



## USAID Office of Food for Peace Multi-Year Assistance Programs/Development Activity Programs

**CARE/ETHIOPIA**  
**Award Number: FFP-A-00-08-00079**

**HIBRET II Annual Results Report**  
**Fiscal Year 2009**  
**(August 1, 2008 – September 30, 2009)**

**Submission Date: November 5, 2009**



CARE HQ Contact Name  
CARE HQ Contact Address  
CARE HQ Contact Tel.  
CARE HQ Contact Fax  
CARE HQ Contact Email

Rigoberto Giron  
Director Emergency and  
Humanitarian Assistance  
151 Ellis Street NE  
Atlanta, GA 30303-2440, USA  
1-404-681-2552  
1-404-589-2604  
[rigiron@care.org](mailto:rigiron@care.org)

Garth Vant Hul,  
Program Director  
Box 4710  
Addis Ababa  
Ethiopia  
251-11-618-3294  
251-11-618-3295  
[vanthul@care.org.et](mailto:vanthul@care.org.et)

CARE Country Office Contact Name  
CARE Country Office Address  
CARE Country Office Contact Tel.  
CARE Country Office Fax  
CARE Country Office Contact Email

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	<i>Page #</i>
<b>1. Introduction: Annual Food Aid Program Results</b>	1-15
<b>2. Success Stories</b>	15-17
<b>3. Lessons Learned</b>	17-18
<b><u>Attachments:</u></b>	18
<b>A. Indicator Performance Tracking Table</b>	
<b>B. Detailed Implementation Plan</b>	
<b>C. Standardized Annual Performance Questionnaire</b>	
<b>D. Tracking Table for Beneficiaries and Resources</b>	
<b>E. Expenditure Report</b>	
<b>F. Monetization Tables</b>	
<b>H. Supplemental Materials</b>	
<b>I. Completeness Checklist</b>	
<b><u>Tables</u></b>	
<b>Table 1: Number of Originally Approved Public Works (PW) and Direct Support (DS) Beneficiaries by Woreda, Type of Transfer and Number of Months of Transfer</b>	3
<b>Table 2: Actual Number of PW and DS Beneficiaries Reached by Woreda, Type of Transfer and Number of Months of Transfer</b>	3

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

CAP	Community Action Planning
CF	Community Facilitator
CI	Chronically Ill
DA	Development Agent
DMFSS	Disaster Management and Food Security Sector
DPP	Disaster Prevention Preparedness
EDAC	Ethiopia Development Assistance Consortium
ELTAP	Ethiopia Strengthening Land Tenure and Administration Program
EWS	Early Warning System
FFP	Food for Peace
FTC	Farmer Training Center
FFW	Food for Work
FSTF	Food Security Task Force
FY	Financial Year
GOE	Government of Ethiopia
HIBRET	Household Income Building and Rural Empowerment for Transformation
IR	Intermediate Result
JEOP	Joint Emergency Operation Plan
MBL	Master Beneficiary List
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MIS	Management Information System
MFI	Microfinance Institutions
MLVP	Market-led Livelihoods for Vulnerable Populations
MT	Metric Ton
NRM	Natural Resource Management
PW	Public Works
PSNP	Productive Safety-Net Program
SWC	Soil and Water Conservation
SO	Strategic Objective
TOR	Terms of Reference
VAT	Value Added Tax
VS&L	Village Savings and Loans

## **1. Introduction: Annual Food Aid Program Results**

*HIBRET II beneficiaries protected and enhanced their household and community assets by participating in the project activities, which contributed to their improved food security status.* As such, HIBRET II achieved the stated objectives in FY09, making steady progress towards achieving Life of Activity (LOA) expected results.

In June 2008, FFP approved HIBRET I's no-cost extension to end on 30th September, 2008. The extension was requested to facilitate a smooth transition from HIBRET I to II and to enable CARE to close-out activities in Laygaint Woreda in Amhara region, which was not included in the MYAP. Although the MYAP was approved in August 2008, most of the interventions, other than the startup activities, could not be initiated due to the close out of HIBRET I, during the no-cost extension period.

Factors contributing to HIBRET II's achievements in FY09 include:

- a) Willingness and ability of project staff to learn from project beneficiaries and successfully implement lessons learnt to improve performance;
- b) Utilization of Community Action Planning (CAP) to empower communities and build their capacities to plan, implement and sustain development efforts;
- c) Effective integration with PSNP *Plus*<sup>1</sup> in Doba and Kurfa Chelle Woredas;
- d) Systematic and consistent empowerment of women;
- e) Effective scale-up and use of best-practices, even from HIBRET I;
- f) Involvement of community leaders and government officials in all project activities, which fostered ownership along with timely and efficient reconciliation of challenges;
- g) Utilization of a holistic implementation approach i.e. providing beneficiaries with a package of HIBRET services e.g. food aid, agricultural extension and VS&L.

The sections below highlight HIBRET's results achieved in FY09:

### **Strategic Objective SO1: Household assets and community resources are protected<sup>2</sup>:**

HIBRET II beneficiaries strengthened their resiliency to shocks as demonstrated by the following results reported by our annual survey<sup>3</sup>:

- **48% of households reported selling productive assets during periods of chronic food insecurity, which exceeded our set target by 2%.**

---

<sup>1</sup> PSNP *Plus* Program is funded by USAID Ethiopia. CARE is the consortium Lead Agency consisting of international and local organizations. The Program goal is complementary to the objectives of the GOE's Food Security Program. The goal states: *Targeted PSNP households' resiliency improved and livelihood assets enhanced as a means towards achieving graduation.* There are two key interventions (value chain development and linkage to microfinance).

<sup>2</sup> We have revised some of our original objectives and intermediate results in Attachment A - IPTT, based on feedback from AED and FFP. However, this is not reflected in the narrative report, because we are awaiting final approval of our IPTT submitted on September 10, 2009. We, also request FFP to review the attached IPTT as the final version, instead of the September 10 version, because we have made some changes, based on the results of our October 2009 annual survey.

<sup>3</sup> Annual survey conducted by an independent consultant in October 2009, with a total of 899 respondents in Grawa Woreda, East Haraghe and Doba and Chiro Woredas, West Haraghe.

- **The average value of assets in US\$ was reported at \$694, exceeding the set target of US \$510.**

The above two targets were surpassed because the food transfers provided our beneficiaries with the opportunity to diversify their livelihoods by engaging in other productive activities e.g. petty trading. The survey also reported that over one-third (35%) of the respondents were Village Savings and Loans (VS&L) members. As such, were able to borrow money, especially during hard times, while 6% (of the 35%) initiated small scale businesses. The transfers also protected our beneficiaries' harvests during the hunger gap.

- The average number of enterprises per household was reported at 2, which is slightly below our set target of 3. This target was not achieved, because it was ambitious for the first year, when beneficiaries require more time to steadily diversify their livelihoods. We have learnt that it is more sustainable and effective to build our beneficiaries' capacities to select appropriate enterprises and manage them e.g. by enhancing their business planning and financial literacy skills, utilizing the VS&L methodologies. This will be our focus in FY10.

**Intermediate Result (IR 1.1): Household assets protected through PSNP Food-For-Work (FFW) or direct food assistance.**

HIBRET II provided food resources to FFW/PW and Direct Support (DS) beneficiaries, while successfully piloting the cash/food mix. Results of our transfers are outlined below as well as our experience with the cash/food initiative.

- A total of 250,367 people (128,898 females and 121,469 males) participated in FFW activities, receiving a total of 12,505 MT of commodities. This achievement surpassed our planned target of 125,627, due to the additional extended Woredas beneficiaries, provided with 3 months transfer.
- A total of 30,690 chronically food insecure people (16,047 females and 14,643 males) received a total of 1,547 MT of commodities, exceeding the planned target of 14,041 (for the same reason outlined above).

Similarly, the total amount of food commodities distributed also differed from the original PW and DS plans of 11,363 MT and 2,841MT, respectively, as a result of the cash/food mix initiative.<sup>4</sup> Additional PW beneficiaries were provided with commodities originally planned for the DS. This is because the number of DS fluctuates as the targeted beneficiaries sometimes graduate into the PW category, when they are well enough to fully participate in FW activities.

Table 1 below shows the original approved food distribution plans for public works and direct support, while Table 2 demonstrates the impact of the cash/food mix initiative on our initial plans.

---

<sup>4</sup> It is noteworthy, that the approved commodities for PW and contingency were combined into a total of 14,204MT.

Table 1: Number of Originally Approved PW and DS Beneficiaries by Woreda, Type of Transfer and Number of Months of Transfer

Zone	Name of Woredas	# of Originally Approved Beneficiaries			# of Approved Months of Transfers
		PW	DS	Total	
East Haraghe	Grawa	36,205	4,215	40,423	6
	Kurfar Chelle	17,458	2,394	19,852	6
West Haraghe	Chiro	23,806	2,354	26,160	6
	Gemechis	22,013	2,177	24,190	6
	Doba	26,145	2,901	29,046	6
Total		125,627	14,041	139,668	

Table 2: Actual Number of PW and DS Beneficiaries Reached by Woreda, Type of Transfer and Number of Months of Transfer

Zone	Name of Woredas	# of Actual Beneficiaries Reached			# of Actual Months of Transfers
		PW	DS	Total	
East Haraghe	Grawa	35,497	4,215	39,712	3
	Kurfar Chelle	17,282	2,392	19,674	3
	Bedeno	27,112	531	27,643	3
	Haramaya	18,122	1878	20,000	3
	Kombolcha	13,824	1340	15,164	3
West Haraghe	Chiro	23,168	1,578	24,746	3
	Gemechis	22,325	2,063	24,388	3
	Doba	25,717	3,319	29,036	3
	Tullo	13,440	1,748	15,188	3
	Mieso	40,569	10,805	51,374	3
East Showa	Fantele	13,311	821	14,132	3
Total		250,367	30,690	281,057	

The **cash/food mix initiative** was an interesting and challenging learning experience as outlined below:

- The lengthy process taken to formulate and implement this new strategy coupled with inadequate communication amongst the key players, especially Zonal and Regional government offices, undermined the pace of implementation, contributing to

late food transfers. There was inadequate clarity in the woreda/CARE roles and responsibilities, which further delayed implementation. The three months cash transfers in the traditional woredas were delayed and often paid as a lump-sum (e.g. end of July in East Haraghe), due to the delay in transferring the money from the Region to the woredas. This resulted in some beneficiaries selling off their assets to buy food, during the hard times. According to our annual survey, selling household livestock is the key coping strategy employed by close to two-thirds (65%) of the respondents, during hard times.

We **addressed these challenges** by our field team proactively sharing information at the Kebele, Woreda and Zonal level with our government counterparts, especially the Woreda Food Security Task Forces (FSTF). The field team also accompanied the woreda officials to the field and provided them with the logistical support required to plan and implement e.g. vehicles. Similarly, the CARE Commodity Manager and PSNP Chief of Party also garnered support at the Regional and Federal level by meeting with Obbo Chala Hordofa, Oromia Commissioner twice, to request his support in overcoming the outlined challenges. At the Federal level, CARE's representatives also engaged in the donor/NGO efforts to smoothen the process, through consultative meetings. HIBRET's senior staff i.e. Woreda Team Leaders, Project Managers, Commodity Manager and Chief of Party spent considerable time facilitating the successful implementation of this initiative (e.g. in meetings, planning and monitoring). We also organized a cross-learning visit in the West Haraghe extended and traditional Woredas to facilitate easy adoption to the new system.

- Communicating the new initiative to the **traditional** HIBRET beneficiaries and gaining their buy-in was tough, because they preferred food to cash transfers, due to the global economic crisis and inadequate access to food markets. This challenge was a risk anticipated during project development and was addressed as outlined below. Some traditional Woreda beneficiaries were reluctant to participate in the PW activities, maintaining that the cash provided was not equivalent to the standard food ratio.

We **addressed these challenges** by enlisting the support of the FSTF to conduct repeated sensitization meetings with beneficiaries, appealing to their leaders for support along with gaining a better understanding of the impact of the initiative. For instance, we learnt that:

- Beneficiaries and government officials in the **extended woredas** welcomed the food transfers, especially due to the high food prices; and
- This experience provided the extended and traditional woreda officials as well as CARE staff the opportunity to learn from each other. For example, CARE staff and traditional woreda officials learnt about the cash transfer approach, while the extended woreda officials were exposed to new commodity management standards and practices.
- The master beneficiary list (MBL) submission to CARE by the extended Woredas took considerable time and most often did not reconcile with the payment sheet. This challenge was addressed by CARE staff thoroughly checking the MBL and

discussing anomalies with the FSTF and Disaster Prevention and Preparedness (DPP) unit. We also trained Woreda staff to computerize the MBL and payment sheet.

- The identification of suitable warehouses (i.e. with the capacity to hold the commodities as well as meet USAID criteria) in the extended woreda was another challenge, which further contributed to the late transfers. Most extended woredas did not have appropriate warehouses and the identification process took a long time to complete. For instance, the Fantele woreda officials identified the warehouse in September 2009, after repeated visits and meetings with the CARE Awash Office staff. This effort was coupled with a visit to the Oromia Commissioner's Office – Obbo Chala's Office and the Food Security Coordinator by the Commodity Manager and Chief of Party to enlist their support. The Fantele distribution was completed in October 2009.

We also made effort to expedite the food distributions as soon as the commodities were delivered to the extended woreda, in order to minimize the delays, and avoid spoilage or loss associated with theft.

- Servicing the extended woredas stretched limited resources such as vehicles and staff. CARE provided logistical support to the woreda staff to plan (e.g. sensitization meetings) and undertake the transfers, which diverted resources from other planned HIBRET activities. The shortage of vehicles undermined CARE's monitoring of the food distributions and other project activities e.g. low commodity management capacities of the extended woreda officials, required oversight from CARE's team (Food Monitor and Project Manager). Additional costs incurred by CARE, that the extended woreda were initially expected to pay include warehouse staff (e.g. guards and in some instances, storekeepers). CARE also incurred higher than anticipated fuel and vehicle maintenance costs, during the distribution period. It is noteworthy that the extended Woredas did not have adequate funds to cover all the costs associated with the initiative.

Our field team **addressed this challenge** by increasing the coordination between the other CARE projects operating from the same Field Office e.g. HIBRET staff traveling to project sites with JEOP Emergency Staff and/or PSNP-Plus staff.

In FY10, we have made the following plans in anticipation of the cash/food mix initiative:

- Commenced early community sensitization exercises in all the kebeles;
  - Assessed our warehouse capacity and identified additional ones in order to increase our capacity;
  - Initiated actions with Kebele/Woreda officials to support them in the identification of suitable warehouses in the extended Woredas;
  - Used the risk financing process to clarify the roles and responsibilities of the woreda and CARE;
  - Actively engaged in the planning of the second cash/food mix phase at all levels;
- and

- Adjusted our budgets during the PREP submissions to allow for increased funding to implement.

**Minor challenges** that further contributed to the delayed food transfers include:

- Bureaucratic delays in preparing the Public Works (PW) attendance sheets, and obtaining the necessary approvals between the DPP, Food Security Offices and CARE to effect payment. Additionally, the woredas' technical teams were unable to effectively monitor/assess the completion of PW in all kebeles within a month, which delayed food payments to the PW beneficiaries. We **enlisted the support** of the woreda FSTF, who reinforced the monitoring team by providing overall supervision and follow-up to speed up the bureaucratic process at the Food Security offices.

**CARE did not experience major challenges with transportation to the extended woreda and the related payments have been completed.** However, routine challenges with transporters to our traditional woredas such as failure to adhere to contractual obligations, resulting in the late delivery of commodities were experienced. Another challenge was the delayed submission of payment requests by transporters. Problematic transporters were black listed and not contracted for further services. We also conducted some distributions over the weekend to minimize delays. Some areas were inaccessible during the rainy season, which further delayed distributions.

**Commodity Carryover:** we have a carryover of 292.76MT (cereals: 274.83MT; pulses: 1.8MT; and oil 16.13MT) due to the following reasons:

- Contingency resources were not fully utilized, due to late or no requests from the regional government;
- Absentee beneficiaries in the public works activities, who did not receive food payments, because they did not participate in PW activities; and
- Discrepancies between planned and actual beneficiaries.

**Construction of structures:**

- We were not authorized to build a warehouse, but we installed a rub hall in Dire Dewa and upgraded the rub hall in Chulul by mounting a concrete floor.
- In West Haraghe, we fenced two warehouses and constructed two additional pit latrines.

***IR I.2: Community assets built and improved through PSNP public works***

HIBRET II beneficiaries identified priority community assets at project inception, which they have constructed, protected and enhanced to improve their food security status. The establishment of performance standards for public works, increased provision of technical support to technical teams and formation of 72 asset management committees contributed to the results outlined below:

- **Conserving a total of 425HA** land through the implementation of various soil and water conservation (SWC) measures e.g. terracing, contour bunds, check dams, and bund stabilization. This accomplishment exceeds the FY09 set target of 370HA.

The target was surpassed due to the participatory planning and consultative process that was employed to gain buy-in from the communities. The effective use and general adherence by communities to the watershed approach in natural resource management also contributed to the accomplishments.

- **Constructing 90% of the planned human and 80% of the planned livestock water points**, with 1,117 households and 6,746 livestock accessing water. The targets are unmet because planning with some communities took longer than anticipated. For instance, in Grawa, East Haraghe, the design of one water point was altered to include a water reservoir based on feedback from beneficiaries, who prioritized access to adequate supply of clean water in their participatory planning exercise.
- **Rehabilitating 772km of road exceeding the FY09 set target by 54%**, due to the communities' commitment to improve access to public services and markets, especially during the rainy season. The extensive soil degradation has contributed to challenges in rehabilitating the roads, which has sometimes required increased labor to achieve expected results.
- **Irrigating 4HA of land, in 2 schemes, which is below the FY09 of 300HA target and 10 schemes**. Progress in this area has been slow due to the initial lack of technical expertise within CARE, which was addressed by hiring an Engineer to serve both East and West Haraghe. As such, potential irrigation sites have been identified, structural designs developed along with the associated bills of quantities and construction works will speed-up in FY10. A key lesson learnt is that assigning one staff to serve two Field Offices is ineffective, cost-inefficient and undermines the required monitoring of on-going activities (e.g. the traveling back and forth from the two field offices wastes time). We have addressed this challenge by sharing staff with the PSNP-Plus project i.e. there will be two Engineers, each assigned to one field office to support both projects. This approach will also promote synergy between the two United States Government funded projects.

The key **challenge** faced under this intermediate result is inadequate supervision of public works by the Kebele supervision task forces. This was further compounded by the limited number of CARE Community Facilitators (CF) to effectively backup the taskforce members and government Development Agents. The Development Agents have also been stretched this year, with additional duties to prepare communities for the upcoming elections. This has significantly increased the CARE CF's workload and undermined the implementation efforts. For instance, in East Haraghe, there are cases of one CF covering 12 kebeles. We are **addressing this challenge** by planning to increase the number of Community Facilitators and strengthening the asset management committees to support the supervision task forces.

### ***IR 1.3. Effective and timely community preparation, mitigation and response to shocks and emergencies***

HIBRET II strengthened the capacities of 128 Kebeles to appropriately and timely prepare, mitigate and respond to shocks and emergencies. All the 128 Kebeles have the Early Warning System (EWS) in place, which exceeds our FY09 target of 84 Kebeles. This was accomplished by establishing 117 EWS, training 138 (114 males/24 females) Community Based EW facilitators and selecting 37 sentinel sites. The EW facilitators

were given a three-day training by the CARE JEOP emergency team and are now collecting information on variables such as crop status, crop market prices, livestock diseases and rainfall. They provide the information to the Woredas Early Warning office and CARE fortnightly, as well as immediately alert both offices about potential emergencies. One trained Community Based EW Facilitator in Grawa, East Haraghe, immediately reported to the Woreda about the death of livestock in his community due to a disease outbreak. The information was sent to the Disaster Prevention Preparedness (DPP) unit, which dispatched a team to immediately vaccinate the other animals in the villages. Additional results achieved include:

- A total of 50,537 persons (24,097 males and 26,440 females) received 2,572 MT of food commodities based on the information from the EWS to the region, which requested CARE to provide the 20% contingency. The number exceeds the planned 27,934 due to the request for additional resources by the region to respond to emergencies in Grawa and Doba. It is reported that 83% of the food transfers were made on time, which is 15% below our FY09 target. Delays in food transfers were usually caused by delays in the request for transfers by the Regional offices and sometimes by the subsequent discussions between CARE and the Zonal/Regional offices during the approval of the requested contingency figures (this process also involves the USAID approval). This is the case in Kurfar Chelle, where a lengthy approval process between CARE and the Woreda/Zonal offices delayed the transfers, while a speedy approval was made for Doba, West Haraghe. We are addressing this challenge by ensuring that such critical matters are addressed during the weekly/ fortnightly meetings with the FSTF and EW officers, and by sensitizing the Zonal officials about the information required to approve the contingency request.

#### ***1.R 1.4 Capacity of key government departments enhanced to implement PSNP***

Enhanced capacities, especially at the Kebele, Woreda and Zonal level are demonstrated by: i) increased utilization of M&E plans by Woreda staff; ii) improved technical competency of Kebele technical supervision teams; iii) improved planning of PSNP activities, especially at the Kebele level; iv) enhanced ability of Development Agents to learn and scale-up best practices; and v) enhanced collaboration between CARE and the Woreda/Zonal/Regional food security officials through the monthly Woreda and quarterly Zonal and Regional coordination meetings. This is coupled with the strengthening of working relationships between the Woreda FSTF and Regional Disaster Prevention and Preparedness Agency (DPPA) to utilize early warning information by involving them in the establishment of the systems and subsequent planning efforts. As such, the following results have been achieved:

- **100% of the HIBRET Woredas have functional monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems, which is on target.** A total of 42 Woreda staff (2 females) have been provided with on-site and formal training in monitoring techniques, report preparation, project cycle management, M&E plan development and implementation. As a result, they have participated in panel monitoring exercises in the Woreda, provided required information for the project as well as developed M&E plans.
- **85% of the Kebeles prepared and implemented development plans with quality safety net plans – this achievement is 15% below our target.** The target is unmet because the capacity building process has been slow, but sure. For instance, building

M&E capacity has involved extensive interactions with the respective government officials, which were not initially anticipated during the planning process. Key results achieved to date include:

- Joint implementation plan development, review and implementation. In May 2009, about 25 government and CARE staff (2 females) attended a review meeting, where progress was assessed, key strategies identified to achieve expected results and action plans developed. This activity also provided the East and West Haraghe teams to meet and share experiences. For instance, the aforementioned challenge with shared Field Office staff;
- Weekly interactions by the CARE Woreda Team Leaders with their Woreda Food Security Task Force and Food Security counterparts to plan and implement all project activities. Similar coordination efforts are employed at the Kebele level, through coordination with the Kebele and Community Food Security Task Forces. The aforementioned teams jointly address challenges and make key decisions. For instance, in both East and West Haraghe, the teams worked together in September 2009 to prepare for the Risk Financing initiative planned for September and October 2009. Based on lessons learned from the cash/food mix process, the CARE field team provided timely feedback to the Addis team about the limited flow of information to their government counterparts. Based on that, the CARE Commodity Manager and PSNP Chief of Party visited the Oromia Regional Food Security Coordinator, who immediately addressed the challenge and facilitated preparations for the Risk Financing cash/food transfers;
- Increased joint field supervision trips to provide oversight and technical support to the Community Facilitators and government Development Agents e.g. implementation of public works activities; and
- Inclusion of Woreda and Zonal government officials in all project planning and execution efforts as described in previous sections.

#### **SO4: Increased agricultural production and productivity**

*HIBRET II is still serving the most vulnerable households, with only 4.4% of the annual survey respondents indicating that they have achieved food self-provisioning for 12 months<sup>5</sup>.* Additional survey results indicate:

- **19% increase in average household agricultural production, which is lower than the 50% target<sup>6</sup>.** The target was not met due to late planting by some farmers, erratic rainfall experienced in both operational Zones along with the drought and poor Belg rains. The rains in some areas ceased too early, leading to crop failure. The economic crisis also contributed to farmers not accessing adequate improved seeds and other farm inputs for cultivation. Drought was indicated by over three-quarters (77%) of the annual survey respondents as the main reason for their food shortages.
- **17% of respondent households planting improved seeds, which is lower than the 30% set target.** The economic crisis noted above contributed to this challenge

---

<sup>5</sup> Year 2 and 3 targets for this indicator were revised downwards in the IPTT because they were too ambitious, with year 1 at 30% and LOA at 75%.

<sup>6</sup> Year 2 and 3 targets were revised downwards, because they were too ambitious at 80% year 2 and 90% in year 3.

along with the inadequate access to the improved seeds within close vicinity to the farmers. The project is addressing this challenge by using seed revolving schemes that were successful in HIBRET I and are sometimes combined with the VS&L groups. HIBRET also sourced haricot seeds from the Melkasa Research Center (e.g. Argane, Chore, and Batu.) The project provided 15.6MT of assorted seed (maize, haricot beans and vegetables to 2,152 farmers (1,352 males/800 females).

• **Close to half (49%) of the respondent households adopted three or more improved techniques** (see box on the right). This achievement surpassed the set target of 30%<sup>7</sup>, due to the practical on-site introduction of a wide selection of improved techniques.

The Farmer Training Centers were effectively utilized to demonstrate some of the techniques to individual and farmers groups. Key topics included: i) establishing and maintaining nursery beds; ii) seedling transplantation; iii) appropriate spacing and planting; (iv) SWC e.g. mulching, planting vetiver, and shedding; and iv) appropriate water management techniques. The CARE CF and government DA complemented this strategy with house-to-house outreach.

• **Over two-thirds (67%) of respondent households actively participate in functional markets, exceeding the set target of 10%**<sup>8</sup>. This achievement is due to the effective collaboration between HIBRET and PSNP-Plus. The latter project has established market nodes and trained both farmers along with staff in key marketing areas such as value chain addition.

<u>Improved Technologies Promoted</u>	
1.	Use of improved seed
2.	Use compost manure
3.	Use of energy saving stoves
4.	Use of improved storage facilities
5.	Intercropping
6.	Reforestation
7.	Integrated farming
8.	Integrated pest-management
9.	Soil and water conservation
10.	Modern honey production
11.	Water harvesting
12.	Irrigation

***IR 4.1: Increased agricultural productivity and diversified agricultural production***

HIBRET farmers are diversifying their crop production and steadily adopting promoted techniques as demonstrated by the results below:

- **The project introduced eleven (11) new crop varieties, exceeding the set target of 9.** New varieties include (the three mentioned above from Melkasa) and other haricot beans varieties such as Awash 1 and Awash Melkasa, two maize, two sorghum, and vegetables (onion and tomatoes). A key challenge faced in the trials was in maintaining the desired quality standards and producing to meet the demand. This was addressed by the CFs providing additional technical support to the trained groups as well as encouraging other farmers to visit high performing model farmers.
- **39% of trained farmers interviewed in the annual survey reported cultivating high value crops such as haricot beans and off-season vegetables, surpassing our set target of 15%.**
- **A total of 57 farmer seed producing groups were linked with seed suppliers. This translates to 95% achievement of the set target.**

<sup>7</sup> Year 2 and 3 targets have been revised upwards in the IPTT to 65% and 85%, from 50% and 75% respectively, due to the overachievement in year 1.

<sup>8</sup> Year 2 and 3 targets revised upwards in the IPTT to 75% and 85% due to year 1 over achievement.

The above performance is due to the use of effective skills transfer approaches such as the Farmer Training Centers coupled with the selection of appropriate model farmers, who further transferred their acquired skills to family members and neighbors. Another contributing factor was the formation of 135 seed producing groups (comprised of 2,374 members – 909 females), who tested the introduced crop varieties and have started supplying seeds to their communities and local traders. Eighty-seven (87%) of the 2,374 farmers established home gardens, after their training to increase seed production. Additionally, 57 of the seed groups were linked to seed suppliers (i.e. for sorghum, maize, and haricot beans). For example, a group from West Haraghe, received training from the Awash Melkasa Research Center. The training included practical exercises on value addition e.g. grading of seed after harvesting, conducting germination tests, and post-harvest pest management. Another group from East Haraghe visited the Haramaya University and was linked to the Haramaya Union, a local seed supplier.

However, the groups were challenged by the limited supply of quality seeds, which undermined their achievements. It is anticipated that the linkages facilitated by the project with the research institutions, will gradually address this challenge.

- The project also trained 22,408 farmers (10,559 females/11,849 males) in improved farming technologies, which is below the set target of 100,000. This included training in compost manure, improved storage, post harvest handling, soil and water conservation measures and other techniques noted above. The target is unmet because it was too ambitious. During implementation we learnt that farmer group formation takes longer than planned, especially due to the importance of selecting members who can effectively transfer skills to their neighbors. Based on this lesson, we placed emphasis on the key steps of awareness creation and selection of the appropriate group members. The latter is critical due to the rigorous standards required to produce quality seed. Farmers also expressed a desire to have smaller groups, in order to maintain the necessary cohesion and trust amongst the members. As such, the overall number of farmers was reduced<sup>9</sup>.

#### ***IR 4.2. Enhanced Capacity of Communities to Effectively Manage and use Natural Resources in a Sustainable Manner***

HIBRET II communities are steadily demonstrating an increased capacity to manage, utilize and sustain natural resources as demonstrated in the previous sections e.g. 425HA of land conserved through the establishment and management of soil and water conservation (SWC) measures. The following results have been achieved:

- ***298 landless households (organized into 21 groups with 178 females/424males) are accessing 303HA*** of improved land for productive activities (e.g. farming, beekeeping and harvesting grass), surpassing the set target of 143 households. This target was surpassed due to the commitment of the landless groups, which have established their by-laws, started planting trees, keeping bees, engaging income generating activities through their VS&L groups and reclaiming the land through enclosures. The 7.5 HA certification of one group in Grawa East Haraghe

---

<sup>9</sup> We have also reduced the year 2 and 3 IPTT targets based on the discussed realities.

has encouraged other groups along with the Community Facilitators and Development Agents. However, the certification process is a lengthy and tedious process, as demonstrated by the current delay in obtaining certification for other groups who have completed the required bureaucratic steps. HIBRET has established contact with the USAID funded Ethiopia – Strengthening Land Tenure and Administration Program (ELTAP), which is providing certificates to farmers in Oromia Regional state.

- **105 (36 females/69males) landless farmers trained in Natural Resource Management (NRM), which is below the 612 set target.** This target is unmet because the group formation process took longer than anticipated, due to the scattered nature of the targeted individuals (who often reside in different villages). This was further complicated by the difficulty in securing land, which is in limited supply. However, the government counterparts were instrumental in supporting the groups, through various discussions with community leaders and land owners.
- **535 female farmers using energy saving stoves, surpassing the set target of 387.** The target was surpassed due to effective awareness creation and practical training, which combined this topic with post harvest handling techniques such as improved storage by the CARE Health and Nutrition Animators. Using the Animators further contributed to the success, because they are known and trusted in their communities and have identified proven strategies overtime.
- **46 plans developed to link honey bee, fodder and fruit enterprises with reclaimed land, which is below the set target of 100.** The target is unmet due to challenges encountered, for instance, in obtaining bee colonies, which were scarce. The project addressed this challenge by coordinating with PSNP-Plus to establish joint colonies as well as source them from other Woredas. The supply of fruit seedling was also inadequate and the project has enlisted the support of the Woreda forestry personnel to obtain appropriate seedlings – it is important to replant indigenous trees.

#### **IR 4.3. Improved Agricultural Marketing Extension System**

HIBRET farmers are increasingly market savvy, especially in Doba and Kurfa Challe woredas, where the project overlaps with PSNP-Plus. Farmers have utilized some of the PSNP-Plus market nodes to obtain information about crop prices and availability. Some key results achieved include:

- **Over two-thirds (67%) of farmers interviewed during the annual survey indicated that they used market information systems, while close to half (46%) indicated that they are linked to market nodes.** Both achievements surpassed the set targets, due to effective learning and integration of the project with PSNP-Plus.
- **67 marketing groups were established, which is below the set target of 72<sup>10</sup>.** This activity took longer than anticipated due to some of the issues discussed earlier e.g. difficulty in identifying appropriate farmers, who are committed. Additionally, the anticipated low agricultural yields also contributed to farmers' reluctance to market their harvest – they preferred to keep it for household consumption. It is noteworthy that the Market-led Livelihoods for Vulnerable Populations (MLVP) manual

---

<sup>10</sup> The year 2 and 3 targets for this indicator have been revised downwards because they were ambitious.

developed in HIBRET I was shared with the Development Agents and utilized with the groups.

- **5 traders were using the market information system, which is below the set target of 10.** The target is unmet due to the difficulties experienced in establishing the market nodes, which would attract more traders and farmers. Identifying both suitable locations and market node operators has been a challenge. Usually, the operators selected were not committed and abandoned the exercises mid-way or were ineffective. The project has addressed this challenge by making the selection criteria more flexible e.g. a farmer does not have to own a shop in order to qualify as an operator. Owning a phone, along with the demonstrated willingness and ability to obtain and share market information with other farmers in the community at one's home are acceptable criteria. The Doba project team recently identified a viable operator, using this criterion.

#### **IR 4.4. Institutional linkages and enabling environment created to implement NRM, farming and land-use policies**

CARE, as a member of the Ethiopia Development Assistance Consortium (EDAC) has been instrumental, at various levels (woreda, Zonal, Regional and national), in facilitating coordination of NRM interventions. This has involved the representation of other EDAC members in the quarterly Joint Coordination Committee meetings, where donors, government and NGOs, discuss and plan various food security policy issues. For instance, the current efforts to graduate PSNP beneficiaries - CARE has shared its experience and lessons learnt to date. Field based project staff also coordinate monthly and quarterly at the Woreda and Zonal levels with government and other NGOs to address key issues- such as the formulation of buy-laws for the landless to use rehabilitated land. Results achieved include:

- **55% of action plans implemented to improve the capacity of actors engaged in NRM and agricultural production, falling short of set target of 100%.** This target was unmet due to the longer than anticipated participatory approaches employed to plan and implement the associated activities. CARE's project staff consistently and systematically involved their woreda counterparts as well as the community members, who were empowered to make key decisions such as (selecting the priority public works activities);
- **One (1) group linked to microfinance institution, which is below the set target of 25.** This target is unmet because CARE's assumption at the project development phase that the microfinance institutions (MFIs) will become established and serve CBOs and communities did not hold true. Most MFI's are reluctant to lend to groups that they deem risky. The project has addressed this challenge by working closely with the PSNP-Plus project in Doba and Kurfa Chele to identify viable options.
- CARE and Save UK are the two NGOs currently representing the Ethiopian NGOs in formulating the National Social Protection Platform. Activities are preliminary, but CARE has engaged in drafting the Platform Terms of Reference (TOR), work plan and planning a workshop in September 2009 to share the TOR with civil society, government representatives. The platform members also plan to revise the Developmental Social Welfare Policy along with IGAD, framing it within the broader social protection context.

### **General Overall Challenges:**

- ***Inadequate staffing: The number of Community Facilitators*** is insufficient to effectively oversee project activities at the Kebele level. This was compounded by the limited time the Development Agents allocated to HIBRET activities, due to other government priorities. As such, the quality and timeliness of project activities was sometimes compromised, especially under SO4. The project will address this challenge by increasing the number of CFs as appropriate as well as other positions within the project, in order to improve performance (e.g. ensure adequate oversight, quality information management and technical support provision).
- ***Graduation:*** 2,194 households were graduated by the government during the reporting period. The challenges faced with this process include, inadequate inclusion of HIBRET staff in the planning and implementation process (e.g. lists of the graduated households were not shared with CARE), unclear beneficiary selection process and criteria, along with insufficient preparation for beneficiaries to sustain their gains.
- ***Targeting/Retargeting issues:*** beneficiary selection for PSNP is conducted by woreda and kebele officials, which is a challenge for CARE as an implementer. Another challenge is that some targeted beneficiaries reported smaller family sizes in order to allow for other needy households to be targeted by the project. This is a consistent challenge. However, its magnitude has reduced over time. We have addressed the challenge through extended sensitization meetings with beneficiaries, and government officials.
- ***Management of the Capital/Admin budget*** by the woreda has sometimes been a challenge as they want to undertake unapproved or unplanned activities and even purchase unfunded items. The project staff has handled this issue by conducting joint planning meetings where all the approved project plans are discussed and action plans developed. This has facilitated understanding on both sides and identification of strategies to support the Woreda staff to undertake priority activities.
- ***Value Added Tax (VAT) experience:*** delayed approval of exemption vouchers by USAID. It was normal for the price to change, and for us to obtain a number of quotes and submit more than one voucher for the same item, while awaiting the approval. This delayed the implementation of project activities. Sometimes, the purchase price changed or the item went out of stock, before obtaining the approval. We welcome the new system, it expedites the procurement process.

### **Other issues:**

**Monetization:** HIBRET II did not monetize commodities in FY09, but used proceeds from HIBRET I. Hence, we have only completed the LOA analysis table.

## 2. Success Stories

### Community Builds a Sustainable Water Resource

Before 2008, the community of Wadema Village, Burka-Jeneta Kebele, Grawa Woreda, East Hararghe Zone, Ethiopia, did not have access to clean water. In this Kebele, comprised of 60 households, women and girls trekked three hours daily to fetch water from unprotected sources. Community members suffered from various ailments associated with drinking unsafe water. CARE's Productive Safety Net Project, HIBRET II, constructed a water point from which the community currently accesses clean portable water in just 10 minutes.



*Left: Mohammed Mussa and Safiya Beyan, the rest are community members collecting water. Wadma village, taken by: Bena Musembi, April 2009*

Women and girls now have the opportunity to increase their engagement in other productive activities such as farming, small scale enterprises and schooling. In addition, incidences of water-induced illnesses such as diarrhea have decreased. According to the government Health Extension Worker at the Burka-Jeneta Kebele health post, on average about 10 to 12 diarrhea and other water induced cases were handled monthly at the facility prior to the construction of the water point. However, she said, *“at this time, the number of diarrhea and other water induced cases coming to the health post are not more than one per month and even, there are usually no cases.”*

The water point is managed by a community asset management committee, comprised of six members (two females), which was established and trained by HIBRET II in collaboration with the government Development Agents. The committee is mandated to ensure the sustainability of community assets within Burka-Jeneta Kebele. The government Water Resource Office has trained two community members, Mohammed Mussa and Safiya Beyan, to operate and maintain the water point. The committee has established a mechanism for Mohammed and Safiya to collect user-fees from people fetching water from the point. They charge Birr 0.10cents (less than \$0.25) for a 25 liter plastic container and the funds are given to the management committee, which avails them, upon request, to purchase spare parts and undertake other repairs. In addition, the local government regularly provides technical support to Mohammed, the trained technician, and the other management committee members. Community members collecting water, when the photo was taken, indicated that the pump is regularly maintained. To date, the management committee has saved Birr 404 (\$32.32) from the sale of water – the amount excludes funds utilized to purchase spare parts for maintenance.

## A Boost in Honey Production



Adem Abdela with his modern beehive, in Jirugemechu village. Taken by: Bena Musembi, April 2009

Adem Abdulla Wariyo is a 60-year-old beekeeper, living in Mumed Village, Jiru-Gemechu Kebele, Grawa Woreda, East Hararghe Zone, Ethiopia. In June 2009, he graduated from CARE's Productive Safety Net Project, entitled HIBRET II (Household Income Building and Rural Empowerment for Transition). His graduation was greatly facilitated by his enhanced ability to produce increased quantities of high quality honey. For about ten years, prior to his participation in HIBRET II, he had relied on rudimental beekeeping technologies such as traditional beehives and harvesting practices to produce honey for the local market and household consumption. He harvested honey once a year from each of his two traditional beehives, producing 5 kilograms per hive and earning 20 Birr (US\$1.6) per kilogram.

In 2008, Adem witnessed the benefits of modern technology. He received a modern beehive and honey harvesting equipment along with an on-site training in improved honey production techniques from CARE project staff and the government Development Agents. Since then, life has not been the same for Adem; he has employed his acquired skills to substantially overhaul his business by almost quadrupling his production to 17 kilograms per beehive and doubling his earnings to 40 Birr per kilogram of honey - *he is now harvesting four times a year from his one modern beehive*. Today, he also produces high quality honey since he adopted the hygiene and sanitation practices that he learned at the training provided by the project (e.g. using the modern honey extractor instead of handling the honey with bare hands or unhygienic items.) He also spends less time on pest management, due to the improved design of the modern beehive.

To date, he has bought one calf with Birr 500 (US\$40) he obtained from the sale of honey harvested last year. Currently, he and other farmers in his group have saved Birr 2,000 (US\$160) to purchase a honey extractor. Adem acknowledges that modern technology has revolutionarised his business, which is now so successful that he is unable to meet the current demand. He says, ***“My eyes are now open!”***

## A New Lease on Life

Fatuma Aliyi is a 40-year old widow, from Doba Woreda, West Haraghe Zone, Ethiopia, with five children. Before her participation in CARE's Productive Safety Net Program (PSNP), Fatuma's household was food secure for only 3 months in a year and she supplemented her subsistence farming by selling firewood in Hirna town, earning Birr 5 (US \$0.4 cents) per day. In her words, *“my house was empty, so my life was just suspended between life and death.”*

Accordingly, she was targeted by CARE's PSNP project, HIBRET, to participate in food-for-work activities, allowing her to receive six months food rations for her household, while contributing to the creation of community assets. She also received Birr 1,500 (US\$ 120) from the World Bank to purchase a heifer and obtained another heifer from CARE's Orphans and Vulnerable Children's Project. Fatuma received trainings in natural resource management, financial literacy for Village Savings and Loans (VS&L), as well as in environmental and personal sanitation.



*Fatuma Aliyi, with two of her heifers. Doba Woreda, Taken by Bena Musembi, April 2009*

Today, Fatuma's life has been transformed! She has increased her income and assets, diversified her livelihoods, and her household is more food secure. She joined a VS&L group, which initially did not allow her to borrow funds, because the other members had no confidence in her ability to repay her loan. But she gradually proved herself, by utilizing her training in financial literacy to provide cashier services to her group and started saving Birr 3 (US\$ 0.24 cents) fortnightly. To date, she has saved more than Birr 288 (US \$25) and has taken out eight loans, ranging from Birr 50 to 100 (US\$ 4 to 8) for petty trading of salt, sugar and other fast moving items. She is also able to nutritiously feed her family and send her children to school. She has also accumulated valuable assets that include two heifers with one calf, one goat with one kid and three hens. Fatuma also has time to cultivate coffee on her land.

## **2. Lessons Learned**

HIBRET has utilized the following lessons learnt to improve project performance:

***Timely food transfers significantly contribute to protecting against the depletion of the most vulnerable households' assets.***

***Linking honey production with area enclosure is a viable natural resource management strategy that is also favorable to communities:*** the enclosures are suitable locations for the bee hives as well as the multiplication of bee colonies, because they are protected from livestock and people.

***Targeting landless and jobless youth for land reclamation is effective in directing their efforts into productive activities:*** the targeted youth have demonstrated creativity and commitment in undertaking this activity e.g. a group in East Haraghe constructed a public toilet, which customers pay to use while receiving hygiene and sanitation messages.

***Provision of land certification for the landless serves a dual purpose, by providing access to land and strengthening solidarity amongst the landless to withstand challenges.***

***Market node operators should be trustworthy in order for farmers to have confidence in the information that they provide:*** as such, the project facilitates a process, whereby the community members select the market node operator.

***Effective exit strategies commence at program inception:*** The establishment of asset management committees to oversee the operation and maintenance of community assets developed by PSNP and other interventions, will ensure lasting impacts.

***Beneficiaries prefer food to cash transfers*** due to the global food crisis, high inflation as well as lack of adequate food supplies in the local markets.

***The cash/food transfer initiative requires thorough prior planning*** (e.g. extensive beneficiary awareness/consensus building process) and effective coordination of limited resources. It is also necessary to simultaneously engage the government at all levels i.e. Kebele, Woreda, Zonal, Regional and Federal.

***It is more sustainable and effective to build our beneficiaries' capacities to select appropriate business and manage them.***

***Community Action Planning (CAP) is an effective sustainability strategy:*** project staff and their government counterparts took a backseat and guided the targeted communities to identify, prioritize, plan and implement their public works activities, as well as institute mechanisms of sustaining the assets on their own. This approach fostered community ownership, as the participating community members set their targets, agreed on modalities of monitoring and assessing progress as well as their roles and responsibilities.

***Some farmers prefer to work in small groups in order to build team cohesion and trust. Inclusion of all members in the development of group by-laws guarantees ownership and success.***

***VS&L are engines of economic growth and provide effective cushioning during hard times:*** CARE has employed VS&L's as a means to an end, by facilitating the formation of groups to enhance other project activities. For instance, supporting a marketing group to become a VS&L or vice versa, in order to inject a regular supply of funds.

#### **4. Attachments:**

The following documents are attached:

- A. Indicator Performance Tracking Table
- B. Detailed Implementation Plan
- C. Standardized Annual Performance Questionnaire
- D. Tracking Table for Beneficiaries and Resources
- E. Expenditure Report
- F. Monetization Tables
- H. Supplemental Materials (Cost Benefit Analysis)
- I. Completeness Checklist