

17  
538003000~~201~~

*IP new-jm*

PD-AAI-463-01

2

EVALUATIVE REPORT

First Year of  
Basic Human Needs (BHN)  
and  
Caribbean Education Development  
Programs (CED)

Presented To:

Regional Development Office/Caribbean  
USAID

Prepared By:

Roy Littlejohn Associates, Inc.  
1328 New York Avenue, N.W.  
Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20005

## CONTENTS

		<u>Page</u>
Section I	SUMMARY OVERALL FINDINGS.....	I-1
Section II	OBJECTIVES ADDRESSED.....	II-1
	a) Overall Objectives.....	II-1
	b) Charge given the Evaluative Team.....	II-2
Section III	PRINCIPAL INPUTS TO THE PROCESS.....	III-1
	a) Evaluative Team.....	III-1
	b) Briefings.....	III-2
	c) Methodology.....	III-4
Section IV	EVALUATIVE CRITERIA and RELATED ADDENDA.....	IV-1
	a) B.H.N. Component.....	IV-1
	b) Infrastructural Component.....	IV-3
	c) Evaluative Addenda.....	IV-4
Section V	OUTPUT: COUNTRY REPORTS.....	V-1
	a) St. Vincent.....	V-1
	i. Overall.....	V-1
	ii. Respective Projects.....	V-4
	iii. New Project Prospects.....	V-6
	b) Antigua.....	V-6
	i. Overall.....	V-6
	ii. Respective Projects.....	V-10
	iii. New Project Prospects.....	V-12
	c) St. Kitts.....	V-13
	i. Overall.....	V-13
	ii. Respective Projects.....	V-15
	iii. New Project Prospects.....	V-16
	d) Dominica.....	V-17
	i. Overall.....	V-17
	ii. Respective Projects.....	V-23
	iii. New Project Prospects.....	V-25

	<u>Page</u>
<u>Contents con't</u>	
e) Barbados.....	V-26
i. Overall.....	V-26
Section VI	
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	VI-1
a) Conclusion.....	VI-1
b) Recommendations.....	VI-8
Section VII	
APPENDIX I - Aggregate Data	
Section VIII	
APPENDIX II - Antigua Publicity Program	
Section IX	
APPENDIX III - Other Data	
Section X	
APPENDIX IV - Documentation of Objectives and Statement of Work	

## SECTION I

### SUMMARY OVERALL FINDINGS

#### Note:

The intended objective of the grant program under AID Project No. 538-0029 and 538-0030, as amended, will have been satisfied if the projects create jobs and also produce infrastructural components that will be available for use by the mass of the people.

Another implied objective is that of assisting these emerging countries to manage, for themselves, the circumstances which will contribute to their social and economic development.

The listed findings are not ranked. They were prepared after making visits of approximately two days each to St. Vincent, Antigua, St. Kitts, and Dominica; and after having a one-hour meeting at the offices of the CDB with the project supervisor for Barbados.

#### 1. The Independence Effect of the Program

A significant operational consequence of the management strategy in which grant recipients receive assigned sub-project budgets within the Caribbean Educational Development (CED) project (USAID Project No. 538-0029) and the Basic Human Needs/Employment (BHN/E) project (USAID No. 538-0030) is that of assisting these countries, which hitherto functioned on the basis of management decisions that were made for them by the British Colonial Office, to take charge of the management of their own

social and economic affairs. The type of institution-building that is necessary to successfully execute this strategy must be prepared to accommodate learning adjustment periods that will, by their nature, cause some delays in the start-up of building projects.

## 2. Management of Funds

The current management arrangements involving the use of letters of credit with local banks, and also verification of the technical integrity of the item on which funds are spent, are sound, and are working reasonably well. The difficulties that exist can be attributed to resistance on the parts of grant recipients and their agents. The discipline of planning to budget (as the arrangement which USAID, RDO/C has with the Caribbean Development Bank (CDB) requires) appears to be a relatively new experience for these countries.

## 3. Progress Toward Goal Achievement

By and large, notwithstanding the disbursement data of Table I, Appendix I, progress within the infrastructure-creating, and also within the employment-generating objectives of the projects, is being achieved (with the exception of Barbados, where nothing beyond the recent appointment of a project supervisor, has occurred).

In Dominica ineffectiveness of the management, at the level of the project supervisor, appears to be a notable source of dysfunction. Problems are aggravated and projects are not brought on line as expeditiously as they might. In addition, the supervisor produced no pertinent data. He is not an expeditor.

As a result, programs are hampered because of his inaction that appears to be brought about due to his focus on minor detail and his misunderstanding -- together with his unwillingness to adopt required new procedures.

#### 4. Effectiveness of Project Supervisor Operations

The level of effectiveness with which the program secures desired objectives in the short-term as well as in the long-term, is critically dependent upon the level of financial, administrative, and managerial acumen that the resident project supervisors possess.

While the evaluators recognize that the project supervisor is not a representative of the CDB, by virtue of the fact that they are appointed on the recommendation of the respective governments and are paid out of the aggregate funds provided by the CDB for Sub-projects in the respective countries, care needs to be taken to ensure that they (the project supervisor) fully understand where their prime responsibilities and loyalties lay in terms of assisting their respective countries with the administration and supervision of BHN/E and CED activities. Currently, the matter regarding where the prime responsibilities and loyalty of the project supervisor should lay does not seem to be sufficiently clear. As a result, start-up delays in projects (with the necessary increase in inflation-generated costs) can be traced to the failure of Project Supervisors to emphasize to the local government that they are expected to submit plans for schools within the available budget for respective projects. This weakness, at the level of the project supervisor's office, can be corrected if the following steps are taken:

- a) The CDB must emphasize to appointees (as project supervisors) that although they are conduits between the bank and the local government, their prime responsibilities are as local representatives in behalf of the expediting function, which the bank is carrying out in respect of the BHN and the CED programs.
- b) The CDB must assure itself that recommended appointees (as project supervisors) have the necessary administrative skills which are required for their tasks and that these appointees, besides being committed to the program objectives, are familiar with recognized practices of financial management.
- c) The CDB should be encouraged to have periodic meetings of its project supervisors; and at least one of these meetings should be held at its head office in Barbados. The other meetings should be held in the field in order to familiarize each supervisor with what the others are doing, and in order that they may be better able to devise common solutions that may expedite the program objectives.

##### 5. Data Availability

Ready data availability is an important part of any monitoring or any evaluation operation. Unfortunately, the aggregate employment data were not available in a form that was practicably useful--given the time constraints of the evaluation period. In order to correct this shortcoming in the availability the accessibility of the program data, the CDB should encourage all the project supervisors to keep records that are similar to those which the project supervisor of the Antigua program provided the team (Appendix III).

The information which the other project supervisors in St. Vincent and on St. Kitts supplied was less systematic, and on examination, seemed less reliable. Furthermore, the project supervisor in Dominica expressed surprise at the suggestion that such data are needed and should be provided. Not surprisingly, therefore, the team did not get any data from him.

## 6. The Private Labor Contract Problem

When the construction is not done under a force account procedure, and is instead done by private contractors, the program is left to rely on the expectation that there exists a relatively common method of construction in these parts, and that this feature will assure that the desired employment-creating objectives of the program are met. The evaluating team, however, requests that the RDO, USAID Barbados, should assure itself that a circumstance which it observed on the Grand Bay/Pinchelin water project in Dominica is not the usual practice on other projects (even if historically that is how such matters are usually handled) in the islands.

On this Grand Bay/Pinchelin Project, discussions with the accountant of the Central Water Authority (the prime contractor) and some laborers at the site, revealed that ditch digging work had been sub-contracted to a private source. The persons conducting the digging--under reported current arrangements--share 75 per cent of the amount that was allocated for the project. The private contractor, therefore, could get the 25 per cent remainder. Although this discussion in no way suggested that this specific circumstance is common or widespread in the islands, the evaluators felt that precautionary steps should be taken by the CDB and AID/Barbados to ensure (if these findings were correct) that such practices would not be emulated at other projects in the islands.

Again, although there is no evidence that this circumstance (if true) is extensive, the evaluators felt that this type of arrangement does not appear to be in the spirit of a program whose prime target is that of enhancing the economic distributive effects,

via an employment-creation strategy. RDO, AID Barbados should do the following. It should request of the project management team for respective countries, that they take systematic steps to assure that the greater proportion of amounts budgeted for labor payments is received by those persons who actually do the work.

#### 7. Using the Consultants More Effectively

The project consultants are recruited with the concurrence of the respective local governments. They do a valuable job in checking the technical as well as the financial integrity of projects for which they are retained. However, a number of problems, in respect to the effective use of these consultants, still need to be resolved. Some of these consultant-linked problems go beyond the level of what one could call starting-up or settling-in problems. Chief of those which fall in that group are the following:

##### 7(a) Review Procedure

Unless the CDB has some uncommunicable technical design standard or has a set of modules to which building designs should conform, once the budget for a program has been agreed upon, it seems superfluous and time consuming to an unnecessary degree (with its attendant effects on costs) that preliminary as well as final drawings should be submitted to the project head office at the CDB for approval. Rather the consultant in cooperation with the grant recipient should be requested and expected to design to the budget, and subsequently, to submit the final drawings to the CDB for approval.

##### 7(b) Designing Within Budgets

If the countries persist in requiring designs for buildings that will cost beyond the project budget (as past performance suggests) the following is recommended:

Rather than cut classroom size from 24'x 24' and from 20'x 24' to 20'x 20' (as is currently being done) the following option is recommended. Classroom size should be standardized on a 24'x 24' basis. Consultants should be requested to design in modular form. They could then submit plans which allow for the use of additive or deletive alternatives. If the plan is over budget, then the grant recipient can decide what classrooms or other annexes it will wish to leave out. Correspondingly, if more funds become available, then the additive alternate could be included. In addition, the basic building should be put out to bids. An additive alternative bid, if the left-out portions were to be included, could be solicited.

#### 7(c) Multiple Use Designs

The evaluating team observed evidence the CDB and consultants have made substantial efforts to incorporate hurricane resistant modifications in school design and construction techniques. However, in the specific cases of the Mahaut and Weirs Margot School rehabilitations (based on discussions with the MCW buildings division representative at Mahaut) it was noted that although hurricane tie precautions were being taken to anchor the steel roof trusses to the roof ring beam, the ties for the aluminum replacement roofing were as before. Hurricane David had pulled the roof c. with these ties which were basically a bolt and ring washer arrangement. A stronger roofing material, such as a thicker corrugated steel, to better resist the uplift action of the hurricane winds against tie down washers, or some reinforcing of the ties with other than ring washers against which the thinner aluminum roofing pulled through before, would be indicated. The Project Supervisor advised that the repairs were being made and aluminum roofing materials were again being utilized on the advice of the consultant on the work.

Since schools are expected to function as community shelters when there are hurricanes, it is in order to question (not withstanding the sea-blast consideration) the appropriateness of replacing the roofs of these schools (if reports from the aforementioned persons are accurate) with the same gauge aluminum as that which had been torn-off by the hurricane.

#### 8. Informal Educational Opportunities

In the environment of a developing economy, informal education significantly contributes to the development of new attitudes to doing. It is these attitude changes which lead to behaviors which produce the measured changes in the data that economists and social scientists use as indicators of economic development.

If the following recommendations are applied to the environment, the result would be a marked enhancement of the productivity of the existing CED and BNH programs.

##### 8(a) Include the Ministry of Community Development

Project supervisors should be requested to actively involve (at the outset of any program) the ministry which has the responsibility for community and social affairs. That involvement should be designed to get respective communities to be active participants in the maintenance program (plan) which under the terms of the project agreement, grant recipients are expected to submit to the CDB.

8(b) Augment The Required Publicity Program

The substance and thrust of the required publicity program which grant recipients are expected to develop, should be augmented. The augmented thrust should be directed at highlighting the proposition that development should be managed in behalf of meeting basic human needs. The fact that the U.S. is doing so in their country thereby becomes indirectly emphasized. Automatically this emphasis changes the customary image which these people have been led to have of the U.S.

The United States, as a donor, will benefit from this highlighting. The recipient countries, as modifiers of existing infrastructure so as to secure changed dispositions to skill acquisition, will benefit. Such an augmented emphasis in the publicity program is strongly recommended if it can be successfully accommodated within the purpose and thrusts of the BHN/E and CED programs.

9. Prospects for The Future

Although it is recognized that the current structure and emphases of the BHN/E and CED programs do not permit this, future expansions of these activities might consider the inclusion of technical, managerial and vocational skills development features which these emerging countries will require. Related infrastructure should therefore be considered.

Projects that address health-related needs can also be regarded as creating human capital. Providing infrastructure which deals with waste disposal, is an appropriate extension of the BHN/E program.

Attempts should be made to link the community-involvement of the BHN program, with the sources of the decision-making that are now managing and shaping the AID-sponsored Caribbean Curriculum Development Program.

The equipping of technical schools that will supply needed skills in agricultural production and skills that are needed in the running and maintenance of locally used equipment is an effective direction in which future planning should proceed. While this is not possible within the framework of the BHN/E and CED program structures, other means for the support of this direction should be sought. This is why this provision of infrastructure, under the BHN/E and CED programs must, for planning purposes, be integrated with the operations that are being provided under the Caribbean Curriculum Development Program.

#### 10. Technical Assistance Needs

In some cases the local Ministry of Works is weak in the number and in the availability of technical skills. This is especially the case in St. Kitts.

Even though the CDB-retained consultants augment the available limited pool of talent, in order to take advantage of the benefits in savings that can accrue through government ordering of materials, some type of technical assistance seems to be desirable. Furthermore, at the time of the final presentation in Barbados, the representative of the CDB (Mr. Yhap) indicated that the bank intended to explore, seriously, the possibilities of providing such technical assistance.

## 11. The Barbados Problem

Apart from appointing a project supervisor in October of 1980, nothing seems to have occurred on the Barbados program. The report is that a joint program of execution between the Ministry of Works and the Ministry of Housing is now being awaited. It was also indicated that in the revised program, the bulk of the funds would be committed to road-building.

If the unemployment rate were high, or was expected to become higher, the labor usage potential of this type of road-building commitment would be in the spirit of the BHN program. However, the information is that during the time of the sugar cane harvest, unskilled labor is scarce. This means that when the road-building program is started-up, Barbados may elect to use an argument about labor scarcity as a method for justifying the use of more mechanized methods of road-building. If this country does so, it would have further acted contrary to the spirit of the loan agreement under the terms of the BHN project.

RDO, AID Barbados, should therefore be alert to this additional possibility and should take the necessary steps to either have Barbados act under the terms of the loan, or to request that Barbados free-up the funds so that they can be consistently utilized elsewhere.

## 12. Integration of The Projects

At the time of the initial briefing which the team received from RDO, AID, Barbados, it was instructed that operationally, (especially as far as the schools component was concerned) the CED and the BHN projects were managed as one, even though they received funding from different budgets. The team evaluated them accordingly. The foregoing comments should be regarded as being applicable to either or to both projects.

### 13. Distribution of Project Benefits

It is in the spirit of the BHN program that the employment as well as the capital benefits of a program should, as much as possible, accrue directly to the mass of the people. With the government as the principal landholder on St. Kitts, the capital benefits of the Con Phipps peanut growing "pilot" project and of the Green Hill soil conservation program on government "owned" land, will accrue to the mass of the people in only a roundabout way. The land-clearing operation will have the effect of increasing the amount of sugar cane growing land which the National Agricultural Corporation (NACO) will have available.

By and large, until the present government of St. Kitts has worked out its programs for land reform and the agricultural and other economic diversification, the matter of the distribution of the capital benefits of programs in this country should be given serious consideration. The foregoing reservations on project selection should be considered. Accordingly, health-related and education-related projects should be given the primary consideration.

### 14. Use of Maintenance Funds

Three components appear to inhibit the usage of maintenance funds. They are interrelated; therefore, this listing is not to be viewed as a ranking:

- (a) Finding matching funds from the financially strapped budgets, as the project agreement requires, can be problematic for these governments. Even though they may support the idea and the intent of the fund matching, until these governments develop the necessary system of management and priority setting for the available funds, executing the matching will be difficult for them.

- (b) If the Ministry of Community Affairs could be properly mobilized, the matching maintenance could be arranged and provided via contribution in-kind from the community.
- (c) Misunderstandings about the limits and the availability of the maintenance funds exist. The effectiveness of the project supervisor's office is critical for mobilizing the Ministry of Community Affairs and for communicating about the availability of funds.

#### 15. Project Interrelationships

The objective of the CED project is basically to provide school "plant" (material infrastructure). The prime objectives of the BHN project are directed at quality-of-life targets, via providing structures such as school plant and structures which facilitate health-care delivery, and via employment opportunities which will give the unemployed (especially youth and women - within the cultural tolerances) opportunities to earning.

The employment-creating objective confronts the fact that on projects that are put-up for bids to private tenders (irrespective of which program finances these projects), bidders are seeking profit. On having the bid accepted, they have the right to choose their method of using labor, and also their personnel. Therefore, unless the CDB (in cooperation with AID) intends to provide the technical assistance that will allow all these countries to do the building by using the force account procedure, the most that can be done is to use "suasion" techniques on successful bidders and to ask them to make (consistent with their work quality), employment opportunities available to the maximum number of persons.

Providing that level of technical assistance which would be necessary to avoid the private construction route would be undesirable, given the fact that independence-creating is one of the implicit objectives of the overall program.

The recommendation is that irrespective of the source of the funds that are applied to a particular project, the labor-usage criteria should not be rigidly applied on a project-by-project basis. Where a project promises to yield high socially-productive results that can be objectively identified, the labor content provision of the BHN program could be waived -- provided the overall program for that country is well within the labor usage percentage guidelines.

## SECTION II

### OBJECTIVES THAT WERE ADDRESSED

#### a. The Overall Objectives

An elaborate statement of the objectives which the evaluative team was charged with meeting, is presented in Appendix IV.

Briefly stated, the evaluative team was charged with doing the following:

- i. Making a review of the interrelationships of the CED and the BHN projects, and of the factors affecting the success in the implementation of their respective components.
- ii. Making a thorough investigation of the overall coordination and the administrative procedures employed among the Agency for International Development, the Caribbean Development Bank, and the participating countries.
- iii. Doing an investigation of the sub-projects, and also an appraisal of the identification, selection, and implementation plans for each participating country.
- iv. Making an appraisal of the procedures that are used for contracting construction, for engineering inspection services, and an appraisal of the responsibilities which these agents discharge.
- v. Producing a report of the findings of this evaluation, (which report is to be completed prior to the departure from that host country) and to present as well to AID Governmental Representatives, a briefing for tentative approval, and in which documents that were developed as a result of the evaluation would be handed over.

b. The Charge Given to the Evaluative Team

At the briefings which the team had at RDO, USAID, Barbados, over the period of November 24-26, 1980, the team was informed that both programs (CED, and BHN/E) were managed operationally as a unit, even though the funding for the schools portion of the BHN program is a different account from the funding CED provides.

The team was therefore instructed to look at the program operations as if these operations were being handled as a single unit.

The evaluation team did as it was requested, and within the scope of its objectives, examined the field operations and the management program which the CDB was undertaking as if the projects formed an integrated unit.

### SECTION III

#### PRINCIPAL INPUTS TO THE PROCESS

##### a. The Evaluative Team

The evaluating team comprised of three persons. Dr. W. Donald Walling, Horace R. Carby-Samuels, and Charles S. Stevens.

Walling and Carby-Samuels are consultants who had been engaged on contract to the firm of Roy Littlejohn Associates, Inc., 1328 New York Avenue, N.W., Suite 200, Washington, D.C. 20005.

Stevens had been engaged as a consultant on a Personal Services Contract to AID.

Walling is a Rutgers University Professor of Educational Administration and Infrastructures. He indicated that he has directed over 100 educational infrastructure studies in the U.S. For purposes of the evaluation the team made him responsible for the area of facilities planning.

Carby-Samuels is an agricultural economist and a social scientist. His area of specialization is economic development, with special emphasis on the economics of education and human resources development. He indicated that as a researcher, a consultant, and an educator, he has done studies that are pertinent to his professional specialization in parts of Africa, the Caribbean, and in North America. For purposes of this project, the team assigned him to concentrate on the area of Basic Human Needs.

Stevens is a civil engineer consultant. He brought over 20 years of engineering experience with AID to this evaluation. Further, he made engineering studies in Dominica and St. Vincent after the recent severe hurricanes, (David and Allen). The team assigned him the responsibility to deal with the engineering aspects of the projects.

b. Briefing Received

(i) General

Over the period November 24-26, 1980 the team was briefed by AID officials RDO/C, Donald Boyd, Evaluation Liaison Officer; Hal Freeman, Education Officer; and Dwight Johnson, Assistant Director, RDO/C.

In meetings with CDB officials, the team was briefed by Mr. O. K. Yhap, Director of Infrastructure, and Project Implementation Officers, Messers Morris Charles and Stephen Asher.

(ii) Documentation

The team received copies of pertinent documents such as project agreements, descriptions of the studies that were a precursor to the project selection for the CED program, and was informed by the officers of the CDB, about the structure of the program under which the grants were administered. A list of the documents received is given in Appendix III.

(iii) Data

The team received data showing amounts that the Board of the CDB had approved for respective projects.

(iv) Administration

The team was also informed of the procedural modifications which the CDB had made for purposes of administering these projects (and in particular the BHN program).

These modifications include making funds available for projects by means of letters of credit with local banks.

CDB Officers indicated that under the prevailing administrative arrangements, projects can start-up prior to formal CDB board approval of the project. The necessary process which countries are required to pursue is that of presenting the coordinating officers at the CDB with detailed information. The CDB management committee approves or rejects, as the case may be, the grant requests. The president of the Bank is then informed of the management committee's action. His signature enables funds to be released for projects that have been given management committee approval. He, in turn, informs the Board of the CDB of such action that had been taken by him.

Regular formal reports are made to AID/RDO/C. Mr. Boyd, the AID project Liaison Officer, told the team that there is such a close and amicable day-to-day working relationship between himself and the officers who manage the project for the CDB, that these regular reports become largely a formality.

The team was informed that countries are permitted to revise priorities in respect of previously submitted projects. The management operation of the bank also accommodates new projects which meet project agreement criteria. Arrangements for the site visits by the team were made by the CDB.

c. Method of Gathering Information

The team made site visits of approximately two days each, to projects in St. Vincent (Nov. 27-28, 1980); Antigua (Dec. 1-2, 1980); St. Kitts (Dec. 3-4, 1980); and Dominica (Dec. 5-6, 1980).

A Barbados appraisal was made at the request of the team. At the offices of the CDB, on Dec. 9, 1980, members met with the recently appointed project supervisor for that program. This discussion was made subsequent to the oral preliminary presentation which the team (on request, and also as per its overall charge) had made to AID officials in its offices on Dec. 8.

The Barbados meeting was held in conjunction with the final briefing by the CDB. This joint meeting was a particularly helpful one.

On these site visits, the team examined the projects that were underway. Members talked with project officials of the respective countries and with the project supervisors for these countries. They also talked with persons on site, who were employed on the jobs that have been created.

The project supervisors, in the respective countries, planned the site visits and the visits with officials. They were quite ready to arrange such additional

visits with officials as team members requested. This was all done in a spirit of amicability and cooperation.

Representatives of the CDB head office accompanied the evaluative team. They were always on hand and ready to provide clarification or additional information, as needed. During the St. Vincent visits, Messers Charles and Asher were both in attendance. For the other site visits, Mr. Charles accompanied the team.

At each visit, the team solicited hard data on employment, on disbursements, and on items that would tend to indicate the presence of problems which needed to be rectified.

Senior Government officials were also asked a number of questions. These included (a) their opinion of how the program was working; (b) whether experience had led them to revise previously stated project priorities; and (c) what new important areas they would like to see the program expanded to include.

## SECTION IV

### EVALUATIVE CRITERIA AND RELATED ADDENDA

#### a. The Basic Human Needs Component

##### (i) Objectives and Boundaries (BHN/E)

There are three components to the BHN/E objective. One component aims to provide capital infrastructure such as schools (for the purpose of human capital formation), health facilities which provide quality-of-life results, and roads which provide economic as well as employment-related benefits.

The second component addresses employment-creation. In so doing, the effect of this component is to suggest the types of technology that should be applied on projects which use the funds.

The third component of a BHN/E program, under the rubric of the term maintenance, seeks to do two things. One of these is to assure the continued productivity as well as the social effectiveness of the material investments that have been made. The other maintenance feature is directed at getting community involvement, with a view toward creating, in recipient communities, a heightened sense of themselves as managers of their own environment and destiny.

There is nothing in these three effective objectives of AID Project No. 538-0030 and Project No. 538-0029 (as amended), which preclude the use of an evaluative criterion which also requires that the use of these funds should satisfy reasonable criteria as to the productive effectiveness of the on-going programs.

Effectiveness will be measured against standard benefit cost criteria, insofar as such criteria can be developed within the intent of the project as that is stated in the project documents.

(ii) Criteria Applied (BHN/E)

Note:

It is understood that the expected market productivity of the committee funds will not be used as the principal component in measuring the effectiveness of the program. Employment-creating potential, and the contribution to social capital and infrastructure that will raise the quality of life of the mass of the persons in the recipient society, will be the principal performance criteria.

The following performance criteria are applied to the on-going projects in the islands that the evaluating team visited.

- (ii,1) The extent to which a viable technical outcome of a project, can be understood, verified, and measured.
- (ii,2) The extent to which the recipient country has a clear and verifiable program for maintaining the viability and the durability of the infra-structural material on which the expenditure was made. (Therefore, indication of a commitment to maintenance of the investment as a piece of social capital, rather than as merely being a piece of engineered "plant", is regarded here as a positive indicator of the potential effectiveness with which a recipient will be using the grant funds).
- (ii,3) Further to criterion (ii.2), the extent to which a maintenance plan:
  - (a) exists;

- (b) is integrated into the long term community development program of the country;
  - (c) is linked, institutionally, to the existing and to the evolving community development programs which use the formal and also the informal processes of education.
- (ii,4) The extent to which the recipient governments are prepared to coordinate the benefit streams that arise from this and other financing packages that are provided either by USAID or by other donors; (for example, making the technical objectives of a re-afforestation program consistent with the practices which the government tolerates in areas that are financed under a soil conservation program).
- (ii,5) The extent to which reasonable and adequate controls on the "integrity" of financial disbursements appears to exist; (where integrity is seen as consistent with the grant objectives, and also with acceptable financial practices such that payments are made (a) for work done, and (b) to those who have actually done the work).

b. Infrastructural Component

Consistent with the documented project objectives and Statement of Work, (Appendix IV), the members of the team applied their respective technical expertise to the examination of specific projects.

Engineering and accommodation criteria that were applied include the following:

- i. The extent to which the roofs that are installed, enable the schools to be used for community protection shelters during hurricanes.
- ii. The square footage per classroom.

- iii. The potential durability of the structures and associated equipment that are installed.
- iv. The technical capability that is available for the design and the building of infrastructures.
- v. The identity and the impact of existing components that inhibit the expeditious physical mobilization of the inputs that are required for building the respective infrastructures.

c. Evaluative Addenda

The team was asked by the local USAID officer to get the reaction of the recipient countries to the current BHN/E and CED project-financing method involving the letters of credit arrangement with the local commercial banks.

The team was also asked to probe in order to determine whether the countries had other priority projects which, with the benefit of hindsight, satisfy the existing BHN/E criteria, but which they had not submitted, or which had been precluded from qualifying because of the project emphasis on the labor usage and employment criterion.

## SECTION V

### OUTPUT: COUNTRY REPORTS

#### a. St. Vincent

##### i Overall

i,1 Because of the efforts of the chief engineer of the public works department here, the employment-creating objectives of the program are being emphasized in the school building programs and in the road maintenance ones, at the same time that these programs seem to be delivering a technically viable output.

i,2 There are serious questions to be raised about the technical consistency of the afforestation program, with the program objectives that the country states. Questions about the management practices which obtain on these programs need to be raised, as well.

Item: The Minister of Trade and Agriculture stated that re-afforestation for watershed protection remains the number one priority. There are, in this island, at least two varieties of rapidly growing trees which grow largely from cuttings. In addition, one of these trees is a legume. Available labor could readily be mobilized for planting sessions using the cuttings. To do that would also meet effectively and admirably the employment objectives of the BHN/E program.

The forestry program, however, has invested in preparing a small nursery of commercial forest plants. The number of seedlings available in that nursery is miniscule compared to the number that would be necessary to provide adequate coverage of the area to be re-afforested. The program managers also reported that they had made expenditures on clearing the site to receive the seedlings and that they planned to again spend funds to re-clear the site of regrowth that had occurred in the interim.

The prime difficulty that the program managers expressed was that they needed to have an additional 4-wheel drive vehicle that would be specifically allocated to the re-afforestation program. Accordingly, they were complaining that the CDB veto of this expenditure was ill advised. The CDB, however, appears to have acted wisely.

These programs in the Ministry of Agriculture were also giving insufficient attention to the need for developing community-linked maintenance strategies for the afforestation or to the soil conservation program. Furthermore, at the same time that the re-afforestation program is allegedly a number one priority item, it appeared that continuing denudation of the steep slopes was being tolerated in the Fancy area where a soil conservation program with BHN project sponsorship is underway.

Item: On the soil conservation program, the report which the project manager gave is that the program provides labor and materials for the operation. The farmer provides nothing but site availability.

The technical integrity and viability of the project practices, in respect of soil conservation, can be called into question. What the team saw was straight lines of grass which were being planted at allegedly specified and control-producing intervals on the slopes. However, the observed intervals were such as to appear to be of questionable effectiveness for controlling either water run-off or soil erosion.

The technical capital productivity of the funds which have to date been allocated to the soil conservation project and the re-afforestation project does not seem to be effective. The remoteness of the site makes the retaining of project consultants potentially cost prohibitive. However, decided technical and managerial improvements are needed on these programs in order to make them effective.

In light of the fact that the permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Community Affairs (Mr. Clim Balla) indicates that, without AID support funds, his ministry is getting community participation in a soil conservation program in the Georgetown area; it appears that the project supervisor in cooperation with the technical support personnel at the CDB may have some additional options that could be productively explored.

The team assumed that the usual practice of where persons signed for their pay was also in operation here on the soil conservation program. It requests the CDB project personnel to verify that fact in view of the general disorganized appearance of this project.

i,3 The Minister of Trade and Agriculture questioned the effectiveness of having consultants in the feeder roads and on the low cost housing projects.

The CDB properly requires that disbursements are consistent with the effective output that has been produced. At the same time, with a very capable chief engineer, St. Vincent is able to provide technical support to these identified types of projects, thereby reducing overhead costs.

The situation in respect of the need for consultants, appears to be one that can be amicably resolved by discussion between the CDB and St. Vincent officials.

i,4 Because the employment data that were provided by the project supervisor's office, seem unreliable, a need for better record keeping seems to exist. For example, the employment data for the school at Barrouallie, (a school where the ground is still being prepared with PWD heavy equipment) is given as 79; whereas that for Clare Valley (where we are told over the period of the construction, labor opportunities rotate between the employed and the unemployed) is given as 102 as of the 27th of November, 1980.

i,5 Greater reporting effectiveness on the part of the project supervisor would assist project objectives. Right now it appears that it is the enthusiasm, the dedication, and the managerial effectiveness of the Chief Engineer of the St. Vincent PWD, which is carrying the program along.

ii. Respective Projects

ii,1 Clare Valley school seems to be operating in the letter and the spirit of the grant, so too are the building programs for other schools.

ii,2 The Afforestation and Soil Conservation Program

Both these programs are in need of more effective management, and also more effective integration. For example, farms are selected. The program brings in labor and material. The farmer effectively appears to contribute nothing more than site. There was gully control work. However, the technical integrity of the contour program seems to be in need of improvement. There needs to be additional provision for an effective maintenance program that will better assure that the soil conservation practice will continue after the current paid scheme has run its course. Accordingly members of the team had talks in this regard with the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Community Development.

The soil conservation sub-project, with special permission from the CDB, has been allowed to acquire a Toyota 4-wheel drive pick-up (Non-U.S. procurement was waived).

This is in addition to the Ministry equipment pool. Yet the re-afforestation sub-project in the same Ministry, is requesting another vehicle.

The management of the CDB should be commended for vetoing this additional acquisition.

ii,3 Addendum

The Ministry of Community Development is conducting without the use of grants from USAID a soil conservation program in the Georgetown area.

The Permanent Secretary in that Ministry, a Mr. Clim Balla, promised to consult with the project supervisor, and to coordinate the efforts of his Ministry with the on-going maintenance requirement of the respective programs under BHN as well as under CED.

ii,4 The chief engineer of the Public Works indicated that the coastal protection at Colonaire, could be brought within the BHN/E labor-usage criteria.

iii. New Project Prospects

Officials suggested that new funding could be applied to extending the island's infrastructure, roads, electricity, telephones, water supply, schools, community center, and health clinics. However, current programs are within existing priorities.

b. ANTIGUA

i. Overall

i,1 All program planning and work management is being done using force account procedures. There seem to exist, however, problems that grow out of the need to have multiple quotations from U.S. sources for materials that will be used on the projects. It appears that these are examples of some of the settling in problems and that the CDB management is adequately coping with the managerial education that will yield the remedy. However, a refusal of Antigua to design schools within budget is a definite problem.

i,2        The management process at the level of the project supervisor's office is commendable. His data are pertinent, well organized, and readily available. He takes the responsibility of his job seriously. There was evidence that he had managed the delivery of an effective publicity campaign.

i,3        Reports from the Ministry of Education and from the project supervisor, indicate that there exists social resistance to trades related education and to engaging in agricultural enterprise. The potential productivity of such new directions is high.

Therefore, funds that are committed for augmenting the informal educational impact of the Antigua publicity program will have a potentially high productivity potential also. Serious consideration should be given to making such an investment in program augmentation.

i,4        Before additional funds are committed to meet legitimate development assistance requests, (such as those which the Minister of Health has made for equipment in the form of garbage trucks), what one can characterize as the unrepressed and widespread importuning on the part of Antigua for unlimited supplies of grant funds, should be systematically attached.

That can be done within the context of the "extension" program which the CDB is now doing under the rubric of these projects.

If the Government of Antigua, with the technical assistance of the CDB, could be assisted to work to budget within a system of priorities, it would be able to develop the necessary management skills. One of the implied objectives of the BHN/E program is that of increasing the capacity of aid recipients to man-

age effectively their society, so as to meet desired quality-of-life objectives. Accordingly, this recommendation of technical assistance is consistent with that premise.

The potential role of the CDB, in forcing this planning to budget in Antigua, is a positive one. It should be explored with a view to implementation.

i,5 Antigua complains about the fact that the use of non-resident consultants has caused costly delays. Although these consultants are selected with the concurrence of the local government, the CDB management office for the projects should be encouraged to weight into the criteria governing the choice of consultants, an allowance for the potential levels of indirect costs that may be occasioned by delays that are likely to occur when non-resident consultants are retained.

i,6 In Antigua the Ministry of Education also has the responsibility for community affairs. This fortuitous arrangement provides for maximum potential that allows the formal and the informal programs of education to reinforce each other. In the light of the managerial skills which the current project supervisor for Antigua appears to have, this island is in an excellent position to secure maximum results from any commitment which it makes in behalf of maintenance.

i,7 The Ministry of Works expressed the opinion that when the project constraint on the utilization of funds for the purchase of equipment was applied (as it had been) to the acquisition of small tools such as picks, shovels, and a concrete mixer; that was an unnecessarily restrictive constraint on sub-

project planning. The CDB officer indicated that appropriate adjustments had been made.

i,8 Further to 5.b, i,5 (above), the CDB appears to be in agreement with the Ministry of Communications and Works concerning the contracting of off-shore consultants. It seems to have been agreed that hereafter CDB plans to avoid their use insofar as that is possible.

i,9 The cutting back of classroom sizes in order to meet funding constraints needs to be reviewed in order to determine the extent and the impact of the overcrowding that may result.

i,10 The soliciting of quotations from off-shore United States Suppliers, represents a new experience for the MCW which is accustomed to off-shore United Kingdom procurement that is performed by the donor agency upon request.

This learning experience should resolve itself with more project experience and with the aid of the project supervisor.

i,11 The team observed that the majority of the sub-projects (except for the Liberta clinic which used project funds in order to complete a structure that had been originally funded under another program) were concentrated in the St. Johns area.

The project supervisor indicated that this was a coincidence, and also that the locations of the sub-projects were areas of high population concentration.

ii. Respective Projects

ii,1 Following the discussions with officials, field visits were made to the sub-projects to review and observe progress: Gray's Farm Area Drainage, Gray's Farm Clinic, Greenbay School (rehabilitation and extension), Otto's School (new), Arts and Crafts Center (rehabilitation), Liberta Health Clinic and Skerrit's Village Drainage. The Gray's Farm and Liberta Clinics were completed. Work was in progress at all other sites except the Skerrit's Village Drainage where the upper section had been completed and work still remained on a lower section which drained to the sea. The bottom of the completed widened section had become overgrown with weed growths, indicating a lack of maintenance which would result in restricting its capacity to carry off storm flows, contrary to the objective of the widening which was to increase the flow capacity. It was reported that this lack of maintenance was not critical at this time and it would be performed during improvement of the lower section.

The clinic and school sub-projects employed 20-25 people and the drainage projects 40 on a typical month, requiring 6 to 9 months to execute. About one quarter, 6 to 8, were women and youths. The women performed non-labor tasks, time keeping, water carrying and cooking duties. The completed clinics appeared well constructed and hurricane/seismic resistant measures were incorporated in the design. Work at the construction sites appeared neat and orderly.

On the Gray's Farm drainage, equipment had been used to clean a muck and muddy soft bottom to save time and avoid a difficult and messy excavation and clean-

up operation. This was deemed necessary and desirable in view of its urban location in a built-up area of St. Johns.

ii,2 The progress on the sub-project implementation, after the initial program start-up delays in new organizational development and adaptation of new implementation procedures, appears to be now progressing. A qualified project supervisor is working with a capable and knowledgeable MCW in sub-project administration. Employment is being generated and efforts to use women and youths are being exercised. However, the progress is subject to the need to have the Antigua Ministry of Education plan to budget. Antigua appears to be meeting the spirit of the BHN/E objective.

ii,3 The representatives report that youth and women are not readily available. They also report that there is no need to rotate the work among potential applicants. That seems strange, but that was the report.

ii,4 Skerrit's Drainage Project

The evaluation team hopes that the one maintenance deficiency at Skerrit's Village drainage (which is overgrown with weeds), is a purposeful delay awaiting completion of the remainder of the sub-project. This project appears to be under some yet to be resolved funding constraints. Some of it seems to have been created by reported incomplete program planning. It is the team's understanding that the MCW which raised the issue of funding was the one which provided the original sub-project program planning infrastructure cost estimates. Probably, the CDB working with its retained consultants can resolve the issues causing the bottleneck.

iii. New Project. Prospects

iii,1 The Ministry of Works expressed a preference for new infrastructural projects such as roads, sewerage and water.

iii,2 The Minister of Health was desirous of having infrastructural equipment for projects that meet the community health needs, (such as garbage collection, and the management of solid wastes). He expressed the need for equipment. Specifically, he requested four garbage trucks.

iii,3 The Ministry of Education expressed the need for more schools and/or classrooms and equipment in behalf of technical and vocational education.

iii,4 In view of the present dependence of Antigua on tourism, the current underdeveloped state of its agricultural potential (such that its foreign exchange earnings from tourism is in turn spent on the acquisition of food for domestic consumption); investment in technical and vocational education and in programs which will enhance the agricultural delivery capacity of this country recommend themselves.

Reported lower rainfall than the other islands and the social prejudice against agriculture are among the items that such new investment would need to address.

iii,5 The project supervisor recommended that from his perspective, the needed new projects should address the needs of young people. He then recommended an emphasis on community centers, playground facilities, and facilities for the development of aquatic sports such as those which exist in the olympics.

c. ST. KITTS

i. Overall

i,1 The new government of St. Kitts is in the process of getting its management program underway. It is wise at this time to restrict AID emphasis to health-related and school plant programs, pending recommendations from that government.

i,2 The government envisages a restructuring of its existing educational programs and a revision of land tenure arrangements, among other things.

i,3 The process of investing BHM/E funds on Government-owned lands, for the purpose of enhancing the productivity of its sugar production program, is questionable even if such investment produces short-run employment-related benefits to the employees of the National Agricultural Corporation, (NACO).

i,4 The St. Kitts public works is also short of technical expertise. It seems to be a one-man operation. This has caused program delays; and the likely supervision requirements is the source of an unwillingness to let the Cayon School project out to several contractors in order to speed up the building process.

Planning and design is being performed by both MCW and consultants. MCW performs the rehabilitation work by force account and new school work is done by consultants. Here again the problem of MOE influenced designs exceeding cost allocations was encountered during the preparation of the construction drawings. As a result, cut backs were made in classroom sizes, walkway widths, and roof overhangs -- resulting in delays in completion.

Some planning work, originally to be performed by the MCW (St. Paul School plans, for example) have now been turned over to consultants. It appears that the MCW office is a one-man operation presently burdened by the task of completing the construction of a new CIDA-financed airport terminal building. No delays have been experienced in reimbursement through the letter of credit procedures.

MCW now maintains the schools, but a shift to the MOE is underway. It is planned to organize self-help community participation to be performed jointly with the MOE under programmed maintenance operations. To date, no funds have been used under the 50/50CED/AID program because of the inability of the government to produce its share of the matching funds.

i,5        The managerial experience, at the level of the Project Supervisor's office, is also limited. There is, in addition, no noticeable or marked effective commitment (on the part of the Project Supervisor at this site) to ensuring that BHN/E criteria are followed in building projects. However, at one school site that the team visited, young persons who were in training at the technical school, were working on a school repair job. There is even the case where AID funds are now being used, reportedly over the last two months, for a school rehabilitation job at the Sadler's Primary School. Yet, the sign in front of the school gives credit for the work to the British.

i,6        Use of consultants and construction contractors to the maximum, practicable, appears necessary in St. Kitts in order to move the sub-projects and to maintain progress. This has been recognized by the government in its recent decision to take work away from the MCW and to turn it over to consultants and contractors. New school construction is being undertaken in this manner.

ii        Respective Projectsii,1      Overall

Following the discussions with officials, site visits were made to the following projects to observe and review progress: Newton School (rehabilitation), Greenhill Soil Conservation, Cayon Reservoir, Cayon School (rehabilitation and extension), Sadler's School (rehabilitation), Con Phipps Pilot Project and the site of St. Paul's School (new).

School rehabilitation is performed under force account procedures under the administration of MCW. At the Newton School, the rehabilitation was initiated, but work still remains to be done. Debris and dismantled scaffolding were lying around the school yard, toilets needed repair, and no work appeared to be in progress. In fact, the impression was that of an abandoned job.

The sub-projects were employment-generating with approximately 10 to 40 jobs per sub-project. Sixty-six acres of peanuts were planted at the Con Phipps site, and during the visit, 10 workers were noted performing weeding operations. No women were noted to be working at any sites. Student masons from the technical college were being used at the Sadler's School rehabilitation.

ii,2      The soil conservation project on the sugar cane plantation at Green Hill, and the Con Phipps peanut growing "pilot" Project meet the technical performance standards. However, on the basis of the distribution of the capital benefits of these projects, their choice is questionable in the spirit of the grant program. One suggestion which the team makes, is that the gross market value of the output from the peanut production (funded under the BHN program),

be used to finance other similar needed projects or to provide the government share for the 50/50 CED/AID school maintenance funding.

ii,3        The Cayon water supply project seems to be progressing.

ii,4        Work on the Cayon Primary School has been progressing slowly. However, there is evidence that the community is participating in a maintenance program.

ii,5        The Ministry of Education has been confused about the maintenance grant, and has been slow in utilizing it.

iii        New Project Prospects

The new Government of St. Kitts is in the process of doing a structural overhaul of the St. Kitts economy. That overhaul plans to include agricultural diversification, land-tenure reform, and educational reform.

The Director of Economic Planning (who coordinates the plans of respective ministries and who reports directly to the Prime Minister) indicated that consistent with the manifesto of the People's Action Movement, new programs would be in the area of human resources development. He indicated that a school lunch program will be high on the list.

The manifesto cites a sugar refinery, programs of economic diversification, communications-related projects, and other infrastructure such as electricity, and water availability.

d. DOMINICA

i. Overall

i,1 It appears that serious management problems exist on this program. They exist at the project supervisor level. They also appear to exist at the CDB level, and the results appear to contradict the substance of the briefings which the team reviewed from the CDB. The following narrative aptly describes the Dominica situation.

Meetings were held with the project supervisor, the MOE, and the Prime Minister. Programmed meetings with the MCW and the Central Water Authority (CWA) did not take place because of unforeseen delays in initiating the meetings.

Three local consultants have been retained for assistance in the new school construction and the water supply additions and extensions. On school rehabilitation, the MCW is planning and administering the improvements.

Considerable discussion centered around pipe procurement for the water supply work. It seemed that the pipe had been ordered for all water supply projects, all of which had not been approved by the CDB. Pipe is due to arrive soon and potential problems of payment resulted in considerable exchange between the CDB representative and the project supervisor. This exchange continued throughout the visit, and from all indications, still remained unresolved on the team's departure.

Some of this pipe is of Jamaica fabrication from reportedly U.S. steel billets with British standard threads requiring U.K. fittings. Orders were placed in

May for the pipe which is to arrive this month, December. Fittings were ordered from the U.K. in October.

When queried as to whether quotations were solicited from U.S. suppliers who undoubtedly could respond with off-shelf deliveries and eliminate the aforementioned delay, the response was that they were only aware of CARICOM suppliers and did not know the addresses and how to contact U.S. suppliers. The evaluators found this statement to be surprising and urge a review of the procurement history of Dominica for corroboration. They also indicated that they favored British standard threads to maintain conformity with existing installations -- necessitating the use of U.K. fittings for joining.

The project supervisor complained about the many procedural responsibilities confronting him because of AID/CDB requirements. The country agreement had been signed in February 1980, and he could not understand why the delays in processing documentation had occurred.

Apparently, the problem of school planning and design which exceeds available funding also exists here. This had caused the inability to use what were thought to be completed plans for two school sites which officials at the Ministry of Education believed were ready for the initiation of construction. Apparently, the French are financing two schools and have sent a man/wife architect team to work with the MCW in planning and design. A U.S. Peace Corps architect is participating and the MCW office is drafting project material which they expect to have out for bids early next year.

The Dominica officials reported that the Artisan Craft Center was approved by the CDB nearly a year ago, but that CDB keeps returning with requests for ad-

ditional information. They claim that they are at a loss to understand all this procedural dealy. It appears that there exists, here, a lack of understanding (on the parts of Dominica officials) of the documentation requirements of international donor financing.

Officials showed an unanswered September letter to the CDB identifying 17 public conveniences, 7 health centers, and one water supply improvement sub-project, together with a tabulation by sub-project, and by cost, for the utilization of \$306,000 U.S. proposed for addition to the BHN program. This matter was also raised by the Prime Minister who again emphasized to the team the delays encountered in AID/CDB project implementation. At the same time the Prime Minister expressed appreciation of the very good intentions with which the assistance was being provided by the U.S. CDB, however, advised the team that telephone communications had taken place regarding the Artisan Craft Center and the appropriate documentation requirements to minimize additional delays.

The CDB representative mentioned that this project was subject to its Board's approval, thus the delay in response. The CDB project management apparently approves sub-projects and sends them on for Board notification, and funds are not made available until the Board has been notified. The experience on this project (based on the comments of the CDB representative) could be construed as indicating (his belief) that Board approval is necessary prior to the release of funding.

The team interjected an idea that funding for small sub-projects, costing less than \$40,000/\$50,000 E.C. (U.S. \$15,000/\$20,000) or some reasonable amount to be set by RDO/C, might be released on request and identification (location, description, cost/materials and labor, implementation procedures). Documentation for (purposes of reimbursement) detailing actual disbursement, could be

submitted on sub-project completion. The number of such projects under implementation would be limited to five in any country at any one time at a total limitation of U.S. \$75,000, - or some other amount to be determined between the CDB and RDO/C.

The CDB is now circulating a draft letter approving all remaining Dominica sub-projects and funding allocations, including those identified in the September letter (with the exception of the Medical Center - St. Joseph). This step, hopefully, will expedite implementation and eliminate some of the experienced funding constraints.

#### i,2 Consultants' Reports

Conversations were held with two consultant firms. On one school, Wesley, one firm reported that it was told by the government to make the CDB submittal for preliminary approval even though the cost estimate exceeded funding by EC \$140,000. To stay within budgets, classrooms were later reduced from 24'x20' to 20'x20'. The experience of these consultants with hurricanes, has resulted in their designing in the use of concrete roofing on all new schools.

The firm gave the timetable of its contracting by the CDB as follows: 12/19/79, technical proposal submitted: 2/26/80, financial proposal submitted: 3/20/80, negotiations summary letter submitted: 7/22/80, contract signed. This firm has one school ready for bidding and the second firm expects to have two schools out for bids before Christmas. The CDB representative reported that lack of available funding was still holding up some school work.

i,3 Project Revisions and Timetabling

It appeared that hurricanes David and Allen, both experienced after the authorization of the CED/BHN programs, had changed the concept of the school program from one of basically maintenance and rehabilitation to one of new school construction to replace those destroyed by the hurricanes. However, as a result of these hurricanes, construction contractors are busy performing private repair and rehabilitation work. Building materials are also scarce. These elements could also create additional delays in school construction implementation and could also cause costs to escalate.

i,4 Publicity

Publicity for the program and for work is principally through the press and radio. A school maintenance supervisor has been appointed. He reviews needs and contracts local labor by the school sites to perform the routine maintenance operations. To date, no funds have been disbursed under the reimbursable CED/AID school construction program.

i,5 Summary

From all indications this program is just getting off the ground with only some water work and two school rehabilitation sub-projects now underway. Programs in Dominica are administered by a project supervisor, who is a former permanent secretary of the MOE. He appears reluctant and hesitant to take and follow-through on the necessary procedural steps which are required to initiate

and execute sub-projects. Throughout the team visit, he appeared to be continually annoyed and disturbed with the program documentation required by AID and CDB even though these procedures formed a part of the new abbreviated measures which have been designed to accelerate project implementation.

From the short visit and exchange which the team had, it is difficult to truly evaluate whether or not CDB non-responsiveness (witness failure of CDB to respond to project supervisor September letter on program proposal for use of added U.S. \$306,000 funding) may be contributing to this unfavorable attitude which the project supervisor showed. Considerable exchange during the visit between the CDB representative and the project supervisor apparently failed to resolve some pending financial matters in respect to water pipe purchases, about which the project supervisor was concerned.

The pipe that was ordered, is on its way and due to arrive soon. School plans are being completed and bids will be solicited in December and in January. School rehabilitation work is underway and water supply construction is in progress. Should this apparent impetus continue, one could probably deduce that the worse is over and that the program is ready to take-off. However, the Dominica program should be watched closely during the coming months in order to ensure that no further unnecessary, and avoidable procedural delays will materialize.

The fully occupied private contractor capability and shortage of building materials also needs to be followed closely. Options, such as the use of off-shore contractors and the advance procurement of building materials, need to be explored and preparatory measures taken for such courses of action. Combin-

ing the construction of more than one school into one contract might be considered to attract off-shore interest. Whatever the course of action, a difficult period can be foreseen in initiating new school construction. Accordingly, a continued and close program surveillance and an advance review and exploration of alternative options is required.

In the rehabilitation work, the choice of roofing materials needs to be reviewed as do the means for their attachment to the roof-support structure so as to ensure maximum hurricane resistance. As noted above, at the Mahaut School the current roof choice has reportedly produced no real improvement to ensure such needed hurricane protection.

An observed problem with the Fordillas on public taps, would indicate that their use should be minimized. They should be installed only at locations where they can be closely controlled or possibly even eliminated from the program.

The one labor contract on the Grand Bar/Pichelin with a reported profit of 25 percent needs to be reviewed. Such profit is reportedly gained through the payment of reduced wages since the negotiated contract cost is considered acceptable for the work to be performed. Consideration should be given to introducing reasonable minimum wage payments under such contracts.

ii. Respective Projects

Following the discussions with officials, the team made site visits in order to observe and review the construction progress at the following locations: Grand Bay/Pichelin water supply, Canefield Craft Center, Mahaut School (rehabilitation), Atkinson water supply, and the Weirs/Marigout School (rehabilitation).

ii,1      The Grand Bay/Pichelin Water Sub-Project

Supply-main pipe for the Grand Bay/ Pichelin water sub-project had been provided from an earlier CIDA/CDB program which terminated prior to its installation. Under this new program, these mains are being installed together with storage, treatment, and distribution facilities for Pichelin and extensions to the Grand Bay system. Work is administered by the Central Water Authority and it is performed by labor contracts (apparently a common practice in Dominica) whereby the government provides the materials and a contract for the provision of labor is negotiated. A reported profit on this labor contract of 25 percent needs to be reviewed.

ii,2      The School's Program

The Mahaut and Weirs/Marigout Schools are being administered by the MCW under labor contracts again. At Weirs/Marigout School, three such contracts exist: one for windows and doors, one for plumbing, and one for the roof. In discussions with the MCW buildings division representative at Mahaut, it was noted that although hurricane tie precautions were being taken to anchor the steel roof trusses to the roof ring beam, the ties for the aluminum replacement roofing were as before. David had pulled the roof off these ties which were basically a bolt and ring washer arrangement. A stronger roofing material, such as a thicker corrugated steel, to better resist the uplift action of the hurricane winds against tie down washers, or some reinforcing of the ties with other than ring washers against which the thinner aluminum roofing pulled through before, would be indicated. The project supervisor advised that the repairs were be-

ing made and aluminum roofing material was again being utilized on the advice of the consultant on the work.

ii,3 The Atkinson Water Supply Sub-Project

At the Atkinson water supply, only recently completed, the Fordilla taps were already damaged and non-usable. This is a special type tap which releases one to two gallons per operation. It was designed to minimize waste, but it can also be frustrating to a user trying to fill a five-gallon and larger container. As a result, the users break them so that the taps run continuously, wasting water and defeating the original intent of the Fordilla installation.

Since not all members of the contiguous communities will be served by this water supply program (thus requiring members that are not served to use the water at the source), there is a continuing problem of community sabotage of the pumping operation. This means that although the Central Water Authority will have the responsibility for maintaining this distribution system, the maintenance feature that funded projects are expected to show may be met in letter, but not in spirit (as long as this type of community sabotage promises to be a continuing problem).

iii. New Project Prospects

iii,1 Conversation with the supervisor of the school rehabilitation program for public works indicated that to his mind, the best direction into which new projects should turn should be in the generation of hydroelectric power, inasmuch as the existing water resource capability would allow for such investments. This appears to be a practical and practicable option with great merit.

iii,2 The Prime Minister indicated that she intended to submit a special sub-project request for public conveniences specifically for Rousseau.

ii,3 The Minister of Education expressed the need for schools that would be equipped to train individuals in vocational skills.

e. Barbados (Dec. 9, 1980)

i. Overall

Barbados has yet to initiate any sub-projects, and it has been revising its previously submitted sub-projects list. The loan agreement with the CDB was signed in May, 1980 nearly 8 months after the signing of the CDB/AID funding agreement in September, 1979. Fulfillment of conditions precedent and, finally, the appointment of a project supervisor were accomplished in August/September, 1980. This loan funding follows the usual CDB procedures and the accelerated implementation for the grant funded projects, as used in the other islands, is not applicable. The result is that there is more direct involvement with CDB Board in the approval process.

The project supervisor indicated that construction plans prepared by MCW were ready on the health centers (U.S. \$100,000) and some sections of the U.S. \$1.2 million street and road sub-projects. At this time, Barbados is not sure whether the construction will be performed by contract or by force account. It is reported that contractor capability is fully occupied, and that skilled labor is in short supply. Implementation problems can be foreseen and the program will need to be closely monitored to minimize further delays. This will be especially so when the projects begin to compete for unskilled labor with the sugar cane harvest.

One potentially encouraging feature of the Barbados environment is that labor and community services in Barbados are managed within the same ministerial portfolio. This should enable the informal education element of the BHN program the opportunity to link up maintenance with community participation, once projects get underway.

## SECTION VI

### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

#### a. CONCLUSIONS

1. The programs are meeting the objective of generating work and providing jobs for the unemployed. The extent of the employment of women varies due to the cultural differences among the islands. In one island, St. Vincent, the women worked with the men doing heavy labor at the construction site, whereas in others they served as water carriers, cooks, and time-keepers. Unemployed youths are being given jobs and a general 20/25 percent ratio of women and youths to the total labor force was noted.
  
2. The BHN program is being well received, its job generating impact felt, and in all islands visited, requests were received for its continuation. With few exceptions, signs at construction sites, together with reported radio and demonstrated press announcements gave credit to U.S. participation.  
  
In one island, a radio announcement for jobs at a construction site resulted in 500 job seekers. To give all seekers an opportunity, workers were rotated every two weeks.
  
3. The present CDB CED/BHN administrative staff of two is overworked and needs to be reinforced as soon as practicable to a full approved complement of three and consideration of an increase to even four or five professionals should be made. Otherwise, delays could result in CDB fulfillment of its pro-

gram administrative responsibilities, including sub-project reviews, approvals, site visits, etc.

4. If the managerial performance of the project supervisors in the other islands can be brought up to that of the level which the Antigua Supervisor shows, definite improvements would result. In St. Kitts the problem at the project supervisor level is one of inexperience. In Dominica, the incumbent project supervisor is a part of the sub-project execution problem.

5. Where MCW capability exists, as in St. Vincent and Antigua, need for consultants on force account, planning and construction work should be reviewed and minimized to greatest extent practicable. (A suggestion to be considered against the cost effectiveness background which the CDB also polices, might be a beginning plans, design, cost estimate, a mid-point and final acceptance consultant reviews -- with interim progress and disbursements to be reported by the project supervisor in monthly reports to the CDB.)

The consultant would be available on an interim basis, as needed, should problems develop that require his assistance. Also, selection preference should favor local as opposed to off-shore consultants.

6. Contracting of consultants by the CDB created delays in the initiation of the programs. The contracting process was initiated in December/January, 1979 with requests for proposals. Selections were made in March/April, 1980, and contracts negotiated and signed in May/June/July, 1980. Similarly, staffing of the CDB/AID program administrative office proceeded at a somewhat slow

pace with the full complement of 2 engineers and 1 architect not on board until January, 1980. The BHN agreement with the CDB was signed on August 31, 1979.

7. Funding for small sub-projects of less than some minimum amount to be decided upon by consultation between CDB and USAID/RDO/C, should be released on request and sub-project identification (type, labor, materials, cost, implementation procedures) with documentation detailing actual disbursements to be submitted on sub-project completion. The number of such projects under implementation would be limited to five in any country at any one time at a total funding limitation of some U.S. dollar amount to be decided by the foregoing consultation between the CDB, and USAID/RDO/C.
  
8. In sub-project selection criteria under BHN, exceptions to the proportion of labor input may be worthy of consideration. In Antigua, the purchase of rubbish and solid waste collection vehicles was proposed. Although there is no labor input in the procurement, in the operation (which is highly labor-intensive) permanent, and not temporary jobs are generated.
  
9. The problem of delays and potential cost overruns under the new school construction is believed to be now understood. However, the remedy of cutting back on classroom sizes needs to be reviewed to determine whether or not retention of classroom dimensions and the reduction of the number of classrooms might not be more feasible in the long run.

10. The soil consideration and re-afforestation program in St. Vincent do not appear well organized and are in need of technical assistance and guidance. These programs are also in need of inputs from the Ministry of Community Affairs. The team did not visit Montserrat, but it was told that a successful program was underway in that island. The soil conservation and land reclamation work observed in St. Kitts also demonstrated a well planned and organized effort. Guidance might be forthcoming through observation and field visits of the St. Vincent implementing agency staff and the contracting of a consultant in a similar manner as done in Montserrat (within appropriate considerations as to cost effectiveness and as to the remoteness of the St. Vincent Site).

11. In St. Kitts, the soil conservation and pilot reclamation sub-projects did generate work. The primary benefit, however, was of an indirect nature -- increasing lands under cultivation by NACO (a government-owned corporation), and, in turn, increasing foreign exchange reserves. Since this increase is the result of the BHN program, consideration might be given to using the income from the pilot land reclamation sub-project, now planted in peanuts, to contribute to the government participation for the school maintenance. During the visit, the project supervisor point out schools not included in the CED program and in need of repairs and maintenance. When it was suggested that this work could be done under the CED maintenance component, he advised that matching from funding St. Kitts was just not available.

12. Labor contracting procedures in Dominica need to be reviewed. In one instance, Grand Bay/Pichelin water supply, it was reported that the contractor could be making a 25 percent profit on his labor through the payment of reduced wages. The team was advised that this, if true, would be resolved among the laborers as soon as they become aware of the situation, and apparently they do find these facts out. Laborers usually resolve such situations by requesting a better salary or by walking off the job. It might be advisable that, within such labor contracts, a minimum wage be stipulated.
  
13. The Letter of Credit procedure was well received in all islands and favored for all CDB administered work. No delays in meeting sub-project reimbursements were experienced and the 10 percent mobilization advance allowance was helpful in initiating the work.
  
14. School maintenance funds under the CED program have not been utilized except for small amounts reportedly disbursed to Antigua and Monsterrat. Apparently, country budget constraints have limited the execution of this program. It is understood that maintenance programs had been submitted to CDB prior to granting sub-project approvals for school construction. These maintenance-related program components need to be reviewed for compliance and execution.
  
15. In Dominica, the continued potential hurricane wind loss is indicated with the replacement roofing and tie-downs are reportedly being installed as were ripped away during hurricane David. This needs to be reviewed and corrected.

16. The private construction capability of Dominica is now occupied with private rehabilitation and new work following hurricane David and Allen, and building materials in quantity are scarce. New schools are ready for bid and options, such as off-shore solicitations for both materials and contracting, need to be explored and reviewed should responses not be forthcoming from local contractors. Possible cost escalations, as a result, need to be anticipated and preparatory measures taken for resolution, such as possible classroom reductions and advance procurement by the government of the scarcest of building materials.
17. The disbursements under the BHN/CED programs are proceeding very slowly and only show a rate of disbursement of approximately 10 percent of total funding over an elapsed implementation period of about 35 percent of time. Accelerated implementation procedures need to be reviewed with each island, not that the school construction appears ready to proceed at a faster pace. Close monitoring needs to be exercised to assure that there is no loss to this evolved impetus now that a slow start (related to country familiarization to new and different operational procedures) is well underway.
18. Country reporting does not always show the employment and jobs data, nor other information which is needed to measure the effectiveness with which the country is achieving projected employment goals. Appropriate reporting forms need to be developed and distributed to the islands. The reports which the project supervisor in Antigua has developed provide a good design basis.

19. Barbados has yet to initiate any sub-projects. A continued close monitoring and a continued sub-project review, together with discussions of plans and proposed scheduling for implementation, will be needed to minimize further delays.

20. There is a healthy positive and productive working relationship between USAID/RDO/C and the CDB. This healthy relationship has led to the anticipation and to the tackling of many of the settling-in as well as execution problems. This relationship is especially commendable in view of the new thrust of the BHN objective as a focus on development programming, and also in view of the fact that each island represents different subtleties in political/economic reality and also in technological capability.

21. The indefatigable role of Mr. Morris Charles, who accompanied the team for the entire evaluation tour, is to be highly commended. He travels much and puts in long days confronting and dealing with the ever changing and troublesome problems which he is called upon to handle.

22. The recommendations which Mr. Flax (the project supervisor in Antigua) has made to the effect that new projects should consider facilities for young people, should be given serious consideration.

## B. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The CDB must give more emphasis to ensuring that project supervisors recognize that their prime responsibilities lay in their functions as expeditors within the project agreement that is administered by the bank. It is recommended that the CDB conduct the periodic conferences among project supervisors for the purposes of familiarizing them with updated program conditions and of formulating, in concert, potential solutions to problems that are common to respective country programs.
2. The CDB should clearly indicate to consultants the budget within which they are expected to design. The additive alternate feature, in respect of plans and bids, should be used as the control or the safety valve option to which consultants could turn when they submit final drawings to the CDB. Accordingly, it is also recommended that the CDB should communicate the building standards within which it expects final drawings to conform and that the CDB should seriously consider foregoing the present time-consuming custom of also requiring that preliminary drawings be submitted.
3. Community services officers should be brought in at the initial stages of the planning and the execution of all projects. It is also recommended that these officers should be given an active role in the planning and in the execution of all maintenance programs.
4. In view of the significant productive role which informal education plays in all societies, funds should be allocated for the purpose of augmenting the

BHN thrust of the publicity program which grant recipients are required to undertake. It is further recommended that this new allocation should be regarded as an effective (longer-term) adjunct to current and expected school building programs and to evolving curriculum development ones, as well. Accordingly, this augmentation should be managed as an adjunct to the on-going publicity program that grant recipients have initiated.

5. CDB, in consultation with the Government of Dominica, should seriously consider the possibility of changing the current project supervisor as a strategy for speeding up the effectiveness of the existing program.

6. There should be a re-organization of the St. Vincent programs that are administered through the Ministry of Agriculture. That re-organization should be directed at improving the technical quality of the output of these sub-projects. It should also aim to make more effective use of locally-available material, such as plant cuttings, and also the services of the Ministry of Community Development.

7. CDB develop, with countries, a monthly summary form to show by country and by sub-project; the current total funding allocation; claims to date against such allocations, and claims pending reimbursement.

8. CDB develop, with the countries, a standardized monthly summary project reporting form, to show by country and by sub-project, current month employment data (number, women, youths and new workers) and the current status, by percent, of sub-project implementation progress.

9. CDB/BHN technical project staff be increased from three to at least four and preferably five, to comprise three engineers and two architects.
10. CDB review, with the countries, the impact of reductions in classroom sizes, develop standard classroom dimensions for on-going work, and accomplish future reductions to remain within budgeted allocations through classroom eliminations in place of classroom size reductions.
11. CDB approval for smaller sub-projects of less than some maximum that is to be determined by consultation between RDO/C and the CDB, should be immediately forthcoming upon sub-project identification -- showing the type, the cost distribution of labor and materials and the need, together with a brief narrative outline of the plan for execution.
12. Sub-project selection criteria be simplified to consider basically the need, labor content, government priority, available capability for implementation, and the 45 percent labor criterion be selectively waived for community-related sub-projects which have highly productive, visible and social impacts such as water supply and drainage extensions and improvements; roads and street repairs and improvements; health clinics; public conveniences as rubbish and solid waste collection and disposal -- provided the overall program of the country is within the labor usage guideline.
13. That new projects be directed at facilities which impact on young people. These include community centers, recreational infrastructure, and schools that provide technical and vocational training.

14. That RDO/C seriously conduct a survey program similar to the schools survey one for the purpose of assisting these islands in their development of agricultural and industrialization diversification programs.

## APPENDIX I

### AGGREGATE DATA

Table I:	Summary of Planned AID Financing For Project. Basic Human Needs Fund.
Table II:	CDB/USAID Basic Human Needs Project
Table III:	Basic Human Needs/Employment Sector Employment Generated as of 11/24/80
Table IV:	Commitments by CDB to Specific Sub-Projects as of 11/24/80
Table V:	Status of Active BHN Subprojects by Company
Table VI:	Annex 2 Status of Planned and Approved BHN Subprojects

Table I

SUMMARY OF  
PLANNED A. I. D. FINANCING FOR PROJECT  
BASIC HUMAN NEEDS FUND

<u>PROJECT ELEMENTS</u>	<u>TOTAL</u>
1. <u>Infrastructure and Skills Training*</u>	
School Construction (G)	\$ 3,245,000
School Maintenance (G)	400,000
Other Physical and Social Infrastructure	
a) Barbados (L)	2,000,000
b) LDCs (G)	5,440,000
Skills Training Fund	250,000
	<hr/> \$ 11,335,000
2. <u>Program Support (all grant)</u>	
8 Project Supervisors for 3 Yrs. 1 for 2 yrs. @ ave. of \$10,000/yr.	260,000
CDB Direct-Hire Personnel; 3 Person Yrs.	126,000
302 Person Months of Consultants @ \$2,200/month	664,000
Public Information Program	30,000
Contingencies and Travel	61,000
3. <u>Evaluation</u>	24,000
	<hr/> \$ 1,165,000
<hr/> <b>TOTAL:</b>	<hr/> <b>\$ 12,500,000</b>

\* Figures in this category include a 1½% fee to the CDB for indirect costs.

Table IIBASIC HUMAN NEEDS/EMPLOYMENT SECTORApproved Allocations to Date:

---

	Schools	Non-School Infrastructure	Total
Antigua	461,700	843,915	1,296,615
Belize	-	350,000	350,000
Dominica	1,190,700 *	834,915	2,025,615
Grenada	461,700	834,915	1,296,615
Montserrat	145,800	270,510	416,310
St. Kitts/Nevis	461,700	834,915	1,296,615
St. Lucia	461,700	834,915	1,296,615
St. Vincent	461,700	834,915	1,296,615
	<hr/> 3,645,000	<hr/> 5,630,000	<hr/> 9,275,000

---

Commitments by CDB to Specific Sub-projects as of 11/24/80

Antigua	455,000	788,000	1,243,000
Belize	-	302,500	302,500
Dominica	1,240,300	472,300	1,712,600
Grenada	393,000	781,000	1,174,000
Montserrat	120,000	150,000	270,000
St. Kitts/Nevis	410,000	805,000	1,215,000
St. Lucia	88,000	291,000	379,000
St. Vincent	417,000	793,000	1,210,000
	<hr/> 3,123,300	<hr/> 4,382,800	<hr/> 7,506,100

Table III

BASIC HUMAN NEEDS/EMPLOYMENT SECTOR

EMPLOYMENT GENERATED AS OF 11/24/80

<u>COUNTRY</u>	<u>PERSON WEEKS OF EMPLOYMENT</u>
Antigua	1690
Belize	nil
Barbados *	nil
Dominica	156
Grenada	1220
Montserrat	1100
St. Kitts/Nevis	1740
St. Lucia	600
St. Vincent	1600
	Total
	<u>8106</u>

\*186 students have completed training modules in the construction trades, for which OAS indicates a job placement rate of 90%, under the Skills Training Program.

Table IV:

CDB/USAID BASIC HUMAN NEEDS PROJECT

<u>COUNTRY</u>	<u>TOTAL ALLOCATION</u> <u>U.S. \$*</u>	<u>TOTAL DISBURSEMENTS TO</u> <u>NOV. 24, 1980 - U.S. \$</u> <u>Sub-project Activities</u> <u>&amp; School Maintenance</u>
Antigua	1,250,744	297,160
Belize	345,625	nil
Dominica	1,970,631	61,890
Grenada	1,250,744	216,305
Montserrat	407,463	234,710
St. Kitts/Nevis/ Anguilla	1,250,744	172,130
St. Lucia	1,250,744	95,610
St. Vincent	1,250,744	176,620
<hr/>		
Total (Sub)	8,371,439	1,254,425
Skills Training Project		
(Barbados)	250,000	75,313
Loan to Barbados	2,000,000	nil
<hr/>		
Total		1,329,738

\*Figures are net of a 1½% fee to CDB for indirect costs.

Actual reimbursement claims submitted to RDO/C 676,743.84

Claims presently being processed by CDB 595,920.18

Table V

STATUS OF ACTIVE BHM  
SUBPROJECTS BY COUNTRY

SUBPROJECT	COST (US\$)	DESCRIPTION	DISBURSEMENTS		ESTIMATED COMPLETION DATE	ESTIMATED TIME TO BE CLEARED (PERSON WEEKS)
			ACTUAL (US\$)	PROJ. TO DEC'80		
<b>ANTIGUA:</b>						
Liberta Clinic	48,000	Complete 2 story bldg. for community clinic in rural area.	44,000	4,000	11/80	480
Gray's Farm Clinic	50,000	Rehabilitation and extension of existing clinic in low-income area	34,000	16,000	11/80	480
Drainage Improvements at Gray's Farm	210,000	Redesign and Construction of 2,500 feet of drains, affecting 27% of St. John's population.	53,000	30,000	12/81	2,250
Drainage Improvements at Skerrits Village	90,000	Redesign and Construction of drains in poor section of capital city, affecting 2,500 persons.	9,000	5,000	12/81	1,300
Greenbay Primary School	109,000	Rehabilitation and extension of current school to eventually provide 700 places.	7,800	55,000	5/81	1,200
St. John's Primary School	346,000	Construction of new school for 600 students.	30,000	35,000	11/81	2,900
Conversation and Improvement of Handicraft Center	180,000	Will renovate a former government building to house a center for production and sale of handicrafts by 40 artisans.	18,000	15,000	8/81	

\*To October, 1980

SUBPROJECT	COST (US\$)	DESCRIPTION	DISBURSEMENTS		ESTIMATED COMPLETION DATE	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT TO BE CREATED (PERSON WEEKS)
			ACTUAL (US\$)	PROJ. TO DEC '80		
<b>DOMINICA:</b>						
Grand Bay/Fichelin	95,000	New distribution lines and intake structure on Fichelin River; to benefit 4,000 persons.	9,500	16,000	1/81	2,900
Bagatelle/Fond St. Jean Water Supply	38,000	Will extend existing main; 7,200 feet of supply mains and construction of service reservoir; village of Fond St. Jean, 1,800 people, will benefit.	3,800	18,000	7/81	600
Wiers Primary School	58,000	Rehabilitation and extension to relieve severe overcrowding in school which enrolls 700.	5,800	25,000	3/81	480
Mahant Primary School	115,000	Approved by CDB 10/80 rehabilitation and extension of current overcrowded facility for 690 students.	6,000	30,000	2/81	1,200
<b>GRENADA:</b>						
La Mode/Boca Water Supply	96,000	Expansion of rural water supply in 2 agricultural communities involving approximately 3,000 persons.	28,714	30,000	4/81	600
Refurbishing of Health Clinics	120,000	Repairs to 6 rural health clinics; 3 already completed. Clinics serve estimated 6,000 population.	19,139	27,500	8/81	3,500
Sauteurs Health Clinic	167,000	Construction of new clinic	28,538	40,000	11/81	2,000
Hillsborough Primary School	62,000	Rehabilitation and extension of school on island of Carricou - 264 pupils.	28,538	40,000	11/81	320
					2/81	

SUBPROJECT	COST	DESCRIPTION	DISBURSEMENTS		ESTIMATED COMPLETION DATE	ESTIMATED EMPLOY TO BE CREATED
			ACTUAL (US\$)	PROJ. TO DEC '80		
<u>GRENADA: (Cont/d)</u>						
Peggy's Whim Water Supply	95,000	Installation of 10,000 ft of pipe to extend and improve water supply.	95,000			960
Replacement mains at St. Georges	100,000	Installation of 8,500 ft of pipe to replace severely deteriorated system. Entire 24,000 population of St. Georges will benefit.	10,000	25,000	8/81	2,200
Repair to Abutment-Dunfermline Bridge	71,000	Repair damage and disrepair to road system infrastructure in rural areas.	7,100	6,000	3/81	600
Repair of Belmont to St. Patrick Road	112,000		11,200	25,000	2/81	800
Repair of Diamond to St. Marks Road	61,200		6,120	20,000	2/81	500

SUBPROJECT	COST (US\$)	DESCRIPTION	DISBURSEMENT		ESTIMATED COMPLETION DATE	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT TO BE CREATED (PERSON WEEKS)
			ACTUAL (US\$)	PROJ. TO DEC '80		
<b>MONTERRAT:</b>						
Reforestation of Northern Section of Island	75,000	Replanting of 150 acres as pilot project for extension to other parts of island to halt serious denudation.	46,637	15,000	4/81	1,800
Development of spring sources of water supply	75,000	Development of 13 spring sources through desiltification piping, etc. 60% improvement in yield achieved after 1/3 of subproject completed.	71,946	3,000	12/80	900
Lees Primary School	120,000	Rehabilitation and extension to relieve overcrowding and provide 100 additional spaces.	93,851	15,000	1/81	2,000
<b>ST. KITTS/NEVIS:</b>						
Soil Conservation at Greenhill	180,000	Restoration and erosion control to 153 acres of cane land at Greenhill, a government estate.	31,735	27,000	9/81	2,900
Water Reservoir at Cayon	110,000	Construction of new reservoir and catchment improvement to supply Cayon village - population 4,600.	83,832	26,000	2/81	840
Land Clearance and Site Preparation for Con Phipps Pilot Project	130,000	Clearing, planting and cultivation of 150 acre plot of former cane land as pilot peanut project for ag. diversification.	19,815	20,000	9/81	960

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

SUBPROJECT	COST (US\$)	DESCRIPTION	DISBURSEMENTS		ESTIMATED COMPLETION DATE	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT TO BE CREATED (PERSON WEEKS)
			ACTUAL (US\$)	PROJ. TO DEC '80		
<b>ST. KITTS/NEVIS: (Cont'd)</b>						
Communal pasture for cattle rearing in Nevis.	85,000	Removal of brush, cultivation fencing and planting of 600 acres, acre paddocks for crop rotation. Will benefit poor farmers who rear cattle.	11,027	15,000	6/81	960
Cayon Primary School	210,000	Rehabilitation and extension to relieve overcrowding for 500 pupils.	43,874	32,000	11/81	1,000
St. Paul's Primary School	200,000	Replacement for old building which was destroyed by fire; 360 pupils site preparation work underway.				2,800
<b>ST. LUCIA:</b>						
Water Supply Improvements at Fond St. Jacques/Choiseul/Delcer	83,000	Will harness water from spring sources to augment present inadequate supply for 3 rural villages - 6,000 population.	18,024	30,000	2/81	1,000
Balca Water Supply	43,000	Will construct service reservoir, distribute mains to Park and Balca residents now drawing water from polluted streams - 1,000 rural direct beneficiaries.	4,300	18,000	7/81	350
Drainage Improvements at Hevanorra, Victoria Park and Dennery	90,000	Redesign, regrade and line drainage canals to relieve flooding and health hazard for some 5,000 residents in 3 areas.	37,000	50,000	12/81	700
Water Supply for Bouton	25,000	Develop minor piped-in system for rural village. Present water is hand-carried from river.	7,500	7,500	7/81	600

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

SUBPROJECT	COST (US\$)	DESCRIPTION	DISBURSEMENTS		ESTIMATED COMPLETION DATE	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT TO BE CREATED (PERSON WEEKS)
			ACTUAL (US\$)	PROJ. TO DEC '80		
<b>ST. VINCENT:</b>						
Soil Conservation at Ovia and Fancy	72,000	Erosion control, replanting at Ovia watershed in Northern part of island - will improve ag. production on 675 acres, benefitting 4,000 rural persons.	15,591	12,000	11/81	1,400
Reforestation at Three Rivers, Montreal and Richmond	92,000	Will plant seedlings, control erosion steep hillsides and return land to production in 3 rural locations - nursery started.	14,498	10,000	11/81	1,700
Clare Valley Primary School	200,000	Originally to be a rehabilitation and extension, school was destroyed by Hurricane Allen; will construct a new 2 story facility for 300 pupils in poor seaside community.	42,500	40,000	4/81	1,600
<b>BARBADOS:</b>						
Skills Training Program	250,000	Entry-level skills training in the construction trade for unemployed youth in electricity, masonry, carpentry, and plumbing. 186 trained to date; 167 gained employment. Training conducted in 6 locations throughout Barbados.	45,000	30,000		
<b>TOTALS</b>			<b>1,013,841</b>	<b>840,000</b>		

6,277,730

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

## ANNEX 2

## STATUS OF PLANNED AND APPROVED BIN SUBPROJECTS

Table VI

SUBPROJECT	COST	DESCRIPTION	ESTIMATED START UP	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT (Person weeks)
<b>ANTIGUA:</b>				
Casada Gardens Drainage	200,000	Will relieve flooding of St. Johns clean and line 6,000 ft of drains.	3/81	1,600
Gray's Farm Drainage II	100,000	Extension of earlier BIN subproject to relieve flooding; removal of silt and rubbish and replace with quarry stone.	10/80	2,000
<b>GRENADA</b>				
Florida Primary School	120,000	Existing facility to be demolished and new one constructed for 200 pupils.	5/81	1,400
*Grand Roy Primary	111,000	Rehabilitation of existing building which houses 400 pupils.		750
*South St. Georges Primary	162,000	Rehabilitatio.. and extension seriously overcrowded facility enrolling 320 pupils - to accommodate 500.		1,600

\*Peoples Revolutionary Government (PRO) is re-examining CDB approved projects with a view to possibly consolidating two schools into larger single facility. GOG decision will affect extent and type of design work required as well as eventual construction schedule. Therefore, above subprojects have been put on hold pending PRO decision.

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

*Laboratory EC  
Cabinet EC*

SUBJECT	COST	DESCRIPTION	ESTIMATED START UP	ESTIMATED DURATION (Foreign weeks)
<b>DOMINICA:</b>				
<i>CF</i> Penville Primary School	220,000	Replace previous school which was destroyed in 1979 by Hurricane David - 100 students.	Designs in final stage, JOD prequalifying contractors, construction to start 1/81.	2,400
<i>CF</i> Savanne Paille Primary School <i>min 61</i>	100,000	Replace previous hurricane-damaged school - 160 pupils.	"	1,500
<i>CF</i> Massacre Primary School	235,000	Construct a new facility for 430 children.	"	2,700
<i>CF</i> Campbell Primary School <i>min 61</i>	127,300	Reconstruct expanded school on-site of former facility damaged by Hurricane David - 175 pupils.	"	900
<i>CF</i> Bagatelle Primary School	198,000	Construction of new facility for 340 pupils to replace previous edifice damaged by Hurricane David.	"	2,100
Portsmouth Primary School	65,000	Rehabilitation of existing facility for 300 students.	"	480
Restoration of Canefield Mill	100,000	Restoration of former sugar cane mill for use as cultural center.	2/81	900
Calibishie Water Supply	98,200	Intake structure pumping station and distribution lines will be constructed to serve 1,300 persons in rural areas.	1/81	720
Grand Fond Water Supply	91,800	Piping storage facility to repair and extend water system destroyed by Hurricane David - will serve 1,400 people.	2/81	600
Dos D'Ane Primary School	124,000	Replacement of 500 pupil facility which was destroyed by fire	Designs in final stage, JOD prequalifying contractors construction to start 1/81.	1,050

*20-255 Amount  
1/2 added*

**MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY**

SUBJECT	COST	DESCRIPTION	ESTIMATED START UP	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT (Person Weeks)
<u>DOMINICA (Cont/d)</u>				
Atkinson Water Supply	12,000	Rehabilitation of existing system system, clearing present intake, new distribution system for 1,600 people.	10/80	250
Marigot Water Supply		Increase supply and distribution system for 1,400 persons.	2/81	720
<u>ST. LUCIA:</u>				
Rock Hall Primary School	213,000	New school for 300 pupils in suburb of Castries.	3/81	2,200
Hewanorra Drainage II	3,000	Extension of 3,000 ft of drainage improvements from previous DDM subprojects.	12/80	200
<u>ST. VINCENT:</u>				
Georgetown Community Center	100,000	Construction of a new center for handicraft and community recreational activities.	2/81	1,280
Canouan Road Improvement	100,000	Widening an extension of road connecting main village & Airport at Canouan, in the Grenadines.	12/80	800
Union Island Road Improvement.	125,000	Clifton-Ashton road will be repaired and surfaced with gravel on Union Island in the Grenadines.	12/80	1,440
Coastal Road Protection - Belle Vue Colonarie	204,000	Erosion control on main east coast road which is principal access for 30,000 people in northeast section.	2/81	3,000
Rehabilitation and Extension of Mesopotamia Health Center	100,00	Repair and addition of clinical facilities to a rural health clinic to service a population of 4,0000.	3/81	700

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

SUBPROJECT	COST	DESCRIPTION	ESTIMATED START UP	ESTIMATED EMPLOYMENT (Person weeks)
<b>ST. KITTS/NEVIS:</b>				
Pinney's Mini-Dams/Nevis	80,000	Desiltification and clearance of 3 brick dams, laying of line to Pinney's industrial site.	1/81	480
Improvement to Jessups Distribution System/Nevis	20,000	Replace 6,500 ft of line to improve flow to Jessups and Cotton Ground - 2,000 population.	2/81	240
Earth Storage Reservoir and Treatment Tank at Jessups and Bornes Grant/Nevis	150,000	Construction of earthen reservoir to store rain-water and run-off to augment present dam and establish treatment plant to serve Jessups, and Vanghores - Total population served 2,500.	2/81	1,400
Storage Reservoir at Cotton Ground/Nevis	50,000	Construction of 34,000 gallon storage reservoir to serve Cotton Ground and surrounding village areas.	2/81	400
<b>BELIZE</b>				
Coastal Protection (Corozal, Belize City, Sarteneja)	47,500	Repair of seawalls, construct gabions, install new seawalls.	11/80	1,100
Land Reclamation in Belize City (Landivar and Martin de Porres sections)	100,000	Fill-in 50 acres in Landivar and permit low-income housing project; improve drainage of areas Martin de Porres to serve population of 14,000.	11/80	1,700
Dangriga Community Centre/ Hurricane Shelter	100,000	New clinic in rural border areas to serve population of 4,000.	1/81	1,600
Health Centre at Benque Viejo del Carmen	55,000		12/80	720

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

## APPENDIX II

### THE ANTIGUA PUBLICITY PROGRAM

Further to the grant requirement that the recipient country must enter into an effective program of publicity, that which Antigua used, demands special attention.

The project manager arranged, at the primary and secondary school level, a poster competition where students, after hearing about the BHN/E program, would design posters with slogans that captured their understanding of the intent and the spirit of the program. Cash prizes were awarded for the best posters (1st, 2nd, 3rd, and two consolation prizes).

The entries that we saw were remarkable. They were judged by the Deputy Education Officer, Mr. Clarence Edwards, and the Supervisor for Arts, Mrs. Rosetta Edinoff.

I particularly liked this slogan, which earned a consolation prize:

"CDB and USAID are organizations with a vision. Together they will improve our health, sanitation and education."

The other consolation entry read as follows:

"CDB and USAID have it made, Developing communities for the 80 's."

(Entry from All Saints Secondary School)

"The USA and CDB have both joined together to make a healthier Antigua."

(Entry from Hughes Primary School)

"The United States and CDB. Thank you for an improved society."

(Entry from Cedar Grove Primary)

1st Prize

"Salute USAID and CDB. They build for the development of our country."

2nd Prize

"In education, health, and draft, USAID and CDB are on the helping raft."

(Entry from Pares Primary School)

3rd Prize

"Human needs must be satisfied. USAID and CDB, we thank you for help supplied."

(Entry from Pares Primary School)

Another part of the Antigua publicity program consists of color pictures showing the projects in operation. These will be put in a display case at the airport to indicate what USAID is doing on the BHN/E program.

APPENDIX III

REPORTS

## APPENDIX III

### REPORTS

1. The format and content of the reporting system which the project supervisor of Antigua uses, as per documents entitled "Workers data, USAID, CDB project for period ending....." (See report for period 17-22 November, 1980, Appendix III-1) could be emulated by other countries.

It has a breakdown of workers by age, sex, and length of time on the job, for respective projects.

The other appended data that he presented, reflected his systematic approach to his job.

The appended documents bear the title (a) USAID Statement of Expenditures 26/11/80 (b) Summary Expenditure of Projects (c) Letter of Credit Payments/ Projects.

2. The accompanying material Appendix III-2 entitled "Greenhill Project" is the substance of the record that the team got from St. Kitts. The associated information on man hour usage should be regarded as unreliable. It was produced only after it was requested. One suspects that it was computed by dividing recorded payments by some average wage per hour. In addition the inexperience of the project supervisor showed when he read off the man hour numbers that he had received over the telephone, as man weeks.

WORKERS DATA U.S. AID G.D.B. PROJECT FOR THE PERIOD 17 - 22nd NOVEMBER, 1980

PROJECT	REMARKS	REMARKS	UNDER 20 YEARS	UNDER 40 YEARS	UNDER 50 YEARS	OVER 50 YEARS	TOTAL EMPLOYED
Skorritts Pasture Drainage	No. of Female on Project = 3 No. of Male on Project = $\frac{11}{14}$	No. of New Workers on Project = 1 Other Workers = $\frac{13}{14}$	1	7	2	4	14
St. John's Primary School	No. of Female on Project = 2 No. of Male on Project = $\frac{29}{31}$	No. of New Workers on Project = 15 Other Workers = $\frac{16}{31}$	5	20	3	3	31
Gry's Farm Drainage	No. of Female on Project = 4 No. of Male on Project = $\frac{24}{28}$	No. of New Workers on Project = 2 Other Workers = $\frac{26}{28}$	2	8	1	7	28
Handy Craft Centre	No. of Female on Project = 3 No. of Male on Project = $\frac{12}{15}$	No. of New Workers on Project = 1 Other Workers = $\frac{14}{15}$	6	9			15

MICROFILMED FROM BEST  
AVAILABLE COPY

STATEMENT OF EXPENDITURE 26/11/80

VOTE ACCOUNTS	US / ID ALLOCATION	ACTUAL EXP.	UNESTIMATED COMP.	TOTAL EST. EXP.	BALANCE	REMARKS
Gray's Farm Drainage	8594,000.00	1262,850.07	160,909.04	1323,759.11	\$270,240.89	
Skerritt's pasture Drainage	243,000.00	59,545.85	1,167.06	60,712.91	182,287.09	
Green Bay School	270,000.00	73,222.49	39,691.83	112,913.62	157,086.15	
For St. John's Primary School	860,269.00	19,183.87	69,754.36	89,938.23	770,330.77	
Liberta Clinic	129,600.00	129,794.99	-	129,794.99	(194.99)	In Excess
Gray's Farm Clinic	135,000.00	129,371.29	-	129,371.29	5,628.71	
Handicraft Centre	126,000.00	6,948.26	12,149.44	19,097.70	106,902.30	Letter of Credit from China

MICROFILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Appendix III-1 (b)

SUMMARY OF EXPENDITURE PROJECTS

Payments Through E.C.C.A. ----- E.C. = \$ 176,480.73

Payments From L/C ----- = 511,964.33  
\$ 688,444.46

Banks Com. etc.        \$    889.32

Debit Advices        \$ 5,575.04 -----        6,464.36  
\$ 6,464.36                                694,908.82

LETTER OF CREDIT - PAYMENTS

Appendix III-1 (c)

PROJECT

DATE	AMOUNT SANCTIONED	APPLICATION NO.	DRAW DOWN	BALANCE	GRAYS FARM DRAINAGE	SKERRITS PASTURE DRAINAGE	LINCOLN CL. P.	GREEN BAY CLINIC	GREEN BAY SCHOOL	OTTOS PRIMARY SCHOOL	ALL AGE SCHOOL	HANDICRAFT CENTRE	SCHOOL CLASSIFIED MTC.	NATURE PAYMENT
one	1,070,682.77													
Aug-11		# 1	\$51,525.84	\$1,009,157.93	\$30,476.01		\$6,489.4	14,560.79						Consultant Certificate GF 3.1/C3.
ep-9		# 2	23,401.42	965,756.51			9,465.8	33,935.49						Consultant Certificate GF 4.1/C4
ep-9		# 3	82,600.00	883,156.51						\$82,600.00				Mobilization Payment
ep-9		# 4	20,081.71	863,074.80					20,081.71					Consultant Certificate # 1
ep-9		# 5	64,935.00	798,139.80										Two Concrete Mixers \$64,935.00
		# 6	24,637.50	773,502.30	24,637.50									Consultant Certificate GF 4.
		# 7	34,668.10	738,834.20		34,668.10								Consultant Certificate S 2
Oct-27		# 8	102,500.00	636,334.20										Mobilization Payments
		# 9	113,670.00	522,664.20	113,670.00						\$54,000.00	\$48,600.00		Consultant Certificate GF 5.
		# 10	10,599.87	511,964.33										
		Sub Total												
C.D.B. / ECCA payments June 12					\$168,783.51	\$34,668.10	\$5,955.07	\$48,496.28	\$20,081.71	\$82,600.00	\$54,000.00	\$48,600.00	\$10,599.87	
					41,290.00	1,782.00	54,000.00	59,000.00						Consultant Certificate GF 12.51.0 L#1
July 10							9,793.52	1,012.61					14,499.	Consultant Certificate GF 12.51.0 L#2
					\$240,073.51	\$36,450.10	\$9,350.59	\$8,508.89	\$20,081.71	\$82,600.00	\$54,000.00	\$48,600.00	\$24,098.87	

MONEY OFFERED  
AVAILABLE FOR

APPENDIX III-2

GREENHILL PROJECT - ST. KITTS

<u>Week Ending</u>	<u>Labour</u> \$	<u>Machinery</u> \$	<u>Materials</u> \$	<u>Total</u> \$
16/8	497.03	3,192.00	-	3,689.03
23/8	2,616.06	4,788.00	-	7,404.06
30/8	2,490.04	4,788.00	-	7,278.04
6/9	3,231.04	9,614.00	-	12,845.44
13/9	3,484.47	2,386.00	-	5,870.47
20/9	2,880.36	780.00	-	3,660.36
27/9	3,105.02	1,758.00	-	4,863.02
4/10	4,612.43	1,236.00	-	5,848.43
11/10	4,165.18	2,700.00	-	6,865.18
18/10	10,828.87	3,090.00	14,875.68	28,794.55
25/10	14,592.64	8,790.00	5,280.00	28,662.64
1/11	6,325.80	3,072.00	2,340.55	11,738.35
8/11	8,265.14	6,768.00	309.72	15,342.86
15/11	6,149.17	4,308.00	234.25	10,691.42
22/11	8,927.40	6,282.00	-	15,209.40
			Total:	<u><u>161,898.08</u></u>

National Agricultural Corporation

2nd December, 1980

Appendix III-2 (a)

GREENHILL PROJECT \*

<u>Week Ending</u>	<u>Man Hours</u>
16/8	32
23/8	170
30/8	161
6/9	210
13/9	226
20/9	187
27/9	201
4/10	229
11/10	270
10/10	702
25/10	946
1/11	410
8/11	536
15/11	399
22/11	571

National Agricultural Corporation

3rd November, 1980

\*(Man Hour figures are questionable, probably arrived at by dividing labor bill by the average wage per hour).

APPENDIX IV

DOCUMENTATION OF OBJECTIVES AND STATEMENT OF WORK

### Article I - Title

Caribbean Education Development, No. 538-0029 and Basic Human Needs/ ;  
Employment, No, 538-0030.

### Article II - Objective

To assess the operational procedures and implementation process of A.I.D.'s Caribbean Education Development and the Basic Human Needs Project with the Caribbean Development Bank.

### Article III - Statement of Work

At the outset the evaluation team shall review and become completely conversant with:

- A. The inter-relationship of the two projects and the factors affecting the successful implementation of all the components in both projects.
- B. The overall coordinative and administrative procedures employed for both the projects, between A.I.D. and CDB and between CDB and the participating countries.
- C. The sub-project identification, selection and implementation plans for each participating country.
- D. The procedure employed for contracting construction, engineering and inspection services and the responsibilities of such contractors.

Based upon the above and after a comprehensive examination of the specific questions and analysis listed below, the Contractor shall present to USAID and the CDB specific recommendations to improve the implementation of the projects, as well as to assess the accomplishment of the projects' objectives and activities to date. The evaluation team shall address three major areas of concern:

#### A. Project Administration

1. Examine the RDO/C-CDB operational relationship in the administration of both projects and suggest such improvements as may be appropriate.
2. Assess the effectiveness of the CDB management team for both projects, with reference to their:
  - a. execution and monitoring of project and sub-project implementation plans;
  - b. preparation and recommendation for approval by CDB management of all sub-project proposals submitted by participating countries;
  - c. determination of contract scopes of work, contractor selection and supervision;
  - d. monitoring and active participation in the inspection and reporting system within countries and ensuring timely compliance with project requirements.
3. With reference to the participating countries, review the performance of the principal officials responsible for the projects' administration particularly the project supervision and the consultants; and identify corrective measures to be taken in the management of project activity at the country level.

#### B. Sub-project Selection

Review sub-project eligibility criteria and their application and examine range and emphasis of sub-projects chosen and recommend ways to provide greater sectoral balance and employment generation, (if deemed necessary.)

#### C. Sub-project Implementation

1. Review the efficiency of the accelerated sub-project identification, inspection, certification and disbursement system in use under the projects and suggest means of eliminating any bottlenecks being encountered.
2. Analyze the procurement arrangements being employed by countries for commodities on sub-projects and suggest such expedited procedures as may be deemed necessary and feasible.
3. Appraise, with particular reference to the BHN project but also generally to the CED project, the extent and nature of employment generation which has taken place under sub-projects, especially as related to opportunities created for women and youth.

4. Evaluate, for the school construction and rehabilitation components of BHN and CED, the progress achieved and the standardization of educational specifications, and identify modifications or improvements required to achieve project objectives related thereto.
5. Assess the utilization and effectiveness of the public information aspect of the BHN/CED program.