

AIRGRAM

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

6690124-8
669-124
PD-AAC-105-D1

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

For each address check one ACTION

TO - AID/W

TO AID A 06 X

INFO

DATE REC'D.

14p

DATE SENT

1/18/78

DISTRIBUTION

ACTION

INFO.

MAIL ROOM
35W

FROM - Monrovia

SUBJECT - LIBERIA PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY NO. 78-1
CIVIL SERVICE DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (669-11-730-124)

REFERENCE -

Contained in this airgram is the subject PES and evaluation report with attachments, for AID/W duplication and distribution.

CARTER

ATTACHMENTS: PES With - TO MAIL ROOM 2/12/78

- (A) Revised Project Logical Framework
- (B) Tentative CSA Staffing Pattern
- (C) Financial Analysis Summary
- (D) November 17, 1977 letter from Director Siegel To CSA.
November 23, 1977 response from Director-General of CSA.
- (E) Summary of Project Status, November 1977.

OTHER AGENCY

PAGE 1 OF 14 PAGES

DRAFTED BY

EVAL: Tunavick:med Evaluation

OFFICE

PHONE NO. DATE

26900/ 52 1/5/78

APPROVED BY:

Stanley J. Siegel, Director

AID AND OTHER CLEARANCES

ID: FChagel
PR: BMarsh

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY

1. Mission USAID/Liberia			2. Project Number 669 11-730-124		
3. Project Title Civil Service Development					
4. Key project dates (fiscal years)					
a. Project Agreement Signed FY1973		b. Final Obligation FY1978	c. Final input delivered FY1979	5. Total U.S. Remaining-life of project \$ 1,856 (000)	
6. Evaluation number as listed in Eval. Schedule 78-1		7. Period covered by this evaluation FROM: 12/76 TO: 12/77 Month/year Month/year		8. Date of this Evaluation Review 12/15/77 month/day/year	
9. Action Decisions Reached at Evaluation Review,			10. Officer or Unit responsible for follow-up	11. Date action to be completed	
<p>The PROP, Logframe, Technical Assistance Contract with California State Personnel Board should be amended to reflect the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Increase of 12 months of long term advisors (2 advisors at six months each from August, 1978 through February, 1979). b) Eliminate any further short-term advisors. c) Add two additional MA level participants for a total of over life of project of 19. d) Extend life of project through February, 1979. <p>Two additional participants will be selected from existing CSA staff members and begin training at Sacramento.</p> <p>Results of the evaluation be brought to the attention of the President and his assistance sought with regard to upgrading salary levels for both CSA and LIPA professional staff and to discouraging Presidential Commissions outside the CSA regulations.</p> <p>An internal indepth evaluation be executed prior to departure of the last two contract team members.</p>			USAID and AID/W	Jan. 31, 1978	
			USAID/CSA/Contractor	Jan. 15, 1978	
			USAID/CSA	Feb. 1, 1978	
			USAID/CSA	Jan. 31, 1979	

12. Signatures:

Project Officer		Mission Director	
Signature		Signature	
Typed name	Fred G. H. [unclear]	Typed name	Stanley J. Siegel
Date	1/5/78	Date	1/5/78

UNCLASSIFIED
EVALUATION REPORT

CIVIL SERVICE DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

I Introduction

This evaluation report covers the activities during one year period December 1, 1976 to December 1, 1977. The Civil Service Development Project (CSD) #669-11-770-122, which began in September, 1974 with the arrival of the first contract team members, was scheduled for completion in August, 1978. Since CSD has been evaluated annually (December, 1975 and November, 1976) and no major problems signalled the need for an in-depth or external review, this year's evaluation followed the pattern of a joint Civil Service Agency/USAID review for the purpose of: (a) assessing progress in meeting targets established by the December 1976 evaluation; and (b) making recommendations on a proposed six month extension of the California State Personnel Board contract for technical assistance.

The following participated in the evaluation:

Hon. John Payne Mitchell, Director General, Civil Service Agency
 Mr. Fred Hagel, Chief, Office of Institutional Development, USAID
 Ms. Nancy Tunavick, Program Evaluation Officer, USAID
 Mr. Charles Walter, Chief of Party, Civil Service Development Project
 Mr. Gene Westlake, Financial Analyst, USAID

II Findings and Recommendations

A) Project outputs for 1977/78 in terms of systems designed and procedures developed were reviewed and found to be behind schedule by an average of four months. Although four critical dates relative to classification and pay plans were missed during 1977, a revised project work schedule has been developed to telescope activities without detrimental effect to the project. A discussion of project outputs appears in Section IV.

B) (An increase of 12 months of long term field advisors is recommended (2 men at six months each from August 1978 to February 1979) for the following reasons:

1. Assist in full implementation of the position classification and pay plans;
2. Provide on-the-job training for four participants returning in August 1978 and one in January 1979;
3. Assess staff members potential for supervisory positions and make recommendations for organizational structure of the Civil Service Agency (CSA);
4. Supervise the second complete cycle of the salary setting system recommendations for the President's review in February, 1979; and

5. Complete the core 100 personnel tests for the Fiscal and Professional employee category.
- C) It is recommended that no further short-term consultants be provided to the project beyond the months of services provided to date. Agreement was reached that the expertise available to the CSA through the long term consultants was sufficient to meet project targets.
- D) A review of participant training indicates that end of project status of 17 MA level graduates working with CSA may not be met. (See Tentative Staffing Pattern Attachment B.) Two participants who have completed training in Sacramento are not on the job; one worked with CSA for a year and departed for the States and one is on informal leave of absence in the States. Return to a CSA position is doubtful in the first case and probable in the second. Additionally, marginal academic performance of a student may result in no degree awarded. To assure an adequate number of professional staff is available to CSA, it is recommended that two additional MA participants be trained. Mr. Augustus Wah-Dorless and Mr. McDonald Reed who have worked with CSA for over one year are the candidates.
- E) Amendment to the AID contract with the California State Personnel Board should be executed to reflect the above recommendations. In accordance with the financial analysis contained in Attachment C, the amount programmed for FY1978 will be adequate to cover the costs of the contract extension.
- **
- F) It is recommended that the results of this evaluation be brought to the attention of the President and that his assistance be solicited in two areas:
1. Supporting both CSA and Liberian Institute of Public Administration in attempts to retain trained professional staff by providing salary and position for MA degree personnel equivalent to other GOL Ministries and Agencies.
 2. Adherence to Civil Service regulations by discouraging Presidential commissions for individuals who do not meet established job requirements.
- G) The PROP should be amended to reflect the six month project extension and the above adjustments to project inputs. The revised Project Logical Framework (Attachment A) should also be incorporated into the PROP. Life of project contributions by AID will not exceed the \$1,856,000 that was programmed.
- H) It is recommended that an internal indepth evaluation be conducted in January, 1979 prior to the departure of the remaining two contract team members. The evaluation will focus on end of project status.

** These matters were already presented to the President by the Director-General of the Civil Service Agency week of January 9.

III Status of Actions Recommended by the Last Evaluation.

The 1976 evaluation report contained a series of eight issues and recommended actions as a result of the review. Status of each item is as follows:

1. Cooperation of GOL Ministries with Civil Service Agency Directives. Attachment D, letter dated November 23, 1977 from the Director-General of the Civil Service to the USAID Director outlines the situation. Bureau of the Budget has now resolved the issue of allocation of funds to each Ministry's budget to allow compliance with the approved salary schedules for Clerical personnel. Secondly, although there has been a delay of five months, approximately 50% of the GOL Ministries and Agencies (11 of 21 major areas) have now submitted the required Personnel Action Notifications (PAN) for clerical personnel to the CSA and all are expected by the end of February, 1978.
2. Presidential Commissions. Although commissions for appointments to positions in the Civil Service have not ceased entirely, the frequency has been significantly decreased. Over the past six months there has been only one case of a commission given to a person who had not complied with the CSA testing and placement procedures. Nevertheless, the Director-General believes that the issue continues as a matter of principle (albeit no longer magnitude) and the matter should be brought to the attention of the Executive Mansion.
3. Fringe Benefit Program. Effective July 1, 1977, fringe benefits were discontinued as a separate form of compensation and the salary of each position was increased by a corresponding amount. Thus, the objective of basing benefits on duties and responsibilities has been achieved since that is the basis on which salaries are set by CSA.
4. Vehicles. In November, 1977, the CSA received four new vehicles to replace those that had worn out. Funds for an additional two vehicles are included in the FY1977/78 budget. With this increased mobility, CSA personnel are able to maintain more regular contact with Ministry personnel responsible for submitting PANs, to respond to Ministry inquiries, and to administer Civil Service tests in the counties.

5. Civil Service Staff Development.

As planned, the advisory team prepared a timetable for the Civil Service Agency staff assumption of responsibility for operation and maintenance of programs. The timetable appears as Annex E to the contractor's Quarterly Report No. Q-10. The delays encountered in approval and implementation of the several classification and pay plans (see Summary of Project Status in Section IV) has had an impact on the timetable. A discussion of staff development appears in Section V below.

6. Modification of the Logical Framework.

The changes in the framework, essentially minor input adjustments and a restatement of outputs were made in January 1977 and the revised logframe was submitted as an attachment to the 1976 evaluation. The new logframe (Attachment A) will be included as a PROP amendment.

7. Budget Analysis.

Suggested adjustments to the California State Personnel Board Contract were accomplished in early 1977. The current recommendation for an increase in long-term advisors elimination of any further short-term consultants, and the addition of 2 MA degree participants will require further line item adjustments in the contract when FY1978 funds are added.

8. AID/L Support of Contract Team.

According to the Chief of Party there are no aspects of the area that are current problems. USAID/L made representations to AID/W on behalf of all contract employees with respect to housing support.

IV Review of Project Outputs.

Summary

The project logical framework revision of January, 1977 divided outputs into eight categories which are addressed below: The Summary of Project Status Table, Attachment E, is a graphic presentation of the narrative.

OUTPUTS #1 & 3 Position Classification and Pay Plans.

The project implementation plan divided civil service positions into four categories and scheduled activities accordingly: clerical, administrative, fiscal and professional, and general.

(The clerical classification, pay plan, and Civil Service rules were approved by the President in August 1976 with full implementation expected by July 31, 1977. On November 17, 1977 USAID sent a letter of inquiry to the Director-General of the CSA with regard to delays in implementation. The November 23 reply (both letters appear as Attachment D) indicates the positive steps

taken to proceed with implementation. Bureau of the Budget has now resolved the longstanding issue of the appropriate means of allocating funds to the Ministries to install the new clerical pay plans. In addition, a vigorous effort is being mounted by the CSA staff to have all Ministries and Agencies submit the required Personnel Action Notifications (PAN) by the end of December. While all Ministries and Agencies have submitted PANs to the CSA for all clerical personnel changes (i.e. transfers, separations, appointments, salary changes) the PANs reflecting changes in salary and position structure have lagged behind schedule by almost 5 months. p 6

The administrative classification and pay plans were approved by the President in August, 1977 approximately four months behind schedule and a month past the critical date. The delay was not in the Executive Mansion but rather related to the cumbersome process of appointment of a Review Committee, subsequent review meetings and report presentation and recommendations for the President. While the clerical plan approval process took 6 months the administrative plan absorbed a full 8 months. Implementation is now in process with anticipated completion by March, 1978. The delay is not judged detrimental to meeting end of project targets. However, similar extensive delays in approval of the two remaining categories will create confusion in implementing the two plans simultaneously.

The evaluation team explored possibilities for condensing the Executive review and approval process with no success. Rather than curtail implementation, it is recommended that the Director-General's request for a six month extension of two members of the contract team be approved. At least the first three months of the extension will be applied to the installation of the classification and pay plan for fiscal/professional and general employee categories.

The development of the fiscal and professional classification and pay plans has been completed and the plans will be forwarded to the President prior to the end of December, 1977 at which point attention can be focused on the general classification and pay plans which should be forwarded to the President by April, 1978, albeit six months behind schedule.

CUFFUT #8 Appeals Board

In conjunction with the classification and pay plans, a Civil Service Appeals Board was planned to hear and pass judgement on civil servants' grievances. Although the critical date for Presidential appointment of the Board members was met in July 1977, a chairman was not immediately selected. The Board's first meeting was scheduled for December 2, 1977 so no feedback from this initial organizational meeting is yet available. It is anticipated that the CSA will function as staff to the Board members in examination of cases brought before the Board. CSA will also be responsible for publicizing the Board's existence and its operating principles.

OUTPUT #4 Salary Setting System

The President agreed that all salary increase proposals for civil servants be directed to the Civil Service Agency (CSA) for analysis and recommendations before final decisions are made, and he also approved the committee proposal that annual salary increase recommendations be made by the CSA. A proposed executive order to implement the former decision was sent to the President in July 1977 and subsequently approved. Recommendations are to be submitted to the President in February each year. The CSA staff has completed the salary survey for the current year and is on schedule in preparation of the first annual report due in February, 1978 which will theoretically determine FY1979 salary levels.

OUTPUT #2 Personnel Testing System

Civil Service tests for clerical and administrative positions, which have been in development and use since 1975, continued to be administered during the review period. All clerical tests are completed and an estimated 90% of the development works on the administrative tests is completed. In addition to Monrovia, tests were administered at all county seats of government at least once each year - in Voinjama, Zwedru, Bomi Hills, Robertsport, Buchanan, Saniquellie, Harper, Greenville and Gbarnga. A total of 1,853 tests, mainly clerical and administrative, were administered (35% eligibility resulted) during the period January, 1977 through September 30, 1977. At the end of March 1977 testing for Clerk I, Clerk II, and File Clerk was closed to non-government employees because more than 600 individuals had passed the examinations. All ministries have been instructed to hire from this pool of qualified eligibles.

Tests for the fiscal and professional occupational family are under development with a goal of core tests for every entry level clerical and administrative class. Quantitatively, this would be about 75 tests completed by October, 1978. 27 tests have been developed and administered to date. An additional 15 tests including a few replacement tests, are ready for use.

OUTPUT #5 Roster and Transaction System

Of the estimated 20,000-22,000 GOI Civil Servants, a total of 13,568 (65%) are now included in the roster maintained by the CSA. Additions to the roster normally come from three sources of information: Personnel Action Notice (PAN) filed when an individual's status changes; personnel lists submitted by Ministries and Agencies prior to implementation of the classification and pay plans; and documentation associated with the approval process by Bureau of the Budget at the time of implementation. The ongoing process is aimed at listing 90% of the civil servants by the beginning of 1979 including fiscal, professional, and general category employees.

OUTPUT #6 CSA Policy and Procedure Manual

As of December, 1977, a total of 25 sections of the CSA manual have been completed out of an anticipated 41 over life of project. Assignments have been made to the CSA staff members for the remaining sections. Estimated completion date is December, 1978.

OUTPUT #7 Training of CSA Staff and GOL Ministries and Agencies**(A) CSA Staff**

Under the technical services contract with the California State Personnel Board, 17 CSA staff members have completed or are currently enrolled in a Master's degree program at the University of California at Sacramento.

The performance record and rate of return of participants has been reasonable and selection procedures for the second group of participants resulted in higher quality candidates. In reviewing the "dropouts" both during and after the MA program the poor performance and/or retention rate among women staff members is evident. Of the 19 individuals selected, 5 (26%) have been women who were selected on the bases of academic records, work experience and career plans. The two women included in the first group both dropped out prior to completion of the MA program: one married and quit the program after two months while the other's academic record after one year was too poor to allow her to continue. Two replacement candidates were selected.

Two women have successfully completed the MA programs but are not currently working at CSA. Ms. Hall returned to Liberia to work with CSA for one year. Although her September, 1977 request for leave of absence was not granted she discontinued work. Dr. Mitchell has written Ms. Hall in the U.S. reminding her of her obligation to CSA with no results. Ms. Rhodes was granted her MA in August, 1977 but remained in the States on an informal leave of absence with a sick parent. Her return to CSA is expected. The fifth woman, Ms. Fredricks, is enrolled in her second year at Sacramento. Her poor academic performance in not maintaining a 2.0 average may result in her termination.

To insure the full complement of MA level staff and in view of the proposed staff increase of 2 professional positions (See Section V below) it is recommended that 2 additional MA participants be funded by AID. Mr. Augustus Weh-Dorlese and Mr. McDonald Reed, who have proven their potential over the past year of CSA employment, are the candidates. Sufficient funds have been programmed in FY78 for this purpose and the contract backstop officer is exploring the possibility of enrollment in January, 1978,.

On-the-job training continues. As of January, 1978 ten of the participants will be at work with CSA with another 4 due to return in August and one in January, 1979. While the academic training imparts management and administrative skills required by CSA staff, the on-the-job training by the contract staff is essential to produce a functioning agency. Since full implementation of the classification and pay plans will probably occupy the advisors' time through October, 1978, it is recommended that the advisors remain-through February, 1979 to complete in-service training of returned participants.

(B) GOL Ministries and Agencies

In conjunction with the installation of the classification and pay plans, the CSA staff conducts training sessions for the Ministry Personnel, Officers and Personnel Clerks. A one day session was held during December 1976 and January 1977 in which individuals from GOL Ministries and Agencies participated. A second training session is scheduled for July 1978. These initial training period provide a basic knowledge which is supplemented through regular contacts by CSA staff. The fairly new vehicles acquired by the CSA in November 1977 have provided increased staff mobility for prompt response to Ministry inquiries.

Unplanned Outputs CSA Services Provided to GOL and other Agencies

In addition to the above outputs during the review period, the CSA has provided, on request, a variety of services to GOL Agencies, the Executive Mansion, and the African Development Bank:

- (1) At the request of the Deputy Minister of Finance, the CSA made recommendations on the functions and organizational placement of a proposed new Office of Financial Planning and Analysis in the Ministry. Recommendations were also made for the classification, salary and recruitment of staff for the new Office.
- (2) At the request of the Director of the National Police Force, the Civil Service Agency agreed to prepare an entry level law enforcement aptitude test and tests for Patrolmen and officers through the rank of Captain. Fifty policemen from Patrolman through Captain were interviewed and a tentative examination plan was developed and approved. Since September, 1977 the National Police Force has sent patrolmen candidates to CSA for testing. Those who pass are hired. About 400 people have been tested to date. A consultant from the National Police Force prepared approximately 60 questions for use in technical subject-matter areas. Work on this project was coordinated with IPA, which was requested by the National Police Force to help prepare a job-related training program.
- (3) At the Director-General's request, the advisory team developed a proposal for Government-sponsored group life, accidental death and medical insurance for Government employees. The cabinet Committee assigned by the President to review the CSA proposal recommended rejection on the grounds that it would overlap with the Social Security Program scheduled to begin in September 1977.
- (4) CSA provided recruitment services for the African

Development Bank (fourteen applicants) and the Ministry of Finance (seven applicants). Recruitment programs were initiated on behalf of the Director of Transportation, Maintenance and Procurement in the Ministry of Health and Social Welfare and for Executive Secretaries and Administrative Officers.

V. End of Project Status (EOPS)

The evaluation focused on one important aspect of the CSD project at the project purpose level, that of staff development. In order for the CSA professional staff to assume full responsibility after the contract advisors depart there must be assurance of adequate number of individuals, of proper training offered, and of the ability of the CSA to retain the staff.

(A) Staff Size and Composition

The staffing for CSM as projected in 1975-78 FY anticipated a total of 17 professional positions distributed functionally as follows:

Management - (1) Assistant Director-General	1
Administration Division - (1) Director	1
Examination Division - (1) Director	
(1) Assistant Director	6
(4) Analyst	
Position Classification (1) Director	
& Salary Scale Division (1) Assistant Director	7
(5) Analyst	
Records & Research Divi (1) Analyst	2
(1) Director	17

Since that time there has been some reordering of the organization as shown in Attachment B. In addition, based on the experience of the past two years there has developed a recognition that the professional staff in the Examination Division and the Position Classification and Salary Scale Division each should be augmented by one position. In the Examination Division, it has become apparent that added professional staff will be needed for Test Development work. The current expectation that upwards of 100 examinations will need to be created for the Fiscal and Professional Classifications represents a significantly greater workload of both test construction and test maintenance activities.

In addition to writing new examinations, the staff in the Test Development Unit will be responsible for on-going analyses and revision of all examinations. The nature of this work demands professional skills and background. An additional professional position is justified on that basis.

In the Position Classification and Salary Scale Division, the current development of staff is insufficient to provide the continuing, day-to-day review, advice and assistance to the Ministries and Agencies of the GOL. Currently, each analyst has responsibility for all personnel activities of

four Ministries and Agencies. Because of the time consuming day-to-day demands such processing PAFs, checking eligibilities, helping solve payroll problems, performing job audits, following-up on instructions from the CSA to all ministries, the staff is unable to devote any time to provide advice and assistance to Ministries and Agencies on their personnel Management program responsibilities. Helping the Ministries of the GOI have effective internal personnel processes and controls is an important aspect of creating a modern personnel system. The addition of another professional analyst to the PC and SS staff will reduce the day-to-day workload demands on each analyst and enable him to devote time to the important personnel management activities.

It is recommended that the functional staffing be revised as follows:

Management (1) Assistant Director-General		1
Examination Division	(1) Director	
	(2) Assistant Director	8
	(5) Analyst	
Position Classification and Salary Scale Division	(1) Director	
	(1) Assistant Director	8
	(6) Analyst	
Records and Research Division	(1) Director	2
	(1) Analyst	

 19

- (B) As noted earlier, to insure the full complement of MA level staff it is recommended that two additional MA participants be funded by AID. Studies should begin in January, 1978 if arrangements can be made through the California State Personnel Board to enroll Mr. Wah-Dorless and Mr. Reed at Sacramento. The short lead time may not be adequate.

Since 12 participants are expected to return during FY 1978 (four in August 1978) it is recommended that two contract advisors be extended for on-the-job training and to assist CSA in organizational adjustments and supervisory assignments.

(C)

Staff Retention

The CSA anticipates problems in retaining the MA level professional staff once their two year work commitment is completed. While normal attrition can be tolerated, there is the additional lure of higher salaries offered to MA level staff in several other Government Ministries and Agencies. The CSA, along with LIPA, are currently limited to an annual salary of \$8,100 while the Ministry of Planning and the Ministry of Finance are able to offer \$10,500 per year to an employee with an MA degree. Within the last year, LIPA lost one trained staff member to the Ministry of Finance specifically for the higher salary.

The Director-General has requested that the President eliminate the discrepancies in salary levels for CSA and LIPA to enable the two agencies

to retain their staff. It is recommended that this request be reiterated to President stressing the institutional implications for the two agencies.

ATTACHMENTS

- (A) Revised Project Logical Framework
- (B) Tentative CSA Staffing Pattern
- (C) Financial Analysis Summary
- (D) November 17, 1977 letter from Director Siegel to CSA.
November 23, 1977 response from Director-General of CSA.
- (E) Summary of Project Status, November 1977.

EE CARTER