

19A 67687

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY PART I

(BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS)

IDENTIFICATION DATA

A. REPORTING A.I.D. UNIT:

Bangladesh
(Mission or AID/W Office)
(ES#)

B. WAS EVALUATION SCHEDULED IN CURRENT FY ANNUAL EVALUATION PLAN?

yes slipped ad hoc

Eval. Plan Submission Date: FY 9

C. EVALUATION TIMING

Interim final ex post other

XD-APP-515-A

D. ACTIVITY OR ACTIVITIES EVALUATED (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; If not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report)

Project #	Project/Program Title (or title & date of evaluation report)	First PROAG or equivalent (FY)	Most recent PACD (mo/yr)	Planned LOP Cost ('000)	Amount Obligated to Date ('000)
388--0054 0070 & 0021	Rural Elec. Project Assessment by OAK Ridge Lab. Team Nov. 1985 (Updated status)	1977	9/88	145	113.7

ACTIONS

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

Action(s) Required

See Attachment A

Name of officer responsible for Action

Date Action to be Completed

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. DATE OF MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE REVIEW OF EVALUATION: mo 08 day 25 yr 88 (First update)

G. APPROVALS OF EVALUATION SUMMARY AND ACTION DECISIONS: Reviewed and approval updated 05/90

Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director/A
Signature Typed Name	Signature	Signature	Signature
<u>David E. Warner</u>	<u>Arn Schwartz</u>	<u>Malcolm J. Purvis</u>	<u>Malcolm J. Purvis</u>
Date: <u>May 90</u>	Date: <u>May 90</u>	Date: <u>May 90</u>	Date: <u>May 90</u>

H. EVALUATION ABSTRACT (do not exceed the space provided)

ABSTRACT

I. EVALUATION COSTS

1. Evaluation Team

Name

Affiliation

Contract Number OR
TDY Person Days

Contract Cost OR
TDY Cost (US\$)

Source of
Funds

COSTS

2. Mission/Office Professional
Staff Person-Days (estimate) _____

3. Borrower/Grantee Professional
Staff Person-Days (estimate) _____

111

ATTACHMENT A

E. Action/Decisions Approved by Mission	Name of Officer Res- possible for Action	Action Status
--	---	------------------

(Action Required) T.A. to be Provided
by NRECA/GC

A. Management System

1. The REB Directorate of Finance should be divided into two Directorates.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Completed
a) Finance b) Accounts		

Status (8/17/88): Small problems exist
which are being addressed.

2. REB should provided additional training for:	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB & Team Leader, NRECA/GC	
a) PBS personnel in (1) O & M in substation	Monthly continuing & as needed	
(2) Work Order Accounting	Training to be initiated	
(3) Materials Management & Controls	Training to start on Apr. of Mat. Adv.	
(4) Management Planning & Controls	Monthly, continuing, C&L training 2 persons for future training	
b) Local construction contractors in building short distance lines	Reg. train by PBBs. Rev. & Monitor. of Local Cont. by REB/NRECA	
c) Technical personnel located in the field to provide technical services and assistance in construction to REB & PBS's	Continuing on the job (DTB) training REB Tech. personnel located in field for O.T.J.T.	

Status (8/17/88): All training has
been initiated except the a(3) above
is ongoing. Turnovers have been
reduced with REB providing better
personnel benefits.

3. Improvement on work order accounting and training	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Ongoing
Status 8/17/88) Coordination and emphasis in REB 1987-88. Improvement in procedure more improvement needed. Continuing.		
4. PBS adopt the REB system of bank collection of electric service bills when perfected.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Completed
Status (8/17/88): System will be expanded.		
5. REB to recruit and train more General & Assistant Managers placing emphasis on interpersonal relations, team building, planning and control.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Ongoing
Status (8/17/88): Turnovers have decreased due to new salaries & benefits.		
6. Communication between PBS management and members of PBS to be strengthened by:	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Completed but Ongoing
a) Holding quarterly or monthly meetings with meter readers to provide information to PBS members with whom they come in contact on PBS issues of common interest.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	
b) More frequent meetings of the existing member Advisory Committees.		Completed except that board meeting will still be held at Headquarters
c) Hold Board meetings at different locations in PBS areas.		
d) Hold open house yearly meeting at headquarters and district officers.		
e) Inform all employees on issues affecting members.		

f) Provide a periodic newsletter to members. Completed but

Status (8/17/88): Any existing restraints will be addressed by the new member services/power use adviser.

7. PBS hold a security deposit equal to two month's bill for irrigation accounts to be applied to outstanding past due bills.	PBS Managers	Completed
---	--------------	-----------

Status (8/17/88):

8. REB to do a study to determine the cost-effectiveness of computer billing.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB and	Continuing basis
---	---------------------------------------	---------------------

Status (8/17/88): The progress has been slow due to computer maintenance service and training difficulties.

9. Studies to be performed to help members find ways of using electricity effectively.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Ongoing
--	-----------------------------------	---------

Status (8/17/88): Member services/power use advisor will provide solutions.

10. Strengthening existing training staff to meet personnel requirements associated with intensification.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Ongoing
---	-----------------------------------	---------

Status (8/17/88): New Train. Advisor completed full evaluation of REB training to staff, programs, equipment etc. Strengthen.

11. REB should train PBS personnel to handle engineering situations, such as equipment failure.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Continuing basis
---	-----------------------------------	---------------------

Status (8/17/88): NRECA's system's advisor working on the job training.

12. PBS to provide adequate transportation for lineman for emergency services calls.	PBS Managers	Completed but Ongoing
--	--------------	-----------------------

Status (8/17/88): Completed where access is possible. However, there is no road access in many areas and there are still areas where vehicles can not travel.

13. Provide incentives and additional benefits to retain key personnel.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Completed
---	-----------------------------------	-----------

Status (8/17/88): There has been progress in providing retirement program, insurance and better pay.

14. REB should continue its role with the PBS's as lender, expeditor and helper and not become too closely involved in PBS daily operations.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB	Continuing basis
--	-----------------------------------	------------------

Status (8/17/88): At older PBS's REB is reducing involvement in daily operations. Attention is toward newer PBS.

3. System Planning & Engineering

1. Improve the detailed material standards for procurement of equipment.	Team Leader, NRECA	Completed
--	--------------------	-----------

Status (8/17/88): Improved standards are updated and improved continuously.

2. Customer education in use of electricity for irrigation systems only during specified hours to raise system COAR factor.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB and PBS Managers	Continuing
---	---	------------

Status (8/17/88): New system-power use advisor conferences will add to customer education.

3. PBS's to rectify unmetered system losses.	PBS Managers	Continuing
Status (8/17/88): There has been a marked decrease in the non technical losses in all PBS's due to increased policing actions. Tech. losses have been found to be 7-8% of total losses.		
4. Complete detailed materials standards to meet needs of multiple donors.	Team Leader/NRECA	Completed
Status (8/17/88): See B.1 above.		
5. Improve material handling and inventory system of warehouse facilities possibly by computers.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB and the NRECA/GC	Continuing basis
Status (8/17/88): Material handling advisor has not been selected to date. Some assistance provided by PBS systems operation advisor.		
6. Improve the quality assurance of equipment and materials received through a random testing and measurement program and an electrical tests for electric equipment.	Brig. M.A. Halim Chairman, REB and the NRECA/GC	Ongoing
Status (8/17/88): REB test cell needs some improvements.		
7. Design criteria for distribution system and equipment specifications should be revised due to the present harsh operating environment.	Team Leader, NRECA	Completed
Status (8/17/88): Consultant has redesigned with provisions for revision of design criteria when applicable.		

8. Engineering assistance will have to be given to the PBS's in substation operation and troubleshooting, line operation and troubleshooting, maintenance and repair.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
NRECA/GC

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): Consultant providing on the job training to address these support needs.

C. R.E. Tariffs and Energy

1. Government pricing policies to provide equivalency for energy prices.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
BDG/ERD

Completed but
ongoing

Status (8/17/88): Tariffs were levied with rate increases in July 1987.

2. Improvements in tariff structure to encourage efficient use:

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
BPDB officials

Ongoing

a) BPDB increase bulk power tariff rate and include meter demand charge.

Status (8/17/88):

b) PBS review of off-peak productive use rates to smooth load curves.

PBS Managers

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): New system power use advisor to review and provide advice on rates.

c) Should be more active application of demand charges and tariff penalties for low power factors.

PBS Managers

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): Policing has improved. NRECA in continuously advising REB on further improvement TOD metering is not used by REB. Consultant is helping so that policy will improve gradually.

8. Engineering assistance will have to be given to the PBS's in substation operation and troubleshooting, line operation and troubleshooting, maintenance and repair.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
NRECA/GC

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): Consultant providing on the job training to address these support needs.

C. R.E. Tariffs and Energy

1. Government pricing policies to provide equivalency for energy prices.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
BDG/ERD

Completed but
ongoing

Status (8/17/88): Tariffs were levied with rate increases in July 1987.

2. Improvements in tariff structure to encourage efficient use:

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
BPDB officials

Ongoing

a) BPDB increase bulk power tariff rate and include meter demand charge.

Status (8/17/88):

b) PBS review of off-peak productive use rates to smooth load curves.

PBS Managers

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): New system power use advisor to review and provide advice on rates.

c) Should be more active application of demand charges and tariff penalties for low power factors.

PBS Managers

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): Policing has improved. NRECA in continuously advising REB on further improvement TOD metering is not used by REB. Consultant is helping so that policy will improve gradually.

3. Twenty four person months of technical specialists are needed.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
Team Leader, NRECA

Continuing

a) Specialists in computerized billing, inventory and material storage.

b) Specialists in power usage.

c) Specialists in quality assurance.

Status (8/17/88): No request for short term advisor's to date. Power use advisor will over added strength for power use consumers power usage.

4. Most critical areas in TA in RE III will be material management, management and finance and operation and maintenance.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
Team Leader, NRECA

Continuing
basis

Status (8/17/88): Management & Finance Advisor has been app'd and is working in Bangladesh. Materials advisor has not been selected yet. O&M provided by system operating advisors.

E. Economic, Social Impact

1. Possible joint study to analyze role of women in the cooperative ownership of Hullers under a new technology.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
Ford Foundation

Status (8/17/88): Preliminary socio-impact study being done by a Bangladesh consultant.

2. Coordinate with REB Evaluation for reservoir of baseline data done in 1983 on objective data from sample village.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB

Ongoing
Evaluation

Status (8/17/88); PBS Financial Evaluation being done by Coopers and Lybrand.

3. Coordination of REB evaluation and studies for USAID impact evaluation as per OAK Ridge National Lab. Report.

Brig. M.A. Halim
Chairman, REB and
USAID Project

Ongoing

Status (8/17/88): Final Assessment or PBS's in final stages. M&E system design will incorporate soc. impact study.

PDE/DEWarner:sq:8/29/89:(0119E)

COMMENTS BY MISSION

The continuing monitoring of the RE project shows that 11 out of the 31 original evaluation report recommendations have been completed. All recommendations have been addressed and many are on a continuing basis. As more studies are completed to show progress in socio-economic areas and REB and PBS personnel obtain more experience and training, more programs should be implemented which are based on the evaluation report recommendations. The overall outlook of the project should become increasingly better. The mission believes that the project goal and objectives can be achieved within the PACD if the intensification program of RE III is carried out effectively.

COMMENTS BY THE RURAL ELECTRIFICATION BOARD

The updated status of the Evaluation Summary of the Rural Electrification Project by USAID has been found to reflect the exact position of the project as it stands now as well as areas requiring further intervention in the future. While REB would agree on the Evaluation Summary, it may be mentioned that the BPDB's bulk supply tariff (BST) has been enhanced by Taka 0.05 per kwh effective from August 1, 1988. Due to this increase, present BST stands at Taka 1.19 per kwh against the previous BST of Taka 1.14 per kwh (Attachment C.1 of Summary Evaluation).

With the experience gained over the past years, REB has realized the need for improved Business Planning and has effected a determined policy to strengthen same; and, at the same time intensify the efforts to improve in key areas for a timely and effective implementation of RE-III project. REB would continue to utilize the services of both long and short term consultants and specialists to insure that nothing falls short of the desired standard in the implementation of the RE-III project.

Warner/PDE
8/28/88-(0009E)