

**Curbing Sex
Slavery Abroad by
Helping Women
Earn a Living in
Ukraine:**

***Assessment of the
Economic-
Empowerment
Aspects of the Anti-
Trafficking Project,
USAID/Kiev***

A project funded by the Office of Women in Development, Bureau for Global Programs, Field Support and Research, U.S. Agency for International Development, under contract number FAO-0100-C-00-6005-00 with Development Alternatives, Inc.

September 2002



1717 Massachusetts Ave. NW, Suite 302, Washington, DC 20036 USA
Tel.: 202-332-2853 FAX: 202-332-8257 Internet: WIDinfo@widtech.org

A Women in Development Technical Assistance Project

Development Alternatives, Inc. " International Center for Research on Women
Academy for Educational Development " Development Associates, Inc.

This publication was made possible through support provided by the Office of Women in Development, Bureau for Global Programs, Field Support and Research, U.S. Agency for International Development, under the terms of contract number FAO-0100-C-00-6005-00. The opinions expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the U.S. Agency for International Development.

Curbing Sex Slavery Abroad by Helping Women Earn a Living in Ukraine:

Assessment of the Economic Empowerment Aspects of the
Anti-Trafficking Project, USAID/Kiev

by

Rae Lesser Blumberg
Olha Shved

Development Alternatives, Inc.

September 2002



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors wish to thank all the people who contributed to this report, including not only the 125 people with whom we spoke individually or in focus groups, but also the many people in the USAID/Kiev Mission who provided everything from encouragement to logistical advice and support.

Among USAID/Kiev staff, we especially would like to thank Tetyana Tymoshenko, our COTR, who oversees the Anti-Trafficking Project, and Christopher Edwards, the director of the program office, for all their efforts to make our assessment a success. Their insight and support were invaluable. Additional thanks are due to Tatiana Rastrigina, who oversees the Women's Economic Empowerment Project. She provided valuable briefings and accompanied us to Chernigiv, our first field visit. Moreover, we would like to express our appreciation to Basharat Ali, senior project development officer, who accompanied us to Lviv and shared many useful ideas. We want to give particular thanks to Tamara Palyvoda and Lydia Novinskaya, who graciously and cheerfully went out of their way to help us in every possible manner. Pamela Mandel, the acting director of the Office of Health and Social Transition, contributed valuable suggestions, as did Borys Uspensky, also of that office. Indeed, we extend our appreciation and thanks to every person from USAID named in our list of contacts (see Annex A)—we could not have produced this report without your help.

Among all those associated with the Winrock International Anti-Trafficking Project and Women's Economic Empowerment Project with whom we met, we would like to express our gratitude to Grace Kennan Warnecke, the country director as well as the chief of party for the Women's Economic Empowerment Project, and Amy Heyden, director of trafficking prevention programs. We also want to warmly thank Winrock's Halyna Vdovychenko, economic development coordinator of the Women's Economic Empowerment Project, who accompanied us to the field in Donetsk. Special appreciation is due to the three center directors who facilitated our field visits to Donetsk, Lviv, and Chernigiv, respectively: Ljudmila Gorova, the director of both the women's business support center and the women for women center in Donetsk (she is also president of the league of business and professional women in that city); Luba Maksimovych, director of the women for women center in Lviv; and Irina Dorozhkina, director of the women's business support center in Chernigiv. Their enthusiastic support made all our fieldwork fun as well as informative.

ACRONYMS

AED	Academy for Educational Development
AIHA	American International Health Alliance
ATP	Anti-Trafficking Project
CURE	Center for Ukrainian Reform Education
DG	democracy and governance
GDP	gross domestic product
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MP	member of Parliament
MSI	Management Systems International
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NIS	New Independent States
PRA	participatory rural appraisal
RAPs	rapid assessment procedures
RRA	rapid rural appraisal
SOW	scope of work
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
WBSC	women's business support center
WEE	women's economic empowerment
WID	women in development
WNIS	Western New Independent States

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	vii
CHAPTER ONE	
INTRODUCTION	1
THE ECONOMIC AND GENDER CONTEXT OF TRAFFICKING OF UKRAINIAN WOMEN	1
THE OBJECTIVES OF THE ASSESSMENT.....	6
THE METHODOLOGY AND THE FIELDWORK.....	7
CHAPTER TWO	
FINDINGS FROM FIELDWORK IN FIVE CITIES	11
OVERVIEW.....	11
DONETSK—THE “TWO FOR ONE” MODEL	16
LVIV—FIGHTING TRAFFICKING IN A DEPRESSED REGION	19
CHERNIGIV—PROMOTING ENTREPRENEURSHIP PRIOR TO ECONOMIC RECOVERY	22
ODESSA—THE PROGRAMMING GAP	24
KIEV—THE MAJOR ORGANIZATIONAL PLAYERS	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
ANALYSIS OF THE PRESENT ATP’S STRENGTHS, WEAKNESSES, AND IMPACT.....	28
CHAPTER THREE	
LESSONS LEARNED, MODELS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS	31
LESSONS LEARNED	31
A SUGGESTED MODEL FOR FOLLOW-ON PROGRAMMING AND TWO ALTERNATIVES	36
RECOMMENDATIONS	45
BIBLIOGRAPHY	51

ANNEX A: LIST OF PERSONS AND ORGANIZATIONS CONTACTED, BY CITY	A-1
ANNEX B: STATEMENT OF WORK, ANTI-TRAFFICKING INITIATIVE—UKRAINE	B-1
ANNEX C: RAPID APPRAISAL METHODOLOGIES	C-1
ANNEX D: ANTI-TRAFFICKING PROGRAMS IN UKRAINE (DRAFT)	D-1

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Overview. Among the key findings of this assessment, which focused principally on the economic aspects of the USAID/Kiev-funded Anti-Trafficking Project (ATP), are the following:

- ? The strongest factor pushing Ukrainian women to seek employment abroad, thus exposing themselves to the risk of being trafficked into sex slavery, is not being able to make a living in their own country;
- ? Therefore, the mission strategy, which combats trafficking by promoting more economic opportunities for women within Ukraine, is the best and most direct approach;
- ? Furthermore, because no other donor has adopted this economic-empowerment strategy, USAID/Kiev now has a comparative advantage in the field;
- ? The empirical findings of this assessment show that not only the ATP but also its sister project, Women's Economic Empowerment (WEE), both implemented by Winrock International, have provided highly popular, free, economic training that has helped many women earn a livelihood; and
- ? In the present research, none of the women interviewees whose ATP or WEE training led them to a job or their own business even mentioned the possibility of seeking work abroad.

Consequently, the authors' chief recommendations for the follow-on ATP are to (a) emphasize economic opportunities even more strongly in follow-on programming; (b) keep the same women for women centers as in the executing entity; (c) correct several troubling weaknesses in the present ATP, especially its inadequate monitoring and evaluation system; (d) promote even closer integration and synergy with the WEE project; and (e) resources permitting, expand to a regional approach that would extend activities to Odessa and Moldova.

Methodology. The assessment used a rapid appraisal methodology that involved interviews, focus groups, and group meetings with 125 people (87.2 percent women, 12.8 percent men). Between July 11 and August 1, 2002, field research was carried out in five cities—Kiev, Chernigiv, Lviv, Donetsk, and Odessa—and in all but Kiev and Odessa the research focused on the activities of the two projects being executed by Winrock International: the ATP, the primary focus of the study, and the WEE project.

Findings. The fieldwork uncovered great demand for economically focused courses that are perceived as leading to earning a living. At the ATP-supported women for women centers in Lviv and Donetsk, the free computer courses had waiting lists of about a thousand names. In both centers, women wait for months to get into a course that involves only 8 to 10 hours of instruction stretched over two to four weeks, where they may share a computer with one or

two other classmates and are not given any additional time to practice. That they do so indicates how great women's need for economic alternatives to looking for work abroad continues to be.

Similarly, at the WEE project's women's business support centers (WBSCs) in Donetsk and Chernigiv, the fieldwork showed that their "flagship" economic training, an intensive entrepreneurship course that involves a minimum of nine weeks of full-time instruction, has more demand than the project can meet. (Selection to the free training is competitive, based on one's business idea.)

The research showed that although gross domestic product increased in 2000 after having fallen 65 percent between 1989 and 1999, women still have a hard time finding employment. Moreover, all eight focus groups in Donetsk, Lviv, and Chernigiv vividly described age as well as gender discrimination as further obstacles. These findings further support the conclusion that USAID/Kiev has chosen the right strategy for its anti-trafficking efforts: attacking the lack of economic possibilities in Ukraine, which acts as the most powerful "push factor" driving women into the arms of traffickers.

In terms of strengths, the assessment revealed that the high demand for courses suggests clients' awareness of the economic payoffs of the trainings. The researchers also found strong staff and appreciative clients in all centers studied: the women for women centers in Lviv and Donetsk and the WBSCs in Donetsk and Chernigiv.

Among the areas of concern, the researchers found the weakness of the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system to be the most consequential: project results and impact cannot be accurately assessed. For example, in the ATP's M&E system, various kinds of training courses are lumped together so that there is no way of ascertaining which courses are the most successful in generating employment. Nor does the ATP's M&E system include feasibility or market studies that permit courses to be tailored to local demand. In addition, resources are stretched very thin, with insufficient space and too few computers. In part, this is because the women for women centers spread funds across not only their basic two-day job-skills/anti-trafficking-awareness course and such economically oriented training courses as computers and accounting, but also across a variety of domestic-violence/crisis-intervention activities.

Although the M&E system does not adequately measure project impact, available monitoring indicators show that 3,363 (13 percent) of the 25,000 women who have taken the ATP's basic two-day job-skills/anti-trafficking-awareness course have found employment. In comparison, the WEE's much more extensive entrepreneurship course has led to almost 30 percent of its 1,051 graduates founding/expanding their own businesses and another 20 percent obtaining jobs. This includes an important although unknown number of them employed in the business ventures of their fellow trainees. In fact, one of the fieldwork findings is the strength of the networks the graduates of the WEE entrepreneurship course have created.

The assessment also showed the value of promoting not only networks of trainees but also integration and synergy between the ATP and the WEE project. Opportunities for networking and synergy between the two projects are greatest in Donetsk, which is the only city to have both a women for women center and a WBSC. This “two for one” model was found to be the most effective as well as the one that best facilitates synergy between the two projects. Basically, synergistically integrating the two projects offers possibilities for enhancing the economic impact of both (many of the WBSC entrepreneurs could use computer-savvy employees, to give just one example). In addition, integration would facilitate advocacy activities that further the mission’s health, economic growth, and democracy and governance/civil society efforts. As an example, advocacy to enforce Article 22 of the Labor Code—which prohibits gender, age, and other forms of discrimination in employment listings—could strengthen both economic growth and civil society, while helping to dismantle an illegal barrier preventing women from earning a decent living in Ukraine.

Additionally, the study found that the top age limits of the ATP target group (described as girls and women up to age 30) are not rigidly followed. This is a plus in promoting integration with the WEE project, with its somewhat older clients. The mean age of focus-group participants from the ATP’s women for women centers was just under 28 years, versus a little above 33 years for participants from the WEE project’s WBSCs. The widespread age discrimination in job listings discussed by the interviewees—focus-group participants described ceilings as low as 25 years of age—means there is a need to be flexible about upper age limits for ATP clients. If a woman of 32 faces age obstacles to getting a job in Ukraine, she is at risk of being trafficked if she is forced to look abroad for work—all the more reason to give her ATP computer training that is sufficiently valued by employers to permit her to break through the age ceiling and stay in her own country.

Fieldwork in Odessa revealed two programming gaps. First, Odessa is a key junction for trafficking (for example, during the first half of 2002, 688 women deportees arrived on the twice-weekly ships from Turkey), but it has neither a women for women center nor a WBSC. It does, however, have an excellent NGO dedicated to combating trafficking (Faith, Hope and Love). This group does not focus on economic training because of a lack of resources. Conveniently, though, Odessa also has a professional women’s NGO that would like to provide economic training to the anti-trafficking target group; city authorities are presently renovating and equipping ample space for the NGO to use for such a purpose. Thus, there are viable possible partners for expanding the ATP to Odessa in future programming. Second, 76 percent of the women deported by Turkey who arrive on the twice-weekly ships are from nearby Moldova, which also was identified as the main trafficking route to the Balkans. Furthermore, the capital of Moldova is relatively close to Odessa. So, if future anti-trafficking activities were to include a regional focus, it would be useful to incorporate both Odessa and Moldova in any such effort.

Finally, fieldwork in Kiev confirmed the primacy of USAID/Kiev in economically focused anti-trafficking efforts (see Annex D for an overview of the programs working against trafficking in Ukraine).

Models and recommendations. After summarizing the lessons learned from the fieldwork, the report presents a suggested model for future ATP programming that builds on the strengths of the present effort. This proposed model attempts to remedy the shortcomings of the present project, and focuses even more on economic empowerment as the best way to prevent trafficking. In addition, a high-resource version of the model is presented. A third model, based on suggestions from women for women center and Winrock ATP staff, was not recommended because most of its points were subsumable under the suggested model or involved a further spreading out of scarce resources over even more programs.

To summarize, the suggested model proposes that the mission continue to work with Winrock International and its women for women centers but with the following additions:

1. A strong emphasis on economic-skills training courses that are chosen, retained, or dropped on the basis of specific criteria indicating their level of market demand (for example, market niche studies, waiting lists, student course evaluations, and the proportion of trainees obtaining jobs within, say, six months).
2. First-rate M&E consulting, as early in the new project as possible, to design a system—and train staff to maintain it—that combines (a) results-oriented quantitative indicators (including additional socioeconomic and sociodemographic data that could be analyzed using the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences software program to ascertain the characteristics of trainees most and least likely to find various kinds of jobs); (b) largely qualitative rapid appraisal methods, such as semi-annual focus groups, to measure impact and emerging trends; (c) studies of market niches/demand to guide course design and retention; and (d) a database. (A common M&E system also could be used to promote synergy with the WEE project, so this should be encouraged as well.)
3. More integration and synergy between the ATP and the WEE project, including, wherever possible, the adoption of the “two for one” model of having both women for women centers and WBSCs in the same city.
4. Resources permitting, expansion to a regional focus that would include, at minimum, Odessa and Moldova.

In addition to the four recommendations above, other suggestions were proposed that, if adopted by both the ATP and the WEE project, could promote further synergy and impact. These include:

5. Soliciting “donations” for advanced training courses (in order to start the project down the road to sustainability; the WEE project already has begun to do this);
6. Establishing formal mentoring, on-site consulting, internship, and apprenticeship programs based on stronger links with the private sector;
7. Alleviating space constraints through stronger partnerships with city and other government authorities who might make counterpart contributions; and

8. Promoting networking/advocacy efforts that enhance other mission objectives in the areas of health, economic growth, and democracy and governance.

Other recommendations are specific to one project or the other. For example:

9. For the ATP, the most important prerequisite for more effective economic empowerment will be obtaining double to quadruple the existing number of computers (with accompanying software), as well as the appropriate space to house them. This is strongly recommended, along with a revamping of existing computer training to make it sufficiently intensive to facilitate employment for its graduates.
10. Also for the ATP, it is suggested that if resources permit, adding target groups (such as youths and/or Internat orphans) should be considered.
11. For the WEE project, it is suggested that additional loan products—and/or providers—be explored, as the fieldwork found that the existing system may not be well adapted to the needs of the women graduating from the WBSC training.

As a concluding note, the new USAID/Washington EGAT/WID project, involving various IQCs, might be a resource for carrying out some of the recommendations discussed in this report.

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

The most urgent motive that drives many young women to work abroad and run the risk of being trafficked into sexual slavery is economic: a lack of opportunity at home versus the lure of enticing offers of high-paying work in other countries.¹ This is the principal conclusion of previous studies carried out in Ukraine and in many other nations. The current report is no exception: the authors found that dire economic straits predominate among the “push” factors driving women into the risky business of seeking work abroad. We also discovered, however, that economic alternatives within Ukraine are the best method of preventing trafficking.

Following this introductory chapter, Chapter Two describes the main empirical findings that emerged from this assessment, based on fieldwork in Kiev, Chernigiv, Lviv, Donetsk, and Odessa. Chapter Three then presents lessons learned and suggests recommendations for future programming. Here, the emphasis is on (1) filling the gaps in existing efforts; (2) suggesting a preliminary model for the follow-on project that is even more focused on fostering women’s economic empowerment as the most effective method of preventing trafficking; (3) contrasting this model with possible alternatives; (4) increasing linkages to related sectors of development (specifically, health, economic growth, and civil society/democracy); and (5) expanding future anti-trafficking initiatives to a more regional focus that would incorporate Moldova, because a “Moldovan connection” emerged clearly during the fieldwork.

THE ECONOMIC AND GENDER CONTEXT OF TRAFFICKING OF UKRAINIAN WOMEN

The central message of the fieldwork is that economy and gender considerations combine to create the supply side of trafficking: the large numbers of people—mostly young women but including females of various ages and a number of males, as well—who are driven to try to improve their lot through illegal work abroad but instead become victims of the trafficking trade. Most of them end up in conditions of virtual slavery, most frequently as sex workers.

Based on Interpol information and other data, the United Nations now ranks the trade in women/forced prostitution/prostitution behind only the arms and drug trades in profitability among criminal activities (UNDP, 1999:229). The inhabitants of the former Soviet Union, particularly young women and girls under 16, have become highly sought raw material for human trafficking in the sex trade. They are viewed as especially attractive and especially vulnerable, given the economic chaos that engulfed much of the former Soviet Union in the

¹ “Trafficking” here refers to the cross-border exploitation of vulnerable individuals in some form of coerced labor from which they have no easy escape. Although female sexual bondage is empirically the largest component of trafficking in people, the labor can range from domestic service to farming, involving all ages and both genders.

past decade. Among the New Independent States (NIS), Ukrainian women are among the most prized, often physically winsome and economically desperate.

1. **The economic context.** Since gaining its independence in 1991, Ukraine has fallen into an economic abyss from which it has begun to emerge only since 2000. “At its bottom in 1999, official GDP for Ukraine was only 35 percent of the level in 1989” (Schamper, 2002:1). This constitutes “one of the most severe economic declines of any country in this [20th] century,” according to a 1999 World Bank study cited in Dudwick et al., 2002:5. During the past two years, however, “Ukraine has seen a remarkable macroeconomic stabilization, with budget deficits held in check, much more moderate growth in monetary aggregates, and much lower inflation. Official real GDP for 2000...grew for the first year since independence in 1991, at 5.9 percent. For 2001, [real GDP] growth was 9.0 percent” (Schamper, 2002:1).

Estimates for 2002 gross domestic product (GDP) range from 4.5 percent, according to USAID’s “Macro-Economic Analysis—Ukraine,” to 4.8 percent to 6 percent, according to a July 24, 2002, forecast by the country’s minister of economics and European integration, Oleksander Shlapak.

This long-hoped-for growth is not being felt equally throughout the economy, however. Differences exist by region, economic sector—and gender. Women interviewed for this report in Chernigiv and Lviv perceived that, at best, the decline has halted, but, they stressed, it is still difficult to virtually impossible for them to find jobs, with age discrimination further complicating the picture for women over age 25 in Chernigiv and 30 in Lviv. Even in Donetsk, which the women assessed more favorably in terms of economic recovery than Chernigiv, Lviv, or Odessa, interviewees stressed that women over age 35 face a huge barrier in finding work. Indeed, the age at which women encounter age discrimination in hiring may serve as an informal indicator of the extent of women’s disadvantage in the local economy.

2. **The gender context.** “Gender” here refers to the socially constructed aspects of being male or female, as opposed to the biological dimension of “sex.” As argued in Dudwick et al., 2002:6, “Gender roles and relationships are relevant to development, because they can open up or severely limit economic, political and/or social opportunities. While the nature and extent of gender inequities vary worldwide, nowhere do women and girls enjoy parity with men...”

Furthermore, although females bear the largest and most direct costs of gender inequities, these gender disparities harm everyone in society (Blumberg, 1989a; King and Mason, 2001).

“Gender stratification” refers to the relative power and privilege of men versus women in a given social group at a given location and time. In Ukraine, as elsewhere in the former Soviet Union, an officially proclaimed ideology of gender equality has never succeeded in creating conditions of gender equality. Moreover, the pre-Soviet culture favored men in everything from property to personal freedoms. Pre-Soviet Ukrainian women not only were second-class

citizens economically, politically, legally, and ideologically, they also were subject to a high level of domestic violence.

The Soviet system pushed women into the labor force, but never at equal wages, and into the political sphere, but never with equal power. The Soviet state never cracked down on domestic violence, nor did it push men into the domestic sphere. As a result, women were forced to work a “double day,” carrying out the overwhelming proportion of housework and child care in addition to holding down full-time jobs. There were compensations, however: generous maternity-leave and child-care provisions helped women cope with their dual burden.

The fall of the Berlin Wall on November 9, 1989, and the rapid unraveling of the Soviet Union that occurred from 1990 to 1991 unleashed world-shaking changes. Not the least of these was an economic contraction that approached a free fall (as alluded to above, Ukraine’s economy shrank by almost two-thirds from 1989 to 1999). The introduction of raw capitalism has created new classes of winners, both legitimate and criminal, and more of these winners have been male than female.

The collapse of the Soviet-era “social safety net” disproportionately hurt women. They were the ones most likely to lose their jobs. For example, a national survey conducted by the Ministry of Labor in 1994 and 1998 found that 80 percent of downsized employees were female (Dudwick et al., 2002:29). At the same time, their special benefits vis-à-vis child care and maternity leave were eroding or being eliminated.

Even in situations in which women’s costly social welfare benefits have been eliminated and they have expertise, gender discrimination further constricts women’s’ job opportunities in the post-Soviet economy—especially where the jobs fall outside typically female occupations. As an illustration, in the Dudwick et al. World Bank research (page 30), the “head of the Kharkiv job information center noted that even when women have the appropriate education, employers prefer to hire men in the technology field.”

In the focus groups conducted for the current research, participants echoed this complaint, noting that very often newspaper ads for such jobs as computer specialist or even economist call for “men only.” The representative from the Lviv Oblast Employment Center told the Dudwick et al. researchers that “only 30 percent of vacancies at the employment center are for women, 70 percent are for men...[and] in hiring there is discrimination—the advantage is clearly given to men” (page 40). Moreover, as discussed below, in a “buyer’s market” for (often desperate) female labor, women are further penalized by age and other forms of gender discrimination (see also Dudwick et al., 2002:39). Employers freely (albeit illegally, as discussed below) set age limits and even physical attractiveness requirements that may exclude most otherwise qualified candidates.

Concomitantly, many men, suffering economically in the dislocations and deep declines that marked Ukraine’s first decade of capitalism, increased their drinking—with a corresponding spike in domestic violence against women.

Accordingly, when we examine the most recent statistics on the relative situation of men and women in Ukraine, the picture shows a mixture of advantages and disadvantages for both genders, although clearly women were disproportionately disadvantaged by the post-independence transition.

1. In terms of their numbers and attributes, Ukrainian women should be a valuable resource for their country's development. They make up 54 percent of a population of just under 50 million, and they constitute more than half the country's labor force (Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine et al., 2000:5). They also are better educated than their male counterparts. For example, in the 1999–2000 academic year, 53 percent of the female population and 46 percent of the male population ages 18 to 22 were studying in institutions of higher learning (ibid.:21). Overall, women make up 55 percent of those with complete higher education (Dudwick et al., 2002:33), which is in keeping with their share of the population.
2. What is even more striking is that women live longer and healthier lives than men, living an average of 74 years versus 63 for men (Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine et al., 2000:13). These figures must be put into a larger context. First, "Ukraine continues to have the highest mortality rate and the lowest average life expectancy among the countries of Central and Eastern Europe" (ibid: 12). Second, life expectancies dropped—even for women—in the post-Soviet period. Third, the plummeting economy since the fall of the Soviet Union has pushed more men farther down the road of often deadly health habits: According to focus group participants in the Dudwick et al. World Bank research, unemployment has left many men with high stress and depression and lessened household authority, leading them to intensify already heavy rates of alcohol use and smoking. Alcoholism contributes to male death rates from disease, accidents, and suicide (Dudwick et al., 2002:43–44); with respect to smoking, several recent national sample surveys found 57 percent to 58 percent of men to be smokers, versus 10 percent to 14 percent of women (ibid.:45), with smoking causing 14 percent of all deaths in Ukraine (World Health Organization, cited in Dudwick et al., 2002:44).
3. In short, in terms of human and physical capital, women represent an underutilized asset that might have cushioned the transition. Yet, as mentioned above, they suffered disproportionately in the economic free fall following independence. To cite statistics from the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine et al., 2000:26: "Over the eight years since official registration was introduced, women made up a large majority of registered unemployed... The percentage of young unemployed people under 28 is 35.5 percent with an absolute majority of women (approximately 75 percent)."

The situation is now stabilizing somewhat: women constituted only 62 percent of the registered unemployed by 1999. Yet, the fact that well-qualified, healthy, and potentially highly productive females bore so much of the burden of transition arguably contributed to the depth and duration of the economic crisis. There is less of an argument that their disadvantaged economic position drove—and continues to drive—many increasingly desperate women to accept risky offers of high-paying jobs abroad. Tragically, many of them instead end up as prey in the modern-day slave trade in sex workers.

4. To reiterate, the evidence indicates that the main “push” factor driving women and girls to seek potentially risky employment abroad is economic need. Therefore, any coherent program aimed at combating trafficking must provide economic alternatives. Fortunately, the USAID Anti-Trafficking Project has chosen the right strategy, as shown by the empirical findings of the fieldwork presented below.
5. Women’s economic disadvantage has multiple negative effects on them, their families, and their country (Blumberg, 1989a, 1989b, and 1995; Blumberg and Maryanski, 2001). This, in part, is because relative economic power turns out to be the most important single factor in accounting for the level of gender equality in a society (see Blumberg, 1978, 1984, and 1991a).
 - ? The lower women’s control of income and other economic resources, the lower their level of self-confidence², which affects their ability to promote their own and their children’s well-being under conditions of hardship, and the more likely they are to fall victims to domestic violence (cross-cultural research of 90 societies by Levinson [1989] isolated four factors that predicted violence against women: female economic inequality was the strongest [see Heise, 1994:29]).
 - ? Domestic violence has been found to be another “push” factor leading women to put themselves in harm’s way by seeking risky employment abroad (as described in various Winrock International Anti-Trafficking Project documents).
 - ? Where women are economically dependent, they have less of a voice in household decisions, ranging from their own fertility to decisions involving their children’s well-being (on issues of nutrition, education, health, and so on; see Blumberg, 1988, 1991a, and 1993, for theory and empirical support).
 - ? Women tend to spend income under their control more single-mindedly on children’s welfare than do their male counterparts (ibid.).
 - ? The net result is lower levels of human capital growth and lower levels of economic growth (Blumberg, 1989a, 1995; Goldin, 1986; Hess, 1988).
6. Women in Ukraine are even more disadvantaged in access to political power than in access to economic power (jobs and income). Sliding to 4.7 percent in the 2002 elections, the proportion of women in Parliament now is among the lowest in Europe and is much less than half the worldwide average. The worldwide figure on females in national parliaments hovered a little above the 10-percent mark in the 1990s, with only the Scandinavian countries and the Netherlands approaching or exceeding 40 percent (Inter-Parliamentary Union, 1998; Sivard, 1995). More recently, data for March 2000 show that the Scandinavian countries remain at this level (38.8 percent), while the world average

² The converse finding—that increased income enhances self-confidence—has been essentially universal in the gender and development literature (see Blumberg, 1991a, 1993, and 2001, for discussion and references).

has inched up to 13.4 percent (Inter-Parliamentary Union, 2000). Even though female members of parliaments do not always promote female interests, their current near absence in Ukraine means that efforts to promote women's economic opportunities in a time of economic constraints are unlikely to come from the political sphere. Nor, at this time, is there likely to be much emphasis on anti-trafficking, given the gender distribution of political power.

7. Efforts toward women's economic empowerment and anti-trafficking come mainly from nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), working with donors such as USAID. USAID is committed to enhancing gender equity, which includes women's economic empowerment, as well as to fighting the modern-day slave trade of trafficking, which affects the most vulnerable groups. Women and men have different risks and vulnerabilities and ways of overcoming them. The findings below support the appropriateness of linking anti-trafficking with female economic empowerment and point the way to future programming that will continue to join these two objectives.

THE OBJECTIVES OF THE ASSESSMENT

The statement of work that guided the present consultancy in assessing the economic aspects of anti-trafficking programming by USAID/Kiev (see Annex B) begins with an analysis of the situation that includes the following overview:

- ? Although the number of trafficked women and girls is difficult to determine, due to trafficking's clandestine and criminal nature, the United Nations conservatively estimates that four million people globally are smuggled into foreign countries each year, generating up to \$7 billion annually in illicit profits for criminal syndicates. A significant portion of this human traffic is female.
- ? Although the problem of sexual trafficking in women and girls is not new, it has mushroomed in Ukraine and the NIS since the fall of communism. With multiple and complex causes, trafficking has proven difficult to curb. Recruiters for traffickers target areas where opportunities for women are most bleak, and where the risks of being caught are relatively low. Women and girls from rural areas and small cities, and those coming out of orphanages, are particularly vulnerable, as their poor economic prospects often make offers of jobs overseas too attractive to turn down. The influence of organized crime in Ukraine, and the related problem of corruption among public officials and law enforcement agents, complicates efforts to combat trafficking.

The objective of the scope of work is to have an international expert consultant, aided by a Ukrainian national consultant, "analyze current anti-trafficking initiatives with a focus on providing economic opportunities for women, as well as women's economic empowerment programs." Then:

- ? The findings and recommendations will help USAID/Western New Independent States (WNIS) identify critical gaps in existing approaches that new interventions might

address, primarily in Ukraine, with a special emphasis on combating trafficking by providing women with more economic opportunities.

In a July 12, 2002, meeting with relevant USAID/Kiev staff (see Annex A for the list of persons and organizations contacted), the consultants also were asked to carry out as much of an impact analysis as possible during fieldwork. This was decided because (a) the international consultant has expertise in rapid appraisal methods, and (b) a previous Management Systems International (MSI) report had urged researchers to examine the success of the various job-search and job-skills training efforts aimed at fighting trafficking. As a result, it was agreed in the meeting that as many focus groups as feasible would be conducted not only with clients of the Anti-Trafficking Project (ATP) skills training but also with clients of the Women’s Economic Empowerment (WEE) Project’s women’s business support centers. Both projects are being implemented by Winrock International, and many linkages exist between them.

THE METHODOLOGY AND THE FIELDWORK

In keeping with accepted rapid appraisal methodology (see Annex C), various methodological techniques were used in carrying out this assessment. These include key-informant interviews, focus-group discussions, group meetings, observation, and review of existing literature and project materials. Some key-informant interviews were conducted by telephone before the international consultant left the United States, as was the initial document and literature review. Meanwhile, the national consultant brought her expertise in gender and trafficking as well as her knowledge of local conditions, thereby enhancing the team effort.

Rapid appraisals have become increasingly popular in the field of development since the first one (the rapid rural appraisal, or RRA) was named at a conference at the University of Sussex in 1978. Various rapid appraisal methodologies exist—including RRAs, participatory rural appraisals (PRAs), and rapid assessment procedures (RAPs)—but all are united by their use of the principle of “triangulation” to establish the validity of the data obtained. “Triangulation” means that for each variable or issue on a tightly honed list, one obtains at least two sources of data, preferably via two different methodological techniques. This cross-checking, or validation, is what elevates rapid appraisals above journalistic or “quick and dirty” methods.

In the present brief period of fieldwork, not every assertion could be cross-checked by triangulation techniques, but the data collection involved multiple replications in diverse geographic locations, which permitted considerable cross-validation. All told, the authors talked with 125 people (109 women, or 87.2 percent, and 16 men, or 12.8 percent) in five cities: Kiev, Chernigiv, Lviv, Donetsk, and Odessa. The interviewees represented USAID/Kiev and 27 other national and international organizations, as well as four businesses that were visited in the course of the field research (involving four women and one man).

Three types of interviews were held:

- Individual interviews were conducted with 52 people: 13 men (25 percent) and 39 women (75 percent). (Additional USAID contacts included three women and one man.)
- Group meetings involved 30 people: 2 men (6.7 percent) and 28 women (93.3 percent).
- Eight focus groups, totaling 39 women, were carried out in Chernigiv, Lviv, and Donetsk. All involved clients of the USAID/Winrock–supported ATP and/or WEE projects.

In Chernigiv, there were two focus groups of five women each of women’s business support center (WBSC) trainees, consisting of (a) those who had opened or expanded a business after training, and (b) those who had found jobs (but had not yet begun a business).

In Lviv, there were two focus groups of five women each with women for women center clients, consisting of (a) those who took computer training but had not yet found a job, and (b) those who took the training and had found jobs.

In Donetsk, four focus groups were held, two for WBSC trainees and two for women for women center trainees. The WBSC focus groups were (a) five women who had founded/expanded a business, and (b) five who had found jobs (the WBSC director claimed there were not enough women who had neither found work nor begun a business to put together a focus group). The focus groups for women for women center trainees were (a) five who took computer training but had not found a job, and (b) four who took the training and had found jobs.

All focus groups were homogeneous and small (all but one had the “magic number” of five participants; see Annex C) in order to promote maximum validity. They also were confidential and anonymous: No one from either project was in attendance, and only first names were used.

Table 1: Summary of Persons Contacted, by City, Gender, and Type of Interview

	Male	Female
Kiev		
? Individual interviews	11	25
? Group meeting (14 women for women center coordinators + 2 Winrock International program coordinators)		16
? Brief discussions	1	3
Chernigiv		
? Individual Interviews	1	4
? Two focus groups with clients of WBSC (5 each)		10
Lviv		
? Individual interviews	1	3
? Two focus groups with clients of women for women center (5 each)		10

	Male	Female
Donetsk		
? Individual interviews		2
? Group meeting (staffs of WBSC and women for women center)		7
? Four focus groups (2 each w/clients of each center, in groups of 5, 5, 5, and 4)		19
Odessa		
? Individual interviews		5
? Group meetings (staff of Faith, Hope and Love)	2	5
Subtotal	16 (12.8 percent)	109 (87.2 percent)
TOTAL	125	

CHAPTER TWO

FINDINGS FROM FIELDWORK IN FIVE CITIES

Kiev was the central focus of the assessment, in that all of the donor agencies and most of the parent organization/implementing agencies are located in the capital. The other four cities were chosen, in part, because they represent the north (Chernigiv), west (Lviv), east (Donetsk), and south (Odessa).

OVERVIEW

The fact that the partner organization for the Anti-Trafficking Project (ATP) as well as the Women’s Economic Empowerment (WEE) Project is Winrock International influenced the choice of research sites. Winrock supports women for women centers in Lviv and Donetsk and WBSCs in Chernigiv and Donetsk. (Actually, women for women centers implement anti-trafficking and job-skills training in seven cities: Donetsk, Dnipropetrovs’k, Zhitomir, Rivne, Chernivtsi, Kherson, and Lviv. The WBSCs created by the WEE project are located in Donetsk, Chernigiv, Ivano-Frankivsk, Kharkiv, and Mykolayiv.)

The choice of Odessa was dictated by its importance as a locus of trafficking and by the fact that it has not only a women’s wellness center (which receives American International Health Alliance (AIHA)/USAID support) but also a couple of highly relevant NGOs. Odessa was chosen for the fieldwork because it seemed to offer a likely location for future anti-trafficking activities, and, as it turned out, it proved to be a prime site for possible programming in the next phase of anti-trafficking initiatives.

Because the two Winrock projects—ATP and WEE—were the primary focus of fieldwork, it is useful to provide a capsule view of the two projects, including their areas of strength, shortcoming, and potential for further integration.

Winrock International’s Anti-Trafficking Project (ATP), Ukraine

This 1998–2002 project is now at the end of its cycle, and the matter of its extension is a principal question confronting USAID/Kiev. The main ATP documents describe its targets as females ages 15 to 30 (some of its publications list ages 12 to 30, and some of the project’s top coordinators verbally extend the age range to 35 or older). The seven women for women centers provide a variety of services (hotlines, walk-in services, training, crisis intervention, and so on). “Organizational culture” emphasizes the norms of a women’s crisis center, so confidentiality is a key consideration in dealing with clients. Unfortunately, this makes follow-up data a “catch-as-catch-can” affair, with voluntary participation, and is coupled with a somewhat ad hoc monitoring and evaluation/indicator system that lumps together all training courses, which precludes identifying which courses are most successful in fostering earning a living. This poses a problem, given that the mission envisions “a special emphasis

on combating trafficking through providing women with more economic opportunities” (“Statement of Work,” 2002:2).

Caveats aside, ATP’s impact indicators show that project efforts in training approximately 25,000 women have resulted in about 13 percent (3,363) finding jobs after taking the two-day basic course in job skills and anti-trafficking awareness. According to the data, another 10 percent have decided to continue their education or have already returned to school.

Two types of training are relevant for this assessment: two-day job-skills/anti-trafficking–awareness training seminars, and various technical-skills courses, of which the most popular and economically relevant is a basic computer course. The computer courses generally involve 8 to 10 hours of instruction stretched out over two to four weeks. Below, some of the successes and problems encountered are discussed in detail. In preview, however, the centers visited have too few computers in too little space to meet demand, and women can wait many months for a place in a course where they may share a computer with one or two others and are not given any time to practice.

Without question, the women for women centers visited are doing an exceptional job in providing popular services to large numbers of women, and they are well regarded in their cities. Yet, do their economically focused training courses work—are women provided with economic tools that enable them to earn a living in Ukraine, versus going abroad? This question was raised in an MSI report in 1999 but cannot be answered with the project’s existing monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system. The project M&E evolved in a haphazard manner, and most of it entails listing raw numbers of women who (a) attended training courses (usually lumped into total figures, not disaggregated by course); (b) have returned to or continued in school; (c) claimed they were no longer interested in going abroad; and (d) most critically, have gotten a job. Percentages are not given that, and no attempt is made to, link results, such as the number of women who have obtained jobs, with particular courses other than the two-day basic one (from which it is possible to calculate that 13 percent of the 25,000 attendees have found work).

Winrock International’s Women’s Economic Empowerment (WEE) Project, Ukraine

This project, which began in 1999, has just been awarded a two-year extension. It is adding a sixth WBSC, in Crimea, to the five enumerated above. Thus far, the only place with both a women for women center and a WBSC is Donetsk. This lack of geographic overlap reduces the possibility for meaningful synergy and linkages with the ATP.

The WEE’s “flagship” offering is an intensive course in business and entrepreneurship that involves a minimum of nine weeks of instruction, full-time. In addition, the project provides three-day seminars across Ukraine on how to start a business. The field visits again indicated that the WBSCs are doing an extraordinary job, providing popular and needed services, and that they are well regarded in their cities. Their successes and impact, however, cannot be properly and fully assessed with existing documentation.

The WEE's reporting in its main "executive summary" is similar to that of the ATP: indicators include the number of women attending courses; the number who have started or developed their own businesses; and the number of new jobs created. Some documents also give the number of women who have found jobs and some information about the credit component (discussed below). Again, percentages are not given. Using Winrock International's "Fact Sheet: WEE Project Achievements (March 1999–March 31, 2002)," the authors calculated the following:

The five WBSCs trained 41 groups, involving 1,051 women (mean=25.6 women per group), of whom:

- ? A total of 306 (29.1 percent) created/developed their own businesses, creating 962 new jobs (an average of 3.1 per business; no information is available about total employment);
- ? A total of 210 (20 percent) found employment (anecdotally, the consultants were told that many of the women who have found jobs were hired by their classmates who started/developed their own businesses, but no relevant data were available); and
- ? The special credit union component has made 151 loans totaling \$110,195 (the mean loan size is \$729.77), with 0 delinquencies, at interest rates of 35 percent to 50 percent (generally well above prevailing bank rates, according to focus-group interviewees).

The three-day empowerment training courses have involved 984 Ukrainian women in 48 seminars (a mean of 20.5 women per group). The following figures are not as clearly linked to these seminars as are the preceding figures to the WBSCs, but it appears that 73 businesses were opened or diversified (constituting 7.4 percent of the attendees), creating 231 jobs (mean=3.2 per business), and that 32 women have found employment (3.3 percent).

How do the WEE and ATP programs compare in terms of economic impact (keeping in mind the limitations of the presently available indicator data)? On the one hand, it seems the full WBSC training is much more likely to lead to women earning a living (half the graduates have started or expanded their own businesses or have gotten jobs) than is the two-day basic job-skills/anti-trafficking–awareness course of the women for women centers (where it appears that only 13 percent of trainees find work). On the other hand, the women for women centers' two-day training seems to result in more women earning income than does the WBSCs' three-day training in starting a business.

Also, focus-group data indicate that, for the most part, the women who open/diversify their own businesses after receiving WEE/WBSC training are older than the target group of the ATP women for women centers—even though many are well within the trafficking risk age range (say, under 40 or so). The average age of WEE focus-group participants was 33.3, versus 27.8 for ATP interviewees. This further constrains possible linkages between the ATP and the WEE project.

A key commonality that cuts across the ATP and the WEE project is that their economically oriented—and free—offerings are extremely popular. Demand for all the economically focused training (the ATP’s basic-job-skills and, especially, computer courses, and the WEE project’s WBSC program) far exceeds existing enrollment capacity. Entrance to the WBSC training is competitive, based on having a good and viable business idea. Entrance to the computer courses comes via a long waiting list (this can be finessed, however, if one is willing to become a volunteer at the center).

Interviews with Winrock headquarters staff and 14 top regional coordinators revealed that they now wish to expand geographically both to rural/small town areas and to other oblasts. There was no mention of plans to step up services and cut into the waiting lists in the areas where their women for women centers are already operating. This is clearly an issue for USAID/Kiev to consider in plans for the follow-on project. Below, different models are discussed for the follow-on project, but the option “expand current activities over a much bigger geographic area” is not recommended.

Here, in preview, is a small sample (five points) of what is further discussed in the remainder of this chapter:

1. Making a living seems to be the strongest “preventive medicine” against falling victim to trafficking. In the eight focus groups, involving 39 women in three cities, not one woman who had a job or business mentioned the possibility of seeking employment abroad.
 - ? As noted, the strictly economically focused WEE project has a higher measured success level than the much more eclectic ATP in leading women to earn a living: Some 50 percent of trainees start or develop their own businesses (almost 30 percent) or get a job (20 percent). Not surprisingly, there is more demand than supply for such potentially valuable free training.
 - ? The ATP runs not only economically focused activities but a variety of crisis-intervention programs as well, and not all its free skills courses seem equally likely to result in employment. The biggest waiting lists are for the ATP’s computer courses, despite their shortcomings (as discussed below). Unfortunately, it was not possible to measure the success rate of each type of course in leading to employment, because, as noted earlier, the project indicators lump all forms of training courses together. Because of their crisis-intervention focus, the women for women centers maintain confidentiality, which precludes systematic follow-up to determine just what percentage of enrollees in each type of course manage to find jobs.
2. The authors found that all of the Winrock-assisted centers visited—women for women centers in Lviv and Donetsk and WBSCs in Donetsk and Chernigiv—were doing an excellent job in carrying out their current types of training with minimal resources. Essentially, they were “making bricks without straw.” The most glaring deficiencies involve computers and space.

- ? In the women for women centers in Lviv and Donetsk, there are waiting lists of women hoping to take the computer course that are nearly a thousand names long. A woman can wait months for a spot in the class. Then, she must share one of four working computers with a group of at least 8 to 10 people. On top of this, she cannot practice, because the centers lack the space for their basic training programs and the computer rooms are constantly in use. In fact, in Lviv, during the late afternoon, the authors found that a jewelry-making class of nearly a dozen women was hard at work in the computer room, using the tops of the computers and monitors as work spaces for stringing beads.
 - ? Space is so tight that each center's main training room is barely big enough for the groups being instructed. In the case of the women for women center in Donetsk, there is no air conditioning, and on the hot summer days of the authors' visit, the cramped little room was like a sweat bath. Also in Donetsk, the computers for the classes are located in the same room where the accountant and another staff member are at work—to the detriment of all parties. Yet, for a nominal sum, the city is willing to give the center additional space on the floors its occupies. The catch is that the center has no money to renovate the space.
3. The women's wellness centers may or may not be a good partner for future anti-trafficking/economic alternatives and initiatives, depending on their specific situation.
- ? In Lviv, the authors found a lovely, modern, centrally located center that would make an ideal partner for possible linkage activities.
 - ? In Odessa, however, the underequipped, shabby center was located in a regional hospital so far from the center of town that it seemed to be a formidable obstacle (even if the hospital's daunting bureaucracy could be addressed).
4. The port city of Odessa is a critical site for anti-trafficking efforts.
- ? An indicator of the magnitude of the problem there is the fact that two ships a week disembark women deported from Turkey alone. In fact, from January through June 2002, 688 women arrived by ship; many more were Moldovans (525) than Ukrainians (107).
 - ? The main anti-trafficking hotline gets a lot of use: from January through June 2002, it received 1,010 calls.

Currently, however, Odessa lacks any Winrock-assisted centers, either women for women or WBSC. It does, however, have an extremely dynamic NGO, named Faith, Hope and Love, that is doing extraordinary work on all fronts except economic. The group's services include the hotline referred to above as well as a shelter for the worst cases among the trafficked women returned by ship (unfortunately, they work with only one doctor, who has to handle all medical problems). With respect to economic alternatives, the NGO has funds for only a minimal effort, although it would like to do much more (offer skills courses such as computer training and provide basic job skills, for example).

Odessa also has a women's association of "mover and shaker" business and professional types who have extremely close connections with both the political and economic power structures—and who would like to help in anti-trafficking efforts by providing economic training and alternatives. They have been given 200 square meters of space by the mayor for their programs; the city also is paying for the ongoing renovation of this space, which is to be ready by November 2002.

5. Even though there is only one city where both the WEE project and ATP operate, the synergy observed shows the value of integrating the two projects as much as possible.

DONETSK—THE "TWO FOR ONE" MODEL

The eastern industrial city of Donetsk lies in the midst of a troubled (and disaster-ridden) mining area. Its leaders, however, retain close ties with the present government, to the benefit of the local economy. It remains Russian-speaking, and an imposing statue of Lenin still dominates the large main square.

Donetsk is the only city in Ukraine containing both a WBSC program and a women for women center. In fact, the two services are located on adjacent floors of the same city-owned building and are directed by the same charismatic and competent woman. Therefore, with an eye on future programming that would involve greater linkages between economic and anti-trafficking efforts, the authors carried out participant observation of both centers, visited a WBSC trainee's business, and interviewed 28 people. This included two individual interviews (one with a woman who escaped after being trafficked to Bosnia), a group meeting with the combined staffs of the WBSC and the women for women center, and four focus groups involving 19 people.

The first day, two focus groups were conducted with graduates of the WBSC's training course: one comprised five women who had started or expanded their own businesses and the other involved five women who had not gone into business but had secured employment (the director's claim that, as a criterion for yet another focus group, there were too few WBSC graduates who had failed either to develop their own businesses or get jobs proved impossible to cross-validate). The second day, focus groups comprised women who had taken the women for women center's computer course. One group of five included those who had not found jobs; the other group of four all had found some form of employment.

Following are some of the highlights from the focus groups:

WBSC

- ? The five WBSC grads who did not go into business averaged 33.6 years of age; all had at least partial higher education (two had two university degrees each). They were enthused about the training and gave the course an average score of 8.2 out of a possible 10. They particularly liked the teaching and the continued availability of services and consultants at the center, and all had hopes of ultimately becoming entrepreneurs (lack of funds was

their most common constraint). In fact, all five were members of the league of business and professional women, which is closely linked to the WBSC (although it was begun in 1992).

Criticisms varied and were minor in comparison with participants' appreciation for the excellent free training they were given. One interesting suggestion involved creating a database with information about both WBSC and women for women center trainees. This could be used for such purposes as employment generation, lobbying, and other linkages.

- ? The five WBSC grads who did create/diversify businesses averaged slightly less education—mostly postsecondary subuniversity technical training, although one woman was a veterinarian. Their average age was similar to that of the previous group (although this question was omitted when the discussion ran overtime). Only one was married, three were divorced, and one was single. All five women gave the course the maximum score of 10 and had almost all positive things to say about their training. Even so, they would have liked to see such enhancements as self-confidence training and more Internet instruction (which would entail the WBSC getting a second phone line).

An interesting finding is the link between participants' original occupations/education and their current businesses for three of the five: the vet is selling health supplements, the English teacher is running a foreign language training center, and the math teacher is running a computer club. A fourth woman turned her pastry-making hobby into a business. (The fifth woman developed a retail sales business, her long-standing goal, but one unrelated to her original career in bookkeeping/accounting.)

Women for Women Center

- ? The five women who completed the computer course and did not get jobs were quite young, with a mean age of 20.4; four of them were full-time students (the fifth was a seamstress on maternity leave trying to become a secretary). They gave their computer training an average grade of 7.5 because of the constraints: too few computers in too small a space shared by too many people in a course that lasted too few hours and provided no opportunities for after-class practice. Nevertheless, they considered the course well taught and a good base for future learning. All five said the training had proven useful in their studies.
- ? The four women who took the computer course and did find work were older than their unemployed counterparts, with a mean age of 25.8. Educationally, all had some form of postsecondary training (two from a university, with one of them still a student). They gave their computer course an average grade of 9.1. Interestingly, only two of the four jobs turned out to be paid employment: the two somewhat less-educated women became trainers for the center but are currently working without pay, as the center is tightening its belt in anticipation of a several-month hiatus without funding. The two best-educated women found excellent—and paid—work that can be directly linked to their center computer training. Here are their vignettes:

- + **Masha.** In August 2000, the summer between her first and second years as a university telecommunications student, Masha took the center's computer training course (after a two-month wait). She realized she wanted to work with computers. In October 2000, she was hired as an office manager (she was given—and passed—a skills test but was never asked how many hours of instruction her course had entailed). She worked almost full-time when she was not in class, and much of her work was on the computer. Her office computer already contained graphics programs, and she obtained an Adobe Photoshop program from a friend. The programs fascinated Masha, but working almost full-time interfered with her studies, so she gave up her job to concentrate on school. Soon, however, she realized that she needed at least a part-time job to survive. A friend was working as a teacher in a computer school and told her the school was looking for an instructor on just the programs she worked on at her office job (Word, Excel, and so on). Masha was hired. When she found out the school also was going to hire a computer graphics teacher, she studied computer graphics on her own on a crash basis. The school decided to give her a chance, and she worked very hard to improve her expertise. Now, she has been teaching computer graphics for almost six months while continuing to study full-time at the university. Masha says the school pays her well enough that she needs to work only a few hours. Somehow, her future career will combine both telecommunications and computers—and it was the computer course at the center that started her down this promising path.

- + **Oxana.** Oxana had no knowledge of computers when she began the center course in July 2000 (after a three-month wait). She had just graduated as an energy engineer but could not find work in her field. She thought the computer course might be useful. After she finished the course, she became a part-time volunteer at the center. Very shortly thereafter, a telecommunications company contacted the center and asked for a temporary worker for one to two months. Oxana was recommended and began in September 2000. By November, the company offered her a permanent job as an administrative assistant. After a year (during which she also studied Ukrainian law affecting telecommunications), her company sent Oxana to Kiev to study special computer courses for monitoring television programs and channels. Actually, she already had been named administrative director of her firm (in September 2001). Although she thinks she would have been better paid had she found work as an energy engineer, Oxana is now committed to her new field and sees her future in television/telecommunications.

Donetsk reveals just how useful it is to combine WBSC and women for women centers in the same location. While two full-time directors would be needed should this be attempted elsewhere (superwomen like Ljudmila Gorova of Donetsk are hard to find), the model of two centers occupying adjacent space and coordinating their programs and services makes a great deal of sense. Both programs are functioning very well, despite a lack of resources, space, computers, and the like. With a few more resources, they could function even better, and could become a full-fledged pilot program of the “two for one” model in any future programming.

The amount of resources needed is truly very modest. Donated computers and software would go a long way toward meeting demand, but there has to be a place to put the machines. The city offered the WBSC 22 square meters for about \$14.67 a month, but the space needed renovation, so thus far it remains empty. On the floor above, the city offered the women for women center half a floor of empty, but dilapidated, space for the proverbial song. When the center could not come up with the necessary funds, the city rented it out on a temporary basis to other organizations. It still would be possible to obtain at least some of this space—which could house computers and additional training rooms—because none of the new tenants has long-term commitments. All that is needed is a little more money, or perhaps more help from government authorities.

Another of the strongest findings to emerge in Donetsk concerns project impact: the creation of a network of the graduates of the WBSC. Already this has resulted in significant employment for trainees who lack the economic means to found their own businesses. Because there is also an active league for business and professional women in the city, run by the same dynamic (and exceptional) woman who directs both the WBSC and the women for women center, the potential for a full-scale advocacy group is self-evident. Extending the network to graduates of the women for women’s more business-oriented courses (the computer and accounting courses, to begin with) could promote more links between the two Winrock programs and a stronger base for future advocacy work in Donetsk.

There are so many policy issues that such a group could tackle—issues that would help women as well as the business climate. One example is a campaign to eliminate discriminatory ads and hiring announcements that restrict technical and professional jobs to men, or that specify that candidates for “women’s jobs” be physically attractive and very young—yet have years of experience, computer skills, and so on. (Many even ask for English language skills even though they are never used in the job in question.) As will be seen in the subsequent discussions of the other fieldwork sites, Donetsk’s economy was in the best shape of the secondary cities visited. Advocacy groups could, perhaps, be even more useful where the economy has not yet stabilized.

LVIV—FIGHTING TRAFFICKING IN A DEPRESSED REGION

Lviv’s historic old town is both remarkably beautiful and remarkably well preserved. If Ukrainian visa requirements were eased or eliminated and tourist promotion services were stepped up, the city might find prosperity in its heritage. Meanwhile, however, the local economy is in much worse shape than that of Donetsk. Also relevant to this report is the fact that the town contains no WBSC. The programs of the women for women center in Lviv combine anti-trafficking awareness with activities aimed at enhancing women’s employability—and they seem to be functioning well considering the lack of space, computers, and resources.

The center’s leadership, starting with its director, Luba Maksimovych, is dedicated and quite enterprising. For example, through the negotiating efforts of Ms. Maksimovych, low-cost space for additional training facilities can be obtained from city authorities, and a private

citizen stands ready to turn over a house ideally suited for a shelter for very low rent. Obtaining the resources to act on these possibilities could be high priorities for the next phase of the ATP, assuming it is extended. One way to get these resources is to create closer partnerships with government authorities, so that, for example, they would not only provide space but also renovate it, and, ultimately, provide support from their own budgets.

In the meantime, however, the budget is stretched so tight that all space is in constant use—and not always the optimal use. The most vivid illustration of this is the late afternoon jewelry-making class that the authors observed. It has to meet in the only physical location that could be made available: the computer room. This resulted in close to a dozen women and girls stringing beads on top of computer monitors and desktops, and precluding those computers from being used for their intended purpose. Unfortunately, the resource crunch is so great that two or three women have to share each of the four working computers, and each course is limited to no more than 10 hours of instruction stretched over a two-week period. Practice time outside of class hours also is impossible under the present circumstances. Yet, despite all this, demand is so great that the waiting list to get into one of these brief courses contains close to a thousand names, and it can take months to get in.

The summaries of the two focus groups—one with five women who had taken computer training but had not found work and the other with five women who had obtained jobs after taking the computer course—illustrate some of the strengths and weaknesses of the program.

The first focus group involved five women who had taken the computer course but had not found jobs. Their mean age was 31.4 and all had some postsecondary or higher education. Their stories reflect the economic crunch that accompanied the transition to capitalism. Two sisters, both university-trained mechanical engineers, provide examples. One was let go after 10 years as an engineer. The second, who graduated in 1994, never found a job in her field. A third woman, who graduated from a commercial academy in accounting/bookkeeping, never found a job in her field either; instead, she worked as a secretary and as an assistant to an economist. She is currently on maternity leave, earning a little money working “off the books” in a shop. The fourth was trained and worked as a specialty cook. She then obtained a marketing degree, but the economy already had melted down, so she never found work in her new field. Instead, she has sporadically worked as a typist and document copier. Currently, she and her husband are living on savings. The fifth woman also ended up in the same type of clerical work. She originally had studied philology at a university in Germany but lacked the means to finish. She returned to Lviv, where she took secretarial training. All five women are married, although the fifth is separated.

The husband of the fourth woman has become mentally unstable. He was a mechanical engineer but lost his job and has been unable to find another. He has become what his wife terms a “religious fanatic,” who tells her to pray when she wants to go looking for work because there is no food in the house. (“Don’t worry, God will provide.”) Worse, he has taken to beating her. Unfortunately, there is no women’s shelter in Lviv. She has health problems now and no place to go.

All except the fourth woman have children, ranging from 3 to 13. This complicates their job searches because child care is not free and child-care facilities are hard to find, especially in summer. Given that the still-struggling economy in Lviv permits employers to pick and choose, and the fact that the computer course involved only 10 hours of instruction, it is not surprising that the women's training has not turned out to be a magic key for opening the doors to gainful employment.

When asked to further evaluate the computer course, the five women agreed that the course had not been concrete enough and that there had not been enough time for each person to try every assignment, given the fact that at least two women shared each of the computers. They also noted that the staff also work on the same computers at times, further constraining their availability. The long waiting time to get into the free course appears to be a function of the desperation of women trying to increase their economic options in a still-negative economic climate. This is reflected in the relatively low scores participants gave to the course: their ratings ranged from 5 to 8, with a mean score of only 6.6.

Also in Lviv, the buyers' market was reflected in employers demanding English, computer skills, and experience, and in the sexist age and/or attractiveness restrictions. In fact, one exceptionally attractive, tall, slender blonde of 30 was bitter about job listings with age limits as low as 25.

The second focus group comprised five women who did find jobs following their computer courses. In terms of age, they were slightly older than the first group, with an average age of 33.6. Their education was higher too: all had strong university backgrounds and all had attended and/or graduated from the University of Lviv in fields including mathematics, philology, and physics. When these specialties proved unsuited to the changed economic climate, several went back to school to study subjects such as English, international relations, and management. They also took a larger number of the center's skills courses (two took the tour guide course, for example) as part of their job preparation strategy.

Four of the five landed jobs that include at least some use of computers. The exception is a woman who once taught Russian and is now a graduate student in English. She had just obtained a part-time job teaching English at the University of Lviv. Another participant, an ex-mathematician, is working for a workers' union and setting up a database for a company run by friends in another city; they would like her to establish a Lviv branch of their firm at some point in the future. A third woman, with a background as a Russian teacher and then as a student in a school of management, landed a job running a club for teens; her computer skills help her in her work, she said. The fourth woman got a job as assistant to the director of a publishing house (she had been a philologist and teacher of Ukrainian). The fifth woman works as a secretary in the same publishing house; her background had been in physics.

Assessing the course, the women rated the quality of the teaching as the best feature and the lack of sufficient computers and computer time as the worst. They gave the training an average score of 9.5—about three points higher than those in the first group, who had not managed to find jobs. Even with their more positive job outcomes, however, the women complained about the same discrimination in hiring as all the other focus groups: ads that

specify “men only” and age ceilings for women (about age 30 in Lviv, they said) are commonplace. Moreover, too often, requirements including computer skills, English, and beauty are demanded, whether relevant to the job or not.

CHERNIGIV—PROMOTING ENTREPRENEURSHIP PRIOR TO ECONOMIC RECOVERY

Chronologically, the first field visit was to Chernigiv. Chernigiv is a northern city in an agricultural region and even more economically distressed than Lviv. Accompanied by Tatiana Rastrigina of USAID/Kiev, who oversees the WEE project, the authors carried out five individual interviews, undertook participant observation in the WBSC, visited two businesses run by WBSC trainees, and conducted two focus groups with WBSC graduates—five who opened/diversified their own businesses after training and five who did not but are currently employed.

There were certain points on which everyone in both focus groups agreed. For example, the first question on the focus group “topic list” (no fixed questionnaire is used in this technique) is an “icebreaker” about the current state of the economy and how this compares with the situation a year ago. All 10 participants thought that although the economy had begun to stabilize (for example, people were now receiving their salaries, which had not previously been the case), things were still fairly negative (especially with respect to women finding a way to make a living). Many complained about what they viewed as blatant age and gender discrimination against women. Some jobs specified “men only,” others had age ceilings starting as young as 25.

The five who had begun/diversified their own businesses had a mean age of 35.8 (the range was 26 to 50), and four of the five had some form of higher education (the fifth had postsecondary technical education). Their businesses spanned a wide range. One has expanded her business selling wallpaper and other decorating products (she rents space in a store). Another, who used to have a wholesaling business, is developing an education business and plans to open a school. A third is renting space in a gym and continues her decade-old business of teaching aerobics and fitness while starting to run a 100-hectare rented farm with her husband. The fourth woman created the first salon for women’s lingerie in Chernigiv. Previously, she had operated the business as a “club,” rather than renting space in a fixed location; one of her employees was a student in her training cohort. The fifth woman runs a personnel agency—involving employee recruitment, professional and career counseling, and psychological testing. Two part-time employees were fellow students.

These women gave the training close to a perfect score—everyone gave it between 9 and 10 points, with a mean of 9.7. The woman who had begun running the 100-hectare farm with her husband was not so well satisfied at first—the course did not include agriculture at that time (it does now because Chernigiv is in an agricultural region). After the WBSC found her the agricultural training she needed, she raised her assessment to a 10.

Despite their high ratings of the center’s training, the women had some suggestions for improvement. Three suggested more of an emphasis on self-esteem, two proposed new

computers and more time allotted to computer training, and one wanted Internet instruction added to the computer training module (this would entail a second phone line for the WBSC). The personnel agency owner suggested systematic monitoring of graduates' successes and problems, along with more formalized business-consultant and advisory services for graduates, such as on-site consultants. Credit also was mentioned as a problem; there was a feeling that it is very risky to take credit union loans (which the women believed have a much higher interest rate than bank loans) for start-up businesses. Local banks, however, do not give credit to start-ups.

In the focus group of trainees who had not begun a business but do have jobs, the mean age was somewhat younger—30.6. All had postsecondary education, although not university degrees. Interestingly, further illustrating the theme of how the creation of strong networks was an unanticipated benefit of the WEE project, three of the five work for a fellow trainee. Two of the five work for a woman who runs a dressmaking workshop (which is not yet registered). Neither works in a formal, registered job (one has a background as a nurse and the other as a music teacher, but they can sew). The third now works part-time for the trainee who runs the personnel agency. She also works as a personnel manager for a large company that runs a chain of stores selling everything from food to cosmetics to cleaning products. The fourth woman is the commercial director of a firm that wholesales cosmetics, household cleaning products, and other items. She had lived in Cherniviv for five years and could not find work in her original field (she was trained as a teacher). She enrolled in the WBSC and subsequently found her present (good) job. The fifth woman works as an economist at a firm that repairs agricultural equipment; she took the course while on maternity leave from the same job. Networking among the women extends beyond their immediate circle, as well: the commercial director and the personnel manager (both divorced) also belong to the local league of business and professional women.

All five women described their business ideas. When they were asked why they were unable to launch their own businesses, two main reasons emerged: (1) lack of funds/credit; and (2) insufficient experience for such a step at this time. All five would eventually like to become entrepreneurs, however.

In their assessment of the training, the women gave the course a mean score of 8.4. The shortfalls included some inexperienced teachers and the lack of an interactive teaching method. The women also noted insufficient emphasis on topics such as self-esteem, business communications, and business negotiations. Only three of the five used computers and none pushed for more computer training (instead, that might be an option for those who need it, they suggested). They agreed that the course materials need to be organized in something like ring binders or a book so that participants have more than a pile of printouts at the end of the training. Another criticism was the length of the course—some students apparently had only two months of training and did not think that was enough. A full three months would be much better, the women said.

The two business visits merit short vignettes:

- ? **Synergy in a shoe store.** Taisiya used to rent a kiosk in a larger store where she sold her shoes. After her WBSC training, she opened an elegant shoe salon near the center of Chernigiv. The store sells excellent-quality women's, and some men's, shoes, purses, boots, briefcases, and hats. The merchandise is exceptionally stylish for a store in a secondary city in a poor agricultural area. When the field visit was carried out around 1 p.m., there were plenty of customers: women of all ages and a couple of men came into the store during the interview. Taisiya introduced her manager/director, Larissa, who had been a fellow student in her cohort. Larissa had not been able to launch her own business, but it appeared she was providing an important contribution to Taisiya's venture. Taisiya discussed leather and prices knowledgeably and insisted that she had no use for computers—she had to examine and touch the goods for herself before buying. She was not a stylishly dressed woman, however, and it seemed unlikely that the notably well-selected merchandise was her doing. In contrast, Larissa was exceptionally chic—her hair, dress, makeup, shoes, and manner denoted an elegant sophistication. The authors inferred that she must play a role in the fact that the merchandise seemed so well styled and up-to-the-minute. In any event, the business is prospering and expanding: Taisiya now rents space in a Kiev department store for a satellite operation.

The visit concluded with a brief discussion of whether Taisiya's success has affected her personal life. She explained that she is married to a retired military man. She noted that in Ukraine, it should be the man who is the main breadwinner and the one expected to have the last word in contested decisions. She confessed, however, that that was not the way things were in her household—where she brought in most of the income and finalized most of the decisions.

- ? **The handicrafts store in the former Wedding Palace.** It is somewhat difficult to get to the treasure trove of Ukrainian handicrafts owned by Tetyana, a WBSC trainee, and run as a family business with her husband. The business is located on the second floor of the former Wedding Palace. It is not centrally located. Worse, one has to climb a narrow and rickety spiral staircase to get to the store. Still, the business has taken off. Both Tetyana and her husband are trained engineers who lost their jobs in the post-independence economic contraction. Tetyana had always enjoyed handicrafts as a hobby. Following her WBSC training, it became her business. The quality and selection of the handicrafts she and her husband offer have attracted customers from as far away as Kiev, and they have received product orders from members of Parliament. They showcase locally made handicrafts and provide part-time, home-based employment to a half dozen talented women with small children who cannot easily find other work. These women paint the bright-colored, traditional designs of the region on a wide variety of wooden items that also are produced locally.

ODESSA—THE PROGRAMMING GAP

Many of its factories are closed, but Odessa's economy is cushioned by the city's still-busy port and still-lively tourist trade. The Black Sea, the fine climate, and the broad boulevards lined with elegantly trimmed sandstone buildings continue to draw enough visitors to provide

better economic prospects than in Chernigiv and Lviv. Neither of the Winrock International-run projects has a center in Odessa, even though it is an important city in terms of regional trafficking networks and patterns. This is unfortunate—and could be remedied in any new anti-trafficking programming with a moderate investment of resources.

In the absence of the ATP and WEE project centers, the authors focused on three potential partners for future programming: (1) an excellent NGO that deals with trafficking, Faith, Hope and Love; (2) the impressive Women's Association of Odessa; and (3) the local women's wellness center, which turned out to be less suitable as a possible partner than its counterpart in Lviv.

Faith, Hope and Love also operates a small, four-bed shelter for trafficked women deported from Turkey (two ships a week bring an average of 40 to 60 women at a time, and the NGO has a program that meets each ship and provides what it can to returned women in great need). Additionally, the NGO operates a much-used hotline, a psychological service, medical assistance for "returned women" (provided by a sole medical doctor, however), and various other noneconomic programs, including summer camps for local youths. During the summer, the coordinator of this program reaches more than 1,000 girls ages 14 to 17 with anti-trafficking information.

Currently, Faith, Hope and Love lacks the resources to tackle economic assistance/training programs, but it recognizes the urgent need for this type of programming and would jump in with enthusiasm if it had the funds. (The NGO noted that one commonality among the deported women is that when questioned about jobs, most say they want to learn computers.)

The NGO appeared to be such a strong organization that it would make a good partner for any future programming that might take place in Odessa. As an indicator, it was the only organization or establishment that provided data the authors had requested precisely when it promised to do so. In addition, Faith, Hope and Love claimed it could easily obtain additional space for nominal cost because it maintains very close relations with local authorities. (Its president, Tetyana Semikop, of the police, is chief of a regional department that works with youths; she was described as an important and famous person in Odessa, which opens many doors for the NGO.)

Faith, Hope and Love's data include the following: The great majority of the deported women are from Moldova. Between January and the end of June 2002, the NGO counted 688 deported women who arrived on the twice-weekly ships from Turkey. There were 525 women from Moldova (76 percent) and 107 from Ukraine (16 percent); the remainder came from a scattering of neighboring countries. The great majority of these women had been trafficked, against their will, into forced prostitution. Therefore, it is also relevant that the NGO's hotline received 1,010 calls about working abroad between January and the end of June 2002.

The fieldwork included a visit to Faith, Hope and Love's shelter, which was well hidden, secure, and small. The social worker in charge provided vignettes about each of the four women currently in residence there. All had experienced true horror. One had ended up in

one of the “mass production” brothels where the women are given only two hours for sleep and must snatch additional moments of rest during “tricks.” There, women are controlled by drug addiction (initially, often forced).³ All four were being given medical and psychological help but not (yet) any economic alternatives. A four-bed shelter such as this barely scratches the surface of need in a place such as Odessa.

The fieldwork included one other organization: the Women’s Association of Odessa. The authors interviewed the group’s energetic and obviously well-connected president, Olga Pavlova. She noted that her group’s relations with the mayor are so close that the city is currently renovating 200 square meters of space for the association. The space will be available by November 2002, and she wants to put it to use for economically focused activities.

According to the president, the association would be pleased to work with Faith, Hope and Love in a combination anti-trafficking/economic program. The two organizations’ complementary areas of expertise could provide an appropriate division of labor for future programming that links anti-trafficking with a strong economic orientation.

Conversely, while it is premature to rule out the women’s wellness center, the authors think linkages with alternative medical partners should be explored—particularly those located closer to the city center.

KIEV—THE MAJOR ORGANIZATIONAL PLAYERS

The centerpiece of this section is not in the text but, rather, in Annex D, the list of anti-trafficking programs in Ukraine (prepared by Olha Shved). These include a variety of donors in addition to Winrock International, including the International Renaissance Foundation (Soros), the Academy for Educational Development (AED), the International Organization of Migration (IOM), the British Council, and several embassies. These programs mainly involve small grants between US\$3,000 and US\$15,000 that are awarded to a variety of Ukrainian NGOs, as shown in Annex D.

In addition to these donors, the authors visited several other programs, as shown in Annex A. These include La Strada, CURE (Center for Ukrainian Reform Education), AIHA (American International Health Alliance), BIZPRO, the Office of the Ombudsperson for Human Rights, the State Committee on Family and Youth, the Ukrainian Sociological and Educational

³ None of these four women had fought back in the manner of the woman interviewed at the women for women center in Donetsk: she had escaped from the bar in Bosnia where she had been held against her will after being kidnapped and sold, and then went to the UN authorities in Sarajevo to press charges. Her captors were convicted, but she received death threats by phone from Bosnia, Moldova, and, apparently, Donetsk itself. All but one of the three men convicted are already out of prison, and the bar owner will be free in a matter of months. This woman told the authors she thinks she is being followed and feels herself to be in imminent danger of being killed. Accordingly, the authors notified the appropriate American embassy staff and worked with the women for women center and the International Organization of Migration (IOM) to get further information about the case and further protection for “Lena” if it proved needed.

Women's Center, and the Canada-Ukraine Gender Fund. Other contacts were made through telephone interviews.

It is not necessary to summarize all of these meetings in this section. Instead, the reader is directed to Annex D, which provides details on the various anti-trafficking initiatives undertaken in the past few years. Nevertheless, a few visits merit discussion at this point. In particular, top staffers of the AIHA were quite enthusiastic about collaboration between the alliance's women's wellness centers and the women for women centers. Such collaboration could provide mutually beneficial linkages in those cities where women's wellness centers are suitable partners. This was certainly the case in Lviv, where the women's wellness center was centrally located, under flexible and receptive management, and well equipped and inviting. This was not particularly the case in Odessa, however, where the women's wellness center was located miles away from the center, in a regional hospital, and seemed both underequipped and overbureaucratized.

Similarly, there seemed to be enthusiastic receptivity and a potentially good fit with CURE. The center's youth-focused media work offers new vistas for reaching this critical target group. Two good ideas emerged from the meeting with CURE: (1) a proposed teen radio talk show especially targeted to teen girls that would include both anti-trafficking and economic-opportunity content; and (2) a new video aimed at the same target group about (a) success stories of young women who, for example, were trained and then went on to found businesses in fields that teen girls would find appealing, and (b) horror stories of other young women who went abroad for what had been touted as high-paying jobs, only to find themselves trafficked and sold into forced prostitution.

AED, also, has relevant youth-oriented programming that holds promise for the future: its summer camps. The academy's programming includes both economic-opportunity initiatives and anti-trafficking-awareness messages. AED's October 2002 regional conference on anti-trafficking/economic efforts should provide an ideal venue for learning about and disseminating best practices and lessons learned.⁴

The findings discussed in this chapter illuminate not only the specific activities being carried out in Ukraine to reduce trafficking and/or enhance economic empowerment, but also the continuing threat posed by cross-border criminal activity to some of the most vulnerable groups of females in Ukraine.

There remains in the country a continuing supply of vulnerable girls and women: many still suffer from the post-Soviet economic meltdown, especially those living in rural areas, small towns, and cities that have not yet recovered economically. Other high-risk groups, such as orphans leaving the Internats, are very vulnerable but present programming problems (for example, state regulations preclude integrating them in ongoing programs such as women for women center training).

⁴ Unfortunately, time pressures precluded an exploration of the difficult problem of how to direct programming to orphans in Internats who are approaching 18 and an uncertain future in the outside world. They are prime targets for traffickers. More information is needed to determine whether they are a feasible future programming focus.

There is also the problem of continuing demand for vulnerable females. The profitability of the regional trafficking-for-coerced-sex networks has been demonstrated to the mafias that prey on the area. As profits grow, their incentives to ensnare even more vulnerable females rise apace.

ANALYSIS OF THE PRESENT ATP'S STRENGTHS, WEAKNESSES, AND IMPACT

1. **Some strengths: strong staff and appreciative clients.** The commitment, competence, and professionalism of the ATP staff and management—both at Kiev headquarters and in the centers in Lviv and Donetsk—are impressive and one of the main strengths of the program. The gratitude of the client group for the free services the centers offer also shone through in the fieldwork.
2. **Some weaknesses: a diffuse focus and lack of measurement of the market and results.** Whereas the WEE project, with its women's business support centers, has a single focus, the ATP's resources and energies are divided three ways:
 - ? First, there is the basic two-day course teaching job-seeking skills and anti-trafficking awareness, a reasonable introduction to both the dangers of being trafficked and the economic solution that eliminates the need for potentially disastrous forays abroad: finding a way to earn a living in Ukraine.
 - ? A second project component involves domestic-violence and crisis intervention (the hotline receives calls about both working abroad/trafficking and violence/crisis). This component requires norms of confidentiality and anonymity in dealing with clients that complicate any system of ongoing results monitoring. Yet, domestic violence has not been shown to have a strong link to trafficking; it is a factor but far from the main one. On the contrary, all empirical data indicate that lack of economic options within Ukraine drive many more women abroad than does the need to get away from domestic violence.
 - ? The ATP's third focus is skills training courses, which range from those in very high demand—computer courses—to those that seem to offer little likelihood of leading to making a living. Such offerings as tour guide training and jewelry making, to take two examples, seem to offer scant employment prospects. Other suggestions, such as the Lviv director's idea of offering sales courses, remain to be developed and market-tested. (The director thinks sales positions are more feasible for very young women than are careers as entrepreneurs.) Other existing courses, such as accounting, remain to be evaluated for their effectiveness in leading to paid work.

Another problem confronting the ATP is that the women for women centers, operating on extremely tight resources, have not done the kind of market analyses that should drive the types of courses it offers its target group. In fact, in the group meeting held in Kiev with the top staff in the seven centers, participants' suggestions

for future activities ran heavily toward forays into new territory without any feasibility studies to back their views. These coordinators wanted course offerings in “green tourism” training, training for unspecified service industries, and a general geographic expansion into more oblasts: each center would adopt a neighboring oblast and extend its existing range of services. Moreover, the project director suggested “more rural outreach” (also strongly suggested by the center coordinators), new programs for orphan (Internat) girls, and more training of trainers in order to handle the additional efforts planned.⁵ Such a strategy would exacerbate the three-way division of the project’s resources and preclude improving the performance of the kinds of courses that (a) clients want and (b) are likely to lead to jobs/income.

3. **A few words on project impact.** In a nutshell, the deficiencies in existing M&E systems preclude much more quantitative analysis of impact than the scant numbers and percentages that have been presented to this point. Rather, the rapid appraisal provided almost all the data for the qualitative view of the projects presented in this report. The impression is of much hard work by staff, generally good teaching in courses, and some increases in economic opportunities (more so for the WEE project business trainees than the ATP computer trainees). Also, the anti-trafficking—awareness and hotline efforts of the ATP seem to have had an impact, as measured by higher proportions of women saying they would not consider going abroad having been, versus not having been, exposed to ATP activities. Going abroad for work was never even mentioned as an option by any woman who had developed a business or found a job after taking ATP or WEE project training.
4. **Toward a revamped project.** Based on all the above, as is proposed in Chapter Three, future programming should emphasize true economic empowerment as the best preventive medicine against trafficking. This will require a totally redesigned M&E system that begins with a marketing analysis of open economic niches and the kinds of courses that could be developed to enable trainees to fill them. Such an M&E system also must be designed to measure the impact of each specific training course, so that effective courses can be retained and further improved while ineffective courses can be scrapped. As elaborated below, each course should be judged on a minimum of two criteria: (1) Is there labor market demand for people with the skills imparted by this course? (2) Is there demand for this course among the women of the target group?
 - ? The answer to the first question initially could be obtained with a market feasibility analysis. Then, a comprehensive M&E system could ascertain the percentage of trainees who were earning at least subsistence income X (and Y) months after training. This could enable the centers to tailor their offerings to what works in their local markets.
 - ? The answer to the second question could be obtained by analyzing enrollment figures, waiting lists, and course evaluations. Furthermore, courses could be steadily

⁵ On the positive side, she also pushed for more computers and software; formalized mentoring, internship, and apprentice programs; and a better M&E system, discussed below.

improved by including a qualitative component in any future M&E system, such as the rapid appraisal focus groups carried out for this assessment. Running a round of focus groups, say, every six months, could permit the courses to be improved in response to feedback about (a) the course, (b) trainees' job-search outcomes, and (c) changing economic conditions.

The present assessment clearly identified some concrete problems with the computer courses as they are presently offered: insufficient computers, space, hours of instruction, and practice time were mentioned in each focus group conducted with ATP clients who had taken the training. Yet, despite these deficiencies, waiting lists of about a thousand were encountered in both centers visited. This is an unmistakable indicator that women in the target group think this kind of training will result in employment.

What does this mean? The implications are that instead of proposing untested schemes for spreading their limited resources still thinner, in any future programming the women for women centers should focus on improving their economic-empowerment offerings and adopting a coherent system for measuring the results of their activities.

As for noneconomic programs, the authors observed in the centers studied crisis counselors hard at work on hotlines and the general air of a social service agency. The authors also saw, however, that center activities that focus on crisis intervention use up scarce resources that could be used to strengthen their economic training if it came to a "zero-sum game" in which the follow-on project had no more funding than the present one. Moreover, the centers lack the resources to carry crisis intervention to the next logical step: emergency shelters. They are doing valuable work, certainly, but how much of it should be the work of an anti-trafficking project that focuses on economic alternatives? Also, there was some indication that the centers are perceived by some members of the target group as restricted to women caught up in trafficking and crisis, not as places where they can learn skills to enable them to earn a livelihood. For example, one focus-group participant said she always had thought that the centers provided only services linked to trafficked women and crisis intervention. She came to take a center computer course only because a girlfriend had learned about it in the two-day basic job-skills/anti-trafficking-awareness training.

Ultimately, the level of resources available for follow-on programming should determine how much of the noneconomic activities, worthy as they are, should be continued in any future project. That being said, it might be extremely disruptive to the centers' staff and clients to terminate much of their "social service/crisis" side. It is hoped that some budgetary solution can be found that will not entail hotline counselors hanging up on calls about a domestic crisis and handling only those that involve working abroad/trafficking problems. For this reason, even in the recommended model discussed below, which assumes little additional funding, there is no suggestion to kill off the entire domestic violence/crisis efforts of the centers.

CHAPTER THREE

LESSONS LEARNED, MODELS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter briefly presents lessons learned, a discussion of a recommended model for future programming as well as two alternative models, and a series of recommendations that are forward-looking, aimed at future anti-trafficking programming with a strong economic focus.

LESSONS LEARNED

1. The authors encountered no indication that the magnitude of Ukraine’s trafficking problem is diminishing. For example, La Strada’s Kiev hotline received 11,054 calls about work abroad from November 1997 to June 2002 (approximately 200 per month). No one claimed that the volume of calls has been decreasing recently. Indeed, trafficking continues despite the recent stabilization of the Ukrainian economy at the macro level. The ongoing trafficking problem is due mainly to two factors:
 - ? On the supply side, there are many high-risk groups of young women and girls still suffering considerable economic distress, including those living in rural areas, small towns, and cities. Even many larger cities have not recovered economically. Other high-risk groups include orphans being turned out of state institutions when they turn 18.
 - ? On the demand side, the mafias that control the trafficking are increasingly well organized, and, as their profits grow, their incentives to extend what has become a regional operation continue to rise.
2. The current USAID ATP, which seeks to reduce trafficking by enhancing economic alternatives for the target group, has chosen what the authors view as the right strategy. Economic pressure and desperation clearly are the most important “push” factors driving young—and not-so-young—women to risk seeking work abroad. (If anything, the findings suggest that future programming should adopt an even more economically focused approach than is currently the case with the ATP—but not so exclusively economically oriented as to eliminate other useful activities, ranging from anti-trafficking–awareness training to hotlines.)
3. The ATP has several strengths. First, the authors found very dedicated and capable management and staff in Kiev, Lviv, and Donetsk. Second, the project can point to numerous successes in helping many women obtain basic computer and/or job-skills training. Third, the project also has been somewhat successful in that some of these women subsequently land jobs (although it may take some time). Although the actual rate of clients’ success in finding work after taking specific courses is unknown because of deficiencies in the current M&E system, it appears that fewer trainees are hired (13 percent) than those who take the WBSCs’ much more intensive training (20 percent, with

another near 30 percent opening or expanding their own businesses). In any event, the ATP's successes have been achieved even though it suffers from a great shortfall in basic resources. Specifically, neither women for women center visited for the fieldwork had anywhere near enough computers or space in which to carry out its activities—and, yet, somehow they served large numbers of eager clients, and word of mouth was such that they had long waiting lists for their most popular course: basic computer skills.

Conversely, the project is weakest with respect to measuring its results. As noted above, this problem persists because of the absence of a coherent M&E program that would start with market/feasibility studies and extend to a coherent system combining relevant quantitative-results indicators with qualitative measures of impact derived from periodic focus groups.

4. The other USAID-supported Winrock effort, the Women's Economic Empowerment (WEE) Project, also seems to have had very significant success despite the same lack of resources, computers, and space as the ATP. Its courses are much more intensive than the ATP's and are in high demand. Only the applicants with the best business ideas are selected. As noted in the preceding point, current M&E indicators show that more of these women subsequently find jobs than do those who take the women for women center computer course. Moreover, it should be reiterated that almost 30 percent of WBSC graduates open their own businesses (the goal of the training). It is highly relevant that they tend to employ their fellow trainees. On one hand, this indicates the quality of the training: presumably, they hire their fellow students because they consider them both competent and well trained. On the other hand, it indicates that the training serendipitously creates strong bonds and networks that have further economic ramifications (and that can be harnessed for civil society/advocacy purposes).
5. It bears emphasizing that the formation of a lively network of former WBSC trainees (with especially close ties between those in the same cohort) has been an unexpected payoff of the WEE project, and one with significance for the ATP as well as for the mission's economic growth and civil society/democracy and governance objectives.
6. Already there are some ties between the two projects (although there is much room—and need—for more such ties; see “Recommendations,” at the end of this chapter). In Donetsk, both centers operate from the same building (with a single director, although few such superwomen can be expected to appear; running one such program is more than a full-time job). Here, the linkages and synergies between the two projects are most evident and the promise of more such “two for one” payoffs in the future most manifest. Clearly, the Donetsk situation must be considered as a potential ideal model for future programming. Budgetary constraints might limit the extent to which the Donetsk model could be extended, but its effectiveness is such that in the recommended model described below, at least one or two replications are advocated for any follow-on programming.
7. The tightness of resources facing both projects must be reemphasized. Both have achieved a much higher degree of success than should have been expected from their highly constrained situations, as measured by the large numbers of women served as well

as the long waiting lists for each project’s most economically valuable training: the WBSCs’ intensive entrepreneurship course and the women for women centers’ computer skills training. The level of resources it would take to bring both projects to full fruition and achievement is relatively small. Moreover, some resources, such as low-cost space, already are being offered by the city authorities involved. This is particularly true in Donetsk, where an additional 22 square meters of space right across the hall from the WBSC could be made available by the city for less than \$15 a month, and a much larger space on the floor above could be made available to the women for women center, also at minimal cost. In Lviv, too, the city has offered very inexpensive space for training. In both Donetsk and Lviv, however, there is one string attached: these spaces need renovation. Three possible solutions emerge: (1) negotiating with city authorities to increase their counterpart contributions to include renovation of any space offered and, perhaps, further reduce the cost of that space; (2) modestly increasing the budget of the follow-on project to cover such urgent prerequisites for effective economically focused training; and (3) most disruptively, perhaps, freeing monies for more space and renovations by cutting down on noneconomic ATP activities, specifically those focused on domestic violence and crisis intervention.

8. Shelters—specifically the lack thereof—emerged as major constraints of the domestic-violence/crisis-intervention components of the ATP in Lviv and Donetsk. To be fully successful, an anti-trafficking program should be able to direct its endangered clients to such a refuge, and neither city currently has a shelter. Many of those being pushed toward work abroad not only are economically desperate but also are suffering domestic violence, another “push” factor. In addition, an unknown proportion of “returned women” who have come back to Ukraine after being trafficked are in imminent danger. Both groups would be well served by a shelter, but, as indicated above, shelters are expensive. Expanding the project in this direction in future programming, however, would further reduce the resources available for the economic activities that seem more widely valuable in preventing trafficking. Accordingly, even though the need for shelters was very apparent in the fieldwork, it may not be in the “comparative advantage” (or best interests) of the ATP to move in this direction in the future. Instead, providing shelters could be one of the advocacy targets of the networks of ATP and WEE project trainees envisioned in the model for future programming discussed below.
9. The age limits for the ATP seem artificially low. The project officially targets only females up to age 30, but women considerably above 30 can still be at high risk for trafficking. Also, it should be reiterated that the average age of the focus-group participants at the Lviv and Donetsk women for women centers was 27.8, with a substantial proportion past their 30th birthday. The 30+ women might be better candidates for entrepreneurship, as well. They could make a better target group for the WBSCs than the very young women who do not yet have many ideas about their future careers, let alone viable business ideas—which is the main selection criterion in the highly competitive WBSC intensive training programs.
10. Parenthetically, it was found that a few (but undocumented number of) men had taken courses at the Lviv Women for Women Center, despite its name.

11. It also was found that Odessa is a central and crucially important location for additional anti-trafficking programming that has an economic component. It is a center for trafficking routes and the place where two ships a week from Turkey return deported women. Yet, Odessa has no economic-alternatives programs. This seems to be a clear programming gap. If women are not given a viable alternative economic opportunity, they will continue to feel pressured to work abroad—and little trafficking will be prevented. Furthermore, if returned women are not given economic training, whatever medical and psychological help they receive will become irrelevant.
12. The research made it clear that the trafficking is regional and that Moldova, in particular, is a hub. Not only does a disproportionate share of trafficked women deported from Turkey to Odessa come from there, but Moldova was described by several NGOs as the main route through which Ukrainian women are trafficked to the Balkan countries. The lack of a regional focus seems to be a programming gap that could be filled in follow-on activities.
13. The research also showed that access to credit is a critical need for women who have been trained in entrepreneurship—and that this need is not being as well addressed by the credit unions involved in the WEE project as it could be. There are two chief reasons for this. First, the credit unions' two products may not fully fit clients' needs (a USAID-supported no-collateral loan is sufficiently above prevailing market rates of interest to be affordable for many start-ups, and the credit unions' regular loan programs require more collateral than most women trained by the Winrock/USAID-supported projects can muster). This is not meant to imply that some form of subsidized credit is needed. Dale Adams (1971, 1984) empirically established the 100-percent failure rate of subsidized credit decades ago, and the entire “microfinance movement” that grew to more than 20,000,000 clients by the start of the new millennium is built on the foundation that programs must charge an interest rate high enough to become sustainable in less than a decade (see Blumberg, 2001; Otero and Rhyne, 1994). Second, credit limits (\$2,000) also are quite low for some types of business. Although the best solution would appear to be “best practices” microfinance programs run by NGOs following the most appropriate model (such as the Acción International model, used successfully throughout Latin America), this is not presently possible in Ukraine. Until an NGO microfinance law is passed, the door to such programming remains bolted shut. Meanwhile, future design work to better fit credit union products with client needs could be carried out in follow-on programming.⁶
14. There are potentially important linkages with other mission programs and strategic objectives in the areas of health, economic growth, and democracy and governance/civil society.

⁶ Rodeina A. Fattah, the mission financial markets specialist, had some preliminary suggestions that merit further exploration.

- ? With respect to health, there is a potential link to the women’s wellness centers (at least those centers that are the least bureaucratized and are well located) and possible links to other health programs, also. The reason for such strong potential is that most health professionals lack the training in spotting or treating either women about to go abroad on a risky offer or those returned after having been trafficked. This training could be supplied by anti-trafficking experts and result in additional referrals to the anti-trafficking programs, resulting in a “win-win” situation for both sides.
- ? Links to economic growth could include a trained labor supply and newly minted entrepreneurs. The networks and professional associations created as spin-offs of the business training could focus on regulatory reform at the local level, currently a high USAID priority. The passage of an NGO microfinance law could be another advocacy target of the groups created by the Anti-Trafficking and Women’s Economic Empowerment projects. Such a law would have impact far beyond the present project or any future incarnation thereof.
- ? Links to civil society/democracy and governance could extend to active advocacy groups that would promote the interests of vulnerable groups, including women and/or micro, small, and medium-size businesses, by pushing for policy and regulatory reform—or implementation of existing rules. For example, in all cities, focus-group participants complained of highly discriminatory job announcements in newspapers and at employment centers. For some positions (for example, computer specialist), the ads stipulate “men only.” For others, many attributes, ranging from knowledge of computers and English to years of experience, are called for—and then the candidate may be required to be under age 25 (Chernigiv), 30 (Lviv), or 35 (Donetsk) and of attractive appearance. Although such ads already are technically against the law (they violate Article 22 of the Labor Code, per Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine et al., 2000:30), they are ubiquitous. Advocacy for local-level implementation of nondiscriminatory ads could enhance democracy/equity objectives.

15. Two potential programming gaps were identified with respect to young people:

- ? First, despite the inclinations of ATP staff, the research found no activities aimed at orphans, arguably one of Ukraine’s most vulnerable groups. Filling this potential gap, however, will require both additional resources and a somewhat different approach, as bureaucratic regulations prevent Internat orphans from being integrated into ongoing training activities of the ATP or WEE project. Instead, it appears that the activities would have to involve Internat oversight. The present assessment did not extend to Internat officials, and it is unclear whether they would be willing to provide enough in the way of counterpart contributions to make such an extension of programming feasible if follow-on activities do not receive a larger budget than in the current ATP.
- ? Second, a somewhat related programming gap also emerged with respect to youths in general. The only initiatives aimed at youths are summer camps (the AED’s and Faith, Hope and Love’s) that provide training in both anti-trafficking and economic/job skills. The teen radio talk show and videos proposed by CURE for the youth market seem relevant for any new focus on teens, but targeting youths (and orphans) requires new resources, rather than adding more work for projects and staff

already hard-pressed to meet the demand for their services from their current clientele base.

- ? If no additional monies will be available for follow-on activities, funding one or both of the aforementioned new areas would depend on (a) trimming other parts of the existing program, such as the domestic-violence interventions, which might be disruptive, and/or (b) obtaining funds from other sources, such as the government, the private sector, and other NGOs and donors. In other words, if no additional resources will be available for follow-on activities, this potentially important new programming focus would have to be evaluated in competition with other requirements that seem more central, such as obtaining more computers and software and suitably renovated, low-cost space in which to house them.

A SUGGESTED MODEL FOR FOLLOW-ON PROGRAMMING AND TWO ALTERNATIVES

All three models presented below—the recommended one, which is described first, the higher resource version of the model, which is presented second, and the ATP staff’s “wish list” model that emerged from interviews with top management and women for women center coordinators—are viewed as sharing the same objective. Paraphrasing the statement of work, this may be stated as follows:

Key objective: Preventing trafficking by providing target-group women with more economic opportunities to earn a living in Ukraine.

The recommended model is presented as something that will not require much in the way of additional resources for programming within Ukraine. However, recommendations for expanding the program to adopt a regional focus, including, at minimum, Moldova, would be contingent on obtaining additional funding to do so.

The Suggested Follow-on Model

First and foremost, USAID/Kiev seems to have found a unique niche among donors vis-à-vis anti-trafficking efforts. Its approach emphasizing economic alternatives/empowerment is within the comparative advantage of the mission and attacks what has been found repeatedly to be the strongest “push” factor in trafficking: lack of economic opportunities in Ukraine for vulnerable groups of young women. By further streamlining and focusing follow-on efforts on activities that help these young women earn their own livings without leaving the country, USAID would be building on its areas of strength.

If the new effort included the right kind of M&E system, the impact of the follow-on programming could be demonstrated to and, perhaps, emulated by other donors who currently pay little or no attention to the main reason why young women leave their native land and expose themselves to the risk of being trafficked. Annex D summarizes the activities of these other donors and NGOs.

Following are the main points of the recommended model:

? **Emphasize economic-skills training courses that should be chosen, retained, or dropped on the basis of specific criteria indicating their level of market demand.**

Here is a preliminary list of suggested criteria:

- + A feasibility study shows that a market niche exists in this locality such that trainees could get jobs;
- + Student demand is demonstrated by, at minimum, full enrollment and, even more significantly, by the existence and length of a waiting list;
- + Student satisfaction with the course is demonstrated both by evaluations filled out at the end of the course and by periodic focus groups of trainees; and
- + Student success in obtaining income within a given time frame after receiving training is arguably the most important criterion and should be assessed by follow-up monitoring of trainees, say, three and six months after the conclusion of training (the focus groups suggested in the preceding point could be a supplemental qualitative measure of this criterion).

Existing courses should be assessed using these criteria in baseline research undertaken in the early phases of a follow-on project. Those that fail should be dropped from the curriculum. New suggested courses, such as sales, information technology (including Internet training), more advanced accounting or computer courses, and basic business English, would be vetted on the basis of open niches in a given locality, student demand when they were offered on a trial basis, student evaluation of the courses, and student success in gaining a livelihood following training.

? **Obtain first-rate M&E consulting as close to the start of follow-on activities as possible, in order to develop a first-rate M&E system to guide the project's ongoing activities and measure its impact.**

The M&E consultant(s) must have backgrounds in both economic feasibility studies and, even more important, mixed systems that combine quantitative indicators and analysis with periodic (mostly qualitative) rapid appraisals.

- + The system should include periodic market/feasibility studies to identify economic niches that target-group women could fill if provided with appropriate training. Indeed, some market/feasibility studies should be built into the consultancy as part of a baseline effort.
- + Even if a particular course is requested by large numbers of women, it should not be offered if the feasibility study does not indicate that it would result in income/employment.
- + Quantitative indicators could measure variables that serve not only as good monitoring/results indicators for the project but also as indicators that might correlate with women's reduced vulnerability to trafficking. Examples include:
 - a. The number and percentage of clients who take particular courses;
 - b. The length of the waiting list in terms of names and time to get into particular courses;
 - c. The average satisfaction level at the end of a course, measured on a 5- or 10-point scale;

- d. The pre- versus post-training number and percentage of women who say they are considering going abroad for work;
 - e. The number and percentage of trainees in each specific course who have found work after a specified number of months; and
 - f. The number and proportion of trainees who feel that they are making a reasonable living with their post-training jobs or businesses.
- + All this information should be entered into a database.
 - + In addition, norms of confidentiality should be dropped for those enrolling in training courses (confidentiality should be maintained for users of any crisis-intervention services, of course), and application forms should make it clear that registering in this free training obligates the client to respond to compulsory monitoring questionnaires X and Y months after training. It also should be clearly stated that if a trainee does not respond, she would not be eligible for further free training.
 - + Application forms should ask for more background information, especially about the socioeconomic and sociodemographic characteristics of applicants. These data also should be entered into a database.
 - + The M&E consultant(s) should set up an SPSS (Statistical Package for the Social Sciences, ideally version 10.0 if the manual for this version has already been translated) on various computers (at minimum in project headquarters but ideally in every project location), so that the quantitative data in the database can be analyzed.
 - + The M&E consultant(s) should train at least one staff person in every location with SPSS to perform the (surprisingly easy) analyses.
 - + In this way, it will be possible to construct profiles of the trainees who are most (and, perhaps, least) likely to get a job after taking particular courses, the success rates of individual courses over time, and, for the WEE project, the types of trainee enterprises that are most (and least) likely to provide employment for other female trainees. This will permit further refinement of project activities and targeting.
 - + The M&E consultant(s) should design an integrated package that also includes periodic rapid appraisal focus groups (for ongoing monitoring and measurement of results/impact) and train at least one staff person in every project location to run these focus groups once or (better) twice a year.
 - + The M&E consultant should, ideally, design the systems for both the new ATP and for the WEE project, so a synergistic overview of both their efforts and results/impact could be available to management and USAID/Kiev. One of the indicators that should be incorporated into the WEE project system is the hiring of fellow trainees (from the same versus a different cohort) by women starting or developing their own businesses.
 - + In fact, it is still early enough in the recently extended WEE project for this sort of M&E consultancy to design a better, more comprehensive system that would be extremely valuable in measuring success.
- ? **For the next round of the ATP, continue with Winrock International and the women for women centers.** The present assessment showed that (a) they are doing well, and (b) no other organizations were identified that could provide an alternative.

- ? **Prioritize resources for the follow-on programming to eliminate the deficiencies in the centers' computer courses; if no further resources are available, this might require some shifts of emphasis.** In the worst-case analysis, this would entail a shift of resources away from domestic-violence/crisis-intervention activities.
 - + The next phase of the ATP should provide resources for enough computers and software and appropriately renovated space to house them, in order to cut into the waiting list and to improve the quality and employment ratios of the training.
 - + Computer classes in the women for women centers visited in Lviv and Donetsk could use double to quadruple the number of computers they have currently (both have four that work, at the moment), which would require a corresponding increase in suitable space, additional furniture, and so on.
 - a. There should be active attempts to tap into various U.S. philanthropic funds that provide computers and software (again, it is reiterated that software is as high a priority as are computers).
 - b. City and other levels of government should be approached for the space and whatever it takes to fill it, such as renovations and furniture/equipment.

- ? **Attempt more integration and synergy between the ATP and the WEE project, even when they are not in the same cities.** This could involve:
 - + An additional database of both projects' trainees, classified by location, skills (ATP and WEE), business (WEE grads only), and basic background variables (age, education, and such);
 - + Coordinated networking projects to lobby local authorities on cross-cutting issues;
 - + Information on job availability and wide-open economic niches, derived from (a) employment listings from WEE grads, (b) relevant employment listings from government employment centers (by oblast, in those locations where the projects operate), and, perhaps, (c) other sources, such as NGOs or private employment agencies;
 - + Coordination with local business and professional women's leagues or other relevant NGOs;
 - + Periodic conference calls involving staffs from both projects;
 - + Occasional meetings involving staffs from both projects; and
 - + Perhaps an annual fair in a location where female trainees from several WBSCs and women for women centers in the same region can meet to network and exchange products, services, and ideas.

- ? **Open at least one or two new ATP or WEE centers in order to have more cities with the "two for one" model that currently operates only in Donetsk.** This should entail opening a women for women center in Chernigiv or another city where a WBSC presently operates, and, resources permitting, a WBSC in Lviv or another city where a women for women center is currently functioning.
 - + Each of these new centers would require its own director.
 - + Extending the "two for one" model beyond Donetsk could provide a laboratory for testing other methods of better integrating the two projects.

- ? **If resources permit, expand the follow-on ATP geographically to Odessa.**

- + As a preliminary approach, the Women’s Association of Odessa could take on the bulk of the economically focused training courses while Faith, Hope and Love would provide the anti-trafficking messages and noneconomic assistance. Later, Faith, Hope and Love could be targeted for its own array of economic training activities.
 - + Expanding to Odessa will make it easier to extend the project to a regional effort incorporating, at minimum, Moldova, as discussed below. In fact, if there are available funds for the regional expansion, these might be tapped to fund the extension of ATP activities to Odessa, as the city is a major port through which trafficking—including regional trafficking involving Moldova—takes place.
- ? **If additional resources are available, expand the project into a regional effort involving, at minimum, Moldova.**
- + This should be contingent on obtaining additional funding. Otherwise, it is not recommended that resources be drained from the project’s existing activities and geographic foci to go beyond Ukraine’s borders.
 - + As a first step toward regional expansion, there should be a study assessing existing programs in Moldova (and, perhaps, Belarus) and the organizational strength of the NGOs and entities operating and funding them. The study could involve a somewhat similar statement of work as the present effort in that there also should be some attempt to assess the impact of these efforts in Moldova by qualitative/rapid appraisal means that include speaking with clients as well as the institutions’ management and staff.
- ? **In the follow-up programming, expand the base of support for anti-trafficking and economic activities, with the ultimate goal of starting these economically oriented anti-trafficking efforts down the road to sustainability.** Here are some possibilities:
- + Closer ties with government should be forged. In particular, city authorities and state employment centers in locations where the project is operating should be lobbied to increase counterpart contributions. City authorities should be approached for not only additional space at token rates, where it is needed, but also for the commitment to renovate that space, if necessary. This is already being done in Odessa, which makes expansion there more feasible with tight resources.
 - + Closer ties with the private sector should be attempted, perhaps starting with some collaboration with BIZPRO or other USAID partners in cities where overlap exists. (More ties with business are outlined below in the point about internship and apprentice programs.)
 - + Advanced courses, especially those offered to women who are not unemployed, could be offered for a suggested “donation” to the WBSC involved. This would not violate the rules under which the women for women centers and the WBSCs are organized as NGOs. As a matter of fact, the WBSCs already have launched some pilot activities asking for “donations” for follow-up services to trainees.
- ? **Design follow-on activities to interface with other mission strategic objectives in the areas of health, economic growth, and democracy and governance.** Some suggestions have been proposed above. In addition, early in the design stage for follow-on activities,

brainstorming meetings should be held with the relevant mission offices to identify possibilities for fruitful cooperation.

- ? **Add formal components of on-site consultants (who would be paid through “donations”) to WBSCs and consider them for women for women centers, as well.**
 - + For the WBSCs, the specific on-site consultants (who would be part-time) would be selected based on (a) demand by trainees, as determined by a follow-up questionnaire, and (b) the willingness of specific consultants to undertake some consulting at a rate that would not be beyond the reach of the trainees.
 - + Some consultants, such as those who can explain government regulations on small business, taxation policies, and the like, could be provided by the appropriate government entity as part of the increased contribution from national, oblast, and local authorities called for above. This might result in lower or no “donations” for such assistance.

- ? **Develop formal apprenticeship and internship programs for both projects (ATP and the WEE project).**
 - + Businesses would be required to pay some costs (even if these are quite low) for their apprentices and/or interns, based on the frequently confirmed principle that people value things more if they pay for them.
 - + There should be a trial period of no more than six months, after which the trainee would be offered permanent employment unless cause could be established for not hiring her.

- ? **Expand to new target groups, such as Internat orphans and youths in general, contingent on obtaining enough resources to do so without cramping efforts to bring ATP skills courses up to par (by providing more computers, for example).**
 - + This would mean collaboration with government, private-sector, or other donors and NGOs.
 - a. Specifically, for Internat orphans, collaboration would be required with appropriate government officials, who also would have to provide some counterpart contributions.
 - b. For youth programs in general, the first initiatives should involve the media projects suggested by CURE and the summer camps already being run by the AED and, perhaps, Faith, Hope and Love in Odessa.

The Model Based on a Larger Expected Budget

The discussion of where additional resources would be most useful is arranged in descending order of importance.

The most important differences between this and the preceding model involve the level of effort with respect to the following:

- + Computers/software and appropriately renovated and furnished space in which to use them (including an extra telephone line for information-technology/Internet courses), and
- + The number of “two for one” cities where both the ATP and the WEE project operate centers.

First, with respect to computers, for each existing women for women center, an assessment should be undertaken to determine the number of computers that would be needed to guarantee that:

- (1) Each person in a class could have sole access to a computer (with software, of course) during instruction (that is, students would no longer be forced to share a computer with a classmate while the instructor is teaching);
- (2) Each person in a class could sign up for a number of practice hours at least equal to the number of hours of instruction; and
- (3) The number of hours of instruction could be expanded, and the number of weeks over which those hours are offered could be stretched out, as needed, to meet a minimum standard based on what both trainees and a sample of potential employers in the locality say is needed to make a trainee attractive as a potential employee.

Second, with respect to appropriate space, there need not be as strong a need to have city authorities pay for all renovations or provide basic furniture and equipment—although it still would be desirable to use the level of counterpart contribution as an additional criterion for choosing a city for expansion if two candidates were at about the same economic level (see the next point).

Third, with respect to “two for one” cities that boast both a women for women center and a WBSC (under separate directors), the ideal would be to expand into four cities, as follows:

- (1) Two cities, each having only a WBSC, would get a women for women center, and
- (2) Two cities, each having only a women for women center, would get a WBSC.

These could be phased in so that in year one, two cities would get their “two for one” missing programs, and in year two, the other two cities chosen for expansion would get their missing programs.

- + In terms of geographic dispersion, after expansion to Lviv and Chernigiv in year one, the remaining two cities should be chosen based on the poor state of the local economy. Thus, the last two “two for one” cities would be those with the lowest level of economic recovery, and, hence, higher levels of women vulnerable to trafficking.

A total of five cities (including Donetsk) thus would have “two for one” status. This could vastly facilitate synergy between the two projects, along the lines suggested in the previous model.

The second-most important differences between this and the suggested follow-on model concern geographic and target-group expansion beyond the present foci of the ATP and the WEE project.

Geographic Expansion

First, with a higher level of resources, expansion to Odessa, using a local equivalent of the “two for one” model, is ensured.

Second, with Odessa included in follow-on activities, regional expansion to Moldova and perhaps beyond is significantly facilitated. Given that Odessa is not that far from the capital of Moldova, coordination is made easier.

Target-Group Expansion

First, there would be enough resources to ensure that the radio talk show and videos proposed by CURE could be produced. These would target teenage girls with content about both economic opportunities and the dangers of trafficking and could have national-level coverage.

Second, provided there is sufficient interest and cooperation on the part of Internat authorities, the proposed expansion to orphans could take place. An initial pilot program would be needed to test the kinds of economic opportunities—and anti-trafficking messages—that are most appropriate for this exceptionally vulnerable group.

Third, provided that the ATP had solved the computer/space shortage problems, some selective support could be offered for some of the “wish list” suggestions made by top management and center coordinators. As discussed in the third model, below, the latter proposed “traveling road shows” to bring the basic two-day anti-trafficking–awareness/job-skills training to smaller cities and towns, as well as selected rural areas, in oblasts that already have women for women centers. The managers and coordinators also proposed an “adopt a neighboring oblast” outreach effort that would expand the traveling road shows, perhaps backed by one-person satellite offices, to seven more oblasts.

The third-most important difference between the suggested follow-on model and the model based on a larger expected budget is that the latter would place little or no pressure on the women for women centers to cut drastically or even abandon their domestic-violence/crisis-intervention efforts. To the contrary, funds might even be available to help expand those efforts to the next level: urgently needed shelters.

- ? **Easing the pressure to wind down aid to women in crisis.** Although economic opportunities are more important than violence/crisis situations in pushing women into

work abroad (with the attendant risk of being trafficked into sexual slavery), domestic violence is a factor in trafficking, and few NGOs in Ukraine are dealing with the problem. The “organizational cultures” of the two women for women centers visited in Lviv and Donetsk clearly embrace a social-service orientation rather than a pure economic-empowerment orientation. Studies in business management literature have found that changing organizational culture can be difficult. If the ATP’s crisis-intervention efforts were significantly cut, the staff of the centers would have to overcome feelings that they were abandoning a group of desperate women to a fate that could include injury, trafficking, or even death. This could compromise the centers’ effectiveness in carrying out the remaining economic and anti-trafficking–awareness aspects of their missions.

- ? **Helping to open pilot shelters in at least two cities.** The fieldwork in both Donetsk and Lviv showed the urgent need for a refuge for endangered women—a need no one is supplying at the moment. Even under an expanded resource model, it seems “off target” to undertake the sole burden of operating a shelter that may serve few women in imminent danger of being trafficked (or re-trafficked). With the women for women centers providing some seed money, however, other donors and/or city authorities might be persuaded to contribute enough to sustain a shelter.

A fourth important difference between the larger-budget model and the preceding model is that with the former, as outlined in a recommendation below, more resources could mean closer integration with USAID efforts in health, economic growth, and democracy/governance.

The Model Based on ATP Staff “Wish List” Recommendations

The contents of the ATP staff’s “wish list,” which are presented in earlier sections of this report, offer some suggestions that are perfectly in line with the suggestions of the preceding models, such as:

- ? Acquiring more computers and software for computer-skills training,
- ? Having a consultant design a systematic M&E program,
- ? Fostering more linkages between the ATP and the WEE project centers, and
- ? Offering formal programs involving mentoring, internships, and apprenticeships.

Other of the staff’s suggestions, however, fall at the lower end of perceived importance in the high-resource model just discussed. These include:

- ? Promoting more rural outreach via traveling road shows,
- ? Adopting a neighboring oblast, and
- ? Providing services to orphanage (Internat) girls.

Without a substantial commitment of new resources, expanding into these areas could easily dilute the impact of the economic (and even anti-trafficking–awareness) activities that the

authors recommend emphasizing in the follow-on project. The expression “a mile wide and an inch deep” comes to mind when one contemplates adding all three types of activities to centers that already are stretched too thin to provide adequate backing even to their centerpiece economic training, the computer courses.

A third group of suggestions falls even farther along the “wish list” continuum, in the opinion of the authors. These include:

- ? More intensive work with “returned women” to prevent a second trafficking,
- ? “Green tourism” training (with no call for feasibility/market niche studies), and
- ? Training for (unspecified) service industries (again, with no call for studies of the market).

In the authors’ opinion, these kinds of suggestions, well-meaning though they may be, are not as important as the others to achieving the key objective of the follow-on project, as stated above.

In short, all but the third group of suggestions above are equivalent to others in the two models already presented, and there seems to be no case for investing in the third group at this time. Therefore, only the first two models need be considered from this point on, with the level of resource commitment influencing the final selection of activities adopted for future programming.

RECOMMENDATIONS

This report has emphasized that (1) economic opportunities are the best way to reduce trafficking, and (2) USAID/Kiev is “ahead of the curve” in its work on anti-trafficking because it seems to have the most economically oriented program of any donor or organization encountered in the assessment (both the ATP and the WEE project emphasize economic empowerment, although the ATP less so than the WEE project).

The preceding section presented three preliminary models that might inform the design of follow-on ATP activities but dismissed the third “wish list” alternative. The remaining models—the recommended model and the high-resource version—both suggest continuing with Winrock International and the women for women centers while strengthening the ATP’s integration with Winrock’s WEE project and women’s business support centers. These two models are formulated in a way that strengthens the economic emphasis of the existing ATP while addressing what is arguably its biggest weakness: M&E.

Specifically, the revamped monitoring and evaluation system in the first two models would add economic feasibility studies and set up a regimen involving both quantitative and qualitative/rapid appraisal data that could be combined to present a picture useful to management while offering a set of snapshots of project results and impact over time.

This recommendations section essentially recasts the above points in the form of numbered suggestions and further elaborates on other previously discussed possibilities, such as closer integration of the new ATP with other mission strategic objectives.

In sum, based on the findings, lessons learned, and the first two models, the authors make the following recommendations:

1. Given that the lack of local economic opportunity is the most powerful factor driving women abroad, the strongest prevention programs would be those providing them with the means to earn a living in Ukraine. Accordingly, it is recommended that a strongly economically focused ATP be continued, preferably as part of a larger, more regionally focused and expanded anti-trafficking effort.
2. Specifically, it is recommended that the future programming should (a) even more strongly emphasize providing the target group with viable economic opportunities, (b) expand to (at least) Moldova, and, if and only if resources are available, (c) expand to additional vulnerable high-risk groups. As discussed below, these groups could include orphans in state institutions, youths in general, and, given sufficient additional resources—which seems unlikely—young women living in smaller cities, towns, and villages than those presently being served.
3. It is recommended that Winrock International’s role in the Anti-Trafficking Project be continued, with two provisos:
 - a. That Winrock relax the upper age limits for the target group served by the women for women centers in order to serve women up to approximately age 40 (the fieldwork indicated that the risk of being trafficked does not end at age 30); and
 - b. That, even more important, it contract a monitoring and evaluation consultant to organize an integrated, results-oriented data collection effort from the early days of any new funding.

As further detailed in the first model above, the M&E consultant should help Winrock establish impact indicators that correlate with women’s reduced vulnerability to trafficking, such as the number and proportion of trainees who manage to obtain work or start/develop a business within X months of training; the number/proportion of these trainees who derive a reasonable living; the socioeconomic and sociodemographic characteristics of the women most—and least—likely to better their economic situation following training; the types of trainee enterprises that are most—and least—likely to provide employment for other female trainees, and so on. The consultant also should train specifically designated staff to collect, analyze, and use the agreed-upon M&E data for programming and reporting purposes. The system should not be based only on quantitative indicators but also should entail economic/market niche studies as well as periodic focus groups.

4. Elaborating on the above, in order to increase the project’s ability to provide viable economic opportunities and marketable-skills training, it is recommended that (a) additional computers/software be provided for both the ATP and the WEE project’s

respective centers (women for women and WBSC), because for the ATP, in particular, computer instruction is the course in highest demand; and (b) courses for the future ATP be “demand-tested,” as suggested in the first model above. This means:

- a. ATP computers and accompanying software should be, at minimum, doubled, with corresponding cuts on noneconomic programming if no additional resources are available.
 - b. Strong efforts should be made to obtain donated computers and software from U.S. foundations, USAID programs, and so on, so that other components of the project do not suffer and the number of computers (with software) can be increased sufficiently to meet demand—perhaps tripled or even quadrupled in the case of the ATP—thereby reducing the waiting lists to less than a one-month wait.
 - c. The criteria for “demand-testing” courses described in the first model should be adopted and applied to present and proposed women for women centers and WBSC course offerings.
 - + In this way, existing offerings, ranging from accounting to jewelry making, should be vetted and continued, expanded, or dropped.
 - + Proposed new offerings, such as information technology/Internet training (which would require a second phone line), basic business English, sales techniques, and even such “wish list” suggestions as “green tourism” courses, should be similarly tested, with only those offering viable income prospects adopted.
5. As noted earlier, future anti-trafficking activities should entail a regional focus if additional funds are available, with Moldova, in particular, being a site for programming initiatives. Moldova is suggested because of:
 - a. The regional nature of the trafficking networks and the centrality of Moldova both as a source of trafficked women and as the main route for trafficking Ukrainian women into the Balkans, and
 - b. The probable availability of additional funds and the fact that several anti-trafficking programs already operate in Moldova.
 6. Assuming that there are resources that could be tapped for a regional project, it is recommended that the first step should be a consultancy to Moldova (and perhaps Belarus) that assesses (a) the trafficking and economic problems besetting young women in the target group, and (b) existing donors, organizations, and programs attacking these problems. Such an assessment, further, should be carried out in all countries that might be candidates for the regional expansion of the follow-on anti-trafficking project.
 7. In light of the importance of promoting livelihoods for high-risk women, it is recommended that cooperation be maintained—and strengthened—between the Winrock-executed follow-on ATP and WEE project. This would involve cooperation between the WEE project’s WBSCs and the ATP’s women for women centers.
 8. Even without geographic proximity between the ATP and WEE project centers, some linkages can be forged along the lines suggested above in the discussion of the first model. Because the fieldwork revealed that the best model was the “two for one” in Donetsk, where the women for women center and the WBSC operate on adjacent floors

of the same building, it is strongly recommended that in future programming initiatives, this model be replicated wherever feasible. The first model, which assumes little if any additional funding, recommends opening the “missing center” in only one or two more cities. The second model, which assumes fewer resource constraints, recommends expanding the Donetsk model to as many as four cities. In either case, one additional proviso is also recommended: that each center have its own director, as running one center constitutes at least a full-time job for most individuals.

9. Given that it is impossible to squeeze any more computers or training into the cramped existing quarters of the centers visited, additional space is needed. It is recommended that links with city authorities be strengthened so that they supply appropriately renovated space and, if possible, basic furnishings as a counterpart contribution. Because it appears that most city authorities already are willing to provide space at minimal cost, what should be promoted is their also assuming most or all of the burden of making the space usable.
10. Currently, the number of hours of instruction provided in the women for women centers’ basic computer course is insufficient (only 8 to 10 hours, with no possibility of additional practice time). In order to transfer the centers’ computer training into marketable skills, it is recommended that (a) the number of hours of computer instruction be increased to what demand studies show facilitates employment, and (b) additional computer time be made available to all students so they can practice.
11. If cooperation with the WBSCs is to be strengthened, it is recommended that additional loan products—and/or providers—be considered in addition to those currently offered in the credit component of the WEE project. This is a challenge in which Rodeina A. Fattah, the mission financial markets specialist, has expressed interest. As discussed above, the products of the credit unions currently involved in the WEE project may not offer the best fit with target-group needs.
12. In order to move USAID-supported anti-trafficking efforts toward sustainability, it is recommended that the practice already begun by the WBSCs of providing follow-up advanced training and/or services to graduates in return for “donations” (that are permitted despite the centers’ nonprofit NGO status) be extended to future ATP programs. It is also recommended that women for women center basic job and computer-skills training for unemployed women in high-risk groups remain free of charge.
13. It is recommended that increased links with (a) the private sector and (b) various government entities be pursued.
 - a. The private sector should be approached to sponsor mentoring, consulting, internship, and apprenticeship programs, as detailed in the first model above.
 - b. Concerning the public sector, in addition to liaising with city authorities for additional serviceable space at minimal or no cost, the future ATP should create joint programs with relevant agencies such as oblast job centers. Also, in the event that programming aimed at Internat orphans is considered, cooperation and counterpart contributions from Internat officials should be developed.

14. Increased links should be created with three areas supported by the mission: health, economic growth, and democracy/governance.
- a. With respect to linkages between anti-trafficking and health efforts, it is recommended that ties be established with women’s wellness centers only where they are conveniently located and are well equipped and not mired in bureaucracy. Therefore, it is also recommended that other providers be investigated. Health program personnel could be trained by anti-trafficking staff to recognize women about to go abroad and those just returned from being trafficked and refer them to anti-trafficking programs, to the advantage of both sides.
 - b. With respect to the mission’s economic growth activities, linkages could include advocacy efforts by the strong networks and businesswomen’s associations created by the projects, especially among the cohorts of the women’s business support center trainees. For example, such groups could lobby for regulatory reform at the local level and/or for an end to illegal (but ubiquitous) job ads that discriminate by gender, age, appearance, and so on. They could also provide links (by becoming training providers, for example) for USAID partners such as BIZPRO.
 - c. With respect to linkages with the mission’s democracy and governance/civil society activities, the networks themselves promote civic participation and consciousness. The specific advocacy efforts these networks could spearhead constitute another link. Therefore, it is recommended that training in advocacy and negotiation with local authorities be considered as a joint activity with other strategic objectives as part of future programming initiatives.
15. In addition to having a regional focus, new programming initiatives should include Odessa, if at all possible within resource constraints. Its importance as a port of entry and exit for trafficked women and its exceptional anti-trafficking NGO, Faith, Hope and Love, are in themselves sufficient to justify Odessa’s inclusion, but, in addition, the city offers other NGOs and linkages to health organizations.
16. In order to complement any future economically focused anti-trafficking efforts, the following suggestions should be investigated based on (a) their potential for reducing females’ vulnerability to trafficking, and (b) the availability of additional resources, so that programming aimed at increasing economic opportunities would not have to be constrained:
- a. Additional high-risk subgroups should be considered as possible targets. These include:
 - + Teenage orphans in the state institutions (Internats);
 - + Youths attending summer camps, such as those run by the AED, that include training in both anti-trafficking and economic opportunities; and
 - + Women and girls in rural areas and small towns, as proposed by Winrock International management and women for women center coordinators.
 - b. Media outreach to youths—which can be fairly inexpensive—should be explored. CURE operates media programs that might be particularly useful for reaching youths. CURE is receptive, as well, to preparing additional materials that would be directly relevant. For example, a proposed radio talk show aimed at teen girls could include

both anti-trafficking and economic-opportunity messages. A proposed video that presents success stories of young women who took skills training courses and found jobs or founded their own enterprises could be a useful complement to scare tactics that present the horror stories of those who thought they were going abroad for work and ended up being trafficked into sexual slavery.

- c. Additional exchanges of information, such as AED regional conferences devoted to anti-trafficking and economic alternatives, should be considered for partial support to reap the benefit of the lessons learned and best practices emerging elsewhere in the region.

To recap, the main conclusions of this report are that (1) the important work of combating trafficking should continue to be a USAID/Kiev priority; (2) future programming should emphasize economic options that would permit the prime target group to make a decent living in Ukraine, thereby reducing trafficking; and (3) Winrock International should continue to be involved in future programming, but its efforts should be made more effective with the insistence that (a) a comprehensive M&E system be designed and implemented to measure results/impact and guide selection/retention of economically viable courses; and (b) to the extent resources permit, shortfalls in computers and space be addressed and more “two for one” centers using the Donetsk model be created. Finally, also depending on resource availability, some geographic expansion to Odessa and Moldova should be considered, along with possible expansion of activities aimed at other vulnerable groups (youths, orphans, and, perhaps, some depressed small towns and rural areas).

As a concluding note, the new USAID/Washington WID project, involving various IQCs, is slated to begin in the next few months. This could provide another source of resources for carrying out some of the recommendations discussed in this report.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Adams, Dale W. 1971. "Agricultural Credit in Latin America: A Critical Review of External Funding Policy." *American Journal of Agricultural Economics* 53(2):163–172.

———. 1984. "Are the Arguments for Cheap Rural Credit Sound?" Pp. 65–77 in *Undermining Rural Development with Cheap Credit*, edited by Dale W. Adams, Douglas Graham and John D. Von Pischke. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.

Blumberg, Rae Lesser. 1978. *Stratification: Socioeconomic and Sexual Inequality*. Dubuque, Iowa: Wm. C. Brown.

———. 1984. "A General Theory of Gender Stratification." Pp. 23–100 in *Sociological Theory 1984*, edited by Randall Collins. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

———. 1988. "Income Under Female vs. Male Control: Hypotheses from a Theory of Gender Stratification and Data from the Third World." *Journal of Family Issues*, 9(1), March: 51–84.

———. 1989a. *Making the Case for the Gender Variable: Women and the Wealth and Well-being of Nations*. Washington, D.C.: Agency for International Development/Office of Women in Development.

———. 1989b. "Toward a Feminist Theory of Development." Pp. 161–199 in *Feminism and Sociological Theory*, edited by Ruth A. Wallace. Newbury Park, California: Sage.

———. 1991a. "Introduction: The 'Triple Overlap' of Gender Stratification, Economy, and the Family." Pp. 7–32 in *Gender, Family, and Economy: The Triple Overlap*. Newbury Park, California, and London: Sage.

———, ed. 1991b. *Gender, Family, and Economy: The Triple Overlap*. Newbury Park, California, and London: Sage.

———. 1993. "The Political Economy of the Mother-Child Family: New Perspectives on a Theory." Pp. 13–52 in *Where Did All the Men Go?: Women-Headed Households in Cross-Cultural Perspective*, edited by Joan Mencher and Anne Okongwu. Boulder, Colorado: Westview.

———. 1995. "Engendering Wealth and Well-being in an Era of Economic Transformation." Pp. 1–16 in *Engendering Wealth and Well-being*, edited by Rae Lesser Blumberg, Cathy A. Rakowski, Irene Tinker and Michael Monteon. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.

———. 2001. “We Are Family: Gender, Microenterprise, Family Work and Well-being in Ecuador and the Dominican Republic—with Comparative Data from Guatemala, Swaziland and Guinea-Bissau.” *History of the Family: An International Quarterly*, 6(2):271–299.

——— and Alexandra Maryanski. 2001. “The ‘Created Biology’ of Gender Stratification.” Paper presented at the annual meetings of the American Sociological Association. August.

Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, State Committee of Statistics of Ukraine, UNDP Promoting Gender Equality Project. 2000. “Gender Statistics for Monitoring the Progress in the Area of Equality Between Women and Men.” Kiev, Ukraine: UNDP.

Dudwick, Nora, Radhika Srinivasan and Jeanine Braithwaite. 2002. *Ukraine Gender Review*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank. Social Development Unit—Europe and Central Asia Region.

Goldin, Claudia. 1986. “The Female Labor Force and American Economic Growth.” In *Long Term Factors in American Economic Growth*, edited by Stanley Engerman and Robert Gallman. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Heise, Lori, with Jacqueline Pitanguy and Adrienne Germain. 1994. “Violence Against Women: The Hidden Health Burden.” World Bank Discussion Paper 255. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Hess, Peter. 1988. *Population Growth and Socio-Economic Progress in Less Developed Countries: Determinants of Fertility Transition*. New York: Praeger.

Inter-Parliamentary Union. 1998. “Women in Politics” (chart). Geneva, Switzerland: Inter-Parliamentary Union.

———. 2000. “Women in Politics: Situation in March 2000 as of Official Data” (chart). Geneva, Switzerland: Inter-Parliamentary Union; also distributed by the United Nations Department of Public Information, New York.

King, Elizabeth M. and Andrew D. Mason. 2001. “Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice.” Washington, D.C., and New York: The World Bank and Oxford University Press. A World Bank Policy Research Report.

Levinson, David. 1989. *Violence in Cross-Cultural Perspective*. Newbury Park, California, and London: Sage.

Otero, Maria and Elisabeth Rhyne, eds. 1994. *The New World of Microenterprise Finance: Building Healthy Financial Institutions for the Poor*. West Hartford, Connecticut, and London: Kumarian Press and Intermediate Technology Publications, Ltd.

Schamper, John. 2002. "Macro-Economic Analysis—Ukraine." Kiev, Ukraine: USAID. March.

Sivard, Ruth Leger. *Women: A World Survey* (2d. ed.) Washington, D.C.: World Priorities.

UNDP. 1999. *Gender Analysis of Ukrainian Society*. Kiev, Ukraine: UNDP.

USAID/KIEV. 2002. "Statement of Work" (includes SOW for present assessment). Kiev, Ukraine: USAID.

Winrock International. 2002a. "Fact Sheet: WEE Project Achievements (March 1999–March 31, 2002)." Kiev, Ukraine, and Arlington, Virginia: Winrock International.

———. 2002b. "Women's Economic Empowerment, Ukraine (WEE)." <http://www.winrock.org/fact/facts.cfm?CC=5194>, 6/28/02.

———. 2002c. "Anti-Trafficking Program, Ukraine." <http://www.winrock.org/fact/facts.cfm?CC=5162>, 6/28/02.

ANNEX A

LIST OF PERSONS AND ORGANIZATIONS CONTACTED, BY CITY

LIST OF PERSONS AND ORGANIZATIONS CONTACTED, BY CITY

KIEV

USAID

Alexandria Panehal, Deputy Director
Christopher Edwards, Director, Program Office
Tetyana Tymoshenko-Yakunina, Training Office/Mission Gender Advisor
Basharat Ali, Senior Project Development Officer
Tatiana Rastrigina, Business Development Specialist
Borys Uspensky, Project Management Specialist, Reproductive Health
Pamela Mandel, Acting Director, Office of Health and Social Transition
Tamara Babiuk, Information Officer, Program Office
Laurie Landy, Program Office
Victoria Marchenko, Project Manager, Ukrainian Reform Education Program
John Schamper, Program Economist
Rodeina A. Fattah, Financial Markets Specialist
Thomas Rader, Senior Business Development Specialist
Sergey A. Vetosh, Private Sector Development
Ivan Schvets, Project Specialist (BIZPRO)
Bob Wallin, Team Leader, Ukraine, Moldova, Belarus

Winrock International

Grace Kennan Warnecke, Country Director, Ukraine, Chief of Party, Women's Economic Empowerment Project
Amy Heyden, Director, Trafficking Prevention Programs
Halyna Vdovychenko, Economic Development Coordinator
Winrock Group meeting—Focus group—14 coordinators of 7 women for women centers + 2
Winrock Program Coordinators

CURE (Center for Ukrainian Reform Education)

Iryna Movchan, President
Allison Lynch, Grant Manager
Iryna Skorbun, Research and Social Programs Manager
Oksana Sidoruk, Manager, Interpreter

AED (Academy for Educational Development)

John Raleigh, Regional Director
Tetiana Treschuk, Senior Program Coordinator

AIHA (American International Health Alliance)

Elena Voskresenskaya, Senior Program Coordinator
Alyona Gerasimova, Regional Director, West NIS

BIZPRO

Natalia Karbovska, Gender Specialist

Office of Ombudsperson for Human Rights

Edward Pavlenko, Member, National Coordinating Council to Prevent Trafficking in Human Beings

Iryna Targulova, Secretary, National Coordinating Council to Prevent Trafficking in Human Beings

World Bank

Maria Koreniaka, Gender Coordinator

La Strada Ukraine

Inna Shvab, Project Manager

IOM (International Organization for Migration)

Fredric Larsson, Program Officer

Oksana Horbunova, Program Coordinator

Canada-Ukraine Gender Fund

Larysa Magdyuk, Coordinator

State Committee of Family and Youth

Larysa Kolos, Vice-director of Gender Issue Department

British Council

Veena Lakhmalani, HIV and Human Rights Adviser

Ljubov Batih, Media Manager, EC-U.S. HIV/AIDS Prevention and Awareness Program for Ukraine

Andrey Kavakin, Project Manager of NGOs

International Renaissance Foundation (Soros)

Olesia Bondar, Project Assistant

Ukrainian Sociological and Educational Women's Center

Alla Mikhaylichenko, Manager

1 business visit—Paritet Women's Center (one woman)

CHERNIGIV

Women's Business Support Center (WBSC)

Irina Dorozhkina, Director

Oksana Kozlova, Coordinator

Focus group of 5 women who opened or expanded their own business after WBSC training:
Irina, Natalia, Tatiana, Elena, Tatiana

Focus group of 5 women who got jobs (but no business yet) after training: Angela, Tatiana,
Elena, Oksana, Larissa

2 business visits (two women in shoe store; 1 man in handicraft shop; owners of these
businesses are WBSC trainees)

LVIV

Women for Women Center

Luba Maksimovych, Director

Focus group of 5 women who didn't find jobs after computer course:
Nadya, Natalia, Victoria, Lilia, Ulyana

Focus group of 5 women who found jobs after computer course:
Victoria, Natalia, Victoria, Irena, Svitlana

U. S. Peace Corps

Lynn Jarrett, Volunteer, Business Consultant working with women for women center

Women's Wellness Center (Railway Hospital)

Ludmila Guzal, M.D., Director

BIZPRO

Ernest Ishchuk, Regional Representative

DONETSK

Note: Ljudmila Gorova is director or president of three organizations visited:
women for women center, Director; women's business support center, Director; Donetsk
Regional League of Business and Professional Women, President

Staff meeting for both Centers (WBSC and Women for Women): Maryna Novikova,
Svetlana Tkachenko, Katya Chebotyuk, Natalia Safchenko, Iryna Polyakova, Katya
Pilipchenko, Aza Goloschapova (plus Ljudmila Gorova)

Focus group of 5 women who found jobs after WBSC training but had not (yet) started a
business: Natasha, Svitlana, Galina, Natalia, Tamara

Focus group of 5 women who created or expended their own business after WBSC training:
Vera, Ludmila, Natalia, Tatiana, Elena

Focus group of 5 women who didn't find jobs after women for women center computer
course: Alyona, Elena, Katya, Kira, Katya

Focus group of 4 women who found jobs after women for women center computer course:
Masha, Svetlana, Natasha, Oksana

1 interview with trafficked woman (“Lena”), client of women for women center

1 business visit (one woman in fashion salon/designer dressmaking; WBSC trainee)

ODESSA

Women’s Wellness Center

Lidia Gumenyuk, M.D., Chief of Family Planning Center

Valentina Golubenko, M.D., Director of Wellness Center for Women

Odessa Regional Hospital

Nellya Gozhenko, M.D., Director

Faith, Hope and Love—Public Movement

Tetyana Semikop, President

Olga Kostyuk, Lawyer, Manager of Project

Marina Antonyuk, Hotline Consultant/Coordinator

Inna Cobenko, M.D., Coordinator of “Stop Traffic” Project; Shelter Director

Valeriy Kiyunov, Psychologist; Coordinator of HIV/AIDS prevention program among female sex workers

Alexey Trohimchuk, Policy, Information Dissemination and Youth Specialist (also, President of University Youth Union of Odessa)

Maria Didenko, Sociologist/Social Worker

Svitlana, Social Worker at Shelter

Women’s Association of Odessa

Olga Pavlova, President

ANNEX B

**STATEMENT OF WORK, ANTI-TRAFFICKING
INITIATIVE—UKRAINE**

STATEMENT OF WORK, ANTI-TRAFFICKING INITIATIVE—UKRAINE

BACKGROUND

Throughout the countries of the former Soviet Union girls (females under 16 years of age) and women are trafficked within their own country and across international borders in a modern-day slave trade. Often duped or coerced by friends and relatives, these girls find themselves forced to work—through violence and intimidation—in brothels, sweatshops, or in private homes as domestic laborers. Here they become virtual slaves, unable to control their own fate. While the number of trafficked women and girls is difficult to determine, due to its clandestine and criminal nature, the United Nations conservatively estimates that four million people globally are smuggled into foreign countries each year, generating up to \$7 billion annually in illicit profits for criminal syndicates. A significant portion of this human traffic is female.

While the problem of sexual trafficking in women and girls is not new, it has mushroomed in Ukraine and the NIS since the fall of communism. With multiple, complex causes, trafficking has proven difficult to curb. Recruiters for traffickers target areas where opportunities for women are most bleak, and where the risks of being caught are relatively low. Women and girls from rural areas and small cities, and those coming out of orphanages, are particularly vulnerable, since their poor economic prospects often make offers of jobs overseas too attractive to turn down. The influence of organized crime in Ukraine, and the related problem of corruption among public officials and law enforcement, complicate efforts to deal with the trafficking.

The U.S. State Department Anti-Trafficking report, July 2001, lists Ukraine in a Tier 2, as the country which does not meet the minimum standards for elimination of trafficking, but is taking significant steps to combat trafficking in persons.⁷

USAID would like to consider appropriate directions which would help Ukraine to move to the Tier 1 countries, under which the following minimum standards listed in the above mentioned report must be taken to account:

1. The government should prohibit trafficking and punish acts of trafficking.
2. The government should prescribe punishment commensurate with that for grave crimes, such as forcible sexual assault, for the knowing commission of trafficking in some of its most reprehensible forms (trafficking for sexual purposes, trafficking involving rape or kidnapping, or trafficking that causes a death).
3. For knowing commission of any act of trafficking, the government should prescribe punishment that is sufficiently stringent to deter, and that adequately reflects the offense's heinous nature.
4. The government should make serious and sustained efforts to eliminate trafficking.”

⁷ See July 2001, U.S. State Department Anti-Trafficking report; p.12; p.59

USAID/Kiev developed a strategy together with other U.S. government agencies to combat trafficking in Ukraine in early 1998. It consists of three components: Prevention, Protection/Assistance, and Prosecution.

In 1998 the United States Agency for International Development awarded Winrock International a grant to establish a pilot project to prevent trafficking in women from Ukraine. Based on the success of this initial pilot project, Winrock was awarded additional funding to expand this project in Ukraine. Winrock is now a leading force in the international effort to combat trafficking in women and children from the NIS. (Winrock also implements USAID's Women's Economic Empowerment (WEE) project in Ukraine.)

The Trafficking Prevention Project addresses two key factors that contribute to the susceptibility of Ukrainian women to trafficking: lack of economic opportunity, and violence against women. Project activities are grounded on the assumptions that in order to improve trafficking prevention efforts in Ukraine: 1) Women in the at-risk group need to be trained in recognizing and creating viable economic opportunities for themselves; and 2) Increased crisis prevention services for at-risk women need to be established. Activities are aimed at women between the ages of 12 and 30, the group at greatest risk of being trafficked.

Due to increased interest on the part of the government in tackling trafficking, the Mission decided to undertake a review of its strategy back in October 1999. The MSI team reviewed the strategy and found it largely appropriate, but recommended some shifts in emphasis. The suggested changes do not represent a radical departure from the Mission's existing program. The team designed a protection component, meant to improve the law and to strengthen its application and enforcement, but it has not been implemented because of the budget cuts. Most of the recommendations from the anti-trafficking MSI report seem to be outdated now, but some of them can be taken to account, like the following:

- ? Job search and job skills training are vitally important but no one knows the success rates of the various programs in place. Some additional research should be undertaken to ascertain the proportion of "graduates" actually finding jobs. This research might provide very useful information for developing or adapting skills training programs.
- ? Microenterprise training is probably most suitable for a somewhat older audience of women than the recommended target group (early teens to 25). It is not a panacea for the lack of opportunities in rural areas. The team would like to suggest a harder look at what might work for women living in rural areas, where jobs are scarce.

The current Cooperative Agreement ends on December 2002, and there is a need to identify the steps that USAID will take to continue this effort in future. The Mission would like to assess current anti-trafficking efforts with a focus on economic empowerment in Ukraine. These programs are being implemented by indigenous NGOs, Government of Ukraine, Department of State, Winrock International with financial support from the United States Agency for International Development, International Office of Migration, OSCE and other donors.

PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The objective of this scope of work is to obtain the services of an international expert (the Consultant) in anti-trafficking activities with an economic empowerment focus. The Consultant will analyze current anti-trafficking initiatives with a focus on providing economic opportunities for women, as well as women's economic empowerment programs. The findings and recommendations will help USAID/WNIS identify critical gaps in existing approaches that new interventions might address, primarily in Ukraine, with a special emphasis on combating trafficking through providing women with more economic opportunities. (The Consultant will be assisted in this assignment by one or more Ukrainian national consultants.)

When completed, this information and accompanying list of recommendations will provide USG officials in USAID/WNIS with the information and tools necessary to design specific implementations at a later date.

SCOPE OF WORK

The Consultant will conduct an analysis of:

1. Economic opportunities for women and their role in preventing trafficking
2. Possible ways to address constraints, such as access to credit, unemployment, etc., and
3. The role of NGOs already working on this issue.

For example, under the existing Winrock-implemented projects, seven Trafficking Prevention Centers and five Business Centers are operating in different oblasts of Ukraine. One of the centers - in Donetsk - works successfully on both of the issues - women's business education and anti-trafficking. Those who come to the center to learn about business skills receive information about dangers of trafficking and vice a versa. Five Business Centers work with credit unions that the WEE project supports. They are all existing credit unions whom we have provided with technical assistance, special training, and with funds that are to be loaned exclusively to women entrepreneurs, graduates of our women's business support centers, who have successfully presented a business plan and been approved by the credit committee. The interest on these loans stays with the credit union and can be used in the future for whatever purpose the credit union designates. The consultant should analyze the potential for these, or similar activities, to help at-risk groups of women to avoid being trafficked.

The Consultant shall undertake an analysis in Ukraine of existing anti-trafficking interventions with an economic empowerment focus. These programs include those already being implemented by international donors, U.S. Government agencies, the GOU and NGO institutions. The assessment should include:

- ? A list of major programs focusing on the women's economic empowerment aspects of anti-trafficking efforts in Ukraine. The list should include the programs' starting and

ending dates; major grantees or sub-grantees; the region or focus of the program; and amounts and sources of donor funding, if applicable;

- ? An analysis of the role of creation of economic opportunity—own business and employment—in the prevention of trafficking, and possible ways to address constraints such as lack of income-generating skills, access to credit, etc;
- ? An analysis of the impact of donor funded, including USAID, programs focusing on economic opportunities in the prevention of trafficking; and
- ? Broad recommendations for USAID-funded interventions or programs to fill in existing gaps not already addressed by other USG agencies, international or bilateral development agencies.

ILLUSTRATIVE APPROACH

The Consultant shall provide an analysis of the current economic empowerment-focused measures to combat trafficking in women from Ukraine and define a niche where USAID could propose its assistance. In carrying out the analysis, the Consultant shall:

- ? Lead a two-person team of researchers in the process of data collection, analysis and reporting;
- ? Review pre-existing studies and assessments in Ukraine to help address gaps in the Ukrainian program;
- ? Interview key experts on trafficking and women's economic opportunities from donor agencies, host-country government institutions, NGOs and universities in Ukraine;
- ? Debrief USAID and U.S. Embassy staff in Ukraine on findings and recommendations before departure; and
- ? Provide USAID and U.S. Embassy staff in Ukraine with a draft outline of the written report at the time of the debriefing.

The consultant shall revise the report's analyses and suggestions based on feedback received from U.S. Embassy and USAID staff in Ukraine and W/NIS.

ESTIMATED LEVEL OF EFFORT

The Consultant team will be composed of the following:

- ? A U.S. or other international Consultant having professional and practical experience in anti-trafficking of women issues, with an emphasis on the role of women's economic empowerment in the prevention of trafficking; and

- ? At least one Ukrainian professional having similar experience.

The estimated level of effort to carry out the work is 40 person-days for the U.S./international Consultant and 20 person-days of Ukrainian national individual(s). This time includes travel to and from Kiev for the international Consultant.

SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS

1. Duty Post: This work will be performed in Ukraine with short trips to up to three (?) regional trafficking prevention centers. Three days of home office time will be allowed for preparation and up to 15 days for final document preparation.
2. Language: Proficiency in a language other than English is not required for U.S./international Consultant. (Proficiency in English will be required for any Ukrainian team member.)
3. The consultant will work closely with the USAID/Kiev Cognizant Technical Officer on Anti-Trafficking Initiative who will provide background information and assist in organizing entry and exit meetings with the Mission Director in Kiev and the Country Program Officer in Ukraine.
4. Access to classified information: The consultant will not have access to any U.S. Government classified material.
5. Logistical support: The consultant is responsible for providing all logistical support.
6. Workweek: Six-day workweeks will be allowed for time spent in Ukraine.
7. Travel: All consultant travel to Ukraine requires prior country clearance from the CTO and USAID/Ukraine. Visa will be required for Ukraine.

PERFORMANCE PERIOD

The work should commence o/a June 2002 and be completed within 60 days.

REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Consultant will submit a rough draft report at the completion of the Ukrainian assessment. There will be a debriefing in Kiev prior to returned to the U.S. USAID/Kiev will provide informal comments within two days of receiving the rough draft report. Within five days of return to the home office the consultant will submit a draft work in electronic form to the CTO. All reports will be in Microsoft Office format. USAID will provide comments on the draft report with two week of its receipt for the consultant's use in preparing a final report.

The final report will be prepared in 10 copies (together with an electronic version) and delivered to CTO by DHL (or similar international courier service).

ANNEX C
RAPID APPRAISAL METHODOLOGIES

RAPID APPRAISAL METHODOLOGIES

Rae Lesser Blumberg
University of Virginia and University of California, San Diego
September 2000

Overview of RAMs

The first rapid appraisal methodology was named Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA) at a conference at the University of Sussex in 1978, and proposed the concept of “triangulation” for establishing validity. Triangulation entails working with a honed-down list of variables and issues, and for each of them, gathering data from (at least) two sources, preferably using (at least) two different research techniques (say, focus groups vs. key informant interviews). Today, there is a growing family of rapid appraisal methodologies, including Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA), Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) and Rapid Assessment Procedures (RAP). All rely on the principle of “triangulation” for validity. It is precisely this systematic attempt at cross-validation that raises the rapid appraisal methodologies above journalistic accounts, or “quick and dirty” research.

Even with triangulation, rapid appraisals produce data that are not as rigorous as random sample survey research. But because of their better ability to handle contextual data, rapid appraisals may have comparable - and sometimes better - levels of validity.

Moreover, rapid appraisals can be undertaken where random sample survey research cannot. The four principal reasons for not doing random sample survey research are that (1) it is not possible to meet the requirements for a random sample; (2) it is too early in the research process to be able to write the right questions and, especially, write the right closed-end alternatives to those questions, (3) the topics and/or target group may not be amenable to the rigid format of a survey, and/or (4) it is suspected that there is little variation in the answers people will give to the questions of interest. Specifically:

- ? The main reason for not being able to fashion random samples is that in many remote, large, or difficult terrain areas, it is too difficult and expensive to undertake the mapping that can establish the universe from which the random sample can be drawn.
- ? The main reason that surveys are inappropriate for the early, exploratory stages of research is that the multiplicity of open-ended questions that are needed at this juncture are horrendously expensive to code and analyze, and the process usually takes so long that results come in much too late to be of use to the average development project.
- ? Surveys also may be contra-indicated when the topic is too controversial or delicate or complex, and/or the target group may be engaged in activities that are too intimate or illegal to be willing to give truthful answers to the interviewer. (It also is impossible to delineate the universe of those engaged in illegal activities, precluding a random sample.)

- ? Finally, a large-scale random sample survey is most justified where there is lots of variation in the questions being explored, but too expensive if it just confirms key informants' assertions of uniformity (e.g., that almost 100 percent raise maize and cattle).

It is also worth mentioning two other potential advantages of rapid appraisals (RAs) that are relevant for development projects:

- (1) RAs are extremely useful for measuring results or impact at any point in the life of a project, and RAs can be integrated into any Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) system.
- (2) RA focus groups with various sub-groups of both clients and control groups can be used to supplement quantitative indicators and provide the prospect of a more participatory way of creating and periodically measuring indicators.

A Typical Rapid Appraisal Sequence

As a caution, note that not all the steps presented here must always be done, nor must they be done in the following order; sometimes two or more steps can take place concurrently. What is important is that the information obtained is triangulated, or cross-validated. This means using two or more techniques, comparing the vision of "insiders" and "outsiders," and (where projects already are under way) contrasting the experiences of both clients and control groups. The typical steps of a rapid appraisal for a development project or program are:

1. Review of secondary data.

This includes two types of literature/documents: outside literature (social science studies, government reports, donor studies, "gray literature," etc.), and inside literature (those related to the organization's project cycle, from initial formulations to final evaluations).

It also includes re-analysis of existing data. Again, these can be outside sources (national account statistics, household surveys, census, and/or quantitative data generated by bilateral or multilateral agencies, such as the World Bank LSMS series), and/or inside sources (e.g., rerunning tables to disaggregate them by gender, region, economic sector, age groups, etc.) The idea behind re-analysis of extant data is to use variables that had been collected and which are important to you but had not been used to disaggregate the data in the original analysis.

2. Gathering of primary data.

Here are the main techniques:

- ? **Key informant (KI) interviews.** These make use of a flexible, semi-structured "topic list," rather than a rigid questionnaire, and this topic list can and should be continually adapted/modified as new insights and topics emerge.

Typically, KI interviews begin at the top, at the national level, and then work their way down to the grass roots level.

- + They also should involve both outsiders (e.g., the staffs of NGOs that compete with the one(s) involved in the project; locally knowledgeable people such as teachers, health post workers, etc.) and insiders (various level of project staff).
- ? **Focus group interviews.** These can be conducted in a participatory manner by the facilitator, so that participants interact and discuss topics among themselves, often arriving at new insights and recommendations.
- + The most essential thing is that focus groups should be homogeneous. One should never combine people with conflicting interests in the same focus group (e.g., labor and management; large landlords and tenant farmers, and - in most situations - men and women). Neither side will be forthcoming and honest.
 - + Focus groups also should be small; the ideal size seems to be five. In practice, up to eight can be manageable with a trained facilitator running the discussion and a second person recording; conversely, the occasional group of four (or even three) may be necessary if there are no-shows. Why five? Social psychology research has established that when group size goes above five, a clear leadership structure begins to emerge: one or two dominate the group and one or more tend to withdraw, saying little or nothing. And based on my experience in over three dozen countries around the world, five is indeed the magic number for interactive, insight-producing discussions that can be managed by one facilitator (aided by one assistant to help record answers).
 - + Focus groups can collect two kinds of data: (a) on the issues, and (b) socioeconomic and socio-demographic information. The social data can be collected at strategic moments when the issues discussion is veering off on a tangent, or being monopolized by 1-2 people. The facilitator announces that it is now time to go around the circle, and asks everyone, e.g., how many children they have and how old they are. This breaks up the unwanted discussion pattern and the facilitator can pick up with a new topic or ask for a comment from someone who had not spoken.
 - + During the project implementation phase, focus groups should be conducted not only with insiders/clients but also with outsiders/controls. It is necessary to have separate control group meetings in order to find out what other factors (exogenous variables or externalities) may have been affecting the people in the area, independent of the program/project.
- ? **Supplemental techniques.** These include:
- + Follow-up individual interviews with a few people from the focus groups to clarify points that remain in doubt.
 - + Observation. This can be a powerful tool, especially for conservation/natural resource management projects. One can walk a farmer's fields and see what measures he/she actually is using, vs. what the person may say in an individual interview or focus group.

- + Content analysis of newspapers or other media (TV, radio, magazines) or even donor or project documents may be very revealing - especially of biases that exclude certain groups or present them in a stereotyped way.

? **A “last-step” mini-survey.** Such a technique is useful if, after all the above:

(1) we still cannot predict what the people in the next focus group are going to say on a particular topic, or

(2) we need quantitative data, either to convince skeptics or because the consequences of loose estimates could be detrimental to the clients.

But this “last step” survey need not include all the items for which clear patterns have emerged. For example, if we already know the main crops and livestock in the area, the gender division of labor vis-à-vis those crops and livestock, and any variation in that gender division of labor by ethnic group or level of wealth, we do not have to include these items in the survey instrument. To reiterate, the mini-survey questionnaire need contain only the questions that remain in doubt. By this time, we probably know enough about even those issues to be able to make most questions “closed-end.”?

Naturally, a random sample remains the ideal. Sometimes, this becomes feasible for a “last-step” mini-survey when it would have been impossible for an initial baseline survey. This may be because the unsettled questions are now confined to a small sub-sector of the original geographic area. If so, the cost of constructing the “sampling universe” could be greatly reduced.

3. Feedback.

In order to help the various stakeholder groups feel a sense of ownership in the project, it is necessary to encourage their participation in decision-making related to the project. One key step is to consult with them about preliminary findings and first round suggestions about project initiatives. The general sequence is to reverse the process to this point and “go back up the pyramid.” In short, one would start with some of the grass roots people who had been focus group or key informant interviewees. Then one could hold a community-level meeting, even though those with less power would be unlikely to participate freely. There also should be feedback meetings with project staff (front-line workers, as well as project management), and finally, at the national level (including top management of the project, relevant donors, government officials, and the like).

In sum, rapid appraisals can provide data that can be defended scientifically more quickly and cheaply than any comparable method. As a final bonus, they are particularly suitable for typically under-funded development sectors, such as gender and development.

ANNEX D

ANTI-TRAFFICKING PROGRAMS IN UKRAINE - DRAFT

ANTI-TRAFFICKING PROGRAMS IN UKRAINE - DRAFT

List of Anti-trafficking Programs Focusing on Women's Economic Empowerment

#	Program	Dates	Grantee	Geographic Focus	Donor
1	Summer and winter schools for teenagers on prevention of trafficking in human beings, job skills and ABC steps of business development	07/2000-09/2002	School of Equal Opportunities	Ukraine	AED/USAID
2	Stop Traffic (shelter for, and education of, trafficked women)	06/2001-12/2002	"Faith, Hope and Love"—Public Movement	Odessa	German Government (Munich), IOM
3	Job skills program for unemployed women (including 5 trafficked women among 87 trained)	02/1998-02/1999	Ukr. Sociological and Educational Women's Center	Kiev	USIS
4	Development of women's enterprises	04/2000-05/2001	Ukr. Sociological and Educational Women's Center	Ukraine	SIDA, UNDP, TACIS
5	Development of women's enterprises in various regions of Ukraine as prevention of trafficking in women	10/2001-09/2002	Ukr. Sociological and Educational Women's Center	Sumy, Simferopol, Cherkassy, Uzhgorod, Kiev	Winrock International/ USAID
6	Training of business-trainers and teachers. Establishment of resource center	07/2000-06/2001	Ukrainian Network of Entrepreneurship Agencies	Sumy, Kiev region, Rivne	Winrock International/ USAID
7	Conducting trainings for trainers focusing on businesses for rural women	07/2000-06/2001	Association of Taxpayers of Ukraine	Ukraine	Winrock International/ USAID
8	"Starting your own business"—economic and educational organization for Crimean women	07/2000-07/2001	Women's Club "Femina"	Crimea (based in Simferopol)	Winrock International/ USAID
9	Training program on "Business Alternatives" for unemployed women	07/2000-07/2001	Mykolayiv City Fund (LASKA) for support of social and economic reforms	Mykolayiv	Winrock International/ USAID
10	Supporting female residents of the Rivne Region in employment and private business management matters	07/2000-07/2001	Municipal Regional Business center	Rivne	International Renaissance Foundation (Soros)
11	Conducting 5 training workshops to train a group of skilled instructors that will provide free consulting services in economic matters to unemployed and	07/2000-07/2001	International Charity Foundation for the Development of Intellectual and Natural	Zhitomyr region	International Renaissance Foundation (Soros)

#	Program	Dates	Grantee	Geographic Focus	Donor
	business women		Resources of Ukraine		
1 2	Implementing instruction courses in business planning, general management, financial management and marketing studies	07/2000-07/2001	Women's Business Association (Khmelnitsky City Office)	Khmelnitsky	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
1 3	Implementing a four-day training workshop in business planning for female managers of small and medium-sized business	07/2000-07/2001	Ukrainian Marketing Business Association (based in Kiev)	Mykolayiv, Mykolayiv region	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
1 4	Support for female residents of the Cherkassy willing to start up private business, and to businesswomen running their own companies	07/2000-07/2001	Industrial Managers' Association (affiliate of Cherkassy Business Center)	Cherkassy Region	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
1 5	Establishment of the Crimea School of Business Training for Women, which trains women willing to start private businesses	07/2000-07/2001	"Svitoch," a Center for Public Initiatives	Crimea (based in Bahchisaray)	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
1 6	Supporting the "Paritet" Business Center to foster new dimensions of women's business project success	07/2000-07/2001	Ukrainian Sociological and Educational Women's Center	Kiev	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
1 7	From home economy to own business	07/2001-02/2002	International Charity Fund for Development of Intellectual and Natural Resources of Ukraine	Zhitomyr region	Winrock International/ USAID
1 8	Women's business	07/2001-07/2002	Business Support Center "Poltava Business Incubator"	Poltava	Winrock International/ USAID
1 9	Business education and consultative support of business women from Rayon Centers of Western Ukraine	07/2001-07/2002	Kosivschina Business Women's Center	Kosiv (Ivano-Frankivsk oblast), Ternopil, Chernivtsy, Transkarpattya	Winrock International/ USAID
2 0	"My Business - My Success"	07/2001-07/2002	Volyn Business Association "21st Century"	Rivne region	Winrock International/ USAID
2 1	Business Development Center	07/2001-07/2002	Agency of Women's and Youth	Lviv, Lviv region	Winrock International/ USAID

#	Program	Dates	Grantee	Geographic Focus	Donor
			Entrepreneurship		
2 2	Conducting five training sessions on the basics of economic business planning, management of services, and legal provisions regulating entrepreneurship	07/2001-07/2002	Union for the Promotion of Crimean Rural Green Tourism	Crimea (based in Simferopol)	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 3	Training in skills for unemployed women with further job-placement, setting up a women's resource center, creating a video program	07/2001-07/2002	Makariv Rayon Women's Organization "Berehynia"	Makariv (Kiev region)	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 4	Information and consulting assistance to young women, agricultural workers and land owners	07/2001-07/2002	Chernigiv City League of Women Entrepreneurs and Professionals	Nizhin, Chernigiv and Ripkyn Rayons (Chernigiv region)	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 5	Carrying out a series of training and consulting seminars	07/2001-07/2002	Association of Ukrainian Taxpayers	Sumy, Khmel'nitsky, Chernigiv, Volyn, Rivne, Zakarpattia, Zaporizhia, and Mykolayiv	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 6	Training, consultation and technical assistance in launching private business to women from villages and townships	07/2001-07/2002	Mykolayiv City Fund "Laska"	Mykolayiv region	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 7	Training of unemployed women at Oleksandriya Employment Center	07/2001-07/2002	Civil Information Mission "Civil Management Center"	Oleksandriya (Kirovograd region)	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 8	Information campaign aimed to improve labor conditions and enhance economic opportunities for women	07/2001-07/2002	Kharkiv Center for Women's Studies	Kharkiv	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
2 9	Assisting women in stepping up their business activity by raising their self-esteem	07/2001-07/2002	Agency for the Development of Women's and Youth Entrepreneurship	Lviv	International Renaissance (Soros) Foundation
3 0	Symbiosis: work with unemployed women and children from orphanages	07/2000-12/2000	"Devchata"	Enakievo (Donetsk region)	British Council/DFID
3 1	Development of women's entrepreneurial initiatives	07/2001-12/2001	Makeevka Branch of the Donetsk League of Business and Professional	Makeevka (Donetsk region)	British Council/DFID

#	Program	Dates	Grantee	Geographic Focus	Donor
			Women		
3 2	Development entrepreneurial initiatives of female students	07/2000-12/2000	Center for Young Women's Initiatives	Odessa	British Council/DFID
3 3	Social adaptation of wives of retired military servicemen	07/2001-12/2001	Center of Support for Civil Initiatives	Odessa	British Council/DFID

List of Programs Which Include Only Prevention of Trafficking (No Economic Component)

#	Program	Dates	Grantee	Geographic Focus	Donor
1	Prevention of trafficking	2000-11/2002	La Strada Ukraine	Kiev	Winrock International/ USAID
2	Support of 6 regional hotlines for anti-trafficking	07/2000-07/2002	La Strada Ukraine	Odessa, Ternopil, Lugansk, Sevastopol, Kharkiv, Uzhgorod,	OSCE/ ODHIR
3	Activities and administrative support	06/1997-12/2002	La Strada Ukraine	Kiev	Dutch Government
4	Social assistance to victims	01/2001-12/2001	La Strada Ukraine	Ukraine	IOM
5	Hotline support in Kiev	1998-12/2001	La Strada Ukraine	Kiev	IOM, OSCE
6	Prevention materials (Manual for schools and video edition)	07/2001-06/2002	La Strada Ukraine	Ukraine	British Embassy
7	Hotline support in Kiev	03/2002-09/2002	La Strada Ukraine	Kiev	Finland Embassy
8	Information and preventive help for women in high risk group	02/2001-08/2001	Women's Law Protective Center "Collaboration"	Simferopol	Winrock International/ USAID
9	"You are not alone"	02/2001-12/2001	Regional Information Service on Women's Issues	Kirovograd	Winrock International/ USAID
10	"We say no to trafficking in people"	02/2001-08/2001	Kharkiv Women's NGO "Nadija"	Kharkiv	Winrock International/ USAID
11	Prevention of trafficking in women in Khmel'nitsky region	02/2001-08/2001	Women's Business Association	Khmelnitsky	Winrock International/ USAID
12	"Roksolana"	02/2001-02/2002	Poltava Family Center "Family Home"	Poltava	Winrock International/ USAID
13	Prevention of trafficking and domestic violence in rural areas	11/2000-11/2000	School of Equal Opportunities	Zhitomyr region	Counterpart Alliance/ USAID
14	Hotline on prevention of trafficking in people	09/2000-07/2002	"Faith, Hope and Love"—Public Movement	Odessa region	La Strada Ukraine