



*Afghanistan Local Governance Assistance Project (ALGAP)*

---

Contract No. AEP-I-809-00-00016-00

**Notes on ALGAP Consultancy, August 2006**  
**Gary Forbes**

---

➤ **APM 2 and How To Design Participatory Events Seminars, 05 – 10 August 2006**

We had approximately 32 participants in these two seminars. The APM 2 is focused on improving skills and introducing new techniques to facilitators who are actively using participatory methods in their work. The How To . . . seminar is focused on designing new events to be used in a project. Participants completed written evaluations that Farzana is compiling.

The APM 2 seminar gave participants an opportunity to practice their skills in facilitating four different sessions; a current reality dialogue (a participatory assessment exercise), a practical vision workshop, a strategic actions workshop, and an implementation and prioritization activity. The participants joined one of these teams and each team facilitated a two hour session. The overall theme of the practice sessions was “*Strengthening Provincial level governance, involving Provincial Councils, the government administration, and local civil society actors.*” The practice sessions went well, and the quality of both the workshop content and especially the facilitation skills improved over the course of the three days.

I often complete an evaluation of the participants after the APM 2 seminar, using my observation of their abilities and understanding of the methods and techniques. I usually organize my evaluation in three categories; the names in each category are not listed in any specific order.

A. Excellent skills, demonstrated significant understanding, and applied the methods and techniques very well:

- Abdul Qadir Rahimi
- Karim Balkhi
- Abdul Hadi
- Zabiullah Mushfiq (the younger man from Kunduz)
- Nizamudin Malyar
- Abdul Hamid Sarash
- Bahman Azad
- Azizullah Dehyar
- Hamayoon Karim
- Abdul Rahman Parwani

B. Good understanding of participatory methods and some demonstration of skills:

- Siddiqullah Assas
- Mohammad Qasim Stanikzai
- Abdul Hamid Kakaei
- Muhammad Shifa Mushfiq
- Shohaib Ahmadi
- Mohammad Da’ud
- Naisr Rezaei (hard to read)

C – Need more experience and deeper understanding of how to use participatory methods; need to train and facilitate with other more qualified PBFs:

- Fahem Salek (he was ill at the beginning, and is committed, but has less experience and confidence than the others)
- Mohammad Zabiullah (the older man, the “old dog...new tricks” situation)
- Mohammad Nawaz (but committed)

In terms of facilitation skills demonstrated in the seminar, Rahmani, Mohboobullah, Qayoom, Jamal, and Hafizullah would be in category A, and Bilquees and Lailuma in category B.

We re-designed the How To . . . seminar to meet the specific needs of ALGAP at this time. Since we had three days available for additional work with the group, we divided the seminar into a day focusing on designing future events, a day of training practice, and a day of facilitation practice.

For the design day, after introducing the five step process of how to design participatory events, we organized into five design teams:

1. Training Module: Basic Budgeting
2. Training Module: Meeting Management
3. Action Planning: Meeting with Provincial Council and Provincial Administration officials on improving relations
4. Provincial Consultation: Anti-Corruption Program
5. Provincial Consultation: Security and Stability

Each of the teams developed an event analysis, a participant profile, event objectives, and key activity or session modules. These were collected and are being compiled in the office.

The second day was a day of practice as trainers, with the focus on presentation of module curriculum through flip charts and explanations, and the facilitation of the group exercises. We organized the group into six practice teams, one for each of the six sessions of the Meeting Management Module. Each team then prepared and presented a sixty minute activity based on their assigned session. This gave an opportunity for the whole group to better understand the new module, work together to prepare assignments and presentation materials, and observe the other PBFs in the practice sessions. This was a highlight of the training, and all the teams did very well. Butch, Rahmani and Steve assisted the teams in preparing for their practice.

The third day was focused on practicing their new facilitation skills. We selected the two possible Provincial Consultations, Anti-Corruption and Security/Stability and had two teams prepare and facilitate two activities for each; a current reality dialogue and a consensus workshop. The facilitation was excellent, the results achieved in each was also very insightful, and everyone enjoyed the opportunity to practice their skills one more time, and with a higher level of achievement. For example, the results of the Security/Stability workshop were six major points of consensus of what needed to happen at the provincial level (the points are articulated as two year strategies):

1. Carry Out Weapons Collection Without Any Exception
2. Protect Borders Through Joint Cooperation of National and International Forces
3. Strengthen Operations and Professionalism of Security Forces
4. Put Pressure on Government to Solve Issues Through Political Solutions
5. Attract Cooperation of People (Districts, Tribal Groups, Communities) With Government
6. Make People Aware of Security Situation at Provincial and District Levels

➤ **APM 1 Seminar, 12 – 14 August 2006**

We had approximately 30 participants in this three day seminar, including four from other projects (2 from NCI, 1 each from Global Rights and UNDP) and three from the ALGAP team (Shukria, Malali, and Hafizullah, who were all a great assistance in the training). For many of the provincial participants, this was an eye-opener on what we mean by “participation”, and it was my feeling that they had never seen anything like these methods before. But they began to get the idea of what we were proposing, and the practicality of the methods enabled most of them to finally understand what participation really could be, and for most of them, how to actually use the new methods and techniques.

We used ALGAP-specific situations/simulations for the demonstration and practice sessions; e.g. we did an action plan for an awareness campaign in the community related to the role of the Provincial Council, and we did practice workshops on the technical and managerial skills required by provincial councilors, and the role of the Provincial Development Council. The results of these two workshops was interesting, in terms of the consensus that came out of them.

For example, there were eight key roles for members of the Provincial Council:

1. Establish Coordination with Relevant Organizations
2. Technical and Professional Skills
3. Attracting Financial Support and Budget Analysis
4. Monitoring and Evaluating Reconstruction Efforts
5. Individual and Group Communication Skills
6. Skill of Transparent Accountability in Their Role
7. Local Problem Resolution Skills
8. Taking Into Account Culture and Traditions of People.

There were five major responsibilities of the Provincial Development Council:

1. Determine Priorities Through Conducting Workshops
2. Prepare Proposals to Get Financial Resources
3. Monitor and Evaluate Development Projects
4. Coordinate Planning of Government and Non-Governmental Organizations
5. Provide Balanced Development in the Province

➤ **Suggestions and Recommendations**

- ◆ Consider using three person PBF training teams to present the new modules. They are more complex than the earlier ones and a three person team would better guarantee a high quality training experience for the participants. It would also put more pressure on the teams to deliver each module as it is intended, i.e. not simplifying it just to get by. It might also be good to use some of the better trainers in adjoining provinces, as ALGAP is already beginning to do I believe.
- ◆ Use some of the suggestions that came out of the day two Meeting Management training practices to improve the content of that module. Rahmani has these and I think is already intending to do this. Use Kabul staff to assist in the creation of training materials; e.g. Shukria has good artistic abilities. And if Lailuma and Bilquees don't have enough to do, they could assist Rahmani in preparing flip charts, etc. to give to the PBFs. Some of the training material is better done in Kabul, with a higher level of quality and consistency; Rahmani could ensure that these are done well and distributed to the PBFs.

- ◆ I'm not convinced that the Activity Planning is a real training session. A better way to deliver the module is to actually lead the Provincial Council through an activity planning exercise, with time devoted to discussing the process and methodology employed. A simple exercise could be selected to be used in all the Provinces. For example, the same simulation that we used in APM 1; "A Public Awareness Campaign to Communicate and Disseminate the presence and role of the Provincial Council throughout the province."
- ◆ Continue and expand the use of the Program Associates in the TOT sessions and periodic visitation and assistance to the PBFs in delivery of the training modules. I think they could be helpful in delivery of the modules in addition to the organization of the training program. And Rahmani I think needs some assistance in doing all the TOTs and support that he is expected to give. Butch is very helpful but will not be there all the time. Qayoom and Jamil especially could assist in the TOTs and in the Provinces. And Lailuma and Bilquees could also assist in the TOTs.
- ◆ Coordinate closely with UNDP and NCI in the delivery of the training modules; they both sent representatives to the training and their people did very well. For example, invite some provincial government administrators to some of the modules, if that is not already done. UNDP and NCI could help identify other important local leaders to be involved in the training. They could also be involved in any facilitated (non-training sessions) activities that PBFs might organize.
- ◆ Seriously consider experimenting in some provinces, with some PBFs, the two provincial consultations we worked on during the training, anti-corruption and security/stability. The PBFs indicated that the Councils would be very open and eager to sponsor such events, and that it would assist them in strengthening their credibility (for both the Council and the PBFs) in the provinces. The PBFs also indicated that they feel they could develop and facilitate consultations based on the processes and methods we discussed in the training.

This is another area where you would want the program associates to be very involved in whatever sessions the PBFs organize. The associates could assist in designing the events as well as co-facilitating them. Hafizullah could also be key in this effort, given that it is seen as being part of his position responsibility.

- ◆ Try to elevate the significance of the training modules at the provincial level. The response to date from Council attendees as I heard it has been mixed, and I imagine the quality has as well. Some ideas might include:
  - written invitations to the council members;
  - hold attendance to 25 participants; fill each session by special invitations to government administrators and other community leaders;
  - higher quality written materials; hand-outs, flip charts, manuals, etc.;
  - written ALGAP training evaluation forms, to be filled out by all participants;
  - using PBFs from other provinces;
  - name tents, a more participatory table arrangement, some décor like posters, etc.;
  - providing snacks and meals as appropriate;
  - holding training to one day (seven hours) for each module; may be split into two sessions however;
  - visiting ALGAP program associates and others from Kabul;
  - joint training and other events with UNDP and NCI.

- ◆ Now that the PBFs are operating at a higher level of intervention, and given that they provide good training and facilitating other activities, consider a bump in their pay. Either across the board raise for “higher skills achieved through training and field demonstration” or based on achieving advanced indicators, e.g. so many training days during the month, so many facilitated events, so many trainings done outside assigned province. Find some way to provide incentive the group; they are all mid or late career professionals, highly dedicated, increasingly understanding the ALGAP mission and objectives, and on a rapid learning curve. ALGAP is becoming ever-more successful I think, in developing a core of trainers/facilitators for ALGAP, for other follow-on projects, and for future local development in general. And the PBFs are one of the keys to ALGAP’s recent and possible future success. Perhaps they could receive some minor financial incentives for the work they’re doing and the work we expect of them in the future.
- ◆ Find out if UNDP or NCI will be offering other types of future training, and seek out slots for some of the PBFs. There is so much for them to learn and they’re ready to do it given an opportunity. And they have so many opportunities to apply what they learn, immediately in their provinces.



**Advanced Participation Methods; How to Design Participatory Events  
Kabul, 05 - 10 August 2006**

**Participants Listing**

<b>Province-based Facilitators</b>			
	<b>Last Name</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Work Province</b>
1	Balkhi	Abdul Karim	Balkh
2	Karimi	Hamayoon	Balkh
3	Razai	Nasir	Bamyan
4	Dehyar	Azizyllah	Faryab
5	Daud	Mohammad	Ghazni
6	Nawaz	Mohammad	Ghazni
7	Stanikzai	Mohammad Qasim	Hilmand
8	Ahmadi	Mohammad Shoaib	Hirat
9	Kakaei	Abdul Hamid	Kabul
10	Parwani	Abdul Rahman	Kapisa
11	Shurish	Abdul Hamid	Kunar
12	Assas	Sidiqullah	Kunduz
13	Monsif	Zabiullah	Kunduz
14	Malyar	Dr. Nazamudin	Laghman
15	Azad	Bahman	Nimroz
16	Moshfiq	Mohamad Shifa	Nuristan
17	Oryakhel	Zabiullah	Paktya
18	Rahimi	Abdul Qadir	Parwan
19	Salek	Fahim	Samangan
20	Hadi	Abdul	Zabul
<b>Project Staff</b>			
	<b>Last Name</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Position</b>
21	Nasir	Jamal	Program Associate
22	Bassam	Abdul Qayoom	Program Associate
23	Daud	Bilquees	Program Associate
24	Rahmani	Abdul Wasi	Program Associate
25	Oryakhel	Mahboobullah	Program Associate
26	Social	Lailuma	Program Associate
27	Ghashtalai	Hafizullah	Program Associate
28	Sherani	Malalai	Translator
29	Noori	Shukuria	Translator
30	Perdes	Mohammad Saber	Interpreter
31	Forbes	Gary	Trainer, ARD
32	Reid	Stephen	Sr. Technical Advisor, ARD
33	Ragragio	Juan Mayo M.	Training Specialist, Consultant

**Advanced Participation Methods - Level 1: Facilitation Skills Training - Kabul, 12 - 14 August 2006****Participants Listing**

	<b>Last Name</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Province</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Organization</b>
1	Aman	Mohammad Rahman	Panjsher	Medical Doctor	Public Health Department
2	Amer	Ahmad Masood	Kabul	Program Officer	UNDP - Provincial Councils and Parliament
3	Omar	Jamila	Kabul	Program Officer	Global Rights - Women's Rights and Parliament
4	Anwar	Mohammad	Baghlan	Chairperson	Provincial Administrative Committee
5	Atiq	Mohammad Nabi	Kabul	Sr. Program Officer	National Democratic Institute
6	Ayubzada	Mohammad Naeem	Kabul	Program Officer	National Democratic Institute
7	Farahi	Abdul Ahmad	Farah	PC Member	Provincial Council
8	Zamanfar	Mohammad Hanife	Kabul	Human Resources	Governor's Office
9	Hayat	Sayed Esmatullah	Faryab	Provincial Supervisor	Independent Administrative Reform Civil Service Commission
10	Intezar	Abdul Halim	Kunduz	Chairman	Provincial Development Committee
11	Kaka	Khan	Parwan	Admin Officer	MRRD
12	Kaooos	Eng. Mohammad	Panjsher	Advisor	Governor's Office
13	Katawazi	Mohammad Hashim	Paktyka	Director	Governor's Office - Immigration Department
14	Majidi	Mohammad Shah	Ghor	Municipal Manager	Governor's Office - Municipal Manager
15	Mayar	Habib-u-Rahman	Zabul	Director	Department Agriculture and Irrigation
16	Hashmi	Sayed Mohsen	Daykundi	Admin Assistant	Depratment of Public Health
17	Musleh	Sayed Mujtaba	Samangan	Provincial Supervisor	Independent Administrative Reform Civil Service Commission
18	Kakar	Mohammad Mustafa	Kapisa	PC Member	Provincial Council
19	Nasibullah		Paktya	Admin Officer	Governor's Office - Municipal Office
20	Qadir	Eng. Abdul	Hilmand	Deputy Director	DRRD
21	Rahman	Haji Abdul	Balkh	Chairman	Provincial Development Committee
22	Rasoli	Dr. Abdul Ghafar	Laghman	Director	Sra Miashth (Afghan Red Crescent Society)
23	Rosali	Abdul Rashid	Takhar	Chairman	Provincial Development Committee
24	Saif	Mohammad Nasir	Bamyan	Reporter	National Radio & Television
25	Qayomi	Abdul Samad	Sari-Pul	Officer	Rural & Rehabilitation Development - MRRD
26	Sanayee	Ghulam	Ghazni	Director	MRRD
27	Tawasali	Sayed Ahmad Shah	Wardak	Admin Officer	Water and Irrigation Department
28	Siddiq	Mohammad	Logar	PC Member	Provincial Council

**Advanced Participation Methods - Level 1: Facilitation Skills Training - Kabul, 12 - 14 August 2006****Participants Listing** *(continued)*

	<b>Last Name</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Province</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Organization</b>
29	Wassi	Ghulam Wassi	Ghazni	NSP/Responsible	RRD
30	Zalmai	Rashidullah	Kunar	Director	Irrigation Department
31	Ghashtalai	Hafizullah			ALGAP Program Associate
32	Noori	Shukria			Translator/Interpreter
33	Perdes	Mohammad Saber			Interpreter
34	Sherani	Malalai			Translator/Interpreter
35	Forbes	Gary			Trainer, ARD, Inc.

**Invited Non-participants**

	<b>Last Name</b>	<b>First Name</b>	<b>Province</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Organization</b>
	Anwar	Mohammad	Kapisa	Admin Staff	Governor's Office
	Faqir	Dr. Faqir	Nangarhar	Assistant Professor	Public Health Department
	Jawad	Abdul Qahar	Kabul	Professor	Interpreter
	Khaliludeen		Kabul	Chief of Policy	Independent Administrative Reform Civil Service Commission
	Muhaideen	Haji	Logar	Admin Officer	Water and Irrigation Department
	Omar	Mohammad	Khost	Director	MRRD
	Razaq	Abdul	Nuristan	Director	Rural Rehabilitation & Development Department
	Usuf	Eng. Mohammad	Jawzjan	Director	Rural & Rehabilitation Development - MRRD
	Wardak	Mirwais	Kabul	Program Officer	CPAU