

# BEHIND LOCKED GATES



## *An Assessment of Trafficking Women and Girls in Papua*

*Prepared by  
International Catholic Migration  
Commission (ICMC) for  
United States Agency for International  
Development (USAID)*

*October 2005*



**Behind Locked Gates:**  
**An Assessment Report on Trafficking of**  
**Women and Girls in Papua**

**Prepared by**

**International Catholic Migration Commission Indonesia**

**For**

**United States Agency for International Development (USAID),**  
**Jakarta**

**Jakarta,**  
**25 October 2005**

**Assessment Team**

**Literature Review**

Widya Setiabudi

**Field Assessment**

Stina Carlsson  
Magdalena Pasaribu  
Dian Octarina  
Abhijit Dasgupta  
Maria Ining Nurani

**Facilitation of Stakeholder Meetings**

Widya Setiabudi  
Ade Yuanita  
Magdalena Pasaribu

**Report**

Widya Setiabudi  
Ade Yuanita  
Magdalena Pasaribu

**Translations**

Dian Octarina

**Cover**

Ade Yuanita

**Logistics**

Tantyawati

## Table of Contents

Executive Summary...	4
Acknowledgment ...	6
<i>by</i>	
<i>Abhijit Dasgupta</i>	
Prologue:	
The Girl in The Other Room...	8
Chapter I:	
A Drift of Smoke...	13
Chapter II:	
Preparing for the Voyage...	15
Chapter III:	
Treasure Island in the East...	18
Chapter IV:	
Of Boats and Beer...	29
Chapter V:	
Behind Locked Gates...	40
Chapter VI:	
Hovering Between Denial and Smugness...	44
Chapter VII:	
Clues, Conjectures and Conclusions...	49
Chapter VIII:	
Extinguishing Forest Fire...	57
Epilogue:	
The Answer Is Blowing in The Wind ...	74

## Executive Summary

1. An assessment of trafficking of women and girls to Papua was carried out by ICMC in September 2005 at the instance of USAID Jakarta.
2. The assessment was carried out with the help of published materials, field observations and interviews with key informants in six locations of Papua, and two stakeholders' meetings in Jayapura and Sorong.
3. The assessment indicates that, at a minimum, 800 - 1,000 women and girls are trafficked to Papua every year. However, this number could be actually much higher because of the clandestine nature of human trafficking. Though a fairly large number of women from other provinces work in factories, offices, shops, supermarkets, restaurant and eating houses, no evidence could be found that indicate that they are trafficked. A striking feature of private sector employment in Papua is the virtual absence of Papuan women in the ranks.
4. The main sites in Papua for trafficking of women and girls are karaoke bars and discotheques, massage parlors and *lokalisasis* (brothels). Younger girls can be found quite extensively among street based prostitutes. It is estimated that there are close to 1,000 trafficked girls (aged below 18 years) in Papua
5. Nearly half of the trafficked women and girls are from North Sulawesi, about a third from Java and the rest from other provinces. There are indications that at least some of the Javanese women who are trapped in to prostitution in Papua belong to trans-migrant families. Nearly half of the women and girls in street prostitution were Papuans.
6. The women trafficked from North Sulawesi are relatively more educated than those from Java. It is suspected that a good number of the street based prostitutes are students from schools and colleges of Jayapura and Sorong.

7. Whereas most of the trafficked women and girls are from poor rural families, a number of them, especially those from North Sulawesi are married / separated with one child or more.
8. The traffickers' agents come to the women and girls with attractive offers for jobs in hotels and bars in Papua. A few trafficked women, especially from North Sulawesi, responded to job advertisements in newspapers. Some employment agencies based in Makassar, Manado and Surabaya are parts of the trafficking chain to Papua.
9. Traffickers use an instrument called "contract" to put the trafficked women and girls to debt bondage. Though the "contracts" are usually for four months at a time; once they come to Papua, they are unable to leave till the expenses incurred by the traffickers to get the women and girls across, their board and lodging etc. are worked off. Often, these costs are computed at rates much higher than actual.
10. Women working in karaoke bars and massage parlors are forced to offer sexual services to men because they are keen to buy their freedom by paying off the debts. It is estimated that at least one-half of the initially trafficked women are unable to pay off the initial debt, and are then "sold" to another establishment. This process could continue till they end up in brothels. Some others embrace prostitution once they have been able to pay off their debts. Some others, who are able to escape from Papua go to / are taken to Maluku Utara to work in entertainment establishments and in brothels. Ultimately, very few return to mainstream.
11. Two things that encourage trafficking to Papua are firstly the existence of a good number of harbors along its coast that generate demand for sexual services for transient population, and secondly the efforts by beer manufacturers to increase their sales in Papua by engaging hostesses in bars to sell beer. It is also learnt that

- traders collect a type of aromatic wood called *gaharu* from the Asmat region by offering sexual services of women to the gatherers.
12. Physical distances and the prohibitive boat / airfares discourage trafficked women and girls from trying to leave Papua.
  13. Traffickers are additionally benefited by the fact that there is little clarity among the local administrators about what constitutes trafficking and why it is crime. The administrators are often unaware that trafficking takes place to their own towns or districts, and sometimes those are direct outcome of their policies.
  14. Currently, no Inter-Governmental Organization (IGO), donor or International Non-Government Organization is working in Papua on the issue of trafficking though the International Organization for Migration has plans to start working there.
  15. Any intervention into the situation in Papua with respect to trafficking of women and girls would require coordinated efforts in both sending and receiving locations. It should essentially consist of components of vulnerability reduction of women and girls at risk, return and reintegration of trafficked women and girls, strengthening the legal environment in Papua, and advocacy for demand reduction.
  16. It is felt that a two years multi-location counter-trafficking program should be able to build necessary local capacities of both the Government and the Civil Society to combat trafficking in Papua.

### Acknowledgement

*This report is dedicated to those 3,000 and more trafficked women and girls in Papua who wait for deliverance from their sufferings*

As the Program Manager responsible for overseeing this assessment, it befalls me to write a note of acknowledgement for all the help and support the ICMC Assessment Team got. I am indeed grateful to my colleagues in ICMC for leaving this small bit of work for me while they quietly, and without any undue fuss, finished rest of the work. This, at least, saves me from being an outsider altogether.

This report would not have materialized without financial support and constant encouragement from USAID, the American People – and especially Mark D. Clark, Larry Meserve and Maria Ining Nurani. Special thanks goes to the last named for her immense support, critical questions and infectious enthusiasm that constantly inspired the Assessment Team during field work.

Our sincere thanks are due to Dr. Soeparlarto of the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Ir. Maesuroh of MenkoKesra for attending the Stakeholders' Meetings in Papua and making valuable contribution to the proceedings. It is important here to express our gratitude to all the key respondents who provided most of the information that this report can boast of.

Kristin Dadey and Damianus Bilo from International Organization for Migration lent a lot of credibility to the Stakeholders' Meeting not only by their knowledgeable interventions, but also by demonstrating that they were with us.

My colleagues Stina Carlsson, Widya Setiabudi, Magdalena Pasaribu and Dian Octarina took unimaginable pains to get the right information from the field. Dian deserves additional mention for being my interpreter when I needed most to understand what others were saying. She also took care of the on-field logistics. Tanyawati planned the field team's flights, booked accommodation and provided the link to funds that kept the fieldwork on schedule. Ade Yuanita, along with Widya and Magdalena organized and

moderated the Stakeholder Meetings in Jayapura and Sorong. They are also the team that wrote this report. Ade gifted the report with a beautiful cover as she was leaving ICMC for better prospects elsewhere.

The rest of the SIGHT Team in ICMC – Anis Hamim, Keri Lasmi Sugiyarti and Fatimana Agustinanto provided critical comments on each draft of the report to keep sharpening its focus and improve its readability. Charles Davy, the ICMC Regional Director, penned through the entire report considerably improving its readability.

This page of acknowledgement will remain incomplete if I do not mention Ocha – the 9 months old baby girl who sat on my lap, chewed at my nose, gurgled and smiled as her trafficked mother spoke to me. I could launch my own personal War Against Trafficking for the prize of seeing that Ocha can smile all her life.

## Prologue

### "The Girl in the Other Room"

It was my second day in Sorong. Having arrived on the previous evening, and then having spent a couple of red-eyed hours with Bapak Abner being briefed on prostitution in the three years old provincial capital of West Irian Jaya, I decided to venture out to do a bit of scouting of my own. Declining the offer of Ibu Ellis of the local Polda to arrange for some interviews with bar hostesses, I wanted to do it my way.

It had rained a little while ago. The road from Grand Pacific Hotel, whose tarred top must have worn off a long time back and is full of potholes at the best of times, was pockmarked with ugly puddles. The stretch of the road was ill lit with light from the roadside warungs, and whenever a car came from the opposite direction I was blinded by the headlamps and their reflections in the mirrors of water on the road.

It was only 8 o'clock in the evening. I entered the Café 49 - a stone's throw from the hotel. It looked quite ordinary - just another man drinking in a corner table. A Papuan man served me with my bottle of Bintang. After some time, the lady cashier, who was apparently an immigrant, went over and joined the man in the corner. I assumed that they were friends for long. I still had to while away some more minutes as most of the bars really got active after 9.00 pm.

At 9.00 pm, I came back to Star Light, the so-called star of night spots in Sorong which claimed to have the 20 most pretty girls in town, and also was a part of the Grand Pacific Hotel. There was a man in the bar counter polishing glasses. Another was practicing his act of juggling with the cocktail shaker - a scene I was familiar with from Batam. Two girls sat in a table looking most disinterested in whatever was going on. I was the only other person in there. I went and sat in another corner waiting for my order to be taken. Half an hour passed, and no one was interested in me. Action seemed to be in the other side of the large hall. People came in, gazed through a glass window and then vanished down a corridor. Finally, I went up to the bar counter and asked for a bottle of beer. The

beer was served, and a little while later, a very fashionable lady came and asked me, "Nona?" I was confused. I did not know what she meant and shook my head to say no.

After I finished my beer, I paid my bill and went to take a peek through the glass window. Some 15 girls were lounging in a room - most looking quite bored, but pretty. Some, I thought, were too young to be there. So, I realized that customers must have been picking up girls from there and then retiring to some other room in the back.

Any way, since I had already decided to check out another venue, I left Star Light and walked down to Monalisa discotheque further down the road. Either because it was past 10 pm, or because this place was more popular, there were people on the dance floor as loud music blared out from huge speakers placed in every corner. Having learnt from my previous experience this time I went to the bar counter straight away and asked for a beer. Even before the bottle of beer could be opened, a doughty lady in black pants and a jacket introduced herself as the mamasan and asked me, "Nona?" This time I nodded my head in the affirmative. She took me down a corridor to a glass window marked "Show Room", and asked me to take my pick. I pointed to a young looking girl, but the mamasan said that the lady of my choice does not speak "Inggris". So, she got another girl called Kristen to come and sit with me. But, first I had to put down 50,000 rupiahs to have Kristen's company for three hours.

Kristen said that she was from Makassar. From her high forehead, I suspected that she was from Toraja. She spoke a little English, and with my limited Bahasa Indonesian, we began a conversation. Kristen was in Mona Lisa on a four months contract. She was 22 years old and the eldest among four brothers and sisters. Her family was poor, and she had to work for the family's survival. She did not say if this was her first assignment, or if she had been to other towns in Papua, but shared with me the information that she worked as a waitress in a Makassar restaurant before. Life was hard there, long working hours and little pay. She was contracted to come to Papua by an agent in Makassar, with a promise of higher earning. "Do you really earn more here?" I asked. She said she did, but then costs were higher in Papua as well. "Will you be able to take some money

home?" "May be", her answer was noncommittal. She lived on the premises and shared a room with three other girls. She did not know much of Sorong since she hardly went out. She had to pay all the costs for lodging and board, which was adjusted against her earnings.

Within 15 minutes of our contracted three hours Kristen drank two pints of beer *hitam*, ordered a packet of cigarettes, and a pack of tissues. It was almost 11 pm and I had to work the next day. So, I called for my bill. She decided to keep the change without even waiting for my offer to do so, and asked me to return to her the next evening.

\* \* \* \* \*

The next morning was disappointing with our respondents in the DISNAKER claiming that mini-bars were good for the economy of Sorong, and that they had hardly anything to do with the employees of mini-bars as these women were neither recruited through the DISNAKER, nor they held "yellow cards" – the permit to work in Papua. However, they provided us with a list of all establishments in Sorong that employed workers – with a break up by gender, and Papuans vs. trans-migrants. The list showed that a bar called Fiesta employed the largest number of trans-migrant women in Sorong.

That night, Fiesta was my port of call. Fiesta did not have a "Show Room", and all the women were out in the hall. I struck it rich here as the mamasan offered me a woman to sit with who spoke good English, and also, I did not have to pay for her time. Arie was originally from West Java, but then her parents settled in Balikpapan in East Kalimantan. At the age of 19, she had married a man from Balikpapan who left her for another woman, because he thought Arie was "too manly" (Arie is tall with a broad statuesque frame, and has a somewhat manly voice. I asked her if she was a *Waria*, but she was almost insulted by the question. She offered to prove to me that she was not a *Waria*, but I dared not press the issue any further.) Arie has a five years old son, and after her father died of "too much drinking and too much smoking", she had to take up a job. She was told that a girl of her qualifications (a high school graduate with

reasonable fluency in English, and with some kind of a personality that puts her in a different class from others) would easily get a job of a Public Relations Officer in one of the hotels in Papua for 3 million rupiahs or more per month. So, she flew to Surabaya to meet an agent suggested by her contact in Balikpapan, and got shipped to Sorong from there. What she found on arrival was entirely different from what was promised.

In fact, Arie cried a lot during our time together, and kept ruing her indiscretion of believing someone she hardly knew. She also cursed her own helpless condition, as her mother was not in a position to support Arie and her son. Arie did not like Sorong; she did not like what she was doing and her living conditions where she was held almost captive. She lived on the premises of Fiesta with 25 other women – all from Karawang area in West Java. All of them came to Fiesta through the same agent. If she were lucky, she said, she would have 1.3 million rupiah at the end of her contract, and free passage up to Surabaya – back to her agent. She has not been able to save much as she did not provide sexual services to her customers (often enough), and also picked up serious drinking and smoking problems, which cost her all her commission earnings and more. She only has one “special friend” – an Arab, who was a very kind man. She went out with him twice, because she trusted him. When I told her about AIDS in Papua, and that she should use condoms if she were ever to go to hotels with customers, she shuddered and said that she did not feel very comfortable going out with them

Arie gave me a lot of information about the way establishments like Fiesta operated and the kind of money they raked in. In fact, when she was crying inconsolably, I offered to take her out for a meal. She said that it would be foolish to do so because I have to pay 200,000 rupiahs to the bar to take her out. She also warned me against making similar offers to any other woman, because if someone accepted, then she might ask me to pay up 300,000 to 500,000 rupiahs more, once outside. The mini-bars charged up to 22,500 rupiahs for beer putih (a lager or a pilsner), up to 35,000 rupiahs for a beer hitam (ale), and up to 20,000 for a packet of Sampourna “A” cigarettes. Normally, the hostesses got 1,000 rupiah for a beer *putih*, and 1,500 rupiah for a beer *hitam*. If a single bill reached 200,000 rupiah, then they would get 10% on the billed amount. This was one of the

reasons why almost all the bar hostesses drank beer *hitam*, and they drank faster than the customers. They also chain-smoked – at least most of them.

Arie certainly does not want to return to Papua. From Surabaya, she plans to go to Jakarta where she has “family” and look for a job.

\* \* \* \* \*

During the next few days, I met a number of women in the bars of Sorong and Biak. Out of the 14 women (and girls) I talked to, at least two – Ita and Diti certainly looked to me to be under 18 years of age (in fact Diti would have been in her early teens). When Ita kept insisting that she “*pulang hotel*” (come to my hotel with me), I told her that she was “*sangat muda*” (too young) and she shook her head vehemently. When I asked her age, she fetched a two years old child from inside to claim that she was old enough to be a mother. Diti was a more reckless creature – probably because of her age, and kept teasing and flirting with tough looking men with abandon ease. Both Ita and Diti chain-smoked.

Rezza, on the other hand, was 47 and probably Biak was her last stop before she would go into oblivion. She had been a prostitute for long (she had no hesitation in telling me that she came from the Dolly complex in Surabaya), and had resigned to living off commission on beer sales. Sometimes, she pimped for younger women for a fee. She spoke Chinese in addition to English and Indonesian. It was Kenny’s first contract. She was running away from a violent husband back in Manado. After a few bottles of ale, she became so hysteric and abusive (I could not make out who she was abusing – her husband, the man who tricked her into coming to Papua, or me) that she had to be carried away by the *mamasan*. Irem appeared to be resigned to her fate. She had no idea about what she would do once her contract was over. She kept tapping her forehead with her finger whenever I asked “*Ada mau anda* (What do you want to do?)” On the other hand, Cindy wanted to go back to Manado and find another job (she had left her

job in an office because her husband became jealous of her male colleagues), but not to her husband. Cindy's two years old daughter was staying with her mother.

Siti came from Madura. She actually allowed me to hold her nine months old baby as she talked to me. She had no one to go back to, and her *mamasan* was very kind to have allowed her to keep her baby with her. Her colleagues were wonderful - they took turns in looking after the baby if she was entertaining a customer. (Actually, I saw babies of different ages in at least three or four bars, and at times wondered if they were born during the captivity of their mothers.) She would probably have to stay longer with her employer as she did not go out with customers. When I asked her why, she looked away, pointed to her own breasts and just said "*Susu* (milk)".

Perhaps this account will remain incomplete if I do not talk about Ernie and Mirnawati from Ternate. As we stopped in Ternate on our way back to understand why it was regarded as an important link in trafficking to Papua, I met them - Ernie in Rio Rio, Ternate's most famous eating place (and also a "karaoke" bar), and Mirnawati in the *Swering*, a place where men went in the evenings to pick up women. On a Thursday evening, Ernie was one of the three women working in Rio Rio. When, in a matter of two hours, she was forced to go "upstairs" for the third time by her boss, she had a few things to say. Obviously, she was in some kind of pain and discomfort, but that did not make her boss relent. Mirnawati, when alone with me, admitted that she was actually 16 years old, her true name was Susan, and she came from one of the IDP camps still existing in Ternate. Susan was malnourished even for all of her 16 years, and her education remained unsettled because of the unsettled nature of her life. She had to split her earnings three-ways - with the owner of the *warung* where she normally waited, and her "keeper", a man who works in Ternate airport, and drives her to and from clients' hotels.

So, the stories were the same. Whether they came from Kendiri or Karawang, Tomohon or Toraja; whether they were married or not; whether they went to school and had a senior high school diploma; whether they were 14 or 34; it was compelling

circumstances at home, sweet talking recruiters, tough and deceptive agents - all made up for their tales of woe. Most of them were earning much less than they were promised, had contracted significant debts, and were forced into compromising circumstances in order to buy freedom, or its hope. All of them suffered from stress and trauma related disorders - expressed through rebellion, grief or simple resignation. Most of them had addictions - alcohol and nicotine (and may be, even, hard drugs). I would not know how many of them were infected with sexually transmitted infections and HIV, but many had beer bellies and smokers' cough. They got blamed for creating disharmony in families, breaking up marriages and being bad influence on young Papuan women. Meanwhile, a whole lot of people and agencies - starting from beer manufacturers to placement agencies and bar owners to municipalities earned substantial revenues at their expense.

Meet the girls in the "other room" before they are turned into cold, hard statistics relating to place of origin, age groups, number of months spent in bars, marital status and some such other indexes that academicians and government officials use to classify them.

## Chapter - I

### “A Drift of Smoke”:

#### Background to the Assessment

When ACILS and ICMC, with the support of USAID, started working on the issue of human trafficking in Indonesia in 2001, little was known about trafficking in this country other than the problems of migrant Indonesian workers in Malaysia, Singapore and some of the Arab countries. Over the years, domestic trafficking gained increasing recognition, and over and above international destinations, Jakarta, Surabaya, Medan and Riau Islands (especially Batam) gained notoriety as domestic destination areas for traffickers. The condition of boys trafficked to “jermals” or fishing platforms in North Sumatra caught international imagination because of its extreme effects on their young bodies and minds. In the last few years, there has been increasing evidence of Papua emerging as a popular domestic destination with traffickers.

In 2001, in a research report called “Migration Patterns of Sex Workers in Irian Jaya” PATH Indonesia found two prominent trends emerging in relation to the origins of sex workers. It said, “Brothel based sex workers for the most part (of Papua) came from the predominantly Muslim provinces of Eastern Java whereas entertainment based workers tended to originate from Christian province of Manado (*sic*) in Northern Sulawesi.” (PATH Jakarta, January 2001). In 2003, Rosenberg wrote that NGOs in North Sulawesi province reported a large number of girls being sent to Papua to provide sexual services for the many migrant workers in local mining companies (Rosenberg, 2003). There were incidental press reports that pointed to women from North Sulawesi being forced into prostitution in Papua. In August 2003, *Tabloid Komentor*, Manado Post reported that police rescued 23 North Sulawesi women from Timika, Sorong, Jayapura, Biak and Serui (Liputan6.com, *Tabloid Komentor*, Manado Post). In 2004, *Kerukunan Keluarga Kawanua* in Timika rescued 13 trafficking victims from North Sulawesi ([www.tempointeraktif.com](http://www.tempointeraktif.com)). From one of the ICMC partners in North Sulawesi, *Pusat Informasi Dan Perlindungan Perempuan Dan Anak* (PIPPA), it was learnt that out of the 35

women staying in their shelters between 2002 and 2005, 22 returned from Papua (Daftar Korban Trafiking, PIPPA, 2005).

Because of the nature of Papua's demography and economy, it has emerged as an attractive destination for migrants from other parts of Indonesia – particularly from East Java, Maluku and North Sulawesi. Evidence points to Papua's pre-eminence as a destination for migrants – and not so much of a source or transit place, though there are some claims that some Papuan women migrate to the Philippines.

For many reasons, trafficking follows hand in hand with migration when the potential migrants are misled into coercive and exploitative life situations. Factors leading to trafficking could be poverty and desperation, lack of access to job markets, lack of transparency on the part of employers' agents/recruiters/middlemen, local administrations' apathy to the plight of migrants - or "aliens", as they are sometimes considered to be.

Alerted by these reports and other anecdotal evidences, late in August 2005, ICMC requested USAID Jakarta to support an assessment of trafficking in women and children to Papua. Once USAID agreed, the assessment was carried out between August 28 and September 17, 2005 by the ICMC field team. In the following pages, a report is being presented of the findings, and ICMC's recommendations made after discussions with stakeholders in Papua and Jakarta.

## Chapter - II

### “Preparing for the Voyage”:

#### Objectives and Methodology

The purpose of this assessment was to start the process of creating an enabling environment in order to prevent trafficking of women and children in the Indonesian provinces of Papua and Irian Jaya Barat.

#### Objectives

The main objectives were that:

- All communities vulnerable to trafficking of women and children to Papua and in Papua will be identified for future interventions;
- The nature of trafficking to Papua will become clearer (and not only anecdotal);
- There will be greater insight to the level of awareness and concern of the local administration and the Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) about trafficking to Papua;
- There will be clarity about what international donors and Inter-Governmental Organizations (IGOs) are thinking / doing about the issue;
- And finally, potential partners for counter-trafficking interventions in Papua will be identified.

The methodology adopted for the assessment was a three stage one. In the first phase, a review of existing documents was carried out to understand the nature and extent of migration to Papua, with a focus on trafficking related issues. For the review of literature, the assessment team studied a wide range of documents, including statistical reports, websites, news articles, papers and publications.

#### The Field Assessment

Following this phase of document review, field assessment was conducted to probe further into information available from the document review, and look for explanations

to a number of questions that arose. The questions could be classified under the following broad headings:

1. Are there migration/trafficking from Papua? If so, who migrate, and where?
2. What causes migration to Papua?
3. How are local population and the migrants located - both spatially and occupationally?
4. How do the indigenous Papuan's view the migrants assuming that there are two sets of migrants - the economically better offs (mainly in Government services and in trade and commerce), and the poor? Is there any "stereo-typing" of the migrants - like "All migrants are anti-socials" or "Migrant girls disrupt our family lives"?
5. The nature and the extent of trafficking in persons to Papua
6. Why does trafficking to Papua take place?
7. Living conditions of trafficked persons;
8. Living conditions in "migrant colonies";
9. Working conditions of trafficked persons;
10. Role of Administration:
11. Role of Private Sector / Trans-nationals:
12. Position of CSOs vis-à-vis migration and trafficking?
13. International Donor / Inter-Governmental Organization Activities:
14. Perceptions in Jakarta among RI Ministries / Departments:

*Some of the locations where the Field Study was carried out:*

Jayapura and Sorong are the provincial capitals of Papua and West Irian Jaya respectively. In addition, Sorong is a seaport, reported by many to be the main entry point of migrants. Timika is the gateway city to the Freeport mines, and has significant migrant activities. Kota Biak was once developed as a tourist centre and is still a center for tourism in Papua. Merauke in the southern coast of Papua and Fak Fak in West Irian Jaya are other places where migrant concentration is reported.

The field study covered Jayapura, Merauke and its close neighbor Mappi, Timika, Biak and Sorong. A trip was made to Ternate in Northern Maluku as it was understood that it served as a transit point between Papua and Eastern Java on one hand, and North Sulawesi on the other.

*Duration of Field Study*

The assessment team interviewed over a hundred key informants spread over Jayapura (28 August - 3 September 2005), Merauke (28 August - 3 September 2005), Timika (4-8 September 2005), Sorong (4-9 September 2005), Biak (9-14 September 2005), and Ternate (14 - 17 September 2005). Information was collected from the following key informants:

**Table 1: Number of Respondents by Different Groups of Key Informants**

No	Key Informant classification	Number of Key Informants interviewed
1	Women in prostitution (in Lokalisasi, Bars, Massage Parlors, etc) (See note below for justification)	54
2	Local Governments (Dinas PP, Dinas Sosial, Disnaker, Dinas Kesehatan, Dinas Pendapatan Daerah)	20
3	Police	10
4	NGOs	25
5	University Women's Study Centre	1
6	Komisi Penanggulangan AIDS (AIDS Prevention Commission)	2
7	International NGOs	3
	<b>Total</b>	<b>115</b>

*Note: Who is a trafficked person in the Papuan Context?*

During the assessment it was understood that the women migrants to Papua could be classified into three broad groups. The first would be those who got what they migrated for - a moderately well paid job, security and reasonable living conditions. Most of the women belonging to this group could be found working in factories and offices such as fish canning, plywood etc. They are paid well, have regular working hours, live in rented premises outside the factory / office, and were picked up and dropped back by

company's transport. The second group would be less fortunate. They worked for lower salaries, often had debts to repay, had long working hours and lived on the premises. Their mobility was not severely restricted nor were they, in general, sexually exploited (consensual sexual relationship with colleagues excepted). This group could be found working in supermarkets, shops, and the numerous eateries – both *Rumah Makans* (restaurants) as well as *warungs* (roadside footstalls). Except for the fact that most of the girls working in eateries came from the regions where the owner belonged to, not much information could be gathered on how they got there, and if at all they were trafficked. The third group were those who carried a debt the moment they left their homes, got paid little or nothing, had their mobility severely restricted, and were forced into sexually exploitative situations. In the worst form of servitude, they were traded from one establishment to another till they lost their will to return to normal life. Such women were normally found in *lokalisasi* (red light areas), karaoke bars, and massage parlors.

Because of the time frame within which the team had to complete the assessment, more effort was given to find evidences of trafficking among women from the last group. It is quite possible that the assessment team may have missed cases of trafficking among workers in shops and eateries.

#### Stakeholders' Meetings

In the final phase of the assessment, two stakeholders' meetings were held in Jayapura (26 - 27 September 2005) and Sorong (30 September - 1 October 2005). In these meetings, the assessment team first presented a framework of trafficking, followed by the main findings of the field study. Subsequently, the participants - 15 in Jayapura and 14 in Sorong, discussed the findings, provided additional information and worked on likely plans of counter-trafficking initiatives in the two provinces.

### Chapter - III

#### "Treasure Island in the East":

##### Background to Papua

###### History

Papuans, the native people of West Papua and Papua New Guinea area Pacific Melanesian people. They have inhabited the island of Papua and New Guinea, and the Moluccas for over 40,000 years and developed diverse cultures and languages. . Indigenous people of Papua belong to approximately 250 tribes, where each has its own culture and language. There are over 300 languages and two hundred additional dialects in the West Papua alone ([www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/nationmaster](http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/nationmaster)). There are different opinions as to which colonial power landed first on the island. Some say it was the Portuguese ([www.abc.net.au](http://www.abc.net.au) & [www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/nationmaster](http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/nationmaster)), while others claim that it was the Spaniard Ynigo Ortiz de Retes who stumbled upon it ([www.irja.org](http://www.irja.org)).

When the Dutch set up their colonial empire in the region, the missionaries came with them. They first landed in the Birdhead area (Biak and Serui) and set up their schools there. This explains why the people of these two islands are known to be the most educated among native Papuans (McGibbon, 2002). The Dutch recognized Indonesia's Independence in 1949, but they retained the western part of Papua, although they agreed to discuss the Indonesian claim for Papua within one year.

During the post World War II era of de-colonization, the Dutch were subject to increasing international pressure to give up the region. However, they were preparing to convert the territory into an independent state. Indonesians, on the other hand, believed that as the region was a part of the earlier Dutch colony, and claimed it to be part of Indonesia. In 1962 the Indonesian and the Dutch signed the *New York Agreement* to end dispute and Republic of Indonesia became the caretaker of Papua as Papuans prepared for the process of self-determination ([www.asiasource.org](http://www.asiasource.org)).

In 1969, a referendum for self determination was held under the supervision of the United Nations. An electoral college formed of 1,025 Papuans voted to stay with Indonesia. Following the referendum, this region became the 26<sup>th</sup> province of Republic of Indonesia, and was named Irian Jaya.

#### Special Autonomy (Otonomi Khusus)

During the 30 years that followed the Act of Free Choice, economic development in Papua was slow. This period was also characterized by large scale migration from Java to Papua that was backed by the government, and contracting of large mining leases in Papua to transnational corporations. A majority of the indigenous Papuan lived below the poverty line, and nearly all businesspersons and entrepreneurs were migrants. A Special Autonomy Bill was passed in 2001 with the objective of “the empowerment of the indigenous people to enable them to participate significantly in the business sector becomes an important focus” of *Otsus* (*Otonomi Khusus* meaning Special Autonomy). One of aims of the Bill is to create a middle class of 20% of Papuans who might be characterized as being relatively young, having a strong work ethos and entrepreneurial spirit, honest, creative and innovative.

#### Migration to Papua

Migration from Java to Papua started in the 70s through transmigration programs organized by the government and sponsored by the World Bank. It was followed by spontaneous migration from Java and Sulawesi later in the 80s-90s. Most trans-migrants were relocated in large settlements along the Indonesia-PNG border, near the towns of Jayapura and Merauke ([www.cs.utexas.edu](http://www.cs.utexas.edu)). Migration is still continuing - though at a slower rate than before as people still see Papua as a “Land of Opportunities” because of its vast natural resources and sparse population.

The distribution of migrants and Papuan people vary across provinces. The early trans-migrants lived in the interior where the government provided them with residential and agricultural land - usually segregated from areas inhabited by native Papuans. Migrants, who came later and on their own, do not live in areas separated from the

native Papuans. In coastal areas, migrants and local population are distributed almost 50:50. However, in some areas such as Timika, there are more migrants than local population. This segregation has been partly responsible for the result that the indigenous Papuans see migrants as people that exploit their natural resources and their kin. The migrants are always called “migrants” (*pendatang*) no matter how long they have lived in Papua. One can live in Papua for two generations and still be called a “*pendatang*”.

*The Magnitude of Migration and Its Effects*

Out of a total population of Papua of 2,308,719 in 2001, a little over 40% were estimated to be migrants from other provinces. The total population of the two provinces of Papua and West Irian Jaya is expected to grow to 2,646,489 by 2005 – about 15% in 4 years.

**Table 3: Population Projection by Regency / Municipality  
2001 to 2005**

<b>Regency / Municipality</b>	<b>Population 2001</b>	<b>Population 2005 (estimated)</b>	<b>Projected 4-year growth rate (%)</b>
<i>Province Papua - North East</i>			
Kota Jayapura	177,718	192,791	8.5
Jayapura	95,991	116,980	21.9
Keeoram	40,559	49,428	21.9
Sarmi	39,151	47,712	21.9
<i>Province Papua - Central Highlands</i>			
Puncak Jaya	82,637	97,176	17.6
Tolikara	51,391	54,899	6.8
Jayawijaya	215,733	230,463	6.8
Yahukimo	104,987	112,156	6.8
Pengunungan Bintang	52,163	55,725	6.8
<i>Province Papua - Southern Plains</i>			
Merauke	162,057	180,928	11.6
Boven Digoel	36,391	40,629	11.6
Mappi	64,826	72,375	11.6
Asmat	63,964	71,413	11.6
<i>Province Papua - Western</i>			
Mimika	99,658	150,754	51.3
Paniai	98,740	102,902	4.2
Waropen	22,577	24,003	6.3
Nabire	131,529	157,405	19.7
Yapen Waropen	60,275	64,081	6.3
Biak Numfor	113,394	110,602	-2.5
Supiori	12,119 (2003)	12,632	8.4 (projected)
<b>Regency / Municipality</b>	<b>Population 2001</b>	<b>Population 2005 (estimated)</b>	<b>4-year growth rate (%)</b>
Province West			

Irian Jaya - Bird's Head			
Raja Ampat	27,611	30,981	12.2
Kota Sorong	165,681	204,875	23.6
Sorong	66,160	74,234	12.2
Sorong Selatan	49,373	55,398	12.2
Teluk Bintuni	35,311	41,756	18.3
Manokwari	141,250	167,035	18.3
Teluk Wondama	26,960	31,881	18.3
<i>Province Irian Jaya - South</i>			
Fakfak	53,044	61,160	15.3
Kaimana	29,588	34,115	15.3

Source: Derived from Table 3.1.13 Badan Pusat Statistik, Irian Jaya, Jayapura  
[www.irja.bps.go.id](http://www.irja.bps.go.id)

The projected high population growth rates for areas close to Jayapura, Mimika, Nabire, and the whole of West Irian Jaya appear largely to be result of migration. The influx of migrants is expected to continue.

#### Migration and poverty

According to Irian Jaya office of Badan Pusat Statistik of the Government of Indonesia <http://irja.bps.go.id?LEFT%20FRAME/DATA%KEMISKINAN/Tabel%20KEMISKINAN...> an estimated 966,800 people lived below the poverty line in 2004 in the two Papuan provinces. This was an absolute increase of 49,900 poor people over the count of 2003. However, the table also claimed that the proportion of poor people in the general population dropped by 0.33 percentage points - from 39.02 in 2003 to 38.69 in 2004. (Table 4)

**Table 4: Number and Percentage of Poor People in the Districts and Municipalities of Papua During Years 2003 and 2004**

District/ Municipality	Number of people living below poverty line in 2003	% of poor people to total population in 2003	Number of people living below poverty line in 2004	% of poor people to total population in 2004
<i>District</i>				
Merauke	47,400	28.07	43,800	28.15
Jayawijaya	84,800	45.55	96,700	46.21
Jayapura	27,900	29.60	26,000	28.39
Nabire	68,500	45.06	69,000	43.01
Fak Fak	22,500	38.99	21,900	37.43
Sorong	16,900	29.54	21,600	33.15
Manokwari	77,800	52.07	74,800	49.55
Yapen Waropen	30,200	43.27	30,000	42.62
Biak Numfor	52,300	42.27	30,000	44.87
Paniai	50,800	50.31	54,600	49.09
Puncak Jaya	34,900	53.47	55,800	50.67
Mimika	38,000	32.75	38,800	30.75
Boven Digoel	11,200	29.40	8,900	28.76
Mappi	20,200	29.86	19,600	29.97
Asmat	19,900	31.74	19,200	31.37
Yahukimo	51,800	46.93	61,900	45.74
Pegunungan Bintang	27,500	49.20	42,000	47.85
Tolikara	18,700	46.48	19,700	45.15
Sarmi	10,600	29.13	8,700	27.88
Keeoram	9,500	27.24	9,800	26.16
Kaimana	13,500	37.52	12,900	35.17
Sorong Selatan	11,600	28.81	13,800	28.95
Raja Ampat	7,600	30.38	9.2	31.73
Teluk Bintuni	26,500	57.47	25,200	53.70
T. Wondama	11,300	56.75	11,100	54.94
Waropen	9,600	44.83	9,500	44.48
Supiori	NA		Na	
<i>Municipality</i>				
Jayapura	45,100	23.48	45.8	22.98
Sorong	70,200	38.74	66,000	36.08

*Source:* Jumlah dan Persentase Penduduk Miskin dan Garis Kemiskinan Menurut Kabupaten/Kota Provinsi Papua Tahun 2003 – 2004 ([www.irja.bps.go.id](http://www.irja.bps.go.id))

Further analysis of the data presented in Table 4 shows interesting regional variations.

**Table 5: Population and Number of Poor People in the Districts and Municipalities of Papua During Years 2003 and 2004**

District / Municipality	Estimated population 2003 ('000)	Estimated population 2004 ('000)	Net increase in estimated population ('000)	Estimated number of poor people in 2003 ('000)	Estimated number of poor people in 2004 ('000)	Net increase in number of poor people ('000)
<i>Province - West Irian Jaya</i>						
Kota Sorong	181.2	182.9	1.7	70.2	66.0	(4.2)
Manokwari	149.4	150.9	1.5	77.8	74.8	(3.0)
Fak Fak	57.7	58.5	0.8	22.5	21.9	(0.6)
Kaimana	36.0	36.7	0.7	13.5	12.9	(0.6)
T. Bintuni	46.1	46.9	0.8	26.5	25.2	(1.3)
T. Wondama	19.9	20.2	0.3	11.3	11.1	(0.2)
<i>Sub-total (1)</i>			<b>5.8</b>			<b>(9.9)</b>
Sorong	57.2	65.2	8.0	16.9	21.6	4.7
Sorong Selatan	40.3	47.7	7.4	11.6	13.8	2.2
Raja Ampat	25.0	29.3	4.3	7.6	9.2	1.6
<i>Sub-total (2)</i>			<b>19.7</b>			<b>9.5</b>
Total West Irian Jaya			<b>25.5</b>			<b>(0.4)</b>
<i>Province - Papua</i>						
Y. Waropen	69.8	70.4	0.6	30.2	30.0	(0.2)
Puncak Jaya	65.3	110.1	44.8	34.9	55.8	20.9
P. Bintang	55.9	87.8	31.9	27.5	42.0	14.5
Yahukimo	110.4	135.3	24.9	51.8	61.9	10.1
Jayawijaya	186.2	209.3	23.1	84.8	96.7	11.9
Paniai	101.0	111.2	10.2	38.0	38.8	0.8
Mimika	116.0	126.2	10.2	38.0	38.8	0.8
Nabire	152.0	160.0	8.0	68.5	69.0	0.5
Tolikara	40.2	43.6	3.4	18.7	19.7	1.0
Keeoram	34.9	37.5	2.6	9.5	9.8	0.3
<i>Sub-total (1)</i>			<b>159.7</b>			<b>63.6</b>

District / Municipality	Estimated population 2003 ('000)	Estimated population 2004 ('000)	Net increase in estimated population ('000)	Estimated number of poor people in 2003 ('000)	Estimated number of poor people in 2004 ('000)	Net increase in number of poor people ('000)
Merauke	168.9	156.6	(13.9)	47.4	43.8	(3.6)
Biak Numfor	123.7	112.3	(11.4)	52.3	50.4	(1.9)
Boven Digoel	38.1	30.9	(7.2)	11.2	8.9	(2.3)
Sarmi	36.4	31.2	(4.2)	10.6	8.7	(1.9)
Jayapura	94.2	91.6	(2.6)	27.9	26.0	(1.9)
Mappi	67.6	65.4	(2.2)	20.2	19.6	(0.6)
Asmat	62.7	61.2	(1.5)	19.9	19.2	(0.7)
Waropen	21.4	21.3	(0.1)	9.6	9.5	(0.1)
Kota Jayapura	192.1	182.9	(9.2)	45.1	45.8	0.7
<i>Sub-total (2)</i>			<b>(52.3)</b>			<b>(12.3)</b>
<i>Total Papua</i>			<b>107.4</b>			<b>51.3</b>

In West Irian Jaya province, though population increased by 25,500 persons, there was a net decrease of approximately 400 in the number of persons living below the poverty line. Though this figure is not significant by itself, and could arise because of enumeration or computational errors, there is a possibility that the economy has improved in this province. Further analysis shows that in five districts and a municipality the absolute numbers of poor people have actually gone down in spite of a slight increase in total population; whereas in three districts close to Sorong Municipality, both absolute population and number of poor people have increased. One explanation of this could be that poor people migrated closer to Sorong municipality in order to access growing opportunities in the young and prosperous provincial capital. A spokesperson of the Women's Empowerment Bureau of Sorong district said that a large majority of the recent migrants were women from Ambon, Manado and Java. According to her, they lived in boarding houses falling under the kabupaten's jurisdiction and "worked as domestic maids". That some of them also engaged in street prostitution in Kota Sorong in the evenings cannot be entirely ruled out. There is also indication that these three districts have attracted investors / more affluent population from outside the province.

Conversely, the province of Papua shows a significantly different pattern. Here, one finds distinctly two groups of districts and municipalities – the first showing increases in population as well as in the number of poor persons; and the other displaying a decline in both. The exceptions are Jayapura Municipality where the number of poor people has increased in spite of a marginal decrease in population; and district Yapen Waropen that shows a decrease in poor people in spite of a slight population increase. On the whole, the net increase of poor persons in Papua province is 51,300 – a figure close to the net increase in poor people in the Indonesian part of the island of Papua and New Guinea. The increase of number of poor people in Papua province is mainly contributed to by the four kabupatens of Puncak Jaya, Pongkor, Puncak Mutiara, Jayawijaya and Yahukimo – which also account for the largest increases in generic population. Is it possible that large numbers of people, including the poor, migrated to these kabupatens in search of new opportunities? This might look plausible when it is further seen that some of the previously prominent kabupatens like Merauke and Biak Numfor lost population during the year – a population comprising more of investors / non-poor. It may be just a coincidence that all these four kabupatens that attracted large-scale in-migration are located on the mountainous ridge that runs east to west in Papua province.

The second inference is that the first wave trans-migrants who were settled near Jayapura, north of Merauke, and along the southern plains stretching west from Merauke through Mappi and Asmat up to Fak Fak are among the poor on the move – abandoning agricultural activities in favour of logging and mining (both probably illegal) in the mountainous region in the interior. A source in DISNAKER in Sorong told us that “Trans-migrants were supposed to work on their land – but many of them are now moving into industry and other occupations also”. The fact that at least two women in prostitution in Eci (near Merauke), recorded as Javanese by the local authorities, reported that they were born in Merauke in the early 1980s could be a clue to the fact that all is not well with the first wave trans-migrants sent forcibly to Papua in the 1970s. It is quite possible that some of their women have taken to / been trafficked into prostitution in other parts of Papua (Daftarnama Pekerja Seks Komersial Di Kecamatan Assu / Eci). This surely opens up an interesting area for further investigation. Could some of the “non-Papuan” street prostitutes who are significant in numbers in Jayapura,

Sorong and Merauke actually be the daughters of the first wave trans-migrants from Java?

Migration and employment

The overall effect of the arrival of migrant has been to limit opportunities for employment of Papuans in private sector activities. These are the common occupations for Papuans and Non-Papuans:

**Table 6: Occupational Distribution**

<b>PAPUANS</b>	<b>NON-PAPUANS</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Unskilled labors</li> <li>• Farmers</li> <li>• Street vendors and small traders</li> <li>• Street commercial sex workers (PSJ)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Skilled labors</li> <li>• High-ranked government officials</li> <li>• Traders</li> <li>• Bar owners, masseurs, commercial sex workers at localizations/bars/hotels</li> </ul>

The following table is an example of how skewed are the employment patterns between Papuans, and migrants.

**Table 7: Distribution of Employees by Origin in Commercial Establishments in Kota Sorong (July 2004)**

Type of establishment	No. of establishments surveyed	Total no. of employees	Papuan Females	Papuan Males	<b>Total Papuan</b>	Non-Papuan Females	Non-Papuan Males	<b>Total non-Papuans</b>
Manufacturing	13	1,403	12	351	<b>363</b>	78	962	<b>1,040</b>
Commercial	8	110	1	11	<b>12</b>	40	58	<b>98</b>
Other non-service	4	106	3	38	<b>41</b>	18	47	<b>65</b>
Shops and supermarkets	14	308	12	25	<b>37</b>	164	107	<b>271</b>
Entertainment establishments	17	314	1	12	<b>13</b>	255	46	<b>301</b>
Restaurants and eating houses	4	53	1	8	<b>9</b>	27	17	<b>44</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>2,294</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>445</b>	<b>475</b>	<b>582</b>	<b>1,237</b>	<b>1,819</b>

Source: Dinas Tenaga Kerja Kota Sorong, 2004

In terms of employment, certain patterns can be observed. Out of a total number of 2,294 persons surveyed in 60 establishments of Sorong Municipality, 79% were non-Papuans. Out of the number of Papuan employed, only 30 (a little over 6%) were women. Among non-Papuans employees, 32% were women. However, a very clear gendered pattern can be seen in the employment opportunities of non-Papuan women.

In the higher end of jobs - like in factories, offices and other non-service sector establishments, men (88%) by far outnumbered women. However, scanning down the ladder to the service sector, women's employment rises to 60% in shops and eating houses; and to 81% in places of entertainment. This clearly indicates that that employment of women was channeled to the service sectors.

One notable feature was the sparse presence of Papuan women in almost all types of private establishments. Various explanations were offered to justify this phenomenon - starting from "Papuan women being culturally shy of seeking employment outside the government", to being "un-smart and unattractive", to "Non-Papuan employers

preferring to employ women from their own places of origin". Probably, this question merits deeper investigation.

Migration and health:

West Irian Jaya and Papua have the highest incidence of HIV in Indonesia. AIDS was first detected in Papua in 1992. More and more young people are migrating to towns in search of education and employment, and many girls who are still students are taking to prostitution. Some sources claim that over 90% of the street based prostitutes of Jayapura are Papuan women.

Some reports from the Voluntary Counseling and Testing (VCT) Centre in Merauke make interesting reading. Out of a total of 1,002 persons tested during the period 1 January to 31 July 2005, only 17.5% were men and the rest women. However, men showed a much higher rate of infection (18.54%) compared to women (4.28%). (Table 8)

**Table 8: Incidence of HIV by Sex**

Sex	Number Tested	Number HIV +	Percentage HIV +
Male	178	33	18.54
Female	817	35	4.28
Sex unknown	7	1	14.29
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,002</b>	<b>69</b>	<b>6.90</b>

Source: Voluntary Counseling and Testing Centre, Kabupaten Merauke

By occupational groups, housewives (3.09%) and women in prostitution (3.59%) had the lowest infection rates. Laborers (37.5%), Private Sector employees (17.78%), members of TNI / Police force (16.67%), and students of schools of college (14.29%) showed much higher infection rates. (Table 9)

**Table 9: Incidence of HIV by Occupation**

Occupation	Number Tested	Number HIV +	Percentage HIV +
Housewife	259	8	3.09
Prostitutes	390	14	3.59
Sailors / Fishermen	12	1	8.33
Government employees	34	3	8.82
Farmers	176	16	9.09

School and College students	21	3	14.29
TNI / Police	12	2	16.67
Private Sector employees	45	8	17.78
Laborers	8	3	37.50
Occupation unknown	45	11	24.44
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,002</b>	<b>69</b>	<b>6.90</b>

Source: Voluntary Counseling and Testing Centre, Kabupaten Marauke

**Table 10: Incidence of HIV by Origin**

Place of Origin	Number Tested	Number HIV +	Percentage HIV +
Java	532	18	3.38
Papua	263	30	11.41
Sulawesi	113	5	4.42
Maluku	40	10	25.00
NTT	33	4	12.12
Other provinces	11	0	0
Other countries	2	1	50.00
Origin not disclosed	8	1	12.50
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,002</b>	<b>69</b>	<b>6.90</b>

Source: Voluntary Counseling and Testing Centre, Kabupaten Marauke

The largest number of people tested were originally from Java, followed by Papuans, people from Sulawesi, Maluku and the NTT. Those from Maluku (25%) and Papua (11.41%) showed the highest infection rates, and those from Java and Sulawesi, the lowest. (Table 10) Since the number of people from Java tested is far more than the number of women in prostitution, a question arises about who the so-called Javanese might be. One guess is that they are the first wave trans-migrants who have lived in Papua for a long time but not yet treated as Papuans. This also adds to the possibility that some of the Javan women in prostitution in Papua may in fact belong to the families of the first-wave trans-migrants.

#### Observations

Because of geo-political reasons, a significant degree of mobility is seen among the population of Papua. This mobility involves both in-migration and relocation – temporary and quasi-permanent, of Papuans and trans-migrants, for a plethora of

reasons. Some of its effects can be seen in employment and movement patterns. One of the outcomes is marginalization of Papuan women – both of ethnic as well as of trans-migrant origins. This can influence future patterns in trafficking of women and girls in Papua.

## Chapter - IV

### “Of Boats and Beer”:

#### Nature and Extent of Trafficking in Women in Papua

##### Remembering definitions

Before trying to describe the nature and scope of trafficking in Papua, it is important to go through definitions of trafficking once more.

The United Nations Protocol (Geneva, 2000) defines trafficking as “Recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation (in particular, labor and sexual exploitation).”

*Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. (United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children” passed in November 2000).*

In 2003, based on the above definition, ACILS/ICMC developed a framework for easy identification of cases of trafficking. The framework is described below.

**Trafficking on Women and Children is transferring them from their family support or other support system through:**

<b>Process</b>	<b>+</b>	<b>Means</b>	<b>+</b>	<b>Goal</b>
Recruitment Or Transportation Or Transferring or Harboring or Receiving	A N D	Threat Or Coercion Or Abduction Or Fraud Or Deceit	A N D	Prostitution Or Pornography Or Violence/Sexual Exploitation Or Forced labor/ unfair

		Or Deception Or The abuse of Power		wages / hazardous working conditions Or Slavery/Similar practices
1	+	1	+	1

If one condition from each of the three columns (Process + Means + Purpose) above is met, the end-result is trafficking. The *consent* of the victim of trafficking shall be *irrelevant* where any of the means above have been used. If children below 18 years of age are found being used for any of the purposes listed in the third column, they will be deemed to have been trafficked irrespective of *the use of any of the processes or means* described above. Nor will *consent* matter. This framework has been used by the Assessment Team to determine the nature and the extent of trafficking in women and children in Papua.

#### Sites for trafficking in Papua

The essential elements that define trafficking to Papua are recruitment by means of deception, transportation involving significant costs, and forcing women to sexually compromising situations through debt bondage. The assessment noted that women migrating to Papua with help of agents / brought to Papua by agents start with initial debts made up of their cost of transportation, and perhaps a little mobilization advance (overt – the would be migrant knows about these, and agrees to pay back from her earnings); and other charges and commissions (covert – not disclosed till much later, often very close to the end of the contracted period when she does not have a choice rather than signing another contract). Some are able to pay off their debts and escape the net, while some others get trapped. Some are in occupations that do not require sexual services to be provided. Some others are.

On the basis of the assessment it is possible to say that the highest proportion of trafficked women (and children) in Papua are found in places of entertainment (karaoke bars, discotheques and massage parlors) and in brothel areas. Children forced into prostitution were seen in *lokalisasi* (red light areas) and in street prostitution, but not so

extensively in other places of entertainment. All the 52 migrant women interviewed were deceived, though in different degrees, during recruitment; transported from one part of Indonesia to another; held in captivity / harbored through threat and coercion; and forced into sexually exploitative situations including prostitution. All of them were trafficked women (and girls) in the most classical sense of the term.

It is perhaps pertinent to mention a form of trafficking that is unique to Papua. Some women are promised partnership in eaglewood ('*gaharu*', a type of aromatic wood found in the Asmat region of Papua) businesses. Later, they find themselves becoming an instrument for barter of eaglewood. While they provide sexual service to "eaglewood hunters", the male pimp (Daddy) takes the eaglewood, and the women receive little to nothing in terms of compensation. The better the quality of the eaglewood, the longer she has to provide sexual services to the collector. Some women come on their own will; some with their agents. Those who come on their own are normally prostitutes in their previous town of residence ([www.kompas.com](http://www.kompas.com), 29th March 2004).

Women employees in shops and other service providing establishment often carry debts related to their joining expenses, some are forced to live on the premises and work long hours for low wages, but are not (normally) sexually exploited. For the purpose of this assessment, therefore, they get the benefit of doubt. An estimate of number of trafficked women in Papua has been made in the following sections.

*Estimates of numbers in lokalisasis and other sites of prostitution:* In the course of mapping of lokalisasis and other sites of prostitution in the 7 towns of Papua, an estimate of approximately 3,775 women in prostitution was arrived at. Out of these, the largest number of approximately 1,500 or 40% was based in karaoke bars and discotheques. Lokalisasis accounted for 28%, and Street prostitution for about 23% of the numbers – the balance 9% being found in massage parlors. Though Timika had the biggest *lokalisasi*, the largest number of prostitutes was to be found in Jayapura.

**Table 11: Estimated Number of Establishments  
And Women in Prostitution**

CITY	Brothel areas (Lokalisasi)		Mini bars		Massage Parlor		Street Prostitution	
	No. of locations	No. of women	No. of locations	No. of women	No. of locations	No. of women	No. of locations	No. of women
Sorong	1	219	22	313	5	58	5	<u>+ 360</u>
Mappi	1	98						
Jayapura	2	300	25	370	13	136	3	500
Biak	1	<u>+ 60</u>	7	50	10	<u>+ 50</u>		
Timika	1	400	9	110	10-15	100		
Fak fak			4	100				
Merauke	2		10		2	NA		
<b>Sub- total</b>	8	<b>1,077</b>	78	<b>1,494</b>	40-45	<b>344</b>	8	<u><b>+ 860</b></u>

**TOTAL = + 3775**

Source: ICMC Assessment Team August - September, 2005: Meetings with key informants.

*Estimate of number of trafficked women and girls in Papua*

It has been argued earlier that all women in mini-bars are trafficked women as they satisfy the all the three conditions set out in the ACILS/ICMC framework. The same conditions would apply to a majority of the women in *lokalisasi*. In the *lokalisasi* of Eci, 49 out of 61 women were there for four months or less - an indication that they were subject to similar contracts as their sisters in mini-bars. The table on the next page gives a rough estimate of the number of trafficked women in Papua.

**Table 12: Estimated Number of Trafficked Women and Girls in Papua**

Type of site	Estimated total number of women	Estimated % trafficked including girls below 18 years	Estimated number of trafficked women and girls
Mini bars	1,494	100%	1,494
Massage Parlors	344	100%	344
Localisasis	1,077	80%	862
Street prostitution	860	50%	430
<b>Total</b>	<b>3,775</b>	<b>83%</b>	<b>3,130 out of which 900 are child prostitutes</b>

Who are the traffickers?

In the case of Papua, essentially the traffickers are the owners of brothels, massage parlors, and places of entertainment such as discotheques and karaoke bars because they harbor trafficked women and girls, administer spurious contracts, and force the women into prostitution. Most traffickers are from outside Papua. The following exhibits will give some indication about their places of origin. Recruiters act as their agents.

**Exhibit A: Massage Parlor and Brothel Owners in Jayapura**

Place of Origin of Owners	Number of Establishment
Java	13 massage parlors
Java	3 <i>lokalisasis</i>

Source: Bina Mitra, Polres Kota Jayapura, 2005

**Exhibit B: Bar Owners in Jayapura**

Place of Origin of Owners	Number of Establishments
Makassar (South Sulawesi)	4
Toraja (South Sulawesi)	2
Manado (North Sulawesi)	4
Ambon (Maluku)	1
Kalimantan	1
Java	2
Batak (North Sumatera)	1
Palembang (South Sumatera)	1
Papua	4
China	4

Source: Bina Mitra, Polres Kota Jayapura, 2005

**Exhibit C: Bar owners in Timika**

Place of Origin of Owners	Number of Establishments
Manado (North Sulawesi)	2
Makassar (South Sulawesi)	2
Ternate (North Maluku)	2
Batak (North Sumatera)	1

*Routes used by traffickers*

Since 1995, Pelni operates 6 ships on its routes to Papua. All routes in which Pelni's ships ply are used for trafficking.

**Exhibit D: Routes on which PELNI Liners operate**

- Tanjung Priok- Semarang- Surabaya- Denpasar- Kupang- Ambon- Sorong
- Surabaya- Denpasar- Kupang- Ambon- Sorong- Biak- Jayapura
- Surabaya- Makassar- Sorong- Merauke
- Surabaya- Sorong- Biak- Jayapura
- Surabaya- Kalimantan Timur- Sorong- Biak- Jayapura
- Manado- Sorong- Merauke
- Manado- Sorong- Jayapura
- Manado- Jayapura- Timika
- Manado- Timika- Merauke- Eci
- Batam - Makassar - Sorong - Manokwari - Jayapura

Trafficked women are on every ship that arrives in Papua. Since there are not more than 4 to 6 women on any ship, each unknown to the other, they do not attract attention of either the ship's crew or the port authorities.

*Why are women trafficked to Papua?*

For time immemorial, globally ports and harbors have been major centers of prostitution. The earliest example is perhaps Alexandria on the eastern coast of Africa, which was known to be a port, full of attractive women worshipers of Aphrodite, where Greek fleets used to stop. The same pattern to the growth of prostitution has been observed throughout the world over the last 3,000 years or more. In the late 18<sup>th</sup> century, whenever a shipload of East India Company's English Writers (clerks) arrived in the port of Calcutta, the city based European prostitutes used to "invade" the docks.

Papua's long coastline is dotted with a large number of harbors of different sizes and importance. This is one reason that Papua has seen the growth of prostitution in Papua, and it is not just a contemporary phenomenon. The *Wakil Bupati* of Sorong called it the "City of Happiness" where sailors have been coming for many years now to get a few nights of pleasure. Even during our presence in Sorong, whenever a new ship docked at the harbor, we could see heightened level of activity among street based prostitutes near the docks, and also along the Berlin Wall (a wall along the sea front constructed to keep out high tide). Ships of foreign flags call in on many ports of Papua to carry minerals, timber and logs. Pelni has six passenger ships sailing the seas from Surabaya, Kupang, Makassar, Ternate, Bitung, and also ports as far as Batam and Medan to numerous harbors in Papua. In addition, foreign fishing trawlers are also known to dock in Papuan harbours from time to time.

The second and more recent development is the rapid increase in spending power of a section of the population even while the number of Papuans living below poverty continues to grow. This, like many other countries in South East Asia, has opened up an entertainment sector that is also linked with the promotion of beer consumption. According to information provided by Pemerintah Kota Sorong - Dinas Pendapatan Daerah (the Revenue Department of Sorong Municipality), its single largest tax revenue

was provided by tax on bars and restaurants. It is, therefore, in the interest of municipalities and district administrations to encourage growth of this sector. As there are more bars, more hostesses are required to promote their business. As later analysis will show, mere sale of beer cannot financially sustain the hostesses trafficked from primarily Java and Sulawesi, and so, they have to succumb to prostitution.

The third factor, connected with the second, but having a slightly different undertone, is the growing practice of providing services of prostitutes to men in key political and administrative positions in order to access favor. The high rate of incidence of HIV among government servants (Table 9) tends to support this contention. Such clients could be neither taken to lokalisasi nor provided with anything but “exclusive” women – those selected from amongst the prettiest bar hostesses and, at times, specially flown in from Manado. The Director of Sorong based NGO, LBH HAM, estimated that the likely cost of spending a night with a bar hostess is USD 100 at a minimum (\$ 20 is the booking fee to be paid to the bar, \$20 for a hotel room, \$30 to &50 for the woman, and another \$10 for drinks, transport and other incidentals). Sailors do not spend that kind of money for buying sex. So, it is more likely paid by those who need others to do them a favor that will be paid back many times over. This is also a reason why bar hostesses are normally brought on contracts ranging between four to six months, so that favors of the powerful do not have to be exchanged for “soiled goods”.

#### Profile of Trafficked Persons

Based on interviews and some data obtained from local government sources, almost all trafficked persons in Papua / IJB are women and girls from outside the island of Papua and New Guinea. A majority of them come from Java such as Madura, Banyuwangi, Malang and Karawang; Sulawesi such as Manado and Makassar; and some of them also are trafficked from Toraja and Ternate. Commonly, the women come from poor family backgrounds with low education. Women from North Sulawesi, however, have higher education levels than the average. Marital status varied from being single to married/separated – both with and without children. The age range varied from 14 to 50 years.

*Age:* It was not possible to get a proper distribution of age groups among the women trafficked to Papua. One estimate, which is based on data gathered from the shelter records of Pusat Informasi Dan Perlindungan Perempuan Dan Anak (PIPPA) in Manado, says that 10 of the 18 women who came back from Papua and stayed at the PIPPA shelter between 2004 and 2005 were below 18 years of age. That gives a proportion of children among prostitutes in Papua as high as 55%. On the contrary, based on a survey of mini-bars of Sorong by the KPP in June 2004, out of 57 women whose age was recorded, only one was below 18 years (See Table 13).

**Table 13: Distribution of Women by Age  
In Mini-bars and Massage Parlors in Sorong**

Age	Number of Women and Girls
<b>Mini bar:</b>	
< 18 years	1 (1.75%)
18-20 years	14 (24.6%)
21-25 years	29 (50.9%)
> 26 years	13 (22.8%)
<b>Total</b>	57 (100%)
<b>Massage Parlor:</b>	
> 26 years	12

Source: Kantor Pemberdayaan Perempuan Kota Sorong, 2004

However, there were 14 more women in the age group of 18 to 20 years. One of the major problems reported by the Police in processing trafficking cases is reported to be false certificates from kampong/kecamatan/kabupaten authorities inflating age of girls making them eligible to work. Since this practice is fairly widespread, we feel it may be safe to assume that at least half of these 14 women could have been below 18 years of age. That would give us a proportion of 14% children among the women in the bars and cafes of Papua. However, those working in Massage Parlors were normally older women – a fact also verified by our observation.

The ICMC team interviewed 52 women. Four of them (7.7%) were below 18 years of age. The team also saw some younger girls at bars and prostitution areas (Yobar, Merauke;

Belrusak, Merauke; Tanjung Elmo, Jayapura), but the pimps did not allow team members to approach them, let alone to interview them. The police and local NGO activists confirmed that there were a number of under-aged girls engaged in prostitution.

According to a source in Sorong Police, many sex workers from Manado were 16 - 17 years old and sold by their parents to pimps. After finishing their 4 months contracts they return home till their parents find another pimp to sell them to.

Based on the different sets of figures arrived at - varying from 1.75% to 55%, it may be safe to estimate that at least 12 to 15% of the women in the karaoke bars, cafes, and discotheques in the five towns of Papua are under-18, and therefore children. Using this proportion, we estimate that there are 175 to 225 child prostitutes in the places of entertainment in Papua.

According to key informants, the proportion of child prostitutes in *lokalisasi* and among street based prostitutes is certainly higher than that in the places of entertainment. The same sources claim that at least half the women on the streets are below 18 years of age. So, if it is argued that about a half of the street based prostitutes and a fourth of those in *lokalisasi* are children, the number of child prostitutes in Papua could be as high as 900. By definition, they all are victims of trafficking.

**Table 14: Education patterns of workers in Commercial Establishments in Sorong Municipality, June 2004**

Type of Establishment	No. of establishments surveyed	No. of employees	Level of education (%)				
			Sekolah Dasar (Elementary School)	Sekolah Menengah Pertama (Middle School)	Sekolah Menengah Atas (High School)	Diploma	Sarjana (Undergraduate degree)
Manufacturing	13	1,403 (100)	7	12	77	2	2
Commercial	8	110 (100)	11	17	63	6	3
Other non-Service	4	106 (100)	3	9	86	1	1
Shops and supermarkets	14	308 (100)	5	8	84	1	4
Bars and discotheques	17	314 (100)	4	28	68	-	-
Eating houses and restaurants	4	53 (100)	17	64	19	-	-

Source: Dinas Tenaga Kerja Kota Sorong, 2004

*Education:* Again, authentic figures are not available to make comments about this. Based on a survey report provided by Dinas Tenaga Kerja Kota Sorong for 2004, a majority (96%) of the women working in bars and discotheques had junior or senior high school education (Table 14). What is worth noting is that most of the women working in places of entertainment would otherwise qualify to find employment in manufacturing or other commercial establishments.

Generally, women from North Sulawesi were found to be comparatively more educated than their counterparts; and since they constituted more than half of the workers in karaoke bars and discotheques, it accounted for the overall observation that women working in bars were comparatively more educated than those in lokalisasi and massage parlors. Actually, we were quite surprised to find a few women who spoke good English among those held virtually prisoners in the karaoke bars and discotheques. On the other hand, the women in the *lokalisasi* were less educated.

There were different bits of information available about the street based prostitutes. According to some sources, many of these women were actually students in *skolahs* (schools) and *mahasiswas* (universities) in the towns they worked in. According to others, they came from poor rural families and had little education.

*Marital Status:* Similarly, no systematic data could be found about the marital status of trafficked women in the prostitution sites of Papua. What is significant to note is that the team encountered, especially in the karaoke bars, a fairly large proportion of women who were married and separated – some with children. Data from a lokalisasi in Eci near Merauke indicated that out of a total of 61 women staying there, 6 were unmarried, 3 had husbands, and the rest 52 were either widows or separated women (they recorded themselves as ones whose husbands ceased to exist).

*Origin:* About half the women in the karaoke bars and discotheques were from Manado, followed by West Java (13%), Central Java (9%), Jakarta (8%) and East Java (6%). Whereas Sulawesi accounted for 54% of the trafficked women, Java's share was 34%. Other significant places of origin were Jakarta and Ternate in Maluku. (See Table 15 on next page)

Based on a report from Eci *lokalisasi*, East Java emerges as the single biggest origin of women in *lokalisis* (47%), followed by West and Central Java. In Eci, there were at least two women who were born in Merauke, Papua in the early 1980s.

**Table 15: Distribution by Origin of Women Working in Mini-bars and Lokalisasi**

Origin	Number of women in mini bars in Sorong	Number of women in localisasi at Eci near Jayapura
North Sumatera	1 (1%)	-
Lampung	-	1 (1%)
West Java:		
• Bandung	2	1
• Cipanas	-	1
• Indramayu	-	7
• Karawang	9	-
• Other	4	1
<b>Total West Java</b>	<b>15 (13%)</b>	<b>10 (17%)</b>
East Java:		
• Banyuwangi	-	5
• Bojonegoro	-	1
• Jember	-	1
• Jombang	-	2
• Kediri	-	5
• Lamangan	-	1
• Lumajang	-	1
• Madura	-	2
• Madiun	1	-
• Surabaya	2	2
• Tuban	-	1
• Others	4	7
<b>Total East Java</b>	<b>7 (6%)</b>	<b>28 (47%)</b>
Central Java:		
• Purwoketo	1	-
• Klaten	1	-
• Solo	1	1
• Banjarnegara	3	-
• Pemalang	1	-
• Pati	3	2
• Jepara	-	2
• Other	-	6
<b>Total Central Java</b>	<b>10 (9%)</b>	<b>11 (18%)</b>
Java (not specified)	6 (5%)	1 (1%)
Jakarta	9 (8%)	-
Maluku:		
• Ternate	4	-
• Ambon	1	-
<b>Total Maluku</b>	<b>5 (4%)</b>	<b>-</b>
Sulawesi		
• U Pandang	3 (3%)	5
• Kendari	-	1
• Manado	56 (49%)	1
• Toraja	2 (2%)	-
<b>Total Sulawesi</b>	<b>61 (54%)</b>	<b>7 (12%)</b>
Merauke		2 (4%)
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>60</b>

Source: Kantor Pemberdayaan Perempuan Kota Sorong, 2004, and Daftarnama Pekerja Seks Komersial Di Kecamatan Ase / Eci

*Observation:* A connection could be seen between women from North Sulawesi with comparatively higher levels of education constituting the bulk of women trafficked to karaoke bars and discotheques, whereas women from Java with relatively less education were directed to lokalisasi and massage parlors. However, there is a need to desegregate Javanese women still further. It is quite possible that some of the daughters / sisters / wives of first generation trans-migrants were also a group vulnerable to trafficking to prostitution in Papua.

## Chapter V

### “Behind Locked Gates”:

#### Living and Working Conditions of Trafficked Women and Girls in Papua

The purpose of this chapter is not to examine forms of prostitution in Papua in detail, but to look at the living and working conditions of women and girls trafficked to Papua. What distinguishes one from the other is the extent of women’s ability to self-determine in prostitution, and the levels of freedom enjoyed by those trafficked and those not.

#### *Living conditions of trafficked persons*

There is much evidence that women trafficked to mini bars and massage parlors have very little choice over where and how they stay. Most of them are forced to live either on the premises, or in accommodation arranged by their employers. Four to eight women share a room, and sometimes, the owner / *mamasan* also sleep in the same room (for example, in Lido Bar, Biak) as the girls. The living premises are often ill ventilated (according to Arie of Fiesta, Sorong), hot and suffocating. The owner provides the meals, so there is limited variety or choice of menus. The costs of accommodation, food, electricity and supply of water for personal use (like ablutions and bath) is charged as expenses against salaries promised to them. One of the younger girls interviewed complained that she was scared to sleep in the night as *tikus besar* (big rats) ran all over the room she was allotted.

The women trafficked to mini bars and massage parlors also reported little or no mobility. Normally, they are simply not allowed to leave the premises unless they have a BL (booking *luar* - meaning a paid appointment for rendering sexual services to a client). Even a BL requires that the trafficked woman is dropped off at the hotel and collected by an escort from the bar. The women in the massage parlors provide sexual services on the premises.

Those women trafficked to provide sex to *gaharu* collectors are mostly forced to live in barracks with the men. This does not allow the women even the minimum of privacy

and modesty. Although these women are often allowed to go wherever they want to, they cannot do so because the villages are in the middle of nowhere.

Similar restrictions apply to the women in *lokalisasis* who are on short-term contracts. On the other hand, those who are older and decide to stay on enjoy more freedom. However, it is not easy to go out frequently from *lokalisasis* as more often than not these are located in isolated areas far from townships. In comparison, child prostitutes working from streets enjoy greater mobility. Some of them also lived in groups in boarding houses, and have the luxury of consuming food and drinks of their own choice. The relatively better off among them also indulge themselves with fashionable clothes and cheap cosmetics.

Some of the Christian women said that they are escorted to the church for a couple of hours on Sunday mornings. Once a significant amount of the “debt” had been worked off, some of the women are allowed to go out escorted by motorcycle drivers on the employers’ payrolls.

One of the side effects of this lack of mobility is higher expenses incurred on basic necessities like sanitary napkins, non-prescription medicines, telephone cards and cigarettes as all these were to be bought from “approved” suppliers at “higher than the market” prices. That, in turn, pushes up the debts by which they are bound to their traffickers.

One redeeming feature about the owners of places of entertainment is overtly displayed concern for the infants and children who are forced to come / live with their mothers. Irrespective of whether it increases the mothers’ debts, the children enjoy far more love (and care, perhaps) than they would have normally from their own paternal families back home. This is an area where women’s concern for their children is on its best display.

Working conditions of trafficked persons

Migrants at the higher end of employment are provided certain facilities by their employers. According to DISNAKER, oil and gas companies provide accommodation to their employees. For example, PetroChina has quarters for its workers. Smaller establishments do not provide housing. Their employees live in private messes and boarding houses. This differentiates them from trafficked women.

Though there are minimum wage stipulations in Papua – 750,000 Rupiahs per month for contractors' employees and 700,000 per month for others, service based establishments normally pay less than the stipulated minimum. According to DISNAKER sources, though the minimum wages are higher in Papua than in other provinces, cost of living is higher, too. One of the Labor Inspectors interviewed said, "Those (working) in bars are not regulated by local employment rules – they just come and go as they like".

Working conditions vary among types of establishment – mainly because of the nature of its basic business. Whereas *lokalisasi* and massage parlors operate almost round the clock – starting at 11 am and closing late in the night, bars and discotheques are open from 7 pm to 3 am (though 1am was the official closing time). Street based prostitutes start taking up their positions after sunset, and depending upon where they deliver their services, working hours could last till midnight or 1 am. Whereas sex is not an essential part of the services rendered by those working in bars and massage parlors, it is so for those working the streets or from *lokalisasi*. Some bars and massage parlors allow the women to refuse sexual services, whereas some others do not. We came across reports of coercive bar owners / mamasans who would not take "no" for an answer. However, we shall see later that women agree to provide sexual services more out of financial compulsions than fear of reprisal.

The insistence to use condoms also varied between types of establishments as well between establishments of the same type. In this sense, *lokalisasi* were more concerned about AIDS prevention than the bars and massage parlors. In *lokalisasi* such as Tanjung

Elmo (advertised as a 100% condom area) or Malanu, condom compliance had the support of pimps and brothel owners, making it easier for the individual woman to insist. Among bars and massage parlors, though there was awareness about AIDS and supplies of condoms provided by NGOs, official policy varied from establishment to establishment. For the women trafficked to bars, the situation was more vulnerable because mostly sexual transactions took place in a location of the client's choice - leaving the woman with little bargaining power. In some bars, there were VIP (karaoke) rooms, or a room at the back where a quick intercourse can take place.

What separated the trafficked women in the bars from the rest was by their compulsion to drink beer with their clients and be fondled and groped. In some bars, it was formalized through the imposition of a "booking fee" on the client which gave him a right to touch the woman companion's body in any way that he wished. We came across scenes in bars where a customer tried to kiss his partner forcibly on her mouth and she resisted, leading the customer to become violent and crush the woman against the sofa. The booking fee could vary from Rp 20,000 per hour to Rp 50,000 for the evening, but according to many accounts, this was the bar's earning and not the woman's. In other bars, there would be no "booking fee", but the hostess earned commission for each bottle of beer that got sold through her efforts. This often led to compromises in physical intimacy, and many cases of excessive drinking of beer by the trafficked women.

Perhaps, the story of Int will not be out of place here to give some idea about the working conditions of women recruited to provide sexual services in the *gaharu* business. Int, aged 26 years, is one of 600 prostitutes who work in Asmat. She reported that in November 2000, she was brought by H. Koffid and his wife from Merauke to collect *gaharu* (eaglewood). "The agent paid me transportation costs of 175,000 Rupiahs to go to Waganu in Asmat by ship. I worked in H. Koffid's bar for the first two months without receiving any money. H. Koffid's wife took all the money I got from clients in repayment of my debt. After a year, H. Koffid told me that the income from *gaharu* was decreasing and, therefore I must move to the forest in Etji. I was forced to collect *gaharu* from Asmat men as much as possible. I had to provide 4-5 days of sex for a kilogram of

good quality *gaharu*. Those who had less than a kilo *gaharu* would get 2-3 days service, depending on negotiations between the “daddy” and the collector. All the *gaharu* was taken by H Koffid. I only received a salary 2 million Rupiahs per month. In July 2002, I started falling ill and it was difficult to find medication for me in the forest. I was brought back to Merauke in a critical condition.” After medical tests, it was found that she was infected by HIV/AIDS.

(Source: Kompas article, “Gaharu, Pintu Neraka Kaum Asmat”, 10 November 2002)

Contracts and other Risks: The most intimidating feature in the context of women and girls trafficked to Papua is the *kontrak*. It is questionable how legal this piece of paper might be, but this is an instrument used extensively to keep women in perpetual bondage. The *kontrak* is normally for a given period of time (four months in majority of the cases), which makes it mandatory for a woman to serve her employer for that given period. If she wants to leave earlier, not only does she have to forego her right to a return passage, but also repay the expenses incurred by her traffickers in her transportation, accommodation, food and other expenses which are computed rather arbitrarily. In addition, there are hidden charges to cover the profits of the recruiter and the scout. We wonder if the women get to keep a copy of the *kontrak* as *none* of the women were able to / allowed to show the document.

This is also an instrument to keep adding to her indebtedness. Initially, the agent transfers his debts to the trafficker in Papua. In short, the agent collects a certain amount from the owner of the establishment, which covers her / his costs and profits as soon as s/he hands over the trafficked woman to an establishment. The local trafficker then goes on adding to the debt through fines (if the woman does not do what she is told), cost of treatment (in case she has to go to a doctor or spend a few days in a hospital – this is actually a double jeopardy as she gets simultaneously docked for absence from work), or even for breaking a glass tumbler accidentally. Kenny of Lido Bar, Biak was fined for getting drunk and abusive in the presence of a client. All these costs are computed at much above the market rates. According to some of the trafficked women, if the rate of

recovery is slow, or the “debts” are not fully liquidated by the end of the *kontrak*, then a usurious rate of interest is applied to the outstanding balance.

The biggest risk faced by trafficked girls in street prostitution is of being not paid, or even being raped and robbed as many of the sexual exchanges take place in dark and secluded spots because many of their clients do not have the ability to rent a hotel room. There are also indication of coercion by the pimp or the “base owner” (usually a *warung* where she parks herself during her prowls for a customer) in order to dissuade her from getting out of prostitution at her will.

## Chapter VI

### “Hovering Between Denial and Smugness”:

#### Perceptions About Trafficking of Women to Papua Among Government and Non-Government Organizations

This section of the report is devoted to perceptions of the government departments (GOs), inter-governmental organizations (IGOs) and non-government organizations – both local and international (NGOs and INGOs), to trafficking in Papua.

#### *Perceptions of Government Agencies in Papua*

We tried to get some understanding of how four main departments of the government which, it thought, will have some stake in the issue viewed trafficking of women to Papua. These were the departments of Women Empowerment, Social Issues, Manpower, and the Police. Some of the discussions are summarized below.

#### *Office of Women Empowerment (Kantor Pemberdayaan Perempuan or KPP in short):*

Structurally, the Office of Women’s Empowerment at the provincial level came under the Office of People’s Empowerment. The current thrust of the KPPs was on gender issues and domestic violence. Primarily, these monitor activities of housewives in the villages where, culturally, the women were under pressure. In Sorong, they were planning to build an integrated service center for distressed women. They requested more information about trafficking to help in building capacity of the Kantor staff, so that they could do more outreach work.

Kantor Pemberdayaan Perempuan (KPP) Kota Sorong was aware that trafficking of women takes place to Sorong, Jayapura and Timika. It maintained data on the number of women workers in bars, massage parlor and in lokalisasi. Officials of Timika KPP met with the provincial DPR in North Sulawesi to discuss the issue of under-age labour force being allowed to come to Papua. They felt that their intervention was responsible for the Perda the administration in North Sulawesi drew up in 2004 (Perda no.1 of 2004).

However, some of the persons interviewed regretted that trafficking was still a low priority issue in the province and there had been no “socialization” of trafficking issues. Unlike Papua, no representative of KPP West Irian Jaya was included in the Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) Training organized by the Women Empowerment Ministry. Nor have they handled any trafficking case because no one ever filed a report. KPP Sorong has no space for counseling. If a trafficked woman was brought to them they would have to hand her over to the police. The provincial KPP was in the process of drafting a Perda on trafficking.

*Dinas Sosial (DINSOS)*: Once every six months DINSOS Jayapura goes to the places of entertainment i.e. bars, massage parlors etc. to collect data on their women employees. According to Ibu Berta (DINSOS Official) “this (periodic) data collection is necessary because those women frequently migrate to other places”. However, DINSOS Jayapura has no activities for these women as they think that “the women would not have time for training” because of their busy schedules. They, instead, ran a program for street children in 2003. DINSOS in Timika, on the other hand, had offered a vocational training program to women in prostitution in 2003. However, their budget did not support setting up small business following the training, and therefore, the training was a failure.

Jayapura DINSOS has vocational training facilities for women engaging in prostitution in and around Dok IX.

*Provincial and District-level Manpower Offices (DISNAKER)*: DISNAKERS’ role is to mediate between industries and their employees. Law no. 7 of 1981 makes it mandatory for all employers to recruit through DISNAKER. Additionally, they have been vested with responsibilities of inspecting working conditions and settle disputes between employers and employees.

People leaving a province to go to another in search of a job have to get “Akad” – a permit from the authorities of the province of origin. An “Akad” can even be given by a village head. Those who have an Akad, and are 18 years or older, are entitled to a

“Yellow Card” issued by the receiving DISNAKER, which makes them eligible for employment. These are valid for 2 years after which those must be renewed. DISNAKERs are aware that often ID cards (or Akads) falsify the holders’ age. But since Labour Inspectors do not have investigative powers they are helpless to take any action. DISNAKER offices claim that most of the women arriving in Papua do not approach them, but seek jobs in supermarkets, karaoke bars, restaurants and construction sites through private channels. There are currently no PJTKIs in Sorong, but it is believed that the new oil company in Bintuni was expected to appoint a recruiting agent.

DISNAKER is supposed to be responsible for the safety of only those workers with “Yellow Card”. There are Special Police Investigators to look into criminal cases concerning labour. Those who do not have “Yellow Cards” must go to the Police in case they have problems. However, DISNAKERs claim that they try to help even those who do not have “Yellow Cards” - especially those employed in karaoke bars, massage parlors and shops. A statement that summarizes the role of DISNAKER with respect to trafficking in Papua is that they have “never heard of any case of trafficking”.

Police: In the same vain, the Police chief in Biak started by reassuring the Assessment Team that there was no *lokalisasi* in Kota Biak. Actually, there were two - even if the first one off Jl. Sudirman (close to Pelni’s Biak office) is very small and could escape detection, one can not miss “by chance” the *lokalisasi* behind Pasar Impres.

In Sorong, however, the police was not so confident. One informant said that “No trafficking in Sorong, but sometimes people bring women here on false promises.” Another admitted to some, but “not many cases of trafficking”. Finally, both of them confessed that they found it difficult to identify cases of trafficking, though “pimps” regularly registered prostitutes with the Police. (Note: We feel that the traffickers do this on purpose to scare the trafficked women - registering gives two messages, firstly that there is nothing illegal about their employment conditions; and secondly that if they try to run away the Police will arrest them on charges of dishonoring the contracts they had signed). She finally admitted that “(trafficked) women may find it difficult to talk to male officers.”

When discussions shifted to social issues, our informant admitted that Papuan women were marginalized, citing the example that when a new department was opened in Sorong Police, there were “only two applications from women” for filling up newly created positions.

There was only one Ruang Pelayanan Khusus (RPK) in Jayapura which carried an overload of domestic violence cases. Our respondent felt that RPKs must be “socialized” (their importance explained) to the male officers in the force.

It may not be out of place to mention that more than one government departments met in different towns, especially DISNAKER and the Police, repeatedly said that discotheques and karaoke bars were “good for local economy”. A senior people’s representative from Sorong was a step ahead of others when he justified all these and *lokalisis* by claiming that Sorong had been a “City of Happiness” for as long as he could remember.

### *The Papuan Civil Society*

*What constitutes the Civil Society in Papua:* Both Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces have local NGOs/CBOs. All the five towns covered had church-based organizations. They worked at par with local NGOs, only difference being that they are under church control. Local NGOs are often supported by international NGOs.

In Sorong, the local NGOs seem to have a harmonious relation with the government officers, although they admit that they do not get along quite well with the top level of the government. In Jayapura, we did not see the same kind of cooperation. The fact that in Sorong even government officers (for example the KPAD officers) do not receive support from their decision-making-superiors that make them turn to the local NGO and CBO friends who work on the same issues.

Lembaga Adat (Customary Institutions) is considered important in Papua / IJB. Some issues like marriage and land are strongly related to the customary laws. To the people, these institutions give advice on custom-related issues. One such institution in Sorong plays more than only the advisory role. They try to educate the people, and are building a boarding school currently for children of the Moi tribe.

In Papua / IJB, there are many organizations of similar background – for example, Kawanua Clan in Sorong, Makassar Clan and so forth. Incidentally, one of the groups (Kawanua Clan in Sorong) helped return a woman from Kawanua to her home. Gender and domestic violence, HIV & AIDS, Human Rights are some of the issues of importance to CSOs in Papua.

Somehow, there is yet no networking among academia-government-local NGOs-CBOs-INGOs. A representative of an international NGO claimed that his organization works with the government only and he feels no need to link up with other organizations.

The government (the provincial and district Governors and the Bupatis), the head of “adat” from “Dewan Adat Papua” (that oversees the Lembaga Masyarakat Adat), and heads of religious institutions (MUI for Moslems, the Archbishop for Catholics, and the Head of the Classis for Protestants) are considered to be the three pillars on which any future humanitarian intervention by a non-Government organization will have to stand.

*Perception of trafficking by the Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) in Papua:* Most of the CSOs felt that trafficking in women is not a serious issue for Papua yet. For them, there are much bigger issues like peace building, poverty, domestic violence, education of Papuan children and gender that need immediate attention. Yet, at the end of the stakeholders’ meetings many seemed to agree that, in the ultimate analysis, trafficking in women is a violation of women’s rights.

There was a point of view in Sorong that trafficking in Papua is migrants’ problem, because traffickers and their victims were migrants. To make matters worse, the trafficked women were “also prostitutes” who “disturbed our men” and “dressed in a

way that influence our women and destroy our culture". Many felt that "outsiders have jeopardized our lives more than helping". Other NGOs contest this view. They argued that they see it as human rights violation and it should not happen in their land.

LBH HAM in Sorong recently concluded a video-documentation on trafficking. They felt that their investigations showed that cases of trafficking were few in Papua. At the same time they also said that certain entertainment establishments in Sorong engaged girls who were "not even 14 years old". They also said that they had found out that women from Sorong were being taken to Bintuni to provide sex to higher officials of logging companies mostly foreigners. There were cases of some ships picking up prostitutes for during-the-voyage sex by the crew, and dropped them off at other ports, or in Sorong on their way back. LBH HAM admitted that lack of knowledge about the issue and resources prevented them from working on trafficking.

Some of the organizations met during the assessment showed interest and had potential to working on counter-trafficking. Some of them (from Biro PP and the Police) have already received counter- trafficking training in Java (Jakarta and Bogor). Some have helped in returning trafficked women and girls. Unfortunately, so far the assistance given to trafficked women and girls were case by case - often not even recognized as incidents of trafficking.

There are potential partners in each town of Papua who have interest and resources to work on trafficking, and some of them are networked not only among themselves, but also with organizations in North Sulawesi and Maluku Utara.

#### *Activities of International Donor Agencies and Inter-Governmental Organizations*

There are two different types of donor / inter-governmental organizations working in Papua. The first is the ones who have offices in Papua / IJB and implement their programs there with or without local partners (could be government, communities, and local NGOs). The second group is those that provide funding for local partners (both the

government and local NGOs), but they do not set up offices in the region. These organizations mostly work on HIV/AIDS and health issues. Some other issues have received attention in Papua are: education, gender (domestic violence) and human rights. The first group is as follow:

No	Name of Organization	Coverage Area	Types of issues
1	UNICEF		Education, HIV/AIDS
3	FHI	11 Kabupaten	HIV/AIDS, primary health care
4	WVI		Education, Livelihood
5	MSF-Belgium	Merauke	Health, HIV/AIDS
6	MDM-France	Jayapura (field office), Puncak Jaya District (working area)	HIV/AIDS, primary health care

The biggest presence of international NGO in Papua, in terms of coverage area and networking, is of Family Health International (FHI). Working in 11 districts & municipalities, FHI has 114 local NGO partners. Soon, they are going to extend their coverage area to Fak Fak. UNDP has recently concluded an assessment in 5 districts, and they are expected to come soon to work in the whole region. They are going to do community development and HIV/AIDS prevention.

A number of donors who sponsor activities in the region are: Bread For the World, CCFD (France), CIDA, Cordaid (The Netherlands), DAP (Australia), Ford Foundation, Global Fund (Geneva), HIVOS, ICMC (Survivors of Torture), KFB (Austria), Misereor, NOVIB, PATH, Peace Winds Japan, USAID, and WWF Indonesia & Australia.

Observations:

Introducing the issue of trafficking in Papua will require sustained efforts as the GOs are at best non-committal, and NGOs are currently preoccupied with other issues over and above being unfamiliar with even basic concepts of trafficking. There is also a serious lack of capacity for working on counter-trafficking interventions. Except for

International Organization for Migration (IOM), there is no other IGO or international donor who has an anti-trafficking agenda for Papua.

## Chapter VII:

### Clues, Conjectures and Conclusions

This assessment is like a patchwork quilt. Many disjointed pieces were knitted out of micro- and segmental data that made partial sense. However, when all the patches are stitched together, one starts seeing dismal patterns. In this chapter, an attempt is made to synthesize all the information collected. It will be honest to admit at this stage that a few leaps of conjecture had to be taken, based on clues thrown up by data or provided by key informants, in order to see the larger picture.

There are three major connections that create the trafficking situation in Papua unique requiring an equally creative solution. None of these factors apply to Papua alone, but it is their interplay that makes the situation so difficult to tackle. Though these have been mentioned in passing in different sections of the report, it is now being attempted to bring everything together in this chapter.

#### *Role of Beer manufacturers in trafficking to Papua*

The first is the role beer manufacturers play not only in Papua but also in many other countries of South East Asia. At its roots lies an advertising concept called “love products” developed by Satchi and Satchi, a global advertising giant, in the mid 1990s. A “love product” is one with which its user develops an emotional bond that causes pain if the product is removed, and intimacy is an important requirement for developing this kind of an emotional bond. American beer manufacturers like Budweiser were the first ones to employ young girls for sales promotion in bars who would wear skimpy dresses and a sash with the name of the brand, and hover in tantalizingly close vicinity of the drinkers of Budweiser. Later on, the concept of Beer Promotion girls came to countries like Hong Kong, the Philippines, Vietnam and Cambodia where, with the opening up of markets, a large number of global beer manufacturers rushed in to grab their shares. The cabin restaurants of Nepal and dance bars of Mumbai, India were variations of the same theme – to the extent of the rules of the game being changed by local representatives of the global brands. Whereas the Beer Promotion girls engaged by Budweiser got paid USD 6 per hour for wearing a sash and had bouncers abound to keep fresh men away, in

the poorer South and South East Asian countries the Beer Promotion girls were paid through commission on sales. The commissions were fixed in such a way that it kept the Beer Promoters in perpetual need for more earnings. There were no bouncers to protect them, but coercive bar owners were always ready to “discipline” the girls instead if they complained of the way the customers behaved with them.

What happens in the bars of Papua is a local variation of the same theme. The manufacturers of brands like Bintang (which is actually the Indonesian incarnation of Heineken) and Guinness, and their distributors use intimacy to promote sales of beer – only intimacy, in this case, like in the cabin restaurants of Nepal being interpreted as offering the body of a woman to be touched and felt in every way the customer desires as he drinks the brand. Consumption goes higher and higher as the customer is not willing to let go of the woman, and continues ordering more in exchange for the woman’s favors. This rakes in huge profits not only for the manufacturer, but everybody down the line except the hapless hostess. The following computation will show how the beer economy works in Papua, and how it encourages trafficking of women and girls.

Sorong Municipality set a target of Rupiah 600,000,000 as tax collection (its second largest source of revenue next only to earnings from illuminated advertising displays) from bars and restaurants for the year 2005. By the end of July, 73.03% of the target had been met. At the current exchange rate, the tax collection is equivalent to USD 33,760. At the current tax rate, it means a turnover of USD 337,600 made by the bars in seven months, or approximately, USD 48,100 per month. The turnover comes primarily from the sale of beer and ale as none of the bars and discotheques serves food.

A 330ml bottle (pint) of lager or pilsner sells in the bars approximately for USD 2 and ale for USD 3. Both are consumed in almost equal quantities as the hostesses push ale for a higher commission. So, it is safe to assume that average per unit price is USD 2.5. The money value of turnover converts to a monthly sale of approximately 19,240 pints. Approximately, 250 women were working in the bars of Sorong during the period of assessment. Therefore, monthly sale per hostess was 77 pints.

When this is extrapolated over the estimated total number of 1,494 hostesses in the bars of 7 towns of Papua, this gives a sale figure of 1,386,000 pints (57,750 cases of 24 bottles each) annually valued at USD 3,465,000. It is no mean sales volume for only two (and probably poorer) of Indonesia's 33 provinces. A likely distribution of this amount is:

Municipality / Kabupaten in taxes (10% of turnover)	USD 346,500
Manufacturer / Distributor (@ USD 1.2 per pint *)	USD 1,641,600
Hostesses (@USD 0.15 per pint)	USD 207,900
Bar owners	USD 1,269,000

\* This also includes freight from Surabaya, handling charges, and transit insurance (?)

Distributed over 78 bars, the gross annual profit comes to USD 16,270 per bar (almost 100% return on purchase price), whereas each hostess earns USD 141 spread over 12 months. During her 4 months' contract she is likely to get USD 47 from this pie for all the trouble she has to take - from physical harassment to occupationally contracted ailments.

On the other hand, given the fact that a pint of beer costs less than USD 0.15 at the factory gate, one can imagine the huge profits the manufacturers and their channel partners rake in. It can, therefore, be argued that it is in the interest of beer manufacturers that hostess bars keep growing in numbers in Papua. As number of bars grows, more and more women will be trafficked to Papua, as trafficking is inherent in the nature of employment in these bars. Also, as the existing markets start getting saturated or shrinking (Biak, for example) the manufacturers and their channel partners will start looking at developing new markets resulting in proliferation of bars in smaller towns in the newly carved out *kabupatens*. Bintuni in West Irian Jaya is a case in point. More bars will generate demand for more trafficked women.

*Role of administration and political leadership*

*in failing to prevent trafficking to Papua*

The second factor that abets growth of trafficking is decentralized governance following *Otsus*, and the lack of capacity / experience of the local administrators to manage this

newly acquired autonomy. The number of *kabupatens* grew from the earlier 12 to 26 after the formation of two provinces adding to administrative expenditure and military deployment, sources of revenue have not been adequately identified making the provincial administrations overtly dependent on central assistance – all these have resulted in unplanned opening up of the economy. This is the reason why each *kabupaten* is looking for its own private gold mine – be it logging concessions, mining leases or maximizing local income from taxes. So, there is a general feeling all around that bars are “good for the local economy”. Also in the absence of policy guidelines and perspective plans, different interest groups are at work to secure concessions in their favor. Even if corruption and unwise spending of central assistance are not considered seriously, inexperience is encouraging local administrators to look at sex “tourism” and entertainment as sectors that can rake in large revenues. One look at the Tanjung Elmo *localisasi* near Jayapura will tell any observer the kind of investments that might have been made on its infrastructure and in promoting it. Many of the establishments looked spacious, had polished wooden walls and ceilings, and ceramic tiled floors. There was a prominent advertisement on the main road, just at the turning that leads to Tanjung Elmo, declaring it as a “100% Condom Area”.

There is also a marked lack of coordination between different provincial and *kabupaten* level government departments in the absence of a strong inter-departmental coordinating body like the *MenkoKesra*. It is reported that the BPDA plays this role to some degree, though decisions are often political with Governors and *Bupatis* having the final say. Most of the departments dealing with social issues are cash strapped. There is only one Women’s Grievance Cell (RPK) in Papua Police, the Biro PPs have little funds, and even the AIDS Coordination Cells in the provinces do not have resources to carry out interventional programs. DISNAKERS are hands off as far as the employees in bars are concerned, as they are not recruited through the DISNAKERS. So, whereas the economic units at provincial and *kabupaten* levels are all in favor of taking steps to increase occupancy rates of hotels and turnover of bars; the social units that are opposed to such ideas because of their consequences on gender and other social issues have neither staff nor budgetary support to deal with the fall-out, leave alone challenging such decisions. Perhaps this kind of a development perspective could be faintly justified

in case of a place like Batam where most of the visitors are from Singapore and Malaysia (though this is a flimsy contention); in the absence of a coherent policy framework in Papua it is almost akin to picking one's own pocket. Those who flock to the bars in Papua and spend their money are mostly locals and not foreigners – this is a fact borne out by the Assessment Team's observations as well as from the accounts of hostesses themselves. Another observation that supports this contention that less than 10% of the bar hostesses (one or two in every bar) speak other languages than Bahasa Indonesian or their own local dialect. The result is high incidence of HIV among Papuan males including government officials, and increased impoverishment of Papua as those who make big profits are mostly from other provinces (and even other countries!)

Once again, this is not a feature unique to Papua or Indonesia. These kind of shortsighted policies were seen in action in the Kingdom of Cambodia till about early 2000s before the country acquired the dubious distinction of becoming a prime destination for worst kinds of international pedophiles. Before Prime Minister Hun Sen personally took interest in clearing Cambodia's name, vehicles of senior government officials and military personnel used to ferry very young Vietnamese girls from Tay Ninh in Vietnam to Phnom Penh, with very similar objective of increasing Cambodia's earnings from tourism! In Vietnam, a rape a night was taking place in the karaoke bars as, while turning a blind eye to sales promotion of beer, its government disapproved prostitution and most of the hotels were under surveillance in order to prevent guests from bringing in prostitutes / girl friends. Only Thailand had a prudent (while ideologically questionable) policy of having an extremely efficient HIV prevention program in place while making it easy for overseas visitors to take prostitutes to their hotel rooms. Both bars and hotels would simply put a fee on the customer and be unconcerned about what "consenting adults" did later.

The second argument that the Assessment Team forwards is that in the absence of an enabling policy framework that ensures allotment of sufficient funds by the provincial Governors, Badan Perencanaan Pembagunan Daerah (BPDA)s and *Bupatis* (Mayors /

District Governors) to combat trafficking, there will not be any significant administrative action to prevent trafficking in women and girls to Papua.

*Role of Papua's location and physical characteristics  
in relation to trafficking of women and girls*

Perhaps what makes trafficking to Papua uniquely easy is its location and connections with the rest of Indonesia. Papua is an island, separated by large masses of water from most of the other parts of Indonesia, and for traveling to and from Papua (and even between different Papuan towns) airplanes and boats are the only means. So, as women arrive, they are already indebted at least to the extent of fares, and leaving Papua becomes enormously more difficult without the consent of the trafficker. Even if one can escape from confinement, leaving the shores of Papua is almost impossible without the support of government, inter-governmental or non-government organizations; and without neutralizing traffickers and their allies. This makes unfair contracts easy to enforce, without investing large sums in keeping trafficked women under surveillance. It will be explained later how once the women arrive in Papua for the first time, they are forced to enter into increasingly coercive contracts and move from town to town till they accept prostitution as a way of life.

Ships play a very important role in the lives of trafficked women. Not only ships carry women to Papua from Bitung, Kupang, Makassar or Surabaya, they also bring in the beer. In short, ships carry both cannon and its fodder! Similarly, once the women were in Papua they are moved around, from one town to another, by ships. There are ships connecting Papuan ports of Merauke, Fak Fak, Sorong, Manokwari and Jayapura even to Medan and Batam – close to the western tip of Indonesia. It is an important link that needs exploration – especially if the big shipping lines like Pelni or their staff is complicit in trafficking of women and girls to Papua.

The third major argument of the Assessment Team is that because of Papua's geographical location, trafficked women have less chance to escape. It is not unlikely that large shipping companies like Pelni look the other way even if they know that

women traveling on board their vessels are being transported for sexual exploitation in Papua.

So, what is unique in the case of trafficking of women and girls to Papua is the combination of these three factors - the interest of beer manufacturers and their channel partners to increase their sales, apathy of Papuan administration, and logistic hurdles which make it difficult for trafficked women to escape. No intervention that does not address these issues is likely to make any difference to trafficking of women and girls to Papua.

There are *two* more issues that merit some discussion. The first is how some women get into a perpetual cycle of exploitation, and the second is why so many women from Manado are trafficked to bars in Papua. The following paragraphs will attempt to explain some of the reasons behind these.

#### The trap

A woman employed in the bar normally comes in with a debt of approximately 3 to 4 million Rupiahs (USD 300 - 400). This is made up of two-way passage (varying between 1 million Rupiahs and 2 million Rupiahs depending upon the port of embarkation), pre-departure advance and the Agent's profits. For accommodation, food, electricity and water they are charged between 40,000 to 50,000 Rupiahs per day. Over a 4-months contract this adds another 5 to 6 million Rupiahs to the initial debt. So, she is required to work off 8 to 10 million Rupiahs in four months in order to be allowed to return wherever she came from.

Depending on the business of the bar and their "attractiveness", the women are offered a nominal wage of 500,000 to 700,000 Rupiahs per month. This accrued wage of 2 to 3 million Rupiahs over a period of 4 months is set off against the debt. This means that a bar hostess has to earn 6 to 7 million Rupiahs more for the bar before she starts earning for herself, and all of it over a maximum permissible 120 working days.

If the figures of beer consumption are revisited, one of the interesting findings is that the average sale per hostess per month is 77 pints of beer. The experience of the team is that an average customer and his companion consume 6 to 8 pints of beer during one session. This means that a hostess has a customer on 10 / 11 evenings on an average during a month, and theoretically she could earn bar fees of up to 1.5 to 2 million Rupiahs during her 4 months contract. This is also supported by the team's observations that on most of the evenings more women were just lounging around and only a few were entertaining customers. So, she will still have almost 5 million Rupiahs in debt unpaid. This makes it imperative for her to agree to at least 25 to 30 "booking *luar*" during the period of her contract. Though these computations looked complicated to the Assessment Team, the women understood their compulsions much quicker. So, at the end of the contract, if she is able to meet all these targets, she could return with an earning of 10 to 15 million Rupiahs earned from prostitution, tips from customers and commission on beer sales. Actually, most of the women claimed that their tips and commissions on beer sales were spent almost entirely on cigarettes and other daily necessities.

However, there is an inherent fallacy in this line of argument. If one looked at the figures from a different angle, on a given evening only about a third of the women in the bars have a customer. What is wrong in this assumption is that all women do not get equal number of customers because the latter work out their own choices by their second or third visit to the bars. The end result is that some women have more clientele than others. In every bar, there are always some women who are rarely sought by customers. They find it extremely difficult to repay their debts, and are forced to accept a second or a third contract, which carries over the unpaid part of the debt with an usually usurious rate of interest, and is perhaps more coercive than the one before. If they continue to be failures in their second or third places of engagement, they run the risk of being sold to *lokalisasi*. So, for them, it is extremely difficult to get out of the trafficking cycle. This is what "rotating" the hostesses between different Papuan towns means.

On the other hand, those who are able to meet their contractual obligations are not safe from further risks either. Some of the risks are situational, whereas others are self-created. Some of the more popular women can be moved to another town at the request of an outstation client – more often against the woman's wishes than not. In her new establishment, she starts from scratch, with another load of debt passed on to her. A few get emotionally entangled with their clients and end up as "*istri-piara*" mostly in Jayapura – a glorified concubine who has to serve her keeper's friends and clients – important government servants, for free.

Some of the more successful women decide to return to Papua after their first contract is over, often without debts, encouraged by their ability to earn handsomely. Probably they cannot be called trafficked women any longer, but they accept prostitution as a viable means to acquire a comfortable lifestyle. Some of them base themselves in Manado, and are flown in by their agents in Papua to serve important clients for high fees (USD 100 or more per night with all expenses paid).

There is a group of trafficked women who are in between. They are monetarily not as successful as the last group, nor in as pathetic a situation as of those who get into perpetual debt bondage. They just manage to meet their contracts without making much money for themselves. In order to escape from the stifling conditions of Papua and to earn some money before returning home, they often stop over in North Maluku for some time, engaging in prostitution in Ternate, Tobelo, Sidangoli, Mangoli and Bacan, where they enjoy relatively greater freedom of movement and less restrictive working conditions. Either they stay in boarding houses in Ternate and pick up customers from Swering or Taman Ria, or they join entertainment establishments in Tobelo on their own accord. This makes Ternate the important chain in movement of women from North Sulawesi to Papua and back. The exhibits below confirm the transit of a good number of women from North Sulawesi through Ternate and Tobelo particularly, where they work in short stints for some additional income. According to reports, for a woman in prostitution, it is easy to earn upwards of 2 million Rupiah per month in North Maluku.

**Exhibit E: Proportion of Women in Prostitution in North Maluku by Province of Origin**

Location	No. of Women interviewed	Province of Origin			
		Local	North Sulawesi	Java	Others
Ternate	208 (100%)	36%	30%	16%	18%
Tobelo	68	37%	35%	25%	3%
Bacan	18	78%	6%	11%	5%
Sidangoli	15	67%	13%	20%	0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>309</b>	<b>40%</b>	<b>29%</b>	<b>18%</b>	<b>13%</b>

Source: Commercial Sex Workers and Potential Risks of STD / HIV / AIDS Epidemic in Maluku Utara, Yayasan Mitra Masyarakat, Manado, 2004. (Table 3, page 15)

**Exhibit F: Mobility of Women in Prostitution in North Maluku**

Location	No. of women interviewed	Fixed to the same location	Mobile
Ternate	208	32%	68%
Tobelo	68	43%	57%
Bacan	18	33%	67%
Sidangoli	15	53%	47%
<b>Total</b>	<b>309</b>	<b>36%</b>	<b>64%</b>

Source: Commercial Sex Workers and Potential Risks of STD / HIV / AIDS Epidemic in Maluku Utara, Yayasan Mitra Masyarakat, Manado, 2004. (Table 9, page 17)

*Disempowered by Empowerment*

In UNICEF's authoritative report *Participatory Research on Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Surakarta and Indramayu (UNICEF Indonesia, 2004)* some of the causes and consequences of trafficking in girls from Java have been explained in great detail. No such analysis is available on North Sulawesi - especially, on trafficking from Minahasa.

In spite of some belief expressed by some respondents that young girls from North Sulawesi are sold by their parents to traffickers' agents, a different but more interesting scenario emerges as one talks to women trafficked from North Sulawesi, particularly Minahasa, to Papua. It has been noted elsewhere in this report that many of them are educated up to senior high school, in their twenties, and separated / divorced from their husbands. Some have one child or more.

If these women are to be believed, then it is easy to see that women from Minahasa are unwilling to suffer in silence, and are neither timid nor prevented by their natal families from moving out of an oppressive marriage. Many of them are confident of being able to look after themselves and their children without their husbands' support. Most believe that they can find a good spouse once they have a solid financial ground to stand on. Their inner urge to build a meaningful life for themselves often leads them to walk into traps carefully laid by dishonest recruiters. Some of them respond to job advertisements put in local papers, and accept job offers without checking the antecedents of the so-called employers. Others, like the proverbial vain crow, are convinced by the recruiters that they have the looks, education and poise to get dignified jobs in Papua where the economy is vibrant, salaries are high, and there is a real dearth of smart women. Most of them come to Papua not as women without a choice, but believing in their capability to make it big.

It may be helpful to absorb some information shared by the Village Chief of Raanan Baru in South Minahasa almost six weeks before this assessment began. The first important thing that he said was that the current population of the village was 1,277 persons, which is lower than the previous year by at least 300. Almost 70 families had one or more members living elsewhere. Migration was mainly to Papua because of reported "higher income potential". It was not a recent happening but started in 1980s. According to him, "Migration is a gamble people want to play". He was quite unequivocal in saying that no "*Calo*" (recruiter) operated in his village, those who migrated used their own channels and contacts.

In the context of the Perda (Provincial Perda no. 1 of 2004, North Sulawesi) requiring every intending migrant woman to get a written "no objection" from the Village Chief, he only said he was "encouraging safe migration". He also admitted that families of some young migrants to Manado display so much "disproportionate prosperity" that people becomes suspicious about their occupation. Yet, he thought it could be just out of envy.

This is what makes the fate of the women trafficked to Papua from Minahasa so tragic. Many of them are unable to handle the traumatic stress of their disappointment. For some, their pride makes them stay on in Papua if they are doing well; some others stop at Ternate and Tobelo on their way back to Minahasa – so that they have something at least to show to their friends and families for the misadventure they had undertaken. In the absence of an enabling information environment, their empowerment laid the grounds for their being trafficked to Papua.

## Chapter - VIII

### Extinguishing Forest Fire:

### Recommendations Arising Out of the Assessment

The foregoing synthesis enables us to precisely define the problem of trafficking of women and girls to and within Papua.

#### Statement of the problem

*Nature and extent of trafficking* - Trafficking of women and girls to Papua is an established phenomenon, with women and girls being trafficked primarily for purpose of sexual exploitation. Currently, the estimated number of trafficked girls and women in Papua is over 3,000, with 800 - 1,000 women and girls being trafficked every year to karaoke bars, *lokalisasi*, massage parlors and street prostitution. Out of the numbers trafficked annually, 50 to 60% are forced to remain in prostitution in Papua. The others are able to leave Papua, but not all of them are able to get out of prostitution.

Women are trafficked mostly from North Sulawesi and Java, and the younger girls are mostly local Papuans, though trafficking of second generation trans-migrants is not being ruled out entirely.

*Pull factors* - Trafficking takes place because of the increasing demand for sexual services in the towns and harbor areas of Papua. The demand for sexual services is partly because of the existence of a substantially large traveling population in the form of migrant labor in the growing mining, fishing and logging based industries; sailors and uniformed personnel. The other part of the demand is generated by a need to appease influential persons in order to secure commercial gains, and the interests of an expanding beer market. There is also some demand generated by an obscure but significant need of bartering sex for *gaharu* - a forest product fetching high prices in international markets that grows on lands of people who are not aware of its monetary value.

*Push factors* - Increasing poverty, discordant family life and an aspiration for a better quality of life create conditions for women and girls being trafficked to Papua. There are regional variations in patterns that are clearly observable - whereas women from Java and trans-migrant communities in Papua, and young Papuan girls are pushed into sexually exploitative situations primarily because of poverty; women from North Sulawesi get trafficked by trying to escape discordant situations in the family - strained and broken marriages in a large number of cases. There are also instances of girls aspiring for a better quality of life based on their own assessment of their capabilities getting tricked by traffickers.

*Instruments* - Deception at the time of recruitment, and "contract" or debt-bondage, which is also used to immobilize trafficked women and girls are two instruments used extensively by traffickers. Method of computation of debts ultimately forces trafficked women into sexually compromising situations. The trafficked women and girls are discouraged from escaping by their unfamiliarity with their surroundings, and inability to pay for their return passage.

### **Factors Contributing to Trafficking in Women and Girls to Papua**

<b>Push factors</b>	<b>Pull factors</b>	<b>Enabling factors</b>	<b>Instruments used by traffickers</b>	<b>Geographical regions where intervention is required</b>
<p>Increasing poverty, discordant family life;</p> <p>Younger women and girls aspiring for a better quality of life based on their own assessment of their capabilities getting tricked by traffickers.</p>	<p>Increasing demand for sexual services in the towns and harbor areas of Papua;</p> <p>Perceptions created in the minds of certain communities about opportunities in Papua and lack of any objective information contesting such perceptions;</p>	<p>Perceived low risk and high gains;</p> <p>Distance and the physical isolation of Papua from the rest of Indonesia making escape difficult and expensive;</p> <p>The absence of awareness among the law makers and enforcers in</p>	<p>Deception at the time of recruitment,</p> <p>"Contract" used to immobilize trafficked women and girls;</p> <p>Method of computation of debts forces trafficked women into sexually compromising situations;</p>	<p>East, Central and West Java;</p> <p>Papuan districts where trans-migrant communities are located;</p> <p>Suburbs of Sorong and Jayapura where young Papuan migrant girls from districts normally reside</p> <p>North Sulawesi</p>

	<p>The interests of an expanding beer market;</p> <p>Need of bartering sex for <i>gaharu</i> – a forest product fetching high prices in international markets that grows on lands of people who are not aware of its monetary value.</p>	<p>Papua about what constitutes trafficking in women and girls, and why is it a crime;</p> <p>Pervading apathy in the Papuan civil society about trafficked women and girls</p>	<p>Unfamiliarity with surroundings, and inability to pay for return passage by the trafficked women and girls</p>	<p>in general and Minahasa in particular</p> <p>Papua, and towns like Ternate and Tobelo in Maluku Utara where women and girls are trafficked to.</p>
--	--	---	---	---

Enabling factors – Low risk and high gains make trafficking of women and girls to Papua an attractive proposition. There are factors that make trafficking to Papua a low risk and easy crime to commit. These are perceptions created in the minds of certain communities about opportunities in Papua and lack of any objective information contesting such perceptions; the distance and the physical isolation of Papua from the rest of Indonesia making escape difficult and expensive; thirdly the absence of awareness among the law makers and enforcers in Papua about what constitutes trafficking in women and girls, and why is it a crime; and fourthly the pervading apathy in the Papuan civil society about trafficked women and girls. The high gains come through profit from beer sales, unusually high rates of interest charged on imaginary debts and incomes from contracting to provide sexual services of trafficked women and girls.

#### A Framework for Intervention

In the next section, we shall attempt to design a framework for future counter-trafficking interventions in order to address the problem of trafficking of women and children to Papua. Any intervention designed to combat trafficking of women and children to Papua should have the following goals:

- The local administration in Papua will be sensitized about trafficking of women and girls to and within Papua by end of 2006;

- The local administration and CSOs in Papua will have acquired the capacity to deal with trafficking of women and girls to and within Papua by end of 2007;
- Vulnerable groups of women and girls in selected geographical regions of Java and Sulawesi will gain sufficient knowledge about trafficking and safe migration by end of 2006;
- A set of institutions and policies will be in place by end of 2007 in Papua as well as Java and Sulawesi that will help to empower women and girls trafficked to, or at the risk of being trafficked to Papua; and
- By end of 2007, a system will be in place for reintegrating trafficked women and girls stranded in Papua and Maluku Utara

It is our understanding that in order to stop trafficking, we need simultaneous and collaborative work on both demand and supply sides. If we work only in the areas of origin, traffickers are likely to find other sources to meet demand. If we only work on demand reduction, traffickers will find newer sites to traffic women and girls. Papua is an example of a new site being explored by traffickers. It is also important to understand the legalities of “contracts” used by the traffickers so that the law enforcers do not punish the trafficked women and girls for violating contracts – just the way illegal immigrants are convicted while their traffickers go scot-free. In the following table, a likely framework for interventions is being presented. It is by no means exhaustive, nor is all the interventions proposed readily implement able, as some of those may be extraneous to the immediate objective environment, or beyond the mandate of implementing agencies.

**A Possible Framework for Intervention into Trafficking of  
Women and Girls to Papua based on ICMC  
Field Assessment in September 2005**

Factor to be countered	Objective for intervention	Choice of Likely Strategies	Likely Outcome
<p><b>Increasing demand for sexual services in towns and harbors of Papua</b></p>	<p><i>To ensure that girls below 18 years are not required to provide sexual services for survival, or for lack of choices</i></p>	<p>Supporting the schooling of Papuan and trans-migrant girls in the age-group 14 - 18 years</p> <p>Providing low cost / subsidized accommodation for Papuan and trans-migrant girls coming to Sorong and Jayapura for higher education</p> <p>Spreading awareness about trafficking in schools, universities and host communities</p> <p>Preparing Papuan and trans-migrants girls in the age-group 16 - 18 years for jobs in the government, commercial and service sectors</p> <p>Lobbying for job quotas of Papuans and trans-migrant women and girls in every bona-fide employment sector in Papua</p>	<p><b>More girls are likely to remain in school, and thereby out-reachable.</b></p> <p><b>Reduce the need to earn extra money for lodging and board</b></p> <p><b>Girls below 18 will be aware of the consequences of street based prostitution – such as disease, rape and getting trafficked</b></p> <p><b>Increase “employability” of local girls whose current representation in the employed workforce of Papua is extremely low.</b></p> <p><b>Increase actual employment of Papuan women and girls thereby reducing the risk of having to join prostitution</b></p> <p><b>More women will have a chance to</b></p>

	<p><i>To see that migrant women are not trafficked into prostitution</i></p>	<p>Providing women arriving in Papua with post-arrival career counseling that provide accurate information about opportunities, wages and working conditions</p> <p>Providing short-stay shelters for those who wish to go back after post-arrival counseling</p> <p>Enabling survivors to choose between returning to their families and acquiring skills for alternative livelihood options</p> <p>Providing alternative livelihood packages to those who do not wish to return to their families</p>	<p><b>protect themselves from being trafficked</b></p> <p><b>Once having taken a ship to Papua, migrant women and girls will have an optional place to stay, empowering more women to challenge their traffickers</b></p> <p><b>Provide time for reflection delay</b></p> <p><b>Women under family pressure will have at least another livelihood option</b></p>
<p><b>Increasing demand for women and girls for sales promotion of beer in discotheques, karaoke bars and cafes of Papua</b></p>	<p><i>To make beer manufacturers and their channel partners aware about the unethical aspects of using women's bodies to promote beer sales and its consequences on women and girls working in the bars of</i></p>	<p>Lobbying with beer manufacturers and their global principals</p> <p>Getting the print media interested in starting a campaign against this form of beer sales</p>	<p><b>Global principals may bring pressure on local subsidiaries</b></p> <p><b>The local subsidiaries and channel partners will be under media scrutiny, and</b></p>

	<p><i>Papua</i></p> <p><i>To get existing laws enforced, or having new laws passed to protect women and girls working in bars from being forced to promote beer sales</i></p>	<p>promotion</p> <p>Advocating for <i>Perda</i> and legislation prohibiting drinking of beer by employees in bars;</p> <p>Making it mandatory for employers to protect their women employees from being sexually harassed</p>	<p><b>the concerned government departments are likely to take note</b></p> <p><b>Bar hostesses will be protected against hazards caused by heavy alcohol consumption</b></p> <p><b>The bar hostesses will not be forced to trade their bodies for bigger sales for the bar.</b></p>
<p><b>Use of women's sexual services to extract <i>gaharu</i> from tribal men</b></p>	<p><i>To create formal and remunerative mechanisms for collection of <i>gaharu</i> from tribal men</i></p>	<p>Creating awareness among Papuan tribes about the monetary value of <i>gaharu</i> and how it can improve living conditions of families / communities / tribes</p> <p>Encouraging local governments / concerned provincial departments to create market collection arrangements for <i>gaharu</i> against payment of remunerative prices</p>	<p><b><i>Gaharu</i> hunters will learn to ask for money and not sex in payment</b></p> <p><b><i>Gaharu</i> hunters will have easy access to money in exchange of <i>gaharu</i>, perhaps reducing the need for "sex as a last recourse"</b></p>
<p><b>Increasing poverty in some geographical regions of Java, Papua and North Sulawesi leading to</b></p>	<p><i>To reduce vulnerability of women and girls from poor families</i></p>	<p>Preventing school drop out by girls in the specific geographical sub-regions of Java, Sulawesi and Papua</p>	<p><b>More girls are likely to remain in school, and thereby out-reachable.</b></p>

<p><b>unsafe migration of women and girls</b></p>		<p>Encouraging the formation of self-help groups for women</p>	<p><b>Out of school women can be reached for spreading awareness about trafficking</b></p>
<p><b>Within the family discord leading to unsafe migration of women and girls</b></p>	<p><i>To reduce vulnerability of women and girls affected by discords in the family</i></p>	<p>Providing short-stay opportunities for reflection delay</p> <p>Encouraging women affected by family discords to join community / church (in Minahasa) based groups with the aim to provide support to / seek support from each other</p>	<p><b>Women under pressure will get time to take informed decisions</b></p> <p><b>Women under pressure will have greater chance of looking at less risky survival options than migrating to Papua</b></p>
<p><b>Illusions created in the minds of vulnerable women and girls about opportunities in Papua</b></p>	<p><i>To provide correct information about employment opportunities in Papua for women and girls</i></p>	<p>Providing potential migrants with accurate information about job opportunities in Papua, precautions to be taking while signing a contract with recruiters, and what to do in case they find themselves in difficult situations during their trip to / after reaching Papua</p> <p>Encouraging trafficking survivors from Papua to provide useful advice to potential migrants from</p>	<p><b>Vulnerable women will be in a position to make better decisions</b></p> <p><b>Vulnerable women can challenge recruiters and work out better and more transparent deals for themselves</b></p>

		geographical areas they belong to	
<b>Difficulty in getting out of Papua even if a trafficked woman or girl can escape her trafficker</b>	<i>To facilitate easier exit of trafficking survivors from Papua</i>	<p>Creating awareness about services of IOM and other agencies who are mandated to facilitate return and reintegration, and providing easier access to such agencies through Public Service Announcements</p> <p>Encouraging reputed carriers like Pelni, Merpati and Garuda to provide free / subsidized and priority passage to trafficking survivors as a part of their social responsibility</p>	<p><b>Trafficked women will know who to approach for help, and thereby more willing to challenge traffickers</b></p> <p><b>Trafficked women will not be in a quandary about how to leave Papua, and therefore, will be more willing to challenge traffickers</b></p>
<b>Lack of awareness and capacity in law makers and law enforcers to identify cases of trafficking</b>	<i>To generate awareness among law makers and law enforcers in Papua about trafficking</i>	<p>Conducting seminars, workshops and roundtables across Papua to disseminate the findings from the USAID Papua Assessment</p> <p>Releasing the Indonesian version of the assessment report through Papuan and national press for wider awareness and public discussion</p>	<p><b>Law makers and law enforcers will have clearer idea about the nature and extent of trafficking in women and children in Papua</b></p> <p><b>Communities and the educated classes will ask questions to law makers and enforcers, putting them under pressure to learn more about the issue</b></p>

	<i>To enable law enforcers in Papua to identify cases of trafficking with greater clarity</i>	<p>Working with local NGOs and CSO organizations to disseminate information about trafficking in women and girls in Papua to district / sub-district level officials</p> <p>Building capacity of law enforcers and prosecutors to identify cases of trafficking and using legal provisions to punish traffickers</p>	<p><b>Understanding about trafficking will penetrate deep making it difficult for traffickers to work without being challenged</b></p> <p><b>More traffickers will be identified and punished</b></p>
<b>High gains from beer sales</b>	<i>To regulate the attractiveness of discotheques and beer bars as business propositions</i>	<p>Persuading beer manufacturers and their channel partners to recommend maximum retailing price of their products in bars etc.</p> <p>Encouraging local governments to regulate business of bars etc by imposing deterrent rates of taxes</p>	<p><b>Hostess bars will not remain an attractive proposition curbing the need for trafficking of women and girls</b></p> <p><b>The rapid proliferation of bars will stop, reducing the demand for trafficked women and girls as hostesses</b></p>
<b>Use of spurious contracts and fallacious debts to immobilize women and girls, and forcing them into sexually exploitative situations</b>	<i>To bring transparency in contracts entered into by women and girls with traffickers in karaoke bars, discotheques, cafes and massage parlors</i>	<p>Conducting research into the legal shortcomings of such contracts</p> <p>Bringing pressure</p>	<p><b>Law enforcers will be equipped to deal with "spurious contracts" that create debt-bondage</b></p> <p><b>Places of entertainment will</b></p>

		on DISNAKERS to scrutinize contracts, and start criminal proceedings against traffickers for fraudulent interpretation and coercive enforcement of spurious contracts	<b>be discouraged from creating debt-bondage - the tool used extensively to perpetuate trafficking of women and children to Papua</b>
--	--	---	---

**Program Design:**

Programmatically, these interventions can be bunched under four major heads, namely -

1. Vulnerability reduction of women and girls belonging to communities at risk,
2. Return and reintegration of trafficking survivors,
3. Strengthening legal environment against trafficking in Papua, and
4. Advocacy for demand reduction in Papua.

Initially, an intervention for two-years is being proposed for Papua which will be primarily aimed at enhancing the understanding of policy makers, administrators and the CSOs about trafficking in women and girls. The second phase of the program in Papua will be aimed at bringing about certain changes in how certain establishments / businesses are currently run through local laws and other initiatives.

Another part of the program will deal with increasing the capabilities of affected / vulnerable communities to combat trafficking through empowerment.

**Component 1: Vulnerability Reduction of Women and Girls at Risk**

The Vulnerability Reduction component will try to work on the push factors described in the problem description. It will essentially try to ensure older girls from selected geographical areas in Java and Sulawesi stay in school, those out of school and women from dysfunctional families are encouraged to form self-help groups, and proper shelters and counseling facilities are set up in both the places of origin and destinations to empower the women and girl migrants. This component will also aspire to build

capacities of women and girls at risk to embrace alternative occupations, and make informed choices.

The Vulnerability Reduction component of the program will be implemented in selected locations of Java, Sulawesi, and Papua. It is understood that some of the proposed activities may be carried out already by some INGOs like Save the Children Fund UK (SCF-UK) , the Asia Foundation (TAF), and the American Centre for Labor Solidarity (ACILS) - particularly in Java.

Expected Accomplishment	Activity	Location	Timeline
The factors responsible for migration of married women from Minhasa will be better understood	A rapid assessment of reasons for the high rate of migration of married and separated women from Minhasa in North Sulawesi	In selected districts and sub-districts of Minhasa	Year 1, Quarter 1
Geographical areas in Papua will be identified from where women and girls migrate in search of work	A rapid assessment of migration patterns from areas where trans-migrants were originally settled	In selected districts and sub-districts of Jayapura, Merauke and Fak Fak	Year 1, Quarter 2
More girls are likely to remain in school where they can be reached with anti-trafficking messages	Supporting continued schooling of girls in the age-group 14 - 18 years	Specific districts of East, Central and West Java North and South Sulawesi Papua and West Irian Jaya	Other agencies are already working on this issue in Java and Sulawesi.  Intervention in Papua to start in Year 1, Quarter 3
There will be less need for "extra money" for lodging and board for the girls who come to towns of Papua for education	Provide hostels for girls coming to Jayapura and Sorong for higher education	Sorong and Jayapura	Year 1, Quarter 3
Girls below 18 will be aware of the consequences of street based prostitution - such as disease, rape and getting trafficked	Spreading awareness about trafficking in schools, universities and communities at risk	Sorong and Jayapura	Year 1, Quarter 2
Out of school women and girls can be reached	Encouraging formation of self-help groups for out-of-school women	Selected districts of East, Central and West Java,	Year 1, Quarter 2

with anti-trafficking / safe migration messages		North and South Sulawesi, Papua and West Irian Jaya	
Women from discordant families will get more time to take informed decisions	Encouraging formation of self-help groups for women from discordant families with the aim of providing / seeking support.  Provide short-stay facilities for women from discordant families	Specially in Manado and other towns in North Sulawesi  Selected districts of East, Central and West Java; North and South Sulawesi	Year 1, Quarter 2  Year 1, Quarter 4  Year 1, Quarter 3
Potentially migrant women and girls can challenge recruiters and work out better deals for themselves	Providing potentially migrant women and girls with accurate information about job opportunities in Papua, precautions to be taken while signing contracts with recruiters, and steps to be taken in case of problems after reaching Papua  Encouraging trafficking survivors from Papua to provide useful advice to potential migrants	Selected districts of East, Central and West Java; North and South Sulawesi	Year 1, Quarter 4  Year 2, Quarter 1
More women and girls will be able to save themselves from being trafficked even after arriving in Papua	Providing women and girls with post-arrival career counseling that provide accurate information about opportunities, wages and working conditions	In Sorong, Jayapura, Merauke and Fak Fak  In Sorong,	Year 1, Quarter 4  Year 2,

Having arrived in Papua, migrant women and girls will have an optional shelter empowering more women to challenge their traffickers	Provide short stay shelters for those who wish to leave Papua after post-arrival counseling	Jayapura, Merauke and Fak Fak	Quarter 1
Get time for reflection delay	Enabling trafficking survivors to choose between returning to place of origin and acquiring skills for alternative livelihood options in Papua	In Sorong, Jayapura, Merauke and Fak Fak	Year 2, Quarter 1
Women and girls under family pressure to earn will have at least one more livelihood option	Providing alternative livelihood packages to those who do not wish to return to their places of origin	In Sorong, Jayapura, Merauke and Fak Fak	

Component 2: Return and Reintegration

The Return and Reintegration component of the program will facilitate effective reintegration of women and girls who have been trafficked to Papua and Maluku Utara already. Since IOM is mandated to provide this service to trafficked persons, ICMC's role will possibly remain restricted to creating awareness about IOM's services; and negotiating with major carriers to and from Papua to provide subsidized passage to trafficking survivors.

Expected Accomplishment	Activity	Location	Timeline
Trafficked women and girls will know who to approach for help and therefore empowered to challenge traffickers	Creating awareness about the services of IOM and other agencies who are mandated to facilitate return and reintegration, and providing easier access to such agencies through Public Service Announcements	At different locations of Papua and Maluku Utara  East, Central and West Java  North and South Sulawesi	Year 1, Quarter 3  On going (?)  North Sulawesi Year 1, Quarter 1 South Sulawesi Year 1, Quarter 3
Trafficked women and girls will know how to leave Papua if they wanted to, and therefore, more willing to challenge traffickers	Encouraging reputed carriers like Pelni, Merpati and Garuda to provide subsidized / free passage to trafficking survivors as a part of their social responsibility	In Jakarta, as well in different locations in Papua	Jakarta Year 1, Quarter 3  Papuan locations Year 1, Quarter 4

Component 3: Strengthening the legal environment in Papua

This component is expected to both create awareness about the nature and extent of trafficking in women and girls to Papua as well as strengthen the capacity of local governments to deal with the issue. It will comprise dissemination and sharing of the Papua assessment report with different departments of local administration through workshops and seminars and personal meetings at appropriate levels. In the second phase, capacity building of the concerned departments - including the Manpower

offices and the Police will be attempted. The third phase of this component is intended to exert public pressure on local governments to restrict the proliferation of bars, and to ensure that employers carry out their obligations towards their employees to the extent of safeguarding from physical, mental and sexual harassment.

Expected Accomplishments	Activities	Locations	Timeline
Law makers and law enforcers will have clearer idea about the nature and extent of trafficking in women and girls to and within Papua	Conducting seminars, workshops and roundtables with Local Development Planning Boards (BPDA), KPP, DISNAKER, Police etc. across Papua to disseminate findings from USAID sponsored Papua assessment	In different locations of Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces	Year 1, Quarter 1
Communities and educated classes will ask questions to law makers and enforcers, putting them under pressure to learn about the issue	Releasing the Indonesian version of the assessment report through Papuan and the national press for wider awareness and public discussion	In Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces, and in Jakarta	Year 1, Quarter 2
Understanding about trafficking in women and girls will penetrate deep making it difficult for traffickers to work without being challenged	Working with local NGOs and CSOs to disseminate information about trafficking in women and girls in Papua to district / sub-district level officials	At different locations in Papua, West Irian Jaya and Maluku Utara provinces	Year 1, Quarter 2
More traffickers will be identified and punished	Building capacities of law enforcers and prosecutors to identify cases of trafficking and using legal provisions to punish traffickers	In Papua, West Irian Jaya and Maluku Utara provinces	Year 1, Quarter 3 (IOM)
Law enforcers will be equipped to deal with “spurious contracts” that create debt-bondage	Conducting research into the legal validity and shortcomings of such contracts and disseminating the results	In Jakarta, and also in Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces	Research during Year 1, Quarter 1  Dissemination during Year 1, Quarter 4  Year 2,

<p>Entertainment establishments will be discouraged from using debt-bondage to hold trafficked women and girls captive</p> <p>Number of bars will not be allowed to increase from the present level</p>	<p>Bringing pressure on the Police and the DISNAKERS to start scrutinizing contracts and bring criminal proceedings against traffickers for fraudulent interpretation and coercive enforcement of spurious contracts</p> <p>Encouraging local governments to regulate business of bars by restricting their numbers</p>	<p>In Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces</p> <p>In all municipalities and district headquarters of Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces</p>	<p>Quarter 1</p> <p>Year 1, Quarter 3</p>
---	---	---	---

Component 4: Advocacy for Demand Reduction in Papua

This component is broadly designed to work on a long-term demand reduction for trafficking in women and girls by pointing out to policy makers the connections between beer marketing, gaharu collection etc. with trafficking in women, and offering long-lasting solutions. However, these efforts will start later - only after there has been sufficient sensitization of the local administration about trafficking of women to Papua, and seeing the connections.

Expected Accomplishment	Activity	Location	Timeline
<i>Gaharu</i> hunters learn to ask for money in exchange of <i>gaharu</i> wood and not sex	Creating awareness in the Asmat region of Papua about the monetary value of <i>gaharu</i> how it can help in improving the living conditions of families / communities / tribes	In the Asmat region of Papua province	Year 2, Quarter 1
<i>Gaharu</i> hunters have easy access to cash in exchange of <i>gaharu</i> reducing the demand for sex	Lobbying with local governments / concerned provincial departments to create market collection system for <i>gaharu</i> against payment of remunerative prices	At Jayapura as well as in Asmat district	Year 1, Quarter 4
The bar hostesses will not be forced to give company to customers	Making it mandatory for all employers to protect their women employees from sexual harassment	In all towns and district headquarters in Papua and West Irian Jaya	Year 1 Quarter 3
Number of bars will not be allowed to increase from the present level	Encouraging local governments to regulate business of bars by restricting their numbers	In all municipalities and district headquarters of Papua and West Irian Jaya provinces	Year 1, Quarter 3
Hostess bars will not remain attractive business proposition	Lobbying with the government to impose heavy taxes on bars thereby reducing profitability / clientele	In the different municipalities and districts of Papua and Western Irian Jaya	Year 2, Quarter 1

It is hoped that a 2-year program will significantly contain the issue of trafficking of women and girls in Papua provided there is a network of CSOs and NGOs to perform a watchdog function subsequently.

## Epilogue

### "The Answer is Blowing in the Wind"

It is time again to unfreeze the statistics and bring little Snow White back to life. The assessment brings us face to face with some uncomfortable issues – issues that are manifestation of much deeper malaise affecting parts of the Indonesian society. These are primarily the high vulnerability of women and girls in some parts of the country including Papua itself leading to their commodification; the growth of an entertainment sector driven by certain interest groups and abetted by local governments; and a general sense of apathy among both administrators and policy makers about a few communities of stereo-typed women (such as those from Indramayu and Manado). A statement that was hurting, and which came from a very senior official was that the people of Manado are such that they like to buy televisions even if there was no electricity in their villages.

Let us face that to aspire for a better quality of life is human nature. This is what compels us to take risks – particularly of migration, false promises, and even compromising our beliefs, especially if the conditions at home are stifling – because of poverty, bad marriages and general neglect. The Aries, Cindys and Sitis did not come to Papua to enjoy sexual freedom nor break other women's families. Their circumstances forced them to look for options however ill founded and tentative those might have been. Having taken a route that they thought would be liberating, many of them found themselves in situations that are perhaps worse, in many ways, than before.

There are two issues that concern us after the completion of Papua assessment. These are firstly, that many of the women in the entertainment sector and lokalisasi are in fact trafficked (though the numbers may be few compared to those trafficked across Indonesia's borders), and that a growing number of under-18 girls – both locals and migrants are taking to street prostitution. Many of the latter, according to reports, come to the towns from interior regions of Papua primarily to gain education. Usman, our guide and driver in Sorong, befriended a girl sitting on the Berlin wall one evening, and

then laughed his guts out as he narrated that she came from Serui to go to college, but look what she is doing now!

It is easy to call prostitution by Papuan girls a natural next step to “seks antri” (a popular term which means “queuing up” for sexual favors from the school / college stud or the queen-bee. These student sex idols are expected to be high performers and disappoint none). Those claiming vague knowledge of Papuan culture darkly refer to some obscure fertility rights still practiced by one or two Papuan tribes to increase productivity of land in order to infer that promiscuity is a part of Papuan culture. This is contrary to the understanding of the local Papuan population. To them, it is one of the influences of the migrant prostitutes have on the young and impressionable Papuan girls who want the same lifestyle (mostly referring to the way they dressed and used cosmetics to make themselves look prettier). Unfortunately, both lines of thinking overlook the fact that there might be something more that compels them to take to prostitution – poverty, for example. And once having got into it, they are trapped by those who derive pecuniary advantages from such girls – like the owners of warungs, ojek drivers, and street thugs who provide “security”. It will not be surprising if invisible pimps also controlled them.

The second is that in most of the Papuan towns that we visited the administrators seemed to be of the opinion that it is necessary to shut one’s eyes to these developments as prostitution provides the town administration – directly and indirectly, with much needed revenue. A very senior peoples’ representative called Sorong a city of happiness where men come to enjoy themselves. Having spent a good 50 odd years in Sorong, he was referring to the fact that Sorong had always been a popular stop for ships. He went on to add that for Sorong this is nothing new, that both the lokalisasi and the bars existed for over 30 years now, and that the places of entertainment had been bringing in women from other parts of Indonesia since the 1980s - the only difference now was that more women came from Manado than from Java. Papuan women’s groups feel that the migrant prostitutes cause disharmony in the Papuan families as men are left with less money for family consumption – one of the root causes for domestic violence.

At the end the Cindys and the Irems have no allies – allies who would work together to stop trafficking. Some, among the stakeholders, would want local laws to prevent migrant women from coming to Papua. Some want the establishments of entertainment to be closed down. But to town administrations, such ideas are impractical.

As we crunch through policy and moral debates surrounding trafficking in Papua, we feel that every single day is a living hell for the women who are trapped in the lokalisasis, massage parlors, and bars. First, take a look at the infants - some of whom might have been born while their mothers were in captivity. Then, there are the children who were forced to accompany their mothers to their place of work in the absence of any other alternative. No doubt, the women themselves work out some coping mechanisms to care for their children (their own agency at work). But is that adequate? Do these children deserve to grow up in such an environment? On the other hand, it would be heart wrenching for the mothers if their children were to be taken away to Homes.

Secondly, most of the women – especially those who came from broken homes with lots of dreams in their eyes, are in deep trauma. A good majority of them need immediate trauma counseling in order to prevent them from indulging in behavior that will affect their health in the short or medium term. Risk of HIV is not the only one they carry. The type of drinking and smoking they indulge in can lead to gastric and respiratory ailments, even if they claim they are not “addicted”. Some others would lose their will to resist. They might stop looking for alternatives after a while, and be timidly waiting to be shipped to Bintuni, Merauke or Timika.

All these women are made up of emotions and little desires like any of us. Irem comes with an escort to Biak airport to see me off, says nothing before she leaves five minutes later. That evening she sends me an SMS asking for a “hadiah (gift)” on her “ulang tahun (birthday)” falling on September 17. Arie, on the other hand, has a gift for “papaku” on his “ulang tahun”. She started calling me “papa” after our first meeting.

Cindy wants me to settle down with her in Manado, and bring up her daughter together. She says she will work too, so that between the two of us, we can take care of the family needs. "What if I become jealous of your men colleagues at work?" I ask her. She gives me a look that says, "You too?" And Mirnawati offers to return a part of the 30 US Dollars I paid to spend some time alone with her because she thinks that it is too high a sum for sitting with me and talking over the supper we had together.

The contracts system offers them with a window of opportunity to escape. Arie wants to come to Jakarta in November and look for a job. She wants me to help her in this. Cindy wants to move out from the bar and then take a ship back to Manado. She wants me to provide her with the required money. Mirnawati wants ideas about alternative livelihood she can embrace. All of them keep in touch with me through SMS. While we keep looking for systemic solutions their existential issues become bigger and bigger. As Bob Dylan (and earlier Trini Lopez) would have sung many years back, we are left wondering, "How many years must some women wait before they are allowed to be free?" The answer is unlikely to be blown in by the wind - someone has to start making an effort soon.