

XD-ABB-741-1A  
68172

**EVALUATION OF PL 480  
TITLE I AND TITLE III AGREEMENTS  
AND  
CREDIT PROGRAMS CARRIED OUT BY THE  
EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT**



**PREPARED FOR USAID/BOLIVIA**

**CONTRACT NO. LAC-0000-C00-6032**

**NEW MEXICO STATE UNIVERSITY**

**LAS CRUCES, NEW MEXICO 88003-0001**

**OCTOBER 1989**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

EVALUATION TEAM . . . . .	1
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY . . . . .	2
The PL-480 Executive Secretariat . . . . .	2
PL-480 Program Activities . . . . .	4
Summary of Recommendations made by the Evaluation Committee . . . . .	5
General . . . . .	5
Agricultural Production and Marketing Credit . . . . .	6
Wheat Policy Marketing and Production . . . . .	6
Health and Nutrition . . . . .	6
Education and Training . . . . .	7
Community Infrastructure . . . . .	7
Seed Improvement . . . . .	7
SCOPE OF WORK . . . . .	7
METHODOLOGY USED IN DETERMINING IMPACT OF PL-480 PROGRAMS . . . . .	10
Analysis . . . . .	10
EVALUATION OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT . . . . .	11
ES Evaluation Procedures . . . . .	11
Executive Secretariat Response . . . . .	12
PL-480 POLICY BENCHMARKS . . . . .	12
Recommendations for Implementation of 1989 Benchmarks . . . . .	12
PROGRESS TOWARDS ACHIEVING 1988 EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS . . . . .	15
Trigo . . . . .	16
Credito . . . . .	17
Recursos Naturales . . . . .	18
Infraestructura . . . . .	19
Desarrollo Alternativo . . . . .	20
Administracion . . . . .	21
Otros . . . . .	22
FUTURE OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT . . . . .	23
Recommendations for 1990 . . . . .	24
WHEAT PRODUCTION POLICY . . . . .	25
Recommendations for 1990 . . . . .	27

WHEAT MARKETING POLICY . . . . .	27
PL-480 Wheat Importation Policy . . . . .	28
National Wheat Council Concept . . . . .	29
Regional Wheat Council Approach . . . . .	29
Competition in Wheat Marketing . . . . .	30
Credit Programs for Wheat Marketing . . . . .	30
Recommendations for Wheat Marketing . . . . .	31
Recommendations for the Joint Commission and Executive Secretariat . . . . .	31
RURAL DEVELOPMENT POLICY . . . . .	32
Recommendations for 1990 . . . . .	33
CREDIT POLICY, MARKETING AND PRODUCTION . . . . .	34
HEALTH AND NUTRITION POLICY . . . . .	38
Recommendations for 1990 . . . . .	38
EDUCATION POLICY . . . . .	40
COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE POLICY . . . . .	43
Recommendations for 1990 . . . . .	43
SEED IMPROVEMENT POLICY . . . . .	45
Recommendations for 1990 . . . . .	45
APPENDICES . . . . .	46

## **EVALUATION TEAM**

### **I. New Mexico State University**

Gene Ott - Team Leader, Wheat Programs  
Fred Smith - Agricultural Economist, Credit Policy  
Frank Smith - Rural Development Specialist  
Walter Taylor - Financial Analyst

### **II. PL-480 Executive Secretariat Ex-officio Members**

Jorge Noda - Gerente Financiero  
Luis Jordan - Gerente Tecnico

### **III. Bolivian Interview Team - LA PAZ**

Juan Carlos Molina - Team Leader  
Roxanna Leon - Interviewer  
Bladimer Leon - Interviewer  
Edmundo Montero - Interviewer

#### **COCHABAMBA**

Ibernon Viezaga - Team Leader  
Delfin Nogales - Interviewer  
Adolfo Pedraza - Interviewer  
Raul Rojas - Interviewer  
Jaime Rojas - Interviewer

#### **SANTA CRUZ**

Gerardo Polo - Team Leader  
Porfirio Chambi - Interviewer  
Raul Valle - Interviewer  
Hector Villarroel - Interviewer  
Juana Mendoza - Interviewer

### **IV. Executive Secretariat Computing Team**

Carlos Silva - Department Head  
Juan Carlos Perez - Programmer

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

An important portion of the United States assistance program to Bolivia is the PL-480 Title I and Title III shipments of wheat to Bolivia. This program has been in operation since 1978. A significant portion of Bolivia's demand for wheat has been supplied under these programs. In addition these programs have provided local currency for ongoing U.S. Food and Development Programs. The PL-480 program currently generates approximately \$US 17,000,000 per year. After eleven years of operation total funds generated is near \$US 190,000,000. These funds are administered with the advise and consent of USAID/Bolivia by the PL-480 Executive Secretariat (ES). The PL-480 Executive Secretariat is an autonomous Bolivian public sector agency.

The evaluation period covered in this report is July 1988 through June 1989. The evaluation consists of four components:

- (1) Conduction of an impact analysis of projects financed under line items selected by the Evaluation team in conjunction with USAID/ Bolivia. The focus is on credit programs carried out by the Executive Secretariat.
- (2) A review of the current monitoring and evaluation system implemented by the Executive Secretariat. A determination of how well this system functions and whether adequate impact data can be obtained. Recommendations are made regarding the improvement of the system.
- (3) Evaluate the progress made by USAID/Bolivia and the Executive Secretariat in implementing the recommendations of the last evaluation. Recommendations are made regarding future improvements which can guide the USAID/Bolivia staff and the team involved in designing the new multi-year PL-480 program.
- (4) An analysis of the GOB's progress in implementing policy commitments and benchmarks in the 1986 Title III agreement and its amendments. The relevancy of the benchmarks are considered and reasons for not achieving them are discussed.

### **The PL-480 Executive Secretariat**

During the past year the Executive Secretariat moved into a much improved office facility. This has improved their ability to more efficiently perform their responsibilities. However, this is not nearly as important as the high level of professional dynamism and esprit de corps that exists within the ES organization. The Executive Secretariat is evolving into an organization which can make a major contribution to Bolivian development.

The Executive Secretariats total staff has provided excellent cooperation and support to the PL-480 evaluation team. A request was made by the evaluation team for the Executive Secretariat, Gerente Financiero and Gerente Técnico to join the team as ex-officio members. Their contributions added greatly to the working of the group. Both traveled to the field with the evaluation team, seeing that time was used most effectively, and also providing insights into the programs being evaluated. Their openness in discussing the policies, activities and programs of the Executive Secretariat is greatly appreciated.

A great amount of progress has been made by the Executive Secretariat since the last evaluation. In addition to last years PL-480 evaluation, the ES has been through an intensive management study conducted by the Price Waterhouse International Consulting Service. Added to this has been a series of internal audits, studies and evaluations. As a result, the Executive Secretariat is beginning to improve its administrative functions and to redirect its program activities into directions that are more oriented to the objectives set for the PL-480 program. Certainly much more needs to be accomplished by them. The evaluation team is pleased by the progress of the Executive Secretariat and anticipates even greater progress in the future.

We believe a thorough discussion of the implementation of last year's evaluation recommendations is made in this report. Good progress has been made in achieving many of the recommendations made in the last evaluation. Good reasons exist why a few of the recommendations have not been implemented.

Some small progress has been made in changing the Executive Secretariat from an organization reacting to requests, to one which plans a program direction toward established goals and then moves for their implementation. The impact of PL-480 programs could be greatly enhanced if the Executive Secretariat would move from a position of reacting to the requests of others to one of development.

As the Executive Secretariat moves to one of greater developmental impact, it will need to increase its competency in evaluation and planning. It will also need to become more aggressive in its promotion of projects and activities demanded for development. Their present monitoring and administrative functions will need to be continued. It is the opinion of the Evaluation team that the Executive Secretariat has the potential to perform this needed developmental role. However additional training and support will be needed if they are to perform their roles well.

The PL-480 Evaluation team is heartened by the apparent changes in direction exhibited by the Joint Commission. The group appears much more willing to accept its responsibilities in determining policy and direction of the PL-480 program. They need every support in order to further evolve into a highly effective group, representing the Government of Bolivia's goals and interests in the PL-480 programs. Hopefully, they can develop into a group which represents the larger objectives of Bolivia, instead of concerning themselves with the special interests of their individual ministries. The evaluation committee also has a concern as to the future

interaction of the Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat. The roles of both should be well delineated and followed if the system is to function well.

Beneficiaries of the funds dispersed by the ES are satisfied with the program. Interest rates are considered fair and equitable. A general agreement exists among farmers and their cooperatives and associations that more technical assistance is needed. Again, a few PL-480 participants were critical of the late arrival of funds. This administrative problem is currently not under the control of the Executive Secretariat.

### PL-480 Program Activities

This year the evaluation team has given intensive attention to Credit programs administered under the PL-480 program. The evaluation team does believe that credit can be an important tool in the implementation of sound rural development programs. However, the indiscriminate extension of credit which is not a part of an overall development plan is not productive. The recommendations made in this report should be of value to US/AID and the Executive Secretariat as they redirect programs for maximum impact.

Last year the evaluation team gave special attention to Bolivia's wheat marketing system, particularly as it is impacted by the PL-480 program. This year more consideration is given to Bolivia's wheat production concerns. It is apparent that past PL-480 programs have had little impact on increasing national production and so have not reduced Bolivia's dependence on wheat imports. A redirection of resources and efforts from marginal, small traditional production areas to areas of larger commercial potential has begun. Even with this change, it is doubtful that Bolivia can become self sufficient in wheat production in the foreseeable future. However, it is possible to significantly increase commercial production. The recommendations made by the evaluation Committee should be helpful in guiding PL-480 program efforts into areas of greater impact.

The evaluation team still has a deep concern for the continuing problems associated with the existing system of PL-480 wheat importation. Little positive change has occurred since last year's evaluation. The Government of Bolivia, USAID, and the Executive Secretariat have been pushed into a role of importer and merchandiser of wheat. The Bolivian millers, through their national association, "Asociacion de Industriales Molineros (ADIM)" take very little risk in the present wheat importation scheme. However, they are assured a rather handsome profit margin for their participation. ADIM and its individual miller members are quite capable of accepting a much greater responsibility in the importation of PL-480 wheat. Basically, the Government of Bolivia, USAID, and the Executive Secretariat should limit their future activities in wheat importation, establishment of milling rates, and pricing of wheat and wheat products. Recommendations made in the body of this report can be helpful in formulating plans to assist all parties to PL-480 wheat importation in a hoped for movement toward a more equitable free market approach.

PL-480 program investments into health and nutrition programs have been quite successful. Small programs with a potential for high impact have been targeted for support. This area of activity is one which is presently paying high dividends. The insights and recommendations made in this section of the evaluation should be valuable as future PL-480 programs are designed for even greater impact.

Education and training is an area of long term investment which has historically had high benefits. In the short run, it is often difficult to determine the impact of these types of programs. This years evaluation should be helpful to those who are attempting to increase the most positive effects of this program area.

The PL-480 program does not have the resources for massive investments in large infrastructure programs. It can make a more positive impact by targeting its efforts into the smaller, often more productive projects. These worthy activities are often overlooked or ignored by larger donor organization. This years evaluation report will help in further refining and developing guidelines for the implementations of future infrastructure projects.

Improved seed is an important component of agriculture development in Bolivia. The evaluation team looked at how the existing system is functioning and has made some recommendations for future direction of PL-480 programs concerned with seed production. Continued support of the program is recommended. The PL-480 program should encourage the Consejos Regionales de Semillas in their enhancement of quality and their increased commercial independence. Improved seed use should be promoted in educational programs and also as a requirement for credit.

#### Summary of Recommendations made by the Evaluation Committee

With respect to the Executive Secretariat and the function of the PL-480 programs the following recommendations are made:

#### General

1. Establish priorities for the implementation of the recommendations in the Price Waterhouse study. The Executive Secretariat should move quickly to put in place those recommendations critical to the enhancement of their operations. Less critical recommendations may be left for future consideration.
2. Continue implementation of recommendations from the 1988 evaluation.
3. Seek means for reducing demand on ES management and staff time caused by many audits, evaluations and studies.
4. Consider possible long term advantages of some diversification of funding for Executive Secretariat program activities so as to assure a continuation of its productivity and its contribution to Bolivian rural development.

5. Reduce the responsibilities of the Government of Bolivia, USAID, and the Executive Secretariat in the importation and distribution of PL-480 wheat. If this cannot be done, seek outside assistance in the management of PL-480 wheat so as to minimize the demands on ES staff time in this endeavor.

#### Agricultural Production and Marketing Credit

1. Use credit as a tool in implementing well prepared development plans and programs. Credit programs should not be made available with PL-480 funds, unless they contribute to planned development.
2. Continue to seek ways to strengthen the service capability of private banks.
3. Continue to seek ways to strengthen the credit management capability of non private bank intermediate credit institutions.
4. Tie credit availability to the use of improved production practices and an improved production and marketing structure.
5. Establish three lines for small and medium sized agricultural loans.
  - A. Annual operating loans.
  - B. Equipment and livestock loans.
  - C. Soil and Water Development loans.
6. Provide quality technical assistance to PL-480 borrowers.

#### Wheat Policy Marketing and Production

1. Develop agreement between the GOB, USAID, and the ES as to the best strategy to be followed in the importation of PL-480 wheat. Policies should be developed which can then guide the program as it moves to a freer market approach.
2. Support the Joint Commission and the ES in their fulfillment of their obligations on the importation and distribution of PL-480 wheat (US agencies).
3. Develop clear guideline delineating the roles and responsibilities of the JC and ES on wheat importation and distribution (JC and ES).
4. Explore ways of securing support and cooperation of ADIM on the wheat importation program (JC, ES and US agencies).
5. Shorten the process and time used in securing PL-480 imports, with delivery spread more uniformly throughout the year (US agencies).
6. Continue wheat development programs in areas of potential future commercial success, dropping programs in areas where wheat is not a "best alternative" (EC)
7. Support a comprehensive study of potential commercial wheat production areas to determine perimeters of successful production (EC).
8. Encourage the organization of Regional Wheat Councils (EC).

#### Health and Nutrition

1. Continue to seek high payoff, small investment opportunities to improve the health and nutrition programs of the PVO's.

2. Fund immunization projects with a view to their marginal productivity.
3. Promote regional coordination of outreach programs in health and nutrition.
4. Shift the balance of donations toward more disease prevention (health promotion) and less disease treatment.

#### Education and Training

1. Continue with the current philosophy in the funding education projects.
2. Promote greater coordination of public and private sector professionals for the purpose of education and training.
3. Develop system of quality control to assure that education and training methods and materials are appropriate and content is based on the best information (research) available.

#### Community Infrastructure

1. Continue with current policies for investment in infrastructure projects.
2. Seek less conventional infrastructure projects for future investment.

#### Seed Improvement

1. Assist in increased and improved promotion of the use of improved seeds.
2. Encourage the commercial independence and quality reputation of the Consejos Regionales de Semillas.
3. Require the use of improved seeds in the credit program.

### **SCOPE OF WORK**

The four tasks assigned by the USAID mission are summarized as follows:

1. Impact analysis of specifically selected projects within selected ES line items.
2. Evaluate current ES monitoring system(s).
3. Evaluate response to last report.
4. Analyze policy benchmarks with respect to relevancy and recommend changes.

The selected ES line items are identified in chapter 5. Impacts of these selected line items are reported in chapters 11 through 15. Evaluation of the current ES monitoring system is included in chapter 9. Response to the 1988 evaluation is included in chapters 8, 9, and 11 through 15. Finally, policy benchmarks are analyzed in chapters 7 and 8.

**E R R A T A**

**This report is complete as bound; there are no pages 8 and 9.**

## METHODOLOGY USED IN DETERMINING IMPACT OF PL-480 PROGRAMS

The ES maintains 20 individual line items for purposes of management and administration. Within each line item are activities which may involve one or more organizations and institutions in Bolivia. Discussions with the USAID mission and the ES resulted in a reduction of the list of 20 line items to seven. This selection was based on the following criteria:

1. Line items which included collaborative activities exclusively were eliminated for evaluation because they will be evaluated under another program.
2. Line items in natural resources were eliminated because a specialist in natural resources was not included on the evaluation team.
3. Line items which would be impossible to visit within the allotted evaluation period were eliminated.

The remaining seven line items are as follows:

<u>No.</u>	<u>Line Item</u>	<u>86-89 Expenditure in US\$</u> <u>(Millions)</u>
3.	Small farmer credit	16.8
4.	Wheat production and marketing	2.4
6.	PVO health and nutrition	1.0
8.	Training	2.4
10.	Community infrastructure	8.6
13.	Control of diseases	5.7
15.	Rural development	4.4

To improve the efficiency of the field interviews these seven line items were reorganized slightly as follows:

1. Wheat policy (which includes wheat production and marketing)
2. Agricultural production and marketing credit
3. Health and nutrition (which includes control of diseases)
4. Education and training
5. Community infrastructure (includes rural development)
6. Seed improvement (includes some credit and rural development)

Impact analysis was conducted for the 29 activities within the six line items listed above. This analysis included individual contacts with principals of different organizations and institutions, having direct beneficiaries of PL 480 programs in three departments of Bolivia (La Paz, Cochabamba and Santa Cruz). In general methods for estimating impacts of the various selected activities of the PL 480 program included interviews of direct beneficiaries, interviews of intermediaries, and compilation of statistical data. Fifteen Bolivian paratechnicians and interviewers interviewed the direct beneficiaries and obtained the quantifiable data relating to benefits of PL 480 activities. The evaluation team interviewed 460 functionaries of the various organizations and institutions involved in the 29 selected activities.

The 15 paratechnicians and interviewers used six specially designed survey forms for obtaining information from a sample of beneficiaries regarding demographic characteristics, use of PL 480 funded services, difference in the economic or social situation of the beneficiary as a result of the PL 480 funds, and for identifying obstacles to greater success. These six forms are provided in the appendix. The paratechnicians and interviewers also took data from the archives of the involved organizations and institutions relating to the beneficiaries relationship with those organizations and institutions.

Analysis of the PL 480 results relative to the specific benchmarks listed under each line item in the February agreement between the government of Bolivia and the U.S. was based upon the data included in the annual report of the ES, interviews with functionaries in the field, conversations with ES staff and interviews with four government ministers or subsecretariats.

The evaluation team was divided into two field teams. One team included two members of the evaluation team and the ES gerencia financiero. The second team included two other members of the evaluation team and the ES gerencia tecnico. Each team interview functionaries from 29 organizations and institutions within the selected seven lines. These field teams also used specially prepared interview forms to illicit opinions regarding the role of the PL 480 funds to or through their organization with respect to rural development and to obtain information regarding progress towards the broader benchmarks identified in the February agreement between the government of Bolivia and the U.S.. These interview forms are also illustrated in the appendix.

Survey procedures, sample sizes, institutions and procedures are also shown in the appendix.

### Analysis

Analysis took place continuously through frequent debriefing sessions among the evaluation team. The quantifiable results from the field interviews were first normalized and standardized by the three paratechnicians. The data was then entered into a Lotus Spreadsheet format according to the line item and department. Simple statistical analysis was then applied and tables summarizing the impact data were prepared for inclusion in this report. The computer staff of the ES assisted directly in the preparation of this data. The evaluation team then reviewed the statistical results and prepared the narrative. Non quantifiable results from the field survey are summarized in the appendix.

## **EVALUATION OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT**

### ES Evaluation Procedures

An evaluation of the ES procedures was accomplished through interviews with the Gerencias Tecnico and Financiero, and by examining documents in the ES

office. Criteria for this evaluation is found in the evaluation team report of 1988. This task was accomplished by two members of the evaluation team.

#### Executive Secretariat Response

A summary of the recommendations from the 1988 annual evaluation report was prepared and presented to the Gerencia Financiero and Tecnico in the ES. The evaluation team then met with the gerencias and discussed these recommendations. The gerencias then prepared responses to each of the 1988 recommendations. These responses are found in section, "Progress Towards 1988 Evaluation Recommendations."

In addition to this written response, the evaluation team conducted interviews with selected functionaries in the field and with office staff to substantiate ES responses to the 1988 recommendations.

#### **PL-480 POLICY BENCHMARKS**

An evaluation of progress in achieving the policy benchmarks found in the February agreement between the government of Bolivia and the U.S. was accomplished through interviews and discussions with functionaries of the organizations benefiting from PL 480 funds, from ES officials, from US AID staff and from selected GOB officials including members of the Joint Commission. Included in this analysis was a consideration of the overall relationship of ES activities to rural development and the relevance of the credit activities.

#### Recommendations for Implementation of 1989 Benchmarks

There are approximately ten goals in the February '89 GOB/US Government agreement that relate to rural development and Title III. Information obtained from agricultural and rural development leaders in the departments of Cochabamba and Santa Cruz, various GOB ministers and from the Gerencia of the ES has been combined with the professional experience of the evaluation team to evaluate each of these ten goals. These ten goals are listed in the interview form found in the appendix under the title "Grupo De Evaluacion". These ten goals are numbered 11 through 22 under this title. These numbers are repeated here with a brief summary of each goal, followed by the recommendation and explanation.

(11) Channel PL 480 funds to the agriculture sector through private banks.

Recommendation: Change this goal to read: "Channel PL 480 funds to the agriculture sector through those intermediaries that will contribute the most to the rural development objectives of Title III.

Explanation: The private banking system is being used extensively for the credit programs (see section on credit). However, the private banking system lacks some of the required characteristics to serve the objectives of PL 480. For example, while the private banking system has excellent qualifications for managing credit and for providing credit to the commercial sector, they are generally unfamiliar with the special needs of the agricultural and rural sector. Further, as has been noted elsewhere, success with credit in the artesinal rural sector depends extensively upon complimentary technical assistance or supervised credit. This is especially true if credit is to be used to enhance agricultural productivity and efficiency. Unfortunately, the private banking sector has little interest in technical assistance or supervised credit. Therefore, the role of the private banking system in assisting with the objectives of PL 480 will be restricted. Other financial institutions appear to be somewhat better prepared to provide the necessary services to the agricultural sector, even though they may not have the credit management capability of the private banking system. For a more complete analysis, see sections on credit in this report.

(12) Increase national agricultural production 4% during 1989.

Recommendation: Express production goals in terms of productive capacity.

Explanation: There is general agreement that this goal will not be reached, primarily due to problems of the drought. The drought illustrates clearly the weaknesses of specific production goals. Success or failure may be entirely due to factors beyond the control of the government, PL 480 or farmers. Natural disasters and external markets are obvious examples of factors beyond the government or farmer control. Goals such as this can be improved by referring to increased productive capacity, improved ability to produce in spite of natural disasters or poor markets; etc.

(13) Increase national agricultural production through technical assistance.

Recommendation: Express goals in terms of technical assistance capacity.

Explanation: If production increases were realized an substantial research project would be required to attribute any of the increase to technical assistance. There are many factors which contribute to production. Fortunately, previous research has demonstrated a positive relationship between technical assistance and production. Therefore, it should be sufficient to note that technical assistance has improved and is being provided in a manner that is widely known to be beneficial.

(14) Increase national agricultural production through production credit..

Recommendation: Express goals in terms of credit system capacity.

Explanation: Again, if production increases were realized, a substantial research project would be required to attribute the increase to credit. Results of previous research is not as definitive as with the relationship of technical assistance to production. Nevertheless, it should be sufficient to measure success in terms of credit system capacity and service.

(15) Increase national agricultural production through marketing credit.

Recommendation: Express goals in terms of credit system capacity.

Explanation: The explanation here is basically the same as for number 14 above. However, there may be opportunities to relate specific structural improvements provided by credit to improvements in marketing. For example, the volume of potatoes placed on the market may be increased because of better storage facilities (therefore lower storage loss) or by improved transportation (therefore less product damage).

(16) Restructuring of Ministerio de Asuntos Campesinos y Agropecuarios (MACA).

Recommendation: Express government policy goals with a view to immediate changes in government, instead of committing future governments.

Explanation: The restructuring of MACA is in process. However, the recent change in the government illustrates one weakness of this type of goal. The restructuring plan was developed by the previous Bolivian government. While their objective in proposing a restructuring MACA may have been appropriate, there also may have been political motives in the restructuring proposal. It may not be appropriate for the U.S. government to require that a new government follow through with policies proposed by a previous government, especially if those policies were proposed to gain votes in an upcoming election.

(17) Prepare an agricultural development plan.

Recommendation: No change.

Explanation: While this has some of the same problems as number 16 there are probably fewer risks with this type of goal. The previous government did prepare a ten year social and economic development plan which is available for the current government to implement. There also exists a special study of the agricultural sector. It is not clear at this point that the current government agrees with or will follow these plans.

(18) Form national and regional agricultural commissions.

Recommendation: No Change

Explanation: Again, this has some of the same problems as number 16 and 17 but appears to be well accepted by the current government. Most felt that this goal has generic benefits, especially in view of the current governments philosophy of government decentralization.

(19) Simplify agricultural exportation.

Recommendation: No Change.

Explanation: There is broad support for this goal and plans are in process. The initial idea is to form departmental commissions to assist with border problems, with market information to exporters and with

transportation problems. Additional assistance that might be included is the provision of information and training regarding consumer taste and preferences in the target countries, and export financing. Technical assistance in packaging, processing, credit, etc. could also be provided.

- (20) Increase the national budget for research and extension so as to increase nontraditional production and exports.

Recommendation: No change.

Explanation: There also seems to be general agreement with this goal. At a minimum the need is obvious for applied research to fit the various geographic conditions. The benefits from this research will be better realized with a corresponding extension system. Unfortunately, both research and extension appear to be at quite primitive stages of development in Bolivia and will require large investments and many years before the benefits can be fully realized. Rather than considering a traditional research and extension system modeled after the U.S. it may be valuable to consider other models. For example, research may be accomplished by private organizations with the participation of the government. Fundacion Chile provides an example. The government of Chile provides some funds but the major funding is from several large international corporations. Fundacion Chile conducts applied research on production technology, genetics, marketing, etc. and develops profit oriented enterprises in the process.

- (21) MACA coordinates activities with the private sector regarding research and extension.

Recommendation: No change.

Explanation: Basically the same as in number 20 above.

- (22) Form a national wheat commission.

Recommendation: Delete.

Explanation: At the time of the 1988 PL 480 evaluation there appeared to be a need for such a commission. Apparently, the JCRD arrived at a decision to change dramatically the traditional methods for receiving and distributing wheat and administering the resulting financial resources. With the proposed changes the national wheat commission is no longer appropriate. The need to form regional wheat commissions may still exist.

#### **PROGRESS TOWARDS ACHIEVING 1988 EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS**

The following section was prepared by Lic. Jorge Noda, Gerente Financiero, and Lic. Luis Jordan, Gerente Técnico, of the Executive Secretariat on request of the evaluation team. It is the team's judgement that the presentation gives a sensitive and balanced discussion of progress towards the recommendations from 1989.

## Trigo

### 1. Fomentar la constitución de un Consejo Nacional de Trigo

No se organizó el Consejo Nacional de Trigo debido a que el gobierno no tomó la determinación de que el mismo tenga un poder de decisión y, por lo tanto, solamente se constituiría en un ente coordinador y consultivo, sin ningún efecto positivo en favor del programa de trigo. Adicionalmente, la operación del consejo demandaría un financiamiento de más de 600.000 dólares americanos que pueden ser utilizados en proyectos de mayor impacto en la producción de trigo nacional. Dada la situación actual definida para las importaciones de trigo y las grandes posibilidades de fomentar la producción a nivel regional, especialmente en el departamento de Santa Cruz, parecería que la conformación del Consejo Nacional de Trigo ya no tiene la importancia del pasado.

### 2. Hacer proyecciones de la producción de trigo que se anticipa en Bolivia

Se han realizado esfuerzos, principalmente por la Secretaría Ejecutiva, con el fin de efectuar investigaciones que permitan mejorar la productividad del cultivo de trigo, especialmente en lo referido a la producción de semilla de altos rendimientos. Asimismo, se han efectuado estudios que permitan mejorar los sistemas de comercialización entre el productor y el molinero y, en el caso del departamento de Santa Cruz, con un financiamiento otorgado por la Secretaría Ejecutiva y con la participación activa de la Asociación de Productores de Oleaginosas y Trigo (ANAPO), se ha establecido un sistema eficiente de comercialización, que representa un incentivo para los productores de trigo.

Respecto a la competencia del trigo importado, el alto costo (precios elevados del trigo americano, debido a la sequía presentada en los Estados Unidos de América mas el transporte e internacion), no han significado una competencia para el trigo nacional, sinó más bien un incentivo a la producción de trigo. En el caso del trigo argentino, los factores de competencia se deben a políticas económicas existentes en la Argentina, tales como los subsidios a la producción de harina de trigo y la brecha existente entre el dólar oficial y paralelo, que hacen difícil competir con la harina argentina, sin embargo, los efectos de estas distorsiones de tipo económico, no han afectado significativamente a la producción nacional.

### 3. Evaluar cómo puede la industria molinera y panadera aportar más al logro de las metas de producción de trigo en Bolivia

En lo referente a la política de fijación de precios de harina y pan, si bien aún se mantiene una responsabilidad del sector público, el Ministerio de Industria, Comercio y Turismo para la harina y las Alcaldías para el control de los precios del pan, existe una buena disposición a nivel del gobierno central, de eliminar el control de precios de estos productos, lo que representaría un apoyo significativo para el fomento a la producción de trigo nacional.

Respecto a las mejoras en el procesamiento y la distribución de la harina de trigo, se han efectuado algunos estudios que permitirán a corto plazo establecer nuevos procedimientos más eficientes.

4. Investigar cómo mejorar los sistemas de transporte del trigo y/o reducir los costos del mismo

Se han analizado qué puertos ofrecen mayores ventajas para el transporte del trigo, por lo cual se determinó transportar una mayor cantidad a través del puerto de Arica, debido a los menores costos en comparación con el puerto de Antofagasta. Asimismo, a pesar de las limitaciones para internar el trigo a través del puerto de Matarani en el Perú, se han efectuado los cálculos de costos, para determinar la conveniencia de volver a utilizar este puerto, previéndose su utilización para los embarques correspondientes al nuevo Convenio del Título III.

La Secretaría Ejecutiva ha financiado un estudio sobre las mermas existentes en la importación de trigo, el cual se encuentra en la etapa de revisión final. Los resultados preliminares muestran que la pérdida del 3% reconocida a ADIM, puede ser disminuída sustancialmente.

Credito

1. Las ICIs proveen la mayor parte del crédito en insumos

Esta situación se aplica en el caso de las cooperativas agrícolas donde en la mayoría de los casos el crédito se efectúa en fertilizantes, semillas y otros insumos requeridos en la producción, empero, es difícil intentar ampliar este mecanismo con los bancos privados, ya que los mismos no cuentan con la infraestructura adecuada para prestar este servicio.

2. Las ICIs proveen mayor asistencia técnica a los prestatarios

No todas las ICIs tienen la capacidad de otorgar asistencia técnica a sus prestatarios, motivo por el cual la Secretaría Ejecutiva ha visto por conveniente recurrir a los servicios de asociaciones de productores, las cuales proporcionan asistencia técnica a los asociados que optan al crédito. Para tal efecto, la Secretaría Ejecutiva reconoce una comisión en favor de las asociaciones, de manera de cubrir parte de sus costos de asistencia técnica y, al mismo tiempo, se le exige el seguimiento de los créditos, como apoyo a la labor desarrollada por las ICIs.

3. Las ICIs mejoran los procesos de evaluación de los proyectos de factibilidad

Mientras los ingresos de las ICIs no sean lo suficientemente importantes, difícilmente podrán tomar la determinación de mejorar la capacidad de sus oficiales de crédito, en lo referente a evaluación de proyectos de factibilidad. Por esta razón, la Secretaría Ejecutiva ha

visto por conveniente desarrollar programas de capacitación del personal de las ICIs, el mismo que se iniciará el mes de noviembre, con un curso sobre políticas de crédito agrícola dictado por el Instituto Centroamericano de Administración de Empresas INCAE y la Facultad de Harvard.

4. Las ICIs prestan mayor apoyo administrativo y analítico a los prestatarios

En el aspecto administrativo, la mayor parte de las ICIs han mejorado sus servicios, no así en el aspecto analítico, por lo que debe considerarse prioritariamente la capacitación del personal de las ICIs, en créditos agropecuarios.

5. La Secretaría Ejecutiva obtiene información sobre la rentabilidad de los proyectos y exige lo mismo de las ICIs

Frecuentemente se analizan en la Secretaría Ejecutiva, algunas políticas de financiamiento dirigidas a financiar básicamente proyectos de viabilidad técnica y financiera. Estos análisis han permitido que la cartera en mora de la Secretaría Ejecutiva no sea alta en comparación a otras fuentes de financiamiento.

En el caso de las ICIs, esta situación no es tan efectiva debido principalmente a que no todas cuentan con el personal especializado para analizar la rentabilidad de las diferentes alternativas de inversión, sin embargo, en la medida de sus posibilidades, la Secretaría Ejecutiva ha orientado a las instituciones que tienen dificultades sobre este aspecto.

6. La Secretaría Ejecutiva ha ayudado a que las ICIs cumplan las recomendaciones de los Evaluadores

El seguimiento de la Secretaría Ejecutiva ha permitido asesorar y supervisar el cumplimiento de estas recomendaciones, dejando establecido que las mismas no se aplican a todo el universo de ICIs, sino que se diferencian de acuerdo a las características específicas de cada una de ellas.

Recursos Naturales

1. Seguir asesorando en la elaboración de leyes ecológicas en Bolivia

A través de la Liga de Defensa del Medio Ambiente (LIDEMA), la Secretaría Ejecutiva ha continuado el apoyo para la definición de políticas de protección y conservación del medio ambiente y la explotación racional de los recursos naturales. Este apoyo se ha intensificado en el último año, básicamente con el financiamiento de diversos proyectos de investigación, promoción, capacitación y de conservación de parques naturales.

2. Ampliar la zona geográfica en la cual se llevan a cabo actividades de manejo ecológico y de recursos

Además de la Estación Biológica del Beni, la Secretaría Ejecutiva ha financiado la implementación de los parques Amboró y Noel Kempf Mercado, mientras que con otros financiamientos, el gobierno boliviano ha financiado dos parques de protección adicionales. Por lo expuesto, el avance logrado en este aspecto es bastante significativo.

3. Registrar todas las actividades del Programa PL 480 que de una u otra forma tienen que ver con el manejo de recursos naturales

Con el fin de concentrar las actividades de conservación del medio ambiente y los recursos naturales, la Secretaría Ejecutiva contrató un profesional especializado. Dicho profesional, participa también en la evaluación de proyectos de desarrollo rural que puedan tener un impacto sobre el medio ambiente.

4. Seguir apoyando las operaciones y el desarrollo de CUMAT

El financiamiento a CUMAT continúa hasta la fecha, empero, es conveniente señalar que si bien la Secretaría Ejecutiva reconoce la importancia de esta Institución, es necesario establecer los parámetros que permitan su autofinanciamiento en el futuro. Para tal efecto, la Secretaría Ejecutiva determinó que sus financiamientos vayan disminuyendo gradualmente, hasta lograr el autosostenimiento deseado.

5. Reducir el enfoque del Programa PL 480 en cuanto a recursos naturales

Para el cumplimiento de esta recomendación se solicitó a LIDEMA la presentación de un plan de trabajo que demuestre los objetivos y metas programadas y el campo de acción de la misma.

6. Fijar normas y procedimientos que permitirían analizar de forma consistente los beneficios y costos de la conservación y los proyectos de rehabilitación

La creación de un banco de datos es responsabilidad de LIDEMA, para lo cual se están efectuando los análisis requeridos para su implementación. Esta base de datos permitirá cuantificar los beneficios y costos de los proyectos relacionados con los recursos naturales.

### Infraestructura

1. Establecer orientaciones y prioridades para los proyectos de infraestructura

La Secretaría Ejecutiva realiza continuamente un análisis de los resultados obtenidos en todos los proyectos financiados, en base al cual determina los ajustes necesarios para mejorar la implementación

de los proyectos y, principalmente, los impactos de su ejecución. En este sentido, básicamente se han financiado proyectos de infraestructura que tienen impacto significativo sobre el desarrollo de una región, considerando que el beneficio-costo de los mismo sea justificado y compatible con los requerimientos de las comunidades beneficiadas.

2. Seguir enfatizando proyectos de enfoque local que usan tecnologías sencillas

Este aspecto sigue considerándose en el análisis y evaluación de los proyectos presentados a la Secretaría Ejecutiva, debido a que se considera que la existencia de recursos financieros escasos requiere la aplicación tecnología eficiente de baja inversión.

3. Participación de PL 480 en proyectos viales mayores

Luego de la evaluación efectuada el año 1988, la Secretaría Ejecutiva no consideró ningún proyecto vial de magnitud, básicamente por el cambio de política en este aspecto y la restricción en la asignación de fondos para proyectos de magnitud.

4. Elaborar planes de desarrollo local regional para integrar actividades de infraestructura

Se han estado identificando áreas de producción y posibles instituciones con la suficiente capacidad de ejecución de proyectos, con el fin de promocionar y ejecutar proyectos de infraestructura diversa y con impacto significativo para la población rural. Uno de estos casos es el proyecto Jaima Arco Iris, donde se puede apreciar la ejecución de diversas actividades o proyectos dirigidos al desarrollo de las comunidades beneficiadas.

Desarrollo Alternativo

1. Limitar la participación de la PL-480 a actividades de desarrollo rural a largo plazo

La característica ecológicas de la región del Chapare condicionan la implantación básica de cultivos perennes, cuya producción comercial se da recién a mediano y largo plazo. Al ser un proyecto de contraparte para la PL 480, solamente la Secretaría Ejecutiva atiende los proyectos y requerimientos aprobados por USAID/B, sin una participación activa en la promoción, evaluación y supervisión de actividades y proyectos en la región del Chapare y los Valles Altos del departamento de Cochabamba.

2. Continuar la búsqueda de cosechas alternas

Básicamente a través del Instituto Boliviano de Tecnología Agropecuaria del Chapare (IBTA-Chapare) y con el asesoramiento de consultoras americanas, se han estado investigando nuevos rubros de producción agropecuaria que podrían ser una alternativa interesante de sustitución de cultivos de coca.

### 3. Elaborar un plan de desarrollo integrado para la región del Chapare

El gobierno boliviano, a través de la Subsecretaría de Desarrollo Alternativo y Sustitución de Cultivos de Coca SUBDESAL, ha elaborado el Plan Integral de Desarrollo Alternativo y de Sustitución PIDYS, el cual se encuentra actualmente en ejecución.

## Administración

### 1. Delegación de responsabilidades

Los procesos administrativos han sido mejorados mediante la delegación de responsabilidad a niveles intermedios, sin embargo, esta delegación aún no ha sido completada debido a que algunas secciones organizadas en la nueva estructura no han adquirido la suficiente práctica y experiencia para asumir mayores responsabilidades. se estima que este proceso será concluido en un período máximo de cuatro meses.

### 2. Reemplazo de la UCCP por una institución de auditoría

Al haberse definido la fusión de la Unidad de Coordinación y Control de Proyectos a la Secretaría Ejecutiva, esta recomendación se cumplió con la organización del Departamento de Auditoría, donde trabajan un Gerente y tres auditores.

### 3. Participación más activa de la CCDR

La Comisión Conjunta para el Desarrollo Rural desempeña desde hace un año atrás, una labor más efectiva para el desarrollo del Programa PL 480. En efecto, el interés demostrado por los representantes de los diferentes Ministerios ha permitido que las reuniones de la Comisión Conjunta se realicen con mayor frecuencia y se tomen determinaciones importantes sobre las políticas de financiamiento y ejecución del Programa.

### 4. Promoción del Programa PL 480

Esta labor ha sido desarrollada por la Secretaría Ejecutiva, aunque no con la intensidad deseada, debido principalmente a las recargadas labores que implica la reestructuración administrativa. Se considera que una vez finalizado este proceso de reestructuración, la Secretaría Ejecutiva podrá dedicar mayor tiempo a la identificación, análisis y promoción de nuevas inversiones compatibles con la Estrategia de Desarrollo Social Económico 1989-2000.

### 5. Consolidación de líneas de financiamiento y actividades financiadas

Este objetivo ha sido definido por la Secretaría Ejecutiva desde hace bastante tiempo atrás, sin embargo, su cumplimiento se ha dificultado por los constantes presiones para atender requerimiento no contemplados por la Secretaría Ejecutiva, ya sea por requerimiento del gobierno boliviano o por la obligación de fondos de la PL 480 como

contraparte a proyectos de USAID. Consideramos que en el futuro sería conveniente dar mayor énfasis a este objetivo, tomándose la decisiones necesarias a distintos niveles del gobierno y de USAID/B.

6. Duplicación en el manejo de la documentación

Consideramos que no existe duplicación en el manejo de la documentación, porque si bien el Secretario Ejecutivo y el Gerente Técnico reciben y revisan las solicitudes de financiamiento, son los técnicos los que evalúan dichas solicitudes y a nivel ejecutivo se revisan y aprueban los informes de evaluación elaborados por los técnicos.

7. Dedicar más tiempo para planificación, evaluación, análisis, etc.

Lamentablemente no es posible delegar muchas actividades a instituciones intermediarias o ejecutoras, debido a que la mayor parte de ellas no tienen la suficiente capacidad para efectuar trabajos de aprobación y administración de proyectos o créditos; por esta razón, la Secretaría Ejecutiva en algunos casos debe realizar este trabajo. Sin embargo, existe una tendencia a no atender muchas solicitudes individuales, con el fin de dedicar mayor tiempo a trabajos de planificación, promoción, supervisión y evaluación.

8. Representación de la Secretaría Ejecutiva en la Comisión Nacional de Trigo

Como la Comisión Nacional de Trigo no operó hasta la fecha, no fue posible dar cumplimiento a esta recomendación, sin embargo, en caso de que se organice dicha Comisión, la Secretaría Ejecutiva solicitará su participación, especialmente ahora que tiene la responsabilidad de la administración de las importaciones de trigo.

Otros

1. Mayor asistencia técnica y capacitación

Se ha dado énfasis en la asistencia técnica y la capacitación del personal de las instituciones intermediarias y ejecutoras, con el objeto de que en el futuro la Secretaría Ejecutiva pueda delegar determinadas actividades y, principalmente, para asegurar la adecuada ejecución de los programas y proyectos.

2. Mayor análisis de los riesgos en el sistema de crédito

Esta actividad es realizada continuamente en la Secretaría Ejecutiva, con el fin de evitar el financiamiento de proyectos que no tengan la capacidad de repago. Consideramos que el fruto de este análisis es el reducido porcentaje de mora existente en nuestra cartera, pese a que las condiciones económicas actuales no son las más adecuadas para el desarrollo de proyectos rurales.

3. Autofinanciamiento del programa de semillas y otros

Uno de los objetivos más importantes trazados por la Secretaría Ejecutiva es la consolidación administrativa y financiera de los programas, proyectos e instituciones que reciben financiamiento del Programa PL 480, empero, lamen' ablemente en el caso del programa de semillas, esta situación se ha visto afectada por dos razones: la prohibición de financiar actividades relacionadas al rubro de la soya, que representa más del 80% de la producción de semilla en el país y, los desastres naturales que afectaron los cultivos de semillas de diversos rubros. Una vez superados estos problemas, consideramos que gradualmente los Consejos Regionales de Semilla podrán ir alcanzando su autofinanciamiento.

#### FUTURE OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT

The ES was created to administer Title III funds and to carry out the terms of the agreement between the GOB and the US Government. A unique organization for rural development in Bolivia has evolved from the years of experience in administering the Title III agreement. Apart from its major source of funding, PL 480, the organization currently has special capabilities and serves a special purpose in Bolivian development. Therefore, it is appropriate to consider the future of the ES in terms of its effective role in rural development, and not only as administrator of Title III funds.

This may include administration of funds from other sources in the future, changes in the structure of the JCRD to reflect these other sources of funding and a change in the name of the organization and other actions which will help retain the expertise and experience which has been capitalized into the ES. The ES should continue flexible, low investment but high payoff rural development activities which currently characterize the organization.

Currently the JCRD is responsible for managing the wheat delivered to Bolivia by the U.S. Government. Historically this has been left to the government which has used a complex method of distributing the wheat to the millers who then take a share of the sales revenue and deposit the rest in the national treasury. These funds are then available to the ES, albiet on a somewhat delayed basis.

Different alternatives for the management of PL-480 wheat importations is presently under consideration by USAID and the JCRD. This could result in more responsibility being shifted to the millers (ADIM) or even the possible importation of flour if the millers prove uncooperative. Depending upon the system of management chosen (discussed in the wheat marketing section) additional operational responsibility could be placed on the ES staff. This would conflict directly with the staff's primary responsibility of managing development programs. This conflict should be avoided.

## Recommendations for 1990

Recommendation Implement the recommendations of the Price Waterhouse study with a view towards retaining the professional esprit de corps and productivity of the staff.

Recommendation: Continue to implement recommendations from the 1988 annual evaluation.

Recommendation: Seek means for reducing the demands on management and staff time related to the many audits, evaluations and studies of the ES.

Recommendation: The future of the ES should be considered in terms of its effective role in rural development, and not just as administrator of Title III funds.

Recommendation: Seek outside assistance in the management of PL 480 wheat and minimize the demands on ES staff time in this endeavor.

Explanation of Recommendations: The 1988 evaluation included a number of recommendations for improving the performance and productivity of the ES. These recommendations were made with the knowledge that the office was functioning quite efficiently and effectively. The staff are generally well qualified for their responsibilities, the management is devoted to its work, is professionally qualified and are highly motivated. The opinions of all the organizations and beneficiaries that are affected by the ES are uniformly positive regarding the quality of service and of the people.

Nevertheless, US AID initiated a very large management and control study of the ES during 1988-89 and two formal external audits. The management and control study by Price Waterhouse (PW) produced thousands of pages of recommendations. PW has since then been retained to assist in the implementation of these recommendations.

The ES has implemented many of the accounting and auditing recommendations of the PW study. The auditing department has been greatly expanded, a new computer system installed, and accounting and control software installed.

The major impact of these administration and control studies during 1988-89 was the consumption of a majority of ES staff time in cooperating with the investigators. The ES office is to be credited for continuing with their normal responsibilities during this period. Their ability to continue with their normal credit management and technical project management responsibilities is attested to by the positive comments from the "field".

There exists in the ES office a high level of professional dynamism and esprit de corps. The implementation of the PW recommendations should be made with caution. The productivity of the office will be reduced if structural changes and tighter controls stifle the individual initiative currently demonstrated by office staff. Improved productivity is the objective now that improved accountability has been installed! Imposing a text book structure and administrative procedures is appropriate only if they contribute to this objective. Therefore, failure to install all the recommendations of PW should not be de facto evidence of uncooperativeness.

## WHEAT PRODUCTION POLICY

Bolivia has a goal of national self sufficiency in wheat. National statistics show little or no progress in achieving this goal. In fact, Table I illustrates what has occurred in the Bolivian wheat picture from 1979 through 1989. The area devoted to wheat has remains stable at 88,000 hectares. National production is also fairly stable at around 60,000 to 65,000 metric tons during years when drought is not a factor. National demand on the other hand, is showing a slow increase. A period of severe drought this year will see Bolivian wheat producers supply less than 15% of national needs. PL-480 wheat imports will be nearly double that at over 30% of national demand.

TABLE 1  
PRODUCTION AND IMPORTS OF PL-480 WHEAT IN BOLIVIA 1979-1989

	WHEAT PRODUCTION		INTERNAL DEMAND	NATIONAL PRODUCTION	TITLE III PL-480 WHEAT	
	Has	M.T.	M.T.	% OF DEMAND	M.T.	% DEMAND
1979	98.070	67.755	315.360	21.4	107.705	34.1
1980	100.370	60.140	336.012	17.8	74.081	22.0
1981	95.955	66.620	344.413	19.3	-	-
1982	96.422	66.000	291.806	22.6	63.171	21.6
1983	70.507	40.347	361.215	11.2	146.334	40.5
1984	88.810	68.456	352.333	19.4	64.478	18.3
1985	93.125	67.730	383.918	17.6	148.370	37.6
1986	82.000	60.000	330.000	18.1	171.365	51.9
1987	77.000	50.000(1)	330.000	15.1	180.915	54.8
1988	88.000	55.000	338.000	16.2	123.458	36.5
1989(2)	88.000	48.000(1)	340.000	14.1	103.846	30.5

SOURCE: MACA - MICT - ANAPO - USAID BOLIVIA

- (1) MAJOR DROUGHT
- (2) ESTIMATE FOR 1989

Past wheat policies have not been successful in increasing production. Hopefully, this evaluation will help to reverse this trend by encouraging more effective PL-480 wheat production program support.

The PL-480 evaluation team visited the wheat production areas of Santa Cruz and Cochabamba. The team member responsible for the wheat section of this study was also responsible for the wheat section of the 1988 PL-480 evaluation. Last year emphasis was placed on the wheat marketing and milling system, as well as the policies on importation of PL-480 wheat. The current evaluation focuses on the problems and opportunities of wheat production.

The Santa Cruz area is unique in its capability of producing wheat for the commercial wheat market. The production areas of Cochabamba, Chuquisaca, Tarija and others have only small sub-marginal wheat producers who are expected to continue to produce grain for household consumption and for possible sale to local rural mills. They are not expected to provide significant production to meet Bolivia's commercial wheat needs. A few may be able to successfully produce seed wheat to meet the demand of commercial growers in the Santa Cruz Area.

The PL-480 program, administered by the Executive Secretariat, has recently implemented a policy of pulling back its program support of wheat development programs in the non-commercial wheat areas. This is a sound decision, based upon the development needs of the country. This need not mean that these areas will not receive future PL-480 assistance for development. Rather, it means they will no longer be encouraging small farmers into an area of production where they have little hope of success.

The Santa Cruz area presents a unique situation for the potential expansion of wheat production. Conceivably, the area could produce all of Bolivia's wheat needs. However, this is not apt to occur for many years. Wheat has not been a particularly profitable crop in the area. The profit crop has been Soy Beans, which grows well in Santa Cruz and has a good market potential. Wheat is viewed as a second crop, being planted in rotation with Soy Beans. Two crops can be produced a year, soy beans in the summer and wheat in the winter. Wheat uses the same farm equipment and land as soy beans, thus reducing costs. In addition, wheat can help to control weeds on land that would otherwise be idle during the off season for soy beans. Until now, the PL-480 program has ignored Soy Beans and their potential to make area wheat production feasible.

Future wheat production growth in the Santa Cruz area will depend upon (1) production technology adapted to the area, (2) supervised credit at equitable interest rates, (3) market planning and assistance, (4) favorable Bolivian government policies fostering wheat production, (5) a reduction in competition from Argentina and Paraguayan wheat (both legal imports as well as contraband).

Not all of the Santa Cruz area is adapted to wheat production. The Executive Secretariat's PL-480 programs should avoid past mistakes of encouraging production in uneconomic areas, and play a role in area wheat development. A comprehensive study should be made which will delineate those areas which have true potential for commercial wheat production.

Such a study should consider the following:

1. Soils.
2. Climatic conditions.
3. Accessibility to markets.
4. Anticipated costs and returns of wheat.
5. Anticipated costs and returns of competing and complementary crops.
6. Anticipated wheat pest problems.
7. Environmental impact.

Once feasible wheat production areas are determined, PL-480 sponsored programs of credit, technology transfer, market development and infrastructure could have real impact on sound wheat development for Bolivia.

The use of producer organizations as a conduit to provide credit, technology and market assistance has proven effective in Bolivia. Examples of this type of organization observed by the evaluation team was ANAPO and "Cooperativa Integral Cochabamba" in Punata. The Executive Secretariat in a developmental role should consider searching for areas where like organizations are needed, and serving as a catalyst in their organization and support.

It is logical to expect that within five years wheat producers in the Santa Cruz area can produce all of the wheat needs of the Oriente area. However, this will occur only if it can be demonstrated that wheat is indeed a "best alternative" for producers.

A need exists to coordinate the efforts of the many different groups and institutions involved in some aspect of wheat. A regional approach to solving the problems of wheat production and marketing could be most profitable. In addition to solving the local problems, this group could and should make input to the Joint Counsel, Executive Secretariat, and Government Ministries. This input could increase the effectiveness of these organizations in their role of wheat development.

#### Recommendations for 1990

1. Continue wheat development programs in areas of potential future commercial success. Drop programs in areas where wheat is not a "best alternative".
2. PL-480 support of a comprehensive study of potential commercial wheat production areas to determine perimeters of successful production.
3. Encourage the organization of Regional Wheat Councils or committees. This group could play a role in both regional wheat development, and in providing input to the Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat on national wheat development programs. Santa Cruz is one location recommended for early organization.

#### **WHEAT MARKETING POLICY**

In the 1988 evaluation of PL-480 programs, emphasis was placed on the wheat marketing component. This year a greater emphasis is placed upon Bolivian wheat production activities.

The 1989 evaluation team has two members who participated in the 1988 evaluation. This includes the individual given the responsibility for the wheat section. This continuity permits a greater insight into Bolivia's complex wheat production and marketing activities.

## PL-480 Wheat Importation Policy

Many of the past problems associated with the importation of PL-480, wheat could be alleviated if the Government of Bolivia, through its Joint Commission, shifted its role from one of wheat importer to one of policy development. A movement toward a more commercial system for the import of PL-480 wheat would be a most positive development. To do so would permit the Joint Commission to become an effective force for the preparation of coordinated policies fostering Bolivia's development.

The Bolivian milling industry, through its national organization ADIM, is quite capable of assuming a greater responsibility for the importation of PL-480 wheat from ports in Chile and Peru. In fact, they could assume responsibility for Bolivian shipment of wheat from U.S. gulf ports. Such a move could be helpful to the millers in their desire to schedule a more orderly flow of grain from PL-480 stocks to their mills.

Unfortunately, the millers have shown little interest in changing their role in wheat importation. The past system has been very beneficial to them. Others have assumed the risk and responsibility, while they have been assured a generous profit margin on every ton of wheat milled.

If the existing system is to be altered, the following course of action could be as follows:

1. The Government of Bolivia, through its Joint Commission, USAID, and the PL-480 Executive Secretariat, develop new policies and procedures for the commercial importation of PL-480 wheat. There should be complete agreement between all three parties that the resulting strategies are ones they can fully support.
2. Once the proposed policies and procedures for wheat importation are established and agreed to, negotiations should be started with the Bolivian milling industry on their involvement in implementation. The Joint Commission, USAID and the Executive Secretariat should approach these negotiations from a position of strength and resolve. They should be fair and equitable in their dealings with the millers. The millers are an important part of Bolivia's industrial development, and have an important role to play in Bolivia's plans to become more self sufficient in wheat production. USAID should always keep in mind the political vulnerability of the Joint Commission, and to a lesser extent the Executive Secretariat to the powerful and politically astute millers organization.
3. If an impasse is reached, and no movement is made by the millers, alternative plans should be in place. Perhaps individual millers will be willing to bid on the PL-480 wheat imports. Or, as has been suggested, wheat flour could be imported instead of wheat grain. Flour import should be used only as a last resort. Flour importation is fraught with risk, and could move ADIM to political retaliation against Bolivian institutions. Finally, such a move would be counter-productive to Bolivia's long-term economic development goals.

The millers national organization, ADIM, is still a strong monopoly, interested only in maintaining and improving the position of the country's milling industry. However, it is apparent it is not as monolithic as in the past. This year there were indications that individual members were going their own direction, counter to the plans of ADIM. Further, individual ministries and their subsecretariats, appear to be stronger and better motivated than they have in the past. Perhaps now it is possible to effect structural changes in the importation of PL-480 wheat.

#### National Wheat Council Concept

A National Wheat Council was recommended by last years evaluation team. At that time it was felt this structure could best fill a perceived vacuum existing in the development and implementation of rational and effective policies to guide the importation and distribution of PL 480 wheat. Further, it was envisioned that this group could foster the development of an increasingly productive Bolivian wheat production sector. At the time of the 1988 evaluation, there existed little desire or capability on the part of key ministries and their Joint Council to perform these most necessary functions.

Now, after one year, we are better able to evaluate the past years recommendations, tempering them with our better information coming from a year of major changes in Bolivian institutions concerned with wheat. Major changes have occurred in the membership of the Joint Council. It now appears that this group now is willing to accept it responsibilities in its role of representing the Government of Bolivia in the development of national policy guiding the importation of PL-480 wheat. In addition, the Executive Secretariat has strengthened in its ability to perform the needed administrative and support functions called for to make a national wheat program function well.

Because of these changes, it is wise to defer the organization of a National Wheat Council. The Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat should be encouraged to be aggressive in fulfilling their obligatory functions on PL 480 wheat importation. We do caution that they follow closely the roles established for them. Basically, the Joint Commission is responsible for planning and policy. The Executive Secretariat is responsible for management, support and oversight. At no time should the Executive Secretariat be pushed into a role of policy determination.

If, for whatever reason, the Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat system does not function, The National Wheat Council concept should be reconsidered.

#### Regional Wheat Council Approach

Consideration of regional wheat councils should be considered. Because of the isolation of different regions of Bolivia and of their unique production and marketing conditions, a regional council concept should prove profitable. Membership in such a group could include producer organizations, flour millers, agricultural credit agencies as well as other regional interests involved in the production, marketing and processing of wheat.

Such a group could do much to coordinate their efforts on a local or regional level. In addition, they could also provide important inputs into the plans and program of the Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat. At some future time, the regional councils may wish to form a National Wheat Council.

#### Competition in Wheat Marketing

The importation of PL 480 wheat does not seem to be a factor in competition with Bolivian produced wheat. The major commercial wheat area of Bolivia, Santa Cruz, receives no PL-480 wheat. The railroad and trucking services are such that movement of grain or wheat products between eastern and western Bolivia is difficult and costly. However, this year some concern was voiced in the Santa Cruz area on the possible future effect of wheat importations as production increases and transportation problems are lessened.

Contraband is still listed as an important factor in the wheat market. As might be expected, its real impact is difficult to measure. It may adversely effect local wheat producers. However, it does benefit consumers who can buy their daily bread a little more cheaply because of the illegal imports. While it is generally agreed it should be controlled, the real lasting solution is the development of a more productive and efficient wheat production and marketing system. A more competitive relationship with potential illegal importers is a more permanent long term solution.

#### Credit Programs for Wheat Marketing

The use of PL-480 credit to stabilize market prices and to foster the construction of handling and storage facilities has been most beneficial to Bolivian wheat production programs. The repayment history of this activity is better than that of PL-480 sponsored wheat production credit programs. It should be expected that this type of program will remain an important tool in future development plans for PL-480 sponsored activities. However, care should be exercised in future market credit programs so as to assure that investments are only made as a part of a well-designed development plan for support of Bolivia's wheat industry.

Table II presents a summary of market credit data collected through the field survey conducted by the paratechnicians, as a part of this evaluation. Respondents noted an over 57 percent increase in the amount of wheat stored with the help of a PL-480 credit program. Little change was noted by those who did not receive credit. When respondents were asked to list the obstacles or constraints they had to marketing their wheat, 40 percent noted the variability of markets and the quality of their production. Slightly fewer, 33 percent listed the variability of production. The efficiency of intermediaries was listed as a constraint by 25 percent. Administrative ability was an obstacle to 20 percent, and 13 percent listed available technology as a problem. Interestingly, none named available storage capacity or transportation facilities as constraints.

**TABLE II**  
**MARKETING**

RESULTS	PERCENT CHANGE WITH PL480		PERCENT CHANGE WITHOUT PL480	
	MEANS	STD	MEANS	STD
(11) Amount of storage	57.807	75.853	2.813	55014.537
(12) Average sales price	1.333	4.000		
(13) Lost production (%)	20.	28.284	17.500	11.147
<b>CONSTRAINTS</b>				
(14) Available storage capacity			0.000	
(15) Transportation facilities			0.000	
(16) Variability of production			0.333	
(17) Variability of markets			0.400	
(18) Quality of production			0.400	
(19) Available technology			0.133	
(20) Administrative ability			0.200	
(21) Efficiency of intermediaries			0.267	
(22) Others			0.000	

**Recommendations for Wheat Marketing**

- 1) Efforts should be made to shorten the process and time used in securing PL 480 imports. Delivery should be spread more uniformly throughout the year.
- 2) Support should be given the Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat in their fulfilling their obligations in the importation and distribution of PL 480 wheat.
- 3) Plans and strategies should be developed and implemented which will move PL-480 wheat importation from governmental agencies into a free market commercial system.

**Recommendations for the Joint Commission and Executive Secretariat**

- 1) Develop clear guidelines which delineate the roles and responsibilities of the Joint Commission and the Executive Secretariat.
- 2) Explore ways of securing support and cooperation of ADIM on wheat importation program.

- 3) Support establishment of regional wheat committees in Santa Cruz, Cochabamba and other areas as needed.

### **RURAL DEVELOPMENT POLICY**

There are two aspects to the credit question:

1. A credit system that serves the special needs of agriculture and rural areas
2. The use of credit to improve agriculture and the rural areas.

The requirements for success in both cases are quite different. Also, the concept of making more funds available through credit and making more credit available to agriculture and the rural areas may not improve the credit system or improve agriculture and the rural areas. There has been a policy of making more credit available without consideration of the different needs of the two aspects nor the potential negative impact of more and cheaper credit.

To create a credit system that serves the special needs of agriculture and the rural areas, those needs must be well understood. Interviews suggest the following problems in PL-480 sponsored agricultural credit:

- Terms are too inflexible to account for climatic, market, and other variables outside the producers control.
- Principle is not sufficient to take full advantage of all profit improving inputs and practices.
- Insufficient terms and amounts available for infrastructure improvements (mortgage loans).
- Insufficient amounts available for financing marketing.
- Insufficient technical assistance to help borrowers obtain the maximum benefit from the credit.

It has been demonstrated in other countries that a credit system can be created that can eventually operate without subsidies. However, some outside assistance is usually required to create a credit system meeting the special needs of agriculture and the rural areas. This may come in the form of low interest sources of funding of the financing institutions closest to the borrower, in the form of guarantees or in the form of direct administrative, accounting and technical assistance. An agricultural or rural credit system that cannot eventually function without subsidies is not operating in an optimal manner. However, if the government wishes to subsidize the agriculture and rural sector, continued subsidy of the credit system provides such an opportunity, albeit not the most effective subsidy.

A determination should be made to determine what conditions are missing in the current credit system so that resources may be channeled to correct these conditions. This may mean creating an entirely new structure for agriculture and rural credit or in transforming the commercial banks to meet the special needs. Both approaches are currently being tested in Bolivia and it is not clear which will best serve the special needs of the agricultural and rural sector.

There is no problem with the line of credit available to agriculture if one can assume that all borrowers are knowledgeable in the use of credit and have the ability to analyze their credit needs and uses accurately. Unfortunately, this is not the case in Bolivia. Most farmers and rural borrowers have had very limited experience with credit and are not especially skilled in credit analysis. At a minimum there is a need to provide considerable and extensive technical and analytical assistance to the agricultural and rural borrowers. Without this assistance more liberal credit in this sector is likely to result in severe economic problems not only for the borrowers, but for the lending institutions.

The general purpose of PL-480 is to improve the economic conditions in the rural areas of Bolivia. Therefore, it is appropriate to question the use of PL-480 funds to provide more liberal credit in the rural areas without directing those funds toward the general purpose of PL-480. Clearly, providing more credit will not automatically improve economic conditions in the rural areas. All future PL-480 credit programs should be an integral part of a well prepared development plan. The wise use of credit as a tool can further Bolivia's development plans.

To assure that more liberal credit in the rural areas will improve economic conditions it is important to tie credit to improvements in agricultural practices, to improvements in agricultural infrastructure or superstructure, to improvements in marketing, etc. Specifically, credit should not be granted if it allows the borrower to continue with traditional practices. However, credit should be extended to assist in the use of certified seeds, to improve irrigation practices, to contour lands, to construct storage facilities, to use better quality weed or pest control, to improve access roads, etc.

#### Recommendations for 1990

Recommendation: Continue to seek ways to strengthen the service capability of private banks.

Recommendation: Continue to seek ways to strengthen the credit management capability of Intermediate Credit Institutions that are not private banks.

Recommendation: Tie credit availability to the use of improved production practices, improved production and market structure.

Explanation: It is clear that credit can play a very important role in rural development. Unfortunately, the mere provision of credit will not automatically enhance rural development as many producers may simply use the credit to continue with traditional practices, and/or use credit for consumption. Some of these problems can be addressed through the use of supervised credit and/or technical assistance as discussed in the next section.

The continued importance of credit in the PL 480 program can be better justified if, in addition to improvements in technical assistance and supervised credit, the use of credit is restricted to improved production practices, improved production structure and improved market structure.

## CREDIT POLICY, MARKETING AND PRODUCTION

Recommendation: Establish three loan line categories to the small producer.

Discussion: (1) An Annual Operating loan designed to facilitate annual operating costs i.e. seed, fertilizer. This loan line would be repaid on an annual basis coordinated with harvest and sale of crop and or crops financed. (2) Equipment and Livestock purchase loan line designed to facilitate purchase of equipment and livestock on terms that can be supported by crop income. i.e. equipment 5-7 year term with payments at time of crop or livestock production sale. (3) Soil and Water improvement loan line to facilitate land improvements on a longer term i.e. irrigation wells and delivery systems, land leveling, permanent structures related to agricultural production.

Recommendation: Develop a technical assistance support system by the lending agency or the producers' cooperative or association.

Discussion: Credit institutions that provide technical assistance and supervised borrower activities report better repayment and increased producer knowledge in production and credit management. Increased support and development of technical assistance and supervision is recommended. This can be funded thru loan charges via an increased interest rate or up front origination fees to the borrower. This technical assistance and supervision should be a firm requirement of the loan commitment made by the lender and borrower. The quality of technical assistance is of concern, including the transfer of new technology in place of traditional practices. The most effective method of delivery is technical assistance offered at the level of the producer via cooperatives and/or associations, university specialists, or private consultants. Technical Assistance is given on an equal and a consistent manner. Another positive point to be considered is the greatly reduced cost of the technical assistance that results. Technical assistance offered thru commercial banks is minimal to non existent. An increased interest rate or origination fees to cover such costs should be considered as a solution to this problem. Standard and traditional lending policies by commercial banks may still keep this type of assistance from occurring. To be consistent, the loan requirement of technical assistance must be in place for all credit sources for all small producers.

Recommendation: Establish a marketing credit line within the PL-480 loan program.

Discussion: This credit line will serve local markets primarily administered thru producer organizations or cooperatives approved as credit line administrators. The credit will be used to construct storage and grain handling facilities, facilitate marketing of local crop, and provide financial support to the small producer until crop can be orderly marketed.

The present PL-480 credit system to small farmer beneficiaries is influenced by both internal and external factors. Examples are regional climatic differences, differences in geographic location, market availability, crop production history, and local requirements. It is

evident that technical assistance is of major importance to the small producer in increasing production and profit margin relative to their loan repayment ability. At present, PL480 credit delivery via cooperatives and associations gives the most viable technical assistance and the greatest impact. With some exceptions the bank credit system has been unable to deliver credit with technical assistance or supervision. Banks cite problems of increased cost, thereby decreasing their profit margins. Also noted were standard lending policies which precluded lending to borrowers with limited collateral and guarantees. These lending conditions have limited the scope of delivery systems and lessened the impact of PL-480 loan programs.

The small producer has four sources of PL-480 credit available to choose from relative to need. These are noted as follows:

1. Commercial Banks (Intermediate Credit Institution - ICI) - to producer.

This source of credit to the small producer is somewhat limited due to collateral and guarantee requirements and lack of technical assistance. Interest rates are set at 13% with terms from 1 to 5 years. Most loans reviewed at the bank level showed credits to medium sized producers and larger agroindustry concerns. However, Banco Hipotecario had made several small individual loans to small producers and indicated a desire to continue in this direction. A major condition of the small producer credit is technical assistance and careful review of production and market conditions.

2. Commercial Bank/Coop (ICI) to Coop or Asso. (Sub ICI) to producer.

This source of credit is very attractive to the small producer because of the intensive technical assistance given as a condition of the credit. The sub ICI has area specific knowledge of production potentials, best seed varieties etc. to better assist and insure a successful farm enterprise. This knowledge offers a control factor that also insures repayment of the credit. Another distinct benefit is the lower collateral requirements and guarantees due primarily to the close supervised conditions. The interest rate and terms offered are similar as noted above in 1..

3. Commercial Bank/Coop (ICI) to producer.

Similar to 2 with intensive technical assistance as a major component to the individual credit line. The ICI in this case realizes a greater portion of the interest margin. Interest rates and terms are similar to the other loan programs.

4. Coop (ICI) - to producer.

Also offers intensive technical and supervised credit assistance but with an added cost to the borrower for the assistance. In most cases the 1/2 point to up to 2 points are part of the initial fund disbursement. Although a cost to the producer the additional monies created do assist in cost support for the technical staff needed by the producer.

Impact of PL-480 credit delivery to the small producer can be measured by increased production, number of total credits and the use of better farm management techniques. We noted that those interviewed were strongly in favor of technical assistance as a condition of the credit because of expected increases in production and income. The information compiled by the field survey team indicated the impact of PL 480 funds with technical assistance shows substantial increases in yield and income (See Table III). Interest rates were considerably lower with commercial rates at 30% and informal credit at between 10 to 20% per month. The 13% rate was extremely attractive to producers questioned. Terms were considered favorable for operating capital and small equipment purchase. However, the credit terms were considered too short for land improvements i.e. irrigation systems, wells, and permanent structures. It was apparent that the cost of the improvements desired could not be repaid under existing profit margins.

Problems encountered by the small producer relative to PL480 credit delivery were varied. Most producers indicated satisfaction with the interest rate but would like more flexibility in terms where equipment and land improvements investments are made (See Table III). In several of the coops and/or associations, funds were also not available at planting time thus requiring other arrangements to be made. When asked about increased interest rates to pay for technical assistance most were in favor as long as rates were reasonable and that collateral and guarantees remained the same. Eighty-seven percent of the survey respondents in Table III were male, with a mean age of 45. They had completed seven years of school.

TABLE III

CREDIT

CHARACTERISTICS OF BENEFICIARIES	MEANS	STD		
(8) Household size	5.766	2.269		
(9) Age	44.709	11.774		
(10) Gender (1)	0.868	0.338		
(11) Education completed	7.150	4.195		
-----				
TERMS OF CREDIT	AMOUNT	TERM	INTEREST	
(14) PL480 Credit	7220.544	20.376	12.938	
(15) Other Credit	9525.700	9.900	14.000	
-----				
RESULTS	PERCENT CHANGE WITH PL-480 CREDIT (N=96)		NEW ACTIVITY WITH PL-480 CREDIT (N=34)	
	MEANS	STD	MEANS	STD
(17) Number of units produced	138.076	165.354		
(18) Yield expected	191.555	1024.802		
(19) Yield obtained	174.020	1025.099		
(20) Income obtained (month)	215.955	195.423	3508.138	9500.272
-----				
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE				
(21) Use of improved technology (proportion)			0.829	
(23) Technical assistance (number of times)			4.011	
-----				
CONSTRAINTS	PERCENT LISTED AS A FACTOR			
(25) Market conditions			0.377	
(26) Climate			0.846	
(27) Plagues			0.377	
(28) Lack of inputs			0.138	
(29) Delays in credit			0.215	
(30) Others			0.069	
-----				
FUTURE				
(32) Seek future PL480 Credit			0.969	
-----				

(1) Gender, 1.0 represents male, 0.0 female. 0.868 indicates over 86 percent of the respondents were men.

## HEALTH AND NUTRITION POLICY

### Recommendations for 1990

Recommendation: Continue to seek high payoff, small investment opportunities to improve the programs of the PVO's.

Recommendation: Fund immunization projects with a view to the marginal productivity of the financing.

Recommendation: Promote regional coordination of outreach programs in health and nutrition.

Recommendation: Shift the balance of donations toward more disease prevention (health promotion) and less disease treatment.

Explanation: In rural areas of Bolivia the benefits of health improvement funding will nearly always be greater than the costs. Furthermore, investment in health improvement in the rural areas is an investment in human capital and therefore the future productivity of these rural areas.

Despite well considered programs of the Executive Secretariat the conditions of health and nutrition are poor and in some areas deteriorating. In the case of tuberculosis, it is expected that 13,500 cases will be confirmed in 1989 up from 10,624 cases in 1988. Further, it is estimated that only one in five cases of tuberculosis are diagnosed by health centers. A recent study (OPS/OMS, 1987) reported the total incidence of tuberculosis to be above 300/1000 population--or approximately three times the rates reported for Peru, Chile, Paraguay, Argentina and Brazil. With respect to malaria, confirmed cases have increased from 22,258 in 1988 to an expected 35,000 in 1989. For yellow fever, there is a high risk of an epidemic due to the fact that 24.5 percent of the houses inspected in the target areas have been infested with the mosquito carrier (*Aedes aegypti*). The infestation rate should be reduced to less than five percent to control an outbreak of this often fatal disease.

The increases in malaria are attributed to the migration of persons to affected areas (e.g. the Chapare). Also the success of efforts by health agencies to search out cases has resulted in larger numbers of confirmed cases.

Given these conditions, PL 480 activities in health should be directed to rural areas. It is impossible for the available meager PL-480 funds to alone support major health programs in Bolivia. However, there are many health programs already in progress funded by PVO's and government organizations. PL 480 funds are fortunately sufficiently flexible to compliment existing health programs and to substantially improve these programs.

This principle of funding small, high benefit project applies to most PL-480 program but is particularly appropriate in the health and education. The principle of marginal productivity can be applied here. In the early

stages of investment (the present state), health improvements may not increase very rapidly. As the investment in program increases health improvements become more obvious and beneficial. Continued investment in health improvements may eventually surpass an optimal value and additional investments will yield smaller improvements in health. This latter point can be illustrated by the very high cost of seeking out the last malaria or yellow fever mosquito in a widely dispersed rural area. As much as it is desired to eradicate TB, malaria, yellow fever, etc. the cost of finding the last mosquito, the last victim, etc., is very large. The marginal cost cannot be justified by a program such as PL-480. Again, the present policy of the ES is appropriate since they seek opportunities to enhance underfunded projects and to obtain large benefits from small investments.

Many smaller PVO health programs in Bolivia are perpetually underfinanced or overambitious for available budget. They are at an early or middle stage of development. They therefore provide an excellent opportunity to obtain a relatively large payoff with a small amount of matching or fill-in funding. Therefore, the current policy with regard to health programs should be continued.

A related issue is the relatively high costs of the house-to-house immunization campaigns in the rural areas. The Programa Ampliado de Inmunizaciones (PAI) would like funds to transport their technicians to each house and immunize. The cost of this is very high when only slightly less benefits could be obtained by subsidizing recipients transportation to a central immunization point. Past house-to-house campaigns have served to raise the consciousness of rural populations to the importance of immunizations. Therefore, saturation of communication media with timely announcements of immunization services in local health centers should mobilize persons to seek immunization producing comparable benefits to house-to-house campaigns at much lower cost. The change also has the advantage encouraging people to take greater responsibility for their own health care and to strengthen identification with their local health center.

The ES has played an important role in funding model programs in high priority areas. Two visited by the team were: a) San Martin de Porres, the facility for treatment of the estimated 3000 drug abusing poor and homeless children in the Cochabamba area; and b) Hospital Warnes, which has established a model outreach program involving seven regional health centers which offer health education, prevention, control and referral services to remote populations. Each has attracted considerable community support and complementary funding from other donors.

Results of the health survey conducted by the paratechnicians is presented in Table IV. In the study, it was found that 57 percent of the beneficiaries of health and nutrition programs were female. The average number of years and formal schooling was only 5.3 years. Perceived health risks were greatest for tuberculosis and least for yellow fever. Without PL-480 health programs most of the sample would not have received any immunizations or medical assistance. Problems of accessibility to health services are mentioned by more than half the beneficiaries.

TABLE IV

HEALTH

CHARACTERISTICS	MEANS		STD	
(8) Household size	5.431		1.860	
(9) Age	33.000		13.182	
(10) Gender (1)	0.431		0.495	
(11) Education completed	5.292		3.372	
-----				
RISKS	MEANS		STD	
(12) Tuberculosis	1.955(2)		0.952	
(13) Yellow fever	1.318(2)		0.666	
(14) Malaria	1.717(2)		1.014	
(15) Others	1.282(2)		1.011	
-----				
RESULTS	PL-480		CONTROL	
	MEANS	STD	MEANS	STD
(17-18) Services received	1.000	1.225	0.895	1.410
(20) Number of immunizations	13.627	30.895	0.196	0.595
(21) Medical assistance	4.706	4.586	0.588	1.375
-----				
CONSTRAINTS	PROPORTIONS			
(22) Costs	0.686			
(23) Transportation	0.500			
(24) Per diem	0.682			
(25) Availability	0.542			
(26) Others	0.048			
-----				

- (1) Gender 1.0 represents male, 0.0 female, 0.431 indicates 43 percent of respondents were women.
- (2) 1-represents a low risk, 2-represents a medium risk, 3-represents a high risk; thus respondents rated the risk of contracting tuberculosis as higher than yellow fever.

EDUCATION POLICY

**Recommendation:** Continue to seek investment opportunities which complement rural development.

**Recommendation:** Promote greater coordination of public and private sector professionals for the purpose of education and training.

Recommendation: Develop system of quality control to assure that education and training methods and materials are appropriate and content is based on the best information (research) available.

Explanation: Education and training must be a basic component of rural development strategy in Bolivia. Bolivia has among the lowest stocks of human capital in South America. Information provided by the Ministry of Education (Estrategia de Desarrollo, 1989) show that 91% of urban children but only 79% of rural children complete 5 years of education; 67% of urban children but only 12% of rural children complete 11 years of education (intermedio y medio). Clearly, the underdeveloped state of human capital is a major constrain on rural development.

Building from a weak base, one would expect that the returns on investment in human capital to be extremely high. Obviously, the responsibility for formal education lies with the central and regional governments. PL 480 cannot hope to effect significantly the average level of education, even in the rural areas. PL 480 can supplement and augment education in the rural areas, especially where this education will contribute significantly to rural development.

The ES has been following a policy of looking for special opportunities to augment and supplement educational programs that are specifically designed to improve youth and adult contribution to rural life, and to add to existing programs rural development focus. This policy compliments the other lines of PL 480 and in some cases will multiply the benefits gained from other lines.

Training is an integral component in many of the 20 lines of financing under the Fiscal Year 1989 Title III Food for Development Program. Training is programmed in support of the following; agro-industrial and artisanry credit systems; agricultural producer organizations; research and extension; private sector health and nutrition programs; privatization and micro enterprises; control of communicable diseases; and MACA restructuring.

In addition to the nonformal education (training), support for formal basic and technical education is provided through scholarship awards and strengthening grants to institutions. Beneficiaries receive education that without financial support would be unattainable.

With respect to measurable benefits from investment in education and training, the lag between the investment and the ultimate quantifiable benefit is quite long and the research required to measure these benefits is quite costly. Fortunately, this research has been done elsewhere and the results may be more or less applicable in Bolivia. The benefits of vocational, technical and formal education have consistently been shown to be greater than alternative investments in developing countries. Therefore, it is save to assume that investment in a well managed and functioning educational or training program will return excellent benefits not only to the students but to the institutions and communities with whom they are associated.

The important factor here is for the various organizations and agencies seeking PL 480 support or advising the ES to have the patience and vision to realize these significant benefits.

Results of the education survey conducted by the paratechnicians is presented in Table V. The study found that PL-480 scholarship programs benefit primarily young males. The average age is 16.5 years and 89 percent are male. The effect of PL-480 support is to increase the number of school years completed, educational goals, and professional goals. Grade point average (GPA) is also improved. Program constraints identified by program participants are the direct costs to participants for transportation, per diem, and inadequate quality of educational materials.

TABLE V  
EDUCATION

CHARACTERISTICS	PL-480 BENEFICIARIES (N=84)		NON-BENEFICIARIES (N=8)	
	MEANS	STD	MEANS	STD
(8) Household size	6.024	2.883	5.625	2.446
(9) Age	16.500	2.603	18.250	2.990
(10) Gender (1)	0.893	0.309	1.000	0.000
(11) Education completed	7.810	1.842	8.750	1.479

RESULTS	PL-480		CONTROL	
	MEANS	STD	MEANS	STD
(15) Education completed	9.071	2.348	7.810	1.842
(16) Educational goals	12.661	2.620	9.488	2.505
(17) Professional goals	14.463	3.232	9.625	3.112
(19) Grade Point Average	2.190	0.422	1.273	0.617

CONSTRAINTS	PROPORTIONS
(22) Costs	0.826
(23) Transportation	0.649
(24) Per diem	0.679
(25) Scheduling	0.208
(26) Infrastructure	0.152
(27a) Quality of instruction	0.130
(27b) Quality of materials	0.500
(28) Others	0.276

(1) Gender, 1.0 represents male, 0.0 represents female, 0.893 indicates over 89 percent of the respondents were male.

## COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE POLICY

### Recommendations for 1990

Recommendation: Continue with current policy for investing in infrastructure projects.

Recommendation: Seek less conventional infrastructure projects for future investment.

Explanation: Infrastructure projects require a relatively long time to demonstrate full benefits and these benefits are often difficult to quantify. Further, infrastructure projects can be very capital demanding. In spite of these difficulties, the need for improved infrastructure in the rural areas of Bolivia is acute and cannot be ignored.

The current policies of the ES appears to be to seek opportunities to match funds (or contributions in-kind) with other organizations, to provide the key funding to make projects feasible and to fund small projects in areas of acute need. This policy is appropriate. The ES will never have sufficient funds for large monumental projects which require not only large capital inputs for construction, but a substantial cash flow for maintenance. The BID can build the roads, the Swiss Government the large reservoirs and the German Government the dams. The ES can cooperatively finance bridges for farm roads, canals for irrigation systems, classrooms for agricultural education, equipment for rural hospitals, storage buildings for ag cooperatives, etc.

A good example is the irrigation project at Tuti Mayu in the department of Cochabamba. Much of the labor was provided by the campesinos and the productivity of their small subsistence farms has been greatly enhanced. They are now surviving the drought with less problems than they would have without the irrigation system. Productivity has increased considerably, they are now producing directly for the Cochabamba market as well as for home needs and emigration of younger people to the city has diminished. They would now like to have another large reservoir and canal system. While this may be economically feasible, the ES philosophy might be applied here and some assistance could be provided in lining the canals to reduce water loss, planting more trees around the reservoir to reduce silting in, grading the fields for more efficient water use, irrigating at night to reduce evaporative loss, etc. There is probably another community that could benefit more from a first reservoir.

Additional but less obvious infrastructure projects that deserve attention include:

- system of agricultural information via radio and television
- improved rural communication (telephone, two-way radio or some other system)
- appropriate technology water treatment plants for producing potable water
- fuel efficient cooking and heating equipment
- resource conserving projects such as dikes, trees, grass,

Results of the infrastructure survey conducted by the paratechnicians is presented in Table VI. In the study it was found that infrastructure investments benefit small rural communities with relatively low per capita income. The perceived economic, environmental and social benefits of infrastructure are moderate to high. Maintenance of infrastructure was cited as a problem by only 22.5 percent of the sample. Ninety percent of the communities who have benefited from PL-480 infrastructure projects would seek additional PL-480 projects for their communities. Sixty-nine percent of the communities receiving PL-480 support have other sources of support also.

TABLE VI  
INFRASTRUCTURE

CHARACTERISTICS OF BENEFICIARIES	MEANS	STD
(7) Population	1017.443	1219.302
(8) Percapita Income (Bs/year)	1780.309	4778.068
(9) Level of unemployment (%)	6.634	7.400
-----		
PL-480		
PROGRAM BENEFITS	MEANS	STD
(14) Economic	2.351(1)	0.737
(15) Environmental	2.143(1)	0.639
(16) Social	2.418(1)	0.706
(17) Others	2.333(1)	0.471
-----		
CONSTRAINTS	PROPORTIONS	
(18) Quality of the infrastructure	0.100	
(19) Maintenance	0.225	
(20) Accessibility	0.088	
(21) Others	0.363	
-----		
SUPPORT		
(22) Seeks future PL480 support	0.912	
(12) Has other sources of support	0.692	
-----		
(1) 1 represents low expected benefits, 2 represents medium benefits and 3 represents high benefits; all were rated much the same, with social benefits ranking slightly higher than environmental benefits.		

## SEED IMPROVEMENT POLICY

### Recommendations for 1990

Recommendation: Assist in increased and improved promotion of the use of improved seeds.

Recommendation: Encourage the commercial independence and quality reputation of the Consejos Regionales de Semillas.

Recommendation: Require the use of improved seeds in the credit program.

Explanation: Included in this area are the efforts at producing more certified or registered seeds, encouraging the use of these seeds and producing and planting tree seedlings. ES activities in these areas have been slower to show results and there have been some difficulties in encouraging the use of improved seeds in the altiplano and the slopes of Bolivia. Also, there have been many problems in establishing tree plantations.

The work of the Consejo Regional de Semillas is not consistent from department to department, but overall is of high quality and consistent. It is important that the CRS maintain its reputation of high quality work and independence from the commercial sector. Seed users will continue to have confidence in the program and the use of improved seeds will grow. Also, the increase in the commercial production and processing of improved seeds is noticeable during the past year. This is also important to the success of the program.

In general, more can be done to promote the use of improved seeds. There is now enough experience in the country to document the benefits of using improved seeds. This needs to be quantified and used in an extensive promotion campaign with growers. Apparently the demand for improved seeds in the department of Santa Cruz is quite strong, but this is not the case among potato growers who probably have more to gain. This will probably require a special campaign which will include some technical assistance in combining other improved inputs to obtain the maximum benefits from seed.

Another method related to credit is to tie the use of production credit to the use of improved seeds and other complimentary inputs.

If the benefits of improved seeds are clearly enough demonstrated producers will be willing to pay a sufficiently high price to eventually eliminate the need for subsidies to the seed producing and certifying sector. Therefore, the investment in promotion in education at this stage may pay off well in the near future.

**APPENDIX A**  
**INDIVIDUALS AND ORGANIZATIONS INTERVIEWED**  
**- BY THE PL-480 EVALUATION TEAM**

**INDIVIDUALS INTERVIEWED****ORGANIZATION**

Darrel McIntyre	ARD/USAID
Raymond Victorine	ARD/USAID
Hernon Munoz	ARD/USAID
Oswaldo Vega	ARD/USAID
Carlos Brockman	Executive Secretariat
Jorge Noda	Executive Secretariat
Luis Jordan	Executive Secretariat
Marcelo Urquizo	Executive Secretariat
Marcelo Barbery	Executive Secretariat
Maria Elena de Prudencio	Executive Secretariat
Freddy Salas Soruco	ADIM
Gozalo Escobari	ADIM
Freddy Hidalgo	ADIM
Jose Maria Vicente	Ind. Com. HNOS.
Lu's Teran	Ind. Com. HNOS.
Alfonso Mollor Venagas	Molina Modelo
Ricardo Salvago Franco	Banco de la Union Santa Cruz
Bismarck Benagas Benagas	Banco de Santa Cruz
Jaime Subieta	Banco Hipotecario CCBA
Carlos Buitrago	Banco Hipotecario CCBA
Alberto Montero	FENACRE
Celiar Lopez	FENACRE
Juan Antezona	CIAPROT
Angel Davilla Gutierrez	Coop. San Jose de Punata
Guillermo Ribera Cuellar	ANAPO
Pablo Gottret Valdes	Ministry of Finance
Herman Foebolles	Ministry of Agriculture
Gonzalo Mendez	Ministry of Commerce
Enrique Blanco	Banco Hipotecario La Paz
Guillermo Salcedo	Banco Industrial
Hector Soto	Banco Boliviano Americano
Hugo Monje	Centro de Rehab. S.Mart. de Porres
Alfredo Ponce de Leon	Centro de Rehabil S.Mart. de Porres
Sylvia Zapata	Unidad Sanitaria de CCBA
Freddy Villegas	San Ignacio de Tacata
Sister Gloria Esposito	San Ignacio de Tacata
Jorge Flores	PAI
Saul Villarroel	PAI
Juan Antezana	PAI
Roberto Vargas	PAI
Roger Jimenez	Unidad Sanitaria St. Cruz
Jose Cespedas	Unidad Sanitaria St. Cruz
Rosa Vargas	Unidad Sanitaria St. Cruz
Guillermo Cuentas	Ministry of Health
Roger Lozada	Hospital Warnes
Hugo Moreno	Hospital Warnes
Manual Egas	Colegio Adv. de Bolivia
Juan Medina	Colegio Adv. de Bolivia
Roberto Tellez	Colegio Adv. de Bolivia
Roberto Melognoc	PAHS
Virginia Fernandez	PAHS

Raul Montenegro  
Luis Zaballos  
Mary Scheflen  
Edgar Guardia  
Arturo Rios  
Guido Revollo  
Jorge Rosalles  
Frank Gutierrez

Univ. Gabriel Rene Moreno  
Univ Evang. Bolivia  
Univ Evang. Bolivia  
DESEC  
ARADO  
Consejo Reg. de Semillas  
Consejo Reg. de Semillas  
Coop. Imm. Conception

**APPENDIX B**  
**INSTITUTIONAL SURVEY REPORTS**

## **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) **NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADORS:** Frank J. Smith  
Frederick J. Smith
- (2) **FECHA:** Oct. 10, 1989
- (3) **INSTITUCION:** Centro de Rahabilitacion San Martin de Porres
- (4) **DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:** Cochabamba
- (5) **NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:**  
  
Sr. Hugo Monje, Administrative Director  
Lic. Alfredo Ponce de Leon, Administrator

## **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) **CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480?** July 1987
- (7) **CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:** PL 480 support has provided for costs of construction of a mini-clinic (capacity 50) and an observation facility. Equipment and furniture were also provided.

## **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) **CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?**  
  
The program provides in-patient treatment for drug abusing children. The period of rehabilitation ranges from 24 to 36 months for each child. The program also is involved in prevention activities-- group presentations are made in the community to discourage drug use.
- (9) **QUENCES ON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**  
  
The beneficiaries are all males ages 5 to 16 years old.
- (10) **COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**  
  
It is estimated that 3000 children are living on the streets of Cochabamba and abusing drugs. Children from this population who are referred to the program are screened by a social worker to determine the status of the child and the nature of the drug abuse.

**(23) CUALES TRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

Twelve boys have completed the rehabilitation and considered "cured". The program provides for follow-up contacts every 2 months to prevent/monitor possible relapse. Of the twelve who completed rehabilitation three are in the army, the others are in various jobs and doing well. The program is unique in Bolivia. The program apparently has good community support: \$45,000 in small donations were raised in the community to buy the 30,000 square meter lot; a group of 30 local women provide voluntary support to the program. The program has received funds from the World Bank and IBD to provide residential facilities.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

The program is presently independent of government and chooses to remain so.

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

The program requests future consideration of scholarships for training of professionals in drug prevention and rehabilitation (2-3 months out-of-country). Future efforts of the program will concentrate more on prevention.

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 11, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Unidad Sanitaria de Cochabamba
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dra. Silvia Zapata, Head of the Regional Tuberculosis Program

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? before 1986
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

PL 480 has provided medicines, one vehicle, and travel support for supervision of rural program activities.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

The goal of the program is to reduce disease and mortality from tuberculosis. Components of the program include education of personnel, detection of new cases of TB, vaccination, and improvement of the network of diagnostic laboratories.

- (9) QUENCES ON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

The program serves the entire regional population. The greatest incidence of pulmonary tuberculosis is in persons between 15 and 20 years old. Extrapulmonary tuberculosis most effects children.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Everyone who comes to the centers are entitled to services. The Ministry of Health reaches about 1/3 of the affected population. The program complements the Ministry of Health in outreach to the rural population. Consideration is given to whether a person will follow the treatment regime required or will prematurely abandon treatment.

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL ANO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

In the period 1986-88 more cases of TB are being indentified. The incidence of TB is estimated at 400/100,000 which is the highest reported rate in the world. The program has organized a local commission to coordinated activities.

**OBSTACULOS**

(24) ECONOMICAL

(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL

(26) AMBIENTAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL

The government has identified control of TB as a national priority.

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480

The program needs a nurse, improved laboratories (the microscopes presently available were donated in the period 1960- 70), another vehicle and travel support to improve supervision of field work. More effort is needed in prevention (education).

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) **NOMBE DEL ENCUESTADORS:** Frank J. Smith  
Frederick J. Smith
- (2) **FECHA:** Oct 10, 1989
- (3) **INSTITUCION:** San Ignacio de Tacata
- (4) **DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:** Cochabamba
- (5) **NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:**  
Freddy Villegas, Administrator  
Sister Gloria Esposito, Director

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) **CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480?** 1985
- (7) **CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:**  
PL 480 has provided scholarship support for 40 students to cover food, health care, educational materials, utilities and related costs. The amount of the scholarship is 60 Bolivians/month while the estimated program costs are twice that amount (120 B/month).

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) **CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?**  
The program has dual objectives of education and production.
- (9) **QUENCES ON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**  
The school serves 110 students. Of those 59 are residents at the school.
- (10) **COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**  
The students at the school are orphans and are received from state agencies as space permits. 100 are boys and 10 are girls. The 40 scholarships are reserved for the older students.
- (23) **CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**  
The school has produced 20 graduates with the degree of tecnico medio (4 year program) o tecnico auxilliar (3 year program). All graduates are currently employed.

**OBSTACULOS**

(24) ECONOMICAL

(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL

The school has suffered losses in production as a result of pilfering by the surrounding community. They would like to provide for greater security with fences, etc.

(26) AMBIENTAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 11, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Unidad Sanitaria Cochabamba, Programa de Epidemiologia (PAI)
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dr. Jorge Flores, Head of Epidemiology  
Dr. Saul Villarroel, Head of Zone 2 Malaria-Cochabamba  
Dr. Jauan Antezana, Health Center-Cerro Verde  
Dr. Roberto Vargas, Director Unidad Sanitaria-Cochabamba

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1979
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

PL 480 has provided vehicles, refrigerators for storage of medicines, training, vaccines, health supplies including uniforms for workers, and other related costs of operation.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

Activities include: control of tuberculosis including diagnosis and treatment (BCG vaccine for children less than one year and for children age 6); house to house campaign to vaccinate children ages 0-3 for polio; vitamin A supplements for children ages 1-5; control of intestinal parasites for children ages 2-15; vaccinations for measles (children 9 months to 3 years); Diphtheria, tetanus and caluche (children 2 months to 3 years; toxoide tetanico (women 15-44 years).

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

100 percent control of polio, DPT and measles

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Total coverage of the population;

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

In rural areas, persons are advised by radio of the health services available and persons are encouraged to come.

**(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

Number of confirmed cases of malaria and tuberculosis rates have approximately doubled since 1980 in spite of (in part due to the extensive efforts to identify cases). Another factor is the population migration to affected areas.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

Shortage of vehicles, refrigerators are more than 10 years old, radio communications with rural areas are inadequate

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

There is too much centralization of functions

**(29) OTROS**

Timely access to supplies (e.g. DDT)

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Create conditions for greater stability of personnel; streamline the process for obtaining necessary medical supplies; and regionalize program activities.

**GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 10, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Unidad Sanitaria, St. Cruz
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: St. Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dr. Roger Jimenez, Director General  
Dr. Jose Cespedes, Director of Malaria Program  
Dra. Rosa Vargas, Director of Yellow Fever

**PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1979
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:  
PL 480 has provided insecticide, equipment, vehicles, and maintenance.

**ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?  
Control of the vectors for disease transmission and inoculations.
- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?
- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?
- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)  
Malaria control has achieved an 85% coverage of rural houses in its spray program, up from 35% in 1988.

**OBSTACULOS**

- (24) ECONOMICAL
- (26) AMBIENTAL
- (27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

Delays in deliveries of chemical agents has been a problem but is better this year.

**(28) POLITICAL/GOVIERNAL**

**Centralization of functions has caused problems**

**(29) OTROS**

**Shortage of personnel to do the work required, untrained workers have not maintained proper records of their work**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 17, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Ministry of Health
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dr. Guillermo Cuentas, Subsecretario

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Provide for the policy, planning, research and supervision of national health services.

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

### **OBSTACULOS**

- (24) ECONOMICAL
- (25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL
- (26) AMBIENTAL
- (27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480
- (28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNA

Excessive governmental centralization and not enough interagency coordination.

- (29) OTROS

- (30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480

Provide for integrated delivery of health services as opposed to management of independent programs (e.g. yellow fever, malaria, chagas, etc.); Decentralize health programs and streamline processes; Encourage the participation of groups of all kinds (churches, sports clubs, labor unions, etc.) in health promotion activities; Give greater emphasis to health education activities.

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) **NOMBE DEL ENCUESTADORS:** Frank J. Smith  
Frederick J. Smith
- (2) **FECHA:** Oct 13, 1989
- (3) **INSTITUCION:** Hospital Canero Nuestra, Sra. Del Rosario  
(Warnes)
- (4) **DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:** St. Cruz
- (5) **NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:**  
  
Lic. Roger Lozada, Administrator  
Dr. Hugo Moreno, Director

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) **CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480?** 1989
- (7) **CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:**  
  
PL 480 has provided support for improvements in the hospital infrastructure, equipment (beds, surgery gear, etc.)

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) **CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?**  
  
The 54 bed hospital attends to the medical needs of the community and in addition has implemented seven pilot medical centers throughout the province of Warnes. The remote centers emphasize prevention, environmental health, and education.
- (9) **QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**  
  
Beneficiaries include those families insured by the sugar producers, their employees, private citizens of the area including indigents.
- (10) **COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**
- (23) **CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL ANO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**  
  
The hospital has assembled a good team of medical professionals and has the support of the community including a group of 20 women volunteers who regularly assist the staff of the hospital.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Approvals for PL 480 funding took approximately 2 years.

**(28) POLITICAL./GOBIERNAL**

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADORS: Frank J. Smith  
Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 11, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Colegio Adventista de Bolivia
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:
- Manuel Egas, Manager  
Juan Medina, Director General  
Roberto Tellez, Treasure

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1979
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:
- PL 480 has provided 60 scholarships for student-interns. The scholarships provide food, medical care and educational expenses.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?
- The school provides formal and technical education to students. Graduates with the degree of technico medio are employed as school teachers throughout the country.
- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?
- The school has an enrollment of 1400 students of which 400 are residents.
- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?
- The school screens candidates for academic and personal characteristics. They don't want problem students.
- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)
- The director reports a minimal dropout rate (approximately 60 in nine years of operations). Without the PL 480 program 10 students would not have been admissible for financial reasons.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

The scholarships provide only a portion of the per/capita costs of education (60/335 per month)

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

**(29) OTROS**

Discipline and interest of students

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 16, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Fundacion Programas de Asentamientos Humanos (PAHS)
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:  
Roberto Melognoc, Director  
Virginia Fernandez, Executive Director

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1986
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:  
PL 480 has provided 2 vehicles, radio communication equipment, and support for technical assistance.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?  
The program is consists of three integrated components: relocations, health promotion, and adult education. A staff of 18 includes 14 with technical specialties (4 are clerical/support).
- (9) QUENCES ON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?  
Approximately 45,000 families (9500 to 11,000 families) are living in the resettlements in the Beni and Ungas.
- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?  
Persons are evaluated with respect to their health and technical preparation prior to relocation. They are also briefed on the social and organizational aspects of the program.
- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL ANO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)  
Program participants are reported to be producing higher agricultural yields than the local average (for tea, banana, rice yuka, citris, soy bean and corn). Approximately half of the persons involved in the

resettlement program leave the community but for the most part they stay in the area as independent family enterprises. There are some apparently divisive social conflicts within the settlement communities involving disputes over priorities and policies. PAHS has attracted a diversified funding base. Approximately 50% of the funding is from sources other than PL 480.

#### **OBSTACULOS**

(24) **ECONOMICAL**

(25) **INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

The resettlement communities are disadvantaged for lack of an access road. The road would be 30 km.

(27) **ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

(29) **OTROS**

(30) **QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Longer term projects are suggested (up to 3 years); Greater emphasis on development objectives with accounting serving the greater objective not an end in itself.

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 12, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Universidad Gabriel Rene Moreno, Proyecto Florida
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: St. Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dr. Raul Montenegro, Vice Rector

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1989
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

PL 480 has provided a vehicle, 2 motorcycles, 2 sets of radio communication equipment, laboratory equipment, supplies, and audiovisual equipment (betamax).

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

The Florida project includes activities in animal management, training of local leaders in matters of animal health, and improvement of animal nutrition.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

The project is just getting started but there are a number of favorable indicators. The University appears to have a group of well trained and dedicated professors. The University participates in various regional commissions to coordinate research and extension activities: Consejo Regional de Investigacion Agricola (CRIA); Consejo Regional de Extension Agricola (CREA); Consejo Regional de Semillas (CRS).

**OBSTACULOS**

(24) ECONOMICAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480

**GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct. 20, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Escuela de Formacion Profesional Patacamaya
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Ing. Gudustrial, Director  
Father, Juan Ramirez

**PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1989
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:  

PL 480 has provided materials for the industrial arts courses.

**ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?  

The school offers an integrated program leading to degrees bachiller humanistico and tecnico medio. The technical training is organized into three specializations (carpentry, auto mechanics, and metal mechanics).
- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?  

The school has a capacity for 180 students. The program is being phased in over a four year period. Two classes have been admitted and the enrollment is now 100 students.
- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?  

Students are selected on the basis of an examination of basic academic skills. Also the school seeks to maintain a balanced enrollment of 70% rural and 30% local community students. All are male.
- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)  

The dropout rate is reported to be approximately 10% The programs are popular in the quality of work is improving.

**OBSTACULOS**

(24) ECONOMICAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480

The school is limited somewhat by not having the necessary tools, motors to disassemble/assemble, and scholarships for needy students.

### GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 13, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Universidad Evangelica Boliviana
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: St. Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Ing. Luis Zeballos, Rector  
Mary Scheflen, Vice Rectora

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? 1986
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

PL 480 has provided support for construction of chicken houses, swine house, a elevated water tank and well, purchase of livestock and initial feedstocks (first three months).

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

The agricultural program of the University has 34 student/residents from all around Bolivia. They receive formal education leading to the degree of tecnico medio. In addition they receive supervised training in agricultural production.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

34 scholarship students

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

The students are largely self-selected. Few if any who have sought admission have been denied. Preference is given to students from rural areas.

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

The first class will graduate this year. The first year 5 of 24 dropped-out of the program mostly for personal reasons. In the second class only 1 of 35 have dropped-out.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

**Getting started was a problem; many delays**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480**

**The program could benefit from additional scholarships. They need a tractor for their 24 hectare facility. They also wish to develop the capacity to prepare their own feedstocks for their poultry operations.**

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct. 10
- (3) INSTITUCION: DESEC
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Edgar Guardia, Director

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1984 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

PL 480 provides operating support for reforestation, operation of tree nurseries and training in forestry.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

1. Improve agriculture by establishing vegetative cover and preventing erosion
2. Rational resource management and augment soil productivity
3. Control floods
4. Reforest marginal areas
5. Increase rural employment in forests
6. Consolidate forest activities

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

75% of the participants are communities and 25% individuals.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

There is one nursery in each geographic region of CBB. Each nursery has a promoter that establishes criteria for participation. The promoter speaks at public meetings and encourages maximum participation where the commercial and ecological benefits will be the greatest.

### **RESULTADOS**

- (23) CUALES OTROS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Have achieved planting goals during the past two years but it is too early to measure impacts against their own objectives mentioned above.

They are changing their procedures because of the low success rate of the plantings. There are many problems with seedlings destruction by uncontrolled domestic animals and inadequate care by property owner. For the next three years the planting goals will be reduced and an attempt will be made to find solutions to these two problems (and others). They will plant fewer trees but improve the management of the plantations. They will attempt to protect the trees against animals, drought and poor property owner management. Also, they feel that more training is necessary.

#### **OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

Lack of roads makes it difficult to establish plantings in places where needed

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

Big problem this year with the drought.

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

ES staff very helpful.

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

No problem.

**(29) OTROS**

Difficult teaching the campesinos the value of plantings. Their planning horizon is too short.

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Stability of funding for DESEC is important because so much time is required to realize the benefits of their program. There must be confidence in the long term benefits of the program even though the average rural citizen doesn't believe or understand the benefits. It is unrealistic to expect strong support from the local people whom will be the eventual beneficiaries of the program.

Regarding the role of credit as a rural development tool, they feel that the amount of credit provided in the rural areas commercial banks is woefully inadequate to provide the normal needs of the community. Therefore, PL 480 funds fill an important need.

## **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct. 9
- (3) INSTITUCION: ARADO
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Ing. Arturo Moreira Rios, Gerente General

## **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

ARADO is an intermediary that provides credit and technical assistance with PL 480 funds.

## **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

ARADO's objective is to bring about rural and agricultural development.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Participants are full time farmers. There were 1200 family members in CBB during 1988. The number is now 1380. There are 500 in La Paz and 82 in Santa Cruz.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Only full time agricultural producers qualify as members of ARADO. They must live on the farm and be good producers. They are recommended by neighbors and there must be a minimum of 12 families for a community to receive the technical services of ARADO.

## **RESULTADOS**

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

ARADO has consistently kept records of each members production. From these records they estimate that members gross incomes have increased

by approximately 300% due to participation in the credit and technical assistance programs during the past two years. This was not verified and seems to be a rather bold claim.

## **OBSTACULOS**

### **(24) ECONOMICAL**

This is the primary obstacle, especially marketing problems.

### **(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

Lack of good roads and insufficient irrigation capacity (especially in 1989) were major obstacles.

### **(26) AMBIENTAL**

### **(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

The ES staff is a big help.

### **(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

### **(29) OTROS**

Many times the inputs don't arrive on time and there are problems with quality consistency. Also mentioned was the weakness of the central government.

### **(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Felt that the commercial banking sector did not serve the needs of the agricultural producer. They are too much accustomed to serving the consumer or comerciante. They felt that their system was the best and that it should be duplicated in all parts of Bolivia.

ARADO is applying for emergency relief from credit requirements because of the severe drought in the region. This drought seemed to provide an opportunity to seek ways to protect against future droughts such as improved irrigation methods and improved soil management.

## **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: October 10
- (3) INSTITUCION: Consejo Regionales de Semillas
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Guido Revollo, Director

## **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1966 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:
  1. PL 480 covers some office and communication expenses.
  2. PL 480 provides a line of credit to seed producers through ICI's

## **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Increase agricultural production through the use of certified seed.
- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Any producer that demonstrates the ability to produce good quality seed can participate in the seed production process. Beneficiaries are also the users of the increased volume of improved seed.
- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

The CRS depends upon the producer cooperatives (ARADO, CIAPROT) to identify qualified producers.

## **RESULTADOS**

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Intermediate results include increases in seed production and plantings. From 1988 to 1990 hectares in seed production is expected to increase by 400. The Demand for improved seed is up significantly this spring and distributors are having difficulty finding enough improved seed to meet their needs.

Some production data indicates that wheat yields are up by as much as 1400 kilos per Ha and potatoes as much as 15 tons due to improved seeds.

#### **OBSTACULOS**

##### **(24) ECONOMICAL**

The market for improved seeds is still not fully developed. There is resistance to paying higher prices for improved seeds.

##### **(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

##### **(26) AMBIENTAL**

##### **(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

No problems.

##### **(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

Need more government credit and laws to allow seed producers to organize.

##### **(29) OTROS**

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 12
- (3) INSTITUCION: Consejo Regionales de Semillas
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Santa Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Ing. Jorge Rosales, Director  
(and president Consejo National de Semillas)

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION.

PL 480 provides operating cost support. Also, the CRS must approve credit for seed producers that is being provided by PL 480 intermediaries. 3% of the interest goes to CNS and 1% to CRS.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

1. Increase agricultural production through the use of certified seed.
2. Introduce new seeds to agriculture.
3. Develop to the point where CRS is self financing.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Producers and processors of improved seeds, sellers of improved seeds, credit intermediaries (ANAPO, ARAPO, FENACRE...), the corporation desarrollo rural and the research institutions.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

In Santa Cruz there are more applicants for producing seed than CRS can serve. Therefore, they have developed a complex system of selecting producers. The applicant must complete several forms, the farm is examined by the CRS technician and the information must be approved by the CRS staff. After acceptance the producers activities are monitored by the technicians.

Seed processors must also apply and their facilities are examined before acceptance and during the processing. The seeds processed by the plant must be certified by CRS before being sold.

## **RESULTADOS**

### **(23) CUALES OTROS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

3320 hectares of seed were approved for production during the summer of 1987-88 producing 2,994,623 kilos of certified seed. 1988 Winter production was another 6,286,176 kilos of seed. This made Santa Cruz the largest seed producing region in the nation. The increase in soybean seed production from 1988 to 1989 was 40% in spite of the fact that PL 480 credit could not be used.

The number of seed processors increased from 8 in 1986 to a current 14 in Santa Cruz. Even with this increase in the number of processors, warehouses are jammed with seed anticipating the planting season.

## **OBSTACULOS**

### **(24) ECONOMICAL**

No direct financial assistance from the central government.

### **(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

### **(26) AMBIENTAL**

### **(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

More credit flexibility would help. Credit not available for soybean seed production.

### **(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

### **(29) OTROS**

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith  
Frank J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct. 13, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Cooperativa Immaculate Concepcion
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Santa Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Frank Gutierrez, Director

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1987 )

- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

This cooperative is a credit intermediary for PL 480 funds. It also receives funds for equipment and infrastructure. It has also received funds to assist in the commercialization of rice.

### **ACTIVIDADES.**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

1. Produce better quality rice.
2. Replace the rice currently being imported from Brazil and eventually export to Brazil.
3. Reduce cost of rice production in Bolivia.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Any rice grower can join the cooperative. There are currently 1000 members.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Open to anybody.

### **RESULTADOS**

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

The cooperative claims that the cost of production has been reduced by 20 to 25 dollars due to the assistance of PL 480. They were not able to document this claim. Also, PL 480 funds helped buy two tractors used to clear jungle for rice production.

## **OBSTACULOS**

### **(24) ECONOMICAL**

Claimed to short of capital.

### **(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

### **(26) AMBIENTAL**

Can use cleared soils only 5 years. (see comments below)

### **(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Improve timing of credit.

### **(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

Problem with contraband rice.

### **(29) OTROS**

Low demand for rice or rice products in Bolivia, even though it can be produced cheaply here.

### **(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Large inventories of rice were observed and the cooperative claimed that there was no market for it. Yet they continue to clear jungle and plant more acreage of rice. In addition to the addition to rice surplus, this of course, reduces the natural areas which might be used for more productive purposes in the future. There appears to be no interest in using a crop rotation to maintain soil productivity and reduce the need for jungle clearing. Continuance of these practices should be seriously questioned.

## **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct. 16, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Ministry of Finance
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dr. Pablo Gotret, Subsecretary of Finance and  
President of the JCRD.

## **RESULTADOS**

EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!

- (11) QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?

The policy of the Government of Bolivia puts it at an disadvantage relative to Chile, Brazil, Argentina, etc. with respect to the open market. Bolivia must develop a strong and helpful credit system to counter the protective policies of these other nations.

- (16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA REESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?

This is in process.

- (17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

This is included in the 1989-2000 year plan for economic and social development.

- (18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?

In process.

- (19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

There are plans for PL 480 to finance regional export development foundations, especially for soybeans. Most producers need better market information.

(20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?

Soybeans are the most important. Much research is needed to improve soybean production, including research on seeds.

(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?

Some traditional things are being done, but not much.

## GRUPO DE EVALUACION

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Frederick J. Smith
- (2) FECHA: Oct 17, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Ministry of Commerce and Tourism
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Dr. Gonzalo Mendez, Subsecretary of Commerce and Tourism and member of the JCRD

## **RESULTADOS**

EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!

- (12) SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?

This is not a very good measure and should consider other factors.

- (16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA RESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?

In the planning stages.

- (17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

Since the current government wasn't involved in the original planning it will probably have a different view than that expressed in the 1989-2000 social and economic development document.

- (18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?

Doesn't believe that this will work. Centralization is a bad idea. Perhaps there is an opportunity to develop regional councils.

- (19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

Would like to see regional commissions formed to assist in the exportation of products.

Other observations by the subsecretary.

1. Would like to see the relationship with PL 480 continue for a long time at about \$20 million per year.
2. Would like to see most emphasis on the development of agriculture, especially the production of wheat.
3. Would like to see the PL 480 wheat monetarized more efficiently and effectively.
4. Must break the power of the millers but doesn't think the JCRD should get involved in the politics.
5. Campesinos that can use credit well should have access, but many don't. Therefore credit is justified, except for the very poor who should receive donations.
6. The production of wheat is the primary point. Doesn't think there is any problem with competition from the PL 480 wheat. Production in Santa Cruz can be greatly increased, also some in Cochabamba and Tarija, especially with more irrigation.
7. The good experience and capability of the ES should be utilized for as long possible, even without PL 480 funding.
8. The new government doesn't necessarily agree with the previous government and therefore the agreements previously made with the U.S. government may not apply. This government places a high priority on the control of contraband. (even though this will significantly raise the cost of living for the majority of people and benefit only a few producers?)

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Walter Taylor and Gene Ott
- (2) FECHA: 10-10-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: ANAPO (Asociacion de Productores de Oleaginosa y Trigo)
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Santa Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Lic. Guillermo Ribera Cuellar - Gerente General

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1985 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

An association primarily devoted to the research, production and marketing of wheat. Works with CIAT in research and seed certification.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

1. Planting of a certain amount of hectares reserved for seed for next crop year.
2. Continue with developing different crop rotational systems i.e. Soya - Wheat, Soya - Rice
3. Improve wheat marketing and pricing. Become involved in researching alternatives in wheat, soy bean and rice production.
4. Would like to become involved in developing a credit that uses technical assistance and supervision as a loan approval condition.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Mennonite community - at present have approximately 80% of total area production.

Japanese community - raise 10% of local production.

Bolivian farmers - raise the remaining 10% of local production

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

As ANAPO/CIAT have the only available certified seed in the area this condition holds area to know and understand the assistance offered. Both organizations also issue a newsletter that gives information on varieties of seed available and noteworthy management practices.

## RESULTADOS

EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!

- (11) QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?

Likes the program very much. Beneficiaries are also well pleased with the program results. ANAPO however would like to have a greater share in the interest margin to be able to improve and mobilize intensive technical assistance and research.

- (12) SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?

SI (x) NO ( )

ESTE AUMENTO SE DEBE GRACIAS AL APOYO EN:

- (13) ASISTENCIA TECNICA?

SI (x) NO ( )

- (14) CREDITO A LA PRODUCCION?

SI (x) NO ( )

- (15) CREDITO A LA COMERCIALIZACION?

SI (x) NO ( )

- (16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA RESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO? no comment

SI ( ) NO ( )

- (17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

SI (x) NO ( )

- (18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS? no comment

SI ( ) NO ( )

- (19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

- (20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?

SI ( ) NO ( )

EN CUANTO?

(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?

SI (x) NO ( )

(22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

1. Increased number of hectares planted
2. Better seed for planting
3. Technical assistance and research to members has resulted in better management and production.

#### OBSTACULOS

(24) ECONOMICAL

Marketing and price is controlled by Millers

(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL

none

(26) AMBIENTAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

Very good

(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?

Would like a direct PL480 loan to facilitate a supervised credit system that offers intensive technical assistance. The increased interest margin will allow for more services offered to their members. They noted that the Bank lending policies were too hard requiring guarantees and collateral at a 2 to 1 ratio. This limited ANAPO's ability to improve across the board.

**NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:**

(2) **FECHA:**

(3) **INSTITUCION:**

(4) **DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:**

(5) **NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:**

**PARTICIPACION**

(6) **CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? (                    )**

(7) **CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:**

**ACTIVIDADES**

(8) **CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?**

(9) **QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**

(10) **COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?**

**RESULTADOS**

**EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!**

(11) **QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?**

(12) **SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?**

SI (    ) NO (    )

**ESTE AUMENTO SE DEBE GRACIAS AL APOYO EN:**

(13) **ASISTENCIA TECNICA?** SI (    ) NO (    )

(14) **CREDITO A LA PRODUCCION?** SI (    ) NO (    )

(15) **CREDITO A LA COMERCIALIZACION?** SI (    ) NO (    )

(16) **EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA REESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?**

SI (    ) NO (    )

- (17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?  
SI ( ) NO ( )  
EN CUANTO?
- (21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

**OBSTACULOS**

- (24) ECONOMICAL
- (25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL
- (26) AMBIENTAL
- (27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480
- (28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL
- (29) OTROS
- (30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?

- (2) FECHA
- (3) INSTITUCION
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

**PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION

Medium to larger agriculture producers, cooperatives, agroindustrial and land development. Do not give intensive technical assistance because of cost factor

**ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Agroproduction and agroindustrial development

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

See 7

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Bank clientele with previous bank participation  
Established cooperatives and associations that show strength in management and experience.

**RESULTADOS**

EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!

- (11) QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?

No comment

- (12) SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

ESTE AUMENTO SE DEBE GRACIAS AL APOYO EN:

- (13) ASISTENCIA TECNICA? SI ( ) NO ( )  
(14) CREDITO A LA PRODUCCION? SI ( ) NO ( )  
(15) CREDITO A LA COMERCIALIZACION? SI ( ) NO ( )

(16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA RESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?

SI ( ) NO ( )

EN CUANTO?

No Comment

(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?

SI (x) NO ( )

**(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

Very well received by the public resulting in good public relations  
Bank directors are well pleased with the PL480 program

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

none noted

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

none noted

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

none noted

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

would like more funds

**(28) POLITICAL/GOVIERNAL**

no comment

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Clients needs cannot always be met because of loan amount limits

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA October 16, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Banco Boliviano Americano
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Ing. Hector Soto, y Enrique Lopez  
Departamento de Desarrollo

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION  
Small Industry Artesenos to associations and cooperatives.  
Very few agriculture related loans

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?  
Will continue to lend to the same loan lines
- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?  
Small artisans and small commercial concerns.
- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?  
Bank information pamphlet that includes all development loan .  
information. Bank customers that fit the credit line.

### **RESULTADOS**

- EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!
- (11) QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?

(12) SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?

SI ( ) NO ( )

ESTE AUMENTO SE DEBE GRACIAS AL APOYO EN:

(13) ASISTENCIA TECNICA?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(14) CREDITO A LA PRODUCCION?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(15) CREDITO A LA COMERCIALIZACION?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA REESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?

SI ( ) NO ( )

EN CUANTO?

(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

**(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

Interest rate and terms are good  
Substantial impact to small artisans and commercial concerns

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

Impact on small artisan and commercial concerns

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Pleased with administration of PL 480 funds

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

**(29) OTROS**

Unable to offer Technical Assistance due to cost of funds limiting profit margin

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

More funds to meet increased demand  
More flexibility of terms and also interest rate to increase bank profitability

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA: October 9, 1989
- (3) INSTITUCION: Banco de La Union S.A.
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Santa Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Ricardo Salvago Franco, Oficial de Credito

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION

Machinery and equipment for small commercial and agroindustrial industries. Land development and dairy loans. Limited technical assistance given.

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Small to meduim size producers and industries.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Small to medium size producers and industries. Work with some coops and associations.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Bank customers that fit the loan program.

### **RESULTADOS**

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Increased public relations  
In Agriculture related loans, increased production.  
Better seed and Agriculture management being used.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

Increased agricultural production

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

Improvement but no specifics

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Well pleased with administration of PL 480 by Executive Secretariat

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

**29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

More funds. Present budget does not meet demand. Would like a 5% interest margin to pay for additional servicing costs  
More flexibility on terms offered

## **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA: 10-13-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: Cooperativa Integral de Servicios Cochabamba
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

## **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? (9-77)
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

Small producer cooperative with a high quality credit delivery system. Have several departments, each with a specific function. The credit department handles loan processing , analysis and approval determination.

The payment and accounting department processes payments and keeps detailed records that are integrated into final balance statements and income on a monthly basis. They have a new computer that will be installed in the coming months that will speed up recordkeeping and analysis.

The supply department was quite extensive with fertilizers, insecticides, and various pieces of equipment i.e. plows, pumps, hoes. The extension department handled the technical assistance associated with education, improving use of seed varieties and working with individual crop plans.

All departments worked well as a team effort. This is one reason why this cooperative is so successful.

## **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Education, Credit, and Technical Assistance

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Small Producer organizations in the Cochabamba area specifically the Punata agriculture sector.

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Organization is well known to the local producers. Continue to grow because of services offered and communication level with local producers.

**(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

Improved farming techniques by its members  
Better seed varieties  
Increased production subject to drought  
A combined community effort  
A very good interest rate

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

Market conditions could be improved

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

Improve irrigation systems and techniques

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

None Noted

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Improve terms especially in land development projects i.e. community irrigation wells, land leveling, and structures.

It is noted that this cooperative is being used by agronomic students as a field study source.

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA: 10-11-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: Bancb Hipotecario Nacional
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Jaime Subieta F., Gerente Regional  
Carlos Butrago C., Subgerente de Fomento

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? (1986)
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

All Agricultural related industries  
Main emphasis thru Cooperatives and Associations

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

To improve technical assistance offered. Felt the institution would like to encourage TA thru local village associations and cooperatives. Most effective way of credit delivery.

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Small to large agricultural customers and producers  
Bank customers  
Associations and cooperatives

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Thru local interest and word of mouth information  
Bank customers  
Testimony of profitable loans

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Credit deliverability is excellent  
Excellent credit opportunity to those that otherwise could not be served by commercial lenders  
Excellent public relations tool for the bank

**OBSTACULOS**

(24) ECONOMICAL

(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL

(26) AMBIENTAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?

Would like to see more flexibility on terms offered  
Possibly a point increase in interest rate to support better technical  
assistance

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA: 10-16-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: Banco Industrial S.A.
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: La Paz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Guillermo Salcedo Jimenez - Ejecutivo

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )

- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

Small PL 480 budget

Small Industrial loans to associations and cooperatives

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Continue on status quo

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Small artisan associations

Small commercial concerns

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Bank customers that meet program requirements

Bank decides if program will fit a particular customer

### **RESULTADOS**

EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!

- (11) QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?

(12) SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?

SI ( ) NO ( )

ESTE AUMENTO SE DEBE GRACIAS AL APOYO EN:

(13) ASISTENCIA TECNICA?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(14) CREDITO A LA PRODUCCION?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(15) CREDITO A LA COMERCIALIZACION?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA RESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?

SI ( ) NO ( )

EN CUANTO?

(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Have been able to help a particular commercial sector that standard commercial loans would not reach

**OBSTACULOS**

(24) ECONOMICAL

none

(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL

(26) AMBIENTAL

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?

Would like more funds to meet demand  
Reporting to ES could be simplified  
Loan limits are too low

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Walter Taylor and Gene Ott
- (2) FECHA: 10-9-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: Banco De Santa Cruz De La Sierra
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Santa Cruz
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Official Bismarck Banegas Banegas

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? ( 1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION

Medium to larger agriculture producers, cooperatives, agroindustrial and land development. Do not gave intensive technical assistance because of cost factor

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

Agroproduction and agroindustrial development

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

See 7

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Bank clientele with previous bank participation  
Established cooperatives and associations that show strength in management and experience.

### **RESULTADOS**

EXISTE METAS EN EL CONVENIO DEL GOBIERNOS EEUU Y BOLIVIA. TENGO VARIAS PREGUNTAS CON RESPECTO A ELLO. QUIERO SU OPINION FRANCA Y HONESTA!

- (11) QUE RESULTADOS MUESTRAN LOS ESFUERZOS DEL GOB PARA CANALIZAR FONDOS DESDE EL PROGRAMA PL 480 Y OTRO PROGRAMAS INSTITUCIONALES DIRIGIDOS AL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO, A TRAVES DE BANCOS PRIVADOS?

No comment

(12) SE HA LOGRADO AUMENTAR LA PRODUCCION NACIONAL DE LA AGRICULTURA HASTA EN UN 4% DURANTE EL AÑO 89, POR ENCIMA DE LOS NIVELES DEL AÑO 88?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

ESTE AUMENTO SE DEBE GRACIAS AL APOYO EN:

(13) ASISTENCIA TECNICA?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(14) CREDITO A LA PRODUCCION?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(15) CREDITO A LA COMERCIALIZACION?

SI ( ) NO ( )

(16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA RESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESARROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?

SI ( ) NO ( )

EN CUANTO?

No Comment

(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?

SI ( ) NO ( )

No Comment

(22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?

SI (x) NO ( )

(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Very well received by the public resulting in good public relations  
Bank directors are well pleased with the PL480 program

#### OBSTACULOS

(24) ECONOMICAL

none noted

(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL

none noted

(26) AMBIENTAL

none noted

(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480

Would like more funds

(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL

no comment

(29) OTROS

(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?

Clients needs cannot always be met because of loan amount limits

### **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA: 10-12-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: Ciaprot
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

### **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? (1986 )
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

A Cooperative involved in Wheat research and development associated with technical assisted loans

### **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

To improve wheat production with small producers

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Small producers

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Usually by small coops and/or associations organized by village

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Use of better seed varieties. Although impact of increased wheat production has yet to be realized due to the ongoing drought, improved farming techniques are being used and should result in increased production in upcoming crop years.

### **OBSTACULOS**

- (24) ECONOMICAL

Poor market conditions

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

Would like to improve irrigation by use of community wells, improved delivery systems and land leveling

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Would like a little more flexibility on loans. Drought has affected their program tremendously.

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Would like to expand loan lines to include equipment. Improve terms to allow longer terms.

Groups contacted under CIAPROT administration: Tarata, Pampamamata, Gualberto Villarroel, Pacpani, Arani

## **GRUPO DE EVALUACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR: Gene Ott and Walter Taylor
- (2) FECHA: 10-11-89
- (3) INSTITUCION: FENACRE
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA: Cochabamba
- (5) NOMBRE(S) Y TITULO(S) DEL GERENTE O FUNCIONARIOS:

Alberto Montero Cossio, Gerente General  
Celias Lopez Coelho, Gerente de Operaciones

## **PARTICIPACION**

- (6) CUANDO COMENZO LA PARTICIPACION DE PL 480? (1980)
- (7) CARACTERISTICAS DE LA PARTICIPACION:

Cooperative credit to a total of 215 cooperatives with 178 active cooperatives at present.  
Importance placed on Supervised Credit

## **ACTIVIDADES**

- (8) CUALES SON LOS OBJETIVOS DE SUS ACTIVIDADES (PROGRAMA)?

To improve Cooperative organizations and delivery of credit and technical assistance  
Strengthen political, economic conditions in rural Bolivia

- (9) QUIENES SON SUS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Cooperatives and Associations in rural Bolivia

- (10) COMO SELECCIONA LOS PARTICIPANTES Y/O BENEFICIARIOS?

Group representatives come to FENACRE  
Some advertisement  
FENACRE offers legal, organizational counsel, education and technical assistance training.

- (23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)

Although not all cooperatives and associations are successful, the cooperatives that are achieving impact are growing rapidly and efficiently improving education, health and agriculture production.

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

Commercialization is weak especially in crops harvested

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

Lack of funds

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

Work well with PL 480 delivery

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

Cooperatives and associations are improving political and governmental participation

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**

Flexibility in terms offered to their borrowers  
Increase Interest rate to increase funds to administer and improve program funds and technical assistance.

**APPENDIX C**  
**QUESTIONNAIRES USED BY PARAPROFESSIONALS**

**CO COMERCIALIZACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:
- (2) FECHA:
- (3) INSTITUCION BENEFICIARA:
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:
- (5) NOMBRE DEL EMPRESA BENEFICIARIO:

**CARACTERISTICAS DEL EMPRESA:**

- (6) ACTIVIDAD PRINCIPAL:
- (7) ACTIVIDADES SECUNDARIAS:

USO DEL CREDITO	(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)	(e)
RECIBIO CREDITO:	<u>SI</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>MONTO</u>	<u>PLAZO</u>	<u>INTERES</u>
(8) EN EL AÑO 88-89?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
(9) DEL FUENTE DE PL-480?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
(10) DE OTRAS FUENTES?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )

- (11) EJEMPLOS DE LAS OTRAS FUENTES:

**RESULTADOS**

	(a)	(b)
	<u>CON CREDITO</u>	<u>SIN CREDITO</u>
	<u>DEL PL-480</u>	<u>DEL PL-480</u>
(12) CANTIDAD DEL PRODUCTO EN ALMACEN	( )	( )
(13) PRECIO DE VENTA PROMEDIO	( )	( )
(14) PORCENTAJE DE PRODUCCION PERDIDO	( )	( )

**OBSTACULOS**

- (15) ( ) CAPACIDAD DISPONIBLE DEL ALMACEN
- (16) ( ) INFRAESTRUCTURA DE TRANSPORTES
- (17) ( ) VARIABILIDAD DE PRODUCCION
- (18) ( ) VARIABILIDAD DEL MERCADO
- (19) ( ) CALIDAD DEL PRODUCTO
- (20) ( ) TECNOLOGIA DISPONIBLE
- (21) ( ) HABILIDAD ADMINISTRATIVA
- (22) ( ) EFICIENCIA DEL INTERMEDIARIO
- (23) ( ) OTROS

- (24) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL-480?

**CR CREDITO**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:
- (2) FECHA:
- (3) INSTITUCION INTERMEDIARIA:
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:
- (5) NOMBRE DEL BENEFICIARIO:

**CARACTERISTICAS DEL BENEFICIARIO**

- (6) ACTIVIDAD PRINCIPAL:
- (7) ACTIVIDAD SECUNDARIA:
- (8) NUMERO DE PERSONAS EN LA CASA:
- (9) EDAD DEL POSTULANTE:
- (10) SEXO DEL POSTULANTE:
- (11) NIVEL DE EDUCACION COMPLETADO:
- (12) NIVEL DE CAPACITACION O PROFESION:

USO DEL CREDITO	(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)	(e)
RECIBIO CREDITO:	<u>SI</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>MONTO</u>	<u>PLAZO</u>	<u>INTERES</u>
(13) EN EL AÑO 88-89?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
(14) DEL FUENTE DE PL-480?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
(15) DE OTRAS FUENTES?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )

- (16) EJEMPLOS DE LAS OTRAS FUENTES:

**RESULTADOS**

	(a)	(b)
	<u>CON CREDITO</u>	<u>SIN CREDITO</u>
	<u>DEL PL-480</u>	<u>DEL PL-480</u>
(17) NUMERO DE HECTARES CULTIVADAS O CABEZAS DE GANADO	( )	( )
(18) RENDIMIENTO O PRODUCCION ESPERADO	( )	( )
(19) RENDIMIENTO ACTUAL	( )	( )
(20) INGRESOS ACTUALES	( )	( )

**ASISTENCIA TECNICA**

	(a)	(b)
	<u>SI</u>	<u>NO</u>
(21) MEJORO SU TECNOLOGIA CON AYUDA PL-480?	( )	( )
(22) RECIBIO ASISTENCIA EN EL AÑO 88-89?	( )	( )
(23) NUMERO DE VECES QUE RECIBIO ASISTENCIA O ENSEMANZA TECNICA EN EL AÑO 88-89? ( )		
(24) EJEMPLOS DEL ASISTENCIA O ENSEMANZA:		

**OBSTACULOS**

- (25) ( ) **CONDICIONES DEL MERCADO**
- (26) ( ) **CLIMA**
- (27) ( ) **PLAGAS**
- (28) ( ) **FALTAN INSUMOS CUANDO LOS NECISITAN**
- (29) ( ) **RETRAZO EN EL CREDITO**
- (30) ( ) **OTROS**
  
- (31) **TIENE PLANES PARA SOLICITAR CREDITO EL PL-480 EN EL PROXIMO ANO?**
- (32) **SI NO, PORQUE?**
  
- (33) **QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL-480?**

**SA SALUD**

(1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:

(2) FECHA:

(3) INSTITUCION INTERMEDIARIA:

(4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:

(5) NOMBRE DEL BENEFICIARIO:

**CARACTERISTICAS DEL BENEFICIARIO (UNA FAMILIA)**

(6) ACTIVIDAD PRINCIPAL:

(7) ACTIVIDAD SECUNDARIA:

(8) NUMERO DE PERSONAS EN LA CASA:

(9) EDAD DEL POSTULANTE:

(10) SEXO DEL POSTULANTE:

(11) NIVEL DE EDUCACION COMPLETADO:

**ENFERMEDADES**

QUE ENFERMEDADES CREE USTED QUE PUEDE CONTRAER:

	(a)	(b)	(c)
CON PROBABILIDAD	<u>BAJO</u>	<u>MEDIO</u>	<u>ALTO</u>
(12) TUBERCULOSIS	( )	( )	( )
(13) FIEBRE AMARILLA	( )	( )	( )
(14) MALARIA	( )	( )	( )
(15) OTROS (POLIO, TET, TY)	( )	( )	( )

**SERVICIOS**

	(a)	(b)
RECIBIO SERVICIOS DE SALUD	<u>SI</u>	<u>NO</u>
(16) EN EL AÑO 88-89?	( )	( )
(17) CON AYUDA DE PL-480?	( )	( )
(18) CON AYUDA DE OTRAS ORGANIZACIONES?	( )	( )

(19) EJEMPLOS DE OTRAS ORGANIZACIONES:

**RESULTADOS**

	(a)	(b)
	<u>CON AYUDA</u>	<u>SIN AYUDA</u>
	<u>DEL PL-480</u>	<u>DEL PL-480</u>
(20) NUMERO DE VACUNAS	( )	( )
(21) NO. DE VECES QUE RECIBIO ASISTENCIA MEDICA	( )	( )

**OBSTACULOS**

(22) ( ) COSTOS

(23) ( ) MOVILIZACION

(24) ( ) VIATICOS

(25) ( ) DISPONIBILIDAD DEL SERVICIO A TIEMPO

(26) ( ) OTROS

(27) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL-480?

**ED EDUCACION**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:
- (2) FECHA:
- (3) INSTITUCION INTERMEDIARIA:
- (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:
- (5) NOMBRE DEL BENEFICIARIO:

**CARACTERISTICAS DEL BENEFICIARIO**

- (6) ACTIVIDAD PRINCIPAL:
- (7) ACTIVIDAD SECUNDARIA:
- (8) NUMERO DE PERSONAS EN LA CASA:
- (9) EDAD DEL POSTULANTE:
- (10) SEXO DEL POSTULANTE:
- (11) NIVEL DE EDUCACION COMPLETADO:
- (12) NIVEL DE CAPACITACION O PROFESION:

**REQUISITOS PARA BENEFICIO DE EDUCACION:**

- (13) APROBADO
- (14) RECHASADO

**RESULTADOS**

	(a) CON BECAS DEL PL-480	(b) SIN BECAS DEL PL-480
(15) ANOS DE EDUCACION COMPLETADO	( )	( )
(16) ANOS METAS EDUCACIONAL	( )	( )
(17) METAS PROFESIONAL	( )	( )
(18) INGRESOS ESTIMADAS	( )	( )
(19) PROMEDIO DE CALIFICACION (BAJO, MEDIO O ALTO)	( )	( )
(20) OBTUVO OTROS BENEFICIOS EDUCACIONAL DEL PL-480?	SI ( )	NO ( )
(21) EJEMPLOS:		

**OBSTACULOS**

- (22) ( ) COSTOS
- (23) ( ) MOVILIZACION
- (24) ( ) VIATICOS
- (25) ( ) DISPONIBILIDAD DEL SERVICIO EN TIEMPO
- (26) ( ) INFRAESTRUCTURA INADECUADA
- (27) ( ) CALIDAD DE INSTRUCCION INADECUADA
- (28) ( ) MATERIALES INADECUADA
- (29) ( ) OTROS

- (30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL-480?

**IN INFRAESTRUCTURA**

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:
- (2) DESCRIPCION DEL PROYECTO:
- (3) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:
- (4) NOMBRE DEL LIDER ENCUESTADO:

**CARACTERISTICAS DE LA COMUNIDAD**

- (5) ACTIVIDAD PRINCIPAL:
- (6) ACTIVIDAD SECUNDARIA:
- (7) POBLACION DE LA COMUNIDAD:
- (8) INGRESOS PER CAPITA:
- (9) NIVEL DEL DESEMPLEO:

**INFRAESTRUCTURA**

- (10) SU COMUNIDAD OBTIENE BENEFICIOS CON FINANCIAMIENTO DE PL-480?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (11) EJEMPLO(S):
- (12) SU COMUNIDAD OBTIENE BENEFICIOS CON FINANCIAMIENTO DE OTRAS FUENTES?  
SI ( ) NO ( )
- (13) EJEMPLO(S):

**RESULTADOS**

**RESULTADOS CON INFRAESTRUCTURA FINANCIAMIENTO POR PL-480:**

	(a)	(b)	(c)
IMPACTO	<u>BAJO</u>	<u>MEDIO</u>	<u>ALTO</u>
(14) ECONOMICO	( )	( )	( )
(15) AMBIENTAL	( )	( )	( )
(16) SOCIAL	( )	( )	( )
(17) OTROS	( )	( )	( )

**OBSTACULOS**

- (18) ( ) CALIDAD DE LA INFRAESTRUCTURA
- (19) ( ) MANTENIMIENTO DE LA INFRAESTRUCTURA
- (20) ( ) ACCESIBILIDAD A LA INFRAESTRUCTURA
- (21) ( ) OTROS
- (22) QUE SU COMUNIDAD PARTICIPE EN OTROS PROYECTOS DE INFRAESTRUCTURA FINANCIADOS POR PL-480?
- (23) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL-480?

- (1) NOMBRE DEL ENCUESTADOR:  
 (2) FECHA:  
 (3) INSTITUCION BENEFICIARA:  
 (4) DEPARTAMENTO/PROVINCIA:  
 (5) NOMBRE DEL EMPRESA BENEFICIARIO:

**CARACTERISTICAS DEL EMPRESA:**

- (6) ACTIVIDAD PRINCIPAL:  
 (7) ACTIVIDAD SECUNDARIA:

USO DEL CREDITO	(a)	(b)	(c)	(d)	(e)
RECIBIO CREDITO:	<u>SI</u>	<u>NO</u>	<u>MONTO</u>	<u>PLAZO</u>	<u>INTERES</u>
(8) EN EL AÑO 88-89?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
(9) DEL FUENTE DE PL-480?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
(10) DE OTRAS FUENTES?	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )

- (11) EJEMPLOS DE LAS OTRAS FUENTES:

**RESULTADOS**

	(a) CON CREDITO <u>DEL PL-480</u>	(b) SIN CREDITO <u>DEL PL-480</u>
(12) HECTARES PLANTADAS PARA OBTENCION DE SEMILLAS MEJORADAS	( )	( )
(13) PRODUCCION TOTAL DE SEMILLAS MEJORADAS	( )	( )
(14) MEJORADAS	( )	( )

**OBSTACULOS**

**CUALES OBSTACULOS EXISTEN CON RESPECTO A:**

	(a) <u>EXITO EN PRODUCCION</u>	(b) <u>EXITO EN COMERCIALIZACION</u>
(15) CLIMA	( )	(21) MERCADO ( )
(16) ASST. TECNICA	( )	(22) TECNOLOGIA ( )
(17) CALIDAD INSUMOS	( )	(23) FINANCIAMIENTO
(18) CANTIDAD INSUMOS	( )	HABILIDAD ( )
(19) MANO DE OBRA	( )	(24) ADMINISTRATIVA ( )
(20) OTROS	( )	(25) OTROS ( )

- (26) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL-480?

**APPENDIX D**

**QUESTIONNAIRE USED BY EVALUATION TEAM**



**(16) EL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS HA CUMPLIDO CON LA RESTRUCTURACION DE SU ADMINISTRACION, RECOMENDADA POR EL PLAN DEL GOBIERNO?**

SI ( ) NO ( )

**(17) SE HA CONCLUIDO CON EL PLAN QUINQUENAL DE DESAROLLO ESTRATEGICO PARA EL SECTOR AGROPECUARIO?**

SI ( ) NO ( )

**(18) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL AGROPECUARIO Y LOS CONSEJOS REGIONALES DEPARTAMENTALES, A FIN DE PROMOVER POLITICAS AGROPECUARIAS?**

SI ( ) NO ( )

**(19) SE HAN REALIZADO ACCIONES PARA SIMPLIFICAR LOS TRAMITES DE EXPORTACION PARA LOS PRODUCTOS AGROPECUARIOS?**

SI ( ) NO ( )

**(20) SE HA INCREMENTADO EL PRESUPUESTO DEL TESORO GENERAL DE LA NACION AL MINISTERIO DE ASUNTOS CAMPESINOS Y AGROPECUARIOS, EN LOS RUBROS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION PARA CULTIVOS NO TRADICIONALES CON DESTINO AL MERCADO INTERNACIONAL?**

SI ( ) NO ( )

EN CUANTO?

**(21) REALIZO EL MACA, LOS ESFUERZOS NECESARIOS A FIN DE COORDINAR LOS SERVICIOS DE INVESTIGACION Y EXTENSION CON EL SECTOR PRIVADO?**

SI ( ) NO ( )

**(22) SE HA FORMADO EL CONSEJO NACIONAL DE TRIGO, A FIN DE BRINDAR UN SEGUIMIENTO DE LAS POLITICAS Y LOS PROGRAMAS DE PRODUCCION Y COMERCIALIZACION DEL TRIGO?**

SI (x) NO ( )

**(23) CUALES OTRAS BENEFICIOS SE HA RESULTADO EN SU PROGRAMA O ACTIVIDADES EN EL AÑO 88-89? (QUIERO ESPECIFICAS)**

**OBSTACULOS**

**(24) ECONOMICAL**

**(25) INFRAESTRUCTURAL**

**(26) AMBIENTAL**

**(27) ADMINISTRACION DEL PROGRAMA PL 480**

**(28) POLITICAL/GOBIERNAL**

**(29) OTROS**

**(30) QUE SUGERENCIAS TIENE USTED PARA MEJORAR EL PROGRAMA PL 480?**