program level, Training for Pakistan monitored all project activities on an ongoing basis throughout the duration of the project, including:

- Maintaining contact with universities/training providers: Through email, phone calls, and site visits, the project maintained contact with training providers during each training program to assess program progress, and that training continued to meet the program objectives. Training for Pakistan reported issues to USAID and other stakeholder groups in a timely manner. A list of U.S. and third country training provider information is included as Annex 8.

- **Monitoring participants during their programs:** The project conducted monitoring interviews by phone, and when possible, site visits to the program. We monitored participants in every program, interviewing either all participants if the number of participants in the program was small, or a sample of participants if the training group was large. When issues arose, we notified USAID immediately, and worked with the training provider to resolve the issue. Phone calls were scheduled with each scholar each month, and calls with advisors were held at least once each semester. The PhD scholars were also in regular contact by email. Annex 9 provides contact information for the PhD scholars in the United States.
- **Preparing Training Program final reports:** After each training program, Training for Pakistan prepared a final report that included a summary of the training event, and initial participant feedback based on monitoring interviews and an exit questionnaire analysis on how well the program met its objectives. A summary of each program is included in the Section II. D. 2. Annex 10 includes the final reports for all programs.
- **Drafting success stories and gathering testimonials:** The project collected success stories and testimonials from participants as possible during the course of the year. Annex 11 includes success stories and participants’ testimonials, the project accomplishments document submitted in July 2012, and a success story for the FATA scholarship
- **Support debriefing, networking among alumni, and follow-up evaluations:** Training for Pakistan held debriefing meetings after each U.S. and third country training programs and all but two debriefing findings were included in the final reports (Annex 10). The GAO International Auditor Fellowship Program and the Summer Institute in Reproductive Health and Development program debriefings were reported by ECI. In addition, ECI conducted a number of follow on debriefings several months after training to gather additional information on the impact of training and results of the training. These reports are included as Annex 12, and the table below reflects the reports that ECI prepared.

List of ECI debriefing and follow on interview reports (Annex 12)
Monitoring of FAFEN training on ‘Electronic Media and Elections’ at Lahore
Follow-on GAO International Auditor Fellowship Program
Telephonic follow-on with Efficient Water Management Study Tour 1- USA
Telephonic follow-on with Efficient Water Management Study Tour 2- Australia
Follow-on of Dr. Nabeela from the Summer Institute in Reproductive Health and Development
In-field follow-on Mr. Mohsin Ali Khan Toru (EWM II- Australia)

Second follow-on Mr. Syed M. Haroon (GBV)
In-field follow-on Dr. Atifa Naheed (GBV)
In-field follow-on Mr. Ahmad Said (EWM II- Australia)
In-field follow-on Mr. Abrar Shaikh (EWM II- Australia)
In-field follow-on Ms. Madeeha Latif (GBV)

Training for Pakistan provided information to all participants on the U.S. State Department Alumni Association website and encouraged all participants to sign up. Given the short duration of the project, this was the main alumni activity.

G. Best practices:

Participant Processing

- Given the Consular Office guidance (early on the project) that 90-120 days were needed for visa processing, ensure that the AO teams were aware of this timing, plan for additional time to gather the visa documents needed for submission to VCS and to the Consular Office, and set firm deadlines with the AO teams for receiving participant data.
- In budgeting for participant training programs, include a buffer for items that fluctuate, such as travel.
- For those participants who work for the government, plan enough time for the participants to secure an NOC before U.S. visa processing starts.
- For candidates who are nominated through the AO teams, not only review participant qualifications, but also review who they are employed by and the source of employer funding to help determine if participants are eligible for J-1 visas.
- Continue to work with the AO teams to include alternate candidates for U.S. and third country training. As candidates do drop out, it's important to process alternates at the same time as the primary candidates to ensure a full group will be able to participate in the program.
- When high ranking government officials are selected to participate in out-of-country training programs, obtain their consent to fly economy class (or to upgrade at their own expense) as soon as they are identified in order to avoid potential last minute drop-outs.
- Since pre-departure orientations are normally held in Islamabad on the day before departure for the training program, advise participants before their departure to Islamabad of the weather conditions in the host country to allow time to pack properly.

- While the participants normally fly third country and U.S. training from Islamabad after attending pre-departure orientations, it is advised to book their return flight directly to their respective city of residence.
- Though it is difficult to enforce a nomination deadline on DO teams and/or partner organizations, particularly for U.S. programs, officially notify the intended party of the risk in not obtaining timely visas.
- When candidates are nominated through the DO teams, not only review participant qualifications, but also ensure that they are eligible as Exchange Visitors in compliance with the ADS.
- For U.S. training, start processing participants no less than 10 weeks in advance.
- When processing students for Ph.D. studies at U.S. universities, admission notifications for fall semesters may not be received until May or June. Therefore:
 - Wait until university admission is issued before conducting medical exams and SRFI interviews since these are valid for four months and since visa applications cannot be submitted until university admission is received;
 - Plan that students will not be able to travel before mid-July since visa processing takes a minimum of six weeks;
 - Communicate consistently with the Education Office and scholars about the application process to U.S. institutions, the competitiveness of admission, and the need to be open to the schools where scholars are ultimately accepted;
 - When identifying universities for female students, focus on universities that have a significant number of international students. The presence of campus resources for international students provides support to newly enrolled international students, particularly to female students.

Program and Administration

- High visibility is critical for the Mission in Pakistan and therefore critical that Public Outreach and Communication Specialists are recruited at the start of the project.
- Because of the unreliability of visa issuance by Pakistani Authorities, line up local experts to support the foreign SMEs and/or replace them, in case they fail to obtain a visa.
- When long term participants apply for their dependents to join them, they typically are anxious for their family to arrive. However, from the day they apply until the day they join, the process takes at least four to five months. Although warned, early in the process, of the delay the applications can take, participants tend to become nervous and impatient while waiting for the arrival of their dependents. To help ease such tensions, request that the applicants acknowledge in writing at the time they submit their application that they understand the process can take up to six months or longer.
- Due to security concerns, Training for Pakistan staff were unable to travel to areas like Bannu, DI Khan etc., to monitor scholarships in person and/or carry out contract related tasks. Under such circumstances, pay per diem for institute staff to travel to Islamabad or to another city to meet the project staff and finalize necessary tasks and documentation.

- Training for Pakistan realized early in the project that it had a serious challenge in holding stakeholder meetings. The DO teams were usually very busy and, once they finalized their training plans, they depended on Training for Pakistan to manage program issues. They tried to limit the number of meetings to a minimum. In addition, once Training for Pakistan was working with the partner organization or counterpart entity on the implementation of the approved interventions, the need to hold stakeholder group meetings was decreased. Assess the need for Stakeholder Groups at the beginning of the project, and be flexibility in establishing and/or convening Stakeholder Groups over the life of the project dependent on the need.

G. Local capacity building

Training for Pakistan contracted with Empowerment Thru Creative Integration (ECI) as its local partner. ECI is a Pakistan-based capacity development and consulting organization that provides technical services to the development sector in the thematic areas of: livelihood and enterprise development, agribusiness development and extension services, gender mainstreaming, good governance and institutional development. The organization, owned by an alumna of USAID participant training programs, has over twenty years of national and international experience in strategic planning, institutional development, project design and implementation.

ECI's accomplishments during their work with Training for Pakistan include:

- Entered data on TraiNet as R1 and uploaded documents as R2
- Assisted in the issuance and the evaluation of RFPs
- Assisted in processing exchange visitors
- Assisted in SRFI sessions and took notes
- Worked on the development of Training Request forms
- Participated in the completion of Training Implementation Plans
- Researched training service providers in third-countries
- Prepared Pre-Departure Orientation (PDO) booklets and developed PDO materials
- Participated in the delivery of PDO
- Monitored training sessions
- Conducted action planning sessions
- Participated in debrief sessions
- Participated in the development of final reports
- Identified USAID per diem rates in different cities
- Assisted in the design of promotional material in line with USAID branding procedures
- Developed financial budgets in line with USAID's format
- Prepared procurement requests
- Participated in procurement committees
- Conducted in-training under the Economic Growth DO (Farming as a Business)

One of ECI's objectives was to build its capacity in the agriculture sector. In line with this objective, Training for Pakistan assigned its in-country agriculture training portfolio to ECI. ECI conducted a series of training workshops on "Farming as a Business" during the month of September as reported above. The program was very well received by the participants.

In addition to the focus on building the capacity of ECI to work with USAID participant training programs, Training for Pakistan worked with several additional local training providers to help develop their capabilities to respond to RFPs and to develop short-term training programs. Training for Pakistan released an RFP to select a small group of local training providers to conduct in-country training and received twelve proposals in response to the RFP. In February, 2012, Training for Pakistan completed a

review and evaluation of the proposals that were submitted. The technical committee, composed of the DCOP, Training Manager, and M&E Specialist, selected six proposals as technically qualified. The financial committee, composed of Creative's Senior Associate and the COP, then reviewed and evaluated the cost proposals. After the consolidation of the results was completed, Training for Pakistan informed the COR and the Acquisition and Assistance Specialist of the final results and selection. The three winning proposals were submitted by:

- LEAD
- Human Resource Learning Center (HRLC)
- IBC – Sukkur

For two of the four in-country activities (three training programs, and one needs assessment), an RFP was sent to the three selected providers and a provider chosen:

Election Monitoring I: conducted by HRLC
HSA Needs Assessment: conducted by LEAD

For the other two in country training programs, providers were chosen based on the needs of the program, and on our subcontract with ECI:

Election Monitoring II: managed by FAFEN with local and international experts
Agriculture as a Business: ECI (as part of their subcontract scope of work)

III. Recommendations on ways to resolve problems and constraints identified

Training for Pakistan identified the following constraints that arose during project implementation. Our recommendations to resolve these constraints are also included below.

- Due to the project timeline, Training for Pakistan could not begin the placement process with the Pre-STEP scholars until late fall 2011. Many U.S. university application deadlines passed before the scholars' applications could be submitted. Training for Pakistan was able to place all selected scholars, however, we recommend that the application and placement process begins for new cohorts of scholars 10-12 months before their expected program start.
- Training for Pakistan received participant selections for project activities from each DO team. We recommend an application and interview process for all training programs to ensure participant buy-in. Training for Pakistan encountered a disconnect with many participants as to how they would use the training during their daily job activities and many programs were postponed due to participants dropping out at the last minute. The application and interview process will offer an important opportunity to emphasize the connection between each participant's job and the training, as well as ensure participants are willing and able to commit to the training activity.
- In the first three months of the project, Training for Pakistan focused on training preparation as most of the participating DO offices were not quite ready to identify their training needs. Given the short project life, the training design, development, and implementation needed to be accomplished in a limited period of time. In spite of this challenge, Training for Pakistan was able to implement 16 training interventions and one needs assessment during the project.
- Training for Pakistan started with a limited number of staff and limited support in major areas such as monitoring and evaluation (M&E), public outreach, and communication. The limited

support resulted in delays in accomplishing major tasks and requirements, such as establishing and managing a website, conducting high profile events and providing visibility for USAID's work, implementing M&E activities, and developing and updating the PMP. We recommend that M&E and outreach/communications staff are recruited early on in the project lifecycle.

- In early 2012, the U.S. visa approval process was taking three months or longer. For a one-year project, such delays are very significant. For example, a U.S.-bound program was postponed twice due to visa delays and many programs were moved to a third country to avoid such delays. This was a constraint that was out of our control, but as of August 2012, the visa approval process was reduced to six to eight weeks.
- Issuance of visas to U.S. and third-country national (TCN) consultants to travel to Pakistan is unreliable. While a few consultants were able to obtain visas in a reasonable period of time, others failed to receive a visa with three to four months advance planning. This caused the postponement of programs and the near cancellation of others. We recommend having alternate means to cover the U.S. and third-country experts, primarily through using local consultants or implementing partner in-country experts.
- The pressure exerted by the Mission to keep the rates of host-country national (HCN) consultants under the Mission pay Scale limited the pool of qualified Subject Matter Experts. To overcome this challenge on the Election Monitoring II program, TFP identified local consultants who had a deep commitment to the mission of FAFEN and who offered their services pro-bono and others who were willing to provide their services at substantially reduced rates.
- Some of the essential resource material identified for use in election training programs was sensitive and copyrighted, which created a challenge in branding such material with the USAID logo. Such literature could become unusable in USAID sponsored programs and, as a result, affect the quality of the programs. FAFEN held the rights of the resource materials that were used. A possible solution would be for the Mission to waive in advance branding of copyrighted material for use in training programs.
- Security issues in various provinces of Pakistan caused the cancellation and/or postponement of programs. Additionally, the security situation in Pakistan caused foreign experts to cancel, at the last minute, their participation in programs thus forcing postponement and disruption of various interventions.
- GOP officials dropped out of third-country and U.S. training programs because of their inability to obtain a NOC. Typically, these drop-outs occurred just before departure when processing alternates became impossible and caused an unavoidable drop in the number of participants. We recommend identifying the need for a NOC as early as possible, with a deadline for receiving the NOC that allows sufficient time to prepare alternate candidates to be processed to attend the training.
- To approve the participation of their officers in out-of-the country training programs, some provincial governments, particularly KPK, required that requests be submitted to EAD. The Mission initially did not to issue such requests and/or authorize IPs to issue such requests. This caused delays of programs which were targeted to assist those specific provinces. To address this challenge, the Mission agreed in late September to submit formal requests through EAD.

- The selection of participants by DO teams or partner organizations proved to be very lengthy. Training for Pakistan often received the list only days before the start of the training intervention. This caused the postponement of programs. At times, providers had difficulties in rescheduling programs and this nearly led to cancellation of programs. To avoid such obstacles, it is recommended to schedule the dates training interventions once the participants are identified.
- Keeping the gender balance of participants to a 50-50 ratio in every intervention was extremely challenging. While the DO teams tried hard to accomplish this goal, the ratio was not met for various reasons. When government officials are the targeted participants, gender balance becomes nearly impossible as in several GOP departments, the ratio of males to females is overwhelmingly male. We recommend reinforcing gender requirements from development of the training plan, through the full training cycle, to maintain an on-going discussion on how to incorporate more women into training programs.

III. Lessons-learned during implementation

Training for Pakistan identified the following lessons-learned from project implementation:

- Long-term scholars require more time than expected to obtain all required university application documents, the most important of which are official transcripts. U.S. universities require university transcripts to arrive in sealed envelopes, with the university stamp or seal of approval indicating that the transcript has not been tampered with. The higher education system in Pakistan does not require transcripts in the same way and many scholars faced long delays in obtaining transcripts from their institutions that met U.S. application requirements.
- It was important for staff to be proactive in working with the DO teams to help them understand the full-range of options available to them under a training contract, providing the DO teams with different options for training, and working with the DO teams to help identify the best training intervention to meet their needs.
- In some cases, the expectations of participants did not align with the program objectives. It was important to use each touch-point with both participants and training providers (i.e. the application process, pre-departure orientation, daily debrief with training providers) to reiterate program objectives and expectations and ensure they aligned with the participants' expectations.