



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

IMPROVING WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES IN THE MENA REGION (IWSMR)

TRAINING IMPACT ASSESSMENT (TIA) REPORT 1:
ROCTP PILOT- NABLUS/WEST BANK

WASTEWATER TREATMENT-LEVEL 1
ON-JOB FOLLOW-UP

JULY 2015

This report was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by Chemonics International Inc.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 1. <i>ASSESSMENT DESCRIPTION – ROCTP PRE/POST-TRAINING (ON-JOB FOLLOW-UP)</i> | 4 |
| 2. <i>SUMMARY OF RESULTS</i> | 5 |
| 3. <i>QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS</i> | 8 |
| 4. <i>QUALITATIVE INDICATORS</i> | 12 |
| • Trainees Pre/Post Training On-Job Follow-up-Survey Results | |
| • Supervisor pre/post training on-job follow up survey results | |
| <u>ANNEXES</u> | 18 |
| A.1 List of Nablus WWTO1 Trainees and Supervisor | |
| A.2 Summary of Survey Responses to Pre- Training and Post-Training- On-Job Follow-up - Trainee | |
| A.3 Summary of Survey Responses to Pre- Training and Post-Training On-Job Follow-up - Supervisor | |
| B.1 Pre Training Survey Trainee Questionnaire | |
| B.2 Post Training- On- job Follow-Up Trainee Questionnaire | |
| B.3 Pre Training Survey Supervisor Questionnaire | |
| B.4 Post Training- On- job Follow-Up Supervisor Questionnaire | |

1. Assessment Description - ROCTP Pre/Post-Training (on-job follow-up)

Background

As a part of the ACWUA Regional Operator Certification and Training Program (ROCTP) pilot implementation, the ACWUA and IWSMR Project utilized the Training Impact Assessment (TIA) approach and methodology developed by the USAID-funded Operations and Maintenance Training (OMT) project, to evaluate the performance impact at the facilities where the pilot training was taking place. ACWUA will continue to use this approach and methodology to measure the effectiveness of the ROCTP on improved water and wastewater facility O&M and to make improvements in the program as indicated.

TIA Report 1 - Post-Training- On-Job Follow-up provides both baseline quantitative data for the Nablus/West Bank treatment facility and an analysis of the first set of TIA data collected back on the job after the completion of training as shown below:

| Course | Level | Pilot Site | TIA Type | Date |
|----------------------|-------|---|---|----------------------|
| Wastewater Treatment | 1 | Nablus/West Bank Wastewater Treatment Plant | Pre-Training Post-Training On-Job follow up after 6 months | Oct 2014 May 2015 |

Purpose

By design, the first round of post-training TIA is conducted on-job six months after training to collect both quantitative and qualitative data to compare and identify any change in O&M performance as measured against the pre-training baseline established for the designated facilities. The findings of this assessment will be used to further improve the operator certification and training program and to assist managers in improving O&M performance at their facilities.

Due to the limited duration of the IWSMR project, ACWUA may accelerate the six-month on-job TIA for ROCTP pilots. For the Nablus/West Bank Wastewater Level 1 training course a pre training survey within the first day of the training course, then after 6 months of the training, the first on-job TIA was conducted, and results are contained in this report.

ACWUA has a full description of the TIA methodology and the raw data for this the Nablus/West Bank ROCTP Wastewater Treatment Operator – Level 1 available upon request from ACWUA.

2. Summary Results

Quantitative Performance Indicators

Performance data is collected and reported annually. Below are the 2013 baseline, the 2014 and the 2015 data collected for the Nablus/West Bank wastewater treatment plant. In future TIAs, annual performance data will be summarized and compared with the results reported for previous years.

Nablus/West Bank Wastewater Treatment Plant (WWTP) Year 2013 - 2015

| # | Indicator | 2013 baseline | 2014 | 2015 | Remarks |
|---|---|---------------|-----------|-------------|--|
| 1 | Quality of W/WW treated – Non-compliance Citations | N A | N A | N A | West Bank authorities don't issue citations for compliance problems |
| 2 | Major Unplanned Shut-downs | 0 | 1 | 0 | Electricity failure from its source (Israel) |
| 3 | Emergency Actions | 1 | 1 | 0 | Due to heavy rain and snow in year 2013, where the emergency generator was kept running for 3 days; Break in excess sludge pipe in 2014 |
| 4 | Accident Reports | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| 5 | Operating Costs (US\$) | \$342,000* | \$805,000 | \$292,000** | * The indicated cost is only for about 5.7 months from July 9 (the plant starting date) to the end of December 2013. ** The indicated cost covers 5 months from January to the end of May 2015. |
| 6 | Maintenance Costs (US\$) | \$42,000* | \$142,000 | \$49,000** | * The indicated cost is only for about 5.7 months from July 9 (the plant starting date) to the end of December 2013. ** The indicated cost covers 5 months from January to the end of May 2015. |
| 7 | Wastewater Quality (Lab) | | | | For wastewater line and sludge line. All test were in line with set standards. |
| | a) number of external lab tests conducted | 0 | 4 | 1 | |
| | b) percentage of results of noncompliance with the standard | 0 | 0 | 0 | |

As remarked under the ** symbol for the year 2015, the operation cost covers 5 months (January – May), hence the expected operation cost to cover all year 2015 if calculated based on the actual cost of the first 5 months of the year will be \$700,800 which is less by \$104,200 compared with 2014. Although the reduction in the

operation cost can't be attributed only and directly to the training and certification of the operators, it still can be considered as an indicative.

Reduction in the maintenance cost can be also observed by applying the same method in calculating the expected maintenance cost for the total year of 2015, where it will be totaled to \$117,600 which is less than the total maintenance cost for year 2014 by \$24,400.

3. Quantitative Indicators

Pre-training survey was conducted on the first day of the training course using the questionnaire shown in Annex B1 for the trainees and B2 for the supervisor. It involved 5 operator trainees from Nablus Wastewater Treatment Plant with their supervisor (Annex A1). The number of trainees involved in the survey is about 21% of the total number of trainees participated in the training course from different water utilities in Palestine.

The post training/on-job follow-up survey conducted 6 months after the training used the questionnaire shown in Annex B3 for the trainees and B4 for the supervisor, with participation of the same 5 operators and supervisor.

4. Qualitative Indicators

Trainee's pre/post training on-job follow-up survey questionnaires results

The following summarizes the main results/conclusions of the post training on-job follow-up survey including comparison of these results with the pre training survey results:

1- Relevance of training

80% of the questioned operators continued to express their interest in learning and improving their job skills in the post survey after 6 months of the training, which is less than the rate indicated by the operators in the pre survey (100%).

Regarding training topics, 80% of the operators in both surveys indicated with either agree or strongly agree that they want to study topics within the field in general and beyond their current jobs.

Such results indicate importance of the technical training in satisfying operators' interest in improving their job skills and the need for covering the field in general when designing training programs contents.

2- Language of instructions

Operators had no clear preference for using a specific instruction language (Arabic or English), since 60% of them indicated in the post-survey their agreement or strongly agreement that they have no language preference.

This was slightly different from the operators' responses in the pre-survey where only 40% of them indicated that they have no language preference and 60% preferred the English language.

3- Knowledge/ Understanding

Operators' responses assured increasing their knowledge/understanding in their fields as a result of the training, where:

- All questioned operators indicated in the post survey their agreement/strong agreement of becoming more aware of the new technologies that could improve their performance and of the safety equipment and safe O&M procedures, although 60% of the operators trainees in the pre training survey respectively indicated their disagreement/strong disagreement of being not aware of those areas.

- 80% of the operators indicated in the post survey their agreement/strong agreement that the training had increased their knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their fields. This goes

almost in line with their expectation in the pre survey where 100% of them agreed/ strongly agreed that the training should achieve that outcome.

- 80% indicated in the post survey that they have better understanding of the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their jobs, thus complying with their wish in the pre survey and at the same rate (80%) of having better understanding as a result of the training.

4- Attitude/ Confidence; Self Esteem

All questioned operators in the post training survey agreed/strongly agreed that the training had given them the confidence to apply new knowledge on their jobs, which correspond to their expectation in the pre survey at the same rate of agreement/strongly agreement (100%).

While regarding gaining confidence as a result of the training to pursue promotion, career objective and jobs opportunities elsewhere, only 60% of them were in agreement/strong agreement. Results were less than their expectation in the pre survey concerning pursuing promotion (80%), and similar to their expectation concerning job opportunity elsewhere (60%). **This can be due to the high unemployment rates in the West Bank, difficult economic situation and unstable circumstances prevailing in the region in general that negatively affect operator's confidence in getting promotion and/or jobs opportunities elsewhere.**

Operators' opinions regarding awareness of their families, friends and neighbors of the importance of their jobs in protecting public health and controlling pollution remained the same in the two surveys, where 60% of them reported agreement/strong agreement that these people are not aware.

5- Skills/ Technical; management

80% of the questioned operators in the post survey agreed/strongly agreed that they had acquired new technical skills as a result of the training that enabled them to do their jobs better. This is less than the pre survey rate, which was 100%, but still a vital indicator of the success of the training course on providing operators with new technical skills that enabled them to improve their job performance.

For the management skills, the questioned operators confirmed their pre training survey opinion at rate of 80% agree/strongly agree in acquiring new ways for solving work problems, while for learning new ways to organize people and tasks as result of the training, the rate increased from 80% in the pre survey to 100% in the post survey.

Operators' responses in general indicate that the effects of the training are not short-lived, since they continued to agree/strongly agree that the training after 6 months back on the job enabled them to perform better which indicates the success of the training program.

6- Impact of training

80% of the operators in the post survey indicated that they could see improvements in their performance and the performance of their work unit as a result of the training. This was less than their expectation rate in the pre survey, which was 100%.

Regarding supervisor support of the operators in application of their new knowledge and skills on the jobs, only 60% of the operators indicated their agreement of receiving such support against 80% who expected to receive the support in the pre survey.

Operators in the post survey indicated at a rate of 80% their agreement/strong agreement that the supervisor is monitoring the application of their new knowledge and skills to determine impact on their performance and the performance of their work units. This was higher than their expectation in the pre survey where the agreement rate was 60%.

ACWUA should consider conducting orientation for supervisors to ensure that operators receive support in application of new knowledge and skill obtained during training.

Supervisor pre/ post training- on- job follow up surveys questionnaires results

The following are the main results/conclusions of the post survey questionnaire results of the supervisor from the Nablus Wastewater Treatment Plant including comparison with the pre survey questionnaire results:

1- Relevance of training

The supervisor strongly agreed in the post survey that his staff is interested in learning and improving their job skills, while only agreed with that in the pre survey. This corresponds with 80% and 100% of the operators opinions in the post and pre surveys respectively.

Regarding training topics, he confirmed in both surveys his agreement of having his staff only study topics directly related to their current jobs, **which is understandable, since as a supervisor his main concern is having his staff doing their current jobs properly.** This differs from 80% of operators opinion who wanted to study topics related to their field in general and beyond their current jobs.

2- Language of instruction

The supervisor indicated his agreement/strong agreement with preference of using English as a language for staff training instruction in the post and pre surveys respectively differs from operators opinions where 60% of them in the post survey indicated that they have no language.

3- Knowledge/ understanding

The supervisor agreed in the post survey that his trained staff are:

- Better aware of the new technologies that could improve their performance, safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields.
- Having more knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their field.
- Better understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their jobs.

His opinion corresponds largely with the trainees' opinions, and reflects the success of the program in improving operators' knowledge/understanding of their working field that could improve their performance.

4- Attitude, confidence and self esteem

Unlike the operators who were 100% in agreement/strong agreement and also his expectation in the pre survey, the supervisor opinion was neutral (not sure) in the post survey after 6 months of training regarding staff confidence in applying their new knowledge on their jobs.

Also his opinion regarding the staff confidence in pursuing promotion and career objectives as a result of the training was neutral. Thus, not matching 60% of the operators who indicated their agreement/strong agreement, and also his pre survey expectation where he was in agreement that confidence in future promotion and career opportunities.

Like 60% of the trainee operators in the post training survey, the supervisor indicated his agreement that the training had given his staff confidence to pursue job opportunity elsewhere.

Also, he agreed with 60% of the trainee operators that the staff's families, neighbors, and friends are not aware of the importance of their work in protecting public health and environment.

ACWUA should consider support the Nablus utility in a public awareness campaign informing customers that operators were receiving training and certification to international standards.

5- Skills/ Technical; management

The supervisor after 6 months of the training reported his agreement that the staff had acquired/ learned new technical skills/methods that enabled them to do their jobs better, solve work problems and organize people and tasks.

The supervisor's responses in the post survey were similar to those in the pre survey except that regarding learning new ways of organizing people and tasks the supervisor was neutral.

The supervisor's opinions confirm the success of the program in developing technical and management skills of the operators that enabled them to do their jobs better.

6- Impact of training

After 6 months of the training, the supervisor agreed that he is supporting his staff in applying new knowledge and skills on their jobs, and, monitoring their performance to assess impact.

The supervisor can see improvements in staff and work unit performance as a result of training.

Supervisor's responses are in line with operators' responses, and also with his expectations in the pre survey.

The response of that the trainee operators are demonstrating improved job performance is a validation that so far the ROCTP training is having a beneficial impact at the Nablus Wastewater Treatment Plant and that further investment in ACWUA ROCTP training is justified.

ANNEX A.1 LIST OF NABLUS WWTO1 TRAINEES AND IMMEDIATE SUPERVISOR

| Trainee | Position | Contact Details | Immediate Supervisor | Position | Contact |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|----------------------|--------------------------------|---|
| Amjad Mohammed Shanteer | Operation Technician | T: ++970 599073081 amjdsanteer@gmail.com | Yousef Abu Jaffal | Operation Supervisor | T: ++970 569870794 yousefabujaffal@gmail.com |
| Anas Asa'd Baraq | Electrical Engineer | T: ++970 597440136 Abareq86@hotmail.com | Yousef Abu Jaffal | Operation Supervisor | T: ++970 569870794 yousefabujaffal@gmail.com |
| Amer Mohammed Shanteer | Operation Technician | T: ++970 598166576 amershanteer@hotmail.com | Yousef Abu Jaffal | Operation Supervisor | T: ++970 569870794 yousefabujaffal@gmail.com |
| Khaled Ahmed Makhzoum | Control Technician | T: ++970 599392177 Khaled20152010@hotmail.com | Yousef Abu Jaffal | Operation Supervisor | T: ++970 569870794 yousefabujaffal@gmail.com |
| Seham Nasser Abu | Engineer-Environmental Control Unit | T: ++970 598713807 Eng.seham2013@hotmail.com | Yousef Abu Jaffal | Operation Supervisor | T: ++970 569870794 yousefabujaffal@gmail.com |
| Yousef Abu Jaffal | Operation Supervisor | T: ++970 569870794 yousefabujaffal@gmail.com | Suliman Abu Ghoush | Nablus Treatment Plant Manager | T: ++ 970 599785738 ssabughosh@nablus.org |

ANNEX A.2 NABLUS WWT01- TRAINING IMPACT ASSESSMENT SURVEY- PRE/POST TRAINING (SIX-MONTH FOLLOW-UP)/TRAINEE RESPONSE SUMMARY

| Pre Training Survey | | Post Training Survey | |
|--|---|---|--|
| <p>1. Relevance of Training</p> <p>1.1 I am interested in learning and improving my job skills.</p> <p>1.2 I only want to study topics that are directly related to my current job.</p> <p>1.3 I want a complete knowledge of my field regardless of the current relevance.</p> | <p>1.1 100% of the trainees agreed or strongly agreed that they are interested in learning and improving their job skills.</p> <p>1.2 Trainees were distributed across the range regarding studying topics that are only directly related to their current jobs.</p> <p>1.3 80% of the trainees agreed or strongly agreed that they want a complete knowledge of their fields regardless of the current relevance.</p> | <p>1. Relevance of Training</p> <p>1.1 I am interested in learning and improving my job skills.</p> <p>1.2 I only want to study topics that are directly related to my current job.</p> <p>1.3 I want a complete knowledge of my field regardless of the current relevance.</p> | <p>1-1 80% of the trainees continued expressing their agreement/ strongly agreement of their interest in learning and improving their job skills.</p> <p>1-2 Trainees still distributed across the range regarding studying topics that are only directly related to their current jobs.</p> <p>1-3 Trainees confirmed their pre-training opinions. After training they continue to see the value in receiving training in all aspects of operator responsibilities. A total of 80% agreed or strongly agreed that they want a complete knowledge of the field regardless of their current jobs.</p> |
| <p>2. Language of Instruction</p> <p>2.1 I prefer to study my field in Arabic.</p> <p>2.2 I prefer to study my field in English.</p> <p>2.3 I have no language preference.</p> | <p>2.1 Trainees were distributed across the range in regard to their preferences of studying their fields in Arabic.</p> <p>2.2 60% of the trainees agreed or strongly agreed that they prefer to study their field in English.</p> <p>2.3 40% of the trainees strongly agreed that they have no language preference against 60% who disagreed with that.</p> | <p>2. Language of Instruction</p> <p>2.1 I prefer to study my field in Arabic.</p> <p>2.2 I prefer to study my field in English.</p> <p>2.3 I have no language preference.</p> | <p>2-1 80% of the trainees were neutral regarding studying in Arabic language, with only 20% agreeing with that.</p> <p>2-2 100% of the trainees were neutral regarding studying their fields in English, which reflect a change in their opinions from the pre-training survey, where 60% of the trainees were in agreement/ strongly agreement.</p> <p>2-3 Slight change was noticed here in the opinions of the trainees where 60% of them agreed/ strongly agreed of having no language preference. This goes in line with their opinions in 2-1 and 2-2. Trainee's opinions can be understood, since both Arabic and English language were used in conducting the training.</p> |
| <p>3. Knowledge/Understanding</p> <p>3.1 I am not aware of the new technologies that could improve my performance.</p> <p>3.2 The training should increase my knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in my field.</p> <p>3.3 I would like to understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to my job.</p> <p>3.4 I am not aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in my field.</p> | <p>3.1 60% of the trainee's opinions were in disagreement/ strongly disagreement that they are unaware of the new technology in their fields.</p> <p>3.2 100% of the trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that the training should increase their knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their fields.</p> <p>3.3 80% of the trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they would like to understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their job.</p> <p>3.4 80% of the trainees disagreed/ strongly disagreed that they are not aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields.</p> | <p>3. Knowledge/Understanding</p> <p>3.1 I am now more aware of new technologies that could improve my performance.</p> <p>3.2 The training increased my knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in my field.</p> <p>3.3 I now better understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to my job.</p> <p>3.4 I am now more aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in my field.</p> | <p>3-1 100% of trainees agreed/strongly agreed that as a result of the training they have a greater awareness of new technologies that could improve their job performance.</p> <p>3-2 80% of trainees agreed/strongly agreed that the training have increased their knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their fields.</p> <p>3-3 80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they are now better understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their jobs.</p> <p>3-4 100% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they are now more aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields.</p> |
| <p>4. Attitude/Confidence; Self Esteem</p> <p>4.1 I expect the training to give me confidence to apply new knowledge to my job.</p> <p>4.2 I expect the training to give me confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives.</p> <p>4.3 I expect the training to give me confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere.</p> <p>4.4 My family, friends and neighbors are not aware of the importance of my</p> | <p>4.1 100% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that the training will give them confidence to apply new knowledge to their jobs.</p> <p>4.2 80% of trainees agreed that the training will give them confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives.</p> <p>4.3 60% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that the training will give them confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere.</p> <p>4.4 60% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that their families, friends and neighbors are not aware of the importance of their jobs to protect</p> | <p>4. Attitude/Confidence; Self Esteem</p> <p>4.1 The training is giving me confidence to apply new knowledge to my job.</p> <p>4.2 The training is giving me confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives.</p> <p>4.3 The training is giving me confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere</p> <p>4.4 My family, friends and neighbors are not aware of the importance of my job to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of</p> | <p>4-1 Trainees continued with 100% rate (agreement/ strongly agreement) their confidence of applying the new knowledge to their jobs complying with their expectations in the pre training survey.</p> <p>4-2 60% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that training have given them confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives. This rate is less than their expectation in the pre survey, which was 80%, may be because they have realized that there is no direct link between promotion and certification yet.</p> |

| | | | |
|--|---|---|---|
| <p>job to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment.</p> | <p>the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment.</p> | <p>controlling pollution to protect the environment.</p> | <p>4-3 <i>Almost similar to their expectation in the pre training survey, only 60% of trainees agreed that the training has given them confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere. This modest rate of confidence could be due to unstable situation and economic conditions prevailing in the region.</i></p> <p>4-4 <i>60% of trainees continued to have the same opinions as in the pre training survey of agreement/ strongly agreement that their families, friends and neighbors are not aware of the importance of their jobs to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment.</i></p> |
| <p>5. Skills/Technical; Management</p> <p>5.1 I expect to acquire new technical skills that enable me to do my job better.</p> <p>5.2 I expect to acquire new ways to solve work problems.</p> <p>5.3 I expect to learn new ways to organize people and tasks.</p> | <p>5.1 100% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they expect to acquire new technical skills that enable them to do their jobs better.</p> <p>5.2 80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they expect to acquire new ways to solve work problems.</p> <p>5.3 80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they expect to learn new ways to organize people and tasks.</p> | <p>5. Skills/Technical; Management</p> <p>5.1 I acquired new technical skills that enable me to do my job better.</p> <p>5.2 I acquired new ways to solve work problems.</p> <p>5.3 I learned new ways to organize people and tasks.</p> | <p>5-1 <i>80% of trainees confirmed after six months of training their agreement/ strongly agreement that as a result of training they have acquired new technical skills that enabled them to do their jobs better. This is slightly less than their opinions in the pre training survey (100%).</i></p> <p>5-2 <i>Similar to their expectation, 80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that as a result of training they have acquired new ways to solve work problems.</i></p> <p>5-3 <i>Higher than their expectation in the pre training survey, 100% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they have learnt new ways to organize people and tasks as a result of training.</i></p> |
| <p>6. Impact</p> <p>6.1 I expect to receive the support of my supervisor and the utility in the application of new knowledge and skills on the job.</p> <p>6.2 I expect my supervisor to monitor my application of new knowledge and skills to determine impact on my performance and the performance of my work unit.</p> <p>6.3 I expect to see improvements in my performance and the performance of my work unit as a result of the training.</p> | <p>6.1 80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they expect to receive the support of their supervisor and the utility in the application of new knowledge and skills on the job.</p> <p>6.2 60% of trainees agreed that they expect their supervisor to monitor their application of new knowledge and skills to determine impact on their performance and the performance of their work unit.</p> <p>6.3 100% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they expect to see improvements in their performance and the performance of their work unit as a result of the training.</p> | <p>6. Impact</p> <p>6.1 I am receiving the support of my supervisor and the utility in the application of new knowledge and skills on the job.</p> <p>6.2 My supervisor is monitoring my application of new knowledge and skills to determine impact on my performance and the performance of my work unit.</p> <p>6.3 I can see improvements in my performance and the performance of my work unit as a result of the training.</p> | <p>6-1 <i>Only 60% of trainees agreed that they are receiving the support of their supervisor and the utility in the application of new knowledge and skills on the job. This was less than their expectation in the pre training survey (80%).</i></p> <p>6-2 <i>80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that their supervisor is monitoring their application of new knowledge and skills to determine impact on their performance and the performance of their work unit, which is higher than the rate they have indicated in the pre training survey (60%).</i></p> <p>6-3 <i>80% of trainees agreed/ strongly agreed that they could see improvements in their performance and the performance of their work unit as a result of the training, which is actually less than their expectation in the pre training survey (100%).</i></p> |

ANNEX A.3 NABLUS TRAINING IMPACT ASSESSMENT SURVEY- PRE/POST TRAINING (SIX-MONTH FOLLOW-UP) /SUPERVISOR RESPONSE SUMMARY

| Pre training survey | | Post training survey | |
|--|--|---|---|
| 1. Relevance of Training 1.1 My staff is interested in learning and improving their job skills. 1.2 I only want staff to study topics that are directly related to their current job. 1.3 I want staff to receive complete knowledge of the field regardless of the current relevance. | 1.1 Agreed (rating:4) 1.2 Agreed (rating:4) 1.3 Neutral (rating:3) | 1. Relevance of Training 1.1 My staff is interested in learning and improving their job skills. 1.2 I only want staff to study topics that are directly related to their current job. 1.3 I want staff to receive complete knowledge of the field regardless of the current relevance. | 1-1 <i>Increased to strongly agree (rating: 5).</i> 1-2 <i>Remained agreed (rating: 4).</i> 1-3 <i>Remained neutral (rating: 3)</i> |
| 2. Language of Instruction 2.1 I prefer staff to study in Arabic. 2.2 I prefer staff to study in English. 2.3 I have no language preference. | 2.1 Disagreed (rating: 2) 2.2 Strongly agreed (rating: 5) 2.3 Disagreed (rating: 2) | 2. Language of Instruction 2.1 I prefer staff to study in Arabic. 2.2 I prefer staff to study in English. 2.3 I have no language preference. | 2-1 <i>Changed to neutral (rating: 3)</i> 2-2 <i>Decreased to agreed (rating: 4)</i> 2-3 <i>Changed to agreed (rating: 4)</i> |
| 3. Knowledge/Understanding 3.1 My staff is aware of the new technologies that could improve their performance. 3.2 My staff is not aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields. 3.3 The training should increase staff knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their field. 3.4 My staff currently understands the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their jobs. | 3.1 Agreed (rating: 4) 3.2 Disagreed (rating: 2) 3.3 Strongly agreed (rating: 5) 3.4 Agreed (rating: 4) | 3. Knowledge/Understanding 3.1 My staff is now better aware of the new technologies that could improve their performance. 3.2 My staff is now better aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields. 3.3 The training has increased staff knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their field. 3.4 My staff now better understand the importance of safe drinking water | 3-1 Agreed (rating: 4) 3-2 <i>Agreed (rating: 4)</i> 3-3 <i>Agreed (rating: 4)</i> 3-4 <i>Agreed (rating: 4)</i> |

| | | | |
|--|---|--|---|
| | | and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their jobs. | |
| <p>4. Attitude/Confidence</p> <p>4.1 I expect the training to give staff confidence to apply new knowledge on their job.</p> <p>4.2 I expect the training to give staff confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives.</p> <p>4.3 I expect the training to give staff confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere.</p> <p>4.4 In my opinion, the families, friends and neighbors of my staff are not aware of the importance of the jobs my staff do to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment.</p> | <p>4.1 Strongly agreed (rating: 5)</p> <p>4.2 Agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>4.3 Agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>4.4 Strongly agreed (rating: 5)</p> | <p>4. Attitude/Confidence</p> <p>4.1 The training is giving my staff confidence to apply new knowledge on their job.</p> <p>4.2 The training is giving my staff confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives.</p> <p>4.3 The training is giving my staff confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere.</p> <p>4.4 In my opinion, the families, friends and neighbors of my staff are not aware of the importance of the jobs my staff do to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment.</p> | <p>4-1 Changed to neutral (rating:3)</p> <p>4-2 Changed to neutral (rating:3)</p> <p>4-3 Remained agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>4-4 Decreased to agreed (rating: 4)</p> |
| <p>5. Skills/Technical; Management</p> <p>5.1 I expect staff to acquire new technical skills that enable them to do their job better.</p> <p>5.2 I expect staff to acquire new ways to solve work problems.</p> <p>5.3 I expect staff to learn new ways to organize people and tasks.</p> | <p>5.1 Agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>5.2 Agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>5.3 Neutral (rating: 3)</p> | <p>5. Skills/Technical; Management</p> <p>5.1 My staff is acquiring new technical skills that enable them to do their job better.</p> <p>5.2 My staff is acquiring new ways to solve work problems.</p> <p>5.3 My staff is learning new ways to organize people and tasks.</p> | <p>5-1 Remained agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>5-2 Remained agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>5-3 Changed to agreed (rating: 4)</p> |
| <p>6. Impact</p> <p>6.1 I intend to support staff in applying new knowledge and skills on the job.</p> <p>6.2 I intend to monitor the performance of staff after training to assess impact.</p> <p>6.3 I expect to see improvements in staff and work unit performance as a result of training.</p> | <p>6.1 Agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>6.2 Agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>6.3 Strongly agreed (rating: 5)</p> | <p>6. Impact</p> <p>6.1 I am supporting staff in applying new knowledge and skills on the job.</p> <p>6.2 I am monitoring the performance of staff after training to assess impact.</p> <p>6.3 I can see improvements in staff and work unit performance as a result of training</p> | <p>6-1 Remained agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>6-2 Remained agreed (rating: 4)</p> <p>6-3 Decreased to agreed (rating: 4)</p> |

ANNEX B.1 .3 PRE-TRAINING SURVERY TRAINEE QUESTIONAIRE

**Improving Water and Sanitation Services in the MENA Region
Training Impact Assessment
Pre Training Survey/ Trainee's Questionnaire**

Name: _____

Job position: _____

Job Location: _____

Please refer to the level of agreement and disagreement by putting (X) in each box:

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | (1) Strongly Disagree | (2) Disagree | (3) Neutral | (4) Agree | (5) Strongly Agree |
|--|---|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1. Relevance of Training | 1.1 I am interested in learning and improving my job skills. | | | | | |
| | 1.2 I only want to study topics that are directly related to my current job. | | | | | |
| | 1.3 I want a complete knowledge of my field regardless of the current relevance. | | | | | |
| 2. Language of Instruction | 2.1 I prefer to study my field in Arabic | | | | | |
| | 2.2 I prefer to study my field in English. | | | | | |
| | 2.3 I have no language preference. | | | | | |
| 3. Knowledge/ Understanding | 3.1 I am not aware of the new technologies that could improve my performance. | | | | | |
| | 3.2 The training should increase my knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in my field. | | | | | |
| | 3.3 I would like to understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to my job. | | | | | |
| | 3.4 I am not aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in my field. | | | | | |

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | (1) Strongly Disagree | (2) Disagree | (3) Neutral | (4) Agree | (5) Strongly Agree |
|--|---|--------------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 4. Attitude/Confidence; Self Esteem | 4.1 I expect the training to give me confidence to apply new knowledge to my job. | | | | | |
| | 4.2 I expect the training to give me confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives. | | | | | |
| | 4.3 I expect the training to give me confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere. | | | | | |
| | 4.4 My family, friends and neighbors are not aware of the importance of my job to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment. | | | | | |
| 5. Skills/Technical; Management | 5.1 I expect to acquire new technical skills that enable me to do my job better. | | | | | |
| | 5.2 I expect to acquire new ways to solve work problems. | | | | | |
| | 5.3 I expect to learn new ways to organize people and tasks. | | | | | |
| 6. Impact | 6.1 I expect to receive the support of my supervisor and the utility in the application of new knowledge and skills on the job. | | | | | |
| | 6.2 I expect my supervisor to monitor my application of new knowledge and skills to determine impact on my performance and the performance of my work unit. | | | | | |
| | 6.3 I expect to see improvements in my performance and the performance of my work unit as a result of the training. | | | | | |

ANNEX B.2 POST TRAINING-ON-JOB FOLLOW-UP SURVEY TRAINEE QUESTIONNAIRE

Training Impact Assessment Survey Post Training- On- job Follow Up Survey/ Trainee's Questionnaire

Training course
Venue:

Trainer:
Dates:

Please refer to the level of agreement and disagreement by putting (X) in each box:

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | (1) Strongly Disagree | (2) Disagree | (3) Neutral | (4) Agree | (5) Strongly Agree |
|---|--|-----------------------------|-----------------|----------------|--------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Relevance of Training | 1.1 I am interested in learning and improving my job skills. | | | | | |
| | 1.2 I only want to study topics that are directly related to my current job. | | | | | |
| | 1.3 I want to receive complete knowledge to the field regardless of the current relevance. | | | | | |
| 2. Language of Instructi | 2.1 I prefer to study in Arabic. | | | | | |
| | 2.2 I prefer to study in English. | | | | | |
| | 2.3 I have no language preference. | | | | | |
| 3. Knowledge/ Understanding | 3.1 I am now more aware of the new technologies that could improve my performance. | | | | | |
| | 3.2 The training had increased my knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in my field. | | | | | |
| | 3.3 I now had better understand the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to my job. | | | | | |
| | 3.4 I am now more aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in my field. | | | | | |

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 4. Attitude/ Confidence; Self Esteem | 4.1 The training had given me confidence to apply new knowledge on my job. | | | | | |
| | 4.2 The training had given me confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives. | | | | | |
| | 4.3 The training had given me confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere. | | | | | |
| | 4.4 In my opinion my family, friends and neighbors are not aware of the importance of the jobs that I do to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment. | | | | | |
| 5. Skills/ Technical; Management | 5.1 I had acquired new technical skills that enabled me to do my job better. | | | | | |
| | 5.2 I had acquired new ways to solve work problems. | | | | | |
| | 5.3 I had learned new ways to organize people and tasks. | | | | | |
| 6. Impact | 6.1 I am receiving the support of my supervisor and the utility in the application of new knowledge and skills on the job. | | | | | |
| | 6.2 My supervisor is monitoring my application of new knowledge and skills to determine impact on my performance and the performance of my work unit. | | | | | |
| | 6.3 I can see improvements in my performance and the performance of my work unit as a result of the training. | | | | | |

ANNEX B.3 PRE-TRAINING SURVEY SUPERVISOR'S QUESTIONNAIRE

Training Impact Assessment Survey Pre Training Survey/ Supervisor's Questionnaire

Name:

Job position:

Work place:

Please refer to the level of agreement and disagreement by putting (X) in each box:

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | (1) Strongly Disagree | (2) Disagree | (3) Neutral | (4) Agree | (5) Strongly Agree |
|---|---|-----------------------------|-----------------|----------------|--------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Relevance of Training | 1.1 My staff is interested in learning and improving their job skills. | | | | | |
| | 1.2 I only want staff to study topics that are directly related to their current job. | | | | | |
| | 1.3 I want staff to receive complete knowledge of the field regardless of the current relevance. | | | | | |
| 2. Language of Instruction | 2.1 I prefer My staff to study in Arabic. | | | | | |
| | 2.2 I prefer My staff to study in English. | | | | | |
| | 2.3 I have no language preference. | | | | | |
| 3. Knowledge/ Understanding | 3.1 My staff is aware of the new technologies that could improve their performance. | | | | | |
| | 3.2 My staff is not aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields. | | | | | |
| | 3.3 The training should increase staff knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their field. | | | | | |
| | 3.4 My staff currently understands the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their jobs. | | | | | |

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 4. Attitude/ Confidence; Self Esteem | 4.1 I expect the training to give staff confidence to apply new knowledge on their job. | | | | | |
| | 4.2 I expect the training to give staff confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives. | | | | | |
| | 4.3 I expect the training to give staff confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere. | | | | | |
| | 4.4 In my opinion, the families, friends and neighbors of my staff are not aware of the importance of the jobs my staff do to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment. | | | | | |
| 5. Skills/ Technical; Management | 5.1 I expect staff to acquire new technical skills that enable them to do their job better. | | | | | |
| | 5.2 I expect staff to acquire new ways to solve work problems. | | | | | |
| | 5.3 I expect staff to learn new ways to organize people and tasks. | | | | | |
| 6. Impact | 6.1 I intend to support staff in applying new knowledge and skills on the job. | | | | | |
| | 6.2 I intend to monitor the performance of staff after training to assess impact. | | | | | |
| | 6.3 I expect to see improvements in staff and work unit performance as a result of training. | | | | | |

ANNEX B.4 POST-TRAINING ON-JOB FOLLOW-UP SURVEY/ SUPERVISOR QUESTIONNAIRE

Training Impact Assessment Survey

Post Training- On- job Follow Up Survey/ Supervisor’s Questionnaire

Training course:

Trainer:

Venue:

Dates:

Please refer to the level of agreement and disagreement by putting (X) in each box:

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | (1) Strongly Disagree | (2) Disagree | (3) Neutral | (4) Agree | (5) Strongly Agree |
|---|--|-----------------------------|-----------------|----------------|--------------|--------------------------|
| 1. Relevance of Training | 1.1 My staff is interested in learning and improving their job skills. | | | | | |
| | 1.2 I only want staff to study topics that are directly related to their current job. | | | | | |
| | 1.3 I want my staff to receive complete knowledge to the field regardless of the current relevance. | | | | | |
| 2. Language of Instruction | 2.1 I prefer staff to study in Arabic. | | | | | |
| | 2.2 I prefer staff to study in English. | | | | | |
| | 2.3 I have no language preference. | | | | | |
| 3. Knowledge/ Understanding | 3.1 My staff is now more aware of the new technologies that could improve their performance. | | | | | |
| | 3.2 My staff is now more aware of safety equipment and safe O&M procedures in their fields. | | | | | |
| | 3.3 The training had increased staff knowledge of new international developments and new technologies in their field. | | | | | |
| | 3.4 My staff now understands the importance of safe drinking water and/or pollution control laws/regulations to their job. | | | | | |

| Capacity Building - Learning-to-Perform | | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| 4. Attitude/ Confidence; Self Esteem | 4.1 The training has given my staff confidence to apply new knowledge on their jobs. | | | | | |
| | 4.2 The training has given my staff confidence to pursue promotion and career objectives. | | | | | |
| | 4.3 The training has given my staff confidence to pursue job opportunities elsewhere. | | | | | |
| | 4.4 In my opinion the families, friends and neighbors of my staff are not aware of the importance of the jobs that my staff do to protect the public health by providing safe drinking water and/or the importance of controlling pollution to protect the environment. | | | | | |
| 5. Skills/ Technical; Management | 5.1 My staff has acquired new technical skills that enable them to do their job better. | | | | | |
| | 5.2 My staff has acquired new ways to solve work problems. | | | | | |
| | 5.3 My staff has learnt new ways to organize people and tasks. | | | | | |
| 6. Impact | 6.1 I am supporting staff in applying new knowledge and skills on the job. | | | | | |
| | 6.2 I am monitoring the performance of the staff after training to assess impact. | | | | | |
| | 6.3 I can see improvements in staff and work unit performance as a result of training. | | | | | |

Name:
Working Place:
Signature:

Job Title:
Date: