



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

Poverty Alleviation Training For Local Government Batch 2

JAKARTA, 15 APRIL – 20 APRIL 2013

DISCLAIMER

This document is made possible by the support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). Its contents are the sole responsibility of the author or authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States government.



PREFACE

This is the report on the implementation of the Poverty Alleviation Training for Local Governments Batch 2, conducted by the Institute for Economic and Social Research Faculty of Economics, University of Indonesia (LPEM FEUI), in cooperation with the National Team for Accelerating Poverty Reduction (TNP2K) and USAID-SEADI Project, from April 15 to April 20, 2013. This report provides information concerning the training's background, objectives, list of participants, schedule, implementation, and evaluation.

On behalf of LPEM FEUI, we would like to thank TNP2K and USAID-SEADI Project for their cooperation in implementing the training. Last but not least, we also would like to express our appreciation to the training coordinator team that successfully implemented the training.

Jakarta, 30 April 2013

Director

TM. Zakir Machmud, PhD

NUP: 060 703 158



TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	i
I. BACKGROUND	1
II. OBJECTIVES OF THE TRAINING	1
III. TRAINING SCHEDULE	1
VI. TRAINING PARTICIPANTS	2
V. TRAINING IMPLEMENTATION	3
VII. TRAINER EVALUATION	11
VIII. EVALUATION OF TRAINING IMPLEMENTATION	12
APPENDIX 1 DATA OF PARTICIPANTS	15
APPENDIX 2	26
PARTICIPANT'S SCORE	26



TABLE OF APPENDIX

APPENDIX 1 DATA OF PARTICIPANTS.....	15
APPENDIX 2 PARTICIPANT'S SCORE	26





I. BACKGROUND

Poverty has long been a critical issue in Indonesia. Numerous poverty alleviation programs have been conducted, but unfortunately the effectiveness of the programs has always been constrained by a lack of coordination. To improve the coordination of programs, especially at the local level (provincial, district, and municipal), Poverty Alleviation Coordination Teams (*Tim Koordinasi Penanggulangan Kemiskinan*–TKPK) were formed in 2010. This training was initiated to enhance the capacity of TKPK officials, and thus accelerate the process of integrating poverty alleviation programs into local planning and budgeting activities.

II. OBJECTIVES OF THE TRAINING

The Poverty Alleviation Training for Local Governments aims to:

1. increase the capacity of the TKPK at the district level;
2. increase the capacity of the TKPK in coordinating and governing the implementation of poverty reduction programs at the district level;
3. put more emphasis on poverty reduction endeavors in the local governments' programs/activities and budgets;
4. increase effectiveness of poverty reduction programs at the district level.

III. TRAINING SCHEDULE

The training was designed for a five and a half day period, conducted from April 15 to April 20, 2013. Based on evaluation of the training in batch 1, the second batch training was shortened to consist of 28 sessions (with a duration of 90 minutes per session), including a final test and presentation. The period of the training in this batch was shortened to accommodate inputs from local governments because prominent officials that work on local poverty alleviation (mostly echelon 3 and 4) are unable to leave work for more than one week to participate in the training. Moreover, by shortening the training period, the local governments, which bear the costs of participant transportation and accommodation, can financially support their officials' participation in the training.

The training was conducted from Monday to Saturday from 08:30 AM -21:00 PM. More details on the training schedules can be seen in **Table 1**.



Table 1. Training Schedule

 Institute for Economic and Social Research Faculty of Economics University of Indonesia Poverty Alleviation Training for Local Government Batch 2 15 – 20 April 2013								Week 1
Time	Day	Monday 15-Apr-13	Tuesday 16-Apr-13	Wednesday 17-Apr-13	Thursday 18-Apr-13	Friday 19-Apr-13	Saturday 20-Apr-13	Notes
I 08.30 – 10.00		(Dimulai Pukul 08.00) REGISTRASI (08.00 - 08.30) PEMBUKAAN (08.30-09.00) PRE- TEST (09.00-09.30) PENGENALAN PELATIHAN (09.30-10.00)	MEASURING ON POVERTY DATA ARDI ADJI	PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION FOURNAWATI	BUDGET ANALYSIS ADVOCATING TEAM - TNP2K	MONITORING AND EVALUATION MONEV TEAM TNP2K	PRESENTATION	
10.00 – 10.15	COFFEE BREAK							
II 10.15 – 11.45		POVERTY CONCEPT ARI FERDANA	MEASURING ON POVERTY DATA ARDI ADJI	POVERTY PROFILE SPKD & RAD TIM ADVOKASI - TNP2K	BUDGET ANALYSIS ADVOCATING TEAM - TNP2K	FINAL TEST	PRESENTATION	
11.45 – 12.45	LUNCH BREAK							
III 12.45 – 14.15		POVERTY CONCEPT ARI FERDANA	BEST PRACTICE PRIANDOKO	POVERTY PROFILE SPKD & RAD TIM ADVOKASI - TNP2K	BUDGET ANALYSIS ADVOCATING TEAM - TNP2K			
IV 14.15 – 15.45		POLICY AND INSTITUTION IRWAN SURY ANTO	BEST PRACTICE PRIANDOKO	POVERTY PROFILE SPKD & RAD TIM ADVOKASI - TNP2K	MONITORING AND EVALUATION HERA SUSANTI	PRESENTATION TECHNIQUE (13.30 - 15.00) ACHMAD PURWONO	CLOSING CEREMONY (12.00-13.00)	
15.45 – 16.00	COFFEE BREAK							
V 16.00 – 17.30		POLICY AND INSTITUTION IRWAN SURY ANTO	BEST PRACTICE PRIANDOKO	POVERTY PROFILE SPKD & RAD TIM ADVOKASI - TNP2K	MONITORING AND EVALUATION HERA SUSANTI	PRESENTATION TECHNIQUE (15.15-16.45) ACHMAD PURWONO		
17.30 – 19.30	DINNER BREAK							
VI 19.30 – 21.00		GROUP FORMING	PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION FOURNAWATI	POVERTY PROFILE SPKD & RAD TIM ADVOKASI - TNP2K	MONITORING AND EVALUATION HERA SUSANTI	PRESENTATION TECHNIQUE (18.45-20.15) ACHMAD PURWONO		

VI. TRAINING PARTICIPANTS

Twenty-six local government officials participated in the training. These local government officials came from various provinces in Indonesia, e.g.: West Papua, Maluku, North Maluku, Southeast Sulawesi, Central Sulawesi, East Nusa Tenggara, West Nusa Tenggara, East Java, West Java, Jambi, Riau Islands, Bengkulu, North Sumatera, and Aceh.

Prior to the training, most of participants were involved in short-term training and internships, which were held by TNP2K for at least two years. Details on the participants are presented on **Table 2** below, and the participants' biodata is in **Appendix 1**.



Table 2. List of Participants

Poverty Alleviation Training for Local Government 2013

No	Name	Gender	Province	District/City
1	Abdiel Sonasa Amazihono	M	North Sumatera	South Nias
2	Abdul Wahid Syihabuddin, S.Ip	M	West Nusa Tenggara	North Lombok
3	Albet Adya Putra S.Ap	M	Bengkulu	Kaur
4	Andi Hasriati, ST	F	Central Sulawesi	Central Sulawesi
5	Azis Marasabessy	M	Maluku	Central Maluku
6	Chaidir, SE,MM	M	Aceh	Aceh
7	Dedi Abdul Rosyid, SE	M	Bengkulu	Bengkulu
8	Dora Silvia Dewi, SP.,M.Si	F	Aceh	Aceh Tamiang
9	Dra. Merliaty, M.Si	F	East Nusa Tenggara	East Sumba
10	Efendi Monoarfa, SH	M	Central Sulawesi	Tojo Una - Una
11	Fachrir Rachman, ST	M	North Maluku	Tidore
12	Fajar Arief Thamrin	M	Maluku	Maluku
13	Hasrullah.SSTP.,Msi	M	Sotheast Sulawesi	Southeast Sulawesi
14	Ii suhantri	M	Bengkulu	South Bengkulu
15	Ir. Ibrahim, MBA	M	Aceh	Gayo Luwes
16	Irwanto S,Pd,M.Si	M	Riau Islands	Karimun Islands
17	Iwan Sutani Siregar.S.STP,M.Si	M	North Sumatera	North Sumatera
18	Jimmy Dance Nenabu, S.TP	M	East Nusa Tenggara	South Timor Tengah
19	Legius Wanimbo	M	West Papua	West Papua
20	Michael Siahaya	M	Maluku	Maluku
21	Rahmawati. R. Am.D	F	Central Sulawesi	Toli - Toli
22	Sigit Wahyu Widodo W, S.Ip	M	Jambi	Jambi
23	Solihin, S.Sos,MT	M	East Kalimantan	Kutai Kertanegara
24	Sukasa, S.Sos., M.Eng.,M.Sc	M	West Java	Indramayu
25	Umar Hidayat, S.Sos.MM	M	East Java	Probolinggo
26	Zainal Abidin	M	Jambi	Merangin

V. TRAINING IMPLEMENTATION

a. Accomodation

All the participants stayed at the Blue Sky Pandurata Boutique Hotel, Jl. Raden Saleh, Central Jakarta. The training was also conducted there because it was carried out until evening. The hotel was chosen because it is close to the training centre of LPEM – FEUI and TNP2K, which made facilitator mobility easy.



b. Teaching and Learning Activities

The opening ceremony of this training was conducted at 8:30 AM, Monday, April 15, 2013. The ceremony began with the training coordinator's (Mr. Untung Afandi, SE., MM) report on the training preparation activities, followed by a welcoming speech from the Director of LPEM- FEUI, T.M. Zakir Machmud Ph.D, and a speech from Mr. Firman Aji (USAID). The training was formally opened by Dr. Ir. Bambang Widiyanto, MA , Executive Secretary of the TNP2K.

Figure 1. Opening Ceremony



Opening speech by Bapak T.M Zakir Machmud (LPEM FEUI), Bapak Firman Aji (USAID) and official opening by Bapak Bambang Widiyanto (TNP2K).



A group photo after the opening ceremony

Following the opening ceremony, all of the participants were asked to do a pretest. The test consisted of 20 multiple-choice questions prepared by the coordinator team of LPEM–FEUI, and which referred to the training modules.

This training applied adult learning methods. By applying these methods, all participants had an opportunity to ask questions, express their opinions, share their experiences and knowledge, as well as have discussions with trainers and other participants. In order to encourage participants to share knowledge, five small discussion groups were randomly formed. A list of the groups is provided in **Table 3** below.



Table 3

List of Participants in Each Discussion Group

Group 1

Name	Institution
Abdul Wahid Syihabuddin, S.Ip	Bappeda Kab. Lombok Utara
Azis Marasabessy	Bappeda Maluku Tengah
Chaidir, SE,MM	Bappeda Aceh
Ii Suhantri	Bappeda Bengkulu Selatan
Rahmawati	Bappeda Kab. Toli2
Solihin	Bappeda Kutai Kertanegara

Group 2

Name	Institution
Dora silvia Dewi, SP.M.Si	Bappeda Kab.Aceh Tamiang
Irwanto S.pd,M.Si	Bappeda Kab. Karimun Kepri
Michael Siahaya	Bappeda Prov. Maluku
Fachrir Rachman	Bappeda Kota Tidore
Umar Hidayat, S.Sos.MM	Bappeda Kota Probolinggo

Group 3

Name	Institution
Albet Adya Putra S.Ap	Bappeda Kab. Kaur
Dra. Merliaty, M.Si	Bappeda Kabupaten Sumba Timur
Efendi Monoarfa	Bappeda dan PM Kabupaten Tojo Una Una
Sigit wahyu widodo W, Sip	Bappeda Provinsi Jambi
Zainal Abidin	Bappeda Kab. Merangin

Group 4

Name	Institution
Dedi Abdul Rosyid	Bappeda Prov Bengkulu
Iwan Sutani Siregar	Bappeda Prov Sumut
Hasrullah.SSTP.,Msi	Bappeda Prov. Sulawesi Tenggara
Ir. Ibrahim, MBA	Bappeda Kabupaten Gayo Lues
Legius Wanimbo	Bappeda Papua Barat

Group 5

Name	Institution
Abdiel Sonasa Amazihono	Bappeda Kab. Nias selatan
Andi Hasriati	Bappeda Sulteng
Fajar Arief Thamrin	Bappeda Prov. Maluku
Jimmy Dance Nenabu, STP	Bappeda Kab. TTS
Sukasa, S.Sos., M.Eng.,M.Sc	Bappeda Kabupaten Indramayu



The training started at 8:30 am and ran until 21:00 everyday, with a long break in the afternoon from 17:30 until 19:30. The first subject was Poverty Concepts, delivered by Bapak Ari A. Perdana, this was followed by Policy and Institutions of Poverty Alleviation by Bapak G. Irwan Suryanto.

Figure 2. Learning and Teaching Activities



*Enhancing effectiveness of the training by applying adult learning methods.
The participants not only learned about theory, but also case studies and*

On the second day, the first subject was Poverty Data Analysis, which was carried out by Bapak Ardi Adjie from TNP2K, followed by Best Practices of Poverty Alleviation and Problem Identification, which carried out by Ibu Fournawati from LPEM FEUI. Due to the tight schedule, there were no field visits conducted in this training. As a substitute for the field visits, participants were given subjects on Best Practices of Poverty Alleviation.

Before the participants came to Jakarta, they were asked to make a short presentation on poverty alleviation programs in their districts. Out of 26 participants, only 13 participants made presentations. The subject was carried out by Bapak Prihandoko from the Department of



Anthropology, Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of Indonesia. Bapak Prihandoko asked the participants to choose 5 out of the 13 presentations for discussion.

Figure 3. Class Discussion



Group discussion. In this discussion, each group was asked to identify root problems of poverty based on their chosen best practice by using fishbone analysis. The subject was facilitated by Ibu Fournawati and the group results were

On the third day, Poverty Profiles, SPKD and RAD were taught, which were carried out by an advocacy team of TNP2K. This was the main subject of the training, and by end of the training all of the participants were expected to make an SPKD draft for their area. This was followed by Budgeting Analysis, where the participants learned how to make a proper budget for their poverty alleviation program.

On the fourth day, the participants learned how to make a Monitoring and Evaluation plan for their program. The Monitoring and Evaluation concept was carried out by Ibu Hera Susanti from LPEM, and was followed by Bapak Rizal Adi Prima from the Money Team, TNP2K.

A Final Test of the participants was conducted on Friday, 19 April 2013. There were 6 essay questions, which had to be done in 90 minutes. Unfortunately, most of the participants could not



finish all of the questions due to the lack of time. In the evening, they were asked to fill in a post test, but only 25 participants participated in this activity. The questions on the post-test were the same as those in the pre test. Scores of the post-test were compared to scores on the pre test, so that participants' knowledge before and after the training could be compared.

Figure 4. Final Test



There were six essay questions from five different trainers that were to be done

The last subject that was taught was Presentation Skills, carried out by Bapak Achmad Purwono from FEUI. In the first batch training, this subject was called Public Communication, however, based on evaluations of the first batch training, it was changed to Presentation Skills.

The work of each group was presented on the last day of training. The presentations were facilitated by Ibu S.M Fournawati and Bapak Himawan Fuady. In general, both facilitators thought that most participants were able to make good SPKD drafts and presentations. The presentation session can be seen in the photographs below.



Figure 5. Group Presentation



Each group presented their SPKD and fishbone analysis as part of their training assessment.

A closing ceremony of the training was held on Saturday, April 20th, 2013 at 12:00 PM, and was attended by Ibu Thia Jasmina (Vice Director of Research and Training, LPEM FEUI), Ibu Moekti Soejachmoen (Senior Economist USAID SEADI Project), M. Arif Tasrif (Head of Advocacy Team TNP2K), and officially closed by Bapak Firman Aji (USAID).

VI. TRAINING PARTICIPANTS EVALUATION

The evaluation of participants was based on the following assessments:

1. Daily attendance per session of training with a minimum attendance rate of 90%;
2. Pretest and Post Test;
3. Activity score



4. Final Exam

5. Presentation

The average participant attendance rate was 97.25%. There were 5 participants who arrived late on the first day due to their flights from their districts. Of the 26 participants, there was one participant with a very low attendance rate, 53.57%, so this participant was not eligible to receive a training certificate. In addition, this participant did not participate in the Post Test (Bapak Efendi Monoarfa from Kabupaten Tojo Una – Una, Central Sulawesi).

The average score on the pre-test in this training was 46.15, with the highest score a 75 and the lowest score a 30. The post-test was conducted after the final examination, where the average score of participants was 56.54, with the highest score a 90 and the lowest score a 30. Comparing scores of the pre-test and post-test, the participants' scores increased an average of 28.71%, with the highest increase of 180%. Nevertheless, there were participants who experienced a decline of 26.67%.

Based on the results of the final examination, the highest average score was 74.33, which was achieved by Bapak Abdil Sonasa Amazihono from Kabupaten South Nias, and the lowest was 22.5, achieved by Bapak Efendi Monoarfa from Kab. Tojo Una – Una. The average score was 47.68. Due to time limits, most of the participants could not finish all of the questions on the Final Exam. Most of them only did 3 out of the 6 questions on the Final Exam.

On the last day of the training, the participants were asked to present their SPKD and problem identification. From these activities, their SPKD and presentation quality was scored by Ibu Fournawati and Bapak Himawan. In addition to group assessment, individual participation was also assessed based on involvement of each participant during the group work. The highest score was reached by Bapak Azis Marasabessy, with an average score of 78.75. This was followed by Ibu Merliaty, with an average score of 77.5.

Based on the overall assessment, the highest final score was achieved by Bapak Zainal Abidin from Kab. Merangin, with a final score of 73.94, which was followed by Bapak Abdul Wahid Syihabuddin from Kab. North Lombok, with a final score of 73.18. The lowest final score was 22.89, achieved by Bapak Efendi Monoarfa from Kab. Tojo Una Una. **Appendix 2** shows the assessment scores of each participant.

VII. TRAINER EVALUATION

Trainer evaluation questionnaires were given to participants every other day. The participants were asked to assess: (i) trainer's knowledge/comprehension on the subject; (ii) teaching effectiveness; (iii) facilitation skills; and (iv) participant satisfaction. Results of the evaluation of each facilitator are provided in **Table 4**.



Table 4. Evaluation of Facilitators & Resource Persons

TRAINER	Fitness for Purpose	The Mastery of Training Subject	Clarity and Systematics of Subject Delivery	Fitness for Training Materials	Timeliness	Method	Behaviour	Language	Respond to Questions	Motivating	Facilities Utilization	Average
Tim Advokasi SPKD RAD	5,95	5,95	5,86	5,81	5,71	5,86	5,95	5,90	5,90	5,86	5,67	5,86
Achmad Purwono	5,88	5,88	5,71	5,71	5,75	5,75	5,83	5,92	5,67	5,79	5,67	5,78
Fournawati	5,59	5,81	5,50	5,64	5,50	5,68	5,86	5,73	5,73	5,64	5,59	5,66
Ardie Adjie	5,57	5,74	5,43	5,61	5,48	5,39	5,70	5,52	5,52	5,48	5,52	5,54
Prihandoko Sanjtmiko	5,39	5,35	5,22	5,30	5,22	5,26	5,43	5,43	5,17	5,26	5,30	5,30
Tim Advokasi Evaluasi Anggaran	5,45	5,05	4,95	5,32	5,64	5,23	5,50	5,32	5,14	5,14	5,05	5,25
Ari A. Perdana	5,31	5,23	5,23	5,27	5,09	5,00	5,41	5,45	5,23	5,27	5,14	5,24
Hera Susanti	5,19	5,09	4,9	5,33	5,38	5,29	5,52	5,24	5,33	5,05	5,14	5,22
G. Irwan Suryanto	5,23	5,23	4,95	5,14	5,00	5,00	5,45	5,36	5,09	5,14	4,95	5,14
Tim Monev TNP2K	5,04	5	4,83	5,25	5,17	5,04	5,54	5,33	5,04	5,00	5,25	5,14

There were 10 trainers involved in this training. All of the participants were “very satisfied” or “satisfied” with the trainers. Although, if we look into details, there were a few categories that were scored “quite satisfied” by the participants, such as the systematics of subject delivery, where four trainers scored “quite satisfied.” The Advocacy Team of TNP2K reached the highest average score, 5.86 (scale 1 to 6), on the subject Poverty Profiles. This means that almost all of the participants were very satisfied with the quality of the trainers and that the subject fits with their work. The second highest average was Bapak Achmad Purwono from the Faculty of Economics, University of Indonesia, who taught Presentation Techniques, with an average score of 5.78. The third highest average score was Ibu Fournawati from LPEM FEUI who taught problem identification with an average score of 5.66.

VIII. EVALUATION ON TRAINING IMPLEMENTATION

Based on the evaluation of the training implementation, most of participants agreed that the training was appropriate to their work. Indeed, 52.38% of the participants thought that the training was appropriate to their work. In addition, most participants also felt that the training could increase their capacity.

The most valuable training subjects for participants were Poverty Profiles, SPKD, RAD (72.73% participants), followed by Budget Analysis (63.64% participants), and Presentation Techniques (59.09% participants).

Interrelation and group dynamics are crucial to training implementation. In this training, about 63.64% of the participants strongly agreed that the atmosphere during the training was always active and cooperative. Furthermore, they felt that the training could increase their network. By the end of this training, the participants made a Facebook page named “Komunitas



Penanggulangan Kemiskinan Daerah,” and they hope that through this page they can interact with each other and discuss the poverty alleviation programs in their districts, not only with other participants, but also with TNP2K and LPEM FEUI.

If we look at the training implementation as a whole, approximately 67.9% of participants strongly agree that the existing training facilities were properly available and suitable for the training. Furthermore, 72.73% of the participants were very satisfied with the provided meals, and 56.25% were very satisfied with the accommodations. 61.9% of participants strongly agreed on the performance of the training coordinator. Overall, 63.16% of participants were very satisfied with the training. They also thought that the length of the training was enough, a total of 76.47%. These percentages are in table below.

Table 5. Overall Training Evaluation (%)

INDICATORS/SCALE	Strongly disagree/ not satisfied					Strongly agree/ satisfied
	1	2	3	4	5	6
TRAINING SUBJECT						
Appropriate to Work			14.29	4.76	28.57	52.38
Appropriate to Participants' Expectations			19.05	9.52	38.1	33.33
Improvement of Participants' Capacity			9.52	9.52	19.05	61.9
BENEFIT OF THE SUBJECT						
Poverty Concept				4.55	36.36	59.09
Policy and Institution of Poverty Alleviation				13.64	40.91	45.45
Poverty Data Measurement				4.55	45.45	50
Best Practice				18.18	27.27	54.55
Problem Identification				9.09	36.36	54.55
Poverty Profile, SPKD, RAD					27.27	72.73
Budget Analysis			4.55	9.09	22.73	63.64
Monitoring and Evaluation			4.55	13.64	27.27	54.55
Presentation Technique				19.05	23.81	57.14
Group Work Presentation				13.64	27.27	59.09
TRAINERS EVALUATION						
Comprehension of the subject				13.64	45.45	40.91
Systematics in delivering the subject				13.64	50	35.36
Facilitation/teaching methods				13.64	40.91	45.45



INDICATORS/SCALE	Strongly disagree/ not satisfied						Strongly agree/ satisfied					
	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
TRAINING PARTICIPANTS												
Cooperation among the participants										36.36		63.64
Participants have involved during the training and will maintain communication after the training. The training has enhanced participants' networking					9.52					23.81		66.67
ACHIEVEMENT OF TRAINING OBJECTIVES												
I already understand the concept and implementation of the subject					13.64					59.09		27.27
I could implement the training on my work					4.55					50		45.45
The training is very useful to increase human resource's capacity of my institution					4.54					36.36		59.09
I am interested in participating in another related training				4.76	4.76					19.05		71.43
TRAINING IMPLEMENTATION												
Readiness and availability of the training facilities				4.55	18.18					22.73		54.55
Readiness and availability of the training supporting facilities				10.53	26.32					36.84		26.32
Readiness and availability of the other training supporting facilities					19.08					19.08		67.9
Readiness and compatibility of training materials				4.76	9.52					42.86		42.86
Compatibility between training implementation and planning				5.06	20					35		40
Consumption during the training				4.55	4.55					18.18		72.73
Accommodation during the training		6.25	6.25	6.25	6.25					25		56.25
Organizer performance					4.76					33.33		61.9
Overall training organization					10.53					26.32		63.16



INDICATORS/SCALE	Strongly disagree/ not satisfied						Strongly agree/ satisfied					
	1	2	3	4	5	6	1	2	3	4	5	6
Period of the training *	23.53	76.47										

*1= too short 2= enough 3= too long

APPENDIX 1 DATA OF PARTICIPANTS

Abdiel Sonasa Amazihono, S.STP., M.Ec.Dev	
Jabatan	: Kepala Bidang Perekonomi
Instansi	: Bappeda Kabupaten Nias Selatan
Kantor	: Jl. Saonigehe Km 3,5, Telukdalam, Nias Selatan, Sumut
Telp./Fax	: (0630) 7321438
Rumah	: Jl. Kartini Samping SD Inpres Telukdalam
Telp./HP	: HP: 085292932920
Alumni	: UGM, FE & Bisnis, Ekonomi Pemb./Pemb, Daerah
Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	: Gunungsitoli, 26 Agustus 1983
NIP	: 19830826 200112 1 002
Golongan	: III/c
Agama	: Kristen
Email	: kent.amazihono@gmail.com
2. Abdul Wahid Syihabuddin, S.IP	
Jabatan	: Staf Program dan Pelaporan
Instansi	: Bappeda Kabupaten Lombok Utara, Provinsi NTB
Kantor	: Jl. Raya Tanjung - Bayan
Telp./Fax	: (0370) 6147694 Fax: (0370) 6147694
Rumah	: Jl. Kenanga No. 1, BTN Pakel Gnungsari, Lombok Utara NTB
Telp./HP	: HP: 081931239131
Alumni	: Univ. Mataram, FE, Keuangan Daerah
Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	: Mataram, 14 Februari 1988



	NIP	:	19880214 200701 1 001
	Golongan	:	Penata Muda, III/a
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	abdul.0418@yahoo.co.id
3.	Albet Adya Putra, S.AP.		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Sekretariat
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Kaur, Provinsi Bengkulu
	Kantor	:	Jl. Ki Hajar Dewantara, Komp. Perkantoran Padang Kempas, Bintuhan, Bengkulu
	Telp./Fax	:	(0739) 61061
	Rumah	:	Desa Pasar Saoh Kec. Kaur Selatan, Kaur, Bengkulu
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081278876181
	Alumni	:	STIA LAN, Jakarta
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Manna, 30 Agustus 1985
	NIP	:	19850830 200312 1 002
	Golongan	:	III/a
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	albettadyaputra@yamaail.com
4.	Andi Hasriati, ST		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Pengendalian, Monitoring dan Evaluasi
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Sulawesi Tengah
	Kantor	:	Jl. Prof. Dr. Moh. Yamin No. 7, Palu 94121
	Telp./Fax	:	(0451) 421845 Fax: (0451) 451560
	Rumah	:	BTN Biromaru Indah Blok A/16, Jl. Karanja Lemba, Palu
	Telp./HP	:	081341401905
	Alumni	:	Univ. Tadulako, Palu, FT, Teknik Sipil
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Parigi, 6 Januari 1975
	NIP	:	19750106 201001 2 001
	Golongan	:	III/a
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	dalmnev_32@yahoo.co.id
5.	Azis Marasabessy, ST		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Sosial Budaya
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Maluku Tengah, Prov. Maluku
	Kantor	:	Jl. Imam Bonjol, Masohi, Maluku Tengah



	Telp./Fax	:	(0914) 22306	Fax: (0914) 22306
	Rumah	:	Jl. Kapitan Pattimura , Masohi, Maluku Tengah	
	Telp./HP	:	085242524232	
	Alumni	:	UNHAS, Makasar, FT, Teknik Mesin, Industri	
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Hawai, 13 Januari 1980	
	NIP	:	19800113 200604 1 010	
	Golongan	:	III/b	
	Agama	:	Islam	
	Email	:	azmarssy@gmail.com	
6.	Chaidir, SE., MM			
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Perencanaan Pembangunan Keistimewaan dan SDM Aceh	
	Instansi	:	BAPPEDA Aceh	
	Kantor	:	Jl. H.M. Daud Beureueh No. 26, Banda Aceh	
	Telp./Fax	:	(0651) 21440	Fax: (0651) 33654
	Rumah	:	Jl. Melati, Desa Blang Oi, Kec. Meraxa, Kota Banda Aceh	
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081360986600	
	Alumni	:	UNSYAH, FE, Manajemen	
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Blang Asan, Sigli, 5 Maret 1984	
	NIP	:	19840305 200302 1 008	
	Golongan	:	III/a	
	Agama	:	Islam	
	Email	:	Adcf.aceh@yahoo.com	
7.	Dedi Abdul Rosyid, SE			
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Sosial Budaya	
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Bengkulu	
	Kantor	:	Jl. Pembangunan No. 01, Kota Bengkulu	
	Telp./Fax	:	(0736) 21502 - 27696	
	Rumah	:	Jl. Batanghari No. 02, Kota Bengkulu	
	Telp./HP	:	085267242059	
	Alumni	:	Univ. Muhammadiyah Malang, FE, SP	
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Majalengka, 13 Juli 1976	
	NIP	:	19760713 201101 1 001	
	Golongan	:	Penata Muda, III/a	
	Agama	:	Islam	
	Email	:	dedigrafer@yahoo.co.id	



8.	Dora Silvia Dewi, SP., M.Si		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubbid Perekonomian dan Pemerintahan
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Aceh Tamiang
	Kantor	:	Komplek Perkantoran Pemkab Aceh Tamiang
	Telp./Fax	:	(0641) 7447043 Fax: (0641) 7447043
	Rumah	:	Desa Bundar, Kec. Karang Baru, Aceh Tamiang
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 085280300771
	Alumni	:	IPB, Pertanian, Ilmu Tanah
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	15 Agustus 1978
	NIP	:	19780815 200604 2 003
	Golongan	:	Penata, (III/c)
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	dorarilvia@ymail.com
9.	Efendi Monoarfa, SH		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubid Pemberdayaan dan Penanggulangan Kemiskinan
	Instansi	:	Bappeda dan PM Kabupaten Tojo Una-Una, Provinsi Sulawesi Tengah
	Kantor	:	Jl. Merdeka Kota Bumi Mas, Tojo Una-Una 94683
	Telp./Fax	:	(0464) 21499/21007 Fax: (0464) 21007
	Rumah	:	Jl. Tanjung Kramat, Kelurahan Dondo, Tojo Una-Una
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081354272765
	Alumni	:	Unismuh Palu, FH, Ilmu Hukum
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Ampam, 30 November 1963
	NIP	:	19631130 198412 1 003
	Golongan	:	Penata Tingkat I, III/d
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	-
10.	Fachrir Rachman, ST		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Sosial Budaya
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kota Tidore Kepulauan
	Kantor	:	Jl. Sultan Mansyur No. 1 Tidore Kepulauan, Maluku Utara
	Telp./Fax	:	(0921) 3162170
	Rumah	:	Jl. Ssssultan Hasanuddin Rt 03 Rw 01, Indonesia
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081244483344



	Alumni	:	ITNM, T. Sssipil dan Perencanaan, T. Planologi
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	-
	NIP	:	19800713 201001 1 014
	Golongan	:	III/a
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	bangkit_tidore@yahoo.com
11.	Fajar Arief Thamrin, S.Hut., M.Si		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang SDA, Lh dan Prasarana Wilayah
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Maluku
	Kantor	:	Jl. Raya Pattimura No. 1, Ambon
	Telp./Fax	:	-
	Rumah	:	Gang Diponegoro No. 2 Rt. 01 Rw 001 Kel. Urimessing Kota Ambon, Maluku
	Telp./HP	:	(0911) 315773 HP: 081247400233
	Alumni	:	UNHAS, PPW, PPW
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Ambon, 23 Februari 1980
	NIP	:	19800223 200904 1 002
	Golongan	:	III/b
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	fajararief23@gmail.com
12.	Hasrullah, S.STP., M.Si		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubbid. Pemerintahan, Pendidikan dan Kependudukan
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Sulawesi Tenggara
	Kantor	:	Jl. Mayjen. S. Parman No. 2, Kendari, Sulawaesi Tenggara
	Telp./Fax	:	(0401) 3121094 Fax: (0401) 3126150
	Rumah	:	Jl. Bunga Duri I No. 6, Kel. Lahundape, Kendari
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081393002033
	Alumni	:	UNS Surakarta, Magister Administrasi Publik (MAP)
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Kendari, 16 Juni 1977
	NIP	:	19770616 199511 1 001
	Golongan	:	Penata Tingkat I, (III/d)
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	hasrullah.bappedasultra@yahoo.com



13	Ir. Ibrahim, MBA		
	Jabatan	:	Sekretaris Bappeda
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Aceh Gayo Lues
	Kantor	:	Jl. T. Machmud No. 03, Komp. Kantor Bupati Gayo Lues
	Telp./Fax	:	(0642) 21599 Fax: (0642) 21599
	Rumah	:	Jl. T. Machmud Luddin No. 149, Gayo Lues, Aceh
	Telp./HP	:	(0642) 21599 HP: 085275673225
	Alumni	:	Dilly Jakarta, Marketing
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Blang Kejeren, 28 Oktober 1962
	NIP	:	19621028 198902 1 002
	Golongan	:	IV/b
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	ibrahimmas2810@yahoo.co.id ; tkpkkabgayolues@yahoo.co.id
14	II Suhantri, SP., M.Si		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubid SDA dan Lingkungan
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Bengkulu Selatan
	Kantor	:	Jl. Affan Bachsin, Bengkulu Selatan
	Telp./Fax	:	(0739) 21475 Fax: (0739) 21475
	Rumah	:	Jl. Jend. Sudirman No. 134, Bengkulu Selatan, Bengkulu
	Telp./HP	:	(0739) 21087 HP: 08127397990
	Alumni	:	Univ. Bengkulu, Pertanian, Pengelolaan Sumber Daya Alam Lingkungan
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Padang Leban, 14 April 1981
	NIP	:	19810414 200604 1 004
	Golongan	:	III/c
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	dhankii@rocketmail.com
15.	Irwanto, S.Pd., M.Si		
	Jabatan	:	Kepala Bidang Ekonomi, Statistik dan SDA
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Karimun, Provinsi Kepri
	Kantor	:	Jl. Jend. Sudirman, Karimun, Kepri
	Telp./Fax	:	(0777) 7366052 Fax: (0777) 7366052
	Rumah	:	Meral Karimun



		Telp./HP	:	HP: 081266556667
		Alumni	:	STIA YAPPAN Jakarta
		Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Kundur, 10 Maret 1972
		NIP	:	19720310 199303 1 009
		Golongan	:	III/c
		Agama	:	Islam
		Email	:	ekstasda13@yahoo.co.id
16.	Iwan Sutani Siregar, SSTP., M.Si			
		Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Perencanaan SDM/Sosial Budaya
		Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Sumatera Utara
		Kantor	:	Jl. P. Diponegoro No. 21 A, Medan
		Telp./Fax	:	(061) 4538045 Fax : (061) 4513830
		Rumah	:	Jl. Kemuning 12 No. 236, Perumnas Helvetia, Medan
		Telp./HP	:	HP: 085220030917
		Alumni	:	STPDN Jatinangor, Magister Adm. Pemerintah Daerah
		Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Pematangsiantar, 6 April 1981
		NIP	:	19810406 200012 1 001
		Golongan	:	III/c
		Agama	:	Islam
		Email	:	iwansutani.siregar@yahoo.co.id ; tkpk_sumut@yahoo.co.id
17.	Jimmy Dance Nenabu			
		Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Ekonomi
		Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Timor Tengah Selatan, Prov. NTT
		Kantor	:	Jl. Gunung Mollo No. 47
		Telp./Fax	:	(0388) 22862 Fax : (0388) 21692
		Rumah	:	Jl. Melati Soe, Timor Timur Selatan, NTT
		Telp./HP	:	HP: 081236219780
		Alumni	:	UNKRIS Artha Wacana, Kupang
		Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Kupang, 08 Juni 1977
		NIP	:	19770608 200804 1 003
		Golongan	:	Penata Muda Tk. I, (III/b)
		Agama	:	Kristen
		Email	:	nenabujimmy@yahoo.co.id



18.	Legius Wanimbo, S.Pt., MM		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubag Umum dan Kepegawaian
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Papua Barat
	Kantor	:	Jl. Yogyakarta, No. 1, Manokwari 98311
	Telp./Fax	:	(0986) 215670/215671 Fax: (0986) 21567a0/215671
	Rumah	:	KPR BTN Sowi III, Manokwari
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 085244114427
	Alumni	:	STIE Artha Bodhi Iswara, Surabaya
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Soba, 9 Desember 1976
	NIP	:	19761209 200605 1 001
	Golongan	:	Penata (III.c)
	Agama	:	Kristen
	Email	:	bappedapapubarat@yahoo.co.id : one_lg@yahoo.com
19	Dra. Merliaty, M.Si.		
	Jabatan	:	Kepala Bidang Penelitian dan Pengembangan
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Sumba Timur, Provinsi NTT
	Kantor	:	Jl. Jend. Suharto No. 42, Sumba timur
	Telp./Fax	:	(0387) 61383 Fax: (0387) 61383
	Rumah	:	Jl. Sultan Agung, Wara, Waingapu, Sumba Timur-NTT
	Telp./HP	:	(0387) 62813 HP: 081353987370
	Alumni	:	UNPAD, Bandung, Ilmu Pemerintahan
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Banda Aceh, 17 Oktober 1967
	NIP	:	19671017 198603 2 001
	Golongan	:	Pembina, (IV/a)
	Agama	:	Protestan
	Email	:	merliatys@ymail.com
20.	Michael Luky Siahaya, S.Sos		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Bidang Penelitian, Pengendalian dan Pengembangan Pembangunan Daerah
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Maluku
	Kantor	:	Jl. Raya Pattimura No. 1, Ambon, Maluku 97124
	Telp./Fax	:	-
	Rumah	:	-
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081343411718



	Alumni	:	UNPATTI, ISIP, Ilmu Pemerintahan
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Ambon, 25 April 1981
	NIP	:	19810425 201001 1 028
	Golongan	:	Penata Muda, III/a
	Agama	:	Kristen Protestan
	Email	:	michaelsiahaya@yahoo.com
21.	Rahmawati R, A.Md.		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Sub Bidang Sosial Budaya
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Tolitoli, Prov. Sulawesi Tengah
	Kantor	:	Jl. Ismail Bantilan No. 17 Panasakan, Tolitli
	Telp./Fax	:	(0453) 22533 Fax: (0453) 22533
	Rumah	:	Jl. Merpati No. 10 Tuweley, Tolitoli
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 085258782845/081342731375
	Alumni	:	Politeknik Negeri UjungPandang, Teknik, Elektro, Telekomunikasi
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Tolitoli, 20 Februari 1982
	NIP	:	19820220 200801 1 007
	Golongan	:	Pengatur Tk. I (II/d)
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	sosbud.bappeda.tolis@gmail.com
22.	Sigit Wahyu Widodo Sudarto, S.Sos.		
	Jabatan	:	Staf Pelaksana Bidang Sumber Daya Manusia, Pemerintahan dan Sosial Budaya
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Provinsi Jambi
	Kantor	:	Jl. Nur Atmadibrata No. 1, Jambi
	Telp./Fax	:	(0741) 62507, 63494 Fax: (0741) 65598, 62122
	Rumah	:	Jl. Jawa No. 76 Rt 22 Kebun Handil, Jambi
	Telp./HP	:	(0741) 41689 HP: 082180148100
	Alumni	:	UI Depok. Sospol, Ilmu Politik
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Jambi, 22 Juni 1986
	NIP	:	19860622 201001 1 008
	Golongan	:	III/a
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	cancerboyui@yahoo.com , sigitwahyuwido22@gmail.com



23.	Solihin, S.Sos., MT		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubid Pengkajian Pembangunan Daerah
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kutai Kartanegara
	Kantor	:	Jl. Wolter Monginsidi, Kel. Timbaw, Kec. Tenggarong
	Telp./Fax	:	-
	Rumah	:	Jl. Danau Upan, Kel. Melayu, Kec. Tenggarong Kab. Kutai Kartanegara, Kaltim
	Telp./HP	:	(0541) 665445 HP: 08215451299
	Alumni	:	UGM, Teknik Sipil, MPKD
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Samboja, 29 Oktober 1972
	NIP	:	19721029 199102 1 001
	Golongan	:	III/d
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	sol_pendakalar@yahoo.co.id
24.	Sukasa, S.Sos., M.Eng., M.Sc		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubid Pemerintahan
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Indramayu - Jabar
	Kantor	:	Jl. Letjen. S. Parman 15 indramayu
	Telp./Fax	:	(0234) 271711 Fax: (0234) 271711
	Rumah	:	Komplek Jatibarang Baru Indah Jl. Adipati Wiragora 24, Indramayu
	Telp./HP	:	HP: 081286962045
	Alumni	:	UGM
	Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Indramayu, 14 Oktober 1974
	NIP	:	19741014 199303 1 001
	Golongan	:	III/d
	Agama	:	Islam
	Email	:	Franzblagador07@yahoo.com
25.	Umar Hidayat, S.Sos., MM		
	Jabatan	:	Kasubid Industri, Jasa dan Investasi pada Bidang Ekonomi
	Instansi	:	Bappeda Kota Probolinggo
	Kantor	:	Jl. Raya Soekarno Hatta No. 52, Probolinggo, Jatim
	Telp./Fax	:	(0335) 4438991 Fax: (0335) 42732
	Rumah	:	Jl. Suyoso No. 73, Probolinggo
	Telp./HP	:	(0355) 421021 HP: 0813539012
	Alumni	:	Univ. Merdeka Malang, Pasca Sarjana Magister Manajemen



		Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Madiun, 21 April 1975
		NIP	:	19750421 199402 1 001
		Golongan	:	III/c
		Agama	:	Islam
		Email	:	Hadyan_hidayat@yahoo.co.id
26.	Zainal Abidin, SE., MT			
		Jabatan	:	Kasubbid Pertanian
		Instansi	:	Bappeda Kabupaten Merangin
		Kantor	:	Jl. Jend. Sudirman No. 4, Bangko
		Telp./Fax	:	(0746) 21288 Fax: (0746) 322506
		Rumah	:	Griya Taman Hidayah Belakang Rina Market No. 07 Marangin, Jambi
		Telp./HP	:	HP: 08117402630
		Alumni	:	ITS Surabaya, Teknik Sipil, Aset Infrastruktur
		Tempat/Tgl. Lahir	:	Jambi, 9 Agustus 1974
		NIP	:	19740809 199403 1 003
		Golongan	:	III/d
		Agama	:	Islam
		Email	:	kak_inal@yahoo.com



**APPENDIX 2
PARTICIPANT SCORES**

Nama	PRE TEST	POST TEST	Kenaikan	Presentasi Fournawati	Presentasi Himawan	SPKD Fournawati	SPKD Himawan	Rata - Rata	Ari AP	Irwan	Ardi	Prihandoko	Fournawati	Advokasi	Advokasi	Rizal	Rata - Rata	Kehadiran	Ujian Ari	Ujian Irwan	Ujian Ardi	Ujian ADV	Ujian ADV	Ujian Hera	Rata - Rata Ujian	NILAI AKHIR
Abdiel Sonasa Amazihono	40.00	50.00	25.00	65.00	62.50	70.00	60.00	64.38	90.00	90.00	90.00	85.00	70.00	70.00	70.00	10.00	71.88	100.00	65.00	60.00	90.00	96.00	85.00	50.00	74.33	71.61
Abdul Wahid Syihabuddin	40.00	55.00	37.50	80.00	70.00	78.00	75.00	75.75	100.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	80.00	70.00	75.00	65.00	75.63	100.00	70.00	50.00	50.00	96.00	85.00	60.00	68.50	73.18
Albet Adya Putra	45.00	45.00	0.00	65.00	65.00	70.00	70.00	67.50	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	10.00	60.00	92.86	95.00	0.00	90.00	50.00	0.00	0.00	39.17	55.33
Andi Hasriati	55.00	70.00	27.27	65.00	60.00	70.00	60.00	63.75	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	70.00	50.00	50.00	40.00	64.38	100.00	0.00	0.00	90.00	35.00	75.00	30.00	38.33	57.93
Azis Marasabessy	45.00	65.00	44.44	80.00	80.00	80.00	75.00	78.75	100.00	75.00	90.00	85.00	80.00	70.00	50.00	65.00	76.88	100.00	90.00	70.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	26.67	58.39
Chaidir	35.00	65.00	85.71	70.00	77.50	75.00	75.00	74.38	90.00	90.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	65.00	73.13	100.00	65.00	50.00	90.00	10.00	0.00	0.00	35.83	60.40
Dedi Abdul Rasyid	45.00	50.00	11.11	70.00	65.00	70.00	65.00	67.50	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	10.00	60.00	100.00	0.00	65.00	70.00	55.00	0.00	0.00	31.67	53.54
Dora Silvia Dewi	25.00	70.00	180.00	70.00	62.50	70.00	75.00	69.38	90.00	40.00	93.00	85.00	70.00	50.00	50.00	10.00	61.00	100.00	75.00	77.50	70.00	20.00	0.00	0.00	40.42	59.66
Efendi Monoarfa	35.00	0.00	-100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	50.00	50.00	50.00	0.00	56.88	53.57	40.00	10.00	40.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	15.00	19.89
Fachrir Rachman	30.00	60.00	100.00	80.00	70.00	80.00	75.00	76.25	100.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	70.00	50.00	10.00	63.75	100.00	70.00	80.00	70.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	36.67	59.29
Fajar Arief Thamrin	75.00	55.00	-26.67	75.00	60.00	70.00	60.00	66.25	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	40.00	63.75	96.43	0.00	20.00	90.00	85.00	90.00	90.00	62.50	66.27
Hasrullah	40.00	45.00	12.50	78.00	65.00	70.00	65.00	69.50	90.00	40.00	96.00	85.00	80.00	70.00	50.00	10.00	65.13	100.00	0.00	0.00	70.00	72.00	50.00	0.00	32.00	54.44
Ibrahim	40.00	60.00	50.00	75.00	65.00	70.00	65.00	68.75	90.00	90.00	90.00	85.00	75.00	50.00	70.00	55.00	75.63	100.00	0.00	50.00	40.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	15.00	50.53
Ii Suhantri	45.00	55.00	22.22	78.00	72.50	75.00	75.00	75.13	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	70.00	67.50	100.00	50.00	65.00	15.00	40.00	0.00	70.00	40.00	60.41
Irwanto	45.00	55.00	22.22	75.00	80.00	70.00	75.00	75.00	90.00	90.00	90.00	85.00	75.00	70.00	70.00	85.00	81.88	100.00	97.50	65.00	90.00	35.00	0.00	0.00	47.92	65.70
Iwan Sutani Siregar	65.00	55.00	-15.38	70.00	67.50	70.00	65.00	68.13	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	70.00	80.00	40.00	70.00	100.00	87.50	60.00	75.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	37.08	57.86
Jimmy Dance Nenabu	30.00	50.00	66.67	60.00	62.50	70.00	60.00	63.13	90.00	40.00	92.00	85.00	70.00	70.00	50.00	40.00	67.13	100.00	70.00	55.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	20.83	49.18
Legius Wanimbo	55.00	50.00	-9.09	70.00	70.00	70.00	65.00	68.75	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	70.00	50.00	10.00	62.50	100.00	90.00	60.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	25.00	51.56
Merliaty	65.00	90.00	38.46	80.00	80.00	80.00	70.00	77.50	90.00	75.00	95.00	85.00	80.00	70.00	75.00	65.00	79.38	92.86	65.00	65.00	92.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	37.08	64.40
Michael Siahaya	45.00	60.00	33.33	78.00	75.00	75.00	75.00	75.75	90.00	90.00	90.00	85.00	80.00	50.00	50.00	85.00	77.50	96.43	40.00	40.00	90.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	28.33	57.54
Rahmawati	40.00	35.00	-12.50	65.00	67.50	70.00	75.00	69.38	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	10.00	60.00	100.00	90.00	80.00	0.00	90.00	0.00	0.00	43.33	57.18
Sigit Wahyu Widodo W	45.00	70.00	55.56	70.00	65.00	80.00	70.00	71.25	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	50.00	40.00	63.75	100.00	0.00	65.00	97.50	28.00	0.00	0.00	31.75	57.08
Solihin	50.00	65.00	30.00	80.00	72.50	75.00	75.00	75.63	100.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	80.00	10.00	65.00	100.00	90.00	87.50	95.00	20.00	0.00	0.00	48.75	64.66
Sukasa	55.00	65.00	18.18	75.00	65.00	75.00	60.00	68.75	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	70.00	50.00	10.00	62.50	96.43	0.00	90.00	80.00	75.00	0.00	0.00	40.83	59.04
Umar Hidayat	40.00	60.00	50.00	65.00	70.00	70.00	75.00	70.00	90.00	90.00	90.00	85.00	65.00	50.00	70.00	10.00	68.75	100.00	75.00	80.00	50.00	65.00	0.00	0.00	45.00	61.81
Zainal Abidin	70.00	70.00	0.00	70.00	75.00	70.00	70.00	71.25	90.00	40.00	90.00	85.00	85.00	70.00	80.00	80.00	77.50	100.00	97.50	80.00	85.00	75.00	75.00	0.00	68.75	73.94
Rata - Rata	46.15	56.54	28.71	69.58	66.35	70.12	66.54	68.14	91.54	54.23	90.62	85.00	69.62	59.23	58.46	36.35	68.13	97.25	54.71	54.81	62.69	36.42	17.69	11.54	39.64	58.49