



**USAID**  
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

**BUSINESS CLIMATE  
REFORM**

# STRATEGY-BUILDING

THE GEORGIAN MINISTRY OF FINANCE IN-HOUSE  
TRAINING UNIT

**December 2007**

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by Chemonics International Inc., contract No AFP-I-00-04-00002-00, TO 3, managed by Chemonics International Inc. and submitted to USAID /Caucasus Cognizant Technical Officer Revaz Ormotsadze.

#### DISCLAIMER

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

# CONTENTS

Executive summary.....	3
Deliverable N° 1- Strategic Training Plan for MoF In-house Training Unit.....	4
Deliverable N° 2 - Delivery of Core Courses for MoF In-house Training Unit ...	5
Deliverable N° 3 - Customized Documents for Training Development that Support Implementation of Strategy.....	6
Annex 1 – Schedule of Meetings.....	7
Annex 2 – SWOT Analysis .....	9
Annex 3 – MoF Draft Provisional Training Strategy.....	11

## Executive summary

In its 2007 – 2011 strategy paper, the Georgian Ministry of Finance (MoF) identified institutional development as one of its five key strategic directions and established a centralized in-house unit in March 2007 to streamline and strengthen training and development initiatives for its 4,190 employees. The MoF strategy for institutional development includes assistance in the preparation of lecture courses in the process of staff training-re-training; as well as preparation and publishing of methodological material for the Study Centre. To lead this effort, in July 2007, the MoF appointed a director of the training unit, who is supported by four full-time professional staff members, who provide administrative and logistical support to part-time training facilitators employed throughout the MoF or those hired externally. Since its inception, the training unit has provided a great deal of ad hoc support to training facilitators. Recognizing a need for greater efficiency, consistency, and higher quality, the MoF training director requested support from the USAID-sponsored Georgia Business Climate Reform (GBCR) project to develop a strategy to move the department forward.

Short-term training consultant, Sarah Meyer, from Chemonics' office in Washington, D.C., worked with the in-house training unit to respond to this need. Three key deliverables were identified for this assignment.

1. Strategic training plan for the training unit of the MoF.
2. Delivery of core courses for training unit (facilitator training and curriculum development).
3. Customized documents for training development that support implementation of training strategy.

This final report provides information about the process of creating each of these deliverables and recommendations for next steps.

## **Deliverable № 1- Strategic Training Plan for MoF In-house Training Unit**

A provisional, six-month training strategy was developed for the MoF in-house training unit after a rapid SWOT analysis and a departmental strategy-building workshop.

From December 11 through 13, I conducted an analysis of the training unit's strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats, with the objective of measuring the gap between the unit's current and expected levels of training services. A schedule of the individuals and groups with whom I met is provided in the appendices. Generally speaking, these people provided information about how well MoF training has been targeted to needs, and how well training is perceived by MoF employees to close performance gaps through improved job performance. Results of the SWOT analysis – provided in the appendices – revealed a few critical points to be addressed in the strategy, such as:

- The training unit needs to expand its expertise from that of providers of logistical support to that of curriculum design specialists.
- There is a nearly complete absence of standard procedures for assessing needs and designing curriculum for adult learners.
- The established method of depending on a relatively small number of contracted technical experts as part-time trainers to facilitate training activities creates a bottleneck in the delivery schedule that is unsustainable and cannot support the MoF strategy for institutional development.

On December 14, we held a strategy-building workshop, which was attended by three members of the five-person training unit, as well as by another MoF director in the human resources department, who is focused on development of position descriptions and performance evaluation criteria. We agreed on the findings of the SWOT analysis, selected three guiding objectives of the strategy, and began selecting actions to be taken over a six-month period to move the department forward.

After a period of reviews and editing by MoF HR staff – Sergo Nozadze and Tea Ruitashvili – the GBCR policy team, and I presented the three objectives and supporting actions of the strategy to Simon Shaphakidze, Deputy Minister, and George Kurtanidze, Head of Staff to the Minister. At that point, we were not able to provide the full Georgian-language version of the strategy to them; however, we had a detailed discussion. We emphasized that the strategy implied a significant increase in staffing of the training unit, as well as an expansion of the unit's mission and a new approach to working with subject-matter experts throughout the ministry. Their reaction seemed quite positive, and they seemed eager to move forward, though they gave no commitments to increased staffing.

### **Recommendations**

- Consider the training strategy at the Georgian Ministry of Justice (or other government agencies in Georgia) in a future iteration of the training unit's strategy. Due to the limited time of this assignment, we were not able to speak with all possible sources of information in our SWOT analysis. Sergo

Nozadze, head of the MoF training unit, referred to a model that has apparently worked well for the Georgian Ministry of Justice. The MoJ's training strategy involves detaching the training unit from the ministry so that it would become a for-profit training service dedicated to the ministry's training needs. While this model may work for other ministries, for many reasons I do not recommend it for the nascent phase of the MoF's training unit. This approach assumes that the training unit is fully prepared to manage the ADDIE process of assessing needs, designing training, etc, all of which are new areas for MoF training staff.

- Consider advocating for the director of the MoF training unit to report directly to the minister's office as a chief learning officer, rather than the current structure in which a training request travels through several MoF departments before it reaches the training unit.

## **Deliverable № 2 - Delivery of Core Courses for MoF In-house Training Unit**

Two fundamental parts of the strategy proposed for the MoF training unit were an emphasis on adult learning principles and the ADDIE model for assessing needs, and designing, developing, implementing, and evaluating training curriculum. To introduce these frameworks and theory, I facilitated two workshops for staff of the training unit and part-time trainers. The first was a two-day training-of-trainers (TOT) workshop; the second was focused on the ADDIE process.

The TOT workshop was divided into two half-day sessions focused on theory and practice sessions for the part-time trainers to practice delivery of curriculum using adult learning principles. We videotaped the participants' practice presentations so that they could later observe themselves and consider constructive feedback to improve their presentation skills for more effective training. One participant, who began her practice session clearly very nervous, said that the new approach was very different from those of the Soviet method of presentation, which emphasized lecturing, little time dedicated to questions-and-answers, etc.

The curriculum design workshop was a half-day session focused on the ADDIE model, working with subject-matter experts, and designing curriculum according to adult learning principles. During the SWOT analysis component of this assignment, part-time trainers reported that the process of developing curriculum was far too time-consuming, and trainees/supervisors reported that curriculum was not targeted to their needs. The primary objective of this workshop was to provide part-time trainers with a few tools to incorporate some level of assessment and design into their limited time for the curriculum development process. A secondary objective was to introduce part-time trainers and staff of the training unit to the concept of working with subject-matter experts from throughout the MoF to understand precisely which information is required to help trainees improve job performance.

### **Recommendations**

- Following an initial pilot of the ADDIE process for curriculum design with the post-clearance customs expert, consider a short-term assignment for a curriculum design expert to complete the entire ADDIE cycle with the training unit to address one or two proposed training needs and to provide additional

tools for this approach. (Proposed expert: staff of home office's Corporate Training Department; director is Marykate Dougherty, [mdougherty@chemonics.com](mailto:mdougherty@chemonics.com); Tel: 202-955-7552). An additional pilot led by a curriculum design expert will illustrate an extremely critical point to the MoF training unit: you do \*not\* need to be a technical specialist to design very effective curriculum. The initial workshop on curriculum design (provided by me in December 2007) was a (too) brief introduction to concepts that are very new to the training unit. Fortunately, Linda Wilcox-Daugherty is both a training specialist who is very familiar with ADDIE, as well as a customs expert, but a second pilot will allow the training unit to establish a level of comfort with this strategy that may be necessary to sustain a successful training effort.

- Consider using project funds to purchase a few guidebooks for the MoF training unit on training design and delivery (one training unit staff person — Nino — speaks English well), such as:
  - Carliner, Saul, *Training Design Basics*, American Society for Training and Development (ASTD), Alexandria, VA 2003.
  - Knowles, Malcolm S., Richard A. Swanson and Elwood F. Holton, *The Adult Learner: The Definitive Classic in Adult Education and Human Resource Development*, Butterworth-Heinemann College, Edinburgh, UK, 2005.
  - Nadler, Leonard and Zeace Nadler, *Designing Training Programs*, Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Inc., Reading, MA, 1994.
  - Piskurich, George M., Peter Beckschi, and Brandon Hall, *The ASTD Handbook of Training Design and Delivery*, McGraw-Hill, New York, NY, 2000.

### **Deliverable № 3 - Customized Documents for Training Development that Support Implementation of Strategy**

In the training strategy document, I provided 14 templates/examples of documents to support the ADDIE process. Approximately half of these documents were translated into Georgian, used for practical exercises in the workshops described above, and provided in hard-copy and electronic versions prior to the end of this assignment. Of particular importance is the “Design Document,” labeled 1Bvi in the strategy, since it encourages development of clear objectives and curriculum design based on adult learning principles. As well, I provided all workshop presentation materials so that the training unit can train trainers and delivery training on the basics in curriculum design. I encouraged the training unit to review these documents and adapt them to the MoF's needs and to the needs of specific training requests.

#### **Recommendations**

- Check in with the training unit director after the first pilot with Linda Wilcox-Daugherty to see if he is using these documents and if he has established a practice of assessing needs through discussions with subject matter experts.

**Schedule for SOW**  
**Sarah Meyer, Training Specialist**  
**December 10 – 23, 2007**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Time</b>	<b>Venue</b>	<b>Action/Event</b>
Monday, December 10			Sarah Meyer arrives into Georgia
Tuesday, December 11	11 am	BCR office	Sarah meets Olin, Nato, Maka
	3 pm	PSFMS project office	Sarah, Maka and Maia meet World Bank Public Sector Financial Management Support Project, Mr. Zurab Antelidze
	5 pm	Forecast project office	Sarah and Maka meet USAID Forecast Caucasus Project, Kevin Carew, COP
Wednesday, December 12	12 pm	MoF	Sarah, Nato, Maka and Maia meet the head of HR, Ms. Tea Rusitashvili and the head of the training unit Mr. Sergo Nozadze
	1 pm	MoF	Sarah, Nato, Maka and Maia and Sergo and Tea meet Mr. Simon Shapakidze, Deputy Minister of MoF
	2 pm	MoF training Center	Sarah, Maka and Maia meet the entire team of the in-house training unit
Thursday, December 13	11 am	BCR office	Sarah, Maka, Maia and the head of the MoF training unit meet with trainers
	2pm -5 pm	BCR office	Sarah, Maka, Maia and the head of the MoF training unit meet with former trainees/trainees' supervisors and the heads of high priority training units
	5 pm	BCR office	Sarah, Maka, Maia and the head of the MoF training unit meet to discuss strategy-building workshop, including reviewing the agenda and roles/responsibilities and addressing any questions.
Friday, December 14	10 am – 5 am	BCR office	Strategy Building Workshop for MoF Training Unit
Monday, December 17	11 am	MoF training Center	Sarah, Maka, Maia and the head of the MoF training unit meet to review/discuss the draft strategy of the training unit and to agree on the agenda for week two of the SOW.
	2 pm	BCR office	Sarah will discuss the draft strategy with Sergo, Nato and Maka
Tuesday, December 18	2 pm	BCR office	Day 1 of TOT Workshop
Wednesday, December 19	10 am - 5 am	BCR office	Day 2 of TOT Workshop
Thursday, December	11 am – 1	BCR	Workshop to discuss curriculum development

20	am	office	issues with trainers
	2 pm – 5 pm	MoF training Center	Sarah, Maka and Maia work with Training unit staff on specific issues of the draft training strategy
Friday, December 21	TBD	MoF training Center	Sarah, Nato, Maka and Maia will present the draft training strategy to the MoF officials
Sunday, December 23			Sarah departs

**SWOT Analysis for the In-house Training Unit of the Georgian Ministry of Finance**

<b>Strengths</b>	<b>Weaknesses</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Director and staff of in-house training unit are highly motivated and eager to provide training solutions</li> <li>• MoF strategy prioritizes institutional capacity</li> <li>• In-house training unit has been extremely responsive to ad hoc, high priority training requests</li> <li>• In-house training unit has documented positive feedback from trainees/trainers</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MoF lacks a training culture</li> <li>• All training requests must be generated by MoF Minister (bottlenecks)</li> <li>• In-house training unit is reactive to ad hoc training requests, rather than being pro-active and strategy-driven</li> <li>• No enterprise-wide standard for verifying and prioritizing training needs, or for selecting trainees most likely to benefit from training</li> <li>• No cost-benefit analysis of approach to hiring/paying part-time trainers versus hiring full-time trainers</li> <li>• Incomplete database of all training activities offered by the MoF; no automated system for registration</li> <li>• Standard roles and responsibilities of MoF’s in-house training unit staff unclear for developing training activities</li> <li>• Distinction unclear between training and education</li> </ul>
<b>Opportunities</b>	<b>Threats</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Standardization of processes and procedures (increased use of templates) can provide quick improvements</li> <li>• Standardization will improve opportunities to deliver generally needed training activities enterprise-wide (e.g. new employee orientations, etc)</li> <li>• In-house training unit must demonstrate their value to the trainers and senior management and “earn” respect through</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No links between individual performance and ministry’s goals (learning management and performance management)</li> <li>• Practice of selecting weakest employees for participation in training</li> <li>• Reliance on part-time trainers and inflexibility of contracting mechanism may inhibit growth of training effort and potential of benefits</li> </ul>

<p>tools to make trainers' jobs easier and impacts clearer, provide smart consultation/guidance; universal challenge: everyone thinks they can develop impactful training</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Short-duration, low-cost, skills-enhancement training and job aids could lead to large and quick improvements, as well as generate support of senior leaders who could further encourage participation in training (e.g. service centers)</li> <li>• Collaboration with other MoF HR units to provide enterprise-wide solutions (linking individual performance with ministry's goals)</li> <li>• Development of skills of in-house training unit staff may accelerate pace of training efforts throughout MoF (TOT delivery to expand # of trainers; training needs assessments; curriculum development; etc).</li> <li>• Incorporation of experience from on-going, donor-sponsored projects (i.e. WB, EU, USAID/Forecast, others if any)</li> </ul> <p>Capitalize on the inclusion of institutional development in the MoF strategy by securing action-based and visible support from senior management</p>	
---	--

# Provisional Strategy for the Training Unit

MINISTRY OF FINANCE OF GEORGIA

December 22, 2007

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development and the Government of Georgia. It was prepared by Training Specialist Sarah Meyer, contract No AFP-I-00-04-00002-00, TO 3, managed by Chemonics International Inc. and submitted to USAID /Caucasus cognizant technical officer Revaz Ormotsadze and Sergo Nozadze, Head of the MoF Training Unit.

## DISCLAIMER

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

## I. Introduction

**Background:** In its 2007 – 2011 strategy paper, the Georgian Ministry of Finance (MoF) identified institutional development as one of its five key strategic directions and established a centralized in-house unit in March 2007 to streamline and strengthen training and development initiatives for its 4,190 employees. The MoF strategy for institutional development includes assistance in the preparation of lecture courses in the process of staff training-re-training; as well as preparation and publishing of methodological material for the Study Centre. To lead this effort, in July 2007, the MoF appointed a director of the training unit, who is supported by four full-time professional staff members, who provide administrative and logistical support to part-time training facilitators employed throughout the MoF or those hired externally. Training facilitators are subject-matter experts in a range of MoF-related technical areas, such as tax, customs, investigations, etc, some of whom are paid an hourly rate for each hour spent in the classroom delivering a specific curriculum to trainees; facilitators are not paid for time spent designing curriculum. Since its inception, the training unit has provided a great deal of ad hoc support to facilitators. Recognizing a need for greater efficiency, consistency, and higher quality, the training director requested support from the USAID-sponsored Georgia Business Climate Reform (GBCR) project to develop a strategy to move the department forward.

**Priority Goals:** The training director teamed with the GBCR project to conduct an analysis of strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats (SWOTs) in the current approach to training in the MoF, involving interviews with MoF part-time training facilitators, former trainees, their supervisors, and members of the training unit. The key themes that emerged from these interviews established three primary goals that will support the MoF's strategy for institutional development and that form the basis of the strategy of the MoF training unit. The three goals of the training unit are:

1. **Standard procedures established to enhance and accelerate curriculum development.** Part-time training facilitators are busy with non-training responsibilities in their area of technical expertise, and they report that the process of assessing training needs and designing curriculum with practical exercises based on adult learning principles is laborious and too time consuming. Through establishment of new standard procedures for developing curriculum, the training unit will contribute to the assessment and design process, which will improve the pace and quality of curriculum development.
2. **Needs-based, results-oriented curriculum.** Trainees and supervisors reported a great need for curriculum that targets performance gaps. By promoting methodologies based on international best practices for curriculum design, the MoF training unit will improve the reputation of training as a tool to improve performance, attracting trainees who are motivated to learn and who will see measurable positive impacts on their job performance, thereby creating a culture of learning in the MoF.
3. **Training process and best practices coordinated and promoted across the MoF.** A centralized training unit staffed by curriculum design specialists provides opportunities for coordination of training on separate but collaborative MoF functions, promotion of best practices, and a central repository of training materials from across the MoF for regular updating and improvement. Logically, action should be taken to ensure that training is coordinated to enhance effective collaboration among MoF agencies.

This training strategy proposes actions that can be taken to improve performance throughout the MoF. For example, GBCR recently completed a survey of the Georgian tax administration. Although respondents (taxpayers) gave high marks to some aspects of the tax process – fair notice, explanation, etc. — they also indicated that the tax agents were discourteous, unprofessional, and unorganized. A strong training strategy led by an appropriately staffed training unit will prepare the MoF to address such concerns with

curriculum that improves performance of tax agents and other MoF employees identified to have performance gaps, ultimately contributing to achievement of the larger MoF mission.

## II. Critical Considerations for this Strategy

**A. Expanded Mission of Training Unit.** To achieve these three goals, the mission of the training unit will need to develop beyond providers of logistical and administrative support — which will remain crucially important — to the role of providers of curriculum and training services to promote staff competence to fulfill the MoF's goal of institutional development. The training unit must expand its ability to provide expertise to assess performance problems, identify learning solutions, and partner with departments across the MoF to design and develop curriculum according to adult learning principles. All of their work will be guided by the ADDIE model for assessing, designing, developing, implementing, and evaluating curriculum.

**B. Implications for Staffing of MoF Training Unit.** The actions proposed in this strategy are designed to reduce the training workload of and dependency on part-time trainers (technical specialists), increase the quality of training materials, and improve performance of MoF employees. However, the strategy necessarily transfers a significant workload to training unit staff. The training unit's workload will increase as the MoF recognizes the positive impacts of training on staff performance and, perhaps more significantly, as the MoF institutes performance evaluation criteria and staff looks to training to prepare them for stronger performance. The training unit will need to be staffed appropriately to sustain training needs. Table 3D provides data from the U.S. training industry on average numbers of training unit staff per number of employees (1:223). This information is crucial to the success of the proposed strategy. A training unit that is staffed appropriately will support the MoF goals for institutional development. An understaffed training unit will likely be unable to sustain the training needs of a Ministry with an increasingly robust culture of learning. A proposed organizational structure is provided on the page 21<sup>st</sup> of this report.

**C. Critical HR Links.** The World Bank initiative to develop position descriptions, classify duties, and establish performance evaluation criteria is critically linked to the training unit's strategy. As each employee's performance expectations are clarified, MoF employees will seek opportunities to improve the skills that are required to do their jobs well. Naturally, they will look to the training unit to provide results-based training and their expectations for the quality of that training will increase. The World Bank project will provide the training unit with focus in terms of curriculum development to help employees improve performance on skills required for their positions. For these reasons, it is critical that the training unit stay in close communication with the progress of the World Bank project, to provide guidance and input where relevant, and to ensure employees that the training unit will provide opportunities for development. The training unit will be proactive in developing training that is aligned with performance expectations outlined in evaluation criteria.

**D. Implementation Timeline:** This provisional strategy is anticipated for implementation over a six-month period. Once the MoF establishes a system for performance evaluation, the training unit should build a strategy for aligning its training services to support evaluation criteria for improved staff performance.

The activities proposed in this strategy can begin immediately and may follow a timeline as shown below:

Action / Month in 2008	Ref	Jan	Feb	March	April	May	June
Adopt strategy	N/A	√					
Join a chapter of an international training/dev association	3D	√					
Recruit, hire, and train additional staff of training unit	II-B	√	√				
Pilot ADDIE for training on post-clearance customs control	1A	√					
Finalize standard templates, checklists, and guidelines	1B	√	√				
Define additional scope of training unit's mission	1C	√	√				
Evaluate technology to further enhance curriculum design	1D	√	√	√			
Pilot curriculum design process	2A		√	√	√	√	√
Identify appropriate members (roles/responsibilities) of Training Advisory Committee	3A			√			
Seek endorsement of senior MoF officials	2B				√		
Launch a Training Advisory Committee	3A					√	
Build redundant communication channels	3B					√	
Evaluate applicability of USAID FORECAST resources	3C						√

### III. Actions to Support Strategic Goals of the MoF Training Unit

#### Goal # 1: Standard procedures established to enhance and accelerate curriculum development.

**1A. Establish New Process for Curriculum Development:** Under its new mission, the training unit will establish a process for designing curriculum based on the ADDIE model that will depend heavily on input from subject-matter experts, who work throughout the MoF (not necessarily for the training unit) and who know the requirements for excellent performance required by the target training group.

Subject-matter experts may be several different types of people. They may be supervisors of the targeted training group who can describe desired performance and define the current performance levels of the trainees (to define performance gaps); they could be MoF employees who work in the same positions as the trainees, who are recognized for excellent performance, and who can describe precisely how they perform specific tasks to be addressed in the training activity; and they could be representatives of the target trainee group, who can describe the work environment and areas in which they feel that they require development and support.

This concept of subject-matter experts is fundamental to this strategy, because MoF training will be required at the advanced, intermediate, and introductory levels, and the current group of contracted part-time trainers cannot possibly be familiar with the training requirements of the more than 4,000 employees throughout the MoF. Furthermore, the current group of part-time trainers has such an advanced level of expertise that their time may be wasted as trainers in introductory and intermediate-level training activities, or their advanced expertise may be radically different than (and thus they may be unfamiliar with) the topic of the proposed training. These technical experts should not be focused on training people at much lower levels; rather they should be focused on their primary job responsibilities and, when determined as necessary in the curriculum design process, they can serve as “cameo” trainers in individual sessions of a larger training activity that is led by someone who is much more familiar with the trainees’ responsibilities. To develop curriculum that addresses performance gaps at any level, the full-time trainers and curriculum designers in the training unit will need to speak with subject-matter experts and develop curriculum that targets specific performance concerns.

The method of working with subject-matter experts depends on the specific training request. Staff of the training unit will assemble a small group of subject-matter experts to conduct a needs analysis and define performance gaps of the target trainees. These meetings can take the form of a series of short meetings (only an hour or so) between the training unit's curriculum designer and one subject-matter expert at a time, or they can be a single meeting with multiple subject-matter experts, debating the current and desired performance in a room together. The training unit will look for agreement among these various subject-matter experts on the definition of desired performance, since opinions may differ even if a clear position description exists for the target trainees. Groups of subject-matter experts can be assembled and disbanded for each new training request. Staff of the training unit will take the information collected at this/these meeting(s) to determine if training is the appropriate solution (see other possible solutions in materials from Curriculum Development workshop), and they will begin the curriculum design process with intermittent feedback from the group of subject-matter experts.

Using the new organization chart of the training unit provided on the page 21<sup>st</sup> of this report, general position descriptions of the MoF follow:

- Curriculum designers will partner with subject-matter experts from throughout the MoF to ensure that all curriculum has been developed according to the ADDIE model. Curriculum designers need not be technical experts. Their primary responsibility will be to design curriculum that is targeted to the specific training needs of adult learners. They will assemble groups of subject-matter experts, meet with them to conduct needs analysis, design and develop curriculum, and work with subject-matter experts to review, edit, and evaluate the resulting training curriculum.
- Full-time technical specialists will serve as trainers on an as-needed basis. They will be available to lead ad hoc training activities in their area of technical expertise. When not in the classroom, they will be actively involved in the ADDIE process of curriculum design and development. The training unit anticipates that these individuals will spend a majority of their time in the classroom; however, since needs-based training is critical to performance improvements, the training unit requests at least one week (ideally, two weeks) notification prior to the beginning of each training activity in order to incorporate the critical needs assessment component with input from subject-matter experts. The training unit also anticipates recruiting four people from the former training unit of the Customs Department, who are both subject-matter experts as well as curriculum design specialists. Other full-time trainers will be recruited from throughout the MoF according to their technical expertise, and the training unit will provide them with training in the ADDIE process and facilitation training (TOT).
- Part-time trainers will be contracted on an as-needed basis. The training unit's curriculum designers will identify appropriate part-time trainers based entirely on the results of needs assessment with subject-matter experts. The curriculum designers may select from the training unit's full-time technical experts (if not currently serving as a trainer), the current group of part-time trainers, other employees throughout the MoF who exhibit the desired level of performance identified in the needs assessment, or external part-time trainers who are familiar with best practices not yet available within the MoF.
- Logistics and administration specialists will support the needs of individual training activities and the training unit, including printing training materials, ensuring that audio-visual needs are met, ordering drinks and meals for trainees, processing registration applications, etc.

The proposed division of roles and responsibilities as described above, coupled with the actions described in this strategy document, will achieve the ultimate goal of increasing the quality, effectiveness, and consistency of MoF training. Generally speaking, the new process will divide roles and responsibilities among staff of the training unit, subject-matter experts, and trainers/facilitators, as described in table 1A below. Please note that one person can serve as both subject-matter expert and trainer; however, creating a distinction in roles ensures that

the speed with which curriculum is developed does not depend entirely on the availability of a single contracted trainer.

**Table 1A: Roles and Responsibilities for Curriculum Design and Development**

<b>Training Unit Staff</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Assess training needs of the target trainees</li> <li>• Partner with subject-matter experts to collect materials and information that respond to trainees’ defined needs</li> <li>• Design and develop training materials according to adult learning principles</li> <li>• Provide periodic TOT training to ensure effective presentation of materials</li> <li>• Serve as trainers when appropriate</li> <li>• Evaluate effectiveness of training curriculum and revise materials as needed</li> </ul>
<b>Subject-matter Experts</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Identify materials and information that respond to the defined training needs</li> <li>• Verify the accuracy and thoroughness of training materials developed by the training unit by editing training materials and providing feedback through participating in initial deliveries of curriculum</li> <li>• When available and with support from training unit staff, use training methodologies provided by the training unit to design the curriculum</li> <li>• Serve as trainers, using training methodologies/materials developed by the training unit (<i>Optional, depending on demand for training</i>)</li> </ul>
<b>Trainers</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Serve as trainers, using training methodologies/materials developed by the training unit</li> </ul>

The flow of work, generally, will be as follows:

**Table 1Ai: General Workflow Responsibilities of Design Cycle**

Step	Task
1	• Training request received by training unit
2	• <b>Training unit</b> assembles a team of <b>subject matter experts</b> on the proposed training topic
3	• <b>Training unit</b> holds meeting(s) with <b>subject matter experts</b> to explore precise needs, determine if training is appropriate, and establish scope of information for training activity
4	• If training unit determines that training is appropriate solution, the <b>training unit</b> begins curriculum design cycle, selecting exercises based on adult learning principles
5	• <b>Training unit</b> submits draft training materials to two to three <b>subject matter experts</b> for review/approval of accuracy and thoroughness of content
6	• <b>Training unit</b> creates final version of training materials
7	• <b>Trainer</b> delivers curriculum in a test-pilot delivery session attended by <b>subject matter experts</b> , and target trainees to evaluate and refine timing, effectiveness of exercises, etc.
8	• <b>Training unit</b> makes edits to curriculum based on feedback from pilot
9	• <b>Trainer</b> delivers curriculum to target trainees
10	• <b>Training unit</b> reviews evaluations and incorporates improvements for future deliveries

**1B. Finalize Standard Templates, Checklists, and Guidelines for Training**

**Materials:** The training unit will create or adapt standard documents to support the new curriculum design and development process. Standard materials will provide a basic infrastructure upon which to build curriculum (content), reduce time spent in administrative preparation, provide a more professional look for training materials, and ensure that all training materials have basic design features, thereby increasing the likelihood for high-quality training that leads to performance improvements. These standard materials may include (but not be limited to) the following:

**Table 1B. Illustrative List of Standard Documents to Support Curriculum Design and Development Process**

<b>Document</b>	<b>* Ref #</b>	<b>Purpose / Function</b>
Questionnaire	1Bi	Collect information to determine if training is the appropriate solution (to accompany or be followed by in-person interviews)
Instructional Design Review Checklist	1Bii	Ensures that the curriculum has achieved the objectives of the standard design cycle
Training Development Process Checklist	1Biii	Ensures that the curriculum has completed all stages of the standard design cycle
Work plan and Timeline for Training Development	1Biv	Establishes accountability, coordinates roles, and tracks due dates for curriculum development
Course Description Template	1Bv	Clarifies parameters through a succinct description of curriculum content, objectives, target audience, prerequisites, duration
Design Document	1Bvi	Serves as the blueprint or outline of the curriculum design prior to full-scale development
Trainer Guide Standards	1Bvii	Provides three standard methodologies to guide the instructor through delivery in accordance with adult learning principles
Standard Power Point Template	1Bviii	Provides standard Power Point presentation style, format, font, and guidance in notes on key points, duration per slide, etc.
Criteria for Selection of Facilitators	1Bix	Helps the training unit distinguish between someone who is ready and not yet ready to serve as training facilitator
Analyzing Performance Problems	1Bxi	Helps the training unit determine what the performance problem is and whether training is the appropriate solution.
ADDIE Model	1Bxii	Illustrates and explains the standard process to assess, design, develop, implement, and evaluate curriculum
Creating Powerful Curriculum Objectives	1Bxiii	Clearly establishes the intended results of the training session
Evaluation Form		Encourages feedback to assist the training unit to improve content or design of the curriculum
Partnership Process Flowchart	Distributed	Illustrates the process by which the training unit partners with subject-matter experts and trainers to develop curriculum

*\* Templates provided electronically at the end of consultant's assignment. GBCR will provide translations at request of training unit director.*

**1C. Define Additional Scope of the Training Unit's Mission:** In addition to managing the process of developing high-quality training materials, the training unit will likely be responsible for the administrative and logistical aspects of curriculum development. Since these aspects are significant to the ultimate success of a training activity and since they can be extremely time-consuming, the training unit will define the specific parameters of their responsibility in these areas. The following is an illustrative list of tasks to be managed by the training unit, in addition to curriculum development:

- Research and contract with external training facilitators
- Identify, interview, and select MoF training facilitators (MoF employees) on behalf of the Minister's office (and develop contracts, if applicable)
- Administer external training approvals, reimbursements, and payments (if applicable)
- Provide each training facilitators with materials to manage training sessions (e.g. flipcharts, markers, tape, guidance on using audio/visual equipment, trainees' [audience's] table/chair arrangements, ordering refreshments/meals, etc)
- Track and keep records of course attendance of each employee
- Maintain copies of trainees' evaluation forms and establish a meaningful system for quantifying and reporting trainees' feedback for high-level, cumulative evaluation of ADDIE process
- Contribute to development of a human resources management system that incorporates critical training data

**1D. Evaluate Technology to Further Enhance Curriculum Design Cycle:** Training for staff working in organizations with offices in remote and multiple locations, or in customer support centers that do not easily facilitate absences, is often impossible to organize in a classroom setting. However, many training needs can be addressed through use of job-aids that do not require time in a classroom (e.g. checklists, simple guidelines, etc) or software (rather than classroom training) that provides “just-in-time” training. The GBCR project is considering support of various software packages that training staff can use to more quickly develop high-quality training materials. Furthermore, the training unit will work with the MoF IT department to incorporate training-related data into its developing HRMS system. Illustrative data might include training attendance history and training examination scores per employee, calendar of scheduled training opportunities and registration functions, specific training activities that contribute to position descriptions, duty descriptions, etc. Please note that use of technology to support training does not mean that the training unit does not need to complete the ADDIE process. The ADDIE process applies in all methodologies of training, including classroom- and technology-based.

## **Goal # 2: Needs-based, results-oriented curriculum.**

**2A. Pilot the Curriculum Development Process:** The training unit will receive initial training in the curriculum design process in December 2007. The logical next step in the learning process will be to put that new knowledge into practice. Once standard templates are created (goal 1B), the training unit will select at least one request for training to be developed in accordance with adult learning principles, completing all stages of the standard ADDIE model for assessing, designing, developing, implementing, and evaluating curriculum. The training unit is encouraged to select a topic that is anticipated to produce short-term, quantifiable impact results so that they can report on success in a non-ambiguous manner (e.g. training for call center employees). They may select one of many planned/ad hoc requests (with at least two week’s lead time in the pilot phase) from the Minister’s office, or they may choose to work with a U.S.-based training facilitator and customs expert, who will be sponsored by GBCR to develop curriculum on post-clearance control in January. GBCR will consider additional opportunities for similar pilots with consultation and guidance from curriculum development experts.

**2B. Seek Endorsement of Senior MoF Officials:** Once the training unit has completed a few pilots of the ADDIE process, it will present the results and highlights of its new procedures to senior MoF officials (e.g. deputy ministers, head of HR, etc) with a goal of showcasing the positive impacts on (i) the relative efficiency with which curriculum is developed, (ii) the quality of the training materials and course facilitation, and (iii) staff performance. Of equal or greater importance, the training unit will explain the importance of senior MoF officials’ leadership in promoting high-quality training as a critical component of institutional development and will ask them to endorse the new processes through regular participation in an advisory committee (goal 3A) and quotes from MoF leaders with positive references to the new procedures in any other Ministry-wide communication channels.

## **Goal # 3: Training process and best practices coordinated and promoted across the MoF.**

**3A. Create a Training Advisory Committee (TAC):** An important role of the training unit will be to build channels of communication on the topic of institutional development between the MoF’s agencies and the training unit, as well as among those agencies. The training unit will create a training advisory committee comprised of at least one representative of each of the MoF agencies who is knowledgeable about the overall effectiveness (or lack thereof) of the agency’s public services, at least one senior MoF official (deputy-minister level), the director of human resources, and the head of the HR unit responsible for development of standards and criteria for performance evaluations.

The TAC will meet on a monthly (or other regular) basis, and the training unit will generate and facilitate the agenda based on current critical MoF institutional development issues related to training. Illustrative topics for discussion at TAC meetings:

- Announce the training unit's new mission/goals, the ADDIE process and accompanying new procedures for subject-matter experts to partner with the training unit to develop curriculum
- Discuss and agree on the TAC purpose statement and roles/responsibilities of TAC members, ranging from attendance policy, collection of information on performance gaps, etc.
- Showcase excellent examples in MoF curriculum designed through the partnering model, presenting participating staff with recognition awards for their role in development and including an article in an internal, agency-wide publication sent to MoF employees
- Share information and opinions on training needs within individual MoF agencies
- Attempt to identify training needs that are common across multiple agencies so that curriculum can be developed that encourages streamlined processes among separate, but collaborative, MoF agencies
- Link the performance evaluation process and training, and brainstorm on opportunities to use training as a tool to contribute to stronger individual and institutional effectiveness
- Other to be determined by training unit with guidance from committee and based on training needs and trends as they arise

At least one member of the training unit, if not all, will attend TAC meetings. Not all members (those in addition to the training unit itself) must attend each meeting, however TAC members should appoint alternates to attend in their place and the training unit will determine each month whether or not a quorum exists to justify a meeting. For each meeting, a training unit staff member will take notes on the highlights of the discussion and disseminate the notes to all members so that they can (i) choose to disseminate the notes to supervisors throughout an agency; (ii) keep abreast of TAC discussions if they are not able to attend a TAC meeting; (iii) reference previous discussions or search for trends.

**3B. Build Redundant Communication Channels:** While the TAC will be a critical communication channel for the training unit, additional, more frequent, and redundant communication channels will ensure that MoF staff are in touch with the pulse of the MoF in relation to performance gaps and other training needs. Furthermore, such redundancy appeals to various communication preferences of thousands of MoF employees. Illustrative communication channels:

- The training unit will assign individual staff of the training unit as contacts for individual MoF agencies. This approach ensures that MoF employees (via TAC members) feel that they can address questions to a caring and responsive human being (not a bureaucracy).
- Establish an "Ask TAC" email address (if email is a regular communication vehicle (?) to which employees can send questions, concerns, etc, regarding development of skills
- A TAC newsletter will provide a channel of communication for advertising newly developed curricula that may be useful to agencies that were not initially incorporated into the assessment process, highlighting training success stories, responding (without reference to the sender) to Ask-TAC questions of potential relevance to a wider audience, and encouraging feedback via TAC members.
- Regular meetings with HR colleagues involved in performance evaluation, dismissals, etc, so that the training unit can take an active role in corrective measures, as deemed necessary.

**3C. Capitalize on FORECAST Resources (Tentative):** In approximately May 2007, the USAID FORECAST project will be prepared to assist the training unit in a Ministry-wide human and institutional capacity development (HICD) assessment. This assessment process will approach performance gaps on an institutional level and funnel critical information to the MOF training unit (and Human Resources Department) so that

they can begin to prioritize plans to develop new or edit existing curriculum to address these needs. Furthermore, this comprehensive information will likely be available at approximately the same time that another HR department will be developing performance evaluation criteria. Both the design and results of these two efforts can be joined to assist the training unit in building standard categories for types of training to support staff development along career paths and in pursuit of promotions or other opportunities for recognition of excellent performance. The relevance and utility of goal 3C will be reevaluated by the MoF training director and GBCR staff, based on the capacity of the training unit to support a potentially large amount of training needs revealed through the HICD process. Please note that the results of a ministry-wide HICD assessment will be of questionable value if the training unit is not staffed appropriately (as proposed in the organization chart) to develop curriculum that responds to the identified needs.

### **3D. Join or Launch a Chapter of an International Training/Development**

**Association:** Staying in tune with industry best practices is essential to maintaining a cutting-edge training unit. Several such associations either welcome international members or provide opportunities for launching new chapters (e.g. American Society for Training and Development; International Society for Performance Improvement; etc.). As well, the training unit will consider subscribing to publications, such as Chief Learning Officer magazine. The MoF training unit will research the most applicable, cost efficient membership and develop a proposal that explains the value of membership and requests MoF funding for the nominal application fee. An example of some meaningful data provided by ASTD is shown in the table below. Such associations also provide reports and research on new training methodologies which would allow the MoF training unit to constantly refine and improve its own procedures.

**Table 3D: Example of Resources Provided by a Training Industry Association**

<b>Key Benchmarks</b>	<b>US Figures (2006 ASTD State of Industry Report)</b>	<b>BEST Winners (2006 average)</b> These are award-winning training departments
Training expenditure per employee	\$1,434.94	\$1,672.47
Learning hours received per employee	45.22 hours	44.73 hours
Expenditures as percentage of payroll	2.57%	2.61%
Percentage of expenditure outsourced	30.9%	26.3%
Employees per training staff member	222.62 adjusted for outsourcing	194.64 adjusted for outsourcing

## **IV. Conclusion**

The MoF training unit understands the critical role of training in achievement of the Ministry's 2007 – 2011 goals, and it is motivated and eager to begin the implementation phase. The training unit also understands the critical role that MoF leadership plays in encouraging staff to embrace and develop a culture of learning, and we look forward to partnering with you to achieve our mutual goals.

# Organizational Structure of MoF Training Unit

