

A Guide to the Governance Assessment Tool for Districts

William Cartier, Andrew Golda, Sahar Shah

USAID/Urban Institute Pakistan “Districts That Work” Project

About Districts That Work

The “Districts That Work” Project focuses on supporting USAID’s goals of “more participatory, representative and accountable democracy” and particularly on “devolution supported through more accountable and responsive local governance.” Established in 2006, DTW now works in 30 districts and 30 tehsils across Punjab, NWFP, and Sindh. DTW works to help partner local governments improve service delivery particularly in the areas of health, education and municipal services. Among other things, DTW facilitates dialogues among key stakeholders and provides essential software, trainings, and limited in kind assistance to partner local governments. The core vision for the DTW project is to help local leaders, councilors and administrative staff shift to an outcome oriented, citizen-focused system of governance.

This Guidebook

One of the challenges faced by DTW, like other local governance projects, is to design valid, reliable and cost effective means of measuring governance, whether for “baseline conditions”, tracking the immediate results of program interventions, or determining the final outcomes. In this effort, DTW has designed an instrument to assess the current state of local governance in Pakistan. This Guidebook is intended to explain the concept and set up of the tool and discuss its pilot and future application.

The document begins with a summary discussion of governance concepts and a review of recent initiatives aimed at measuring local governance. These various initiatives can be divided into two broad categories of assessment methodologies: numerical indexes that rank local governments on “governance performance” across the entire universe of local governments in a particular country; and standardized diagnostic tools for use in supporting change management strategies within individual local governments. It then discusses the DTW-devised indicator led Governance Assessment Tool that seeks to straddle both of these categories.

Introduction

To measure local governance, it is necessary to agree on the meaning of the concept. A recent review of the literature argues that it is “the formulation and execution of collective action at the local level. Thus, it encompasses the direct and indirect roles of formal institutions...as well as the roles of informal norms, networks, community organizations, and neighborhood associations”. These formal and informal institutions are seen as the framework for “citizen-citizen and citizen-state interactions, collective decision making and delivery of local services” (Shah and Shah, 2007: 2). The core of this definition is how state-society relations are structured—or the many different ways individuals and groups act through and in formal and informal institutions to manage their common affairs in local governments. This concept of local

governance always has a strong normative dimension. The main assumption behind the discussion of governance (and local governance) is that “the incentives and accountability framework faced by various orders of government is not conducive to a focus on service delivery consistent with citizens’ preferences” (Shah and Shah, 2007: 22). This is particularly true in transition countries where governance institutions are often nascent and weak. Thus, it always goes back to the question of how to improve the framework for interactions, decision-making and service delivery. And the usual answer is to try to make local governments more responsive, transparent, accountable and effective in their decisions and their actions. Thus, local governance assessments can address different dimensions of these state-society relations in local ambits: how citizens’ preferences and interests are aggregated through political parties, local council elections and councils; how citizens are engaged in local public life, individually or through participation in voluntary associations or how they raise issues and seek to engage local government; local government decision-making processes, including the interaction between elected officials and bureaucrats; internal management and administrative practices, including local government revenue management; the organization and functioning of service delivery, etc.

Governance and Transparency Indexes:

Recent discussions of governance and local governance have placed emphasis on the development of governance indicators, whether to measure processes or outcomes (see G. Soos, 2001: 9-15). Of course, there is intense debate on the methodology for defining and operationalizing indicators, whether in terms of validity (does it measure what it purports to measure?) or reliability. The debate has been centered to a large degree on the numerous international governance indicators—or sets of indicators—but it is relevant for the design of local governance assessments. Is it appropriate to aggregate (or some would say collapse) multiple variables into a single indicator measuring “transparency” or “responsiveness”? For example, Transparency International’s “Corruption Perception Index” (CPI) and the Freedom House “Freedom in the World Index” (FWI) and other similar global indices have received their share of criticism for over-simplifying what are very complex and vexing governance issues.¹ In fact, the answer as to the appropriateness of indicators for assessing governance depends on the intended use of the index, whether for raising awareness of issues, identifying specific problems for eventual reforms, or generating a commitment for improvement from the stakeholders. The CPI and FWI, mentioned here, are intended to focus attention and generate discussion—neither index pretends to offer solutions or policy recommendations for reducing corruption or increasing political freedom.

This same approach to governance indexes has been applied in the local ambit. In both Colombia and Venezuela, Transparency International (TI) has created Municipal Transparency Indexes (MTI) that measure individual municipalities according to their governance and management practices and rank them against other municipalities. Like the CPI and WFI, which are aimed at producing global rankings, these local governance indexes rely on the perceptions of key stakeholders—or what have been called “well informed persons” (see discussion below). The data is collected through structured questionnaires completed by these key stakeholders. While the pilot versions were conducted by external evaluators, later versions were done through self assessment by municipal officials (elected and unelected). The questionnaires are based on a series of items for each area of governance and management, from priority setting and budgeting, through financial management and internal control, procurement and contracting, taxation and revenue management, public debt, access to information and responsiveness, to the functioning of the elected councils as decision-making bodies. The scores for each item/area are tallied and converted into an index. As with the global indexes discussed above, these local governance

indexes are mainly intended to focus attention on issues of transparency and generate debate on appropriate policy responses.

Indeed, in both of the cases mentioned here, the national associations of local governments have taken up the index as a point of reference for policy debate on strengthening local government. However, sometimes this debate has been acrimonious, as individual municipalities question their ranking; incumbent mayors use good ratings to try to bolster their popularity; or opposition politicians use the results to make political points against the incumbents. These problems seem to be inherent in all indexes of this type, whether global or local. Nevertheless, at least in the Colombian case, there is anecdotal evidence to show that the results of the MTI have also been used by some individual municipalities to initiate reforms aimed at improving governance and management practices.

Governance and Management Diagnostics

An alternative approach to governance assessment has its roots in diagnostic tools for change management and financial auditing, and is aimed at identifying problems and issues in governance and management and generating strategies for improvement. An example is the comprehensive methodology used by the OECD’s “Support for Improvement in Governance and Management” (SIGMA) project which assesses “public service and the administrative legal framework; policy-making and coordination capacities; public expenditure management; public procurement; public internal financial control (PIFC); external audit; and the public integrity system (OECD, 2009). The SIGMA assessment reports are presented in narrative form rather than using specific indicators; they are not intended for comparative analysis or benchmarking, rather to highlight issues and problems for policy reform. Another comprehensive governance diagnostic tool has been developed by Transparency International: the “national integrity system assessment” (NISA), conducted by local partners—usually the national TI chapter. The assessment looks at executive, legislative and judicial institutions, evaluating their capacity, internal governance and procedures and roles in the national integrity system. Its purpose is to contrast formal rules and regulations with “actual institutional practice”, highlight discrepancies and formulate policy recommendations (see country reports by Transparency International, 2003; 2007). Again, the assessment results are presented in narrative form.

UN Habitat has developed an assessment tool, in the form of an Urban Governance Index (UGI) which evaluates four core principles of good urban governance: effectiveness, equity, participation and accountability reflected in twenty five indicators. Some of the indicators are: “ratio of mandated to actual tax collection”, which reflects effectiveness and accountability principles; “published performance standards for key services”, which reflects equity and accountability principles; and the use of “public forums”, which reflects the principle of participation (UN Habitat, 2002). The reports include both descriptive narrative and numerical indicator scores. While the indicators used by UGI are sometimes difficult to measure, its strongest point is the emphasis on stakeholder involvement and ownership of the assessment results, through a process of public dialogue. One issue that limits the application of the UGI is that the indicators are universal across all of the countries and urban locations from which data are collected. While this makes comparisons between countries easier, it lacks the country specific context which makes the data most useful for application by the local governments themselves.

Another approach using indicators, developed by the World Bank and applied by several multilateral and bilateral development agencies, are the public financial management

assessments which has been applied in recent years to both national and sub-national (state and provincial) governments worldwide. A good example is the assessment of Pakistan's Punjab provincial government, the purpose of which is "to provide an integrated assessment of the Punjab Province's PFM system against the six core dimensions of PFM performance" and whose results are intended to provide "a statement of the likely impact of those weaknesses on budgetary outcomes, on aggregate fiscal discipline, and on the strategic allocation of resources and efficient service delivery" (World Bank, 2007a). The assessment tool uses a scale (A, B, C, D) to rank performance on each indicator. The assessment reports include both narrative and indicator scores.

Recently this same approach has been applied to local governments, for example, the measurement of "financial management performance" in Aceh's local governments (World Bank, 2007b). Applied to local governments, the PFM assessment tool focuses on several strategic areas: the local regulatory framework; planning and budgeting; cash management; procurement; accounting and reporting; internal audit; public debt and investment; asset management; and external audit and oversight. Each of these areas contains several outcomes and a series of indicators requiring a "yes/no response". For example, in the area of external audit and oversight, one outcome is "Regular external audits provide effective accountability of local government", and the indicators include "audit reports are publicized" and "the public is able to attend local council session where audit reports are discussed".

The purpose of the PFMA applied in Aceh is to provide "a snapshot of financial management capacity in individual local governments" (World Bank, 2007b: 7). The assessment instrument uses numerical scores: a total score is tallied for each strategic area and for each of its respective outcomes. The scores are used to highlight weak points. On this basis, local governments can develop strategies to improve their capacities. The focus of the assessment is on compliance with norms and standards, which is intended to reinforce institutionalization and formalization of good management practices.

DTW Governance Assessment Tool

Reviewing the approaches and methodologies discussed here (and several others not mentioned in this document for lack of space), it is clear that an indicator led governance assessment offers the potential for generating public debate on democratic governance in local ambits, promoting policy and regulatory reform at the national and provincial levels, and assisting individual local governments in designing strategies to improve governance and management. In this sense, it contributes to several of DTW's objectives. Moreover, for USAID Pakistan, having a valid and reliable set of local governance indicators allows for more effective monitoring and evaluation of project outcomes in this area. To the extent that these indicators are developed in collaboration with Pakistani stakeholders (local governments, provinces, local government associations, CSOs, etc), they also meet USAID's guidelines for the design and implementation of performance monitoring, which state that evaluation frameworks "must be user-centered, generating information that stakeholders can use to make decisions" (USAID, 2000:51).

With these various objectives in mind, DTW developed a pilot version of the governance assessment tool, based on a set of indicators. The assessment tool incorporates the following design elements: identification of strategic areas of local governance and specific governance outcomes; the specification of objectively verifiable indicators for each area/outcome; and the use of numerical scores to measure performance in each area and for each outcome.

The scores of individual local governments are processed and analyzed and presented in table form, listing scores for each indicator and total for each outcome and strategic area. While this is in effect an index of local governance, how this index is used, will be decided by the stakeholders, including USAID Pakistan.

Instead of an index ranking local governments on a scale of “governance performance”, the numerical scores are used to establish averages, ranges and benchmarks for different strategic areas of governance. Depending on the results in the pilot local governments, the final presentation and discussion of the results might not use numerical scores at all. Rather it might be more convenient to use scales (High, Medium, Low) or similar qualitative rankings.

Prior to the application of the assessment tool, initial meetings need to be held with the nazim, council and senior managers to sensitize them on governance issues; discuss the approach and methodology; and form a small multi-stakeholder group for the assessment. This group will provide leadership and support during the application of the assessment tool and the discussions of the results. Depending on the initial conversations with the local government officials, the group may or may not include representatives from local CSOs.

The results of the assessment should be discussed with stakeholders in each locality, focusing on opportunities for improvement, and working with the stakeholder group to develop a change strategy supported by the local government nazim and council. The analysis and presentation to the multi-stakeholder group uses a standard reporting format with tables and graphs to highlight results for strategic areas and outcomes and to lead the discussion towards how to improve scores in each strategic area. This will be used by the group to develop recommendations to the local government council in the form of an improvement plan, including a variety of policy measures ranging from council resolutions, rules of business, internal organization and management practices, redesign of processes, and allocation of human resources and budgets. The group will also have a role in overseeing implementation of the agreed policy measures.

Strategic Areas and Governance Outcomes

Of course, there are many entry points for improving local governance, focusing on state-society interactions, political parties, interest aggregation, civil, organization and mobilization of civil society, etc. A focus on civil society gives emphasis, for example, to promoting civil society organization and action to better express and communicate citizen’s preferences and priorities; to build capacity of CSOs to exercise oversight of their governments; to opening democratic spaces for public debate and dialogue on key policies; and to developing mechanisms for collaboration between government and civil society. In contrast, DTW’s governance assessment tool *focuses on the formal institutions of local governance such as* local government decision-making processes; the interactions between Councils and the administration; priority setting and budgeting; and internal management and administrative processes. These areas are a critical entry point for USAID program interventions to improve the *framework for interactions* between local governments and citizens; to make decision-making and management processes more transparent; and to make elected and non-elected officials more responsive to citizens’ preferences. Maintaining this focus on the formal institutions of local governance, the assessment looks at eight strategic areas 1) council governance; 2) council effectiveness; 3) responsiveness; 4) transparency; 5) budget management; 6) management of services; 7) asset management; and 8) internal and external control. These areas contain 21 specific outcomes, with their respective indicators (see Table 1). The indicators are discussed in the next section. Here, it is useful to explain each of these areas and what they are measuring in terms of outcomes.

Council Governance. Of course, the critical point of intersection for governance is the elected Council. This strategic area focuses on whether the Council works as a representative body, meeting regularly, attended by most of the members and the members of reserved seats. It also looks at how the Council functions, does it make decisions in a formal manner, do council meetings use agendas, are the proceedings recorded in minutes and decisions expressed in written resolutions. Finally, it also looks at whether the Council is able to exercise oversight of the executive (nazim and administration).

Council Effectiveness. Having a local government Council whose members in fact meet regularly is necessary, but not sufficient for the Council to be an effective decision-making body. Indicators in this area assess whether the Council actually makes formal decisions on key local government policies expressed in by-laws and plans; whether it in fact reviews and formally approves the annual revenue and expenditure budget; and whether it formally approves taxes and fees through written resolutions.

Depending on the form of local government emerging from the new Provincial Local Government Acts currently under discussion, the above two sections dealing with councils may be deleted or modified as required.

Responsiveness. Local governments are supposed to be more responsive than governments at higher levels, owing to the increased opportunities that local governments have for interaction with citizens. This area measures local government responsiveness; whether it has established and implemented mechanisms for consulting citizens on key decisions such as plans, annual budgets and revenues; and whether there are clear procedures in place for registering and processing complaints and requests.

Transparency. Many critics of decentralization in developing countries argue that local governments are particularly susceptible to capture by politicians and local elites, resulting in high levels of corruption. Thus, one critical aspect of local governance is transparency. Are local governments willing to allow the community to scrutinize their decisions and actions? This strategic area measures whether the decision-making process is open to public scrutiny; whether citizens have access to information on key policies and decisions; and whether the public accounts committee proceedings are open to scrutiny.

Budget Management. Responsiveness and transparency are also reflected in the budget process. This area looks at whether the budget process follows formal rules (Budget Rules 2003) that require the local government to state clearly its priorities and policies; whether the budget presentation clearly lays out expenditure allocations; and whether there is a process in place to monitor budget implementation.

Management of Services. The strongest argument for decentralization is that local governments are a more appropriate site for ensuring efficient delivery of critical services. This area focuses on whether local governments collect information on service delivery and set performance targets; and whether local government Councils in fact monitor service delivery, requiring the administration to provide information in this respect.

Asset Management. Local governments often manage significant moveable and immoveable assets and this is a major area of inefficiency and corruption. As a result, many local

governments lose assets or fail to realize potential benefits. This strategic area assesses whether the local government maintains adequate records of assets; and whether the management of immoveable assets is carried out in a transparent manner.

Internal and External Control. Related to issues of local government transparency is the effectiveness of the processes of internal and external control. This area measures whether there is an established procedure for internal control; whether external audits are in fact taken up by the local government Council; and whether the public accounts committee is effective and transparent in how it reviews and resolves audit findings.

Thinking in terms of the formal institutions of local governance, these areas and outcomes are by no means exhaustive. This version of the assessment tool does not include areas/outcomes relating to local government financial performance, for example, generation of own source revenues; financing of service delivery through user charges; or “pro-poor” criteria in setting fees. Nor does it include an area referring to transparency in procurement and contracting decisions. These and other areas/outcomes might be included in subsequent versions of the assessment tool, to the extent that local governments and other stakeholders are willing to engage in dialogue and take action on improving governance practices.

Indicators

There are two versions of the assessment tool, one for districts and another for tehsils. These are for the most part the same, with minor changes to reflect differences in designated personnel and their responsibilities. Each of the 21 outcomes is measured by indicators; in total there are 118 indicators. *The indicators are focused to a large extent on compliance with Pakistani laws and regulations:* 40 are taken from the provisions of the 2001 LGO; 18 are based on the Budget Rules or other Rules of Business; 9 are taken from the 2002 Police Order; and the remaining 47 are reasonable standards, related to the effective application of Pakistani legal provisions. In the latter case, for example, if the LGO states that Council sessions are open to the public, an additional indicator is “the place where the council meets has sufficient room and seats for the public”.

The focus on compliance provides a critical reference point for subsequent discussions about the “meaning” of the assessment results. To a very large degree, the results measure whether local governments’ practices are in compliance with Pakistani laws and regulations. It is assumed that higher levels of compliance with these norms will result in improved governance and management, owing to the individual effects and mutual interactions of these practices.

For example, compliance with norms providing for public access to Council meetings will put pressure on elected Council members to attend and take part in Council decisions, thus strengthening the Council’s deliberative function. At the same time, compliance with requirements that nazims and DCOs/TMOs present periodic performance reports to Council will pressure local government administrators to improve how they collect, analyze and present performance data on local government services. And, as a result, increased information on service delivery, presented and discussed in open Council meetings, may provide a stimulus to Council to exercise its oversight function.

Furthermore, while the majority of the indicators are based on compliance with Pakistani legislation, the selected indicators are also uniformly good practices within local governments. For example, the LGO states that regular performance reports be made to the council including

semi-annual performance reports by the nazim, monitoring committee reports about service delivery, and annual reports from the account committees. While these are all compliance issues with the LGO or other Pakistani legislation, regular reporting on issues of local government performance, financial health and service delivery are key elements of having a transparent and accountable local government.

Returning to the question of compliance, by basing the first version of the assessment tool on compliance with legal and regulatory norms, the entire assessment exercise is legitimized for all of the stakeholders. This is particularly important given the strong legalistic culture in the Pakistani bureaucracy and the emphasis on “legal writ” for any proposed reform or improvement of governance and management practices. But it is also important for engaging citizens in actions to improve local governance and management, in that the provisions for access to Council sessions, access to information, and for different consultative mechanisms can be interpreted in terms of political and civil rights.

Data Collection Methods

One way of assessing governance is through survey instruments to measure the subjective dimensions of governance, for example, “governance perceptions” that measure public trust in political institutions and processes, perceived legitimacy of different institutions, or prevalence of certain governance “practices” (voting, participation in CSOs, corruption victimization, etc), or perception of governance outcomes (i.e., perceived fairness of elections, prevalence of corruption in government) among other topics.

For the purpose of local governance projects, surveys of governance perceptions in local ambits has several challenges. First, the large number of exogenous variables makes it difficult to separate out program effects. Second, to be useful in isolating program effects, they may also require controls groups (i.e., a quasi experimental design). Thirdly, they could be costly, especially if the intent is to compare governance across many different local governments (which requires very large sample sizes) and over time (which requires several applications of the same survey instrument).

The indicator-led assessment approach discussed above uses in each locality a combination of collecting data from agency records and what has been called “well informed persons” (WIPs) methodology (see Court, et al, 2002). Using structured questionnaires similar to public opinion surveys, supplemented by focus groups and other techniques to get information about background conditions, this assessment methodology can get at a wide variety of governance processes and outcomes. Compared to surveys, it is considerably less expensive to design and implement, and for that reason it can be applied in a large number of sites (local governments) and applied repeatedly (for example to monitor the results of program interventions). But these are not its only advantages.

One especially important advantage of the WIPs methodology is the ability to delve into the details of local governance as experienced by the key stakeholders in each locality. The general public often lacks detailed knowledge and understanding of specific governance issues. For example, by using detailed questionnaires applied to different stakeholders and in combination with the review of agency records it is possible to assess compliance of local governments with relevant legal norms; map decision-making and internal management processes; identify formal and informal governance practices of local councils and executives; characterize the interactions between the local governments and citizens, etc.

Another advantage of this methodology is the possibility of incorporating the different stakeholders into the process design and implementation—many of the WIPs are those people and groups who are most influential in the process of governance, whether mayors (nazims), council members, local government managers and employees, civil society representatives, etc.. As was discussed above, participation in the assessment process offers the stakeholders an opportunity to change their perceptions; it creates opportunities for reflection and public dialogue, and opens the door to new governance practices.

The list of potential WIPs is long, including elected officials (nazims and council members); high ranking civil servants (DCOs, EDOs, DOs); local judges, magistrates and lawyers; local police officials; local business leaders (individually or in their trade associations); educators (school directors, head teachers and teachers); health care professionals (hospital and clinic directors and administrators and doctors, individually or in their associations); academics (vice rectors of universities, respected professors and researchers); directors and managers of local CSOs and CBOs or local branches of national organizations); and editors and reporters in local media outlets (or local representatives of national media). In any case, a balanced and complete local governance assessment will have an acceptable mix of respondents from both state and society (see Court, et al, 2002: 8). Since there is such a strong focus in this assessment to the legal compliance of the local government to its roles and responsibilities, the majority of people that will be interviewed for this assessment are local government administrators, elected members or other officials.

Of course, not all indicators will require verification through interviews with WIPs; many will be verified using local government agency records. However, several key indicators require cross checking between nazims, council members, managers and representatives from civil society.

Implementation: Pilot Testing and Revisions to the GAT

DTW held a consultative meeting on the Governance Assessment Tool in March 2009. Stakeholders, including DCOs, District Nazims, NGO representatives, and representatives of donor agencies had a chance to look through the tool and offer feedback. After incorporating these suggestions, DTW applied the GAT in 1 partner district (District Narowal) and 1 partner tehsil (TMA Talagang). The application of the instrument in each local government was done by DTW's field staff in the Hub Office (Citizen Participation Advisors).

Based on this pilot data collection, the tool was revised to address certain implementation issues as well as to maintain relevance of the indicators in light of recent changes in the local government policy environment. Minor revisions were made to adjust for record keeping practices of the local government, including identifying the appropriate focal person for each worksheet. Major changes included adding in sections on service delivery, particularly adding in performance indicators (in addition to compliance indicators) to the health and education service areas as well as a new section on police services.

One important factor in revising the GAT was the uncertain future of local bodies pending provincial devolution reviews and amendments to the LGO. The indicators needed to be broadened in scope to measure the spirit behind the specific LG requirements. For example, one indicator measured whether the council met on a specific day each month, determined by the Nazim. The spirit behind this legal requirement is that the council meets regularly on a day that is determined ahead of time so the public is able to plan on attending. Therefore, while the nazim

may no longer remain the head of local government, and therefore would not set the date for the meetings, the principle behind this requirement would remain relevant and thus important to measure. The tools for effective governance at the local level would remain the same even if the person or body using the tools or carrying out specific tasks changes. Therefore many of the indicators were adjusted so that they could remain applicable despite minor changes in the LG system.

The system of scoring was also changed after the pilot data collection. Partial scoring had been awarded during the pilot activity which meant that for each indicator, the local government could earn a score of 0, 0.5 (partial compliance), or 1. These scores would be given based on detailed computation from the questions asked (see “district worksheets” in Annex 3). The range corresponding to a middle score (0.5) was adjusted after the pilot because of concerns that the range for the middle score was too wide and therefore setting too low a benchmark. A score of 0.5 meant that the local government was in compliance with the given indicator between 25% and 75% of the time. (A score of 0 was given if the government complied less than 25% of the time and a score of 1 was given if the government complied more than 75% of the time). For example, if the council is supposed to meet every month, but in the last year met only 3 times, this would mean a $3/12 = 25\%$ compliance rate and therefore a score of 0.5. The middle range was adjusted after the pilot because it was felt that a compliance rate of 25% was too poor a performance to merit partial scoring. Therefore, in the new scoring, a score of 0 is given when the government is in compliance less than 50% of the time, while partial scoring is given if the government complies between 50% and 75% of the time.

With regards to scoring, it is important to mention that the indicators should be re-weighted before presenting the scores to ensure that no category is overemphasized over another. This is because some of the eight broad categories contain many more indicators than others. The indicators were selected based on DTW’s own scope and areas of interest as well as based on current ground realities, including past performance of the body under assessment and its future potential. For example the council’s workings are measured in great detail but there are very limited questions on monitoring committees. This is because MCs have been largely non-functional, and at this early stage it made sense to simply measure whether or not they are in fact operating.

A Guide to Using the Tool

The Governance Assessment Tool is by no means a comprehensive assessment of all areas of local government working. However, it is a useful tool that can provide insight to selected areas of functioning and can be implemented by NGOs, national/provincial governments, or local governments themselves to monitor performance and select areas for interventions. It is useful to follow the following steps in order to carry out the governance assessment.

Step 1 - Sensitization / orientation meetings

The body that is implementing the tool should call together a group of stakeholders before the data collection in order to explain the purpose behind the study. It is pertinent to involve only a select group of individuals in the beginning, perhaps starting with a meeting with just the district Nazim and DCO. It is important to emphasize that this study is not for punitive purposes but is of benefit to the district itself, and will not be shared externally, unless they themselves decide to do so. Assessing the various procedures will give an idea of specific areas

that can be strengthened for greater efficiency. The implementing body could also agree to work with the local government in devising plans to improve those areas that score lowly.

In the meeting, a detailed overview of all the areas that will be measured and the reasons for choosing the indicators must be provided. The “Legal Basis” document (Annex 1) shows the list of indicators as well as their corresponding basis for selection. In some cases, the indicators are direct requirements from the 2001 Local Government Ordinance, and the relevant article is provided for reference. In other cases the indicators are requirements from the 2003 Business Rules. In other cases still, the indicators may be based on a “reasonable standard.” A copy of the scoring sheets and worksheets should also be provided so they get an understanding of the way the data will be collected.

After the Nazim/DCO give their consent, holding a similar meeting with the various officials who will be interviewed or asked to provide documentation should be carried out. The experience from District Narowal shows that the issuance of a letter from the head of the local government to the various officials instructing them to assist in the study by answering questions and providing any requested documentation was very beneficial.

Step 2 - Data collection

The bulk of the GAT is in the data collection. Experience from Narowal suggests that the data collector should be highly qualified, with broad based knowledge of devolution and all the various workings of local government. She/he must be able to convince officials that the indicators are based on legal requirements and that the documentation should be available and provided. In order to collect the data, the “district worksheets” should be used (Annex 3). All the indicators have been grouped into these worksheets according to a specific focal person. For example, all the indicators that will be measured by speaking to the Council Chairman are in one section. The table of contents provides an idea of the different officials that will be interviewed and the topics that will be covered. At the beginning of each section, there is a list of the things that will need to be provided by the focal person for that section. A copy of this list, the relevant worksheets, and the letter of instructions prepared by the DCO/Nazim should be sent to the respective focal person several days in advance of the data collection. This should be followed up with phone calls to ensure that the data is being collected and to set a time for the actual data collection to take place.

For each worksheet, there is a working sheet (in blue) and a corresponding scoring sheet (in red). During data collection, only the blue working sheets should be filled in to save time. At the top of each worksheet is a list of the specific items required to fill that worksheet. It is possible that multiple meetings will have to be made in order to gather all the necessary data.

Step 3 - Computation of Scores and Data Entry

The red scoring sheets within the worksheets should be used for computation of scores. Formulas for computing the raw score for each indicator are provided which must be computed using the data filled in the corresponding worksheet. In the score column, the corresponding score for the raw score must be entered in, based on the instructions. For example, “if raw score >75%, score = 1.”

The “district score sheet” (Annex 2) matches each indicator to the corresponding worksheet in which the data is entered and scores computed. The scores can be entered into the matrix which can be presented back to the partner local governments. Scores of multiple districts can be entered in to allow for comparisons and identification of trends.

Step 4 - Results sharing workshop and action planning

After the data has been compiled and score sheets have been generated, it is important to present them back to the local government. The presentations should focus on how the local government has performed and how they can move forward with improvements. The implementing body can work to support the stakeholder groups in developing improvement plans and implementing specific measures.

Annex 1: Legal Basis Document

Annex 2: District Score Sheet

Annex 3: District worksheets

Annex 1:

LEGAL BASIS FOR DISTRICT GOVERNANCE INDICATORS

SN	Strategic Area/ Outcome/ Indicator	Legal Basis	Article	Text of the Article
STRATEGIC AREA 1: COUNCIL GOVERNANCE				
Outcome 1.1 The Council works as a representative body				
1.1.1	The Council meets monthly on a specific day set by the nazim	LGO	42.2	42. Conduct of the business of Zila Council.- (2) The Zila Council shall meet at least once in every month and shall be in session for at least fifty accumulated days in a year.
1.1.2	The Council meets at least 12 times a year	LGO	42.2	42. Conduct of the business of Zila Council.- (2) The Zila Council shall meet at least once in every month and shall be in session for at least fifty accumulated days in a year.
1.1.3	The Council sessions have confirmed attendance in minutes	RS	-	
1.1.4	Women representatives for reserved seats chosen	LGO	37.i	37. Composition of Zila Council.- (1) A Zila Council shall consist of all Union Nazims in the district and following members elected on the reserved seats namely:- (i) such number of women so as to represent thirty-three percent of the total number of the Unions in the district
1.1.5	Minority representatives for reserved seats chosen	LGO	37.iii	37. Composition of Zila Council.- (1) A Zila Council shall consist of all Union Nazims in the district and following members elected on the reserved seats namely:- (iii) such number of persons from minority communities so as to represent five percent of the total number of the Unions in the district, subject to a minimum of one seat.
1.1.6	Peasant representatives for reserved seats chosen	LGO	37.ii	37. Composition of Zila Council.- (1) A Zila Council shall consist of all Union Nazims in the district and following members elected on the reserved seats namely:- (ii) such number of peasants and workers so as to represent five percent of the total number of the Unions in the district, subject to a minimum of one seat;
1.1.7	Representatives for reserved seats participate regularly in Council sessions	RS	-	CHAPTER IV -ZILA COUNCIL –section 37. Composition of Zila Council.- (1) A Zila Council shall consist of all Union Nazims in the district and following members elected on the reserved seats namely (i) such number of women so as to represent thirty-three percent of the total number of the Unions in the district; (iii) such number of persons from minority communities so as to represent five percent of the total number of the Unions in the district, subject to a minimum of one seat.
Outcome 1.2 The council makes decisions in a formal manner, registering decisions in written minutes				
1.2.1	Written agendas are distributed prior to Council meetings	RS	-	
1.2.2	The Council keeps written minutes for each meeting	LGO	42.8	42. Conduct of the business of Zila Council.- (8) The minutes of the meetings of Zila Council shall be recorded and maintained by the Secretariat of the Zila Council
1.2.3	The Council minutes are approved and signed by council members	RS	-	

1.2.4	The Council makes decisions through resolutions recorded in minutes	LGO	42.3	42. Conduct of the business of Zila Council.- 3) Save as otherwise provided, decisions of the Zila Council shall be taken by resolutions passed by a simple majority of the members present and voting and a copy of each resolution shall be transmitted to the Local Government Commission.
1.2.5	Council resolutions sent to Province (LGC)	LGO	42.3	42. Conduct of the business of Zila Council.- 3) Save as otherwise provided, decisions of the Zila Council shall be taken by resolutions passed by a simple majority of the members present and voting and a copy of each resolution shall be transmitted to the Local Government Commission.
1.2.6	Council resolutions posted in public place or published	RS	-	
Outcome 1.3 The council exercises oversight of the executive				
1.3.1	The nazim makes annual address to Council on plans and priorities	LGO	43	43. Address of Zila Nazim.- (1) At the commencement of first session of the Zila Council after its election and on commencement of first session of every year, the Zila Nazim shall address the Zila Council and shall inform the Council of his plans and programmes for the said year and, as the case may be, the performance of the District Government during the preceding year.
1.3.2	The nazim presents semi-annual performance reports to the council	LGO	18.i	18. Functions and powers of the Zila Nazim.- (1) The functions and powers of the Zila Nazim shall be to- (i) present report on the performance of the District Government in person to the Zila Council at least twice a year
1.3.3	The Council members have copies of all three basic documents (annual budget, bylaws, and audit reports)	RS	-	
1.3.4	The Council has an assigned budget for its functioning	LGO	38	38. Secretariat of the Council.- The Zila Council shall have its Secretariat under the Naib Zila Nazim and shall have a separate budget allocation.
STRATEGIC AREA 2: COUNCIL EFFECTIVENESS				
Outcome 2.1 The council makes formal decisions on local bylaws and plans				
2.1.1	The Council has approved some bylaws (listed in 2001 LGO)	LGO	39	39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers of a Zila Council shall be to- (a) approve by-laws proposed by the District Government under this Ordinance;
2.1.2	Approved bylaws are published in the Gazette	RS	-	
Outcome 2.2 The council formally reviews and approves the annual budget				
2.2.1	The council members receives copies of draft budget before or during council meeting	RS	-	
2.2.2	The nazim presents the draft budget to the council in 1st week of April	BR	LGO 112	112. Approval of Budget: (1) Following the presentation of the Provincial budget but, before the commencement of the next financial year, each Nazim shall, present the budget for approval by the respective Council before the beginning of such financial year:

2.2.3	The final budget presented and approved in council session with quorum registered in minutes	BR	63.1	63. Presentation to the Council.-(1) The budget documents shall be laid before the Council for approval.
2.2.4	The council members receives copies of final budget before council meeting	RS	-	
2.2.5	The final budget is approved by council in formal session before commencement of new fiscal year	BR	62.5, 2nd Sch.	62. Draft and Final Budget.-(5) The budget based on the final estimates provided by the Government shall be presented by the Nazim to the Council for approval.
Outcome 2.3 The council formally reviews and approves taxes and fees				
2.3.1	The council has formally approved the taxes that it collects through written resolutions	LGO	39.b	39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers Zila Council shall be to- (b) 10[approve taxes proposed by the District Government on the subjects specified in Part-I of the Second Schedule, or in case of a City District, on subjects specified in Part-II of the Second Schedule;]
2.3.2	Council has approved the procedure for collection of taxes and fees (directly or contracted)	RS	-	
2.3.3	All approved taxes and fees are billed and collected (directly or contracted)	RS	-	
STRATEGIC AREA 3: RESPONSIVENESS				
Outcome 3.1 The local government has formal mechanisms for eliciting citizens' views and opinions				
3.1.1	Nazim/Council holds public consultations on budget call letter (BCL) including different stakeholders	LGO	BR 11.1	11. Budget call letter.- (1) The budget call letter shall be finalized after consultation with the relevant stakeholders.
3.1.2	The BCL refers to the priorities identified by the stakeholders	LGO	BR 11.3	11. Budget call letter.- (3) The Finance and Budget Officer shall consolidate the information received from the stakeholders including the priorities identified by the Councils and the local government offices in the draft budget call letter and submit it to the Nazim for approval.
3.1.3	Nazim/Council holds hearings or consultations on changes in taxes and fees	LGO	116.2	116. Taxes to be Levied: (2) No tax shall be levied without previous publication of the tax proposal and after inviting and hearing public objections
Outcome 3.2 The local government has formal mechanisms for registering and processing complaints				
3.2.1	Complaints cell established and administrative responsibilities assigned	LGO	188	188. Complaint Cell.- Every District Government, Tehsil Municipal Administration, Town Municipal Administration and Union Administration shall set up a complaint cell for redressal of grievances within the ambit of their responsibilities under this Ordinance.
3.2.2	Complaints cell operational (complaints received and processed)	LGO	188	188. Complaint Cell.- Every District Government, Tehsil Municipal Administration, Town Municipal Administration and Union Administration shall set up a complaint cell for redressal of grievances within the ambit of their responsibilities under this Ordinance.
3.2.3	A record of complaints is maintained	RS	-	
3.2.4	DCO holds regular office hours stated to the public	RS	-	
STRATEGIC AREA 4: TRANSPARENCY				

Outcome 4.1 The council's decisionmaking process is open to public scrutiny

4.1.1	Dates of council meeting are posted/published in advance	RS	-	
4.1.2	The Council meetings have written agendas	RoB		
4.1.3	Members of the general public attend Council meetings without restrictions	LGO	42.7	42. Conduct of the business of Zila Council.- (7) The meetings of the Zila Council shall be open to public, unless the Council, by a resolution, decides to hold any meeting in camera
4.1.4	The place where the council meets has sufficient room and seats for the public	RS	-	

Outcome 4.2 The local government provides access to information on important decisions and policies

4.2.1	Monthly and annual Accounts statements are placed at a conspicuous place for public inspection.	LGO	114.5	114. Accounts : (5) A statement of monthly and annual Accounts and such other necessary statements shall be placed at a conspicuous place by the Local Government concerned for public inspection
4.2.2	The draft budget is shared with the general public in April	RS	137.3	137. Transparency. (3) Information about the staffing and the performance of the office of a local government during the preceding month shall, as far as possible, be displayed at a prominent place within the premises of the office for access by the citizens.
4.2.3	Information about the staffing and the performance of the local government is displayed at a prominent place	LGO	137.2	137. Transparency.(2) Every office shall provide requisite information, if not restricted under any law for the time being in force, on the prescribed forms and on payment of such fee as may be prescribed
4.2.4	The minutes of the council meetings are open to public inspection	RS	-	
4.2.5	All Council decisions and notices affecting the public are published in local dailies	RoB		

Outcome 4.3 The local government public accounts committee provides access to the public

4.3.1	The accounts committee publicises/posts the date, time and place of its meetings	RS	-	
4.3.2	The accounts committee meetings to discuss audit findings (paras) are open to the general public	LGO	114.6	114. Accounts 6) The respective Accounts Committees of the Councils shall hold public hearings in which- (a) objections to statement of accounts referred to in subsection (5) above may be heard and, if required, appropriate action may be taken; and (b) internal and external Audit Reports will be discussed for appropriate action.
4.3.3	The accounts committee meetings are held in a place with sufficient space and seats for the general public	RS	-	

STRATEGIC AREA 5: BUDGET MANAGEMENT

Outcome 5.1 The annual budget process follows budget rules				
5.1.1	The local government issues an annual Budget Call Letter (BCL) along with key dates in budget calendar	BR	11.4	11. Budget call letter.- (4) After approval by the Nazim, the Finance and Budget Officer shall issue to each Head of Offices the budget call letter, including the budget calendar.
5.1.2	The BCL indicates sector or site-specific priorities for the ADP	BR	11.3	11. Budget call letter.- (3) The Finance and Budget Officer shall consolidate the information received from the stakeholders including the priorities identified by the Councils and the local government offices in the draft budget call letter and submit it to the Nazim for approval.
5.1.3	The development projects outlines are reviewed by the DDC /TDC	BR	31.3	31. Processing of development projects.- (iii) approval of development project outline by the Budget and Development Committee
5.1.4	The draft budget is reviewed and discussed in the DDC/TDC	BR	62.2	62. Draft and Final Budget. (2) The Draft Budget shall be discussed and finalized by the Budget and Development Committee
5.1.5	The local government meets with other tiers in Mushawirat Committee to coordinate budget priorities	LGO	140.3	140. Zila Mushavirat Committee.- (3) The Zila Mushavirat Committee shall meet at least once in every three months or as and when called into meeting by the Zila Nazim or on the request of any two members of the Committee.
5.1.6	The budget presentation includes a written Annual Budget Statement (ABS)	BR	52	52. Budget Documents.- 1. The Finance and Budget Officer shall for the Council prepare the budget documents specified below- (ii) Annual Budget Statement;
Outcome 5.2 The annual development program budget is presented in a transparent manner				
5.2.1	The ADP has multiple line items (not a single line item budget)	RS	-	
5.2.2	The ADP contains no major line item allocations for "generic" or lumpsum activities	BR	58.5	
5.2.3	The ADP identifies specific projects by objective/location/amount	BR	40.1	40. Classification of Annual Development Programme.- (1) The Annual Development Programme shall classify projects by sector, function and geographic location.
Outcome 5.3 The local government has a formal, transparent process of budget implementation				
5.3.1	The Council has set a limit for budget modifications requiring council approval	BR	90.4	90. Procedure for Re-appropriation.- (4) In the event that the re-appropriation is beyond the limit set by the Council, it shall require the approval of the Council. In such cases the request for re-appropriation of funds shall be prepared by the Head of Offices and forwarded to the following officers in succession- (i) The Finance and Budget Officer; (ii) Budget and Development Committee; and (iii) Council for approval.
5.3.2	Major budget modifications (reappropriation) during the year are presented and approved in formal Council sessions	BR	90.4	90. Procedure for Re-appropriation.- (4) In the event that the re-appropriation is beyond the limit set by the Council, it shall require the approval of the Council. In such cases the request for re-appropriation of funds shall be prepared by the Head of Offices and forwarded to the following officers in succession- (i) The Finance and Budget Officer; (ii) Budget and Development Committee; and (iii) Council for approval.

5.3.3	The local government administration presents monthly financial reports to the Council	BR	74.1	74. Monthly Reports of expenditure.- (1) Each local government shall submit a monthly report to the respective Council relating to the expenditure incurred during the month by the local government.
5.3.4	The local government administration presents reports on completed projects to the Council	BR	46	46. Development project Completion.- On development project completion, a project handing over report shall be submitted by the concerned Head of Offices to the Planning Officer and a copy provided to the Budget and Development Committee, Finance and Budget Officer and a copy shall be provided to the Council.
STRATEGIC AREA 6: MANAGEMENT OF SERVICES				
Outcome 6.1 The annual budget incorporates performance targets for services				
6.1.1	The budget includes a statement of Budget Salient Features (BSF) including service delivery issues and policies	BR	52.iii, 55	52. Budget Documents.- (iii) Budget Salient Features; 55. Budget Salient Features (BSF).- (1) The Budget Salient Features shall provide a brief description of the main features of each office and also include performance targets, service delivery facilities, policies and plans of the various offices. (2) The salient features of each office shall be provided in Form BSF-1. (3) The performance targets shall be provided in Form BSF-2. (4) The status of service delivery facilities shall be provided in Form BSF-3
6.1.2	In the BSF each local government office presents specific performance targets	BR	55.1, 55.3	55. Budget Salient Features (BSF).- (1) The Budget Salient Features shall provide a brief description of the main features of each office and also include performance targets, service delivery facilities, policies and plans of the various offices. (3) The performance targets shall be provided in Form BSF-2.
6.1.3	The BSF includes a report on the status of individual service delivery facilities	BR	55.4	55. Budget Salient Features (BSF).- (4) The status of service delivery facilities shall be provided in Form BSF-3.
Outcome 6.2 The local government Council exercises oversight of policies and management of services				
6.2.1	The DCO/TMO reports to Council on status of performance targets presented in annual budget	BR	94.4	94. Distribution of Funds to local government by Government.-The share of each local government shall be in accordance with the Award notified by the Governor.
6.2.2	Local government service departments maintain record of relevant Council policies and decisions	RS	-	
6.2.3	Monitoring Committees have been formally notified	LGO	138; 39.e	138. Monitoring by committees.- (1) The Monitoring Committees elected by the Zila Council shall be responsible for monitoring the functioning of the offices of the District Government and preparing quarterly evaluation reports on the prescribed format.; 39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers of a Zila Council shall be to- (e) elect committees of the Zila Council for monitoring the performance of the District Government;
6.2.4	Monitoring Committees meet periodically	LGO	138	138. Monitoring by committees.- (1) The Monitoring Committees elected by the Zila Council shall be responsible for monitoring the functioning of the offices of the District Government and preparing quarterly evaluation reports on the prescribed format.

6.2.5	Monitoring Committees have assigned budget for their activities	RS	-	
6.2.6	Monitoring Committees present reports to Council	LGO	138.5	138. Monitoring by committees.- (5) The Monitoring Committees shall submit their quarterly reports to the respective Councils which may through a resolution require the respective Nazim to take necessary action
6.2.7	The District Public Safety Commission has been officially notified	PO	37.1	37. Establishment of District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission.- (1) The Provincial Government shall establish a District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission in every District, including Capital City District, consisting of nine members one of whom shall be the Chairperson.
6.2.8	The District Public Safety Commission has the proper composition	PO	38	38. Composition.- (1) The composition of the District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission shall be as follows:- (a) one-third members shall be appointed by the Government from amongst the Members of the Provincial Assembly and National Assembly of the District concerned as ex-officio members, including a woman member: Provided that where in a District, members of the Provincial Assembly or National Assembly fall short of the required number of such members, the vacant seat shall be allocated to independent members: Provided further that in case of non-availability of a woman member of the Provincial Assembly or National Assembly in a District, the seat shall be allocated to a woman independent member; (b) one-third members, of whom one shall be a woman, shall be appointed as independent members by the Government from a list of names recommended by the Selection Panel; and (c) the remaining one-third members, out of whom one shall be a woman, shall be elected by the Zila Council from amongst its members on the basis of each member casting only one vote in favour of any contesting candidate through secret ballot.
6.2.9	The District Public Safety Commission meets regularly	PO	47.4	47. Meetings and conduct of business of the District Public Safety [and Police Complaints] Commission.- 4) Members shall attend meetings of the Commission as and when required for which at least a week's notice, with agenda, shall be given. There shall be minimum of one meeting in a month provided an emergency meeting may be held at a short notice not exceeding twenty four hours.
6.2.10	The District Public Safety Commission has its own budget heading in the budget	PO	37.2	37. (2) The Commission shall have its independent budget under a separate budgetary head of account, Drawing and Disbursing Officer and the Chairperson of the Commission shall be its Principal Accounting Officer.

6.2.11	The District Public Safety Commission creates a district policing plan which includes performance targets	PO	44.1.a.ii	44. Powers and Functions of the District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission.- (1) The District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission shall exercise the powers and perform the following functions including those relating to complaints against the police officers serving in the District, except the Head of District Police, namely:- (a) approve an annual Local Policing Plan prepared by the Head of District Police in coordination with the Zila Nazim setting out the arrangements for policing during the year: Provided that such Policing Plan shall include- (i) a statement of financial resources expected to be made available; and (ii) performance targets for the year and their delivery mechanism;
6.2.12	The District Public Safety commission prepares an annual report	PO	44.1.b	(44. Powers and Functions of the District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission.- (1) The District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission shall exercise the powers and perform the following functions including those relating to complaints against the police officers serving in the District, except the Head of District Police, namely:- b) the District Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission shall submit an annual report to the Government through the Provincial Public Safety and Police Complaints Commission, inter alia, containing-
6.2.13	The District Criminal Justice Coordination Committee has been notified	PO	109	109. Establishment. – There shall be a Criminal Justice Coordination Committee in a district.
6.2.14	The DCJCC meets regularly	PO	111.2	111. Functions of the Criminal Justice Coordination Committee.– (2) The meeting of the Criminal Justice Coordination Committee shall be held at least once a month. The secretary of the committee shall record the minutes of the meetings.
Outcome 6.3 The local government collects basic information about service provision				
6.3.1	The district is able to provide information on school conditions	RS	-	
6.3.2	The district is able to provide information on disease incidence rates	RS	-	
6.3.3	The district police is able to provide information on crime statistics	RS	-	
Outcome 6.4 The local government provides quality services				
6.4.1	The district has an acceptable rate of primary schools that are not katcha - District only	RS	-	
6.4.2	The district has an acceptable rate of primary schools with bathrooms - District only	RS	-	
6.4.3	The district has a good number of schools with no missing facilities - District only	RS	-	
6.4.4	Drop out rate for primary schools - District only	RS	-	
6.4.5	Drop out rate for secondary schools - District only	RS	-	
6.4.6	Births by skilled attendant - District only	RS	-	

6.4.7	Percentage of Children Who Are Full Immunized - District only	RS	-	
6.4.8	Under five morality rate - District only	RS	-	
6.4.9	Incidence rate of Diarrhea - District only	RS	-	
6.4.10	Incidence rate of Pneumonia - District only	RS	-	
6.4.11	Percent of cases that are resolved	RS	-	
6.4.12	Percent of sanctioned police posts that are filled	RS	-	

Outcome 6.5 The local government invests in service improvement

6.5.1	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of primary education	RS	-	
6.5.2	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of Secondary education	RS	-	
6.5.3	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of primary healthcare	RS	-	
6.5.4	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of secondary and tertiary healthcare	RS	-	

STRATEGIC AREA 7: ASSET MANAGEMENT

Outcome 7.1 Local governments maintain adequate records of assets

7.1.1	Incumbent nazim undertook inventory of moveable and immovale property	LGO	123.1	123. Stock taking by the Nazim (1) Every Zila Nazim, Tehsil Nazim, Town Nazim and Union Nazim shall, on assumption of his office and thereafter, once in every year on a date fixed by him, take the physical stock of movable and immovable properties of the concerned local government and submit a report to the concerned Council.
7.1.2	Annual inventory of moveable and immoveable property	LGO	123.1	123. Stock taking by the Nazim (1) Every Zila Nazim, Tehsil Nazim, Town Nazim and Union Nazim shall, on assumption of his office and thereafter, once in every year on a date fixed by him, take the physical stock of movable and immovable properties of the concerned local government and submit a report to the concerned Council.
7.1.3	Description of condition, actual use or loss for all moveable assets	LGO	123.2	123. Stock taking by the Nazim (2) The report referred to in sub-section (1) shall contain- a. particulars of the properties held during the preceding year; b. total value of the property, annual return therefrom and change in its value, if any; c. particulars of unserviceable articles; d. particulars of losses, if any; and e. proposals for utilization, development and improvement during the following year.
7.1.4	Description of actual uses and income from all immoveable assets	LGO	123.2	123. Stock taking by the Nazim (2) The report referred to in sub-section (1) shall contain- a. particulars of the properties held during the preceding year; b. total value of the property, annual return therefrom and change in its value, if any; c. particulars of unserviceable articles; d. particulars of losses, if any; and e. proposals for utilization, development and improvement during the following year

7.1.5	The district police maintains an inventory of unclaimed property	PO	4.1.(h)	4. Duties of police. - (1) Subject to law, it shall be the duty of every police officer to - (h) take charge of all unclaimed property and to prepare its inventory;
Outcome 7.2 Local government assets are managed in a transparent manner				
7.2.1	Inventories of assets are presented to Council	RS	-	123. Stock taking by the Nazim (1) Every Zila Nazim, Tehsil Nazim, Town Nazim and Union Nazim shall, on assumption of his office and thereafter, once in every year on a date fixed by him, take the physical stock of movable and immovable properties of the concerned local government and submit a report to the concerned Council.
7.2.2	Administration has registry of titles for all immovable assets	RS	-	121. Ownership of immovable property.- (1) Subject to any reservations made, or any conditions imposed by the Government, the property specified hereunder shall vest in the respective local government if it is- (c) constructed or acquired by a local government with its title.
7.2.3	All immovable assets rented to third parties have registered contracts/leases	RS	-	121. Ownership of immovable property.- (1) Subject to any reservations made, or any conditions imposed by the Government, the property specified hereunder shall vest in the respective local government if it is- (a) vested in a local government through succession as provided in section 180; (b) transferred to the local government by the Government or any other authority, organisation or an individual; and (c) constructed or acquired by a local government with its title.
7.2.4	Leases are given through a competitive bidding process	LGO	124.2	124. Use and disposal of properties of local governments.- (2) Immovable properties of local governments shall, subject to section 125, not be sold or permanently alienated: Provided that such properties may be given on lease through competitive bidding by public auction for periods not exceeding five years at a time.
7.2.5	Leases are re-bid after 5 years	LGO	124.2	124. Use and disposal of properties of local governments.- (2) Immovable properties of local governments shall, subject to section 125, not be sold or permanently alienated: Provided that such properties may be given on lease through competitive bidding by public auction for periods not exceeding five years at a time.
STRATEGIC AREA 8: EXTERNAL AND INTERNAL CONTROL				
Outcome 8.1 There is a functioning process of external audit				
8.1.1	External audits have been completed and presented to local government for previous fiscal years	RS	-	
8.1.2	Nazim refers external audit reports to the council, and these are entered in minutes	LGO	115.2	115. Audit: (2) The Nazim shall cause the Audit Report to be submitted to the respective Council and the Council shall refer it for examination to its Accounts Committee
8.1.3	External audit reports are distributed to council members	RS	-	
8.1.4	The council refers external audits to the public accounts committee	LGO	115.2	115. Audit: (2) The Nazim shall cause the Audit Report to be submitted to the respective Council and the Council shall refer it for examination to its Accounts Committee
Outcome 8.2 There is a functioning process of internal audit				
8.2.1	The internal auditor has been appointed	LGO	115-A.1	115-A. Internal Audit. (1) Nazim of each District and Tehsil or Town shall appoint an Internal Auditor.

8.2.2	The internal auditor has presented audit reports	LGO	115.1	115. Audit: (1) The Auditor General of Pakistan shall, on the basis of such audit as he may consider appropriate or necessary, certify the accounts, compiled and prepared by the respective Accounts Official of the local government for each financial year, showing under the respective heads the annual receipts and disbursements for the purposes of each local government and shall submit the certified accounts with such notes, comments or recommendations as he may consider necessary to the respective Nazim.
8.2.3	The internal audit reports have been referred to the accounts committee	LGO	115.2;39.s; 115-A.3	115. Audit: (2) The Nazim shall cause the Audit Report to be submitted to the respective Council and the Council shall refer it for examination to its Accounts Committee;; 39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers of a Zila Council shall be to- (s)review the audit reports of the Zila Accounts Committee; 115-A. Internal Audit. (3) The Internal Auditor shall serve as a principal support person to respective Nazim of Government or Tehsil or Town by providing information to him and members of the respective Council on Local Government performance.

Outcome 8.3 The public accounts committee reviews audit findings

8.3.1	The public accounts committee has been notified	LGO	39.l	39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers of a Zila Council shall be to- (l) elect a Zila Accounts Committee
8.3.2	The public accounts committee meets to review internal and external audit findings	LGO	39.l	39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers of a Zila Council shall be to- (l) elect a Zila Accounts Committee
8.3.3	The public accounts committee has reviewed external audit reports up to previous fiscal year	RS	-	
8.3.4	The public accounts committee has presented annual reports to Council	LGO	39.s	39. Functions and powers of Zila Council.- The functions and powers of a Zila Council shall be to- (s)review the audit reports of the Zila Accounts Committee;
8.3.5	The public accounts committee has presented annual reports to Province (LGC)			

KEY

LGO = Local Government Ordinance 2001

40

PO = Police Order 2002

9

BR = Business Rules 2003

18

RS = Reasonable Standard

47

Annex 2:

DISTRICT GOVERNANCE SCORE SHEET

SN	INDICATOR	Wksht #	Score
STRATEGIC AREA 1: COUNCIL GOVERNANCE			
<i>Outcome 1.1 The Council works as a representative body</i>			
1.1.1	The Council meets monthly on a specific set day (ie. first Monday of every month OR 1st of every month)	2	
1.1.2	The Council meets at least 12 times a year	2	
1.1.3	The Council sessions have a record of attendance, as evidenced by minutes or attendance/signatures sheet	2	
1.1.4	Women representatives for reserved seats chosen	1	
1.1.5	Minority representatives for reserved seats chosen	1	
1.1.6	Peasant representatives for reserved seats chosen	1	
1.1.7	Reserved representatives for reserved seats participate regularly in Council sessions	2	
<i>Outcome 1.2 The council makes decisions in a formal manner, registering decisions in written minutes</i>			
1.2.1	Written agendas are distributed prior to Council meetings	9	
1.2.2	The Council keeps written minutes for each meeting	2	
1.2.3	The Council minutes are approved and signed by council members	2	
1.2.4	The Council makes decisions through resolutions recorded in minutes or past year's resolution register	2	
1.2.5	Council resolutions sent to Province (LGC or relevant authority)	3	
1.2.6	Council resolutions posted in public place or published	3	
<i>Outcome 1.3 The council exercises oversight of the executive</i>			
1.3.1	The nazim makes annual address to Council on plans and priorities	6	
1.3.2	The nazim presents semi-annual performance reports to the council	6	
1.3.3	The Council members have copies of all three basic documents (approved annual budget, bylaws, and audit reports)	9	
1.3.4	The Council has an assigned budget for its functioning	14	
STRATEGIC AREA 2: COUNCIL EFFECTIVENESS			
<i>Outcome 2.1 The council makes formal decisions on local bylaws and plans</i>			
2.1.1	The Council has approved some bylaws (listed in 2001 LGO)	4	
2.1.2	Approved bylaws are published in the Gazette	4	
<i>Outcome 2.2 The council formally reviews and approves the annual budget</i>			
2.2.1	The council members receives copies of draft budget before council meeting	9	
2.2.2	The nazim presents the draft budget to the council in 1st week of April	6	
2.2.3	The final budget presented and approved in council session with quorum registered in minutes	6	
2.2.4	The council members receive copies of the revised draft budget and can propose changes before it is finalized	9	
2.2.5	The final budget is approved by council in formal session before commencement of new fiscal year	6	
<i>Outcome 2.3 The council formally reviews and approves taxes and fees</i>			
2.3.1	The council has formally approved the taxes that it collects through written resolutions	5	

2.3.2	Council has approved the procedure for collection of taxes and fees (directly or contracted)	5	
2.3.3	All approved taxes and fees are billed and collected (directly or contracted)	5	
STRATEGIC AREA 3: RESPONSIVENESS			
<i>Outcome 3.1 The local government has formal mechanisms for eliciting citizens' views and opinions</i>			
3.1.1	Nazim/Council holds public consultations on budget call letter (BCL) including different stakeholders	13	
3.1.2	The BCL refers to the priorities identified by the stakeholders	13	
3.1.3	Nazim/Council holds hearings or consultations on changes in taxes and fees	7	
<i>Outcome 3.2 The local government has formal mechanisms for registering and processing complaints</i>			
3.2.1	Complaints cell established and administrative responsibilities assigned	15	
3.2.2	Complaints cell operational (complaints received and processed)	17	
3.2.3	A record of complaints is maintained	17	
3.2.4	DCO holds regular office hours stated to the public	15	
3.2.5	District Police maintains a record of complaints against the police	22	
STRATEGIC AREA 4: TRANSPARENCY			
<i>Outcome 4.1 The council's decision making process is open to public scrutiny</i>			
4.1.1	Dates of council meeting are posted/published in advance	2	
4.1.2	The Council meetings have written agendas	2	
4.1.3	Members of the general public attend Council meetings without restrictions	9	
4.1.4	The place where the council meets has sufficient room and seats for the public	17	
<i>Outcome 4.2 The local government provides access to information on important decisions and policies</i>			
4.2.1	Monthly and annual Accounts statements are placed at a conspicuous place for public inspection.	8	
4.2.2	The draft budget is shared with the general public in April	6	
4.2.3	Information about the staffing and the performance of the local government is displayed at a prominent place	17	
4.2.4	The minutes of the council meetings are open to public inspection	9	
4.2.5	All Council decisions and notices affecting the public are published in local dailies	7	
<i>Outcome 4.3 The local government public accounts committee provides access to the public</i>			
4.3.1	The accounts committee publicizes/posts the date, time and place of its meetings	12	
4.3.2	The accounts committee meetings to discuss audit findings (paras) are open to the general public	11	
4.3.3	The accounts committee meetings are held in a place with sufficient space and seats for the general public	17	
STRATEGIC AREA 5: BUDGET MANAGEMENT			
<i>Outcome 5.1 The annual budget process follows budget rules</i>			
5.1.1	The local government issues an annual Budget Call Letter (BCL) along with key dates in budget calendar	16	
5.1.2	The BCL indicates sector or site-specific priorities for the ADP	16	
5.1.3	The development projects outlines are reviewed by the DDC /TDC	15	
5.1.4	The draft budget is reviewed and discussed in the DDC/TDC	13	
5.1.5	The local government meets with other tiers in Mushawirat Committee to coordinate budget priorities	14	
5.1.6	The budget presentation includes a written Annual Budget Statement (ABS)	13	
<i>Outcome 5.2 The annual development program budget is presented in a transparent manner</i>			

5.2.1	The ADP has multiple line items (not a single line item budget)	14	
5.2.2	The ADP contains no major line item allocations for "generic" or lump sum activities	14	
5.2.3	The ADP identifies specific projects by objective/location/amount	13	
Outcome 5.3 The local government has a formal, transparent process of budget implementation			
5.3.1	The Council has set a limit for budget modifications requiring council approval	8	
5.3.2	Major budget modifications (reappropriation) during the year are presented and approved in formal Council sessions	8	
5.3.3	The local government administration presents monthly financial reports to the Council	2	
5.3.4	The local government administration presents reports on completed projects to the Council	15	
STRATEGIC AREA 6: MANAGEMENT OF SERVICES			
Outcome 6.1 The annual budget incorporates performance targets for services			
6.1.1	The budget includes a statement of Budget Salient Features (BSF) including service delivery issues and policies	14	
6.1.2	In the BSF each local government office presents specific performance targets	14	
6.1.3	The BSF includes a report on the status of individual service delivery facilities	15	
Outcome 6.2 The local government Council exercises oversight of policies and management of services			
6.2.1	The DCO/DCO reports to Council on status of performance targets presented in annual budget	15	
6.2.2	Local government service departments maintain record of relevant Council policies and decisions	17	
6.2.3	Monitoring Committees have been formally notified	18	
6.2.4	Monitoring Committees meet periodically	18	
6.2.5	Monitoring Committees have assigned budget for their activities	14	
6.2.6	Monitoring Committees present reports to Council	8	
6.2.7	The District Public Safety Commission has been officially notified	21	
6.2.8	The District Public Safety Commission has the proper composition	21	
6.2.9	The District Public Safety Commission meets regularly	21	
6.2.10	The District Public Safety Commission has its own budget heading in the budget	21	
6.2.11	The District Public Safety Commission creates a district policing plan which includes performance targets	21	
6.2.12	The District Public Safety commission prepares an annual report	21	
6.2.13	The District Criminal Justice Coordination Committee has been notified	22	
6.2.14	The DCJCC meets regularly	22	
Outcome 6.3 The local government collects basic information about service provision			
6.3.1	The district is able to provide information on school conditions	20	
6.3.2	The district is able to provide information on disease incidence rates	19	
6.3.3	The district police is able to provide information on crime statistics	22	
Outcome 6.4 The local government provides quality services			
6.4.1	The district has an acceptable rate of primary schools that are not katcha	20	
6.4.2	The district has an acceptable rate of primary schools with bathrooms	20	
6.4.3	The district has a good number of schools with no missing facilities	20	
6.4.4	Drop out rates for primary schools	20	
6.4.5	Drop out rates for secondary schools	20	

6.4.6	Births by skilled attendant	19	
6.4.7	Percentage of Children Who Are Full Immunized	19	
6.4.8	Under five morality rate	19	
6.4.9	Incidence rate of Diarrhea	19	
6.4.10	Incidence rate of Pneumonia	19	
6.4.11	Percent of cases that are resolved	22	
6.4.12	Percent of sanctioned police posts that are filled	22	
Outcome 6.5 The local government invests in service improvement			
6.5.1	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of primary education	20	
6.5.2	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of Secondary education	20	
6.5.3	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of primary healthcare	19	
6.5.4	The District invests in the maintenance, improvement and expansion of secondary and tertiary healthcare	19	
STRATEGIC AREA 7: ASSET MANAGEMENT			
Outcome 7.1 Local governments maintain adequate records of assets			
7.1.1	Incumbent nazim undertook inventory of moveable and immovable property	10	
7.1.2	Annual inventory of moveable and immovable property	10	
7.1.3	Description of condition, actual use or loss for all moveable assets	10	
7.1.4	Description of actual uses and income from all immovable assets	10	
7.1.5	The district police maintains an inventory of unclaimed property	22	
Outcome 7.2 Local government assets are managed in a transparent manner			
7.2.1	Inventories of assets are presented to Council	10	
7.2.2	Administration has registry of titles for all immovable assets	10	
7.2.3	All immovable assets rented to third parties have registered contracts/leases	10	
7.2.4	Leases are given through a competitive bidding process	10	
7.2.5	Leases are re-bid after 5 years	10	
STRATEGIC AREA 8: EXTERNAL AND INTERNAL CONTROL			
Outcome 8.1 There is a functioning process of external audit			
8.1.1	External audits have been completed and presented to local government for previous fiscal years	11	
8.1.2	Nazim refers external audit reports to the council, and these are entered in minutes	11	
8.1.3	External audit reports are distributed to council members	9	
8.1.4	The council refers external audits to the public accounts committee	11	
Outcome 8.2 There is a functioning process of internal audit			
8.2.1	The internal auditor has been appointed	11	
8.2.2	The internal auditor has presented audit reports	11	
8.2.3	The internal audit reports have been referred to the accounts committee	11	
Outcome 8.3 The public accounts committee reviews audit findings			
8.3.1	The public accounts committee has been notified	11	
8.3.2	The public accounts committee meets to review internal and external audit findings	11	
8.3.3	The public accounts committee has reviewed external audit reports up to previous fiscal year	11	

8.3.4	The public accounts committee has presented annual reports to Council	8	
8.3.5	The public accounts committee has presented annual reports to Province (LGC)	12	

Annex 3:

Scoring Worksheets for Indicator-Led Governance Assessment Tool

(For Districts)

Print Double Sided

Date(s) of Fieldwork: _____

Location (District): _____

Table of Contents

- To fill with Council Officer: Worksheets 1-9
- To fill with EDO Revenue: Worksheet 10
- To fill with EDO F&P: Worksheets 11-14
- To fill with the DCO: Worksheets 15-16
- To fill through physical verification: Worksheet 17
- To fill with Chairman of the Development Committee: Worksheet 18
- To fill with EDO Health: Worksheet 19
- To fill with EDO Education: Worksheet 20
- To fill with DPO: Worksheets 21-22

WORKSHEET 1: COUNCIL INFORMATION	32
WORKSHEET 2: COUNCIL MEETINGS	34
WORKSHEET 3: RESOLUTIONS	36
WORKSHEET 4: BY-LAWS	38
WORKSHEET 5: TAXES	40
WORKSHEET 6: NAZIM PRESENTATIONS TO COUNCIL	42
WORKSHEET 7: CONSULTATIONS ON TAXES	44
WORKSHEET 8: QUESTIONS FOR COUNCIL OFFICER	46
WORKSHEET 9: INTERVIEWS WITH COUNCIL AND OPPOSITION MEMBERS	48
WORKSHEET 10: INVENTORIES.....	51
WORKSHEET 11: AUDITS.....	54
WORKSHEET 12: ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE	56
WORKSHEET 13: BUDGET CALL LETTERS	58
WORKSHEET 14: BUDGET PRESENTATION	58
WORKSHEET 15: QUESTIONS FOR THE DCO	61
WORKSHEET 16: DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE.....	63
WORKSHEET 17: FOR PHYSICAL VERIFICATION	66
WORKSHEET 18: MONITORING COMMITTEE	69
WORKSHEET 19: HEALTH SERVICES.....	72
WORKSHEET 20: EDUCATION SERVICES	75
WORKSHEET 21: POLICE SERVICES - 1	78
WORKSHEET 22: POLICE SERVICES - 2	80

WORKSHEETS 1-9

TO BE FILLED WITH THE COUNCIL OFFICER

Need:

- List of council members
- Correspondence records
- Council meeting minutes
- Council meeting agendas
- Meeting attendance records
- Public notices
- Press releases
- Resolution register
- By-laws register
- Monthly gazettes
- Performance reports
- Budgets
- Master plans

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 1: Council Information

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask the Council Officer for a list of council members.

List of Council Members

SN	1. Name	2. Non-Reserved Seat (✓)	3. Reserved seat-woman? (✓)	4. Reserved seat-minority? (✓)	5. Reserved seat-peasant? (✓)
1					
2					
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					
29					
30					
31					
32					
33					
34					
35					

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 1
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
1.1.4	A. Total number of unions in the district = ____ B. 33% of the number of unions in the district = $A \times 0.33 =$ ____ C. Number of occupied women's reserved seats in council (sum column 3) : ____ <u>If $C \geq B$, score = 1; otherwise, score = 0</u>	
1.1.5	A. Total number of unions in the district = ____ B. 5% of the number of unions in the district = $A \times 0.05 =$ ____ C. Number of occupied minority reserved seats in council (sum column 4): ____ <u>If $C \geq B$, score = 1; otherwise, score = 0</u>	
1.1.6	A. Total number of unions in the district = ____ B. 5% of the number of unions in the district = $A \times 0.05 =$ ____ C. Number of occupied peasant reserved seats in council (sum column 5): ____ <u>If $C \geq B$, score = 1; otherwise, score = 0</u>	

Worksheet 2: Council Meetings

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask Council Officer for:

- minutes of council meetings from last 12 months, and attendance record, if separate
- reminders/invitations sent to council members for meetings in last 12 months
- public notices announcing the meetings in the last 12 months

1. Ask the council officer whether council meetings are supposed to be held on a set day each month (for example first Monday of every month, or for example 10th of every month).

Y/N ____ If yes, specify the set day/date _____

SN	1. Date (Day, DD-MM-YY)	2. Was there a press brief/ public notice publicizing the date of the meeting in advance?	3. Is the agenda Available? (Y/N) (view agendas)	4. Is the attendance record available? (Y/N) (view attendance record)	5. # of council members who attended the meeting	6. # of women members who attended the meeting	7. # of minority members who attended the meeting	8. # of peasant members who attended the meeting	9. Are meeting minutes available? (Y/N) (view minutes)	10. Were the minutes approved and signed by members? (Y/N) (view minutes)	11. Was a resolution passed? (as recorded in the minutes)	12. Was the month's financial report received and discussed? (as recorder in the minutes)
1												
2												
3												
4												
5												
6												
7												
8												
9												
10												
11												
12												
13												
14												
15												
16												
17												
18												

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 2:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If final computed percentage (in shaded box) is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
1.1.1	A. Total number of meetings (from column 1) that are on the same set date/day as stated in the question 1 above the table = ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (count only from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	
1.1.2	A. Total number of meetings in last 12 months = ____ (count only from column 9) B. A/12 = ____ / 12 X 100 = ____%.	
1.1.3	A. Total number of meetings with attendance record available (column 4) = ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (only count from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	
1.1.7	A. Total number of meetings in last 12 months = ____ (count only from column 9) B. Total number of women, minority members, and peasant members that attended all council meetings (sum column 6 + sum column 7 + sum column 8) = ____ + ____ + ____ = ____ C. Average number of reserved seat holders per meeting = B/A = ____ / ____ = ____ D. Total number of reserved seats in council (sum columns 3, 4, 5 from Worksheet 1) = ____ + ____ + ____ = ____ C. Divide D/C = ____ / ____ x 100 = ____%	
1.2.2	A. Total number of meetings with recorded meeting minutes (column 9) = ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (column 1) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	
1.2.3	A. Total number of meetings for which council minutes are approved/signed (column 10)= ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (only count from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	
1.2.4	A. Total number of meetings that passed at least one resolution (column 11)= ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (only count from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	*No partial scoring: If >75%, score = 1, otherwise score = 0.
4.1.1	A. Total number of meetings for which dates were published/posted in advance (column 2) = ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (only count from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	
4.1.2	A. Total number of meetings with prepared agendas (column 3)= ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (only count from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	
5.3.3	A. Total number of meetings that discussed the month's financial report (column 12)= ____ B. Total number of meetings in last 12 months (only count from column 9) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%	

Worksheet 3: Resolutions

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask Council Officer for:

- Resolution register
- Correspondence record
- Public notice/press release

SN	1. Resolution Title/Number	2. Date	3. Is the correspondence record available to show it was sent to the LGC (or relevant authority)? (Y/N)	4. Was it shared with the public, as evidenced by some document? (Y/N)	5. What was the method? (ie view press release, document with instructions to place on bulletin board)
1					
2					
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					

29					
30					
31					
32					
33					
34					
35					
36					
37					
38					
39					
40					

Comments:

**Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 3:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)**

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If final computed percentage (in shaded box) is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
1.2.5	A. Total number of resolutions passed in last year (sum column 1) = ____ B. Total number of resolutions sent to LGC or relevant authority (sum column 3) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ x 100 = ____%	
1.2.6	A. Total number of resolutions shared with public (column 4) = ____ B. Total number of resolutions passed in last year (sum column 1) = ____ C. A/B = ____ / ____ x 100 = ____%	

Worksheet 4: By-Laws

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask Council Officer for:

- By-laws register
- Resolutions register
- Monthly gazettes
- Correspondence records

1. Has the By-Law Been Passed? (Y/N)	2. Is a record available to show it was passed? (Y/N)	3. Specify the means of verification (ie. Resolution #)	4. Was it published in the gazette? (Y/N)	5. Verify with the gazette – enter the date of the gazette OR if gazette unavailable, enter the date of the correspondence record – write (CR) in brackets	6. Has the by-law been published in the local newspaper? (view ad) (Y/N)	By Laws from 5 th Schedule of 2001 LGO that pertain to Districts
						Local government (Elective officials remuneration and allowances)
						Local government (Agricultural development)
						Local government (Community development).
						Registration, management and regulation of orphanages, widow homes.
						Animal husbandry and milk supply.
						Dangerous and offensive trades and articles.
						Prevention of beggary, juvenile delinquency and other social evils.
						Prevention of air, water, noise, and soil pollution.
						Forests and plantations.
						Local government property.
						Farm produce markets.
						Delegation of powers, duties, and functions of the sub-committees of farm produce market committees if any.
						Pollution of air, water or soil.
						Other matters as in the opinion of the Zila council are necessary or expedient to be provided for in the by-laws.

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 4:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If final computed percentage (shaded box) is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
2.1.1	A. Total Number of By-laws Approved (sum column 2) = _____ B. Divide A by 14 (total in list) = ___ / 14 X 100 = _____%	
2.1.2	A. Total number of approved by laws that were published in the gazette (sum column 5) = _____ B. Total Number of By-laws Approved (sum column 2) = _____ C. Divide A by B = ___ / ___ X 100 = _____%	

Worksheet 5: Taxes

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask Council Officer for:

- Last year's District accounts
- Tax register
- Resolutions register
- Demand and collection register (bills/receipts register)

SN	Look through last year's accounts and list down the 5 major taxes collected by the District (largest rupee amounts) List them from highest to lowest.	1. Has the tax been formally approved by the council? (Y/N)	2. Enter the resolution # that approves the tax	3. Has the procedure for collection been formally approved by the council? (Y/N)	4. Enter the resolution # that approves the collection procedure	6. Is the demand and collection register available? (Y/N) – view copies of bills/receipts
1						
2						
3						
4						
5						

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 5:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If computed percentage is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
2.3.1	A. Number of Taxes/Fees approved through council resolutions (sum column 2) = _____ B. Divide A by 5 = ____ / 5 X 100 = ____%	
2.3.2	A. Number of taxes/fees whose collection procedure has been approved through council resolutions (sum column 3) = _____ B. Divide A by 5 = ____ / 5 X 100 = ____%	
2.3.3	A. Total number of taxes/fees for which collection register is available (sum column 6) = _____ B. Total number of approved taxes/fees approved (sum column 2) = _____ C. Divide A/B = ____ / ____ = ____%	

Worksheet 6: Nazim Presentations to Council

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you would need to ask the Council Officer whether the District Nazim has made annual addresses outlining his goals over the last 3 years. Obtain documentation that records the address.

SN	Date of Nazim's Annual Address (DD-MM-YY)	Is documentary evidence available? (Y/N)	Specify type of documentary evidence	Title of document
1				
2				
3				
4				

To fill out this worksheet, you would need to ask Council Officer whether the Nazim presented the draft budget to the council in April. Obtain minutes of April council meetings from the last three years.

SN	1. Date of Council Meeting (DD-MM-YY)	2. Do minutes show draft budget was presented by Nazim? (Y/N)	3. Was the draft budget shared with the public? (Y/N) (Ask council officer for advertisement or public notice)
April 2008			
April 2007			
April 2006			

To fill out this worksheet, obtain minutes of April/May/June/July council meetings from the last three years. Look for the one in which the final budget was approved and enter the date of that meeting below.

SN	4. Date of Council Meeting (DD-MM-YY)	5. Do minutes show the final budget was presented and approved? (Y/N)	6. Total number of council members that attended the meeting
2008			
2007			
2006			

To fill out this worksheet, you would need to speak with the Council Officer and check whether the nazim presented semi-annual performance reports to the council. Obtain reports and meeting minutes from last two years.

SN	7. Title of Performance Report	8. Date of publication (DD-MM-YY)	9. Date of council meeting in which report was discussed (only if recorded in council meeting minutes) (DD-MM-YY)
1			
2			
3			
4			
5			
6			

Worksheet 7: Consultations on Taxes

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, ask Council Officer whether consultations are held before major changes in taxes/fees. Obtain tax register and reports/press coverage on associated public consultations from the last two years.

SN	1. Specify the tax or fee that was changed	2. Was this published in the newspaper? (view ad) (Y/N)	3. Was a public consultation held regarding this change? (Y/N)	3. Is there a document showing a consultation was held? (Y/N)	4. Type of document (ie press release/title of report)
1					
2					
3					
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					
29					
30					

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 7:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If final computed percentage (shaded box) is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
3.1.3	A. Total number of taxes/fees that were changed in last 2 years (column 1)= ____ B. Total number of public consultations on changes in taxes/fees in last 2 years (column 3) = ____ C. $B/A = \underline{\quad} / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$	
4.2.5	A. Total number of changes in taxes/fees that were published in the local newspaper (column 2) = ____ B. Total number of changes in taxes/fees (column 1) = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____% C. $A/B = \underline{\quad} / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$ D. Total number of by-laws that were published in local newspaper (from Worksheet 4, column 6) = ____ E. Total number of approved by-laws (worksheet 4, column 1) = ____ F. $E/D = \underline{\quad} / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$ G. $(C + F)/2 = (\underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad}) / 2 = \underline{\quad}\%$	

Worksheet 8: Questions for Council Officer

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

1. Are the monthly and annual accounts placed at a conspicuous place for public inspection? (Y/N) = ___
Where (show copy of public notice/newspaper ad) _____

2. Has the council set a limit for budget modifications, requiring council approval? (Y/N)

View and specify the document which states this _____

What is the maximum amount that can be re-appropriated/modified? _____

Check the minutes of the council meeting in which the budget was approved for the last 3 years. Do the minutes mention the approval of the modified/revised budget? (Y/N) 2008 ___ 2007 ___ 2006 ___

3. Does the accounts committee present annual reports to the council? Fill in the table for the last three years annual reports:

SN	Date (DD-MM-YY)	Did the council receive the accounts committee annual report? Y/N (ask to see reports)	Enter date of meeting in which the report was discussed (verify through meeting minutes) (DD-MM-YY)
1			
2			
3			

4. Does the monitoring committee present quarterly reports to the council? Fill in the table for the last 12 months:

SN	Date (DD-MM-YY)	Did the council receive the monitoring committee report? Y/N (ask to see reports)	Enter date of meeting in which the report was discussed (verify through meeting minutes) (DD-MM-YY)
1			
2			
3			
4			

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 8:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
4.2.1	(Q1) <u>If documentation is available, score = 1, otherwise, compute score based on worksheet 10.</u>	
8.3.4	(Q3) <u>If council received reports in all three years, score = 1. If received report for 2 years, score = 0.5. If received report for 0-1 years, score = 0.</u>	
6.2.6	(Q4) <u>If council received four quarterly reports in last 12 months, score = 1. If 3 reports, score = 0.5, if 1-2 reports, score =0.</u>	
5.3.1	(Q2) <u>If document available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.</u>	
5.3.2	(Q2) <u>If council minutes show approval of modified budget in all three years, score = 1. If available for 2 years, score = 0.5, if available for 0-1 years, score =0.</u>	

Worksheet 9: Interviews with Council and Opposition Members

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

Part A - To fill out this worksheet, using the list of council members entered in worksheet 1, select every fourth person to call for a brief phone interview (ie SN 4, 8, 12...). Obtain their phone numbers from the Council Officer.

Total number of council members to be interviewed = ____

On the phone, explain that you need their help in conducting a governance survey which has been approved by the Nazim and Council Officer. Explain that you will ask them a total of ___ yes or no questions, and that it will take less than 5 minutes. Reschedule the interview if necessary.

SN	QUESTION	PERSON 1	PERSON 2	PERSON 3	PERSON 4	PERSON 5	PERSON 6	PERSON 7	PERSON 8	PERSON 9	PERSON 10
1	In the last year, did you receive a copy of the proposed draft budget to look over at least a day before it was presented in the draft budget meeting in April? (Y/N)										
2	After the draft budget meeting in April, there is another meeting to discuss any changes that were proposed. Did you receive a copy of that edited draft budget in order to make changes before it was finalized? Y/N										
3	In the last year, have you received a copy of the final annual budget from the council? (Y/N)										
4	In the last year, have you received copies of the bylaws approved by the council? (Y/N)										
5	In the last year, have you received copies of the audit reports from the council? (Y/N)										
6	Do you receive a copy of the meeting agenda prior to every council meeting? (Y/N)										
7	Are members of the general public able to attend council meetings without restriction? (Y/N)										
8	Are monthly and annual accounts statements posted or published for public inspection? (Y/N)										
9	Are the minutes of council meetings open to public inspection?										

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 9:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If final computed percentage (shaded box) is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
1.3.3	A. Total number of people interviewed = ____ B. Total number of yeses for question 3 (part A) = ____ C. $B/A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$ D. Total number of yeses for question 4 (part A) = ____ E. $D/A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$ F. Total number of yeses for question 5 (part A) = ____ G. $B/A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$ $(C + E + G) / 3 = (\text{____} + \text{____} + \text{____}) / 3 = \text{____}\%$	
2.2.1	A. Total number of yeses for question 1 (part A) = ____ B. $A/1.3.3A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$	
4.1.3	A. Total number of yeses for question 7 (part A) = ____ B. $A/1.3.3A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$	
4.2.4	A. Total number of yeses for question 9 (part A) = ____ B. $A/1.3.3A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$	
8.1.3	A. Total number of yeses for question 5 (part A) = ____ B. $A/1.3.3A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$ (compute score only if minutes don't show this, as indicated in worksheet 15)	
1.2.1	A. Total number of yeses for question 6 (part A) = ____ B. $A/1.3.3A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$	
2.2.4	A. Total number of yeses for question 2 = ____ B. $A/1.3.3A = \frac{\text{____}}{\text{____}} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$	

WORKSHEETS 10

TO BE FILLED WITH THE EDO REVENUE

Need:

- Inventory Records
- Lease register
- Registry of title deeds

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 10: Inventories

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

1. Ask EDO F&P whether the Nazim undertook an inventory of moveable and immovable property upon taking office and whether the Nazim does this on an annual basis.

	Did the Nazim conduct an inventory? (Y/N)	Is a record of this available? (Y/N)	Specify how this was recorded (ie Signature on inventory list with date, or internal memo)
Upon Taking Office			
Annual Inventory (2008)			
Annual Inventory (2007)			
Annual Inventory (2006)			

2. Do you have a record of the condition/use of the moveable assets? (view this record) Y/N ____
3. Do you have a record of actual users and income from all immovable assets? (view this record) Y/N ____
4. Are the inventories of assets presented to the council? (view correspondence record) Y/N ____
5. Do you have a registry of titles for all immovable assets? (view registry of title deeds) Y/N ____
6. Do you have a record of contracts and leases for immovable assets that have been rented out to third parties? (view record) Y/N ____
7. Are lease contracts given through a competitive bidding process? (view contract/lease register and verify record of bidding process) Y/N ____
8. Are leases re-bid after 5 years? (check lease register and see if expired leases are re-bid or if they are continued without a bidding process) Select one (✓) of the following three options:
 - All expiring leases were re-bid after 5 years ____
 - Some expiring leases were re-bid after 5 years, but some were continued without being rebid ____
 - No expiring lease was rebid on after 5 years ____

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 10:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
7.1.1	Refer to Q1 table. <u>If a record is available showing Nazim conducted an inventory upon taking office, score =1; Otherwise score= 0.</u>	
7.1.2	Refer to Q1 table. Total Number of inventories conducted in last three years (count only those which have an official record) = _____ <u>If 3 inventories, score =1, if 2 inventories, score = 0.5, if 0-1 inventory, score = 0.</u>	
7.1.3	<u>Q2: If record is available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
7.1.4	<u>Q3: If record is available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
7.2.1	<u>Q4: If record is available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
7.2.2	<u>Q5: If record is available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
7.2.3	<u>Q6: If record is available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
7.2.4	<u>Q7: If record is available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
7.2.5	<u>Q8: If option 1, score = 1, if option 2, score = 0.5, if option 3, score = 0.</u>	

WORKSHEETS 11-14

TO BE FILLED WITH THE EDO F&P/Accounts Committee Chairman

Need:

- Inventory Records
- Lease register
- Registry of title deeds
- Accounts Committee meeting minutes
- Notifications
- Internal audit reports
- External audit reports
- Correspondence records
- Budget Call Letters
- Press Releases/Public notices
- Consultation records
- Budgets & related documents

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 11: Audits

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need the help of the EDO F&P and Council Officer

- Council meeting minutes
- Accounts committee meeting minutes
- Appointment notices
- Audit reports
- Correspondence records

1. Has an internal auditor been appointed? Y/N (Obtain copy of notification) ___

2. Has the accounts committee been notified? Y/N (Obtain copy of notification) ___

3. List the dates of all internal audits conducted in the last 12 months.

SN	1-Date of audit (DD-MM-YY)	2-Were the findings presented to the council? Y/N (verify through council meeting minutes)	3-Enter date of council meeting in which audit was discussed. (DD-MM-YY)	4-Were the findings forwarded to the accounts committee? Y/N (verify in council meeting minutes or correspondence record)	5-Did the committee discuss the findings? Y/N (Verify through accounts committee meeting minutes)	6-Enter date of meeting in which audit was discussed. (DD-MM-YY)	7-Was the meeting open to the public? (view copy of public ad/ sign in sheet + specify MOV)
1							
2							
3							
4							
5							
6							

4. List the date of the external audit conducted in the last three years.

SN	1-Date (DD-MM-YY)	2-Was the external audit referred to the council? (verify through meeting minutes)	3-Were copies of the external audit distributed to council members? (verify through minutes)	4-Did the council refer the audit report to the accounts committee Y/N (verify in minutes or correspondence record)	5-Did the committee discuss the findings (Verify through meeting minutes) Y/N	6-Enter date of meeting in which audit was discussed. (DD-MM-YY)	7-Was the meeting open to the public? (view copy of public ad/ sign in sheet + specify MOV)
2008							
2007							
2006							

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 11:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If computed percentage is:

- >75% score = 1
- between 50% and 75% (inclusive) score = 0.5
- <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
8.2.1	If notification is available for question 1 above, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.	
8.3.1	If notification is available for question 2 above, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.	
8.3.2	A. Total number of accounts committee meetings in which internal audits were discussed (Q3, column 3) = ____ B. Total number of accounts committee meetings in which external audits were discussed (Q4, column 5) C. Total number of internal audits conducted (Q3 column 1)= ____ D. Total number of external audits conducted (Q4 column 1)= ____ E. $(A + B) / (C + D) \times 100 = (___ + ___) / (___ + ___) \times 100 = ___ \%$	
8.3.3	If the external audit has been discussed by the accounts committee for the 2008 end FY, then score = 1, otherwise score = 0.	
4.3.2	A. Total number of accounts committee meetings in which internal audit findings were discussed which were open to the public (Q3 column 7) = ____ B. Total number of accounts committee meetings in which external audit findings were discussed which were open to the public (Q4 column 7)= ____ C. Total number of meetings discussing internal audits (Q3 column 3)= ____ D. Total number of meetings discussing external audits (Q4 column 4)= ____ E. $(A + B) / (C + D) \times 100 = (___ + ___) / (___ + ___) \times 100 = ___ \%$	
8.2.2	A. Total number of internal audits that were presented to the council (Q3 column 2) = ____ C. A divided by 8.3.2C = $___ / ___ \times 100 = ___ \%$	
8.2.3	A. Total number of internal audits that were referred to accounts committee (Q3 column 4) = ____ B. Divide A by 8.3.2C = $___ / ___ \times 100 = ___ \%$	
8.1.1	Refer to Q4 column 1. Score = 1 if three external audit reports available, if 2 available, score = 0.5 if 0-1 available = 0.	
8.1.2	Refer to Q4 column 2. Score = 1 if council meeting minutes show that external audit report was received in all three years, if 2 available, score = 0.5; if 0-1 available score = 0.	
8.1.4	A. Total number of external audits that were referred to accounts committee (Q4 column 4) = ____ B. Divide this by 8.3.2D = $___ / ___ \times 100 = ___ \%$	

Worksheet 12: Accounts Committee

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

1. To fill out this worksheet, you need to ask the Chairman of the Accounts Committee for the dates of accounts committee meetings in the last 12 months and associated public notices/advertisements.

SN	1- Date of Meeting (DD-MM-YY)	2- Was the date/time/venue published in advance? (Y/N) (Obtain copies of press brief/public notice. If available, answer "Y", otherwise "N")	SN	1- Date of Meeting (DD-MM-YY)	2- Was the date/time/venue published in advance? (Y/N) (Obtain copies of press brief/public notice. If available, answer "Y", otherwise "N")
1			11		
2			12		
3			13		
4			14		
5			15		
6			16		
7			17		
8			18		
9			19		
10			20		

2. Are annual reports presented to the Local Government Commission? Is a correspondence report that shows the annual report was sent to LGC available for the last three years: (Y/N)

2008 ____

2007 ____

2006 ____

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 12:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
4.3.1	A. Total number of accounts committee meetings in last 12 months (Q1 column 1)= ____ B. Total number of meetings for which a public ad/notice is available, announcing the date/time of the meeting (Q1 column 2) = ____ C. $B/A = \text{____} / \text{____} \times 100 = \text{____}\%$ <u>If >75%, score = 1, if between 25 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50% score =0.</u>	
8.3.5	Refer to Q2. <u>If correspondence record is available for 3 years reports, score = 1, if available for 2 years, score = 0.5, if available for 0-1 years, score = 0.</u>	

Worksheet 13: Budget Call Letters

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, ask the Council Officer for a copy of the BCL from the last three years and materials associated with any pre-budget consultations.

	FY 2008	FY 2007	FY 2006
1. Was a budget call letter issued along with key dates in budget calendar? (view copy of BCL) (Y/N)			
2. Did Nazim/council hold a pre-budget consultation with stakeholders? (Y/N)			
3. Date of consultation (DD-MM-YY)			
4. Is there documentary evidence? (Y/N)			
5. Type of document (ie. Report, press release, public announcement)			
6. What were the citizen priorities identified (list top three)?			
7. Were the citizen priorities from the public consultations mentioned/prioritized in the BCL? (Y/N)			
8. Does the BCL indicate sector or site specific priorities for the ADP? (Y/N)			

Worksheet 14: Budget Presentation

(To be filled by Data Collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you need a copy of the budget from the last three years.

	<u>2008</u>	<u>2007</u>	<u>2006</u>
1. Does the budget presentation include the annual budget statement? (view ABS) Y/N			
2. Does it include the Budget Salient Features? (view BSF) Y/N			
3. Is the BSF-II included with specific performance targets? (view BSF-II) Y/N			
4. Is the BSF-III included with status of service delivery facilities? (view BSF-III) Y/N			
5. Is the ADP included? (view ADP) Y/N			
6. Does the ADP have multiple line items? (Not just a single line item budget) Y/N			
7. Does the ADP list any non specific, lump sum items? (answer 'none', 'some', or 'all')			
8. Does the ADP identify specific projects with objective/ amount/ location? (answer 'none', 'some', or 'all')			
9. Is there a budgetary allocation for the functioning of the council? (Y/N)			
10. Is there a budgetary allocation for the functioning of the monitoring committee? (Y/N)			

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 13:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks: If final computed percentage (shaded box) is:

- If >75% score = 1
- If between 25 and 75% score = 0.5
- If <50% score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
3.1.1	A. Total number of BCLs issued (sum row 1) = ____ B. Total number of pre-budget consultations held (sum row 2) = ____ C. B/A = ____ / ____ X 100 = %	
3.1.2	A. Total number of BCLs that state citizen priorities from consultations (sum row 7) = ____ B. A divided by 3.1.1A = ____ / ____ X 100 = %	
5.1.1	Refer to Row 1. If 3 yeses, score = 1, if 2 yeses, score = 0.5, otherwise, score = 0.	
5.1.2	A. Total number of BCLs with site/sector specific priorities (sum row 8) = ____ B. A divided by 3.1.1A = ____ / ____ X 100 = %	

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 14:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Unless otherwise indicated, scoring for all indicators will be based on the following benchmarks:

- If all three Yes score = 1
- If 2 Yes score = 0.5
- If 0-1 Yes score = 0

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
6.1.1	Refer to Question 2	
6.1.2	Refer to Question 3	
6.1.3	Refer to Question 4	
5.1.6	Refer to Question 1	
5.2.1	Refer to Question 6	
5.2.2	Refer to Question 7. Score each 'none' = 1, score each 'some' = 0.5, score each 'all' = 0. Average of row 7 = (____ + ____ + ____) / 3 X 100 = % If >75%, score = 1, if between 25 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.	
5.2.3	Refer to Question 7. Score each 'none' = 0, score each 'some' = 0.5, score each 'all' = 1. Average of row 7 = (____ + ____ + ____) / 3 X 100 = % If >75%, score = 1, if between 25 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.	
1.3.4	Refer to Question 9	
6.2.5	Refer to Question 10	

WORKSHEETS 15-16

TO BE FILLED WITH THE DCO

Need:

- Press releases/public notices
- Notifications
- Performance reports
- Project handing over reports
- Meeting minutes of joint committee meetings

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 15: Questions for the DCO

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

1. Does the local government have open office hours for citizens clearly known to the public? (view copies of public ad) Y/N ____

Enter schedule / timings: _____

2. Has a complaints cell been established? (Y/N) ____ (View copy of notification)

Is this a centralized complaint cell? (ie one place for citizens to come for all types of complaints?) Y/N ____

Has a physical space been designated for the complaints cell? (Y/N) ____

Has staff been appointed/ administrative responsibilities assigned? Obtain copies of staff appointments.

Number of staff appointments = ____

3. Does the DCO report to the council on the status of performance targets presented in the annual budget? (Y/N) = ____ # of times per year this is done = ____

(view copies of reports/presentations/correspondence record and specify here

4. Does the local government administration present reports to the council on completed projects?

SN	1-List all completed projects in last 12 months	2-Were project handing over reports prepared? (Y/N)	3-Were these reports shared with the council? (View correspondence record/ presentations) (Y/N)	4-Verify with council meeting minutes. Enter date of council meeting in which presentation made.
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				

5. Does the local government meet with other tiers in the Mushawirat Committee to coordinate budget priorities? (view minutes of joint meetings to see if budget/budget priorities were discussed)

Enter date(s) of joint meeting in which budget was discussed _____

Comments:

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 15:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
3.2.4	A. Total number of days that DCO holds office hours, as evidenced by public notice (question 1) = ____ If A = 3, score = 1, if A = 1-2, score = 0.5, if A = 0, score = 0.	
3.2.1	<u>If notification available for establishing complaint cell (Q2), score = 1, otherwise, score = 0</u>	
6.2.1	<u>if documentary evidence available (Q3), score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.</u>	
5.3.4	A. Total number of completed projects in last 12 months (Q4 column 1) = ____ B. Total number of projects for which project handing over report was shared with council (either verified through Q4 column 3 or 4) = ____ C. B/A = ____ / ____ X 100 = ____%. If >75%, score = 1, if between 25 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.	
5.1.5	<u>If joint meetings took place, evidenced by meeting minutes (Q5) in which budget priorities were discussed, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.</u>	

Worksheet 16: Development Committee

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask the DCO (Chairman of the Development Committee) for meeting minutes concerning draft budget and ADP.

1. Is the draft budget reviewed and discussed in the DDC? (check meeting minutes from April to May from the last 3 years and find the one in which the draft budget is discussed)

SN	Date of Council Meeting (DD-MM-YY)	Do minutes show the draft budget was discussed (Y/N)
2008		
2007		
2006		

2. Are the development projects/outlines reviewed by the DDC? (get copy of the ADP from the last 3 years and check meeting minutes to see if development projects are reviewed)

SN	Date of Council Meeting (DD-MM-YY)	Do minutes show the ADP was discussed (Y/N)
2008		
2007		
2006		

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 16:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
5.1.3	Total number of DDC meetings in the last 3 years in which the draft budget is discussed (Q1) = ____ <u>If 3 meetings, score = 1, if 2 meetings, score = 0.5, if 0-1 meetings, score =0.</u>	
5.1.4	Total number of meetings in the last 3 years in which ADP is discussed (Q2) = ____ <u>If 3 meetings, score = 1, if 2 meetings, score = 0.5, if 0-1 meetings, score =0.</u>	

WORKSHEET 17

TO BE FILLED BY PHYSICAL VERIFICATION

Need to visit the following:

- Council meeting room
- District Bulletin Board
- Complaints Cell
- Accounts Committee meeting room
- EDO F&P, EDO Health, EDO Education

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 17: For Physical Verification

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

Go to the following places and physically check:

1) Council Meeting Room

Are there designated seats for the public? (Y/N) ____

2) District Government Bulletin Board

Is the staffing information displayed? (Y/N) ____

Is there information about the performance of the local government (Y/N) ____

What other documents are displayed? (ie. Public notices, accounts statements, dates of meetings/events, meeting minutes) _____

3) Complaints Cell

There is a designated area for the complaints cell = Y/N ____

There is staff in the office = Y/N ____

There is equipment in the office = Y/N ____

There is a complaints register available (showing complaints received from citizens) = Y/N ____

There is a system of tracking complaints processing/progress= Y/N ____

4) Accounts Committee Meeting Room

Are there designated seats for the public? (Y/N) ____

5) Visit the following people and ask to see copies of council resolutions. Refer to Worksheet 3- tell them the total number of council resolutions passed in last 12 months, and ask them how many do they have copies of.

	EDO F&P	EDO Edu	EDO Health
List down the number of council resolutions the office/official can show copies of.			

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 17:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
3.2.2	Look at #3 above. <u>If physical area, staff, equipment, and means of tracking progress on complaints are available, score = 1, otherwise 0.</u>	
3.2.3	Look at #3 above. <u>If there is a complaints register available, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.</u>	
4.2.3	Look at #2 above. <u>If there is a complete list of staff appointments displayed on the bulletin board, as well as facts/information about the local government, score = 1; otherwise, score = 0.</u>	
4.1.4	Look at #1 above. <u>If yes, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.</u>	
4.3.3	Look at #4 above. <u>If yes, score = 1, otherwise, score = 0.</u>	
6.2.2	Look at #5 above. <u>If all departments have all information from council, score = 1. If some information missing, score = 0.5. If any department doesn't have any resolutions from council, score =0.</u>	

WORKSHEET 18

TO BE FILLED WITH

The Chairmen of the Health and Education Monitoring Committees

Need:

- Notifications
- Committee meeting minutes

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 18: Monitoring Committee

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you will need to ask the Chairmen of the Monitoring Committees for Health and Education for the notification and meeting minutes from the last 12 months.

Table 1.

Has the monitoring committee been formally notified?	View copy of notification (Y/N)
Health	
Education	

Table 2.

List the dates of all monitoring committee meetings in the last 12 months, as evidenced by meeting minutes

HEALTH

SN	Date (DD-MM-YY)
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	

EDUCATION

SN	Date (DD-MM-YY)
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 18:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
6.2.3	Refer to Table 1. <u>If notification is available for BOTH education and health monitoring committees, score = 1, otherwise score =0</u>	
6.2.4	A. Total number of health monitoring committee meetings in last 12 months = ____ B. Divide A by 12 = ____/12 X 100 = ____% C. Total number of education monitoring committee meetings in last 12 months = ____ D. Divide C by 12 = ____/12 X 100 = ____% E. Average B and D = (____ + ____) / 2 = ____% (If shaded box >75%, score =1, if between 25 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score =0)	

WORKSHEET 19

TO BE FILLED WITH EDO Health

Need:

- Data collection reports on disease incidence
- ADP

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 19: Health Services

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you need to ask the EDO Health whether the District Government collects information on the following health indicators, and fill in the chart below.

Table A.

1- Health Indicator	2 - Enter the statistics here (%)	3- When was this information last collected? (DD-MM-YY)	4- How often is this information collected/compiled? Enter # of times this information was collected in the last 12 months (view reports)	5- Data collection method (i.e. surveys/hospital records)
A -Percent of children who are fully immunized in the district				
B -Percent of births by skilled attendant				
C -Under five mortality rate				
D -Incidence rate of diarrhea in children under five				
E -Incidence rate of pneumonia in children				

Obtain a copy of the last year's ADP and fill out the table below.

Table B.

	Enter Rupee amount here
A. Total Amount of ADP	
B. Investment in maintenance of primary health facilities	
C. Investment in improvement of primary health facilities (if different from B)	
D. Investment in Expansion of primary health facilities	
E. Investment in maintenance of secondary health facilities	
F. Investment in improvement of secondary health facilities	
G. Investment in Expansion of secondary health facilities	

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 19:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
6.3.2	Refer to Table A. If statistics are available for all indicators (A-E) collected within the last year, score = 1. If statistics are available for more than half the indicators (A-E) collected within the last year, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.6	Refer to Table A. If cell B2>33% (national average), score = 1, if > 50% (75% of national average), score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.7	Refer to Table A. If cell A2 > 76% (national average from Government of Pakistan’s Economic Survey 2007-2008), score =1. If > 57% (75% of national average), score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.8	Refer to Table A. If cell C2 < 99/1000 (national average from GOP Economic Survey), score = 1. If < 124/1000, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.9	Refer to Table A. If cell D2 <15% (national average) score = 1, if <18% (50% more than national average), score =0.5. Otherwise, score =0.	
6.4.10	Refer to Table A. If cell E2 < 15%, score = 1, if < 20%, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score =0.	
6.5.3	Refer to Table B. Compute the investment in the maintenance/improvement/expansion of primary health facilities as a percent of last year’s ADP: $(B + C + D) / A \times 100 = (\underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad}) / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$ If > 10%, score = 1. If >5%, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.5.4	Refer to Table B. Compute the investment in the maintenance/improvement/expansion of secondary health facilities as a percent of last year’s ADP: $(E + F + G) / A \times 100 = (\underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad}) / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$ If > 10%, score = 1. If >5%, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	

WORKSHEET 20

TO BE FILLED WITH EDO Education

Need:

- Data collection reports on education indicators
- ADP

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 20: Education Services

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you need to ask the EDO Education whether the District Government collects information on the following education indicators, and fill in the chart below.

Table A.

1- Education Indicator	2 – Enter the statistics here (%)	3- When was this information last collected? (DD-MM-YY)	4- How often is this information collected? Enter # of times collected in the last 12 months (view reports)	5- Data collection method (i.e. surveys/ agency or school records)
A – Percent of primary schools that are functional				
B – Percent of primary schools with a toilet				
C – Percent of primary schools with a boundary wall				
D – Percent of primary schools with clean drinking water				
E – Percent of primary schools with electricity				
F - Average dropout rate of elementary schools in the district				
G – Average dropout rate of secondary schools in the district				

Obtain a copy of the last year's ADP and fill out the table below.

Table B.

	Enter Rupee amount here
A. Total Amount of ADP	
B. Investment in maintenance of primary education facilities	
C. Investment in improvement of primary education facilities (if different from B)	
D. Investment in Expansion of primary education facilities	
E. Investment in maintenance of secondary education facilities	
F. Investment in improvement of secondary education facilities	
G. Investment in Expansion of secondary education facilities	

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 20:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
6.3.1	Refer to Table A. If statistics are available for all indicators (A-G) collected within the last year, score = 1. If statistics are available for some indicators (A-G) collected within the last year, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.1	Refer to Table A. If cell A2 > 95% (national average), score =1. If > 71% (75% of the national average), score =0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.2	Refer to Table A. If cell B2 > 60% (national average), score = 1. If >45% (75% of the national average), score = 0.5. Otherwise, score =0.	
6.4.3	Refer to Table A. To score 1, all four school facilities indicators (B, C, D, E) must be greater than or equal to the national average (as indicated by the Government of Pakistan’s Economic Survey 2007-2008). If cell B2 > 60% AND cell C2 > 62% AND cell D2 > 68% AND cell E2 > 44% , score = 1. If some of the facilities are above the national average, score = 0.5. If none of the facilities statistics meet the national average, score = 0.	
6.5.1	Refer to Table B. Compute the investment in the maintenance/improvement/expansion of primary education facilities as a percent of last year’s ADP: $(B + C + D) / A \times 100 = (\underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad}) / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$ If >10%, score = 1, if > 5%, score =0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.5.2	Refer to Table B. Compute the investment in the maintenance/improvement/expansion of secondary education facilities as a percent of last year’s ADP: $(E + F + G) / A \times 100 = (\underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad} + \underline{\quad}) / \underline{\quad} \times 100 = \underline{\quad}\%$ If > 10%, score = 1, if > 5%, score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.4	Refer to Table A. If cell F2 < 31.3% (national average – Ministry of Education), score = 1, if <37.5% (50% more than national average), score = 0.5. Otherwise, score = 0.	
6.4.5	Refer to Table A. If cell G2 < 47.3% (national average – Ministry of Education), score = 1, if <60% (50% more than national average), score = 0.5. Otherwise, score =0.	

WORKSHEETS 21-22

**TO BE FILLED WITH THE
DPO**

Need:

- Notifications
- Meeting Minutes
- District Policing Plan
- District Budget
- Police Records

Estimated Time Required: _____

Actual Start Time: _____

Actual End Time: _____

Worksheet 21: Police Services - 1

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you need to ask the DPO for a list of DPS members, meeting minutes from past 12 months, and a copy of the district policing plan.

1. Was a District Public Safety Commission officially notified? Y/N (view notification) _____
2. Does the DPS have the proper composition? Fill out the table of DPS members below.

SN	1. List the names of all DPS members.	2. MNA/MPA? (✓)	3. Independent member? (✓) (selection panel)	4. Elected by Zila Council? (✓)
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				

3. Does the DPS meet regularly? Fill out the table below.

SN	Date (DD-MM-YY)	Are Meeting Minutes/ other Record available?
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		

4. Does the District Public Safety Commission have its own budget heading in the budget? Y/N (view copy of last year's budget) _____
5. Did the District Public Safety Commission create a district policing plan? Y/N (view copy of plan) _____
6. Did the district policing plan include performance targets? Y/N (view copy of plan) _____
7. Did the District Public Safety commission prepare an annual report for the last year? Y/N (view report) _____

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 21:

(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
6.2.7	Refer to question 1. <u>If notification is available, score =1, otherwise score =0.</u>	
6.2.8	Refer to the table in question 2. A. Enter Total number of members of the DPS (sum column 1) ____ B. Number of members who are MPAs/MNAs (sum column 2) ____ C. Number of “independent members” appointed by Government based on Selection Panel (sum column 3) ____ D. Number of members elected by Zila Council from amongst its members (sum column 4) ____ Divide B/A X 100 = ____/____ X100 = ____% Divide C/A X 100 = ____/____ X100 = ____% Divide D/A X 100 = ____/____ X100 = ____% <u>If all three raw scores are between 30 and 35%, score = 1, otherwise score =0.</u>	
6.2.9	Refer to the table in question 3. A. Total number of meetings for which minutes/written record is available = ____ B. Divide A/12 = ____/____ X100 = ____% <u>If >75%, score = 1. If between 50 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.</u>	
6.2.10	Refer to question 5. If yes, score = 1, otherwise score = 0.	
6.2.11	Refer to question 6. If yes, score = 1, otherwise score = 0.	
6.2.12	Refer to question 7. If yes, score = 1, otherwise score = 0.	

Worksheet 22: Police Services - 2

(To be filled out by data collector) Start Time ___:___ End Time ___:___

To fill out this worksheet, you need to ask the DPO for meeting minutes from past 12 months and access to police records/statistics.

- Has a District Criminal Justice Coordination Committee been notified? Y/N (view copy of notification) _____
- Does the DCJCC meet regularly? Fill out the table below. List all DCJCC meetings

SN	Date (DD-MM-YY)	Are Meeting Minutes/ other Record available?
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		

- Total number of sanctioned police posts in the district _____
- Total number of sanctioned police posts that are filled _____
- Total number of sanctioned police posts that are filled by women _____
- Does the police maintain an inventory of unclaimed property? Y/N (view inventory) _____
- Does the district police keep relevant statistics? Fill in the following table:

Type of statistic	1 - Does the district police keep these statistics? Y/N (view record)	2 - Total number of filed cases in past 12 months	3- Number of cases resolved in past 12 months
A- Homicides			
B- Burglaries			
C- Robberies			
D- Assaults			
E- Rapes			
F- Obstruction			
G- Traffic violations			
H- Complaints against the police			

Scoring Instructions from Worksheet 22:
(To be filled out by data entry operator)

Indicator #	Data Computation	Enter Score
3.2.5	Look at the table in Question 7. <u>If Cell H1 = Yes, then score =1, otherwise score =0.</u>	
6.2.13	Refer to Question 1. <u>If Yes, then score =1, otherwise score =0.</u>	
6.2.14	Refer to the table in Question 2. A. Total number of meetings, as evidenced by meeting minutes in the past 12 months (sum column 2) = ____ B. Divide A/12 = ____/____ X 100 = ____ <u>If >75%, score = 1. If between 50 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.</u>	
6.3.3	Refer to Question 7. <u>If statistics are available for all crimes A-G, score = 1. If statistics are kept for only some, score = 0.5, otherwise score = 0.</u>	
6.4.11	Refer to Question 7. A. Total number of cases in past 12 months (Sum column 2) = ____ B. Total number of resolved cases in past 12 months (sum column 3) = ____ C. Divide B/A = ____/____ X 100 = ____% <u>If >75%, score = 1. If between 50 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.</u>	
6.4.12	Refer to questions 3-4. Divide question 4/ question 3 = ____/____ X 100 = ____ <u>If >75%, score = 1. If between 50 and 75%, score = 0.5, if <50%, score = 0.</u>	
7.1.5	Refer to Question 6. <u>If the inventory record is available, score = 1, otherwise score = 0.</u>	