

COURT DECISION EVALUATION FORM

DECISION EVALUATION FORM			
Case Name:	Court:		
Judge(s):	Date decided:		
Criminal _____ / Civil _____ / Other _____	If decision was appealed, was it reversed _____ or affirmed _____		
Part A. FORMAT AND STRUCTURE	Very Good	Good	Poor
1. Does the format of the decision comply with the applicable procedural rules?			
2. Nature of case explained clearly?			
3. Are the facts clearly explained?			
4. Are the facts chronologically explained?			
5. Are the facts presented by using numbers, bullets or paragraphs?			
6. Are the parties' disputes / contentions about the facts clearly explained?			
7. Are credibility conflicts adequately addressed?			
8. Does the Decision explain why a party's evidence is being rejected? <i>[Mandatory for criminal case to explain why</i>			

COURT DECISION EVALUATION FORM

<i>evidence of defendant is being rejected].</i>			
9. Are the parties' legal arguments clearly explained? 10. Are the parties contentions regarding the applicable law explained?			
11. Are the elements of the article/claim set out?			
12. Is the appropriate statute cited and explained?			
13. Does the court clearly and persuasively explain the law (including engaging in appropriate statutory construction and explain the rules of construction)?			
14. Is the order clear and unambiguous?			
15. Is the decision overall persuasive in its legal reasoning?			

COURT DECISION EVALUATION FORM

Part B.			
WRITING	Very Good	Good	Poor
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ <i>Readability</i> ▪ <i>Paragraphs</i> ▪ <i>Sentences</i> ▪ <i>Words</i> 			
1. Is the organization of the Decision clear and logical?			
2. Are headings used or other devices to make Decision's organization logical and easy to understand?			
3. Paragraphs divisions are logical, paragraphs are appropriate length, topic sentences used.			
4. Sentences are appropriate length (shorter the better - active voice is used.			
5. Word structure – clear language used.			
6. Transitions between paragraphs and transitions between sentences used and appropriate.			
7. Punctuation, spelling, and proper grammar.			
8. Readability and overall flow; easily and effectively conveys ideas.			