

Post	USAID/Colombia	No.	Classification	Page	Pages
			UNCLASSIFIED	1 of	7

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY

1. Mission or AID/W Office Name USAID/Colombia			2. Project Number 514-11-690-187		
3. Project Title Educational Technology Unitary Schools					
4. Key project dates (fiscal years)			5. Total U.S. funding life of project		
a. Project Agreement Signed 3-9-76	b. Final Obligation 11-2-76	c. Final input delivered 9-30-78	\$ 452,000		
6. Evaluation number as listed in Eval. Schedule Not scheduled (annual)	7. Period covered by this evaluation From: 6-76 To: 6-77		8. Date of this Evaluation Review 6-9-77		
	Month/year	Month/year	Month/year		
9. Action Decisions Reached at Evaluation Review, including items needing further study (Note--This list does <u>not</u> constitute an action request to AID/W. Use telegrams, airgrams, SPARS, etc., for action)			10. Officer or Unit responsible for follow-up		11. Date action to be completed
1. Amend Pro/Ag to provide for more realistic budget to meet actual project requirements; to provide for the employment of two employees until the MOE can establish the positions on the Civil Service Scale and describe other donor contributions to project.			Project Manager		Oct. 30/77
2. Reduce EOPS No. 3. (Recommendations from five research studies to two.)			Project Manager		Oct. 30/77
3. Suggest an evaluation of GOC Project management, personnel and budget.			MOE/AID		Jan. 18/78

12. Signatures: Cleared by: _____
 Project Officer PO: George McCloskey Mission or AID/W Office Director
 Signature EHRD: DCox *[Signature]* Signature

Typed *Hunter Fitzgerald* Typed *James Megellas*
 Name Hunter Fitzgerald, Chief, EHRD Name James Megellas, Director
 Date _____ Date _____

Post	USAID/Colombia	No.	Classification	Page	Pages
			UNCLASSIFIED	2 of	7

13. SUMMARY - SUMMARIZE IN ABOUT 200 WORDS THE CURRENT PROJECT SITUATION, MENTIONING PROGRESS IN RELATION TO DESIGN, PROSPECTS OF ACHIEVING PURPOSE, MAJOR PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED, ETC.

After one year of implementation, the Unitary School Project (Educational Technology) can be considered successful in improving, unifying, and expanding the Community Unitary School Program in three regions of Colombia and in creating the conditions which will permit the further improvement of the program and its expansion throughout rural Colombia. With assistance from project consultants, the curriculum has been improved and is undergoing constant evaluation and revision; instructional materials for students are 30% completed under a contract with the University of Pamplona; a teachers book to be used as a basic text in the training of Unitary School teachers has been written and 5,000 copies published; supervisors have been trained (16 in Norte de Santander 33 in Cundinamarca, and 16 in Boyacá); teachers trained include 100 in Norte de Santander, 30 in Boyacá and 30 in Cundinamarca; an evaluation design has been completed for all major components of the project; the GOC has initiated action to add two more full time employees to the project-one an overall administrator and the other a project coordinator. This staff increase will enable the GOC to expand the program throughout rural Colombia; an evaluation team of three full time evaluators is analyzing various aspects of the movement.

The success of the pilot efforts has earned enthusiastic support from the highest officials in the MOE. A successful future is foreseen providing administrative and logistical mechanism can be improved.

The project has not gone without serious problems. Both training and the production of student materials have fallen behind anticipated completion dates; however, these problems have not seriously threatened the project. It seems that most of the problems have arisen because of insufficient project personnel to plan, implement, and monitor the various workshops and material production in the three departments and a lack of an administrative organization at the departmental level.

14. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY - DESCRIBE THE METHODS USED FOR THIS EVALUATION, I.E. WAS IT A REGULAR OR SPECIAL EVALUATION? WAS IT IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE EVALUATION PLAN IN THE PP WITH RESPECT TO TIMING, STUDY DESIGN, SCOPE, METHODOLOGY AND ISSUES? WHAT KINDS OF DATA WERE USED AND HOW WERE THEY COLLECTED AND ANALYZED? IDENTIFY AGENCIES AND KEY INDIVIDUALS PARTICIPATING AND CONTRIBUTING.

This is a regular (annual) evaluation required by AIDTO CIRC. A No. -138 dated 5/11/77.
 1. The evaluation was conducted in accordance with the Evaluation Plan of the PP (p. 45). The project log frame also provides for continuous evaluation as does the PPT. The evaluation plan requires review and analysis of various project components including curriculum, student and teacher materials, student, teacher and parent attitudes, and student achievement. Data for evaluation included the use of paper and pencil tests (for student achievement) attitude inventories, and structured interviews. These data were collected and analyzed by a four person evaluation team. The original evaluation design, including the methodology had substantive inputs by consultants Beryl Levinger and Everett Egginton. Other key individuals participating and contributing to this evaluation are the GOC evaluation team of

Clara Victoria de Arboleda, Luz Nelly Vásquez, Angela de Botero, and Rebeca Bernal; AID Contractor Murray Simon, AID evaluator Janice Weber, and AID Project Manager Dan Cox.

15. Documents to be revised to reflect decisions noted page 1 (other side:)

Project Paper (PP) Logical Framework CPI Network Financial Plan

PIO/T PIO/C PIO/P Project Agreement Other

This evaluation brought out ideas for a new project -- a Project Identification Document (PID) will follow

16. EVALUATION FINDINGS ABOUT EXTERNAL FACTORS - IDENTIFY AND DISCUSS MAJOR CHANGES IN PROJECT SETTING WHICH HAVE AN IMPACT ON THE PROJECT. EXAMINE CONTINUING VALIDITY OF ASSUMPTIONS.

There have not been any major changes in the project that have adversely affected the project design and implementation. Examples of some of the minor changes that have influenced the implementation include changes of top level MOE personnel insufficient staff to properly implement the project, and difficulties involved with fiscal procedures. However, these problems have not warranted the need to revise the project assumptions. The most significant external change was the frequent turnover of MOE officials and changes in Governors and Secretaries of Education on the Department level.

17. EVALUATION FINDINGS ABOUT GOAL/SUBGOAL - FOR THE READER'S CONVENIENCE, QUOTE THE APPROVED SECTOR OR OTHER GOAL, (AND SUBGOAL, WHERE RELEVANT) TO WHICH THE PROJECT CONTRIBUTES. THEN DESCRIBE STATUS BY CITING EVIDENCE AVAILABLE TO DATE FROM SPECIFIED INDICATORS AND BY MENTIONING PROGRESS OF OTHER PROJECTS (WHETHER OR NOT U.S.) WHICH CONTRIBUTE TO SAME GOAL. DISCUSS CAUSES -- CAN PROGRESS TOWARD GOAL BE ATTRIBUTED TO PROJECT, WHY SHORTFALLS?

Sector Goal - "To improve the quality and availability of primary education in rural Colombia so that it is more effective in meeting the needs of the rural poor."

Evidence to date from specific indicators toward goal achievement include the following.

1. A curriculum for the Unitary Schools has been drafted and adopted. The curriculum is undergoing constant evaluation and revision where needed. A salient feature of the curriculum is its flexibility in being adaptable to local situations.

Post	USAID/Colombia	No.	Classification	Page	Pages
			UNCLASSIFIED	4 of	7

2. Teacher training textbook has been written and published (5,000 copies).

This book will be used to train all prospective Unitary School teachers and in-service teachers who will be converted from the traditional to the Unitary School System.

3. The preparation of student materials (contracted to the University of Pamplona) is behind schedule but the quality of work is good. The University has completed about 90% of the lessons in mathematics, 90% of the language lessons, 75% of the natural science lessons, and 75% of the social studies lessons. A variety of problems, most attributable to the Pamplona's great distance from Bogotá resulted in this project component falling behind schedule. However, the Contract is presently being amended and will extend the contract completion date to August 31, 1977.

4. The training of teachers and supervisors is also behind schedule. However one of the three departments has trained its target of 100 teachers while the other two have trained 30 teachers each. The latter two reductions were made at the request of the respective department education officials. The lack of sound administrative units at the departmental levels also has impeded progress.

5. The project component which provides for a reference library in each Unitary School, is moving well. Selections have been made (100 books), prices have been negotiated, and purchases are presently being made. Distribution will be forthcoming upon completion of the purchases and preparation for shipment completed. Follow-up workshops on Library utilization will accompany the distribution of the books.

6. As noted above, the MOE has recently initiated necessary action to add two more full time persons to the Unitary School staff. One will be an overall administrator and the other will be a coordinator. This move is part of the preparations by the MOE to expand the project to other departments.

13. EVALUATION FINDINGS ABOUT PURPOSE - QUOTE THE APPROVED PROJECT PURPOSE. CITE PROGRESS TOWARD EACH END-OF-PROJECT STATUS (EOPS) CONDITION. WHEN CAN ACHIEVEMENT BE EXPECTED? DISCUSS CAUSES OF PROGRESS OR SHORTFALLS.

"To improve, unify and expand the Community Unitary School Program in three regions of Colombia and to create the conditions which will permit the further improvement of the program and its expansion throughout rural Colombia".

1. A complete Unitary School curriculum has been approved and adopted.

2. The preparation of instructional materials for students is approximately 30% complete. A basic teacher training textbook has been written and published. The 100 books to constitute the reference libraries have been selected, purchased and are now being prepared for shipment to each school.

Post	USAID/Colombia	No.	Classification	Page	Pages
			UNCLASSIFIED	5 of	7

3. The training of 65 supervisors and 160 teachers is completed. This fact appears to be at an acceptable status at this point in the project life.

Of the 33 supervisors trained in Cundinamarca, eight were selected to work in the project; in Boyacá - six of the 16 trained were selected; and in Norte de Santander all 16 who were trained all 16 were retained for project work.

4. As noted above, a GOC evaluation team is functioning and the TA provided by the project has been well utilized.

5. Three educational leaders training seminars, with 40 participants each have been conducted.

6. Recommendations from one study on evaluation (Egginton) have been received.

7. Teachers manuals have been written and published. Systematic distribution will be undertaken soon in the three departments where the project is operational. The above status on the EOPS represents acceptable progress although not perfect. The ground swell of interest among the upper echelons of the MOE reflects the overall success of the project. This success is the result of a sound technical concept, proper planning, and dedicated implementors.

8. Budgetary problems are likely to occur if such is not given proper consideration soon enough to meet expansion needs. However, the proposed study to develop an expansion plan should alert the MOE soon enough to make appropriate plans.

19. EVALUATION FINDINGS ABOUT OUTPUTS AND INPUTS - NOTE ANY PARTICULAR SUCCESS OR DIFFICULTIES. COMMENT ON SIGNIFICANT MANAGEMENT EXPERIENCES OF HOST CONTRACTOR, AND DONOR ORGANIZATIONS. DESCRIBE ANY NECESSARY CHANGES IN SCHEDULE OR IN TYPE AND QUANTITY OF RESOURCES OR OUTPUTS NEEDED TO ACHIEVE PROJECT PURPOSE.

On balance, outputs to date have been satisfactory and supportive of Purpose/Goal as planned. There has been some slippage from planned schedules, without endangering planned project completion. We have concluded during the course of the evaluation that the GOC decision to concentrate and intensify activities in three geographic departments should ultimately enhance project impact. This will require some re-statement of outputs. We have also concluded that a restatement of the original budget, within project totals, is in order and essential to fulfill Goal and Purpose. For example, we find that the original amount projected for Technical Assistance is excessive to actual needs, as is the amount for Participant Training. On the other hand, we find that the GOC decision to concentrate on three Departments will necessitate an increase for training-related activities and for locally procured commodities, particularly library materials. The GOC/MOE budgetary process inadvertently failed to include funding for two national-level positions in project administration

and coordination; in view of the need for these two positions, we recommend their temporary incorporation under the Other Cost component. A PP revision to reflect the changed outputs and budget is presently being prepared collaboratively with the GOC/MOE for AID/W approval, following which the necessary Pro/Ag revisions will be executed.

20. EVALUATION FINDINGS ABOUT UNPLANNED EFFECTS - HAS PROJECT HAD ANY UNEXPECTED RESULTS OR IMPACT, SUCH AS CHANGES IN SOCIAL STRUCTURE, ENVIRONMENT, TECHNICAL OR ECONOMIC SITUATION? ARE THESE EFFECTS ADVANTAGEOUS OR NOT? DO THEY REQUIRE ANY CHANGE IN PLANS?

It is premature to assess or to identify any unexpected results or impact as reflected in the social structure, environment, technical or economic situation as a result of this project. However some trends appear to be taking shape such as the influence of the project in pressing the various departmental administrations to provide per diem for the in-service training of teachers - which in Colombia, is an innovation.

21. CHANGES IN DESIGN OR EXECUTION - EXPLAIN THE RATIONALE FOR ANY PROPOSED MODIFICATION IN PROJECT DESIGN OR EXECUTION WHICH NOW APPEAR ADVISABLE AS A RESULT OF THE PRECEDING FINDINGS (ITEMS 16 TO 20 ABOVE) AND WHICH WERE REFLECTED IN ONE OR MORE OF THE ACTION DECISIONS LISTED ON PAGE 1 OR NOTED IN ITEM 15 ON PAGE 2.

See discussion in block 19 for appropriate comments on design and execution.

22. LESSONS LEARNED - WHAT ADVICE CAN YOU GIVE A COLLEAGUE ABOUT DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY-- E.G., HOW TO TACKLE A SIMILAR DEVELOPMENT PROBLEM OR TO MANAGE A SIMILAR PROJECT IN ANOTHER COUNTRY? WHAT CAN BE SUGGESTED FOR FOLLOW-ON IN THIS COUNTRY? SIMILARLY, DO YOU HAVE ANY SUGGESTIONS ABOUT EVALUATION METHCDOLOGY?

1. It is difficult or impossible to determine what influence this project made on the ground swell of official interest because other somewhat similar attempts have been made over the past few years. The design of this project capitalized on some of the mistakes made earlier. However, the Mission believes this project can serve as a model for other third world countries who have similar interests, and similar economic and political characteristics. Aside from this some major considerations for others would include the following.

A. A PR program, stressing that every rural child should have access to a complete primary/elementary school education, is vital.

B. Periodic follow-up in-service programs are a key component. In addition to cognitive skills, follow-up has a powerful human element. It makes teachers believe they are not forgotten.

Post	No.	Classification	Page	Pages
USAID/Colombia		UNCLASSIFIED	7 of	7 -

C. The development and supply of student and teacher materials in quantity for use in the schools is most vital.

D. A work plan, understood by all those involved in implementation, is a key point.

E. An evaluation plan should be a project component and should include parental attitudes, student achievement, curriculum revision, and teacher attitudes.

F. Implementation requires good and enthusiastic leadership. The program should include a good national committee for policy-making a good executive group to act within the policy guidelines.

G. The development of a good cadre of trainers and trainers-of-trainers will make the difference in the expansion of the project within each selected department and to other departments.

H. The administrative processes (bureaucracy) are inefficient. Although it is not within the scope of this project to streamline these processes the project will suffer until this is done.

I. It is very important to have effective and efficient coordination in order to maximize all participatory involvement.

23. SPECIAL COMMENTS OR REMARKS (FOR AID/W PROJECTS, ASSESS LIKELIHOOD THAT RESULTS OF PROJECT WILL BE UTILIZED IN LDC'S).

This project can make a contribution to other LDC's who are interested in developing rural education. It is recommended that officials from interested countries make on-site visits to project activities, interview project officials, and read project materials.