

~~DUPLICATE~~

PAGE 1

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO. 511-11-690-139.4	2. PAR FOR PERIOD: 1/1/75 TO 8/30/76	3. COUNTRY Bolivia	4. PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1976-8
------------------------------------	---	-----------------------	--------------------------------

8. PROJECT TITLE

Title II Voluntary Agency Food Distribution Program

PD-AAA-116-A1

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY 1955 Ends FY 1980	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST RIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR May 19, 1975
---	---------------------	--------------------	-----------------------------------

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: \$30,551 million	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: \$3.73 million	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: \$
------------------	--	--	--

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.
CRS/CARITAS	Vol Ag

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X)			3. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
USAID	RID/W	HCST		
			<p>I. <u>Summary</u></p> <p>During the reporting period the Title II program continued to provide commodities to rural areas, especially for school feeding and maternal child health programs. Also a small portion was provided for Disaster Relief. The inspections that were made, although inadequate in number, indicated that the recipients received the commodities as scheduled, however, weaknesses in the management of the program noted in the last PAR for the most part were not corrected during this period in spite of the vigorous effort of the USAID with the implementing agencies. Project management and the USAID interest in understanding more fully the nutritional impact of the program have been negatively affected by these failures.</p>	

D. REPLANNING REQUIRES

REVISED OR NEW: PROP PIP PRO AG PIC/T PIC/C PIC/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE
 HRDD: Amedee S. Landry *A. Landry* 30/1/76

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE
 John R. Oleson *John R. Oleson* 10/1/76

PROJECT NO. 511-11-690-439.4	SUBMISSION <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ORIGINAL <input type="checkbox"/> REVISION	(Number)	DATE 1/1/75 to 8/30/76	PAGE 1A of _____ PAGES
---------------------------------	--	----------	---------------------------	------------------------

A. ACTION (X) USAID/AID/W HOSE	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
	<p>II. <u>Principal Accomplishments</u></p> <p>A. As recommended in the last PAR, the GOB conducted a number of nutrition surveys. Although these surveys were deficient in many ways and their results were made known to USAID only upon requests for specific information required for the Nutrition Sector Assessment, they are considered to have been a significant accomplishment for the following reasons:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The data gathered in the survey process provided the most significant information on Nutrition in Bolivia since the Inter-departmental Committee on Nutrition for National Defense (ICND) survey of 1962. 2) A number of health personnel in the Ministry of Health have gained important experience in Nutrition Surveys. 3) The data was used by the Ministry of Planning in the preparation of the National Nutrition Plan which, in turn, has generated considerable interest of other donor organizations in assisting the GOB to overcome some of the nutritional deficiencies found in the population. <p>B. After lengthy discussions between USAID, CRS, Caritas and the GOB, the host country contribution to Caritas for the management of the program was increased by 35% and the amount allocated for the purchase of local food commodities tripled.</p> <p>C. With USAID encouragement, another voluntary agency, CARE, which has been inactive in Bolivia for many years, has opened an office in La Paz and is preparing a food assistance program in collaboration with USAID and the Junta de Acción Social.</p> <p>D. Although the number of CRS inspections of school feeding programs and mothers clubs was inadequate, it did increase the number of inspections by 28% over 1975 and therefore cover 48% of the entities presumably benefitting from the program.</p>	

PROJECT NO.

511-11-690-439.4

SUBMISSION

(number)

DATE 1/75

 ORIGINAL REVISION

to 8/30/76

PAGE 1B of

PAGES

A. ACTION (X)

B. LIST OF ACTIONS

C. PROPOSED ACTION
COMPLETION DATE

USAID/AID/W HOST

III. Status of Recommendations made in PAR FY 1975-4

The following is the status of recommendations made on the last PAR:

1. It was recommended that USAID and the GOB determine the feasibility and the capability of the Ministry of Health to conduct nutritional surveys to: a) assess the nutritional impact of the Title II Food Distribution project, and b) provide "conclusive" information to help the GOB formulate an Integrated National Nutrition Plan and its corresponding policies. The Ministry of Health conducted nutrition surveys during the reporting period. Unfortunately, there was no assessment made of the nutritional impact of this project. More importantly, however, the surveys did provide a basis for the development of a National Nutrition Plan and the GOB is presently formulating policies to improve the nutritional deficiencies in large sectors of the Bolivian population.
2. The GOB and USAID in conjunction with CRS/ Caritas, and the Ministries of Finance and Education should have developed an action plan to train teachers in the basics of nutrition in order to extend this education to students throughout Bolivia. A specific plan of action was not developed, however, the National Nutrition Plan contemplates reorganization and strengthening nutrition education programs. Additionally, the Ministry of Education established a nutrition manual during the reporting period which includes food and nutrition education as a part of the Technical Vocational Education System.
3. It was suggested that the Ministries of Health and Education and CRS/Caritas develop a system to determine the effect of school feeding programs on attendance. The system was not developed.
4. The GOB had contributed \$55,000 annually for the purchase of local food commodities. It was recommended that this contribution be increased to \$110,000 in CY 75 and \$220,000 in CY 76. The action was completed for CY 1975 and \$225,000 has been allocated for 1976.
5. This recommendation concerned the preparation and completion of a plan to phase out Title II commodities and phase in locally produced and other commodities to replace this project. During the reporting period a significant increase of Title II commodities

A. ACTION (X) USAID AID/WFOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
	<p>became available. At the same time the World Food program has developed & presented a program for approval to their central office. These factors have temporarily deferred the urgency and therefore the preparation of the phase out plan.</p> <p>6. The pipeline for food shipments has been uneven in prior years causing abnormalities in program operations. As recommended in the last PAR a means was found to stabilize availabilities through the establishment of an in-country reserve amounting to approximately 25% of annual program requirements.</p> <p>7. It was recommended that CRS complete and submit a self audit NTL December 31, 1975. The audit was completed in June 1976, and the report has been submitted to the USAID Controller.</p> <p>8. CRS was requested and in fact has publicized the assistance provided through the Food Distribution Program. The publicity gave proper recognition to the U.S. government contribution.</p> <p>9. This recommendation requested CRS/Caritas to develop a brief plan of action showing how the project would support the MCH activities of the MOH. In lieu thereof, CRS/Caritas prepared and put to use an Operating Manual for the MOH's MCH program. A second manual for the school feeding program and the action plan requested are being prepared.</p> <p>10. CRS was requested to increase its efforts to provide reports in a more timely fashion. Most of the reports required during the year were submitted late, although the lag was decreased and with new and additional personnel USAID expects an improvement for this Fiscal Year.</p> <p>11. A Memorandum of Understanding between the GOB, USAID and CRS was prepared in 1975 to reinforce the implementation of Title II activities. It was recommended that this Memorandum be reviewed and signed NTL 30 April 1975. At present the Memorandum is with the MOH, but USAID believes it will be signed soon.</p> <p>12. It was recommended that CRS/Caritas review the supervisory functions, along with personnel and budgetary requirements. This action was partially completed with the arrival of an additional CRS team member and a review which brought about significant increases in the Caritas funding from the GOB.</p>	

PROJECT NO.

511-11-690-439.4

SUBMISSION

ORIGINAL

REVISION

(Number)

DATE 1/1/75

to 8/30/76

PAGE

1D

of

PAGES

A. ACTION (X)

B. LIST OF ACTIONS

C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE

USAID AID/WFOST

IV. Recommendations for Action

X	X	X	1. CRS/Caritas, USAID and the MOH should analyze the GOB's Five Year Nutrition Plan to determine whether the Food Distribution Program could be designed to better support the GOB's developing Nutrition Program.	December 31, 1976.
X			2. USAID Mission Director or designee should contact the Minister of Health to obtain definitive action on the Memorandum of Understanding.	October 30, 1976.
		X	3. CRS/Caritas should a) prepare and submit to USAID a time phased plan for on site inspections of project activities, and b) submit a monthly follow-up report on inspections made and irregularities uncovered in the inspection process.	a) October 15, 1976. b) NTL 15 days after close of each month.
		X	4. A survey by USAID Food for Peace Office revealed that many schools in the School Lunch Program were not complying with agreed upon conditions. In conjunction with Recommendation 3 above, CRS should evaluate compliance during each inspection, institute remedial measures and report instances of non-compliance to USAID in the follow-up reports cited in 2.b) above.	December 30, 1976.
X			5. USAID should forward to CRS/Caritas another schedule of reports required from CRS/Caritas indicating due dates and reiterating the need for prompt compliance with these reporting requirements.	October 15, 1976.
X			6. USAID should request the Nutrition Division in writing to publish the results of the nutrition surveys conducted with counterpart funds.	October 30, 1976.
		X	7. CRS/Caritas should assure that posters are developed identifying the source of Title II commodities and placed in conspicuous sites where Title II projects exist.	December 30, 1976.
		X	8. Before new school feeding sites are selected for the school feeding program, CRS/Caritas should determine and submit to USAID baseline data on the previous years school attendance and drop out rates. Additionally CRS/Caritas should require data on previous years school attendance and drop out rates from all schools participating in the school feeding program. The program to collect this data should be initiated as soon as possible and continued through the life of the project.	starting Oct.1, 1976 and continuing.

PROJECT NO. 511 -11-690-439.4	SUBMISSION <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ORIGINAL <input type="checkbox"/> REVISION _____	(Number) DATE 1/1/75 to 8/30/76	PAGE 1E of _____ PAGES
----------------------------------	--	------------------------------------	------------------------

A. ACTION (X)		B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
USAID	AID/W HOST		
X	X	<p>9. The GOB contributions for CY 76 and CY 77 should not fall below the \$220,000 level. USAID will continue to make a strong effort to persuade the GOB to continue to increase its contribution. As soon as the outcome of the proposed new World for Food Program is known, USAID and the GOB should determine future contributions as a part of the Phase over plan.</p>	<p>March 1977 and continuing</p>

AID 1020-25 (10-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD:	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
PAGE 2 PAR	511-11-690-439.4	1/1/75 to 8/30/76	Bolivia	FY 1976-8

II. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN							C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X)				
	UNSATISFACTORY		SATISFACTORY			OUT-STANDING		LOW		MEDIUM		HIGH
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
1. C. R. S.			X									X
2.												
3.												

Comment on key factors determining rating

For 6 months during the reporting period, CRS was understaffed by one key person. After several conferences with CRS/Bolivia, USAID requested the intervention of AID/W with CRS/New York to help assure improved project management and more responsiveness from CRS/Bolivia to USAID reporting requirements. CRS failed to submit their program plans AER's, commodity and recipient status reports on time. The later were submitted only after repeated requests. The contractor's relations with host country has been rated negatively because USAID has reason to believe that communications between the CRS staff and both counterpart organizations have been inadequate.

2. PARTICIPANT TRAINING N. A.	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
-------------------------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Comment on key factors determining rating

There are no participants under this program.

3. COMMODITIES	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
----------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Comment on key factors determining rating: PL 480, Title II commodities are the major project inputs although the GOB commodity inputs have increased. During 1975, the USG donated food commodities amounting to 15,357,274 lbs. valued at \$3,582,978. The GOB supplemented this USG contribution with \$110,000 to purchase locally produced non-fat dry milk and corn and soya. It should be noted that the GOB contribution has increased to \$225,000 in CY76. These contributions are considered adequate at present. Timeliness of Procurement and Delivery, rated negatively in the last PAR, have improved significantly. Storage facilities are excellent.

4. COOPERATING COUNTRY	PERSONNEL	C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X)											
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
5. OTHER	CARITAS Nutrition/MOH			X	X								X
	GOB Financing					X							X

Comment on key factors determining rating

Caritas resources increased substantially during the project appraisal period and an overall improvement in their field supervision operations has been experienced in the last few months. We expect this improvement to continue. However, the Caritas counterparts in Nutrition Division of the Ministry of Health are not yet receiving allowances required to be effective in rural areas. Supporting activities such as nutrition and health education and concomitant contributions from communities to promote the purposes of the project declined almost 50% during the reporting period. Funds in the amount of \$150,000 for the purchase of supporting commodities (milk and locally produced corn/soya blend) were provided from both counterpart and funds from GOB regular budget until December 1975. After December 1975 counterpart ceased to be provided but the GOB increased its contribution significantly for CY 1975 and 1976. Finally, the Nutrition Division has not provided nutrition survey data as promised repeatedly.

7. OTHER DONORS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
-----------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

(See Next Page for Comments on Other Donors)

AID 1020-2M(10-70) PAGE 3 PAR	PROJECT NO. 511-11-690-439.4	PAR FOR PERIOD: 1/1/75 to 8/30/76	COUNTRY Bolivia	PAR SERIAL NO. FY 1976-8
----------------------------------	---------------------------------	--------------------------------------	--------------------	-----------------------------

N. 7. Continued: Consists on key features determining rating of Other Donors

The World Food Program has developed and presented a project proposal to their central office which would contribute significantly to achievement of the purposes of this project. Moreover, the proposal was worked out in coordination with USAID to avoid duplications of effort.

80. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					END OF PROJECT	
		CUMU- LATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY 76		FY 77 <small>estimate</small>	FY 78 <small>estimate</small>		
			TO DATE	TO END				
1. Supplementary Feeding: A. Mothers/preschool Age Children (000)	PLANNED	495	100	100	100	100	100 <u>1/</u>	
	ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE	430	88.5					
	REPLANNED			90 <u>2/</u>				
	B. Primary School Children (000)	PLANNED	650	134	134	134	134	134 <u>1/</u>
		ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE	466	168.8				
		REPLANNED			175 <u>2/</u>			
	C. Other Children (includ- ing institutions) (000)	PLANNED	26	10	10	15	15	15 <u>1/</u>
		ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE	18	8.7				
		REPLANNED			10 <u>2/</u>			
2. Education: (000) Number of mothers receiv- ing education on nutrition, health, cooperativism, craftsmanship, etc.	PLANNED	51	24	24	34	34	34 <u>1/</u>	
	ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE	28	15					
	REPLANNED			15 <u>2/</u>				
4. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	COMMENT:							
1.	1/ Yearly number of recipients, Non-add. 2/ Number of recipients reached as of 6/30/76.							
2.	COMMENT:							
3.	COMMENT:							

IL 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					END OF PROJECT
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY 76		FY 77	FY 78	
			TO DATE	TO END			
3. a. Training of Caritas personnel Caritas	PLANNED		40	80	80	80	80 <u>1/</u>
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE		40				
	REPLANNED			40 <u>2/</u>			
b. Training of Ministry of Public Health personnel ND	PLANNED	50	100	100	100	100	100 <u>1/</u>
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	20	35				
	REPLANNED			35 <u>2/</u>			
4. Instruction manuals One on MCH program One on rural School Lunch not prepared.	PLANNED	1	1				2
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	1	0 <u>3/</u>				
	REPLANNED			0	1		
5. Conferences, workshops and meetings at a program implementation level on an annual basis ND	PLANNED		4	4	4		12
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	1	0				
	REPLANNED			0 <u>2/</u>			
B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS 1. Development of a plan to continue the feeding program after phase-out of Title II assistance. 2. Periodic meetings of the Program Coordinating Committee	COMMENT: The need of a phase-down plan for Title II food support no longer exists for other child feeding MCH and Food for Work programs. However, a plan to progressively phase-in increasing GOB and community contributions for the school feeding program will be ready by December 31, 1976.						
	COMMENT: The Title II food program coordinating committee composed of FFP, CRS/Caritas and GOB representatives, has met only three times during FY 1975/6.						
3.	<p><u>1/</u> Same people trained every year.</p> <p><u>2/</u> Caritas and MOH have suspended training until the new training plan has been approved which is expected next month (October, 1976).</p> <p><u>3/</u> The instruction manual for School Feeding is being prepared.</p>						

U. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					END OF PROJECT
		CUMU- LATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY '76		FY '77	FY '78	
			TO DATE	TO END			
6. Nutritional status surveys and Title II program impact evaluations. 1/	PLANNED	-	2	3	3	3	9
	ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE	2	1				
	REPLANNED			1 1/2			
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE						
	REPLANNED						
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE						
	REPLANNED						
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORM- ANCE						
	REPLANNED						
B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	COMMENT:						
1.	1/ Two nutrition studies involving several surveys were con- ducted by the MOH/Nutrition Division in 1975 in the Departments of Santa Cruz and Beni. A third is scheduled to begin in the department of Pando in December 1976. A fourth to study the impact of Title II commodities on						
2.	nutritional status of Title II groups has been conducted in the Cochabamba area. These surveys were deficient and are being replanned.						
3.	COMMENT:						

AID 1820-23 (110-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD:	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
PAGE 4 PAR	511-11-690-439.4	1/1/75 to 8/30/76	Bolivia	FY 1976-8

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purposes as currently envisaged.

2. Same as in PROPPY YES NO

(conditions expected have been modified)

1. Improve the nutritional status of the most vulnerable groups.
 - a) Preschool age children.
 - b) Expecting and lactating mothers.
 - c) Children in institutions.
 - d) Primary school age children.
2. Establish in the country the necessary institutional capacity to effectively carry out this nutritional activity after the termination of the PL 480 Title II food assistance.

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.

2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.

1. The GOB, Caritas and participating communities will be technically capable of organizing and implementing food distribution and nutrition education programs.

1. a. The GOB has increased its staff in the food distribution program from 42 to 52 employees including nutritionists, administrative personnel and assistants during the reporting period and has requested funds to employ 20 new employees during CY 1977.

b. Up to this date the Department of Nutrition has organized 442 Mothers Clubs throughout Bolivia, 2398 rural schools and 114 orphanages to participate in the food distribution program. Caritas has organized 185 mothers clubs and works with the GOB in the food distribution process.

c. The GOB 5 year Nutrition Plan includes a section on the development of a curricula of nutrition education which when implemented would provide nutrition education throughout the school system. Otherwise progress toward completion of this condition has faltered somewhat during this evaluation period.

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal (Sector Goal)

To raise the health standard of the Bolivian population, especially of children of primary and pre-school age, and expecting and lactating mothers in selected areas; who are participating in the program.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose contribute significantly toward the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national needs of this evidence.

Yes, the program is presently providing nutrition/health education to about 20,000 mothers plus supplementary fortified foods to about 140,000 primary school children and children in orphanages as well as to 100,000 expecting, lactating mothers and pre-school age children. As the food provided through the program has a high nutritional value, it is assumed that the feeding program, combined with the nutrition/health education activity, contributes to improving the health standard of the target group. The exact extent of the program's nutritional impact, however, is not known at this time. It is expected that the nutrition study recommended in Section I of this PAR will provide more definitive information on the actual project's contribution towards the goal. This study is now being carried out by the Nutrition Division and will be available in December 1976.

PROJECT NO. 511-11-690-439.4	SUBMISSION <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ORIGINAL <input type="checkbox"/> REVISION _____	(Number)	DATE 1/1/75 to 8/30/76	PAGE 4A of _____ PAGES
---------------------------------	--	----------	---------------------------	------------------------

B.1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved. 2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.

2. A food distribution program efficiently operating without foreign assistance providing highly nutritious foods and nutrition education to 100,000 expecting/lactating mothers, and, pre-school age children, 134,000 primary school children and 15,000 children institutions by 1988. 1/

3. A reduction of the present mal-nutrition rate of 48% among pre-school age children to about 25% by 1988.

2. Evidence at this point is slight (on hand in USAID), however, the Ministry of Health reports indicate that a modest percentage of mothers' clubs are now capable of purchasing at subsidized prices locally produced or internationally supplied food commodities for their own use, and the GOB has increased the amount authorized for the purchase of locally produced food commodities for distribution programs by over 100% in the last two years.

3. A limited number of nutrition surveys have been conducted by the MOH. The surveys were deficient and in many cases results have not been made available.

1/ GOB has indicated its inability to achieve this EOPS by 1981 at which time this program has been scheduled to conclude. Accordingly it has sought other donor assistance through 1988.