

THE CRS INCOME GENERATION PROJECT
FOR RURAL WOMEN
IN JORDAN:
An Interim Evaluation

by
Isabel Nieves

International Center for Research on Women
1717 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20036

November, 1985

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Project Purpose and Goal	2
Project Work Plan	3
Production Training	4
Production Lines	8
Management Training	9
Project Management	10
Training in Marketing and Sales	11
Current Marketing and Sales	11
Income Generation	14
Income Use and Distribution	15
Finanacial Analysis	16
Summary: Progress Towards Project Objectives	21
Recommendations	22
References Cited	25
Persons Contacted	26

2

Table of Contents/continued

Documents Consulted	27
Appendix 1	28
Appendix 2	33
Appendix 3	35

Introduction

The Catholic Relief Services' (CRS) Income Generation Project for Rural Women in Jordan (Grant No. 278-0258/0260-00) is a clothes-making workshop in the town of Mafrag, 1½ hours northeast of Amman. It currently provides work for 24 local women, 22 of them from low income households. The project began August 1, 1984 and has a 2 year duration. Funding is \$200,000. Additional descriptive information on the project is provided in Appendix 1.

The International Center for Research on Women provided 10 person-days of technical assistance to USAID-Jordan to conduct a programmatic evaluation of CRS' project, under ICRW's contract with AID entitled "Improving the Productivity, Incomes, and Economic Opportunities of Women through Project Specific Technical Assistance." Isabel Nieves of ICRW and USAID-Jordan agreed upon the following scope of work:

- 1) Evaluate the project, looking especially at progress to date in achieving project purpose and goal.
- 2) Provide technical assistance in the following problem areas:
 - a) improving the training and development of locally hired project supervisors and managers;
 - b) increasing the participation and involvement of the Arab Women's Society (AWS) in the project's day-to-day operations in anticipation that it will soon take over the management responsibilities for the project.

CRS had identified these and other weaknesses in the project prior to the midpoint evaluation, and was beginning to take some steps to correct them. However, they are running out of time. AID funding ends July 31, 1986 and the work plan calls for the AWS to take over the project completely by June 30, 1986. There are eight months left to implement a transition plan from CRS to the Mafrag Chapter of the AWS.

market for uniforms is seasonal, that the local market undersells the Ministry of Supplies' price ceiling for uniforms, and that the market for children's clothes is a shallow one.

- 2) The training assessment erroneously assumed that the equipment and training required were for domestic sewing; neither the equipment nor the training capacity for industrial sewing were available in-country.
- 3) The community development assessment of benevolent and women's societies in the project site made evident the weaknesses of such groups but stopped short of concluding they would be ineffective implementing agencies. The proposal prepared by CRS identifies the local women's benevolent society as its counterpart.

Project Work Plan

The time frame for the project is two years, at the end of which a working production cooperative would be running a viable business. The start-up phase was planned to take 2 months, but just the procurement of the industrial sewing equipment took over 4 months. A 5 month training period during which a marketing/accounting officer, 2 sewing supervisors and 20 production workers would receive instruction, would be followed by a 16 month period of production. The production activities would be turned over to the local counterpart organization at the mid-point of this period. A final month of evaluation would bring the project to completion.

This time frame was overly ambitious. Other experience has shown that income-generating projects for women need at least 3 years to become viable small business enterprises or cooperatives (Crandon and Shepard, 1985). In addition, a number of project-specific circumstances, such as the high turnover rate in 3 key management and marketing positions, have made attainment of project goals unfeasible in 2 years time.

The rest of this report will evaluate progress to date in each of the project's components, and make recommendations for adjustments to the work-plan and time frame in order to make them more realistic.

Production Training

1) No one well qualified could be found to fill the post of production technician. A trainee was hired December 15, 1984, 2½ months into the training phase, and a production specialist, the only male employed by the project, was contracted on March 1, 1985. Meanwhile, the production technician trainee received some instruction through arrangements made by CRS and on June 30 she resigned her post. A new trainee with lower qualifications began work August 3, 1985 and is still training. This turnover has made the continued presence of the production specialist indispensable for the remainder of the project, and for at least another 9 months after funding ends, since the production technician trainee will not be able to replace him completely. This activity is 1 year behind schedule.

2) Training of production instructors/supervisors began December 1984, only 2 months behind schedule. Again, a training program had to be designed for them by CRS staff, since such training was not available through vocational training channels. 4 young women were selected on the basis of willingness to travel to other parts of Jordan. In the words of the project director, for these women going to Amman was like going to Europe, and going to Karak was like crossing the Atlantic. All 4 completed training and the 2 better ones became production instructors/supervisors. Their on-the-job training continues as of this writing. According to the production specialist, Mr. Abdul-Haddi, they will need a total of 2 years of training in order to learn all production and quality control skills they require to adequately supervise the production process. My own observations confirm that they are unable at this point, after 10 months of training, to perform quality control and maintain an acceptable production rate.

3) The 20 production workers began training in March, 1985, 3 months behind schedule, due to the delays in obtaining and installing the industrial sewing

equipment, training of supervisors and contracting a production specialist.

The requirements for production workers were:

- 1) ability to work from 8:00 a.m. to 2:30 p.m
- 2) experience or diploma in domestic sewing
- 3) literacy and numeracy skills
- 4) stated commitment to work
- 5) low income

Although the project description envisioned training in numeracy and literacy, during the start-up phase this was decided against because the training period would be too long, but mainly because the Mafraq Chapter of the AWS offers literacy classes and it would have been a duplication of effort. This decision, although understandable from the point of view of the project's time limitations, probably served to disqualify very poor, uneducated, older potential applicants.

Nonetheless, 94 women initially met the prerequisites. CRS collected a wealth of information on these and other applicants to other positions. According to CRS' analysis, of the 94 applicants 44 decided not to enter training once they realized what the working conditions and hours were; 50 entered training and, out of these, 23 failed the course. Of the remaining 27, 20 are currently working, 5 resigned and 2 are on the waiting list.

The CRS' Community Development Specialist provided a very good summary of these women's socioeconomic and demographic backgrounds. These data are extensive and available upon request. Only a few of the more salient of the women's characteristics are presented here.

Project Applicants by Age, Marital Status and Training Status

Age	Not Trained				Trained			
	Single		Married		Single		Married	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
16-20	15	56	3	18	28	70	-	-
21-25	9	33	5	29	8	20	5	50
26-30	2	7	-	-	4	10		
31-35	-	-	2	12	-	-	1	10
36-40	-	-	1	6	-	-	-	-
41-45	-	-	2	12	-	-	-	-
46-50	1	4	4	23	-	-	3	30
51+	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	10
TOTALS	27	100	17	100	40	100	10	100

A total of 27 married and divorced women applied for the project originally; of these 4 are currently employed as production workers: 1 young married woman who has no children, and 3 divorced women only 1 of whom has a child.

Although the proportion of single women who applied for work in the production shop was much greater than the proportion of ever married women (67 of 94 vs. 27 of 94, or 71% vs. 29%), the proportion of ever married women who became discouraged by the working conditions was higher than the proportion of single women (17 of 27 vs. 27 of 67, or 63% vs. 40%). It appears that there was a self-selection process among applicants from the beginning. The main reason given by the discouraged applicants for not accepting training, according to CRS' Community Development Specialist, was that they could not work 6½ hours every day for 6 days a week.

81

Project Applicants by Educational Level and Current Work Status

	Not Trained		Trained		Sub Total	%	Total
	No.	%	Not Working No.	Working No.			
Elementary	17	39	4	4	8	16	25
Intermediate	14	32	10	9	19	38	33
Secondary	12	27	14	7	21	42	33
Community College	1	2	2	-	2	4	3
TOTAL	44	100	30	20	50	100	94

Whereas the tendency among the discouraged applicants was to have lower educational attainment levels, the opposite was true among the applicants who accepted training. It is possible that the discouraged group also had the poorest women, although no data are available on this. It should be noted that among those who entered the training program only the better ones passed the course and, of those, only the best were selected by the project management team for participation in the production phase. In conclusion, the 20 women currently employed as production workers are the unmarried, younger and better educated applicants, and the most technically qualified.

During their training phase production workers did not receive any salary; when production began they received a salary of JD 10 per month and currently they are receiving JD 35 (\$93.10). The project description proposed to pay the workers JD 35 during the training phase and JD 50 during the production phase. These salaries were found to be too high by local standards. If the CRS had maintained the original wages, it would have done so artificially; it would have also overburdened the project's financial self-sufficiency.

Salaries for production workers have been increased twice since production began (from JD 10 to 25 to 35), according to the levels of production attained. Wages have not been fixed at 35; as soon as the workers reach a sustainable higher level of production they will receive a raise.

9

Production Lines

Production of marketable quality began during the month of May, 1985. From the beginning production was diversified, including, in addition to school uniforms, professional ware for hotels, hospitals, laboratories, and army and airline maintenance operations. At least 59 items have been produced. Appendix 2 provides a partial list of items produced to date.

The production workshop appears to be specializing in several types of uniforms, work clothes for skilled technicians, and sheets of various natures and sizes. This is the one project component that, despite delays and technical problems, has accomplished its training goal and is developing satisfactorily. The 20 production workers and 2 supervisors are able to produce goods of competitive quality in the Amman market, with constant supervision and direction by the production specialist. Their production levels have earned them an increase in salaries to JD 35 a month. Yet productive capacity, given current levels of machinery, experience, working hours per day (6½) and supervisor's quality control capability, is beginning to be a bottleneck and a drawback when bidding for tenders in the marketplace. Other workshops, although bidding at higher prices, can promise the goods in less time. In summary, full production capacity has not been reached. The production specialist believes that with the available 12 sewing and 4 finishing machines, full production should be attained within 2 years from the beginning of training, but not any sooner. This is not only because of the variety of items the women have to be trained to sew, but also because the 2 supervisors are learning to sew and supervise simultaneously. The project description planned to achieve full production some time in the last 8 months of the workplan, in order to have an economically viable product to turn over to the Mafraq Chapter of the AWS. It is clear now that this will not happen.

The production workers were, at first, unable to cope with the responsibility of a full-time formal job and their family and tribal responsibilities, including the pressures of brothers and fathers to fulfill their domestic obligations. 5 women left the project for 1 month during the harvest season

to assist their families in the fields. This will probably happen again in the next harvest season. Several of the young women were absent 5 consecutive days to work in the preparations of tribal weddings and attend the festivities. It should be noted that they had to fulfill not only ritual obligations, but economic obligations as well. The CRS' Community Development Specialist, Ms. Rula Qumei, has had to orient the workers and their families throughout 6 months of patient negotiations with them, in order to reduce absenteeism due to conflicting family demands, home production obligations, perceived inability to work during times of menstruation, the presence of a male production specialist in the workshop, and perceived lack of adequate supervision of the young production workers by project staff. Ms. Qumei has done an excellent job of overcoming traditional reluctances and male pressures to keep the women away from the workshop and should be commended for her efforts. It should be noted that Ms. Qumei is a full-time CRS staff member whose salary is not included in AID's grant to CRS.

Absenteeism among production workers and supervisors has been reduced since the initial period of high absenteeism described above. The figures available for the past 4 months are as follows:

	Woman days of work	Woman days absences	% Absentees
June	630	24	3.8
July	682	33	4.8
August	713	17	2.4
September	660	24	3.6

Management Training

After a multitude of recruitment problems, the first project manager trainee began working in mid-December, 1984, about 2 months behind schedule. As was the case with the production trainees she could not be trained in management and marketing according to the project plans. The Jordan Vocational

11

Training Corporation was not forthcoming with the courses it had offered; CRS staff was successful in arranging a one-month training course at several small business and sewing enterprises. However, this trainee resigned after 7 months, setting back the work plan regarding transfer of project management by an equal amount of time.

CRS staff attempted to recruit several of the leaders of the local AWS Chapter for the project manager's position without success. They are all working women who would have to resign their government posts, and possibly lose seniority status and retirement benefits, if they accepted to work for the project full time. A younger member of the AWS was finally recruited at the end of July, 1985 and has been receiving on-the-job training since. Ms. Ekhlass Haddad, the new project manager, has no previous work experience and is completing the course work for a BA in mathematics. She receives a salary of JD 100 per month, works an 8 hour day, and is in charge of inventory, filing, accounting, local sales of school uniforms, and setting up and running weekly meetings of CRS, AWS and local Ministry of Social Development officials, under the close supervision of the project director, Ms. Ayser Akrawi.

Ms. Haddad receives training in accounting from CRS' financial officer once a week, which is insufficient. She will not receive any training in marketing because it is unrealistic to expect that she could become project manager/accountant and marketing officer by July, 1986, as the work plan specifies. It is highly unlikely that she can become a full-fledged project manager/accountant in 8 months time.

Project Management

Current project management is single-handedly performed by the project director, Ms. Akrawi, with the help of Sister Donahue, CRS Country Representative, and Ms. Rula Qumei, CRS Community Development Specialist. Ms. Akrawi also gives daily on-the-job training to the project manager, and does most of the project's financial management, including costing, projections, etc.

Ms. Akrawi has been successful in transferring project management from Amman to Mafraq, although she herself lives in Amman and travels to Mafraq daily. With the institutional back-up of CRS-Amman and frequent use of the telephone, this arrangement could continue indefinitely, but this is not the original project purpose. Nevertheless, a close link with Amman will have to be maintained during the life of the project and beyond because the marketing outlets are mostly in the capital city.

Ms. Akrawi is a capable project director and should be commended for a job well done. She is quite indispensable at this point, however, and given all the vicissitudes in staffing and training that the project has suffered, cannot be replaced in July, 1986 without jeopardizing project activities.

Training in Marketing and Sales

Nobody is currently being trained in marketing. The previous project manager who resigned this past July received some training, but the current manager in-training has not. CRS made the decision to separate the management and marketing posts for 2 reasons: training one person to do both would require a trainee with remarkable capacity and much more time than is currently available, and the main locus of management and marketing activities are and will continue to be Mafraq and Amman respectively, and 2 people will be required to perform these functions.

This decision, although reasonable, means that the marketing training component has been effectively cancelled. There will be no one in place to take over marketing and sales when CRS funding ends in July, 1986.

Current Marketing and Sales

As was the case with 2 other key project posts, that of production technician and project manager, the post of marketing specialist has suffered discontinuities and setbacks due to the resignation of the person originally

assigned to the slot after several days on the job, and a subsequent resignation of the second appointee at the end of June, 1985. The current marketing specialist, Ms. Layla Murad, began work in mid-July and inherited a difficult situation. She had to simultaneously procure contracts for the sewing workshop in Mafrag and conduct marketing surveys in order to determine which production lines to pursue.

The marketing specialist is a successful self-made business woman who has used many of her previous business contacts to the project's advantage, both in terms of obtaining tender information and procuring contracts. She is familiar with the idiosyncrasies of the Jordanian business world and is connected to several networks in the private sector. She has not had any formal training in business or marketing, and has not developed a systematic, comprehensive approach to her work. It is unclear whether this is a result of her personal organizational style or the reality of having to deal with the Amman business community. Ms. Murad has not yet conducted any systematic marketing surveys in order to elicit information on which to base both marketing strategies and production plans in the near and mid-term future.

According to Ms. Murad the women "...at this early stage of the project are producing profit-making items which are marketable in sophisticated and competitive markets." In the last 6 months, since production began, the project has grossed JD 12, 813.00 in sales, most of it under Ms. Murad's supervision. Since she came to the project 36 different items have been produced for contract sales. The marketing specialist has canvassed the private hotel and hospital businesses, as well as 19 semi-private or public concerns, including the Jordanian airline and 2 universities.

Since April, 7 tenders have been pursued, 6 of them have been awarded and delivered, 1 on the basis of merit and 5 through personal contacts and negotiation. Two additional direct orders were also filled, bringing the total number of contracts delivered and closed to 8. Six additional contracts have been negotiated and awarded; an additional 9 contracts are currently being pursued. The expected value of these awarded and possible contracts

was not available; the project director estimates that there are currently between 2 and 3 months of work for the workshop. A list of contracts delivered, awarded and under negotiation is attached as Appendix 3.

The marketing strategy developed for the coming 6 to 8 months targets the lines of hospital and hotel ware, and pursues the business of large private and public enterprises in these fields such as the Ministry of Health, teaching hospitals and the Ministry of Social Development. Secondary items such as school uniforms will continue to be produced and marketed through local merchants and schools, and sold directly to the public. This strategy does not have the benefit of a comprehensive marketing survey, however, and, until one is undertaken, should be seen as tentative. Yet this is all the project has to go on at this point.

Two serious constraints face sales and marketing. The first has to do with the procurement and purchase of raw materials (fabric and accessories). The Amman market for materials is unreliable since it depends mostly on imports. Although there is a cloth factory in Jordan, many of the contract specifications require a higher quality cloth than is locally available. Procuring the scarce raw materials consumes a good third of the marketing specialist's time. The project is not yet at the point where it can take on the additional task of importing its own raw materials, although both CRS and the AWS enjoy duty-free status, and both CRS and the marketing specialist have done some importing in the past. The second constraint has to do with the fact that the workshop is based in Mafraq and the stable, profitable markets are in Amman. The Mafraq market is for items like children's clothes and dishdashes, but it is a shallow market. As was stated earlier, there is a market for school uniforms that is seasonal and reliable but has a low profit margin. This geographical arrangement is not problematic now that the project is subsidized but could become a serious obstacle if and when a local PVO in Mafraq takes it over, and even more so when the enterprise becomes a cooperative responsible for marketing its own products.

Income Generation

As was mentioned earlier the production workers are currently earning JD 35 per month, 15 less than envisioned in the project description. The following table shows how salaries have increased according to production levels since workers started receiving an income:

Salaries paid to production workers versus actual earning according to production in the first 6 months of 1985, JDs

<u>Month</u>	<u>Salary received per worker</u>	<u>Actual earning per worker</u>	<u>Subsidy</u>
April	10.-	minimal	10.
May	25.-	30.998	-5.998
June	30.-	15.732	14.268
July	30.-	29.075	.925
August	30.-	19.650	10.350
September	35.-	33.092	1.908

The third column represents real earnings according to each month's production levels. The drop in real earnings in June was due to Ramadan and other holidays. A similar drop in August was due to a combination of a 6-day holiday and a forced slow-down in production in order to improve quality.

The two production supervisors are earning JD 45 per month each plus overtime, the cutting supervisor JD 90 and the project manager JD 100. All these people are Mafraq-based.

The CRS' Community Development Specialist has been able to obtain data on household income for the production workers and production supervisors. The following table shows total household income from all sources except that contributed by the young women:

Distribution of Households According to Total Monthly Incomes

<u>Total Monthly Income, JDs</u>	<u>No. of Households</u>	<u>% of Households</u>
10-30	3	13.6
31-60	-	-
61-90	3	13.6
91-120	4	18.3
121-150	5	22.7
151-180	1	4.5
181-210	4	18.3
211-240	-	-
over 240	<u>2</u>	<u>9</u>
TOTAL	22	100.0

One of the 2 households earning over JD 240 per month has an income of over JD 500 and the other earns approximately JD 365 per month. Median household income is JD 120 (US\$45) per month, and most households earn between 121 and 150 Jordanian Dinars per month.

Taking the midpoint of each income interval as the average, average household income for the young women employed in the workshop is JD 144 (US\$383). At the current salary levels of JD 35, production workers are increasing household income by an average 24%. If production workers were able to increase their salaries to JD 50 per month, through longer working hours (from 6½ to 8) and/or increased production rates, they would be able to increase total household income by close to an average 35% per month, provided other household income remains stable.

Income Use and Distribution

Production workers and supervisors have been earning income for six months (April through September, 1985). In that period of time the following expend-

iture and savings behaviors have been documented. Twelve women give either part or all of their monthly incomes to their fathers and receive pocket money for daily expenses from their mothers. One woman saves her entire income. The remaining 9 women spend their money in a combination of personal needs (clothes), family needs (appliances, food, education for siblings), and savings. The appliances bought with income derived from project work includes 2 taperecorders, a sewing machine, a washing machine, a color TV, and a cupboard. All these purchases have been done on an installment basis.

A total of 13 women (59% of all 22 workers) practice some form of savings, but only 1 keeps her money in the bank. The rest either purchase gold or give their money to their mothers for safekeeping. Unfortunately the information available does not permit any cross-tabulations between income use and other characteristics such as total household income and household size.

Financial Analysis

The project had been completely subsidized by CRS with AID funds until August 31, 1985 when some of the monthly operating costs were transferred to the project itself. Beginning November 1 the project will assume other costs. In what follows, information on proceeds and costs is presented and analyzed.

Proceeds:

As of September 30, 1985

Total Sales		JD 13,604.970
Minus: items returned	139.710	
price adjustments	<u>651.760</u>	
	791.470	
Net Sales		JD 12,813.500
Bank Interest Accrued to Date (4½%/month)		48.065
Total Proceeds to Date		<u>JD 12,861.565</u>
		(US\$34,211.76)

18 1

It should be noted that this figure does not represent profits since the project has been totally subsidized by CRS with AID funds up to September 1, 1985.

Expenditures:

On August 31 CRS stopped subsidizing the purchase of raw materials and accessories, and the project itself began covering these expenses from sales proceeds.

Expenses for the Month of September

Raw Materials	JD 4,298.080
Miscellaneous Expenses	170.850
Total Expenses to Date	4,468.930
Balance	JD 8,392.635

According to the project director and CRS' financial officer, the monthly expenditures on raw materials to date have been considerably lower than JD 4,000; this was due to the fact that during the training period very little raw materials were required and that production up to now has not involved large purchases of fabric. However, it can be expected that, if contracts currently under negotiation are awarded, the monthly outlay for raw materials will be greater than it has been up to now. A figure of JD 4,500-5,000 would be reasonable to use for projections. At this projected level, the current balance would be enough to carry purchases for 2 months only. A cash flow problem might be expected if contract work requires the project to cover the initial expense of purchasing raw materials, as it has up to now, and if several contracts are awarded in close succession.

Beginning November 1, the following additional monthly expenses will be transferred from CRS funds to project funds:

In total, current monthly expenses carried by the project are:

Raw Materials	4500
Other Variable Costs Estimated at About	200
Fixed Costs	<u>1756</u>
TOTAL	6856

Given these expenses, total project sales need to exceed the cost of raw materials and other variable costs by about 2,000 Dinars per month between November, 1985 and August, 1986 in order to break even, or about JD 12,000 yearly.

If and when monthly salaries for production workers are increased to -JD 50 and for production supervisors to JD 75, which, according to the project description, is what these women should be earning by the second project year, then monthly fixed cost will increase to JD 2152. Consequently monthly sales will have to increase, but not by much, in order to break even, other things being equal.

Pricing:

Pricing of production items is currently established as follows: to the basic cost of raw material and accessories per item is added, first, a portion of the fixed costs, figured as JD 76.500 per day (total monthly fixed costs + 23 working days per month), and then a profit margin of approximately 20%, although on some items the profit margin has been as high as 50%. It is on the profit margin that contract negotiations for total prices are done, and the project has been able to maintain an average profit margin of 15%. It has not been able to underbid other contractors on some tenders, however, due to the project's high overhead rate (JD 76.5 per day).

Current projections provided by CRS for the year starting August 1, 1986 take into account increases in salaries for the production workers but do not anticipate any increases in the running costs. Assuming a 15% inflation

rate, total monthly costs for the project starting next August would be:

Salaries

Project Manager, 1	JD	100.000	
Supervisor Cutting, 1		90.000	
Supervisors, 2 x 75		150.00	
Production, 20 x 50		1,000.000	
Driver, 1		80.000	
Perdiem (Travel Allowance)		40.000	
Social Security 10%		146.000	1,606.000

Depreciation

Depreciation Equipment	JD	35.000	
Depreciation Vehicle		20.000	55.000

Running Costs

569.250

Total Monthly Costs

JD 2,230.250
(US\$5932.47)

In order to break even, therefore, the project should net about JD 27,000 in the year between August, 1986 and July, 1987, assuming other things remain equal. It should be noted that these projections do not include the costs of a project director, a marketer and a production specialist which are currently totally subsidized by CRS with AID funds. None of these costs can possibly be absorbed by the project, either now or in the foreseeable future. Current salary costs for these 3 positions run at JD 1615 or about US\$4296 per month. These expenses were never meant to be transferred to the project. Nevertheless some additional expenses for senior management and continued expert support in production should be included in the projections of the next project year, possibly at about half the current rate. If these additional project costs were included in the projections, total monthly salaries would increase by about JD 800, and total monthly costs would be closer to JD 3000 or about US \$8000.

22

Summary: Progress Towards Project Objectives

- 1) Train 20 women in quality commercial sewing: Twenty women are receiving training, but they will not be fully trained by July, 1986. According to the expert, they need a 2 year training period, starting in April, 1985, to become quality commercial seamstresses.

- 2) Train 2 women as instructors/supervisors: Training of the 2 supervisors began in December, 1984. As with production workers, they will require at least 2 years' training time, possibly more since they not only have to become good seamstresses but also good production supervisors. By the end of the CRS project time, July, 1986, they will be at least 6 months short of training time.

- 3) Train 1 woman as accountant/marketing officer: One woman began training as manager/accountant in September, 1985. (The previous trainee resigned after 7 months of on-the-job training.) Her managerial training is not particularly structured; she learns from daily events and situations as they present themselves. The project director is just now beginning to have some free time to systematically train her in filing, costing, etc. She receives training in accounting one day per week under CRS' financial officer who is himself in need of some advanced training. No marketing training is being provided and none is envisioned. This objective will not be achieved by project's end.

- 4) Establish a cost-effective production cooperative operated and managed by women: This objective will not be met. The project is not and probably will not be cost-effective in 8 months time. Although 4 different plans exist to train the women in cooperativism and implement principles of cooperative operation and ownership, the project is not sufficiently far along production-and management-wise to be turned into a cooperative. The women do not have the time to receive cooperativism courses; even if the time were made available, they would probably be overwhelmed by 2 types of training occurring simultaneously.

5) Provide 24 women with salaried jobs: Twenty-four women are being offered a steady monthly income. The salary for production workers (JD 35) is JD 15 (US\$40) off the objective; it is doubtful that it will reach the JD 50 mark by July 31, 1986. The salary for production supervisors (JD 45) is JD 30 off the projected salary and it is even less likely that it can be increased to JD 75 by the end of the project.

6) Improve numeracy and literacy skills of participants: This objective was deleted. Literacy courses were already available in Mafraq and there was no need for duplication. Instead numeracy and literacy became pre-requisites for participation.

Recommendations

1) CRS should submit quarterly narrative progress reports instead of semi-annual ones. Quarterly financial reports should continue.

2) One, two or three lines of production should be chosen based on marketing surveys. These production lines should be as parallel as possible - for instance hotel and hospital ware - so as to reduce the number of patterns, sewing techniques and production items that the project needs to generate. On-the-job training of production instructors/supervisors should, for the next year, concentrate on these production lines and on quality control techniques. The design and cutting supervisor should concentrate her training on altering basic patterns in these production lines and cutting. The production specialist should strive to design all the needed and foreseen basic patterns in several versions.

3) The marketing specialist should attend a 2 week marketing management course offered in December by the Jordan Institute of Management. Prior to that she should start setting up a plan to conduct a thorough, systematic marketing survey of the production lines she has been exploring. With the benefit of the JIM course and the help of a CRS business consultant who will

be available (at no cost to the project) from January to the end of May, 1986, the marketing specialist should conduct, in January and February, a systematic marketing survey, and make some projections regarding volume of sales in 2 or 3 production lines in a period of one year. In order to become financially viable, the project needs to sell between JD 4000 and JD 5000 per month.

4) An Advisory Board of 4-5 influential Jordanians should be established as soon as possible. These individuals should span the development and business communities in Amman and should be willing to provide advice and other kinds of help to the project ad honorem. They should also be able to meet periodically with CRS project staff. They would lend local visibility and prestige to the project, award it their personal, social and political sponsorship, and help integrate the project into Amman-based socioeconomic development circles.

5) The Mafraq-based project manager should be given the opportunity to take some management and accounting courses at the Jordanian Institute of Management in the course of the next 8 months. The JIM's short course on accounting for non-accountants as well as their small business management training offers seem particularly relevant.

6) The directors of the Mafraq Chapter of the AWS should be made to understand that attendance at weekly meetings and occasional contact with the project director and project manager will not qualify them to take over the project in July, 1986, regardless of how well CRS has trained the production and supervisory staff. They should also be told as directly as possible, that CRS is actively seeking other potential counterparts and that, if none are found to be suitable, the project will be either terminated, or turned over to a business concern, once the project's title is turned over to the Ministry of Labor and Social Development.

7) CRS should begin, as soon as possible, a concerted and systematic search for a viable counterpart organization. The following organizations should be

contacted:

- 1) Council for Voluntary Agencies
- 2) YWCA
- 3) Al-Joffa Cooperative Organization
- 4) Jordan Cooperative Organization
- 5) Queen Alia Fund
- 6) Queen Nur Foundation
- 7) Salt Development Corporation
- 8) Development Bank for Cities and Villages
- 9) Soldiers' Families Welfare Society
- 10) Jordan Commercial Centers Corporation
- 11) Federation of Jordanian Business and Professional Women
- 12) Jordan Institute of Management.

The idea of working with two counterpart organizations should be explored, one to take over Mafraq-based production and management operations, and the other to eventually become responsible for procurement, purchasing, marketing and sales in Amman. This arrangement could create more political problems than the management ones it could solve; nonetheless its feasibility should be assessed.

8) At the same time, the possibility of seconding the current secretary of the Mafraq Chapter of the AWS from the Ministry of Education to the Ministry of Labor and Social Development, should also be explored. Ms. Haddad is the headmistress of a government school in Mafraq. She will retire in mid-1987. She has some management skills and a desire to become more active in the CRS project, but currently lacks the time to become involved. If she could be seconded, she would be available full time to the project and maintain both her government salary and retirement benefits. She could then be trained at JIM to jointly run the project with the project manager. If Ms. Haddad's secondment is not feasible, then the notion of obtaining the participation of the AWS to manage the project in the near or even the long term should be dropped altogether.

9) If points 2) to 8) above have been accomplished in 5 to 6 months time

(March or April, 1986) USAID-Jordan should consider the possibility of extending CRS' grant for 1 year, August 1, 1986 to July 31, 1987. This extension should provide sufficient funds to cover the salary of the marketing specialist for 6 months, the production specialist for 9 months and the project director and a driver for 12 months. The request for extension should be accompanied by a detailed, step-by-step plan and time line to transfer the project to a viable local counterpart or counterparts by the end of the extension period.

10) If CRS is unable to accomplish points 2) through 8) and to develop a transition plan that is reasonable, the project should be ^{allowed to} terminated. _{on schedule}
without extension

11) Whatever the outcome, both CRS and AID should consider alternatives to the cooperative organizational model. Such alternatives might include private ownership of shares in the project by workers and individuals not currently associated with the project, or some other profit sharing arrangements. This would allow the project to become privately owned without it also having to become a sweatshop. One concrete possibility would be for the Federation of Jordanian Professional and Business Women, or a group of members, to come to some arrangement with the Ministry of Social Development to manage the project after CRS' tenure expires. This could happen in August, 1986 or progressively during the one year extension period.

12) CRS should evaluate the economic and practical feasibility of working with one or more marketing agents for its production lines. Although the profit margins for the project would be lower, the need to subsidize and eventually transfer to the project the cost of a marketing specialist would disappear. Such a saving could make up for part of the lost profits that would be transferred to the middle man or woman.

References Cited

Crandon, Libbet and Bonnie Shepard, n.d. "Women, Enterprise and Development."
Chestnut Hill, MA: The Pathfinder Fund.

Persons Contacted

AID-Amman

Richard Brown, Program Officer

Nancy Hardy, WID Officer

George Ishaq, PVO Officer, CRS Project Officer

Thomas Rishoi, Projects Office, Private Sector Officer

Donald Morton, Projects Office

David Schroeder, Projects Office, Agriculture

Fuad Qushair, "

Catholic Relief Services-Amman

Sister Leona Donahue, Country Representative

Ayser Akrawi, Director, Income Generating Project

Rula Qumei, Community Development Specialist

Leila Murad, Marketing Specialist

Antoine Sousoa, Financial Officer

CRS-Mafraq

Ekhlass Haddad, Manager, Income Generation Project

Yousuf Abdul-Haddi, Production Specialist

Arab Women's Society-Mafraq

Salwa Haddad, Secretary, Mafraq Chapter

Josephine Haddad, Treasurer, Mafraq Chapter

Minsitry of Social Development-Amman

Muhammed Wardam, Undersecretary for Social Development

Amal Sabbagh, Director, Office of Women's Affairs

Jordan Institute of Management

Muhammed Mallalah, Director

Federation of Jordanian Professional and Business Women

Salwa Masri, Member, Directing Council, 1984

Member at Large, 1985

Documents Consulted

- 1) "A Feasibility Study of Income Generating Projects for Rural Women in Jordan." Catholic Relief Services, Amman, Jordan. February 1984.
- 2) Project Proposal "Income Generation Project for Rural Women in Jordan." Submitted to AID, Jordan by Catholic Relief Services. May 1984
- 3) Semi-Annual Progress Reports submitted by CRS-Jordan to USAID Mission. January 1985 and August 1985.
- 4) Grant Document and Project Description. Grant No. 278-0258-00, USAID-Jordan. July 31, 1984.
- 5) Qumei, Rula K., 1983. "Report on Mafraq." CRS Jordan. December.
- 6) Account Books, Inventory Documents and Bank Statements of the Project, Mafraq.
- 7) "Background Information on Project Applicants and Participants." 1985. CRS, Jordan. October.
- 8) Marketing Notes and Documents, Tenders, Contracts and Correspondence. CRS, Jordan.
- 9) Jordan Institute of Management. Summary of Activities, 1984; Qualifications and Sectors of Employment of Trainees, 1979-1984. List of Courses Available, 1985.

Appendix 1

PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

I. PURPOSE OF GRANT

This Grant supports an Income Generation Project for Rural Women in Mafrak area - North East Jordan. The project will be implemented by the Catholic Relief Services (CRS) in coordination and cooperation with the Ministry of Social Development (MSD) and other concerned GOJ Departments as necessary. The purpose of the project is to raise the socio-economic status of rural women in the Mafrak area and to increase the female work force in that area by initiating an income generation project - Sewing Center, to manufacture school uniforms and children's clothes.

The needs assessment and the feasibility study conducted by the CRS during a seven month period 1983/1984 identified a number of income generation activities for rural women. The following four activities are considered economically viable:

- Manufacture of school uniforms and children's clothes. ✓
- Educational and recreational toy making.
- Replication of museum artifacts.
- Manufacture of moghrabieh (a type of cous-cous).

The study identified the following location to be the most suitable for these activities: Mafrak for the manufacture of clothes, Wadi-Mousa for the replication of museum artifacts; Karak and Aqaba for the educational and recreational toy making, and Azraq for the moghrabieh.

USAID/J will support the clothes manufacturing center in Mafrak and contribute to the administrative expenses of the project. USAID's total contribution will not exceed \$200,000.

II. IMPLEMENTATION

The project will be implemented over a period of 24 months and will include skills training, numeracy and literacy training, management and marketing training. CRS will be the executing organization and will work through the Mafrak Women's Society. The Ministry of Social Development (MSD) staff will provide aid in community liaison, will assign necessary personnel to be trained as supervisors, and will give financial aid to the Mafrak Women's Society which is required to provide appropriate facilities for the center. The Vocational Training Corporation will provide the required technical training and will supervise the initial on-the-job production during the training phase.

no,
no
contributing

It is expected that 26 women will participate in the Center's activities:

- 1 Full time Production Technician.
- 2 Full time Instructor/Supervisors.
- 1 Accountant/Marketing Officer.
- 20 Production Workers.
- 1 Driver.
- 1 Janitor.

*24 women
but participation in
10*

STARTING PERIOD - 2 MONTHS

The following preparation will be taken during the two month starting up period. New equipment and machines will be installed in the premises of the Marrak Women's Society. This is in addition to equipment previously supplied by CRS. The production technician will set up the facilities for production, including proper allocation of space, placement of machines and other steps which are necessary to ensure efficient production. Participants in the project will be selected.

Following are the details of the three phases:

TRAINING PERIOD - 5 MONTHS

During the first two months, the women selected to be instructors/supervisors will be trained in commercial sewing, maintenance of machines and quality control. The Vocational Training Corporation will train these two women and at the satisfactory completion of their training will issue them certificates. The woman selected to be the marketing/accounting officer will receive training in accounts, use of office machines and marketing under the supervision of the Vocational Training Corporation and the full time CRS staff marketing specialist. A certificate will be issued by VTC upon successful completion of the training. In the final 3 months twenty women will receive training in sewing and simple maintenance of the machines as well as in numeracy and literacy skills. This training will be done on the premises under the supervision of the production technician, VTC personnel and by the two local instructors/supervisors trained by the VTC.

During the five month training period it will be the job of the production technician and the marketing consultant, with the help of the local society, to purchase the raw materials, establish the marketing contacts and prepare for the production and distribution of the types of

PRODUCTION - 8 MONTHS

Intensive support and supervision of the production center by the production technician, marketing expert and community development specialist will be given for the first 8 months of production during

31

which time on-the-job training will continue in order for the center to be self-sufficient both in production and management. Any modification in production and management necessary for the efficient operation of the center will be made. An additional 5 to 8 women will be selected as trainees in order to have trained personnel to replace dropouts or to extend production to 2 shifts of 12 - 15 women.

During the last two months of this production/on-the-job training phase, intensive efforts will be made to prepare the women to take over the operation of the production center. The CRS Community Development Specialist, Ministry of Social Development personnel and the local officials of the Jordan Cooperative Organization (JCO), will instruct the women on forming a cooperative. The JCO will conduct a two week specialized course.

PRODUCTION INSTITUTIONALIZED - 8 MONTHS

In the final eight months of the project administrative and managerial support will be made available to the women by the district offices of the Ministry of Social Development, the local JCO office and the social workers who were specially trained for this project. These social workers will generally oversee the project and call in consultants for special problems should they arise. The production technicians will continue to monitor quantity and quality of production.

CRS on-going monitoring and evaluation will continue.

EVALUATION - 1 MONTH

At the culmination of this eighth month phase a full scale evaluation will be conducted by the CRS staff and a Woman in Development Consultant.

III. PROJECT OUTPUTS

- Train 20 women in quality commercial sewing.
- Train 2 women as instructor/supervisors.
- Train 1 woman as accountant/marketing officer.
- Establish a woman's cooperative sewing production center operated by women using modern production, marketing and cost effective techniques.
- Provide 24 women with salaried jobs which will improve their economic status.
- Improve numeracy and literacy skills of all participants as the need is indicated.

IV. BUDGET

PERIOD JULY 84 - JUNE 86

Funds provided under this Grant will be used for the following:

I. A.I.D CONTRIBUTION

A. Salaries - Office staff, Training Instructors and Production personnel

<u>1. PERSONNEL ASSIGNED TO CRS OFFICE</u>	<u>US DOLLAR</u>
a. <u>Project Director, 24 mos @ \$1,750.00</u>	42,000
b. <u>Marketing Specialist, 17 mos @ \$1,000.00</u>	17,000
c. <u>Fringe Benefits (a & b above)</u>	11,500
	<hr/>
SUB-TOTAL (A.1)	70,500

<u>2. PERSONNEL ASSIGNED TO SEWING CENTER</u>	
a. <u>Production Technician, 17 mos @ \$540.00</u>	9,180
b. <u>Driver/Messenger, 17 mos @ \$270.00</u>	4,590
c. <u>Janitor, 17 mos @ \$135.00</u>	2,295
d. <u>Accountant/Marketing, 11 mos @ \$405.00</u>	4,455
e. <u>Two instructors/supervisors, 11 mos @ \$405.00</u>	8,910
f. <u>20 production women, 8 mos @ \$189.20</u>	30,272
	<hr/>
SUB-TOTAL (A.2)	59,702
TOTAL SALARIES (A.1 & A.2)	130,202

B. COMMODITIES

a. <u>Non-expendable supplies</u>	1,350
b. <u>Production Equipment</u>	17,130
c. <u>Vehicles - One Micro Bus</u>	16,217
d. <u>Raw Material</u>	4,054
	<hr/>
SUB-TOTAL - (B)	38,751

21K

350/0

C.	<u>TRAINING STIPENDS</u>	
a.	Accountant/Marketing, 2 mos @ \$94.59	189.00
b.	Two instructors/supervisors 2 mos @ \$95.593	379.00
c.	20 Production Women, 1 mos @ \$67.57	1,351.00
d.	20 Production women, 2 mos @ \$94.59	3,784.00
		<hr/>
	SUB-TOTAL (C)	5,703.00
D.	<u>OTHER COSTS:</u>	
a.	Running costs and utilities	9,732.00
		<hr/>
	SUB-TOTAL (D)	9,738.00
	TOTALS (A to D)	184,388.00
	8.5% Overhead Costs - CRS	15,612.00
		<hr/>
	GRAND TOTAL	<u>\$200,000.00</u> =====

+ 70. = 85^k
42.5%

	ITEM PRODUCED	AVERAGE PROFIT	CLIENT-PUBLIC	CLIENT-PRIVATE
1.	Doctor's Short Lab - Coat	20%	Queen Alia Hotel Queen Alia Hotel	_____
2.	Domestic Dress and Apron - Z	42%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
3.	Housekeeper's Jacket	78%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
4.	Fron Desk Jacket	90%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
5.	Barman's Jacket	90%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
6.	Scarf-Cook's Vest	42%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
7.	Cook's Hat	12%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
8.	Cook's Apron	71%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
9.	Cook's Jacket	44%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
10.	Assistant Waiter's Jacket	70%	Queen Alia Hotel	_____
11.	Surgical Suit - Z	48%		Jebel Amman Hospital
12.	Surgical Mask	33%		_____
13.	Surgical Cap	41%		Jebel Amman Hospital
14.	Leggings - Z	47%		Jebel Amman Hospital
15.	Surgical Towel	47%		Jebel Amman Hospital
16.	Surgical Gown	14%		Jebel Amman Hospital
17.	Tray Cover	23%		Jebel Amman Hospital
18.	Single Bed-Sheet	4%		Jebel Amman Hospital
19.	Eye-Sheet	127%		Jebel Amman Hospital
20.	Blue School Uniforms - Z Beige School Uniforms - Z		To merchants and the public according to gov- ernment fixed prices minus. (5% discount)	_____ _____ _____

-33-

Appendix 2

35

	ITEM PRODUCED	AVERAGE PROFIT	CLIENT-PUBLIC	CLIENT-PRIVATE
21.	Overalls	20%	Arab Wings	_____
22.	Shirts-Long Sleeved	25%	Arab Wings	_____
23.	Shirts-Short Sleeved	33%	Arab Wings	_____
24.	Doctor's Coat	20%	Air Force	_____
25.	Pillow-Cases	10%	Air Force	_____
26.	School Skirts	5%	_____	Mr. Aslan-Merchant
27.	Blue ICU Suits-Z	10%	_____	Khalidi Hospital
28.	Ladies Surgical Gowns	65%	_____	Khalidi Hospital
29.	Green Men's Surgical Gowns	60%	_____	Khalidi Hospital
	36 total			

96

Appendix 3

<u>Contracts Delivered</u>	<u>Amount</u> -
Queen Alia Hotel	JD 2778.420
Arab Wings	2054
Jordanian Air Force	872
Maïnas Hospital	673
Jebel Amman Hospital	562.200
Khalidi Hospital	511
Al-Naziri School-Zarqa	569
School Shirts for Mr. Aslan	521
School Uniforms--several outlets	4900 ✓

Contracts Awarded

Olympia Apts.
Jet Bus Company
Beit Miriam
(Francescan Sisters)
Queen Alia Hospital-Amman
Princess Basma
Hospital-Irbid

Contracts under Negotiation

Islamic Hospital	Yarmouk University School of Nursing
Shmeisani Hospital	Jordan University School of Nursing
Al-Amal Hospital	Public Transport Authority
Alia-Royal Jordanian Airlines	Inter Continental Hotel
Civil Aviation Authority	Princess Basma Hospital-Irbid
Jordanian-Syrian Land Transport	
Princess Basma Maternity Hospital-Irbid	

37