Food Inspection Working Group
Activities

Prof. Ibrahim Roushdy, Cameron Smoak
TAPRII Consultants

FSAE Workshop: Ein Sukhna, January 30 – February 1, 2008
Presentation Outline

- Inspection Working Group Action Plan Follow-up
- Current Food Inspection System Of Egypt
- Preliminary Gap Analysis
- Future Developmental Activities
Inspection Working Group
Action Plan Follow-up
## INSPECTION WORKING GROUP ACTION PLAN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Activities</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interview small sample of managers at small and large retail outlets and food processing plants, in Cairo about how they perceive the government’s current food safety program and solicit their suggestions as to what improvements need to be made.</td>
<td>Nov. 11-15, 2007</td>
<td>Done</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Planned Activities | Timeline | Follow-up
--- | --- | ---
Collect information about food establishments in Egypt (type, geographic location, size, etc) to facilitate workload planning for the new agency. | Nov. 18-29, 2007 | Done [but hard to have data on informal sector and small establishments]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Planned Activities</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Review previous reports on international best practices – and if necessary collect further information – in the area of food inspection, including food inspection at the border versus in domestic market, job descriptions for food inspectors, standard operating procedures, qualifications, training, regulations, etc.</td>
<td>Dec. 3-14, 2007</td>
<td>Done</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned Activities</td>
<td>Timeline</td>
<td>Follow-up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Producing a report detailing a field inspection structure and method of operation including recommendations as to how the FSAE will implement a start-up program for hiring, training and takeover of inspectional duties of designated food safety responsibilities.</td>
<td>March 2- 13, 2008</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CURRENT FOOD INSPECTION SYSTEM OF EGYPT
The Ministries and Agencies charged with food inspection responsibilities include:

- Ministry of Health and Population (MOHP)
  - General Department for Food Control

- Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (MALR)
  - General Authority for Veterinary Services
  - Central Administration for Plant Quarantine

- Ministry of Trade and Industry (MTI)
  - General Organization for Export and Import Control (GOEIC)
  - Industrial Control Authority

- Ministry of Social Consolidating (former Supply and Home Trade)
  - Control and Distribution Sector: Control and Supply Department

- Ministry of the Interior
  - Supply Investigation Police

- Ministry Of Electricity
  - Atomic Energy Agency
PRELIMINARY GAP ANALYSIS STUDY
GAPs identified in key inspection areas are as follows:

- Egyptian Food Safety Law
- Inspector Qualifications
- Inspector Training
- Number of Inspectors
- Inspectional Responsibility
- Standard Operating Procedures
- Data Management System
Laws

- **Current**
  - About 58 laws and decrees that give the various Ministries their authority to perform certain aspects of the current food safety system

- **Proposal**
  - Is to have one comprehensive food safety law, all inclusive, for all aspects of food safety except those assigned to the Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation. All food safety regulatory responsibility, including imports and exports of human foods, would be the responsibility of one new Agency

- **GAP(s)**
  - Existing food laws are not based upon risk assessment; they do not include the obligation of food companies to apply principals such as HACCP, GMP, GAP, etc. nor do they all conform to the latest internationally recognized standards.
  - The lack of clear concise laws makes the work of the field inspector much harder than it should be
Inspector Qualifications

• Current
  – Minister of Trade and Industry (Industry Control Authority): B. Sc. Of Agriculture (Food Science/Dairy Science)
  – Minister of Trade and Industry (General Organization for Exports and Import Control) B. Sc. Of Agriculture; B. Sc. Of Veterinary Medicine; B. Sc. Of Science; Post Graduate Studies (Master or Ph. D.)
  – Minister of Health and Population: Health Technical Institute (two years following the general secondary school stage)
  – Minister of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (General Authority for Veterinary Services): B. Sc. Of Veterinary Medicine

• Proposal
  – **Minimum Qualifications**: Bachelor Degree in Agriculture (Food Science/Dairy Science) or Veterinary Medicine (Food Hygiene/food control).
  – **Preferred Qualifications**: Working knowledge of Windows computer operating system and applications.
Inspector Qualifications (cont’d)

• GAP(s)
  – The education requirements vary between the Ministries at the present time. The educational requirements for inspectors, mostly those in MOHP, are under the required level.
Inspector Training

• Current
  – MTI (ICA): Annual or semiannual training for the examiner or inspector based on a training plan prepared by those in charge of training in the Organization in order to meet the different training requirements.
  – MTI (GOEIC): The Authority conducts training courses throughout the year for those working in the Authority in the area of visual examination and sampling.
  – MOHP: There is a budget provided by the Ministry amounting to 100 thousand Egyptian pounds allocated for training annually for a number of governorates starting from the health controller in the rural units as well as the health offices, departments and directorates.
  – MALR: No training data available
Inspector Training

• Proposal
  – Training of Trainers: food law, regulations, agency policies, and code of ethics, electronic inspection system, and sampling procedures
  – Initial training: food law, regulations, agency policies, and code of ethics, electronic inspection system, and sampling procedures.
  – After initial startup: SOPs
  – Advanced food related training courses: low acid canned foods, food processing and distribution, acidified foods, juice, HACCP and many other topics that would constitute continuing education.
  – Update courses
Inspector Training

- GAP(s)
  - A major key to having a well respected contingent of inspectors is the amount and quality of their training. The basic qualifications are very important as a start, but continued training will keep the inspector abreast of modern methods in a highly technical profession.
Number of Inspectors per Ministry

• Current
  – MTI (ICA): 43
  – MTI (GOEIC): 241
  – MOHP: 1373 food inspectors/3554 health inspectors
  – MALR (GOVS): 194

• Proposal
  – An exact number of inspectors required to carry out the inspectional responsibilities of a single food agency can not be determined at this time.

  – A team of highly qualified, well trained and well equipped inspectors, with clearly defined procedures, will be able to operate independently in most cases. The independent operation of an inspector in the majority of cases will eliminate duplication of effort and allow for a greater number of inspections to be completed by each inspector.
Number of Inspectors per Ministry (cont’d)

• GAP(s)
  – The number of inspectors within the current system is very large while the number of inspectors under a new system as proposed can be drastically less. Decreasing the overall number of inspectors will be a start for better utilization of resources for the benefit of all stakeholders. Saved resources can be diverted to better pay for inspectors, better equipment, and a better data management system means better respect for the food safety program as a whole.
Inspection Responsibilities

**Current**

The current system for food safety is divided between five public sector organizations.

- **MTI (ICA):**
  - Food Processing Facilities
  - Product sampling

- **MTI (GOEIC):**
  - Exported and Imported Food Products (visual examination and sampling)

- **MOHP:**
  - Food establishments (processing facilities and retail markets)
  - Product sampling

- **MALR (GOVS):**
  - Animal Farms, Slaughterhouses, Meat Industries, Retail activities related to meat products
  - Product sampling
Inspection Responsibilities (cont’d)

• Proposal
  – One single food safety agency should have the regulatory authority and responsibility for the safety of all food imported for human consumption, and for domestic food at all stages of its production for human consumption.
Inspection Responsibilities (cont’d)

- GAP(s)
  - The structure of food safety was organized within the model “multiple bodies system” and there is no identified policies and strategic plan of food safety documentation.
  - Areas of responsibility are not clearly defined and the methods of operations of the Ministries under the current system seem to be more subjective than risk based.
  - Food inspection activities focus mainly on end-product testing and are mainly reactive and not preventive.
Product Sampling Procedures

• Current
  – Many Ministries/Agencies involved in the sampling process for imported, exported and domestic food products.
  – Sampling standard Operating Procedures can not be verified
  – Sampling handling, storage facilities are not adequate.

• Proposal
  – All sampling whether for imports, exports or domestic should be based on a risk assessment system.
  – GOE agencies should not require prior certification of tests if they are going to conduct the same test at the border.
  – Retail outlets and factories should be sampled by one agency
  – The practice of warehouse testing of product already inspected should be discontinued
Product Sampling Procedures (cont’d)

- GAP(s)
  - The existence of written inspection procedures could not be verified.
  - Areas of responsibility are not clearly defined and the methods of operations of the Ministries under the current system seem to be more subjective than risk based.
Data Management

• Current
  – No indication was found that any of inspection records were transferred to an electronic data base (except for GOIEC).
Data Management (cont’d)

• Proposal
  – A comprehensive fully electronic data management system can provide real time information to FSAE management, the consuming public and the import/export community.
Data Management (cont’d)

• GAP(s)
  – Lack of an updated centralized data collection and management system.
  – The current information system does not allow for the sharing of data between the different Ministries that have food safety duties.
  – Even within each Ministry, data is difficult to retrieve and use for management and/or audit purposes.
  – Inspection data is not readily available to assist management in work load planning which would help better control budgeted resources.
  – Inspection data is not readily available for issuing meaningful ‘free trade certificates’ to facilitate expedited export shipments.
Future Developmental Activities
Future Developmental Activities

• Producing a report detailing a field inspection structure and method of operations
JOB QUALIFICATIONS

• **Minimum Qualifications:**
  – Completion of a Bachelor's degree in Agriculture (Food Science/Dairy Science) or Veterinary Medicine (Food Hygiene/food control).

• **Preferred Qualifications:**
  – *Preference will be given to applicants, who, in addition to meeting the Minimum Qualifications, possess knowledge, skills and abilities in the following areas:* Working knowledge of Windows computer operating system and applications.
FOOD INSPECTION PROCEDURES MANUAL

• 1. Food Inspection
  • 1.1 Inspection Objectives
  • 1.2 Fields of Specialization of the Food Inspectors
  • 1.3 Food Inspection Activities
    • 1.3.1 Administrative Impoundment
    • 1.3.2 Judicial Impoundment Activities
  • 1.4 Capabilities that should be Available in the Inspection Team
2. Policies and Planning

2.1 Policies

2.1.1 Encouraging Establishments to Achieve Voluntary Compliance

2.1.2 Adopting Announced/Unannounced Principle

2.1.3 Responsibility of the Inspectorate Towards Corrective Actions

2.1.4 Respecting Facilities Rights
FOOD INSPECTION PROCEDURES MANUAL (cont’d)

• 2.2 Planning
• 2.2.1 Criteria for Identifying Plan Priorities
• 2.2.2 Identify Financial Resources
• 2.2.3 Building Inspectors Capacity
• 2.2.4 Evaluating Inspectorate Performance Efficiency
3. Inspection Activities

3.1 The Comprehensive (Periodic) Inspection

3.2 Specific Inspection
   - 3.2.1 Follow-up Inspection for the Violating Facilities
   - 3.2.2 Inspection in Response to Complaints
   - 3.2.3 Inspection Campaigns
4. Stages of Food Inspection
   4.1 Pre-Inspection Stage
   4.1.1 Tasks of Inspectorate
   4.1.2 Tasks of the Inspectors
   4.2 The Field Inspection Stage
   4.2.1 Tasks of the Inspectorate
   4.2.2 Tasks of the Inspector (s)
   4.3 Post Field Inspection Stage
   4.3.1 Tasks of the Inspectorate
   4.3.2 Tasks of the Inspectors
Annexes (examples)

- Annex A Violations of Food Establishments to the Food Law and its Penalties
- Annex B Forms of Food Inspection Activities
RETAIL FOOD INSPECTION GUIDE

- Introduction
- Common Terminology
- Understanding the Food Official Inspection Report
- How Violations are identified
- Appendices:
  - Food Official Inspection Report
THANK YOU!