



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

AFGHANISTAN

GENDER STATUS REPORT

Homira Nassery

RAMP

July 31, 2005



Gender Status Report

Rebuilding Agricultural Markets Program

- I. Abstract
- II. Introduction
- III. Background
- IV. Major findings and recommendations
- V. Modification of 3 job orders
- VI. Detailed reports on other 12 job orders
- VII. Constraints
- VIII. Annexes
 - 1. Simple gender checklist
 - 2. Getting staffing right
 - 3. Bibliography
 - 4. Terms of Reference

Homira Nassery
July 31, 2005

I. Abstract

1.1 The Rebuilding Agricultural Markets Program (RAMP), funded by the U.S. Agency for International Development and implemented by Chemonics International has to abide by the United States Afghan Women and Children Act of 2001 which is to ‘seek the involvement of women at every stage of reconstruction – as planners, implementers, and beneficiaries’. Automated Directive System (ADS) Guidelines of USAID require that gender be integrated into all of the work of USAID in order to contribute to effective programs, social equity, and sustainable change.

1.2 The principal finding of this report is that RAMP has done far more for the women of Afghanistan than has been recorded by the institution. The principal recommendation of this report is that a concerted mechanism must be found to record and recognize the inclusion of women in RAMP’s job orders. This effort should include the entire team of project implementers from the program managers, to the monitoring and evaluation team, to the communications and reporting team. To start with, the quarterly reports should be re-evaluated for every single job order, including infrastructure programs. The quarterly reports are a touchstone for everyone from government to senior managers at Chemonics HQ to get a picture of what’s happening on the ground, and the picture that the quarterly reports paints is utterly devoid of women apart from the few projects that target Afghan women as specific beneficiaries. This is misleading, inaccurate, and not fair to the program.

1.3 Having said that, there is wide scope for improving Afghan women’s access to agricultural markets within RAMP, in terms of supplying inputs, training, and entry into trading circles. The foremost reason for promoting women’s inclusion in agricultural markets is to raise the country’s GNP. Regardless of rights-based arguments, the fact is that Afghanistan needs its women’s sweat equity to be able to feed itself and to develop agricultural markets outside the country.

1.4 There is so much more to do, both in terms of research, evaluation, and advocacy, and documenting and disseminating what we are doing right. What this consultant has presented is only a bird’s eye view of the inclusion of women in RAMP’s programs. It is strongly recommended that a full-time gender specialist be assigned to the remaining life of RAMP.

II. Introduction

2.1 Afghanistan has recently emerged from decades of war and instability that have destroyed much of its infrastructure and human capital. Afghan women were particularly targeted during this period by systematic discrimination and exclusion from access to public resources. Since the Bonn Accords of December, 2001, the Government of Afghanistan has established some record of commitment to advancing the position of women in this country, and to goals of gender equality and equity. These efforts culminated in the Constitutional Emergency Loya Jirga, which determined in the *Constitution 1382* that all citizens, women, as well as men, are equal in rights with each other. The next major step is to translate that commitment into concrete reality via a policy of gender mainstreaming implemented by sector Ministries via their programs and projects

2.2 This commitment has been underscored by the *Provisional Framework for the Advisory Group on Gender*, which confirms that ‘the Government’s principle strategy on both practical and strategic gender concerns is mainstreaming within each of the national development priority program areas and the national budget’.

2.3 RAMP's principal gender goal is to ensure that Afghan women and men are integrated in all of its market activities to fully maximize the human capital needed to raise incomes and consumption levels in Afghanistan. The reality is that both women and men are part of the agricultural production cycle in Afghanistan. Rural women in Afghanistan are *already* a part of the informal economy, and to not recognize this is to miss a major link in the agricultural value chain. There is very little that is produced on the farm that does not involve both sexes, as well as individuals of different ages or social status. RAMP, like most USAID projects in Afghanistan, has chosen to mainstream women in all of its projects rather than to create 'gender-specific' approaches, which usually exclude the roles and activities undertaken by family or community members other than women themselves. When the latter approach is taken, quality and economic improvements to these phases in the value chain of production are often overlooked and limit the overall gains to be made.

III. Background

3.1 In Afghanistan, women's role in agricultural production is shaped by the life cycle of the household, the physical site of fields, and other reproductive and productive tasks that women perform during the agricultural year. The supply of adequate labor within the household sometimes means that women do not have to work in cultivation outside the family compound, however, vulnerable women (widows, women with disabled husbands, etc.) often do have to assist with the production of labor-intensive crops. At the same time, it's critical to recognize that men's agricultural activities such as land preparation, planting/sowing, and fertilizer application are one-off jobs and usually completed within a specific season, while women's agricultural activities such as weeding are recurrent, daily activities that last from the time the seed is planted to harvest time. Even though women may spend the same amount of time on agricultural activities, women's work tends to be less visible, non-monetized, and much less rewarded than men's work. RAMP seeks to address this imbalance by including women in the full value chain of agricultural production and marketing.

3.2 It is important to note that RAMP recognizes handicrafts and textiles are not economically viable. RAMP has avoided further marginalizing women by creating programs to sell products of traditional skills, such as tailoring and embroidery. Handicrafts like these were originally undertaken purely for family use or as gifts exchanged at life ceremonies in Afghanistan. It is widely recognized that there is now viable internal or external market for these handicrafts, nor is there real income potential due to the limited time that women can invest in such activities, as well as meeting the demands of intensive domestic duties.¹ Since most women learn these basic skills from their mothers, and market demand is limited by existing home production, as well as formidable Asian neighbors who have a considerable comparative advantages in this sector, it is actually damaging to the future of Afghan women to develop programs focusing on handicrafts and textiles - even if they are traditional, and thus 'safe' domains for women to operate in.

3.3 RAMP's own project proposals state 'Research shows that targeting poverty begins with giving women economic opportunities that have multiplier effects on the welfare of their immediate and extended families.'² Women in poor households, or households with a low worker/dependent ratio, tend to participate in more agricultural tasks outside the home. If the

¹ Grace, Jo, Gender Roles in Agriculture: Case of five villages in northern Afghanistan, Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit (AREU), Case Study Series, March 2004.

² Decision Memorandum, November 18, 2004, Subject: Job Order no. 46- Supporting Alternative Livelihood Activities and Assistance Mobilization (SALAAM) in Helmand province under RAMP CLIN 002.

need is great enough, women may, in spite of the prevalent social norms, even engage in wage work on other peoples' land. This is not a new phenomenon but has been an option for poor households for many years.³ The cropping pattern in a given locality has a considerable impact on women's participation in agricultural production, with grain production having the least female involvement and horticulture (vegetables, melons etc.), fruits and nuts in general including large labor input from girls and women. These are major cash crops, which counted for around half of all export earnings in the 1970s, when Afghanistan was the world's largest exporter of dried fruit.⁴

3.5 Most rural households also keep livestock, mainly for domestic consumption of meat, milk, wool, eggs, etc., and occasionally for sale. Women and children are the main tenders of animals. Boys are usually in charge of taking the animals for grazing while women and girls collect fodder. Hence, while women have a significant responsibility for animals, their livestock management in most areas is centered in the home, taking care of newborn and sick animals, milking, collecting fodder and stable feeding. In some of the northeastern mountainous areas in Panjshir and Badakhshan, the women play a far wider role in livestock management and may go to summer pastures without their families to tend animals and produce dairy products, even on contract for neighbors.⁵ Most rural households have some animals.⁶

3.6 A snapshot of the priority provinces that RAMP works in further supports our gender mainstreaming strategy. Helmand province has one of the highest proportions (0.101-0.183) of female-headed households by district.⁷ Parwan province has one of the highest proportions (0.087-0.112) of very poor female-headed households by district.⁸ Ghazni province has one of the largest proportions (0.113-0.493) of households with women earning income at home and in the village.⁹ Unfortunately, the report that these figures come from, the National Risk and Vulnerability Assessment (NRVA), also states that the major coping strategy in times of crisis for all female is to reduce the diet.

3.7 Certain sub-sectors, such as road construction in Afghanistan, are not quite ready for equitable gender participation, whereas in others, such as irrigation, it is strategic to include women's participation as they are often the users, providers, and managers of water in rural households and are the guardians of household hygiene. If a water system breaks down, women, not men, will be most likely affected, for they may have to travel further for water or use other means to meet the household's water and sanitation needs.

IV. Findings and Recommendations

4.1 Major findings and recommendations have been clustered into the following categories with the recommendations immediately following the findings to ensure continuity and to emphasize immediate action. Note that these are general recommendations that apply to the sector as a whole, however program-specific recommendations can be found in the detailed program reports

³ *Country Gender Assessment*, The World Bank, 2005.

⁴ *Afghanistan: Survey of the Horticulture Sector*, FAO, 2003, p. 22

⁵ Kandiyoti (2004, p. 12) describes this situation for Panjshir while Afghanaid report similarly from Badakhshan.

⁶ Klinkert, 1997a, 1997b and Azerbaijani-Moghaddam, 1998

⁷ NRVA Female Shura and Wealth Group Data: Preliminary Analyses, Thomas M. Nephew, March 9, 2004, p. 10.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 11.

⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 12.

in section VI. It is these program specific detailed reports that are often the most interesting, as they include the human stories behind the findings.

- a) Sectoral
- b) Skills
- c) Inputs
- d) New technologies
- e) Data collection

** The giant issue of land ownership and title to property is grouped under agricultural inputs, however this should not minimize how important this is for Afghan women. That discussion is beyond the scope of this paper, but it should be dealt with via other USAID initiatives that are working on land titling and inheritance issues. **

4.2 Sectoral

4.2.1 Finding Do not generalize that all rural Afghan women stay at home and cannot be seen in public roles in rural areas. Women's roles and responsibilities in agriculture are extremely varied through the country, for example in Nooristan province, women participate more fully in agriculture and are responsible for more substantial agricultural work such as plowing. There is also great diversity in women's roles in agriculture depending on their wealth groups.

Recommendation Do your regional and local homework before planning designing programs. Assess each geographic area for attitudes towards women. Afghanistan is not homogenous – regions vary greatly. In Laghman female landowners are quite common, as reported from the study of three villages in Alingar.¹⁰ About 50% of landowners were female, apparently acquiring land through inheritance. These landowners could and should be included in RAMP interventions such as farmers associations, trading groups, and water user associations.

4.2.2 Finding Gender specific roles in marketing need to be assessed to determine where the entry points for achieving equity in markets would be so that programs can be designed around those roles to ensure equitable market linkages.

Recommendation Design programs round gender specific roles in marketing so that market linkages become equitable and opportunities for market expansion grow. Strengthen women's involvement in agricultural and livestock production in the form of extension and training, credit facilities and expanding market opportunities.

4.2.3 Finding The absence of many services and the need to produce agricultural products for subsistence also imposes an opportunity cost for women farmers. Women often lack ownership, control, and access to productive assets such as land, equipment, and materials, and their legal right to inheritance is usually bypassed. The lack of working capital (and shortage of credit) reduces opportunities to start activities that require an initial investment.

Recommendation Make land ownership for women a priority. Work with other USAID projects and the national authorities to provide access to productive assets such as land and equipment, and inputs such as seed enterprises and information, to women farmers. Target female producers who already have an edge in land ownership or sharecropping to develop further into traders and integrate into trader associations.

4.2.4 Finding Integrating gender equity into rural livelihoods will not be easy or risk-free. Afghanistan has centuries of tradition consisting of secluding women within private spaces in

¹⁰ Kerr-Wilson and Pain, 2003

rural areas. It will take significant investment of resources, time, and energy, but it is critical to reduce poverty and expand access to markets.

Recommendation Hire full-time gender coordinator for RAMP's final year of operation to

- ensure that the integration of gender is fully recognized and included in project records and shared with the public
- coach the implementing partners on how to improve their gender integration within the context of Afghan society
- conduct a full assessment of all job orders where there is even more evidence of women's participation

Take gender integration seriously and the economic returns will be more than worth it.

4.2.5 Finding Diversify income generation programs!!! Activities should support the multiple income strategies that poor households use and not encourage dependence on just one sector, such as agriculture, as a livelihoods source.

Recommendation Form cooperatives!!! One to do this could be to design activities that support an entire household, rather than an individual, such as gabion weaving does in the irrigation and canal construction programs.¹¹ Formation of cooperation among groups of women involved in informal activities and support in the form of guidance on market acceptability, product handling techniques, marketing methods, and calculation of marketing costs would also support these varied tasks so that there would be diversification of roles of various household members in supporting the whole value chain of product to market.

4.2.6 Finding There are very few true women's *shuras* that exist in the rural areas.

According to the National Solidarity Program (NSP), these *shuras* are supposed to exist and be fully functioning units to promote women's piece of the national pie.

Recommendation Make the *shuras* work!!! Make government accountable for these legendary *shuras*. Where are they and what is their share of the resources? These *shuras* could be excellent precursors of women's cooperatives that could be used for a variety of agricultural outputs.

4.3 New technologies

4.3.1 Finding It is culturally accepted that widows and destitute women are able to engage directly in agricultural activities since they have no other choice. This is an excellent opportunity to make these groups 'early adopters' of extension technology. They may be ready to try new technologies that more secure women would not get involved in.

Recommendation Capitalize on introducing new technologies to vulnerable categories of women who are those that usually have little left to lose, and hence are more allowed to take risks.

4.3.2 Finding More research is needed in impacts of technology transfer. There are women landless laborers to different degrees in the different provinces—these women are very important in weeding and harvesting and it is important to make sure their livelihoods aren't being destroyed by introducing new/other forms of technology such as using weeders or herbicides.

Recommendation Do research!! Information has to be collected and programs that do introduce new technologies must provide training and alternatives to these landless laborers as part of a general social safety net.

¹¹ Rethinking Rural Livelihoods in Afghanistan, Jo Grace and Adam Pain, AREU Synthesis Paper Series, June 2004, p. 1.

4.3.3 Finding There is a huge domestic market for *processed agricultural products* that has yet to be tapped. RAMP and its partners have invested in integrating women into this sector via the vegetable dehydration and jam and juice factories that are underway such as the vegetable dehydration factory in Charikar and the home food processing activities in Hirat.

Recommendation Outreach!!! Advertise these efforts and make more of an effort to initiate them in other regions of Afghanistan. Push AIB, AFC, and APAC to reach out to women investors for these productive activities.

4.3.4 Finding Expatriate men come with closed minds. Unfortunately some of RAMP's implementing partners, such as ICARDA are not including women in seed multiplication activities, which have traditionally been part of women's agricultural domain. This is a great oversight and loss to human capital development, as well as the economy. Evidence from surveys in Laghman, Ghazni, Badakhshan, Bamiyan, Paktia, Helmand, Faryab and Saripul confirms¹² that women and girls engage in a number of farm-based activities ranging from seed bed preparation, weeding, horticulture, and fruit cultivation to a series of post-harvest crop processing activities such as cleaning and drying vegetables, fruits and nuts for domestic use and for marketing.

Recommendation Train and hire female agricultural extension agents to conduct outreach for these agencies that are so reluctant to engage with women farmers. Conduct gender sensitivity sessions for the implementing partners that are led by senior USAID management. This should have been addressed at the beginning of RAMP planning and design, however it is not too late to leverage influence to raise ICARDA's awareness. Make financial disbursements contingent on including women in these activities.

4.3.5 Finding Cool, new technologies often don't reach women. The introduction of drip irrigation in RAMP projects for both large scale farming and family gardens is creating greater opportunities for women by allowing families to cultivate family gardens with sufficient production to sell produce in the local market. Since the planting and cultivation of family gardens is traditionally a women's activity, the women will be instrumental in determining the use of income generated through the sale of produce from the family garden. It also reduces the need for weeding and saves women's labor for more productive activities.

Recommendation Expand the provision and instruction of drip irrigation to include women farmers and more family gardens. Thus far, the number of family gardens being targeted is woefully small.

4.4 Inputs

4.4.1 Finding Assets and property rights – very few women own resources such as land or livestock and their income-generating activities are fewer than those available to men.

Recommendation Secure women's inheritance and property rights, to promote their potential as producers and to address important aspects of rural vulnerability. Use community workers to raise awareness of the long-term livelihoods consequence of women marrying much older men since those who do are often particularly vulnerable to poverty¹³.

Recommendation RAMP activities such as the AIB and the Fund need to take women's disparate assets base into consideration when they assess women for ensuring loans, collateral,

¹² *AREU Case Studies Series*: Alice Kerr-Wilson and Adam Pain, 2003; UNDCP Strategic Studies # 4 & #6; David Mansfield, 2001; Wilding, John and Azerbaijani-Moghadam, S., 2002; Strategic Monitoring Unit, 2001; Christoph Klinnert (ed.), 1997a; Christoph Klinnert (ed), 1997b; Azarbaijani-Moghaddam, S. (ed), n.d. (probably 1998); Jo Grace, 2004

¹³ *Ibid.*

etc. Create a different window of lending for women investors for these institutions, or at least different standards.

4.4.2 Finding Information, the ultimate commodity, is not reaching rural women, who need it the most. Very few rural women (or urban Afghan women) are aware of the full array of financial products that are available from other RAMP product lines such as AIB, AFC, and APAC, nor are they being included in the associations and cooperatives that are being formed for men.

Recommendation Develop buyer to producer linkages for women via the associations being created. RAMP activities such as the AIB, AFC, and the Fund need to take their show on the road, into the provinces and to provide better local extension agents to help illiterate farmers and traders benefit from these products.

4.4.3 Finding Some working capital is being provided by MISFA, but this does not target small and medium enterprises for women. This is a huge gap. Many rural women are only receiving half of what they need to be part of agricultural markets – the credit. Giving women credit without the accompanying small business development training and accompanying product development that guarantee a functioning business prevents them from building a sustainable income.

Recommendation In addition to providing working capital in larger amounts for small and medium enterprises, provide adequate business and marketing training to rural women – this cannot be emphasized enough as it is not even being done appropriately for urban women by our other programs such as BDS.

4.4.4 Finding RAMP is giving women control over their own incomes by supporting poultry programs. The use of income, if any, from agricultural produce is in most families controlled by men. Afghanistan's studies from Badakhshan mention that in spite of men and women's equal time spent on agriculture and livestock, the control of expenditures is the men's prerogative. The same applies to the income generated through the sale of wood which was the second most important source of income recorded from studies in mountain villages in Laghman. Likewise, livestock was also being owned either by the household (i.e., owned jointly between men and women) or by men. Only chickens were specifically reported as being owned exclusively and de facto by women¹⁴. This is highly significant in that not only does it not threaten traditional power structures, but the RAMP poultry program adds additional value in the community development and hygiene training it provides. Please see detailed report for additional information on the implementing agency, which is not performing so excellently.

Recommendation Keep doing what we are doing incredibly right -- exactly what RAMP is doing by investing in poultry production to truly empower these women by giving them access to the only income they have the traditional right to keep. Other IPs should be considered in implementing the poultry programs in other priority provinces for RAMP.

4.4.5 Finding Women play a very important role in animal care, but this is not acknowledged because they don't actually own animals aside from poultry. They share responsibilities for cleaning herd stalls, collecting cow dung, releasing animals for grazing, and of course, milking. They usually observe any forms of ill health in the animals and report this to the men. They care for the calves, goats and chickens. Men act as overall 'managers' overseeing the women and children as they perform various chores.

Recommendation Incorporate women into the livestock health training programs that are being led by the Dutch Committee for Afghanistan at the paraveterinarian level, as well as at the Basic

¹⁴ Kerr-Wilson and Paine, 2003, p.14, Klinnert, 1997, 1997b

Veterinary Worker level. The FAO/PIHAM project recognized the different roles and knowledge of women and men in livestock production and in particular the critical role which women play in diagnosing and tending to sick animals. The PIHAM project identified rural women as a key beneficiary group and recognized their capacities as animal production and health ‘specialists’, providing a basic veterinary worker training course for women. The reason was that women can often best provide the diagnosis for a sick animal through their intimate knowledge and observation on a daily basis. The lesson learned from the PIHAM project was that women have an important role to play in participatory livestock management and monitoring and can influence their husbands (or other male household members) to change livestock practices.¹⁵

4.4.6 Finding Lack of accurate information is the single greatest differential in Afghan women’s access to resources that are now available in agriculture.

Recommendation Develop a cadre of professional female agricultural extension workers that are based at the Ministry of Agriculture, as well as various NGOs and implementing agencies. Female extension workers did exist in the past in Afghanistan and are not an anathema to rural culture.¹⁶ It was also found that wherever in Afghanistan – no matter how conservative, e.g. Paktia – that if an announcement was made for a highly trained woman extension agent there were many that applied. Also household women are eager for information and to meet with the extension personnel, and so will not reject such an opportunity. The women extension agents traveled and lived initially in the village woman leader’s house but this was too much of a burden on the village woman so they then rented small houses for the women with a kitchen or housed them in a guest house/hotel. They initially had a truck for the women extension agents and one for men but then had mixed groups of men and women traveling together.

4.5 Skills

4.5.1 Finding Gender training, gender training, gender training. Expatriate male staff need gender training as much, if not more than local Afghan male staff. The array of colonial and sexist attitudes that have been encountered during this consultancy among senior expatriate male staff was truly shocking and revelatory. RAMP and other Chemonics programs need to invest in expanding the awareness of their own senior staff urgently.

Recommendation Conduct gender training for all senior expatriate RAMP staff, as well as local Afghan staff and implementing partners. This has to come with a strong push from management, and full participation of management otherwise it will be seen as a window dressing exercise. The point has to be made that gender is not some frou-frou human rights issue, but a central part of maximizing Afghanistan’s agricultural output.

Recommendation Train all program staff in gender-sensitive budget and project analysis.

4.5.2 Finding Very little technical training has been focused on rural women, particularly in the areas of marketing and consensus-building. New interest in building the capacities of women in a range of small business development skills has thus far focused on educated urban women.

Recommendation Expand the services offered to rural women beyond microcredit. Provide business development training for women, including building confidence, public speaking to computer usage and English skills. Accelerate implementation of micro-credit schemes (MISFA), with particular focus on women. Integrate skills enhancement training and vocational training with provision of micro-credit, supported by market surveys and training in account keeping.

¹⁵ Hill, 1997

¹⁶ Personal notes of Zulaikha Aziz from 2004 Gender Mission: Dr. Samin received his master’s degree in 1963 from the University of Wyoming and his PhD from Oklahoma State in 1969 in agriculture. He has broad experience in working with rural women and made the above comments.

4.5.3 Finding Using examples and models from the local culture and religious framework enhances compliance and learning among participants.

Recommendation Provide training for local program participants using local models and Islamic foundations for gender equity. Include religious education in all projects

4.5.4 Finding After meeting with Mr. Fazli, who is the coordinator of extension services for MAAH, it was found that out of almost 400 agricultural extension workers, only 3 are women. This is abhorrent and unacceptable. RAMP has an obligation as a major policy advisor to the ministry to address this.

Recommendation Lobby for a gender unit to be in MAAH, reporting directly to the Minister. Assist the ministry in developing terms of reference for this gender unit.

4.5.5 Finding With one notable exception (the director that commissioned this consultancy) there is a lack of political will and interest among the program managers and even senior staff at RAMP to discuss gender, much less to actively promote it among their implementing agencies.

Recommendation Act upon Zulaikha Aziz' idea to create a gender advisory group at RAMP, reporting directly to Lou Faoro, that meets monthly to monitor and track progress on gender interventions.

4.6 Data collection

4.6.1 Finding Strong and measurable indicators are keys to setting a vision and goal for the overall project. Only a few of the RAMP implementing partners collected baseline data on gender integration or any gender issues. Collection of adequate sex-disaggregated data across all sectors to document women's and men's involvement and to enable monitoring of future developments and effects of investments is crucial to documenting change and/or progress.

Recommendation Improve monitoring and evaluation to include gender indicators at all levels. Collect adequate gender-disaggregated data across all sectors to document women's and men's involvement and to enable monitoring of future developments and the effects of investment. Hold program managers accountable for the collection of this information and surveillance and hold the project accountable for reaching those targets set at the beginning.

4.6.2 Finding During the detailed site visits, it was discovered that RAMP has accomplished a great deal more for women than has previously been thought. This information oversight must be remedied by having a consistent system of capturing information on gender in RAMP programs. In addition, gender-specific information was often found in the implementing agency monitoring reports that are on file on the o:\ drive. It was startling that this information had not been documented or noted regarding RAMP's impact on the lives of Afghan women.

Recommendation Develop a simple matrix of gender questions that apply across sectors so that program managers can use them on every site visit and report back on upon return to the office. Make this a habit for the program managers, enforced by the program directors. Read the monitoring reports. Draft a monthly gender summary of all program impacts at RAMP based on the monitoring reports and site visit reports. This directive has to come from the highest levels.

V. Modifications for 3 existing job orders

As per the scope of work referenced in the bibliography, the consultant has been tasked with recommending modifications to at least three RAMP job orders to increase their impact on rural Afghan women's lives. The two job orders selected are:

1. JO#13-0004- DCA Livestock Health, Production, and Marketing Improvement Program
2. JO#29-0004- RoP Grape Revitalization for Afghanistan Productivity and Empowerment
3. In place of the third job order to have been selected, the entire sector of **infrastructure** has been selected since so little has been actually attempted in integrating gender into infrastructure in Afghanistan. Our logic is that we can build on lessons learned from practices in the first and second years of infrastructure development in RAMP, as well as make recommendations for larger interventions and inclusion of women in the third year's worth of infrastructure activities.

These recommended revisions are organized in the following order.

- I. Objective
- II. Findings
- III. Recommendations
- IV. Detailed site visits
- V. Monitoring reports
- VI. Resources and contacts

1. JO#13-0004-DCA Livestock Health, Production, and Marketing Improvement Program

Objective: create a national network of private veterinary field units (VFUs) capable of providing livestock health services in all 380 districts of Afghanistan. Train sufficient numbers of paraveterinarians (paravets) to staff and service the national network, and create a livestock health, production and marketing information system that link this private paravet network with government departments on such issues as disease surveillance, livestock inventories, and trans-border issues.

Findings

- *Gender awareness* The implementing agencies, DCA and local partners, do have a strong grasp of the significance of gender integration into the overall program, but have been restricted by cultural and institutional bottlenecks. This 'ownership' of gender awareness is important to recognize and to reward as very few other implementing agencies have demonstrated it – even ones that are working directly in 'women's' sectors, such as poultry.
- *Length of training restricts female recruitment* DCA did try to recruit female paravets for training program, particularly in the northern regions of Afghanistan, where restrictions for females are less severe, but had trouble retaining the trainees due to the length of the course (6 months) and the reluctance of the women's *mahrms* (brother or husbands) to spend the full course of the 6 months with the women in the training locations.
- *Paramount urgency of improving livestock health in Afghanistan* Rural women tend to be more associated with livestock production than crop production.¹⁷ The case for

¹⁷ RAMP Impact Assessment of Assistance to the Livestock Sub-sector Program in Afghanistan, May 2005

promoting increased livestock production is pressing given the growing demand for animal products and a large proportion of the population living in extreme poverty, most of who are dependent, at least in part, on food and income derived from livestock. So, in effect, improving livestock health in Afghanistan is helping Afghan women since their food security is so dependent on having healthy livestock in the family compound.

- *Afghan women are vital to livestock management* Family livestock production systems, which make up all of Afghanistan’s livestock production systems, since no large commercial livestock farms exist yet, have always been women’s productions systems. FAO realized this in the 1990’s and although they did not set out to target women, they ended up working primarily with women since male veterinarians were not permitted to deal with women farmers.¹⁸ This program was so successful that over 3,000 women in the country were trained and the Taliban even asked FAO to establish a women’s veterinary clinic in Kabul.
- *BUT their roles are selective* Although Afghan women are intensively involved in livestock health management, it is important to recognize that they are primarily responsible for smaller livestock (sheep, goats, and chicken primarily), as well as smaller numbers of those livestock, as opposed to the larger herds that men often manage. However, once the larger herds are brought in from grazing, it is the women who do the milking and maintenance, which is significant since they are then often the first to notice signs of disease.
- *Existing plans to integrate gender* DCA via its local partner, the Afghan Veterinary Association (AVA), has already begun an assessment of female client needs via a draft survey shared with this consultant. This is an important planning step that AVA has taken in collecting gender-disaggregated data prior to implementation and should also be applauded. Find the form directly below:

Women Survey Form

Month-----Year ----- Date of Visit-----

Region: ----- Province-----District-----Village-----

Name of the Field Visitor----- Name of the women-----

1. Purpose of the Visit: Treatment Drenching Vaccination Other treatment

2. No of Visit: 1st time 2nd times Many times

3. Company: None other women with relative others

4. Marital status: married not married widow divorce

5. Distance of VFU: Very far far close very close

6. Type of animal: large ruminants small ruminants equine poultry.

7. Accessibility: Easily Not easily problematic

8. Reference to VFU: Visited made enquiry Told by some one

9. Recognition of the sick animal: Difficult easy Very easy

10. Importance of the service: Very important Important require not

11. Satisfaction: Very good Good Somewhat good Not good

12. Follow up: one time two time many time Not at all

¹⁸ “Afghanistan’s women – the hidden strength of a war-torn land”, FAO <http://www.fao.org/News/2002/020105-e.htm>.

13. Cost of service charge: Very expensive expensive fair very chief
14. Payment: Fully paid partially paid Loan Free
15. Type of payment: Cash loan as animal product as agriculture product
16. Who support the family: Husband Brothers Myself other
17. Main source of income: Sale of animals Sale of animal products sale of agricult[ur] products others
18. Problem encountered during Visit:
19. Suggestions:

- *Existing capacity* Afghan women in rural areas are illiterate but they do have specialized veterinary skills that help keep their animals healthy and protect household income and nutrition. These specialized skills need to be built upon and further developed, however lack of formal education is a barrier to women becoming paravets.
- *Working hours* After visiting the University of Kabul's veterinary teaching facilities that were built by DCA, it was a surprise to find that they are only open from 9am-12pm. How can farmers access this facility, which is also supposed to offer veterinary care for local animals within this small window of time, not to mention women, whose schedules are far more restricted due to household duties?

Recommendations

- *Existing capacity* Initially invest in basic veterinary worker (BVW) training for women, which is possible via the shorter (1 month) trainings offered to the BVWs on location in the community, which also makes the issue of travel with a *mahram* unnecessary. Depending on the success of this program, consider plans to recruit women for the paravet program.
 - *Special gender program* With the active support of AVA, continue plans to develop a special program to target women as both recipients and deliverers of veterinary services for their livestock. One step already taken in this direction is the development of the survey tool mentioned earlier. This program could be piloted in certain select areas.
 - *Hire female veterinarians* To train the female participants in both the BVW program and the paravet program eventually. Having female trainers makes all the difference in the world in terms of allowing women to have access and permission to attend the trainings. It is also critical in establishing strong role models for females as BVWs and paravets.
 - *Geographic focus* Initially focus female paravet trainings in the northern provinces of Afghanistan since restrictions forbidding women's movement and advancement are somewhat less rigid in those areas. However, female BVW trainings should be conducted nationwide as reaching female clients in remote and underserved areas is critical to ensuring livestock health.
 - *Survey tool* A detailed response pasted below with additional recommendations has been delivered to AVA by this consultant to further expand and refine the survey tool that they are developing to assess female clients' veterinary needs.
- a) It would be useful in the marital status section to note if the women are the 1st and only wives of their husbands or if they are co-wives, and if so, what number in the hierarchy.
 - b) Total number of people in the household
 - c) Number of children
 - d) Who cleans the animal stalls?
 - e) Who takes the animals out for grazing?

- d) Who milks the animals?
- e) Who assists the animals during calving?
- f) Who owns the animals?
- g) Head of household?
- h) Who can sell any of the animals?
- i) Who handles the profits from the sale of the animals?
- j) Who decides about slaughtering the animals?
- k) Can you purchase animals of your own?
- l) Have you attended any community meetings?
- m) Have you attended any training in animal health?
- n) Are there women's groups in your village? If so, are you a member?

I look forward to hearing your thoughts on these suggestions, and if you are amenable to accepting any of them, I'd be glad to help you insert them into the soft copy of your survey form, as well as to format it to make it user-friendly for field staff.

- *Business training* The curriculum for private management of the VFUs that was developed by DCA and AVA via internal working groups is excellent. This model should be used by FAO to develop business skills for the women in its poultry program, as well as other RAMP programs that aim to deliver business training to clients. With such a high demand for business development services in all sectors, it is crucial to recognize that a large amount of resources do not need to be dedicated to the task, and DCA has demonstrated this aptly here.

IV. Detailed site visits:

June 7, 2005 with Dr. Daad Mohammad Amir and Rensje Van Neck on road to Charikar.

Visited a VFW training center, which was staffed by AVA. The staff, which included two female veterinarians, was sharp and all fluent English speakers. We took a tour of facilities, which included live animals (horse, sheep, dogs, and poultry) for students to practice vaccinations and examinations on. Interestingly, one of the female veterinarians was afraid of the dogs, which had been raised on an ISAF base and were very friendly. Personally, I don't see how you can be a veterinarian and be afraid of dogs, but the whole veterinary college selection process in Afghanistan was very haphazard and arbitrary in the past according to Dr. Daad Mohammad. If you did not have the connections or money (for bribes) to get into medical school, then you were assigned to veterinary school. Very sad that such an esteemed profession in other countries is considered sub-standard in Afghanistan.

The classrooms were well-lit and stocked with diagrams and skeletons of animals. Separate male and female bathrooms were available.

They told me that they have an official training program for female paravets in Mazar, but that the women dropped out of the program. However, they do not decline female participants – if any of the local NGOs or the government sends them women to be trained as paravets at this Charikar clinic, they would welcome them.

It should be noted that the 3 (one was not present during my visit) female veterinarian trainers on staff are funded by the Danish/Dutch program SV - not by RAMP. Why is SV able to find female trainers and AVA/DCA not able to? Perhaps this is not a fair question as we have been focusing on female trainees in the AVA/DCA paravet courses, but it's worth noting for future

reference. Unfortunately, I was not able to meet with Dr. Sayed Safi, as he was out of the country with Dr. Daad Mohammad on training in the United States, but we communicated by email.

July 19, 2005 Tuesday, 1:00 pm site visit to Kabul office of DCA

Met with Dr. Wim Tondeur, who explained that it is admittedly difficult to recruit females for the paravet training for many reasons such as distance, access, lack of formal education, and need for *mahrms*. DCA did try to recruit female paravets for the training program, particularly in the northern regions of Afghanistan, where restrictions for females are less severe, but had trouble retaining the trainees due to the length of the course (6 months) and the reluctance of the women's *mahrms* (brother or husbands) to spend the full course of the 6 months with the women in the training locations. For example, Oxfam, Intl. nominated 3 female candidates from Badakhshan for the training of paravets in Mazar-i-Sharif, and DCA went to the trouble of renting a separate house for them and their *mahrms*, but the women ended up dropping out because their *mahrms* would not stay with them for the duration of the course.

Dr. Tondeur further elaborated that other parts of the DCA program not affiliated with RAMP do have women participating fully in the BVW program, as well as being linked up with micro-credit provision, such as the program in Karabagh district in Parwan province. This merits further investigation. Why do RAMP's programs not have female participation? Is it our implementing partner? Or is it the lack of gender focus from the RAMP side? Obviously, the IP is trying to integrate gender into the program via the survey tool that they have shared with us, but it's 2 years too late into RAMP's lifecycle, almost as an afterthought.

I raised the issue of the paravets being almost exclusively men, and how that would impact female livestock holders in terms of access to medical treatment for their animals. Dr. Tondeur showed me the picture of a male paravet vaccinating a woman's hen in a clinic near Kabul. This is the same picture that is blown up to super-size in RAMP's conference room. He assured me that women do take their animals to male paravets for vaccinations and treatment, even if they have to haul them in on bikes and wheelbarrows. I still wonder if this only applies in areas near Kabul since in other parts of the country mobility is more restricted for women. In addition, in remote regions and mobile populations such as the Kuchis of the Registan desert, it is solely the responsibility of women to take care of sick animals in the home, so these women would not have access to a paravet at the VFU.¹⁹ Female paravet workers are needed to conduct outreach and extension for these isolated populations, which comprise a large part of Afghanistan's population.

I asked him what we can do to improve women's access to DCA's livestock health program. He showed me data in tables where the actual proportion of poultry being treated/vaccinated in comparison to larger livestock was 29/1371, indicating that the greatest demand for livestock health services is in the arena of larger livestock such as camels, horses, cows, bulls, donkeys, etc. If this is indeed the case, and the full range of data demonstrates the evidence, then RAMP has a responsibility to respond to the actual demand, which is what it is doing. In terms of smaller livestock such as ruminants, he suggested that the BVW, who should be based in each community, can meet the women livestock owner's needs. Larger flocks of ruminants are managed by boys and men. Women do play a large role in raising the young of the large livestock, but men take care of them in maturity.

¹⁹Aziz, Zainab, and Jost, Christine, DVM, MA, Tufts University School of Veterinary Medicine International Program, "Men, Women, Children, and Livestock: A Livelihoods Analysis of the Afghan Registan Kuchi Focused on Gender and Animal Health", p. 14.

However, data can be misleading. It could be that the demand being recorded by DCA at present only represents the populations being reached, and that a larger unmet demand exists at the household compound level, where women would be the actual clients of veterinary services. Hopefully, the results of AVA's survey can answer this question and this report will stimulate more detailed analysis of livestock health needs.

I asked him why all of the expatriate staff at DCA were men. They did have one expatriate woman working in administration a few months ago. He stated that even in the West, it is still relatively unusual for women to go into livestock management and care or to select posts in places like Afghanistan, Frauke de Weijer being one of the exceptions. Agriculture is still a relatively patriarchal field.

Veterinary Field Units (VFUs) consist of 2 kinds of clinics:

1. Privately owned and usually family operated
2. Rented, usually in the middle of bazaars

DCA generally prefers not to build new VFUs as government officials inevitably end up taking them over as 'office space'. DCA prefers to spend its funds on equipment, instruments, and motorbikes for its paravets to conduct outreach into under-served rural areas. DCA/AVA sends monitors out to villages to find candidates from the village for the paravet training, so that they will eventually return back to that home village, rather than appointing paravets from distant areas to unfamiliar posts. This ensures retention rates of the paravets. With the plans to have all of the existing and new VFUs privatized, Dr. Tondeur explained that DCA is conducting small business training itself for the paravets/soon-to-be entrepreneurs. A copy of the curriculum for this training was provided and deemed to be excellent.

Contacts and Resources

Dr. Wim Tondeur, Deputy Program Director, Dutch Committee for Afghanistan (DCA) 079-328-805, wimtondeur@planet.nl

Dr. Zia Ahmad, PRB Animal Health, Qunduz, 079-184-125

Dr. Noor Jahan 079-318-485

Dr. Zubaida Popal 079-323-394

Dr. Sayed Safi, Program Director of AVA, sayed_gul@yahoo.com,

Dr. Frauke de Weijer, Pastoralist Specialist, F_deweijer@hotmail.com

2. JO#29-0004-RoP Grape Revitalization for Afghanistan Productivity and Empowerment

Objective: RoP will

- Provide extension services for Afghan farmers
- Training for 20 horticultural MAAH extension agents
- Develop 10 model farms for best practices
- Create market/collection centers
- Improve vine propagation
- Establish 3 farmer-owned businesses
- Promote commercial sales management to re-establish and develop local, regional, and international markets.

Findings

- *Overall* Given the scope of what is possible to accomplish in this sub-sector, Roots of Peace has had little impact on the lives of rural Afghan women in the course of its RAMP project cycle. It is particularly striking that another RAMP IP, CADG, has been able to include women in a raisin processing factory in one of the most traditional and unstable regions of Afghanistan, Kandahar. Unfortunately, this is not under RAMP programming, but the point is that it can be done. CADG has succeeded in hiring 73 women to clean, sort, oil, and package the raisins at the Haji Sher Mohammad Raisin Factory in Kandahar.
- *Progress made* Towards the end of this consultancy, Roots of Peace has made an effort to include gender in its programming by planning on hiring a gender specialist for its Market Training Center in Parwan. This is a step in the right direction.
- *Depth and understanding* of the local culture and historical background are also missing in the Roots of Peace management team. It is deeply ironic that an Afghan man literally working in the demonstration field on a Roots of Peace project could give me the contact information for female extension agents working with another project when the Roots of Peace management team continued to insist that no such thing as a female extension agent exists in Afghanistan.
- *Vision* One of the most obvious roles that women could play in the raisin and nut sector is be in the shelling, cleaning, and sorting of the final product, however, this potential role was never discussed in meetings or in project documents with the Roots of Peace team. The nut assessment team from Modesto did mention this possibility; however women need to be integrated early in the processing facility planning process. One example of the role that women play in the processing of nuts illustrated below was found on the desktop computer in Helmand, probably from CADG programs:

PROCESSING COST FOR 2MT PER DAY FOR ALMOND, WALNUT & PISTACHIO					Cost per Kg	
<u>Particulars</u>	<u>Gender</u>	<u>Unit</u>	<u>Unit Cost</u>	<u>Total Cost</u>	Af	USD
Cracking	Female	100	100	10000	5	0.1
Sorting	Female	100	100	10000	5	0.1
Dust Cleaning	Female	2	130	260	0.13	0.0026
Sorting seed	Female	8	100	800	0.4	0.008
Packet Filling	Female	2	120	240	0.12	0.0024
Weighing	Female	2	120	240	0.12	0.0024

Packet sealing	Female	2	120	240	0.12	0.0024
Box sealing	Male	4	262.5	1050	0.525	0.0105
Loading cost	Male	1	250	250	0.125	0.0025
Controller	Male	3	150	450	0.225	0.0045
Total				23530	11.765	0.2353

- *Management* No female expatriates exist in the Roots of Peace office which indicates lack of diversity on the management level. It is understood that the president of Roots of Peace is a dynamic American woman, but this leadership is not translated down to the grassroots level.

Recommendations:

- *Gender awareness and vision* Invest in gender training for the senior level management staff at Roots of Peace to give them a deep understanding of the issues that affect women in developing countries, particularly in Muslim communities. Provide all project staff and beneficiaries gender awareness training via a series of workshops that expatriate and local managers attend also so that the local staff has strong role models of a management team that is invested in gender equity. Training men in gender awareness is more important than training women. This will not be a costly exercise as there are plenty of local NGOs in Kabul with expertise in this area.
- *Staffing* Recruit at least 1 female extension agent for the raisin team and 1 female extension agent for the almond team to conduct outreach for women farmers. If they have trouble finding qualified females willing to work in rural areas, refer them to one of their own sub-contractors, the Global Partnership for Afghanistan (GPFA) or to DCW's vegetable dehydration program right down the street in Charikar.
- *Business development opportunities* Include a % of women as members of the nut marketing associations. Women nut and raisin farmers do exist. According to a 1999 FAO report, 11% of horticulture farms were headed by women. It is often incorrectly assumed that women do not sell products in Afghanistan when in fact most destitute women and single heads of household have no choice but to market their goods themselves. Include a % of local businesswomen as producers and traders, as well as general labor in the nut packaging facilities. The upcoming Mazar-i-Sharif and Kabul nut packaging facilities are both quick wins as both environments are fairly liberal, and you can find plenty of businesswomen and female laborers in those areas.
- *Coordination* Establish clear linkages via meetings and sharing information between Agricultural Finance/Credit Assessment and Recommendations (5b in original proposal) to MISFA and BDS services as both of the latter target female businesses and this will create a natural link enabling RoP to find more female participants. Provide minutes of meetings and results to RAMP in monthly monitoring reports.
- *Data collection and disaggregation* Evaluate how many female almond/raisin farmers and traders exist in each district of proposed project. Women farmers and traders do exist, particularly in the Shomali Plains, however most male extension agents often do not have access or are not aware of them. All of RoP's extension agents are currently male. Assess what the specific needs of female producers, processors and traders are regarding resources, pricing, and marketing. Without a baseline, we cannot monitor progress or regress.
- *Outreach* Use a set # of targeted radio programs and female extension agent outreach to ensure that women get the information about your project inputs such as fertilizer, trainings, and marketing information. On program inputs, one of the most significant variables in access to resources between Afghan men and women is asymmetry in *information*. Time and time again, reports from the National Solidarity Program (NSP), the major rural rehabilitation program in Afghanistan, state that women are often not included as beneficiaries of the project even though they are specifically targeted because they either
 - a) Do not know about the benefits (e.g., block grants for villages) or

- b) The timing of the meetings is such that they could not attend due to household and agricultural chores

Detailed site visit:

May 11, 2005, Wednesday The visit was more of a picnic than a project site visit. I met the Roots of Peace team at their office in Karte Char at their request, and we rode in their vehicle up to Parwan province. The vehicle was very nice, it had air conditioning vents in the back, much nicer than any of the RAMP vehicles I have ridden in. Zach Lea and Gary Kuhn took the long way, to eat fish at restaurant and take pictures. LOTS of picture taking. We visited the same sites that I had visited with David Frey of GIA, with a few schools added in along the way to distribute soccer balls. Gary had a strong knowledge of viticulture, pruning, and trellising.

Visited a demonstration farm where drip irrigation was being used to educate farmers about improved irrigation practices versus the usual flooding practices that Afghan farmers have traditionally used in their fields. The farmers themselves were not there, but a team of the Roots of Peace Afghan extension workers were present. They were all men, very nice and friendly, quite progressive, and interested in me and where I came from locally. When I told them Shakardara (a district in Kabul province), they were delighted as some of them were from that district also. I think they were just glad to speak to someone in Farsi as the translator that Roots of Peace had employed was doing a terrible job with the translations between the extension workers and the visiting team. I explained that I was really there to see what kind of an impact the program had on women in the area. They told me that for that information I would have to meet with another NGO, GPFA. One of them very quickly pulled up the telephone number of the GPFA manager from his cell phone and gave it to me. Gary asked me to do all of the translations for the rest of the trip.

We met Jean-Pierre Detry, the Extension Advisor at Bagram Market Center site. Upon being introduced, Mr. Detry discouraged me from attempting to integrate Afghan women into grape activities simply because ‘they’re not ready yet’; ‘they’ being the Afghan people. He then proceeded to show me a lovely locust in its larval (worm) stage that he had picked off a tree.

Next we visited the Post Harvest Training, Storage and Process Center, which was located on one of the Taliban’s former frontlines in Parwan province. The facilities were still under construction, but appeared to be stable and appropriate. They showed me a steel container from where the IFDC dealer would be selling sulfur spray for the grapes. I asked why IFDC didn’t have women selling the sulfur spray. Gary said to me, “Have you ever seen a woman sell anything in Afghanistan?”. I said, “Yes, I have, especially destitute women.”

Next we visited one farmers’ field that had trellis demonstration poles installed. The farmer asked me in Dari for cement to solidify the wooden stakes that held up the grape trellises since he was afraid that moisture, insects and wear and tear would begin to disintegrate the wood of the poles. The farmer further told me that he was destitute and he had lost everything, his tools, his house, his doors and window frames when the Taliban burned the Shamali Plains. When I translated this to Mr. Detry, Zach, and Gary, they said it was an unreasonable request, and that the farmer should invest in the cement himself. Upon discussion with program manager, Mr. Mohibi, later on, it was suggested that the trellis poles themselves should have been made of cement, as those would be far more permanent and less likely to be stolen for firewood in the winter. Mr. Mohibi also confirmed that prior to the war, Afghans had used cement to create trellis poles and some were still left standing in the Shamali Plains from before the war, attesting to their durability.

Contacts and resources:

Gary Kuhn, Executive Director, Roots of Peace, 415-596-9637, gary@rootsofpeace.org
J.D. 'Zach' Lea, Chief of Party, Roots of Peace, 079-403-246, jdzea@hotmail.com
Guy Ewald, Marketing Advisor, Roots of Peace, 079-183-541 guy_ewald@hotmail.com
Extension Advisor, Jean-Pierre Detry, 079-183-542, detry366@hotmail.com

3. Infrastructure

In place of the third job order to have been selected, the entire sector of **infrastructure** has been selected since so little has been actually attempted in integrating gender into infrastructure in Afghanistan. Our logic is that we can build on lessons learned from practices in the first and second years of infrastructure development in RAMP, as well as make recommendations for larger interventions and inclusion of women in the third year's worth of infrastructure activities.

- I. Findings
- II. Recommendations
- III. Detailed site visit
- IV. Questions to ask

Findings

- National or local NGOs sometimes have better access to local communities to gain permission to include vulnerable women in their programs. For expatriate NGOs, it may be quite difficult to identify and communicate with local elders to gain access to their pool of female labor. This has cost, as well as efficiency ramifications.
- Inclusion of women in RAMP projects often occurs, but the information does not get transmitted back to the Kabul office via site visits, reports, or monitoring indicators.

Recommendations

- Elicit suggestions and feedback from national counterparts and national implementing partners on how women can be incorporated into RAMP projects.
- Make monitoring and evaluation team go out for periodic site visits outside Kabul so they can see what program managers often overlook in the bigger picture of what's happening on the ground.
- Institutionalize gender indicators into monitoring and evaluation reports, as well as general trip reports.

Detailed site visit **June 27, 2005 Monday trip to Kunduz**

Met with the Engineer Gul Rahman of the Kunduz Rehabilitation Agency (KRA) to look at their program on irrigation and road construction under part of Job Order # 4. We visited Lala Maidan and Woluswal Aliabad. Although this job order is closed, and was not part of the 15 selected for the gender review, it was fascinating to learn that women had been incorporated in the implementation of the project without any pressure or impetus from the RAMP program team. This deserves particular attention because it shows that even an Afghan male-owned and operated NGO, KRA, has the awareness to work within the community to target vulnerable women while many of our expatriate implementing partners are reluctant to get involved. One reason for this increased flexibility on the part of national NGOs may be that it is easier for them to talk to the local male leaders and *shuras* to access permission to enlist the participation of vulnerable women. Access can make all the difference in making it easier to incorporate gender.

Interestingly, KRA had included women in both its irrigation project as gabion weavers, as well as preparers of food for its laborers in the road construction project. This has not been documented at all in official trip reports or the monitoring and evaluation reports that KRA has in the RAMP office in Kabul. For one square meter of gabion wire, the family would be paid \$4.00, which appears to be a much more fair deal than the \$1.00 that families were earning in Helmand.

In addition, the quality of gabion wire used in Kunduz was of the soft, non-erodable variety, which made it less difficult for the women's hands. The males of the family would provide the base and support for the gabion construction by nailing the structure down, mapping the design, and securing it while the females wrapped the wire around that frame. None of this is documented in official RAMP reports.

On the roads program, KRA staff approached the village elders or *maliks*, and asked them to identify the poorest of the families, who were then given the task of preparing the daily fresh *nan* for the manual laborers on the roads project. KRA stated that they firmly believed in including women's participation, and that the relatively less strict culture of the north made their efforts possible as opposed to the more rigid culture of southern Afghanistan. When asked by this consultant why they never reported these activities to RAMP, they said that RAMP never asked them about gender in their projects before this consultant came to visit. This is a sad phenomenon.

They also include women in their other projects that are not funded by RAMP, including watershed management, sapling plantings, and nurseries. Fascinating work.

Contacts and resources

Engineer Gul Rahman, Kunduz Rehabilitation Agency (KRA), 079-209-284

GENERAL CHECKLIST FOR THE INFRASTRUCTURE SECTOR

What are the objectives of the irrigation system?

What are the needs of female and male water users?

To what extent are (1) and (2) compatible, or: in what ways can irrigation professionals contribute to accommodating the irrigation systems to the needs of both female and male water users?

If the aim of the project is a well, what is the distance the women have to walk?

Are there differentials in access to transport in carrying the water?

In other words, do men have trucks, motorbikes, while women have to walk, thus doubling their burden of labor, and leaving them more vulnerable to the elements and potential security problems?

As the primary collectors and users of water, do women have safe access to the planned source of water?

Consider that women are also in charge of household sanitation and cleansing of utensils and clothes. For example in one case, when women were consulted on irrigation canals, they insisted that one site selected by the project engineers should have stone slabs instead of concrete blocks because the concrete blocks would crack when the clothes were beaten with sticks during the washing. The engineer complied and the women were happy with their rock.

Irrigation rehabilitation, such as building or repairing aqueducts ('qarezes') are women's ideas

<p>sought?</p> <p>This may not seem like a relevant gender point, but in fact, these qarezes which men demand for crop irrigation, are often used by women, children and the elderly as crossing points to graze livestock, reach schools, attend clinics, wash clothes, or visit relatives.</p>
<p>If the project is energy-related – are alternative energy sources considered to save women’s time and labor? Wood fuel exhaust inhalation has been proven to have a very high burden of disease on women in particular.</p>
<p>If the project is income generation, do women have equal access to the selling and marketing of the products the project is promoting, or do they have to go through middleMEN, thus reducing their potential profit/income?</p> <p>Do they get to decide how the products are costed?</p> <p>Are there quality control systems to increase the value?</p> <p>Are they trained in pricing?</p> <p>Are the project activities tripling or quadrupling the women’s current burden of labor?</p> <p>Consider time-management studies on household chores – have these been conducted before women are given extra tasks?</p>
<p>If the project is a school, are there latrines built for the girls, are they in a safe location, and is there a plan for routine cleaning?</p> <p>Is there a way for the girls to get to school without being harassed or harmed? Are there appropriate numbers of male and female teachers to be hired?</p> <p>If the project is a health clinic, are their female health practitioners to see female clients/patients?</p> <p>Are there separate waiting areas for men and women?</p>
<p>If the project is a road, is the road large enough for women to walk through with their burqas and children in their arms and often other children in hands, as that is the way that most women travel, as they are responsible for care of the children. The width of a road should be doubled to reflect the reality that women need room to navigate, particularly when there are large vehicles passing them.</p> <p>Is the roadway clear enough to prevent assaults on women or are there bushes, shrubs, trees, where risks could be high for women to be using the road?</p> <p>Do planned routings consider women’s access to services and their security?</p> <p>Is the road well-lit for dark hours in early morning, evening, or at night?</p>
<p>Land or legal reform, are women given equal consideration under Afghan and Islamic</p>

law to all benefits?

Are they represented in discussion?

What mechanisms are being considered to include land ownership for women, especially female heads of households and orphans?

Has the project ensured that the legal frameworks cover rural women and their rights to land, credit and most importantly, WATER?

Is information regarding all programs and projects shared equally with the women of the community?

How does the project ensure and report this?

Labor-generating, building or public works,

how are the needs of vulnerable women (single heads of household) being addressed (e.g., by specific quotas and measures to identify them)?

How will they benefit? (e.g., by providing women-oriented tasks such as gabion wearing-stone-breaking; by women-specific work gangs or work space; by giving equal pay for equal work)?

They could be included as administrators or logisticians or secretaries if they cannot conduct the heavy labor themselves, but their inclusion is essential if the project benefits are to reach them.

VI. Constraints, or tasks I wish I had time to complete, but were not on my scope of work:

1. New job orders to explore and develop – this item was removed from the SOW due to budgetary restrictions that prevent new RAMP job orders, but recommendations would have been:
 - a) Sericulture, especially Mazar and Herat
 - b) Gender-equitable market linkages
 - c) Honeybees
 - d) Further develop gabion weaving
2. Following up on the women’s applications for the Cochrane Agricultural Entrepreneurship Program and the Singapore Midwives Program. This takes time and energy and phone units. The women from Lashkargah enthusiastically submitted applications that were hand-carried by Rick Breitenstein, but they were incomplete, and as much as I tried to get more information from them via our Lashkargah office on the phone, they never gave us the rest of their pictures or the info. Lost opportunity to have deeply expanded their horizons.
3. Meet with Tawab Assefi of DAI to discuss the importance of women’s roles in irrigation and water usage. Prepare fact sheet on what Afghan women actually do with the qarezes and wells. Assess the impact of the upcoming water user association and its bylaws on women’s lives.
4. Actually get to read the Nut Sector Assessment so that I can comment on its gender-related sections. A lot of time was invested with this team, so it would have been worthwhile to get returns.
5. To coach and mentor the IPs that are interested in getting more gender integration or training in their work programs, as well as in learning from each other and synchronizing their efforts on behalf of Afghan women (e.g., food processing training for Helmand women via Job Order 24 in Peshawar will be useful for the food processing facility that Andres plans on building in Lashkargah). Linkages add value, but they’re not being maximized in RAMP, particularly for women’s activities.
6. Train all staff at RAMP on gender awareness and sensitivity.
7. Create a gender awareness indicator for all of the performance evaluations of RAMP staff.
8. Work with Monitoring and Evaluation team to have gender indicators in all job orders, as well as sector specific questions for each sector.
9. To brief program managers on what short questions they can ask to assess women’s participation in RAMP projects – checklist developed

VII. Detailed reports on other 12 Job Orders

JO 1 Rural Financial Services MISFA Program Manager Fran Toomey

- I. Objectives
- II. Findings
- III. Recommendations
- IV. Detailed site visit
- V. Monitoring report
- VI. Contacts and resources

Objective is to finance a mix of organizations that implement a varied range of microfinance approaches in order to test their applicability to Afghanistan and support the development of a diverse and competitive microfinance sector.

Findings

- Very difficult and frustrating to get gender disaggregated or any information from the MISFA team – email history available upon request.
- In terms of outreach to beneficiaries, MISFA has a solid track record of targeting women, as over 90% of its loan clients are female. This is great.
- In terms of expatriate management staff mix, MISFA also represents females excellently at senior and middle levels of management.
- More information is needed (and a World Bank study is in process, I believe) to understand what kind of an impact the microloans to women are having on the household income level.
- The visit to the Kunduz office of AKF demonstrated relatively poor level of outreach to women clients.

Recommendations

- Have expatriate staff from implementing partner, the Aga Khan Foundation (AKF) staffing the office in Kunduz. They need the capacity building and support in a big way.
- Link the provision of microfinance to business development services for women so that their businesses actually have a chance to survive, much less thrive.
- Gain more of an understanding of what Afghan women who seek to become small business owners really need in terms of microfinance and support services. Hopefully the World Bank study will flesh this out for us.

Detailed site visits

May 11, 2005 2:30 pm, Wednesday Met with Fran Toomey who recommended that I visit the following sites:

- a) Women for Women, (W4W) Intl. – ask Kirsten Weiss for contact info, also looking at impact because all the loan officers are female. MEDA....Loan capital is provided only to W4W, no operating costs covered.

- b) BRAC in Nangarhar – will introduce me to them, Ibrahim Biswas, 070-284-178, ibrahimbiswas@yahoo.com, ask him how many agricultural loans are made to women?
- c) Hirat City and Guzara – BRAC also
- d) Gave me number for Khalid Khyber, the ‘raisin man’, a producer/processor with a factory on Jalalabad road, who actually employs a lot of women to clean and sort his raisins: 079-037-061. Is he a borrower from AIB? Other borrowers are not hiring women. No one ever answered this phone number no matter how many times I called.
- e) She will get me info on Mohd. Kabir Hakimee – followed up 05/24/05. Could never get this information from Fran or Shakir no matter how many times I bugged them.

I asked Fran about life after microcredit for Afghan women thus far, what are the support mechanisms and how sustainable are their businesses? She said there are cost issues; microcredit institutions cannot bear those costs, so it’s not happening. Other NGOs may be working on that. Fran believes in keeping the provision of credit and training separate because these are two different skills sets that have to be acquired.

June 28, 2005 Tuesday 11:00 a.m. Aga Khan Foundation in Kunduz

Extremely gracious and kind local management team led by men welcomed me to their office. They only have one female loan officer, formerly a teacher, who has just begun recruiting 12 women over the last month. No loans have been given to these upcoming female clients yet. Interestingly, this unit was prominently displayed as an example of good practice in the first issue of *Insights*, the RAMP communication briefing note.

The clients from last year were all men, individual loans, and they all had good repayment rates. Most of those were farmers who borrowed for livestock and agricultural inputs. The expressions of interest from the 12 women clients thus far have been for sewing machines and handcrafts. The women heard about the program from the radio advertisements about AKF’s interest in women clients. No training on business development, marketing or price structures is provided with the microcredit loans for men or women. It is too early to assess the impact on the female clients yet. The female component of the program was delayed because the team was unable to find a woman to work as loan officer last year. In spite of Kunduz’ relatively more open atmosphere regarding women working outside the house, these loan officers seem to feel that having a female loan officer was viewed negatively by most of the community.

The female loan officer, Nassimajan that I met with was extremely shy, unable to even answer my simplest questions in Dari. She has received no training yet on microcredit or business. She used to live in Hairatan, which is a border town close to Uzbekistan. However, the one positive factor is that women are interested and will be attending the training sessions for loans.

Monitoring Reports

From Altai Consulting Micro-Finance for the Agricultural Sector Report of September 2004, one positive impact noted was that some of the female interviewees stated, “At least I am busy now”.²⁰ This is the only mention of rural women’s issues in the entire report.

From the MISFA website, it is apparent that quite sophisticated trainings are offered to the participating MFIs, but it is not clear what type of trainings are available to program beneficiaries or participants.

²⁰ Altai Consulting Micro-Finance for the Agricultural Sector Report, September 2004. p.15/18.

Contacts and resources

Debra Boyer, Program Manager, 079-334-061, debra_boyer@misfa.org

Nazari, Aga Khan Foundation in Kunduz, 079-225-098

Kirsten Weiss, Independent Microfinance Consultant, 650-430-2726, 079-36-611,

Kirsten_weiss2001@yahoo.com

Meagan Andrews, Senior Consultant/Project Manager Microfinance, Mennonite Economic Development Associates, 519-725-1853, ext. 32 mandrews@meda.org

Gender Assessment
JO 5 Development of Rural Poultry Production Activity
Food and Agricultural Organization (FAO)
Program Manager: Daad Mohammad Amir

- I. Objectives
- II. Findings
- III. Recommendations
- IV. Detailed site visits
- V. Numbers from monitoring reports
- VI. Contacts and resources

I. Objective: FAO will provide training in improved poultry care and production to 25,000 village women as well as introducing poultry income generating activities to open new markets for the surplus eggs.

II. Findings

- *Urgent item to improve* In site visit after site visit, the same refrain was heard over and over: increase the number of pullets distributed, as well as the amount of feed provided. The morbidity and mortality rates among the pullets were astonishingly high even *after* delivery of the pullets to the women. Much is made in the literature of 70% mortality rates of the pullets during transport from Pakistan, but very little is noted of the high number of pullets that died due to disease *after* they were given to the women. This is despite the vaccinations and treatment medications provided by the group leaders. This point cannot be overlooked as it has serious ramifications on the success of the program and the subsequent participation levels of the beneficiaries.
- *Major success* The hygiene training that accompanies the poultry training is a major positive externality from this program. The RAMP program manager, a very dynamic veterinarian, Dr. Daad Mohammad, recommended that we add a component to the hygiene program, that of training participants in the concepts of zoonosis, which is the transmission of diseases from vertebrate animals to human beings, which is incredibly relevant as the majority of Afghans in rural areas live in close proximity to their livestock. However, adding this component into the curriculum will cost money and the program will need more funding.
- *Question of scale* Given the results of reports such as the Altai study²¹, local poultry farms could add serious value to the Afghan economy, particularly since studies have shown that Afghan eggs and chicken meat are more valued than Pakistani or Iranian imports. However, this program is not geared towards large-scale production, but more towards subsistence poultry husbandry on the household level. The main

²¹ **Market Sector Assessment - Small and Medium Enterprises (for UNDP):** Altai Consulting is currently working on the development of Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in selected sectors of the Afghan economy. The approach involves conducting an in-depth analysis of the market dynamics to identify business opportunities in the following sectors: Poultry / Cumin and saffron / Gems / Services related to construction and small construction material / wheat-based products / cashmere / Soap, shampoo and laundry detergent.

reason this project has been designed is to alleviate women's poverty within the traditional Afghan context of roles and responsibilities in the household, but it would be worth examining the difference between these small poultry farms and larger poultry production facilities that could employ these women and truly make a difference in the poultry stock available for local consumption in Afghanistan, and potentially for export to other countries. This difference can be compared to putting a bandage on a gushing wound, or properly suturing and dressing the wound. This question is a larger policy issue than what is within RAMP's mandate; however, it would be responsible for RAMP senior management to discuss this issue with Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Husbandry (MAAH) policymakers.

- *Measurement issue* As one of the stated goals of the project is to improve food security and increase rural household incomes, the methods of measurement do not currently exist to accurately evaluate these goals. The majority of women interviewed during this consultancy did not report improved nutritional outcomes or higher incomes due to the poultry project, however in monitoring reports submitted by FAO, numbers are extrapolated to indicate that household income has indeed increased. It would be useful to forge a link between the extrapolations and actual findings from the field. This may be a difficult exercise; however the results would be worthwhile for assessing the sustainability of the project, as well as future investments in small-scale poultry production to improve women's livelihoods in Afghanistan. One of the difficulties in assessing improvements in household income is the lack of literacy and numeracy skills among the female clients, so they cannot determine if their monthly incomes have changed or not.
- *Use of profits/eggs* It is not clear if the program is nutritionally adding value to the family's livelihoods at this point. Quantitative estimates have been made by FAO via the monitoring and evaluation reports, but site visits do not corroborate these numbers. A larger issue to examine is how the women use the profits of the egg sales. For example, in one of the site visits, the woman in question responded that she used the profits to buy sugar for visiting guests. I asked her if her children's health was more important or providing hospitality for her guests. She stated that of course in Afghan culture, providing for your guests is the priority.
- *Capacity building* One of the interesting aspects of the program is the English instruction training provided to the female trainers. Although not directly related to the poultry program, it does add value to their future capacity and job prospects, as well as giving them the opportunity to potentially instruct other women in their communities in English. One question is whether or not the resources devoted to this task could not be better spent in training the poultry program participants in numeracy and literacy skills so that they can manage their poultry stocks better. Conversely, both programs could be implemented to give Afghan women the advantage they need to overcome the deficiencies of the war years. Linkages to other USAID programs such as the Afghanistan Learning for Life (ALCEP) program would also be beneficial.
- *Grey areas* of the project are savings/credit and market linkages. Although this program has only been implemented for the first of the two years planned, FAO states clearly that it has been working with women and poultry since 1999. Hence it is disappointing to note the lack of business training skills or market linkages for the

beneficiaries. It will be interesting to see if the ‘self-sustaining businesses’ manage to become part of the ‘poultry associations’ operating in the big cities at the conclusion of the project, as written in the project documents by the FAO.

- *Women in management roles* None of the senior level national managers at FAO or at the implementing partner levels are female – only the lower level trainers. This does not set good role models for gender equity and advancement.
- *Community development* The trainers provide the link between the rural women who may not have ever left their compounds to the outside world. One of the successes of the poultry project is that individual women have now left their homes to meet in houses that are reachable for all, as a group to learn about poultry production and public hygiene, as well as to discuss ideas. Even women whose families have been in conflict have been brought together.

III. Recommendations

- *Urgent item to improve* To improve and better support the program, the number of chickens, the amount of mixed feed, and support to village groups should be increased. In addition, the cost of the feed to the participants should be decreased if we want healthy chickens that survive to maturity and produce healthy eggs. Increase the number of chicks/pullets distributed.
- *Measurement issue* A more detailed study into the actual income and nutritional value added of poultry production in Afghan women’s lives would justify the evidence base to expand or continue these traditional small-scale poultry production activities. Improve monitoring and evaluation of actual project outcomes such as improved food security and increased household incomes, rather than relying on extrapolation of approximate figures.
- *Business training* Focus on the next value chain linkages, especially marketing, as Afghan eggs are more valued in the local markets than Pakistani eggs, which are considered ‘machine-made’.²² Build the client’s understanding of marketing and pricing relative to demand.
- *Expansion into priority RAMP provinces* FAO is doing a fine job of implementing the poultry project in secure provinces, but since it will not work in the less secure but higher priority provinces such as Helmand, consider allowing other IPs that RAMP is already working with, such as Mercy Corps to implement poultry production by women in those areas. When this was suggested to management, the response was that no one can implement poultry production as well as the FAO, but this is a case of throwing the baby out with the bathwater. There are regions such as Helmand with critical needs for income generation for women that are not radical or threatening to traditional roles, and as such, we need to maximize these opportunities regardless of who the IP implementing the project is. Finally, the communities of Helmand themselves have requested poultry production programs for vulnerable women.
- *Act more strategically:* Build on the increased local value of Afghan eggs and chicken by encouraging the more successful female poultry owners to expand and enlarge their flocks into industrial-type farms, giving them the necessary business training to operate and sell in the national markets. This would not only be a good

²² Altai study on SMEs.

role model for other women with poultry, but it would reduce imports of external eggs and chicken, thus boosting Afghanistan's terms of trade.

- *Gender awareness training* Provide intensive gender awareness training to the Parwan sub-contracting manager, Mr. Saeed Mohammad Sultani of Agency for Building a New Afghanistan (ABNA). In addition, begin grooming and mentoring a female co-manager to work alongside him, as well as at the other IPs.
- *Other externalities* Determine how many of the women have started sending their daughters to school since the inception of this program to gauge the effects of the informal discussion groups on topics such as sanitation, family planning, tailoring, and literacy.

IV. Detailed site visits

1. May 15, 2005 2:00 pm Sunday - Met with Saeed Mohammad Sultani of Agency for Building a New Afghanistan (ABNA), referred by Haroon Nessar, FAO National Poultry Advisor. ABNA manages Parwan poultry program.

- Has 34 women trainers in Kabul and Parwan provinces, with a team leader, supervisor (salaried).
- The trainers also teach 'ibs i seha', or general hygiene
- This gentleman is not a useful individual with archaic management skills, full of himself, condescending and patronizing, insulted the consultant's intelligence several times during the interview on a variety of different topics from the demonstrations down south to how Afghan women should dress.
- Take eggs to market and sell for women, give the profits back to the women
- Information provided was disjointed and disorganized, such as 'Women cannot feed chickens up to full growth. We used to not import any chickens from Iran and Pakistan'.
- Trainers also take English classes four times a week at the office.
- Claims that ABNA has raised and equipped over 3,500 women so far with poultry production skills and materials, but that the women need to increase their own marketing skills.
- The women make up teams with team leaders, and each team works in two districts of the selected province. Each trainer serves 70 or 80 families. Most of these women have worked with FAO from two to three years back, before the RAMP support began – they are veterinarians or have a degree in agriculture or education. Their job is to distribute chicks to women in rural areas, the poorest and the widows – some have disabled husbands; establish women's poultry groups; train in poultry care and diseases; and finally, to facilitate market linkages. They have a set curriculum of 46 lessons, and they carry a kit of vaccines and medicines for the chickens with them at all times. Once a week, the lead trainers receive technical training and discussions.
- Each village has a group leader that treats chickens, vaccinates and facilitates movement of chickens to market. The participants pay the group leader for her services, e.g., vaccinations, simple treatments and marketing – they also sell feed, feeders, drinkers and other supplies. There are 300 village groups in 5 provinces.

- The group leaders use a system of revolving funds where the women are charged 25% of the pullet cost. The women can borrow money from this revolving fund and a small interest rate is applied to buy supplies.

2. May 29-31, 2005 Kabul, FAO Poultry Workshop

Three-day workshop designed to share best practices and lessons learned among the FAO poultry sub-contractors for this project. Representatives of the IPs and female trainers from all active regions, namely, Qunduz, Parwan, Baghlan, Ghazni, and Nangarhar provinces were present. Helmand was meant to be one of these provinces, but due to security restrictions, FAO will not work in Helmand.

It should be noted that at the beginning of this workshop, Mr. Sultani, the afore-mentioned manager of the FAO IP, ABNA, loudly ordered all of the female trainers to sit in the back of the room. This observer felt this command to be degrading and disrespectful, and hence joined the women trainers in the back of the room despite repeated requests to join the ‘more important’ people sitting in the front of the room.

Antonio Rota commenced the meeting by stating clearly that while the Germans were the main donors for the poultry program, others should be recognized, such as the Government of Afghanistan, FAO itself, and USAID. He made an interesting point comparing the projected growth of the world’s population rate, 1.4, versus the projected growth of Afghanistan’s population, 3.3, and questioned how Afghanistan could then feed its people. Poultry production could make a serious contribution towards food security in Afghanistan due to its short production cycle, the good feed conversion rate, and the relatively small investment needed.

Dr. Haroon Nessar, the National Poultry Advisor, made a strong case for improving rural poultry production in Afghanistan. His arguments included the following:

- Over 93% of all poultry in Afghanistan are owned and managed by women
- There is no commercial parent stock breed.
- There are less than 100 semi-commercial farms – defined as having less than 50,000 birds.
- There are only 7 broiler farms in Jalalabad alone.
- Afghanistan imports over 250 million table eggs, and this number is rapidly growing.
- Local brown eggs cost 25-30% more than the white eggs.
- Local eggs cost twice as much as imported eggs.
- Afghanistan imported over 55,000 metric tons of frozen chicken meat last year.
- Per capita egg consumption is 30 eggs/person/year in Afghanistan compared to 100 eggs/person/year in the rest of the world, demonstrating lots of room to grow.

3. June 7, 2005 Tuesday Parwan Province with Dr. Daad Mohd. Amir, Mr. Sultani and Rensje Van Neck

a) In Sabsang Qariya (village) of Qarabagh District we visited the beginning of a program during the 3rd

month of its training phase. The program begins with the lead trainers mobilizing the community: a one month needs assessment and selection of beneficiaries; then two months to

establish women's groups and to organize meetings, select group leaders and begin to establish markets. Then there is up to two years for follow-up from the lead trainers and with medicines and vaccines. After this period, there is permanent contact with group leaders as they are supposed to become self-sustaining businesses. They are then supposed to become part of the poultry associations operating in big cities.

The women all appeared to be answering questions about chicken illnesses' symptoms correctly. The room is small and crowded in the group leader's house, the yard is very, very clean, so obviously hygiene messages are being received and absorbed. The training session is about how to diagnose chicken diseases. For example, the trainer asks, what does it mean if water emanates from the chicken's eyes and mouth? It's Newcastle Disease. What are other symptoms of Newcastle's disease the trainer asks? Participants answer feathers are raised and the bird is weak, with the legs often paralyzed. How does the bird catch this disease? From microbes and dirty water. Women seem to speak up of their own volition. About 16 women/class. The course lasts 3 months, meeting once a week. They have already built the chicken coops themselves based on the lessons from this course, and they are very proud of the coops, but they will not allow me to take their pictures with the coops, allowing their children to pose with the coops instead. So what is the best prevention for the disease? Vaccinations! Once the bird is sick, however, one must bury or burn the bird so that other birds don't catch it.

They learn other topics in the curriculum too, such as:

- Hygiene
- Cleanliness in the kitchen
- Using soap or powder to wash dishes with
- Killing flies

The hygiene training alone is tangibly visible. These women's compounds are impeccably well-swept and clean of any debris or trash, which adds serious value to the poultry program itself, as infectious diseases are the number one killer of children under five years of age in Afghanistan.



These women are also carpet weavers. They sell the carpets to NGOs. The consultant asked women what other problems they face in everyday life:

- No teachers for their children's schools they said, and no salaries for those few teachers that are there.
- Water is only acquired from the qarezes, very dirty and not potable.
- No health clinic but in Qarabagh or Kabul, many miles away, making access difficult if not impossible.
- No fuel for cooking
- No materials to rebuild their homes
- No food.
- **Want more seeds/grain for chicken feed at lower costs**
- **Need business training so they can buy products low and then sell them high.**

b) Saeed Muzaffar village in Ofryan Sharif district in Parwan province (shrine for victims of rabies' bites) – further along in program with chickens already in coops and eggs being laid. Visited widow grandmother in large dusty compound, very dry, a few trees, fig and mulberry. Grandchildren all over the place, she is the group leader, Pariguljan.



Pariguljan has trouble because there is limited water from her well; she cannot plant vegetable gardens or water her fruit trees. Chickens are the only possibility in this environment. She was creative with 20 eggs that hatched from one of the chickens. The chicken itself could not sit on all of them to keep them warm and incubate them, so Pariguljan put half of them under the turkey that she keeps in her yard, which took care of them very well. Afghan ingenuity! We saw some of the hatchlings. One had severe constipation as Dr. Amir diagnosed. The trainers were not able to diagnose this, so the quality of the trainings should be improved.

Pariguljan could not figure out whether or not she made a profit from sales of eggs, vaccines, grain/seed, and other medications because she is numerically illiterate and not able to conceptualize a monthly budget. She knew that she sold the eggs for 4 Afghanis each, the vaccines for 1 Afghani each, the treatment medications or 'advia', for 2 Afghanis each, and the seeds for 10-11 Afghanis per kilogram. The latter three items were sold to the students/beneficiaries of the program, who of course complained that the costs were too high, while the eggs themselves were sold in the market on behalf of all the students/participants.

My own observation of this meeting and discussion was that the trainers need to be better listeners, they tend to be defensive about questions I ask them, volunteering long-winded tangential responses that don't answer my questions at all. If they're like this with the client, it is probably very frustrating for the clients.

Trainers also need business knowledge to pass onto the clients. The women do not seem to know if they benefit or not from having the chickens.



Asked Pariguljan what changes have occurred in her life after the poultry program:

1. Grandchildren eat breakfast with eggs.
2. She can buy rice and oil from profits.
3. She can put tomatoes, potatoes, onions, cilantro, etc. into the 'sitarai' that she makes in the mornings.

She was concerned about our cars and asked one of the trainers when we would be leaving, as the cars would be attracting attention. I thought maybe she was afraid people would talk about the 'foreigners' visiting her. I probed, she was actually worried that if her grandkids damaged the cars, she would be held liable and possibly be taken to the police. Bless her heart, I assured her that that would not happen.

c) Masjid I Safayd – another grandmother named Pariguljan, also a widow, but this time severely deaf, so I had to shout all questions which made it difficult to communicate. She is also a group leader, has a smaller compound and even dustier compound, higher up in mountains, stated that the advantage of the poultry program are that the kids appear to eat better. Also said the seed is too expensive. She had invited all of the women in her program to attend, but only one showed up b/c most of them thought the seed was too expensive and hence boycotted the meeting. She was distressed at this and hoped that we wouldn't blame her for being a poor leader.

What was particularly heartbreaking at this site was that Pariguljan had an adult, able-bodied son living with her who owned a shop down in Charikar, but he refused to help her with household expenses. He was lounging in the sitting room during our visit, and his Harley Davidson motorcycle was parked nearby. Rensje also noticed that they had an antennae for television reception. I later met the son as we were leaving, and as he was saying that his mother worked very hard, he received a phone call on his mobile telephone that interrupted our conversation. Is this really a vulnerable household? This type of a situation raises questions regarding intra-household division of resources that are beyond the scope of this report or RAMP's activities, but that should be considered for future operational research.

This led to an extensive discussion with the trainers in the car over how much respect for mothers has deteriorated in Afghanistan during the war years. They stated that at least this son didn't appear to beat his mother, which is often common among some of their other clients. This type of a situation is becoming more and more common in Afghan households, unfortunately, and has important ramifications for future development work.

4. June 27, 2005 Monday, 2:00 p.m. Qunduz

Meeting with Dr. Erfan Tokhi of FAO poultry program in Qunduz, where the poultry program has been newly started. In Qunduz they engage 50-60 women per village with one village leader to manage the medication distribution, vaccinations, and sale of eggs. The village leader gives all of the profits from her client's eggs back to the clients. The only fees she extracts are from sales of seed, vaccines, and medications. Dr. Tokhi maintains that the poultry program has given authority and independence to the women in the program. He stated that they are now more respected by their children, no longer perceived as needy, and that the funding must continue to keep the program going.

Notably, he pointed out that prior to the poultry program, these household's diets were usually all bread. Now with the eggs and the chickens, a significant factor of protein has been added, although he did not have empirical findings on household consumption to back these statements up. One interesting point he did make on income earnings however, was that usually women make only 10 Afghanis/day for weeding other farmers' plots, and now they make approximately 40 Afghanis/day for selling their eggs. He claimed that women can now pay for their own doctor's bills. Again these statements need to be corroborated by monitoring and evaluation reports.

When asked what the lessons learned from the poultry program's implementation in Qunduz would be, Dr. Tokhi stated:

- Increase the numbers of pullets up to 20 and the amount of seed distributed
- Follow-up with the women is extremely important to ensure that they have learned the disease prevention and hygiene lessons, as well as to ensure that the hens are laying eggs
- There is greater demand for this program from other neighboring villages now that they see the difference it has made in these women's lives, even from the mullahs themselves, who had originally disapproved of the program.
- The poultry feed is too expensive; decrease the cost.



IV. Numbers from monitoring reports

Work Progress				
Activity/Performance Indicators	Performance Targets	Accomplishments		
		Previous	Current Month	Cumulative To-date

Work Progress				
Activity/Performance Indicators	Performance Targets	Accomplishments		
		Previous	Current Month	Cumulative To-date
• Baseline Village Poultry Assessment ²³	23	14	0	14
• No of Chickens distributed	300,000	61,565	35,018	96,583
• No of women trained in poultry management	25,000	13,282	1,399	*14,681
• No. of producer groups established	500	302	94	396
• No. of PG revolving funds established	500	441	0	441
• Vaccination programs implemented (Newcastle) ²⁴	1,000,000	303,601	127,615	431,216
• Feed processing units Est'd ²⁵	5	4	0	4
Project Cost (\$US)	US\$ 3,599,239			²⁶
Intermediate Results				
<i>Eggs/month</i>				
• Ave # produced/recipient	1800	785	160	945
• Ave # sold/recipient	900	345	55	400
<i>Chickens</i>				
• Ave # maintained/ recipient	12	10.0	10.0	10.0
• Ave # lost/recipient	3	1.0	0.0	1.0
• Ave # sold/recipient	7	1	0	1
• Ave additional # purchased/ recipient	6	6	2	8
<i>Inputs/month (\$)</i>				
• Ave feed costs/recipient	2	15.1	1.3	16.4
• Ave vaccination costs/recipient	0.01	0.08	0.00	0.08
Impacts (Estimated)				
• Increased household income (all beneficiaries excluding those not receiving direct inputs)	Total \$ 1,200,000/year @ \$4/month/beneficiary after 5 months of chick distribution	387,170	86,400	473,570
Increased sales of inputs and vaccinations (all beneficiaries excluding those not receiving direct inputs)	\$30,000/year @ \$ 0.1/month/beneficiary	4,037	1,305	5,342

V. Contacts and resources

Mr. Haroon Nessar, National Poultry Advisor, FAO, 070 253 465 haroon.nessar@af.fao.org

* The number 14,681 includes 1704 interested families that have not received any input from project, but attended the training. This came from the beginning of the project as reporting was not systematically arranged and cleared.

²³ Information for a few months of the starting was provided on a village base. Data are given by training cycle and region (Province) after wards.

* Increase of the house hold income covers 6,000 families for egg production, only. This is because the chickens of rest of the families have not started producing eggs, yet. The amount US\$ 471,570 shown here includes the sum of the price of 6,827 culls sold by the whole number of the selected families and the price of about 5,060,000 eggs produced by (4,000 village producers (@ 945 eggs and 2,000 producers @640 eggs). The total egg production of the mentioned number of the families is being estimated about 960,000 during the month (960,000 x Afs.4.5 @ \$50=\$ 86,400). \$ 387,170+\$ 86,400 = \$ 473,570.

²⁴ Most vaccines are produced in Pakistan, but thermo-stable vaccines from Indonesia/Jordan have also been used. The 303,601 birds vaccinated, includes 45,580 indigenous chickens that is extra than the project chickens.

²⁵ Establishing feed processing centers in Kabul, Jalalabad, Baghlan and Kunduz are completed. Establishment of the processing center in Ghazni was postponed as we were going to change the relevant IP.

²⁶ Financial data are reported separately by FAO on a monthly/quarterly basis, as agreed.

Dr. Antonio Rota, Senior Technical Advisor Livestock (FAO), Antonio.rota@fao.org
Dr. Mariam Habib, FAO, 070-288-646, mariam.habib@af.fao.org
Mingu from Qunduz province, Team Leader, 079-435-647
Saeeda Maqsoodi, Supervisor, 070-270-841, saeeda_maqsoodi@yahoo.com
Saeed Mohammad Sultani, Agency for Building a New Afghanistan (ABNA)
Dr. Erfan Tokhi, FAO Qunduz, 070-064-596



**JO 6 Potato Seed Distribution and TA
ICARDA
Program Manager Alemi Alemi**

- I. Objectives
- II. Findings
- III. Recommendations
- IV. Monitoring Reports
- V. Detailed site visits
- VI. Contacts and resources

Objectives ICARDA and its subcontractors shall provide technical guidance in needs assessment, machinery and equipment needs, purchase of start-up inputs, and training for virus-free potato seed production, multiplication, storage and marketing.

Findings

- Although seed multiplication has traditionally been a female activity in Afghanistan, ICARDA has made no efforts to include women in any of its program activities.
- The management team of ICARDA is hostile to the concept of gender inclusion (see email May 17, 2005), preferring to consider Afghan women ‘beneficiaries’ of the ICARDA Potato Seed project as they eat the potatoes.
- None of ICARDA’s subsidized MAAH extension workers are female.

Recommendations

- Conduct closer consultations with the management team to determine if they are open to discussion regarding women’s roles in their projects, particularly in the Aflotoxin laboratory, where it women would be very comfortable working.
- Train women in tissue culture since seed multiplication has been a traditionally female activity, this is the perfect entry point for us.
- Hire female extension workers via the subsidized MAAH program also.
- Involve women in the bagging and tagging of the harvested potatoes.

Monitoring Reports

No female extension workers are recorded as having been hired or trained. Poor performance.

Detailed site visits

May 9, 2005 1:30 pm, Monday. Met with Dr. Samin at RAMP office in Kabul – he delayed and delayed and made me wait a long time, bizarre. He recommended that I speak with Mr. Atayee, the coordinator for ICARDA, 070-236-38? One digit in this telephone number is missing, I told him this, but Dr. Samin rejected the number missing in the telephone #. Communication was bizarre. Referred me to the Karte Parwan directorate, 070-274-365. Gave me irrelevant information that women are working with tomatoes via ACTED (job order dropped

by RAMP). Stated that there is no room for women in the potato project, women should work on chickens.

May 17, 2005 Email communications with ICARDA:

Dear Dr. Wassimi,

Thank you so much for your prompt response. Please do not be alarmed. I did not say that women are not beneficiaries of ICARDA's JO#06 and JO#07. My task and my point are to make recommendations on integrating women *and* men in project design and implementation, not just as passive beneficiaries of the seeds in the long run. I'd be glad to discuss this further with you in person, and I apologize in advance for any miscommunication on my part. CGIAR is one of the most respected institutions in our field, particularly with their emphasis on gender equity, and I have many dear friends at CGIAR headquarters in Washington, D.C., from my years there with the World Bank. We probably know many of the same people.

Thank you very much for including the contact information for your colleagues in the field. I would appreciate it if you could kindly forward my emails to them to alert them of my assignment. I would also appreciate their email addresses. Many thanks in advance.

Best regards,
Homira Nassery

From: N.Wassimi [mailto:n.wassimi@cgiar.org]
Sent: Tuesday, May 17, 2005 11:14 AM
To: Homira Nassery
Cc: Abdul Qahar Samin; Alem Alemi; Kenneth Neils
Subject: Re: Gender in RAMP

Dear Ms. Homira,

As you have stated that at present time women are not directly involved in JO#06 & JO#07. In all our projects women are the direct beneficiaries. With the exception of Noristan, in no other province women are directly in contact with RAMP IPs. The Name of coordinator in Helmand is Mr. Rasouli 079246269. In Kunduz is Mr. Mohaqiq 079210777.

Thank you and best regards

N. Wassimi, Ph.D.
Executive Manager
ICARDA-Afghanistan Program
+9370274365, +9379330540

N.Wassimi@cgiar.org

----- Original Message -----

From: [Homira Nassery](mailto:Homira.Nassery@cgiar.org)
To: n.wassimi@cgiar.org ; a.manan@cgiar.org ; a.moustafa@cgiar.org
Cc: [Abdul Qahar Samin](mailto:Abdul.Qahar.Samin@cgiar.org)
Sent: 17 May 2005 10:09
Subject: Gender in RAMP

Dear ICARDA Colleagues,

I am the new gender specialist at RAMP charged with evaluating the impact of programs on livelihoods of men and woman. As such, I would like to include your projects in my analysis of the job orders. Specifically, I'd like to look at the Potato Seed Distribution and Village Seed Enterprise programs in Kunduz and Helmand. I understand that at present, women are not involved in these projects, but I would like to find entry points for potential participation in the future. Could you please provide me with field

contacts and their telephone numbers in Helmand and Kunduz? It would also be greatly appreciated if you could inform them of my task and mission.

June 27, 2005 3:00 pm Kunduz visit to ICARDA compound

Could not find anyone to talk to, no one was in compound.

JO 23 Agricultural Production, Processing and Marketing Program
Central Asia Development Group (CADG)
Atiqullah Mohibi

- | | |
|------|------------------------|
| I. | Objectives |
| II. | Findings |
| III. | Recommendations |
| IV. | Detailed site visits |
| V. | Monitoring reports |
| VI. | Contacts and resources |

Objectives: CADG will establish demonstration farms, contract growing of selected crops, provide agricultural technical assistance and expertise, processing and marketing, application of technologies to crop development, and implementation of drip irrigation plots.

- One local fruit and nut processing facility developed and expanded.
- Radio programs on improved technologies, as well as on alternatives to opium cultivation
- Sunn pest training for emergency control
- New nurseries for the development of long-term orchards.

Findings

- *Caveat:* The highly lauded CADG raisin factory in Kandahar that has been advertised frequently in USAID publications has some qualifications regarding the employment of women. Apparently, according to Andres Judeh, the cohort of women selected for employment in this factory is unusual in that they are Farsi-speaking women from Kabul. According to Andres, it's a whole different story trying to get Pashtun women to work in those types of factories. This merits further investigation and is not enough to make a sweeping assumption regarding ethnic variables in women's participation.
- *Demonstration farms* are not best suited to introduce Afghan women to innovative agricultural technologies since they are typically located in public spaces near roads, and women's agricultural activities are limited to secluded areas within compounds. This is a serious issue to investigate in terms of women's access to technology and resources in the Afghan context.
- *Reporting issues within RAMP* Once again (as with CRS), the activities that this consultant 'discovered' existed on the monitoring reports, but were simply not noted as gender activities by the monitoring and evaluation team or program managers.
- *Radio programs* It is important that USAID funds and RAMP support not be going to spread harmful messages about women that could be used to further subjugate and oppress women. For this reason, the content and substance of the programming should be consistent and accurate.
- *The school agriculture program* is an excellent initiative, but it is only being targeted at boys' schools. This is an unfortunate miscalculation.

Recommendations

- *Sun-dried tomatoes* Given that one of the main crop lines that CADG is assisting Helmand farmers with are tomatoes and eggplant, it is

recommended that they begin a woman's program in the sun-drying of these vegetables using sanitary techniques and trays like DCW is using in Parwan province. To do this, of course, CADG will need female extension workers. Likewise with the dried apricots program – why can't women be involved in this?

- *Internal awareness of gender within RAMP* must be heightened to actually notice what is happening on the ground.
- *Conduct field assessment* of women's activities in raisin factory in Kandahar to see what's worked and what has not worked.
- *Female extension workers* CADG needs to hire female extension workers to reach out to women in their regions.
- *Radio programs* Include women's voices and agricultural issues affecting women in the radio programs. CADG needs to liaise with the radio programming resources provided to them by this consultant, and RAMP program managers need to follow up to ensure that the messages are accurate and equitable within Afghan culture.
- *The school agriculture program* should also conduct outreach and field visits for girls schools in Helmand province.

Detailed site visits – trip to Kandahar was not possible given the security situation, but raisin factory where CADG has done most innovative work with women in Kandahar.

May 19-21th, 2005 Evacuated from Helmand on due to tragic killings of colleagues

July 5, 2005 Tuesday 3:00 p.m. in Helmand with Atiqullah Mohibi

We met at the CADG office in Helmand with Michael Koch, who began the briefing by informing us that it has been extremely difficult employing women in their factories due to logistical issues, such as their transport and seclusion (men can't come into rooms where women are working). On their demonstration farms, women cannot be included because demonstration farms have to be near roads and public areas. Women typically work in family plots located in more secluded areas in compounds. Michael was very honest about the challenges facing their attempts at including women, which is commendable.

CADG employs no female extension workers. Michael recommended that we meet with INTERSOS to learn about their programs with women and hygiene. However, he did tell us about the agricultural radio programs that CADG is producing to improve farming practices. Within these radio programs which are broadcast in Pashto for an hour every day at 5:30 p.m., a specific topic is covered. Programs are developed from reading material, mostly in English, which is then translated into Pashto. Copies of the programs are sent to Kandahar to be broadcast there also. It is estimated that around 82,000 adult farmers in Helmand and a further 200,000 young boys and men listen to their programs.

They could use some assistance on quality and substance in the programs. I introduced them to groups that already had radio programs in Pashto ready to be

broadcast on important topics for women such as Equal Access, Gender and Media, and the BBC's New Homes New Lives. These are tried and field-tested programs that fully respect Afghan culture, religion and traditions. Some of the programs that Amanullah Barak, their radio manager, has produced are:

1. Women's association broadcast programs
 - i. Causes of women's crimes (**Puhleeze!...ever since Eve.**)
 - ii. Women's difficulties in our country
 - iii. Mother as a good trainer for children
2. Public health programs
 - i. Diarrhea as a serious disease in children in warm weather
 - ii. Family has a great role in children's sanitation
 - iii. Causes of bone's weak growth
 - iv. Information about AIDS disease
3. Drug control programs
 - i. Campaign against drugs, terrorism and weapons must be strongly followed
 - ii. Activities against poppy this year are successful
 - iii. Poppy cultivation is not a political weapon
 - iv. UN agencies try to decrease opium in Afghanistan

Radio is an incredibly powerful tool for reaching Afghan women in remote areas. I asked if they could send me Pashto transcripts of those programs so that I could vet them for content. It is important that USAID funds and RAMP support not be going to spread harmful messages about women that could be used to further subjugate and oppress women.

Monitoring reports - no relevant data to present here aside from radio program list above

Contacts and resources

Michael Koch, CADG Agricultural Program Advisor, 079 250 059
mike@central-asia.net
Amanullah Barak, CADG radio@web-sat.com

Gender Assessment
JO 26 Dried Vegetable Program
Development Works Canada (DWC)
Program Manager: Mr. Mohibi

- I. **Objectives**
- II. **Findings**
- III. **Recommendations**
- IV. **Detailed site visits**
- V. **Numbers from monitoring reports**
- VI. **Contacts and resources**

I. Objectives:

Develop a dried vegetable agribusiness that includes the construction of a factory used for cleaning, dicing and drying machinery, a warehouse, a small test laboratory, a classroom for the research farm and training opportunities, and a 70 meter borehole to provide clean water for washing produce and irrigating the research farm.

II. Findings:

- DWC has met and surpassed its gender objectives as set out at the beginning of the project, as its factory staff is currently 57% female. It is unique in that it had any gender objectives at all.
- By approaching the husbands of the women it employs first, DCW is gaining the trust of the local communities, as well as approaching livelihoods from the household level.
- DWC has excellent monitoring data that disaggregates farmers and producers by gender.
- The employment of female ‘community outreach officer’, or extension worker, has been critical to their success in recruiting vulnerable local women to participate in their programs.
- A seminal finding is that female Afghan farmers do exist and produce and should be included in all service delivery programs in the country from inputs to marketing to associations.
- Without being advised to do so, DWC is already making provisions to ensure that female farmers will be included in the Grower’s Associations for farmers that are being set up in July, 2005. This is a model of good practice for other IPs to follow.
- Including vulnerable women (widows, women with disabled husbands) has been a challenge since most of them do not own land, and hence cannot be part of the dried tomato program, however, DWC adjusted the program to hire those vulnerable women at the factory instead.
- DWC pushed to include women in the facility, and initially there was some reluctance on behalf of more conservative members of the community. In time, however, the community so warmed to the idea that women are involved in all aspects of production, while some are working night-shifts and a few are being

groomed for management positions. Women account for half the factory workforce.

III. Recommendations:

- Other IPs should emulate DWC's gender-disaggregated data gathering and monitoring methods, as well as its persistence and commitment to ensuring gender equity in agribusiness.
- DWC's efforts to include women in all aspects of its programs should be recognized by the respective authorities (USAID, RAMP, MAAH, whomever), and be given a 'good practice' award.
- DWC could further enhance its reputation as a gender-aware employer by instituting quarterly gender awareness seminars for all staff and participating farmers, to keep standards high and to increase the knowledge of local farmers.
- Providing transport for the women to and from the factory is another good practice that should be replicated in other projects.
- One alternative to hiring vulnerable women as only factory workers is to do what the Global Partnership for Afghanistan (GPFA) does, which is to request the local community leaders to provide the landless widows with small plots that they can cultivate for the year. This has worked in the Guldara region of Parwan province, where GPFA works.

III. Detailed site visits

1. First site visit – May 10, 2005 Monday, 10 a.m. with David Frey from GIA, who is turning over their warehouses to RoP – not a whole lot of relevance to DCW, but came along for the ride. Met with Dax Arnold, Rural Markets Specialist of DCW, who explained to us that new seeds are brought in for Afghan farmers which have resulted in a massive difference in quality and quantity of output. General comments: Charikar city wants only Charikar workers hired, which limits the labor pool, as well as the scope of vulnerable persons that can be hired. The factory structure itself was built by the Kabul Construction Company. Sixty percent of it is owned by Dax and company until they decide to sell. They invested US\$1 million investment themselves in this venture.

DWC learned that leaders of the local cooperatives are acting more as brokers, creating a monopoly by setting the prices of produce in Charikar. This unfair price-fixing has and continues to profit the brokers only and effectively reduces equitable income for the farmer. It is clearly not in interest of farmers to work through the existing cooperatives. DCW has a female 'community dvpt worker', which is similar to an extension agent, Ms. Zoubida Shekiba, who was trained as a pharmacist, trying to learn English, but with very little English at present. She is enthusiastic and committed, however.

The factory has bathrooms for all workers, male and female. Men and women work together in a common area with equal wages. Work is conducted in eight hour shifts right now, but employees will be working two 12-hour shifts once crops have been harvested. There might be a problem with women working night shifts, so they came up with solution – they are splitting up duties to have cleaning, packing and sorting during

the daytime hours. Also, the extra light will help with quality control during daytime. The women were offered childcare, but they didn't want it. They use the container that was planned for the children for men's prayers now. Where do women pray? Dax is not sure – hadn't thought of that.

They will have lab to test stuff, coliform counts, and plate counts.

2. Second site visit - May 25, 2005, Wednesday, 10 a.m. DWC Office with Erica Gilmour, Program Officer, Zubeida Shekiba, Bilquese Miakhel from GPFA, Aisha Khushi, Deeba Sadat, the latter being younger girls and admin/translators. GPFA was invited along for the visit since I had heard they had female extension agents from another field trip with RoP – the local *male* Afghan extension agents gave me their contact info. My goal was to learn how other organizations *were* able to employ female extension agents, while RoP maintained that it was impossible.

An interesting distinction between the two organizations, DCW and GPFA is that when it's time to pass out the contracts for the sun-dried tomatoes, Erica must talk to the men of the village first, they use the men as intermediaries, whereas GPFA works directly with women who are widows or have disabled husbands. Erica says there's more accomplished if you talk to the husbands also as it is approaching livelihoods on a household level, and GPFA must also go through the village maliks to identify the vulnerable women.

Erica is doing her master's thesis on women in agriculture. I asked her if she had any insights for RAMP's work with women in agriculture:

- Start with traditional tasks such as dairy processing, livestock management, sun-drying.
- Have women extension workers
- Empower women to make decisions on selling and marketing.
- Engage widows who don't have access to extension agents via their nephews or other males that they often rely on.
- Men are not involved in tomato drying, women are. It's a 2 step process, men plant the tomatoes and women process them.
- If they choose not to dry the tomatoes, they will sell them fresh, and then only the men are involved. Whatever is left over at the end of the season is dried.
- Regarding having women work in the factory, they have to talk to the Khan of the Qariya.
- Women need to have transport from home to the factory or workplace.

3. Third site visit - June 22, 2005, Wednesday, 10:00 am - Revisited factory to meet with female farmers who grow tomatoes for dehydration later in the autumn. Went to visit women's tomato fields with Anjeer Shir Agha, the new (male) Field Officer, and Zubeida Shekiba, the Community Officer from my previous visits.

They have selected 400 women to train, equip with tomato seeds, fertilizer, drying racks, and other tools for obtaining the final product – high quality sun-dried tomatoes. To date

they have signed 197 contracts with women to sun dry tomatoes in their homes and have distributed fertilizer and seed. During the remainder of the year, DCW expects to exceed their goal of 400 participating female farmers. Additional women have been identified to participate in the program and will be signing contracts with them through July.

In addition, they have adjusted their outreach/extension procedure to better target the most impoverished. As the most vulnerable women (widows, women with disabled husbands) often do not own land on which to grow tomatoes, they will purchase some fresh tomatoes and hire widows from the area to sun-dry them at the factory. This will allow them to provide employment to additional women who are most in need of added income, as well as providing a place to train the rest of the women participating in the sun-dried tomato project.

The program includes training for the participants and the distribution of drying trays and salt. The outreach officer will travel to each village to train the participants and will have an additional program at the factory, allowing one or two representatives from each village to receive additional training which they will then share with their community members. Training will be held as close to the time of tomato harvest as possible to ensure that the information is retained.

In working with female farmers, Zubeida reiterated what Erica had told me, that it is first necessary to ask permission from the husbands of the women to allow them to tend their own plots for prospective sale of the harvest. However, up until now, they have received 100% compliance from the husbands who have been asked. Zubeida makes site visits to the field every day and submits reports to the local DWC office, which then passes them onto the Kabul office.

1. First visit – Dashtiofion – we meet Sabera, who has 5 kids, she used to dry her tomatoes in the past as well, but using traditional methods that were not as sanitary or efficient, on the roof usually. Now DWC will bring her 20 drying trays that are made of mesh, which allows the tomatoes to dry from both sides with screens to prevent flies and other germ-carrying insects to land on them. In addition to providing the trays, DWC also provides the initial tomato seeds for the female farmers, along with training on how to wash the trays. The irrigation used is from the local canals. In one field, we noticed there was a huge stalk of corn growing in the middle of the tomatoes. When I questioned this planting practice, since it's not really efficient in terms of horticultural spacing, Sabera told me that her little boy likes to plant things in odd places.
2. The next woman we visited, Nasreen, was truly inspiring, as her husband, Abdul Hanan, was in the field working with her. He was very proud of her accomplishments, and two of their five children were with them. This husband fully supports his wife's income-generating activities, and the obvious affection between the couple was touching to see, particularly in the context of what we normally see in Afghanistan.

The women do have some market knowledge of the pricing of dried tomatoes since this is not a new practice for the Parwan region, however, DWC is providing additional training on packaging and marketing of the final product. Dried tomatoes cost more than fresh tomatoes, at approximately 90 cents/kg.

The project builds on initial contacts made with the local community as the factory workers were introduced by Zubeida from the crate-making workshop, which was a fixed-term project providing skills-building and income generation for local women that ended in the spring. At peak operation, it operated 24 hours daily, six days a week and employed 90 staff (35 women). Many of these employees were re-hired at the factory, and some (including women) were selected for management posts. The crates themselves are currently being used at the factory for storage of the vegetables. This is a perfect example of using local resources and local labor to add value to the final product.

The gender impact from the June 2005 DWC report is outstanding as it states that, ‘with 47 women working in line and management positions, **females account for 57% of the factory workforce**. A significant, if unexpected achievement’. In addition to the inclusion of women in the factory work and the tomato drying program, it is fascinating to see that DWC also has women farmers participating in its mainstream agricultural outreach program, which is not a gender-targeted program. This proves that the common fallacy stated by other IPs (e.g., RoP) has been disproven. Female Afghan do farmers exist and produce and should be included in all service delivery programs in the country from agricultural inputs to marketing to associations. Without being advised to do so, DWC is already making provisions to ensure that female farmers will be included in the Grower’s Associations for farmers that are being set up in July, 2005.

V. Numbers from monitoring reports

The table below details the progress of the Sun Dried Tomato Project to date:

No.	Village	Total Farmers	Total Women	Total Widows	Total Workers	Total Jeribs	Total Seeds	Total Fertilizer (KG)
1	Aktachi	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Boba Khail	6	6	2	19	4.25	0	250
3	Chaikal	8	8	0	0	6	0	300
4	Dashtofian	49	49	3	200	36	0.31	2,575
5	Dalat Shahi	11	11	2	61	19	0	1,050
6	Demiskin	21	21	1	28	20	0	1,025
7	Haji Khil	2	2	0	7	2	0	100
8	Kakara Laghmani	7	7	0	44	5.5	0	275
9	Khowja Siaran	15	15	0	0	9.75	0.68	775
10	Mian Shakh	27	27	0	0	24.25	0	1,225
11	Pashan	2	2	1	8	1	0	100
12	Pul Matak	14	13	0	47	21.5	0	1,075
13	Sadullah	8	8	0	0	8.5	0	525
14	Said Kheil	3	3	0	0	3	0	150
15	Shabaz Khail	7	7	2	19	7.5	0	375
16	Shamarad Khail	3	3	0	9	5	0	250
17	Totomdara Aolia	9	9	0	12	4.25	0	275
18	Zarbiya	5	5	0	23	7	0	350
	Totals	197	196	11	477	184.5	0.99	10,675

The table below details agricultural outreaches in general to all farmers, where women are also included as farmers, only a few, but still, treated on an equal basis:

	Village	Total Farmers	Total Workers	Total Women	Total Jeribs	Total Seeds (KG)	Total Fertilizer (KG)
1	Aktachi	15	60	0	21	20	1,450
2	Baba Khil	12	56	0	10	117	550
3	Chaikale	1	0	0	37	3	0
4	Dashtofian	48	243	0	33	255	2,050
5	Daulana	11	80	0	10	42	1,000
6	Dault Shahi	12	55	0	10	107	625
7	Demiskin	1	2	0	2	0	100
8	Jabul Saraj	63	430	2	67	694	3,375
9	Khowja Siaran	1	5	0	1	6	50
10	Mian Shakh	12	113	0	14	17	1,200
11	Pashan	4	15	0	3	0	0
12	Pul Matak	7	50	1	9	112	450
13	Qalainaw Laghmani	9	23	0	7	30	475
14	Qalai Bagi	17	9	0	11	7	700
15	Rabat	2	0	0	71	280	50
16	Said Kheil	20	78	0	21	178	1,225
17	Sadaqat	7	32	0	7	71	350
18	Sadullah	6	16	1	11	11	400
19	Sofian Laghmani	2	3	0	2	6	150
20	Togh Berdi	6	12	0	9	26	450
21	Totomdara Aolia	17	74	1	27	70	1,000
22	Zarbiya	2	17	0	3	31	100
	Totals	273	1,356	5	379	2,051	15,650

VI. Contacts and resources

Dax Arnold, Rural Markets Specialist, Development Works,

Arnold@developmentworks.cc, 070-214-540

Erica Gilmour, Program Officer, Development Works,

ericagilmour@developmentworks.cc, 079-148-055

Zoubida Shekiba, Community Outreach Officer, DWC, 079-429-281

Anjeer Shir Agha, new Field Officer, DWC, 079-230-468

Aisha Khushi, Admin Assistant, Aisha_khushi@yahoo.com,

afghan_citygirl@hotmail.com 079-128-009

Deeba Sadat, Translator, 079-170-723

Naquibullah Azimi, GIA 079-132-155

Bilquese Miakhel, Global Partnership for Afghanistan (GPFA), 079-040-661

JO 24 Agri-Input Dealer Training and Development Project
International Fertilizer Development Corporation (IFDC)
Program Manager Nazari

Objectives IFDC will

- train 2,000 agro-input dealers
- improve market transparency through analysis and dissemination of market information
- develop business linkages between Afghan and regional suppliers of agri-inputs
- establish 5 private sector associations of agri-input dealers

Findings:

- To their credit, IFDC management was open to consulting with us on entry points for Afghan women farmers to engage in fertilizer associations once we approached them.
- Afghan women farmers are not being targeted for the IFDC credit lines
- IFDC management is open to cooperation and learning in working on gender issues in its product lines, however there was not enough time during this consultancy to work with them further on this task.

Recommendations

- Include women farmers in the agro-input trainings – even if they are not dealers, they will benefit from the knowledge and could become dealers.
 - Integrate promising women farmers into the existing male dealer groups
 - Evaluate the training materials for gender content, recommend additions and methods of outreach to female farmers so that they can benefit from this agro-input as well as the male farmers
1. Get copy of latest dealer baseline survey.
 2. Did the 2005 calendar include images of women as integral parts of agricultural production in Afghanistan?

Got to have women involved at this level, especially as brokers create monopolies – see the Dried Vegetable Program, price-fixing.

Gender Assessment
JO 28 Grain Post-Harvest Training, Storage, and Milling in Afghanistan
Grain Industry Alliance (GIA)
Program Manager Alemi Alemi

- I. Objectives
- II. Findings
- III. Recommendations
- IV. Detailed site visit
- V. Monitoring Report
- VI. Contacts and Resources

Objectives: GIA will

- Provide training opportunities and demonstration sites for cleaning, storage and handling of grain
- Develop 25 community level storage sites
- 25 full-scale farm demonstration units
- 25 small farm demonstration units

Findings

- The collaboration in Kunduz with the private sector miller and WFP's micronutrient fortification program is really exciting and could have broad-reaching effects for Afghan women and children's health outcomes. This is an unexpected positive externality.
- There are no women involved in GIA's efforts or program.
- GIA could use female expatriate staff on the ground in Afghanistan.
- Gender awareness was mild to moderate. Concerns expressed did not exactly reflect reality of Afghan women's realities.
- Plans to build women's bathrooms in the storehouses and the training facility were sabotaged by the contractor.

Recommendations

- Further disseminate information about the partnership in Kunduz and try to replicate it in other geographic areas of Afghanistan where GIA is working.
- Find out why the contractor did not build the female bathrooms as planned and fine him for that omission to ensure this does not happen again in the future.
- Train women to run tests at the Aflatoxin test laboratory and perform other functions related to quality assurance of the grain.
- Train and hire women in running the administrative tasks at the grain storage sites.

Detailed site visit

May 5, 2005 10:00 a.m. GIA in Parwan province

Traveled to Parwan province David Frey of GIA to visit the grain storage facilities and training center that they have build. He was very upset that GIA had specifically planned for female bathrooms, but the local contractor had cut them out of the design – this has serious implications for women workers and access of women to training opportunities. This is a valid concern and should be investigated via the contract trail. This is not the only location for this omission to happen, and clearly it saves the contractor money to not have to build the female bathrooms.

June 27, 2005 Monday 1:00 pm GIA Office Kunduz met with Scott Kice

Haji Ghulam Mohaiuddin paid for the flour mill with his own money, which will have the capacity to mill over 20% of the grain grown in Kunduz. GIA has built warehouses in six districts for the storage of this flour.

Micronutrient malnutrition is a very serious mental and physical problem for people in Afghanistan that undermines national productivity. GIA and Haji-sahib are working with WFP to donate pre-mixed flour so that the flour produced will be fortified with essential micronutrients such as Niacin and Iron that many women and children in Afghanistan lack. Imported flour from Tajikistan and Pakistan is not micronutrient fortified. The primary beneficiaries of this fortified bread will be pregnant women and children under the age of five. This flour will be sold to the local bread makers.

One of WFP's main programs for 2006-2008 will be pushing for mandatory fortification of flour for domestic consumption. They are willing to supply the inputs for fortification to anyone, as well as to include the basic information, education, and communication outreach to increase consumer demand for fortified flour. This is a great deal.

Contacts and resources

David Frey, GIA Consultant, 079-848-379 david_frey990@hotmail.com
Scott Kice, GIA Project Manager, Kunduz 079-848-106, scottkice@hotmail.com
Jamshid Zewari, jamshid.zewari@wfp.org,

JO 32 Green Kabul Program
UNOPS
Program Manager Alemi Alemi

Objective UNOPS will

- Procure and distribute approximately 1 million trees throughout Kabul including:
- Planting fruit and forestry trees in various public locations throughout Kabul, including schools, government buildings, parks, roadsides, and the Kabul Green Belt.
- Organize Green Week activities, including public events, children's activities, receptions, entertainment, and education
- Coordinating an ongoing public information campaign to raise public awareness of environmental issues in Afghanistan.

Findings

- The Women's Conservation Corps is a component of the Afghan Conservation Corps. Located in the center of Kabul, the site of the pilot project is a 400-bed hospital facility. They actually did include destitute women, as planters of trees around the 400 bed hospital at least.
- The rehabilitation of the grounds included landscaping, maintenance of a vegetable garden; rehabilitating the orchard, naturally wooded areas, children's playground, flower nursery and gardens; and creating a waste separation and composting area. They also cleaned up garbage, repaired an existing irrigation system, planted trees and helped build a small greenhouse.
- The Kabul Green Week activities included the WCC in plans to establish private home nurseries for women as an ongoing income-generation project. Fruit seedlings and training are available to interested women with access to small plots, in targeted vulnerable locations or circumstances. They will engage in ongoing informal skills workshops, and participate in casual work forces involved in conservation work (collecting seed, landscaping, planting) as additional income opportunity.
- Later in the year, ACC will expand it's Women's Conservation Corps to develop the capacity for private home nurseries that would serve as an income source for vulnerable women. Fruit seedlings procured from local markets and from ACC's current nursery stock will supply these women with initial investment and training. DID THIS HAPPEN? Show me where, let's visit.

Recommendations

- It was difficult to assess this program because there is no one currently in charge of it on the UNOPS side.
- Further site visits should be conducted to assess how sustainable the WCC is one year after its founding.

**JO 39 Rural Financial Services
ACAP (Afghan Renewal Fund)
Program Manager Fran Toomey**

Objective: ACAP will

- Fund will create a finance delivery mechanism to fulfill the unmet financing needs of SMEs
- Total capitalization will be close to \$20 million initially, and could grow to \$30 million
- Will generate market-based returns for investors by contributing to the regeneration of the private sector.

Finding:

- The Fund has yet to close because the ADB has not paid its share yet. Hence there is about US\$20 million sitting there that could be used to jump-start medium sized businesses for women. This is a shame.
- The management of the Fund is strictly Olde World British establishment and gender was not a welcome topic.

Recommendations:

- Institute a quota for women-owned businesses that they have to fund
- Provide equity for women-owned agribusinesses
- Rewrite their mission statement and proposal to integrate gender.
- Conduct strategic outreach to ensure that Afghan women investors know about this Fund.

**JO 40 Rural Financial Services
Afghanistan International Bank (AIB)
Program Manager Fran Toomey**

Objectives AIB will

- Extend medium and large-sized loans in the range of US\$50,000 to \$500,000 to entrepreneurs, enterprises, and value-added processors along the agricultural value chain.

Findings

- No mention of gender or women in proposal.
- No time to conduct site visit or meet with principals.
- Finance team not helpful in giving me contacts to meet with this client.

Recommendations

- Target loans for women-owned agribusinesses
- Figure out a way to register women's collateral. Get information from courts on how to expedite this.
- Fast-track loan system for women clients.
- Retain a lawyer with specific expertise in female client's needs.

**JO 42 Rural Financial Services
Afghan Financial Services (AFC)
Program Manager Fran Toomey**

Objectives AIB will

- Extend medium and large-sized loans in the range of US\$50,000 to \$500,000 to entrepreneurs, enterprises, and value-added processors along the agricultural value chain.

Findings

- No mention of gender or women in proposal.
- Chief financial officer very responsive and willing to consider gender awareness campaign as well as increase women managers, but environment is a constraint he said.
- Very difficult to get information from Rural Finance team in RAMP on follow-up and activities with AFC. Requested copy of Market Profile Surveys (from p. 4 of Deloitte concept paper) – sent email to Shakir – especially identify the sub-sectors, business leaders, risks, etc. No response.
- p. 5 of concept paper says that FSF will establish systems to gather monitoring information that will be required by USAID/RAMP including.....what types of businesses for which regions, what about *gender*?

Recommendations

- Provide loans for women-owned agribusinesses
- Figure out a way to register women's collateral. Get information from courts on how to expedite this.
- Retain a lawyer with specific expertise in female client's needs.
- Fast-track loan system for women clients.
- Under Resources on p. 6, no women in cadre of experts !!!!

Annex A

Simple Gender Checklist²⁷

Applies to all RAMP Projects

Are there any women involved in this project?
How are they involved?
Do they get to make decisions regarding resources?
Are they included in training programs?
Do they gain any income from project activities?

²⁷ Per Tim Prewitt's request for Mumtaz to have at all times.

Annex B

“Getting Staffing Right”

RAMP Human Resources Gender Questionnaire For Prospective Hires

I. Background The short-listing and selection process is where personal, unconscious prejudices emerge, and is key to achieving our desired gender-sensitive culture. Common biases include a predisposition to recruiting men to management, finance, or information technology (IT) posts, or those involving a lot of travel; and to recruiting women to administrative support, health promotion and gender posts. More serious, are assumptions that a working mother, particularly with small children, is unsuitable for a management post or one involving significant travel or interaction with men.

Specifically, for **all** staff qualification criteria, USAID ADS²⁸ includes:

- Key personnel with demonstrated sectoral and gender analysis skills
- Position descriptions that require gender expertise, especially for leadership positions

II. How we can do it

1. The advertisement: To start with, how and where we advertise the job openings are critical to ensuring gender equity in the final recruitment. Some questions to do this right:

- Which people does this advertisement reach?
- How are the qualifications presented?
- Do they inadvertently exclude either gender? To avoid this, specify that knowledge and previous experience of gender issues is part of the job requirement.
- What kind of an image are we projecting via this recruitment advertisement? Do we specifically say, “Women are encouraged to apply” – necessary and a good practice in the Afghan context.
- Is one sex being favored above another? For example, logistics has traditionally been a man’s job; if recruiting managers fail to think beyond this stereotype, women may be discriminated against subconsciously.
- Are the recruiting managers normally of one sex, and could it be that like selects like?

2. The interview panel: To minimize the risk of personal biases when selecting an interview panel, ensure that you have the following:

- a) A gender-balanced panel, i.e., equal numbers of men and women on the panel.
- b) Panel members who demonstrate gender awareness. This can be gauged by their reactions and responses to the questions below.

3. The interview questions: No questions regarding marital status, children, nationality, religion, or other personal issues can be asked. *Open-ended, general* questions

assessing gender knowledge is asked, and depending on the answers, contribute to successful selection of the gender-sensitive applicant:

²⁸ As part of the USAID family, RAMP is charged with following the Automated Directive System (ADS) Guidelines of USAID, which includes gender equity in hiring and promotions of USAID project staff.

- a) Who works harder, men or women, and can you tell me why/how?
- b) Who has access to which resources in Afghanistan (finance, land, legal, health)?
- c) What role do women play in decision-making about resource use?
- d) Who carries out what tasks?
- e) What would happen if women started doing jobs that are traditionally meant for men?
- f) What is getting better for women/men?
- g) What is getting worse for women/men?
- h) Who has the most time to make wise decisions?
- i) What is the future like for Afghan women?
- j) Can we integrate gender into our projects? If so, how? If not, why not?
- k) Have you ever had a woman boss, and if so, was it a successful relationship?
- l) Do men have the right to beat their wives? If so, what is this right based on?
- m) What jobs are women not capable of doing? Why not?

III. The outcomes With the understanding that RAMP is a fixed-term project that will end in June 2006, the results of these interviews could provide valuable data for gender analysis in the future.

It is anticipated that 'right' or 'correct' answers to these questions do not need to be provided, as the senior managers of RAMP are already sensitized to gender issues in Afghanistan.

Annex C

Bibliography

Grace, Jo, Gender Roles in Agriculture: Case of five villages in northern Afghanistan, Afghanistan Research and Evaluation Unit (AREU), Case Study Series, March 2004.

Decision Memorandum, November 18, 2004, Subject: Job Order no. 46- Supporting Alternative Livelihood Activities and Assistance Mobilization (SALAAM) in Helmand province under RAMP CLIN 002.

Country Gender Assessment, The World Bank, 2005.

Afghanistan: Survey of the Horticulture Sector, FAO, 2003.

Kandiyoti (2004, p. 12) describes this situation for Panjshir while Afghanistan report similarly from Badakhshan.

Klinnert, 1997a, 1997b and Azerbaijani-Moghaddam, 1998

NRVA Female Shura and Wealth Group Data: Preliminary Analyses, Thomas M. Nephew, March 9, 2004,

Rethinking Rural Livelihoods in Afghanistan, Jo Grace and Adam Pain, AREU Synthesis Paper Series, June 2004.

AREU Case Studies Series: Alice Kerr-Wilson and Adam Pain, 2003; UNDCP Strategic Studies # 4 & #6; David Mansfield, 2001; Wilding, John and Azerbaijani-Moghaddam, S., 2002; Strategic Monitoring Unit, 2001; Christoph Klinnert (ed.), 1997a; Christoph Klinnert (ed), 1997b; Azerbaijani-Moghaddam, S. (ed), n.d. (probably 1998); Jo Grace, 2004

Personal notes of Zulaikha Aziz from 2004 Gender Mission

RAMP Impact Assessment of Assistance to the Livestock Sub-sector Program in Afghanistan, May 2005

“Afghanistan’s women – the hidden strength of a war-torn land”, FAO
<http://www.fao.org/News/2002/020105-e.htm>.

Aziz, Zainab, and Jost, Christine, DVM, MA, Tufts University School of Veterinary Medicine International Program, “Men, Women, Children, and Livestock: A Livelihoods Analysis of the Afghan Registan Kuchi Focused on Gender and Animal Health”.

Market Sector Assessment - Small and Medium Enterprises (for UNDP): Altai Consulting

Altai Consulting Micro-Finance for the Agricultural Sector Report, September 2004. p.15/18.

Annex D

TORs Distilled²⁹

1. Suggest opportunities for development of new job orders.
2. Conduct an abbreviated portfolio review to provide further insight into the roles, rights, and responsibilities of women and men on RAMP-supported activities.
 - a) conduct site visits to measure impact of specific/select RAMP activities on the livelihoods of rural women
 - b) recommend modifications to IP activities, and subsequent amendment to contracts and/or reporting requirements
3. Select 15 most successful job orders in dealing with gender issues to review in depth and visit sites.
4. At least 3 JOs will be revised to lead to an increased impact on rural women's livelihoods.
5. Identify at least one market-driven opportunity to impact women.
6. Suggest a preliminary design for this new opportunity in line with increasing marketable output of agricultural products in infrastructure, market development, rural finance, or agricultural technology.
7. Identify lessons learned and best practices for working with women.
8. Complete at least one communications brief during the short-term assignment.
9. Coordinate with other stakeholders, as usual.
10. Administrative deliverables:
 - a) report of the 15 site visits/JOs
 - b) recommendations to amend or revise 3 JOs
 - c) 1 communications brief
 - d) identify and design 1 market-driven opportunity
 - e) end-of-tour report – draft no later than 5 days before end of contract – final no later than 2 days

²⁹ Only have a hard copy of the original RAMP terms of reference – management should have electronic copy if necessary.