

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

1. PROJECT TITLE  Integrated Regional Development/ University of the West Indies			2. PROJECT NUMBER  538-V-004	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE  RDO/C
			4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) <u>538-80-06</u>	
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING	7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY _____	B. Final Obligation Expected FY _____	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>82</u>	A. Total \$ <u>13,000,000</u> B. U.S. \$ <u>8,500,000</u>	From (month/yr.) <u>January 1976</u> To (month/yr.) <u>September 1980</u> Date of Evaluation Review _____

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Review and approval of plans, specifications, etc. for St. Augustine Library Extension	RDO/C	Sept. '80
2. Extension of TDD to permit construction of St. Augustine Library Extension.	AID/W	Nov. '80

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS			10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT		
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) <u>TDD</u>	A. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change		
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	B. <input type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or		
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C		<input type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan		
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P		C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project		

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)		12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval	
Donald W. Boyd, CPDO, Project Officer			
Stephen C. Ryner, CRDO		Typed Name William B. Wheeler	
		Date October 3, 1980	

13. Summary

Terminal Disbursement Date is March 30, 1981. Loan is fully committed. Construction activities on Mona and Cave Hill Campuses are virtually completed. St. Augustine Library extension and CARDI/Agriculture Building remain to be completed. In view of slow progress at St. Augustine, TDD may be extended to one year to permit completion of Library extension.

14. Evaluation Methodology

A formal evaluation of this Project was scheduled for March 1980, however, because a comprehensive AID audit was performed in September 1979, and a detailed annual report was submitted by UWI on the Project early in 1980, it was deemed preferable to let this serve as an interim evaluation and to conduct a final evaluation upon termination of the Project.

15. External Factors

Included within discussion on No. 16

16. & 17. Inputs/Outputs

There are four basic outputs to the Project: Facility Construction, Equipment and Furnishings, an LDC Scholarship Program and Technical Assistance and Training.

A. Facilities Construction

1. Mona

Eight facilities form part of the Mona construction program:

(i) Botany and Greenhouse; (ii) Zoology; (iii) Inter-Faculty Classroom Centre; (iv) Central Analytical and Food Science Laboratory; (v) Administration Offices; (vi) Arts and General Studies Offices; (vii) Electronics Workshop; and (viii) Printery.

The total allocation under the Loan for Mona construction is \$1.9 million. The construction contract between UWI and Cedar Construction Company Ltd. was signed on March 10, 1978.

The duration of the contract period was fixed for 15 months. Following the trend of all construction projects in Jamaica at this time, the work progressed smoothly for several months, but as soon as a greater quantity and a larger variety of materials were required, there were delays. The progress of the works was slowed because of the unavailability of local materials such as cement, steel bars and lumber, inclement weather, difficulty with the Trade Board in obtaining licences for overseas materials, and changes and/or additions to the original drawings. The Contractor failed to meet the completion date of June 29, 1979, and several extensions were therefore granted.

However, the construction program gained momentum and has been successful. To date, all eight buildings have gone through a Practical Completion Inspection. Correction of problems noted on the lists of defects compiled during these inspections is 95% complete. The Arts and General Studies building has had a Final Completion Inspection. All buildings except the Botany Laboratory, Zoology Laboratory and Food Science Analytical Laboratory are fully occupied and in use. The latter facilities are expected to open by November, 1980 pending arrival of essential equipment items. Savings achieved in the above activities permitted AID approval for completion and enclosure of the Administration Building ground floor, for construction of a Botany Greenhouse and Seedstore, and installation of seating in the Inter-Faculty Classroom Centre. The Ground Floor has been enclosed and inspected for Practical Completion. Greenhouse and Seedstore are 90% completed and seating installations for 304 students in the Inter-Faculty Lecture Theatre have been completed.

2. Cave Hill

During 1979, all construction activities were completed under the Loan at Cave Hill, including extension to the Administration Building and Library, addition to the Biology Laboratory and construction of the Language Laboratory and Learning Resource Centre. All buildings are occupied and fully functional. Total AID costs for construction were \$794,000, an actual savings of \$15,000, which has been used to reinstate items originally removed because of budget constraints. Dedication ceremonies for these facilities were held on May 6, 1980 and were widely publicized throughout the region.

3. St. Augustine

Because the Government of Trinidad and Tobago announced a major facilities expansion program at St. Augustine after the USAID Loan was signed, adjustments in the budget were made to avoid duplication and assure complementarity of effort. Unfortunately, it took nearly one year for the Government to approve the revisions in the plan. AID funds previously designated for professional services, construction equipment for the Food Processing Plant, Library and Administration are now concentrated on Library construction and equipment for the Food Processing Plant. The Government of Trinidad and Tobago funds previously designated for further expansion of the Library and Administration are reallocated to provide professional services and construction for the Food Processing Plant and the expanded Library, and equipment for the Library and Administration Building. Total US contribution for construction will be US\$2.5 million.

a) Cardi/Agriculture Building

A contract was signed with the contractor on March 2, 1979, for the CARDI/Agriculture Building, and the site was formally handed

over on March 5, 1979.

After a good start to construction activities in March 1979, work was slowed down considerably following the discovery of a loose gravel vein during the course of excavation work on the foundations. The vein rendered impossible the construction of the foundations, as designed, unless the soil was first stabilized. In order to prevent the project being brought to a standstill, thereby incurring further costs, the Contractor was instructed to complete soil stabilization on the understanding that the matter of liability remained to be settled. This work has been done but resulted in revision of the target completion date to November 1980.

b) Food Processing Plant

Construction of the Food Processing Plant is now in progress as part of the facilities expansion program being funded by the Government. The target date for completion of construction is September 1980.

c) Library

Progress on the proposed Library extension was seriously delayed because of the time involved in rationalizing the AID and GOTT programs. Final drawings for the extension will be submitted to RDO/C in September for review and approval. Pre-qualification notices were issued in May and construction is slated to begin in December, after solicitation of tenders, contract negotiations and AID approval. A 12 month construction period is contemplated; therefore, the TDD would need to be extended beyond the current 3/30/81 date. This matter is under consideration by RDO/C. RDO/C has met repeatedly with St. Augustine officials to expedite the movement towards completion of this last phase of the Loan construction component; however, the current construction boom in Trinidad

has had a definite negative influence on the ability of UWI to accelerate the pace of a relatively small project such as this extension.

B. Equipment Procurement

The University has contracted with the Afro-American Purchasing Center (AAPC) to process all aspects of the procurement of equipment and furnishings. Approximately \$2 million under the Loan is earmarked for this category.

As of June 30, 1980, 87% of the amount available for equipment and furnishings at Mona was either expended or committed, with orders being formally placed. The figure at Cave Hill was 94%, at St. Augustine 35%.

At Mona, some difficulty has been encountered with items for botany because of source and origin requirements. At Cave Hill, delays in finalizing orders occurred because of specifications and compatibility problems with respect to Language Laboratory equipment. At St. Augustine, the general slowness of the building program to develop affected equipment orders and the Library list has still not been completely resolved.

There have been some general delays during the past year between the issuing of a quotation by a firm and the placement of an order. This has been due to a variety of reasons - difficulties in agents obtaining competitive quotations, postal slow-downs, incomplete information on items quoted which necessitates a time consuming exchange of correspondence, technical problems, source and origin considerations. This situation is a reflection of a complex procurement process for 3 separate campuses which in recent months has been considerably improved through joint RDO/C, UWI, and AAPC consultations.

Generally, it should be noted that there have been very few instances of damage, pilferage or discrepancies between the order placed and goods received. In those minor cases, both AAPC and suppliers have acted swiftly to rectify the problem.

No difficulty is expected in finalizing orders and deliveries by early 1981.

C. Scholarship Program

The scholarship program was designed to aid LDCs in furthering their education in disciplines which are directly related to the development of their countries.

Under the Loan, both AID and UWI share the \$1 million cost of scholarship awards as follows:

	<u>1976/77</u>	<u>1977/78</u>	<u>1978/79</u>	<u>1979/80</u>	<u>1980/81</u>	<u>Total</u>
USAID Loan	93,734	108,692	100,000	100,000	97,574	500,000
U.W.I.	-	63,334	185,660	164,410	86,596	500,000
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>93,734</b>	<b>172,026</b>	<b>285,660</b>	<b>264,410</b>	<b>184,170</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>

In 1976/77 there were 22 awards; in 1977/78 22 new and 17 continuing awards; 1978/79, 27 new and 29 continuing; in 1979/80, 9 new and 37 continuing. In 1980/81 there will be 24 continuing awards. The areas of study will provide vitally needed skills to the LDCs - education, economics, public administration, engineering, agriculture, management, nursing, etc.

This program has been highly successful and has significantly enhanced the University's relevance to development of the region.

D. Technical Assistance and Training

This \$200,000 component of the Loan is to provide University faculty and staff with opportunities to upgrade their knowledge and skills in key development areas and to provide training in effective utilization and maintenance of Loan-financed facilities. The University plan for apportionment of this funding across the three countries was approved in July 1979, but most activities under the plan are scheduled to occur during the period July-September 1980. University faculty and staff will be undertaking a variety of courses and attachments principally with U.S. institutions. Because of an administrative problem which occurred under a Letter of Commitment, no actual disbursements have been recorded for this Program. The problem is, however, being resolved and actual disbursements of \$100,000 are expected by December 1981.

AID Audit

In September of 1979, AAG/LA submitted a final audit report on the Loan Project. The purposes of the audit conducted from February to April 1979 were to evaluate RDO/C and UWI's effectiveness and efficiency in carrying out the Project's objectives to assure that AID funds were used for Project purposes, AID regulations and Loan Agreement terms were being complied with and to identify areas requiring corrective action.

The Report recommended that:

(1) AID Regional Office in conjunction with the University should determine whether certain additional A&E Services costing approximately \$54,000 at Mona benefitted the project and were eligible for reimbursement and, if so, the contract should be amended.

(2) AID Regional Office should determine the total amount paid to the UWI for the Barbados A&E contract and a refund made for any unauthorized payments.

(3) AID Regional Office and UWI should determine possible uses of the excess funds accruing from devaluation of the Jamaican dollar and reprogramme them accordingly.

(4) AID Regional Office should assist the University in negotiating a significant reduction in the 25% AAPC estimate for freight, insurance and contingencies.

(5) UWI should refund the value of all ineligible commodities financed from the Loan.

(6) Marking requirements should be established by the Regional Office to fulfill the provisions of the Loan Agreement.

RDO/C and UWI have since resolved all of the above matters and the recommendations have been officially closed.

#### Disbursements

As of September 15, 1980, total disbursements under the Loan were \$5,105,472; \$1,936,618 at Mona, \$866,916 at Cave Hill and \$1,195,820 at St. Augustine. In addition, disbursements under 2 L/Com's for A&E services totaled \$96,648, and under the L/Com for AAPC totaled \$1,009,470. As may be noted, the preponderance of remaining disbursements are for construction at St. Augustine and for equipment purchase. RDO/C is making every effort to move forward on both of these matters.