

C A R E - D O M I N I C A N A

INTERNAL REVIEW OF

PL-480 FEEDING PROGRAM

MARCH, 1986

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

CARE-DOMINICANA

INTERNAL REVIEW OF PL-480 TITLE II FEEDING PROGRAM

MARCH 17 - 28, 1986

A: Conducted by Beti Astolfi - External Consultant, according to guidelines specified in AID Handbook 9, Attachment 14A.

B: Places reviewed:

1. CARE-Dominicana central office.
2. Port facilities at Rio Haina.
3. CARE central warehouses in Santo Domingo.
4. Distribution site/centers as follows:
 - a) 4 MCH clinics: 2 in San Pedro de Macoris province
1 in La Vega "
 - 1 in Monseñor Nouel "
 - b) 2 MCH 'puestos': 1 in San Pedro de Macoris "
 - 1 in San Cristóbal "
 - c) 2 OCF Recuperation Centers:
1 in San Pedro de Macoris "
 - 1 in Distrito Nacional

5. Counterpart personnel contacted other than centre administrators include:

- a) 1 Regional Director - Division of Nutrition
- b) 3 area doctors
- c) 1 promoter

No Pre-School centres were visited as the review was conducted during Easter vacation time.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The CARE-Dominicana Feeding Program distributes approximately 5 ~~thousand metric tons of PL-480 Title II Commodities a year to~~ 116,000 beneficiaries in 3 different program categories.

The attached internal review of the Feeding Program has led to the following observations:

- All agreements between CARE and the counterpart agencies SESPAS and SEEBAC have been brought up to date and CARE observes its pledges to both agencies. More coordination between all three agencies is recommended in order to strengthen program monitoring activities and establish improved evaluation procedures.

- Staff capabilities are generally good, with language and basic training recommended for three office staff members and in-service training needed for supervisors and warehouse personnel.

- Additional supervisors should be required in order to improve the ratio of supervisor to number of centres and enable the Program to strengthen administrative weaknesses seen at centres during field visits.

- CARE is introducing a new measuring unit which should also improve field administration, assist monitoring, and encourage correct ration distribution.

- Planned distributions have been seriously curtailed by the loss of Commodities due to arrival in port of infested food stocks.

- The office and warehouse location is still tentative pending lease negotiations. Consideration should be given to transferring the CARE compound to a more secure location. At the very least, the warehouse roofs should be replaced.

1/4

~~- Logistical capabilities would be improved by the purchase of an additional truck and the computerization of distribution/logistical data.~~

1/5

- Computerization of Feeding Program data should be completed to refine monitoring systems and allow supervisors to spend more time in the field.

1/6

- Office records and files are complete and reports follow AID and CARE guidelines although loss reports for spoiled food should be filled more consistently.

1/7

- Funding from various sources is not committed in time to meet actual program costs. This interferes with program implementation, and as a result, well-planned activities are often unable to be completed. In view of the delay in releasing funds for this fiscal year, CARE is advised to again review its program toward the end of ^{cy}86 and make adjustments to the '87 Operational Plan if necessary.

- CARE follows required procedures for beneficiary selection but counterpart agencies do not always use recommended selection criteria. As per CARE's policy and guidelines for food use, consideration should be given to family targetting.

1/8

A complete summary of recommendations appears under Sections C, D, F and G.

NOTE: Throughout this report, the CARE-Dominicana PL-480 Title II Feeding Program will henceforth be referred to as the Feeding Program, and cooperating counterparts of the Ministry of Health and Public Welfare and the Ministry of Education, Arts and Culture as SESPAS and SEEBAC respectively.

C. Overall Assessment.-

C.1. CARE-Dominicana has occupied grounds located at the Feria Ganadera (Agricultural Fairground) on the coastal road leading south-west from the city since 1965. The total compound comprises approximately 20,000 square feet, 4,200 square feet of which is taken up by three warehouses offering a total storage capacity of 3.7 thousand metric tons. The grounds and garage space surrounding the office complex provide satisfactory conditions for the security and maintenance of the project fleet and allow the movement of containerized vehicles to and from the CARE warehouses. General security is enhanced by the fact that the Dominican army has had a permanent contingent of about 50 soldiers located at the Feria Ganadera for the past seven months, although it is certain that the present location offers less security in the event of a hurricane. CARE is presently negotiating its lease of the office and grounds, and continuation at the present site remains tentative. It is recommended that should facilities have to be moved, that CARE consider a site less vulnerable to hurricane damage, especially since CARE operations and facilities would be a focal point of any post-hurricane activities. A metal recycling factory adjacent to the CARE compound also poses a certain health hazard to CARE employees.

The main office area occupies about a third of the total compound and is pleasant and well laid-out. The general ratio of employee to working space is excellent.

Documents pertaining to port operations and shipment arrivals are kept in centrally located files and are maintained by the shipping officer or his assistant (for review of documents see Section F.) Other files pertaining to Feeding Program staff are ~~under the general administration of the Assistant Country Director (also see Section F).~~

The three warehouses, built in 1962, are adjacent to the main office. The roofing was damaged during Hurricane David in 1979 and has undergone some repairs since, but is evidently in need of replacement in order to protect stocks from damage. CARE's Three Year Plan FY '86-88 originally allowed for replacement during August through to November 1985 under FY '86 budgeting, although this was not included in CARE's actual budget estimate for the same year. In view of the present problem concerning ownership of the land the CARE compound is located on, it is recommended that CARE suspend plans for warehouse roof replacement until the issue is solved. Should CARE retain its present location under a new agreement, the costs for roof replacement should be included in the FY '87 budget.

In the event of relocation, the warehouse ventilation system could be improved. CARE's palliative measures to stock commodities away from roof leakage results in a less efficient use of warehouse space.

The warehouse has adequate pallets for commodity storage.

C.2. CARE-Dominicana has a total of 29 staff members directly attached to the Feeding Program. Six of these are located in the Santo Domingo central office, and include an international staff member with five years' Title II feeding experience on joining the mission in August, 1985; a Title II Commodity Manager with almost four years' direct experience within the CARE-Dominicana

Feeding Program; 2 Commodity Movement Assistants; a Shipping Officer and a Shipping Assistant.

With the exception of the two recently appointed assistants in commodity movement and shipping operations, all other staff members ~~are knowledgeable in the CARE administrative procedures of~~ the Feeding Program. The PL-480 Commodity Manager seems particularly capable and occupies a vital link between decision-making management and other Feeding Program personnel.

very good

Although the support position of Commodity Assistant has had a high turnover in the past, the present main staff member, although non-conversant in English, is now well-trained in commodity administration, including preparation of claim procedures. In view of job responsibilities and in order to strengthen necessary communication skills, the reviewer recommends that the Commodity Assistant be given English language training.

|

All other central office personnel are being encouraged to experience field, port and warehouse operations and many have directly observed Feeding Program activities.

The Warehouse Manager is in charge of the three warehouses located in the main CARE compound and also general grounds maintenance. He reports to the PL-480 Commodity Manager or her assistant. Apart from a week's initiation by CARITAS, he has not received any on-the-job training in the 12 years he has been working for CARE. He has not yet visited any food distribution sites. In order to increase motivation it is strongly recommended that he be given the opportunity to visit CARE-sponsored centres. It is also recommended that CARE consider a training session in warehouse management be made available to new warehouse clerks for the three new regional warehouses and that the central warehouse manager be included in the training. An assistant to the central warehouse manager should also be recruited in order to assist in commodity dispatch and operations at the 3 central

✓
|

warehouses which could then be considered as hands-on training prior to expansion of regional warehousing under the Title II Enhancement Project to 3 other areas.

There are presently 5 ten-ton trucks attached to the Feeding Program, ~~one of which is 11 years old and will be sold during FY '86.~~ Of the 4 remaining trucks 3 were received in October, 1985 through Outreach Grant funding for CY 85 and are planned to be used for each regional warehouse. An additional truck from CARE funding is expected in April, 1986. CARE will therefore have 2 trucks only to deliver commodities in all centres in South-Centre and Eastern regions. Depending on regional warehouse completion, CARE should envisage the purchase of another truck in FY 1987.

The Feeding Program also employs seven supervisors, each of whom is responsible for reporting on feeding activities in a different area of the country. Supervisors change zones each year. They spend 2 half-days a week travelling to and from the central office each Monday and Friday, and also spend one week out of four in central office administration when any problem-solving takes place through informal group discussions. The PL-480 Commodity Manager also conducts group sessions in the field as training reinforcement. Visits by the reviewer to sample centres indicate that centre personnel do not generally fully understand or follow CARE administrative procedures; therefore, in order to allow supervisors to strengthen weaknesses in on-site administration in relation to commodity management and distribution, it is recommended that the time spent in the central office for administrative duties by supervisors be reduced and that more direct field training be given.

The Feeding Program requires additional supervisors if the objectives of the FY '87 Operational Plan and Three Year Program Plan 1986-88 are to be met. The ratio of supervisors to centre is now 7: approx 1,600 (1:228) or 52% above the recommended level of 1:150 contained in the Three-Year Plan. Since there is also a

planned increase of beneficiary levels for FY '87 from a total of 116,000 to 137,000, it is recommended that the Feeding Program also plan for additional supervisors in order to maintain adequate program controls. This need for increase of supervisors is presently unaccounted for in the 87 Operational Plan. If funds remain unavailable for more supervisors to be hired, then CARE should consider maintaining present beneficiary levels in FY '87. In either case, a decision should be made before preparation of the AER for FY '87 in April, 1986.

C.3. CARE-Dominicana has not performed an internal review since the U.S. Evaluation/Audit of 1982. Although introduced into the Three-Year Plan 1984-6 and the revised Three-Year Plan 1986-8 for September 1984 and 1985, the prescribed review was delayed until March, 1986. However, recommendations contained in the 1982 U.S. audit have since either been followed (see U.S. Audit Recommendation No. 4 and Three-Year Plan Primary Objectives Nos. 1 and 5) or are included in PL-480 activities linked to the Title II Enhancement Project beginning in FY'86. (See U.S. Audit Recommendations No. 1 and Three-Year Plan Primary Objectives Nos. 2-6). U.S. Audit Recommendation No. 3 is being followed through CARE's Annual Operational Plan which has been submitted to US/AID. It is the opinion of the reviewer that the CARE-Dominicana Three-Year Plan 84-86 contained objectives which responded to 1982 U.S. Audit guidelines and recommendations, and that these same objectives offered additional, often stimulating components to normal food distributions. However, many were not implemented during the 3 year period 84-86 and have not yet been implemented under the revised Three-Year Plan of 86-88 due to lack of available funding both for CARE-Dominicana and counterpart agencies. Mission's objectives are also prone to delay by staff changes both within the CARE mission and especially within the counterpart agencies.

It is also the opinion of the reviewer that funding sources available to CARE are locked into different and complicated time-

frames which can also hamper program plans. The Feeding Program is not only subject to administrative controls under three different fiscal years (July-June, CARE; October-September, US/AID; and January-December, GODR) but also has to solicit major funding from Outreach Grants based on calendar years. The ~~release of Outreach funds is often slow and money is frequently~~ unavailable to meet the costs it is planned to cover. The Outreach Grant for CY 86 and CY 87 was submitted by CARE-Dominicana on June 11, 1985, but still has not been approved. GODR Title I funds amounting to over \$214,000 have also not yet been released for FY '86.

In view of the unreliability of funding and its time warps, it is recommended that CARE-Dominicana conduct its own additional internal review at the end of FY'86 to measure the progress and completion of program objectives for FY'86 and, if necessary, make necessary adjustments to the Operational Plan for 1987 to incorporate objectives not met in 1986. An amendment to the Outreach Grant for CY'87 can then be submitted before the end of CY'86. The same sequence should be adopted for each subsequent year under the present plan. This procedure is especially advised in view of tentative counterpart support in certain complementary program activities.

C.4.a.1. CARE is able to implement programs in health-related activities under a basic agreement established with the Ministry of Health and Social Welfare (SESPAS) on Feb. 15, 1967. This agreement was revised in May, 1967 and again in Jan. 1973 and is subject to annual renewal. The renewal for FY'86 is valid until June 30th, 1986. A similar agreement for education activities exists between CARE and the Ministry of Education, Arts and Culture (SEEBAC), and was signed in May 30, 1967. It has since been renewed for the current fiscal year. Under these agreements, CARE has pledged to give complementary logistical assistance to SESPAS and SEEBAC for transportation of goods

received. The Feeding Program presently operates 5 trucks for program support.

CARE pledges also to supervise program activities and inform SESPAS/SEEBAC of program progress. This used to be done through ~~formal monthly meetings which have now been dissolved by the new~~ Director of the Division of Nutrition (DON) of SESPAS. Meetings are now held on an ad-hoc basis, and there have been 3 in the past 4 months. The DON of SESPAS regularly receives CARE progress reports containing statistical data drawn from 'mini-audit' forms filled out by supervisors. However, these reports are not acknowledged by the counterpart agencies, and conversely weight/age measurement data is not conveyed to CARE on a formal basis.

It is recommended that CARE attempt to restructure formal channels of communication between the Feeding Program and SESPAS/SEEBAC for the exchange of data. In order to determine methods required to be able to evaluate the impact of the food received. (See also G.3).

In addition CARE has pledged to obtain funds to provide for technical training in beneficiary selection criteria, nutritional education, administration systems, oral rehydration therapy, and for promoting breast-feeding among mothers and self-help food-producing projects within communities. All these pledges are being honoured through the Title II Enhancement Project with plans to extend these training aspects to the Feeding Program as a whole.

In return, SESPAS and SEEBAC provide CARE with suitable offices, tax-exempt entry of food commodities, material needs and supplies, and SESPAS also cooperates in the disposal of any spoiled commodities (see F. 15). Under the renewed agreement the Government of the Dominican Republic (GODR) also officially assumes responsibility for any goods not received by program beneficiaries, and as such, is responsible for ensuring the program cen-

11

tres are adequately staffed and controlled by competent personnel. The GODR invariably takes action to replace personnel deemed unsuitable by CARE Feeding Program staff. In addition SESPAS and SEEBAC provide free access to CARE staff to travel to program centres and examine records or documentation pertaining to the Feeding Program. ~~Visits by the reviewer to centres indicate that GODR support to centres is generally weak. It is therefore recommended that CARE follow up closely on the training aspects incorporated into its own program plan and endeavor to seek adequate annual funding to ensure that counterpart personnel operating centres maintain the required skills to implement all other components linked to feeding activities. Of particular importance is beneficiary selection (see note (i) below) and nutrition education. This will maximize present food assistance and also make it more cost effective.~~

(i) Of 8 health centers visited, none were utilizing simple arm measurements as a selection criterion and only 1 had access to suitable material for nutrition education, although SESPAS has developed nutrition education which was initially distributed by CARE to health centers.

C.4.a.2. See C.4.a.1.

C.4.a.3. CARE distributes PL-480 commodities to 201 centres or "puestos" located on sugar plantations which fall under the general administration of the Dominican Sugar Council (CEA) or the Dominican Agrarian Institute (IAD) and which receive health services support from SESPAS. CARE has no formal agreement with the CEA or IAD, however CARE's mandate to intervene in these centres is recognized under the existing agreement between CARE and SESPAS.

C.4.b.1 No record exist of a formal contract between CARE and the independent survey company Dominican Cargo, which is present at port of entry during stock arrivals. CARE pays a charge of RD\$75.60 or approximately \$U.S.27.00 for a container of 900-50 lb. bags following verification of survey at the port facilities.

~~To activate a formal agreement at this time, would undoubtedly~~
invite an increase of charges and as long as the present satisfactory service is maintained, it is to CARE's advantage to maintain the status quo.

C.4.b.2 See C.4.a.1

C.4.b.3 See C.4.a.1

C.4.b.4 See C.4.a.1

C.4.b.5 The GODR has passed Law No.576 prohibiting the illegal sale or exchange of Title II commodities. The confiscation of food from black markets was non-verifiable by reviewer, but 8 selling points were visited for checking illegal sales. No Title II commodities were visibly for sale.

C.4.b.6 Care-Dominicana has submitted a budget estimate of \$753,932 for Feeding Program operational costs during FY'86. This amount includes equipment and vehicle purchase, fuel and vehicle maintenance, salaries, warehouse construction and office supplies. For the seven-month period July 1, 1985 - January 25, 1986, \$312,410 or 41% of the total budget has been expended. This figure is explained by the fact that GODR-Title I funds totalling U.S. \$204,246 have not yet been released and therefore no expenditures have yet been made against this amount. (See also Section C.3).

Summary of Recommendations Under Section C.

1. Following leasing agreements presently under negotiation, that CARE either relocate to a less hurricane damage-prone area, or replace warehouse roofing in FY '87.
2. That the Commodity Assistant receive CARE-sponsored language training.

3. That the Warehouse Manager be given the opportunity to observe feeding activities and that he receive some kind of in-service training.
4. That CARE-Dominicana consider recruiting and training a warehouse assistant prior to regional warehouse extension.
5. That the amount of office time for Supervisors be reduced to allow more time for increased support to centre personnel.
6. That CARE-Dominicana conduct an additional internal review in 1986 and adhere to a schedule for future annual reviews.
7. That CARE-Dominicana seek funding to support training for related program components.
8. That channels of communication between the Feeding Program and SESPAS/SEEBAC be set up for the regular exchange of information concerning food distributions and especially its impact.
9. That more supervisors be hired to maintain the planned ratio of supervisor to centres, or that intended total beneficiary levels for FY '87 be reduced to present levels.
10. It is recommended that the Feeding Program purchase an additional truck to increase logistical capabilities.

D. Policy and Guidelines and Their Implementation:

D.1.a. Groups soliciting food aid from CARE-Dominicana must have their request approved by either SESPAS or SEEBAC. Both counterpart agencies are aware of CARE's eligibility requirements for receiving food assistance. ~~These eligibility criteria are outlined in the Three-Year Plan, 86-88 and are consistent with AID policy.~~ Following approval by SESPAS or SEEBAC, and if the number of beneficiaries requested does not exceed total numbers of beneficiaries set by the Feeding Program for the specific category, the application is accepted. The CARE supervisor then visits the centre and reports on the type of infrastructure in place. A standard form is used for this procedure. Counterpart agencies are also familiar with CARE guidelines in relation to the physical needs of a centre in order to be finally approved by CARE.

D.1.b. CARE has not designed or implemented any new direct feeding projects within the last five years, and none is anticipated. The new Title II Enhancement project which is being started in the South-West region around Barahona is an extension of the Title II Feeding Program in health/education services. The decision to terminate a feeding project is generally based on CARE's own organizational policies as outlined in the 'Food Aid Policy and Guidelines, 1985', the extent of the need of the recipient population and the resources available to CARE to implement the project.

D.1.c & d. All eight centres visited by the reviewer receive beneficiaries from a low socio-economic background, that is, who earn a monthly income of less than the official minimum wage of approximately RD\$250. CARE's contact with rural communities has determined that many families earn less than RD\$150 per month. Attending SESPAS doctors or nurses are in charge of beneficiary selection, but although some use the Gomez weight for age test to measure the degree of malnourishment in children, none

interviewed admitted to using arm measurements for the selection of mothers into the MCH program. It is expected that the issue will be somewhat addressed by the expansion of the health component from the Title II Enhancement project to other MCH centres. (Payment of fees discussed under F.20) CARE supervisors ~~have access to the health cards of beneficiaries and are able to~~ check that program participants do, in fact, fall within groups targetted by CARE. Should this not be the case, CARE can rely on established channels of communication to redress the situation since both parties recognize policies under the basic general agreement.

D.2.a. Ration levels for FY '86 have not been changed for some years and were determined following consultation with the Division of Nutrition of the Ministry of Health and Public Welfare and AID-DR.

D.2.b. The supervisor checks that the quantity of food found at centres corresponds with the latest dispatch invoice. In one centre the total of empty bags corresponding to amounts dispatched from CARE was verified as being satisfactory. In two centres visited the CARE supervisor noted discrepancies between expected and actual inventories and concluded that the MCH/OCH centre personnel were not following CARE-prescribed ways of measuring food rations ("jarro" system). During FY '84 CARE introduced the "jarro" measurement in 15 selected centres and then developed it throughout the program together with an administrative system for guidance in ration measurement per beneficiary ratio. Supervisors feel that the present size of "jarro" used does not reflect practical use of ration measurement. CARE is planning to implement a sixteen-ounce jarro which will be a more practical unit for present ration size. The jarros have already been purchased. Confusion is also due to the frequent change of centre personnel who may not have received the initial basic instruction or adequate reinforcement by the CARE

supervisor. It is recommended that supervisors, during each visit to the centre require administrative personnel and/or cooks to physically measure out prescribed rations for CARE verification. Supervisors could be provided with inexpensive but hygienic plastic bags for this purpose.

D.2.c. Supervisors control beneficiary numbers during visits to centres. Statistical data is entered on the 'mini-audit' form which is returned to the central office for review and evaluation. When the beneficiary level at a feeding centre falls below target the CARE supervisor encourages the centre, through the SESPAS representative, to select additional beneficiaries and may even go out into the community to send potential beneficiaries to the centre. Beneficiary decreases are also noted by CARE truck drivers who report any remaining monthly stocks to the central office. Subsequent food dispatches are reduced until verification by the supervisor and a return to target levels.

D.2.d. At the time of this review, the Feeding Program had been experiencing heavy losses of food shipments due to arrivals of contaminated grain into Dominican ports. This has resulted in serious distribution delays and shortages following lengthy administrative procedures and fumigation.

Since October '85, only NFDM and Oil have been distributed according to program plan. Centres normally distribute commodities twice a month; however, because of the unavailability of grain, most centres have been making a single monthly distribution. In 5 of 8 MCH/OCF centres visited no food was seen. In the 2 other centres the CARE Supervisor noted discrepancies between expected and actual inventories and concluded that the MCH/OCF centre personnel were experiencing difficulties in measuring food rations ("jarro" system). As discussed in D.2.b. this problem should be reduced with implementation of the new "jarro".

D.2.e. Annual total tonnage of food commodities for distribution requirements is based on planned total beneficiary figures for each feeding category times the prescribed yearly ration, and thus follows the accepted CARE procedure. The normal procedure of calculating Quarterly Call-Forward amounts is based on planned ~~beneficiary needs, in-country stock balances undistributed by~~ CARE, and known quantities of shipment arrivals for the current quarter. This method is recognized as being the most accurate as it takes into consideration program variables such as vacation time in Pre-School Feeding or changes in stock availability at the CARE warehouse due to delayed/accelerated shipment arrivals, or unforeseen vehicle down-time. It is recommended that CARE recognize these variables in computing Call Forwards.

Summary of Recommendations under Section D.

1. That the CARE Supervisors following revision of the measuring unit require centre personnel to demonstrate their knowledge of "jarro" system through physically measuring rations.
2. That Call-Forwards be computed taking into consideration program variables.

E/F. Review of Control Documents:

F.1. Information regarding planned program levels for preparation in April '85 of the FY '86 AER was submitted to AID in April, 1984. The ABS document was prepared by AID/DR. No copy was sent to CARE-Dominicana.

F.2. CARE operates the Feeding Program in the Dominican Republic in cooperation with US/AID-DR, and keeps the US/AID mission informed of all the activities through the required reporting systems.

At the present time, there is no approved Country Development Strategy Statement (CDSS) for 1986-1987; however, activities within the CARE-Feeding Program reflect AID policy for Title II use as outlined in the 1983 CDSS, pages 51-52. The required ~~developmental impact of Title II food is recognized through~~ CARE's close collaboration with SESPAS and SEEBAC and will be further implemented through the Title II Enhancement project.

F.3. The Annual Estimate of Requirements (AER) for the current year FY '86 was prepared after taking into consideration the following:

- Number of beneficiaries as per Three Year Plan, including SESPAS/SEEBAC needs.
- US/Congressional and W/FFP approval of ABS filed a year earlier.
- USDA/FAS commodity pricing.
- CARE's logistical capabilities in FY '86.

F.4. See D.2.e.

F.5. The following documents pertaining to incoming shipments for the Third Quarter FY '85 were verified as follows:

- a) Call Forward submitted to CARE-NY by CARE-Dominicana on January 10, 1985.
- b) CARE-NY ALMIS #1535 for commodity approval (form ccc-183) dated February 20, 1985.
- c) CARE-NY ALMIS #1535 for notice of availability (form ccc-512) dated March 22-27, 1985.
- d) Bills of Lading and Pro-Forma Invoices were checked for the following shipments:
 - F-1907-0001-033 dated May 10, 1985.
 - F-1907-0001-039 dated May 6, 1985.

Above documents are dispatched through Island Courier, and the Feeding Program receives them in good time. Staff can therefore check availability of amounts against Call-Forward quantities and are able to make necessary adjustments in case of error or other ~~extenuating circumstances.~~

F.6. The following procedure is regularly required for clearance of Title II commodities by Dominican Port authorities. Each stage was verified by the reviewer by noting records for Bulgur Wheat shipment No. F-1995-0018-115.

1. Bill of Lading No.031-980269 with the corresponding Pro-Forma invoice, CARE's request for duty free entry of commodities (form 946) and the consular invoice (form 50) were submitted to the Custom Department.

2. Form 946, No.168546, dated March 4, 1986, was returned to CARE from the Department of Finance, certifying that CARE is granted franchise to import foods.

3. On February 18, 1986, CARE also requested import authorization from the Secretary of Agriculture.

4. Import authorization from the Secretary of Agriculture was sent on February 25, 1986.

5. The Customs Department letter of exoneration for import duty was dated March 7, 1986.

6. The shipment was covered by the USDA Phytosanitary certificate No. B.342584, dated February 3, 1986.

7. On entering the Dominican Republic, grain shipments are also inspected by the DR Department of Agriculture at the Port, and are again fumigated following dispatch authorization. The

rider for this shipment states that all containers were fumigated although the reviewer was not able to verify the fumigation certificate.

8. Dispatch authorization No. 2125 by Port Authorities-Rio Haina for all 21 containers of this shipment was issued on March 24, 1986.

NOTE: All NFDM and OIL shipments also require INESPRES authorization to import. This institute is in charge of price controls of local foodstuffs and, as such, decides whether imported Title II commodities affect local market prices.

The clearance of documents by Dominican authorities can be slow (4 weeks or more). In this particular case, the ship 'San Pedro' arrived on February 22, 1986 and although the official clearance was granted on March 24, 1986, stock remains in port facilities. The Sealand facilities at Rio Haina lack manoeuvring space for containers, which can remain out of reach of inspection by Port Authorities for long periods of time. CARE should appeal to port, shipping and Government authorities for quicker processing of necessary documentation, in order to minimize risk of infestation at Dominican port facilities.

F.7. The independent surveyor, Dominican Cargo (DC), is present at the port for inspection. In general practice, the survey is made during offloading of bags from containers onto private trucks hired by CARE, as the containers do not leave the port area. The CARE shipping officer follows the truck to the CARE warehouse where bags are offloaded in the presence of the survey agent. Any discrepancy in losses recorded by the surveyor at the port and by the CARE warehouse is charged against the Trucking Association and an inland loss report is filed with AID-DR.

The reviewer raised the question of direct off-loading from containers into the CARE warehouse to minimize risk of losses occurring after the survey, but was informed that this is not possible since the Port Authorities will not allow movement of commodities from port until after the survey has been completed. Moving stock ~~from port to warehouse by containerized transportation is also~~ cost prohibitive. Controlling loss quantities during transfer of stock from containers to trucks is therefore the only available satisfactory method.

F.8. Port losses are claimed through the normal CARE procedure as follows:

1. A numbered claim, or Loss Advice, is filed against the shipping company.
2. Support documents include
 - Survey report
 - Certification of fee paid to surveyor
 - Fumigation certificates
 - Outturn report issued by the shipping company.
3. The claim is sent to Rollins, Burdick, Hunter of New York, an insurance brokerage firm retained by CARE for claims procedures.

Claims for marine losses are filed as soon as the entire shipment has cleared the port.

F.9. See F.7.

F.10. Warehouse controls are done through the warehouse ledger which contains the following information:

- a. Dates of stock received and stock distributed.
- b. Quantities of stock received and distributed.
- c. Names of centres receiving distribution.
- d. Truck numbers.
- e. Dispatch invoice numbers.

- f. Quantity of stock returned.
- g. Reduction of spoiled stock.
- h. Running balance for each commodity.

A random check was made for a distribution to an MCH centre in ~~Boca Chica on February 22. Ledger tallies were correct and corresponded with quantities recorded on dispatch invoice No.8342.~~

A warehouse ledger inventory check was made on March 26, 1986. the last ledger entry for a stock balance of 6,134 bags of NFDM was dated March 21, 1986, although dispatch amounts for 706 bags were entered up to March 26. The physical inventory of 5,428 bags of NFDM recorded on stock sheets corresponded to the ledger entries.

The warehouse manager regularly records ledger entries but does not always keep stock control sheets up to date.

PL-480 staff control warehouse administration on a frequent basis. In general, the PL-480 Commodity Manager and her assistant visit the warehouse twice a month for inventory purposes and inspect the warehouses at other unspecified times for control purposes.

Any spoiled food is removed from the warehouse and placed in a separate area. The following bags were entered on November 29, 1985:

2-1/2	bags NFDM
2	bags Wheat flour
1	bag Bulgur

These bags have not yet been disposed of as the requested written authorization has not yet been received from AID-DR. (Please refer to Loss Advice I-118/03-FY-85, dated November 29, 1985). Following AID authorization, spoiled food is donated to government animal raising projects.

F.11. Food requirements for each project (MCH, OCF and PSF) are reviewed yearly in anticipation of AER preparation the following year. The Feeding Program takes into consideration counterpart requests for decrease or increase. (See also F.3)

F.12 The 4 CARE trucks which are operational deliver food weekly to SESPAS centres. Each centre receives a monthly ration. SEEBAC operates 3 government-owned trucks which are controlled and maintained by CARE and which receive commodities weekly from the CARE warehouse. Each pre-school feeding centre receives a monthly ration. CEA and IAD supported centres receive food from the warehouse on an ad-hoc basis and provide their own transport.

F.13. Prior to January 1, 1986, loss reports were filed with AID for commodities lost during transport from the CARE warehouse to receiving centres.

F.14. Supervisors note losses or quantities of spoiled food at project sites. SESPAS officials certify the spoilage and the CARE supervisor disposes of the spoiled quantities by donating food to animal-raising projects within the community. A receipt for donation is returned to the central office for verification. Since January 1, 1986, loss reports for such spoilage are not filed with AID-DR. It is recommended that CARE-Dominicana file loss reports for all food spoilage as per Regulation 11, article 211.9 (f).

F.15. See F.10

Warehouse fumigation is done on a regular basis. CARE-Dominicana has a contract with "La Exterminadora" since April, 1983. This contract is renewed annually. Fumigation records were checked for 5 fumigations within the last six months. Because of regular fumigation, CARE's warehouse spoilages are very minimal. Of more concern, is the enormous loss of PL-480 through infestation prior

to arrival to Dominican Republic ports. CARE has lost more than 1,050 metric tons of grain, valued at over \$309,000 within the last six months. These losses have severely reduced program activities.

~~F.16. See F.10 and F.13~~

F.17. CARE does not yet have any regional warehouse.

F.18. See also D.26. Centres use notebooks to list beneficiaries and distribution dates. A corresponding record of the distribution date is made on a numbered beneficiary card. At one time CARE devised a "Weekly Distribution and Attendance" report form (Formulario #4) and a "Monthly Inventory and Beneficiary Report" (Formulario #5) and also a log for "Receipts and Distributions" (Formulario #6). However, these proved too complicated for centre personnel to fill out and were suspended by CARE.

Up until about 2 years ago, centres filled out a monthly summary report on distribution activities. This report was returned to CARE and entered in the corresponding file for each centre. Different forms were used for each type of program. No reporting is being done at the present time. It is recommended that the Feeding Program devise a simple and practical standard form to be used by each centre for monthly reporting.

F.19. See also Section C.2 for inspection frequency.

CARE's Three Year Plan 86-88 allows for each centre to be visited 3 times a year. An increase to 4 times a year is anticipated under the FY '87 Operational Plan. The inspection form, "Mini-audit" records actual findings for e.g. beneficiary levels, inventory, nutrition monitoring, publicity posters, administrative systems, commodity receipts. The information logged is mainly quantitative.

A weekly summary is filled out by each supervisor. The summary compiles the information contained in the "Mini-audit" forms and records numbers of centres which have/use the above components.

~~Since adequate administration at the centres seems to be a particular problem, CARE should evaluate the weaknesses and attempt to redress the situation.~~ The mere yes/no answer to whether a centre has an administrative system in place is only the first step to solving the problem.

On many occasions the supervisors do not even supply this information. Since the administrative systems for centres developed under the Three Year Plan have proved to be somewhat impractical, it is recommended that CARE reestablish what administrative systems centres are to use, test them in sample centres and train the supervisors to, in turn, train centre personnel.

F.20. Most centres encourage program participants to donate amounts varying between 20 - 80 centavos monthly. This money is used to reimburse cleaning costs or is sometimes forwarded to the counterpart agency. CARE does not receive or control these funds, neither does it control the sale of empty containers. Empty containers are usually donated to participants.

F.21. Mostly done through the "Mini-audit" form, and food accounting at centres. Supervisors also occasionally visit markets.

F.22. See F.18.

F.23. Since September 1985, AID-DR no longer requires CARE-Dominicana to prepare monthly commodity recipient status reports. Quarterly commodity/reipient status reports are sent to AID-DR. The last report for the period October-December,

1985, was sent to AID-DR on February 11, 1986. The report for January-March, 1986 is under preparation.

F.24. Controlled through the Commodity and Recipient Status Reports.

F.25. a) CARE does not distribute non-Title II foods.

b) CARE annually exchanges beneficiary lists with other agencies engaged in feeding activities.

Summary of Recommendations Under Section F.

1. That CARE-Dominicana file loss reports for all spoiled food as per Regularion II, article 211.9 (f).
2. That a form be devised for regular reporting by program centres.
3. That the present administrative weakness of centres be studied, that a more practical administrative system be reestablished, and that motivation/training be considered to improve program controls.

G. Additional Comments:

1. CARE's philosophy in the use of food aid is set out in CARE's Policy and Guidelines (FAPG), Feb. 1985 where is stated that all CARE-operated food aid programs should be designed to decrease dependency on food. The Title II Enhancement project will respond to this directive through those components intended to strengthen community participation: mother's clubs, fruit tree and vegetable production and sales, animal raising and sales. Self-help projects can also be strengthened by improved

targetting, specifically by considering the entire family as beneficiaries for food aid thus releasing hard-found family income for alternative use in support of self-help activities.

Family targetting was attempted by CARE through SESPAS in 1984 in ~~the El Rio Constanza Project, following recommendations outlined~~ in the Griffiths-Monkeberg report. Forty families were targetted and received food from CARE for a three-month period. However, following AID evaluation the project was suspended as insufficient reporting was being done by the counterpart agency. In view of the importance of discouraging food dependency, it is recomended that CARE-Dominicana once again consider food aid to family units.

Discussions with a Regional Director of the Division of Nutrition reveal that DR health officials would be receptive to projects focusing on family targetting.

2. As an alternative to, or along with the above, the Feeding Program should also consider ways of strengthening community participation in vegetable producing from gardens attached to health centers. (This was previously introduced at the Ingenio Santa Fe in 1980). Only 1 center out of 8 visited by the reviewer had activities linked to vegetable producing. It is suggested that more attention be given to this issue since the impact gained from increased vegetable production far out-weighs the cost of implementation from inputs of training, simple tools, seeds, and motivation.

It is recom[^]ended that CARE coordinate with SESPAS to find ways of revitalizing the vegetable producing component within the MCH/OCF program.

3. Computerization of Feeding Program records was planned for completion by August, 85, under the Three-year Plan, 86-88.

Although begun in June, 1985, computerization of data was suspended.

CARE now has technical staff to continue the process which is planned for completion by the end of FY '86. The early ~~data processing of information gathered from inspection visits is~~ especially recommended to allow supervisors to spend more time in the field.

The Feeding Program should also begin computerization of distribution systems, including those planned for the three regional warehouses. This would help in making logistics more cost effective.

By making its computer systems available to process selected health data forwarded by SESPAS, CARE would encourage the counterpart to relay growth monitoring records on a more regular and structured basis. This would enable both parties to improve techniques for evaluation of food impact and encourage coordination between both agencies.

Summary of Recommendations under Section G.

1. That CARE-Dominicana again consider food distribution to family units, and/or replace emphasis on vegetable-producing support projects.
2. That computerization of Feeding Program data, records, and logistics be completed within the planned schedule.
3. That CARE work with SESPAS to process growth monitoring data to encourage coordination and improve evaluation techniques.

The reviewer wishes to thank Mr. Lawrence Holzman, CARE-Dominicana Country Director, and his staff, for all courtesies and assistance received in conducting this internal review.
