

WORLD VISION, INC.

FINAL REPORT

**SUDAN EMERGENCY
OPERATIONAL PLAN**

GRANT NUMBER FFP--A-00-00032-00

DECEMBER 20, 2000

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	2
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
PROGRAM OVERVIEW	5
Background.....	5
Goal, Purpose and Objectives.....	5
Target Population	6
Geographic Coverage Area	6
PROGRAM PERFORMANCE	6
Achievement Against Objectives	6
Challenges and Solutions	8
Lessons Learned	8
Plans For the Future.....	9

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BEG	Bahr el Ghazal
CRS	Catholic Relief Services
EOP	Emergency Operational Plan
FFP	Food for Peace
FFW	Food for Work
ITSH	Inland Transport Storage and Handling
LWF	Lutheran World Federation
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MT	Metric Ton
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
SPLM	Sudan People's Liberation Movement
SPLM/U	Sudan Peoples' Liberation Movement –United
SRRA	Sudan Relief and Rehabilitation Association
SSIM	South Sudan Independence Movement
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WFP	World Food Program
WV	World Vision

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

WORLD VISION SUDAN EMERGENCY OPERATIONAL PLAN
--

Organization: World Vision, Inc. *Date:* December 11, 2000

Mailing Address:
220 I Street, NE, Suite 270
Washington, DC 20002

Contact Person:
Charles E. Owubah
Telephone: 202-547-3743
Fax: 202-547-4834
E-mail: cowubah@worldvision.org

Country & Region: Sudan, Bahr el Ghazal, Tonj and Gogrial Counties
Disaster (type): Complex Emergency / Transition

Project Description: Distribution of 5,914.81MT of commodities through three food-assisted activities including: Targeted general distributions, supplementary school feeding and Food for Work

Project Area: Tonj County and Pathoun Payam, Gogrial County
Total Population Affected: 300,000
WV Targeted Beneficiaries: 200,400
Period of Project: January 2000 – December 2000

Total Tonnage Approved: 5,914.81 MT

COMMODITY	QUANTITY (MT)
Sorghum	5,190.66
Lentils	642.02
Oil	82.13
Total	5,914.81

In response to a complex emergency situation in south Sudan World Vision, in October 1999, submitted an emergency operational plan (EOP) to Food for Peace (FFP). The purpose of the EOP was to distribute 5,914.91 MT of commodities to beneficiaries in Tonj and Gogrial counties, specifically in five payams (Ananatak, Akop, Kuanythii, Thiet and Luancjang) of Tonj county, and Pathuon payam in Gogrial county.

The EOP outlined two objectives: (a) provision of 5,914.81 MT of food to displaced and vulnerable people in Tonj and Gogrial counties, and (b) development of active community participation in the design, implementation and evaluation of World Vision Sudan's program. None of these objectives were accomplished for the following reasons:

Based on the design of the program, the commodities were expected to arrive in Mombasa, Kenya, in December 1999 to enable the program to start in January 2000. However, as a result of delays in the approval of the EOP and call forward, the food arrived in Mombasa in April 2000. Two events that occurred between January and the end of April 2000 are noteworthy.

In February 2000, World Vision borrowed 1,000 MT of commodities from Catholic Relief Services to start the project pending arrival of the shipment in Mombasa. As soon as the first consignment of the commodities (618.95 MT) reached World Vision stores in south Sudan, the organization was forced to temporarily suspend its activities in Sudan People's Liberation Movement (SPLM)-controlled areas of Sudan. World Vision pulled out of south Sudan to comply with a March 1, 2000 deadline from the Sudan Relief and Rehabilitation Association (SRRA), the civil wing of the SPLM. The temporary withdrawal resulted from a stalemate over a memorandum of understanding the SRRA had asked all non-governmental organizations operating in south Sudan to sign.

World Vision's temporary withdrawal from south Sudan coincided with the peak of Ethiopia's 2000 drought emergency, resulting in the diversion of a disproportionate quantity of the commodities meant for the EOP to Ethiopia to support relief activities in the country. Out of the 5,914.81 MT meant for the project, only 1,526.32 MT reached Mombasa in April 2000. A thousand metric tons out of the 1,526.32 MT was used to repay for the loan from CRS. Per FFP's approval, the rest was donated to the World Food Programme (WFP) of the United Nations to support on going relief food distributions in Kenya.

About 379 MT of commodities in World Vision's warehouse in Koboko, Uganda (part of 1,000 MT of commodities borrowed from CRS), was donated to Lutheran World Relief (LWR). The closing date of the program was extended from September 30, 2000 to December 15, 2000 to enable World Vision transfer the commodities to LWR and WFP.

Before suspending activities in south Sudan, World Vision arranged with SRRA to take custody of commodities in World Vision stores, but SRRA without permission from World Vision nor FFP distributed the commodities to non-targeted beneficiaries in south Sudan. A multi-agency team comprising World Vision, FFP, and SRRA officials investigated the issue and gave SRRA the benefit of the doubt by accepting that 251.94 MT of the commodities may have been distributed to legitimate beneficiaries. The team also found SRRA liable for misappropriating 367.01 MT of the commodities. The team however gave SRRA the benefit of the doubt by acknowledging that 251.94 MT of the commodities might have been distributed to legitimate beneficiaries. World Vision has filed claims against SRRA, and discussions regarding restitution are on going among World Vision, FFP and SRRA.

PROGRAM OVERVIEW

BACKGROUND

Sudan, Africa's largest country, has been plagued by a civil conflict since 1956 when the country achieved independence. The current phase of hostilities between predominantly people from Arab origin in the north versus those from African ethnicity in the south dates back to 1983 and continues to have devastating effects on the social and economic status of Sudan.

The most affected region is southern Sudan where development is extremely limited. The region therefore remains the most isolated and least developed in Africa. The civil war has led to loss of life, destruction of property and violation of basic human rights.

Bahr El Ghazal (BEG) region where Tonj and Gogrial county are located experiences alternating years of severe weather conditions consisting of prolonged rains leading to flooding and prolonged drought resulting in crop failure. Combined with war, insecurity and massive displacement, famine and starvation have become regular occurrences in BEG. In addition, most of the area lacks regular access to markets, essential commodities, and health services. The people live in a food deficit area with little access to safe water and sanitation. The area has also been severely affected by massive migrations of displaced persons fleeing areas of fighting in search of safety, food and water.

Famine swept the entire region of BEG in 1998 and the effects continued through to 1999. In 1998, WV distributed 3,500 MT of food in Tonj county and was forced to reduce the ration size from 50% to a further 25% to cater for a 50% increase in beneficiary population. To mitigate against another famine in 1999, WV designed a food project of 11,000 MT of cereals and pulses that targeted 127,519 beneficiaries in Tonj and Gogrial counties. In 2000, WV's Emergency Operational Plan was designed to stabilize the communities through improved food security among the residents and internally displaced persons (IDPs) in Tonj and Gogrial counties.

GOAL, PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES

The goal, purpose and objectives of the program as defined in the EOP were as follows:

Goal: World Vision's overall goal in Sudan is – To promote and build self-reliance for southern Sudanese.

Purpose: Consistent with FFP Strategic Objective 1, the purpose of this EOP is – Improved food security in Tonj and Gogrial counties (Pathuon Payam), Bahr El Ghazal.

Objectives:

1. Up to 5,929.28 MT of food provided to displaced and vulnerable people in Tonj and Gogrial counties by December 2000.
2. Development of active community participation in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of WV's Sudan program

TARGET POPULATION

The project targeted a total of 200,400 beneficiaries broken down as follows:

- 158,000 individuals – resident population in Tonj and Gogrial counties.
- 25,000 individuals – internally displaced in Tonj and Gogrial counties.
- 14,280 individuals – dependants of 2,380 doing FFW in both counties.
- 3,120 individuals – under Institutional Feeding program.

GEOGRAPHIC COVERAGE AREA

Southern Sudan is geographically divided into five main areas or provinces namely Upper Nile, Bahr El Ghazal, Equatoria, Lakes and Jonglei. These provinces experience different climatic conditions and weather patterns. Various ethnic groups engage in different economic activities mainly subsistence farming and livestock keeping. The EOP covered Bahr el Ghazal, which is mainly occupied by the Dinka tribe – a Nilotic community known for their cattle keeping and rich pastoral culture. Prolonged years of insecurity and severe weather conditions have continued to rob the Dinka community of their wealth. Their coping and survival mechanism has also been eroded subjecting them to dependence on external assistance.

Due to adverse weather conditions and poor infrastructure in BEG, the region is mostly served through air transport from Lokichoggio in North Western Kenya. The road corridor from Koboko in Northern Uganda is only usable during the 4 month of dry season from December through to April.

PROGRAM PERFORMANCE

ACHIEVEMENT AGAINST OBJECTIVES

Objective 1:

Up to 5,929.28 MT of food provided to displaced and vulnerable people in Tonj and Gogrial counties by December 2000.

This objective was not accomplished.

It was expected that the 5,914.81 MT of commodities would arrive in Mombasa before January 2000 to enable World Vision implement the project as planned. However, the commodities arrived in April 2000. To ensure that the project started on time, WV borrowed 1000 MT from CRS to start the program in Tonj and Gogrial counties. However, as soon as the first consignment of 618.95 MT landed in Sudan, and before any distribution could be carried out, there was the issue of the MOU between SRRA and NGOs over its contents. WV was one of the NGOs that withdrew its services from Sudan for not signing the MOU before the deadline of March 1, 2000. As a result, WV suspended the food program pending negotiations. Unfortunately before any agreement could be reached, the SRRA and local authorities in Tonj and Gogrial counties removed all the food from the stores and purportedly distributed it without authorization.

A multi agency investigation team comprising WV, FFP and SRRA established that 367.01 MT was misappropriated by SRRA and a claim has since been filed against SRRA demanding restitution. Prior to WV's withdrawal, there was an agreement to provide 150 MT to MSF Swiss supported hospital in Marial. During investigation, the team found out that SRRA had gone ahead to provide the same amount of food to the hospital. Therefore, the investigating team gave SRRA a benefit of the doubt by accepting that 251.940 MT were issued to legitimate beneficiaries as follows:

Beneficiary	Household	Ration	Qty (MT)
MSF Hospital			150.00
Comboni TB Clinic			25.00
Yinthkuel Displaced	500	6.5Kg/pp/month	39.00
Tonj Displaced	200	6.5Kg/pp/month	15.60
Marial Displaced	30	6.5Kg/pp/month	2.34
FFW			20.00
TOTAL			251.94

Notes: Estimated # beneficiaries per household = 6
The average ration size used by SRRA = 6.5kg/month

Objective 2:

Development of active community participation in the design, implementation monitoring and evaluation of WV Sudan program.

This objective was also not accomplished, and it stems from the impasse over the signing of the MOU, and World Vision's subsequent withdrawal from south Sudan.

The table below shows a summary of commodities received by WV and how it was used.

	SORGHUM	LENTILS	VEG. OIL	BEANS	TOTAL
Received from CRS loan	600.00	400.00			1,000.00
Imported shipments	800.00	499.68	88.89	137.75	1,526.32
Excesses	4.75	0.05			4.80
TOTAL RECEIPTS	1,404.75	899.73	88.89	137.75	2,531.12
Loan repayments to CRS	600.00	400.00			1,000.00
Transfers to WFP	1.65	292.45	79.975	136.10	510.175
Transfers to LWF	310.90	68.75			379.65
TOTAL TRANSFERS	312.55	361.20	79.975	136.10	889.825
Distributed by SRRA	233.80	18.14			251.94
Misappropriated by SRRA	256.75	110.26			367.01
TOTAL	490.55	128.4			618.95
LOSSES	1.65	10.13	8.915	1.65	22.345
BALANCE	0	0	0	0	0

CHALLENGES AND SOLUTIONS

The delay in the arrival of the food at the port of Mombasa posed a challenge to program implementation especially considering the fact that successful road delivery is only possible within the 4 months of the dry season between December and April. WV was consequently forced to borrow 1,000 MT (cereals and pulses) from CRS in February 2000 so as to start the program on time while waiting for the consignment, which finally arrived at the port of Mombasa only in April 2000.

After WV suspended its program activities in SPLM controlled held areas, food amounting to 367.010 MT was misappropriated by SRRA, while 251.940 MT was distributed without consulting WV nor FFP. Discussions with SRRA, FFP officials and WV management have resolved that the food misappropriated needs to be paid back.

When WV programs activities were suspended, there was 379.65 MT of food in Koboko, which was in transit to Sudan, and an additional 510 MT in Mombasa. An agreement between WV and FFP was reached to donate these commodities to support on going drought emergency in Kenya. The food in Koboko was donated to Lutheran World Relief (LWR) for use in Sudan, while the food in Mombasa was donated to WFP to address the famine in Kenya.

While the process of transferring the commodities to LWR proceeded relatively smoothly, the transfer to WFP was long and arduous. In line with FFP's letter authorizing the transfer, WFP was responsible for "clearing" the food at the warehouse in Mombasa. Government of Kenya required the status of the food allocated to WFP to be changed from being in transit to Sudan to use in Kenya. Contrary to expectation, WFP refused to be involved in the process of "clearing" the food with Government of Kenya Customs Authorities, leaving World Vision with no choice than to "clear" the food. This process took months to complete, resulting in World Vision applying for a no-cost extension from September 30, 2000 to December 15, 2000.

LESSONS LEARNED

Food aid programs in Sudan have always been carried out with significant challenges. Every year is unique in terms of the challenges that face NGOs implementing food aid programs. These challenges often result from delays in donor response, logistics preparation, security, weather conditions, and friction between Sudanese counterparts in the field.

Project design and approval, and particularly call forward and arrival of commodities at the designated port, often takes a long time. An emergency project in an area such as southern Sudan with varied weather conditions and landlocked with non-existent or underdeveloped infrastructure and services needs to be implemented swiftly. To achieve this objective, there is need for adequate project planning and preparation.

For future food programs, the internal logistics and storage systems will have to be studied in detail to determine the pros and cons of stock piling in central warehouses versus a decentralized storage system. WV's experience shows that a decentralized system is advantageous in terms of easy access to the beneficiaries.

Involvement of the local authority and community in project management and decision making is very important to the success of any project. There were significant gains, for example, in 1999 when WV formed the County and Payam relief committees and empowered them to participate in beneficiary identification and registration. The relief committees played a crucial role in decisions regarding food allocation within the counties according to population. Continued empowerment of local communities is key to communal ownership of programs. WV believes that working together with the community increases trustworthiness between the agency and the community while improving relationships.

PLANS FOR THE FUTURE

There has been progress in terms of revision to the MOU, but World Vision has not as yet decided to go back to SPLM-controlled area of south Sudan. Depending on when the revised MOU will be finalized, World Vision may not be working in SPLM-controlled area for a while. However, the organization is ready to respond anytime to any humanitarian crisis with support from donors and WV partnership, and if invited by SRRA to do so.

WV has begun emergency programs in the Upper Nile area controlled by other factions namely South Sudan Independent Movement (SSIM), Sudan People's Liberation Movement United (SPLM United) and Sudan People's Defence Force (SPDF). An emergency nutrition program has started in Waat district, Bieh state. A similar program is planned for in Wudier district, Latjor state.

Due to logistical challenges in Upper Nile as well as frequent security threats, WV will not be involved in food aid programming immediately. Operation Lifeline Sudan (OLS) has not opened a road corridor through which food and other relief supplies could be channeled to the Upper Nile region. This is because the terrain is very rough and the road would have to pass through territories controlled by various factions. Currently all supplies to this region are delivered by air from Lokichoggio in Kenya. This makes the logistic operation almost 3 times more expensive as compared to road transport.

WV will continue to work with other UN agencies including UNICEF and WFP in the assessment and monitoring of nutritional status and any urgent or long-term food requirements within the communities where the organization has will be operating. Where needed, WV will take the lead in the same areas to facilitate WFP in its efforts to provide food aid to needy communities.