JOINT EVALUATION OF EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT OF THE ENABLING DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF THE WORLD FOOD PROGRAMME (WFP)

PAKISTAN COUNTRY STUDY

VOLUME 1

DECEMBER 2004

This report can be downloaded at the following website:

www.edpevaluation.com

The evaluation has been carried out by a consortium composed by DRN, ADE, Baastel, ECO Consulting Group and NCG. Responsibility for the contents and presentation of findings and recommendations rests with the authors. The views expressed in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the official position of the sponsoring agencies: Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA); Danish International Development Assistance (DANIDA), Royal Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs; Department of International Development Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Finland; Directorate General for International Cooperation and Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, France; Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Germany (BMZ); Directorate General for Development Cooperation (DGCS), Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Italy; United States Agency for International Development (USAID).

Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development

German Development Policy

Canadian International Development Agency

Agence canadienne de développement international

Ministry of Foreign Affairs Danida

Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland

Liberté • Égalité • Fraternité
République Française

Cooperazione Italiana allo Sviluppo

USAID FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

JOINT EVALUATION OF EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACT OF THE ENABLING DEVELOPMENT POLICY OF THE WFP

PAKISTAN COUNTRY STUDY

Development Researchers' Network (Italy)

Aide à la Décision Economique (Belgium)

Groupe-conseil Baastel ltée (Canada)

Eco Consulting Group (Germany)

Nordic Consulting Group (Denmark)

VOLUME I:

MAIN TEXT

VOLUME II: (on CD Rom)

ANNEXES:

1 – Work plan

2 – List of sites/projects visited, main characteristics of regions visited and maps of WFP activities

3 – Field findings

4 – List of persons met

5 – References

The evaluation has been carried out by a consortium of DRN, ADE, Baastel, ECO and NCG
c/o DRN, leading company:

DRN srl
Via Ippolito Nievo 62
00153 Rome, Italy
Tel +39-06-581-6074
Fax +39-06-581-6390
mail@drn-network.com

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report was prepared during the months of May – June 2004 by the Pakistan Country Team, composed by: Anna Martella, Zia Niazi, Gerli Lantzberg, and Muhammad Hussain Bhatti. The Team would like to thank in particular the WFP Pakistan Country Office for the assistance provided throughout the mission, the efficient organisation of the field visits and of several meetings, and the prompt availability of the necessary background documents and data.

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AJK	Ashak Jammu & Kashmir
AUSAID	Australian Agency for International Development
BCM	Beneficiaries Contact Monitoring
PBM	Pakistan Bait ul-Maal
CARW	Creating Assets for Rural Women
CBA	Cost-Benefit Analysis
CBO	Community Based-Organisation
CCA	Common Country Assessment
CIA	Central Intelligence Service
CO	Country Office (WFP)
COs	Community Organisations
CP	Country Programme (WFP)
CSA	Central Statistic Authority
CSO	Country Strategy Outlines (WFP)
CSP	Country Strategy Programme (WFP)
DFID	Department for International Development
DOC	Direct Operational Costs (WFP)
DSC	Direct Support Costs (WFP)
EAD	Economic Affairs Division
EB	Executive Board (WFP)
EC	European Commission
ECW	Enhanced Commitments to Women Policy (WFP)
EDP	Enabling Development Policy (WFP)
EGS	Employment Generation Scheme
EMOP	Emergency Operation (WFP)
EQ	Evaluation Question
EPI	Extended Programme of Immunization
ESR	Education Sector Reform
EU	European Union
ESDP	Education Sector Development Programme
FAAD	Food Aid and Development
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FFT	Food For Training
FFW	Food for Work
FO	Field Officer
FS	Food Stamp
FSP	Food Security Programme
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNP	Gross National Product
GoP	Government of Pakistan
HH	Household
HQ	Headquarters
ICT	Information & Communications Technology Division (WFP)
ICTI	Information & Knowledge Management Branch, ICT (WFP)
ILM	Integrated Land Management Programme
IP	Implementing Partner
ISC	Indirect Support Costs (WFP)

ISI	Inter Service Intelligence
LGRD	Local Government & Rural Development
LHV	Lady Health Visitor
ITSH	Internal Transport, Storage and Handling (WFP)
MCH	Mother and Child Health
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MoA	Ministry of Agriculture
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MoE	Ministry of Education
MMA	Joint Action Body (of Religious Parties)
MT	Metric Ton
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NHP	National Health Policy
NRM	Natural Resources Management
NWFP	North West Frontier Province
ODA	Official Development Assistance
ODOC	Other Direct Operational Costs (WFP)
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OEDE	Office of Evaluation (WFP)
P&D	Planning and Development
PDM	Programme Design Manual (WFP)
PEP	Participatory Evaluation Profiles
PRA	Participatory Rapid Appraisal
PRRO	Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation (WFP)
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSA	Programme Support and Administrative funds (WFP)
RBoE	Regional Bureau of Education
RBM	Result-Based Management
RBM&E	Result-Based Monitoring and Evaluation
SC	Steering Committee
SCF	Save the Children - UK
SO	Sub-Office (WFP)
SPR	Standardised Project Report (WFP)
SWC	Soil and Water Conservation
TRDP	Thardeep Rural Development Programme
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Fund for Populations Activities
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
US	Unites States of America
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VAM	Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping
WFP	World Food Programme of the United Nations
WHO	World Health Organization
WO	Women Organization

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENT ..... **I**
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS ..... **III**
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ..... **VII**
INTRODUCTION **1**
BACKGROUND 1
RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE OF THE COUNTRY STUDY 1
Basis for country selection *1*
Objectives of the country study evaluation *2*
Terminology used in this report *2*
Activities undertaken *4*
1 METHODOLOGY **5**
1.1 KEY FEATURES OF THE METHODOLOGY 5
1.2 DIFFICULTIES ENCOUNTERED AND LIMITATIONS OF THE EXERCISE 7
2 WFP INTERVENTIONS IN THE COUNTRY SPECIFIC CONTEXT **8**
2.1 THE COUNTRY CONTEXT 8
2.1.1 Socio economic context *8*
2.1.2 Food security situation *10*
2.1.3 Government and donors priorities, policies and programmes addressing poverty and food insecurity *11*
2.2 WFP INTERVENTIONS IN PAKISTAN 15
2.2.1 Portfolio of intervention and its evolution since 1997 ..... *15*
2.2.2 Key issues of CP and outline of ongoing interventions *16*
3 MAIN FINDINGS **19**
3.1 EVALUATION QUESTION # 1: HOW RELEVANT IS THE CP IN TERMS OF THE EVOLVING CONTEXT OF POVERTY REDUCTION AND FOOD SECURITY 19
3.1.1 Country Programme coherence with the EDP principles and objectives *19*
3.1.2 Relevance of the CP to the national policies and international context *20*
3.1.3 Complementarity and integration EMOP/PRRO *21*
3.1.4 Relevance of targeting of Country Programme *22*
3.2 WHAT ARE THE MECHANISMS, MEANS AND TOOLS INTRODUCED/STRENGTHENED AT COUNTRY LEVEL TO FACILITATE EDP/CP IMPLEMENTATION? 24
3.2.1 Progress (and changes) in partnership *25*
3.2.2 Stakeholders' participation and ownership *26*
3.2.3 Progress (and changes) in demonstrating results *27*
3.2.4 Gender mainstreaming *28*
3.2.5 HIV/AIDS mainstreaming *29*
3.2.6 Resourcing *29*
3.3 MAIN RESULTS OF THE EDP AT THE LOCAL/COUNTRY LEVEL 32
3.3.1 Assistance to girls' primary education *32*
3.3.2 Promoting Safe Motherhood *35*
3.3.3 Creating Assets for Rural Women *38*
3.3.4 Efficient use of resources at project level *43*
3.3.5 Consistency of the results with EDP principles *43*
3.3.6 Sustainability of results *44*
4 CONCLUSIONS AND ISSUES FOR CONSIDERATION **46**

TABLES:

Table 1: Demographic Data and Socio-Economic Indicators 8
Table 2: Total Production of Major Crops and Quantity Available for Use (000 Mt) 11
Table 3: Per Capita Availability of Major Food Items (kg/annum) 11
Table 4: Consumption Gaps in central food items (000 tons) 11
Table 5: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 12
Table 6: Evolution of WFP development portfolio since 1994 16
Table 7: Approved Budget and Expenditures: CP 2001-2003 (US$) 30
Table 8: Planned and Actual Beneficiaries Reached and Commodities Distributed 2002 - 2003 30
Table 9: Annual Allocation of the Country Programme Resources for 2004-2008 (US$) 31
Table 10: Oil distribution per beneficiaries in schools during present CP 33
Table 11: Some evidence of growing enrolment from field 33
Table 12: Vegetable oil distributed and beneficiaries in health centres during present CP 36
Table 13: Oil distribution per service delivered in health centres during present CP in Sindh 36
Table 14: Percentage of registrations and vaccinations covered by WFP assisted health centres in Sindh in 2003 37
Table 15: Food distributed and beneficiaries in CARW 39
Table 16: Output of CARW reported in SPR 40
Table 17: Outcome of CARW reported in SPR 40

BOXES:

BOX 1: GENDER ISSUES IN PAKISTAN 10
BOX 2: OTHER RELEVANT SECTORAL POLICIES 14
BOX 3: ASSISTANCE TO GIRLS' PRIMARY EDUCATION 16
BOX 4: PROMOTING SAFE MOTHERHOOD 17
BOX 5: CREATING ASSETS FOR RURAL WOMEN (CARW) 17
BOX 6: EMOP IN PAKISTAN 22
BOX 7: GIRLS' ENROLMENT RATES 34

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. The Pakistan country report is one of seven country studies which form the main component of a comprehensive evaluation of the World Food Programme (WFP) Enabling Development Policy (EDP) launched in 2003 by a consortium of donors. The evaluation is being undertaken in three phases: a desk phase completed in March 2004; a field phase that includes a total of seven country studies undertaken between the months of March and July 2004; and a Synthesis phase due for completion by the end of 2004. During the first phase, four main questions (or topics) and a related evaluation matrix were identified as the main framework of analysis to guide the various evaluation team members throughout the evaluation process and ensure that the country studies are similarly structured and directly comparable.

2. The study included field visits to projects supported by WFP under its Food Aid and Development (FAAD) programme, in addition to interviews with representatives from the Government of Pakistan (GoP), donor agencies and NGOs. During the field phase, the mission visited three regions: two districts in North West Frontier Province (NWFP); two districts in Sindh and one in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK). During these visits beneficiaries were also interviewed.

3. Pakistan is a low-income food deficit country and for large segments of the population there is a combination of poverty-level income, unfavourable social indicators, vulnerable livelihoods and inadequate food consumption. In terms of poverty of opportunity, nearly fifty percent of Pakistanis are poor; they are unable to take advantage of development possibilities owing to illiteracy, poor health, malnutrition and poverty. In Pakistan, the chronic food problem is mainly due to a lack of economic and social access by the poor. Food insecurity at household level has been increasing since the early 1990s, largely as a result of declining real incomes. The incidence of food poverty is higher in rural areas; two-thirds of the population live in rural areas and 46% depend on agriculture. Moreover, parts of the country (the arid areas in the South) are prone to both drought and floods.

4. Women in particular suffer disproportionately from poverty and from low access to education and healthcare. The indicators show poor health status, high maternal mortality rates and very low literacy rates. Social and cultural norms restrict women's personal liberties, their autonomy with respect to taking decisions affecting their own lives and their freedom to make personal choices. They bear multiple responsibilities yet have little saying in decision-making, limited access to economic resources and no control over their own assets or household incomes.

5. The government has demonstrated its long-term commitment to poverty alleviation through the preparation of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), which foresees broad-based economic growth based upon sustained growth in agriculture and rural economic activities. Access to education, health, safe drinking water and rural infrastructure are seen as keys to human development and economic growth, with emphasis on targeting the most vulnerable groups. The lynchpin of the strategy is social mobilization and the targeting of women. Direct strategies for poverty reduction have led to somewhat enhanced social safety nets, including generalized food subsidies, a targeted food support programme, cash transfer payments and improvements in social security.

6. The UNDAF for Pakistan has chosen five priority areas of cooperation within the framework of the PRSP: participatory governance; poverty alleviation; fundamental cross-cutting issues; health; and education. All UNDAF themes are predicated on good governance as the enabling environment. The WFP country policy is generally consistent with the main national poverty reduction strategies and programmes and WFP activities have been integrated into the poverty reduction framework with clear identification of the links between the country

Programme (CP) objectives and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), and between the activities promoted and the policies of government and other donors. WFP provides explicit support to two of the strategic areas of engagement outlined in the PRSP: i) building human capital; and ii) targeted interventions and expanding social safety nets. WFP contributes to four areas of cooperation between the Government and the UN system as defined by UNDAF: poverty alleviation, fundamental cross cutting issues (gender, environment, and humanitarian affairs), education, and health.

7. However, the WFP CP contains no reference to governance and policy reforms, notwithstanding the opportunities WFP has for policy dialogue on strategies in education and health, agricultural development and food security. It has also to be highlighted that the scale of WFP development intervention in the Pakistani context remains small. 2001-2003 CP total investment represents only 1.8% of the total ODA investment in the country in the same period for the two areas of building human capital and expanding safety nets.

8. The Pakistan CP includes three activities: Girls' Primary Education; Promoting Safe Motherhood; *and* Creating Assets for Rural Women (CARW). In light of the results of an evaluation exercise in 1999 and the introduction of the EDP, the WFP portfolio was modified in recent years to ensure the adoption of a programme approach. Major changes introduced to comply with EDP include: a shift of the strategic focus on women as main beneficiaries; the phasing out of classic food-for-work (FFW) natural resource management (NRM) activities which were replaced by a more community-centred approach in NRM; more accurate targeting through an extensive VAM exercise; more emphasis (and resources) on human development - especially education - than on infrastructure development. The WFP Pakistan portfolio also includes emergency operations (EMOP). WFP has been assisting the GoP in coping with a number of emergencies, i.e. the Afghanistan crisis with the subsequent influx of refugees since 1996; and droughts in Punjab, Balochistan and Sindh in 2002-2003.

9. Positive discrimination towards women as targeted beneficiaries is justified by gender-related human development data and the particular situation of women in the country. Women in food-insecure areas can globally be defined as a vulnerable group as specified by the policy. Geographical targeting up to district level has been reviewed and focuses increasingly on food-insecure areas as established by the EDP. The methodology used is satisfactory, although it has data shortcomings under district level for lack of secondary sources and does not include gender-sensitive indicators. The VAM unit has launched a food security community and household survey that will give a clearer picture of food security and vulnerability at community and household level.

10. Within the framework of NRM activities, WFP has a longstanding partnership with the Government administration and a history of joint ventures with some UN agencies and bilateral organizations. However only recently have more efforts been deployed to diversify and improve partnership under the impact of the new policy, although more still needs to be done, in particular in the education and health programmes. The mission's meetings at provincial and district levels confirmed the existing good level of understanding and collaboration with the implementing Government administration departments and NGOs, which have been involved since the projects' identification phases and share most of the EDP principles on which WFP's approach is based.

11. Participatory approaches are not used in the education and health projects, which have a "top-down" approach. Health and education programmes work only as schemes for distribution of incentives, and the diffusion of health and education messages depends on the capacities and goodwill of staff who receive WFP training only on project objectives, implementation strategy, record keeping and reporting. Health and school committees are also practically non-existent as their role would be limited to the distribution of tins of oil. In CARW, although participatory

approaches are adopted by the implementing partners (IPs), women - the main target and beneficiaries of WFP activities - could be further involved throughout the project cycle.

12. WFP's gender approach in Pakistan focuses on the number of women as beneficiaries and not enough consideration is given to the cultural environment with its local differences or to the institutional policy framework. Linkages between gender mainstreaming objectives and WFP gender interventions are limited to micro level and do not impact on policy level. The CP appears to be based upon a generalised gender situation analysis, despite the fact that customs, traditions and socio-economic conditions impacting on gender vary widely from one region to another. There is an absence of qualitative indicators, and indicators used in VAM need to be more gender sensitive. Gender mapping based on the identified strategic needs of women would allow a more effective gender mainstreaming approach.

13. Results Based Management work is still in progress. Demonstrating the results of WFP's Pakistan activities is not easy: reporting by implementing partners is generally weak, notwithstanding extensive training; the monitoring tools and reports present inaccuracies and inconsistencies; and the "periodic studies to assess output and outcome" envisaged in the CP have not been carried out. On the whole, the monitoring system is complex, not user friendly and, at the end of it, not very transparent.

14. **Girls' Primary Education:** According to the School Feeding Survey, girls' enrolment has increased by 43.7% in the assisted schools during the last three years. Apparently a virtuous circle has been established. Provision of oil as an incentive encourages teachers and students to attend regularly, the regular presence of teachers constitutes a further incentive, and regular attendance by students, according to teachers, ensures better performance. The completion rate has increased to 34% (compared with 20% before WFP's intervention). Scattered evidence in data and fieldwork shows that enrolment declines progressively from class 2 to class 5. Synergy with other assistance programmes such as school canteens or the free-books-and-uniform scheme contributes to results and demonstrates that the school's environment and access are as important as oil as an incentive. Logistical and WFP-UNESCO quality standard criteria tend to exclude the poorest and most remote communities. The slow increase in the number of qualified teachers and in the upgrading and equipment of facilities raises questions about the quality of education.

15. **Promoting Safe Motherhood:** Distribution of tins of oil works as an incentive for the women to go to the health centres in case of pregnancy, at least for the first contact. Data at regional level show that attendance is higher in WFP-assisted centres. At every successive visit there is an increasing dropout rate; there are several reasons, among which appear to be the inadequate provision of information for women and also the lack of sensitization of the male members of the family, upon whom women's mobility depends. In the absence of specific studies it is not clear how far health education messages are being passed on to the women and retained by them.

16. **Creating Assets for Rural Women (CARW):** Geographical targeting has focused mainly on VAM-identified food-insecure districts. NWFP, where the former NRM project was implemented, has been phased out because small landowners and landless did not benefit of it as foreseen. CARW concentrates in AJK, where the government has made commitments on participatory approach and has provided resources; and in Sindh, in one of the most food insecure areas, where partnership with NGO is possible. At district level targeting is determined by IP intervention areas and in some cases also by self-targeting of the more dynamic communities. Within each organization, the eligibility to receive assistance through asset creation is determined by the ability to complement with local resources the 'development package' offered by the project. This implies the risk of leaving the poorest of the poor outside the framework of the intervention. CARW is contributing to boosting access to assets and

managerial capacities by rural women, in an advanced phase in AJK, but at a still early phase in Sindh. However the actual impact of this intervention has still to be established. Assets observed during the mission were appreciated by beneficiaries and generally in use, and were in good condition. Beneficiaries appreciate food stamps (FS) as an incentive. The FS system seems to work without problems and allows for greater control of benefits by women than cash does. Women say the Women Organizations give them more voice in community decisions and report more group cohesion and fewer intra-community conflicts caused by project activities. However, given the social and cultural constraints, they are not involved enough throughout the project cycle and most of the tasks are still carried out by men.

17. As for CARW, results are consistent with more than one focus area and principles of EDP. The results of Assistance to Girls' Primary Education are consistent with EDP focus area 2 although inadequacies in Government capacities and lack of co-ordination with other partners limit the impact of the project where 'supportive conditions' are concerned. The results of Promoting Safe Motherhood are consistent with policy focus area 1 but the extent to which healthcare, nutrition messages and health education effectively reach the women receiving the oil, as stated in the policy, has yet to be established. Shortcomings in the monitoring and evaluation system hinder the possibilities of demonstrating results, especially with respect to the education and health projects.

18. Sustainability is pursued by promoting the involvement and ownership of the government as implementing partner and through the increase in counterpart funding; community ownership and beneficiaries' training are at an advanced stage in CARW in AJK, but still building up in Sindh. Sustainability of the education and health projects is questionable, as the incentive system works against sustainability, especially if there is no important complementary investment in non food inputs. Exit strategies are envisaged only in AJK although they need to be further elaborated and clarified.

19. The mission considers that the WFP Country Programme in Pakistan is globally consistent with the EDP and relevant to national and international priorities and to the main key interventions in the area of food security nets. At project level, the results achieved are globally satisfactory with respect to the EDP strategic objectives, beneficiary needs and national priorities, although with some differences between different projects. The mission considers that the application of key EDP principles to WFP development programming has been a contributory factor to the development results achieved by WFP in Pakistan.

20. Key factors in the successes of the Pakistan CP are: i) improved targeting and positive discrimination towards women; ii) successful partnership with government administration at all levels; iii) dynamic partnership with local NGOs in CARW; and iv) the adoption of community-based and participatory approaches in CARW. Problems in implementing the policy have been encountered in the following areas: partnership in the education and health projects; gender mainstreaming; policy dialogue; and in demonstrating results.

21. Efforts to co-ordinate the health and education projects with other UN agencies and donors working in the same sectors need to be further pursued and co-ordination needs to be promoted with community-based participatory projects, including but not only to CARW. Gender approaches should not be limited to a focus on women as beneficiaries, but should also give more attention to the policy and cultural environment that influences the impact of the CP. WFP involvement in policy dialogue should particularly be enhanced in relevant fields (gender, education, participation). The monitoring tools and indicators should be revised, qualitative and gender-sensitive outcome and impact indicators identified, and regular participatory impact studies should be carried out.

EVALUATION OF WFP ENABLING DEVELOPMENT POLICY

PAKISTAN COUNTRY STUDY

INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND

1. On May 4, 1999 the World Food Programme Executive Board approved the Enabling Development Policy (EDP) to help the organisation sharpen the focus of its development activities. This external evaluation, sponsored by a number of WFP donors, aims at assessing the efficiency, effectiveness, impact, relevance and sustainability of this policy. The results of the evaluation are expected to: i) provide the sponsoring donors with valuable insights and issues for consideration in relation to future support for WFP development activities; ii) identify measures and mechanisms that could potentially enhance WFP's effectiveness in the design and implementation of its development portfolio; iii) contribute through empirical evidence to a better understanding of the conditions for success and failure of food aid in development activities. During the scoping phase, it was decided that the EDP will be mainly evaluated on the basis of the assessment of the results it has generated. The assessment is to be carried out at global, country and local levels, but with the main focus at country and local levels.

2. The evaluation is to be undertaken in three phases: a desk phase which has been completed in March 2004; a field phase that includes a total of seven country studies undertaken between the months of March and July 2004; and a Synthesis phase due for completion by the end of 2004. In line with the preliminary analysis of the EDP and with the evaluation's intended objectives and focus, four main questions (or topics) and a related evaluation matrix were identified during the inception phase. They are designed as the main framework of analysis to guide the various evaluation team members throughout the evaluation process and keep it focussed.

3. This report is divided into four main chapters. Chapter 1 presents the methodology employed and difficulties encountered; chapter 2 describes the Pakistan context with respect to food security and food aid issues and the specific cultural and social limitation women are facing, and outlines WFP interventions in the country; chapter 3 illustrates the evaluation main findings at country level and at local and project level; finally chapter 4 presents the country team's main conclusions and draws linkages between findings that have emerged from the different evaluation questions.

RATIONALE AND OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE OF THE COUNTRY STUDY

Basis for country selection

4. **Two criteria** were proposed for the final selection[1] of the countries to be visited during phase 2 of the evaluation. The first was of a **quantitative** nature and referred to the need to have a balanced regional representation of WFP's development interventions, proportional, as far as possible, to the actual development portfolio per region. The second was of a more qualitative nature and was based on the judgement of the evaluation team regarding the contributions that each country study could make in responding to the evaluation questions in a comprehensive manner. This judgement was based on the following considerations:

[1] The SC presented a preliminary list of 11 countries out of which the evaluation team was requested to make a proposal.

a) The need to represent as far as possible all major socio-economic contexts in which WFP operates;
b) Coverage of the five areas of focus listed in the EDP policy;
c) The presence of particularly interesting activities or experiences that could be the basis for specific case studies;
d) Situations where countries have adjusted their development portfolios, which may provide insights into the reasons for such changes;
e) The availability of evaluations and other material that could facilitate the country studies.

5. A total of seven countries (Bangladesh, Bolivia, Ethiopia, Honduras, Mali, Mozambique and Pakistan) were thus proposed and the proposal was endorsed by the SC.

6. The selection of Pakistan was based on several grounds:

- Coverage with respect to EDP areas of focus and the exclusive focus of the CP on girls and women;
- The shift from government budgetary support and food for work initiatives to community projects in line with EDP principles.

Objectives of the country study evaluation

7. In the framework of the overall evaluation exercise the objective of the country studies is "to contribute evidence-based elements to the overall evaluation process through assessment of the EDP-related principles, activities and results in the specific country context". In line with the EDP evaluation matrix, the country studies aim at assessing:

- The relevance of the EDP to the country and local contexts;
- The degree to which WFP's delivery process at country level has been updated to facilitate implementation of the EDP;
- The results (outputs, outcomes and impacts) of the EDP at local and country levels;
- The degree of - or chances of achieving - sustainability of the results attained or likely to be attained.

Terminology used in this report

8. Before entering into the description of the various methodological issues some clarification is provided on the terminology, particularly when describing WFP operations. WFP undertakes three types of operations:

a) Emergency Operations (EMOPs): the mechanism by which WFP, in response to a request from a government or the UN Secretary-General, provides emergency food aid and related assistance to meet the food needs of people affected by a disaster or other emergency. An EMOP, including extensions, generally lasts no more than 24 months, after which any need for continuing relief and rehabilitation or recovery assistance should normally be met through a Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation;

b) Protracted Relief and Recovery Operations (PRROs): the mechanism by which continuing WFP assistance is provided to emergency-affected populations, including refugees and displaced persons, when an EMOP reaches its two-year limit, and by which developmental approaches are gradually introduced to promote recovery. PRROs are normally planned, approved and implemented in a 3-year cycle. Planning for a PRRO should begin after the first twelve months of an EMOP. At present there are no PRROs are implemented in Pakistan;

c) Development Operations: the category of food aid programmes and projects that support economic and social development. This category includes rehabilitation and disaster

preparedness projects and technical assistance to help developing countries establish or improve their own food assistance. The Country Programme is a vehicle for the provision of WFP's development assistance. Country Programmes approved by WFP's Executive Board consist of a number of specific Projects, called Activities, within a country for a set period, normally five years, to achieve a common goal. These Activities are derived from the "key areas of assistance" described in the Country Strategy Outline.

9. WFP Operations budgets are organised according to the following costs:

a) Direct Operational Costs (DOC): any cost WFP incurs in providing inputs that are used directly in WFP interventions by beneficiaries, by the government of the recipient country or by other implementing partners. This includes the cost of commodities, ocean transportation and related costs, and land-side transportation, shipping and handling (LTSH);

b) Other Direct Operational Costs (ODOC): costs that refer to cash resources normally put at the disposal of Implementing Partners for capacity building and project implementation;

c) Direct Support Costs (DSC): costs in immediate support of a project, additional to direct operational costs, which would not be incurred if the project did not exist. These may include non-food items, technical support services, project preparation, appraisal, monitoring and evaluation;

d) Indirect Support Costs (ISC): costs incurred in staffing and operating WFP headquarters and regional offices, and the standard maximum structure at Country Offices that cannot be attributed easily to any programme category or activity.

10. The results of WFP Projects and Activities are classified according to three categories:

a) Outputs (output level of the log-frame hierarchy) defined as the products, capital goods and services which result from a WFP operation; including changes resulting from the operation which are relevant to the achievement of outcomes;

b) Outcomes (purpose level of the log-frame hierarchy) defined as the medium-term results of an operation's outputs;

c) Impact (goal level of the log-frame hierarchy) defined as the positive or negative, intended or unintended long-term results produced by a WFP operation, either directly or indirectly;

d) Sustainability denotes the continuation of benefits from a development intervention after major development assistance has been completed; the probability of continued long-term benefits; and the resilience to risk of the net benefit flows over time.

11. Finally when referring to the Enabling Development Policy, it should be noted that:

a) Within WFP it is often referred to as Food Aid and Development Policy (FAAD);

b) The key policy directives and basic principles referred to in this report are: i) assistance should be provided *only* when and where food consumption is inadequate for good health and productivity; ii) each and every WFP development intervention will use *assistance with food consumption to encourage investment and leave behind a lasting asset*; iii) beneficiaries of food aid and lasting assets should be *poor, food-insecure households*; iv) *geographical targeting* should be used to concentrate resources on food-insecure areas within recipient countries; v) *timeliness* will be treated as a key aspect of targeting; vi) use should be made of *clear and objective indicators* to signal when help is needed and also when it is time for phasing out; vii) greater use of *participatory approaches*; viii) strengthening of *partnerships*; ix) *cost-effectiveness* in terms of the *development results* to be achieved, with M&E becoming more results-oriented;

c) The five key areas of focus or policy priorities are: 1) enable young children and expectant and nursing mothers to meet their special nutritional and nutrition-related health needs; 2) enable poor households to invest in human capital through education and learning; 3) make it possible for poor families to gain and preserve assets; 4) mitigate the effects of natural disasters in areas vulnerable to recurring crises; 5) enable households which depend on

degraded natural resources for their food security to make a shift to more sustainable livelihoods.

Activities undertaken

12. This report is the result of a series of activities consisting of:

a) A preparatory phase, prior to the country visits, where main documents have been analysed and an Inception Report has been prepared;
b) A field or country phase of a duration of 23 days undertaken by a team of four consultants and including: i) briefing sessions with main stakeholders; ii) interviews at all levels; iii) project visits and consultation with beneficiaries; iv) debriefing sessions (see annex 1);
c) Report preparation and consolidation of findings.

1 METHODOLOGY

1.1 KEY FEATURES OF THE METHODOLOGY

13. In line with the overall evaluation methodology, the analysis has been structured at two main levels: i) the country level; and ii) the local and beneficiaries level:

- **Country level:** to examine translation into practice of the key concepts of the EDP, such as partnerships; ownership by governments; targeting towards the most vulnerable groups; gender mainstreaming; demonstrating results and beneficiaries' involvement in the planning, implementation and evaluation of projects. The analysis at country level has also included funding and staffing patterns, the balancing and the links of the different components in the overall WFP country portfolio as well as within the three areas of focus;
- **Local and beneficiaries level:** to assess the results of WFP's interventions at community level, i.e. outputs, outcome and impact at the project level.

14. The **evaluation matrix** elaborated during the desk phase has been the main analytical tool used during the country study and has provided the basis for the elaboration of interviews and check-lists, questionnaires and focus group discussion guide. Some points needs to be highlighted at this stage:

- With respect to Evaluation Question (EQ) 1 "*How relevant is the EDP in terms of the evolving context of poverty reduction and food security*?", it was felt that relevance and coherence need to be assessed with respect to WFP's Country Programme (i.e. the concrete instrument of WFP development programming). A two-step approach to EQ1 was therefore used: i) assessment of the coherence of the CP with respect to the EDP principles; and ii) the assessment of the relevance of the CP with respect to the country context;
- The evaluation question (and sub-questions) on sustainability have been modified to take into account DAC definitions (see par. 10);
- A sub-question on HIV/AIDS mainstreaming has been added[2];
- Some indicators have been revised to take into account SC comments on the Phase 1 report and the findings of the Ethiopia Pilot Study.

15. Interviews (assisted by the use of check lists) and review and analysis of relevant documents have been the main tools used for the analysis **at country level**. Interviews have been undertaken with the following groups of stakeholders:

- **WFP staff** at country and provincial level, to ascertain the progress made and difficulties encountered in promoting EDP principles at country and project levels;
- **Government representatives at federal, provincial and district level as well as elected representatives at district level** in order to: i) verify the relevance and coherence of WFP interventions with respect to sector policies and, on the other hand, assess the implementation mechanisms put in place at all levels; ii) understand WFP's role within the overall framework of the country's poverty reduction and development strategies;
- **UN Agencies:** The rationale for contacting UN agencies has been twofold, namely: i) to improve understanding of the role of WFP (and the potential synergies) within CCA/UNDAF; and ii) to review the past, ongoing and possible future partnership agreements between WFP and individual UN agencies;
- **Donors:** In addition to the meeting held with the donors sponsoring the evaluation, the team has met other key donors (including some with no direct relationship or partnership

[2] It is to be recalled that HIV/AIDS issues were not directly addressed by the EDP since at the time of its formulation HIV/AIDS was not yet part of the International Development Agenda. Nevertheless, the team has decided to add a specific sub-question given the negative effects of HIV/AIDS on food security and the potential role that food aid could play to mitigate (together with other interventions) its negative effects.

agreement with WFP in the country). These contacts have proved very useful in providing the evaluation team with different perspectives and points of view on the pros and cons of the use of food aid in a non-emergency context and on WFP's role in such a framework;

- **NGOs:** Despite the fact that NGOs are only direct implementation partners of WFP development operations in one region (Sindh), their knowledge of the country and of the food security and food aid assistance mechanisms and issues could contribute considerably to further clarifying the context in which WFP operates. In the case of Pakistan, the team interviewed national and international NGOs operating in the provinces where WFP operates and local NGOs collaborating with WFP or due to set up for such future collaboration.

16. **Documents and data analysis** (see annex 5) including: i) project documents and agreements (including other WFP operations); ii) CSOs and CPs; iii) project monitoring and evaluation reports; iv) guidelines and technical notes; v) VAM analyses and reports; vi) partnership and collaborative agreements; vii) food procurement and food markets data; viii) national statistics and reports on food security; ix) national and sector policies relevant to WFP activities; x) other donors' and NGO's reports and studies; xi) CCA/UNDAF documents. WFP documents have been analysed mainly with respect to the level of application of (and coherence with) the EDP principles of WFP development programming (as well as other operations), while analysis of other documents has provided indications on the overall relevance of WFP operations (and development in particular) with respect to the overall country context and development framework.

17. **Results** of WFP activities have been examined at global, project and community levels. The analysis of the overall **results of WFP operations** has been based on the existing available progress reports produced by WFP and implementing partners, evaluation reports and discussions with key informants (government staff, local authorities, NGOs and other donors).

18. Furthermore, evidence emerging from **project visits and beneficiaries' interviews** has been a key element in the independent assessment of the actual results of WFP interventions. However, given the size of the WFP operations (in partly extreme topographic conditions) and the limited number of days at the disposal of the evaluation team, field visits have nevertheless aimed at providing an illustration of what is actually happening at project level. The field visits were the means to cross-check the data available in WFP and other reports and the information given by different stakeholders, while at the same time trying to integrate and supplement available information - and local stakeholders' and direct beneficiaries' views - on the results achieved through WFP support. The findings should be viewed as the main contribution to the overall evaluation exercise, without pretending, given the limited sample and statistical value, that it is fully representative of the results of WFP efforts in Pakistan. With respect to the methodological issues, three key points will be discussed here:

- **Sites and projects selection:** given the need to restrict the sample in the case of Pakistan, priority has been given to three provinces (North West Frontier Province - NWFP; Sindh; and Azad Jammu and Kashmir - AJK) with the view of visiting a variety of different activities and projects and including different socio-economic contexts. The mission visited two districts in NWFP where WFP implements education and health projects; two districts in Sindh where all three activities are present (education, health and CARW); and one district in AJK where education and CARW projects are carried out. Balochistan, which had been selected in the inception phase, has been dropped because of time and security constraints. Overall, the final selection, decided by the evaluating team on the basis of CO information, provides a representative image of the adaptation of the various activities to the different socio-economic and cultural contexts. The complete list of sites visited - together with an overview of the main distinctive features of the provinces visited - is provided in annex 2;
- **Interviews and focus group discussions:** during the project visits, discussions were held with key informants and beneficiaries. Key informants contacted during the field visits

include: i) community leaders and elected district representatives; ii) NGOs' representatives if operating in the project areas; iii) line ministries' staff at district and community level; iv) project committee members; v) teachers; vi) members of parents' and teachers' associations (PTA) and school management committees; vii) medical doctors and Lady Health Visitors (LHVs). The following main rapid appraisal techniques have been used to gather information: i) visits to the sites to collect impressions on living conditions; ii) focus group discussions; iii) on the spot individual interviews; and iv) direct observation of project outputs so as to assess the quality and use of the assets created. Among beneficiaries, given the almost exclusive target group of the Pakistan CP, most interviews were conducted with women, in groups or individually. Men interviewed were school-children's fathers or members of mixed groups in asset creation activities;

- **Key information collected:** a specific checklist was prepared for each of the projects visited, based on the information gathered during the preparatory phase (in Islamabad) and on the evaluation matrix. In line with the EDP policy directives, key information to be collected was essentially as follows:
  - Quality and appreciation of the food delivered;
  - Timeliness of food deliveries (e.g. when compared with the actual needs);
  - Beneficiaries' views on the benefits created by the project;
  - Beneficiaries' and key informants' views on the targeting mechanisms of the interventions;
  - Beneficiaries' role in project identification and implementation.

19. The information collected, though essentially of a qualitative nature, was then consolidated into tables, to allow a more systematic analysis of the findings (see annex 3).

20. Finally, during country studies, separate **briefing and debriefing sessions** for WFP Country Office staff and donors sponsoring the evaluation were organised. The briefing sessions were designed to inform the different stakeholders on the objectives and approach of the evaluation and to identify issues that may have not emerged during the inception phase but that may be worth analysing. The debriefing sessions were designed essentially to verify and discuss the preliminary findings of the country study. In the provinces briefing and debriefing sessions were held at the beginning and the end of the mission, these meetings being attended by concerned ministries as well as WFP staff (both Country Office and sub-office representatives). At district level, briefing sessions were held to inform the local authorities and politicians on the mission's objectives and to obtain assistance in choosing the sites to be visited. The final selection of sites and projects was done on the spot. The mission took care to visit spots off the main roads and far from the district headquarters.

1.2 DIFFICULTIES ENCOUNTERED AND LIMITATIONS OF THE EXERCISE

21. While the organisation of meetings and provision of information was organised by WFP with great care, the work at **field level** faced some difficulties. The security situation in Pakistan and the consequently rigid UN security regulations were sometimes a limiting factor which hindered field research. Also a number of discussions with the CO were devoted to the issue of whether country level personnel should accompany the mission during the field visits. Eventually, during most of the community level field visits, the evaluation team was accompanied by junior IP staff. Cross-checking questions and direct observation was used to avoid biases. Interviews confirmed the impressions and data gathered by the team, even though in some cases they could be carried out only in the presence of an interpreter.

22. The lack of an effective monitoring and evaluation system, of baseline studies, and of qualitative case studies on outcome and impact of the programme has increased the difficulties of this evaluation exercise (see §3.2.3). There was no reference study to assess the actual impact of activities on communities' mentality and behaviours, beside what was possible to collect in (very)

rapid participatory appraisals carried out during the field visits. Moreover, the figures for output and outcome indicators were at times either incomplete or incorrect or inconsistent while explanations provided did not clarify the issues but highlighted a very complex, not user friendly and, all in all, not very transparent way of recording results.

23. Time and shortage of manpower have been other constraints faced by the evaluation team given the size of WFP operations in the country, the size of Pakistan and the logistical constraints linked to poor road conditions, an extremely difficult topography, and the amount of relevant documents to be analysed. In such a context the team, while trying to keep a balance of approach between qualitative and quantitative approaches, has given priority to qualitative analysis.

2 WFP INTERVENTIONS IN THE COUNTRY SPECIFIC CONTEXT

2.1 THE COUNTRY CONTEXT

2.1.1 Socio economic context

24. With 146 million inhabitants, Pakistan is the word's ninth most populous country, with one of the highest population growth rates in South Asia. At the present growth rate the population is predicted to reach 221 million by 2025. Poverty has been increasing since the 1990s[3], after declining during the previous two decades. The fall in the economic growth rate, the significant reduction in employment opportunities, the continuing declining share of development expenditures, the overall depression in economic activity and mounting debts, all have contributed to increasing poverty levels. This poverty is exacerbated by social exclusion and relative deprivation. The burden of economic shocks over the late 1980s and 1990s, the specific policy responses, social sector policy and implementation failures have fallen largely on the poor, the vulnerable and the marginalized[4].

Table 1: Demographic Data and Socio-Economic Indicators

Demographic Trends	**PAKISTAN**	**SA**	**LICs**
Population (million) 2001	146.3	1,455.1	2,515.0
Urban population (% of total population) 2001	33.4	29.5	31.5
GDP per capita (US$) 2001	415	508	432
Population growth rate (2001-2015)	2.4	1.6	1.7
Labour force unemployment rate 2002	8.3	n/a	n/a
Human Development Indicators	**PAKISTAN**	**SA**	**LICs**
Poverty (% of population below national poverty line) 2000	32.6	n/a	n/a
Life expectancy at birth (years) 2001	60.4	62.8	59.1
Infant mortality (per 1,000 live births) 2001	84	69	80
Under 5 mortality rate 2001	109	95	119
One year olds fully immunized against measles 2001	54	n/a	n/a
Child malnutrition (% of children under 5) 2001	38	n/a	n/a
Access to improved water sources (% of population) 2000	90	85	76
Adults living with HIV/AIDS (% age 15-49 years) 2001	0.11	0.5	2.10
Adult literacy (% of population age 15+) 2001	44	56.3	63
Male literacy rate (% of population age 15+) 2001	58.2		
Female literacy rate (% of population age 15+) 2001	28.8		
Net primary enrolment (% of school age population) 2001	66	79	74
Ratio of girls to boys in net primary enrolment 2001	0.55	n/a	n/a

Source: Human Development Report 2003; UNDP; Social Policy and Development Centre Annual Review 2002-03.

[3] Several studies indicate that the proportion of poor rose from 22%-26% in fiscal year 1991 to 32%-35% in fiscal year 1999 (cited in UNDAF, 2003).

[4] Social Development in Pakistan; *Growth, Inequality and Poverty;* Annual Review 2001.

25. Two thirds of the population live in rural areas and 46% depend on agriculture, which accounts for about 25% of GDP[5]. Production growth in the agricultural, livestock and fisheries sectors has been particularly low at just 1.6% in recent years, partially because of a severe drought that lasted from 1999 to 2001[6]. The quality of life has deteriorated and inequalities in income have increased. In absolute numbers, an estimated 47 million people live below the national poverty line; of these, 35 million are in rural areas[7].

26. In terms of poverty of opportunity almost 50% of Pakistanis are poor. They are unable to take advantage of development possibilities owing to illiteracy, poor health, malnutrition and poverty. About 70 - 80 million people are deprived of education and health services[8]. On average, poor households spend more than they earn, incurring debts that further limit their ability to escape from the hunger trap[9]. The poor allocate less than 2% of their expenditure to education and healthcare[10].

27. Pakistan is a low-income food deficit country and for large segments of the population there is a combination of poverty of income, poor social indicators, vulnerable livelihoods and inadequate food consumption. In terms of this poverty-livelihoods-food nexus, the national context is one of heightened vulnerability to sustainable livelihoods, food insecurity and loss of both assets and entitlements, particularly among the rural populations. The manifestation and impact of the poverty-livelihoods-food nexus is as follows:

- Disrupted agricultural systems (food and cash crops, livestock and kitchen gardens) specially in rain-fed areas - *food and livelihood insecurity*;
- Sharply reduced incomes – *increased poverty and indebtedness*;
- Increased migration to irrigated areas or urban centres – *social dislocation, urban slums and increased poverty*;
- Depletion of forest cover and vegetation by communities trying to survive – *lower capacity of land to support populations and loss of entitlements*;
- Decline in freshwater additions to surface water bodies and recharge of natural aquifers – *increased food deficit and loss of livelihoods*;
- Lower food availability and non-varied diet – *malnutrition*;
- Increased incidence of water borne and infectious diseases – *poor health*;
- Children needed to supplement incomes – *increased school drop-outs*;
- Undermining of the social capital of rural communities – *loss of assets and entitlements*;
- Increased vulnerability of children and women – *increased workload, loss of empowerment and denuding of rights*.

28. The adverse outcomes for poverty and issues of vulnerability indicate deep structural flaws[11]. The high incidence of poverty and the concomitant failure of public policy are mostly due to inadequate diagnosis of causes and an obsolete policy framework, giving rise to severely skewed development. In addition strong constituencies and lobbies distort reform priorities while faulty institutional structures, poor financial management practices and defective planning fritter away resources and squeeze pro-poor service delivery. Institutional capacity to handle devolved government functions is inadequate, research capacity is non-existent and no credible monitoring and evaluation mechanisms are in place. This has created a disabling environment for policy

5 Economic Review, 2002-2003, Government of Pakistan.
6 2004-2008 UNDAF, page 8.
7 UNDAF, 2003, pages 6 and 7.
8 CSO, 1999, page 6.
9 2001-2003 Country Programme, page 19.
10 Ibidem, page 12.
11 Page 1; *Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead,* Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper; Government of Pakistan; December 2003.

formulation, programme design and fashioning of appropriate responses for addressing the issues of the poor, the marginalized and the vulnerable[12].

BOX 1: GENDER ISSUES IN PAKISTAN

Women, in particular, suffer disproportionately from poverty and from weak access to education and health care. Compared to other South Asian countries, Pakistan has the highest rate of female illiteracy (71%) and the lowest percentage of girls enrolled in schools[1]. Data indicate that the poorer the household, the higher the likelihood of dependence on female labour. Women's access to the formal labour market is only 13.7%, and women have a relatively lower skills and literacy base, concentrating their work in low-paid or undervalued employment sectors [2]. The economic participation of women in the informal sector and the agricultural labour of women goes largely unrecognized and under remunerated. Both types of female labour are undocumented and not covered by labour laws and regulatory frameworks.

At the World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995 the Government of Pakistan stated that "it is increasingly evident that women and girls in poor households bear a disproportionately high share of the burden of poverty" and suffer from "oppressive patriarchal structures, rigid orthodox norms and stifling socio-cultural customs and traditions". They have little personal liberty, autonomy to take decisions concerning their own lives or freedom to make their own choices. They bear multiple responsibilities, have little say in decision-making, limited access to economic resources and no control over their assets or household incomes. Many women identify themselves within the framework that has been constructed for them by society. This framework is so fraught with sensitivity that mere statements of targeting, participation and empowerment do not suffice to cut across attitudes and norms that have cemented and calcified over centuries. The consequences are reflected in the indicators of poor health status, high maternal mortality rates, a very low literacy rate, increasing numbers of 'honour' killings and declining legal and social status[3]. Equally significant are the relatively less documented indices of domestic violence, economic and physical exploitation, restricted social mobility and psychological slavery, where women view subordination as their fate.

A major gender issue in accessing social services and economic resources is the perception of 'honour', stigma placed on 'unaccompanied' travel and lack of mobility, and the low priority accorded to women's strategic needs in any development initiative[4]. The persisting differences in gender-related social indicators lead to two thoughts: that within the social transformation paradigm (where there is ample space for the 'development' of women) it is the lack of allocations that is keeping the gender gap so wide; and that there are other causes that cannot be dealt with through social transformation process. It follows that the first can be addressed through systemic and institutional policy changes, while the second requires a change from within society to alter its attitudes and its own structure.

1: *Between Hope and Despair*. Pakistan Participatory Poverty Assessment. National Report, Planning Commission. Government of Pakistan, 2003, p. 45.
2: UNDAF, 2003, p. 9.
3: Effects of the Interplay of Formal and Customary Laws on the Lives of Men and Women; Volumes 1-5, Raasta/Royal Netherlands Embassy, 2002.
4: Ibid.

2.1.2 Food security situation

29. In Pakistan, the chronic food problem is mainly due to the lack of economic and social access by the poor. The country produces approximately 80% of its basic staple - wheat - and imports the rest. Food insecurity at household level in Pakistan has been increasing since the early 1990s, largely as a result of declining real incomes. It is estimated that every day one in three people in Pakistan fails to consume enough food to lead a healthy and productive life[13]. According to the poverty line as adopted by the GoP's Planning Division, food security is based on a caloric norm of 2350 calories per adult equivalent per day (2150 calories in urban areas and 2450 calories in rural areas). According to this definition, the incidence of poverty in Pakistan in 2000-01 was estimated to be 32.1% in urban and 36.99% in rural areas[14].

30. The agricultural sector is mainly responsible for taking care of food security. Agricultural production has varied over the last years, particularly because of droughts and lack of water for

[12] Social Development in Pakistan; *Growth, Inequality and Poverty;* Annual Review 2001; Social Policy and Development Center.
[13] Pakistan Human Condition Report 2002.
[14] Economic Survey of Pakistan 2002-03, Finance Division, Economic Advisors Wing, Islamabad.

irrigation. Wheat is the major food crop in Pakistan. The total production of different crops is reflected in table 2.

Table 2: Total Production of Major Crops and Quantity Available for Use (000 Mt)

Items	2001			2002			2003		
	Production	Seed	Net	Production	Seed	Net	Production	Seed	Net
Wheat	19,023	1,046	17,977	18,277	1,000	17,277	19,210.2	1,057	18,153.2
Rice/Paddy	5,823	213.7	5,609.3	6,717.75	212.16	6,505.59	6,751	212.16	6,538.84
Barley	98.9	7.74	91.16	99.8	7.21	92.59	106,6	7.21	99.39
Maize	1,664.4	41.6	1,622.8	1,737.1	43.4	1,693.7	1,275	32	1,243
Millet	216.4	3.76	212.64	189	4.8	184.2	180	4.8	175.2
Sorghum	221.6	6.5	215.1	202.5	8	194.5	230	8	222

Source: FAO Database.

31. The per capita availability of different food items has decreased during the period 2002-03 as can be seen in the following table:

Table 3: Per Capita Availability of Major Food Items (kg/annum)

Food Items	1996	1997	1998	1999-2000	2002-2003
Wheat	126.88	130.85	136.93	140.87	116.31
Rice	15.52	16.85	14.47	19.80	17.24
Edible Oil	11.42	10.46	10.95	12.66	11.95
Meat	17.25	17.87	17.39	20.22	14.56
Pulses	6.15	5.85	5.68	6.65	5.80

Sources: Agricultural Statistics of Pakistan (various) and Economic Survey of Pakistan 2002-2003.

32. The total production of agro-livestock-based food products varies from region to region. According to a study of WFP and the Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 26% of the total districts of Pakistan (34 districts out of 120) are agro-livestock surplus districts. However, the country suffers from a net food deficit if the figures are translated into the net food available for the whole population[15]. According to a recent study conducted by FAO, Pakistan is facing food gaps in almost all food items. The following table shows the overall food consumption gap of some important food items:

Table 4: Consumption Gaps in central food items (000 tons)

Commodities	Recommended Food Consumption	Present Food Consumption	Estimated Food Consumption Gap
Wheat	19,394	19,014	380
Other Grains	3,176	3,114	62
Edible Oil	1,691	1,658	33
Meat	529	519	10

Source: FAO and ECO: Agriculture and Food Security in Pakistan (mimeographed), Islamabad, April 2004.

2.1.3 Government and donors priorities, policies and programmes addressing poverty and food insecurity

Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP).

33. The government has demonstrated its long-term commitment to poverty alleviation through preparation of the **Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP)**. This defines development challenges as: i) achieving high and sustained broad-based economic growth particularly in rural

[15] WFP and Sustainable Development Policy Institute: Food Availability, Food Insecurity in Rural Pakistan (mimeographed), Islamabad 2003.

areas; ii) reducing poverty; iii) providing essential social and economic services and infrastructure to the poor; iv) creating job opportunities; and v) improving governance[16].

Table 5: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

Engagement Objectives	*Strategic Areas of Engagement*
Accelerate economic growth and maintain macroeconomic stability	• Public finance • Monetary policy and financial sector reforms • Trade liberalization and export promotion • Investment policy and privatization • Infrastructure and energy
Improve governance	• Devolution and fiscal decentralization • Judiciary and civil service • Corruption • Information
Invest in human capital	• Education • Health • Population welfare
Targeted interventions and expanding social safety nets	• Public works • Micro-credit • Small & medium enterprise development • Rural development • Housing finance • Zakat system • Food system • Social rehabilitation

Source: Pakistan PRSP, Government of Pakistan; December 2003.

34. The PRSP envisages broad-based economic growth, based upon sustained growth in agriculture and rural economic activities. Access to education, health, safe drinking water and rural infrastructure are seen as keys to human development and economic growth. Good governance is the basis for the equitable and efficient delivery of goods and services. Official Development Assistance (ODA) to Pakistan closely mirrors the PRSP, and donor assistance has increased markedly since 2000[17].

35. Investing in human capital as a strategy for poverty reduction remains at the fore of government and donor policies and programmes and much of the ODA assistance is targeted in the designated areas of the PRSP. These include education, agriculture, environment, poverty reduction and health. The PRSP also emphasises the role that small and medium enterprise development, agriculture and rural development has to play in poverty reduction.

36. In keeping with the GoP emphasis on targeting the most vulnerable, many donors have assisted in expanding safety nets through improved access to credit and direct poverty mitigation strategies.

The millennium development goals (MDG) and UNDAF

37. The PRSP makes constant references to the MDGs, and the Ten-Year Perspective Development Plan (PDP) 2001-2011 is grounded in the achievement targets of the MDGs. For each of the 8 MDGs, the PRSP has developed its own targets and indicators, which serve for monitoring and evaluation of the poverty alleviation strategies[18].

38. The UNDAF for Pakistan has chosen five priority areas of cooperation within the framework of the PRSP: participatory governance; poverty alleviation; fundamental cross-cutting issues;

[16] *Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead,* Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper; Government of Pakistan; December 2003, p. 2.

[17] Development Cooperation Report, 2000-2002; United Nations System, August 2003, p. 7.

[18] Pgs 129-130; Annex-II, *Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead,* Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper; Government of Pakistan; December 2003.

health and education. All five thematic concerns of this UNDAF are based on good governance as the enabling environment[19]. Together the PRSP and UNDAF provide the main framework for donor interventions in the backdrop of the MDGs. Within the interventions, however, the focus, approach and strategies of implementing organizations vary considerably.

Main ongoing programmes in the field of food security and poverty alleviation

39. In terms of the poverty-livelihoods-food nexus, government policy is oriented towards achieving increased agricultural productivity to bring increased food availability to poor households. The PRSP strategy is to: improve rural and agricultural infrastructure; provide access to cultivable land; extend credit to farming communities; introduce crop maximization techniques; invest in water infrastructure, water management and conservation; improve livestock breeds and marketing of livestock and livestock products; address issues of the dairy industry and fisheries; and enhance rural incomes through labour intensive public works programme and micro-finance. The lynchpin of the strategy is social mobilization and targeting of women.

40. Direct strategies for poverty reduction have led to increase social safety nets, including generalized food subsidies, targeted food support programmes, cash transfer payments and enhanced social security. Cash and in-kind transfers are the traditional form of support. They include private, charitable contributions and are considered to be a fairly efficient transfer method because they do not distort consumption or production choices.

41. Established in 1992, the **Pakistan Bait-ul-Maal Programme** has operated a Food Support Programme (FSP), based upon federal budgetary support. The FSP objective is to target households with an income of Rs 2,000 per month or less. The federal government administers the FSP. The food subsidy provides Rs 2,400 annually to poor households to buy wheat and food. Pakistan's FSP provides support both in the form of a cash subsidy and in the form of food stamps / coupons for the purchase of basic food items. Other programmes of the Bait-ul-Maal include individual financial assistance in the shape of cash grants and payment for education and medical needs; centres for rehabilitation of child labour and institutional rehabilitation. Bait-ul-Maal collaborates with WFP in the frame of CARW by providing food stamps (see §2.2.2).

42. **Zakat** is the most important cash transfer scheme in Pakistan. Zakat is a religious tax levied at the rate of 2.5% on financial assets. Since 1979 this tax is collected through deductions on savings bank accounts and fixed deposits, deducted annually directly from the banks and transferred to the Central Zakat Fund, maintained by the State Bank of Pakistan. Two main types of support are provided through the scheme: a monthly subsistence allowance of Rs 500 and a rehabilitation grant of up to Rs 5,000 to the needy and the poor, especially widows, orphans and the disabled.

43. The **Tawana Pakistan Programme (TPP)** is implemented under the Education Sector Reform (ESR). Started in 2001 this is a school feeding programme for 5-9 year old girls in 29 high poverty districts. Funded by the Government of Pakistan under its education budget, the TPP provides a midday meal to school girls in the school premises. A female village representative is paid a salary of Rs 1,500/month to cook and organize the food while Rs 7 per child per day is provided to the school for buying the food. TPP is present in some of the schools assisted by WFP (see §3.3.1).

44. The **Public Works Programme** aims to create employment and income-generating activities for both the rural and urban populations, in addition to improving their living conditions. Farm-to-market roads, water supply projects, construction, renovation and expansion of schools and health facilities and rural electrification projects are conceived and implemented by the civil district administration and the local people. Local communities are involved in the identification

[19] United Nations Development Assistance Framework; Pakistan 2004-2008.

of schemes to be funded under the programme. Funds come from the Government of Pakistan while several donors have projects and programmes in the sector.

45. A key component of the government's poverty alleviation strategy is micro finance for the poor. The **Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF)**, and the **Micro Finance Bank (MFB)**, named the Khushali Bank, provides credit to the poor mainly through partner organizations, largely NGOs. Funding for this comes largely from the World Bank, the ADB and the Government of Pakistan.

BOX 2: OTHER RELEVANT SECTORAL POLICIES

Education

Investing in human capital is a key priority of the PRSP. The **Education Sector Reform (ESR)** 2001 is cast in the long-term perspective of the National Education Policy 1998-2010 and the Ten-Year Perspective Development Plan 2001-2011. Compulsory primary education linked to provision of appropriate facilities is being introduced gradually. The framework of ESR is to reach the disadvantaged population groups in rural and urban areas with emphasis on girls and women; promote community participation and ownership of basic education programmes at the grassroots; and improve relevance and quality of basic education through enhancing learning achievements of children, youth and adults.

HIV/AIDS

The most structured programme against HIV/AIDS is awareness-raising in urban-based organized vulnerable groups such as brothel-clienteles and a National Aids Control programme based upon advocacy and mobilization of communities. HIV/AIDS still prevails in high risk groups (estimated 1% of population). There are signs of cooperation in the country between the WB, DFID, CIDA and UNAIDs, and regionally in the form of a new South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) project. Some NGOs are also active in the field (for example, the Catholic Relief Service). However, there are few facilities for detection, identification and treatment of HIV/AIDS cases in rural areas while gaps in programmes include gender-specific projects, the armed forces, victims of rape and abuse, non-camp based refugees and beauty parlours and barbers [1].

Health

The **National Health Policy (NHP)** 2001 accords priority to primary and secondary healthcare facilities and focuses on prevention and control of diseases, reproductive and child health, and nutrient deficiencies. The Programme for Primary Health Care is based upon preventive and promotional healthcare. The **Population Welfare Programme** combines a community participation approach with an approach that delivers services from a static centre through a service delivery network of family welfare centres, Mobile Service Units, Reproductive health centres, NGOs and a workforce of Lady Health Workers who register households on the basis of the households in their catchments. A **Nutrition Education Programme** is being implemented in the health sector in order to address the issues of low birth-weight babies, maternal and child nutrition, deficiency of micro nutrients and promotion of breastfeeding, fortification and provision of vitamin A, iron and iodine. The national **Expanded Programme of Immunization (EPI)** immunizes children against six contagious diseases and covers the Hepatitis B vaccine and neonatal tetanus immunization. The **TB-DOTS** and **Rollback Malaria Strategy**, as the **National Aids Control** programmes, are based upon advocacy and mobilization of communities and relies mainly on awareness raising programmes [2].

Devolution

The **Devolution Plan** implemented in 2001 entails a wide-ranging reform of provincial institutional arrangements. It has created new local government structures that have the mandate for service delivery as well as social development. The civil administration and district-level functionaries of line departments have been placed, for the first time, directly under the control of elected local representatives. Seats have been reserved for otherwise disenfranchised groups, such as minorities, women, peasants or workers, who are granted one third of all seats. Despite this, in many regions these groups remain practically excluded from discussions in the councils. Citizens Communities Boards are being constituted to monitor the service delivery process [3].

Gender

Gender is stated to be a cross-cutting theme in all development policies. The **Perspective Development Plan** 2001–11 has set targets in terms of indicators of women's development. The **National Policy for the Advancement of Women** and the **National Plan of Action for Women** 2002 emphasize economic and social empowerment of women and the need to eliminate the gender gap, particularly in social sectors. They reflect the basic themes of women's development and partial empowerment, but stop short at issues of discriminatory laws and intra-family violence. The Devolution Plan 2001 has provided a progressive window by allocating 33% of seats to women at all tiers of local governance. These structures, at present, do not have the capacity to implement social development and gender programmes. A widely encompassing **Gender Reform Action Programme** was finalized in 2003 and is scheduled to go before the cabinet for approval.

1: Inventory of HIV/AIDS Activities: Interventions at a Glance; UN Theme Group on HIV/AIDS Pakistan
2: Design and Appraisal of National health Facility (Pakistan), DFID; OCT-Dec 2002
3: The Local Government Ordinance 2001; Promulgated by Provinces

Country context main features

- In Pakistan, chronic food problems are mainly due to the lack of economic and social access by the poor.
- For large segments of the population there is a combination of poverty of income, poor social indicators, vulnerable livelihoods and inadequate food consumption.
- The incidence of food poverty is higher in rural areas.
- Women in particular suffer disproportionately from poverty and from weak access to education and healthcare.
- The Government, with the assistance of ODA, has developed a strategy of poverty reduction that foresees sustained growth in agricultural and rural economic activities and access to education, health, safe drinking water and rural infrastructure.
- Strategies for poverty reduction also include expanding social safety nets as generalised food subsidies, targeted food support programmes, cash transfer payments and enhanced social security.

2.2 WFP INTERVENTIONS IN PAKISTAN

2.2.1 Portfolio of intervention and its evolution since 1997

46. The WFP in Pakistan moved away from projects to a Country Programme approach in 1994, when existing projects were combined to prepare the 1994-1998 CP. Activities remain in the three areas of girls' education, mother and child healthcare and rural development/natural resources management (NRM) which, with the introduction of the EDP in 1999, correspond respectively to focus areas 2; 1; and 3, 4 and 5 of the policy (see § 3.1.1).

47. Even before the diffusion of the policy, the 1994-1998 CP evaluation[20] helped adjusting and refocusing the programme according to lessons learned. Major changes were the strategic focus on women as main beneficiaries; the phasing out of classic FFW; NRM activities to be replaced by a more community centred approach in NRM; more accurate targeting through an extensive VAM exercise.

48. The 2001-2003 CP revised the allocation of resources in accordance with the EDP, giving more emphasis to human development, especially education, than to assets creation. As shown in Table 6, education activities became the most important investment, increasing from 15% to 53% of CP[21], while NRM decreased from more than half of the resources to 27%. Allocations for the health project meanwhile were reduced following the evaluation's recommendations and the VAM targeting. In the next CP (2004-2008) these trends will be confirmed, as the proposed proportion for funds allocation is: education: 76%; health: 14%; CARW: 10%[22]. The share for CARW can be reduced because of the availability of partners' resources, as recommended by the EDP.

49. WFP Pakistan portfolio also includes emergency operations (EMOP). WFP has been helping the GoP face a number of emergencies, i.e. the Afghanistan crisis with following refugees since

[20] WFP, full report of the end of term evaluation of the Pakistan country programme 1994-1998, September 1999.
[21] Also thanks to the US funded School Feeding Initiative, that almost doubled the funds for education (6.4 M US$).
[22] 2004-2008 CP, Annex 1.

1996 and droughts in Punjab, Balochistan and Sindh in 2002-2003 (for details see § 3.1.3). The EMOP allocations during the present CP period amount to 106,795 MT[23].

Table 6: Evolution of WFP development portfolio since 1994

	1994-1998 (10016.0)			2001-2003 (10091.0)		
	US$ M	% on total	MT distributed	US$ M	% on total	MT distributed
Education[24]	5.3	15.5	3,900	14.2	53.8	10,056
Health	13	37.9	9,450	5	18.9	4,194
NRM/CARW	19.03	55.4	90,929	7.2	27.3	15,805[25]
Total CP	37.3	100	104,279	26.4	100	30,055

Sources: 1994-1998 CP Evaluation; 2002 and 2003 SPR; EMOP confirmed contributions on WFP website; WFP CO EMOP brief

2.2.2 Key issues of CP and outline of ongoing interventions

50. The Enabling Development Policy was formulated in 1999 and in Pakistan the reference period for the policy implementation corresponds to the 2001-2003 Country Programme, which started in January 2002 and has been prolonged until September 2004. A 2004-2008 CP has been prepared as a continuation of the present CP, without changes in activities and approach, but more ambitious in increasing the number of beneficiaries, improving RBM and partnership.

51. The overall objective of the 2001-2003 Country Programme is the social and economic empowerment of rural women, by providing access to food, together with the creation of human capital and physical assets, enabling women and girls to take advantage of development opportunities. The CP comprise three main activities:

- **Activity 1: Assistance to Girls' Primary Education**. The objectives are to increase enrolment, attendance and retention rates at selected girls' primary schools in targeted areas. The implementing partner is the Ministry of Education and its departments at provincial and district level. The activity could almost double its resources thanks to the US-funded School Feeding Initiative. It presently covers 28 districts and in 2003 it reached 248,188 beneficiaries[26];

BOX 3: ASSISTANCE TO GIRLS' PRIMARY EDUCATION

Assistance to Girls' Primary Education is implemented by giving a tin of 3.7 litres of edible oil to all girls attending primary school for at least 20 days per month (for the nine months of the school year) and to all female teachers present in the school for at least 22 days per month. The tin of oil has a local value of approximately US$ 3.5, while the average monthly income of a poor family is only US$ 33.20. The oil is fortified with vitamin A.

In-country oil storage, transport and distribution fall under the responsibility of the Ministry of Education. Teachers are in charge of oil distribution to the children while the provincial and district level education officers are responsible for monitoring. WFP also provides trucks for transport of oil and cars for monitoring. WFP provides edible oil and training to the counterpart staff involved in project implementation. The GoP contribution consists of the cost of teachers' salaries, school building maintenance, school supplies, storage, transport and others.

The schools must comply with the UNESCO standards for "Minimum Requirements for Rural Primary School in Pakistan" in order to ensure that WFP is not attracting girls to sub-standard schools. UNESCO checklist covers items such as adequate buildings, qualified teachers and the availability of teaching materials, latrines and drinking water. Given the difficulties of finding such standards in poor areas, three main items are requested (adequate building, qualified teacher, benches or mats and a blackboard) while the other items are qualified as "desirable".

[23] 85,795 MT for EMOP 10043.0, 10043.1 and 10228 (Afghan refugees) and 21,000 MT for 10171.0 (Drought in Sindh and Balochistan and flood in Sindh).

[24] Figures include the Supplementary Activity in education under the US funded School Feeding Initiative (SFI).

[25] The discrepancy between allocated resources and food distributed (more in CARW than in education) is explained by the use of balances from the previous CP in 2002.

[26] The figures include supplementary education activity as well.

- **Activity 2: Promoting Safe Motherhood**. The objectives of this activity are: i) to increase the attendance of expectant mothers at government health centres, where they can obtain reproductive healthcare services; ii) to promote specific vaccinations for mothers and infants; and iii) to promote beneficial practices through health education, including mother's nutrition, the use of trained birth attendants, breastfeeding, family planning and good weaning practices. It is implemented by the Ministry of Health and Provincial Health Departments in 20 districts across three regions (Sindh, NWFP and Punjab). The number of beneficiaries in 2003 was 175,000;

BOX 4: PROMOTING SAFE MOTHERHOOD

Promoting Safe Motherhood consists in the distribution of 3.7 litres of edible oil to all pregnant women and nursing mothers who attend the government Basic Health Units (BHU) for pre- and post-natal services. The tin of oil is given for each of two prenatal and two postnatal visits. During the prenatal visits, tetanus vaccinations are provided, along with messages on safe motherhood and reproductive health. The same messages are given at the postnatal visits, along with tuberculosis (BCG) and the first dose of polio and diptheria-tetanus (DPT1) vaccinations for the infants. Women beneficiaries also receive iron folate tablets as part of a joint CIDA/WFP effort.

BHU are selected using the basic minimum service availability criteria as defined by WHO, including female posted staff, EPI facility, family planning services and functional HMIS. The provincial health departments are the main implementing partners for this activity. WFP provides also training of counterpart staff in project implementation, and vehicles for monitoring.

- **Activity 3: Creating Assets for Rural Women (CARW).** The objectives are: i) to assist in building physical, economic and social assets for poor rural women and their families; ii) to provide and facilitate easy access for poor rural women to natural resources and needed social services; and iii) to strengthen the role of poor rural women in decision-making. The implementation partners (IP) vary in the different provinces: Forestry Department, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development; NGOs. CARW is implemented in three regions: Balochistan, Sindh and AJK. Beneficiaries in 2003 numbered 38,232 (of which 26,762 women).

BOX 5: CREATING ASSETS FOR RURAL WOMEN (CARW)

A number of former food-for-work projects focused on environment rehabilitation and rural infrastructure development have been partly phased out and partly redesigned as **Creating Assets for Rural Women (CARW).** This project is presently implemented in 10 districts in three regions (Balochistan, Sindh and Azad Jammu and Kashmir-AJK), has a community-centered and participatory approach and creates assets particularly demanded by rural women (water tanks, latrines, wells, water ponds) and income-generating activities for women (poultry farms, livestock, vocational training), besides rural and forestry activities of a more general interest such as plantations, irrigation schemes, link roads and land rehabilitation. Management, vocational and skills training are alsooffered to participants.

In Sindh the project is implemented through local NGOs already active in the area. In AJK the project is included in the Integrated Land Management (ILM) of the Forestry Department which implements it through a number of social organisers recruited by the project. In Balochistan WFP is a part of a UNDP/Government programme implemented through a network of social organizers supervised by project experts. In all regions activities are identified, planned and carried out through Villagers' Committees and Women's Organizations, who receive food stamps (from WFP) for participating in the various activities.

Food-stamp system

Food stamps are distributed by the Government-owned Bait-ul-Mal (PBM), the agency that implements the Government's own food stamp system. (see §2.1.3). WFP gives food (calculated as wheat in SPR for simplicity purposes) to the government who monetizes it and issues the food-stamps. Food-stamps can be used to buy food in a list of local shops.

52. The respective areas of focus of the Pakistan CP were selected according to:

- Areas of WFP activities as defined in EDP;
- Corresponding areas of priority according to Governments' PRSP and UNDAF;
- Historical experience and partnerships of WFP in the country;
- Available resources and conditionalities from donors.

Main features of WFP intervention in Pakistan

- The Pakistan portfolio has been revised following the EDP directives, shifting resources from infrastructure development to human development. The education programme is at present the largest investment.
- The focus of the Country Programme is entirely on women: schoolgirls; pregnant and nursing women; rural women.
- Implementing partners of WFP activities in Pakistan are Government administrations and NGOs.

3 MAIN FINDINGS

3.1 EVALUATION QUESTION # 1: HOW RELEVANT IS THE CP IN TERMS OF THE EVOLVING CONTEXT OF POVERTY REDUCTION AND FOOD SECURITY

It was felt that, at country level, the relevance and coherence need to be assessed essentially with respect to the WFP CP (i.e. the concrete instrument of WFP development programming) rather than to the EDP. A two step approach to EQ 1 has therefore been used: i) the assessment of the coherence of the CP with respect to EDP principles; and ii) the assessment of the relevance of the CP with respect to the country context.

3.1.1 Country Programme coherence with the EDP principles and objectives

53. "Assistance to girls' primary education" is consistent with focus area 2 "Enable poor households to invest in human capital through education and training". The positive discrimination towards girls is justified by female enrolment and literacy levels and by the prevailing cultural environment in the country (see also § 2.1.1).

54. "Promoting Safe Motherhood" corresponds to focus area 1 "Enable young children and expectant and nursing mothers to meet their special nutritional and nutrition-related health needs", although the focus is not on nutrition but rather on access to reproductive healthcare, vaccination and health education, including nutrition.

55. "Creating Assets for Rural Women" addresses focus areas 3 and 5 of the policy: "Make it possible for poor families to gain and preserve assets"; and "Enable households which depend on degraded natural resources for their food security to make a shift to more sustainable livelihoods". In some areas, as in Sindh and Balochistan, it also complies with focus area 4, "Mitigate the effects of natural disasters, in areas vulnerable to recurring crises of this kind".

56. WFP activities have been integrated into the framework for poverty reduction with clear identification of the links between the CP objectives and the MDGs and between the activities promoted and the policies of government and other donors.

57. Gender concerns are addressed through the strong focus on women, which are with few exceptions the almost exclusive target group of the CP, and on activities corresponding to women's specific needs (health, education, income generating activities, rural infrastructures). However gender focus is mainly interpreted as simply targeting women. More could be done, especially in the health and education projects through an increased attention to specific cultural and socio-economic constraints and to policy dialogue and advocacy (see also § 3.2.4).

58. Targeting has been improved through identification of the 60 most insecure districts that were scaled down to 34 after consideration of criteria such as the potential partners, security, cost-effectiveness, access and female staff mobility (see also § 3.1.4).

59. In CP, activities have been designed to be implemented using a participatory approach, particularly CARW. Community involvement is a planned component of girls' education activity, while community awareness campaigns are carried out under the "Promoting safe motherhood" activity. Actually, only CARW applies participatory approaches. Community involvement is not apparent in health and education projects, and overall the projects did not succeed in raising "women's and children's issues to become community concerns" as recommended by the 2002 ECW evaluation (see also § 3.2.2).

60. As far as demonstrating results is concerned, the 2001-2003 CP contains provisions for routine monitoring visits, Beneficiaries Contact Monitoring[27] (BCM) and periodic studies to assess output and outcome. In the 2004-2008 CP a Results Based Management (RBM) and evaluation system is planned and a "results and resources matrix summary" is presented with performance indicators (output, outcome and impact). The CP envisages that VAM food security monitoring would provide the basis for exit strategies. However, the matrix and indicators presented are a very first step, and no exit strategies have been determined based on them so far (see also § 3.2.3).

61. The transformation of the previous Natural Management Programme based on classic FFW NRM activities in the community-centred and gender-focused CARW programme is the main feature where the impact of the policy can be observed. However it should be noted that the NRM project had already been changed into a social forestry approach even before the implementation of the policy, confirming the fact that the EDP has been developed on the basis of ongoing experiences and lessons learnt.

3.1.2 Relevance of the CP to the national policies and international context

62. The WFP country policy is generally consistent with the **main national poverty reduction strategies and programmes**. Of the four strategic areas of engagement in the PRSP, WFP provides explicit support in two: **building human capital** and **targeted interventions and expanding social safety nets**. As with the PRSP, the WFP programmes are oriented towards poverty reduction and easily fit within the poverty-livelihoods-food nexus. In fact, the principle of EDP favoured the integration of WFP CP. The strategy used by WFP is food aid in order to enable development in the most vulnerable regions and within the most marginalized community members. This is consistent with the fourth pillar of the PRSP (bringing the poor and vulnerable and backward regions into the mainstream of development). The community participation approach and gender targeting of WFP is also in line with the government strategy of social mobilization and gender mainstreaming.

63. It must be highlighted, however, that the scale of WFP development interventions in the Pakistani context remains small. The 2001-2003 CP total investment of 26.4 million US$ represents only 1.8% of the total ODA investment in the country in the same period for the two areas of building human capital and expanding safety nets.

64. The CARW activities of WFP aim to increase access for poor rural women in creating and preserving physical, economic and social assets and combine targeted interventions with safety nets. Although interventions vary in form and nature from one region to another, all are generally consistent with respect to the strategies of community participation of the Government of Pakistan, increasing access to credit, creation of off-farm employment opportunities, and targeting of vulnerable populations.

65. The principles of the WFP approach and strategy are also part of the governmental objective to **increase agricultural production with implications for food security**. Creating household physical assets for conserving water reduces the burden of work for women while community assets for conserving water safeguard against loss of livestock and crops and also have an impact on conservation and productivity of water resources. Other community assets such as bridle paths, access roads and woodlots provide both labour intensive work and improve natural resources and rural infrastructure. An interesting feature of CARW is that women and

[27] "BCM is defined as a systematic investigation to monitor beneficiaries' – women's, men's, girls' and boys' – perceptions of an operation". […] "BCM is concerned with beneficiaries' perspectives of access to, use of and satisfaction with outputs". WFP, Programme Design Manual.

community organizations are also savings groups and provide a measure of access to credit, a major poverty reduction strategy of the GoP.

66. The PRSP is also targeting the agro-processing sector (mainly for fruits, vegetables, dairy and livestock), and initiatives for marketing, transportation and handling of agricultural production present opportunities for an agro-based rural economy. In some regions CARW activities have included training in vocational skills, livestock care, vegetable growing and fruit processing. Socio-economic packages for livestock, vegetable gardening and small village-based shops offer supplementary means of income. Livestock represent a major part of the 'wealth' of rural households, especially for women, and strategies for livestock rearing have implications both for household food security and poverty.

67. The **Assistance to Girls Primary Education** programme dovetails with the Education Sector Reform 2001-2005 programme of the GoP which underlines the need for enrolment, retention and completion of primary school children, specifically that of girls. A recent governmental school feeding programme (**Tawana Pakistan**) is also aimed at girls' enrolment and completion at primary school level.

68. **Promoting Safe Motherhood** is one main aspect of the National Health Policy 2001. The WFP intervention contributes to the government system of providing preventative reproductive healthcare through basic health units. The WFP programme also supports the government expanded programme of immunization (EPI).

69. The direction, targeting and focus of the WFP CP is overall consistent with the MDGs, falls within the framework of the PRSP and UNDAF, and more generally within the context of the ODA trends in Pakistan. However, the WFP CP is conspicuous by its absence of any reference to governance and reforms. The premise of the MDGs is that goals require political momentum for policy change for faster progress on reducing human poverty, and provide an entry point for applying pressure[28]. The UNDAF points out to the centrality of governance reform in relation to other challenges in Pakistan and all five thematic concerns of the UNDAF are premised on good governance as the enabling environment[29]. Improving governance is one of the four areas of strategic engagement in the PRSP while programmes related to governance and reform account for 16% of the ODA funding.

70. Nevertheless, from lessons learnt from its projects and programmes and from working with government departments, WFP has had opportunity for some policy dialogue on strategies in education and health, agricultural development and food security, off-farm economic opportunities, water conservation and positive discrimination in gender targeting. However, lessons learnt have not yet been translated into policy directives, thereby extending the success of its interventions to a larger scale or over a longer term. Without this documentation the thrust of WFP interventions is likely to remain limited to targeting rather than developing positive action for an enabling development policy. This also has implications for large-scale impact and the long-term success and sustainability of WFP interventions.

3.1.3 Complementarity and integration EMOP/PRRO

71. As seen in § 2.2.1, the value of emergency assistance in Pakistan during the present CP period is more than three times the value of the development operations. There are no evident complementarities between development and the major emergency operation - the assistance to Afghan refugees - since most of it is outside development-targeted districts and is concentrated in camps for foreign populations who are supposed to return home at the end of the emergency.

[28] Page 30-31; The Millennium Development Goals; Human Development Report, 2003; UNDP.
[29] Page viii; United Nations Development Assistance Framework; Pakistan 2004-2008.

An attempt to apply the incentive approach of the girls' education programme in the refugee camps, and distribute edible oil to girls going to school, has been made by proposing a PRRO that has not, however, been approved.

72. On the contrary, some links between emergency and development operations were established during the assistance provided after the drought and successive floods in Sindh. The implementation of the emergency operations reflected EDP directives on targeting, gender and partnership, even though this happened on the basis of operational needs rather than as the consequence of the systematic application of the EDP. Nevertheless, this shows that the EDP framework can also be applied to some emergency situations and that therefore EDP directives could be applied in a more systematic way.

BOX 6: EMOP IN PAKISTAN

Since 1996 WFP Pakistan has been assisting Afghan refugees in 16 camps mostly in NWFP and Balochistan. The most recent EMOP (2002-2004) assists 288,000 refugees with general food distribution and provides supplementary feeding to 23,000 vulnerable women and children, for a total cost of around US$ 25 million. WFP also assisted during two other emergencies: the drought that affected Sindh and Balochistan from 1999 to 2003 and the floods devastating parts of Sindh in 2003. In 2002-2003 WFP distributed 20,500 t of food (wheat flour, pulses and oil) for a value of US$ 7.8 million to the drought affected, populations and 500 t of wheat flour and oil bought through WFP's Immediate Response Account for the victims of the floods.

73. During the drought and floods emergencies, the contacts established with NGOs and CBOs to identify most vulnerable situations, help in food distribution and provide volunteers has been the basis for longer term collaboration in development operations. For instance, one of the major NGOs working in Sindh has become one of the implementing partners of CARW activities in the region. Emergency criteria for identifying vulnerable groups have also been used to target communities, following a "disaster mitigation" approach. Moreover collaboration with private corporations in Sindh started during the drought and had interesting follow-up for development operations (see § 3.2.1).

74. Integration exists between development and emergency operations as far as the use of VAM tools is concerned. VAM provides assessment of vulnerable food-insecure populations in emergency as well as in development settings; a Food Economy Assessment has been carried out jointly by WFP and UNHCR to evaluate the food security status of the refugee population and their extent of self-reliance.

3.1.4 Relevance of targeting of Country Programme

75. The main characteristic of WFP's development strategy is the focus on women as beneficiaries. As explained before (see § 2.1.1) gender human development data and the particular situation of the women in the country justify this choice. Women in rural food-insecure areas can globally be identified as a vulnerable group, as specified by the policy. As far as the health programme is concerned, it corresponds to focus area 1 of the policy, which explicitly addresses women and children as target groups. In primary education, the gap between boys and girls' enrolment and the social handicaps affecting girls fully justify the positive discrimination. In CARW activities, targeting is focused on women's priorities but also includes men in the community: this approach allows for enhanced women participation and benefit sharing without causing conflicts, convincing men, on the contrary, of the opportunities and advantages afforded by women participation.

76. Geographical targeting of CP activities is based on VAM food security analysis (FSA) at **district level**. After the first FSA exercise in 1998, based on social, economic and food

production sectors, the VAM unit was re-established in January 2003 and has updated the FSA with a new framework of FSA analysis, based on availability, access and absorption of food. A set of 187 indicators has consequently been selected from available secondary sources and a series of maps prepared which identify the relative level of vulnerability per district, according to agricultural and animal production, food access and food absorption, so as to provide a clear global picture of the food security in the country. These results have been endorsed by GoP administrations and are shared by the local development community[30].

77. Targeting **below district level** depends on the consideration of criteria such as potential partners, security, cost-effectiveness, access and female staff mobility, as well as, in the case of schools and health centres, on the satisfaction of the minimum standard criteria established by UNESCO and WHO[31]. While it is clear that these criteria are important, in the absence of a programme for upgrading these facilities, the minimum standard criteria may exclude precisely the most remote areas and poorest communities.

78. As far as the education and health projects are concerned, targeting is based on the assumption that only poor people use public health and education facilities and that when these facilities are in food-insecure districts the project has a good chance of reaching the most vulnerable people. It is also assumed that the tin of edible oil (and food in general) is not a commodity that can attract the well-off. The location of the facilities in rural food-insecure areas is a reasonable criterion to ensure that most of its users are from poor households. But well-off families keep away from public facilities when these are of very poor quality, and tend to approach them when the service improves. In any way, the possible bias in favour of richer people is to be monitored, especially in facilities not far from towns.

79. In CARW, targeting is more complex. District and below-district targeting are often influenced by the implementing partner's priorities and assessment. Implementation mechanisms such as cash contributions and saving-loan schemes, may exclude the poorest households. CARW as a development project tends to work with people who just need a helping hand to be independent and are not the worst-off of the community. This trend is more evident in AJK than in Sindh, where communities and households experience a general lack of resources and infrastructures.

80. In the absence of secondary data at under-district level, the VAM unit has launched a food security community and household survey that has begun in AJK and will be extended throughout the country. The survey will give a clearer picture of food security and vulnerability at community and household level.

81. It is interesting to note that problems of former NRM projects, where village committees were dominated by landlords, have been solved in different ways: i) phasing out the project in NWFP, where the power of landlords is too difficult to overcome; ii) continuing it in AJK, where the socio-economic situation is more balanced; and iii) in Sindh, concentrating on activities at community and household level which are not susceptible to interference with landlords (toilets, water-tanks, wells) (see § 3.3.3).

[30] The VAM unit has also prepared and diffused an UN Support Atlas, a series of maps where all UN supported projects are located.
[31] UNESCO for schools and WHO for health centres, see Boxes 3 and 4 § 2.2.2.

Key findings on CP relevance

- The design of CP Activities promoted by WFP is coherent with the EDP principles and directives.
- WFP activities are well integrated in Government's sector policies. WFP provides explicit support in two of the four areas of engagement of the PRSP: building human capital and targeted interventions and expanding social safety nets. WFP CP is consistent with the fourth pillar of the PRSP: bringing the poor and vulnerable and backward regions into the mainstream of development.
- WFP contributes to four of the five areas of cooperation between the Government and the UN system as defined by UNDAF: poverty alleviation, fundamental cross cutting issues (gender, environment, and humanitarian affairs), education, and health.
- The WFP CP contains no reference to governance and reforms, notwithstanding the opportunities WFP has for policy dialogue with regards to strategies in education and health, agricultural development and food security.
- Complementarities and integration of development programmes with emergency operations are limited to the use of VAM tools, mainly because target populations and areas are not the same in the case of larger and long-term EMOP investments (Afghan refugees).
- Links between emergency and development operations have been established in the case of drought emergencies and reflect EDP directives on targeting, gender and partnership, even if they are based on operational needs rather than on systematic application of EDP.
- Positive discrimination towards women as beneficiaries in targeting is justified by gender human development data and the particular situation of the women in the country. Women in food insecure areas can globally be defined as a vulnerable group, as specified by the policy.
- Geographical targeting up to the district level has been reviewed and more focused on food insecure areas as established by the EDP.
- At district level, targeting takes into consideration other criteria, such as IP availability, access, minimum quality standards for health and education facilities. These criteria may exclude the most remote and poorest communities.
- Within communities, implementation mechanisms such as cash contribution and saving-loan schemes may exclude the poorest households.

3.2 WHAT ARE THE MECHANISMS, MEANS AND TOOLS INTRODUCED/STRENGTHENED AT COUNTRY LEVEL TO FACILITATE EDP/CP IMPLEMENTATION?

82. This chapter reviews the progress made and the constraints faced by the WFP CO in putting in place at country level the policy directives of the EDP. As in the phase 1 report analysis and evaluation matrix, the issues to be analysed are the following: i) partnership; ii) demonstrating results; iii) training and capacity building; iv) gender mainstreaming; v) stakeholders participation and ownership; vi) HIV/AIDS mainstreaming; vii) resourcing of the CP and of EDP related measures.

3.2.1 Progress (and changes) in partnership

83. The EDP states that food cannot be considered as a stand-alone resource to promote development and, therefore, *partnership is a prerequisite to WFP involvement in development*. WFP implementing partners are Government administrations at central and local level and NGOs. Partnership with these is discussed in the following paragraph.

84. As far as the NRM activities are concerned, WFP has a longstanding partnership with Government administrations and a history of joint ventures with some UN agencies and bilateral organizations. Some of the most important ongoing and past joint ventures with different partners are listed below:

- FAO and WFP partnership in AJK within the framework of the watershed management project lasted for many years, wherein small interest groups were motivated to organize themselves, work for the rehabilitation of their lands, manage watersheds, save their lands from erosion, and improve their livelihoods. It ended in 1997 when WFP joined hands with the UNDP in the AJK Area Development Programme from 1998 to 2003 in CARW. The programme depended upon community based participatory development and aimed at improving the living conditions of the rural poor. More than 400 male and female organizations were established. To ensure sustainability, a secondary tier of organizations was established, to be later integrated in the State level Apex Body. A number of clusters were organized, three of them were registered and are currently operating as locally based NGOs in the socio-economic fields;
- There has been a collaboration with the German Technical Cooperation (GTZ) in Hazara in the afforestation programme and in Tarbela in watershed management activities, where GTZ supported the overall project activities. Moreover intense collaboration was carried out in the Siran valley where GTZ tested a model to protect forests through community;
- AusAid provided funds to WFP to support the social mobilisation component from 1996 to 2001 in AJK;
- Following the participatory development approach, UNDP and WFP collaboration in CARW is currently going on in the Baluchistan Area Development Programme. In addition to creating assets for rural women, the focus of this programme is to improve the water resource base, develop agriculture and improve the food security situation;
- WFP has signed 5 MoUs with different NGOs in Sindh to implement the CARW programme. Two of these NGOs are already implementing the project. The NGOs are also contributing financially to the implementation cost.

85. Only recently, however, under the impulse of the new policy, have more efforts been made to diversify and improve partnerships, which are still needed in the education and health programmes. Apparently the new CCA-UNDAF approach is compelling UN agencies to overcome competition and work in a more co-ordinated manner. This approach is consistent with WFP EDP. Recent developments in partnership include:

- MoU recently signed with:
  - WHO for children de-worming in schools and health centres. WHO family health modules will be used to impart training to staff on health messages in 19 districts;
  - UNICEF to develop a joint programme in Baluchistan, Punjab and Upper Dir and provide facilities to schools such as sanitation and drinking water;
- Initial meetings held to work out an MoU with IFAD to complement each other's activities in AJK;
- Ann MoU signed with a multinational company to provide hand-pumps to 50 WFP-assisted schools and pure water tablets for distribution through the WFP-assisted health centres.

86. Partnership with local governments, which with the introduction of devolution have a role to play in basic services management at local level, is still incipient. WFP has planned to train local representatives in project implementation and has invited, though with limited success so far, line departments to keep the local representatives informed and share reports with them. Apparently respective responsibilities have not been clarified enough and local administrations are not ready to share their privileged relationship with donors and local governments.

3.2.2 Stakeholders' participation and ownership

87. An important recommendation of the EDP is to involve other partners in the project cycle and use participatory approaches in order to understand beneficiaries' needs, involve beneficiaries in identifying activities suited to their situation, and obtain their feedback on results.

88. Country programmes themselves are the product of a participatory process, through consultations with governments, donors, other UN agencies and NGOs at central and regional level, where programme objectives, activities and approaches are discussed. The discussions in the planning process do not include people at project level.

89. The Pakistan CO worked on the present programme in collaboration with the federal counterpart ministry, the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock, which arranged several consultations with concerned federal ministries throughout this process. WFP also consulted with other United Nations agencies (especially UNDP, UNESCO, UNICEF, UNFPA and WHO) and a range of potential NGO partners. A series of provincial meetings (in all four provinces and AJK) were organized with line departments and implementing partners.

90. The mission's meetings at provincial and district level confirmed the good understanding and collaboration existing with the implementing Government's administration department. EDP principles concerning focus areas, gender and targeting seem well understood and shared, while difficulties are apparent in monitoring and RBM. Participative approaches are not being adopted by education and health departments, but are well integrated into the Forestry Department in AJK.

91. Discussions held with implementing NGOs showed a good level of dialogue and common analysis and integration of partners since the project's identification phase started. Many training sessions on project implementation and approaches are organized by WFP.

92. At project level, participatory approaches are used in CARW activities by all implementing partners. Social mobilizers work with community organizations to prepare participatory village profiles, to prioritise needs and to plan actions to be taken. Although in some cases organizations are created only for the purpose of the project, in general, fieldwork found that members are well informed on project objectives and implementation procedures and have a pro-active attitude, especially in AJK.

93. However, although participatory approaches are implemented by IPs, women, who are the main target and beneficiaries of WFP activities, are not involved enough in the entire project cycle (see also § 3.3.3). This limited participation is due to cultural constraints on women's mobility and on talking with men outside the family, as well as to women's low level of literacy.

94. Participatory approaches are not used in the education and health projects which have a "top-down" approach. In general, health and education programmes work only as schemes for the distribution of incentives, and diffusion of health and education messages depends on the capacities and goodwill of staff, who receive training from WFP only on project objectives, implementation strategy, record keeping and reporting.

95. Health and school committees are also practically non-existent, as their role would be limited to the distribution of the tins of oil. These committees could only have more scope in the frame of a broader programme touching other community health and education related issues, such as

raising awareness, supplying equipment or upgrading facilities. This kind of programme lies outside WFP-assisted education and health projects, and line departments have no specialised unit for social mobilization. No evidence was even found during the mission of the co-ordination of the education and health projects with CARW to upgrade facilities (toilets and water, for instance), as suggested in the CP.

96. The mission noted some interesting integration with other programmes in some cases: with the school canteens of Tawana Pakistan project in Sindh and with the NGO SRSP in NWFP, who have formed school committees.

97. In the case of health, the mobilization of health committees and awareness-raising are the tasks of the Lady Health Workers[32], who are from the community itself and visit households on a daily basis. These LHWs have an important role of first contact between households and health structures, but it is questionable whether women, sometimes very young (not yet married), are the best vehicle to pass on sensitive messages on women's health and reproductive care - also to men and elder women who control women in most Pakistani societies.

3.2.3 Progress (and changes) in demonstrating results

98. As for Results Based Management, work is still in progress in WFP Pakistan. Recent efforts included the preparation of: i) a "results and resources matrix summary", with performance indicators (output, outcome and impact) included in the 2004-2008 CP; ii) a log-frame for the CP; and iii) a "RBM chain matrix" (indicators, means of verification, use of information), to be filled in for each project.

99. The 2001-2003 CP stated that monitoring and evaluation tools would have been: i) routine monitoring visits; ii) Beneficiaries Contact Monitoring (BCM); and iii) periodic studies to assess output and outcome. Routine monitoring is entrusted to line ministries for health and education projects and to implementing partners for CARW, in addition to monitoring visits by WFP field officers from regional offices. BCM is carried out by WFP project managers from Islamabad in collaboration with district officers.

100. According to WFP officials, reporting by implementing partners is generally weak, in spite of extensive training in project implementation by WFP. Reviewed BCMs and mission field visits observed some cases of misuse, such as teachers or health staff asking for money to deliver the oil; fake records of attendance; beneficiaries - schoolgirls and women - not being informed of their entitlements.

101. But the very method of keeping records of beneficiaries and oil distributed is complicated and not very transparent, nor is how these data are reported in the SPR and other documentation. In general, it is not easy to have a clear picture even of outputs, not to speak of outcomes. Outcome indicators, for instance, are not consistent from one year to the next; all beneficiaries of the education programme are under the heading "Children receiving take-home ration", while teachers and other implementing staff also receive the oil. In general, it is not clear how beneficiaries are counted. Without sound hard data any kind of RBM matrix is senseless.

102. In general, there is a tendency to make sweeping and generalized statements in reports, briefs and presentations, without supporting critical qualitative indicators or hard facts. Figures and projections on "what will be done" are more emphasized than data on "what has actually been done".

103. The CP-mentioned "periodic studies to assess output and outcome" have not been carried out. WFP and administration officials told the mission that these studies are planned for the near future and were considered untimely as it is too early to assess outcome and impact of programmes that started only two or three years ago. This reason, however, applies only to more

[32] LHW programme is a part of a Government's programme on family planning.

recent CARW activities (in Sindh, for instance) and to newly-added schools and health centres. In fact WFP has been implementing the education programme for many years, and already the 1994-98 CP evaluation recommended carrying out specific studies, in order to highlight lessons learnt from what appeared a considerable success story, the impressive increase of girls' enrolment in WFP-assisted schools.

104. Pakistan is one of the countries which undertook the School Feeding Survey in 2001 with a follow-up in 2002[33]. It confirmed the dramatic increase in girls' enrolment in relation to the education programme. This kind of quantitative study is interesting as it confirms what is already known to both WFP and administration officials and also to a rapid evaluation mission: enrolment has grown, there are not enough teachers, most facilities are not upgraded, and the great majority of schools do not benefit from complementary programmes.

105. The lack of an effective monitoring and evaluation system, of baseline studies, and of qualitative case studies on outcome and impact of the programme has also limited this evaluation exercise (see also §1.2).

3.2.4 Gender mainstreaming

106. The overall objective of the CP Pakistan 2001-2003 is the social and economic empowerment of rural women in selected districts by enabling women and girls to take advantage of development opportunities. This is in line with the EDP gender emphasis, and the CP assists women and girls on a practically exclusive basis.

107. Within the EDP, however, there is also an explicit reference to the Commitments to Women policy of the WFP[34], which promotes a wider approach to gender that encompasses relations between men and women. It is these relations that determine how far women have decision-making powers, control over income and assets and unrestricted mobility. Although the CP makes reference to *enhancing women's power and decision-making role …leadership development and a voice for women's needs and concerns*[35], the linkage between these objectives and WFP gender interventions is limited to the micro level and does not affect the policy level.

108. The indicators for the expected outcome, outputs and output target indicators highlighted in the Country Programme Action Plan Results and Resources Framework[36] are largely given as numbers, rates and percentages of participation. For instance the expected outcome of the Assistance to Girls Primary Education is measured in terms of gross enrolment rate of girls in primary schools, retention rate and drop out rate[37]. Similarly, in Promoting Safe Motherhood, expected outcomes are measured in terms of percentage of women obtaining healthcare and vaccination rates for women and children. Creating assets for rural women measures outcomes for the number of physical assets created and maintained and the decrease in time spent on collecting water. Decision making is measured by the number of women's organizations and membership. There is an absence of qualitative indicators such as the performance of girls in schools and links between schooling and opportunities; the extent to which women have control over assets and income from income-generating activities; and the extent to which women have control over their own fertility.

---

33 The study is a part of the US initiative Global Food for Education (or School Feeding Initiative) which sponsored part of the Pakistan girls' education project.

34 See EDP §127. The five Commitments to Women were established in 1995 after the Beijing Conference. In 2002 an Enhanced Commitments to Women policy paper was released, that proposes eight commitments for the 2003-2007 period.

35 Page 11; Country Programme Action Plan (Pakistan 2004-2008).

36 Annex 1; United Nations World Food Programme, Country Programme, Action Plan (Pakistan 2004-2008).

36 Page 11; Country Programme Action Plan (Pakistan 2004-2008).

37 Annex 1; United Nations World Food Programme, Country Programme, Action Plan (Pakistan 2004-2008).

109. The CP appears to be based upon a general gender situation analysis although customs, traditions and socio-economic conditions impacting on gender vary widely from one region to the next. For instance the social situation of women in Tharparkar, one of the resource-poorest regions, varies considerably from that in NWFP where social customs and traditions are more inimical to women's development although their resource base is better. In AJK, which has a somewhat better resource base, there is already a strong tradition towards education but health facilities for women are almost non-existent. These differences are not expressed in the projects.

110. Gender mainstreaming also requires that all analyses identify the strategic needs specific to women in any development initiative. Food aid as a stand-alone intervention, for instance, particularly for women and girls, has a limited impact if it does not also address strategic needs such as transport and mobility. There is not much evidence that the VAM analysis in Pakistan has fully taken this aspect into consideration since VAM indicators for assessing vulnerability are not gender disaggregated for identifying the strategic needs of women. The CP clearly states that *the poorest areas are identified by VAM … activities are self targeted to the poorest people…no further selection is desirable*. The assumption is that in identifying the poorest and most vulnerable districts and targeting women beneficiaries, the specific strategic needs of women would be automatically addressed. A gender mapping system based on identified strategic needs of women would allow a more effective gender mainstreaming approach.

3.2.5 HIV/AIDS mainstreaming

111. Although estimates indicate that HIV/AIDS is on the increase in Pakistan it is still limited to high-risk groups with a strong social fencing.[38] There are few facilities for detection, identification and treatment of HIV/AIDS cases in rural areas. The WFP CP in Pakistan has no specific HIV/AIDS interventions. Health staff in facilities assisted by WFP have no specific training and directions in this domain. The evaluation team had the impression that this issue is underestimated and that HIV/AIDS prevention should be mainstreamed in Pakistan. Small NGO programmes that use food as an incentive for affected people to come out and overcome social stigma and as a support to affected families are on-going thus providing a possible basis on which collaborative efforts could be built.[39]

3.2.6 Resourcing

112. The overall financial request for the 2001-2003 Country Programme was US$ 26.4 million[40]. The total allocation of WFP funds to EDP activities for the 2001-2003 CP was US$ 30.3 million including all costs, although confirmed contributions amounted to 28.7 million (see Table 7 in the following page). For the "Assistance to Girls' Primary Education", the 2003 SPR shows a total amount of food distributed of 6,678 MT for a total number of beneficiaries of 248,188[41]. The operation is due to cost US$ 7.8 million for the 2002-2004 period, plus US$ 6.4 million from the US Global School Feeding Initiative (SFI), giving a total amount of US$ 14.2 million. The GoP contribution is US$ 23 million representing the cost of teachers' salaries, school building maintenance, school supplies, storage, transport and others. Government's direct transport and supervision cost is approximately US$ 1 million.

113. For "Promoting Safe Motherhood", in 2003 beneficiaries totalled 175,000 for an amount of food distributed of 2,590 MT. For the period 2002-2004, the cost of the operation has been US$ 5 million plus the GoP contribution of US$ 14.1 million including staff salaries, building maintenance, equipment and supplies, and US$ 0.5 worth of direct transport and supervision

38 CO's information is that indications are present for an epidemic.
39 For example we met the Catholic Relief who is active in this domain.
40 2001-2003 CP, § 100.
41 The figures include supplementary education activity as well.

costs. For CARW, in the period 2002-2004 the cost of the operation has been US$ 7.2 million plus the GoP contribution of US$ 14 million.

114. The approved budget and the confirmed contributions, along with the total expenditure, is shown in the following table:

Table 7: Approved Budget and Expenditures: CP 2001-2003 (US$)

Particulars	Approved Budget	Confirmed Contribution	Expenditures			
			2001	2002	2003	Total
Commodities	20,958,420	20,784,555	5,093,592	1,301,928	13,811,303	20,206,823
Transport	4,740,932	3,858,710	52,461	1,364,189	1,517,030	2,933,680
LTSH	0	0	0	0	0	0
ODOC	789,450	510,269	0	88,643	209,005	297,648
DSC	1,584,000	1,642,262	85,220	0	742,720	827,940
Not programmed Project Costs		- 262,908				
Total Direct Project Costs	28,072,802	26,532,888	5,231,273	2,754,760	16,280,058	24,266,091
Indirect Support Cost	2,189,679	2,179,711	825,931	286,510	1,067,269	217,9710
Total Cost	30,262,481	28,712,599	6,057,204	3,041,270	17,347,327	26,445,801

Source: WFP Standardized Project Reports 2002 and 2003.

115. The table above illustrates the level of resources approved and confirmed contributions of the CP. The confirmed contributions were both in kind (US$ 17,015,526) and cash (US$ 11,697,073). Approximately 5% of confirmed contributions were not delivered. Such a reduction in confirmed contributions is linked to the overall non-availability of funds rather than to reduced development needs.

116. The CO has over-achieved the overall physical targets as far as the total number of beneficiaries is concerned. However, targets remained under-achieved in the delivery of commodities, which may mainly be attributed to inadequate supply. The following table depicts the total number of beneficiaries addressed under different activities and the commodities distributed.

Table 8: Planned and Actual Beneficiaries Reached and Commodities Distributed 2002 - 2003[42]

Activities (commodities distributed)	Beneficiaries Reached			Distribution of Commodities		
	Planned	Actual	% Reached	Planned Mt	Actual Mt	Achievement (%)
Girls' Primary Education (oil)	207,090	198,724	96	6,896	3,766	55
Safe Motherhood (oil)	318,810	362,701	114	5,140	4,194	82
CARW (wheat)	57,310	57,853	101	27,730	15,805	57

Source: WFP Standardized Project Reports 2002 and 2003.

117. The allocation for the next CP 2004-2008 has increased significantly. If received, WFP might then be able to expand its operations within and between districts and thereby increase its coverage. However, US$ 15,862.50 have been received for 2004 under the budget head ODOC and US$ 118,050 under DSC. The table in the following page shows budget allocation for the next CP according to activities.

[42] The difference between planned and actual beneficiaries and available resources is not explained in the SPRs. As mentioned in § 3.2.3, beneficiaries' counting is complicate and not very transparent. Scattered information from SPRs and staff's statements indicate as possible causes of discrepancies: i) utilization of oil balances from the previous CP; ii) distribution of delayed supply, time lags between the handing over of the oil to district authorities at Karachi and its actual distribution to the beneficiaries and different recording periods (e.g. annual distribution of tins to beneficiaries is recorded on the basis of the academic year in Pakistan (1 April - 31 March), while the arrival and delivery of oil at Karachi is recorded on the basis of the fiscal year in Pakistan (1 July - 30 June); iii) confusion between the number of beneficiaries and the number of tins distributed.

Table 9: Annual Allocation of the Country Programme Resources for 2004-2008 (US$)

Programme Activities	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	Total
Assistance to Girls' Primary Schools	7,290,046	8,990,014	10,485,408	11,982,406	13,398,377	52,146,250
Promoting Safe Motherhood	1,925,400	1,925,400	1,925,400	1,925,400	1,925,400	9,627,000
Creating Assets for Rural Women	1,390,000	1,390,000	1,390,000	1,390,000	1,390,000	6,950,000
Total	10,605,446	12,305,414	13,800,808	15,297,806	16,713,777	68,723,251

Source: Government of Pakistan and WFP: Country Programme Action Plan 2004-2008.

118. The progressive increase for education resources is around 22% yearly, whereas allocated resources for health and CARW remain stable.

Key findings on EDP implementation

- In the framework of NRM activities, WFP has a longstanding partnership with Government administrations and a history of joint ventures with some UN agencies and bilateral organizations. Only recently, however, under the impact of the new policy, have more efforts been made to diversify and improve partnership, which is not enough developed so far in the education and health programmes.
- Participatory approaches are not used in the education and health projects which have a "top-down" approach. Health and education programmes work only as schemes for distribution of incentives, and the diffusion of health and education messages depends on the capacities and goodwill of staff, who receive training from WFP only on project objectives, implementation strategy, record keeping and reporting. Health and school committees are also practically non-existent, as their role would be limited to the distribution of tins of oil.
- There is a good understanding and collaboration with the implementing partners. They are involved from the start of the project identification phase. They accept most of the EDP principles on which WFP approach is based.
- At project level, participatory approaches are used in CARW activities by all implementing partners, although women, who are the main target and beneficiaries of WFP activities, are not involved enough in the entire project cycle.
- The WFP CP in Pakistan includes no specific HIV/AIDS interventions. Health staff in facilities assisted by WFP has no specific training or guidance in this domain.
- The WFP gender approach in Pakistan concentrates on the number of women as beneficiaries with not enough consideration given to the cultural environment, local variations, or the institutional policy framework. There is an absence of qualitative indicators. Indicators used in VAM should also be more gender sensitive: gender mapping based on the identified strategic needs of women will allow a more effective gender mainstreaming approach.
- As for Results Based Management, work is still in progress in WFP Pakistan. Demonstrating results of Pakistan WFP activities is not easy: reporting by implementing partners is generally weak, in spite of extensive training; the very method of keeping records of beneficiaries and oil distributed is questionable; how beneficiaries are counted is not clear; and the "periodic studies to assess output and outcome" foreseen in the CP have not been carried out. The lack of an effective monitoring and evaluation system, of baseline studies, and of qualitative case studies on the outcome and impact of the programme has also affected this evaluation exercise.

3.3 MAIN RESULTS OF THE EDP AT THE LOCAL/COUNTRY LEVEL

3.3.1 Assistance to girls' primary education

Beneficiaries

119. The project aims exclusively at girls' education in rural areas. This positive discrimination towards girls appears justified. In Pakistan, literacy and school enrolment rates reflect high discrepancies between men and women (see § 2.1.1). Concerning primary education, 57% of primary-age girls attend school compared to 89% of boys[43]. Girls schools account for 33% of all primary schools; 37.4% of teachers are female[44]. Disparities also exist between urban and rural areas.

120. The project was initiated in two districts in 1994, and was expanded in the year 2000 to 3,300 schools in 34 districts[45]. Since 2001 the programme has been receiving supplementary funding under the US funded School Feeding Initiative (SFI). The activity presently reaches around 3,000 schools across 28 districts. The regional governments' financial commitment has also increased: in Sindh, for instance, it rose from 5% to 9% in 2001 and will rise to 14% in the new programme (2004-2009).

121. Districts have been selected among the most vulnerable ones through VAM analysis. The selection of schools, however, also depends on logistic problems (most schools are not far from a road). The schools must also conform to UNESCO/WFP standard for "Minimum Requirements for Rural Primary Schools in Pakistan" in order to ensure that WFP is not attracting girls to sub-standard schools. The UNESCO checklist covers items such as adequate buildings, qualified teachers and the availability of teaching materials, latrines and drinking water.

122. Given the difficulties of finding such standards in poor areas, three main items are requested (adequate building, qualified teacher, benches or mats and a blackboard) while the other are qualified as "desirable". During the field visits, it was observed that, while some of the schools, particularly those on the road and not far from towns, were in good condition and met all standards, in others, even the basic criteria could not be met. On the other hand, logistic and quality standard criteria also tend to exclude the poorest and most remote communities. The commitment of the government and partners' complementary actions should help overcome these difficulties but fieldwork found that more should be done especially in terms of partners' co-ordination and beneficiaries' participation. Synergy between WFP projects is also not fully exploited: for instance, schools in communities assisted by the asset creation project were not functioning, while assisted schools could not benefit from the asset creation project (for instance to repair the building or building a well or a latrine).

123. According to the field interviews in schools and communities, the main reasons for not sending children to school are: i) distance; ii) direct and indirect costs of education; iii) for girls, cultural values and customs (heavier in NWFP); and iv) a perceived lack of utility of education.

Main outputs

124. According to the new 2004-2008 log-frame, indicators for the output of the programme are "quantity of oil distributed" and "number of girls receiving edible oil". These are also the data that can be found in the SPR.

---

43 WFP CO brief.
44 Ministry of Education brief.
45 GoP-WFP, Country Programme Action Plan 2004-2008.

Table 10: Oil distribution per beneficiaries in schools during present CP[46]

		2002	2003
Oil distributed	MT	3,378	6,678
Total girls receiving oil[47]	No.	164,244	248,188

Source: WFP SPR 2002 and 2003

125. Delays in the supply of the tins of oil were recorded in the visited schools, but they do not seem to have affected attendance, as parents trust that oil will come and distribution will start again.

126. The type of oil is generally well accepted as a substitute for local available oil and "Ghee"[48]. The oil is generally used for household cooking, but in some cases, especially when households receive more than one tin because they have several girls going to school, the oil is also sold or given free to relatives without school-age girls. The sale of oil is minor and no effect on markets could be observed.

127. Training in implementation strategy has been provided to the staff involved and a guidelines brochure in Sindhi and Urdu languages is provided to all schools.

Main outcomes

128. In the CP log-frame, outcome indicators are: "Gross enrolment rate"; "Retention and dropout rate"; "Promotion rate".

129. According to the School Feeding Survey, girls' enrolment increased by 43.7% in the assisted schools over the last three years. Since the beginning of the programme, increase has been even more dramatic: in Sindh, for instance, increase in girls' enrolment has gone from 15,053 at the start of the programme (1998) to 47,071 at present, which represents an increase of 313%[49]. This increase is confirmed in figures supplied by some of the schools at field level. Many girls interviewed in schools reported that their elder sisters have never been sent to school, confirming that the incentive worked in families traditionally not inclined to sending girls to school.

Table 11: Some evidence of growing enrolment from field

Schools	Before WFP	After WFP	Teacher/student ratio
Sunigram, NWFP	62 (2002)	242 (2004)	80
Niazpura, AJK	38 (2000)	96 (2004)	48
"Ismail Kashkeli", Thatta, Sindh	77 (1999)	128 (2003)	32

130. Attendance is ensured by the obligation to be present at school for at least 20 days in a month (22 for teachers) in order to qualify for the tin of oil[50]. Less than 10% of girls could not receive the oil owing to attendance below the required minimum level[51]. Apparently a 'virtuous cycle' has been established. Oil as an incentive encourages teachers and students to attend regularly, the regular presence of teachers acts as a further incentive, the regular attendance of students, according to teachers, ensures a better performance.

46 Figures include Supplementary Education resources from SFI.
47 The SPR only indicate girls as beneficiaries, while also teachers and other implementing staff receive the tin monthly (see § 2.2.2). It is not clear where these beneficiaries are counted.
48 Hydrogenated vegetable oil with animal fat traditionally used.
49 Sindh provincial brief.
50 According to the SFI survey, in Pakistan attendance rate in WFP assisted schools is generally between 70% and 90%.
51 Sindh FO brief.

131. The completion rate is 34%, compared with 20% before the WFP intervention. Scattered evidence in data and fieldwork shows that enrolment declines from class 2 to class 5.

BOX 7: GIRLS' ENROLMENT RATES

In one of the visited schools (Thatta), enrolled girls number 421 in class 1, drop to 81 in class 2, halve in class 3 and 4 and are 22 in class 5. In the same school, since the establishment of the school in 1996 (WFP assistance since 1999) 11 girls have continued studies after the 5th class and this was said to be a record, probably correctly. Interviews with families confirmed that they do not plan to send girls to school after class 5, because of distance and transport problems.

132. Other assistance programmes contribute to results: some of the schools visited in Sindh also receive assistance from the Tawana Pakistan programme (school canteen) and some also benefit from the "free textbook" and vaccinations programmes. In one of the visited schools, the first increase in attendance (from 22 to 55 girls) coincided with the year of introduction of the free textbook scheme (1996), before WFP assistance started.

133. The student–to-teacher ratio shows a much slower increase in teaching staff. According to the SFI survey, the student to teacher ratio passed from 20.7 in 1998 to 44.9 in 2002 and class size increased from 15 to 32 students per classroom. In some cases, "volunteer" teachers join the staff[52].

134. The mission's impressions are that oil works as an incentive but that the school's environment and access is as important. The same applies to free textbooks and uniforms; improved school facilities; the regular presence of qualified teachers; transportation facilities, especially for girls; and a general development environment leading to interest in literacy.

Projected impacts

135. The last version of the 2004-2008 CP log-frame identifies the impact of girls' education programmes in "Improved literacy level among girls in food insecure areas". This issue relates to the quality of education, the slow increase in the number of qualified teachers and to the fact that the upgrading and equipment of facilities are not encouraging in this respect[53].

136. Lately, however, the Government has committed itself to lift the ban on teachers' recruitment, and the WFP CO has finalised a joint programme with UNICEF, which could improve the school environment.

Unintended effects

137. Some evidence has been found of girls shifting from one school to another one where the oil was distributed. In particular, in a school in Tharparkar (Sindh) a neighbouring school closed, apparently because children had all gone to the WFP assisted-school. In AJK and NWFP some girls left private schools to go to WFP-assisted public schools, even if the quality of the facilities and the qualification of teachers were not as good.

138. The tin of oil is so much appreciated by parents that they also tend to send to school very young girls (to "Katchi" pre-school class). These very young girls sometimes have to walk for miles every day with their elder sisters in order to qualify for the oil supply. Some very young boys too walk to school with their elder sisters, as they cannot stay at home alone.

---

[52] The voluntary teachers are appointed under the WFP project (where needed). These are identified by the community and given 1 and sometimes 2 tins of oil (if the teacher is qualified). They are not paid a salary. These teachers will be contacted first when the education department recruits teachers.

[53] The issue of the quality of public school is very relevant: "For those children who complete primary school only 18% are numerate and 7% are literate to an expected level of competency", UNICEF, *Pakistan. Facts and Figures*, 2003.

Key findings on Assistance to Girls' Primary Education results

- According to the School Feeding Survey, girls' enrolment increased 43.7% in the assisted schools over the last three years. Apparently a 'virtuous circle' has been established. Oil as an incentive pushes teachers and students to attend regularly, the regular presence of teachers works as a further incentive, and the regular attendance of students, according to teachers, ensures a better performance.
- The oil provided is generally well accepted as a substitute for local available oil.
- Logistic and quality standard criteria tend to exclude the poorest and most remote communities.
- The completion rate is 34%, compared with 20% before WFP's intervention. Scattered evidence in data and fieldwork shows that enrolment declines progressively from class 2 to class 5.
- The synergy with other assistance programmes contributes to results and demonstrate that the school's environment and access is as important as oil as an incentive.
- The slow increase of the number of qualified teachers and in the upgrading and equipment of facilities raises questions on the quality of education.
- Some evidence has been found of girls shifting from one school to another where the oil was being distributed.
- The oil incentive impels some parents to send to school girls who are too young.
- The absence of impact studies, lack of a good monitoring system and scattered evidence of girls shifting from one school to another one where the oil was distributed, casts shadows on the actual impact of the activities.

3.3.2 Promoting Safe Motherhood

Beneficiaries

139. This activity aims to address the special health needs of expectant or nursing mothers and their young children in food-insecure areas. As shown in § 2.1.1 Table 1, infant mortality rate and under 5 malnutrition in Pakistan are high. Also, 340 women per 100,000 live births die through preventable complications during pregnancy and childbirth; only 20% of deliveries are attended by a skilled person; two-thirds of pregnant women are anaemic; and 25% of neo-natal deaths are from tetanus[54]. The national average for immunization coverage is 53%, but with significant variations between districts.

140. Besides poverty, ignorance and missing or insufficient health facilities, it has to be considered that the Purdah[55] regulations are much more strongly applied to young women than to girls before puberty. It is not at all self-evident that a young mother might be allowed to leave the home even for health reasons.

141. WFP assistance in the health sector started in 1976 with the Supplementary Feeding Programme, followed by the Primary Care Programme in 1996. Since 1994, the activity has

[54] UNICEF, Pakistan. Facts and figures, 2003.
[55] Traditional restrictions on women mobility. Where *Purdah* is strict women cannot leave their compound. Usually they cannot go out unaccompanied by a male relative.

focused on women's health and safe motherhood. The present programme started in 2001 after a VAM exercise that sharpened targeting and reduced geographical coverage from 85 to 19 districts, using the same level of resources.

142. WFP covers 472 health facilities in the selected districts, most of which are basic health units (BHU - the very first reference health centre). Due to the lack of a local qualified BHU WFP also covers higher-level facilities (and also an NGO-managed centre). In order to qualify all centres must conform to WHO/WFP standards (female posted staff, EPI facility, family planning, functional HMIS).

143. Only poor people are believed to go to public health centres, as the well-off usually ask doctors to come to their home or go to private clinics. However, a woman met in one of the centres told the team that she usually sees a private clinic for other diseases but prefers the public health centre for 'women's problems' because there she can find female staff. As previously mentioned, in facilities located not far from towns, it is very difficult to ascertain whether assistance is provided only to vulnerable groups.

Main outputs

144. Output indicators for the Safe Motherhood Programme are "quantity of oil distributed", "number of women receiving oil and health service for themselves and their infants"; "number of children immunized with BCG and DPT"; "number of women immunized with TT vaccine".

Table 12: Vegetable oil distributed and beneficiaries in health centres during present CP

		2002	2003
Vegetable oil distributed	MT	1,604	2,590
Expectant and nursing mothers participating[56]	No.	187,701	175,000

Source: WFP SPR 2002 and 2003

145. Data on immunization are not recorded yet in SPR. Regional data are available for instance for Sindh:

Table 13: Oil distribution per service delivered in health centres during present CP in Sindh

		2002	2003
Total food distributed	Tins	152,116	97,662
	MT	1,685	
Total losses district	Tins	161	277
Total losses centres	Tins	627	533
Visit 1: TTI	Tins	65,198	53,910
Visit 2: TT2	Tins	42,450	35,283
Visit 3: DPT1/BCG	Tins	19,838	19,591
Visit 4: DPT2	Tins	14,397	18,942
LHV (Lady Health Visitors)	Tins	335	514

Sources: Sindh FO brief and monthly provincial report.

146. As is evident from the table, at every successive stage there is an increase in dropouts, which however declined in 2003, due to increased staff training and the distribution of ration cards in the local language. This drop can generally be observed in all provinces.

[56] The SPR only indicate mothers as beneficiaries, while also LHV and other implementing staff receive the tin monthly (see § 2.2.2). It is not clear where these beneficiaries are counted. The SPR 2002 (page 5) provides the following explanation for the exceptionally high number of beneficiaries vis a vis actual quantities of oil distributed in 2002: "In the health centres 187,700 pregnant mothers have registered under activity 2, which appears higher than planned annual beneficiaries, as it includes beneficiaries who will continue to receive vegoil in 2003". The mission did not have access to the actual number of beneficiaries.

147. Staff met during fieldwork confirmed the increase in attendance and vaccination but also stated that "women just come for oil" with a drop in attendance when there are supply shortages. The dropout in successive stages is explained by staff to be variously linked to the following causes: village vaccination schemes, migration, the need to wait for a chance to come with a male relative, and the traditional transfer of the women to their mothers' house for delivery. Better information received from staff has apparently been a motivation, and ration cards in local language have helped improve attendance levels.

148. Shortages of supply, untimely delivery of oil and pilferage are also reported in some cases in BCM and field evidences, and obviously contribute to disaffection and irregular attendance.

149. Cultural attitudes and lack of knowledge and awareness on the part of women should also be considered. The vaccinations given - in women's view - do not correspond to any known illness and are therefore not seen as a benefit in itself without supply of incentives. People sometimes die before they can be taken to the health centres – small children are just "taken by the ghosts" in local perception when they in fact have died of tetanus.

150. Women met in health centres were in general motivated not only by oil but also to go to the health centre for other treatments. The distribution of one tin of oil at two prenatal and two post-natal visits is an incentive to access the health services and healthcare but also enables households to save some money.

151. The nature of the incentive (tin of oil) is appreciated by staff who remember previous programmes, when various food items were distributed, with many logistical problems, resulting in "health centres transformed into shops". The sealed tin is also appreciated by women because they offer a product cleaner than oil sold from open cans at the bazaar.

Main outcomes

152. Outcome indicators for the programme are "improved use of health services by pregnant and nursing mothers" and "improved immunization rates to help towards elimination and control of vaccine-preventable diseases".

153. The mission obtained this kind of data only for the Sindh region, which demonstrated the higher attendance in WFP-assisted centres. In 2003, WFP-assisted centres, which account for 26% of the total in the region, cover more than half of the total registrations, as shown in the following table:

Table 14: Percentage of registrations and vaccinations covered by WFP assisted health centres in Sindh in 2003

	% on total health centres
Pregnant women registration	52%
TT1	57%
TT2	58%
DPT1/BCG	48%
DPT2	48%

Source: Sindh FO brief.

Projected impacts

154. According to the CP log-frame, the impact of the Safe Motherhood programme can be measured by the "improved access of women to mother and child healthcare (MCH) services in food insecure areas".

155. Outcome data show that the distribution of tins of oil works as an incentive for women to go to health centres in case of pregnancy, at least for the first contact. The drop in successive visits probably means that more should be done in staff training and monitoring and in the

presentation of the health communication package. The women's families (husbands and mothers-in-law in particular) also seem to be an important but neglected target of sensitization, as women's mobility actually depends on their agreement.

Key findings on Promoting Safe Motherhood results

- Distribution of the tins of oil works as an incentive for women to go to health centres in case of pregnancy, at least for the first contact. Data at regional level show that attendance is higher in WFP-assisted centres.
- At every successive stage there is an increasing dropout rate due to several factors but apparently also to insufficient information for women and to lack of sensitization of the male members of the family and mothers-in-law in particular, on whom women's mobility depends.
- In the absence of specific studies it is not clear how much the health education messages are passed onto women and retained by them.

3.3.3 Creating Assets for Rural Women

Beneficiaries

156. Creating Assets for Rural Women (CARW) activities are based on social mobilization for creation of economic, physical and social assets of direct benefit to rural women. By addressing these strategic needs CARW aims to provide an environment enabling women to participate in income-generating activities, participatory natural resource management (NRM) and human resource development (see also § 2.2.2). Consequently, women represent the majority of beneficiaries.

157. At present, the project is implemented in 10 districts across three regions (AJK, Balochistan and Sindh)[57]. As already mentioned (§ 3.1.4), targeting of the project has been reviewed on the basis of the 1999 evaluation and of the EDP: the focus on classical NRM activities and large infrastructure creation has shifted towards human development, community based assets and gender. Areas that were selected mainly for their NRM interest have therefore been phased out and geographical targeting has been restricted to VAM-identified food-insecure districts. Activities were also phased out in some areas (e.g. NWFP) where social pressures were strong and landlords tended to appropriate most of the benefits.

158. At district level, targeting is determined by IP intervention areas and, in some cases (as found by the mission particularly in AJK), also by self-targeting of more dynamic communities, who ask to be included in the programme.

159. Within the communities, community organizations (COs) or *para* (i.e. village) development committees (PDC) are formed, sometimes women only, sometimes mixed. In some communities, several committees can be found, following ethnic or neighbourhood criteria. Field evidence showed that communities as a whole were well informed about the programme and participation in COs/PDCs was high. Beneficiaries met reported no conflicts and said that all households in the communities joined the COs/PDC.

160. Within each organization, however, the eligibility to receive assistance in assets creation is determined by the ability to purchase raw materials (in Sindh) or to complement the "development package" offered by the project with resources or savings already possessed (in

[57] The mission only visited Sindh and AJK.

AJK). This implies the risk of leaving the poorest of the poor outside the framework of the intervention. Beneficiaries met appeared to have some resource basis and, especially in the case of AJK, to be the most dynamic members of the communities.

161. Project targeting mainly depended upon the assumption that poverty is widely spread within the districts and that any distinction between the poorer and not so poor households would be difficult. A proper database still needs to be developed[58], in order to analyse and establish the profile of communities at household level.

Table 15: Food distributed and beneficiaries in CARW

		2002		2003	
Food distributed[59]	MT	10,119		5,686	
Beneficiaries		**Male**	**Female**	**Male**	**Female**
FFW	No.	3,846	8,974	7,648	22,938
FFT	No.	1,623	5,178	1,529	6,117
Total beneficiaries	No.	5,469	14,152	9,177	29,055

Source: 2002 and 2003 SPR, and own calculations

162. Calculation of the number of beneficiaries is done on the basis of persons receiving food stamps (FS). This number appears difficult to establish in many cases and does not give a realistic picture of the project's outreach. In AJK, for instance, FS are managed within the COs and members of the organizations often share one "package" of food stamps so as to carry out more than one economic activity which will benefit more than one person. In Sindh, those who physically make the asset, usually men, receive the FS. The asset and the food taken in exchange of FS will benefit the household and, in the case of community assets, the community.

Key findings on CARW beneficiaries

- Geographical targeting has been restricted to VAM-identified food insecure districts. At district level targeting is determined by IP intervention areas and, in some cases (as found by the mission particularly in AJK), also by self-targeting of more dynamic communities, who ask to be included in the programme.
- Within each organization, the eligibility to receive assistance in assets creation is determined by the ability to complement the "development package" offered by the project with resources already owned. This implies the risk of leaving the poorest of the poor outside the framework of the intervention.
- The calculation of the number of beneficiaries is done on the basis of persons receiving the food stamps. This number appears difficult to establish in many cases and does not give a realistic picture of the project's outreach.

Outputs

163. Outputs for CARW, as identified in the RBM-Results Chain Matrix, are "Number of women's organization (WO)/communities assisted through FFW and FFT activities"; "Number of male/female beneficiaries receiving food-stamps"; "Number of skills training conducted"; "Number of women's groups formed and registered"; "Number and types of assets created".

[58] A household survey for AJK is in course of processing by WFP VAN unit.
[59] Although the activity foresees the distribution of food stamps, for accounting purposes wheat is considered as it is the main staple given in exchange of FS.

Table 16: Output of CARW reported in SPR

		2002	2003[60]
Female groups formed	No.	Data not available	1,154
Skills development trainings	No.	Data not comparable[61]	330
Rural access roads and paths	Km	53	Data not available
Woodlots/Fuel wood plantation	Acres	10,963	7,745
Water ponds/Community ponds	No.	230	351
Family water tanks	No.	9,678	3,990
Community wells	No.	Data not available	321

Source: 2002 and 2003 SPR.

164. The project has achieved an impressive number of assets and activities, most remarkably in Sindh, where it started only two years ago. Assets observed during the mission were in good condition and generally in use (excepting ponds that were dry because of the season, and economic stoves, apparently not extensively used).

165. In Sindh, women particularly appreciate household water tanks and toilets, which address specific women's needs, saving time in fetching water and avoiding the dangers and lack of privacy entailed in going "to the bush". Water ponds are appreciated by all the community, as they prolong water availability for farming in a very dry and prone-to-drought environment. In AJK, women are particularly interested in developing economic activities such as poultry farms, community shops, and the raising of milking cows, while there is general interest in fuel wood plantations, water reservoirs and land terracing.

166. In AJK, training courses for women are also an opportunity for women to go outside the village and "take the bus": some women told the mission that at the outset men were not very willing to let them go, but that they were later convinced by the economic advantages that women activities bring to the household.

167. Beneficiaries appreciate food stamps as an incentive and exchange them with basic food (rice, flour, tea, sugar, ghee, oil). The FS system seems to work without problems. In AJK, FS are complemented by the project by means of cash assistance. In Sindh, only FS are received. Although food assistance is appreciated, beneficiaries' main priority remains employment. However, the mission's impression is that FS allow a greater control of benefits by women.

Outcomes

168. Outcomes for CARW, as identified in the RBM-Results Chain Matrix, are "Physical assets created and maintained"; "Women and adolescent girls trained"; "Decrease in time spent on water and fuel wood collection"; "Improved access and participation of women in decision making".

Table 17: Outcome of CARW reported in SPR

		2003
Proportion of women in leadership position	%	70%
Women trained in skills development	No.	6,801[62]
Access to fuel wood	Households	3,897
Availability of clean water	Persons	23,940

Source: 2003 SPR. These outcome data were not available for 2002.

[60] It is evident the effort in the 2003 report to adjust output and how they are expressed to EDP. "Woodlots" became "Fuel wood plantation"; "Water ponds" became "Community ponds"; "Rural roads" disappeared and are replaced by "Community wells".

[61] In 2002 SPR the data refer to "Women trained in skills development" (see below). For missing, incomplete and inconsistent data see discussion in § 3.2.3.

[62] The year of reference of this figure actually is 2002, as the data is not disaggregated by gender in 2003 SPR.

169. As mentioned in the paragraph above, assets created are appreciated by beneficiaries and some of them have had an immediate first impact (water tanks, ponds, link road, terracing, and toilets). It is too early, especially in Sindh, to assess the indicator "assets maintenance".

170. In AJK, beneficiaries reported some success stories about women that received "packages" of FS plus small amounts of money as a loan from the community organization and could start new (or improve old) economic activities. These beneficiaries said that with the money earned they could improve their houses, diversify food consumption, and pay health and education expenditures. Male migration was also reported to have decreased in assisted communities because: i) male labour is required to create assets and is paid by FS; and ii) women have opportunities to contribute to household income. In the Kashmir mountains, terraces and plantations help to reduce landslips while women report that it is easier to find fuel-wood.

171. In Sindh, women use time saved from water fetching for handicrafts even if the markets for them are out of reach and prices are exploitative. Men say that ponds give water for an additional 2-3 months for livestock (if rains are sufficient). However, in Sindh's very difficult environment, which depends totally on rains, FS are a one-off benefit and hardly help to reduce cyclic vulnerability to food and water scarcity. Where an FS scheme is included in a loan system, some of the women use the loan for economic activities (small home shops, handicrafts) while others use it to tide over emergencies or for marriage and death expenses. Several reported paying back loans from regular household incomes.

172. The regular meetings of women's organizations enable members not only to share in the socio-economic development of their community but also to serve the purpose of social gathering. Women report no intra-community conflicts caused by project activities; on the contrary they report stronger group cohesion - "before we would meet only for marriages".

173. Women say the WO gives them more voice in participating in community decisions. Although women have always played a significant decision-making role at home, they are now also recognized as partners in the decision-making process of economic activities. As their technical and organizational capacity develops, they can handle small enterprise units independently, which ultimately contributes to their economic welfare. Women feel also empowered in that the FS come through them and they decide on what food items to purchase. Even for community assets women have a sense of enhanced status as the schemes came through with their explicit participation. Men in AJK declared: "These WO made us wise, we are economically better now".

174. It has to be noted, however, that even in the Women's Organizations men implement most of the tasks. Because of the low literacy levels among women, many WO rely on men for keeping accounts. Because women's mobility continues to be restricted, men do most of the work: they carry out all interactions outside the household; find the money for the beneficiaries' participation; discuss with the builder and pay him; purchase raw materials; do the construction work; take the food-stamps to the shop; and come back with the food (even if the food list is decided together with the wife).

175. In AJK the project aims at forming inter-village cluster organizations that can expand activities. The first step for these organizations is to be legally registered. Women in focus groups were confident that: "when we are registered we won't need assistance any more". Even though 23 clusters have been formed so far and a number of organizations have also been registered, the scope and role of these clusters is not clear. For the moment their activity seems limited to the organization of common training (for instance literacy courses) or the realization of infrastructures benefiting more than one village (for instance, roads). This is a good start to creating solidarity and the habit of working together, but it is not enough for real sustainability, as all actions are carried out within the framework, and with the help, of the project. Furthermore, the economic activities envisaged by these clusters, such as the creation of market poles for handicrafts, do not always seem realistic; in fact, although the women involved concentrate on

the production of handicrafts, it was observed that they lack a clear understanding of broader market issues.

176. The visit to CARW activities confirmed that WFP food assistance works better when it is implemented in the framework of an integrated project approach, as in AJK and, in a still incipient phase, in some villages in Sindh. FFW (and FFT) should not be considered a salary and creating assets at community and household level is not creating employment opportunities. WFP's work is not to create such opportunities but to enable very poor people to take advantage of opportunities created by other programmes, such as the Integrated Land Management programme in AJK and the Thardeep Rural Development Programme in Sindh.

Impact

177. The impact of CARW is identified in the RBM-Results Chain Matrix as "Improved access and management of assets by women".

178. In this respect, and given the findings listed in preceding paragraphs, CARW is contributing to boost access to assets and managerial capacities for rural women, in an advanced phase in AJK, but still at an early phase in Sindh. The actual measure of this impact is still to be studied.

Unintended effects

179. Participation in project activities may cause indebtedness for poor households. Household assets as the water tank and the latrine are also symbols of social status. Beneficiaries were very clear that it was the food stamps (FS) provided by WFP that made it possible for poor households to achieve this status. This is probably the reason why some are also willing to sell their livestock to get money for purchasing the raw material, while others go to the money lenders to get the money for the material and give FS in exchange.

Key findings on CARW results

- CARW is contributing to boosting access to assets and managerial capacities for rural women, in an advanced phase in AJK, and at an early stage in Sindh. The actual extent of this impact has still to be measured.
- The project has realized an impressive number of assets and activities, most remarkably in Sindh, where it started only two years ago. Assets observed during the mission were appreciated by beneficiaries, were in good condition and were generally in use.
- Beneficiaries appreciate food stamps (FS) as an incentive. The FS system seems to work without problems. FS allows greater control of benefits by women than cash.
- The FS system works better where it is implemented in the framework of an integrated project approach.
- Although food assistance is appreciated, the beneficiaries' main priority remains employment.
- Women say the WO gives them more voice in participating in community decision-making. They are now also recognized as partners in decision-making in economic activities.
- Women report more group cohesion and no intra-community conflicts caused by project activities.
- Women are not involved enough in the entire project cycle. Some of the tasks are still carried out by men.

3.3.4 Efficient use of resources at project level

180. Efficiency-related questions have already partially been addressed under 3.2.6 and under the sections covering the description of results at project level. Here efficiency is discussed with respect to the integration of project activities, losses, handling and storage.

181. There exists a consensus amongst WFP staff that integration of activities would not only improve results but might also make implementation more cost-effective. It was observed that the awareness level of community organizations under CARW was quite high and the women were able to undertake their activities independently. The rate of participation was also observed to be high. Currently, all activities are being implemented independently and there is no mechanism to link and integrate these activities. Concerted efforts need to be made to expand collaboration, particularly between CARW and girls' education. The integration of activities would have a multiplier effect in village economy. Infrastructural development schemes, such as road, sanitation and drinking water schemes would directly help school girls, ultimately improving the school atmosphere and enabling girls to attend school regularly. Monitoring activities are being undertaken on a limited scale. The integration of activities would also make M&E activities more convenient and cost-effective.

182. It was reported that oil was sometimes not properly unloaded, which caused damage and losses. The incidence of such events is, in any case, below the acceptable limits.

183. The successful experiences and approaches in effectively implementing the programme in one area, with regards to what functioned well and what did not, need to be disseminated to other programme areas, so that lessons can be learned and adjustments of activities can be made accordingly. Income generation activities in particular should be mentioned here, as these contribute to improving household income and therefore food security.

184. Attempts were made to analyse efficiency with respect to the actual cost of food delivery. A number of issues were encountered when undertaking this exercise. Two major modalities are generally practiced to procure food items. First the donors provide assistance in kind directly from their countries, and therefore procurement remains outside WFP management; secondly, purchases by WFP on international markets are mostly subject to some conditionalities attached by donors. The calculation of per unit transport cost was another issue, as the distance from the supply point to the final destination varied significantly. As a result, it was not easy to identify what approach would be cost-effective as the activity was not invariably under the management control of WFP. The local markets are, however, likely to be affected if the food is provided to beneficiaries in kind instead of *via* food stamps.

3.3.5 Consistency of the results with EDP principles

185. As for CARW, the results are consistent with more than one focus area and principle of EDP. Food aid is enabling dynamic but poor households to participate in integrated development programmes or gain basic strategic household and community assets. Some of these assets can help beneficiaries to cope better during events such as drought (focus area 4) or to preserve their natural environment (focus area 5). The project addresses EDP concerns with respect to gender as "key to food security": the choice to focus on assets for rural women and to favour women's groups as beneficiaries and counterparts allows satisfaction of some of women's specific needs, alleviation of their everyday burden and, beyond that, improvement of their status and of their role in decision making. The project also uses food to enable poor women "to take advantage of opportunities to gain new income generating skills and non-formal education" (focus area 2)[63].

[63] EDP, §71.

186. The results of Assistance to Girls' Primary Education are consistent with EDP focus area 2 as food aid is contributing to reduce the opportunity costs of sending girls to school, thus encouraging girls' enrolment and attendance. Inadequacies in Government capacities and limited co-ordination with other partners reduce the impact of the project as the necessary "supportive conditions"[64] are not always present.

187. The results of Promoting Safe Motherhood are consistent with the policy because the distribution of oil is working as an incentive for women to go to health centres for vaccination in case of a pregnancy. The project for the moment has no focus on nutrition, as specified in focus area 1, because vegetable oil is not a food item specific to women and children and separate from the family food, as recommended by the policy[65]. The extent to which healthcare, nutrition messages and health education effectively reach the women receiving the oil, as stated in the policy[66], has yet to be established.

188. Food aid is concentrated in food-insecure, poor districts identified through systematic analysis of indicators regularly agreed with the Government and the local development community. While the geographical targeting at district level has been carried out according to EDP principles, improvements are needed at sub-district level. Studies aimed at improving targeting[67] at sub-district level are currently being undertaken.

189. "Demonstrating results" is not implemented as recommended in the policy. Work is in progress to establish a reference framework with outcome and impact indicators, but it is also lacking an effective monitoring and evaluation built-in mechanism, which is the basis for all RBM[68].

Key findings on EDP consistency of results

- CP activities results are consistent with all five focus areas of EDP.
- Lack of co-ordination with more partners limits the creation of "supportive conditions" in the education project, as required by the EDP, and therefore limits its impact.
- Shortcomings in the monitoring and evaluation system hinder the possibilities for demonstrating results, especially in the education and health projects.

3.3.6 Sustainability of results

190. As established in the evaluation matrix, sustainability will be assessed against: i) involvement of partners; ii) self sufficiency and management capacities of communities; and iii) exit strategies.

191. As discussed in § 3.2.2, implementing partners' involvement in the programme is good. Relevant Government departments at all levels seem committed to it and share WFP's main approach. The involvement of other partners, necessary to ensure non-food inputs, is on the contrary insufficient at present for the education and health projects, even if steps have been taken to improve the situation (see § 3.2.1).

64 EDP, § 66: e.g. the availability of girls' hostels and appropriate latrines.
65 EDP, § 57.
66 EDP, § 59.
67 EDP, § 94.
68 EDP, § 121.

192. For the education programme, sustainability relies on Government's increased commitment and capacity for creating an environment which motivates families to send their children, and particularly girls, to primary school: proximity of facilities or special transportation; female teachers posted; quality standards for infrastructures and education needs met. The economic environment should also improve, ensuring employment for women to enable them to cover education costs and to motivate their daughters into becoming literate. In this respect, incentives would be probably still useful in a long-term perspective. However Government's growing financial commitment, the lift of the ban on new teachers' recruitment, and the synergy with other incentive programmes (Tawana Pakistan, Free Textbooks), are steps in the right directions.

193. Similarly, for the health programme, phasing out would be possible when awareness and information on the part both of women and of their families is improved, allowing improved access to MCH care. However, as the actual results of the programme, particularly those concerning impact on health education, have still to be studied, sustainability cannot be assessed at present.

194. For both education and health projects, the incentive system works against sustainability, especially if there is no important complementary investment in non food inputs. The risk is that increased access to the services as a rapid response to the incentive provided (and strictly depending on it) be considered by Government and WFP as sufficient evidence of success. The identification and monitoring of outcome and impact indicators, the definition of exit strategies and regular impact studies are therefore necessary and urgent.

195. Sustainability of CARW results depends on self sufficiency and management capacities of communities, which are advanced in AJK and still building up in Sindh, but generally speaking the project is working in the right direction. Exit strategies are envisaged only in AJK (the cluster organizations, see § 175) but need further elaboration and clarification of the scope and resources of these organizations.

Key findings on sustainability of results

- Sustainability depends on partners' involvement: the Government, as implementing partner, is fully involved in activities; the involvement of other partners is still insufficient, notably in the education and health projects.
- Sustainability depends on the level of community commitment, which is advanced in CARW in AJK but still building up in Sindh.
- Explicit exit strategies exist only for CARW in AJK and need still further elaboration.

4 CONCLUSIONS AND ISSUES FOR CONSIDERATION

196. The mission considers that the WFP Country Programme in Pakistan is globally consistent with the EDP and relevant to national and international priorities and to the main key interventions in the area of food security nets. Of the four strategic areas of engagement in the PRSP, WFP provides explicit support in two: i) building human capital; and ii) targeted interventions and expanding social safety nets. The community participation approach and gender targeting of WFP is in line with the government strategy of social mobilization and gender mainstreaming. The WFP interventions contribute to the government aim of increasing enrolment, retention and completion of primary school children, specifically that of girls; and they are also consistent with the system of providing preventive reproductive healthcare through basic health units.

197. "Assistance to girls' primary education" is consistent with focus area 2 "Enable poor households to invest in human capital through education and training". "Promoting Safe Motherhood" corresponds to focus area 1 "Enable young children and expectant and nursing mothers to meet their special nutritional and nutrition-related health needs", although the focus is not on nutrition, but rather on access to reproductive healthcare, vaccination and health education, including nutrition. "Creating Assets for Rural Women" addresses focus areas 3 and 5 of the policy: "Make it possible for poor families to gain and preserve assets", and "Enable households which depend on degraded natural resources for their food security to make a shift to more sustainable livelihoods". In some areas, such as Sindh and Balochistan, there is also compliance with focus area 4, "Mitigate the effects of natural disasters, in areas vulnerable to recurring crises of this kind".

198. The transformation of the previous Natural Management Programme, which was based on classic FFW NRM activities in the community-centred and gender-focused CARW programme, is the main area where the impact of the policy can be observed. However, it should be noted that the NRM project had been already changed towards a social forestry approach even before the implementation of the policy, confirming the fact that the EDP has been founded on ongoing experiences and lessons learnt.

199. At project level, the results achieved are globally satisfactory with respect to the EDP strategic objectives, beneficiary needs and national priorities, although with some differences between projects. "Assistance to Girls' Primary Education" has increased girls' enrolment and completion rates, although the slow increase of the number of qualified teachers and in the upgrading and equipment of facilities raises questions about the quality of education and tends to exclude the poorest and most remote communities. The distribution of the tins of oil in health centres for "Promoting Safe Motherhood" works as an incentive for the women to go to the health centres in case of pregnancy, at least for the first contact. But social and cultural constraints and insufficient information and sensitisation, particularly of male family members and mothers-in-law who control women's mobility, give rise to increasing dropout at every successive stage, which diminishes vaccination coverage and diffusion of health messages. Moreover, the extent to which healthcare, nutrition messages and health education effectively reach the women getting the oil, as stated in the policy, has yet to be established. And in any case shortcomings in the monitoring and evaluation system hinder the possibilities for demonstrating the results of the education and health projects. While CARW is contributing to boost access to assets and managerial capacities for rural women, at an advanced stage in AJK, but only at an early stage in Sindh.

200. The results of "Assistance to Girls' Primary Education" are consistent with EDP focus area 2 as food aid is contributing to reducing the opportunity cost of sending the girls to school

and increasing girls' enrolment and attendance. Nevertheless, the "supportive conditions" are not always met because of inadequacies in Government capacity and limited co-ordination with other partners. The results of Promoting Safe Motherhood are consistent with the policy because the distribution of oil provides an incentive for women to go to the health centre and be vaccinated in the event of pregnancy, although – at present - the project has no focus on nutrition, as specified in focus area 1, because the vegetable oil is not a food item specifically targeted to women and children and separate from the family food, as recommended by the policy.

201. The results of CARW are consistent with more than one EDP focus area and principle: i) food aid is enabling dynamic but poor households to participate in integrated development programmes or gain basic strategic household and community assets; ii) some of these assets can help beneficiaries to better cope during events like drought (focus area 4) or to preserve their natural environment (focus area 5); iii) with its focus on assets for women and women's groups, the project addresses EDP gender-related concerns; and iv) the project also uses food to enable poor women "to take advantage of opportunities to gain new income-generation skills and non-formal education" (focus area 2).

202. The mission considers that the application of key EDP principles to WFP development programming has been a contributory factor in the 'developmental' results achieved by WFP in Pakistan. Key factors in the successes of the Pakistan CP are: i) improvement of targeting and positive discrimination towards women; ii) successful partnership with government administration at all levels; iii) dynamic partnership with local NGOs in CARW; and iv) community-based and participatory approaches in CARW.

203. Comparing CARW with the education and health projects, it is evident that the adoption of a participatory approach makes the difference in terms of project ownership and impact. In fact, the increased involvement of beneficiaries also entails an improved understanding of the projects' objectives and modalities which in turn lead to the greater satisfaction of beneficiaries. On the other hand, in the framework of the health project, even though the provision of food is certainly acting as a strong incentive to increase access to the facility, beneficiaries' control on the implementation and quality of the service provided and feedback to evaluate results are missing, thus reducing the overall impact on the community.

204. Problems in implementing the policy have been evident in the areas of partnership, gender mainstreaming, policy dialogue and in demonstrating results.

205. Partnership needs to be improved, especially in the education and health projects. Efforts to co-ordinate with other UN agencies and donors working in the same sector need to continue and also include the project environment (as for instance not limiting awareness-raising to female beneficiaries); co-ordination with literacy and employment creation projects; and exploring the possibility of co-ordination with a project for dedicated transport for women and schoolgirls. Partnership to upgrade, equip and staff facilities (schools and health centres) would also facilitate access for the poorest and most remote communities. Examples of this 'creative' partnership already exist, for instance in Sindh where WFP assists an NGO health centre.

206. The opportunities for synergy between the different activities, though envisaged in the CP, have not been exploited. The fieldwork has highlighted that the programmes are implemented as separate components rather than trhough an integrated approach. For instance, many people who are benefiting from CARW activities still find themselves poor in terms of their access to education and health facilities. This is particularly apparent in Tharparkar where WFP-assisted schools and health centres are inaccessible from the villages where CARW activities are being implemented. In AJK, access to health facilities remains a major issue for CARW-assisted communities.

207. The insufficient resort to partnership strongly limits sustainability especially with reference to the education and health projects, where food is used exclusively as an incentive. The lack of complementary non food inputs makes the results entirely dependent on the presence of the incentive. In such a framework, the Government and WFP should avoid assessing the success of the activity only on the basis of the rapid increase in output (beneficiaries receiving the oil), and should urgently develop - and monitor - outcome and impact indicators and carry out regular impact studies.

208. CP achievements are contributing to women's welfare, particularly by increasing girls' schooling and women's assets control. However, in the absence of the adoption of a wider gender perspective these achievements risk to remain limited to the micro level and to the short term. In fact, WFP gender interventions concentrate on targeting women while more attention should be paid to the policy and cultural environment that influences the results and impact of the CP. Gender mainstreaming requires that all analyses include the specific socio-economic and political condition of women as well as the customs, traditions and institutional policy framework that inform the limits of their ability to accrue benefits from large-scale development policies and initiatives. The team believes that WFP should build on its good relationship with the Government with a view to contributing to the ongoing formulation of the new gender policies. Moreover, for a programme almost completely focused on women as the target, it is remarkable that VAM does not include specific indicators on gender aspects.

209. Notwithstanding the fact that the UNDAF clearly points out the importance of governance reform, the WFP CP lacks any reference to governance and policy reforms. Furthermore, the important experience gained by WFP through the implementation of its projects and its longstanding partnership with the Government should be documented in the form of policy directives to extend the success of WFP's interventions to a larger scale or over a longer term, and to promote policy dialogue on strategies in education and health, and positive discrimination in gender targeting, among others.

210. Demonstrating the results of WFP Pakistan is not easy because of the very dubious monitoring system and the lack of periodic impact studies. Reporting by implementing partners is generally weak, notwithstanding extensive training in project implementation by WFP. But the very method of keeping records of beneficiaries and food distributed is questionable, as is also the way these data are reported in the SPR and other documentation. The ongoing efforts to prepare a framework for RBM (log frame and indicators) will be useless if the basic data are not correct or consistent. Good monitoring practices and periodic studies using qualitative techniques such as PRA should be integrated into the M&E system. Qualitative indicators should be included to assess outcome and impact and could be followed by an annual PRA.

A few key points to conclude

Key factors of success:

- Improved targeting and positive discrimination towards women;
- Successful partnership with Government at national and regional level;
- Dynamic partnership with local NGOs and adoption of community-based and participatory approaches in the implementation of CARW activities.

Key problems and limitations:

- Inadequate level of partnership in the health and education projects;
- Limited involvement of WFP in national policy dialogue;
- Insufficient mainstreaming of gender issues;
- Lack of clearly defined exit strategies;
- Weak monitoring system, lack of qualitative and gender sensitive outcome and impact indicators, absence of impact studies.

Key Recommendations:

WFP should:

- Improve partnership arrangements through strengthened collaboration with other UN agencies donors, especially with reference to the education and health projects;
- Promote synergies between different activities to ensure that the education and health projects are implemented in the frame of wider community-based participatory development programmes;
- Fine-tune country office and IP staff's sensitivity to gender issues to encompass a deeper understanding and implementation of the Enhanced Commitments to Women policy;
- Increase its participation in policy dialogue fora especially with reference to gender issues and education;
- Revise its monitoring tools and indicators including the identification of qualitative and gender-sensitive outcome and impact indicators, and undertake regular participatory impact studies;
- Define clear exit strategies;
- Analyse the possibility of mainstreaming HIV/AIDS prevention and of setting up a pilot activity building on the experience gained by NGOs that are currently using food to support HIV/AIDS-affected households.

Donors should:

- Actively promote in-country co-ordination with WFP to ensure greater complementarity of their development interventions and increase the availability of complementary non food inputs.