

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART I

1. BEFORE FILLING OUT THIS FORM, READ THE ATTACHED INSTRUCTIONS.
2. USE LETTER QUALITY TYPE, NOT "DOT MATRIX" TYPE.

IDENTIFICATION DATA

A. Reporting A.I.D. Unit: AID/Islamabad		B. Was Evaluation Scheduled in Current FY Annual Evaluation Plan? Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Slipped <input type="checkbox"/> Ad Hoc <input type="checkbox"/>		C. Evaluation Timing Interim <input type="checkbox"/> Final <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Mission or AID/W Office _____ IES# 89/1		Evaluation Plan Submission Date: FY 90		Ex Post <input type="checkbox"/> Other <input type="checkbox"/>	
D. Activity or Activities Evaluated (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; if not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report.)					
Project No.	Project /Program Title	First PROAG or Equivalent (FY)	Most Recent PACD (Mo/Yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	Amount Obligated to Date (000)
391-0471	Tribal Areas Development Project	1982	Sep., 92	\$ 45046	\$ 24000

ACTIONS

E. Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Office Director	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
<p><u>I. PROJECT MANAGEMENT:</u></p> <p>1. Project should be provided clear delegation of authority, and responsibilities to the USAID field office and officers in Peshawar.</p> <p>2. Planning and Development Dept. GONWFP should be more directly involved in project strategy and execution.</p> <p>3. TADP must work with GOP to formulate a framework for project selection and implementation. USAID and GOP must establish specific parameters for sub-project selection, allowing political flexibility, but also maintain the cohesiveness of overall development strategy. GOP and USAID need to coordinate their priorities in Project selection.</p>	<p>G.George, O/Eng F.Pavich, ARD M.Curtis, EKO</p> <p>S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD</p> <p>S.Ghani, GONWFP F.Pavich, ARD T.Durrani, ARD</p>	<p>May 1989</p> <p>Ongoing & TADP-II</p> <p>Ongoing & TADP-II</p>

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

APPROVALS

F. Date Of Mission Or AID/W Office Review Of Evaluation:				(Month)	(Day)	(Year)
				12	11	1988
G. Approvals of Evaluation Summary And Action Decisions:						
Name (Typed)	Project/Program Officer	Representative of Borrower/Grantee	Evaluation Officer (A)	Mission or AID/W Office Director		
	Tariq Durrani	Suleman Ghani Secretary, P&D	Tanvir Khan	J. Norris		
Signature	<i>Tariq Durrani</i>	<i>S. Ghani</i>	<i>Tanvir Ahmed Khan</i>	<i>J. Norris</i>		
Date	February 26, 1989	March 11, 1989	3/14/89	3/14/89		

ACTIONS		
E. Action Decisions Approved by Mission or AID/W Offr. Director Action(s) Required	Name of officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
4. TADP should establish a Planning, Research and Evaluation Unit attached to and supportive of the P&D responsibilities for tribal areas development. Reliable and adequate baseline information should be generated for TADP related sub-projects.	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Dec., 89
5. TADP should focus its resources on specific locations within the Project area where the population has proven itself receptive to government development initiatives.	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing & TADP-II
II. INSTITUTIONAL STRENGTHENING:		
1. Strengthen Government line agencies involved in FATA development. Build greater capacity through training and TA attached to new technology. Have specifics of an action plan.	S. Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing & TADP-II
2. Computer technology should be introduced to the yet unexposed institutions promoting FATA development. Computer use should be broadened and deepened within presently assisted organizations. Computer technology should be directed at specific targets such as FATA development, planning, research, monitoring and evaluation.	T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing & TADP-II
III. INFRASTRUCTURE:		
1. SURFACE WATER IRRIGATION:		
i) Provide funding for equipment and training relating to hydrological data gathering for Kurram, Tochi, Kalaya and Bajaur valley basins.	J.Husan, O/Eng T.Durrani, ARD	TADP-II
ii) Steps be taken to guarantee the utilization of high quality galvanized iron wire on all gabions built with USAID funding. Intake structures should be designed with screening devices. Flow calculation must be verified to assure that high flood discharges will not endanger river bed structures.	J.Hasan, O/Eng	Ongoing

ACTIONS		
E.Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/w Offi. Director Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
iii) Computer/printer be provided for each FATA-DC field office for irrigation designs and preparing PC-1s. An engineer familiar with CAD should be posted in FATA-DC head quarters. In-country and out-country training should be provided.	J.Hasan, O/Eng T.Durrani, ARD	Needs further study TADP-II
2. GROUND WATER IRRIGATION: FATA-DC should be assisted to improve its water mapping and monitoring activities.	J.Hasan, O/Eng	TADP-II
3. BUILDING CONSTRUCTION:		
i) Electrification, water supply, sanitation and basic furnishing should be considered for both the existing buildings and future buildings.	J.Hasan, O/Eng	Ongoing
ii) Site specific weather and light conditions should be considered when positioning windows and doors.	J.Hasan, O/Eng	Ongoing
iii) Building construction activities should complement other TADP sub-projects.	T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing & TADP-II
iv) Strengthen LG&RD capabilities to design and build small buildings and village water supplies.	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	TADP-II
IV. <u>WID ACTIVITIES:</u>		
1. Present WID income generating proposals should not be implemented.	T.Durrani, ARD	Immediate
2. TADP should incorporate WID concerns to address women's requirements through all TADP activities including; village water supply schemes, non-formal education, primary health care delivery systems and range land and woodlot management.	T.Durrani, ARD GONWFP	Ongoing & TADP-II

ACTIONS		
E.Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Offi. Director Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
V. TADP AND NARCOTICS:		
1. TADP should not commit major funds to development of Mohmand or Bajaur from the remaining budget.	R.Nachtrieb, PDM T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing
2. For TADP-II funds should be cached for Bajaur and Mohmand development to be programmed after the NAU program has opened areas and resolved the issue of government enforcement capacity.	T.Durrani, ARD R.Nachtrieb, PDM	TADP-II
3. TADP deserves a more flexible poppy clause, not to place sub-projects in poppy producing areas, but to allow negotiations, when it is appropriate, to end poppy cultivation.	T.Carter, RLA	TADP-II
VI. FUTURE PROSPECTS:		
1. Should the Mission decide to proceed with a follow-on project (TADP-II), choose one of the following three options:	S.Ghani, CONWFP F.Pavich, ARD T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing & TADP-II Decision after TADP has a home in SDU
i) "Transfer Option" which includes funding only major construction activities requiring no TADP-I bridging.		
ii) "Expanded TADP Option" which includes funding infrastructure projects and line agency activities directly supported infrastructure with stronger institutional strengthening and subprojects scattered widely across FATAs.		
iii) "Focused Development Option" which concentrates on selective and receptive tribal agencies in which many line departments contribute to the development of a defined area.		
2. TADP-II AND NARCOTICS:		
i) Project activities confined to poppy free areas. Invoke poppy clause if poppies are observed.	T.Carter, RLA	TADP-II

ACTIONS

E.Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Offi. Director Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date to be Completed
VII. BRIDGING TADP-I WITH TADP-II:		
1. Special Development Unit (SDU) within the Planning and Development Department, GONWFP, should be the institutional home for TADP-II. TADP-I should strengthen SDU.	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Ongoing & TADP-II
2. Initially, a Project Management Unit (PMU) within SDU to implement TADP related activities should be established. Over time, PMUs should shift to the office of the Political Agent in each Agency.	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Further study & TADP-II
3. PMU at the Agency level should have a small core staff and "manage" Infrastructure and Agriculture activities. PMU should buy into line agency activities for: forestry, health, education, electrification and private sector enterprise development.	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Further study & TADP-II
4. TADP-I in its last four years should bridge to the follow-on TADP-II Project. This could include:	S.Ghani, GONWFP T.Durrani, ARD	Further study & TADP-II
i) Move USAID funded TADP supportive staff to SDU. Add to SDU a capacity to begin planning at the Agency level. Have a GONWFP Project Director for TADP located in SDU TADP II design to begin after a GOP/GONWFP Project Director is assigned to work with the Project. Integration of TADP into the Special Development Unit requires an agreement between UNFDAC and USAID on a total level of support to SDU, contribution by each agency to the total and negotiation with P&D to provide GOP staff and services required. After an agreement is reached, USAID should ask P&D to create a TADP Project Management Unit, within SDU.		

ACTIONS		
Action Decisions Approved By Mission or AID/W Offi. Director Action(s) Required	Name of Officer Responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
<p>ii) Institutional strengthening of FATA-DC is recommended through the provision of basic research to develop ground and surface water resources. This will be achieved through project supported equipment, training and technical assistance. Equipment includes measuring and rainfall gauges. A new field section of Hydrology is proposed to be created within FATA-DC. Studies for surface water and siltation are recommended. Training includes visits to the USA and other countries including AIT Bangkok. A two year technical assistance program with a hydrological engineer is proposed.</p>	<p>Chairman, FATA-DC J.Hasan, O/Eng T.Durrani, ARD</p>	<p>Further study & TADP-II</p>
<p>iii) Supporting FATA Agriculture. The evaluation team recommends: 36 man months of locally procured technical assistance, vehicles, motor cycles, teaching and extension related equipment, and local training. The potential direction of TADP funded agriculture includes: Agriculture extension, horticulture, marketing supporting government agriculture extension programs, and private sector entrepreneurs and training of agriculture extension staff.</p>	<p>T.Durrani, ARD</p>	<p>Further study & TADP-II</p>
<p>iv) FATA Forestry. The recommendations include: incorporation of the experience and activities of the on-going USAID funded farm forestry project. Training needs to be imparted to FATA-DC foresters in social forestry. Evaluation team proposes one FSN locally hired expert for three years, two vehicles, and funds for training.</p>	<p>T.Durrani, ARD</p>	<p>Further study & TADP-II</p>

ABSTRACT

H. Evaluation Abstract (Do not exceed the space provided)

The main purpose of the Tribal Areas Development Project (TADP) is to facilitate the integration of the sensitive tribal areas, called Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATAs) bordering Afghanistan into the socio-economic mainstream of Pakistan. In particular it focuses on improving: institutions, agriculture, small infrastructure (schools, drinking water supply, health outlets), irrigation, and the road network in the FATAs which include seven tribal agencies and 4 Frontier Regions under the administrative control of the Federal Government of Pakistan. The main purpose of the evaluation was to assess: implementation progress to date, project impact on beneficiary populations, lessons learned for replication. Also, the evaluation was to provide recommendations for the design of a follow-on project.

Major findings and conclusions are: (i) Institution building through computerization efforts has been most successful with further potential of expansion. (ii) Construction activities have been satisfactory and of good quality, (iii) Project management is by USAID and it does not actively involve GOP participation. Major recommendations include: (i) Further strengthening of line agencies involved in TADP, (ii) Moving project management away from USAID folds into GOP, (iii) and add new sectors (agriculture, Forestry, Health, etc.) and activities (planning, impact studies) to the existing focus on construction, leading to a bridge between TADP and TADP II.

The evaluations noted the following "lessons learned": (i) The focus of TADP planning, direction and management should be GOP and not USAID. (ii) The exclusive dedication to completing infrastructure sub-projects has led to the overlooking of other opportunities including the influencing of development strategies and strengthening of institutions. (iii) Sub-projects are picked from lists whereas concentration should be on preparing area focused development plans, (IV) Tribal areas development assessment requires collection of bench mark and impact related data.

COSTS

I. Evaluation Costs

1. Evaluation Team		Contract Number OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (U.S. \$)	Source of Funds
Name	Affiliation			
	Dev. Alternative Inc.;			
Donald R. Michelwait, Team Leader	"	PDC	\$ 116,180	TADP
Dr. Richard English, Member	"	5315		
Jonathan Greenham, Member	"	I-00		
Thaddeus E. Knowles, Member	"	8101.		
		PIO/T No. 391-0471-3-70356		
2. Mission/Office Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>45 days</u>		3. Borrower/Grantee Professional Staff Person-Days (Estimate) <u>50 days</u>		

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY - PART II

SUMMARY

J. Summary of Evaluation Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations (Try not to exceed the three (3) pages provided)

Address the following items:

- Purpose of evaluation and methodology used
- Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated
- Findings and conclusions (relate to questions)
- Principal recommendations
- Lessons learned

Mission or Office:

Date This Summary Prepared:

Title And Date Of Full Evaluation Report:

The main purpose of the TAD Project is to accelerate the integration of the tribal areas bordering Afghanistan into the socio-economic mainstream of Pakistan through improving roads, irrigation and small infrastructure of the local government institution. Also included in the project is the institutional strengthening through transfer of micro computer technology to the various cooperating implementing host government line agencies and the Provincial Planning and Development Department.

The purpose of the evaluation was to: assess progress to date, review and evaluate project management, assess project impact on the beneficiary population, provide lessons learned, and provide recommendation for the design of a follow-on project. During the course of the evaluation, the four person evaluation team, joined by two GOP representatives, visited six tribal agencies and one Frontier Region with TADP interventions, over a three week period. This was followed by reviews, discussions and meetings with GOP and USAID in Peshawar and Islamabad. The document/file review and information collected through interviews/discussions form the basis of the evaluation report.

Major findings, conclusions and recommendations include:

- i) The Project has made encouraging progress. This was achieved after a long and difficult start-up period. In the three years since interim evaluation in 1985 the Project has built a staff of dedicated professionals. Thus thirty sub-project activities have been completed, 27 are underway and a large number in planning stages. Finished construction is generally of a high standard. Design assistance, reviews and field inspections have kept the project on target and on track. Road completion, although of high quality, is problematic.
- ii) The introduction of computer technology has had a most satisfactory impact on cooperating organizations as part of institutional strengthening objective of the project.

- iii) Project management relied more on Project staff recruited by USAID. As a result Project provided almost no institutional strengthening related to infrastructure development. Role of Planning and Development Department and the implementing agencies in planning or advancing new strategies was minimal. GOP participation in daily management was limited.
- iv) Project impact assessment findings and recommendations. In the absence of suitable socio-economic data pertaining to TADP funded sub-projects, the impact assessment was not possible. There appears to be no integration of TADP sub-project activities. Water resources projects are more successful in terms of rate of completion as against the problematic roads construction component. The Women In Development Component has been slow to develop. Income generating sub-projects do not have any chance of success, while WID activities concentrating on non-formal education centers and Primary Health Care are likely to have a better chance of success.
- v) Major recommendations are: Further strengthen the implementing agencies, build a planning and field research capacity, and shift the central direction for Project activities from USAID to the Government of Pakistan. Finally, it is recommended that part of remaining funds should contribute to creating a bridge from TADP to a follow-on Project, TADP-II.
- vi) Major lessons from the first six years of TADP include:
 - a) Since its inception TADP has been a USAID directed Project. Given the roads construction problems, not responding to USAID solutions, TADP should seek applications of institutional strengthening. Thus, TADP should be integrated into the GOP operations.
 - b) TADP was exclusively dedicated to completing infrastructure sub-projects. Thus new developments within line agencies and several important opportunities have been missed. TADP concentrated on completing construction activities, missing the strategy chances. TADP should avoid picking sub-projects from a list and focus on supporting development planning for tribal areas.

ATTACHMENTS

K. Attachments (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier; attach studies, surveys, etc. from "on-going" evaluation, if relevant to the evaluation report.)

1. Complete Evaluation Report.

COMMENTS

L. Comments By Mission, AID/W Office and Borrower/Grantee On Full Report

The evaluation was relatively complete and within the terms of the Scope of Work. It was informative and answered issues presented in the Scope. It provided the Mission with various options for the design of a follow-on project. The evaluation team spent about 50 percent of their time in the field and were able to appreciate the complexities of the tribal areas where the project is being implemented.

There was no evidence of any particular biases on the part of the evaluation team. The findings and lessons learned generally concur with the conclusions reached by USAID staff and well informed host country officials.

The following recommendations of the Evaluation Team were not accepted, along with the reasons for their non-acceptance.

Recommendation/Action

1. Ground Water Irrigation:

"Convert the present test wells into tubewells".

Not acceptable: Test wells can be converted into tubewells only when there is sufficient water discharge for irrigation. Otherwise, these test wells remain capped.

2. Road Construction:

i) "Approach Additional Chief Secretary, Planning and Development, for his intervention to get the suspended road construction work activated".

Not acceptable: Construction work has begun. Do not need GONWEP intervention.

- ii) "C&W/Eng to immediately assign one engineer on full time basis at Yaka until the four South Waziristan Agency and North Waziristan Agency roads are completed".

Not acceptable: Construction work proceeding satisfactorily through periodic field monitoring by Peshawar based engineers.

- iii) "C&W should be requested to position exclusive staff for USAID funded roads".

Not acceptable: Present arrangements for road construction supervision proceeding satisfactorily. GONWFP has positioned exclusive staff for new major roads (Thall-Parachinar Road).

- iv) "Resolve dispute regarding contractor grievances. Meeting with Secretary C&W, RLA, Contractors & USAID to resolve all contractor related legitimate grievances".

Not acceptable: Dispute resolved and construction proceeding satisfactorily.

- v) "USAID should hire Master Operator to oversee the use of all equipment and train C&W operators for USAID funded equipment. Purchase supply of spares. Discussions to continue with C&W to transfer this equipment to C&W".

Not acceptable: Project funded Master Mechanic will continue to monitor use of equipment. Spares are being procured. Supplier has agreed to train C&W operators as part of contract.

3. Mission Lagging Areas Strategy:

"If the Mission strategy for lagging areas development is to be followed, then it is recommended that the "Focused Development" option be pursued for TADP-II".

Not acceptable: Lagging areas in the tribal areas context are those areas which are inaccessible. No government agent (including the all powerful Political Agent) can enter these areas because of the existing treaties with the tribes. A Political Agent "opens" these areas through a policy of "carrot" and "stick", a policy not in line with the USAID rules of business. Further, the lagging areas policy concept of the Mission has yet to be formalized.

4. 1971-72: Role in Ending Poppy Production in FATA:

- i) "TADP should not commit major funds to development of Mohmand or Bajaur from the remaining budget. Small buildings, schools, and health clinics under design should be allowed to go forward".

Not acceptable: First sentence of this recommendation is acceptable. The second part (in which it is suggested that we continue funding schools, health clinics and other small buildings) is not acceptable because of the poppy clause of the project.

- ii) "TADP should begin and TADP-II complete the tribal agency specific data collection to define tribal groupings by locations and sphere of control".

Not acceptable: This recommendation refers to the poppy cultivation activities and should be left to NAU and not to TADP.

5. Communications and Works Department
Institutional Strengthening

"Institutional strengthening of C&W is recommended through technical assistance, training, and commodity assistance. TA includes 36 person months for highway and bridge engineers. Commodities include: Survey and office equipment, vehicles and computers. Training includes in country and short term abroad training".

Not acceptable: C&W operates in FATA and in the Province as a whole. It will be too much of a task to proceed with C&W institution building under the TADP funding. Project activities should be limited to "buying in" into C&W activities pertaining to the tribal areas.