



CARE/Ethiopia

Piloting Safety Net Program in Pastoral Areas

Annual Results Report

Cooperative Agreement FFP-A-00-08-00049

October 01, 2009 – September 30, 2010

Submission Date: November 1, 2010



*Dewe Woreda, Halbi Village, Appreciative Inquiry Focus Group Discussion,
Photo taken by: Michael DeVries, TANGO, September 2010*

Contacts:

CARE HQ	CARE Country Office
Robert Laprade Senior Director Emergency and Humanitarian Assistance Unit CARE USA Tel. 1-404-979-9224 Email: rlaprade@care.org	Garth Van't Hul, Program Director CARE Ethiopia Tel: +251 11 618 3294, Fax. +251 11 618 3295 Email: Gvanthul@care.org.et care.eth@ethionet.et
Kumkum Kashiparekh CARE Atlanta Tel. +1-404-979-9155, Fax. +1-404-589-2625 Email: kashiparekh@care.org	Bena Musembi, Chief of Party CARE Ethiopia Tel: +251 11 618 3294, Fax. +251 11 618 3295 Email: BMusembi@care.org.et care.eth@ethionet.et

Table of contents

	<i>Page #</i>
1. Introduction: Annual Food Aid Program Results	1-9
2. Success Stories	9-10
3. Lessons Learned	10-12
4. Attachments:	12
A. Indicator Performance Tracking Table;	
B. Detailed Implementation Plan;	
C. Standardized Annual Performance Questionnaire;	
D. Tracking Table for Beneficiaries and Resources;	
E. Expenditure Report;	
F. Monetization Tables;	
G. Baseline Survey, Mid-term or Final Evaluation Reports	
H. Supplemental Materials; and	
I. Completeness	
<u>Tables</u>	
Table-1: PW Beneficiaries and Amount of Commodities	6
Table-2:DS Beneficiaries and Amount of Commodities	6
Table-3:Contingency Beneficiaries and Amount of Commodities	6

Lists of Acronyms

AMREF	Africa Medical Research Fund in Ethiopia
AWGSRHLRP	Afar Women and Girls Sexual Reproductive Health Livelihoods Rights Project
CAMC	Community Asset Management Committee
CF	Community Facilitator
CSSG	Community Self Saving Group
DS	Direct Support
EDAC	Ethiopia Development Assistance Consortium
FFP	Food for Peace
FMTF	Food Management Taskforce
FPWCU	Federal Public Works Coordination Unit
FSCD	Food Security Coordination Directorate
FY	Financial Year
GAO	Government Accounting Office
HIV/AIDS	Human-Immuno Virus/Acquired Immuno Deficiency Syndrome
IGA	Income Generating Activities
KFSTF	Kebele Food Security Task Force
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
PAP	Pastoral Area Pilot
PARDO	Pastoral Agriculture and Rural Development Office
PCDP	Pastoral Community Development Project
PSNP	Productive Safety Net Program
PTF	Pastoralist Taskforce
PLI	Pastoralist Livelihood Initiative
PW	Public Work
SSD	Support for Sustainable Development
TLU	Tropical Livestock Unit
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VS&L	Village Saving and Loan
WCT	Woreda Core Technical
WFSTF	Woreda Food Security Task Force

1. Introduction: Annual Food Aid Program Results

This report covers the PSNP-PAP implementation period of October 1, 2009 to September 30, 2010. During this Fiscal Year (FY), the project focused on scaling up and sharing the lessons learnt, improving the public works (PW) quality, and enhancing community and government counterpart capacities. Accordingly, household and community assets, particularly livestock, were protected and enhanced. A respected Dewe leader stated that “I would like to witness that the PSNP-PAP has assisted its beneficiaries not to make distress sale of their animals for food purchase; and I guess it reduced by half”. Positive changes in traditional practices that undermine women’s social status were noted like their inclusion in the targeting process, enhancing the accountability and transparency of the process. The project also shared lessons learnt to facilitate the current roll-out of PSNP in pastoral areas. A total of 3,377 rural households benefitted directly from this USG supported intervention.

CARE Ethiopia transitioned from an ad hoc project-based programming approach to a long-term strategy, aimed at achieving lasting impact at broad scale. As such, the PSNP-PAP project was incorporated under the Pastoralist School-Age Girls Program, which encompasses the USAID-funded Pastoralist Livelihood Initiative II (PLI II), Norwegian Government Funded Afar Women and Girls Sexual Reproductive Health Livelihoods Rights Project (AWGSRHRLRP) and other pastoral emergency interventions. As part of this initiative, an Appreciative Inquiry¹ exercise was conducted in West Haraghe and Dewe, Afar Region, to identify and assess CARE Ethiopia’s approaches and value-added to the food security of its targeted impact groups and review operational obstacles. Key findings of this exercise are incorporated into this report. Results of the final evaluation have not being finalized and will be shared later.

What is a Program Approach?

CARE defines a program as a coherent set of interrelated activities, done by CARE and others, that involves a long-term commitment to specific marginalized and vulnerable groups to achieve lasting reductions in the underlying causes of poverty and social injustice.

CARE Ethiopia is working with the following impact groups, over the next 15 to 20 years:

- Chronically food insecure rural women in highland areas;
- Pastoralist school-aged girls; and
- Resource poor female youth in urban and peri-urban areas.

The assumption at project design that there is much similarity amongst the target communities did not hold true. The project has established three groups, namely, Pastoralists, Agro-pastoralists and Ex-pastoralists, who rely on different livelihood strategies.

The heavy rains in August 2010 rendered Dewe inaccessible for about a month, limiting the communities’ access to other areas, during the fasting period. This also undermined the achievement of some planned project activities. The project collaborated with the Woreda, Zonal and Regional officials to rehabilitate the 20 km inter-woreda road, with FFP’s approval. The Afar Region government provided heavy duty machinery, the Woreda covered the machinery operators’ costs and oil expenses and the project provided 3,000 liters of fuel. The rehabilitated road re-established access to Dewe.

The following sections outline the project achievements in FY10:

¹ The Appreciative Inquiry report is annexed as part of Attachment H – Supplemental Materials.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE (SO) 1²: Households have increased access to productive infrastructure, social services and natural resources.

Intermediate Result 1.1: Viability of pasturelands, water resources and productive community assets enhanced.

A Construction Supervisor was hired, based on the lessons learnt last FY: i) the project and government staff as well as community members' PW technical skills are limited; and ii) the level of effort required to build their capacities requires a full-time person. These changes improved the timeliness and quality of the PW activities. The project team complemented this effort by holding a cross-visit to successful PW sites in April 2010 for 39 male members of the Woreda Food Security Task Force (WFSTF), Kebele Food Security Task Force (KFSTF) and targeted communities. **Additionally, 300 persons (263 males/37 females) received short-term agricultural sector productivity training.**

Activity: Explore and refine potential PW activities

Activity Result 1: 90% of the PW activities identified conform to community-based implementation guidelines. The activities were identified by facilitating natural resources and socio-economic analysis, environmental screening and community participation. This process was undertaken by a multi-disciplinary PW planning team from the Woreda sector offices, Development Agents (DA) at Kebele level and community elected representatives. Some of the activities identified include rangeland rehabilitation, soil and water conservation measures in rangelands, and water point development for human and livestock consumption.

Challenges and solutions:

The FY target of 100% was unmet, due to the limited technical capacities of the project, Woreda and kebele staff. This was addressed by conducting a 4-day environmental management workshop in January 2010 – West Haraghe. The workshop was organized by CARE Ethiopia, with technical support from the USAID Mission Environmental Officer and Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MOARD) Environment and Social Management Advisor. It imparted skills and knowledge in the planning and implementation of environmentally sound PW activities. Participants included 5 PSNP-PAP staff members (three from the project and two from the Woreda PARDO) as well as HIBRET II, RI and PSNP-Plus staff. An additional 2-day refresher training was conducted by the trained PSNP-PAP staff for the Woreda Core Technical Team and the Woreda PW Planning Team members. The training included natural resources and socio-economic analysis, environmental screening, and environmental management planning.

In December 2009, four persons (2 from the Woreda PARDO and 2 the project) participated in a cross visit to REST project areas of Tigray. The aim was to extract best practices the creation of community assets through the PW activities. Some of the key lessons learnt were committed leadership at grassroots level, maximum community participation, and strict supervision.

I. Activity: Enclose and manage rangelands through community-based knowledge and system.

Activity Result 1: 100 hectares (ha) of pastureland enclosed and managed, surpassing the FY10 set target 98 ha. The over achievement is attributable to the project's success in

² This objective and a few others including the intermediate results were revised, as indicated in our November 2009 annual results report and IPTT.

effectively combining traditional and modern rangeland management techniques, which ensured community participation and ownership. The Appreciative Inquiry indicated this as a good practice, which will potentially improve livestock feed, resulting in increased food and coping capacities for managing risks – with a positive impact on women and girls.

Challenges and solutions: Slow adoption of some of the promoted rangeland reclamation techniques (e.g. of soil and stone bunds) by communities at severely degraded sites, due to their labor intensity and time consuming nature. This challenge is gradually being overcome by piloting the techniques at a small scale.

II. **Activity: Technology transfer in improved rangeland management.**

Activity Result 1: 180 individuals (156 male, 24 female) trained in community-based rangeland management techniques, surpassing the FY target of 120. The achievement is attributable to the mobilization and partnering of highly experienced rangeland experts from Melkasa Agricultural Research Center. Two training sessions were organized, each for 3 days in September 2010. 160 participants from Community Asset Management Committees (CAMC), KFSTF, and Women and Youth representatives. 20 participants from the WFSTF, WCT and DAs representatives. The trainings enhanced the participant's knowledge and practices in rangeland rehabilitation and management systems, especially for degraded areas.

III. **Activity: Water points development for human and livestock consumption**

Activity Result 1: 2 shallow wells (Ellas) rehabilitated, with 50% work in progress for the construction of 5 Ellas and 2 Cisterns. The 5 Ellas rehabilitated last FY are being managed by their respective communities. The FY10 target of 9 was unmet due to communities' unwillingness to adopt the proposed environmental mitigation measures (e.g. covering the Ellas' openings to prevent contamination and locating the new structures away from the river banks and beds). As indicated in last FY ARR page 6, the communities prefer uncovered Ella openings to ease water collection. Though the project learnt from last year, the entire process still took longer than expected. Based on the communities' feedback, the project adopted a win-win design approach by maintaining the Ella opened, but protected with higher and wider masonry structures to protect from peak run-off. Another alternative explored is a separate protected open well for livestock and a covered well for potable water, both located off the floodplain. Each Ella established a WATSAN committee; trained in site selection, design, including required management skills, and proper hygiene and sanitation practices.



Shallow well (Ellas) rehabilitated in Dewe, Photo taken by: Yeshambel Kinde, CARE Ethiopia,, August 2010

Another solution was organizing the Integrated Water Resource Management (IWRM) training for 120 individuals drawn from 10 kebeles (70 Water & Sanitation committee members, 40 KFSTF and 10 Woreda Core Technical members). The 2-day training was facilitated in September 2010 by the project Construction Supervisor with co-facilitation of the woreda health and water offices' technical staff. The training equipped the participants with the basic concepts and principles of IWRM such as sustainable site selection and management of water points; equipping the WATSAN committees with: sustainable water resource management practices including the techniques of ensuring potable water supply; sanitation and hygiene from the point

of views of health, environment and behavioral aspects. The role and responsibility of women was addressed and encouraged.

Activity Result 2: 2 troughs constructed for livestock watering under achieving the FY10 set target of 6. The under achievement is due to the lengthy process employed to reach agreement with the target communities about the location of the troughs (i.e. 50 meters from the water source). The project enlisted the support of the Woreda officials and traditional leaders to revise and adopt the location of the troughs.

The Appreciative Inquiry identified the livestock and human water points as a critical intervention that will improve the lives of communities in pastoral areas. A key recommendation was to consider introducing multi-purpose water points and clearly demarcating human and livestock points, as the project is now doing.

IV. **Activity: Integrated Water Resource Management (IWRM) training**

Activity Result 1: 120 people (Male 107, Female 13) trained in IWRM, achieving the FY10 set target of 120. The 2-day training was reported in page 3 under water development for human and livestock - activity result 1.

V. **Activity: Construct/rehabilitate community roads**

Activity Result 1: 77 Km of community roads constructed, surpassing the FY10 set target of 60 km. The extensive community sensitization process along with their effective mobilization and empowerment to identify, implement and realize the benefits of their priority public works, were the major reasons for the over achievement.

Activity Result 2: 79.5 Km of community roads rehabilitated, over achieving the FY10 set target of 53 km. The factors for this over achievement are similar to those outlined above under road construction. Out of 95 km of roads constructed and/or maintained during FY09, 50.5 Km are maintained by their respective communities.

Challenges and solutions: As mentioned in the FY09 ARR (page 8), achieving the quality of the roads was a key challenges. The problem partly stems from the absence of a pastoral-specific PW guideline that establishes technical specifications and standards. The Federal Public Works Coordination Unit (FPWCU) with the donors has commenced the process of developing this guideline, with CARE Ethiopia proving technical support. The selection of routes for new roads was a challenge, because communities prefer road routes across very gentle slopes - seeing the shortest path, while not understanding the negative impacts of selecting sloppy roads. The environmental management workshop addressed this challenge.

VI. **Activity: Establish Community Asset Management Committees (CAMC)**

Activity Result 1: established 60 CAMC, exceeding the planned target of 50. This success is attributable to the increased focus by the project team on strengthening exit strategies. The CAMCs took the management of the established PW structures and interventions such as area closures, water points, and roads.

Challenges and Solutions: Some of the CAMC members do not adequately understand and/or take full responsibility for the maintenance and management of the community assets. To overcome this problem, the CARE Ethiopia Community Facilitators and Government

Development Agents focused on awareness creation, training of CAMC and development of by-laws for these groups, including user rights and future management responsibilities.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE (SO) 2: Assets of resource poor households protected.

Intermediate Result (IR) 2.1: Appropriate, timely and predictable transfers received by households in response to chronic and transitory requirements.

The project collaborated with the HIBRET II team to strengthen commodity management:

- Conducting a 2-day commodity management workshop in November 2009, attended by 5 people, all males (3 from the project and 2 from the Woreda PARDO). Topics included donor and CARE regulations, targeting, warehouse management, and reporting;
- Training on Payroll and Attendance Sheet System (PASS) software for 4 people, all males, 2 from the project and 2 from Dewe Woreda PARDO in collaboration with Federal FSCD and CARE Ethiopia from 28-31 December 2009.
- Instituting a supervisory and capacity building mechanism by CARE Ethiopia CO commodity department staff through regular field visits;
- Recruiting additional commodity related staff e.g. Commodity Data & Account Clerk to exclusively manage the MBL instead of using temporary staff.

The Appreciative Inquiry noted that food distribution is a good practice, valued by communities, because it allows households to build and protect assets, particularly livestock. The Inquiry also noted the extra burden born by women because they have to either travel far to mill the distributed wheat³ or do it at home, which is very time consuming. CARE Ethiopia will explore ways of addressing this challenge in the next MYAP design.

The project has a carryover of 1,172.2MT commodities (1,025.16MT wheat, 35.34 MT oil and 111.7MT of yellow split peas).

Activity: Provide food to food insecure households through PW activities

Activity Result 1: 10,342 PW beneficiaries received 1,402 MT of food commodities (Table 1).

Table 1: Number of PW beneficiaries and amount of commodities transferred

Woreda	# of Beneficiaries						Amount of FFW Food (MT)	
	Total Planned	Male Planned	Female Planned	Total Achieved	Male Achieved	Female Achieved	Planned	Achieved
Dewe	11,384	6,140	5,244	10,342	5,522	4,821	1,350.71	1,402.4
Total	11,384	6,140	5,244	10,342	5,522	4,821	1,350.71	1,402.4

This achievement is below the planned figure because the number of PW beneficiaries was lower than anticipated as the targeting process identified more direct support (DS) beneficiaries. This might be due to an increase in the number of unable bodied persons. It is noteworthy that these payments included the FY09 two-month transfers, i.e. September and October 2009, which had not been distributed based on initial assessments, indicating a favorable food security situation in

³ There are very few mills in Dewe. Most women prefer to extend their stay at the distribution points to mill the wheat and then travel home, which often results in 2-3days utilized to obtain the food transfers.

targeted communities. This decision was reversed when the actual harvest was poor. This matter was discussed with USAID Ethiopia Mission ATL Team and approved by FFP in October 2009. All the transfers were effected based on the FY09 targeting result as the FY10 targeting activities were incomplete.

Activity: Provide food to food insecure households through DS

Activity Result 1: 3,826 direct support beneficiaries received 518.8 MT commodities in response to chronic food insecurity (see Table 2 below). This achievement surpassed the planned targets because the DS beneficiaries were more than planned, as noted earlier.

Table 2: Number of DS beneficiaries and amount of commodities transferred

Woreda	# of Beneficiaries						Amount of DS Food (MT)	
	Total Planned	Male Planned	Female Planned	Total Achieved	Male Achieved	Female Achieved	Planned	Achieved
Dewe	2,784	1,413	1,371	3,826	2,015	1,811	330.32	518.81
Total	2,784	1,413	1,371	3,826	2,015	1,811	330.32	518.81

The project planned to distribute 336.25 MT of food for 2,834 contingency beneficiaries; but transferred only 96 MT for **708** beneficiaries (see Table 3 below). Only 5% of the contingency food was utilized with the WFSTF's approval, but the transfer of the remaining 15% was not approved by the Region, hence the achievement is lower.

Table 3: Number of Contingency beneficiaries and amount of commodity transferred

Woreda	# of Beneficiaries						Amount of DS Food (MT)	
	Total Planned	Male Planned	Female Planned	Total Achieved	Male Achieved	Female Achieved	Planned	Achieved
Dewe	2,834	1,530	1,304	708	426	282	336.25	96
Total	2,834	1,530	1,304	708	426	282	336.25	96

Challenges and Solutions for all food transfers:

- After CARE Ethiopia completed its four FY10 food transfers⁴, some beneficiaries noted that they had not received two-round distributions. The Woreda requested the project to transfer the two rounds. CARE Ethiopia communicated to the Regional Food Security and Disaster Prevention Bureau (14 September 2010) to request approval for the extra two-round distribution, but we has not received a response to date. The issue was brought to the attention of USAID/ALT, DRMFSS and discussed at the September 14, 2010 Food Management Task Force (FMTF) meeting.
- The FY10 food transfers (particularly the first two months) were delayed, due to prolonged beneficiary retargeting activities as a result of ethnic conflicts and the start of the rainy season. Repeated unavailability of the concerned government implementing partner members of the

⁴ A total of 6 transfers are provided in pastoral areas i.e. 4 by NGOs and 2 by Government. The RRT visited Dewe in October 2010 and further discussed this issue with the Woreda, Zonal and Region officials as well as CARE Ethiopia representatives. The matter is still in discussion as we write this report.

targeting committee was one of the constraints during the reporting period. To resolve these problems, the WFSTF decided to distribute the first three round transfers of this FY, based on the previous year's targeting result and finalize the targeting result before the next transfer month. The next transfer was preceded by awareness creation and familiarization of the retargeting activities to the respective KFSTF and target community members.

- The limited food storage facilities in the impact Woreda contributed to the constraints. FFP approved the construction of two central warehouses, which had been delayed due to the lack of access roads to selected warehouse construction sites, prolonged procurement process and general difficulty of the operating environment.
- Inadequate and unreliable commodity transport services also undermined progress, with some of the trucks failing to access distribution sites before the onset of the rainy season.

IR 2.2: Targeted communities trained on improved health, nutrition and hygiene:

Activity Result 1: 410 direct support beneficiaries trained in health (reproductive health, HIV/AIDS), nutrition, hygiene and sanitation, exceeding the set target of 150. An extra 20 health Extension Agents were trained. The process included 1-day training in each of the 10 kebeles from March 19 to 28, 2010, by the woreda environmental health expert and a nurse. The over achievement is primarily attributable to the adoption of a decentralized strategy, which facilitated multiple trainings at each locality instead of few sessions at the Woreda.

Activity Result 2: An estimated 5,500 community members reached by the trained DS beneficiaries and Extension Agents, surpassing the FY10 target of 5,000. This was achieved by limiting the trainers' geographical and work scope. Lack of appropriate community level training materials, especially visual aids in the local language undermined the dissemination efforts. This challenge was addressed by the project CFs and the Woreda health professionals developing pictorial illustrations by adopting AMREF's training materials and others used by the CARE Ethiopia AGWSRHLR Project.

Activity: Linking PSNP beneficiary with other services:

Activity result 1: 53% of PSNP beneficiaries were linked with the CARE Ethiopia Afar Women and Girls project (AWGSRHLR), World Bank funded Pastoral Community Development Project (PCDP) and Support for Sustainable Development (SSD) Irrigation project in Dewe in order to enhance synergy and maximize the impact of the pastoral girls program. This achievement is below the FY10 set target of 70%, but a major improvement over last FY's 37% achievement. Next FY, the project will strengthen linkages in health/HIV/AIDS information dissemination, VS&L, and irrigation activities.

Activity: Establish Village Saving and Loan Groups

Activity result 1: 8 Village Savings and Loan (VS&L) groups established in the target kebeles, achieving the FY set target of 8. Inadequate technical skills amongst the project and woreda government staff was a key obstacle, which initially undermined the pace of establishing and strengthening the groups. This was addressed by the CARE Ethiopia Income Generation Advisor conducting a Training of Trainers (ToT) for 19 persons (14 male, 5 female) drawn from the Woreda PARDO, the Woreda finance and economic development office, PSNP PAP and AWGSRHL. The 4-day training was co-facilitated by the Woreda partners and AWGSRHL staff. Trainees were equipped with the basic concepts, skills and principles in establishing, monitoring and supervising VS&Ls. A graduate from the University of Addis Ababa was recruited as an

intern. She worked for six-months in Dewe, under the guidance of the Income Generation Advisor, to provide on-site capacity building to both VS&L group members, CFs and DAs.

Activity: Amounts of Savings per VS&L Groups

Activity result 1: average savings per groups was about \$176.6, under achieving the target of \$600. We have learnt that the target was unrealistic, given the following key points:

- In the traditional Muslim Afar culture, earning interest and/or earning on savings is discouraged and undermined savings as group members were reluctant to take loans.
- Women's heavy workload and opposition from some husbands along with the limited livelihood options and income generation opportunities also contributed to their limited participation in group initiatives and low savings.
- Most of the groups are in their preliminary stage and have not fully grasped the importance of adhering to the VS&L methodology e.g. regular meetings and saving.

To overcome these constraints, consecutive meetings were undertaken with interested women before the groups' establishment. This was supplemented with extensive orientation and awareness creation activities done in all 10 target kebeles. Thereafter, women who were interested and/or engaged in businesses self-selected and established their groups. 1-day training was also provided for 89 female members drawn from nine VS&L groups, who have started saving. The trainings were facilitated by the project and woreda staff, trained by the Income Generation Advisor. The training equipped the participants with the basic concepts, skills and principles of the VS&L methodologies such as group establishment and management, regular and sustainable saving practices, constitution and bookkeeping. The project team also arranged experience sharing visits on July 29, 2010 for 49 members (48 female, 1 Male) of the nine groups to high performing CARE AWGSRHLP's VS&L groups. The groups were provided with the necessary VSLA materials such as a wooden saving box with two locks, registration books, pass books and stationary. The Appreciative Inquiry identified VS&Ls as a good practice, recommending the provision of systematic and intensified technical support to both the groups and project/woreda staff.

Activity result 2: HA of land under irrigation. The project did not achieve the set target of 18 ha. Though the irrigation sites were identified twice, the activities were not implemented due to conflict between the Oromo and Afar in the area. Accordingly, the project proposes to drop this activity and invest resources in scaling up other PW interventions.

ADDITIONAL KEY ACTIVITIES UNDERTAKEN:

Annual reflection and review workshop: In addition to monthly and quarterly WFSTF meetings and learning sessions, the project organized an annual reflection and review workshop in December 15-16, 2009 at Kombolcha. The aim of the workshop was to review the project progress and achievements, lessons learnt and challenges as well as constraints encountered, and identify implementation priorities and corrective measures. Twenty seven (27) participants attended the workshop drawn from the WFSTF, KFSTF, the Woreda cabinet, zonal administration, and representatives from Regional PSNP coordination unit as well as CARE Ethiopia. The workshop was an effective strategy of creating awareness and fostering improved commitment and accountability by the key implementing stakeholders.

Capacity building Activities:

- Technical support and a refresher training, aimed at strengthening the M&E systems, was facilitated for 19 Woreda and project staff (11 Woreda, 8 project) by a team from the CARE Ethiopia Program Development and Quality Support (PDQS) unit, including the MYAP (HIBRET II) M&E Advisor in March 2010.
- A participatory planning training on community facilitation/PRA tools and techniques was provided to 26 participants (Community Facilitators - 8 males/1 female, and Woreda DAs and technical staff -13 males/ 4 females) in 19-23 August 2010 at Dewe by the Country Office Pastoral Program Coordinator and PDQS Livelihoods Advisor.
- Office furniture, supplies, one desk top computer, two motor cycles and two printers procured and delivered to the Woreda food security desk.

STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE 3: To generate promising practices and effective approaches and relevant strategies to implement the safety net program in pastoral areas.

15 evidence-based lessons, detailed in section 3 below, were identified and used by the project to improve performance. About 7 of the lessons were shared with other PSNP partners for scaling-up. Both targets, set at 6, were exceeded, because of the diversified strategies employed to identify and disseminate the lessons. For instance, CARE Ethiopia's participation in the Pastoral Task Force (PTF) a coordination mechanism, where the NGOs implementing the PSNP-PAP program, USAID, World Bank and government representatives meet to share experiences and coordinate activities. The project team also shared lessons learnt at forums such as: i) the periodic Afar Regional planning and review meetings; ii) the Ethiopia Development Assistance Consortium⁵ (EDAC) coordination meetings; iii) USAID/ALT meetings (e.g. with the Government Accounting Office representatives); and iv) day-to-day and annual review meetings with communities and government.

Intermediate Result 3.1: Community approved safety nets interventions identified and lessons documented

Two studies were conducted to obtain evidence, achieving the set target. i) the Appreciative Inquiry commissioned by CARE Ethiopia; and ii) Documentation of Lessons study by Dadimos, hired by the Federal FSCD and the Donor group.

2. SUCCESS STORY

Enhanced Viability of Pasturelands:

The recurrent drought, aggressive encroachers/invasive plants and eroding customary rangeland management systems have contributed to the degradation of the Pastoral community rangelands in Dewe. The grazing-lands have not only experienced a drastic decline in the desirable vegetation cover and composition, but have also been encroached by bush and shrubs. This has tremendously contributed to the decline in livestock production and productivity, with communities citing reduced herd sizes⁶ and increased susceptibility to livestock diseases. Coupled with this has been the increase in conflicts amongst the Afar clans and between the Oromo and Afar, over the scarce grazing-lands. Therefore, rangeland rehabilitation was identified as the number one development intervention by communities and a key PSNP-PAP intervention to improve existing livelihood scenarios.

⁵ Six NGOs implementing the PSNP program i.e. CARE, CRS, FH, Save US and UK, and REST.

⁶ The project 2009 KAP study indicated that better-off HHs own 25.1TLUs (tropical livestock unit), with their proportion dramatically decreased from 47% ten years ago to 14% at present.

Accordingly, in Dewe, a team comprised of the project and government staff along with the community, identified the Parthinum and Acacia Melifera, locally called “Merkato” as the predominant invading plant species (75% invasion by A. Melifera). The team collaborated to develop a participatory community-based rangeland management plan, which identified and enclosed 20 ha of rangeland. This was done to give competitive advantage for the desirable pasture and forage species during the rainy season. This strategy, employed for 2 to 3 rainy seasons, reduced the undesirable encroachers and invasive plant species, enhancing the yielding capacity of the grass and fodder tree species, both in composition and species diversity. Before the area enclosure, this communal grazing area was yielding about 1 ton/ha/annum dry matter feed. After closure and livestock exclusion, the rangeland produced 60 – 80 tons of forage during this FY, which is determined using the World Bank’s estimate of about 3 - 4 tons/ha/annum dry matter⁷ for areas like Dewe. The communities used the fodder to make hay during the dry season as well as kept lactating cows and calves in the enclosures, under the shade. This enhanced the livestock’s milk and meat production, creating additional income and improving the community’s food security situation.



Dewe, Kilint Derseda Kebele Pastoral Community Rangelands, Photo taken by: Dereje Nigussie (Dr.), CARE Ethiopia, August 2010

In the enclosed sites of the Kebele, communities maintain that the following grass species which disappeared years ago, were restored: “Durfuta” (Chrysopogon plumulosus), “Eisesu” (Andropogon canaliculatus), “Serdoyta” (Cenchrus ciliaris) and “Kuruf.” According to Mohammed Ali Muraha, the 58 year old, chairperson of Kilinti Derseda Kebele: *“being pastoralist, we know different kinds of grazing management practices and strategies for centuries, but I admit that we don’t have proper understanding about how area enclosure with thinning of “Merkato” restores the degraded land. Really, I am astonished to see the growth of “Durfuta”, “Serdoyta” and many other grass species again with my eye, at my age.”* He added that *“now we have got lessons on how to improve fodder availability and quality as well as the potential of area stock exclusion. These practices have proved to be appropriate and viable options which compliment the traditional management experience; therefore, we have bright hope of enhancing the production and productivity of our livestock. If we replicate and adopt it with soil and water conservation measures as learned from the project, and expand the practices widely to other areas that there will be no need of moving to Cheffa wetlands in Oromiya Zone⁸”.* With such success the Woreda PARDO nominated the site as a model site to be used as a demonstration among the impact communities.

⁷ Based on the studies in the country indicated in the World Bank and Government of Ethiopia Joint Impact Assessment of the PSNP Public Works Program, May 2009.

⁸ A grazing zone shared by the Oromo Agro Pastoralists and Afar, where conflicts over scarce rangeland erupt.

3. LESSONS LEARNT

Some of the lessons learnt during this reporting period are indicated below:

- ***Human and livestock water point are the most important interventions that will improve the lives of communities in pastoral areas, with a reduction in women and girls workload.*** However, balancing between conforming to the environmental management standards and communities' practical requirements is a gradual process that requires flexibility as well as firm decision making to mitigate environmental degradation.
- ***Communities value food aid more for its ability to protect and enhance household assets*** (e.g. reducing distress sale of livestock during the lean season). A key implication of this lesson is the necessity of timely and appropriate transfers to ensure food security.
- ***VS&Ls are a viable mechanism of diversifying livelihood options/increasing incomes, but the methodology has to be tailored to the Afar pastoralist context.*** Ex-pastoralists show more interest and flexibility within VS&Ls, due to their acquired cash-based lifestyle.
- ***Small-scale irrigation is a potential means of diversifying agro-pastoralists' livelihood options.*** Gradually scaling-up by testing simple, appropriate and replicable technologies is recommended in order to ensure effective adoption and sustainability.
- ***The Afar communities are increasingly valuing education, even for girls, while maintaining some of their traditional practices such as Absuma***⁹. A significant concern is the distance children have to travel to reach schools, a security issue particularly for girls, that is being addressed by the project through its PW Alternative Basic Education Centers construction/rehabilitation activities. For traditional pastoralists, there may still be a need for mobile education services, although there is a perception even among these pastoralists that the semi-sedentary transition will continue.
- ***Rangeland rehabilitation through area closures is a potential good practice, especially when traditional and modern techniques are combined.*** Replication, even by non-project participants, is underway as communities realize and value the effectiveness of the practice in regenerating degraded pastureland.
- ***Ethnic conflict is a given in pastoral areas, particularly due to the dwindling grazing lands and constrained mobility as development encroaches on traditional pastoralist's pasturelands.*** Hence, conflict resolution should be considered in pastoral interventions.

Additional Lessons Learnt:

A. Targeting:

- **Targeting is not a one time event, especially due to the seasonal mobility of pastoralist.** The process requires extensive periodic retargeting and verification exercises. In the pastoralist context, communal resource sharing and inter-clan mutual assistances; multiple wives in separate places and multiple families in large extended family groups; the priority focus should be on resolving exclusion errors. In order to minimize the effect of sharing, transfer dilution, and maintain the primacy of the program objective of asset protection.
- **The extended family group ("Dalla") based targeting, distribution and public works implementation approach could be the more appropriate approach for Afar pastoral**

⁹ The practice of early engagement for girls.

communities than the individual targeting approach. The Dalla approach accounts for their traditional risk reduction and coping strategies, traditional safety net mechanisms, and justifies their century old tradition of solving their social and development problems by working together.

- **Extensive community sensitization is a prerequisite to improve the targeting results.**

The appeals committee is a good mechanism when it has independent membership from the targeting committee that includes the involvement of clan and religious leaders and women.

B. Increased Commitment and Accountability Needed at All Levels:

- **Enhanced mechanisms to ensure the accountability of implementing partners at all levels including Regional, Zonal, Woreda, Kebele and community is of paramount importance.** For example, the project experienced inadequate organizational and technical support from the lead implementers at the Woreda and Kebele levels particularly in PWs activities, which resulted in reduced participation of beneficiaries.

- **Pastoralist communities are able to transition from free food distribution to labor based public works.** This was achieved through extensive sensitization and familiarization of the project objectives, principles, and the importance of public works participation.

- **Problem solving along with the development and management of community assets is effective when both the formal and informal institutions have clear roles and responsibilities.**

This strategy has been adopted by the project through creating Community Asset Management Committees (CAMC) mainly comprised of these local institutions.

C. Human Resource Requirement: Technically competent, committed, and adequate staff at Woreda and Kebele levels is critical for project success and sustainability. Development Agents (DA) assigned at the Kebeles are not regularly staying among the communities mainly due to lack of residences, other infrastructure and regular follow up from concerned bodies.

D. Women Participation: Active involvement of women in the targeting and public works activities minimizes their exclusion from project interventions and improves their socio-economic status. For instance, the involvement of women in the targeting and appeal processes minimizes the possibility of excluding women headed households and individual women.

4. ATTACHMENTS

- a. Indicator Performance Tracking Table
- b. Detailed Implementation Plan Table
- c. Standardized Annual Performance Questionnaire
- d. Tracking Tables for Beneficiaries and Resources
- e. Expenditure Report
- f. Monetization Tables
- h. Supplemental Materials
- i. Completeness Checklist