

CENTRAL ASIA CUSTOMS INTEGRITY PROGRAM

INTEGRITY WORKSHOP IN COLLABORATION WITH WCO

WORKSHOP REPORT

ASTANA, KAZAKHSTAN

JUNE 6-8, 2007

Contract Number: PCE-I-00-98-00013-00

Request for Task Order Number: 17

Submitted by:

Booz Allen Hamilton

Paul Fekete, Chief of Party for the Trade Facilitation and Capacity Building Project, "FASTrade."

Date: June 25, 2007



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

Booz | Allen | Hamilton

DISCLAIMER

The author's views expressed in this publication does not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

I. Background

In June 2006, USAID-sponsored customs assessments were conducted in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan under the FASTrade project. Subsequently, the results of the assessments were presented in a regional workshop held in Almaty in December of 2006. All of these events highlighted the increasing awareness by regional customs authorities of the need to focus on corruption issues. More recently, in January 2007 a regional integrity workshop was conducted for regional governments which resulted in the Almaty Resolution. The resolution reaffirmed the desire, by customs authorities in the region, to focus on improving the integrity of their customs administration operations.

In parallel with these developments, the WCO has also been active in the region. Specifically, it has conducted a comprehensive customs assessment in Kazakhstan under the auspices of its Columbus Programme. The Columbus Programme is the WCO's Capacity Building initiative which is intended to eventually cover 106 countries around the world. One of the prioritized areas for the WCO is Central Asia and all the countries in the region are partners in the Programme. The Columbus Programme consists of three phases, (1) needs assessment (according to the WCO Diagnostic Framework), (2) implementation and (3) monitoring/evaluation. Once the assessment in Kazakhstan is completed, the WCO intends to carry out similar assessments in both Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan.

In light of the focus by both USAID and the WCO on customs administration issues in the region, consultations between the two organizations led to an agreement to collaborate in the region. After detailed discussions, it was agreed that the area most conducive to such collaboration would be in the area of integrity issues — primarily because of USAID's past activities in that subject area. Furthermore, with WCO's resources likely to be constrained in terms of follow-on technical assistance implementation, USAID and the WCO determined that cooperation on integrity related issues would be mutually beneficial. Finally, collaboration between the WCO and USAID was viewed as timely support for the region because it would also serve to lay the groundwork for a forthcoming USAID Regional Trade Liberalization and Customs Project that will be coming online, probably in the summer or fall of 2007.

As a result, WCO and USAID's FASTrade project decided to undertake a two or three day workshop focused on engaging senior officials from these three countries on the integration of integrity efforts into their ongoing customs operations. The workshop's target group was identified to include senior officers from a variety of customs departments.

Scheduling of the workshop was coordinated with the WCO which felt that it would be most appropriately timed if it were to be held after the WCO team's conclusion of its Action Plan discussions with Kazakh officials taking place as part of the Columbus Programme assessment process. After some minor delays, the workshop was set for June 6-8, 2007 to be conducted in Astana for customs officials from Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, and Kyrgyzstan.

II. Objectives

Under the direction of FASTrade's Chief of Party, Paul Fekete, two independent consultants, Tim Kelly and Billy Salter were identified to work with WCO officials to develop and implement a workshop program in Astana, Kazakhstan for senior customs managers from regional governments, focusing on integrity reform issues. The program was designed on the best integrity practices employed by both USAID and the WCO vis-à-vis customs organizations, and was intended to focus on assisting senior customs officials recognize and then manage the necessary changes within their organizations that would foster an environment of integrity. The program was designed to provide an overview on the needs for thorough planning, consistent messages, and visible commitment from Customs management and higher level Government managers to integrity issues.

Over a relatively short period of time—just several weeks—the specific contents of the program were developed cooperatively with WCO officials. The specific contents of the workshop were based on a variety of WCO integrity training tools as well as those that have been designed by USAID under the FASTrade project, in particular USAID's Customs Modernization Handbook: *Establishing And Implementing A Customs Integrity Program*. The following areas constituted the core elements of the training program, focusing on how senior managers can strengthen these operational areas within their organizations and how such activities can strengthen the overall customs operations process in revenue collection, employee integrity and consistent application of standards of conduct.

1. ANTI-CORRUPTION PROGRAMS

- a. Anti corruption programs, by their very nature must be consistent, fairly administered and applicable to all employees. The employee's knowledge of what is acceptable behavior and what is not, coupled with his knowledge of what sanctions will be levied for prohibited actions all play key parts in this process. The workshop will discuss the essential components of establishing such a program.

2. ETHICS TRAINING

- a. The institution of a viable ethics training program, acknowledged from the most senior to most junior officer is a key and vital concept in promoting a workforce that values and functions in an integrity rich environment.

3. RECRUITING & SCREENING

- a. Agencies that start out with honest and competent employees are far ahead of those that must adjust for a faulty hiring process later in the officer's career. When developing human resources, customs agencies benefit when they install comprehensive hiring processes that include integrity elements from the outset..

4. RULES OF CONDUCT

- a. Rules of Conduct need to concentrate on employee conduct, not on employee performance. It is important to distinguish between these two. Conduct problems involve the breaking of a rule, regulation, requirement or a direct order. Disciplinary actions are used to correct these problems. Performance problems, on the other hand, involve situations in which an employee is performing a job

poorly. A performance management system should be used to deal with these problems not a disciplinary and conduct system. Both have their place in the management of a customs authority but one should not be confused with the other.

5. DEVELOPMENT OF AN OFFICE OF INTERNAL AFFAIRS

- a.** Once an organization has committed to the installation of an integrity and ethics based system of operations, it must also have a viable, neutral and competent fact finding mechanism to gather facts and present them to management for decisions on action. Relying on managers who must again work with employees who have been the target of allegations is unfair to both the employee and the manager. A separate and distinct unit, established solely for the purpose of adjudicating issues, unhindered by alliances or personal perceptions is essential for both honest assembly of the facts and fair treatment of both the agency and the employee.

In addition to the joint effort in designing the substance of the workshop, translation of most workshop documents into Russian was undertaken as part of the effort. Of most lasting impact is likely to be the translation of USAID's *Establishing And Implementing A Customs Integrity Program* which was distributed to all participants. Other workshop presentations and case studies were also translated and included in a workshop binder given to each participant but some integrity-related material from the UN and other international organizations were too voluminous to translate, given resource constraints. Based on the language constraints faced during the workshop—which was addressed through the use of a team of simultaneous interpreters—future efforts in the region should be cognizant of the need to have as much material as possible translated into Russian. This deficiency was notable, for example with much of the WCO's material, such as the on-line integrity training package, which has not yet been made available in Russian.

III. The Workshop

The workshop was held at the Astana Intercontinental Hotel. Participants included a wide variety of customs officials from Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan (see the attached list of participants). The program was presented by Booz Allen's team, consisting of Tim Kelly, Billy Salter, and Paul Fekete. The workshop (see attached schedule) was divided into numerous modules focusing on various components of a comprehensive integrity program. Presentations were followed by discussions among the workshop's participants. Separate breakout sessions (divided by nationality) were also employed to encourage frank exchanges within country delegations regarding the types of issues that would need to be addressed when implementing an integrity program. Three case studies were also utilized to demonstrate the experiences encountered by other national customs entities as they undertook integrity-related reforms. In the final study, each delegation was asked to design a comprehensive response to the integrity issues facing Tanzania, as presented in the case. Presentations by each group, reflecting the material that had been reviewed over the previous modules, suggested that participants had developed a solid understanding of the varied elements necessary to implement an integrity program.

Marc Declunder from the WCO arrived in Astana on Thursday evening in order to present the WCO material related to training trainers on the last day of the workshop. Using WCO material, he provided participants with detailed information about the WCO and the assistance it could provide on a variety of training needs, focusing in particular on the e-Learning program that has been developed by the WCO. He also conducted several sessions focusing on how the lessons garnered from the workshop could be translated into training sessions for other staff back in their respective customs agencies.

Notwithstanding the overall success of the workshop, the second day of the program saw the absence of many in the Kazakhstan delegation. Organizers learned that a new Director General of Kazakhstan's customs authority had been appointed the previous day, and senior managers had been tasked with a number of matters, precluding their attendance at some of the workshop. Most of them were able to return later, and expressed both their disappointment and apologies for having had to miss some of the program.

At the conclusion of the workshop, Michael Boyd from USAID's regional mission in Almaty offered some closing remarks to the participants and indicated that USAID's commitment to supporting ongoing customs reform in the region would continue under a new regional trade project that will commence in the coming months. Participants were awarded certificates of participation (see attachment).

IV. Acknowledgements

FASTrade would like to express its appreciation to the many individuals who have provided support and assistance to this effort in Astana. These individuals include Lars Kalsson from the WCO and Jan Forest from USAID who were instrumental in first developing the collaborative approach between the WCO and USAID.

Other WCO officials who helped develop this integrity initiative include Samy Gardemeister, Marc Declunder, Thibault Hermes, Yoshiro Baba, and Vitali Mikeladze.

We are grateful to the Kazakhstan Customs Committee which served as the local hosts and co-sponsors of this event. In particular, Aitkul Tulebaeva in Astana, and Mukhtar Baibulov, Custom's Attaché in Brussels from the Customs Committee of Kazakhstan served as liaison's as the planning for the workshop proceeded.

From USAID, the workshop could not have been implemented without the ongoing support of Patterson Brown, FASTrade's CTO, Carrie Abendroth from the E& E Bureau, and in particular, Michael Boyd and Lora Kudaibergenova from USAID's regional mission in Almaty. Robert Simpson from USAID's office in Astana provided opening remarks for the workshop.

Booz Allen's implementation team included Paul Fekete, Tim Kelly, and Billy Salter. Dina Ospanova and Saltanat Amanova provided extensive logistical support from Booz Allen's Astana office. Booz Allen's home office support was provided by Regina Hehir, Nimmi Kavasery, and Claire Avett. .

United States Agency for International Development
World Customs Organization

Workshop on:
Integrity as a Central Element of Customs Administration
Astana, Kazakhstan
June 06 – 08, 2007

MODULE	TIME	INSTRUCTOR
WEDNESDAY, JUNE 06, 2007		
Registration	0800-0900	STAFF
Welcoming Ceremony	0900-0915	Mr. Robert Simpson- USAID/CAR WCO Representative BAH Representative Kazakhstan Customs Representative
Integrity In Customs Part I WCO Presentation	0915-0950	Mr. Kelly – BAH
Integrity In Customs Part II WCO Presentation	1000-1050	Mr. Kelly – BAH
Human Resource Management Pt I Pillar of Integrity - WCO - Presentation	1100-1150	Mr. Salter – BAH
Lunch	1200-1400	Lunch
Class Photograph	1400-1415	Staff
Human Resource Management Pt II Pillar of Integrity – WCO - Presentation	1415-1500	Mr. Salter – BAH
International Conventions on Corruption (United Nations, Arusha Declaration, Transparency International, Interpol standards etc.)	1500-1540	Mr. Kelly – BAH
Scheduled Afternoon Coffee Break	1540-1600	Staff

Group Discussion of Integrity Challenges in the Participating Delegations (Small Group Country Breakout Sessions)	1600-1700	Mr. Kelly and Mr. Salter – BAH
THURSDAY, JUNE 07, 2007		
The Integrity Development Guide – The WCO Integrity Tools Part I	0900-0950	Mr. Salter – BAH
The Integrity Development Guide – The WCO Integrity Tools Part II (small group breakout sessions)	1000-1050	Mr. Salter – BAH
Establishing and Implementing a Customs Integrity Program - The USAID Approach	1100-1150	Mr. Kelly – BAH
Lunch	1200-1400	Staff
Establishing and Implementing a Customs Integrity Program - The USAID Approach (small group break out sessions)	1400-1450	Mr. Kelly – BAH
Case Study – Honduras Customs Service Instructor Delivery and Small Group Study	1500-1550	Mr. Kelly – BAH
Scheduled Afternoon Coffee Break	1550-1610	Staff
Case Study – Honduras Small Group Presentations	1610-1650	Mr. Kelly – BAH Mr. Salter – BAH Mr. Fekete – BAH
Daily Summary	1650-1700	All Instructors
FRIDAY, JUNE 08, 2007		
Case Study) Exercise - Tanzania Instructor Delivery & Small Group Study	0900-0950	Mr. Kelly – BAH Mr. Salter – BAH Mr. Fekete – BAH
Case Study, Exercise- -Tanzania Small group Study Small group Presentations	1000-1050	Mr. Kelly – BAH Mr. Salter – BAH Mr. Fekete – BAH
Round Table Discussion of Integrity Programs Implementation in Participating Countries (Country Small Group Discussions)	1100-1130	Mr. Kelly, Mr. Salter Mr. Fekete – BAH
Lunch	1130-1330	Staff
WCO Training Techniques & Resources	1330-1420	Mr. Declunder – WCO
WCO Training Techniques & Resources	1430-1520	Mr. Declunder – WCO

WCO Training Techniques & Resources	1530-1615	Mr. Declunder – WCO
Course Summary	1615 -1630	All Instructors
Closing Remarks and Certificate Presentation Ceremony	1630-1700	Mr. Michael Boyd – USAID/CAR WCO Representative Kazakhstan Customs Representative Mr. Fekete – BAH Mr. Salter – BAH Mr. Kelly – BAH

	Attendee	Title	Organization/ Agency	Phone Number	Address	E-mail Address
1	Assel Mavletova	Senior Specialist - International Relations Division	Customs Control Committee - KZ	+7 3172 97 45 49	Astana, Beibitshilik street 10	amavletova@q0100.customs.kz
2	Svetlana Abdykerova	Chief of Department of Tariff/Rate Regulation	Customs Control Committee - KZ	+7 3172 97 45 66	Astana, Beibitshilik street 10	sabdykerova@q0100.customs.kz
3	*Marat Tulebaev (speaker)	Deputy Head of Internal Security Dep't	Customs Control Committee – KZ	+7 3172 97 45 63	Abai St. 10	
4	Aidyn Imashev	Specialist	Customs Control Committee – KZ	+7 701 999 3975	Astana, Beibitshilik street 10	aimashev@q0100.customs.kz
5	Aiman Toktarabay	Officer	Customs Control Committee – KZ	+7 701 748 2042	Astana, Beibitshilik street 10	atoktarbay@q0100.customs.kz
6	Daniyar Ospanov	Chief Specialist	Customs Control Committee – KZ	+7 3172 97 45 76	Astana, Beibitshilik street 10	Danunya77@mail.ru
7	Rinat Aitaev	Head of Analysis and Statistics Dep't	Customs Control Committee – KZ		Abai St. 10	raithev@q0100.customs.kz
8	Tolkyn Baimukhanova	Head of Post-Clearance Control Dep't.	Customs Control Committee – KZ	+7 701 514 18 19	Astana, Pushkin Street, 137	tbaimukhanova@q0100.customs.kz
9	Yernar Bakenov	Head of Sub Division	Customs Control Committee – KZ			
10	Dastan Mamytkanov	Head of Internal Security Division	Customs Control Committee – KZ (territory)	+7 372 278 0471	Almaty Zhibek Zholy St. 127	bturganbaev@a0200.customs.kz
11	Marat Berdenbekov	Head of Internal Security Division	Customs Control Committee – KZ (territory)	+7 3152 46 02 31	Petropavlovsk Mira St. 120	ovb.50900@t0900.customs.kz
12	Serik Kozhatov	Head of Internal Security Division	Customs Control Committee – KZ (territory)	+7 3232 57 86 03	Ust Kamenogorsk Novatorov St. 7/2	skojatov@fl400.customs.kz
13	Yerbolat Ulzhabaev	Head of Internal Security Division	Department of Customs Control – KZ (Atyrau)	+7 701 473 98 28	Atyrau Abai St. 8	
14	Ainura Turdubaeva	Head of International Relations	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 24 53	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr	ovs@customs.gov.kg

		Division			str.	
15	Emil Orozaliev	Chief Inspector – Post Clearance Dep't	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 16 61	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	em-jah@mail.ru
16	Meerim Abdukadyrova	Chief of Training Center	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 24 52	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	Meerim_f@rambler.ru
17	Nurbek Mdbetseitov	Deputy Head (Human Resources Division)	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 08 19	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	N/A
18	Salyi Nadyrbekova	Head of Human Resources Dep't	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 08 90	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	ukol@customs.gov.kg
19	Shamil Berdaliev	Head of Dep't on Struggle against Smuggling	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 10 98	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	sberdaliev@customs.gov.kg
20	Turkmen Bootaev	Head of Customs Control Mgmt Dep't	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 24 41	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	tbootaev@mail.ru
21	Vadim Chaplygin	Head of Department of Narcotics	State Customs Committee – Kyrgyzstan	+996 312 51 10 89	720020 Bishkek 4a Baitik Baatyr str.	chaplyginve72@mail.ru
22	Abdurahim Kadyrov	Head of Human Resources Dep't	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 37 223 32 90	Dushanbe Buhoro St. 50	N/A
23	Anvar Mirzoev	Head of Administrative Dep't	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 37 221 60 69	Dushanbe 50 Buhoro St.	N/A
24	Bakhtiyor Sanginov	Chief Inspector	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 372 24 57 40	Dushanbe Buhoro St. 50	N/A
25	Hasan Sharipov	Chief Inspector	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 37 221 67 64	Dushanbe Buhoro St. 50	N/A
26	Isansho Davlyatov	Head of Human Resources Dep't	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 37 221 08 72	Dushanbe 50 Buhoro St.	N/A
27	Muhamadali Badalov	Deputy Head of Organizational Dep't	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 37 221 18 47	Dushanbe Buhoro St. 50	N/A
28	Zikriyo Akhmedov	Head of Currency Control Dep't	Tajikistan Customs Service	+992 37 221 67 64	Dushanbe Buhoro St. 50	N/A
29	Sadullo Sharipov	Head of Human Resources Dep't	Tajikistan Customs Service (Regional	+992 37 233 03 20	Dushanbe Buhoro St. 50	N/A

			Customs Dep't)			
30	*Yermek Yerdildinov	Head of Dep't	Finance Police	+7 3172 32 41 20	Astana, Seifullin St. 30	
31	*Marat Kaspokov	Prosecutor	General Prosecutor's Office	+7 3172 712 767	Astana, Seifullin St. 73	
32	*Rustem Salkenov	Prosecutor	General Prosecutor's Office	+7 3172 71 26 16	Astana, Seifullin St. 73	
33	*Nurlam Djumabaev	Deputy Head of Dep't	National Security Committee	+7 3172 76 51 60		
34	Bob Simpson	USAID Liason Officer	USAID	+7 777 215 7689	American Embassy (Astana)	rsimpson@usaid.gov
35	Lora Kudaibergenova	Project Management Specialist	USAID	+7 705 577 71 38	Almaty, 050010, Kazybek bi street, 41	lkudaibergenova@usaid.gov
36	Michael Boyd		USAID			mboyd@usaid.gov
37	Marc Declunder		World Customs Organization			marc.declunder@wcoomd.org
38	Billy Salter	Customs Specialist	Booz Allen Hamilton	+1 912 554 3669	8283 Greensboro Dr McLean, VA 22102	billy.salter@yahoo.com
39	Nimmi Kavasery	Consultant	Booz Allen Hamilton	+1 703 377 0999	8283 Greensboro Dr McLean, VA 22102	kavasery_nirmala@bah.com
40	Paul Fekete	Chief of Party - FasTrade Project	Booz Allen Hamilton	+1 202 686 1759	8283 Greensboro Dr McLean, VA 22102	pfekete@verizon.net
41	Tim Kelly	Customs Specialist	Booz Allen Hamilton	+ 603 437 1735	8283 Greensboro Dr McLean, VA 22102	timkelly800@hotmail.com
	*Observer					
FASTrade Website http://www.tcb-fastrade.com						



“Class Photo” Astana, Kazakhstan June 6, 2007



Breakout Session



Breakout Session



Closing/Awards Ceremony

(from left to right) Paul Fekete (COP), Michael Boyd (USAID/Almaty), Marc Declunder (WCO), Tim Kelly (BAH), Billy Salter (BAH)



WORLD CUSTOMS ORGANIZATION
ORGANISATION MONDIALE DES DOUANES

Certificate of Participation

This certifies that _____ successfully completed the seminar:

Integrity as a Central Element in Customs Administration

sponsored jointly by the

United States Agency for International Development

and the

World Customs Organization

Michael Boyd
United States Agency for International Development

Marc Declunder
World Customs Organization

Certificate awarded to each participant.