REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL APPROACHES TO ESTABLISHING A MINISTRY OF ECONOMY

Final Report

May 4, 2008

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by <Dr. Kathleen Trask>.

REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL APPROACHES TO ESTABLISHING A MINISTRY OF ECONOMY

FINAL REPORT

SUSTAINABLE ACHIEVEMENT OF
BUSINESS EXPANSION AND QUALITY (SABEQ)

CONTRACT NUMBER: 278-C-00-06-00332-00

BEARINGPOINT, INC.

USAID/JORDAN
ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES OFFICE (EO)

MAY 4, 2008

AUTHOR: DR. KATHLEEN TRASK

DELIVERABLE N$^{\underline{O}}$: 2.1.2.8.6.4_REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL APPROACHES TO ESTABLISHING A MINISTRY OF ECONOMY

DISCLAIMER:

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

CONTENTS

1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.1 Background and Objectives 1
1.2 Overview 2
2 TRENDS IN INTERNATIONAL APPROACHES TO ECONOMIC POLICY GOVERNANCE 4
2.1 Government Structures and the Economy 4
2.2 Roles for a Ministry of Economy 5
3 COUNTRY COMPARISONS – TRENDS AND BEST PRACTICES 8
3.1 Comparator Country Selections - Rationale 8
3.2 Selected Highlights and Best Practices from Comparator Countries 11
4 CONCLUSIONS 13
ANNEX A: GOVERNMENT FUNCTIONS ASSOCIATED WITH ECONOMIC POLICY 14
ANNEX B: COMPARATOR COUNTRIES – ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE 15

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES

The Government of Jordan is considering re-organizing the current Ministry of Industry and Trade (MIT) into a Ministry of Economy. The ministerial re-organization is being considered in response to a wide range of developments. In recent years, the Ministry's organizational structure has remained largely unchanged, while Jordan's domestic economic policies have undergone wide-ranging reforms, and Jordan's commitments to international trade and investment agreements have expanded significantly. At the same time, external economic conditions faced by Jordan, both regionally and globally, have been evolving at a rapid pace. In considering this reorganization, the MIT seeks to more effectively meet the challenges of managing economic policy in an increasingly complex, integrated and rapidly evolving international economy.

To inform this discussion, the current study examines the structural approaches to the management of economic policy in ten comparator countries to identify best practices and international trends. The comparator countries were chosen based on the following criteria.

- Economic similarity to Jordan in terms of current economic conditions, trade and investment policies, and business environment.
- Diversity in approaches to economic governance including trade and investment policy formation.
- Geographic proximity to Jordan with a specific focus on the Middle East/North Africa (MENA) region.
- A review of relevant best practices of developed countries of North America, Europe and Asia/Pacific.

The comparator countries selected are:

Table 1: Comparator Countries

Egypt Lebanon Morocco	**MENA Region**
Ireland Denmark	**Europe**
Costa Rica	**North/Latin America**

Chile US	
Singapore	**Asia/Pacific**
Australia	

The objectives of this study are:

- To present alternative structural approaches to economic governance in MENA and internationally, identifying relevant best practices.
- To compare how structures in the comparator countries align with economic policy goals and international best practices in management.
- To compare the present and planned future scope and structure of Jordan's proposed Ministry of Economy to international practices and inform discussions within the Government of Jordan regarding the shape of the planned Ministry of Economy.

1.2 OVERVIEW

Directly or indirectly, all government ministries and agencies have an impact on the economy, growth, competitiveness and the overall enabling environment for business. In examining the potential scope for a Ministry of Economy, the current study considers the standard roles which directly support, regulate or enhance market development and performance. Table 2 provides an overview of the potential roles for a Ministry of Economy.

Table 2: Potential Roles for a Ministry of Economy

Functional Area	**Activities**
Policy	Domestic Trade Policy Investment International Trade Policy and Negotiation Enterprise Development Policy
Business/Consumer Services and Regulation	Business Services and Regulation Consumer Protection Competition Standards Market Regulation
Enterprise Promotion	Investment Promotion

	Export Promotion Enterprise Development Support
Coordination of Economic Planning	Research and Analysis Economic Planning Statistics

From a functional perspective, the potential roles for a Ministry of Economy include policy, business and consumer services, market regulation, and enterprise support programs. Areas of activity include domestic trade, international trade, investment, competition and consumer protection. Finally, the effective coordination of policy includes overall planning for the government's role in the enabling environment including policy analysis and strategic planning which forms a critical input into the coordination of economic governance activities within and across ministries.

While all the comparator countries address the functions outlined in Table 2, they exhibit a wide range of approaches to the organization of economic governance functions. No singular best practice emerges nor is there in general a common theme in the motivation for the adoption of different structures across countries. Some have maintained historical divisions in the government and some have altered structures in response to particular policy goals.

While no single definition for the scope of a Ministry of Economy emerges, Table 3 provides a generalized classification for the roles of the central economic ministry across the comparator countries. The narrowest classification is defined as the ***Commerce Model*** which is primarily concerned with domestic trade and regulation. The ***Industry and Trade Model***, the current model for Jordan, combines additional roles most specifically international trade policy, negotiation and implementation. The broadest classification is the ***Economy Model*** which additionally serves as a coordinating mechanism for economic governance policy across the government combining the functions of a Ministry of Industry and Trade with overall economic policy coordination, planning functions and research and analysis.

Table 3: International Approaches to Economic Governance

Classification	**Definition**	**Comparator Countries**
Commerce Model	Regulation of domestic trade, provision of business and customer services. In some cases, investment policy and coordination.	US, Denmark, Morocco, Chile, Costa Rica, Australia
Industry and Trade Model	Ministry of Commerce roles in addition to International Trade, Investment and	**Jordan,** Egypt

	enterprise support.	
Economy Model	Ministry of Industry and Trade in addition to policy analysis and overall coordination of activities.	Ireland, Singapore, Lebanon

The current study examines the approaches to economic governance across the comparator countries drawing lessons for best practices in the structures for economic governance. Section 2 provides an overview of international approaches to economic governance including organizational structures internationally and potential roles for a Ministry of Economy. Section 3 compares the approaches to economic governance in the comparator countries including the rationale for the selection of the comparators, a review of economic performance and how structures have affected economic outcomes. Section 4 concludes and draws upon the experience of comparator countries to inform the discussions regarding Jordan's proposed Ministry of Economy.

2 TRENDS IN INTERNATIONAL APPROACHES TO ECONOMIC POLICY GOVERNANCE

To place the analysis of the comparator countries in context of best practices in international approaches to economic governance, the following section provides a broad overview of the division of economic functions within government followed by a review of the roles of government which support, regulate or enhance market development and performance which could potentially be incorporated into a Ministry of Economy.

2.1 GOVERNMENT STRUCTURES AND THE ECONOMY

Virtually all government ministries have an impact, directly or indirectly, on the economy, development and overall competitiveness. The division of major roles across countries is nearly uniform and Table 4 below highlights the division across structures.

The governance and implementation of monetary and fiscal policy are among the most critical factors in determining the competitiveness of domestic firms and the attractiveness of the economy as an investment destination. Monetary policy governing exchange rate policy, inflation and interest rates, housed in a central banking agency across all the comparator countries. Fiscal policy including the structure of taxation, government expenditure and revenue collection has direct implications for economic competitiveness and investment. The authority for the tax framework and expenditure systems most commonly rest with the executive and legislative branch with the Ministry of Finance or equivalent agency as the coordinating and implementing body.

Table 4: Economic Policy Roles across Government Ministries

Policy Area	Government Structure
Monetary Policy	Central Bank
Fiscal Policy and Implementation	Ministry of Finance
Sectoral Ministries	Agriculture, Tourism, Mining
Other	Labor, Transport, Energy, Education, Health

While overall market policy and development is typically centered in a central economic ministry, all of the comparator countries separate out policies for key sectors. All of the comparator countries locate agricultural policies in an independent ministry and depending on the makeup of the economy, additional sectoral ministries include commonly tourism and mining. The majority of the sectoral ministries house functions identical to the overall economic ministry including regulation, business support services and research and planning initiatives. Not only do the policies and functions of the sectoral ministries affect the targeted sector but they also affect overall economic initiatives. Agriculture in particular typically contains a large regulatory component which gives it a substantial role in trade facilitation well beyond the agricultural sector.

Finally, other supporting ministries for water, power, energy and transport provide the basic infrastructure which forms a fundamental component of the basic enabling environment for business. Labor and education determine the skill level of the work force and the ease with which firms can employ workers.

All of these roles are interconnected with each other and with the potential roles for a Ministry of Economy. Internationally and across the comparator countries, economic governance and market regulation and support functions are structured in a variety of ways from coordination within a single Ministry to separation across multiple industries. While no single method comes forward as a best practice, what is clear is that successful, outward oriented economies are able to effectively coordinate not only market development policies but also coordinate economic goals across all government bodies which impact the economy.

2.2 ROLES FOR A MINISTRY OF ECONOMY

The scope of potential roles for a Ministry of Economy spans the range of government functions which address the market framework for the economy, enhance the competitiveness of domestic firms, ensure the efficient operation of markets through regulation and provide overall coordination of government economic policies. Table 2 above outlines the major areas of operation which include policy formation, business services and market regulation, enterprise promotion and the overall coordination of economic planning. These areas represent a maximum scope for a Ministry of Economy. As indicated in Table 3, across the comparator countries, there is substantial variation in the scopes of the primary economic ministries. This section reviews the detailed activities for each of these areas and Annexes A and B provide an overview of the structures in the comparator countries.

Business/Consumer Services and Regulation

Regulation of markets to enhance efficiency, competition and consumer safety is a standard role for government to ensure the orderly operation of markets and to ensure that all individuals can benefit from the market system. Areas of activity include:

- **Standards:** The impact of standards on the economy and its competitiveness can be substantial. Internationally, governments play an active role in the support of standards organizations. Best practice is followed almost uniformly across countries with an independent agency functioning as a national standards institute. Most frequently, this institute is linked to the primary economic ministry.
- **Consumer Protection**: The scope of work for consumer protection is varied, overlapping with standards issues and ranging from consumer education to the enforcement of consumer laws.
- **Competition Policy:** The development of competition policy and the enforcement of competition laws ensure the protection of consumers and the ability of firms to compete effectively in the marketplace. Best practices have evolved towards the establishment of independent Competition Agencies although it is frequently housed in the economic ministry or alternatively under the Ministry of Justice.
- **Market Oversight:** While not a standard role for government, many economic ministries maintain functions related to the monitoring and "control" of prices and the management of government stocks.
- **Intellectual and Industrial Property**: Standard functions for an economic ministry include the the registration of intellectual and industrial property, patents. Trademarks, etc..
- **Business Services:** Services include business licensing, import/export licensing and the issuance of certificates of origin. Some or all of which may be housed in a central economic ministry. Best practices have evolved to streamline these services in a "one-stop shop".

Policy

Policy roles for a Ministry of Economy focus on establishing the framework for competition and the coordination of government support and incentives to business. Four main policy areas are identified domestic trade, private sector development, investment and international trade policy. Across the comparator countries, all four policy areas are located in a variety of institutions. Commonly domestic trade, investment and private sector development are housed in the central economic ministry while the inclusion of international trade policy distinguishes the Commerce and Industry and Trade models.

- Domestic Trade Policy: Policies with regards to the domestic environment for business including a specific focus on the regulatory and business services of the ministry.
- International Trade Policy, Negotiation and Implementation: Common divisions include WTO Division, Bilateral Relations, Regional Relations as well as the coordination of economic research in the area of trade policy.

- Investment Policy: Focused on enhancing the attractiveness of the economy for foreign and domestic investors, policies include the coordination of investment and the structure of incentives.
- Industrial Policy and/or Private Sector Development Policy: In addition to specific industrial policies scope of work includes the promotion of private sector activity often with specific focus on small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs).

Business Support Programs

Internationally, almost all governments are engaged in direct business support programs designed to enhance the competitiveness of domestic firms and the domestic market. Investment promotion and export promotion are two of the primary means of promoting inward investment and expanding outward market share. Programs include one-stop-shops for business, information, training and coordination of activities in foreign markets. Best practices for both investment promotion and export promotion are for independent agencies typically under the oversight of the central economic ministry. Additionally, enterprise support by government encompasses a variety of activities including training and logistical support for SMEs, the development and oversight of industrial parks, free trade zones and the coordination of international trade fairs and exhibitions. As with investment and export promotion, best practice locates these activities in largely independent agencies with oversight from an economic ministry.

- Investment Promotion
- Export Promotion
- Enterprise support: Activities include SME support, Industrial Parks, Free Trade Zones, coordination of international trade fairs and exhibitions.

Strategic Planning

Given the inter-connections between the roles for a Ministry of Economy and those of related government agencies, governments recognize the need for an overall coordination mechanism for economic policy. Such initiatives include engagement with the private sector as well as broader civil service organizations. To inform this process requires quality inputs including accurate statistical data and economic research and analysis across the topical areas. Functional activities in this area include:

- Comprehensive policy coordination
- Engagement with Private Sector and Broader Civil Society
- Statistics: Best practice is an independent agency with government oversight.
- Economic Research and Analysis

There is considerable variation across countries in the allocation of these roles across government. Some economic ministries include a research function and maintain independent statistics. Equally common is the allocation of these activities to a Ministry of Planning. However, recent trends across countries include the emergence of national councils for competitiveness as the forum for economic policy coordination. Such forums

typically incorporate representatives from government, the private sector, as well as civil society.

These four functional areas and related activities do not comprise a comprehensive list of potential activities for a Ministry of Economy but largely captures the most common activities internationally and across the comparator countries. Among the comparator countries, additional roles include the promotion of innovation and research and development. The comparator countries also vary substantially in how they allocate the activities listed above between a central economic ministry and other agencies. As highlighted in Table 2, the countries range from a narrow commerce model to the broadest Economy model which incorporates the majority of areas highlighted.

3 COUNTRY COMPARISONS – TRENDS AND BEST PRACTICES

This section of the report reviews the approaches of the comparator countries with respect to economic governance institutions. An overview of the economic performance of the comparator countries and the rationale for inclusion is presented followed by a presentation of the highlights of the cross-country approaches

3.1 COMPARATOR COUNTRY SELECTIONS - RATIONALE

The ten comparator countries were chosen for this study based on several criteria: economic similarity to Jordan in terms of current economic conditions, trade and investment policies, and business environment; diversity in approaches to economic governance including trade and investment policy formation; geographic proximity to Jordan with a specific focus on the MENA region; relevant best practice approaches in North America, Europe and Asia/Pacific.

Based on these criteria, three MENA countries were selected: Egypt, Lebanon and Morocco. Ireland and Denmark from Europe were included on the basis of their different approaches and a general consensus in the literature that Ireland represents a “best practice” economy with respect to the success of its economic institutions. The US was selected primarily as a benchmark comparison – the size and diversity of the US economy and the importance of state level economic institutions may make lessons for Jordan less relevant. Costa Rica and Chile vary in their approaches and as with Ireland, in many areas, Costa Rica is considered a “Best Practice” country for selected economic institutions. Finally, Singapore and Australia were included as examples of best practice in specific areas – importantly, the overwhelming outward oriented success of Singapore.

All of the comparator countries have explicit policy goals to achieve greater global integration, to attract foreign investment in an outward looking economy. Most have aggressively pursued these goals although the implications for economic institutions are perhaps less significant for the higher income countries with the exception of Singapore.

Finally, all the comparator countries vary in their approach to economic governance institutions. As outlined in Table 2, six of the ten comparators follow Commerce model; Egypt and Jordan follow a Industry and Trade Model. The primary functional differences between the Commerce and Industry and Trade models in the comparator countries is the inclusion of responsibility for trade policy and negotiation in the latter. Finally, Lebanon, Ireland and Singapore are classified as Economy models. Annexes A and B provide details regarding the allocation of scopes across institutions in the comparator countries.

Economic Performance in the Comparator Countries

Table 5 presents selected macroeconomic indicators for the comparator countries and Jordan. The comparators span the range from lower middle to high income economies. With the exception of Lebanon, all are growing economies with the MENA countries reporting growth rates between six and eight percent. The openness of the comparator economies varies considerably. Using the share of exports and imports as a percent of GDP as a standard indicator of openness, Singapore, Jordan and Costa Rica are the most open with ratios in excess of 100 percent. The US is the least open with a ratio of only 24 percent.

Table 5: Selected Macroeconomic Indicators for Comparator Countries

	GNI per capita (US$)	GDP Growth (Annual %)	Exports (% GDP)	Imports (% of GDP)	Net FDI inflow (% of GDP)
Jordan	2,650	5.7	54.6	92.0	21.8
Egypt	1,360	6.8	29.9	31.6	9.9
Lebanon	5,580	0.0	23.7	39.9	12.4
Morocco	2,160	8.0	22.0	38.4	5.2
Ireland	44,830	5.7	81.3*	68.6*	-0.5
Denmark	52,100	3.2	51.9	49.0	1.2
US	44,710	2.9	10.5*	16.3*	1.3
Costa Rica	4,980	8.2	49.6	55.9	6.8
Chile	6,810	4.0	45.4	30.9	7.1
Singapore	28,730	7.9	252.6	220.9	18.8
Australia	35,860	2.5	20.3*	21.8*	3.7

Source: 2006 Data, World Development Indicators Database, World Bank; GDP Growth. * indicates 2005 data.

With the exception of Ireland which recorded a slightly negative Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) inflow for 2006, all of the comparator countries have attracted FDI to varying degrees. For 2006, Jordan had the highest FDI inflow at nearly 22 percent of GDP.

Tables 6 and 7, highlight the performance of comparator countries in terms of two standard indices of competitiveness: the World Bank's "Doing Business" rankings and the Global Competitiveness Index of the World Economic Forum. The high income countries in the sample rank at the top, Chile stands out among the remaining comparators on both indices.

Table 6: "Doing Business" Rankings

	Overall Ranking	Starting Business	Dealing w/Licenses	Registering Property	Protecting Investors	Trading Across Borders
Singapore	1	9	5	13	2	1
United States	3	4	24	10	5	15
Denmark	5	18	6	39	19	2
Ireland	8	5	20	79	5	20
Australia	9	1	52	27	51	34
Chile	33	39	58	34	33	43
Jordan	**80**	**133**	**71**	**109**	**107**	**59**
Lebanon	85	132	113	92	83	83
Costa Rica	115	113	120	41	158	54
Egypt	126	55	163	101	83	26
Morocco	129	51	88	102	158	67

Source: *Doing Business 2008*, World Bank. Rankings are out of 178 Countries.

Table 7: Global Competitiveness Index, Rankings for Comparator Countries

	2007-2008		06-07 Rank
Country	**Ranking**	**Score**	**Change from 06**
United States	1	5.67	0
Denmark	2	5.55	-1
Singapore	7	5.45	1
Australia	19	5.27	-3
Ireland	22	5.03	0
Chile	26	4.77	1
Jordan	**49**	**4.32**	**-3**
Costa Rica	63	4.11	2
Morocco	64	4.08	1

Egypt	77	3.96	-6
Lebanon	N/A		

Source: *Global Competitiveness Report 2007-2008,* World Economic Forum (2007). Rankings are out of 131 countries ranked in 2007-2008. Lebanon was not ranked in the report.

3.2 SELECTED HIGHLIGHTS AND BEST PRACTICES FROM COMPARATOR COUNTRIES

This section reviews trends and best practices across the functional areas for economic governance in the comparator countries. Overall, the basic division of economic governance roles across government institutions has been largely stable. Notable exceptions include Egypt and Australia. In December 2007, a reallocation of responsibilities from the Department of Industry, Tourism and Resources was and the Department of Education, Science and Training formed the Department of Innovation, Industry, Science and Research with overall responsibilities for industry and innovation promotion. Egypt is unique among the comparator countries with a separate Ministry of Investment formed by presidential decree in 2004 with responsibilities for investment policy, promotion and oversight for special economic zones.

Regulatory Roles

As highlighted in Annex A, business and consumer services and market regulation are most commonly under the purview of the central economic ministry. Recent trends and best practices include an overall trend towards the establishment of independent agencies with government retaining oversight.

- Standards: While some government agencies retain some role for standards and measurement, all coordinate functions through a national standards institute.

- Consumer protection: Five of the ten comparator countries house consumer protection services within the central economic ministry. Current trends include a movement towards separate agencies as in Chile's National Consumer Service (SERNAC).

- Market Regulation: The central economic ministry has a role in direct market regulation in eight of the ten comparator countries although the size of this role varies across countries. Current trends and best practices devolves roles for competition and intellectual policy and enforcement to a separate agency such as the Competition Authority in Ireland and the National Institute of Industrial Property in Chile.

- Business Services: For the high income countries, many business services are in part addressed at a sub-federal level but in five of the ten comparator countries the economic ministry performs at least some business services although these may be shared with several agencies. Trends in best practice direct the streamlining and coordination of

these roles into “one stop shops” to increase transparency for business. Requirements, delays and costs for licensing and other business services are among the most significant negatives for the middle income countries in the World Bank’s “Doing Business”.

Policy Roles

- All of the economic ministries retain policy roles for enterprise development policy and domestic trade with the exception of the US and Australia where domestic trade policy is dispersed throughout levels of government.

- Trade Policy and Negotiation is coordinated in the primary economic ministry in only four of the comparator countries and this is the fundamental distinction between the Commerce and Industry and Trade models. In the remaining six comparators, this policy area is included in the scope of work for an independent Ministry of Foreign Trade.

- Similarly, in only three of the comparators is investment policy and promotion under the purview of the economic Ministry. Egypt is unique with an independent Ministry of Investment. In the remaining comparators, investment promotion policies and activities are under the oversight of the Ministry of Foreign Trade/Affairs (Denmark and Chile) or policies are coordinated across government agencies under the auspices of the Investment promotion agency as is the case in Costa Rica and Lebanon. The advantage of the latter approaches is that they allow for greater cooperation across related government ministries as well as the coordination of inputs from a broad array of stakeholders.

Business Promotion

While the US and Australia have more dispersed investment and export promotional activities, in the remainder of comparator countries, the most common practice is an independent agency for promotional activities with oversight from government. The level of oversight and the coordination of promotional activities varies across the comparators.

The more common approach is separate entities for investment and export promotion - the exception is the Investment Development Authority of Lebanon which coordinates both activities in a single agency. IDAL is not attached to a single Ministry but is under the direct oversight of the Council of Ministers. While in Ireland and Singapore, oversight of both activities is coordinated by a single Ministry, across the remaining comparators, oversight is split most commonly between a Ministry of Foreign Trade for Export Promotion and Ministry of Commerce for investment promotion.

Planning and Coordination

In six of the ten comparator countries utilize structures for the coordination of overall economic polices and activities not only across the scope for a Ministry of Economy but also incorporating input from a broader array of government institutions which impact economic

policy. The structures for planning and coordination vary across countries with the most effective structures incorporating input from the private sector and broader civil society. In Egypt, Chile and Costa Rica, overall policy coordination is assigned to a Ministry of Planning. Following the Economy model, for Lebanon, Ireland and Singapore the central economic ministry is responsible for overall policy coordination. The remaining countries (US, Australia, Denmark and Morocco) follow more dispersed approaches. Despite these differences, a few overall trends and best practices emerge.

- Effective policy formation and coordination of policies requires the provision of quality economic analysis across a wide range of topics. While some research functions are housed in the coordinating ministry, the outsourcing of economic analysis and research to private organizations and universities while long common practice in the high income countries this is also an increasing trend across the comparator countries. This practice has the advantage of strengthening local institutions, increasing the range and quality of economic research while allowing government agencies to focus on core competencies without having to maintain expertise in a broad variety of areas.

- Singapore's Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ireland's Department of Enterprise, Trade and Development are widely considered to be "best practice" institutions. As central coordinating agencies across the complete range of economic functions, they are able to avoid problems with poor linkages across agencies which can confound policy coordination and maximize available resources by making extensive use of independent agencies and using ministry oversight roles to ensure the effective coordination of policy.

- Increasingly international trends are towards the formation of broader consultative organizations. These consultative organizations include coordination at the ministerial level such as Australia's Trade Policy Advisory Council and Chile's Foreign Investment Committee. Additionally, forums are emerging which incorporate the input not only of government agencies but also the private sector and civil society most commonly along the lines of a national competitiveness council.

4 CONCLUSIONS

This study has sought to inform the Government of Jordan as it considers a reorganization of the current Ministry of Industry and Trade into a broader Ministry of Economy. The organization of economic governance functions across ten comparator countries reveals that no single approach is considered best practice. While the broad based Economy approach to the coordination includes the successful examples of Singapore and Ireland, Costa Rica's approach particularly to export and investment promotion which coordinates activities through the independent Investment Development Board is also considered a best practice model.

In drawing lessons for a proposed Ministry of Economy in Jordan, the study provides several areas for considerations. International trends are moving towards aggressively streamlining of regulatory and business service functions both in promotional agencies and within the ministry. The comparator countries display an increased reliance on independent agencies not only for enterprise promotion but also for regulatory and business service functions. The most successful examples of effective policy coordination incorporate input from a broad

array of government ministries with direct or indirect impacts on the economy and further incorporate input from the private sector and civil society.

ANNEX A: GOVERNMENT FUNCTIONS ASSOCIATED WITH ECONOMIC POLICY

	Policy				Business Promotion		Business and Consumer Services/Regulatory				Planning and Coordination	
	Trade Policy and Negotiation	Investment Policy	Enterprise Development Policy	Domestic Trade Policy	Investment Promotion	Export Promotion	Business Services	Consumer Protection	Standards	Market Regulation	Statistics	Research and Analysis
Egypt	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	I/+	+	-	-
Lebanon	+	-	+	+	I/-	I/-	+/-	+	I/-	+	I/-	+
Morocco	-	+	+	+	I/+	I/-	+/-	+	+	+	-	-
Denmark	-	-	+	+	-	-	+	-	+	+	+	-
Ireland	+	+	+	+	I/+	I/+	I/+	+	I	+	I/-	+
Chile	-	-	+	+	I/-	I/-	-	I	I	+	I/-	-
Costa Rica	-	-	+	+	I	I/-	+	+	+	+	-	-
US	-	+/-	+	-	+/-	+/-	+/-	-	-	-	+	+
Australia	-	+/-	+	+/-	+/-	+/-	-	-	+	-	-	+/-
Singapore	+	+	+	+	I/+	+	-	+	I	+/-	I	+

(+) indicates function is housed or overseen by central economic ministry, (-) indicates function housed or overseen by a secondary ministry or other entity, +/- indicates shared responsibility; (I/+) denotes an independent agency under the direction of the central economic ministry, (I/-) denotes an independent agency under the direction of a secondary ministry or other organization.

ANNEX B: COMPARATOR COUNTRIES – ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE

Country	Lebanon	**Ministry Mission**	**Ministry Central Policy Areas**	**Key Departments**
Governance Model	Economy	The Ministry of Economy and Trade is responsible for economic matters and national stockpiling needs. These include the planning and coordination of, and implementation in, the fields of trade and the economy.	- International Trade Policy and Negotiation in association with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Emigrants - Consumer Protection and Market Regulation - Intellectual Property - Foreign Business Registration; Import/Export Licenses - **Economic Research and Statistics** - SME Development - Insurance regulation	- Trade - Consumer Protection - Intellectual Property - Economic Research - E-Commerce - SME Project - WTO and Euro Mediterranean Relations Unit
Ministry Name	Ministry of Economy and Trade Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring	Establishment of SME Project (2004)			
Notes:	Lebanon is currently in the WTO accession process. Investment policy per se is not housed in the Ministry of Economy and Trade but Investment Promotion is under the direct authority of the Council of Ministers.			

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	**Functions housed in these organizations**
Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Emigrants	Trade Negotiation is jointly handled with Ministry of Economy and Trade.
Ministry of Industry	Equivalent of Ministry of Commerce. Scope of work is largely oriented towards business services and includes licensing and registration for domestic businesses, export promotion, industrial development. Oversight of Lebanese Standards Institution.
Investment Development Authority of Lebanon	One stop shop for investors and exporters. Independent agency under the direct authority of the Council of Ministers
Lebanese Standards Institution (LIBNOR)	Independent agency with oversight from Ministry of Industry
Central Administration for Statistics	Independent agency under direct authority of the Council of Ministers.
Sectoral Ministries:	Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Tourism and Ministry of Telecommunications

Country	Egypt	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Trade and Industry		- Trade Policy and Negotiation - Enterprise Development Policy/SMEs - Domestic Trade Policy - Export Promotion - Business Services – Registration and Import Export Licenses - Oversight of Standards - Consumer Protection	
Ministry Name	Ministry of Trade and Industry Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring	Ministry of Trade and Industry established in 2004 through a merger of the Ministry of Foreign Trade and the Ministry of Industry and Technological Development.			
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Ministry of Investment	Created in 2004 by presidential decree. Scope of work includes investment policy and promotion including oversight of General Authority for Investment and Free Zones.
Ministry of State for Economic Development	Coordination of overall economic planning and strategies. Oversight of statistical and planning institutes.
Central Agency for Public Mobilisation and Statistics (CAPMAS)	Independent agency under authority of Ministry of State for Economic Development.
Institute for National Planning	Independent agency under authority of Ministry of State for Economic Development. Central agency for research studies related to economic development, planning, trade and the economy.
General Authority for Standards and Quality	Independent agency under authority of Ministry of Trade and Industry.
Sectoral Ministries:	Ministry of Petroleum, Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation, Ministry of Tourism

Country	Morocco	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Commerce	None Available	- Standards - Domestic Trade - Consumer Services - Investment Promotion - Environment - Some economic analysis functions but not related to overall policy coordination	Each related to key policy area.
Ministry Name	Ministry of Industry, Commerce and New Technologies Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Ministry of Foreign Trade	All trade policy, negotiation and implementation including supporting economic research and analysis. Oversight of export promotion activities.
Moroccan Center for Export Promotion	Export promotion agency under the oversight of the Ministry of Foreign Trade.
National Council on Trade	Public/Private consultation forum regarding international trade issues.
Investir au Maroc	Independent agency for investment promotion, under direction of Ministry of Industry, Commerce and New Technologies.
Statistics	
Standards	
Sectoral Ministries:	Ministry of Agriculture, Rural Development and Fisheries; Ministry of Tourism, Handicrafts and Socio-Economics; Ministry of Energy and Mining

Country	Denmark	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Commerce	To create future-oriented conditions for growth for citizens and companies in an increasingly globalised world.	- Business regulation - Intellectual Property Rights - Competition policy - Financial sector - Construction sector - Shipping - Statistics and Standards Agency Oversight	- Economic and Financial Affairs - Commercial Law and Building - Business Affairs
Ministry Name	Ministry of Economic and Business Affairs Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Responsibility for international trade policy. Through the Trade Council of Denmark provides services for export and investment promotion in addition to SME promotion.
Statistics Denmark	Independent agency under Ministry of Economic and Business Affairs.
Invest in Denmark	Investment Promotion under Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Danish Exporters	Export promotion under Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
Sectoral Ministries:	Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Fisheries

Country	Ireland	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Economy	To promote the sustainable development of a modern competitive enterprise economy based on quality employment, social inclusion and enhanced working and living standards	- Trade Policy coordination - Competitiveness Policy - Business Services including Import/Export Licensing - Consumer Protection - Competition - SME Development - Domestic Trade and Internal Market Policy - Science and technology support - Intellectual Property - Investment Promotion - Export Promotion	- Labour Force Development Division - Competitiveness and International Affairs Division - Employment Rights and Industrial Relations Division - Science, Technology and Intellectual Property Division - Corporate Services and Economic Policy Division - Consumers, Competition and Commerce Division - Enterprise and Agencies Division
Ministry Name	Department of Enterprise, Trade and Development (DETE)			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:	International trade policy conducted through EU organizations.			

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Competition Authority	Statutory authority for Irish competition law under direction of DETE.
Enterprise Ireland	Independent agency under DETE responsible for the development and promotion of the indigenous business sector with a specific focus on export promotion.
Forfás	Forfás is the national policy and advisory board for enterprise, trade, science, technology and innovation under direction of DETE.
IDA Ireland	Industrial Development Agency under authority of DETE has responsibility for securing new investment from overseas in manufacturing and internationally traded services sectors.

Country	Chile	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Commerce	Formulate and monitor policies and programmes aimed at generating sustained growth and sustainable, with progressive equity in distribution.	- Competition and Market Regulation - Foreign Trade (TBT, Barriers – trade policy and negotiation with Ministry of Foreign Affairs) - SME Development - Some participation in export promotion - Promotion of innovative industries - Intellectual and Industrial Property - Sectoral responsibilities for aquaculture, tourism and fisheries - Oversight of independent statistics institute.	- Productive Development (promotion of competitiveness) - Industrial Property - Market Development - Foreign Trade
Ministry Name	Ministry of Economy Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Trade Policy and Negotiation, Export Promotion and participation in investment promotion through Chile Foreign Investment Committee
Ministry of Planning	Economic planning, research services and public investment planning.
ProChile	Export Promotion Agency under the direction of Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
Chile Foreign Investment Committee	Investment promotion arm of government. Committee governed by Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Finance and Central Bank.
National Institute of Industrial Property	Independent Office under oversight of Ministry of Economy
Sectoral Ministries:	Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Mining

Country	Costa Rica	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Commerce	Not Available	- Enterprise Development and SME Support - Domestic Trade Regulation - Standards and Metrology - Competitiveness - Consumer Protection - Competition Policy	- Consumer Services - Competition - Competitiveness - Regulatory Issues and Technical Regulation - SME
Ministry Name	Ministry of Economy, Industry and Commerce Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Ministry of Foreign Trade	Foreign Trade Policy and Negotiation, investment promotion,
Ministry of National Planning and Economic Policy	Overall economic planning, aid coordination and research services.
PROCOMER	Export promotion agency under the Ministry of Foreign Trade.
Costa Rica Investment Development Board (CINDE)	Independent Investment Promotion Agency
Sectoral Ministries:	Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock, Ministry of Tourism

Country	US	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Commerce	To foster, serve, and promote the Nation's economic development and technological advancement	- International trade - Competitiveness - Scientific and technical cooperation - National Oceanographic Institute - Statistics - Economic Research - Export and Investment Promotion	- International Trade - Industry and Security - National Institute of Standards and Technology - Intellectual Property/US Patent and Trademark office - Telecommunications - Minority Business Development
Ministry Name	Department of Commerce Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:	Investment and export promotion activities at federal and state level. Business services are at the state level.			

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
United States Trade Representative	Responsible for trade negotiations
Sectoral Ministries:	Department of Agriculture

Country	Australia	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Commerce	To encourage the sustainable growth of Australian industries by developing a national innovation system that drives knowledge creation, cutting edge science and research, international competitiveness and greater productivity.	- Industrial Policy - Encouraging Innovation and Science - Investment and Export Promotion Services - Small Business Development - Standard and Measurement Oversight	
Ministry Name	Department of Innovation, Industry, Science and Research Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring	Department created in 2007 Responsibility for industry from the former Department of Industry, Tourism and Resources was amalgamated with responsibility for science and research from the former Department of Education, Science and Training.			
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade	Trade policy, negotiation and supporting research additionally activities in investment and export promotion.
Foreign Investment Review Board	The Foreign Investment Review Board (FIRB) is a non-statutory body that advises the Government on foreign investment policy and its administration. The Board examines proposals by foreign interests to undertake direct investment in Australia and makes recommendations to the Government on whether those proposals are suitable for approval under the Government's policy.
Austrade	Australian Government agency that helps and assists Australian companies and supports business to export products and services
Trade Policy Advisory Council	The TPAC advises the Minister for Trade on substantive international trade issues and provides a forum in which matters of concern to members and the Minister in the areas of international trade are brought forward and examined.
Sectoral Ministries:	

Country	Singapore	Ministry Mission	Ministry Central Policy Areas	Key Departments
Governance Model	Economy	To promote economic growth and create jobs, so as to achieve higher standards of living for all.		
Ministry Name	Ministry of Trade and Industry Organizational Chart			
Recent Restructuring				
Notes:				

Other Organizations Housing Economic Functions	Functions housed in these organizations
Sectoral Ministries:	

Sustainable Achievement of Business Expansion and Quality
Salem Center, Sequleyah Street
Al Rabieh, Amman
Phone: +962 6 550 3050
Fax: +962 6 550 3069
Web address: **http://www.sabeq-jordan.org**