



COMPASS ASSESSMENT: 2002

**DOCUMENT 44
AUGUST 2002**



Community
Partnerships for
Sustainable
Resource
Management in
Malawi

COMPASS Assessment: 2002

Prepared by Consultants:

Eston Sambo (Team Leader)
Stephen Carr
David Omambia
Terry Moore

Development Alternatives, Inc.
7250 Woodmont Ave., Suite 200
Bethesda, MD 20814
USA

Tel: 301-718-8699
Fax: 301-718-7968
e-mail: dai@dai.com

In association with:

Development Management Associates
Lilongwe

COMPASS
Phekani House
Glyn Jones Road
Private Bag 263
Blantyre
Malawi

Telephone & Fax: 622-800
Internet: <http://www.COMPASS-Malawi.com>

USAID Contract: 690-C-00-99-00116-00
Activity: 612-0248

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The evaluation team would like to express their appreciation of the open and frank discussions they were able to have with all parties. In particular, the team would like to thank various Government Agencies, NGOs, Donor Agencies, partners and clients, the grantees of the COMPASS Small Grants programme, the communities visited, and the staff of COMPASS for providing lengthy and varied information.

The support given by the Dr. Andrew Watson, COMPASS Chief of Party, is appreciated. The team wishes to thank the COMPASS Team representing DAI and DMA and USAID for funding the evaluation through the COMPASS Activity.

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

AEECP	Advocacy, Environmental Education and Communication Programme
AIDS	Acquired Immunity Deficiency Syndrome
APSAM	Association for the Promotion of Sustainable Agriculture in Malawi
ASUFORE	Advocacy on Sustainable Use and Management of Forest Reserves
ATF	Advocacy Task Force
BERDO	Bwanje Valley Rural Development Organisation
BLM	Banja La Mtsogolo
BVC	Beach Village Committee
CABUNGO	Capacity Building Unit for Non-Governmental Organisations
CARD	Church Action in Relief and Development
CARER	Centre for Advice, Research and Education on Rights
CBNRM	Community Based Natural Resources Management
CBO	Community Based Organisation
CCJP	Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace
CEA	Cost Effectiveness Analysis
COMPASS	Community Partnerships for Sustainable Resource Management
CRECCOM	Creative Centre for Community Mobilisation
CSC	Christian Service Committee
CURE	Co-ordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment
DAI	Development Alternatives, Incorporated
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DMA	Development Management Associates
DNPW	Department of National Parks and Wildlife
EAD	Environmental Affairs Department
EDETA	Enterprise Development Training Agency
EDO	Environmental District Officer
ELDP	Evangelical Lutheran Development Programme
EOI	Expression of Interest
EPA	Extension Planning Area
FD	Forestry Department
GAM	Gender Analysis Matrix
GIS	Geographical Information Systems
GTZ	Gesellschaft fur Technische Zusammenarbeit (German Technical Aid)
HIV	Human Immuno-deficiency Virus
IEF	International Eye Foundation
INTRAC	International NGO Training and Research Centre
ITG	Imperial Tobacco Group
LOMADEF	Lipangwe Organic Manure Demonstration Farm
MP	Member of Parliament
MAFE	Malawi Agroforestry Extension Project
MANA	Malawi News Agency
MANASO	Malawi Network of Aids Services Organisation
MHC	Malawi Housing Corporation
MK	Malawi Kwacha
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NICE	National Initiative for Civic Education
NRM	Natural Resources Management
NSO	National Statistical Office

NYCOM	National Youth Council of Malawi
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
RDP	Rural Development Project
RTC	Rural Training Centre
SAGA	Southern African Grantmaking Association
SO	Strategic Objective
SR	Sub-Result
TA	Traditional Authority
TAMIS	Technical and Administrative Management Information System
TOR	Terms of Reference
TR	Targeted Result
TVM	Television Malawi
USAID	United States Aid for International Development
VFA	Village Forest Area
VNRC	Village Natural Resources Committee
VNRMC	Village Natural Resources Management Committee
WILSA	Women and Law in Southern Africa
WESM	Wildlife and Environmental Society of Malawi
WVI	World Vision International

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Acknowledgements	i
List of Acronyms and Abbreviations	ii
Table of Contents	iv
Executive Summary	1
Introduction	1
The Evaluation Mission	1
Mission’s Findings and Recommendations	1
Institutional Issues and Training	2
Efficient Liaison, Communication and Information Exchange	5
The Small Grants Program	7
Gender Issues	9
Financial Issues	13
SECTION I	15
A. BACKGROUND	15
1. Introduction	15
2. Terms of Reference	17
B. METHODOLOGY	20
SECTION II: FINDINGS	22
C. INSTITUTIONAL ISSUES AND TRAINING	22
1. Overarching Goals	22
2. TR1: Effective CBNRM Administration and Technical Services Capacity Established	24
2.1 <i>SR1A: CBNRM Co-ordinating Body and Secretariat Created</i>	24
2.2 <i>SR1B: Relationship Among CBNRM Programmes Established</i>	24
2.3 <i>SR1C: National CBNRM Strategic Planning Process Developed</i>	25
3. TR3: Community Mobilisation Skills Within Government/NGOs/Community Groups Improved	25
3.1 <i>SR3A: CBNRM Training Programme Designed for all Interested Partners</i>	26
3.2 <i>SR3B: Training Delivered</i>	27
3.2 <i>SR3C: CBNRM Best Practices Identified</i>	27
3.2 <i>SR3D: National and Regional CBNRM Exchange Programme Developed</i>	27
4. TR4: Process of Policy and Legislative Reform in Favour of CBNRM Supported	29
4.1 <i>SR4A: Mechanisms for Participation in the Development of CBNRM Guiding Principles Created</i>	29
4.2 <i>SR4B: Capacity to Evaluate and Revise Existing Policies Strengthened</i>	30
5. Major Findings and Discussion	31
5.1 <i>Assessing Overall Impact</i>	31
5.2 <i>Suggested Broad Thrust for the Future of Capacity Building, Training and Policy Reform</i>	31
6. Conclusion	33
7. Recommendations	33
7.1 <i>Capacity Building</i>	33
7.2 <i>Training</i>	34

	7.3 Policy Reform	34
D.	EFFICIENT LIAISON, COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION EXCHANGE	35
1.	TR2: Efficient Liaison/Communication/Information Exchange Mechanisms Between/Among CBNRM Programmes Established	35
	1.1 Assessing Overall Impact	35
	1.2 SR2A: CBNRM Computer Information Network Designed	35
	1.3 SR2B: Public Awareness Campaigns Launched	36
	1.4 SR2C: Relationship among CBNRM Programmes Strengthened	38
E.	THE SMALL GRANTS PROGRAMME	39
1.	TR5: CBNRM Small Grant Management Services to Finance Special CBNRM Opportunities Established	39
	1.1 Grant Application Criteria	39
	1.2 Overall Impact	40
	1.3 SB5A. Manual of Grant Application and Management Procedures Developed.	41
	1.4 SB5B. Clear Selection Criteria for Awards Established	42
	1.5 SB5C. Technical Assistance Provided to Applicants and Recipients	42
2.	Lessons Learned and Recommendations	42
F.	GENDER ISSUES	51
1.	Sampling	51
2.	TR 1. Effective CBNRM Administrative and Technical Services Capacity Established	51
	2.1 Membership of CBNRM Working Group	52
	2.2 Progress Made	52
	2.3 Gender Gaps in the CBNRM Activities	53
	2.4 Conclusion and recommendations	53
3.	TR4. Process of Policy and Legislative Reform in Favour of CBNRM Supported	55
	3.1 Rationale for supporting policy reform	55
	3.2 Progress made	55
	3.3 Membership of Advocacy Task Force	56
	3.4 Gender issues	56
	3.5 Conclusions and recommendations	56
4.	TR5. Support for Small Grants Program for CBNRM Initiatives	57
	4.1 Grant Application Criteria	57
	4.2 Progress Made	57
	4.3 CBNRM group membership by gender	57
	4.4 CBNRM Group Skills Training	58
	4.5 Gender participation in CBNRM activities (Gender analysis)	59
	4.6 Impact of project activities	60
	4.7 Conclusions and Recommendations	61
5.	TR3. Community Mobilization Skills Within Government/ NGOs/ Community Groups Improved	62
	5.1 Objectives	63
	5.2 Process of Identification of Training Needs	63
	5.3 Progress made	64
	5.4 Conclusions and Recommendations	65
6.	Lessons Learned	66

G. FINANCIAL ISSUES	68
1. Sampling	68
2. The Malawi Context	68
3. Management of Allocated Project Funds	68
4. Recommendations	68
5. Training of Project Members	69
6. The Grant Manual	69
7. Programme Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats	69
8. Cost Effective Analysis	70
9. Observations	70
ANNEX 1: List of Documents Reviewed	73
ANNEX 2: Division of Labour	75
Table 1. Activity Profile: Division of Labour at Household and Community	75
Table 2. Bwanje Afforestation Project: Division of Labour in Project Activities in Bwanje	76
ANNEX 3: Access and Control Profile	77
Table 3. Bwanje Afforestation Project: Access and Control Profile of Resources and Benefits	77
ANNEX 4: Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM)	78
Table 4. Impact of The Project on Men and Women in Bwanje Afforestation and Environmental Project	78
ANNEX 5	79
Table 5a. Institutional Issues: Persons Met	79
Table 5b. Small Grants Programme: List of People Met	80
Table 5c. Gender Issues: List of Projects Visited	83
Table 5d. Financial Issues: Projects visited	85
ANNEX 6	86
Table 6. COMPASS Small Grants	86
ANNEX 7: Evaluation of COMPASS Small Grants Performance (1999 – 2001)	91
Table 7: Categories of Project Grants Awarded by COMPASS	91
ANNEX 8: COMPASS Publications	113

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. INTRODUCTION

An evaluation of the performance of the Community Partnerships for Sustainable Resource Management (COMPASS) was made for the period February 1999 to December 2001. The Activity is designed to run for 60 months from February 1999 to February 2004. At this time, about half way after the start of the Activity, it is appropriate to undertake an assessment of the performance of the implementation team and evaluate the overall impact that COMPASS has had on CBNRM in Malawi. This assessment was undertaken as an independent evaluation in lieu of a true mid-term evaluation.

COMPASS' main objective is to promote sustainable use of natural resources. The COMPASS Activity is designed to finance and test innovative community-based natural resources management models that are replicable. COMPASS works in five thematic areas that are defined as Targeted Results (TR) to achieve predetermined goals. Each TR has a set of Sub-Results (SR) and for each SR a set of tasks and/or actions that have been identified and will be implemented to achieve the SR and the overall TR.

2. THE EVALUATION MISSION

The evaluation mission consisted of a team of four professionals who carried out in-depth interviews with grantees, partners, key informants, service providers and donors, reviewed documents, undertook field visits to grantee projects to make observations, and examined financial records. COMPASS performance was evaluated with regard to TRs 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 and with regard to gender issues across all aspects of the Activity, as well as assessing financial performance.

The objectives of the evaluation were:

1. To evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of the COMPASS small-grants initiative and information-support activities and gather additional information that will facilitate capturing of lessons from the CBNRM initiatives.
2. To assist the COMPASS Team identify possible improvements to the small-grants program especially with respect to building the organisational and technical skills of grantees; their financial management capabilities; and the impact of the initiatives on gender equity in the communities involved.
3. To assist the COMPASS Team identify possible improvements to the information-support activities especially with respect to building the organisational and technical skills of partner organisations.

3. MISSION'S FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The mission examined COMPASS achievements with regard to the set targets over the period in question.

3.1 Institutional Issues and Training

COMPASS' work to date has helped to build an increased body of knowledge about the challenges facing CBNRM in Malawi through the production of a range of new publications. It has fostered government and NGO activities to provide a more favourable environment for community based initiatives. It has identified and funded training programmes for staff and communities that have largely been appreciated by the participants. There remain attitudes at all levels of Malawian society which are inimical to CBNRM and it is these which go a long way to explain the shortage of successful examples of communities taking the lead in improving the quality of management of their environment. COMPASS would provide a valuable service by more clearly identifying those attitudes which are currently preventing good policies being translated into tangible action, and then developing appropriate strategies to change that situation.

Recommendations

3.1.1 *TR1: Effective CBNRM Administration and Technical Services Capacity Established*

The CBNRM Working Group was established in March 2000 and has met regularly since then. One of the objectives of the Working Group was to develop a Strategic Plan for implementing CBNRM in Malawi. The Plan has been developed and approved. At the same time it was intended that during 2001 the Strategic Plan would be implemented. It will in fact be some time before it is possible to assess whether the players involved will actually implement the strategies to which they have agreed. The following are recommendations on capacity building efforts:

- (1) Use the CBNRM Working Group meetings to identify and discuss attitudes, reservations and professional concerns inhibiting the implementation of co-management policies.
- (2) Use the material developed from (1) above for a meeting of departmental directors and regional officers to look for ways of changing attitudes and proposing definite lines of action to initiate real change.
- (3) Identify genuine examples of effective CBNRM and arrange site visits for directors and regional staff as appropriate.
- (4) COMPASS could use its influence with the Working Group and Parliamentary Committee to encourage these to face up to the adverse impact on CBNRM of the gross misuse of natural resources by powerful bodies and individuals so that they might use their authority to obtain support for appropriate action at the highest level.
- (5) Sponsor a more detailed survey of NGO activities in the field of NRM that distinguishes projects from community inspired initiatives. Use this material for a meeting of the policy makers of leading NGOs as a means of highlighting the need, where necessary, for a change of approach.

- (6) Foster the formation of associations of VNRCs and VNRMCs where such larger groups are essential for effective action.

3.1.2 TR3: Community Mobilisation Skills Within Government/NGOs/ Community Groups Improved

The training component of COMPASS can be divided into three broad activities.

- The training of community groups;
- The training of front line staff; and
- The organisation of visits to “best practice” sites.

Community Groups

In afforestation projects on customary land, the mission observed that local forestry officers had led the training of VNRMCs which appears to have strengthened relationships between the committees and the forestry extension staff which added to the value of the training exercise. On the edges of protected areas, e.g. the Vwaza Marsh Wildlife Reserve, the committee members claim to have benefited from the training that they had received, but in this case the Game Scouts were not included in the training. In consequence the villagers now maintain that they understand about co-management but that the Game Scouts do not. This has led to less than perfect relationships. The villagers feel that further progress would depend upon the Scouts undergoing training about the role of VNRCs. COMPASS has made overtures in this direction but as yet there has not been a positive reaction from the departmental staff. Co-management has to involve two parties and future planning for training in this sphere will need to take a closer look at the commitment of staff as well as of communities.

Front line Staff

The purpose of the COMPASS sponsored training in preparing the front line staff for roles in co-management had been to convert “policemen” into extension workers. The staff members who were interviewed spoke highly of the training they had received and of the honing of their extension skills. At the same time they had had to admit that they had not really been able to make good use of the skills because of the apparent absence of any will to initiate genuine co-management on the part of their superiors. The staff members were frustrated at having acquired skills that they cannot really utilise under the prevailing conditions. This demonstrates the need to investigate fully the attitudes and ethos of senior staff, which determine the working environment of front line staff, before embarking on a training programme.

Where co-management was not an issue, the staff members were unanimous in stating that the sharpening of their extension skills had helped them to give stronger support to the VNRCs in their areas.

Visits to “Best Practice” Sites

One of the major challenges facing the COMPASS training staff is the paucity of examples of good CBNRM in Malawi. COMPASS needs to exercise care not to prejudice its work by making the achievement of numerical targets its primary goal. The target number of Best Practice CBNRM sites for 2001 was 20. If only half a dozen genuine examples can be found, this should be accepted and the programme modified accordingly.

In summary the following recommendations can be made regarding training:

- (1) In training of VNRC and VNRMC members pay more attention to the reasons why they formed a committee (hope of finance, allowances, prestige, greater exploitative access to a resource or a genuine concern for their local environment?) and use training to strengthen positive attitudes.
- (2) Make sure that appropriate support for co-management exists at the regional and district levels before embarking on extension training for co-management of junior field staff.
- (3) Sift out the inappropriate examples from the Best Practice CBNRM list. Look at some of the small but effective village initiatives of past trainees (e.g. forestry in Nkhotakota).
- (4) Check that the site visits are really appropriate to the needs of the visitors.
- (5) Take measures to limit possible inter-group jealousy in the organisation of site visits.
- (6) Organise site visits for the senior staff of NGOs to help them to distinguish between “projects” and genuine CBNRM.

3.1.3 TR4: Process of Policy and Legislative Reform in Favour of CBNRM Supported

COMPASS sees its role in this sphere as strengthening the capacity of intermediate groups to represent local views. To achieve this there have been four main strategies:

- Supporting the efforts of Parliamentary Committee on the Environment (now re-constituted as Parliamentary Committee on Agriculture and Natural Resources);
- Supporting the efforts of the Advocacy Task Force;
- Strengthening the policy analysis skills of NGOs; and
- Promoting increased awareness of CBNRM approaches among Traditional Authorities.

One of the major policy issues facing CBNRM in Malawi is the relative role of the natural resource departments and the district authorities and district environmental officers. There is abundant scope for confusion and delay in this area as well as potential for positive development. At first sight it would seem odd that COMPASS has not become more heavily involved in this issue but the dominance of the DANIDA supported work in the field of decentralisation has made it difficult for other players to contribute greatly to the discussion. Should DANIDA appreciably reduce its role for any reason then COMPASS would have to give this issue greater attention.

Altogether there is scant evidence that COMPASS has had a significant impact on the reform of policies and legislation in favour of CBNRM. The following are some recommendations regarding the Policy and Legislative reform:

- (1) Prior to embarking on any policy reform ensure that it is a weakness in the policy which is hindering development and not the attitude of key players.
- (2) If there is a proven need for reform ensure that the crucial issues have been sharply focussed and that those leading the pressure for change have the technical competence to make a coherent case.
- (3) It may be necessary to look for an alternative to CURE as the leader of an advocacy group for environmental issues. COMPASS could help develop the necessary co-operation between the leading NGOs to provide alternative leadership.

3.2 Efficient Liaison, Communication and Information Exchange

3.2.1 *TR2: Efficient Liaison/Communication/Information Exchange Mechanisms Between/Among CBNRM Programmes Established*

In this target result COMPASS is involved in establishing formal and informal methods of communication among CBNRM organisations and Partners by:

- developing computer based information to improve the quantity and quality of information collected and disseminated;
- launching public awareness campaigns targeting rural communities; and
- holding workshops and conferences to strengthen linkages to disseminate best practices in CBNRM.

Computer Based Information

The COMPASS website <http://www.compass-malawi.com> is fully functional. Website development has involved customising the Technical and Administrative Management Information Systems (TAMIS) and linking key partners to the system over the Internet; establishing the Geographic Information System (GIS) capabilities at the COMPASS offices; creating the COMPASS site on the World-Wide Web to provide up to date information to all partners and other parties that have access to the web. Redesigning, reconstructing and updating of the site was completed to forge linkages with TAMIS. The facility enables all COMPASS documents and internal reports to be downloaded from the site as Word documents. Word versions are also available for the Reference Catalogue, Partner Directory and ListServe Directory. A special feature of the facility is that the active versions of these databases, as they get accessed via the website, are real-time duplicates of data housed in the TAMIS, thus ensuring access to up-to-date versions generated every time maintenance is done.

A major constraint to wide availability of information via the web is that many institutions and individuals are yet to be equipped with computers, especially in Government Departments. A clear testimony of this is when COMPASS carried out a customer survey using e-mail. The response was less than 15% in two successive years. Wherever computers are linked to internet, however, there are other additional problems such as limited knowledge and skills in internet and web browsing, fear of computer viruses, problems of access and capacity within the telecommunications system, and sometimes usernames and passwords are forgotten.

Recommendations

- (1) COMPASS should consider mounting short courses for clients and partners on computer skills relevant to information access, such as e-mail, Internet and web browsing.
- (2) A case is made for a separate project of GIS training that can be in form of a COMPASS grant to a University College for setting up computer hardware and software to ensure sustained capacity building in this area over the next two years.

Public Awareness

Public awareness activities have involved setting targets and monitoring articles on CBNRM appearing in Daily Newspapers and programmes aired on National Radio and TV station, and establishing contact mechanisms for reaching out to schools particularly through distribution of the *Nantchengwa* magazine.

About 30% of Malawians have occasional access to newspapers. The NSO's figure from the 1998-population census on ownership of radios is 49.6%. The TV has an even greater limitation in accessibility, being mainly an urban and peri-urban communication facility. This shows that both the print and electronic media in Malawi are still limited in their outreach to the majority of the communities. Additional avenues for campaigns are, therefore, needed.

Recommendations

- (1) COMPASS has set the targets for the above indicators. Except for the *Nantchengwa* magazine, all the targets that COMPASS has set appear rather ambitious and may need revising. Regarding outreach through newsletters, COMPASS early in the project decided to use well established partner publications on an as-needed basis to promote CBNRM, for example, through CURE, WESM, TSP, Blantyre Synod etc. Now that COMPASS has many CBNRM-related materials, these efforts should be strengthened.
- (2) There is scope for the making of documentaries of COMPASS Best Practice Sites for more publicity of CBNRM activities for broadcasts on TV-Malawi or video distribution to partners and schools.
- (3) While communication by e-mail and Internet is fast and convenient, the limited availability of computers especially in Government institutions suggests that more conventional methods need to be used also. COMPASS should strengthen collaboration with avenues that already exist in partner organisations for the dissemination of CBNRM activities.
- (4) In the COMPASS focal districts, integrating training of grantees with mounting of awareness campaigns can increase impact.

Workshops and Conferences

A “Media Training for CBNRM Public Awareness Partnerships) sponsored by COMPASS, aimed at providing practical, hands on training to 21 participants in developing public awareness campaigns and Action Plans, was held from March 21 – 27, 2001. The Fisheries Department successfully completed formulation of its Action Plan and was funded by COMPASS. A professional firm was contracted to develop 5 jingles and 10 poems that were subsequently broadcast by the Fisheries Department in the **Usodzi Walero** programme on the national radio. The Department now proposes intensification of the campaign.

Recommendations

- (1) COMPASS has evidently considered proposals from NGOs aimed at increasing public awareness on natural resource management but it has only been possible to support one of these because all of them had large overhead costs and the geographical and technical scope of the campaigns was very limited. The mission observes that COMPASS support to the Fisheries Department was most appropriate and wishes to suggest that a further COMPASS grant could be used to buy airtime to secure prime slots for messages by the Fisheries Department. Acknowledging COMPASS’ sponsorship will also be possible – something that could not be done under “**Usodzi Walero**” that was already sponsored by another donor.
- (2) There were 21 participants at the “Media Training for CBNRM Public Awareness” session. A number of these could develop a similar programme to that done by the Fisheries Department for further campaign development, especially focusing on targeting rural communities. COMPASS should make follow-up contacts with these partners to assess, on a demand-driven basis, whether other broad-based programmes can be supported or mounting of another media training session should be considered.

3.3 The Small Grants Programme

3.3.1 *TR5: CBNRM Small Grant Management Services to Finance Special CBNRM Opportunities Established*

The objectives of this targeted result are:

- to promote the sustainable use of natural resources;
- to develop replicable models for promoting sustainable CBNRM initiatives; and
- to provide assistance to viable natural resources management proposals that are not likely to be funded by other programmes.

The grants are given to community groups, local associations, private enterprises, national and international NGOs and Government agencies. Priority grant activities are in two categories: *Natural Resource Management* and *Capacity Building*.

According to COMPASS, 36 grants have been awarded so far, which is 80% of the target number (45) of COMPASS Small Grants. The grants can be grouped into 11 categories: 11 grants were afforestation, 5 Capacity Building, 3 beekeeping, 3

alternative energy, 2 aquaculture, 4 wildlife management, 1 mushroom production, 2 fruit tree nursery, 1 organic farming, and 3 other types. COMPASS set the target of 187 Expressions of Interest and 76 proposals to be received by 2004. So far, 144 concept papers and 73 letters expressing interest in applying for a grant have been received. A total of 252 applications have been treated as fully-fledged proposals. The 36 grants make up a total disbursement of US\$340,475.00 (MK22,026,459.00), which is 62% of the budgetary provision of US\$550,000.00 for Small Grants to be disbursed by 2004. By the October – December 2001 quarter, the number of grants fully disbursed was 23 (i.e. 64% of the awards made so far), but three of these had been terminated before the end of their funding period: two owing to lack of capacity to implement the project effectively (Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation and Liwonde VNRC) and one (LOMADEF) owing to disbanding the organisation. In addition to the disbursements, the total money obliged is US\$167,000.

Many lessons were learned and conclusion drawn from the 30 grants visited. The following recommendations are made:

Recommendations

- (1) The above summary shows that disbursements for the small grants programme are on schedule. The predominance of afforestation projects is understandable in view of the acute degradation being experienced throughout the country. However, since the COMPASS projects are meant to draw out lessons, it will be important in the remaining period of the Activity to fund other CBNRM projects that are underrepresented or absent in the above list.
- (2) The mission concludes that an 18-month grant period should be considered, with the second year carefully planned to ensure consolidation of mechanisms for asset maintenance. Although the duration of COMPASS grants is not fixed, the majority of the grantees visited had 12-months grants and showed evidence that this period was too short, such as operations being initiated towards the end of the project, thus leaving little time for completion.
- (3) Considerable marketing problems as experienced by the Ndirande and Songani Groups suggest that briquette marketing must first be solved before further replication of this activity is undertaken. The mission learned that several communities were contemplating briquette making. These are IEF-sponsored communities in Chikwawa and the Chipusile VNRMC in Ntcheu.
- (4) More Youth Organisations should be encouraged to apply for COMPASS grants and efforts made to provide them with adequate training as these appear to hold much promise for the furtherance of CBNRM.
- (5) COMPASS should put in place or clarify guidelines on how to handle cases involving grantees that may need to benefit out of face-to-face consultations when they have under-performed.
- (6) COMPASS should continue to provide training in participatory monitoring and should ensure that the grantees use the knowledge in running their own projects.

- (7) COMPASS should re-examine the criteria for project screening to include an evaluation of the appropriateness of the technology being proposed, particularly with respect to technical sustainability.
- (8) It will remain a source of conflict if a service provider is paid from the community's project budget for rendering a service, especially when the community is illiterate. The mission recommends that other sources of funding should be identified and separated from the main budget held by the community.
- (9) COMPASS should provide further guidelines to the evaluation panel to critically examine project proposals that tend to be overly diversified and ambitious so as to make them more focussed and gain on maximising impact.
- (10) It is apparent that standardised procedures for CBNRM implementation cannot be achieved because there are major coordination problems within and across Ministries and service providers. Through the CBNRM Working Group, COMPASS should, therefore, continue to lobby for the establishment of the principle that service providers will only work with communities on NRM activities if those same communities make commitments to share costs. There is danger that some current CBNRM project implementation procedures are creating dependency by the community because CBNRM is being implemented as a welfare activity rather than a development activity.

3.4 Gender Issues

COMPASS has done commendable work to promote the participation of women in project activities. So far about 57% of the grant beneficiaries are women. The project plan is to have 60% of the grant beneficiaries being female. The formation of CBNRM groups in the community and the skills training has enhanced the capacity of groups to manage natural resources management initiatives.

Working with partner NGOs, CBOs and Government agencies in the project has enhanced the work of the otherwise few COMPASS staff. There are advantages of working with partners because they work with the community, have skills relevant to assist the community in their (specific) initiatives. In the case of the COMPASS project, a multiplier effect has been realised in terms of number of established CBNRM groups and people trained with skills to manage groups and activities.

However, although a lot of effort has been made by COMPASS to promote the participation of women in project activities, there are some gender gaps that need to be addressed by the project if gender equity has to be achieved. These gaps are reflected in the recommendations:

3.4.1 TR1: Capacity for effective CBNRM administrative and technical services

The objective in the TR1 is to establish an effective CBNRM Coordinating Group to facilitate rational planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of CBNRM

activities in Malawi. The group has so far developed and launched a Framework for Strategic Planning for CBNRM activities, and a Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. Following are some of the conclusions and recommendations relating to this component.

- There is an imbalance in gender representation in the Working Group and in addition there is no gender expert in the group who can advise on matters related to gender and gender equity. It is recommended that the working group should have a gender specialist in the committee or an organisation that advises the working group whenever there are issues related to gender
- COMPASS does not have a gender policy and strategic framework that can be used as a basis for planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of project activities. COMPASS should therefore develop a gender policy that defines the organisation's core values and how gender equity should be mainstreamed in project supported activities.
 - The Working Group has already developed a Strategic Plan for CBNRM activities. (*Document 35: Strategic Plan for CBNRM in Malawi: COMPASS, November 2001*) the strategic plan has 4 Strategic Actions. It is recommended that gender be integrated in the strategic actions of the plan. Gender can be integrated in Strategic Action1: 'Developing a Commonly Understood CBNRM Concept and Vision' (pages 2&3) and Strategic Action 4: Developing Planning and Implementation Tools (pages 8&9). In this strategic action gender should be part of sub-action 4.6. 'Review Participatory Methodology Toolbox to Assist Community Level Decision Making, with special reference to CBNRM Aspects'. This sub action provides an opportunity to introduce and train people on gender analytic tools. Some of the participatory tools like PRA can be engendered to collect gender disaggregated data. This exercise can be part of the PRA training for capacity building planned for the first quarter of 2002.
 - The membership of the Working Group need to be sensitised first and also have a gender expert who can provide direction of the group and activities. A local NGO, the Co-ordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment (CURE) is a member of the Working Group but the gender experts of the organisation do not attend the meetings. It is important to either have the gender experts attend or form a gender experts sub-group to assist in the issues of gender mainstreaming.

3.4.2 TR3: Improvement of community mobilisation skills within government, NGOs and community groups

The objective of community mobilisation is to improve the skills and a positive attitude of Government, NGOs and Community Groups towards environmental protection within communities and promoting their own vision of sustainable resource utilisation and biodiversity conservation. There are three broad areas of support provided by the project which include: basic skills in training, extension and

community mobilisation, technical skills building in natural resources management and, business skills for sustainable natural resource-based enterprises.

There are two levels of training; one conducted by COMPASS for capacity building of partners and that conducted by partners for improving management and technical skills of CBNRM groups and management of natural resource initiatives.

So far, COMPASS has conducted twenty training workshops for partners since 1999 where 3030 people have been trained. Of those trained, 31% are women. However, for the community level training, there is evidence that the number of women trained is much higher.

COMPASS works with partners in improving the skills of CBNRM groups to manage their initiatives. However, the majority of the partners do not have gender skills. Two out of seven partners interviewed had skills in gender and appreciate the importance of gender in program performance.

It is therefore recommended that COMPASS facilitates development of gender skills on the concepts of gender and appreciate gender analysis as a tool for project planning, monitoring and evaluation.

3.4.3 TR4: Support for policy and legislative reform in favor of CBNRM

COMPASS is supporting strengthening of capacity of NGOs and CBO advocacy groups, to participate in relevant CBNRM policy review, formulation and implementation. So far, COMPASS has organised a national workshop to discuss strategies for grass-root advocacy for CBNRM policy reform, developed strategies and capacity building process to facilitate greater involvement of grass-root organisations in policy reform and a member of the Advocacy Task Force in Land Reform on matters related to natural resource management.

There is a strong gender representation in the Advocacy Task Force. However, the different organisations and government agencies working at the community level have no gender and gender analysis skills to facilitate a gender sensitive advocacy program. Besides, the policy reform strategy is silent on gender. It is therefore recommended that:

- COMPASS needs to develop gender awareness and skills at different levels to facilitate integration of gender in advocacy activities. This will include gender awareness for NGOs and Traditional Authorities at the grass-root level and, gender analysis skills for NGOs to identify the needs of men and women on issues related to policies that affect natural resource management.

3.4.5 TR5: Support for small grants program for CBNRM initiatives

Grants are given to community-based groups to test innovative-community-based natural resource management initiatives and to NGOs and Government Agencies to provide technical skills and services to community groups in natural resource management.

So far, 36 grants have been awarded. Of these 25 grants have been awarded to community groups, 6 to NGOs and 2 to Government Agencies. 57% of the grant beneficiaries are women; 3% less of the project target by the end of the project. In order to streamline the awarding of the grants, a grants manual has been developed.

Following are some of the findings related to the grants program:

- ❑ Through the grants and the skills development for natural resource management program, women in the rural areas are involved in the program. CBNRM groups are able to link their initiatives with the broader environmental conservation goal.
- ❑ CBNRM groups have become a uniting factor in the community and a forum for community development activities. It has provided a forum for women's participation in community development.
- ❑ In a gender analysis conducted with men and women, increased involvement of women in project activities has also increased their workload. For example, in afforestation activities, women are involved in more activities than men.
- ❑ Although women do most of the activities the gender analysis showed that women have no control of the resources and benefits accruing from the initiatives.

It is therefore recommended that the following need to be done regarding the grants program:

- ❑ The project needs to introduce gender analysis as a matter of practice and policy. There is lack of gender analysis as a tool for identifying gender issues and disparities necessary for planning, implementation and developing gender sensitive indicators for monitoring and evaluation.

Planners and project implementation personnel require simplified tools, which enable them identify the complexities of gender relations due to socio-cultural and socio-economic settings in a community, understand the dynamics in division of labor, access and control of resources and benefits as a basis for strategizing community interventions in order to promote equity and increased gender participation, increases awareness on men's and women's tasks and workload therefore facilitating initiation of dialogue with men regarding the status and role of women in the community and in CBNRM activities.

- ❑ The project staff and partners should have gender analysis tools to facilitate collection of gender disaggregated information, develop indicators for gender sensitive monitoring and evaluation.

3.4.6 Major lessons

Following are some of the major lessons learnt during the life of the program.

- ❑ Awareness and sensitisation has assisted the community to appreciate the need and importance of natural resource management and CBNRM as a technically appropriate strategy at the community level.
- ❑ COMPASS partners have facilitated a multiplier effect and have assisted COMPASS to reach more communities in the country although COMPASS has experienced some administrative problems with some of them.
- ❑ CBNRM initiatives where women are the majority seem to be more successful.
- ❑ Technically, CBNRM initiatives are sustainable by the community although there seems to be over-dependence on donor funding.
- ❑ CBNRM projects initiated by the community themselves are more likely to be sustainable because the groups started more as social support groups before they got funding from COMPASS. However groups formed to attract funding from COMPASS do not seem to be sustainable.
- ❑ Women's participation. Women's work load increases as a result of them being involved in project activities. Unless women see the benefits, they may get discouraged and withdraw from the activities. It therefore necessary to identify gender issues that may be useful to minimise the gender disparities and promote gender equity

3.5 Financial Issues

A total of ten small grant projects were visited. All other present and past projects currently filed at COMPASS office were reviewed by file. The information collected included the following: accuracy and completeness of financial records, level of understanding of financial procedures on the part of the grantee organisation as a whole, relevance of improved skills and experience to other and/or future activities, and sustainability of the skills that have been developed.

The present requirements of accounting procedures and financial reporting are in the majority of cases far too complicated a task for the targeted group accepted as being on the whole illiterate, especially when focussed on an element of women's involvement in the projects. Minimal schooling and educational capability have still to be addressed when it comes to the question of gender equality.

3.5.1 Recommendations

- (1) It would be wise to create a tiered system of accounting, as follows:

System 1: Basic. Simplified for project commencement: The necessity to log expenditure only, without classification, requiring the signed receipt for goods or services fully described and a balance. The account and receipts, if requested monthly, will highlight both progress and in other cases misuse.

System 2: Intermediate. Required after 6 months: This should be incorporated in the training workshop. It represents the present system.

System 3: Comprehensive. This is a more involved system, for second time funded or best practice project groups. It should involve the aspect of a sales ledger.

- (2) It is vitally important that the project accounts controller takes extra effort and approaches this complex task with greater enthusiasm. The role is important, being able to offer continual advice to funding recipients and in-field training, completeness and accuracy of records at head-office and, due to the admitted propensity of misuse of funds, a keen eye for detail. The incumbent needs to make a review of the demands of this role and take necessary steps to address the weak links.
- (3) Funding service providers, Government departments and NGOs cannot be seriously judged as cost effective where funds primarily assist in maintaining infrastructure. Direct results and impact would be more beneficial in enhancing COMPASS activity. Direct involvement at grass-root, community level projects are more financially sensible. The opportunity of grants being available should be put more in the public domain.
- (4) Funding to private enterprise, which is reliant on a certain level of expertise, must be thoroughly scrutinised.
- (5) Accounting procedures and their requirements should be re-examined where literacy and numerical skills at community level are minimal.
- (6) It should always be remembered that introduced technology and expertise does not immediately change culture and tradition. In a hand-to-mouth culture like that in Malawi, funding for a bee-keeping project also means temporary funding for food and other commodities (through astute use of funds) for those involved in the project. The project, in theory sustainable, ceases when funding ceases and the extra-curricular household income ceases.
- (7) A one-year contract for funding could be said to introduce the donor dependent syndrome. A country where communities see the government as foreign-aid reliant will see this as short-term assistance to their daily life and not as something for their future. They will not be considering natural resource management an option for a change in attitude but as assistance in their priorities.
- (8) The most outstanding point noticeable is the enthusiasm and commitment of the projects involving the youth of Malawi. This is perhaps the most cost-effective way forward.

SECTION I

A. BACKGROUND

1. Introduction

Community Partnerships for Sustainable Resource Management (COMPASS), a USAID/Malawi Government Activity, is funded through the USAID and is being implemented by Development Alternatives, Inc. (DAI) based in Bethesda, Maryland, and Development Management Associates (DMA) based in Lilongwe, Malawi. The Activity was established to work with local NGOs, donor programmes, government agencies and the private sector to develop overall strategy and site-specific activities that will support and promote community-based natural resource management (CBNRM) in Malawi. The Activity is designed to run for 60 months from February 1999 to February 2004. At this time, about half way after the start of the Activity, it is appropriate to undertake an assessment of the performance of the implementation team and evaluate the overall impact that COMPASS has had on CBNRM in Malawi. This assessment is being undertaken as an independent evaluation in lieu of a true mid-term evaluation.

COMPASS is designed to address USAID Strategic Objective Number 6 (SO6): Sustainable increases in rural income. This and other Strategic Objectives are designed to achieve USAID/Malawi's goal of broad-based sustainable economic growth. USAID/Malawi's Strategic Plan for the period 2001 to 2004 has a goal of increasing food security and reducing poverty through broad-based economic growth. COMPASS works in five thematic areas that are defined as Targeted Results (TR) to achieve predetermined goals. Each TR has a set of Sub-Results (SR) and for each SR a set of tasks and/or actions that have been identified and will be implemented to achieve the SR and the overall TR. These five TRs are:

1. Building Malawian capacity among Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) and Government to administer CBNRM initiatives and provide the necessary technical support to practitioners;
2. Establishing efficient liaison and information exchange among CBNRM programmes in Malawi and neighbouring countries. In this target result COMPASS is involved in establishing formal and informal methods of communication among CBNRM organisations and Partners by developing computer based information to improve the quantity and quality of information collected and disseminated, to launch public awareness campaigns targeting rural communities, and to hold workshops and conferences to strengthen linkages to disseminate best practices in CBNRM;
3. Improving community mobilisation skills within the public and NGO sectors. The focus is to build positive attitude of NGOs and Communities towards natural resource protection and management and sustainable use;
4. Supporting policy and Legislative Reform that assists improved resource management at village level. This is support to strengthen the capacity of

intermediary NGOs and Advocacy groups to ensure local perspectives are incorporated in policy formulation and implementation; and

5. Providing small grants to CBNRM practitioners and promoters for NGOs and communities to develop and implement initiatives in natural resource management.

1.1 Gender evaluation

The gender evaluation was to be integrated to project activities in all the target results but with specific emphasis on TR3 (community mobilisation) and TR5 (small grants programme).

COMPASS requested for evaluation of the project in order to determine the extent to which gender equity was being achieved in the programme. While data collected by COMPASS indicates that there has been a good gender balance in the training programme, the following discrepancies have been observed:

- Training of government extension workers shows a male bias in terms of numbers of participants;
- There is often a strong male bias when training is for village head-persons and chiefs;
- Cultural bias and traditional gender roles in Malawi tend to make women responsible for the management of natural resources; and
- Men more often than not make key decisions at the community level, which influence management practices and the potential for improved NRM.

COMPASS therefore requested for evaluation to address the following critical programmatic issues:

- How to better ensure that the people responsible for resource use (mainly women) are targeted more effectively by the support programs that COMPASS offers (training, grants etc.); and
- How to ensure that targeting of women for capacity building in NRM will have tangible effect on better management of the resource base.

1.2 Rationale for gender equity in natural resource management

The purpose of integrating gender in natural resource management is to ensure that there is equity in access, control and use of natural resources. While many projects have worked to ensure that there is increased participation of men and women in natural resource management projects, sometimes consideration has not been made on the disparities that occur between men and women who hinder their equal participation. Women in Malawi, for example, may have access to natural resources but men make decisions on the use and disposal of resources. Yet when natural resources are destroyed, the burden falls heavily on women in poor households. For example, with the depletion of forests, in some areas in Malawi, women who go into restricted government forests and National Parks to get firewood are assaulted, arrested and charged.

In order to solve such problems, projects have to design activities that will address the immediate problems of women, e.g. firewood, water etc., and also look at the long-term solution of the problems facing women. The short-term solutions are a prelude to finding solutions for the long-term solutions. Firewood is the immediate problem, normally referred to as a *practical need*. In most cases, when addressing practical needs, projects focus activities on women and leave out men. Focusing on women alone does not necessarily address issues of gender equity because there should be a societal approach that looks at men and women disparities. The projects should address the disparities so as to find long-term solutions; in other words, address the *strategic needs* and find strategic solutions e.g. underlying causes of natural resource depletion, and introduce measures that will address long-term solutions of afforestation and thus reduce women's frustration. These strategic solutions could be in the areas of legal rights reform, inhibiting policy issues on the use of forest resources, causes of poor participation of women in natural resource management etc.

Addressing and meeting strategic gender needs help women, who are disadvantaged, to achieve greater equality that changes their subordinate position.

The argument for gender equity stems from the fact that men and women have different gender roles in society, do different types of work, have different degrees of access and control over services and resources, and experience unequal relations. When such disparities are addressed in projects, then equity may be achieved.

Gender roles change all the time because of a number of factors. Women are increasingly becoming heads of households and therefore in a position of family decision-making. This is as a result of men's migrating in search of work, increased deaths due to HIV/AIDS and increased number of single motherhood etc.

If gender equity in sustainable resource management is to be achieved, projects will have to address the concerns of men and women and the ways in which both, individually or collectively, relate to the resource base and equally benefit from it.

2. Terms of Reference

This work was undertaken to evaluate COMPASS performance from 1999 to 2001. The COMPASS Activity has a small grants program to finance and test innovative community-based natural resources management models. During the past 21 months, COMPASS has awarded 36 grants: 25 to community based organisations, 8 to non-governmental organisations, 2 to government departments and 1 to a private developer. As COMPASS moves into the second phase of grant awards (with the first group of grantees now having "graduated"), it is most appropriate that the small grants program and performance of the grantees are evaluated.

COMPASS' main objective is to promote sustainable use of natural resources and the small grants program is designed to develop replicable models for promoting sustainable CBNRM initiatives. The participatory monitoring systems designed and implemented by grantees are not sufficient to capture all the lessons that could benefit institutions intending to implement similar programs.

COMPASS has identified the following targets for gauging its overarching impact

and related CBNRM activities in Malawi. COMPASS expects to be instrumental in accomplishing significant improvements in the natural resource base during its five-year implementation but achieving these goals and targets will rest on the shoulders of a broad group of partners ranging from government and donors to NGOs and community members themselves:

- 400 communities adopting CBNRM practices as a result of COMPASS activities;
- 40% of customary land under improved natural resource management in COMPASS target Districts;
- 60% of beneficiaries of COMPASS small grants are female;
- 80% of grant projects are sustained one year after the end of the COMPASS grant period;
- \$250,000 in supplemental income generated by grants for Income Generating Activities; and
- 60% of grants demonstrating positive environmental and social impact.

2.1 Objectives of the evaluation

1. To evaluate the strengths and weakness of the COMPASS small-grants initiative and information-support activities and gather additional information that will facilitate capturing of lessons from the CBNRM initiatives.
2. To assist the COMPASS Team identify possible improvements to the small-grants program especially with respect to building the organisational and technical skills of grantees; their financial management capabilities; and the impact of the initiatives on gender equity in the communities involved.
3. To assist the COMPASS Team identify possible improvements to the information-support activities especially with respect to building the organisational and technical skills of partner organisations.

2.2 Tasks

A team of four short-term technical assistants were assigned to undertake the assessment of COMPASS. Their roles were as follows:

- A - Evaluate COMPASS performance with regard to TRs 1, 3 and 4 (focus on issues of institutions and training)
- B - Evaluate COMPASS performance with regard to TRs 2 and 5
- C - Evaluate COMPASS performance with regard to gender issues across all aspects of the Activity
- D - Evaluate COMPASS performance with regard to financial performance of grantees under TR5

Their tasks were to:

1. Review various COMPASS documents on the small-grants program, community mobilisation and others related to other target results.
2. Discuss with COMPASS team on how the evaluation will be conducted.

3. Visit grantee project sites, best practice sites and beneficiaries of COMPASS training to collect information on the following:

General

- (a) Type of CBNRM initiative and its membership - disaggregated by gender.
- (b) How the group developed its monitoring plan.
- (c) How communities correct mistakes and weaknesses in their organisation and approach and how they mitigate any negative impacts.
- (d) Social, financial and environmental sustainability of the grant-funded initiative.

Theme A:

- (e) Type and appropriateness of targets and indicators.
- (f) How monitoring information is collected and used.
- (g) Effectiveness of the training provided by COMPASS.
- (h) Contribution of the other training the group has received on the group's performance.

Theme B:

- (i) Gender specific indicators, such as women's participation in decision making, access to land, participation in training programs, and so on.
- (j) Assessment of positive and negative impacts of COMPASS-sponsored activities on women and children, such as their participation rates, amount of time devoted to program activities, and impacts on other uses of their time.

Theme C:

- (k) Accuracy and completeness of financial records.
- (l) Level of understanding of financial procedures on the part of the grantee organisation as a whole.
- (m) Relevance of improved skills and experience to other and/or future activities.
- (n) Sustainability of the skills that have been developed.

4. Analyse the data and make conclusion based on generalised interpretation of the analysed data that will assist in drawing lessons from the grant-funded initiatives.

5. Prepare a draft report that will be presented to COMPASS Team and Partners before producing a final report for circulation. The Team Leader will be responsible for ensuring a thorough integration of the work of the four individuals that make up the evaluation team.

2.3 Outputs and Deliverables:

1. Lessons drawn from grant-funded initiatives.
2. Information that will facilitate refining of the current small grant program approach.

3. Lessons learned from the information-support initiative (TR2) and recommendations on how this can be improved over the coming 24 months.
4. A report that summarises how the work was done, the findings, the results/conclusions and recommendations. The report should be an integration of the work of the four evaluation team members. This will be presented to COMPASS as a single, synthesised report.

B. METHODOLOGY

An assessment of COMPASS performance was made by the evaluators involving review of documents, interviews with COMPASS staff, review and analysis of COMPASS files, interviews with partners, field visits to grantee projects, interviews with project members, and examination of all financial information available. The variations in methodology are detailed below where specific information was needed.

1. Secondary data analysis

A number of reports were reviewed before and during the preparation of this evaluation. The documents provided background information and indications of the progress the project has made over time, as well as institutional linkages developed by the project. These reports included performance monitoring reports, training reports, needs assessment reports, workshops reports, quarterly progress reports and annual work plans.

2. Focused group discussions

The evaluator, with the assistance of a translator where necessary, conducted focused group discussions with members of the CBNRM groups.

2.1 Gender Evaluation

The discussions were done using a checklist of questions. This approach was used to collect qualitative information from grantees on their project activities. In groups where men and women were members, they were interviewed as a group and then interviewed men and women separately. During the second level of interviewing, gender analysis was done focusing on division of labour in the project activities, access to and control over resources and benefits. Analysis was done comparing the men and women roles and responsibilities at home, in the community and the amount of time spent doing the activities in the project. The Harvard Framework of Analysis was used. In addition, an analysis on the impact of project activities on men and women was done using a Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM). The GAM was used in a few selected cases.

3. Key informant interviewing

Leading personnel in a number of Partner Organisations were interviewed. This was done to collect information on their partnership arrangements, their approach to

building the capacity of communities, their experience and working with gender and the lessons they had learnt involvement in CBNRM.

4. Observation

Site visits were made to some of the project activities to see what was being done. The briquette-making group demonstrated how they make briquettes.

SECTION II: FINDINGS

C. INSTITUTIONAL ISSUES AND TRAINING

The findings are presented to broadly follow the Targeted Results and the Sub-Results as laid down in the COMPASS workplans. The mission first discusses the two overarching CBNRM impact-monitoring goals selected by COMPASS.

1. Overarching Goals

COMPASS has selected two major criteria for measuring the overall impact of its activities.

1.1 *First Criterion: 400 Communities Adopting CBNRM Practices as a Result of COMPASS Activities.*

The actual total number of grantees and trainees is easy enough to obtain. What is less straightforward to assess is the level of environmental management that has resulted from COMPASS activity. The impact of a group installing a few bee hives or starting to rear guinea fowl or cane rats as an income generating activity is likely to be far less than that of a community planting out 20,000 young trees. Likewise a distinction needs to be made on the comparative impact of training on an enthusiastic forestry group and a beach village committee which brings about little or no beneficial change in fishing practices. If the qualification of the community producing and implementing a “CBNRM action plan” is rigorously enforced it should be a fairly straightforward matter to assess whether the help given by COMPASS to grantees and trainees is really having an appreciable impact on the improved management of the environment.

1.2 *Second Criterion: 40% of Customary Land under Improved Natural Resource Management in COMPASS Target Districts*

The second overarching impact indicator is much more difficult to assess accurately. The indicator is the percentage of customary land under improved natural resource management in the target districts. Customary land can be broadly divided into arable land and woodland/bush areas. The natural resource management of these areas by local communities is largely exploitative resulting in a steady increase in the level of degradation. The two broad categories are considered below.

1.2.1 Arable land: One of the major environmental problems currently facing Malawi is the degradation of its arable land. This is the result of soil loss due to poor conservation practices, and fertility loss due to annual cultivation with little or no replacement of either nutrients or organic matter. The impact of this poor management is reflected in declining crop yields and soil quality. Technology is available to improve the management of this resource. Soil loss can be counteracted by realigning ridges on the contour and by planting lines of Vetiver grass on the contour. The loss of nutrients and soil quality can be counteracted by the use of leguminous shrubs and trees in agro-forestry systems and by the application of adequate amounts of organic manure.

The most cursory inspection of the Malawian countryside reveals the paucity of examples of the use of improved natural resource management on arable land. This impression is borne out by the figures produced by MAFE and Land Resources Department that claim that over the past five years some 49,000 ha. have been protected with either marker ridges or Vetiver strips. This represents 3% of the smallholder arable land. What is disturbing is that each year the proportion of farm families adopting improved soil management declines as the number of new adopters is lower than the number of new farm families joining the rural population. At the same time it is estimated that an average of 21,000 ha of new land is being opened each year. Much of this is steep and marginal and prone to rapid degradation. This area is larger than the areas being effectively protected in any one year so that the proportion of land under sound conservation management practice is declining.

With regard to soil improving practice it is reported that up to the year 2000 some 15,600 ha had been planted to some form of agro-forestry. This represents 1% of smallholder farm area. Once again the number of new adopters each year is much less than the increase in the farm population and both the proportion of families using good natural resource management and the area under good NRM are declining. The great majority of those using some form of agro-forestry are likely also to be those practising soil conservation. In consequence a generous estimate of improved natural resource management in the year 2000 would be 3.5% with the figure being slightly lower for 2001. Because these figures are based on RDP boundaries that do not coincide with district boundaries it is not possible to identify the exact position in COMPASS districts. There is, however, no compelling evidence that their situation differs markedly from the national average.

1.2.2 Woodland: Malawian families have been using fuelwood at the rate of about 30% more than supply for some years. This has resulted in a steady decline in woodland on customary land. Improved CBNRM on woodland would have to demonstrate that annual new plantings were equivalent to or greater than annual abstraction so as to reverse the current decline. There is little evidence of this taking place in more than widely isolated instances where there is intensive NGO activity. Any suggestion that 20 or 30 % of customary woodland in a district was being managed on a sustainable basis would require the most rigorously collected data to provide convincing evidence that it varied so widely from the national pattern.

Recommendation:

Given the above factors it would seem difficult to justify the figures now being used by COMPASS and in particular the expectation that an increasing proportion of customary land will come under improved CBNRM when the available evidence points in the opposite direction. If COMPASS is to retain this performance criterion it will be necessary to provide more solid evidence than that given by local staff who have no resources with which to gather and assemble credible data.

2. TR1: Effective CBNRM Administration and Technical Services Capacity Established

2.1 *SR1A: CBNRM Co-ordinating Body and Secretariat Created*

The CBNRM Working Group was established in March 2000 and has met regularly since then. So far the Group has not been able to facilitate the production of an annual assessment of CBNRM activities in the country. In other respects the Group does appear to have started with over-ambitious goals. These include “ensuring that CBNRM guidelines are adhered to by all stakeholders”; “Ensuring the implementation of procedures for improved co-ordination of CBNRM activities in Malawi”; “Facilitating the annual assessment of CBNRM activities in Malawi”. Experience over the life of the Working Group has revealed that some of its original terms of reference were unrealistic. New TORs have been developed and approved by the National Council for the Environment in January 2002. These do not include any responsibility for ensuring the implementation of any activities and envisage the Group having a co-ordinating, investigative and advisory role.

2.2 *SR1B: Relationship Among CBNRM Programmes Established*

The impact indicators for this aspect of COMPASS work are not specific and it is therefore not possible to assess the degree to which the Project has achieved its original goals. The mission was able to identify three areas in which COMPASS has supported both established and emerging NGOs. These are:

2.2.1 Direct financial help to five established NGOs. The main impact of this was on the Wildlife Society of Malawi and CURE that were provided with funding to help develop their strategic plans. Of a different nature was the funding of technical training for the field staff of ELDP. Lesser grants to NICE and Greenwigs funded staff participation in training workshops.

2.2.2 Employment of CABUNGO. This was to help community-based organisations to develop more effective management systems. Although this is a positive step, these groups will only be able to make use of the newly acquired skills if they can identify future sources of funding. It is not clear at present from where this will come.

2.2.3 Establishment of ListServ. The establishment of the computerised programme ListServ was meant to strengthen communication links between NGOs involved in CBNRM and to ensure fostering of a loose grouping of CBNRM practitioners to serve the same purpose. The mission appreciates that these services have been made available to the NGO community but was unable to elicit responses as to how they had helped to build the capacity of the NGOs that were interviewed.

COMPASS has opted to deal with organisations directly, whether private sector, community groups or CBOs, NGOs or Government Departments as grant recipients, rather than use the existing NGOs as intermediaries. This has meant that the impact of COMPASS in strengthening local NGO capacity has inevitably been reduced.

In the course of its interviews the mission found that most people, including departmental directors, were more aware of the COMPASS Small Grants programme than of its capacity building and strategy formulation activities. This is in part a reflection of a commonly expressed view that “Malawi has spent too much effort on policy formulation and too little time on enabling communities to improve on the management of their environment”. The Small Grants programme is seen as action, and is therefore welcomed, while the Strategic Plan and Working Group appear to elicit less support. An appreciation of this perception could helpfully influence COMPASS activities over the remainder of the Project’s life.

2.3 *SRIC: National CBNRM Strategic Planning Process Developed*

One of the objectives of the Working Group was to develop a Strategic Plan for implementing CBNRM in Malawi. The Plan has been developed and approved. At the same time it was intended that during 2001 the Strategic Plan would be implemented. It will in fact be some time before it is possible to assess whether the players involved will actually implement the strategies to which they have agreed.

The Group was also expected to introduce a revised monitoring and evaluation plan to be implemented by EAD and all other key government departments. The revised system has been developed and training for its implementation has taken place. This mission was unable to find evidence during its meetings that departmental staff are actually prepared to make fundamental changes to their long established (albeit possibly unsatisfactory) patterns of information gathering. It was also difficult to obtain any clear evidence from the directors of departments that their policies and levels of inter-departmental co-operation were being influenced by the decisions of the Working Group.

There would appear to be two basic reasons for this. The first is that departments often sent middle level staff to the meetings who had little chance of “ensuring” that decisions were adopted or implemented. The second is that departments have not been consistent in the selection of their representatives to the Group meetings so that new faces have appeared at consecutive meetings which has tended to undermine the Group’s long term value.

3. TR3: Community Mobilisation Skills Within Government/NGOs/ Community Groups Improved

The training component of COMPASS can be divided into three broad activities.

- The training of community groups;
- The training of front line staff; and
- The organisation of visits to “best practice” sites.

The mission was able to meet with people who had participated in one or more of each of these categories from whom it was possible to gain a range of impressions that are detailed below.

3.1 ***SR3A: CBNRM Training Programme Designed for all Interested Partners*** ***SR3B: Training Delivered***

3.1.1 *Community Groups*

A meeting with representatives of three Village Natural Resource Management Committees (VNRMC) involved in forestry projects in Nkhotakota provided a favourable impression of the value of the training they had received. This was borne out by visits to the villages involved and the nurseries that they had established. Local forestry officers had led the training that appears to have strengthened relationships between the committees and the forestry extension staff that added to the value of the training exercise.

A meeting with VNRCs on the edges of the Vwaza Marsh Wildlife Reserve produced a different impression. The committee members claim to have benefited from the training that they had received, but in this case the Game Scouts were not included in the training. In consequence the villagers now maintain that they understand about co-management but that the Game Scouts do not. This has led to less than perfect relationships. The villagers feel that further progress would depend upon the Scouts undergoing training about the role of VNRCs. COMPASS has made overtures in this direction but as yet there has not been a positive reaction from the departmental staff. Co-management has to involve two parties and future planning for training in this sphere will need to take a closer look at the commitment of staff as well as of communities.

3.1.2 *Front Line Staff*

The importance of the attitude of senior staff was highlighted by the experience of front line forestry staff in Nkhatabay District. The VNRMCs with which they are working are mostly on the edges of forest reserves in which they are meant to participate in co-management. The purpose of the COMPASS sponsored training had been to convert “policemen” into extension workers. The staff members who were interviewed spoke highly of the training they had received and of the honing of their extension skills. At the same time they had had to admit that they had not really been able to make good use of them because of the apparent absence of any will to initiate genuine co-management on the part of their superiors. They were therefore still collecting all the dues for forestry products and were responsible for patrolling the reserves. None of the staff interviewed could cite any benefit that would accrue to villagers if they formed a VNRMC. Unsurprisingly the only VNRMCs that are active are those that receive cash and other support from international NGOs with which to establish tree nurseries. The staff members were frustrated at having acquired skills that they cannot really utilise under the prevailing conditions. This demonstrates the need to investigate fully the attitudes and ethos of senior staff, which determine the working environment of front line staff, before embarking on a training programme.

The experience of front line staff in Nkhotakota was quite different. Here forest reserves are not an issue and VNRMCs are concentrating on nursery establishment and the conservation of small patches of woodland in their villages. The staff members were unanimous in stating that the sharpening of their extension skills had helped them to give stronger support to the VNRMCs in their areas.

3.2 SR3C: CBNRM Best Practices Identified SR3D: National and Regional CBNRM Exchange Programme Developed

3.2.1 Visits to “Best Practice” Sites

One of the major challenges facing the COMPASS training staff is the paucity of examples of good CBNRM in Malawi. This issue is dealt with in greater detail below but has a bearing on the outcome of the two visits that were considered by the mission.

The first was a visit to communities adjacent to Liwonde National Park by members of one of the 16 VNRCs around Vwaza. The experience had obviously been stimulating although it was difficult for the members to pinpoint any actual lessons they had learned. The more serious issue followed upon their return. They were expected to visit all the neighbouring VNRCs to share their experiences. At the time of the mission’s visit this had not happened and, given the deep-seated jealousy about the visit that the mission encountered in the other VNRCs in the area, it is unlikely to happen. This will severely limit the value of this visit to the wider community which it was expected to benefit. This very human factor deserves careful consideration in the planning of future visits by VNRCs.

The second was by Beach Village Committees (BVCs) in Nkhotakota to those at Lake Chiuta and Lake Chilwa. The interviewees (at least 25) were adamant that they had learned nothing of use to their committee from the visit because the conditions on those lakes were so different to their own. They asked why they had not been taken to BVCs on the southern Lake Malawi shore where conditions are comparable to their own. The answer to that is that the BVCs in the South are no more successful at improving on fish stock conservation than those in the Centre and it is really only at Chiuta, with its uniquely isolated situation, that BVCs are having a proven impact in conserving a fishery. This unfortunate example highlights the need to assess the capacity of a village committee to bring about a positive improvement in CBNRM before embarking on a visit, in addition to the need to see that the example to which they are being taken is in a comparable environment from which truly applicable lessons can be learned. In fisheries at the moment the consensus of staff opinion appears to be that fishermen cannot really control their own neighbours with regard to net size, pattern of fishing or observance of the closed season. In consequence the BVCs on Lake Malombe and Lake Malawi are having a negligible impact on the conservation of fish stocks. On Lake Chilwa the situation is more ambiguous but it is the resilience of the lake’s environment rather than the success of the BVCs in imposing large size mesh nets (used by nobody on the Lake) and keeping technically proven closed seasons which is credited with maintaining that fishery.

3.2.1.1 Selection of CBNRM Best Practice Sites

The paucity of examples of good CBNRM in Malawi is all too clearly illustrated by the difficulty faced by COMPASS in identifying examples that can be used for training purposes. COMPASS has invested a lot of staff time and travel in this exercise (Document 32, June 2001) but with limited success. The target that was set was of 20 examples of CBNRM best practice but a careful review of the list

presented reveals that the actual number is much lower as the following analysis shows.

(1) *Categories of Best Practice Sites*

The published list of Best Practice Sites can be broadly classified into four groups:

(1.1) **Externally Funded:** These are initiatives that have received large amounts of external funding and outside help without which no development would have taken place. Village communities do not normally have their accounts audited by Deloitte and Touche. These initiatives are not replicable on any significant scale. Visits to them by groups without access to comparable levels of funding and technical support could be counterproductive. There are five of these in the COMPASS list.

(1.2) **Outstanding Individuals:** Some individuals have developed unusually good private farms. With careful selection these might be used as examples of new technology but in no sense of the term can they be described as CBNRM. Most are heavily dependent on employed labour and great care will be needed to see how applicable the experience of these individuals is to village groups with few resources. There are five of these in the Document 32 list.

(1.3) **Locally Initiated and Developed.** Examples of communities which do appear to have played a considerable role in the development and implementation of their activity without unrealistic levels of external help. Of these there appear to be six examples. The rarity of these is highlighted by the Matindi Youth Organisation that has elicited visits from cabinet ministers, MPs, the media and civil servants.

(1.4) **Other Cases.** Cases which do not fit into any of the above include: Mbenje Island which is an excellent example of CBNRM but because of its unique background is of little use as a teaching tool; Tambala beekeeping club which has only survived because its members defaulted on their loans and whose membership has not increased from a tiny proportion of the community in eight years; Lake Malombe BVCs which the Fisheries Department staff maintain are having little impact on the quality or sustainability of the fishery; and Ndirande Women's Group briquettes which is an excellent concept but whose long term viability is yet to be proven.

(2) *Lessons Learned*

Three lessons can be drawn from this experience.

(2.1) **The Setting of Target Numbers:** COMPASS needs to exercise care not to prejudice its work by making the achievement of numerical targets its primary goal. The target number of Best Practice CBNRM sites for 2001 was 20. If only half a dozen genuine examples can be found this should be accepted and the programme modified accordingly.

(2.2) **Educational Visits.** These are only of value if the conditions at the Best Practice site are truly applicable to the situation of the visitors. Taking Lake Malawi fishermen to Lake Chiuta or resource poor farmers to Freedom Gardens is unlikely to be a worthwhile exercise.

(2.3) **Paucity of Best Practice Sites.** This shortage of examples of active improved CBNRM has to be considered in the assessment of what proportion of the target districts are under improved environmental management. If anything remotely like 20% of the 2,970,000 ha. of customary land in the nine target districts was under improved natural resource management (draft Document 38) there would surely be hundreds of examples of good CBNRM from which to choose. In the event some districts do not have a single one. This is a further reason for a much more penetrating look at this “overarching” target.

4. TR4: Process of Policy and Legislative Reform in Favour of CBNRM Supported

COMPASS sees its role in this sphere as strengthening the capacity of intermediate groups to represent local views. To achieve this there have been four main strategies.

4.1 SR4A: Mechanisms for Participation in the Development of CBNRM Guiding Principles Created

4.1.1 Support the Efforts of Parliamentary Committee on the Environment.

The support was meant to assist the committee so that it might become an effective agent for advocacy on CBNRM issues. Before significant progress could be made the Committee was dissolved and has been replaced by one (Parliamentary Committee on Agriculture and Natural Resources) which is much more heavily weighted towards specifically agricultural issues.

4.1.2 Support the Efforts of the Advocacy Task Force.

This loose grouping has focussed on the single issue of land reform. Its main objective was to slow down the passage of the government’s new land policy so as to allow for greater public consultation on some of the clauses that were deemed to be contentious. The group was initially led by the Director of CURE who had particular gifts in this field, carried the group along and gave it focus. After he stood down early in the year the group has lacked leadership and has drifted. The government was certainly not seeking outside comment on its land policy reforms and the NGO community lacked skills in the complexities of the legal issues relating to land. In consequence the task force has failed in its objectives of slowing down and modifying the new policy. A national conference was to be organised in January 2002 to follow up on the efforts of the task force but the experience of 2001 does not give much hope that this will make a significant difference to government policy. Oxfam has been the prime mover and financier of this initiative and the role of COMPASS has been marginal.

This activity does raise issues with regard to COMPASS indicators. Firstly, given the peripheral role played by COMPASS in this task force, it is not clear why the Project should claim the activities as one of its achievements. Secondly there is the tendency to rely on the fulfilment of numerical targets rather than solid results. The fact that the group met three or four times is of no significance if those meetings made no progress towards their stated goals. Finally, COMPASS claims a 50% success rate for achieving the task force's objectives whilst the reality is that it failed completely to slow down or modify the government's land policy legislation.

4.2 ***SR4B: Capacity to Evaluate and Revise Existing Policies Strengthened***

4.2.1 *Strengthen the Policy Analysis Skills of NGOs.*

The object of this is to increase NGO capability in advocacy and policy change. COMPASS funded half a dozen staff from NGOs to attend international workshops on advocacy. Hopefully this has honed their skills and will be of use to them in the future. At the same time there are three factors militating against NGOs in the sphere of CBNRM advocacy.

(1) **Government is Cautious.** Even though the government of Malawi sometimes accepts comment or criticism of its policies by "civil society", it usually does so when pressurised by donors. More particularly there is an ambiguous and at times negative attitude towards the major NGOs on the part of the departments involved in natural resource management.

(2) **NGOs' Voice is Weak.** In the light of the above it is most unlikely that a single NGO would be able to have any significant impact on changing government policy. This would require a well-led and powerful coalition that could mobilise donor pressure for its cause and provide government with a broad enough body of opinion to demand a response. At present there is little indication that the NGO community in Malawi is prepared to eschew jealousy, sink differences, espouse a common policy and pool resources to achieve a particular goal in the realm of advocacy.

(3) **Advocacy not a Budget Priority.** Advocacy is a new concept for most NGOs in Malawi and is not therefore included in their core budget. There is a reluctance to divert funds from their main activities to a poorly understood function. As a result advocacy is likely to find itself far back in the queue when funds are being allocated.

In the light of the above factors it is not easy to assess the impact of the NGO staff who have been the recipients of training in advocacy funded by COMPASS. The implications of this are discussed in a later section.

4.2.2 *Promote Increased Awareness of CBNRM Approaches among Traditional Authorities.*

COMPASS had planned to achieve this through formal workshops and field visits for TAs. For various reasons these plans have been dropped and any contact with this level of Malawian society is now simply ancillary to other COMPASS activities.

Recommendation

One of the major policy issues facing CBNRM in Malawi is the relative role of the natural resource departments and the district authorities and district environmental officers. There is abundant scope for confusion and delay in this area as well as potential for positive development. At first sight it would seem odd that COMPASS has not become more heavily involved in this issue but the dominance of the DANIDA supported work in the field of decentralisation has made it difficult for other players to contribute greatly to the discussion. Should DANIDA appreciably reduce its role for any reason then COMPASS would have to give this issue greater attention.

The review team was only able to find scant evidence that COMPASS has had a significant impact on the reform of policies and legislation in favour of CBNRM.

5. Major Findings and Discussion

5.1 *Assessing Overall Impact*

COMPASS has set itself a major target of having 40% of customary land under improved natural resource management in its target districts by the end of its project life. This mission believes that COMPASS should seriously reconsider this goal as a primary target of its effectiveness. The extractive and exploitative management of Malawi's environment by the rural population is driven by the shortage of land for agriculture, the inadequacy of the existing resource base for providing the fuel and timber requirements of the population on a sustainable basis and the poverty which limits households' ability to improve on their land management and which drives them to exploit their few natural resources for survival.

The current situation is that farm size is declining, the woodland resource base is getting poorer and rural poverty is getting deeper. Under these circumstances it is difficult to see how the rural population is going to reverse the trend of recent years on the massive scale envisaged by COMPASS. Both empirical evidence and casual observation point to the fact that the proportion of customary land under improved natural resource management on farms and woodland is declining and not increasing. By holding up this target as a major goal of its work COMPASS risks the danger of being considered out of touch with the realities of the environmental situation in its target districts.

5.2 *Suggested Broad Thrust for the Future of Capacity Building, Training and Policy Reform*

The dominant impression of many in Malawi to-day is that the country has developed a remarkable amount of quite appropriate policies and legislation, that there is a wealth of writing about CBNRM but that examples of communities actively embarking upon the improved management of their local natural resources are extremely rare. This gives rise to statements like "what we need now is more practice not more policies". Such a reaction is understandable and COMPASS could fulfil a valuable role by pinpointing more accurately just which factors are preventing good

policies being transformed into action. COMPASS has received a plethora of proposals for action from various consultants and workshops over the past two years (20 new activities were proposed for the CBNRM Working Group by the first National CBNRM Conference) which it is presumably considering. Many of these, however, appear to deal with symptoms rather than root causes. For instance the extreme slowness of ministries and departments to ratify co-management agreements or community by-laws is too often attributed to flaws in the legislation rather than to an attitude of mind which is basically unsympathetic to the concept of CBNRM. It is suggested that COMPASS look more carefully at the fundamental attitudes which are hindering the development of sounder management of natural resources and then focus its attention on developing initiatives aimed at modifying inimical attitudes in communities, government departments and NGOs. Some examples of these are given below.

5.2.1 Communities: Much environmental degradation on communal land stems from fundamental problems of land shortage and poverty, which is beyond the competence of COMPASS to address. The dependency syndrome that stifles initiative and is particularly common in Malawi however, also hinders progress. Appropriate training and extension can change this. Social cohesion is breaking down in many communities and yet joint action is often required to preserve or restore their resource base. Jealousy hinders co-operation with other communities and yet in some cases (e.g. fisheries) only the participation of a broad population can be effective in achieving the desired result. All of this is well known, but too often the interventions of outsiders focus on symptoms rather than the root cause of a problem. The result is frequently an initiative that has to be continuously nursed and fed with perks to keep it alive.

5.2.2 Government Departments: Apart from the lack of drive and commitment which marks so much of Malawi's civil service to-day it is quite clear that a number of senior staff in the natural resource departments are unconvinced about the effectiveness of co-management and the capacity of communities to care for their natural resources. This is understandable in the light of past experience of exploitation and the lack of successful examples of CBNRM in Malawi. But policies have been formulated, legislation has been passed, the "policing" strategy has almost totally collapsed and new action is now essential. Tinkering with policies or focussing attention on field staff will have little impact until there is a change of heart in the senior echelons of the service. A further stumbling block is the unwillingness of senior staff to be "controversial" by raising sensitive issues or confronting powerful members of society. All too often community action is being stifled by the sight of the powerful flaunting conservation regulations and destroying a communal resource for their own benefit. Only senior government officials have the potential power to curb such detrimental activities and it will require a change of current attitudes to enable them to fulfil that role.

5.2.3 NGOs: It is much easier to design a project than to coax a reluctant and disjointed community to take some initiative on its own. In consequence a great number of so-called CBNRM activities are in reality NGO projects which have used grants, loans or other incentives to obtain local co-operation. There is certainly a place for projects, but these have to be distinguished from the challenge of getting communities to identify, plan and implement activities for

their own benefit. NGOs have to face up to this reality and change their attitudes accordingly. At the same time the NGO community often claims to represent “civil society” more effectively than other groups, yet it can only make its voice heard if there is close co-operation between a range of organisations with a common concern. Current attitudes of jealousy, mistrust and self-protection are all inimical to co-operation and will have to be overcome if the NGOs are to fulfil their claim of being a voice for the broad rural community.

6. Conclusion

COMPASS work to date has helped to build an increased body of knowledge about the challenges facing CBNRM in Malawi through the production of a range of new publications. It has fostered government and NGO activities to provide a more favourable environment for community based initiatives. It has identified and funded training programmes for staff and communities that have largely been appreciated by the participants. There remain attitudes at all levels of Malawian society which are inimical to CBNRM and it is these which go a long way to explain the shortage of successful examples of communities taking the lead in improving the quality of management of their environment. COMPASS would provide a valuable service by more clearly identifying those attitudes which are currently preventing good policies being translated into tangible action, and then developing appropriate strategies to change that situation.

7. Recommendations

This final section offers examples of the kind of activities that COMPASS might consider in order to deal with the issues raised above.

7.1 Capacity Building

- (1) Use the CBNRM Working Group meetings to identify and discuss attitudes, reservations and professional concerns inhibiting the implementation of co-management policies.
- (2) Use the material developed from (1) above for a meeting of departmental directors and regional officers to look for ways of changing attitudes and proposing definite lines of action to initiate real change.
- (3) Identify genuine examples of effective CBNRM and arrange site visits for directors and regional staff as appropriate.
- (4) COMPASS could use its influence with the Working Group and Parliamentary Committee to encourage these to face up to the adverse impact on CBNRM of the gross misuse of natural resources by powerful bodies and individuals so that they might use their authority to obtain support for appropriate action at the highest level.
- (5) Sponsor a more detailed survey of NGO activities in the field of NRM that distinguishes projects from community inspired initiatives. Use this material for a

meeting of the policy makers of leading NGOs as a means of highlighting the need, where necessary, for a change of approach.

(6) Foster the formation of associations of VNRCs where such larger groups are essential for effective action.

7.2 Training

(1) In training of VNRC and VNRMC members pay more attention to the reasons why they formed a committee (hope of finance, allowances, prestige, greater exploitative access to a resource or a genuine concern for their local environment?) and use training to strengthen positive attitudes.

(2) Make sure that appropriate support for co-management exists at the regional and district levels before embarking on extension training for co-management of junior field staff.

(3) Sift out the inappropriate examples from the Best Practice CBNRM list. Look at some of the small but effective village initiatives of past trainees (e.g. forestry in Nkhotakota).

(4) Check that the site visits are really appropriate to the needs of the visitors.

(5) Take measures to limit possible inter-group jealousy in the organisation of site visits.

(6) Organise site visits for the senior staff of NGOs to help them to distinguish between “projects” and genuine CBNRM.

7.3 Policy Reform

(1) Prior to embarking on any policy reform ensure that it is a weakness in the policy which is hindering development and not the attitude of key players.

(2) If there is a proven need for reform ensure that the crucial issues have been sharply focussed and that those leading the pressure for change have the technical competence to make a coherent case.

(3) It may be necessary to look for an alternative to CURE as the leader of an advocacy group for environmental issues. COMPASS could help develop the necessary co-operation between the leading NGOs to provide alternative leadership.

With all the above COMPASS should continue its good work of adopting policies which seek to move attitudes away from making allowances the basic reason for participation in any activity to one which sees value in the activity itself.

D. EFFICIENT LIAISON, COMMUNICATION AND INFORMATION EXCHANGE

1. TR2: Efficient Liaison/Communication/Information Exchange Mechanisms Between/Among CBNRM Programmes Established

In this target result COMPASS is involved in establishing formal and informal methods of communication among CBNRM organisations and Partners by:

- developing computer based information to improve the quantity and quality of information collected and disseminated;
- launching public awareness campaigns targeting rural communities; and
- holding workshops and conferences to strengthen linkages to disseminate best practices in CBNRM.

1.1 Assessing Overall Impact

COMPASS has made customer surveys by sending out 150 questionnaires in 1999/2000 and 120 in 2000/2001. The response rate was 7% and 14% in the respective years. COMPASS will need to explore other ways of getting feedback from partners. It is still worthwhile noting that of those that responded, 100% in 1999/2000 and 70% in 2000/2001 indicated that COMPASS information exchange and liaison is good to excellent. Secondly, at least 90% were able to name CBNRM best practices and approaches.

1.2 SR2A: CBNRM Computer Information Network Designed

1.2.1 The Internet

The COMPASS website <http://www.compass-malawi.com> is fully functional. COMPASS monitors the website traffic by recording the number of hits and tracking the number of visits to the site (found to be 12 minutes on the average). Website development has involved customising the Technical and Administrative Management Information Systems (TAMIS) and linking key partners to the system over the Internet; establishing the Geographic Information System (GIS) capabilities at the COMPASS offices; creating the COMPASS site on the World-Wide Web to provide up to date information to all partners and other parties that have access to the web. Redesigning, reconstructing and updating of the site was completed to forge linkages with TAMIS. COMPASS recently (beginning of 2002) announced to 200 e-mail linked partners and customers the availability of this improved facility. The facility enables all COMPASS documents and internal reports to be downloaded from the site as Word documents. Word versions are also available for the Reference Catalogue, Partner Directory and ListServe Directory. A special feature of the facility is that the active versions of these databases, as they get accessed via the website, are real-time duplicates of data housed in the TAMIS, thus ensuring access to up-to-date versions generated every time maintenance is done.

A major constraint to wide availability of information via the web is that many institutions and individuals are yet to be equipped with computers, especially in Government Departments. A clear testimony of this is when COMPASS carried out a customer survey using e-mail. The response was less than 15% in two successive

years. Wherever computers are linked to internet, however, there are other additional problems such as limited knowledge and skills in internet and web browsing, fear of computer viruses, problems of access and capacity within the telecommunications system, and sometimes usernames and passwords are forgotten.

Recommendation

While communication by e-mail and Internet is fast and convenient, the limited availability of computers especially in Government institutions suggests that more conventional methods need to be used also. COMPASS should strengthen collaboration with avenues that already exist in partner organisations for the dissemination of CBNRM activities.

1.2.2 GIS Training

Training of Environmental District Officers (EDO) in the Geographic Information Systems (GIS) has been postponed several times as a result of lack of a stable home for GIS training. Deletion of GIS software packages from the Bunda College computers has been partly responsible for the delays, but may indicate competing alternative uses for the computers available.

Recommendation

A case is made for a separate project of GIS training that can be in form of a COMPASS grant to a University College for setting up computer hardware and software to ensure sustained capacity building in this area over the next two years.

1.3 SR2B: Public Awareness Campaigns Launched

1.3.1 Daily Newspaper Articles on CBNRM

COMPASS has set a target of 9 news articles per week by 2004. The actual achievement for 2001 was 3 per week as assessed for key newspapers: The Daily Times, The Nation, Malawi News and Saturday Nation (Source: *Document 38, COMPASS Performance and Impact, 2000/2001, December 2001, COMPASS*).

1.3.2 Radio and Television Programmes on CBNRM

COMPASS' target by 2004 is that 8 programmes on the environment will be aired every week on the National Radio (Malawi Broadcasting Corporation) and television (TV-Malawi). So far the number has averaged 2 per week.

1.3.3 Schools Outreach

COMPASS has set a target of 2000 schools to be reached by 2004 in the dissemination of environmental education materials. So far the main vehicle has been the *Nantchengwa* magazine publication that COMPASS supports through a small grant to the Wildlife and Environmental Society of Malawi (WESM). For both 2000 and 2001, the number of *Nantchengwa* copies distributed to schools amounted to 3500 and 4000 in each year.

COMPASS promotes and supports communication strategies that target the community groups and NGOs most likely to be receptive to CBNRM messages in order to fulfil the objective of sustainable management of resources by communities. Access to information is a crucial element in decision-making. Creating understanding and awareness about the development role of CBNRM enables the formation of partnerships and enhances community transformation (*Document 15, A Strategic Framework for CBNRM media campaigns in Malawi, August 2000, COMPASS*).

About 30% of Malawians have occasional access to newspapers. The NSO's figure from the 1998 population census on ownership of radios is 49.6%. This shows that both the print and electronic media in Malawi are still limited in their outreach to the majority of the communities. Additional avenues for campaigns are, therefore, needed.

Recommendations

COMPASS has set the targets for the above indicators to achieve public awareness. Except for the *Nantchengwa* magazine, all the targets that COMPASS has set appear rather ambitious and may need revising. Regarding outreach through newsletters, COMPASS early in the project decided to use well established partner publications on an as-needed basis to promote CBNRM, for example, through CURE, WESM, TSP, Blantyre Synod etc. Now that COMPASS has many CBNRM-related materials, these efforts should be strengthened.

It is clear from the results above that more work needs to be done to increase coverage of CBNRM issues on both the radio/TV and the daily newspapers, and launch a vigorous campaign. More partnerships need to be supported so that they will carry out their strategies more fully.

The following example illustrates the achievement of such a partnership through launching of the public awareness campaign on the closed season:

The Fisheries Department participated in the "Media Training for CBNRM Public Awareness Partnerships, March 21 – 27, 2001) sponsored by COMPASS, aimed at providing practical, hands on training in developing public awareness campaigns and Action Plans (*Document 33, Media Training for CBNRM Public Awareness, June 2001, COMPASS*). The Department completed the take home "COMPASS Media Campaign Action Plan" focusing on the Fisheries Department public awareness campaign on the reason for closed-season on Lake Malombe and southern Lake Malawi.

The mission learned from the Fisheries Department that they first made a survey to identify information gaps, then thematic notes were developed and given to a professional firm to prepare 5 jingles and 10 poems that were subsequently broadcast by the Fisheries Department in the "Usodzi Walero" programme on the national radio. The Department now proposes the intensification of the campaign.

Recommendations

COMPASS has evidently considered proposals from NGOs aimed at increasing public awareness on natural resource management but it has only been possible to

support one of these because all of them had large overhead costs and the geographical and technical scope of the campaigns was very limited. The mission observes that COMPASS support to the Fisheries Department was most appropriate and wishes to suggest that a further COMPASS grant could be used to buy air time to secure prime slots for messages by the Fisheries Department. Acknowledging COMPASS' sponsorship will also be possible – something that could not be done under “**Usodzi Walero**” that was already sponsored by another donor.

There were 21 participants at the “Media Training for CBNRM Public Awareness” session. A number of these could develop a similar programme to that done by the Fisheries Department for further campaign development, especially focusing on targeting rural communities. COMPASS should make follow-up contacts with these partners to assess, on a demand-driven basis, whether other broad-based programmes can be supported or mounting of another media training session should be considered.

1.4 SR2C: Relationship among CBNRM Programmes Strengthened

1.4.1 CBNRM Conference.

The first National Conference on CBNRM in Malawi was held from 16th to 18th May 2001 in Blantyre under the theme “Putting Policies in Practice” (*Document 30, May 2001, COMPASS*). Over 80 participants, with about 13% female participation, met to develop a strategic plan that will help Malawi implement an effective CBNRM programme in the coming years. Female representation was rather low at the conference. COMPASS should look into this for a better gender balance in future conferences.

1.4.2 Library Usage

The number of Library users per month and those requesting COMPASS documents has increased from 2 per month in 2000 to 8 per month in 2001. This is expected to rise to meet the 2004 target of 15 users per month. COMPASS documents appear to be readily available compared with other programmes. In 2001 two visitors from US Library of Congress visited COMPASS to explore ways of ensuring possible document exchange arrangements.

E. THE SMALL GRANTS PROGRAMME

1. TR5: CBNRM Small Grant Management Services to Finance Special CBNRM Opportunities Established

The objectives of this targeted result are (*Document 2, Small Grant Manual, Second Edition, April 2000*):

- to promote the sustainable use of natural resources;
- to develop replicable models for promoting sustainable CBNRM initiatives; and
- to provide assistance to viable natural resources management proposals that are not likely to be funded by other programmes.

1.1 Grant Application Criteria

The grants are given to community groups, local associations, private enterprises, national and international NGOs and Government agencies. Priority grant activities are in two categories:

1. *Natural Resource Management*. These grants are awarded to community based groups for initiatives in natural resource management.
2. *Capacity Building Grants*. These grants are given to NGOs or government departments to develop the capacity of community groups and provide technical skills and services in natural resource management. In order for an NGO to qualify for a grant, it should be well established, have official recognition by registration, have capacity for competent administration of funds, and have strong working relationship with the local community.

Criteria for qualification for a grant have been divided into three categories:

1. **Technical**. The grant should comply with the following:
 - ❑ Demonstrate social and ecological sustainability
 - ❑ Not have any risk of environmental degradation
 - ❑ Have a concrete plan of feasible activities to be implemented
 - ❑ Technologies chosen for project activities must be appropriate to the needs and capabilities of the community
 - ❑ Not be in conflict with on-going activities or projects in the community
2. **Social Criteria**. Social criteria cover three areas:
 - ❑ *Community participation*. The community must be actively involved in identification, planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.
 - ❑ *Gender sensitivity*. Grant activities must integrate main processes of decision making, activity implementation and sharing of costs and benefits equitably with men and women.
 - ❑ *Social equity*. Benefits accruing from the project activities should benefit the community proportionately to the levels of individual input.
3. **Other General Criteria**. The project should not have any negative impact on communities, must use local resources, enhance self reliance and sustainability etc.

1.2 Overall Impact

The mission first discusses the overall impact and secondly, the three sub-results of the small grants programme.

COMPASS has defined six overall impact indicators for the assessment of TR5, namely: percent of grants completed; percent of grants achieving targets; percent of female beneficiaries; percent of grants demonstrating positive environmental and socio-economic impact; percent of grant projects sustained one year after COMPASS grant period; and value of supplemental income generated by grants.

1.2.1 *Percent of Grants Completed*

According to COMPASS (*Document 38, COMPASS Performance and Impact: 200/2001, December 2001*), 36 grants have been awarded so far (see Annex 6 for details), which is 80% of the target number (45) of COMPASS Small Grants. Table 1 gives the categories of grants. The mission visited 30 of these and interviewed the grantees.

Table 1: Categories of Project Grants

Project Type	Number Of Grantees	Number Interviewed
1. Afforestation	11	9
2. Capacity building	5	3
3. Beekeeping	3	3
4. Alternative Energy	3	3
5. Aquaculture	2	2
6. Wildlife Management	4	3
7. Herbal Production	1	1
8. Mushroom Production	1	1
9. Fruit Tree Nursery	2	2
10. Sustainable Agricultural Organic Farming	1	1
11. Other	3	2
Total	36	30

1.2.2 *Percent of Grants Achieving Targets*

Data from grantee performance reports and field assessments by COMPASS shows that the percentage of grants achieving their targets was 55%.

1.2.3 *Percent of Female Beneficiaries*

COMPASS has made an assessment of 19 projects. These showed that the average percentage of women beneficiaries is 69%. A more thorough discussion of gender issues of these initiatives is given in Section F below.

1.2.4 *Percent of Grants Demonstrating Positive Environmental and Socio-economic Impact*

From the results of field assessments by COMPASS and from grantee performance reports, 55% of the grants have shown positive environmental and socio-economic impacts.

1.2.5 *Percent of Grant Projects Sustained One Year after COMPASS Grant Period*

Not enough data is available to determine whether the 23 grants that had received their full disbursements could be sustained one year after COMPASS stopped funding. During interviews, only a few indicated to the mission that they were ready to stand on their own, but the majority were hoping that COMPASS could renew their awards.

1.2.6 *Value of Supplemental Income Generated by Grants*

Assessment of 12 grants by COMPASS has shown total income generation of US\$6,000 from sales achieved as a result of direct production under the projects. This is far less than the year's target of US\$50,000 for 2001. However, the economic value of tree seedlings, amounting to over 2.3 million, raised in at least 10 projects was not included. If this was taken into account, the target could have been exceeded. The mission was able to get an indication of such achievements. For example, Matindi Youth Organisation realised MK85,000 while NICE realised MK104, 650. In addition, grants with activities involving honey production and guinea fowl rearing had not yet started marketing their produce.

1.3 *SB5A. Manual of Grant Application and Management Procedures Developed.*

COMPASS has produced the following manual in English: *Document 2, Small Grants Manual, Second Edition, April 2000*. This has been translated into the two main local languages of **ChiChewa** and **ChiTumbuka**, both of which have been extensively distributed. The manual clearly spells out procedures for applicants to follow, including the proposal review process, grant reporting, monitoring and evaluation, and the contracting arrangements. For example, the proposal review process involves submission of an expression of interest (EOI) or concept paper as the first step on which clearance for development of a full proposal could be based by the review panel. In reality, many applications have been received as letters or full proposals or concept papers that were detailed enough to be regarded as full proposals. In general, there is little data to show that the manuals are being utilised when they should. This may be attributed to the low literacy levels and possibly inadequate orientation. COMPASS, therefore, has adopted a flexible procedure by basing some of the evaluations on EOIs.

COMPASS set the target of 187 EOIs and 76 proposals by 2004. So far, 144 concept papers and 73 letters expressing interest in applying for a grant have been received. A total of 252 applications have been treated as fully-fledged proposals.

1.4 SB5B. Clear Selection Criteria for Awards Established

The review process for the proposals is clearly stated in the Grants Manual. COMPASS has set the target of 45 grants by 2004. Already, 36 have been awarded. These make up a total obligation of US\$340,475.00 (MK22,026,459.00), which is 62% of the budgetary provision of US\$550,000.00 for Small Grants. By the October – December 2001 quarter, the number of grants fully disbursed was 23 (i.e. 64% of the awards made so far), but three of these had been terminated before the end of their funding period: two owing to lack of capacity to implement the project effectively and one owing to disbanding the organisation. In addition to the disbursements, the total money obligated and awaiting disbursement is US\$167,000.

1.5 SB5C. Technical Assistance Provided to Applicants and Recipients

Data from COMPASS shows that 55% of the grantees have demonstrated acceptable grant management skills as defined by the following functions:

- Meaningful consultation with beneficiaries for decision making;
- Adequate financial management mechanisms; and
- Operational monitor performance system for adaptive management.

From the visits to 30 projects, including the three terminated projects, the mission was able to assess these indicators and draw some lessons.

Recommendation

The 36 disbursements made so far (out of a final targeted number of 45) show that the small grants programme is on schedule. The predominance of afforestation projects is understandable in view of the acute degradation being experienced throughout the country. However, since the COMPASS projects are meant to draw out lessons, it will be important in the remaining period of the Activity to fund other CBNRM projects that are underrepresented or absent in the above list.

2. Lessons Learned and Recommendations

In-depth interviews with grantees and service providers revealed many lessons. These have been summarised in Annex 7 while the lessons below and conclusions have been extracted.

- 2.1 A healthy relationship between NGO Service Providers and Government Extension Agents is important to provide synergy during project implementation. In Chikwawa this was achieved by the initiative taken by IEF to involve the Government Extension workers at the project initiation stage, including training, and this led to their active participation in rendering extension services to the project willingly.
- 2.2 The mission observes that choice of a project was sometimes made without careful examination of critical factors. For example, the making of portable clay stoves in Chikwawa was among the projects to be implemented, yet clay in Chikwawa is not readily available. Similarly, the choice of beekeeping by the Nkhotakota Dalitso Club has meant that the women walk long distances to the National Park where the beehives have been placed.

- 2.3 All the grantees expressed the need to extend the project beyond a one-year duration. The mission concludes that this may indicate a genuine concern. At the same time, not a single project that had obtained a second cycle of funding indicated that they were ready to stand on their own. The mission observes that the request for extension was mainly due to the need to consolidate project activities or to initiate similar activities in the neighbouring communities that did not participate in the original project.

Recommendation

The mission concludes that an 18-months grant period should be considered, with the second year carefully planned to ensure consolidation of mechanisms for asset maintenance. Although the duration of COMPASS grants is not fixed, the majority of the grantees visited had 12-months grants and showed indications that this period was too short, such as operations being initiated towards the end of the project, thus leaving little time for completion. Evidently, COMPASS does encourage grants to be about 12 months duration based on well-established principles and guidelines from SAGA (Southern African Grantmaking Association). However, the grants visited so far needed more time.

- 2.4 Two examples suggest that disbursements made directly to the community are to be preferred than through a service provider. First, funding to the Ndirande Women Briquettes Group was done through Nkhomano Centre for Development NGO. Secondly, funding to the Kalino Aquaculture Community was done through the Voice of the Voiceless NGO. In both cases, the beneficiary was disadvantaged until a change was made to funding the community directly. The above should, however, be qualified and weighed against other apparently successful arrangements of fund channelling through the following NGOs: ELDP funding communities in Nkhatabay; WVI(North) funding communities in Mzimba; IEF funding communities in Chikwawa; and NICE funding communities in Dedza.
- 2.5 There is a recurring problem of marketing of the project products. This applied especially to the marketing of briquettes. Both the Ndirande Women Briquettes Group and the Songani Community Care Group have been faced with unsold briquettes. Both groups said that almost always, a customer approaches them enthusiastically, buys the first lot, but never comes back to buy another lot. The Groups producing these briquettes know that this is due to the problem of excessive smoke that is produced, too much ash production and the comparatively lower durability when weighed against charcoal. Unfortunately, charcoal is readily available, and ranked first choice, as an alternative source of energy, while firewood is also preferred especially where it is readily available, for example, in the neighbourhood of Industrial Timbers in Blantyre and Songani in Zomba. The Songani Group has particularly experienced the marketing problem because of their use of sawdust. They have attempted to improve the briquette quality (reduce smoke emission) by adjusting the sawdust-to-paper ratio from 1:1 to 3:1. Still, this has not gained the market. For the Ndirande Group, dedicated customers of their briquettes

are EDETA and the Chiwembe Mushroom Production Group. These are probably less wary about the smoke since the briquettes are used outdoors for the steam boiler in mushroom production. In addition, the Ndirande briquettes are of a higher quality. The mission feels that with more vigorous marketing, there is scope for improved sales as it will take some time to change peoples attitudes.

Recommendation

Considerable marketing problems suggest that briquette marketing must first be solved before further replication of this activity is undertaken. The mission learned that several communities were contemplating briquette making. These are IEF-sponsored communities in Chikwawa and the Chipusile VNRMC in Ntcheu.

- 2.6 Youth Organisations that are well motivated to participate in productive community based activities offer a most promising avenue for cost-effective fund usage in NRM. Both the Matindi Youth Organisation in Blantyre and the Chisoti Youth Organisation in Nkhotakota are well organised and vibrant. Their activities in tree nursery care, fruit tree production, reforestation efforts and other social services are impressive, as well as their financial accountability. The mission observed two powerful incentives to spur them on. Firstly, the youth's desire to be trained is taken as adequate compensation for their involvement, when achieved, since new skills are acquired in leadership, nursery care, accounts, record keeping, proposal and report writing, care of tools, etc. In addition, if the training is done away from home, the idea of travelling to a new place to receive the training is in itself a motivating factor to participate fully. In this respect, the mission also observes that training has had a multiplier effect in the lives of committee members in most of the other COMPASS projects. For example, it was learned from the Mwaiwathu Group at Lake Chilwa that some committee members have used the knowledge of business planning, record keeping, accounts etc to set up or improve own businesses.

Secondly, the desire for the successes of these Youth Organisations to be publicised, especially on the radio and through invitations of high-profile visitors to their projects, when achieved, testifies to their national recognition and importance of their efforts. In this respect, the Youth Organisations are not the only ones wanting such publicity. The mission was informed by WVI when visiting their COMPASS projects in Mzimba that WVI(North) was appreciative of the efforts by COMPASS in bringing the media (TV team and reporters from the Nation newspaper), both of which disseminated WVI activities. On the part of listenership, a request was given to the mission when visiting the nursery belonging to Nkundadzuwa community under NICE projects in Dedza, concerning a community radio so that they should listen to NRM programmes. This is an example of how important the media are regarded.

Recommendation

More Youth Organisations should be encouraged to apply for COMPASS grants and efforts made to provide them with adequate training as these appear to hold much promise for the furtherance of CBNRM.

- 2.7 Three projects that were terminated by COMPASS, mainly because of accountability, were visited. These are: Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation project, Liwonde National Park VNRCs Development, and the Construction of a Training Block by LOMADEF.

Discussions with the Chairman of the Ndirande project revealed the complexity of the society in which this project is being implemented, but that greening of Ndirande Mountain through continued support to the committee is still a viable option. A summary of the interview with the Committee's Chairman appears in Annex 7. Of particular concern, however, is some evidence that COMPASS has not exhausted dialoguing with the Committee. For example, when the mission queried why the Committee has not been accountable, the Chairman was able to produce an apparently genuine receipt for K80,500 and handed it over to the mission that in turn gave to the accompanying COMPASS staff. Similarly, for the Liwonde case, the Department of National Parks and Wildlife asked the mission to appeal to COMPASS to make provision for a discussion since such an opportunity to be heard had not been given.

COMPASS, on the other hand shows that the grantees were consulted closely and detailed verbal and written communications were conducted. In both the above cases, the groups had proposed to change their implementation strategies for the projects and COMPASS found their proposals to be inappropriate or inadequate.

The mission is not in a position to align either way. The mission, nevertheless, feels that procedures for handling cases of this nature need to be refined by COMPASS, especially since one of the receipts meant to have assisted in solving the dispute was only recovered during the mission's visit.

Recommendation

COMPASS should put in place or clarify guidelines on how to handle cases involving grantees that may need to benefit out of face-to-face consultations when they have under-performed.

LOMADEF has an interesting history of development (see Annex 7) in the promotion of organic farming, originally centred at Ntonda in Ntcheu District but later spreading to the districts of Balaka, Machinga, Mangochi and Blantyre. When LOMADEF was disbanding, the COMPASS grant was yet to go through an audit. COMPASS confirmed to the mission that LOMADEF has accounted for all the funds that were disbursed. LOMADEF was registered as an NGO under the Trustees Incorporation Act of 1962 on 12th June 2000. It now has an official auditing firm, Graham Carr and Co., five Trustees and a new five-member Board of Governors. It is ready to start functioning again, but this will entirely depend on the decision to be made by COMPASS. The

events that led to suspension of LOMADEF (though not related to the management of COMPASS grant funds) were, according to COMPASS, unfortunately linked to financial mismanagement within the organisation and this led to in-fighting and withdrawal of key donor support.

- 2.8 The majority of the grantees commended COMPASS staff on excellent monitoring through frequent visits and on-site training to correct things when they were going wrong. A notable exception was the Chitsanzo group in Lilongwe that expressed the need for closer support and training. It was felt that visits were rushed and the grantees were not given adequate time to ask questions. In particular, training and support in accounting procedures had not received enough attention and the group was unsure about accounting principles.
- 2.9 The COMPASS' financial access and reporting procedures have impacted on the grantees in four ways. Firstly, some grantees felt that the accounting procedure is a complicated process due to the requirement to fill many forms, and that there is need to simplify this. Secondly, slow communication between remote grantees and COMPASS was highlighted (especially by ELDP and WVI) to have delayed project progress since further disbursements depend on receipt by COMPASS of the retired accounts such that the lag time to the next tranche is too long. Some grantees, like WVI(North) have solved this problem by physically making a special trip to Blantyre to deliver the receipts. Thirdly, the Saopampeni Group in Salima district, being illiterate, has been disadvantaged through Bank delays due to technicalities such that the Group sometimes has had to go to Salima at least three times to complete one Bank transaction. Fourthly, the mission got the impression that there is a strict requirement by COMPASS for an independent signatory for voucher approval. This has caused anxiety where such a signatory is the single authorised person, and no-one else is available as dictated by the institutional structure; that person may not be available when needed.
- 2.10 It has been observed that conflicts between the chiefs and VNRMCs are likely to arise when the powers of the chiefs to control the resources are perceived to be threatened, or when the chiefs are sidelined by the natural resources committees. The mission cites two examples. Firstly, the Ndirande VNRMCs' power to allocate plots for reforestation has caused disagreements between them and the Chiefs. Secondly, the chiefs bordering Lake Chilwa in the Zomba and Machinga districts have similarly not co-operated with the BVCs. The exceptions are the chiefs in Phalombe District.
- 2.11 A participatory monitoring system was utilised by grantees to various degrees. Where it was properly developed and used, there were important corrections and gains made. For example, the Ndirande and Songani Briquette Groups were able to adjust content of materials used to improve briquette quality; the Kalino Aquaculture Group in Zomba were able to adjust the stocking rate of fingerlings by monitoring breeding rates of mature fish; and the Chiwembe Mushroom Production Group were able to adjust the moisture content of their straw to strike the most optimal level for colonisation of the mushroom spawn. Where a monitoring system was not put in place, the project faced major

problems. For example, the grantee of the Chigumula Fish Promotion Project failed to achieve yields because there was no monitoring of fish growth until it was realised at the prescribed harvest date 8 months later that the fish had not grown.

Recommendation

COMPASS should continue to provide training in participatory monitoring and should ensure that the grantees use the knowledge in running their own projects.

- 2.12 Projects that utilise relatively advanced technologies are less likely to be sustainable. While it is too early to make a final judgement, already community policing of the closed season (December 2001 to April 2002) on Lake Chilwa using boats fitted with engines could not be carried out by the BVC because of lack of fuel. Once funding from COMPASS stopped, the BVC also ground to a halt. The committee had only K10,500 in the bank while they wished they had K50,000. The mission learned about the Committee's efforts to hire out the boats to generate funds, but they faced steep competition from other boats on the lake. The mission observes that there is a tendency at the community level to regard viable income generating activities as those involving advanced technologies.
- 2.13 For example, the BVC expressed the desire to own and operate a maize mill or minibus or pick up motor vehicle or fishing boat as business enterprises, although guinea fowl rearing was given as first choice that COMPASS should be asked to fund. The Saopampeni group in Salima also wished for a maize mill. From a different perspective, BERDO in Ntcheu district expressed the desire to be sponsored to own a minibus and a pick up motor vehicle to facilitate exchange visits and the running of other NRM activities by the monitoring and supervising committee. BERDO clearly stated that they already have the financial capacity to meet the running costs of such vehicles through their own community fund-raising efforts. This latter request is perhaps a viable proposition, considering that BERDO has been built up to a capable institution. A related request concerning transportation arose from the Chipusile VNRC in Ntcheu where the service provider (the Forestry Department) made a two-pronged request involving a motor cycle to enable quick monitoring by the service provider and pedal bikes for VNRCs to enable their movements to meetings. This is perhaps the most practical solution to the long distances involved.
- 2.14 Taking the subject of appropriate technology further, the mission observed during a visit to ELDP site at Nkholola village in Nkhatabay that the design of the micro-irrigation project included pumping water from a small dam built in the middle of a stream channel to small reservoirs up on the flanking slopes to irrigate plots owned by individuals by gravity. ELDP had already purchased motorised pumps for micro-irrigation, including one for the Nkholola site. Discussions with ELDP showed that a contingency plan had not been made in case there was failure of the pumps either as a result of fuel unavailability or mechanical breakdown. For example, treadle pumps were not included. In any

case, it is not certain whether the treadle pumps would raise water over the head existing at the site.

Recommendation

COMPASS should re-examine the criteria for project screening to include an evaluation of the appropriateness of the technology being proposed, particularly with respect to technical sustainability.

- 2.15 A vigorous community sensitisation programme paves the way for their mobilisation and improved relationship with Government Agencies. The DNPW and the Forestry Department are the two Government Agencies that particularly need this intervention. In the case of the DNPW at the Liwonde National Park, the increased frequency of interactions with the communities under the COMPASS project has led to an improved relationship between the community and the DNPW personnel, through which 55 VNRCs have been formed. Furthermore, the new Liwonde National Park Area Advisory Committee was formed as a result of the increased understanding arising from training of the committees, thus addressing an institutional linkage gap that existed between the village level and the regional level. It is to be noted that the COMPASS project has had a synergistic effect with prior sensitisation that CRECCOM carried out in the same area.
- 2.16 The mission found evidence of undue interference by some of the Government service providers in the running of COMPASS projects by communities (to be called Scenario 1), while there was also further evidence that COMPASS had not laid down clear procedures to guide the relationship between the client community and Government service provider (to be called Scenario 2). For example, the Linthipe River rehabilitation project in Salima district by the Kamapeka Environmental Group was initially facilitated by a dedicated Forestry official who prematurely got transferred. Unfortunately, in this Scenario 1, his successor had no interest in the project and never visited the project site. Instead it is alleged by the VNRMC's Treasurer that the Forestry official demanded large amounts of cash from the committee that later went unaccounted for. The Treasurer himself had problems in record keeping and following accounting procedures. COMPASS had no choice but to terminate the grant and let the law take its course. It is ironic that some of the very successful COMPASS projects, such as BERDO and Chisasile both in Ntcheu, and to some extent Ntenje VNRMC in Mangochi, have used Government officials of similar professional standing.

In the case of the Saopampeni Group (Scenario 2), a largely illiterate group, the Government service provider had actually provided the service, i.e. training, but there was serious misunderstanding when it came to meeting the cost of the training, apparently from the community's project budget. The Saopampeni community on one hand accused the DNPW official of grabbing money from them while DPNW official maintained that the money was to meet bills. On the other hand, COMPASS cautioned DNPW officials to deal fairly with the community. The result of all this was strained relationships.

Recommendation

It will remain a source of conflict if a service provider is left to be paid from the community's project budget for rendering a service, especially when the community is illiterate. The mission recommends that other sources of funding should be identified and separated from the main budget held by the community.

- 2.17 Natural Resources Management projects can be a source of frustration and discouragement when they are not able to yield income quickly where this is the main expected benefit. For example, all the beekeeping projects (Dalitso Club in Nkhotakota, Chisasila Project in Nkhatabay, Chitsanzo Club in Lilongwe, Ntenje VNRMC in Mangochi, NICE community projects in Dedza) had one characteristic in common, namely, slow colonisation of the beehives. During the mission's visit, only Chisasila said they have succeeded once to harvest honey from the first two beehives after a long time. Through visits, the grantees have learned that bees can manually be transferred into beehives to help colonisation and they are exploring this possibility. However, beekeeping groups are now making requests to COMPASS to diversify into other projects such as mushroom growing and aquaculture (for Dalitso Club) and cane-rat farming (for Chitsanzo Club) to generate income quickly. The Chitsanzo Club further suggested exploiting an opportunity regarding marketing of honey. The club suggested obtaining a grant from COMPASS to buy honey from beekeeping groups in Rumphi where markets are limited, package the honey and sell in Lilongwe to generate money for the club.
- 2.18 It is of interest to note that income generation is not the only primary benefit that motivates communities. For example, in Chiradzulu district, there are 30 herbal medicines that have been established by Hope Humana People To People, each planted with 28 species of medicinal plants. Here, the primary interest is to have a sustainable supply of herbal medicines. The mission noted, through a visit to one site, that the plants, though still very young, are already being utilised, some so heavily that their establishment is threatened.
- 2.19 NGO service providers, though impressively committed, tend to take on too much to implement and in the process overwhelm supervising officers in the field, thus possibly compromising quality of service delivery. For example, only one or two ELDP officers were supervising the range of COMPASS activities, replicated at three sites in Nkhatabay, apart from running other ELDP projects, and this meant having tight schedules that permitted little flexibility. The COMPASS projects included guinea fowl rearing, beekeeping, micro-irrigation, afforestation nurseries and field planting, making of mud stoves, and vegetable growing. A further complication was that the supervising personnel were themselves not trained in some of the activities such as micro-irrigation and guinea fowl rearing and so could not handle the training of communities in a timely manner. The same was found to apply to some NICE projects in Dedza. The mission learned that training had not been given to the project groups. In fact there was confusion about what to do with *Gliricidia* that was ready in the nursery for planting out as an agro-forestry species, and the Supervising officer appeared not to know himself. In these NICE projects, where coverage extended over the districts of Dedza,

Ntcheu and Salima, COMPASS had to intervene and reduce the geographical scope to only Dedza since it was becoming impossible for one person from NICE to supervise the three districts effectively (*Document 27, COMPASS Grantee Performance Report: 2000, March 2001, p.47*).

Recommendation

COMPASS should provide further guidelines to the evaluation panel to critically examine project proposals that tend to be overly diversified and ambitious so as to make them more focussed and gain on maximising impact.

- 2.20 There are many communities that are unable to understand that CBNRM activities are to their advantage and that paying them to protect their own environment is as strange as paying them to sleep in their own houses. Unfortunately, where such a work-for-reward approach has been made by other funding agencies in CBNRM, the communities have been misled profoundly and remain confused, so that much civic education will be needed to reverse the damage.

Recommendation

It is apparent that standardised procedures for CBNRM implementation cannot be achieved because there are major coordination problems within and across Ministries and service providers. Through the CBNRM Working Group, COMPASS should, however, continue to lobby for the establishment of the principle that service providers will only work with communities on NRM activities if those same communities make commitments to share costs. There is danger that some current CBNRM project implementation procedures are creating dependency by the community because CBNRM is being implemented as a welfare activity rather than a development activity.

F. GENDER ISSUES

1. Sampling

A total of 22 grantee projects were visited and interviewed. 15 of these are CBNRM groups, five NGOs and one government department (Department of National Parks). There are 10 categories of grants given by COMPASS as shown in Table 1:

Table 1: Categories of Project Grants

Project Type	Number Of Grantees	Number Interviewed
1. Afforestation	11	5
2. Capacity building	5	5
3. Beekeeping	3	2
4. Alternative Energy	3	1
5. Aquaculture	3	0
6. Wildlife Management	3	2
7. Herbal Production	1	0
8. Fruit Tree Nursery	2	1
9. Sustainable Agricultural Organic Farming	1	1
10. Other	4	0
Total	36	15

These projects were at different levels of implementation. In order to sample the sites to be visited, a number of factors were considered such as project type, age and performance of different projects. Selection of the projects visited was done with the COMPASS project staff. Some of the best practice sites could not be visited because of distance and the difficult logistical problems. The evaluation was during the rainy season. Therefore, some sites were inaccessible due to the wet and impassable roads e.g. Kalino Fish Farming Project could not be reached even after making two attempts. CBNRM projects are spread all over the country and there are long distances between them.

2. TR 1. Effective CBNRM Administrative and Technical Services Capacity Established

Some of the aspects have already been considered under Section C of this report. In this section, the evaluation focused on the following:

- CBNRM structure and membership by gender
- Achievements of CBNRM Working Group
- Capacity of CBNRM Working Group to facilitate integration of gender in CBNRM
- Recommended gender strategies for CBNRM Co-ordinating group

The main objective of the COMPASS Targeted Result 1 is to help establish an efficient and effective coordination of CBNRM activities in Malawi. COMPASS has facilitated the formation of a CBNRM Coordinating Group and Secretariat whose major role is to facilitate a national CBNRM strategic planning process, provide a

framework for ensuring that the CBNRM initiatives in Malawi are designed and implemented rationally, and that a CBNRM monitoring and evaluation system to assess the impact of CBNRM initiatives is instituted.

The Partners Association is an informal body whose role is to facilitate collaboration among CBNRM initiatives within Malawi, promote best practices in CBNRM and ensure efficient use of project resources. Members of the Association are NGOs implementing CBNRM in Malawi.

2.1 Membership of CBNRM Working Group

The CBNRM Working Group membership is fourteen, composed of ten government agencies, one NGO, an Environmental Endowment Trust, University of Malawi and one Traditional Authority. The group comprises of the following members: Department of Forestry, Department of National Parks and Wildlife, Department of Fisheries, Department of Land Resources and Conservation, Ministry of Water Development, Department of Energy, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Local Government, Ministry of Community Services (Gender), One Traditional Authority, Co-ordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment (CURE), Centre for Social Research of the University of Malawi (Chair), Malawi Environmental Endowment Trust, Department of Environmental Affairs(Secretariat). COMPASS is a non-voting advisor to the group.

There is a gender imbalance in the membership. Most of the members are men. Government agencies form the majority of the membership and usually there are very few women in the required positions. Occasionally, the Centre for Social Research of the University of Malawi sends a woman to the meetings but there is no regular female representative. The mission is aware that such imbalances in membership are beyond the influence of COMPASS and the Working Group since the Departmental Directors and Executives of member organisations decide representation.

It is not clear how the CBNRM Working Group intends to Integrate and promote the gender equity in the CBNRM policy issues. There is no gender expertise in the group to advise on what should be done for inclusion in the policy issues.

The individuals attending the meetings are usually technical people who are unlikely to influence policy change in the respective agencies.

2.2 Progress Made

The CBNRM working Group has so far achieved the following:

- Developed a Framework for Strategic Planning for CBNRM;
- Commissioned the first National Conference on CBNRM in Malawi to launch the strategic planning process;
- Developed a Strategic Plan for CBNRM in Malawi which has been approved by the National Council for the Environment; and
- Developed a Monitoring and Evaluation framework.

2.3 Gender Gaps in the CBNRM Activities

The CBNRM Working group has a responsibility of improving the implementation of CBNRM in Malawi. The group therefore acts as a policy shaping body and influences the strategic direction of the planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. It is, therefore, the role of the Working Group to influence the integration of gender equity and ensure that all CBNRM projects and activities are gender sensitive.

As mentioned above, gender representation in the Working Group is unbalanced and lacking gender expertise to provide technical know-how on issues related to gender equity. During the workshop on 'Principles and Approaches for CBNRM in Malawi' (*Document 10 of March 2000*) held in Blantyre from November 17th to 19th, 1999, the Working Group adopted 10 guiding principles for CBNRM in Malawi. Guiding principle number 8 states that 'CBNRM activities must be gender sensitive or gender neutral'. This principle has not been operational in the activities of the group.

In monitoring and evaluation of COMPASS Performance and Impact (COMPASS Performance and Impact: 1999/2000 page 7) it has been stated that community-based approaches will be established to collect data pertaining to gender specific indicators to facilitate assessment of positive and negative impacts of project activities to men, women and children. Through this process, community members will be aware of how the project affects different groups in different ways and can seek ways to mitigate negative impacts. This is an indication of commitment by COMPASS and the partners to mainstream gender in the project activities.

2.4 Conclusion and recommendations

Although a lot of effort has been made by COMPASS to promote the participation of women in the projects, there has not been a deliberate effort to make gender mainstreaming a matter of policy and practice. There is no policy framework for the Working Group to follow.

Recommendations

1. COMPASS should develop a gender policy that defines the organisation's core values and how gender equity should be mainstreamed in project supported activities. Within the remaining project life, COMPASS can develop the policy guidelines and provide technical assistance both to the working group, partners and the community.
2. In addition to formulation of a gender policy, COMPASS should develop a gender strategic framework that will give direction on CBNRM activity planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. The gender framework here means, analytic tools, methods and indicators to be used to strengthen the capacity to assess needs, plan and implement, more gender sensitive programs. The use of gender analytical tools will demonstrate a direct causal link between gender analysis and better performing programs.

3. The Working Group has already developed the Strategic Plan for CBNRM activities (*Document 35: Strategic Plan for CBNRM in Malawi: COMPASS, November 2001*). The strategic plan has four Strategic Actions. Gender should not be seen as an activity that needs to be implemented separately. Gender is a cross cutting issue and affects all aspects of CBNRM activities.

It is therefore recommended that gender be part of Strategic Action1: '*Developing a Commonly Understood CBNRM Concept and Vision*' (pages 2 and 3). The relevant sub-sections (referred to in the report as Action Steps) where gender should be part of are:

- 1.2. Generating Guiding Principles for CBNRM. Gender policy guidelines could be developed as part of this section.
- 1.3. Developing Consensus to CBNRM Strategic Direction.
- 1.4. Designing Strategic Planning Framework. The frameworks here will include gender analytical tools and gender indicators.
- 1.5. Determining Core Values to form basis for CBNRM.

In Strategic Action 4 Developing Planning and Implementation Tools (pages 8 and 9) gender should be part of sub-action 4.6. '*Review Participatory Methodology Toolbox to Assist Community Level Decision-Making, with special reference to CBNRM Aspects*'. This sub-action provides an opportunity to introduce and train people on gender analytic tools. Some of the participatory tools like PRA can be engendered to collect gender disaggregated data. This exercise can be part of the PRA training for capacity building planned for the first quarter of 2002.

4. The membership of the Working Group needs to be sensitised first and also have a gender expert who can provide direction of the group and activities. The Co-ordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment (CURE) is a member of the Working Group but the gender experts of the organisation do not attend the meetings. It is important to either have the gender experts attend or form a gender experts sub-group to assist in the issues of gender mainstreaming.

COMPASS has an advantage to introduce and facilitate implementation of gender equity in CBNRM because it funds the project. If gender is a policy, other partners will probably adopt their working procedures that appreciate the importance of gender.

COMPASS will however face some challenges. One will be inter-institutional harmonisation of gender approaches in project implementation. Not all organisations are gender sensitive. There may not be policies in organisations that support gender mainstreaming and that will complicate gender mainstreaming in COMPASS supported CBNRM activities with partners. In order to overcome this challenge, the Working Group will play a key role in streamlining the process of gender mainstreaming and ensuring harmonisation in gender approach.

The second challenge is lack of gender skills among partner organisations. This may limit the capacity for partners to integrate gender in their activities. COMPASS can develop the capacity through community mobilisation and training activities. Thus

advantage should be taken to integrate gender capacity building in the planned training programme.

3. TR4. Process of Policy and Legislative Reform in Favour of CBNRM Supported

3.1 Rationale for supporting policy reform

COMPASS is supporting the strengthening of capacity of intermediary organisations, NGOs and other advocacy groups, to ensure effective participation in policy formulation and that review perspectives are incorporated into relevant CBNRM policy formulation and implementation. Some of the policies and legislation being reviewed that affect implementation of CBNRM include, National Environment Management Act of 1996, National Environmental Policy of 1996, National Environmental Action Plan of 1994 and the Fisheries Management Act. The purpose here is not to develop a national policy specific to CBNRM but it is an effort to support review of policies that deal with natural resource and environment at sectors like fisheries, forestry, wildlife, etc. CBNRM is an approach to sustainable natural resource management in those different sectors.

COMPASS is supporting the process of policy reform because a policy framework review undertaken by COMPASS in 1999 shows that with respect to policy environment relating to CBNRM, there are areas of incompatibility and conflict. This notwithstanding, the overall conclusion of the study was that the policies and statutes are incredibly supportive of CBNRM in comparison to the enabling conditions of any country in the region. Because of this, COMPASS committed in late 1999 to focus their TR4 efforts on policy analysis and advocacy that was intended to help identify and remove bottlenecks to implementation of CBNRM initiatives. To ensure that the policy reform initiatives incorporate community views and needs, COMPASS is therefore strengthening capacity of NGOs and other advocacy groups to effectively participate in policy review.

The evaluation sought information to determine:

- Policy Issues being targeted
- Gender issues in the policies
- Constitution of Advocacy Task Force by gender
- Gender skills within Task Force

3.2 Progress made

COMPASS has managed to do the following:

- Commissioned an assessment of the commitment and capacity of grass-root organisations to participate and bring their concerns and opinions to key decision makers;
- Organised a national workshop to discuss ‘Grass-roots Advocacy for CBNRM Policy Reform,’ (Document 14, COMPASS July 2000) for the Parliamentary Committee on Environment and Partners.

- ❑ Supported development of action plans outlining requirements and procedural measures and capacity building to facilitate greater involvement of grass-root organisations in policy reform.
- ❑ Participating in the Advocacy Task Force (ATF) created mid 2000 to assist tackle issues on Land Policy related to natural resource management. Land reform was the focus of the ATF during 2001 because the process for land policy was weak since it lacked involvement and contributions of the grass-root organisations and communities.

A gender committee was formed to review the gender issues in the land policy reform and some of the issues raised include:

3.3 Membership of Advocacy Task Force

The Advocacy Task Force has a strong representation of NGOs that are very strong in gender advocacy issues. Some of these NGOs include OXFAM, Centre for Advice, Research and Education (CARER), Christian Service Commission (CSC), Churches Action in Relief and Development (CARD), National Initiative for Civic Education (NICE), Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace (CCJP), International NGO Training Centre (INTRAC), and Women and Law in Southern Africa (WILSA).

In addition, a committee that was created to look at the gender issues in the draft land policy is composed of renowned gender specialists in natural resource management like CURE and Women and Gender Advocacy.

3.4 Gender issues

1. The Advocacy Task Force has a strong gender representation, according to the COMPASS Director. Gender issues particularly on land reform, are being handled by the gender committee.
2. In the advocacy, the strategy is silent on gender

3.5 Conclusions and recommendations

COMPASS is actively involved in policy reforms on natural resource management through funding and participation in the various committees. This has provided opportunity and channels of communication for advocacy. The Parliamentary Committee on the Environment (now re-constituted as Parliamentary Committee on Agriculture and Natural Resources) and the National Council on Environment's CBNRM Working Group are active and genuine targets for grassroots advocacy.

COMPASS participates in the Advocacy Task Force presently involved in the Land Policy Review and a gender committee is working on gender issues on land policy. However, there are gender gaps in the advocacy strategy. The strategy is silent on gender issues. If the focus of the support is to create opportunity for the grass-root CBOs and community to advocate for changes in policy, then there should be an understanding of the issues that affect men and women and how they can be empowered to participate.

There are opportunities for local empowerment through the following channels. NGOs and CBOs have their bases and implement their activities at the community level. There is rapid decentralisation of administration of government services where Traditional Authorities have a central role of community empowerment and mobilisation at the grass roots.

Recommendations

1. COMPASS should develop gender capacities at these different levels to facilitate integration of gender in advocacy activities. This will include gender awareness for NGOs and Traditional Authorities at the grass-root level, and gender analysis skills for NGOs to identify the needs of men and women on issues related to policies that affect natural resource management.
2. It is also recommended that COMPASS should adopt a gender policy and a strategic framework. This policy will influence the activities of committees or task forces formed to support advocacy issues of COMPASS supported activities particularly in ensuring that gender concerns are integrated in activities as a procedure.

4. TR5. Support for Small Grants Program for CBNRM Initiatives

The objective of the COMPASS small grants programme is to finance and test innovative community-based natural resources management modules.

4.1 Grant Application Criteria

These have already been covered in Section E. *Gender Sensitivity* is among the social criteria for qualification of an award of the grant.

4.2 Progress Made

According to COMPASS the following has been achieved over the last 30 months of the project:

- 200 communities have adopted the CBNRM concept
- 36 grants out of 135 proposals have been awarded amounting to USD 420,000. This has been done over a period of about two years since the first CBNRM grants were awarded in January 2000. 26 grants have been awarded to CBOs, 8 to NGOs and 2 to Government Agencies
- 57% of the grant beneficiaries are women. The project plan is to have 60% of COMPASS small grants beneficiaries being female;
- 6 of the new grants in 2001 are existing grantees who have successfully utilised the first grants and started different activities
- a grants manual and guidelines for developing a proposal for funding has been developed

4.3 CBNRM group membership by gender

COMPASS' goal is to have 60% of grant beneficiaries being women. According to the information available, 57% of the grant beneficiaries are women.

Participation of men and women in CBRNM was determined by looking at membership of the various CBRNM groups and in management of the groups. It was found that women were more than half of the members. In 15 CBRNM groups visited, there were 1,333 members and 54% (722) are women while men form about 46% (511) of the members.

In the 15 groups, 66% (8) of the committees have more women in the committees than men. Women are involved in the management decisions of groups and day to day management of the activities.

4.4 CBRNM Group Skills Training

COMPASS and Partners provide training to members of CBRNM groups. A majority of members interviewed said that the training they received has been very useful in managing their natural resource management initiatives. The skills gained are in two areas:

1. *Technical skills.* Technical skills vary according to the type of project or activity a CBRNM is involved in. The skills include; afforestation, wildlife conservation and management e.g. Cane Rat Farming in Salima, alternative energy, briquette making from waste paper, guinea fowl rearing, beekeeping etc.
2. *Management skills.* These skills include; leadership, management of groups, group motivation as well as book-keeping

As a result of the training, men and women group members said that a number of things have changed in the community. Some examples of these changes include:

1. Communities have developed skills to manage their own CBRNM initiatives and are able to link the initiative they are involved in with the broader environmental conservation concept. In one of the best practice sites in Bwanje, the community now have firewood, they are practising beekeeping in a forest they have replanted and some community members have started harvesting honey for sale. One woman in Bwanje said *‘Our children will appreciate our effort of planting trees because they will not lose soil through erosion and they will have firewood and poles for building their houses and the environment will look beautiful’.*
2. Village Natural Resource Committees (VNRCs) have been created. For example, Liwonde National Park has facilitated creation of 55 VNRCs around the Park. The collaborative management of park resources has reduced conflicts between the community and the park personnel. Women suffered most in these conflicts because they were arrested and sometimes assaulted by the park rangers when they went into the park to collect firewood.
3. In Dedza, the mud stoves technology has assisted women in using less firewood. Some community members have started making mud stoves for sale.

4. Some groups have taken the initiative to start community based natural resource management activities without funding using the skills acquired through COMPASS training. For example, the Matindi Youth Group (a best practice site) in Blantyre District has initiated community tree nurseries in six villages. The group has provided the technical skills independent of COMPASS funding.

4.5 Gender participation in CBNRM activities (Gender Analysis)

In order to help understand how much time men and women spend in performing CBNRM activities, the Harvard Gender Analysis Framework was used to do an activity profile and access and control of resources and benefits. This framework was useful in identifying individual roles in the group activities. It assists in comparing men and women's productive, reproductive and community roles in relation to project activities.

In order to do this analysis, men and women were interviewed separately. It was evident that in some projects like tree nursery, briquettes, cane rat farming, women spend more time working in the project than men. Taking into consideration their domestic (reproductive) roles as well as their farm work (productive) and community activities they were involved in, it is true that women's workload was much higher than that of men.

4.5.1 Division of Labour

An example of the analysis done is given for the afforestation project in Bwanje, Ntcheu District (see Annex 2, Tables 1 and 2). This division of labour analysis was done during the rainy season and the activities are typical of the season when there is land preparation and planting. From this analysis, women and girls in Bwanje do most of the household and farm work compared to men and boys. It is also evident that men and women participate equally in project activities (Annex 2, Table 2). However, it is important to point out that increased participation of women does not mean a corresponding change in the division of labour. Rather than transform existing gender roles, women become more over burdened as a result of participation considering their reproductive, productive and community roles.

In general, division of labour analysis assists groups and project people to understand the various work burdens of men and women in an activity because sometimes women's roles are assumed or taken as normal. This information can be useful in negotiating with the less burdened to take on some responsibilities or introduce labour reducing technologies in the project where possible.

4.5.2 Access and Control Profile

What seemed to emerge in the discussions is that men have more control of resources and benefits than women. Although women said that whatever they have belongs to the family, to a large extent, men are the major decision-makers.

For example in Bwanje, women can collect firewood from the trees they have planted for firewood but if the trees have to be sold for income, then it is the man's responsibility.

When men were asked who owns the trees, one man said 'it is obvious, the men own the trees and make decisions on what should be sold'.

An access and control profile of forestry resources in Bwanje was compiled (see Annex 3, Table 3). This profile shows that largely, men control the resources and benefits. What emerged in this profile is typical in most projects visited during this evaluation. Women provide most of the labour but have minimal control of the resources and benefits.

4.5.3 *Implications on Social Equity*

The imbalance in men and women participation activities shows that women are probably not benefiting as much as the men. The assumption in social equity is that a given person or group benefits from an activity to the extent that they invest resources or energy. This means that women could be discouraged in continuing to participate if they are not benefiting.

The project should therefore develop mechanisms that are sensitive to issues of men and women and try to minimise the disparities that may exist so that social equity may be achieved.

4.6 Impact of project activities

The groups were interviewed in an effort to assess the impact of project activities since they were initiated. Two aspects were looked at: firstly, if there was any observable change in the community as a result of the community coming together as a natural resource management group, and being given technical and group management skills; and secondly, if they had generated any income, what had changed in the community and particularly in the household.

It was difficult to assess the impact of project activities fully because most of the projects are just starting and have not generated any income. Chiwembe Mushroom production, Ndirande Women's Briquette Production and Matindi Youth Group Fruit Nurseries are among the ones visited which have generated some income from selling their products. However the income generated is small and individual members have not benefited much.

The evaluation therefore looked at what had changed in the community as a result of the project being initiated. A Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) was used. The GAM analyses the impact of project interventions at four levels: women, men, households and the community. Other levels can be added depending on project goals and the project in question such as boys and girls, class, ethnic group etc.

One of the advantages of the GAM is that it can be used at different stages of the cycle to assess both the potential and the actual impact of the intervention on the community's gender relations.

The GAM given in Annex 4, Table 4, shows analysis changes that have occurred in Bwanje. The matrix combines the views of men and women. From the matrix, women realised that by participating in project activities, they have a longer working day. During the dry season, tree nurseries have to be watered everyday by the women. In Bwanje, women spend a lot of time at the water well waiting to fill their containers, take the water to the nurseries and water the trees. However, the women appreciate the benefits of having firewood and poles for building houses closer to the home than going to the guarded forest to be arrested.

A discussion was held with men on the time women spend in project activities, at the household and community activities. The men started appreciating that women are over loaded with work but according to the men what increases their work is fetching water, which is a woman's role. This is where women's roles are taken for granted and sometimes not regarded as a burden.

Observed positive changes include:

- Increased number of women participating in community activities with men. In fact women are the majority of the members in the groups.
- Women are members of management committees of groups. They are involved in decision making of the groups and other development initiatives in the community.
- Acquired skills in afforestation enabling the community to set up and manage their tree nurseries. Some community members have started their own tree nurseries.
- CBNRM group has become a uniting factor in the community and a forum for community development activities other than what has been funded by COMPASS.

The use of GAM to analyse the changes in Bwanje is an example of a tool that CBNRM groups and partners can use for planning, monitoring and evaluating projects at the community level, raising awareness of women's subordination as a result of unequal gender relations. It is useful for capturing changes over time, helps to establish gender connectedness or gender relations and assists in not seeing men and women as separate entities.

It is therefore important that COMPASS and partners revisit the issue with the groups so that they can develop their plans and monitor them regularly.

4.7 Conclusions and Recommendations

1. Based on information obtained during this evaluation, while the project has promoted increased participation of women in CBNRM, a lot of work needs to be done in order to mainstream gender in the activities. There is lack of gender analysis as a tool for identifying gender issues and disparities necessary for planning, implementation and developing gender sensitive indicators for monitoring and evaluation.

Recommendation

The project needs to introduce gender analysis as a matter of practice and policy. There is a critical relevance in using gender analysis in the development of sustainable and more equitable programs because gender is both a political and technical process. Planners and project implementation personnel and the community require simplified tools, which enable them to:

- Identify the complexities of gender relations due to socio-cultural and socio-economic settings in a community;
 - Understand the dynamics in division of labour, access and control of resources and benefits as a basis for strategizing community interventions in order to promote equity and increased participation; and
 - Increase awareness on men's and women's tasks and workload, thus facilitating initiation of dialogue with men regarding the status and role of women in the community and in CBNRM activities.
2. There is lack of gender skills in COMPASS project staff and partners necessary to facilitate gender integration. While the project has expressed need for integrating gender in CBNRM activities, personnel skills have not been developed to facilitate integration.

Recommendation

In order for people to perform gender analysis, they should have skills to understand and apply the concepts of gender, and how the division of labor, access and control of resources and benefits between men and women is affected by gender power relations. These skills will assist more gender sensitive programs.

3. There are a number of gender analysis tools that can be used. Basically, gender tools and frameworks are a means to devising and implementing programs and activities in CBNRM which do not exclude or harm, women and/or men, which take their needs and perspectives into account, and which may help redress some of the existing gender imbalances. Some of the tools include observation techniques, Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) techniques etc. PRA can be designed to facilitate collection of gender-disaggregated information like in a seasonal calendar; similarly, resource mapping can be collected and analyzed.

Some of the gender analysis frameworks, which could be used, include:

- *Harvard Analytical Framework* (Gender roles framework). The framework helps planners to design more efficient projects and improve overall participation and productivity. The framework does this by mapping the division of labour, access and control of resources and benefits and highlights the factors that influence the disparities in a specific community.
- *The Gender Analysis Framework (GAM)* is used to analyse the differential impact of project activities on men and women.

5. TR3. Community Mobilisation Skills Within Government/ NGOs/ Community Groups Improved

In the community mobilisation component of the programme, information was collected to determine the level of gender integration in community mobilisation and

training activities. The evaluation focused on: training needs assessment; men and women's participation in training; gender content in the training; and overall gender skills among partners.

Six Partners were interviewed: five NGOs, namely, World Vision International (WVI), Evangelical Lutheran Development Program (ELDP), International Eye Foundation (IEF), Rural Foundation for Afforestation, National Initiative for Civic Education (NICE); and one government agency, the Department of National Parks and Wildlife, Liwonde National Park.

5.1 Objectives

The overall objective of community mobilisation is to improve the skills and form a positive attitude of the Government, NGOs and Community Groups towards environmental protection within communities and promoting their own vision of sustainable resource utilisation and biodiversity conservation. There are three broad areas of support provided by the project:

1. *Basic skills in training, extension and community mobilisation.* The training in this area includes extension skills, communication skills, how to interact with the community, how to assist the community plan, collaborative management strategies, and the role of the community on collaborative management, *leadership* and group management skills.
2. *Technical skills building in natural resources management* which include tree nursery establishment, woodlot management, soil conservation skills, agro-forestry issues, compost manure, beekeeping, guinea fowl rearing etc.
3. *Business skills for sustainable natural resource-based enterprises.* In this area, the focus has been on financial management skills not on business management skills and COMPASS is going towards business management skills.

5.2 Process of Identification of Training Needs

There are two ways of identifying training needs:

1. *Grantees:* The needs are identified by the program person during visits and discussing with grantees, reports from grantees as well as follow-up visits when there are problems.
2. *Partners:* The needs are identified by the partners through presenting a proposal for training depending on the needs of the CBOs they have regarding the specific NRM, the target groups, the training approach and resource persons. The partner has to state how the training will assist the group to improve their performance and its impact. The proposal is presented to COMPASS for scrutiny, discussed and funded if found suitable.

5.3 Progress made

5.3.1. CBNRM members Trained

Information was collected to establish what training activities had been carried out in the project, the number of men and women who have been trained, and what is being done differently as a result of the new skills gained through training.

In the project, training is conducted at two levels. There are those training activities organised and managed by COMPASS mainly to build the capacity of partners and selected community members in management and technical skills in natural resource management. On the other hand, there are training activities carried out by COMPASS partners for CBNRM groups.

So far 20 demand driven training workshops have been conducted by COMPASS for NGOs, Government and CBOs.

In these training activities since 1999, a total of 3030 people have been trained on different skills by the project. (Source: 3rd Quarterly Report 2001: COMPASS). Of those trained, 69% (2098) are men while 31% (932) are women as shown in the table below.

Table 2. Men and Women Trained for Skills in Community Mobilization

Year	Men	Women	Total
1999	174 (76%)	43 (24%)	227 (100%)
2000	661 (80%)	165 (20%)	822 (100%)
2001	1263 (60.5%)	932 (39.5)	2087 (100%)
Total	2098 (69%)	932 (31%)	3030 (100%)

This table shows that 31% of the people who have benefited from COMPASS training are women while the bigger percentage are men. These training activities have mainly been residential. When courses are residential, the attendants will mostly be men while women will attend courses conducted closer to the family so that they can do their domestic duties. The other reason could be the selection process.

Evidence from the field, however, shows that there are more women and men trained by partners through COMPASS grants, at the project sites, than is found in the COMPASS records. There is no information system in place that captures the number of people trained by the partners.

For example, in the Livingstonia Environmental Rehabilitation and Conservation Project, one man and woman have attended training organized by COMPASS. In the project however, the project coordinator and personnel from the Department of Forestry have trained 120 women and 80 men in afforestation techniques. The same applies to the afforestation project in Dedza where the National Initiative in Civic Education (NICE) has trained about 60 women and 40 men in afforestation, stove molding, beekeeping, group management and leadership.

5.3.2. Exchange visits

So far fifteen exchange visits have been undertaken. A total of 300 community members have benefited. Usually, an exchange visit is organised to expose CBNRM members to a best practice site. The need for a study tour is identified by the group itself or by the NGO Partner providing technical service to group.

The evaluator had a chance to be with two beekeeping groups from Lilongwe and Nkhotakota in Central Region to a similar group Mangochi in Eastern Region. Overall, the exchange visit was a very useful learning approach for members because it is practical and since a group is able to learn what the visited group has done to be successful. During this visit, the Lilongwe group members who had been trained on beekeeping were able to teach the other groups what should be done in order to have beehives colonised. The Nkhotakota group's hives had not been colonised since they placed them in the forest in August 2001.

According to information in COMPASS records (*COMPASS Performance and Impact 2000/2001: Document 38, December 2001*), 300 people have participated in exchange visits and 50% (150) of the participants are women.

5.4 Conclusions and Recommendations

COMPASS has succeeded in developing working relationship with organisations working with communities on resource management. However, the following was observed:

- Lack of gender skills among the majority of the partners. Out of seven partners, the NICE co-ordinator in Dedza district and the International Eye Foundation in Chikwawa have skills in gender. The other four partners have no gender skills although they recognise that gender is important in their community work; and
- A system to capture the numbers of men and women trained by Partners in the CBNRM groups should be established by COMPASS.

Recommendations

Based on the findings in this section, the following recommendations are being made to strengthen the gender component of the community mobilisation and training efforts.

1. Partners and community members should be trained on gender concepts and integration of gender as this will improve project performance.
2. People involved in CBNRM should have and apply gender analysis as a matter of policy and practice in order to plan and implement gender sensitive activities. In addition, they should develop gender sensitive indicators to facilitate collection of gender disaggregated information for monitoring and evaluation.

COMPASS should therefore take advantage of any upcoming training activities, for example, the planned PRA training, to integrate gender training. It is fairly easy to do

this instead of organising a separate training. Gender should not be seen as a separate entity and that is why it is important to integrate it in on-going training since it is a cross cutting issue.

6. Lessons Learned

Over the 30 months COMPASS has been involved in implementing the project in the community, there are many lessons that can be drawn from the experience. The following lessons were drawn from interviews and discussions with CBNRM groups, Partners and COMPASS Project staff.

Lessons from the programme include:

1. Awareness and sensitisation have assisted the community to appreciate the need and importance of natural resource management and that the CBNRM strategy is a technically appropriate strategy at the community level.
2. There are advantages of working with different partners in CBNRM although COMPASS has experienced some administrative problems with some partners. Partners have facilitated a multiplier effect and have assisted COMPASS to reach more communities in the country. For example, National Initiative for Civic Education (NICE) have mobilised formation of 30 active Village Natural Resource Management Committees (VNRMCs), the Department of National Parks have mobilised the formation of 55 VNRCs in the communities around Liwonde National Park.
3. CBNRM initiatives where women are the majority seem to be more successful. This is because women attach a lot of importance to an activity that assists them to solve their problems. Some of the successful initiatives are like the Chiwembe Women's Mushroom Production, Ndirande Briquettes Group in Blantyre and Nsipe Afforestation Project in Ntcheu district.
4. There seems to be over-dependence on donor funding even for CBNRM activities that can be easily initiated and implemented by the community. Groups do not seem to develop self-reliance strategies because of the attitude that donors will provide funding. For example, VNRCs around Liwonde National Park were not having their village meetings because the COMPASS funding had ceased.
5. *Social sustainability.*

CBNRM projects initiated by the community themselves are more likely to be sustainable. Such groups started more as social support groups or were involved in income generating activities before they got funding from COMPASS. Examples include Matindi Youth Group, Chiwembe Women's (Mushroom) Group, Nsipe Afforestation Women's group.

However, groups formed to attract funding from COMPASS do not seem to be sustainable.

6. *Technical sustainability:*

Technically all CBNRM projects and activities are sustainable. The groups need basic skills to enable them set up the projects as has been demonstrated in the training and implementation of the funded activities. There is nothing complicated, for example, in tree nursery management and growing trees.

7. *Women's participation.*

Women's work load increases as a result of them being involved in project activities. In most cases this is based on the assumption that they are doing what is regarded as 'women's work'. Unless women see the benefits, they may get discouraged and withdraw from the activities. It is therefore necessary to identify gender issues that may be useful to minimise the gender disparities and promote gender equity

8. In CBNRM initiatives where expected benefits take long to be realised, the community gets discouraged. For example, between August and December, the Dalitso Bee-keeping Group's beehives in Nkhotakota had not been colonised and it will be more that a year before they harvest the honey. When the evaluator talked to the group, they were thinking of starting mushroom production as an alternative. CBNRM practitioners should be motivated to diversify their activities and start other income generating activities. In addition to afforestation activities, Nsipe Women's Group in Ntcheu grows and generates income from growing and selling vegetables.
9. The major lesson is that more women attend courses organised at the project sites since the majority of CBNRM members are women.

G. FINANCIAL ISSUES

1. Sampling

A total of ten projects were visited. All other present and past projects currently filed at COMPASS office were reviewed by file. The information collected included the following: accuracy and completeness of financial records, level of understanding of financial procedures on the part of the grantee organisation as a whole, relevance of improved skills and experience to other and/or future activities, and sustainability of the skills that have been developed.

2. The Malawi Context

Malawi culture at grass roots level is not one of forward thinking but of present day survival. Natural resource management is not a priority on any families survival list and commerce, where present, is on a physical sale basis (agricultural products harvested and sold for immediate income and expenditure). It is therefore difficult indeed to create a programme of projects that incorporate present and future natural resource management with income generation at community level.

3. Management of Allocated Project Funds

The present requirements of accounting procedures and financial reporting are in the majority of cases far too complicated a task for the targeted group accepted as being on the whole illiterate, especially when focussed on an element of women's involvement in the projects. Minimal schooling and educational capability have still to be addressed when it comes to the question of gender equality.

4. Recommendations

It would be wise to create a tiered system of accounting, as follows:

4.1 System 1: Basic

Simplified for project commencement: The necessity to log expenditure only, without classification, requiring the signed receipt for goods or services fully described and a balance. The account and receipts, if requested monthly, will highlight both progress and in other cases misuse.

4.2 System 2: Intermediate

Required after 6 months: This should be incorporated in the training workshop. It represents the present system.

4.3 System 3: Comprehensive

This is a more involved system, for second time funded or best practice project groups. It should involve the aspect of a sales ledger.

It is vitally important that the project accounts controller takes extra effort and approaches this complex task with greater enthusiasm. The role is important, being able to offer continual advice to funding recipients and in-field training, completeness and accuracy of records at head-office and, due to the admitted propensity of misuse of funds, a keen eye for detail. The incumbent needs to make a review of the demands of this role and take necessary steps to address the weak links.

5. Training of Project Members

There could be more correlation between the awards of the grants and training. The grant awards given at a set date, followed shortly by some initial training in the field, followed directly by a training workshop, would be more cost effective than scattered award dates followed by a large workshop which invariably just involves two key members of the project or service provider. It would be more beneficial to have 4 to 6 members of the grantee organisation as a whole. In the situations involving service providers, the persons attending are invariably trained and the involvement of club members is already belittled.

Set grant award dates would also assist in the fluent programme of field visits by respective members of staff. This might also assist the COMPASS activity in their current workload and possible increased workload.

6. The Grant Manual

Excellent that it is now in different languages but it was sad to note that at least one organisation still had it only in English, which they could not understand.

7. Programme Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats.

7.1 At COMPASS Office Level

Strengths: Excellent leadership and experience for a highly challenging program. The program self-evaluations and managerial adaptability are ensuring a successful focus on all aspects (especially financial) of the current projects.

Weaknesses: An improvement/change in the account staff is essential in order to have a better control over the financial performance of funded projects. More control should be exercised over service provider where funded. It could be that wastage would be minimised if they were not funded. This would allow more focus at community level.

Opportunities: To date there is a very clear picture of the direction COMPASS should take with their partners and relationships with government bodies with regard to CBNRM. It has to be noted that youth and education figure highly in performance and this area should be explored in the area of advocacy.

Threats: Currency exchange rates; Government interference; apathetic agricultural departments; high failure rate of sustainability of funded projects at cessation of funding assistance.

8. Cost Effective Analysis

Cost effectiveness analysis (CEA) is used as opposed to cost-benefit analysis as it is not possible to place a monetary estimate on the activity benefits because they are difficult or impossible to identify. With this in mind a general overview is given on three basic questions:

- The result or results the activity is to produce or has produced;
- The possibility of alternative ways of monetary use; and
- The combination of the above.

8.1 *The Result or Results the Activity is to Produce or has Produced*

TR5 and the COMPASS activity: There can be no doubt that COMPASS is demonstrating achievement with cost effectiveness. Working directly with communities has meant not only evidence of direct and tangible results but direct and tangible reasons for those results. The successes and failures and their reasons for such are first hand and not theoretical. It could be said that this alone should be a major feature in developing any strategy for CBNRM in Malawi.

8.2 *The Possibility of Alternative ways of Monetary Use*

It is possible that there are avenues of advocacy through education. Every primary school in Malawi teaches agriculture but with little or no focus on the environment. It is also worth noting that the most self-mobilising in any community is the parent/school partnership. An example of this in action is the former LOMADEF project based in Ntcheu and the new APSAM project based in Balaka.

9. Observations

Funding service providers, Government departments and NGOs cannot be seriously judged as cost effective where funds primarily assist in maintaining infrastructure. Direct results and impact would be more beneficial in enhancing COMPASS activity. Direct involvement at grass-root, community level projects are more financially sensible. The opportunity of grants being available should be put more in the public domain.

Funding to private enterprise, which is reliant on a certain level of expertise, must be thoroughly scrutinised.

Accounting procedures and their requirements should be re-examined where literacy and numerical skills at community level are minimal.

It should always be remembered that introduced technology and expertise does not immediately change culture and tradition. In a hand-to-mouth culture like that in Malawi, funding for a bee-keeping project also means temporary funding for food and other commodities (through astute use of funds) for those involved in the project. The project, in theory sustainable, ceases when funding ceases and the extra-curricular household income ceases.

A one-year contract for funding could be said to introduce the donor dependent syndrome. A country where communities see the government as foreign-aid reliant will see this as short-term assistance to their daily life and not as something for their future. They will not be considering natural resource management an option for a change in attitude but as assistance in their priorities.

The most outstanding point noticeable is the enthusiasm and commitment of the projects involving the youth of Malawi. This is perhaps the most cost-effective way forward.

ANNEX 1
List of Documents Reviewed

Document Number	Title	Author(s)	Date
Document 2	COMPASS Small Grants Management Manual	Umphawi, A., Clausen, R., Watson, A.	Sep-99
Document 5	Training Needs Assessment: Responsive Modules & Training Approach	Mwakanema, G.	Nov-99
Document 6	Guidelines and Tools for Community-Based Monitoring	Svendsen, D.	Nov-99
Document 7	Policy Framework for CBNRM in Malawi: A Review of Laws, Policies and Practices	Trick, P.	Dec-99
Document 8	Performance Monitoring for COMPASS and for CBNRM in Malawi	Zador, M.	Feb-00
Document 9	October 1 - December 31, 1999: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jan-00
Document 10	Workshop on Principles and Approaches for CBNRM in Malawi: An assessment of needs for effective implementation of CBNRM	Watson, A.	Mar-00
Document 14	Grass-roots Advocacy for Policy Reform: The Institutional Mechanisms, Sectoral Issues and Key Agenda Items	Lowore, J. and Wilson, J.	Jun-00
Document 16	Training Activities for Community-based Monitoring	Svendsen, D.	Jul-00
Document 23	Framework for Strategic Planning for CBNRM in Malawi	Simons, G.	Nov-00
Document 25	COMPASS Performance and Impact: 1999/2000	COMPASS	Nov-00
Document 27	COMPASS Grantee Performance Report	Umphawi, A.	Mar-01
Document 30	Proceedings of the First National Conference on CBNRM in Malawi	Kapila, M., Shaba, T., Chadza, W., Yassin, B. and Mikuwa, M.	Jun-01
Document 32	Examples of CBNRM Best Practices in Malawi	Moyo, N. & Epulani, F.	Jun-01
Document 35	Strategic Plan for CBNRM in Malawi	CBNRM Working Group	Sep-01
Document 36	Workplan: 2002	COMPASS	Oct-01
Document 37	July 1 – September 30, 2001: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Oct-01
Document 38	COMPASS Performance and Impact 2000/2001	COMPASS	Dec. 2001

Internal Report 4	Directory of CBNRM Organisations (2nd Edition)	COMPASS	Jan-01
Internal Report 6	COMPASS Grantee Performance Report	Umphawi, A.	Jun-00
Internal Report 7	Examples of CBNRM Best-Practices in Malawi	Moyo, N. and Epulani, F.	Jul-00

ANNEX 2
DIVISION OF LABOUR

Table 1. Activity Profile: Division of Labour at Household and Community

Activity	Women	Men	Girls	Boys
<u>Productive activities</u>				
<i>Agriculture</i>				
1. Land preparation	2	2	1	1
2. Planting	2	2	1	1
3. Weeding	2	1	1	1
4. harvesting	2	1	1	1
<i>Income Generation</i>				
1. Petty trade in the market	2	1	1	0
2. Casual wage labour	1	1	1	0
	11	8	6	4
<u>Reproductive Activities</u>				
1. Water collection	2	1	2	1
2. Food preparation	2	0	2	1
3. maize pounding	2	0	1	0
4. child care	2	1	1	0
5. housecleaning	2	1	2	1
6. firewood collection	2	0	1	1
7. washing	2	1	1	1
8. Nursing the sick	2	1	1	1
	16	5	11	6
<u>Community Work</u>				
1. Weddings	2	1	1	1
2. School construction	2	2	0	1
3. Community meetings	2	2	0	0
4. Funerals	2	2	1	1
5. Group meetings	1	1	0	0
	9	8	2	3

Note

0 – Not involved

1 – Sometimes involved

2 – Fully Involved

From this analysis, women and girls in Bwanje do most of the household and farm work compared to men and boys.

Table 2. Bwanje Afforestation Project: Division of Labour in Project Activities in Bwanje

Activity	Women	Men	Girls	Boys
1. Seed collection	2	2	0	0
2. Nursery preparation	2	2	0	0
3. Manure preparation	2	2	0	0
4. Collection of fencing materials	2	1	0	1
5. Soil pot filling	2	2	0	0
6. Planting	2	2	0	0
7. Water collection	2	0	1	0
8. Watering	1	2	0	1
9. Collection of thatching grass	2	2	0	0
10. Fence construction	0	2	0	0
11. Transplanting	2	2	0	0
12. Planting in the field	2	2	0	0
	21	21	1	1

From the above table, it is evident that men and women participate equally in project activities; however it is important to point out that increased participation of women does not mean a corresponding change in the division of labour. Rather than transform existing gender roles, women become more over burdened as a result of participation considering their reproductive, productive and community roles.

ANNEX 3
ACCESS AND CONTROL PROFILE

Table 3. Bwanje Afforestation Project: Access and Control Profile of Resources and Benefits

	ACCESS				CONTROL			
	Women	Men	Girls	Boys	Women	Men	Girls	Boys
Resources								
1. Land	2	2	1	1	1	2	0	0
2. Equipment	2	2	1	1	1	2	0	0
3. Labor	2	2	0	0	1	2	0	0
4. Skills	2	2	0	0	2	2	0	0
5. Cash	1	2	0	0	1	2	0	0
	9	10	2	2	6	10	0	0
Benefits								
1. Firewood	2	2	1	1	1	2	1	0
2. Building poles	2	2	0	0	1	2	0	0
3. Seedlings	2	2	0	0	1	2	0	0
4. Income from sale of trees	1	2	0	0	1	2	0	0
	7	8	1	1	4	8	1	0

Note:

0 - no access or control, 1- has some access or control, 2 - has full access or control

This profile shows that largely, men control the resources and benefits. what emerged in this profile is typical in most projects visited during this evaluation. Women provide most of the labour but have minimal control of the resources and benefits.

ANNEX 4
GENDER ANALYSIS MATRIX (GAM)

Table 4. Impact of The Project on Men and Women in Bwanje Afforestation and Environmental Project

	Labour	Time	Access to resources	Benefits	Culture	Decision making	Skills
Women	- increased work for women	- Increased hours of working. Long waiting time at well, watering nurseries everyday	+ have firewood and building poles	- none by the women. Men control the cash income + firewood nearer for women	+women are being involved with men more than before	+women are in project management committees + women have also been trained in management	+ have skills in nursery management and tree planting
Men	- a lot of work. Sometimes watering nurseries. Fencing is men's responsibility	- tending nurseries takes a lot of time	+ have poles for fencing and building houses	- sell poles and sometimes firewood for income but income is very little + a few men have beehives in the planted forest	- men are recognising working together with women	+ manage own group activities	+ skills in tree nursery management + have skills in group management, leadership
Household	- increased workload affects work at the household level	- less time spent at home because of increased activities	+ there is firewood available and building poles.	- not much income has come to the households	- mother spends more time in the group than before	-not much change	+ some household have established own tree nurseries.
Community	+ community members work long hours sometimes in the project	- more time spent at the project site	+ even group members have a source for firewood and building poles	+ community has an organised group which is a forum for other development activities + have learnt about access to government extension services	+ changes in men and women working together than before	+ community involved in developing own project and activities	+ skills in afforestation
Neighboring communities							

Note: + represents positive change, - represents no change at all or negative change

From the matrix above, women realised that by participating in project activities, they have a longer working day. During the dry season, tree nurseries have to be watered everyday by the women. In Bwanje, women spend a lot of time at the water well waiting to fill their containers, take the water to the nurseries and water the trees. However, the women appreciate the benefits of having firewood and poles for building houses closer to home that going to the guarded forest to be arrested.

ANNEX 5

Table 5a. Institutional Issues: Persons Met

PLACE	NAME	DEPARTMENT	TITLE
Vwaza Marsh	R. Kabambe	Wildlife	Senior Extension Officer
	35 persons	4 VNRMCs	Committee members
Mzuzu	C. Msukwa	Border Zone Project	CBNRM Consultant
	V. Mseska	Forestry	Regional Forestry Officer
	J. Mwalweni	Forestry	Regional Extension Officer
	J. Munyenyembe	Forestry	ARFO Protection
Nkhata Bay	5 persons	Forestry	Guards and Patrolmen
Blantyre	N. Moyo	COMPASS	Community Mobilisation
	A. Watson	COMPASS	Project Director
	T. Shaba	CURE	Project Director
	D. Mauambeta	Wildlife Society	Programme Manager
	P. Chimutu	CSC	Head of Planning
	M. O'Toole	CABUNGO	Director
	E. K. Meena	ELDP	Director
T. Chibwana	MEET	Chief Executive	
Zomba	C. Jambo	Fisheries	District Fisheries Officer
Lilongwe	R. Bhima	Wildlife	Senior Planning Officer
	S. Machira	USAID	Projects Officer
	K. Nyasulu	Forestry	Director
	R. Kabwaza	Environment	Director
	S. Grange	E.U. Social Forestry	Project Assistant
	S. Nanthambwe	Land Resources	Assistant Director
	J. Balarin	DANIDA ESP	Chief Technical Advisor
	E. Jansen	Lake Chilwa Wetlands	Chief Technical Advisor
	D. Foot	Peace Corps	Environmental Officer
	W. Hyweege	TSP	Project Director
	R. Kafakoma	TSP	Training Officer
Nkhota Kota	Katulo	Forestry	District Forestry Officer
	H. Katenga	Forestry	Assistant DFO
	16 Persons	Forestry	Patrolmen and Guards
	G. Sinde	Nkhongo VNRC	Chairman
	A. Mbatata	Nkhongo VNRC	Secretary
	S. Nkhosi	Tiyese VNRC	Secretary
	A. Katimba	Chinamba VNRC	Chairman
	S. Kabula	Chinamba VNRC	Secretary
	R. Makwinja	Fisheries	District Fisheries Officer
	D. Magoreta	Fisheries	District Fisheries Assistant
	12 persons	Sani VBC	Committee

Table 5b. Small Grants Programme: List of People Met

DATE	NAME	POSITION/INSTITUTION	LOCALITY
19.11.01	Dr A. Watson and COMPASS staff	Chief of Party, COMPASS	Blantyre
22.11.01	Mr L. Mvula	Project Manager, International Eye Foundation (IEF)	Nchalo, Chikwawa
	Ms Lusiyana T. Fombe	Community Farmer, IEF Project, Jasi II Village	
23.11.01	Ms Dauda	Chairperson, Chiwembe Mushroom Group	Blantyre
	Ms Mitiana	Vice-Chair	
	Ms Matiasi	Secretary	
	Ms Banda	Committee Member	
	Ms Zungeni	Committee Member and Chief	
23.11.01	Ms Mofolo	President, Discipline Committee, Ndirande Briquettes Group	Blantyre
	Ms Zalanje	Secretary, Ndirande Briquettes Group	
	Ms Ndeule	Vice Secretary/Coordinator	
19.12.01	Mr W.Chabwela	Programme Officer, Matindi Youth Organisation	Blantyre
	Mr H. Nakhonyopa	Executive Member	
	Mr J. Mwalwanda	Project Officer	
19.12.01	Mr E. Kaisala	Chairman, Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation Group	Blantyre
19.12.01	Mr Hassan Bhamji	Chigumula Fish Promotion Project	Blantyre
19.12.01	Mr David Omambia	Consultant, COMPASS	Blantyre
20.12.01	Mr G.G. Chigaya	Chairman, Mwaiwathu Fisheries Management Committee	Kachulu, Zomba
	Mr V. Khembo	Secretary	
	Mr I.P. Kachoka	Treasurer	
	Mr W. Thubuza	Member	
	Mr G.W. Chipanje	Member	
	Mr C. Chigudulu	Member	
	Mr S.D.V. Gondwe	Senior Technical Assistant, Fisheries Department	
20.12.01	Mr J.A. Kazembe	Park Manager, Liwonde National Park	Machinga
	Mr A. Dzimbiri	Deputy Park Manager	
21.12.01	Mr F.M. Kundembule	Chairman, Kalino Aquaculture Group	Thondwe, Zomba
	Mr P. Majawa	Secretary	
	Ms D. Romphwa	Treasurer	
21.12.01	Mr K.W. Mpoya	Director, Songani Orphanage	Songani, Zomba
21.12.01	Ms R. Chithambo	Forest Assistant, Nsipe EPA	Ntcheu
	Mr M.W. Felem	Forest Assistant, Bilila EPA	
	Mr Namariya	Distrit Forestry Officer	

	Ms Sakula Ms G. Nkhata Plus & Others	Chair, Masitimala Nursery Committee Secretary Committee Members	
26.12.01	Mr F.E.L. Nkungula Plus 21 Members (15 women, 6 men)	Forestry Extension Officer, BERDO, Sharpe Valley EPA BERDO Community (Focus Group Discussion)	Bwanje, Ntcheu
26.12.01	Mr P. Loleni	Treasurer, Linthipe Riverine Afforestation Project	Salima
26.12.01	Mr J. Nduwa Mr T. Kaziputa Mr A. Phiri Plus 5 others (all men)	Chairman, Saopampeni Cane Rat Project Vice Chairman Vice Secretary Members (Focus Group Discussion)	Salima
27.12.01	Mr Y. Rashid Mr I. Kamanga Mr O. Kambwiri Mr Al Haji Rashid Plus 5 others (2 girls, 3 boys)	Executive Director, Chisoti Youth Organisation Vice Executive Secretary Secretary General Treasurer Members (Focus Group Discussion)	Nkhota Kota
27.12.01	Ms M. Mwala Ms Mkwakwa Mr Mbuna	Treasurer, Dalitso Beekeeping Club Member Observer (Chairperson's Husband)	Nkhota Kota
27.12.01	Mr F.S. Manda Plus 5 others (all men)	Chairman, Chisasile Beekeeping Club Members (Focus Group Discussion)	Nkhata Bay
28.12.01	Mr M. Kaunda Mr E. Gama Mr C. Kaunda Plus 13 others (10 women, 3 men)	Chairman, Nkholola Community Group Vice Chairman Member Members of Nursery Sub-Committee – Focus Group Discussion	Nkhata Bay
28.12.01	Mr H.P. Kachepa Mr P. Chikwatula Mr B. Kamwendo	Co-ordinator, WVI(North), ELDP Development Facilitator, ELDP Water Assistant, ELDP	Nkhata Bay
28.12.01	Mrs A.C.J. Farinya Mr P. Chizonda Mr B. Masanduko	Co-ordinator, WVI(North) Assistant Coordinator, WVI Project Accountant, WVI	Ekwendeni, Mzimba
29.12.01	Mr Lipiya	Department of National Parks and Wildlife	Lilongwe
29.12.01	Ms I. Ndhlovu Ms L. Kumwenda Mr S. Sichali	Chairperson, Chitsanzo Beekeeping and Environment Club Secretary Member	Lilongwe
30.12.01	Mr J.J. Kanjanga Mr E.I. Chingota	Executive Director, LOMADEF Consultant, LOMADEF	Ntonda, Ntcheu
1.1.02	Dr S. Carr	Consultant, COMPASS	Zomba

2.1.02	Ms J. Adam Ms M. Chande	Vice Chairperson, Ntenje VNRC Secretary	Mangochi
	Mr J. Nakache Ms E. Migo Mrs Y. Yusuf Mrs M. Chisuse	Chairman, Ukalanga Nursery Comm. Secretary Treasurer Member	
2.1.02	Ms A. Ndege Ms F. Amidu Ms E. Ndala	Chair, Mphaya Nursery Committee Secretary Member	Mangochi
2.1.02	Mr J Kapanila Ms E. Wasi Ms A. Awali Ms M. Chimwala	Chairman, Ntenje Nursery Comm. Secretary Member Member	Mangochi
2.1.02	Mr J. Namukhonde	Extension Officer, Hope Humana	Mikolongwe Blantyre/ Chiradzulu
3.1.02	Mr M. Mpezeni	District Civic Education Officer, NICE	Dedza
3.1.02	Mr J. Nephasi	Chairman, Tayambanawo VNRC, NICE	Dedza
	Mr S. Nephasi	Chairman, Chikondi Club, NICE	
	Mr C. Phiri	Secretary, Chikondi Club	
	Plus 11 others (all women)	Members, Chikondi Nursery Committee	
8.2.02	Mr C. Jambo	Regional Fisheries Officer (South)	Mangochi

Table 5c. Gender Issues: List of Projects Visited

Date	CBNRM Group Visited	Group Initiative	Contact People	District
29.11.01	Dalitso	Beekeeping	K. Mbuna –Chairlady R.M. Kulinji –Secretary	Nkhota Kota
29.11.01	Chitsanzo Club	Beekeeping		Lilongwe
4.12.01	Bwanje Valley Rural Development Organization	Afforestation	Hellena John –Chairlady Ms Stivelia – Vice Chirlady	Ntcheu
5.12.01	Saopampeni	Cane Rat Farming		Salima
6.12.01	Timbiri	Vegetable Growing		Nkhata Bay
6.12.01	Evangelical Lutheran Development Program (Partner)	Capacity Building	Dyton Siyeni Hudson Kachepa Muscot Bvumbwe	Nkhata Bay
6.12.01	Kayezi	Water Dam Rehabilitation		Mzimba
6.12.01	World Vision International	Capacity Building		Mzimba
8.12.01	Pamoza Community, Livingstonia	Afforestation	Pamoza Group Committee Members	Rumphi
9.12.01	Dedza Environmental Advocay	Afforestation	Committee Members of Gundadzuwa, Mulangali, Linthipe and Kwaza Groups	Dedza
9.12.01	National Initiative for Civic Education (NICE)	Capacity Building	Moses Mpezeni-District Co-ordinator Lily Mbalane- Community Trainer	Dedza
10.12.01	COMPASS	Community Mobilizatio/ Capacity Building	Mr Banda	Blantyre
11.12.01	Ndirande Group	Briquette Making Group	Patricia Ndeule -Chairlady	Blantyre
12.12.01	Chasitu Group	Afforestation	Mr. Jelule Jassi –Chair Wilfred Ng’ombe – Treasurer Medison Fombe - Secretary	Chikwawa
12.12.01	International Eye Foundation	Capacity Building		Chikwawa
13.12.01	Matindi Youth Group	Fruit Tree Nursery	Francis Kalonga -Director	Blantyre
14.12.01	Liwonde National Park VNRC	Capacity Building	John Kazembe- Park Manager Aggrey Simbili – Extension Officer	Machinga
14.12.01	Liwonde VNRC	Conservation of Liwonde National Park	Mr. Kauzu – Chairman Margaret Moregeri – Secretary M. Katetha - Treasurer	Machinga
17.12.01	Chiwembe Group	Mushroom Production	Mrs E Dauda - Chairlady Mrs Mitiyani –V. Chairlady Mrs. K Matias – Secretary Mrs. L. Chawinga –	Blantyre

			Treasurer Mrs. Y. Kambalame – V. Treasurer	
18.12.01	Co-ordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment (CURE)	Capacity Building	Lingalireni Mihowa – Gender Program Coordinator Virginia –Gender Officer	Blantyre

Table 5d. Financial Issues: Projects visited

COMPASS -3180-035-Evangelical Lutheran Development Programme

COMPASS -3180-034-Chisoti Youth Organisation

COMPASS -3180-031-Ndirandi Women Briquettes Group

COMPASS -3180-030-Matindi Youth Organisation

COMPASS -3180-029-Dalitso Club

COMPASS -3180-027-Madalitso Entrepreneurs

COMPASS -3180-026-International Eye Foundation

COMPASS -3180-025-World Vision International-North

COMPASS -3180-014-Saopampeni Cane Rat Farming Organisation

ANNEX 6

Table 6. COMPASS Small Grants

Grant Number	Project Title	Project Focus	Award Amount USD	Award Amount Kwacha	Implementing Agency	District
COMPASS-3180-001	Briquettes Promotion Campaign	Alternative Energy	16500	769000	Ndirande Women Briquettes Group	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-002	Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation Project	Reforestation/ Afforestation	12920	594320	Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation Community	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-003	Tree Nursery	Reforestation/ Afforestation	2525	116161	Matindi Youth Organization	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-004	Chigumula Fish Promotion Project	Aquaculture	13040	600000	Fish Promotion Center	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-005	Participatory Natural Resources Management and Capacity Building on CBNRM Activities	Reforestation/ Afforestation	12925	565459	Bwanje Valley Rural Development Organization	Ntcheu
COMPASS-3180-006	Sani Hill Rehabilitation Project	Reforestation/ Afforestation	3250.27	150000	Chisoti Youth Organization	Nkhotakota
COMPASS-3180-007	Livingstonia Environmental Rehabilitation and Conservation Project	Reforestation/ Afforestation	6500.54	300000	Rural Foundation for Afforestation, Manchewe Tree Nursery Programme	Rumphi
COMPASS-3180-008	Integrating Indigenous Knowledge in Community-Based Natural Resource Management in Malawi	Capacity Building	29000	1338350	Coordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-009	Chisasila Beekeeping Project	Beekeeping	12710.72	586600	Mbamba Environmental Conservation Club	Nkhatabay
COMPASS-3180-010	Construction of a training block	Capacity Building	7000	315000	Lipangwe Organic Manure Demonstration Farm	Ntcheu

COMPASS-3180-011	Integrated Environmental Rehabilitation	Reforestation/ Afforestation	12797.4	575882.8	Ntenje Natural Resources Management Committee	Mangochi
COMPASS-3180-012	Liwonde National Park VNRC Development	Capacity Building	13999.03	647782	Department of National Parks and Wildlife	Balaka
COMPASS-3180-013	Linthipe Riverine Afforestation Project	Reforestation/ Afforestation	6483.92	299950	Kamapeka Environmental Group	Salima
COMPASS-3180-014	Cane-Rat Farming in Salima District	Wildlife Domestication	6305.52	291000	Saopampeni Cane-Rat Farming Organization	Lilongwe
COMPASS-3180-015	Mpalasa Afforestation Project	Reforestation/ Afforestation	7686.9	354750	Mpalasa Afforestation Organization (Forestry assistant, Blaza EPA and Matope, Mpalasa, Thunga and Misozo VNRMCs)	Balaka
COMPASS-3180-016	Establishment of Community Herbal Gardens	Herbal Production	15000	690000	Hope Humana People To People	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-017	Nsipe Afforestation Project	Reforestation/ Afforestation	13500	754560	Chipusile Village Natural Resource Management Committee	Ntcheu
COMPASS-3180-018	Eastern Boundary Fence at Nyafulu	Wildlife Management	9973	558500	Liwonde National Park - Game Scout Project	Machinga
COMPASS-3180-019	Guinea Fowl Management, Beekeeping and Efficiency Stove Making Project	Wildlife Management	3000	168000	Tsogolo la Ana	Chikwawa
COMPASS-3180-020	Sawdust Briquette Making	Alternative Energy	2400	134020	Songani Community Care Group	Zomba
COMPASS-3180-021	Advocacy, Environmental Education and Communication Program (AEECP)	Capacity Building	17500	1086250	Wildlife Society of Malawi	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-022	Advocacy on Sustainable Use and Management of Forest Reserves	Capacity Building	15000	1019191	National Initiatives for Civic Education	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-023	Participatory Fish Farming	Aquaculture	9360	584000	Voice of the Voiceless Youth	Zomba

					Organisation	
COMPASS-3180-024	Lake Chilwa Boat Co-management Project	Wildlife Management	13326.25	1066100	Mwaiwathu Fisheries Management Committee	Zomba
COMPASS-3180-025	Community Based Management of Natural Resources and Environment	Sustainable Agriculture (Organic Farming)	25000	1950000	World Vision International (North)	Mzimba
COMPASS-3180-026	Sustainable Community Based Natural Resources Management Involving Rural Communities and National Parks in Chikwawa District	Other	47011	3807891	International Eye Foundation	Chikwawa
COMPASS-3180-027	Chiwembe Dam Mushroom Production Project	Mushroom Production	2000	159800	Madalitso Entrepreneurs	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-028	Community-Based Natural Resources Management Programme	Reforestation/Afforestation	15220	1216080	Bwanje Environmental Rural Development Organization	Ntcheu
COMPASS-3180-029	Beekeeping	Beekeeping	3250	253000	Dalitso Club	Nkhotakota
COMPASS-3180-030	Fruit Tree Nursery	Fruit Tree Nursery	1500	115600	Matindi Youth Organization	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-031	Briquettes Promotion Campaigns	Alternative Energy	4025	310000	Ndirande Women Briquettes Group	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-032	Dedza Environmental Advocacy	Reforestation/Afforestation	10556	766803	National Initiative for Civic Education	Dedza
COMPASS-3180-033	Bee keeping and Plant Propagation in Lilongwe Nature Sanctuary	Beekeeping	5400	404000	Chitsanzo Club	Lilongwe
COMPASS-3180-034	Chisoti Grafted Fruit Tree Nursery	Fruit Tree Nursery	4600	327650	Chisoti Youth Organization	Nkhota kota
COMPASS-3180-035	Promotion of Community Based Natural Resources Management	Other	22286	1760575	Evangelical Lutheran Development Programme	Blantyre
COMPASS-3180-036	Changoima CBNRM Project	Other	12600	779270	Tsogolo La Ana	Chikwawa

ANNEX 7

Evaluation of Compass Small Grants Performance (1999 – 2001)

The report covers the projects visited during the course of evaluation.

Table 7: Categories of Project Grants Awarded by COMPASS

Project Type	Number Of Grantees	Number Interviewed
1. Afforestation	11	9
2. Capacity building	5	3
3. Beekeeping	3	3
4. Alternative Energy	3	3
5. Aquaculture	2	2
6. Wildlife Management	4	3
7. Herbal Production	1	1
8. Mushroom Production	1	1
9. Fruit Tree Nursery	2	2
10. Sustainable Agricultural Organic Farming	1	1
11. Other	3	2
Total	36	30

COMPASS-3180-001 and COMPASS-3180-031 Briquettes Promotion Campaign: Ndirande Women's Briquettes Group, Blantyre

Origin of the project: Nkhomano Centre for Development identified the women's group and wrote a proposal to COMPASS. There was a misunderstanding with Nkhomano. Later the group became independent and have since been funded directly by COMPASS.

Training: They have received training on four occasions (Motel Paradise, Sun Village, Nantipwiri at Bvumbwe). The women have been used to train others in Ntcheu, Dedza and Zomba.

Problems/Constraints: There is a limited market for briquettes. Dedicated buyers of the product are only EDETA and the Chiwembe Women's Group growing mushrooms. Other ways of marketing involves the women carrying the briquettes to sell at the roadside or market places in the Blantyre suburbs such as at Chilomoni, Mbayani, Chilobwe and Bangwe. Attempts to sell near ITG (now known as International Timbers Limited) failed because of competition since that is a wood off-cuts outlet. The grantees were puzzled that the initial enthusiasm of individuals who came to buy the briquettes was not sustained, thus some never came back to buy some more, yet these same people mentioned to the women that they were satisfied with the performance of the briquettes. On close examination, the women have however discovered that people politely complain about the ash content being high and that the briquettes do not last as well as charcoal.

-The women wondered whether firms like Carlsberg Breweries could not become large buyers of briquettes instead of using cottonseed husks or whether schools could not provide

such a market. The main concern is to balance production with market requirements. With a production of 500 briquettes per day, the women feel that they can satisfy a bigger market. -Two other problems were highlighted also. Firstly, they do not have a warehouse for storage of materials and products. They are currently using one of the rooms in a house of one of the committee members. Secondly, there is lack of security since houses surround the project premises. A recent fire that destroyed a grass fence demarcating the premises spread and destroyed part of the shed including materials. The women therefore want to construct a brick fence and need financial support.

Information networking: Briquettes are a new product to the Malawian community. The women have used the radio, TV and demonstrations to advertise the product. The Story Workshop is also assisting through public education and awareness campaigns.

Sustainability: Initially, the project had 30 zones, each with ten members working with one press. Production and sales were not enough and so the women were not adequately compensated to keep up the interest. Some women dropped out and most zonal committees reduced to only two active members. A decision was made to centralise production to the present site. This has concentrated the group to those highly committed.

Organisational development: The women feel that selling the briquettes should go hand in hand with stoves. They have therefore requested COMPASS for funding to be trained in manufacturing stove liners.

COMPASS-3180-002 Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation Project:
Ndirande Mountain Rehabilitation Community, Blantyre

Origin of the project: the Forestry Department (FD) started the project allegedly after the Department failed to manage the Ndirande Forest Reserve. Apparently, the FD used to employ many to plant trees after which they were laid off, but these people set fire to the forest with the view to getting employed again the following season to do more plantings. At the time of handing over the forest to the community, the mountain is said to have been bare. At first, the Chiefs used to allocate plots to farmers but the chiefs started selling the plots secretly. Subsequently, allocation of the plots became the responsibility of the Main Committee of 12 that supervises nine zones surrounding Ndirande Mountain. Each zone has a further local committee of ten people. The number of farmers in the zones varies from 221 to 3,681, giving a total farmer membership of 12,973. In 1996, after the Forestry Department handed over the forest to the community, the present Chairman started plot allocations. He continued after being re-elected in 1998. The plots have ranged from 35x40 m to 70x70 m. Initially the Forestry Department never allowed growing of maize, but only grass slashing was expected. People silently protested by setting fires. Government was later persuaded to allow farming activities, especially growing of maize, in the plots.

Gender: The main committee consists of 12 members (4 women and 8 men) and supervises the nine zones.

Training: The Committees have received training from COMPASS on nursery practice, planting and caring of trees, avoiding bush fires, importance of trees, etc.

Participatory monitoring by grantees: The mission learned that the Committee gives out seedlings and inspects whether they have been actually planted. After two months, they go to inspect to establish survival rates. These are apparently high. The Committee meets once or twice per month depending on issues to be discussed.

Problems/Constraints: The VNRMC feels abandoned by the FD. Apparently there are no extension services. The relationship with FD is thus strained. The Committee has sourced seedlings from various organisations and distributed the seedlings to the community. The COMPASS grant made a tremendous improvement in their efforts, but at the end of 2000, disbursements were stopped because of accountability. At the time of the evaluation at the end of 2001, the matter was not yet resolved. The Committee's Chairman being interviewed alleged that the main reason for suspending the disbursements was that COMPASS was expecting them to produce 600,000 seedlings because another grantee had done so using a similar amount as that given to the Ndirande group which produced only 120,000 seedlings. COMPASS wanted a full account before further disbursements. The Chairman argued that the money provided was only able to purchase 100,000 plastic tubes while the extra 20,000 was the Committee's own contribution from Chibuku beer packets. The Committee apparently had the necessary receipts that for some reason were still with the Treasurer. When the mission asked for these receipts, the Chairman produced one receipt for K80,500. He said that the Treasurer could have produced the rest if available. The Chairman felt that the other grantee probably used other sources of funding to reach a target of 600,000.

The mission feels that the above matter can be resolved by convening a meeting (or an extra meeting if this was already done) with the Committee's Chairman and Treasurer together to examine the records. The Chairman felt anxious to resume activities under COMPASS project. He said that the Committee is still able to buy seedlings and distribute them using moneys collected as plots changed hands when people depart from the area. However, all the nurseries are dormant except the one at Matope.

According to the Chairman, there are other problems as well. Firstly, the Chiefs in some areas resent the powers that the Committees have over land allocation. The Chiefs have wanted to take over some plots. One of the Chiefs has actually contravened the law by himself building a house in the forest area. The Chiefs are moulding bricks and encroaching on the same plots the Committees are protecting, and are easily bribed by people to cut trees. On the Machinjiri side, the Chiefs are doing a pottery business using forest trees. Nevertheless, the Chairman thinks that a good relationship with the farmers is responsible for a measure of success of the project in that there have so far not been fires deliberately set since the farmers realise that the plots belong to them. This ownership recognition is a strong point that the Chairman thinks will be instrumental in the greening of Ndirande Mountain.

Information networking: The mission learned that MANA visited the Ndirande project on 13th January 2001 and publicised it. The Committee holds tree-planting ceremonies every year during tree planting week to which the FD is invited. For the 2002 ceremony, the Committee was planning to conduct this right in Machinjiri where the defiant Chief has built a house in the forest.

Impact: The Chairman thinks the project has done a lot to change people's attitudes towards tree planting. Secondly, there are many other organisations coming forward to give assistance. Thirdly, the incidence of fires has almost gone, and this is partly due to enforcement of the rule the Committee has established that all farmers must slash their maize

stalks. The next target that the Committee has set is to extend the planting onto the higher parts of the mountain.

Sustainability: The Chairman is a highly motivated individual and he claims that his committees have a good relationship with the farmers, although the relationship with the Chiefs is poor. The project is likely to succeed should the majority of the farmers continue to co-operate. The trees that have been planted are still young. They will need care and protection from fire in the medium term. Given enough support, the Committees may be able to achieve this. The ownership of the plots by individual farmers is perhaps the strongest basis for sustainability. When the owners leave, they expect to be compensated as the plots change hands.

Organisational development: The mission learned that the Chairman had made contacts with a donor willing to provide vehicles that could be used to carry manure and distribute to those farmers especially above the Mudi dam so that they stop using fertiliser that leaches into the dam. This initiative has not been followed-up because of lack of appropriate moral support from the Water Board.

**COMPASS-3180-003 Tree Nursery; and
COMPASS-3180-034 Fruit Tree Nursery:**
Matindi Youth Organisation, Blantyre

Origin of the project: The organisation started in 1998, spurred by the alarming rates of deforestation being experienced. They set up six VNRMCs, bought seedlings and distributed them to the community. They heard about COMPASS on the radio and subsequently visited the COMPASS offices. They were then funded by COMPASS to develop a tree nursery and fruit tree nursery while a grant from OXFAM was used for community tree nurseries. Matindi is also involved in HIV/AIDS, human rights and democracy awareness campaigns.

Gender: The organisation has a membership of 25 (9 girls and 16 boys). Within the Executive Committee of 7 members, there were initially 3 girls, but currently only one is remaining (one went to school and the other got married).

Training: Training in nursery establishment and management received at Lunzu RTC was a foundation to the success of the project and the subsequent extension activities by the group in the surrounding community.

Participatory monitoring by grantees: The Executive Committee meets twice per month. Recently, they have been meeting every Monday to review achievements and plan for future activities.

Problems/Constraints: The hot season (October/November) success/survival rate is higher for budded citrus than for grafted mangoes. Success rate is at least 90% for citrus while for mangoes, this gets reduced to almost 20%. There is, therefore, need to provide more protection to mangoes.

-Secondly, marketing the product this year (2001) has been problematic, with no particular major buyer being identified.

Information networking: Apart from COMPASS and OXFAM, Matindi interacts with several other organisations such as the National Youth Council of Malawi (NYCOM) based in Lilongwe, Malawi Network of Aids Services Organisation (MANASO) which gives them information on Aids, and Banja La Mtsogolo (BLM).

Sustainability: Matindi accepts members on the understanding that they are prepared to work on a voluntary basis. Initially, there were many. The number reduced as others dropped out because they wanted benefits or were looking for white-collar jobs. Growth of membership that now stands at 25 has been achieved with only those that are keen. It is expected that membership will continue to grow as the name of Matindi continues to receive high publicity. -Last year (2000), K85,000 was raised from sales. The money was used to meet rentals, buy stationery and make payments to members in accordance with participation. The product's quality was good in as far as no complaints were received from customers, while instead, demand has increased especially for mangoes and indigenous trees seedlings. -Matindi wants further support from COMPASS to extend to other areas within a 10km radius.

Organisational development: CABUNGO has trained Matindi in organisational assessment and strategic planning under COMPASS sponsorship.

COMPASS-3180-004 Chigumula Fish Promotion Project:

Fish Promotion Centre, Blantyre

Origin of the project: The project was started as an individual's initiative by digging fishponds, but the scale of work needed funding. This was obtained from COMPASS, culminating in digging of eight fishponds. The fishponds were stocked with fingerlings from Domasi Fisheries Research Station. But eight months later when it was time to harvest, the size was too small and the fish had obviously not grown.

Gender: Out of the 7 to 11 members of the Chigumula Fisheries Committee, only one is a woman.

Training: The mission learned that the grantee did not undergo training courses in fish farming as part of the grant package and that the siting and design of the fish ponds were done without technical help. This may have complicated matters when problems of water supply later arose. COMPASS, on the other hand, pointed out that the grantee had undergone training in participatory monitoring which he never used.

Participatory monitoring by grantee: The mission learned that instructions on fish feeding and care were provided once only at the time of delivery of the fingerlings by the Fisheries Department personnel. There was no growth monitoring until 8 months later when harvesting was due. It was then discovered that the fish had been stunted.

Problems/Constraints: The mission learned that the slow growth of the fingerlings that had been supplied from Domasi was not a result of using the wrong feeding regime, but rather it was due to the wrong type of fingerlings. This caused some misunderstanding between grantee and Domasi and COMPASS. The grantee later ventured into obtaining fingerlings from another farm that claimed to stock appropriate, fast growing fingerlings while Domasi also undertook to provide other types of fingerlings.

-Two other problems were experienced. Firstly, the birds were invading the ponds and feeding on the fingerlings. Secondly, there was inadequate water supply such that COMPASS had to be asked to provide supplementary funding to buy fuel to pump water into the ponds.

-The grantee complained that all his committee members have deserted him in the face of major problems that the project was experiencing and that he was not worried because he has the determination and means to go it alone. This may raise the question of how valid this can be said to be a truly participatory project with the community.

Information networking: The grantee has visited Domasi Station when harvests were being done. He has exchanged experiences with the Mbandanga fish farm in the neighbourhood from which fingerlings were obtained subsequently.

Impact: The mission learned that three farmers obtained fingerlings from the grantee, but the results were disappointing because of slow growth. Over ten enquiries have been received from potential fish farmers.

Sustainability: The project could not sell enough to support expansion. However, the grantee did not hesitate to say that there is a ready market for fish in the area and that enough money could be generated to support the project if the right things were done. The grantee was planning to make the project a demonstration farm and tourist attraction.

Organisational development: The Chigumula Fisheries Committee of 7 to 11 people was apparently short-lived. What initially was meant to be a broad-based participatory project has turned out to be more of an individual entrepreneurial undertaking, with much individual resources pumped into the project. The future of the project is undoubtedly in the hands of an individual since it is not apparent how members of a committee can have a say.

**COMPASS-3180-005 Participatory Natural Resources Management and Capacity Building on CBNRM Activities; and
COMPASS-3180-028 Community Based Natural Resources Management Programme:**
Bwanje Valley Rural Development Organisation (BERDO), Ntcheu

BERDO (Board of directors: 2 women, 3 men; 75 to 80% overall participation by women) is a grouping of 200 villages administered in a complex structure of over seven committees, supervised by a Board of Directors. A highly motivated individual who has gained the confidence of funding agencies has driven it. Impact of BERDO is partly seen as rehabilitated hill slopes in the Bwanje valley where 50 VFA and 150 communal woodlots have been established.

Of the 200 villages, the two COMPASS grants have covered 30 villages, thus 170 villages are yet to be covered. It is unlikely that a two-year project extension by COMPASS will cover the rest of the villages. However, it is worthwhile providing the extension during which there should be intensification of cross-farm visits to stimulate replication of successes within the BERDO catchment area and lay down a foundation for the promotion of fruit tree growing. The mission found that training has impacted on the community in two main ways. Firstly, new skills are acquired in leadership, nursery care, accounts, record keeping, report writing, care of tools, etc. Secondly, the idea of travelling to a new place to receive the training is in itself a motivating process to participate fully.

**COMPASS-3180-006 Sani Hill Rehabilitation Project; and
COMPASS-3180-034 Chisoti Grafted Fruit Tree Nursery:**
Chisoti Youth Organisation, Nkhotakota

The organisation has 9 girls, 16 boys. The origin of the project dates back to school days of the founding members where they were profoundly influenced as members of a wildlife club. When they came home, they founded the Chisoti Youth Organisation which has concentrated on rehabilitation of degraded areas, initially focusing on Sani hill and establishment of woodlots (nine so far). Membership has grown from 11 in 1998 to the current 25.

The history of Chisoti is dotted with many opportunities for training. Their success is strongly linked to capacity building. For example, their Fruit Tree Project (being funded as the second COMPASS project) came out of a PRA that they carried out. In particular, training in leadership and group dynamics was appreciated, while training in technical areas like seed collection, nursery management etc makes the employable. The organisation has been invited in other parts of the district to influence other youths, have facilitated formation of 10 wildlife clubs, and are facilitating formation of VFAs and drawing up of byelaws.

Lessons learned: Part of the attraction for the youth to work with commitment is the prospect for training, which is seen as reasonable compensation; the opportunity to travel on exchange visits; and the pride to be associated with a successful organisation.

Recommendation: Further support should be given to Chisoti to consolidate activities that are underway. The mission got an appeal to the effect that COMPASS should facilitate a radio broadcast where Chisoti is featured and that they should visit Matindi. This request is seen in the broader sense that the media plays an important part in building organisations, for example, Matindi has featured a lot on the national radio MBC. It is also clear that more youth organisations should be awarded grants and exchange visits between them promoted.

COMPASS-3180-009 Chisasila Beekeeping Project:
Mbamba Environmental Conservation Club, Nkhatabay

The Club has 30 women, 120 men. Chisasila was originally a forest reserve that was degazetted. The community agreed to divide it into two parts: one area to be conserved and the other area for opening up of farmland. Some community members were against reserving an area, so they were bitter. When COMPASS' grant was received, 120 beehives were made and placed in the forest. Apparently vandalism by uncooperative community members reduced the number of beehives to 30 only. At the time of the mission's visit, 12 had colonised while two had just been harvested. The honey harvested, being the first success, was shared amongst the 150 members, each getting a portion enough to fill a coca cola bottle. The mission learned that colonising was a problem such that nine months passed and people were getting discouraged, until someone taught them how to effectively attract bees into the hives by baiting. The impact of the project is wide in the area, with people now making their own beehives.

COMPASS-3180-010 Construction of a Training Block:

Lipangwe Organic Manure Demonstration Farm (LOMADEF), Ntcheu

LOMADEF has had 1061 women and 485 men i.e. 69% and 31% participation, respectively). The organisation has a rather long history of progressive development, with its foundation dating back at least two decades, when the founder started a farm in Ntonda area, Ntcheu. The mission interviewed the founder who said that farming throughout most of the 1980s was dependent on fertiliser application, but slowly, and because of high fertiliser costs, he developed an interest in manure. By 1990, the recognition that use of manure was the best option led him to undergo a series of training sessions sponsored by the Christian Service Committee (CSC). He called the farm “Lipangwe Organic Farm”. CSC advised him to involve other community members. He agreed and formed a club of 17 families in 1993. A communal garden was set up.

A German organisation that was funding CSC was then interested in registering the CBO with the International Federation of Agricultural Movement. This was done by 1995 using the name “Lipangwe Organic Manure Demonstration Farm (LOMADEF)”. Subsequently, the founder (now Executive Director) led LOMADEF on an expansion programme into 12 clubs in the Ntonda area (Ntcheu district), each with 20 to 30 people. Growth of LOMADEF to other districts by clubs formation spread to Ngwira Zone in Balaka in 1996 (5 clubs), Ntaja Zone in Machinga in 1997 (9 clubs), Chilipa Zone in Mangochi in 1999 (7 clubs), and Lunzu/Namisu Zone in Blantyre in 1999 (2 clubs). Before LOMADEF disbanded, the number of clubs had reached 58. The five-district organisation needed capacity building within the various clubs, hence the need for a training block at LOMADEF headquarters.

In 1999, Oxfam provided support to LOMADEF requesting also that a VSO volunteer be present for a two-year period. A volunteer from the U.K. arrived in March 2000 to act as Advisor. OXFAM had suspended funding. COMPASS grant for construction of the training block arrived prior to June 2000 with an agreement that the money was not to be used to pay for bricks. The Executive Director left for Europe on 30th May 2000 for a workshop in Austria on how to produce compost. The mission learned that a number of major changes took place in his absence including suspending him in a letter dated 2nd June 2000 signed by the Chair and Secretary of a new Executive Committee, and appointing a new temporary Executive Director. The Executive Director learned of his dismissal when he arrived back on 17th June 2000. Two days later he convened a meeting of the Management Team which had dismissed him and learned that he was dismissed because he misappropriated moneys. He countered this move by dismissing the team and asked the sponsors to withdraw the Advisor. The team left but decided that they had taken over the institution. They carried office and building materials to Balaka where they opened a new office and announced to donors that LOMADEF had changed and was now APSAM. The suspension of both Oxfam and COMPASS grants is, therefore, understandable.

The way forward will certainly involve a number of steps, one of which is accounting for COMPASS funds. LOMADEF is prepared to do so. LOMADEF was registered as an NGO under the Trustees Incorporation Act of 1962 on 12th June 2000. It now has an official auditing firm, Graham Carr and Co., five Trustees and a new five-member Board of Governors.

Lessons learned: The events that led to suspension of LOMADEF are unfortunately linked to what took place outside the COMPASS grant though related to it in that financial

mismanagement of other funds was involved, leading to in-fighting. However, the lessons here point to the need for scrupulous checks on grantees, monitoring, and how donors should intervene. At the end of the day, resolving internal problems and finding a way forward will also depend on training as part of team building.

Recommendation: The mission recommends that LOMADEF should account for the COMPASS grant.

COMPASS-3180-011 Integrated Environmental Rehabilitation:

Ntenje Natural Resources Management Committee, Mangochi)

There are three sites: Mpwanyana, Ntenje and Ukalanga where seedling nurseries for reforestation, beekeeping, and guinea fowl rearing have been established. The mission learned that when the three communities heard about COMPASS grants, they turned up at the first meeting in large numbers: 77 at Ukalanga, 45 at Ntenje and 58 at Mpwanyana. However, when they further learned that there was no payment for work done, the numbers dropped to a mere 10 at each site, consisting only those who were elected since they felt duty bond. However, it is pleasing that these committees were functional as evidenced by clean and healthy nurseries the mission viewed.

Each committee had also received two beehives that were placed in the VFAs. Only one out of the six had colonised after three months. The mission visited a hillside at Ukalanga, which had been rehabilitated. At Ntenje, the committee reported termite problems with *Eucalyptus* establishment but they were quick to point out that they were following COMPASS' advice not to use chemicals because these might leach out into Lake Malombe nearby. The mission learned that the continued existence of the committees of ten members only was also due to strong encouragement from the chiefs and the extension officer in the area. The prevailing hunger situation had a marked effect on care of guinea fowls. Lack of food resulted in some of them dying.

Lessons learned: There are many committees that are still unable to understand that CBNRM is to their advantage and that paying them to protect their own environment is not sustainable. Unfortunately, where such a work-for-reward approach has been made by other funding agencies in CBNRM, the communities have been misled profoundly and remain confused, so that much civic education will be needed to reverse the damage.

COMPASS-3180-012 Liwonde National Park VNRC Development:

Department of National Parks and Wildlife, Machinga

The mission interviewed the DPNW and learned that the Liwonde project has set up 55 VNRCs from the villages that border Liwonde National Park. Also, there are four zonal VNRCs (i.e. at T/A level). A 24 member Liwonde national Park Area Advisory Committee in which the zonal committees are represented is functional. Training of 52 VNRCs has been done but the project was terminated by COMPASS because of accountability problems, presumably including unauthorised changes to the budget and itemised list of materials and services (Document 27). Unfortunately, according to the grantee, COMPASS has not convened a meeting with the grantee to get an explanation of the expenditures, in particular, records of excessive claims in allowances. Already, it was indicated that "communication

between COMPASS and the main project management team has been very poor” (Document 27).

On a positive note, the setting up of the Advisory Committee was a result of the increased understanding arising from training of the committees. What should follow is the implementation of the projects such as aquaculture that would reduce poaching of the Shire River, and completion of drafting of the constitution. Another positive outcome of the project is that the increased frequency of interactions with the communities has led to an improved relationship between the community and the DNPW personnel.

COMPASS-3180-013 Linthipe Riverine Afforestation:

Kamapeka Environmental Group, Salima

The project has a committee of 5 women, 5 men. This is a project whose funding was stopped by COMPASS due to lack of accountability in the use of funds. The Treasurer was taken into Police custody and released pending a hearing. The mission interviewed him to find out what had caused the problem of misuse of funds and what was the status of the project.

The project was meant to stabilise and rehabilitate the riverbanks of the Linthipe River that typically gets eroded. The mission learned that three rows of *Khaya anthotheca* (**mbawa**) were planted along the river, leaving a buffer zone of five metres to the edge of the channel. Nothing was planted in the channel and the buffer zone to bind the eroding edges despite a recommendation to use bamboo, elephant grass or reeds. The mission learned that the seedlings that survived continue to do well but in some places they have been swept away or burned by bush fires.

The mission observes that rehabilitation of Linthipe River is an urgent matter but that the approach should be technically sound. The project failed to give attention to soil binding measures in the buffer zone by planting quick growing elephant grass or reeds. The treasurer took the initiative individually to do just that in a 30 metre length of the riverbank. It has been a success that can be used as a demonstration for replication all along the eroding bank, should the project be revived.

The mission learned that one nursery was managed by an individual employed by the committee at a monthly salary of K600. He has previous experience of nursery management. It is claimed that the committee had not been trained when the project started, hence the use of this individual. However, the four nurseries, one in each T/A, did have 10-member committees that produced the seedlings.

The mission learned that the Forestry official who originally mobilised the community to engage in this project got transferred early as project implementation started. His successor was not interested and never visited the project although the committee kept him informed. Instead, the new Forestry official is alleged to have instructed the Treasurer to hand over moneys following the death of committee Chairman. The money was subsequently never accounted for. On further demands for funds by the new Forestry official, the Treasurer decided to withdraw from the bank and keep all the remaining funds to avoid complying with these demands. The matter of full accountability still remains and hinges on the Treasurer and the Forestry official.

Recommendations: When moneys are given directly to the community, part of the orientation should involve clarifying roles of the committee and service providers to avoid undue interference such as that from Government agencies. Since the community is keen to continue rehabilitation of Linthipe River, and considering the importance of this river, COMPASS should consider funding a re-organised project that capitalises on lessons learned to put further rehabilitation measures on a sound footing.

COMPASS-3180-014 Cane-Rat Farming in Salima District:
Saopampeni Cane-Rat Farming Organisation, Salima

The project has 10 women and 10 men. The mission visited the Saopampeni cane-rat farming project in Salima and held discussions with the service provider, the DNPW in Lilongwe. The project originated from contacts with the community when the DNPW was looking for young cane rats as part of a domestication programme. Three communities in Salima and Nkhotakota had been identified by DNPW and were acting as sources of cane rats. Expertise had been developed by the DNPW by the time COMPASS awarded the grant to Saopampeni community, a largely illiterate community. As expected, the DNPW was the service provider who gave the training on cane rat rearing. Unfortunately, major misunderstandings arose involving the tripartite: Community-DNPW-COMPASS, revolving around expenses the project was to pay the DNPW officials for conducting training at the site in Salima. The Saopampeni community on one hand accused the DNPW officials of grabbing their money while DNPW officials maintained that the money was to meet bills. On the other hand, COMPASS cautioned DNPW officials to deal fairly with the community. The result of all this was strained relationship.

Thus when the community was constructing the cane-rat house and the holding pens, the exercise was done without supervision from DNPW although specifications had been provided earlier. The mission learned from the DNPW that the height of the cane-rat house should have been higher and that the pens' design was incorrect, while local materials could have been used. Incidentally, the Saopampeni community complained to the mission about excessive heat in the house and were seeking suggestions on how to solve the problem. This may have a connection with construction of the house.

Nevertheless, the mission was impressed with what this community was doing with so much determination, identifying new problems and suggesting solutions. For example, basing their hopes that they were to be funded for five years, they were looking for a wire fence to allow the cane rats free range; a dam planted with elephant grass for watering and feeding the animals; a bore hole from which to obtain the water for the cane rats and themselves (thus solving problems of water shortage at the seasonal Chiluwa River); and a maize mill for income generation.

Regarding the smooth implementation of their project the Saopampeni Group complained about their visits to the Bank. Being illiterate, the Group has been disadvantaged through Bank delays due to technicalities such that the Group sometimes has had to go to Salima at least three times to complete one transaction.

Lessons learned: Where a service provider is needed, expecting the grantee to pay for the operating costs of the service provider causes misunderstandings, especially if the level of education of the grantee is low.

Recommendation: With regard to technical sustainability, the Saopampeni community will in future need the technical advise of DNPW. It is worthwhile for COMPASS, DNPW and the community to meet and resolve any misunderstandings. COMPASS should take the initiative.

COMPASS-3180-016 Establishment of Community Herbal Gardens:
Hope Humana People To People, Blantyre/Chiradzulu

The project is based in Chiradzulu district with 75% women and 25% men participating. There are 30 herbal gardens that have been established in the district, corresponding to 30 committees arranged in two zones. Each garden was planted with 28 species of medicinal plants. The species were decided at a workshop. One extension officer employed by Hope Humana visits each zone three times per week. Each species has had methods of preparing, type of disease treated, and administration of the medicine detailed in the records.

Observations: The mission visited one site and noted that the trees and shrubs were well established. However, the spacing of around two metres between plants that has been used may be appropriate for short plants such as aloes, but in the long term there will be crowding of the tall-growing species. The impact of the project is already wide since people did not know that medicinal herbal plants could be grown. In some cases, demand is causing over-harvesting of the plants.

COMPASS-3180-017 Nsipe Afforestation Project:
Chipusile Village Natural Resource Management Committee, Ntcheu

The project has 149 women, 58 men in the community; and 4 women, 6 men in the Steering Committee. Ownership of the trees in the long term is the greatest incentive that keeps people continue to participate in the project, including making contributions, e.g. the Chipusile VNRC has already contributed K2,500 to set up a fund for replacement/ repair of tools or entertaining visitors.

Participatory monitoring includes keeping of daily records on numbers of participants, meetings held, visitors, number of pots filled, seedlings planted, number that died, number replanted, survival rate, causes of death, seedlings sold, amount realised etc. Monitoring is done in groups so that each one of them is informed.

The COMPASS project has provided a much needed avenue for training of service providers and skills development which have been passed on to the community with greater commitment than before. The guaranteed availability of resources has boosted the morale of Government agencies who have confessed that they are now proud of their work since for a long time, they have never had the opportunity to deliver fully what they were trained to do.

A strategy that has been found to foster competition is to have regular meetings of the VNRC where each village announces their achievements. Training of the VNRC has been found to be instrumental in achieving targets because the trained members want to apply the knowledge and train others – the snowball effect. This has worked well in Nsipe Afforestation Project, thus in the long run increasing efficiency of participatory monitoring.

A constraint that was mentioned by service providers is coverage of large distances using a pedal bike for project supervision. This problem may require a case-by-case examination if provision of a motorcycle is to be considered. Members of the VNRMC that have to walk long distances or use public transport to get to the meeting place raised a similar mobility problem. Again, the ideal solution would be the provision of pedal bikes the cost of which can be justified if weighed against the scenario of a partially functioning VNRMC. On future activities, the desire to go into briquette making and guinea fowl rearing was expressed.

There is need to clarify procedures for project screening. The Nsipe project alleged that COMPASS indicated that project support was for 5 years when in fact this was not the case. On the other hand, the Chikande Afforestation Project (Bilila EPA) alleged that a letter recommending award of small grant was received from COMPASS only to find out later that the grant was not coming through, thus disappointing many beneficiaries.

COMPASS-3180-018 Eastern Boundary Fence at Nyafulu:
Liwonde National Park – Game Scout Project, Machinga

The mission discussed with the DNPW and learned that the fence project at Liwonde National Park had the weakness of not having been participatory. While the fence is technically advanced, it was constructed without using the community as was the case with the already established fence where the community had been involved e.g. in carrying poles. The social sustainability of the new fence may therefore be weak.

-A good maintenance record of the fence is due to adequate backup by watchmen who report the faults regularly. The watchmen are paid from the Scout Training project. When this project winds up, the good maintenance record may falter.

Recommendation: There seems to have been no internal consultation between the Technical Assistant and the DNPW Head at the institution. This has led to some internal breakdown in communication between the project implementers and the institution. Unfortunately, this is a second COMPASS project whereby the challenge of fostering co-operation between Technical Assistance personnel and institutional Head has not been smooth. The other project was LOMADEF. It is recommended that every COMPASS project should involve Head of institution, not necessarily as a full partner, but as advisor and interested party.

COMPASS-3180-020 Sawdust Briquette Making:
Songani Community Care Group, Zomba

The Group consists of women only. The women learned to adjust product to suit the market. In this case the paper - sawdust ratio was adjusted from 1:1 to 3:1 to reduce smoke production. Similarly, in the Ndirande Briquette Making project, the adjustment involved size increase to meet the requirements of the Chiwembe Mushroom project. However, in both projects, marketing is a problem because of the quality compared with available alternative energy sources, especially charcoal. Experience has shown that the initial enthusiasm to use the briquettes wanes and most do not come back, citing “too much smoke”, “don’t last as well as charcoal”, or “too much ash”. All these market problems are a result of wrong pricing of charcoal and the availability of firewood.

COMPASS-3180-022 Advocacy and Sustainable Use and Management of Forest Reserves; and

COMPASS-3180-032 Dedza Environmental Advocacy

National Initiative for Civic Education (NICE), Blantyre/Dedza

There are two components under the NICE project, namely, “Advocacy on Sustainable Use and Management of Forest Reserves (ASUFORE)” and “Dedza Environment Advocacy”. ASUFORE activities have concentrated on communities living next to forest reserves. 31 VFAs have been created and 34 nurseries were achieved, serving for reforestation and planting of individual woodlots. 20 beehives have been given to nine villages. At the time of the mission’s visit, none had colonised (one month after placing them in the forest). 2,900 stoves were reported to have been produced by women in Dedza and Ntcheu.

The mission visited the community at Nkundadzuwa village and inspected a nursery well maintained by a committee of 10 women and 4 men. The committee has set up a fund to which they contribute K5/month. They have produced 162 stoves. Only one pair of guinea fowls was received for the whole villages and it was being reared like they do for chickens. The mission learned that training had not been given. In fact there was confusion about what to do with *Gliricidia* that was ready in the nursery for planting out. The mission was presented with a number of requests such as the need for a borehole to stop drinking from the river and to have nurseries at the village to avoid thefts of seedlings; the need to have a fruit trees project started, as well as provision of seed e.g. water melons; and the need for a radio for use by the community. Overall, the introduction of the COMPASS project has stimulated interest. In some cases people have mobilised themselves, built a fence for a nursery and presented their request for assistance to NICE. The blurring of the roles of Service Provider and funding agency was highlighted when the community thanked COMPASS for providing books for the community library – one of the activities of NICE.

The mission learned that the Advocacy component of the project was aimed at bringing together the community and the Forestry Department to foster co-operation in the use of forest resources. Advocacy also aims at influencing people to be more resourceful. For example, if the people are convinced that woodlots are important, they will not need someone to bring in wheelbarrows or shovels to establish a nursery.

Lessons learned: Service providers working at grassroots level have an important role to play in stimulating communities to think about their problems and come up with own ideas about solutions to those problems.

Recommendation: It is difficult to put in place in a period of one year those measures that can ensure that activities of the project will continue. There is the question of entry, implementation, adjusting etc. Where there is a Service Provider, the activities can be adopted but a community that has been directly funded will need to continue operating for some 18 months before funding should stop.

COMPASS-3180-023 Participatory Fish Farming:

Kalino Community, Zomba

Kalino Aquaculture Project has 2 women and 7 men in the committee. People dropped out from participation because of lack of payment, leaving those that were elected to continue.

The Kalino project was facilitated by Voice of Voiceless Youth Organisation who wrote the proposal on behalf of the community and administered the grant. The Youth group started misusing the funds. The community was subsequently successful in obtaining the funds directly from COMPASS. Since then the project has made tremendous progress. In contrast to the Chigumula aquaculture project, the Kalino project has been able to produce fingerlings for sale to other projects and stock other ponds in an expansion programme.

Lessons learned: Success behind the Kalino project has been influenced by the appropriate training given to the committee on all aspects of aquaculture and effective monitoring and advice by frequent visits from ICLARM. Because of their broad understanding of aquaculture issues, the community has an impressive insight of future plans that integrate fish farming, vegetable growing, orchard development and livestock/poultry raising, with adequate attention paid to water supply development and protective infrastructure.

COMPASS-3180-024 Lake Chilwa Boat Co-management Project:

Mwaiwathu Fisheries Management Committee, Zomba

Origin of the project: The Mwaiwathu Fisheries Management Committee started on 25th September 2000 after a fisheries sensitisation workshop held at Mpwapwe, Mangochi, in December 1999 at which three representatives of the Zomba BVCs were present. Initial contacts with COMPASS were made at that workshop. Subsequently a proposal to COMPASS was accepted to provide boats for transportation to monitor activities on Lake Chilwa. A meeting of all the BVCs out of which was elected a 12-member committee followed this. Two dropped out because they wanted incentives.

Gender: There are no women in the Committee of 10 that represents the 12 Beach Village Committees. Overall, only two women are on the Beach Village Committees, one for Chisi BVC and one for Mchenga BVC. The Committee told the mission that they hoped that women would join them to “serve” when visitors are received. This raises the issue of inadequate sensitisation to gender empowerment in the fishing community of Lake Chilwa.

Participatory monitoring by grantees: There are three boats that operate on Lake Chilwa, one each delivered for the Zomba (December 2000), Machinga (August 2001) and Phalombe (November 2001) BVCs, respectively.

-People are able to organise themselves using the already existing structures to enforce NRM rules and regulations, and they are respected e.g. the Association of Chiefs (the Lake Chilwa and Mpoto Lagoon Fish Resource Conservation Association) that sets the rules and charges the offenders. A Lawyer on another COMPASS assignment was mistaken by parts of the community to have gone there to defend contraveners.

-IGA from expensive boats is not possible because of a few hiring opportunities due to competition with other boats. Hence no money to buy fuel and to carry out maintenance, hence not sustainable. The committee was actually looking for funds to start guinea fowl rearing. They also expressed the desire to own and operate a maize mill or minibus or pick up motor vehicle or fishing boat as business enterprise. When boat patrols stopped during the December 2001 closed season, as a result of lack of funds, the community easily mistook that to mean relaxing of rules in order for people to be allowed to continue exploiting the fish resource in view of the prevailing hunger period. The boats are sitting idle.

Strengths: Community policing institution is very well respected – offenders flee.

- The committees set up to control NRM are in conflict with chiefs who offer little co-operation e.g. chiefs in Zomba and Machinga do not co-operate with the BVCs; chiefs in Phalombe are an exception. A parallel situation exists in other projects e.g. the Ndirande reforestation project where chiefs are not co-operative.
- There is recognition of drama as a vehicle to spread messages e.g. at Chief Chikalume, a drama group exists.
- Training obtained by committee has a multiplier effect e.g. some have gone further using knowledge of business planning, record keeping, etc to set up own businesses.

COMPASS-3180-025 Community Based Management of Natural Resources and Environment:

World Vision International (North), Mzimba

WVI runs the Kayezi Community Based Management of Natural Resources and Environment Project. The COMPASS component covers eight villages and has the following activities: beekeeping, small scale irrigation, fish farming, dam rehabilitation, food and nutrition, soil and water conservation, and shallow wells. Most of the activities are being implemented in the communities. WVI was appreciative of the efforts by COMPASS in bringing the media (TV team and reporters from the Nation newspaper), both of which disseminated WVI activities.

A number of constraints were identified, mainly concerning the approval procedures for disbursements. Firstly, according to WVI, the lag time was too long between retirement of receipts and disbursement of the next tranche. ELDP highlighted the same problem that has resulted in delayed start up of next activities. Apparently, WVI has solved this by physically making a trip to COMPASS in Blantyre. Secondly, WVI/COMPASS agreement stipulates voucher approval by a neutral (non-signatory) person – the Regional Finance Officer in the case of WVI. This is a challenge in the sense that if the Officer travels, there will be no one else to sign, hence making it difficult to function.

The mission visited one site – dam rehabilitation in Mpherembe area. The dam was a source of pride to the community many decades ago but had been entirely silted and forgotten. Now that the dam is completely re-excavated, there is a lot of excitement about several functions such as vegetable farming and aquaculture. The mission also noted several well-colonised beehives in the vicinity of the dam. Already, the impact of the project has been felt wide and other communities are making requests to WVI to talk to COMPASS for similar projects. The mission observed that caring for the dam will be a challenge since there were still numerous footprints of cattle at the dam site despite the understanding that no cattle will be allowed to water there. An alternative watering source was the provision of shallow wells above the dam. However, there was only one such shallow well that measured a mere two metres in diameter and perhaps a metre deep. It may not contain all the animals coming to water there.

Lessons learned: People willingly worked with hoes and shovels to rehabilitate the dam, an example of entrenching ownership of a project.

COMPASS-3180-026 Sustainable Community Based Natural Resources Management Involving Rural Communities and National Parks in Chikwawa:
International Eye Foundation

The IEF engages the community in a range of activities: promoting mud and clay stoves; raising small livestock; soil conservation; planting of Moringa and Neem trees; and establishing tree nurseries at two primary schools with wildlife clubs.

Origin of the project: A PRA was conducted around the Lengwe-Majete-Mwabvi protected areas. They found that people needed meat; although Moringa is abundantly found in the Shire Valley, it is not found at farmers' homes even though they have routinely used the pods and flowers for food; people did not know that Moringa is used to purify (clear) water and that the seeds are a source of cooking oil. IEF wrote the proposal to COMPASS for funding to operate in three Extension Planning Areas (EPAs).

Problems/constraints: Exchange visits are limited by availability of transport. Two to three villages are combined sometimes but these are still a strain. The request from farmers are for visits to go and see animals, not really as exchange visits.

Training: Training to Service Provider on monitoring was received. It was not very useful because material covered was already known. However, a colleague from NPW gained more because for him the material was new.

-Training to community members was appreciated focusing on raising guinea fowls and rabbits, including construction of **kholas**, conducted on site or through visits to other districts.
-Training for briquette making and for soil conservation were not yet done, but demonstrations of the portable clay stove appears to have been enthusiastically received. However, clay is not readily available in Chikwawa.

Participatory monitoring by grantees: They decide what to monitor e.g. number of rabbits expected to be born and the causes of unexpected results (no births), with explanations, such as lack of adequate food or immature age. At two schools in Chikwawa, IEF bought footballs to motivate pupils to participate in watering the nursery. After playing (three times per week) pupils would then water the nursery before going home.

Duration of the grant: One year was found not to be adequate. More money was being requested to target other villages while IEF continues to monitor the projects already sponsored. The rationale for requesting extension of the project to other villages is that out of the 60 farmers attending training, only five would be chosen to receive the initial supply of guinea fowls or rabbits. It will take a long time for the trickle-down effect to work.

Lessons learned: Villages that are closer to Nchalo are reluctant to be involved in project activities probably because they are already employed. Those that are far away are very interested in the programme.

- Involvement of other stakeholders at the initiation of the project is very important. e.g. the Day Training Centre meeting included all the extension staff from Forestry, Fisheries, DPNW to brief them on projects and then train them on various things to happen. e.g. portable stove, Moringa, rabbitry using kholas etc. These people are participating fully, e.g. they come

and tell us about their visits to our farmers. We have provided them with fuel and they report back. IEF has only one extension staff, so these government people are a blessing.

Relationship between NGO service provider and Government extension Agents:

Relationship with extension workers is very good. They come to us unsolicited e.g. they solved a farmer problem with rabbits and all we got was a report from EPA. Each of the three EPAs has a Veterinary Assistant who can attend to diseases.

-Also they invite us to their meetings.

COMPASS-3180-027 Chiwembe Dam Mushroom Production Project:

Madalitso Entrepreneurs, Blantyre

Origin of the project: This is a Church group of women who realised that individually they could not run a business. They finally chose mushroom growing using water hyacinth from the Chiwembe Dam. They have cooperated with City Council in the removal of water hyacinth. They got funding from COMPASS and were trained by EDETA.

Training: This was provided by EDETA (business administration, leadership and mushroom growing) and by COMPASS (committee adherence, proposal writing)

Participatory monitoring by grantees: the women were very knowledgeable about indicators of their progress, e.g.

-Kg of mushrooms sold

-amount of water hyacinth ready for use as substrate

-Number of sheds being built

-Conclusion of an agreement with MHC to buy the place at K69,000 and progress towards raising that amount

-knowledge that each mushroom harvest cycle has a projected income of K75,000 and that they aim to achieve at least half of this.

-The group was able to solve a problem of excess moisture in the substrate

-Similarly, a termite problem was solved by switching from using plastic on the floor to raised boxes.

-The women, in particular, appreciated the course on participatory management offered by COMPASS

Problems/constraints: Temperature control during the hot dry season: the mushroom size becomes small and they tend to develop dry patches. People do not want these.

-There was a problem with briquettes obtained from the Ndirande women's group when pine was used – the briquettes did not last long. The Ndirande group then adjusted and provided those made from paper waste. These are fine.

Lessons learned: A synergy between the Chiwembe and Ndirande group developed. Similar matching of projects is worthwhile as it leads to mutual improvements.

COMPASS-3180-029 Beekeeping:

Dalitso Club, Nkhotakota

The Club has 15 women and 7 men. Dalitso beekeeping project started through a visit to Nkhotakota by a founding member who learned about COMPASS from friends coming from a beekeeping training session. She contacted COMPASS who assisted up to submission of the proposal and funding. There are five beehives placed in the National Park, with only one colonised some three months later. Five more were to be placed in phase two (2nd quarter) and five more in phase three (3rd quarter).

Non-colonisation is a source of frustration as this means that no income is generated. The women have learned that bees can manually be transferred into beehives to help colonisation and they are exploring this possibility. A visit to Monkey Bay was not a source of encouragement either, as again only one beehive was colonised. Above all, the women walk long distances to the Park to monitor progress that appears very slow.

In view of the foregoing, the women have applied to COMPASS to start a sister project on mushroom growing which they think will be very successful because of shortage of fish, despite being next to the lake. They also wish that more men could join them to start an aquaculture project to meet the demand for fish in the area. Men would perhaps be keener on this since they regard beekeeping as simplistic. On the other hand, the women ruled out guinea fowl rearing because a lot of it is already happening.

Lessons learned: The success of a beekeeping project depends on quick colonisation. When the waiting period is prolonged, all hopes of product generation, hence income generation, start to dwindle and the participants begin to seek alternatives as a coping mechanism.

Recommendation: Beekeeping is rather new in various parts of the Central and Southern regions and there is need to establish successful best practice sites to which beekeeping clubs can learn and get encouragement rather than making visits to sites with similar, unsolved problems.

COMPASS-3180-033 Beekeeping and Plant Propagation in Lilongwe Nature Sanctuary:

Chitsanzo Beekeeping and Environment Club, Lilongwe

The Club has 7 women and 3 men. The Chitsanzo beekeeping project at the Nature Sanctuary came about as an alternative project to guinea fowl rearing which COMPASS turned down in May 2000 because there were many other projects on guinea fowls. Even though the club claimed that COMPASS had not given them any training, the DPNW facilitated a two-day visit to the beekeeping project at Nyika National Park, and an official from Mzuzu came to Lilongwe to train them on how to hang the beehives. Twelve beehives were placed in the forest, four of which had now colonised, while three were yet to be hung. The committee was also given a two-day training by MAFE in Lilongwe on nursery establishment. The mission learned that the nursery has been highly acclaimed.

However, a number of constraints were identified. Firstly, the club's investment into beekeeping has not yet yielded results. The mission was informed that individual members are using personal resources to travel and there is no money to entertain visitors. The club suggested obtaining a grant from COMPASS to buy honey from groups in Rumphu where they have limited markets, package the honey and sell in Lilongwe to generate money for the club. Secondly, the club felt that reporting to COMPASS using the eight prescribed forms is

a complicated procedure. They requested simplifying this. Thirdly, the club felt that not enough monitoring has been obtained from COMPASS and reported that visits from them are rushed so that issues are not given enough time to discuss, citing also lack of training in record keeping, bookkeeping etc.

For future activities, the club wished to embark on cane rat rearing.

COMPASS-3180-035 Promotion of Community Based Natural Resources Management: Evangelical Lutheran Development Programme (ELDP), Blantyre/Nkhatabay

The mission interviewed officers in the ELDP offices at Nkhatabay regarding the COMPASS project. The mission learned that ELDP in Nkhatabay as service provider identified community needs and selected three sites in Nkhatabay, namely, Nkholola village (Nkhatabay EPA), Timbiri village (Mpamba EPA) and Zamulomo village (Mpamba EPA). ELDP Head office in Blantyre contacted COMPASS on behalf of the communities and were funded to implement various activities, namely, guinea fowl rearing, nursery management and reforestation, beekeeping, micro-irrigation, soil and water conservation, mud stoves and vegetable farming, beginning September 2001. At the time of the mission's visit, the above activities were at different stages of implementation. The supervising officers at the local ELDP office reported that micro-irrigation had progressed well at Timbiri while some of the activities were lagging behind because of late start.

A number of constraints were identified. Firstly, the ELDP officers had no training pertaining to some of the activities, in particular, micro-irrigation and guinea fowl rearing. This affected the take-off of the project. Secondly, budgeting that was made by ELDP head office was based on Blantyre prices. Thus purchasing the materials locally in Nkhatabay at higher prices meant reductions in quantities. Thirdly, there was a concern that a budget for monitoring COMPASS activities was not there. Instead, a general ELDP operating budget was being used. Fourthly, only one or two ELDP officers were supervising the range of COMPASS activities, replicated at three sites, apart from running other ELDP projects and this meant having tight schedules that permitted little flexibility.

The mission also visited one site (Nkholola village) and interviewed the community. They already had received 20 guinea fowls and 10 chickens (as surrogates), had five beehives ready for hanging in the forest, had landscaped and planted their plots at a micro-irrigation site (13 women, 7 men involved), were tending an afforestation nursery, and had made mud stoves. The mission noted that the nursery had unfortunately not received timely care as weeds had overgrown and the last root pruning missed. A number of constraints were observed. Firstly, the community was implementing some activities without proper training, for example, guinea fowl rearing. The birds had arrived already mature and were laying eggs, but they stopped partly due to underfeeding as a result of the general shortage of food prevailing in the community. Secondly, even though the community had undergone training in manure production, they had not yet produced any to apply to their plots at the irrigation site. ELDP had earlier informed the community that inorganic fertilisers were not to be used. The dilemma was to decide on the next course of action since maize had already been planted, there was no manure and the soils were sandy loam, thus necessitating some intervention with inorganic fertiliser.

Lessons learned: NGO service providers, though impressively committed, tend to take on too much to implement and in the process overwhelm supervising officers in the field, thus possibly compromising quality of service delivery.

Recommendation: Regarding the micro-irrigation activity, the mission learned that five 20 horsepower pumps were purchased and distributed. It is hoped that sales from vegetable farming and honey production would generate money for the maintenance of the pumps. Although this may work out to be the case, not enough contingency has been planned, for example, alternate pumping by purchase of treadle pumps if use of this is feasible. -It is further recommended to train the ELDP supervising staff where they lack know-how, such as in micro-irrigation technology.

ANNEX 8. COMPASS Publications

Document Number	Title	Author(s)	Date
Document 1	COMPASS Year 1 Work Plan	COMPASS	Jul-99
Document 2	COMPASS Small Grants Management Manual	Umphawi, A., Clausen, R., Watson, A.	Sep-99
Document 3	Year 2 Annual Work Plan	COMPASS	Dec-99
Document 4	July 1 - September 30, 1999: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Oct-99
Document 5	Training Needs Assessment: Responsive Modules & Training Approach	Mwakanema, G.	Nov-99
Document 6	Guidelines and Tools for Community-Based Monitoring	Svendsen, D.	Nov-99
Document 7	Policy Framework for CBNRM in Malawi: A Review of Laws, Policies and Practices	Trick, P.	Dec-99
Document 8	Performance Monitoring for COMPASS and for CBNRM in Malawi	Zador, M.	Feb-00
Document 9	October 1 - December 31, 1999: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jan-00
Document 10	Workshop on Principles and Approaches for CBNRM in Malawi: An assessment of needs for effective implementation of CBNRM	Watson, A.	Mar-00
Document 11	January 1 - March 31, 2000: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Apr-00
Document 12	Thandizo la Ndalama za Kasamalidwe ka Zachilengedwe (Small Grants Manual in Chichewa)	Mphaka, P.	Apr-00
Document 13	Njira Zomwe Gulu Lingatsate Powunikira Limodzi Momwe Ntchito Ikuyendera (Guidelines and Tools for Community-based Monitoring in Chichewa)	Svendsen, D. - Translated by Mphaka, P. and Umphawi, A.	May-00
Document 14	Grass-roots Advocacy for Policy Reform: The Institutional Mechanisms, Sectoral Issues and Key Agenda Items	Lowore, J. and Wilson, J.	Jun-00
Document 15	A Strategic Framework for CBNRM Media Campaigns in Malawi	Sneed, T.	Jul-00
Document 16	Training Activities for Community-based Monitoring	Svendsen, D.	Jul-00
Document 17	April 1 - June 30, 2000: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jul-00
Document 18	Crocodile and Hippopotamus Management in the Lower Shire	Kalowekamo, F.	Sep-00
Document 19	Cost-Sharing Principles and Guidelines for CBNRM Activities	Moyo, N.	Sep-00
Document 20	Workplan: 2001	COMPASS	Nov-00
Document 21	July 1 - September 30, 2000: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Oct-00
Document 22	Opportunities for Sustainable Financing of CBNRM in Malawi: A	Watson, A.	Nov-00

	Discussion		
Document 23	Framework for Strategic Planning for CBNRM in Malawi	Simons, G.	Nov-00
Document 24	Kabuku Kakwandula Ndongomeko ya Thumba Lapadera la Wupu wa COMPASS (chiTumbuka version of the COMPASS Small-grant Manual)	Umphawi, A., Clausen, R. & Watson, A. Translated by Chirwa, T.H. & Kapila, M.	Dec-00
Document 25	COMPASS Performance and Impact: 1999/2000	COMPASS	Nov-00
Document 26	October 1 - December 31, 2000: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jan-01
Document 27	COMPASS Grantee Performance Report	Umphawi, A.	Mar-01
Document 28	January 1 - March 31, 2001: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Apr-01
Document 29	Natural Resource Based Enterprises in Malawi: Study on the contribution of NRBEs to economic development and community-based natural resource management in Machinga District	Lowore, J.	Apr-01
Document 30	Proceedings of the First National Conference on CBNRM in Malawi	Kapila, M., Shaba, T., Chadza, W., Yassin, B. and Mikuwa, M.	Jun-01
Document 31	Natural Resource Based Enterprises in Malawi: Action Plans	Watson, A.	Jun-01
Document 32	Examples of CBNRM Best Practices in Malawi	Moyo, N. & Epulani, F.	Jun-01
Document 33	Media Training for CBNRM Public Awareness	Kapila, M.	Jun-01
Document 34	April 1 - June 30, 2001: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jul-01
Document 35	Strategic Plan for CBNRM in Malawi	CBNRM Working Group	Oct-01
Document 36	Workplan: 2002	COMPASS	Oct-01
Document 37	July 1 - September 30, 2001: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Oct-01
Document 38	COMPASS Performance and Impact: 2000/2001	COMPASS	Dec-01
Document 39	Coordination of CBNRM in Malawi: Financing Options	Watson, A.	Jan-02
Document 40 (4 th draft)	Performance Monitoring for CBNRM in Malawi	CBNRM Working Group	Jun-02
Document 41	October 1 – December 31, 2001: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jan-02
Document 42	COMPASS Field Level Training Impact Evaluation: 2000/2001	Moyo, N.	Feb-02
Document 43	COMPASS Grantee Performance Report: 2001	Umphawi, A.	Mar-02
Document 44	Evaluation of COMPASS	Sambo, E., Carr, S., Omanbia, D. & Moore, T.	Aug-02
Document 45	January 1 - March 31, 2002: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Apr-02
Document 46	Community Tourism and Enterprise Training Manual	Kacal, S.	Jun-02
Document 47	Charcoal, Chiefs and Chambo: Status of CBNRM Policies in Malawi	Trick, P. & Manning, L.	Jun-02
Document 48	April 1 - June 30, 2002: Quarterly Report	COMPASS	Jul-02

Document 49 (draft)	Business Development and Marketing Strategy for Natural Resource Based Enterprises	Magai, G. & Nthambi, T	Aug-02
Internal Report 1	Building GIS Capabilities for the COMPASS Information System	Craven, D.	Nov-99
Internal Report 2	Reference Catalogue (3 rd Edition)	COMPASS	Feb-02
Internal Report 3	Workshop on Strategic Planning for the Wildlife Society of Malawi	Quinlan, K.	Apr-00
Internal Report 4	Directory of CBNRM Organizations (3 rd Edition)	COMPASS	Feb-02
Internal Report 5	Proceedings of Water Hyacinth Workshop for Mthunzi wa Malawi	Kapila, M. (editor)	Jun-00
Internal Report 6	COMPASS Grantee Performance Report	Umphawi, A.	Jun-00
Internal Report 7	Examples of CBNRM Best-Practices in Malawi	Moyo, N. and Epulani, F.	Jul-00
Internal Report 8	Software Application Training for COMPASS	Di Lorenzo, N.A.	Sep-00
Internal Report 9	Directory of COMPASS ListServ Members (2 nd Edition)	Watson, A.	Feb-02
Internal Report 10	Introductory Training in Applications of Geographic Information Systems and Remote Sensing	Kapila, M.	Feb-01
Internal Report 11	COMPASS TAMIS Grants Manual	Exo, S.	Mar-01
Internal Report 12	Review of Recommendations of the Lake Chilwa and Mpoto Lagoon Fisheries By-Laws Review Meeting	Nyirenda, K.	May-01
Internal Report 13	End-of-Term Evaluation of the Coordination Unit for the Rehabilitation of the Environment (CURE)	Sambo, E. Y.	Oct-01