

FINAL EVALUATION
MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT

Prepared for:

**The Urban Development Division
Project Management Office
Regional Economic Development Services Office
West and Central Africa
United States Agency for International Development**

By:

Dr. Peter L. Doan

**Consultant to:
INTERNATIONAL CITY/COUNTY MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION
Washington, D.C.**

August 1994

Contract No. PDC-1008-C-00-9091-00

The views herein are those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the U.S. Agency for International Development.

FINAL EVALUATION
MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT

<u>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</u>	iv
I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
A. <u>BACKGROUND</u>	1
1. <u>Decentralization and Economic Crisis in Côte d'Ivoire</u>	1
2. <u>Evolution of the Municipal Management Training Project</u>	2
B. <u>SCOPE OF WORK</u>	3
C. <u>METHODOLOGY</u>	4
II. <u>EVALUATION FINDINGS</u>	5
A. <u>REGIONAL-LEVEL TRAINING ACTIVITIES AND CONFERENCES</u>	5
1. <u>Regional Conference Participation</u>	5
2. <u>Conference Evaluations</u>	6
B. <u>NATIONAL-LEVEL TRAINING ACTIVITIES AND CONFERENCES</u>	7
1. <u>National Conferences</u>	7
2. <u>Study Tours</u>	9
3. <u>Training for Trainers vs. General Management Training</u>	10
C. <u>LOCAL-LEVEL TRAINING SEMINARS</u>	11
1. <u>Successful Resource Mobilization Seminars</u>	11
2. <u>Value of Hands-on Training</u>	12
3. <u>Importance of Local Participation</u>	13

4.	<u>Unmet Demand for Additional Seminars</u>	13
D.	<u>UNFORESEEN EVENTS</u>	15
1.	<u>Political Instability in the Region</u>	15
2.	<u>Economic Crisis in West Africa Region</u>	15
3.	<u>Closing of RHUDO Office</u>	16
4.	<u>Termination of Bilateral Côte d'Ivoire Assistance Program</u>	17
E.	<u>ATTAINMENT OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES</u>	18
1.	<u>Training Activities in Decentralization and Privatization</u>	18
2.	<u>Relationship with Public and Private Training Institutions</u>	18
3.	<u>Meeting USAID Mission Training Needs</u>	19
4.	<u>Preparation of Courses and Training Manuals for Municipal Management Capability</u>	19
F.	<u>EFFECTIVENESS OF REGIONAL PROJECT MECHANISM</u>	20
1.	<u>Strength of Linked Regional Training Activities</u>	20
2.	<u>Funding Training Through Mission Buy-Ins</u>	21
3.	<u>Contracting Difficulties and Delays</u>	21
III.	<u>LESSONS LEARNED – MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT</u>	22
A.	<u>INNOVATIVE TRAINING APPROACH</u>	22
B.	<u>DECENTRALIZATION EQUALS "DEMOCRATIZATION IN THE TRENCHES"</u>	22
C.	<u>PARTICIPATION OF LOCAL INSTITUTIONS AND ENTREPRENEURS</u>	23

D. <u>REFLECTIONS ON THE USE OF REGIONAL PROJECTS</u>	24
E. <u>IMPORTANCE OF REGULAR FOLLOW-UP OF TRAINING ACTIVITIES</u>	25
<u>REFERENCES</u>	27
<u>TABLE 1</u>	28
<u>TABLE 2</u>	29
<u>List of Persons Interviewed</u>	30
<u>French Translations</u>	31

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT

A. BACKGROUND AND PROJECT OVERVIEW

This report constitutes the final evaluation of the Municipal Management Training Project (MMTP). This project was originally developed by the Regional Housing and Urban Development Office for West and Central Africa (RHUDO) in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire, to provide municipal management training activities throughout the region. The project was initially authorized in 1986 and was extended in 1988 and 1990. The same contractor, Research Triangle Institute, ran this contract for the life of the project. After the RHUDO was closed in 1992, project oversight was transferred to the Urban Development Division (UDD) of the Regional Economic Development Services Office (REDSO).

A defining feature of this project was its orientation to training in both the Côte d'Ivoire and other countries in the region. Over the life of the project, the MMTP conducted 54 training activities in 12 countries for 1,127 participants. A variety of training activities were undertaken by the project, including: regional conferences with attendance by participants from multiple countries, national-level conferences with attendance by key national decision makers, and local level seminars with an emphasis on issues of primarily local concern. Many of the training activities used experience the government of Côte d'Ivoire (GOCI) had gained in its ongoing decentralization program and its path-breaking municipal elections in 1980, 1985, and 1990. The Ivoirian experience with decentralization and democratization at the municipal level preceded similar trends in the region a decade later and thus provided valuable lessons that were incorporated in the broader training activities.

B. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

1. Training Activities in Decentralization and Privatization

Regional and National Conferences. The project has clearly met this objective with its major focus on these two interrelated concepts. Activities at the regional and national levels facilitated discussion of these themes and helped host country participants recognize the utility of these notions. Conference and seminar participants in virtually every case were quite pleased with the activities' substance and usefulness.

Study Tours. Study tours around the West African region, but particularly to Côte d'Ivoire, were also a cost-effective means of reinforcing the ideas disseminated at regional and national conferences. These tours were well received by participating government officials and provided a cost-effective and extremely

practical means of illustrating the value of municipal elections or the utility of private garbage collection services.

Local Seminars. Local-level training activities—especially the local resource mobilization seminars—appear to have been the most successful portion of the project. The substance of the training was clearly excellent, with a hands-on orientation in which actual procedures for collecting market taxes were discussed in detail. Broad-based participation from a range of local institutions, including elected and traditional authorities, local government employees, and non-governmental organizations, as well as the explicit participation of representatives from each of the main business groups, was critical to the consensus-building necessary to construct an action plan that could be successfully implemented. The high quality and utility of these seminars are demonstrated by the number of requests for additional repetitions of the sessions in other municipalities throughout the region.

2. Relationship with Public and Private Training Institutions. This objective was only partially met. In each country there were discussions with national training institutions, and in several cases there were joint training activities. However, developing a capacity for municipal management training in these institutions is a time-consuming and expensive task. No country in the region appears to have developed the capacity to conduct this highly successful training element without assistance. For this reason, joint training exercises with other donor participation has proved to be more effective. The Hanns Seidel Foundation (HSF) has engaged in several productive joint exercises with the MMTP throughout the region. For example, in Burkina Faso, HSF and the École National d'Administration will conduct joint training activities for officials from a variety of municipalities funded by the local USAID mission at the recommendation of the RTI project coordinator.

3. Meeting USAID Mission Training Needs. This objective has also been effectively met. The value of the project to local missions was demonstrated by the cabled messages of satisfaction with the project activities, which were provided from Mali, Guinea, and Burkina Faso before the contract extension in 1993, and by several missions' contribution of HRDA funds to support core project costs.

4. Preparation of Courses and Manuals for Municipal Management. This objective has been partially met. Most training activities have had a direct focus on decentralization, privatization, and local resource mobilization. However, many of the training activities mentioned in the project paper objective (management of shelter, community facilities, and urban community development) are beyond the means of a regional project with a minimal training budget. Although most missions were willing to participate in broader activities, many of the activities listed in this objective

are too specific to be funded with USAID mission "buy-ins." They are more appropriate for an intensive level of training activity conducted within a single country, such as the Municipal Development Support Project (MDSP) in Côte d'Ivoire.

C. UNFORESEEN EVENTS

1. Political Instability. Political instability in the region has had a direct effect on the project's ability to carry out its regional agenda. Political unrest in Guinea, Togo, and Niger has curtailed otherwise promising activities in those countries.

2. Closing of RHUDO Office. The closing of the RHUDO office in June 1992 clearly had a major impact on the project, depriving project management of the large direct benefits from the close relationship between the contractor and the RHUDO office cited in the 1990 project evaluation. The project's absorption into the REDSO offices increased the bureaucratic approvals required to get project activities authorized and funds committed, and protracted discussions with the contracts office over minor details caused numerous delays to scheduled training activities.

3. Termination of Bilateral Mission. The decision to terminate the bilateral assistance program with Côte d'Ivoire has also had a marked impact on the project and for the continuation of future project benefits. The sudden closing of the bilateral mission will prevent the kind of direct follow-up activities envisioned in the original project design. Because the Côte d'Ivoire is widely acknowledged by other countries in the region to be a leader in democratization and decentralization, terminating the bilateral assistance program dramatically constrains USAID's ability to continue monitoring progress in decentralization and communal development at the local level. This is extremely important because many other countries in the region have come to look at the Côte d'Ivoire's achievements as a model for their own development strategies. In short, by closing the bilateral program, USAID has largely cut itself out of the very successful regional coordination and exchange mechanisms that it pioneered in the MMTP project. This is a pity, because USAID had achieved a real leadership position among other donors in the area of decentralization and communal training activities with a relatively small expenditure of funds.

D. LESSONS LEARNED

1. Innovative Training Approach. One of the project's most innovative and successful results was to create an interconnected network of regional, national, and local activities. By using a combination of international, national, and local experts to stimulate discussions on a variety of topics, this project effectively promoted useful dialogue and exchange. Although other donors have had some experience in municipal training, the MMTP

training approach provided hands-on activities and examples. It is unlikely that the more theoretically based training activities favored by other donors (such as the UNDP and ILO) can achieve the same results.

2. Decentralization Equals "Democratization in the Trenches". Decentralized municipal development is the "cutting edge" of democratization. The municipalities are the primary locus of democratic activity not only in Côte d'Ivoire, but also in Mali, and in the near future, Burkina Faso (if the anticipated elections occur in February 1995). If the democratic initiatives are to succeed, they must work at this level. The opportunity to strengthen fragile municipal institutions presents a unique opening for outside management training and assistance such as those provided by the MMTP, but failure to sustain these institutions also poses the greatest threat to the democratic gains that have been achieved over the last decade or so.

3. Participation of Local Institutions and Entrepreneurs. One of the most effective elements of the training strategy used in the local seminars was the inclusion of participants from a variety of different agencies and organizations. This was a conscious decision to develop a broad base of support for resource mobilization activities that were not widely understood or recognized as important for municipal development. Because the idea of collecting local taxes for local projects is still quite new, the project recognized that building confidence in locally elected (or in some cases still appointed) government was a critical task. However, the key to maintaining confidence is to continue providing the promised services, and in this area, the project effects are far from secure.

4. Reflections on the Use of Regional Projects. The regional project approach pioneered by the MMTP appears to be an effective vehicle for innovative concepts that are not yet widely accepted or understood by more traditionally oriented missions. Often, new or innovative project activities do not have a logical place in the existing portfolios of mission projects and may not be reflected in existing country programs or strategy statements. The combination of decentralization and democratization is an example that the MMTP has effectively disseminated across the region. The challenge of regional projects is the difficulty of providing follow-up on such a wide variety of projects. In addition, in this particular project (MMTP), the proportion of the training budget for regional work was too small, forcing the project coordinator to rely almost exclusively on mission buy-ins, which caused real contracting bottlenecks in Abidjan. A better mechanism for such projects would be to fund a basic regional training component that could then be supplemented by mission buy-ins. Using mission buy-ins can be a productive way to ensure that a regional project is meeting country-specific needs, but, because of the need to fit in with mission funding cycles, it does impose considerable costs in terms

of delays from contracting complexities and scheduling difficulties.

5. Importance of Regular Follow-up of Training Activities. A consistent lesson from this project is that training cannot be considered a one-shot affair. Even when the need for additional technical skills is evident at the local level, having an effective follow-up program is essential. Municipal officials are under-trained and often receive more demands for assistance than they have time to provide. This means that, in spite of good intentions to implement necessary changes, it may be difficult for a given official to adopt new operating methods because he or she does not have the time to establish the new procedures. One possibility for resolving the follow-up problem would be to use Peace Corps volunteers working in urban settings to fill this gap. In the Côte d'Ivoire, the Urban Environmental Management Program has been quite successful in placing volunteers in urban planning positions in which they do community organizing and basic technical training for community groups and work closely with municipal officials to define local needs and municipal service options.

FINAL EVALUATION
MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT

I. INTRODUCTION

A. BACKGROUND

1. Decentralization and Economic Crisis in Côte d'Ivoire. Throughout the 1960s and 1970s, Côte d'Ivoire experienced a period of rapid economic growth, based largely on its production of agricultural cash crops, particularly coffee and cocoa. The annual rate of GDP growth has been estimated at 7.5% for the period 1960 to 1980 (Stren and Attahi, 1991). The strength of this economic "boom" period is unprecedented in Sub-Saharan Africa. Some have attributed it to the steady leadership of Felix Houphouët-Boigny and others have attributed it to the high levels of investment and involvement by expatriates, particularly the French, in the economy (den Tuinder, 1978). At any rate, the growth enabled the government of the Côte d'Ivoire (GOCI) to make large investments in infrastructure in Abidjan and other key cities, as well as in basic transportation infrastructure throughout the country.

By the late 1970s, however, the luster was fading on the economic miracle, and the country was beginning to experience a growing economic crisis as world prices for key export crops began to erode. In partial response to this economic crisis, in 1980 the government permitted for the first time "semi-competitive" elections for 37 municipalities. In 1985, the GOCI created an additional 85 municipalities before the elections for both municipal councilors and mayors (Stren et al., 1993). In 1990, the elections were repeated, and this time representatives of opposition parties were allowed to run and, in some cases, were elected. The increasing economic difficulties and the greater local responsibility for the provision of municipal services created a

crisis at the municipal level, where technical staff had limited basic skill levels and even more limited financial resources.

2. Evolution of the Municipal Management Training Project. In this context, after the 1985 municipal elections the Regional Housing and Urban Development Office for West and Central Africa (RHUDO) in Abidjan developed a proposal for a Municipal Management Training Project to address some of these problems. The project was subsequently authorized on July 17, 1986, for a 2-year period. This project was intended as a training program to support activities in secondary cities under the Housing Guaranty program (HG-0004). The original project objectives were:

- to establish and manage a RHUDO training program;
- to work with private and public training institutions to provide training throughout the region;
- to create a regional resource center that would disseminate information, conduct training programs, sponsor information forums, undertake research activities, and set up study tours; and
- to encourage collaborative donor efforts in the training field in RHUDO's sphere of interest.

Work actually began on this project's initial phase in January 1987 after the arrival of Hal Minis, training coordinator for the contractor, Research Triangle Institute. In September 1988, the contract was extended for another 2 years, and work began with arrival of the new training coordinator, Jean-Michel Lebreton, in January 1989. This contract renewal included two new objectives:

- to meet the training needs of various USAID missions within RHUDO's area of competence; and
- to prepare training manuals and courses that would strengthen municipal management capabilities.

In 1990, the project's activities were extended once again and essentially divided into two separate project components. The first project, known as the Municipal Management Training Project (MMTP), was developed to continue the previous training activities

in the region outside of the Côte d'Ivoire. This contract renewal a modified set of objectives:

- to conduct training activities and policy discussions to support the efforts of participating countries to decentralize urban development responsibilities and increase private sector urban services provision;
- to establish working relationships with public and private training institutions within the region and provide train-the-trainer assistance to these institutions at an appropriate level;
- to meet the training needs of various USAID missions within specified areas of competence; and
- to prepare training manuals and courses and to conduct training with the assistance of local trainers which would strengthen municipal management capabilities to manage infrastructure, shelter, community facilities, community development, and economic development projects.

A second project with the same contractor included the training component for municipal development activities within the Côte d'Ivoire under the larger Municipal Development Support Project (MDSP). In addition to the ongoing municipal management training activities managed by RTI, MDSP included other activities managed by RHUDO and then REDSO such as financing for cadastral surveys and equipment to improve property tax records and collection, and financing for direct revenue-generating projects, such as markets, bus terminals, and slaughterhouses. Both projects were approved for an initial 2-year term and were extended for a third year. The decision to close the bilateral assistance program with Côte d'Ivoire effectively gave both MDSP and MMTP an effective termination date of August 1994, although some of the construction activities of MDSP are scheduled to continue until December 1994.

B. SCOPE OF WORK

The scope of work for the contract under which this evaluation is being conducted includes an evaluation of both the Municipal

Management Training Project (MMTP) and the Municipal Development Support Project (MDSP). Both the MMTP and the training component of the MDSP were carried out by the same contractor, Research Triangle Institute. This report, however presents only the results of the evaluation of the MMTP; the MDSP evaluation results will be presented in a separate report as specified in the terms of reference for the final evaluations.

C. METHODOLOGY

This evaluation was carried out by a training specialist, Dr. Peter L. Doan, consultant to the International City/County Management Association under USAID contract no. PDC-1008-C-00-9091-00. The field work took place during July and August of 1994.

The evaluation process consisted of a thorough review of files, progress reports, previous evaluations, proceedings from seminars and conferences, trip reports, and field research studies. Interviews were conducted with project management personnel and training staff as well as REDSO/PMO/UD staff in Abidjan. The evaluator also traveled to Burkina Faso and Mali to interview USAID mission staff, host country Ministry representatives, and seminar participants from three municipalities. As indicated in the scope of work, no surveys were undertaken in the context of this evaluation because of the evaluation's limited time frame. In addition, although the initial scope of work called for travel to Guinea as well as Mali and Burkina Faso, after reviewing the limited time available and restricted flight schedules, both the RTI training coordinator and the UDD staff concurred with the evaluators that this travel was not essential and could be omitted.

II. EVALUATION FINDINGS

A. REGIONAL-LEVEL TRAINING ACTIVITIES AND CONFERENCES

The MMTP training activities were spearheaded by large-scale regional conferences that formed the apex of a broad pyramid of activities that stretched down to the municipal level throughout the region. Over the life of the project, the MMTP conducted 54 training activities in 12 countries for 1,127 participants. The regional-level training activities were highly visible and quite successful components of the overall project effort.

1. Regional Conference Participation. The regional conference activities included nine conferences (see Annex A for a list of conference topics, locations, and dates) held between September 1987 and March 1994. Of these conferences, seven took place in the Côte d'Ivoire (six in Abidjan and one in Yamoussoukro), and two were held in Lome, Togo. Participation at regional conferences was broadly based (see Table 1 in the Annexes), including 575 individuals from 17 countries (301 people in 1987-1991 and 274 in 1991-1994). By far the largest number of participants was from the Côte d'Ivoire (293); however, substantial numbers of participants also attended conferences from Burkina Faso (46), Senegal (40), Togo (36), Guinea (24), Niger (23), and Mali (21). In addition, 19 representatives from six anglophone countries were invited to the Yamoussoukro Market Town conference in 1989.

During the most recent phase of the project (1991-1994), there was a shift away from inviting participants from Zaire, Guinea Bissau, and Togo and an extension of invitations to other francophone countries in Central and Southern Africa, including Madagascar, Rwanda, and the Congo. The deletions are more a function of political instability in these countries, whereas the extensions are a result of a conscious effort to expand training activities throughout the francophone zone. However, the proportion of participants from the Côte d'Ivoire increased during the second

phase of the project, from 35% in the first phase (1987-1991) to 68% during the later years. While this is partly understandable because of the increased intensity of activities undertaken by RTI in the Côte d'Ivoire in conjunction with the MDSP, it does represent a significant reorientation of regional conference participation toward the country that has made the greatest progress in decentralization and democratization in the region.

2. Conference Evaluations. The quality of the regional conferences was uniformly high. The organization of each conference was slightly different, but they followed the same basic model. Each conference was sponsored by a key Ministry of the host country, usually one concerned with decentralization and/or municipal development. The conference would typically be opened by a high official, usually the Minister, as well as the U.S. ambassador or USAID director. The program usually included an expatriate keynote speaker from either France or the U.S. In line with the main conference theme, a number of speakers from countries in the region would make presentations on their own experience.

The conference programs typically included presentations in plenary sessions, working groups on carefully selected themes, and a final working session in a plenary where action plans would be presented for each participating country. The open style of the conferences actively encouraged open discussions and allowed participants to engage in wide-ranging debates on the conference topics. Thus, the conferences created a valuable forum for dialogue and exchange among the participants from the various countries.

The two conferences receiving the widest acclaim were the 1989 Conference on Market Town Development and Rural Growth held in Yamoussoukro, and the 1994 Conference on Building Confidence Between Local Governments and their Constituencies held in Abidjan. Each of these were cited by various people interviewed during the course of the study as providing important exposure to new ideas and for the opportunity to exchange viewpoints and experiences

among West African countries. For example, the market town conference generated requests for additional training activities in both Guinea and Niger. Participants in the Building Confidence Conference from both Mali and Burkina Faso, as well as mayors from the Côte d'Ivoire, indicated that this activity was highly successful in increasing awareness of an extremely important subject area.

Because of the limited time available, it was not possible to interview participants from the other conferences and thereby gain an independent assessment of their content. However, post-conference evaluations were conducted for these activities by the contractor, and they suggest that, on the whole, participants were very satisfied with the quality of the conference presentations. In addition, a review of conference materials and documentation suggests that the topics covered were important and directly within the main focus of the project.

B. NATIONAL-LEVEL TRAINING ACTIVITIES AND CONFERENCES

In general, training events at the national level can be divided into national-level conferences, training seminars, research studies in the host country, and study tours to other countries. Most of these activities appear to have been quite useful and are discussed in greater detail below.

1. National Conferences. The highest-profile activities were the national conferences, which assembled participants from various agencies, ministries, regions, and local municipalities to discuss in detail a particular topic. The topics were selected by the resident training expert from RTI, often in collaboration with mission representatives, or in some cases, in response to expressed local needs. Once more, the topics selected were key issues of decentralization, municipal development, and the privatization of urban services.

The general framework of the national conferences resembled that of the regional conferences. However, in place of invited participants from five or more countries, the emphasis at this level was on bringing key actors and decision makers from concerned ministries, various government agencies, municipalities, and local government authorities. Sometimes, an outside keynote speaker was used either from the West or from another country in the region such as the Côte d'Ivoire; however, the bulk of the discussion focused on issues of primarily local concern.

Three specific examples of conferences give a good flavor of this activity. The National Conference on Managing and Financing Decentralization, held in Burkina Faso in 1989, had 86 participants and offered a variety of well-prepared papers and presentations on decentralization and its relevance to Burkina Faso. The conference's usefulness is demonstrated by an unprompted citation by a former Minister of Territorial Administration as a particular example of excellence. He indicated that, at the time of the conference, he had not yet become a Minister and so did not attend the conference. However, after he became Minister he had to learn quickly about the status of decentralization, and he found that the conference proceedings were particularly useful.

The National Conference on Market Towns and Rural Development, held in Conakry, Guinea, in 1990 is a good example of a national-level conference that served as a locus for disseminating ideas about decentralization and communal development activities. A government official who had attended the regional conference in Yamoussoukro on a similar topic requested this conference in particular. He wanted to replicate the conference at the national level in Guinea because he thought the ideas expressed at the earlier conference would be especially useful in Guinea. This conference featured 153 participants, mostly from Guinea, with several international experts and several speakers from other West African nations with relevant experience to share. The success of this conference can be seen by the subsequent willingness of the Guinean government to co-sponsor a series of local seminars on the

mobilization of resources in market towns in the interior of Guinea (Pita, Gueckedou, Forecariah, and Kankan).

The third example of a well-planned activity at the national level is the National Seminar on the Privatization of Municipal Services and Local Participation, held in Bamako in mid-1994 for 85 participants. This conference was the first major activity sponsored by the Association des Maires de Mali (AMM) and represents an important first step for this incipient organization. Previous work by RTI with the Union des Villes and Communes de Côte d'Ivoire (UVICOCI) demonstrated the important role that an association of mayors could play in providing assistance to mayors and their municipalities. A similar conference with UVICOCI in Yamoussoukro, funded by USAID through the MDSP project, had very satisfactory results. The President of the AMM expressed great satisfaction with the Malian conference and helped to get its association started on a good foot. This conference was also cited by several other government officials, who indicated that, in spite of initial skepticism, participants eventually realized what was meant by privatization. Participants realized that, instead of causing municipal workers to lose their jobs, as some feared, privatizing municipal services could be extremely helpful for local governments constrained by very tight budgets.

2. Study Tours. Study tours around the West African region, but particularly to Côte d'Ivoire, were also a cost-effective means of reinforcing ideas disseminated at regional and national conferences. By selecting influential representatives of municipalities and central government support agencies, the MMTP project was able to provide hands-on experience with decentralized municipal governance to key decision makers. These tours were well received by participating government officials from Burkina Faso (4), Guinea (7), Madagascar (1), Niger (7), Senegal (9). A similar study tour has been requested by officials in Mali, but has not yet taken place.

3. Training for Trainers vs. General Management Training. The project objectives specifically call for the MMTP to coordinate with local training institutions to build a capacity for sustainable municipal training activities. As a result, train-the-trainer workshops were held in Guinea in 1990, in Burkina Faso in 1992, and in Niger in 1994. These activities were an important first step in establishing a credible municipal training capacity. However, more training in this area is critical if a long-term capacity is to be developed for the future.

Unfortunately, subsequent national-level training activities did not fit as clearly within the scope of the MMTP. The two management training sessions conducted in Ouagadougou and Conakry focused on sound, but quite general, "management techniques." Although these activities appear to have been well conceived theoretically and satisfactorily presented, the lack of a specific municipal training orientation was disappointing. Although such generalized training may be important for bureaucrats in national-level ministries, they are likely to have only a secondary effect on municipal development activities. In both Burkina Faso and Guinea, the training focused on management skills for the number two professional (Directeur General) in a wide variety of Ministries. An evaluation of the first such training in Guinea revealed that this training was popular among those who received it, but many of the trainees (roughly half) were no longer in the same administrative positions.

Unfortunately, a down side of the mission "buy-in" nature of the MMTP funding mechanism is the need to provide training products desired by the missions and host country agencies. It is possible that, to establish credibility and lay the groundwork for future training activities, the project may have provided activities as requested by mission training staff or by host country counterparts. Establishing linkages with national-level training institutions such as the École Nationale d'Administration is within the project's scope, and generalized management training does fall squarely within the charge of such institutions. When such

training leads to further training at the local level, then the linkage has been successfully made. For example, in Burkina Faso, at the instigation of the RTI training coordinator, the USAID mission had decided to fund municipal training activities that the Hanns Seidel Foundation will coordinate and staff from the ENA will carry out. Unfortunately, in other countries, additional activities to reinforce the capacity of these local institutions to conduct municipal training appear to have been needed.

Training central-level functionaries from a wide variety of ministries and departments is not likely to have much of an effect on municipal development. In all fairness, the training coordinator clearly recognized the need to develop a stronger municipal training and supervisory capacity in Burkina Faso and especially in Mali. His January trip report to Bamako cites the need to develop training activities to help establish the Malian equivalent of the "Tutelle" such as the Département des Collectivités Locales. However, the project's termination has precluded further training activities in this area.

C. LOCAL-LEVEL TRAINING SEMINARS

1. Successful Resource Mobilization Seminars. The local-level training activities appear to have been the most successful portion of the project. The local seminars that focused on resource mobilization achieved, for the most part, outstanding results. In every case, local revenues rose substantially after the seminars, and in most cases are continuing to rise, sometimes more than a year after the last training or follow-up intervention. The following table indicates the percentage augmentation of market revenues from the three municipalities visited during the course of this evaluation. It should be noted that previous evaluations of other cities after 6 months have suggested that these results are rather widespread. Increased receipts in Guinea, for example, are estimated to have been 975% in Pita, 113% in Timbimadina, and 78% in Gueckedou (Lebreton, 1994).

It is instructive to compare the experiences of the Malian municipalities (Sikasso and Segou) with the case of Koudougou, Burkina Faso. In both Sikasso and Segou, municipal revenues have increased since the pre-training levels, but the Malian municipalities have been unable to make critical investments in the key revenue-generating infrastructure, such as markets, taxi stations, and slaughterhouses. As a result, local commercial operators are beginning to get discouraged, and municipal revenue streams have begun to stagnate or even decline slightly in recent months. However, in both cases, local follow-up committees have been established to monitor this situation. The Sikasso committee is especially dynamic and should be able to maintain revenue collection levels. The Segou committee is also monitoring revenue flows, but seems unlikely to provide much dynamic leadership.

In contrast, in Koudougou, Burkina Faso, the city is implementing recommendations and improvements made during the follow-up evaluation that occurred 6 months after the local seminar. The city is developing a new market area for vegetable sellers and is constructing a new butchering facility on that site. In addition the municipality has invested in latrines in both the old and new market areas which will be managed by a private sector group that will charge a small fee for use. In addition, the municipality has built a number of garbage collection containers around the market area. Finally, the municipality has hired a number of new market tax collectors (including one woman) who work on a commission basis, which seems to be working extremely well. To facilitate the collection process in the fixed market areas, more than 650 metal signs have been placed in stalls and more than 180 placards have been placed in areas where informal retailers congregate to sell their wares along the public rights-of-way.

2. Value of Hands-on Training. The substance of the training related to local resource mobilization was clearly superb. Several participants suggested that the real strength of this activity was its applied basis, in which actual procedures for collecting market

taxes were discussed. In addition, because the preparation for each seminar included at least a week of intensive study of the actual situation of each municipal revenue collection system, the trainers were able to incorporate in the seminar concrete examples from the local municipality, which made it extremely relevant to the local case. The relevance and tangible nature of the recommendations are no doubt a major contributing factor to the high rate of success for this activity.

3. Importance of Local Participation. While the hands-on nature of these seminars was clearly essential, another important dimension of the training was its use of participatory techniques. Increased revenue collections are likely to be controversial in most situations and, in areas where most people are not paying local taxes, it may be quite inflammatory. The involvement of the whole spectrum of local institutions, including local authorities, both elected and traditional, local government employees from the prefecture and the municipality, and local non-governmental organizations, as well as the explicit participation of representatives from each of the main business groups (market organizations, transporters, butchers, informal sector) was critical to the consensus-building necessary for constructing an action plan that could be successfully implemented. Including key representatives from these groups on the Follow-Up Committee charged with implementing the action plan is equally important. The success of the Sikasso case is due largely to the Follow-Up Committee's dynamic nature.

4. Unmet Demand for Additional Seminars. In general, the quality of these local training activities has won praise from all parties associated with the training sessions. There appears to be a high demand for repetitions of the sessions in other municipalities in each country. Official requests for resource mobilization seminars from Niger and Guinea were delayed by contracting difficulties and simmering political disputes. Two additional

seminars in Mali are taking place in the last days of the project after very lengthy delays in contracting related to reimbursement rates for the local contractor. In both Mali and Burkina Faso, the evaluator received requests to expand this seminar activity to other key cities in each country.

Unfortunately, the replicability of the training without continued project participation is less clear. The principal trainer used by the project is an Ivoirian private consultant who has developed a finely honed training product. He is willing to travel throughout the Côte d'Ivoire and to Mali and Burkina Faso as well to continue the training activities. The issue for future replication will be covering his costs. If Missions in Mali and Burkina are willing to pay his costs, then the activities can certainly continue beyond the life of the project for some time to come.

However, no country in the region appears to have the capacity to conduct this highly successful training element without assistance. In both Mali and Burkina Faso, there are individuals currently working for the Central Government who have participated in the seminar and follow-up evaluation planning and implementation and who, in principle, should have the ability to replicate these events. However, it is the opinion of this evaluator that such sessions are unlikely to happen without the participation of at least the Ivoirian trainer. In both countries, this trainer is scheduled to conduct additional training exercises with little input from the RTI contractor for the MMTP project. There is no reason that in the future a contract could not be written directly between, for example, the Malian mission and this local contractor. Thus, the training capacity may have been successfully transferred to the private sector, but it is not clear whether existing government agencies in other countries would be able to replicate these kinds of activities without assistance. The issue of adequate financial support for an ongoing training capacity is likely to be the major constraint in both Mali and Burkina Faso.

D. UNFORESEEN EVENTS

1. Political Instability in the Region. Political instability in the region has had a direct effect on the project's ability to carry out its regional agenda. After what seemed to be an auspicious start in Guinea with a series of training activities starting in 1989, the political turmoil resulting from the 1993 presidential elections effectively blocked several planned activities. A national-level seminar on municipal management for key municipal managers was canceled in late 1993 and a subsequent activity to conduct two seminars on local resource mobilization were also canceled for 1994.

Other country programs also have been influenced by political uncertainty and instability. In addition, a scheduled seminar on local participation and resource mobilization in Niger was postponed because of the recent Taureg uprising and internal political difficulties that delayed the municipal elections. Furthermore, because of the high degree of political unrest in Togo for the past 3 years, no activities have occurred in that country since the last Regional Conference was held there in 1990. In addition, a research trip to Rwanda occurred in the fall of 1993 to assess that country's potential for decentralization activities, but after recent events it is unlikely that there will be any follow-up activities soon.

2. Economic Crisis in West Africa Region. The 1980s were difficult throughout Sub-Saharan Africa, except possibly Ghana, which the World Bank has used as an example for the rest of the region. Conditions in other places in the region, especially in the Sahel zone, including Mali, Burkina Faso, Niger, and Senegal, have been nearly disastrous. Each of these countries has been forced to accept fairly stringent structural adjustment conditions in order to receive help from the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund. The combination of the economic recession and the

required reduction in government expenditures has created very difficult conditions for local economic development.

Recovery from this economic crisis has been constrained by what many economists consider to be a highly overvalued exchange rate for the Central African franc (FCFA), which since independence was pegged directly to the French franc at a rate of 50:1. After lengthy discussions the francophone countries of West Africa that comprise the FCFA zone agreed in January 1994 to devalue the FCFA with a new exchange rate of 100:1 with the French franc. This 50% devaluation caused a number of short-run hardships, particularly for activities requiring imported materials such as gasoline or spare parts. At the municipal level, this devaluation created real havoc for the Chefs de Service Technique, who were expected to provide basic municipal services involving the municipal truck(s) with half of the imported materials that had been expected in the current year. Nearly all municipal employees encountered in the course of the evaluation stated that they were constrained by insufficient resources to buy gas and spare parts for municipal trucks, especially for garbage collection.

3. Closing of RHUDO Office. Closing the RHUDO office in June 1992 clearly had a major impact on the project. The earlier versions of the Municipal Management Training Project derived large direct benefits from the close relationship between the contractor and the RHUDO office. The 1990 MMTP project evaluation cited the high quality of the RHUDO staff and the benefits of the close relationship between the RHUDO office and the contractor (Nolan, 1990).

One of the benefits of this close relationship was the fact that from 1987 to 1991 core contract funding for MMTP was provided by the Office of Housing and Urban Programs (PRE/H) through the RHUDO in Abidjan. When the RHUDO office closed, access to PRE/H funds was curtailed, and the Development Fund for Africa (DFA) provided core contract funding of approximately \$350,000. The loss of PRE/H funding also meant the project had to rely on various

missions to provide all the financing for in-country training activities.

Another effect of the project's absorption into the REDSO offices was the increase in bureaucratic approvals required to get project activities authorized and funds committed. Direct access and excellent communication with the RHUDO Director had facilitated a wide range of project activities which were no longer possible under the direction of REDSO. These difficulties were exacerbated by an extended battle with the contracts office over minor details that caused delays in scheduled training activities.

4. Termination of Bilateral Côte d'Ivoire Assistance Program.

The decision to terminate the bilateral assistance program with the Côte d'Ivoire has also had a marked impact on the project and future project benefits. Closing the RTI office at the end of August 1994 has prevented the expansion of a number of new activities and constrained the possibilities for additional follow-up activities in Mali and Burkina Faso. It was only because both missions were eager to continue planned activities that a local consultant who has worked extensively with the project, Isidore Lecadou, was able to visit both countries at the very end of the project. The sudden closing of the bilateral mission will prevent the kind of direct follow-up activities envisioned in the original project design.

In addition, because the Côte d'Ivoire is widely acknowledged by other countries in the region to be a leader in democratization and decentralization, terminating the bilateral assistance program dramatically constrains USAID's ability to continue monitoring progress in local decentralization and communal development. This is extremely important, because many other countries in the region have come to look at the Côte d'Ivoire's achievements as a model for their own development strategies. Mali is the most important example, but Burkina Faso appears intent on following the same path of municipal elections. Guinea has had elections and appears to be interested in continuing the decentralization process as well,

although political turmoil has created some at least temporary barriers. In addition, Niger continues to express interest in the same concepts and ideas.

By closing the bilateral program, USAID has largely cut itself out of the very successful regional coordination and exchange mechanisms that it pioneered in the MMTP project. Although some interregional exchanges will still be possible, losing a central base in the most advanced country in the region will make communication and exchanges much more difficult. This is a pity, because USAID had achieved a real leadership position among other donors in decentralization and communal training activities with a relatively small expenditure of funds. (The World Bank's Municipal Development Program will top \$60 million in contrast to the MDSP's \$6 million budget.)

E. ATTAINMENT OF PROJECT OBJECTIVES

1. Training Activities in Decentralization and Privatization.

The project has clearly met this objective, because its major focus was on these two interrelated concepts. Activities at the regional, national, and local levels were structured in a way that facilitated discussion of these themes and provoked host country participants to re-evaluate the utility of previously rejected notions, such as the Privatization Conference in Mali. The national-level conferences cited above were also of high quality. The various train-the-trainers and training of administrators exercises were adequate, but did not lead to training municipal trainers, with one or two exceptions.

2. Relationship with Public and Private Training Institutions.

This objective was only partially met. In each country there were discussions with national training institutions and in several cases there were joint training activities. However, developing a capacity for municipal management training in these institutions is a time-consuming and expensive task. For this reason, joint

training exercises with other donor participation have proved to be more effective. The Hanns Seidel Foundation (SF) has engaged in a number of productive joint exercises with the MMTP throughout the region. For example, in Burkina Faso, SF and the École National d'Administration will jointly conduct additional training activities for municipal officials from a variety of municipalities. This activity is being funded by the local USAID mission at the recommendation of the RTI project coordinator.

Forging strong links with public training institutions has proven to be a time-consuming task. Links and dialogue with private institutions have been more difficult to arrange, with several notable exceptions in the Côte d'Ivoire (CREPA-Ci and Lecadou's firm being two such examples).

3. Meeting USAID Mission Training Needs. This objective has also been effectively met. The project's value to local missions was demonstrated by the cabled messages of satisfaction with the project activities that were provided from Mali, Guinea, and Burkina Faso before the contract was extended in 1993. The fact that several missions were willing to contribute HRDA funds to support core project costs is an excellent indicator of the utility of this project for mission training needs.

4. Preparation of Courses and Training Manuals for Municipal Management Capability. This objective has been partially met. The majority of the training activities have had a direct focus on decentralization, privatization, and local resource mobilization. This is appropriate and within the project's scope and resources availability. Many of the related training activities mentioned in the project paper objective are well beyond the means of a regional project to provide, given the minimal training budget.

For training to have occurred in areas like managing shelter, community facilities, and community development activities, it would have been necessary for USAID missions to "buy in" to these activities. Although most missions were willing to participate in

broader activities, many of the specific management activities included in this objective are appropriate for a more intensive level of training activity like that conducted in the Côte d'Ivoire with the MDSP project.

F. EFFECTIVENESS OF REGIONAL PROJECT MECHANISM

1. Strength of Linked Regional Training Activities. One of the real strengths of the regional MMTP mechanism was the contractor's ability to take full advantage of linked training activities. By concentrating training activities within the francophone region with basically similar government structures and development patterns, the project was able to make excellent use of linkages between regional, national, and local training activities. For example, by inviting participants from one country to a second country for a brief regional conference, the project was able to showcase effective training strategies developed for the host country which could be adapted with minimal effort to other countries.

An excellent example of linked training activities is the Yamoussoukro Conference on Market Town Development and Rural Growth, which attracted 150 participants from 21 countries. Conference participants from Guinea were quite impressed by this activity and requested a similar conference at the national level in Conakry. A preliminary study of conditions in market towns in Guinea was conducted by RTI under the IQC, which was used as a key element of the national conference. Participants at this conference from the USAID mission, as well as the various Ministries concerned with decentralization, were impressed with the concepts promoted during this activity and receptive to the idea of local seminars on resource mobilization. Four such local seminars were successfully completed, and two more were planned but had to be postponed due to the post-election unrest.

2. Funding Training Through Mission Buy-Ins. Using mission buy-ins is a productive way to ensure that a regional project is in fact meeting country specific needs. The 1-year extension of the MMTP in 1993 received \$100,000 in direct contributions from HRDA funds from Burkina Faso (\$25,000) and Guinea (\$75,000) in support of the core MMTP contract. In addition, from January 1993 to June 1994, the project received \$339,330 in delivery orders for various training activities in the region. In addition, the project received \$53,000 to finance the participation of 39 individuals at regional conferences and 12 individuals for study tours to the Côte d'Ivoire. Finally, the Burkina Faso mission contributed \$21,000 to municipal training activities developed by the MMTP, which will be implemented by the Hanns Seidel Foundation in Burkina Faso during the coming year.

This level of funding indicates that the MMTP has been successful in satisfying the needs expressed by various missions for training activities. However, there are costs associated with such a large percentage of training funds derived from outside sources. When such large volumes of funding must come through a "buy-in," it is difficult to get initial activities going in a new country.

In addition, the buy-in formula may pressure the project to provide training outside its initial scope or focus. For example, the training to high-level administrative cadres provided in Burkina Faso and Guinea was at least partly in response to expressed needs of the local missions, but were a deviation from municipal training activities as has been noted above.

3. Contracting Difficulties and Delays. The constant use of "buy-ins" to fund the regular training activities also creates a more complicated funding process that has the potential to create real bottlenecks because of the constraints of normal contracting procedures. The project files are full of training activities that had to be delayed because of misunderstandings by the missions "buying in" because of inadequate contractor documentation, and by

what appears to have been excessive diligence on the part of the REDSO contract office. The difficulties of getting PIOTs funded quickly was cited by Mali Mission staff as a problem. They indicated that it was not unusual for a PIOT for RTI training in Bamako to take more than 6 months to be approved and authorized.

III. LESSONS LEARNED – MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT

A. INNOVATIVE TRAINING APPROACH

One of the project's most innovative and successful results was to create an interconnected network of regional, national, and local activities. By using a measured combination of international, national, and local experts to stimulate discussions and interchanges on a variety of topics, this project effectively promoted wide-ranging dialogue and exchanges. The horizontal nature of much of the training and exchange visits is a unique characteristic of the approach. Widespread use of local expertise whenever possible has not only reduced overall project costs when compared to the costs of bringing in outside experts, but it has also resulted in concrete and accessible training sessions that all parties uniformly praised.

B. DECENTRALIZATION EQUALS "DEMOCRATIZATION IN THE TRENCHES"

Decentralized municipal development is the "cutting edge" of democratization. The municipalities are the primary locus of democratic activity not only in the Côte d'Ivoire, but also in Mali, and in the near future, in Burkina Faso (if the anticipated elections occur in February 1995). If the democratic initiatives are to succeed, they must work at this level. The election of deputies to the Assembly is also a component of democratization, but it is at the municipal level that the bulk of the population will come into the closest contact with its elected representatives.

Decentralization, however, has also forced municipalities into a difficult position. They have been given more responsibilities by the central government, and local expectations are rising about the potential for improved service delivery, but the level of resources to make this possible has, if anything, decreased because of the ongoing economic crisis. The opportunity to strengthen fragile municipal institutions presents a unique opening for outside management training and assistance such as that provided by the MMTP, but failure to sustain these institutions also poses the greatest threat to the democratic gains that have been achieved over the last decade or so.

MMTP and MDSP training activities at the municipal level, and especially with the Associations of Mayors from Mali and Côte d'Ivoire, have played a crucial step in the democratization process. The contractor realized the importance of such associations to unite mayors from diverse cities and help them to leverage additional resources and technical assistance from the central government. Because these lobbying activities could make a huge difference to tightly strapped municipal budgets, it is unfortunate that USAID project activity is terminating. It will be essential to find ways to continue this kind of training and support. Unlike the MDSP in the Côte d'Ivoire, the intermittent MMTP training activities in the rest of the region have not been able to create a sustainable training framework. Although some donors have begun to express interest in this area, it was the MMTP training approach that created many of these opportunities. It is not clear if the more theoretically based training activities favored by other donors (such as the UNDP and ILO training efforts) will be able to achieve the same results.

C. PARTICIPATION OF LOCAL INSTITUTIONS AND ENTREPRENEURS

One of the most effective elements of the training strategy used in the local seminars was the inclusion of participants from a variety of different agencies and organizations. This was a conscious decision to develop a broad base of support for resource

mobilization activities that were not widely understood or recognized as important for municipal development. After years of strong Central Government control in most of these countries, the idea of local taxes for local projects is quite foreign, and a major hurdle confronting each of the seminars was the lack of confidence in locally elected (or, in some cases, still appointed) government.

Recognizing this potential constraint, the project managers ensured that each of the important groups within the community were represented in each seminar. Accordingly, they invited elected officials (both the mayor and municipal councilors); municipal-level employees; Central Government agents assigned to the region; local traditional chiefs from various neighborhoods; representatives of each of the principal markets, the transport workers' union, private transportation companies, and butchers; and in some cases, even representatives of the informal sector. A Follow-Up Committee was established based on those who had attended the seminar and was charged with implementing the action plan, which was the final product of each seminar.

The utility of this approach in building confidence in municipal authorities is demonstrated by the decision in Sikasso to use a similarly broad-based committee to spearhead its local drive to collect money and oversee construction of 15 kilometers of paved roads within the city. However, the key to maintaining confidence is to continue providing the promised services. It is in this area that the project effects are far from secure, and more needs to be done.

D. REFLECTIONS ON THE USE OF REGIONAL PROJECTS

The regional project approach the MMTP pioneered appears to be an effective vehicle for innovative concepts not yet widely accepted or understood by more traditionally oriented missions. Often, new or innovative project activities do not have a logical place in the existing portfolios of mission projects and may not be reflected in existing country programs or strategy statements. The

combination of decentralization and democratization is an example that has been effectively disseminated across the region by the MMTP. However, with the increasing interest in Washington in democracy and governance, each Mission may be more willing to take up individual projects. For example, Mali is programming its own democratization effort and is eager to find new ways of including decentralization and municipal training in its future HRDA budget. However, the ability to coordinate and reinforce local training activities with regional conferences and study tours would be lost in a wholly mission-oriented, country-specific project.

The challenge of regional projects is the difficulty of providing follow-up on such a wide variety of projects. In addition, in this particular project (MMTP), the proportion of the training budget for regional work was too small, forcing the project coordinator to rely almost exclusively on Mission buy-ins, which caused real contracting bottlenecks in Abidjan. A better mechanism for such projects would be to fund a basic regional training component that could then be supplemented by mission buy-ins. The use of mission buy-ins can be a productive way to ensure that a regional project is in fact meeting country-specific needs, but it does impose considerable costs, because contracting complexities cause delays and scheduling difficulties, because they must fit into mission funding cycles.

E. IMPORTANCE OF REGULAR FOLLOW-UP OF TRAINING ACTIVITIES

A consistent lesson from this project is that training cannot be considered a one-shot affair. Even when the need for additional technical skills is evident at the local level, having an effective follow-up program is essential. Municipal officials are under-trained and often receive more demands for assistance than they have time to provide. This means that, in spite of good intentions to implement necessary changes, it may be difficult for a given official to adopt new methods of operation, because he or she does not have the time to establish the new procedures.

In Koudougou, the original resource mobilization seminar appeared to be quite successful, but 6 months later very little had been done. During the evaluation study, a number of key suggestions were made for improvements that were later implemented. Over a year later, when the evaluator visited the site, nearly all the recommended changes had been implemented and investments were being made in the market areas. Without the follow-up evaluation there would have been virtually no changes a year and a half later.

In Sikasso and Segou, a single evaluation follow-up does not appear to have been sufficient, perhaps because of the extremely low levels of skills in the municipalities. In addition, in spite of the fact that these are the second and third largest cities in Mali in population, the shortage of resources does constrain municipal abilities to implement new programs quickly. The situation in both villages is extremely fragile, and some mechanism for ensuring regular follow-up visits must be devised.

One possibility for resolving the follow-up problem would be to use Peace Corps volunteers working in urban settings to fill this gap. In the Côte d'Ivoire, the Urban Environmental Management Program has been quite successful in placing volunteers in urban planning positions in which they do community organizing and basic technical training for community groups and work closely with municipal officials to define local needs and municipal service options. According to APCD Julie Burland, this project has been reasonably successful and could be a model for other countries seeking to provide longer-term assistance to municipalities.

REFERENCES

- Chemonics International. "History of the RHUDO Housing Loan Guaranty Program in Côte d'Ivoire." Prepared for the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Economic Development Support Office for West and Central Africa.
- Cuenco, Kim and Juliana Pigeay. 1993. "Côte d'Ivoire: Municipal Development Support Project, Mid-Term Evaluation," Abt Associates. Submitted to the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Economic Development Support Office for West and Central Africa.
- den Tuinder, Bastiaan. 1978. *Ivory Coast: the Challenge of Success*. Washington, DC: Johns Hopkins University Press for the World Bank.
- Lebreton, Jean-Michel. 1994. "Municipal Management Training Program: Draft Final Report," Research Triangle Institute. Submitted to the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Economic Development Support Office for West and Central Africa.
- Lebreton, Jean-Michel. 1994. "Municipal Management Training Component of the Municipal Development Support Project: Draft Final Report," Research Triangle Institute. Submitted to the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Economic Development Support Office for West and Central Africa.
- Mandel, Jennifer. "The Decentralization Process in Côte d'Ivoire," Annex H of the Municipal Development Support Project Paper. Prepared for the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Economic Development Support Office for West and Central Africa. August 1990.
- Nolan, Riall. 1990. "Evaluation of RHUDO/WCA Training Strategy, Final Report," PADCO, Inc. Submitted to the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Housing and Urban Development Office for West and Central Africa.
- Stren, Richard and Koffi Attahi. 1991. "Building Municipal Institutions in Africa: The World Bank Experience in Côte d'Ivoire," World Bank.
- Stren, Richard, Nezem Mozabar, and Koffi Attahi. 1993. "The Experience of Decentralization in Côte d'Ivoire, 1980-1993," Abt Associates. Prepared for the United States Agency for International Development, Regional Economic Development Support Office for West and Central Africa.

Table 1
Participation at Regional Conferences
by Country and Regional Conference

	Regional Conference Attended									TOTAL
	1987-1989					1990-1994				
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
Benin		3	4					2	3	12
Burkina Faso	6	7	7		5			5	11	41
Burundi			2							2
Cameroun			3						2	5
C.A.R.			1							1
Chad			2					1		3
Côte d'Ivoire	25	12	29	12	24	4	38	77	70	291
Congo								2		2
Gambia			4							4
Ghana			5							5
Guinea	1		4	2	4	4	2	3	4	24
Guinea-Bissau	3		2	2	1					8
Liberia			3							3
Madagascar							3		3	6
Mali			6	2	2	3			6	19
Mauritania	2		6						2	10
Niger		2	7		3	2	2		2	18
Nigeria			2							2
Rwanda			2						3	5
Senegal	2	4	9	4	4	11			5	39
Togo		13	2			21				36
Uganda			4							4
Zaire			6							6
Zimbabwe									1	1
TOTAL	39	41	110	22	43	45	63*	90**	114***	561

Conference Key

1. Management and Financing of Decentralization: 1987
2. Privatization of Urban Services: 1988
3. Market Town Development and Rural Growth: 1989
4. Management Skills: 1989
5. Local Economic Development and Employment Generation: 1989
6. Financing and Managing Infrastructure: 1990
7. Municipal Credit Systems: 1992
8. Privatization of Municipal Services: 1993
9. Building Confidence Between Local Governments/Constituencies: 1994

* This figure includes 18 conference participants invited by the World Bank.

** This figure includes 2 conference participants invited by USAID/REDSO/PMO.

*** This figure includes 14 conference participants invited by the World Bank.

Table 2
Increase in Average Monthly
Municipal Revenue Collection Efforts

	Receipts Prior to Training	Receipts After Six months	Receipts After One year	Percent Increase
Koudougou, Burkina Faso				
Market tax	309,250	512,225	742,500	140%
Auto gare	39,854	259,000	160,583*	302%
Abatoir	126,497	64,375	164,062	30%
Sikasso, Mali				
Market tax	205,028	638,705	549,239	168%
Auto gare	922,708	1,206,230	1,181,359	28%
Segou, Mali				
Market tax	79,300	354,500	371,196	368%
Auto gare	435,000	503,800	447,250*	3%

* Receipts slipped when private transporters pulled out; but in Sikasso the mayor was able to reinstitute taxes for these companies in mid 1994. In Segou this has not yet happened.

MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT EVALUATION

List of Persons Interviewed

Côte d'Ivoire

USAID: REDSO PMO/UD - Carlene DEI
RTI: Jean-Michel LEBRETON, Dean SWERDLIN, Pierrette OUMAR
DGCL: Albert HOBA, Jean-Baptiste AKE
Private Sector Trainer: Isidore LECADOU
Peace Corps: Julie BURLAND, Asst. Peace Corps Director for Urban
Environmental Management Program

Meetings in Burkina Faso

USAID: Tom LUCHE, Director
Jeanne-Marie ZONGO, Training Officer
National Commission on Decentralization - SAWADOGO, Raogo Antoine
Ministry of Territorial Administration - M. OUEDRAGO, Idrissa
Ministry of Planning - M. Kote GAOSSOU
Hanns Seidel Foundation - telephone interview with M. SANDAOGO
Commune of Koudougou
ZOMA, François - Secretary General
DAMA, Moussa - Principal Treasurer
OUEDRAGO, Hamidu - Registrar of Receipts
BUDA, Daniel - Municipal Technical Services Agent
KONDOMBO, Patrice - Accountant
Follow-Up Committee Members
Market Collectors

Meetings in Mali

USAID-EDO - Yacouba KONATE, Boubacar DIALLO, Freda WHYTE-HENRY
USAID - Bruno KOSHALEFF, Director
Decentralization Mission - Mme. SOW, Lassine BOUARÉ
Administrative Reform Commission - N'tji BAGAYOKO
Mayors Association of Mali - Djibril SANGARE
Hanns Seidel Foundation - Anne BERTHÉ
Commune of Sikasso
KONE, Mamadou Moussa, The Mayor
TRAORE, Aguibou, First Adjutant
OUALOUQUEM, Yaya, Secretary General
MAMBY, Diaby, Businessman
SADIO, George Dembele, GRAM-SUD
Members of the Follow-Up Committee
Commune of Segou
MAMADOU, Fanta, Mayor and Deputy
Members of the Follow-Up Committee

MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT TRAINING PROJECT EVALUATION

French Translations

National Commission on Decentraliation - Commission National de
Décentralisation
Ministry of Territorial Administration - Ministère d'Administration
Territoriale
Ministry of Planning - Ministère du Plan
Accountant - Comptable
Municipal technical services agent - agent technique communale
Principal treasurer - Trésorerie Principale
Registrar of receipts - Régisseur des recettes
Follow-Up Committee members - Membres de la Comité de Suivi
Market collectors - Collecteurs de marché
Decentralization Mission - Mission de Décentralisation
Administrative Reform Commission - Commissariat à la Reforme Administra-
tif
Mayors Association of Mali - Association des Maires de Mali
Businessman - Operateur économique
Secretary General - Secrétaire general
The Mayor - le Maire
First Adjutant - Première adjoint
Mayor and Deputy - le Député-Maire