

~~PN-ACN-442~~
PN-ACN-442

ASSESSMENT OF THE WORLD BANK PROJECTS 1, 2 AND 3
CONCERNING PRIMARY EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN

PREPARED FOR
USAID/PAKISTAN
HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT DIVISION

BY
(ERWIN) CLAYTON SEELEY
EDUCATIONAL CONSULTANT
BOX 179 L.O.W.
Locust grove, VA 22508
(703)972-7883

JANUARY/FEBRUARY 1988

CONTRACT NO. 391-0470-0-00-8301-00
PIO/T NO. 391-0470-3-70318

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN
EDUCATION AT A GLANCE

A. Population

1. Estimated Total (1986)	99.0 million
2. Annual Rate of Growth (1972-85)	2.9% p.a.
3. Adult Literacy Rate (1985)	24%
4. <u>Urban Literacy Rate</u>	44%
. Male	55%
. Female	37%
5. <u>Rural Literacy Rate</u>	15%
.Male	26%
.Female	7%

B. Enrollments (1984/85)

Level and Age Group	Grade	Total	Male	Female	% Female
		-----'000-----			
1. Primary (5-9)	I-V	6,931.9	4,667.33	2,264.6	32.
Punjab		4,036.5	2,497.8	1,538.7	38.1
Sind		1,650.7	1,153.4	497.3	30.1
NWFP		943.5	764.6	178.9	19.0
Baluchistan		301.2	251.5	49.7	16.5
2. Secondary (10-14)	VI-X	2,755.6	2,130.4	625.2	22.7
3. Higher (14+)	X+	548.4	392.3	156.0	28.5
Arts & Science Colleges		409.1	279.3	129.8	31.7
Professional Colleges		88.8	71.1	17.7	19.9
Universities		50.5	41.9	8.6	17.0

C. Primary Level Participation Rates (1982)

	<u>Both Sexes</u>	<u>Boys</u>	<u>Girls</u>
Pakistan	48	63	32
Rural	40	58	20
Urban	72	77	68
Punjab	46	56	36
Sind	42	54	30
NWFP	35	50	21
Baluchistan	20	31	8

D. Public Expenditure on Education (1985)

1. As percent of GDP	1.73%
2. As percent of total government expenditure	8.8%
3. As per cent of public sector outlays	
Sixth FYP (Allocations) (83-88)	6.50%

Gross Participation Rates: Includes over-age students and repeaters.

CONTENTS

Page

EDUCATION AT A GLANCE, 2

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY, 6

World Bank Assistance to Primary Education

Issues, Problems and Lessons Learned, 14

Pitfalls to be Avoided, 21

Opportunities for USAID Support, 22

I. INTRODUCTION, 29

II. DESCRIPTION OF THE FIRST PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT

PEP I - All Provinces, 31

A. Objectives

B. Scope

C. Components

D. Achievements

E. Deficiencies

III. DESCRIPTION OF THE SECOND PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT, 44

PEP II - SIND, NWFP, Baluchistan

A. Scope

B. Objectives

C. Components - Progress to Date

1. Administration Management

2. Supervision

3. Learning Materials

4. School Construction/Remodeling

IV. DESCRIPTION OF THE THIRD PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT- Punjab , 57

A. Scope

1. Punjab Five- Year Plan for Investment in Primary Education
- Prime Minister's Program
- Provincial Annual Development Plan

B. Objectives:

1. Management Improvement
2. Curriculum Development/Materials Supply
3. Teacher Training, Development and Appointment
4. Communications/Demand Generation
5. School Construction/Maintenance

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR USAID PROGRAM SUPPORT , 64
OF PRIMARY EDUCATION

V. MAJOR LESSONS LEARNED FROM PEPS I, II AND III

VI. PITFALLS TO BE AVOIDED BY USAID PLANNERS

VII. OPPORTUNITIES FOR USAID SUPPORT TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

1. Assumptions
2. Government of Pakistan Requests
3. Projects Recommended for USAID Support

ANNEXES:

External Donors to Education
Person's Interviewed
Notes From the Sind
Acronyms

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pakistan is a country of over 100 million people which straddles ancient trade routes and the sites of civilizations which flourished thousands of years ago. The heritage of the area it occupies is indeed remarkable. Yet Pakistan itself was carved out of the Indian sub-continent as a truly Islamic State in 1948 during the aftermath of World War II.

Pakistan is struggling to better its position in the world and overcome its handicaps. A well-founded education system and a highly literate population are cornerstones for successful development that are sadly lacking, however. Pakistan has the lowest literacy rate (24%) in Asia. Vast numbers of its children especially girls, do not have the opportunity to go to Primary school and among those that do the wastage rate is very high indeed. All aspects and levels of education need strengthening but most important is the Primary school base that establishes literacy, numeracy and Islamic studies.

Since 1979 the World Bank, through its International Development Agency (IDA), has been the prime foreign donor to offer valuable assistance to the Primary education sub-sector. The framework for IDA assistance has been the comprehensive Education chapter of Pakistan's Fifth and Sixth Five-Year Development Plans. The Seventh Plan is now being formalized. These Plans give increasing importance and funding to Primary schools.

The purpose of this paper is two-fold:

- 1) to identify obstacles encountered in the implementation of the IDA assisted Primary Education Projects (PEP) I and II and describe how the IDA and the Government of Pakistan (GCP) have attempted to overcome such obstacles in designing PEP III for the Punjab, and
- 2) to indicate priority areas in which USAID might complement and/or supplement the Bank and other foreign Donor efforts to strengthen

the ever-increasing attention Pakistan is giving to Primary education.

Based on its strong cultural heritage Pakistan education is divided almost completely into parallel but separate systems for boys and girls. Under one Minister of Education each Province maintains dual administrative organizations.

That document is not.

A brief summary of the GOP/IDA projects follows.

PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT (PEP I)
Selected Schools and Districts in All Provinces

Period 1979-84	Cost \$ 10,000,000	IDA (60%)
	<u>6,600,000</u>	GOP (40%)
	\$ 16,600,000	(100%)

This was an experimental project. It addressed major essential inputs in a coordinated manner. A Project Implementation Unit (PIU) was set up at the Federal level as a focal point for IDA negotiations and to oversee the work of similar PIU's set up in each of the four Provinces. The project was large enough for a valid experiment. It covered about 10% of the total school population. Each Province selected the participating Districts and schools as well as the teacher training institutes that would be used. Most quantitative targets were met by the end of the project but many delays were experienced. Objectives, elements and quantitative targets are shown in the charts which follow.

✓
✓
✓

PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT (PEP II)
Sind, Northwest Frontier Province (NWFP) and Baluchistan
(Punjab did not participate)

Period: 1985-90	Cost \$52,500,000	IDA (72%)
	<u>20,540,000</u>	GOP (28%)
	\$73,040,000	100%

Despite growing pains PEP I was considered to be effective. The PIU was firmly established and evidence available convinced the IDA and GOP they were on the right track.

PEP II extended the very complex program to all of the schools in the Districts selected under PEP I, in the Sind, NWFP and Baluchistan. Approximately 50% of the Primary students in these Provinces are benefiting.

Adjustments were made to remedy problems encountered previously. PEP II has completed three years. It has three more to go. Vehicles only now are ready for use. Construction should begin soon. Personnel have been hired but regular training waits the development of learning Modules. Some teacher training is underway.

PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT (PEP III)

Punjab

PERIOD: June 1987-Jan. 1994	Cost \$140,000,000	IDA (65.2%)
	15,500,000	CIDA (07.2%)
	4,810,000	EEC (02.2%)
	<u>54,460,000</u>	GOP (25.4%)
	\$214,820,000	100%

The project is still in the pre-implementation stage. It should be signed in March 1988 after a 6 month delay.

Infrastructure is being set up and strengthened as pre-conditions to signing. It covers a "CORE" program of the Punjab's five-year investment plan for primary education. The Canadian International Development Agency(CIDA), and the European Economic Commission(EEC) have joined IDA in co-financing technical assistance and fellowships.

Complete descriptions of these three projects are found in the body of this report. The following charts, however, show at a glance the Objectives, Major Project Elements and the Scope of these very complex projects. It is important to note the progression of inputs as each project draws upon prior experience.

GENERAL RELATIONSHIPS OF THE
OBJECTIVES, PROJECT ELEMENTS AND SCOPE
OF THE WORLD BANK ASSISTED
PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECTS

	<u>PEP I</u>	<u>PEP II</u>	<u>PEP III</u>
	1979-84	1985-91	1989-94
<u>OBJECTIVES</u>			
Increased access - especially Girls.	x	x	x
Reducing wastage	x	x	x
Higher Pupil achievement	x	x	x
Reduced costs	x	x	x
Stress Quality over Quantity	x	x	x
Policy Reform			x
<u>PROJECT ELEMENTS</u>			
Pre-service teacher training	x	x	x
In-service teacher training	x	x	x
Increased supervision - supervisors	x	x	x
Learning Coordinators	x	x	x
Assistant teachers	x	x	x
PIU integrated into system		x	x
Planning by tranches		x	x
Communication and Disseminations		x	x
Female teacher hostels	x		x
Learning modules		x	x
Instructional materials kits	x	x	x
Pre-fabrication		x	x

	<u>PEP I</u>	<u>PEP II</u>	<u>PEP III</u>
	1979-84	1985-91	1989-94
Physical facilities/construction/maintenance	x	x	x
Construction management NESPAK		x	x
Civil Engineering Cell			x
Community Support "NICE"		x	x
Additional Directorate Public Instruction			x
Curriculum Development			x
Rapid Low Cost (RLC) studies			x

GOALS

<u>SCOPE</u>			PEP I	PEP II	PEP III
<u>SCHOOLS</u>	Boys	New	2702	}	-
	Girls	New	1364		6,000
	Boys	Remodel	}	}	-
	Girls	Remodel			4000
<u>SUPERVISORS</u>	Male		32	36	-?
	Female		19	43	-?
<u>LEARNING</u>	Boys		300	470	}
<u>COORDINATORS</u>	Girls		166	209	
<u>TEACHERS-APPOINTED</u>	Male		-	-	11,650
<u>NEW</u>	Female		-	-	33,350
<u>TEACHER TRAINED</u>	Male		6831	23,509	2,500
	Female		3069	5,698	15,000
<u>ASSISTANT TEACHERS</u>	Male		150	1508	}
	Female		190	1836	
<u>PUPILS (000)</u>	Boys		500	985	-?
	Girls		280	277	?
<u>DISTRICTS SERVED</u>			19	19	
<u>TEHSILS SERVED</u>			-	80	
<u>UNION COUNCILS SERVED</u>			-	831	

ISSUES, PROBLEMS AND LESSONS LEARNED

Pakistan's Five-year Plans and the IDA assisted Primary Education Projects have sought to improve persistent issues and problems that constrict Primary education. Some of these are listed here.

PERSISTENT ISSUES

1. CURRICULUM: High rate of wastage, dropouts, repeaters; Quality and relevance of all major inputs; Rigid, heavily loaded, irrelevant curriculum; Sparse instructional materials.
2. TEACHING: Lack of teachers (especially female) and teacher incentives in rural areas; Inadequate teacher training, methods, and supervision; Under-aged siblings (katchis) that dominate Class I; Low pay and incentives; Community/parent apathy.
3. FACILITIES: Inadequate buildings, facilities, furniture; Preponderance of one-room, one-teacher schools; Inadequate transportation/communications infrastructure.
4. MANAGEMENT: Inadequate financing, inflexible PC-Is which hinder flexibility and required deviations caused by changing circumstances; Unreliable statistical base for planning; Administration/management based on seniority/patronage--not aptitude/ability; Untrained administrators at all levels--especially at lower levels; Cleavage between formal and non-formal education administration/management; Inadequate financing; Many-layered levels of responsibility--both inter and intra-ministerial.

PROBLEMS AND LESSONS LEARNED

1. Teacher Training

Faculty of the Government Colleges for Elementary Teachers (GCET) seldom have had actual responsibility for teaching in a Primary school. The teacher training Curriculum needs revision. Both pre-service and in-service programs need strengthening. No practical instruction is given how to teach more than one grade level in the same room - yet such is required of most Primary teachers. Trainers are not involved in designing the new learning Modules. Model schools should serve as GCETs supervised practice-teaching centers.

The problem of inadequate training was identified early during PEP I by the LCs. The development of 276 learning Modules was begun in PEP II to give focus to new ways of teaching but GCETs are seldom involved. Supervision and training is also provided by the school Learning Coordinators at the Union Council level.

2. Female Education

Girls Primary and Middle schools (Classes I-VIII) need special attention. Female administration and teaching face unique problems in Pakistan. Although there are dedicated and well qualified women in leadership roles, their mobility and freedom to act are strongly curtailed at all levels. Female teachers are in short supply in rural areas. Girls may now be hired as teachers when they have "passed" class 8 of the Middle school. To acquire a growing supply of female teachers at local village levels it is imperative that Model Girls schools at the Union Council be upgraded through class 8 to serve both girls and other village women who might aspire to become teachers. USAID should focus on this problem along with the ADB and IDA to assure full coverage.

3. School Construction

Site acquisition has not been a problem. All construction and remodeling in PEP I and II have been to already existing schools. Unfortunate delays have been because established Provincial engineering departments of the Local Government and Rural Development Ministries (LGRD) were unable to handle the sudden enormous extra burden of supervising construction, renovation and maintenance of thousands of scattered schools under PEP I. (See preceding chart). Often construction was poorly supervised and deficient.

Under PEP II a Construction Management (CM) firm was hired at the Federal level to manage all construction. They receive tenders, let bids and supervise construction and remodeling. Remodeling is now progressing well in all three Provinces. Long delays in new construction have been solely due to International Bidding Procedures and Ministry of Education/FCU/IDA approvals of low bids received and pre-fab technologies.

New construction was sub-divided into large parcels of about 1000 schools each for bidding purposes. Also pre-fab technology was introduced to improve quality and uniformity. The Sind had special pricing problems. Costs under IBC procedures came in too high in two successive tenders. Local bidding is now permitted. Three valuable years were lost. However, construction will start soon in all three Provinces.

Under PEP III, during the negotiation stage, a Construction Engineering Cell has been organized within the Punjab Department of Education. Final responsibility for supervision still rests with the Federal CM.

Infrastructure for construction has been improved but long delays still hinder effectiveness of other program elements in PEP II.

4. Vehicle Procurement

Delays in international bidding required by the IDA have had a negative effect on the LCs and supervisors, in-service education, etc. Motorcycles provided under PEP I had no spare parts readily available in Pakistan. The LCs depend on the motorcycles to visit their schools and teachers. All PEP I male LCs are now without transport. Evidently the PC-1 did not provide for replacement and the GOP could not or did not provide them in the Provincial ADPs. PEP II vehicles arrived three years late but are now being distributed. Motorcycles are now on a hire/purchase basis so the male L.C. will pay for and maintain it out of his Rs. 75 daily transportation allowance. PEP I LCs are still without their own transport as such was not included in the budget or PC-1 for PEP II.

5. Re-imbusement of Funds and Prompt Payment of Invoices

In 1985 the IDA opened an account in the Pakistan National Bank to reimburse PIUs for expenses incurred to meet Conditions Precedent to loan Effectiveness (1986-87). Legitimate PIU requests for reimbursement amounting to more than one million dollars have been repeatedly denied by the GOP finance departments. The problem appears to have been a series of misunderstandings of both IDA and GOP procedures required to release such funds. In other cases people were appointed to positions but experienced delays in salary payment, and Researchers were not allowed to visit Provinces to verify data because funds were not available. IDA teams and the FCU have sorted out some problems but payments continue to be slow for no apparent reason. Unfortunate delays in PEP II implementation result.

GOP budgeting procedures and incentive systems are not conducive to the functioning of a Development project. To avoid any chance of mishandling of finances the GOP rules and regulations governing fiscal transactions have been cast in concrete. A Development activity that is innovative in nature must be flexible and able to change magnitudes or add and delete activities when

necessary. The financial mechanism must also be flexible to accommodate the project. Prompt payment for legitimate costs must be safeguarded by USAID during Project development. Perhaps a manual needs to be prepared clearly identifying both USAID and GOP financial requirements and procedures. Included would be limits of authority for releasing operational funds vested in each level and/or appropriate government office - Union Council, Tehsil, District, Division, Department, PIU, FCU, etc.

The provision of timely and adequate flow of funds from the Federal level to the Provincial units is a direct responsibility of the Federal Coordination Unit (FCU). Delays in the release of funds make it impossible for the project to stick to its schedule of activities. The FCU must take a more active role in financial management.

6. Unreliable Data Base

It is impossible to chart progress in enrolments, attendance, drop-outs, failures, teacher attendance etc. without adequate information collected at the source. A Management Information System (MIS) is being developed for the total educational system. The PEP programs have kept constant pressure on the Ministry of Education for this. L.Cs and supervisors will be instrumental in data gathering and school-mapping. USAID's Basic Research and Implementation In Developing Educational Systems (BRIDGES) project will address the MIS problem and carry the data base through analysis and policy design at the administrative level.

7. Increased GOP Financial Investment in Primary Education

On paper and in real terms the GOP is spending more money for both development and recurrent costs. It is often hard to trace the funds through the system from source to expenditure however. More teachers are being hired but salaries of new positions needed for PEP developments are borne by IDA "on a

* IBRD pays salaries of new teachers on a declining scale basis.

declining scale", also, as shown previously, the percentage of GOP to Donor funding has decreased in each project from 40 to 28 to 25.4% respectively. Total contributions have increased, of course, but USAID might seek a clearer accounting "trail" that will show to what extent the GOP - both Federal and Provincial - is increasing their financial support to Primary schooling as well as the dates funds are made available. USAID should avoid participation in a shell game.

8. Project Management

PEP projects are practically all inclusive. Most elements that effect learning are identified and supported. Management is largely carried out by PIUs and periodic visits of IDA teams whose members are constantly changing. There have been instances whereby Provincial PIUs have requested Federal assistance without success. Many problems have had to await the arrival of an IDA team when they could have been clarified or solved much sooner. The reimbursement problem is a case in point. The IDA does not have "hands-on" management with authority vested in field staff.

The USAID assistance package may be a large one with many facets. It will deal with complex issues on a daily basis. Adequate direct hire staff and an adequate number of contractors must be available for effective management. The new Directorates for Primary Education in each Province and at the Federal level will undoubtedly need a great deal of help in getting their staff to focus on the unique features of Primary schools mainly because they lack first hand experience. The same is true of the many GCETs that will require massive assistance. Curriculum development in both Islamabad and the Provinces along with the concomitant development of instructional materials and individualized instruction software (so necessary for multi-grade teaching) will need hands-on assistance and local authority to make decisions.

The project also might require AID/W support from a direct hire or contractor

for two or three days a week - especially if co-financing is included in the design.

9. Teaching

IDA evaluations and studies (PEP I) show that most Primary teachers do not understand the curriculum content themselves and can hardly be expected to teach it to others. Only 25% had an adequate grasp of math and science during in-service training. It is little wonder then that the overall percentage marks obtained by children tested in 1982, adjusted for guessing on multiple choice items, was 21.9% for science and 26.2% for math. PEP II, then emphasizes better in-service training by L.C.s, new teaching materials and the development of 276 learning Modules for children. It appears that writing Modules is perhaps too sophisticated an approach. Selected personnel went to _____ for a three month course. Then the National Institute of Psychology (NIP) developed the first 72 which were rejected by the PIU members who also had attended the course. PIUs then re-wrote and modified 54 Modules and submitted them to the MOE National Standing Committee. Not one was considered appropriate. IDA next held workshops for writers in June, 87 and set 31 March 88 as the date to have the first 120 acceptable Modules completed. By October 1987 only 11 of 36 were approved. As of 31 December the results stood:

	<u>Urdu</u>	<u>Math</u>	<u>Science</u>	<u>Total Approved</u>
SIND	4	5	4	13
NWFP	2	-	4	6
BALUCHISTAN	4	-	4	8
	<u>10</u>	<u>5</u>	<u>12</u>	<u>27</u>

The Modules are not appropriate for multi-level teaching. USAID might promote the development of programmed-learning materials instead.

10. A BRIGHT SPOT

Learning Coordinators (LC)

They represent a real success chapter in the PEP story by bringing professional help ^{to} teachers in 15-20 schools on a regular basis. They also serve on Community Education Committees. Although LCs are not yet able to fulfill their full duties due to lack of transport, the position has been well-established and there is much more contact with teachers and students than before. Much remains to be done but in general L.Cs have been well selected, have received some (though not all) prescribed training in their new responsibilities. They are experienced Primary school teachers and seem to be establishing good rapport with their clientele. They provide a much needed hands-on approach to supervision and community liaison.

Female coordinators seem to have more problems in being accepted than do their male counterparts. It is much more difficult for them to move around and demonstrate independence of action.

PITFALLS TO BE AVOIDED

1. Over Extension of Donor Assistance to Pakistan's Primary Education Sub-sector

The bottom line here is that Pakistan increase its real financial support to the Primary sector in a planned program. Increased Quality depends on a greatly improved support structure. Pakistan must show itself ready to sustain this. Most delays in progress can be traced to Pakistan's low absorptive capacity in terms of appropriate personnel, lines of authority, road networks, electricity and other infrastructure. Quantity expectations exceed capacity. USAID seeks a cure through establishment of a well-integrated, competent system. It would be remiss to offer a band-aid instead. Evidence is growing that Pakistan is indeed seriously working to increase its physical, human and financial resources. Let this be further documented.

2. Fragile Infrastructure

Leadership at the top is first class. As responsibilities spread to lower levels the infrastructure becomes noticeably weaker. A viable MIS supported by comprehensive training and research is urgently needed. The weak support capacity of an illiterate population can not be over-emphasized.

3. Under-utilization of Non-Formal Education

Formal education provides the basic cone for developing a functionally literate population. Many older children and young adults have not had the opportunity to enter or complete the formal system. Other techniques must be employed to reach them. Distance education programs of the AIOU are proving to be worthy of USAID support. So is the National Institute for Communications through Education (NICE) program which is being developed by the Literacy and Mass Education Council (LAMEC). This program was originally proposed by USAID in 1977.

4. Additional Directorate for Public Instruction - Primary (ADPI)

If left to develop without expertise specifically trained and experienced in the unique learning problems inherent in Primary classes this new Directorate could be a dangerous pitfall. Support from USAID, however, could assist greatly in its development. Until now, the GOP has not really focused on the Primary level which lays the base for future schooling.

OPPORTUNITIES FOR USAID SUPPORT

The program suggested herein is based on the premises that

- 1) a country's development possibilities largely depend on the functional literacy level of its people as provided by its education system and, that

2) strengthening the Quality aspects of education is the surest and most effective route to sustained Quantity or access. The major thrust is to assist the Sind, NWFP and Baluchistan (and, as appropriate, the Punjab) to extend their comprehensive PEP II programs to their remaining Districts. Based on preliminary discussions with education officials (summarized below), meetings with IDA personnel and review of the pending ADB program focusing on Primary girls, the USAID program should support:

- 1) Teacher Improvement and supply including Model Girls Middle Schools, Classes 1-8
- 2) Curriculum and Evaluation
- 3) Instructional Materials,
- 4) Union Council Model Boys Schools, Classes 1-5
- 5) Non-formal Teacher Education and Functional Literacy program
- 6) Educational Infrastructure Support
- 7) Private-Not-for-Profit Schools.

A brief summary and suggested magnitudes follow. More complete descriptions are found in the main report.

	Federal	Sind	NWFP	Baluchistan
Female teacher hostels and transport.			X	X
Matching grants/loans for water, toilets, walls etc.		X		
Non-Formal Education - Federal level AIOU - teacher training Distance education. LEMAC. -"NICE",				
communications multi-media Program (part of PEP III).	X	X		X

From the above the following were selected for immediate support. A more complete discussion of each area is found in the main report. Suggested dollar inputs are tentative "guesstimates" at this point.

1. Teacher Improvement Girls Middle schools - 30 GCETs \$66.4 million

Teachers are a most important ingredient in the teaching - learning process. Their training is not appropriate. Supervision has been nearly non-existent. Teacher performance is poor. Absenteeism is a problem. Rural areas lack teachers in the villages - especially women. To improve the supply of candidates available for village female schools, Union Council Model girls schools (with dormitories) need to be upgraded to Middle schools (Classes 1-8) supplementing ADB/IDB efforts in this regard. Primary teachers are trained in 87 Government Colleges for Elementary Teachers. GCETs are in great need. The curriculum needs revision. They have no Model schools for practice teaching; staff have not taught in Primary schools. The IDA is helping both female and male GCETs in the Punjab. The ADB plans support to female colleges in the other Provinces. USAID should assist other GCETs in a coordinated program.

87 Govt. colleges for elementary education.

2. Curriculum and Evaluation - Reform - Relevance \$5 million

What children are taught and how their learning is evaluated should be the responsibility of the Curriculum Wing. This will necessitate a change. The 2-step curriculum needs to be developed and made relevant. Boy-Girl, Urban-Rural and age differences must be studied and incorporated.

IBRD is doing this in Punjab.

Young children (Katchi) 3-5 years old must come to school so their older siblings can attend. A suitable program must be developed for them. Now they disrupt classes and gain negative feelings about school attendance.

3. Instructional Materials - Textbooks, Kits, Libraries \$25 million

These are basic teaching tools and learning guides. They are practically non-existent in public schools-but essential to problem solving and active participation other than rote memory and chanting.

not available in school
most students must buy

With individualized instruction materials, multi-grade teaching could be greatly improved. Most rural school classrooms are multi-grade.

4. Union Council Model Schools for Boys (1,000) \$38 million

The Union Council is the basic administrative unit in the Province. It is also the home base for the L.C. and his assistance to teachers. Girls Model Middle schools will probably be supported by the ADP and IDA (Punjab). Strong U.C. schools should set standards for improving community support under the L.C. in the villages.

5. Non-formal Education AIOU and LAMEC \$20 million

Support to the Federally based Open University and out-of-school literacy programs of LAMEC may give a second chance to thousands. Teacher Education by Distance; Basic Fundamental Education Project (BFEP); Integrated Functional Education (female) IFE; NAI ROSHNI (Drop-in) schools and the "NICE" program to develop community participation and support would be assisted.

Distance Ed
for teachers
AIOU

6. Infrastructure Strengthening/Support (AEPAM) \$20 million

Establishing a firm educational data base MIS program from Union Council to Islamabad and intensive training of educational administrators and managers over a prolonged period of time would be the thrust of this project. It would have support from the AID/W, Harvard University "BRIDGES" project as well as the IDA and ADB.

7. Support of Private Sector "Not-for-Profit"
Primary Schools

\$25.6 million

"Not-for-Profit" needs definition. This project would not support large or small institutions that are commercial ventures. Quality education at low tuition (Rs. 50-Rs. 200 per month) would probably be an acceptable definition. Minister of Education Syed Sajjad Haider has recently said that no one would grudge if the fees charged matched Quality of education imparted.

Assistance would be through a low cost loan - revolving fund; matching grants for rural Primary schools administered by the Private sector, and grants for small private schools. PVOs and NGOs would be prime recipients. Schools would have to be included in the MIS system and be subject to educational and financial audit. GOP would make qualified schools tax-free.

TOTAL \$200 million

ASSESSMENT OF THE WORLD BANK PROJECTS 1, 2 AND 3
CONCERNING PRIMARY EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN

INTRODUCTION

USAID/Pakistan is considering the feasibility of joining other Donor efforts in providing assistance to Pakistan's long-neglected Primary education sector. To lay the ground work for such US support the Mission financed an in-depth Primary Sector Assessment which was completed in July, 1986. This four volume report was well received by the GOP and other Donor agencies. It clearly defined major issues, their historic legacies and recommended broad areas that require urgent attention and thoughtful assistance.

Quality, as the essential ingredient for infrastructure improvements, was highlighted. Focus on the teacher/learner situation and increasing the flow of funds to the sector permeated the assessment. Development of an accurate data base for planning, decision making and management was stressed.

In 1987 a further study was made by Benson, Freeman and Method. This again pointed out major issues and constraints being faced by the education sector. Their report underscored the fact that the GOP is slowly but demonstrably increasing its support to Primary education. Progress through the Sixth and Seventh (proposed) Five-Year Educational Plans and the focus on Primary education contained in the Prime Minister's Five-Year Program (1985-90) all evidence the importance the GOP is now giving to the sector. A careful review showed that the GOP is increasing its financial allocations to Primary education and literacy. Progress being made under the IDA's PEP projects also led them to believe that the risks to USAID investment in Primary education are diminishing. They then recommended parameters for a USAID project which would enhance and hasten sector development - particularly in the improvement of schooling for Girls.

Meanwhile, the Asian Development Bank (ADB) has initiated (October 1987) a probable \$75 million project to improve the infrastructure surrounding the education of Primary-age girls. The ADB design team is expected to complete its report by April 1988. A USAID PID team will have these inputs as well as further IDA plans to consider during its project design. The IDA has also expressed willingness to consider co-financing of further PEP investments. Since 1979 (when AID asked the World Bank to "take-over" USAID's planned Primary Education Project) the IDA has been the prime foreign Donor. It continues to support Primary education in Pakistan through a series of soft loans of 10,52.5 and 140 million dollars respectively.

Before identifying a definitive project to be submitted to AID/W The Mission requested this writer to analyze the Bank's extensive ten year sector experience. The following report highlights constraints and successes. It attempts to show how the IDA and GOP have overcome problems as they have emerged during implementation.

II.

THE WORLD BANK FIRST PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT (PER I)
SELECTED SCHOOLS IN ALL PROVINCES

PERIOD: 1979 - 84; COST: \$10,000,00	IDA
<u>\$ 6,600,00</u>	GOP
\$16,600,00	

A. OBJECTIVE

This first of a phased series of planned World Bank (IDA) loans to the Primary education sector pursues four major objectives:

1. Increased access to Primary schools, especially for girls and rural poverty groups, is sought by:
 - a. providing school facilities and materials,
 - b. Providing more female teachers, and
 - c. enhancing supervising with the intent of improving school-community relations and overcoming parental indifferences to enrollment and attendance.
2. Reducing Wastage, principally by reducing dropout and repetition through improved facilities, materials, instruction, supervision (and teacher presence), and by working with parents and community leaders to avert dropouts.
3. Higher pupil achievement and improved quality of instruction through:
 - a. recurrent in-service teacher training in methods of

teaching and classroom management aimed towards better utilization of school time and

b. more frequent local supervision of instruction.

4. Reduced costs by:

a. reducing wastage inherent in drop outs,

b. introducing lower cost teacher, and

c. moving towards larger class and school sizes.

The project proposes a limited approach to these objectives: coverage is low enough to avoid large scale investment in improved approaches, yet large enough to provide statistically significant experimentation and research.

B. SCOPE

Being experimental in nature and focused on rural rather than urban schools, the target areas selected for implementation represented less than ten percent of the Primary education system. It was anticipated, however, that favorable results in terms of access, efficiency, learning achievements and cost reductions could be applied, over time, to the ninety percent of the system not included in the project.

Improved teacher training, increased supervision, better instructional materials and more adequate physical facilities were the most important project elements. Intensive and recurrent in-service teacher training was expected to lead to improved teacher effectiveness. Additional Primary school supervisors and a new category of Learning Coordinators attached to District educational units were expected to result in

improved teacher performance, reduced teacher absenteeism and closer relationships among schools, parents and communities. New instructional materials were designed and introduced in an effort to raise pupil achievement. Lower per pupil costs were expected to result from hiring locally recruited "assistant teacher" (especially women), larger schools sizes and new low cost building designs.

The project was designed to include upgrading of approximately 4000 schools, nearly 10,000 teachers, and over 380,000 currently enrolled students as well as about an additional 400,000 children who would not otherwise be reached. Seventy percent (280,000) of the additional students were to be female.

The scope of project content and coverage differed among Provinces in order to provide for varying approaches to the components being tested and to concentrate activities in the two Provinces most disadvantaged in terms of opportunities for girls, Baluchistan and the NWFP.

C. PROJECT COMPONENTS

Teacher Services

Assistant Teachers - 340 (150 male - 190 female) - Qualifications were that they be recruited from the same or an adjacent village, be familiar with the community and have completed grade 8 or equivalent. They received special 2-3 week intensive resident training annually as well as 2-3 day training in alternate months by Supervisors or Learning Coordinators. Content focused on:

In-service Teacher Training

- a) methods for teaching each major subject

	<u>PUNJAB</u>		<u>SIND</u>		<u>BALUCHISTAN</u>		<u>NWFP</u>		<u>TOTAL</u>
	<u>M</u>	<u>F</u>	<u>M</u>	<u>F</u>	<u>M</u>	<u>F</u>	<u>M</u>	<u>F</u>	M + F
Supervisors	20	10	4	4	0	0	8	5	51
L.C.	200	100	20	20	40	23	40	23	466
Schools	1200	600	200	200	447	171	855	395	4068
Schools Per Supervisor	60	60	50	50	-	-	107	79	-
Schools per L.C.	6	6	10	10	12	14	21	17	-

Qualifications

Supervisor - 5 years Primary Teaching plus leadership/counselling potential

L.C. - 2 years etc., primary teaching plus live in VICINITY

Instructional Materials to be Furnished Included:

textbooks, teachers guides, library books, school equipment

	<u>PUNJAB</u>	<u>SIND</u>
Textbooks	1 set per teacher	1 set per teacher
Teachers guides	1 set per school	1 set per school
Pupil text books	-	-
Libraries	1 per school	1 per school
	<u>BALUCHISTAN</u>	<u>NWFP</u>
Textbooks	1 set per teacher	1 set per teacher
Teachers guides	1 set per school	1 set per school
Pupil textbooks	1 set(3 yrs) per pupil	1 set per 10% of pupils
Libraries	1 per school	1 per school

Physical Facilities - New

	Classrooms		Housing for Female Teachers		In-Service Centers	
	M	F	Total	F	M	F
Punjab	200	100	300	200	-	-
Sind	200	200	400	50	4	4
Baluchistan	20	44	64	18	1	1
NWFP	<u>60</u>	<u>190</u>	<u>250</u>	<u>20</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>
Total	480	534	1014	288	5	5

By the last year of the project (1983) quantitative organaizational and physical targets had been met. Too often, though, completion was not on schedule or in the integrated manner necessary for quality achievement.

D. ACHIEVEMENT - 1983

<u>Operation</u>	<u>Target</u>	<u>Achievement</u>
1. Establishing FIU & PIUs	5	5
2. Construction of class-rooms	1014	997
3. Construction of boundry walls	182	179
4. Construction of teacher residences	334	334
5. Establishing Centre Schools	300	300
6. Establishing District Resource Centre	8	8
7. Supplying furniture to schools	4100	4100
8. Supplying class-room equipment to schools	4100	4100
9. Supply transport-----Vans	25	25
Motorcycles	168	168
Cycles	300	300
10. Appointment field personnel - Supervisors	51	51
Learning	466	437
Coordinators		
* Asst. teachers	340	306
Drivers	300	300

E. DEFICIENCIES

Project activities were spread across the country in all Provinces. Being experimental in nature it met some resistance from the far-flung "establishment" and was often not well understood. Many teachers and administrators ~~felt~~^{felt} threatened by the new ideas, equipment and procedures which they really did not understand.

Evaluation studies made as part of program management are recorded in the Draft Comprehensive Report prepared by the Federal Implementing Unit in 1983.

The most notable deficiencies found were clustered around:

1. Teacher training and the improvement of instructions. In many ways this was a story of lost opportunity.
2. Implementation difficulties were often caused by not understanding procedures - hence many unnecessary delays.
3. Bottlenecks in releasing funds when due even though such funds appeared to be "available" on paper.
4. Inadequate procedures for contracting and supervising construction resulted in many delays and unsatisfactory buildings.
5. Nearly 300 newly constructed female teacher residences did not attract teachers to live in the villages. The rooms were generally used by the community but did not serve their original purpose.
6. Teachers did not understand the purpose or how to use the 4100 sets of instructional materials that were distributed to them. Few sets are in evidence today.
7. Learning Coordinators eventually were supplied with motorcycles but the brand purchased had no spare parts available locally. The rough terrain soon made the cycle useless.
8. Project evaluations designed and conducted by outside experts were not suited to nor valid for the Pakistan setting.

9. The bottom line is a lack of flexibility built into project design and the all powerful PC-1. The inability to make midstream adjustments was a major limitation.
10. Delay in obtaining vehicles was severe. Only in the last year of the project (1983) was the Supervision component considered mobile.

PEP I, broke new ground. Innovations are always risky. Yet the GOP feels that most major objectives were reached. Progress, although slow, was sure as witnessed by:

1. The appointment of a successful Primary teacher to the new position of Learning Coordinator to work directly with teachers in 20 to 25 schools was an outstanding success.
2. Community and parental support of schools increased as the program became functional.
3. Pupil and teacher attendance improved.
4. Dropouts were reduced.
5. Upgraded shelterless schools and classrooms were an inspiration to teachers and parents alike.
6. The unqualified Assistant Teacher concept proved successful.

*
These are on preceding page under Achievements

Administration/Management/Financial Flow:

With the understanding that management of PEP I has been generally successful, it serves constructive planning to identify deficiencies so they may be eliminated or improved.

Administrative

- * Recruitment for Field staff vacancies was sometimes delayed. Approved positions were not filled.
- * Two-way communication was weak. PIU obtained little feedback from the field.
- * Field staff received little PIU support and only one Province set up a monitoring system.
- * Distribution of learning materials, and equipment suffered long unnecessary delays.
- * Few field staff reports were forwarded to the FIU.
- * FIU representatives were not invited to PIU meetings.

Personnel

- * A few researchers trained under the project left their jobs which did not offer them enough job security.
- * Considerable staff turnover interrupted progress and momentum.
- * Some key posts such as Deputy Director (Research), Public Relations Officer and Accounts Officer were never filled.
- * Salary adjustments were delayed reducing enthusiasm and job satisfaction.
- * Withdrawal of conveyance from female field staff on one pretext it another was so request as to give the impression that what they were supposed to do was not important.

Professional

- * Researchers were sometimes not allowed to go to the field to spot check data.
- * B and C type training were not evaluated.
- * Exactly the same content was given to the same people by the same trainers through 3 annual training cycles.

Financial

- * Disbursement claims usually were not made on time.
- * Quite often disbursement claims were not filled out using standard claim procedures. Much time and effort was lost in seeking clarifications.
- * Auditing of expenditures was not taken seriously.
- * Accounts often were not maintained according to international practice of codification etc., as required by the IDA.
- * Only 50% of 6th Plan targeted funds had been utilized by 1985. Delays in planning and obtaining necessary approvals through the system hindered the use of funds allocated in the PC-1s.
- * In absence of increased GOP financial inputs being made on a timely basis, the affordability of large scale educational expansion remains in question.
- * GOP budgeting procedures are not conducive to a development project. They are established only for maintaining order. They do not meet flexible circumstances required for changing conditions. Yet the reason for development projects is to promote change.

- * Delays in release of funds from the Finance Department made it impossible for PEP I to maintain its schedule of activities.

Management

- * Institutional framework of the Project was too loose for effective execution.
- * Functional authority but no line authority exists between FIU and PIU.
- * Concept of a Federal/Provincial team with common objectives and aspirations never took deep roots.
- * Horizontal coordination between PIU and the normal system was totally absent.
- * PIU's worked in isolation and did not generate enough "community" support. PIU's should make use of Local Government Organizations.

Please note again that the above achievements and deficiencies were all noted in the FIU DRAFT COMPREHENSIVE REPORT. This evaluation was instrumental in PIU/FIU/IDA planning of PEP II. Each of the deficiencies was considered. Attempts to eliminate or "soften" them were incorporated in administration/management procedures. Closer ties were made with the regular system and FIU/PIU relationships improved. Budget and flow of funds problems still exist but required procedures are better understood. Such problems will probably continue to exist until the total infrastructure is modified and further decentralized.

SECOND PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT

SIND, NWFP, BALUCHISTAN

PERIOD: Oct 1985-Sept 1990 -- \$52.5 million equivalent IDA (80%)
 \$20.54 million GOP (20%)

A. SCOPE

The main objective of the project is to improve the Quality of education in Pakistan. The project covers about 14,000 schools in the Sind, Baluchistan and the Northwest Frontier Provinces (NWFP). In these provinces the project aims to upgrade educational Quality in about 59% of the schools, influence the teaching methods of approximately 54% of the teachers and improve the achievement of approximately 44% of the Primary school children. It covers all schools in the 14 Districts served by PEP II.

	<u>SIND</u>		<u>NWFP</u>		<u>BALUCHISTAN</u>		<u>TOTAL</u>	
	M	F	M	F	M	F	M	F
(SDEO) SUPERVISORS	28	28	2	7	6	8	34	43
LEARNING COORDINATORS	267	111	144	74	59	24	470	209
SCHOOLS	6,700	1,400	3,600	1,100	1000	250	11,300	2,750
TEACHERS	14,997	2,777	6,034	2,115	2,476	806	23,509	5,698
ASSISTANT Tos	762	444	410	296	334	96	1508	836

PUPILS(000)	528	112	384	93	73	72	985	277
DISTRICTS	8		5			6		19
TEHSIL	52		12			14		80
UNION COUNCILS	483		267			81		831

B. OBJECTIVES

Quality improvement is to be achieved by:

- 1) more effective in-service training and the supervision of teachers,
- 2) improved learning materials, by the development of 276 integrated teacher learning Modules,
- 3) expanded use of Assistant teachers,
- 4) improved low-cost, low maintenance physical facilities,
- 5) greater community support,
- 6) increased literacy rates and students achievements.

Punjab opted out of PEP II. Reasons are not clearly stated but in 1984-85 they evidently thought they had greater success with PEP I than they were given credit for in the evaluation papers. They also wanted to create the Additional Secretariat system solely responsible for Primary education. This was later included in PEP III. They were developing a Four-Year Comprehensive Educational Investment Plan that went further than the PEP II program. They were also worried about costs. In 1985 foreign assistance monies were not treated as additionality to Provincial budgets as they now are. When this change occurred the Punjab saw they had lost a large opportunity for Federal support. Consequently they are negotiating PEP III to cover all Punjabi Public Schools as well as to support other innovations with the non-formal and private sectors.

C. COMPONENTS - PROGRESS TO DATE

1. ADMINISTRATION/MANAGEMENT

Management and Planning

- * Consolidation of Inputs - Project inputs are not dispersed over scattered school sites (as in PEP I) but now are concentrated on all the schools within an entire District.

- * The responsibility for effective use of inputs are substantially transferred from special Project Implementation Units (PIUs) to the regular management structure of the Provincial Education Departments. In the Districts that participate, the project is the only system of Primary education in effect.

- * For greater clarity of purpose and responsibilities between the Federal and Provincial project units, the Federal Unit changed its name and functions from Implementation (FIU) to Coordination (FCU) The PIU has increased responsibilities for implementation decisions and financial disbursements. The FCU responsibilities have become primarily the appraisal of tranche proposals, supervision of implementation and liaison with the IDA.

- * Additional staff positions in educational technology, research, management information systems (MIS), communications and public relations are scheduled.

- * Project management is being integrated into the provincial administrative system. PIUs are being incorporated into or having closer links with the Department of Education- Schools.
- * Phasing implementation into five discrete tranche periods of planning and accountability increases flexibility and enables the FCU to gradually phase out its present implementation/management role and pass these functions on to the PIUs and the Provincial Departments of Education.
- * Implementation by tranches (time periods) gives District level officials and PIUs responsibility for establishing targets, adopting overall strategies to fit local conditions and preparing proposals for allocating resources. Substantial improvements in local planning and management capabilities are expected as a result of this move to extend responsibilities from Provincial to District levels. Implementation will not be undertaken in any Tehsil until a detailed implementation plan has been prepared by the District Education Office and approved by the Provincial Education Department and the Federal Coordination Unit.
- * Separate implementation plans are prepared for boys' and girls' schools in each Tehsil.
- * To ensure that adequate financial resources are available for project implementation 80 percent of project costs are supplied to the Provinces in addition to their normal Annual Development Program (ADP) allocations. The remaining 20 percent is provided by the Provinces from their own resources or from their normal ADP.

Information Systems: PEP I had limited success in supplying accurate data on enrollments, repeaters, drop-outs and costs. PEP II supports the strengthening of the Management Information Systems by financing the costs of additional staff and equipment on a declining scale.

Communication and Dissemination: Information about PEP I findings has had little circulation in Pakistan and the educational community. An active dissemination program including the use of broadcast media is being undertaken under PEP II.

- * Also on a declining scale PEP II finances salaries of additional staff including one Information Officer in the FCU and a Professional Assistant in each PIU

Project Evaluation: Improvements under PEP II include assessments made jointly by PIU and FCU staff concerning:

- * local community attitudes towards Primary education;
- * verifiable improvement of teachers' classroom activities; and
- * achievements of the project's ultimate objectives--increased participation, greater student achievement and lower per capita costs.
- * Diagnostic and formative studies to identify aspects of the project that might be strengthened or added are being scheduled.

2. SUPERVISION

Learning Coordinators: The hypothesis that the new role of Learning Coordinators (LC) would reduce teacher absenteeism, increase professional guidance to teachers and stimulate greater community support was confirmed by PEP I. As a result of this the use of LCs is expanded to meet the management demands at District and Sub-district levels.

- * Six hundred seventy nine LCs and 79 new supervisory staff are added in the three Provinces.

* Salaries and allowances are financed on a declining scale.

* Appropriate vehicles are also completely financed by the project.

Assistant Teachers: The hypothesis that the employment of uncertified Assistant teachers (especially female), resident in the local area can be a valid, low-cost solution to rural teacher shortages was also confirmed by PEP I.

* This project supports the salaries of about 2350 additional Assistant teachers on a declining basis.

In-Service Training: PEP I identified the nature and extent of skill deficiencies but did little to overcome them. Experience showed that course content was often inappropriate, training was isolated from other project inputs and trainers did little to follow-up and give assistance in applying the lessons in the classroom.

* PEP II aims to restructure in-service training and link it to the use of tightly structured learning modules. Follow-up is provided by LCs.

* Approximately 2500 supervisors and LCs (Level A), 2350 assistant teachers (Level B) and 30,000 regular teachers are being trained.

Female Teachers: Basic to the objective of increasing the participation of girls is the support system for female teachers.

1. Transportation of female teachers to villages and return has encountered many difficulties:

* Procedures are unclear as to who pays for gas, oil and necessary repairs for teacher transport.

* No private companies operate transportation services in rural Baluchistan.

- * Cultural factors are too strong in many areas of Baluchistan and the Sind.
- * Security of the "outsiders" welfare within the village is a problem.
- * Male drivers sometimes cause problems.
- * Misuse of the transportation equipment - being commandeered by higher level officials for other purposes results in teacher absenteeism and lowering of parent, student, community esteem/support.

2. Baluchistan has only female DEOs at the Divisional level but none in the District offices.

- * This problem has not been rectified so far by PEP II. It compounds problems of supervision.

3. It is generally felt that females make better teachers but not administrators. Competent as they may be there are places they just may not go.

- * Female administrators must rely on male clerks as "GO-FERS".
- * Girl clerks can't move about in the sector reserved for males.

3. LEARNING MATERIALS:

Modules: Under PEP I only limited provision was made for developing and distributing instructional guides. Instructional material kits were distributed but have mostly disappeared. PEP II analyzes the specific skills and knowledge of subjects at each grade level and supports text books and material development.

- * Self-contained learning modules consisting of demonstration exercises for the teacher, practice exercises for the student and a mastery test for in-service training, as teacher guides and for on-the-job training by the LCs.
- * Two hundred seventy six separate modules are being prepared, tested and printed but progress is slow .
- * None of the 42 now developed in the Provinces have been tested.
- * Full implementation is scheduled for 1990 (grades (IV-V) and 1992 (grade I-III).

TEACHING KITS: The modules emphasize use of free and inexpensive learning materials that may be developed by the teacher. The L.C. has responsibility for assisting teachers to make, use and save such materials. This activity has yet to begin as modules are not yet ready.

4. SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION AND REMODELING:

A total of 6000 classrooms are being added to already existing schools and 12,000 classrooms are being upgraded in PEP II under a new system of construction and supervision.

- * NESPAK, a competent national firm of planning and construction consultants, was appointed to provide the services of construction management (CM). The CM is responsible for managing all civil works including procurement of the 6,000 classrooms. It is charged with the responsibilities of:

- 1) pre-qualification of contractors,

- 2) preparation of documentation for international competitive bidding (ICB) including performance specifications and two "deemed to satisfy" designs (traditional and semi-industrialized classrooms),
- 3) evaluation of submissions,
- 4) recommendations on the award,
- 5) phasing and scheduling,
- 6) logistic and legal consideration,
- 7) performance testing and guarantees and,
- 8) site supervision.

- * The Construction Manager (NESPAK) advises and coordinates the technical planning and costing of local individual works at each school site such as boundary walls, classroom renovation and the coordination of all building production June, 1985 was the date set for tending. An external consultant was appointed to assist with bid evaluation and qualifications.
- * Once bids were awarded the contractor became responsible for the construction and/or manufacture, testing, transportation, erection and commissioning of classroom units and providing the necessary warranties and bonds.
- * The CM is responsible for assisting the FCU in monitoring progress and coordinating building production completion and on-site supervision on in accordance with provincial franchising.
- * Some civil works (about \$2,1 million) scattered over the 6,000 sites are to be procured by locally awarded contracts under local bidding procedures using locally available labor and locally procured materials.
- * Local communities are encouraged to erect some 4,000 boundary walls.
- * Twelve thousand existing classrooms are to be rehabilitated.

Legalizing Sites

Land for Primary schools must be provided by the village or community. All other public school levels (middle schools and up) are provided by the government. Basic problems arise.

- * Each village has common land that it can use for such purposes or a landlord may provide the 2 kanals required for a Primary school in 1971. In 1971, however, the GOP nationalized most schools and private parties "benefactor" initiative has died out.

- * Land is proportionately expensive in many rural areas as well as urban areas (where prices are astronomical). Few communities can afford the contribution. Hence, thousands of "shelterless" schools and many sub-standard rented facilities dominate the Primary school sector.
- * When new land must be provided, obtaining clear title is often complicated and time-consuming - especially when more than one owner is involved.
- * Actual construction of a Primary school in the selected area may be long delayed and grossly disrupt ADP and PC-1 schedules, the training and hiring of a teacher and procurement of teaching materials. Site acquisition doesn't appear to be a problem in the rural areas. The occasional disputes over title cause delays but they are few. More important problems for the engineers are unsuitable contours, drainage, electricity, water supply, latrines, orientation for wind and sun, and the instability of migrating tribes.
- * Insufficient funding in the PC-1 is of major concern. Only Rs. 2500 (\$145) is provided for classroom renovation/repair. Average renovations currently cost Rs. 15,000 (\$867). Rs. 8000 is provided for a boundary wall but actual cost is Rs. 150 per running foot-enough to construct only 53 feet! Communities may supply some labor but they have no money. The wall or building provides no direct benefit to most individual villagers so it receives no community support. Yet boundary walls are necessary for all Primary schools - especially those for girls.

CONTRACTING FOR CONSTRUCTION

Since some of the construction under PEP I was deficient the IDA recommended in 1985 that PEP II classrooms be built using pre-fab technologies. It also

suggested that International Bidding Procedures (IBP) be followed in selecting contractors. This proved to be a lengthy process. Tenders were received and opened in March 1986. However, the 2000 classroom contract for the NWFP and 1000 classrooms contract for Baluchistan were only awarded 9 months later in January 1987. The contractors chosen for Baluchistan and the NWFP required six months (July 1987) to provide prototypes of the pre-fab construction. The Federal Education Committee then required further assurances from the contractors about life expectancy of the pre-fab technology; maintenance schedules for waterproofing the roof, rustproofing walls and anti-termites treatments; fire resistancy of panels and the quality and strength of steel to be used. The above were submitted and certified by NESPAK but as of 2 years after the PEP II became effective, (January 1988) the MOE Committee had not given final approval to begin construction in those two Provinces.

Meanwhile the lowest bid for 3000 classrooms in the SIND exceeded the limit set by the PC-I and had to be re-bid. To lower costs prospective contractors could now opt to submit traditional, semi pre-fab or totally pre-fab designs. International bidding procedures were again used. Twenty nine firms submitted qualifications in June 87. By August, 6 were pre-qualified and asked to submit tenders by 15 October 87. The cost still exceeded the SIND PC-1 limitations by Rs 70,500 million. An average of about \$1360 per classroom.

Again, the MOE Secretary Committee met on 21 December 87 and decided:

- 1) PEP II construction be entrusted to the SIND Education Department's Director of Engineering Works (EEW) to decide specifications of construction and awarding of contracts according to local conditions. NESPAK would have the top supervisory responsibility over construction work.
- 2) The World Bank be asked to permit Local Construction Bidding (LCB) procedures to be followed instead of ICB. The Bank agreed and work is progressing.

CONSTRUCTION: Civil works under PEP II is being handled directly by the FCU through NESPAK. 6000 classrooms will be added. New construction is delayed three years as described above. Signals now (February 88) seem to be "Go" as bidding and contracting procedures are finalized.

Renovation and Repair of existing classrooms has proceeded in the Sind through their EEW. A total of 1088 classroom have been upgraded. Baluchistan, working through the Rural Development Department, renovated 162 classrooms during the 1985-86 tranche but none since that time. The NWFP repair/renovation program doesn't seem to have gotten started to date.

The SIND Director of Education Engineering Works, (EEW) Manzoor Ahmed Qureshi is confident all construction in the Sind will be completed by the end of 1991. The EEW was established in 1980 and has trained supervisors below the Tehsil level. They handle all other SIND Education Civil Works. NWFP and Baluchistan are not as optimistic.

The abnormal delay in the start of civil works has greatly effected the crucial construction/renovation of schools and therefore forced delays in general project implementation. Acquisition of sites however does not appear to have been a major problem.

THIRD PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT

- PUNJAB

PERIOD: June 1987 - Jan. 1994	\$140.0 million	-	IDA (65.2%)
	15.5 million	-	CIDA (07.2%)
	4.81 million	-	EEC (02.2%)
	54.46 million	-	GOP (25.4%)
	<u>214.82 million</u>	-	<u>(100%)</u>

A. SCOPE:

This project is still in the pre-implementation stage. It is designed to support the core program of the Punjab's five-year Primary education investment. It also supports the Prime Minister's Plan for education and activities elaborated in Pakistan's Sixth and Seventh (in draft) Five-Year Plans for educational development. It covers planned educational efforts in all Punjabi Districts as stated in the Punjab Five Year Primary Education Program and the Provincial ADP as follows.

Punjab Five-Year Primary Education Investment Program 1988-1992

PART I

PRIME MINISTER'S PROGRAM (FEDERAL FINANCING - DEVELOPMENT & RECURRENT COSTS)

OPEN - 5737 Mosque schools

OPEN - 9950 Girls schools

Appoint - 45,000 new teachers

33,350 for new girls schools

1,633 for single teacher schools

11,524 additional for largest schools in Union Councils

Appoint - 4,734 Learning Coordinators

PART II

PROVINCIAL ADP

Construction - 7803 boys shelterless schools
8526 girls shelterless schools
8298 additional class rooms

Teacher training - 40,000 pre-service for unqualified Assistant teachers
17,500 in-service

Management - Create new departmental organization for new position of
Additional Director of Public Instruction - Primary. (ADPI)

Text books & learning materials
Curriculum development
Communications/Demand Generation development.

AIM to increase Primary participation rate ages 5-9 from 55% to 74% by 1992.

TOTAL COST (US MILLIONS)

<u>Local</u>	<u>Foreign</u>	<u>Total</u>
\$396.83	\$49.23	\$446.06

B. OBJECTIVES

PEP III stresses Quality improvement rather than Quantity improvement.
It aims to:

1. Develop and strengthen institutional capacity to plan, manage and
implement Punjab's educational investment program;

2. Support the development and institutionalization of policy reform;
and

3. Assist in the introduction of innovative project components.

MORE SPECIFICALLY, the institutional development objective is intended to be achieved by strengthening:

- a) the Directorate of Public Instruction (DPI) by adding a new Additional Directorate to focus on Primary education. This Directorate will clearly delineate a hierarchy for the management of Primary education;
- b) the National Bureau of Curriculum and Textbooks (NBCT), and the Curriculum Research and Development Center (CRDC) Punjab to implement a program of curriculum reform;
- c) the Provincial Education Extension Center (PEEC) in the Punjab to assist in the reorganization and strengthening of the pre and in-service teacher training programs;
- d) the National Institute for Communications through Education (NICE) for the development and implementation of a Communications/Demand Generation program; and
- e) the establishment of a Civil Engineering Cell (CEC) to manage, supervise and implement the school construction program.

The policy reform objective is planned to be achieved by working with both National and Provincial governments to institute policies and programs for:

- a) career development of Primary school teachers;
- b) recruitment, training and appointment of more female teachers;
- c) improvement of the incentive package to encourage more teachers to serve in rural areas;

- d) increased financial provision for the annual supply of pedagogic materials;
- e) maintenance of Primary school buildings; and
- f) parental and community involvement in school management.

The innovation objective would be achieved by directly supporting:

- a) the development of a Communications/Demand Generation program; (NICE);
- b) the reform of pre and in-service teacher training; and
- c) the introduction of a two-stage curriculum in Primary schools.

These program support activities are expected to result in increased enrollments, improved efficiency, and improved quality of instruction.

The "core" program components of the Punjab Investment Plan that will receive IDA financing are focused on the following:

1. MANAGEMENT IMPROVEMENT (\$4.53 MILLION)

- * Reorganize the DPI by adding an Additional Director - Primary, (ADPI) and staff to Union Council level.
- * Develop a Provincial monitoring and evaluation capacity complete with MIS and computers.
- * Rapid Low Cost studies (RLC) through contracts.

2. CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT AND MATERIALS SUPPLY (\$29.35 MILLION)

- * Two-stage curriculum reform.
- * Increased capacity of the National Bureau of Curriculum and

Textbooks (NBCT) and the Curriculum Research and Development Center (CRDC) Punjab to plan, design analyze, test and disseminate curricula through special Primary units.

- * Improve and increase supply of Teacher Guides, Teaching Kits and Basic Educational Materials. Increase the per Pupil allocation from Rs.6 to Rs.50.
- * Subsidize paper costs and reduce prices of the textbooks.

3. TEACHER TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT (\$52.16 MILLION)

- * Pre-service training at 29 existing Government Colleges for Elementary Teachers (GCET).
- * In-service training for 17,500 unqualified "assistant" teachers.
 - Distance teaching - AIOU
 - Micro-teaching
 - Multi-grade teaching
 - School parent/teacher community participation
- * Recurrent In-service training.
 - Completely revised using Learning Coordinators.
 - Provincial and District Education Extension Center (PEEC)
- * Management training.
 - All new ADPI staff (PEEC and AEPM).

Female Teacher Appointment

- *Ratio 1 to 40 Pupils
- *Relax age requirements at both ends.

Incentives - to attract both male and female to the rural area.

Teacher career development/mobility - Assistant teacher be able to become SDEO through experience and training.

4. COMMUNICATION/DEMAND GENERATION (\$3.65 MILLION)

- * Motivation for attendance rather than compulsion.
Advanced salary increments to teachers, principals and AEO's for achieving 98% boy enrollment, 50% girl enrollment in grade I.
- * Flexible scheduling of school calendar and operational hours.
- * Training/motivation of community and parental groups (NICE) program. National Institute for Communication through Education.

5. SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION AND MAINTENANCE (\$100.65 MILLION)

- * 5200 New classrooms and boundary walls for Girls shelterless schools.
- * 5100 New Girls schools includes Mosque schools for girls.
- * Maintenance - clear policy and responsibilities.
- * New Civil Engineering Cell (CEC) in the Department of Education for repair, maintenance and construction of shelterless schools.
- * Use of Local Government and Rural Development (LGRD) for supervision and construction of other new buildings.

PEP III is a little slow in reaching the negotiation stage. Delays appear to be due largely to inadequate GOP staff time rather than differences of opinion or conflict. Much detailed planning has been accomplished and final negotiations are expected to take place in March 88. Given the status of preparation, the capacities of both the Federal and Provincial Ministries, the completion of the school map and establishment of the CEC, it is expected that recruitment of foreign and local experts can begin as soon as the loan is made effective. Construction should proceed expeditiously and not repeat the consequences of the PEP II delay.

The IDA will set up a special bank account to be managed by the FCU for Federally sponsored activities of NICE (communications), NBCT (curriculum

development) and AIOU (in-service training). A second account to meet foreign exchange and other local expenditures will be managed by the Punjab Department of Education (DPI and ADPI) Retroactive funding up to \$2 million will cover eligible expenditures incurred after September 1986 for costs incurred by the GOP in implementing appraisal activities. The IDA feels that the priority now being given to Primary education and the impetus provided in the Prime Minister's program will also help ensure timely project implementation.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR USAID SUPPORT
OF PRIMARY EDUCATION

V. MAJOR LESSONS LEARNED FROM PEPS I, II, III

1. Teacher training needs a complete overhaul. Learning Coordinators confirm that teacher/pupil interaction is the most important single ingredient of successful learning. True, the support system of adequate buildings, text books, learning materials class size and supervision are essential as well... but the focal point is the teacher. Training institutions need renovating or new structures; curricula for training teachers are obsolete; methods of teaching based on the realities of Primary education and classrooms need to be changed; College teachers need first-hand experience in Primary schools; multi-grade teaching is required of nearly all Primary teachers but how to do this is not taught in the Elementary Colleges for Primary teachers; no supervised student teaching exists in the teaching colleges; both pre-service and in-service teaching is sadly deficient; libraries even in the best and newest institutions are practically non-existent as independent reading and study are not in the curriculum...the list could go on...

Clearly the training and supervision of Primary teachers must be a crucial element of USAID assistance to this sub-sector.

2. Integration of PEP II programs into the regular Provincial "on-line" system will require a greater definition of PIU/DPI responsibilities and procedures required to make thoughtful program modifications. Room for change based on experimentation research studies and day-by-day experience must be maintained.
3. A PIU has little or no authority. It must submit operational problems to others for approval to act. This interrupts time schedules and

causes many unnecessary and often crucial delays. PIU responsibilities and authority need clarification to permit more independent action to try new procedures.

4. Government Colleges for Elementary Teachers who are "trainers of the trainers" are not directly involved in developing the learning modules used in in-service training. They are seldom conversant with the face-to-face problems of pupil/teacher learning. As noted in No. 1 above, GCTE's present a challenge to USAID technical assistance.
5. Primary curriculum reform is urgent. This has been highlighted in both Plans V and VI and will continue to be a target in Plan VII. Basic responsibility is at the Federal level yet for 8 years little has been done. The curriculum is the key to development of instructional materials, textbooks, and learning modules. Teacher training is also based on the curriculum to be taught. There is an urgent need for reform.
6. Understanding of intra and inter-ministerial relationships, authorities and responsibilities needs to be more clearly defined and understood at all management levels. Training should include all levels of responsibility and be an on-going activity - not a one shot exposure. Lack of such understanding has caused unnecessary delays.
7. "Assistant teacher" posts have been identified in PEP II but the NWFP financial structure has delayed their appointment. This situation needs further study by the USAID PID team.
8. Responsible officials must be aware of USAID requirements procedures and accounting practices to assure a smooth flow of funds. IDA opened a special account in the Pakistan National Bank of around \$2 million to provide for GOP expenses incurred prior to 1 January 85 in activities necessary to set up or expand certain infrastructures required to meet

conditions precedent to Negotiations. This account was to assure the GOP retroactive IDA payment for such expenses incurred prior to formal negotiations. However the GOP did not provide or release the necessary funds when reimbursement was claimed.

9. LCs need training in interpersonal relationships. The human relation problems of teacher supervision by LCs or ASDEOs are often complex. High rates of teacher absenteeism are often caused by teachers holding other jobs to augment their low salaries. These teachers may resent the GOP efforts to improve their attendance as well as the Quality of their teaching through closer supervision. Others look at supervision as "snoopervision" (as it usually has been) and feel threatened by the L.C. Despite obvious shortcomings some teachers feel that they have had more education than most other village members and defiantly defend their position as the traditional "GURU". A younger LC finds it difficult to effect change of behavior and introduce new or different patterns of management and teaching. The threat of "Losing Face" is real.
10. Inadequate classrooms in heavily populated areas hinder learning. Both the Sixth and Seventh Educational Plans acknowledge that the traditional classroom size is not sufficient to support Quality improvements in class size, curriculum, teaching modules, textbooks, and community requirements. Schools constructed with USAID funds should be designed to fit the age and learning characteristics of its pupils and community. Standard components may be fit together on a school by school basis considering future growth trends, site characteristics and community aspirations. USAID should study this and push for standard classrooms of various size.
11. Effective school mapping and data collection are essential...but they are not easy nor can they be simply legislated. Adding an Additional

Directorate of Instruction - Primary will facilitate this important task. However, development of these infrastructural units will require much time, effort, study, and experimentation before they operate efficiently. New staff must be recruited and trained within the total infrastructure. Others being transferred from other jobs also will require special training. Space, transport, communication equipment, software must be provided with resulting increases in both development and recurrent budgets. The Master PC-1 and ADPs must be flexible to allow further modifications so that funds may flow when needed.

12. PC-1s and ADPs must provide for more flexibility. The PEP II PC-1, approved by the Federal Planning Commission permits no flexibility for a PIU to increase or modify its training program. As a result the flexibility to be allowed by the tranche system becomes redundant. A PC-1 must include the mechanism to permit flexibility, within agreed upon parameters, according to each Provinces varying conditions, human resources, experience and time-frame requirements. National standards/expectations and Provincial/local realities may differ. A Provincial PIU must have greater decision making power and responsibility during implementation to solve problems as they arise.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR USAID SUPPORT OF PRIMARY EDUCATION

VI. PITFALLS TO BE AVOIDED BY USAID PLANNERS

1. OVER EXTENSION OF PAKISTAN PRIMARY EDUCATION RESOURCES

It appears that the GOP has negotiated or is hopeful of negotiating with Foreign Donors for about \$528 Million earmarked for Primary education and its support sector such as Government Colleges for Elementary Teachers, textbooks, learning Modules, teaching materials, furniture and construction.

Present and potential assistance is as follows:

P R E S E N T

	\$(million)	
IDA - PEP II (about)	\$ 42.0	Still to be spent.
IDA - PEP III (Punjab)	\$140.0	March 88
CIDA "NICE" TA AND Fellowships	\$ 15.0	March 88
EEC TA and Fellowships	\$ 4.0	March 88
ADB Primary Girls Project	<u>\$ 75.0</u>	In Preparation
	\$276.0	

P O T E N T I A L

USAID (in view)	\$150.0	Pre-PID stage
IDA IV Expansion of PEP III	<u>\$100.0</u>	Discussions anticipated o/a June 88 for a possible 1990 project
Total additional funds	\$526.0	
GOP Draft Plan #7 as of 15 Feb.88	\$610.52	Rs. 10.562 billion @ Rs.17.3 to \$1

The Total GOP commitment to Primary education in the Draft 7th Five-Year Plan (1988-93) now amounts to Rs. 10562 million or \$610,520,230 at the Rs.17.3 to \$1 exchange rate.

The original draft Plan for the entire education sector indicates that the total expenditures would be Rs.37,790 million: Rs.19,000 million (50.3%) brought forward from unspent Sixth Plan funds. New commitments were to be only Rs.18,790 million (49.7%). Total disbursements during the Plan were estimated at Rs.28,000 million leaving Rs.9,790 million (\$565,895,950) to be carried forward to the Eighth Plan (1993-98). The carry over to Plan 8 is only about half of the Rs. 19 billion carried over to Plan 7. This is a positive improvement.

Although the total budgeted for Primary education represents a 50.88% increase over the Sixth Plan allocations this Rs.3,562 million may be about equal to the actual funds unspent for this category in the Sixth Plan. If the IDA and USAID come through with their anticipated new inputs of \$100 and \$150 million, Foreign Donors would be supporting about 86.5% of the newly budgeted expenditures for Primary education.

It might appear that the GOP after utilizing Donor funds, would need no new Pakistani allocations to the Primary sector. Because of the dollar exchange fluctuations, they are not now able to spend the surplus dollars in PEP II that have been made available under the exchange rate. USAID needs to get GOP assurance that their own monies will be increased substantially throughout the period of USAID assistance.

The very recent IDA Education Strategy Review dated December, 1987, was concerned with GOP expenditures falling far short of Plan targets. Even with the increased emphasis on Primary education provided by the Prime Minister's program, Development expenditures to the sector will reach only about 50% of Plan targets. This report showed that:

1. Total educational expenditures during the period 1977 to 1987 averaged about 7% compared with 12.7% for all Asian countries;
2. The share of the Education budget earmarked for Primary education is also comparatively low averaging about 34% (7th Plan is 33%) compared with 44% for South Asia.
3. The share of education to total GOP expenditures rose from 6.2% in 1982-83 to 9.6% in 1987-88. This is better than reported in #1 above but is still far below the 17% mean for developing countries.
4. The share of educational expenditures to GNP has risen from 1.6% in 1982-83 to 2.4% in 1987-88. (for the 7th Plan period it is estimated to be only 2.1%). This is low by comparison with all developing countries (4.4%).
5. Sixth Plan actual expenditures for Primary were Rs.3.5 billion. The adjusted Seventh Plan target is Rs.10.56 billion. This is about a 302% increase over actual expenditures. The challenge is to get Primary sector infra-structure strengthened to spend these monies. Great efforts will be required to achieve this spending target and keep GOP funds flowing to the sector. By 1993 net enrollment rates are still forecast by the IDA to be below 66% for boys and 51% for girls.

On the bright side, of making better use of funds available, in 1987-88 there was a substantial rise in civil service pay scales. The starting pay for a trained Primary school teacher rose 34% from Rs. 560 to Rs. 750 per month. This will be compounded by a proportional increase in staff allowances.

As of 31 December 87 the FCU of PEP II reported the following utilization of funds available under the first three tranches (years) of this project: No new construction or vehicle purchase are reflected in these figures. Notwithstanding, the progressive increase in expenditures is impressive.

ADP Provision and Expenditures by Province
DURING FIRST THREE TRANCHES
(Rs. in Millions)

<u>PROVINCE</u>	<u>YEAR</u>	<u>PROVISION</u>	<u>EXPENDITURE</u>	<u>% OF EXPENDITURE</u>
<u>SIND</u>	1. 1985-86	10.000	2.498	24.98
	2. 1986-87	29.005	11.518	39.7
	3. 1987-88	14.000	15.31	109.5
<u>NWFP</u>	1. 1985-86	16.552	2.539	15.3
	2. 1986-87	20.000	5.214	26.0
	3. 1987-88	20.000	4.754	23.8
<u>BALUCHISTAN</u>	1. 1985-86	4.090	2.101	51.4
	2. 1986-87	6.056	4.665	77.0
	3. 1987-88	5.000	5.043	101.0

Charles Benson (23 March 1987) found evidence to show that the GOP at both Federal and Provincial levels was increasing its attention to Primary education. It appears that expenditures have become more favorable for Primary Education. Development allocations to Primary education as a share of total education development funds allocated rose from 29.1% in 1985-86 to 38.2% in 1986-87. In addition MPA's, MNA's and Senators allocated Rs. 242 million (U.S \$13,988,439) of their allotments for education construction in 1986-87. The bulk of this money went to the construction of Primary schools.

Recurrent expenditures on Primary education also increased in all Provinces by an average of 23.4% during the same period.

Benson found still other indications that the GOP has made a definite decision to expand the Primary education system with priorities towards rural schools

and girls. 1. With ECNEC approval it has been proposed that the Primary education component of the Prime Minister's five part Program be included in Provincial ADP targets. 2. The Seventh Plan gives strong emphasis to strengthening schools through "Consolidation" (an integrated approach) with the focus on improving Quality. Both Secretaries of Finance and Education at the Federal and Provincial levels give high priority to Primary Schools.

The IQRA surcharge has not provided Provinces with an assured source of income for Primary schools as was anticipated. Thus their long term planning for recurrent expenditures is probably inhibited. USAID should clarify this with the GOP. Objectives of the proposed USAID project will call for increased expenditures to meet recurring costs as many more children come to and stay in schools. The level of financial support must be raised and other sources of revenue sought. It would not be prudent to allow the GOP to shift responsibility for improvement and expansion of Primary education to external Donor sources. USAID should explore ways in which the Private sector, including NGO's, might become more fully involved in education.

Is it all a shell game? The Rs. may be there but under which shell? Where are the IQRA additional monies and where are the budgeted NEW monies for education?

The above discussion of funding availability is directly related to the persistent problems of prompt payment and reimbursement.

The GOP counterpart funds have not always been supplied on a timely basis to PEPs I and II. Lack of reimbursement for expenses incurred since 1985-86 was identified as a problem by each of the PIU Directors and noted in the FCU report of 31 December 87. Over \$1 million had been claimed but not received: Sind, Rs. 8,594,000 (\$496,763); NWFP, Rs. 6,620,000 (\$382,659); and Baluchistan, Rs. 2,898,000 (167,514) at the rate Rs. 17.3 = \$1.

Financial arrangements in respect of sanction, approval, competency to incur expenditures and regulations regarding purchase need critical analysis in order to promote the effective implementation of development rather than acting as obstructions. Procedures of appointment, promotion, sanction of allowance and termination etc. need modifying.

The system of maintaining accounts needs redesigning with a view to simplifying and rendering it susceptible to meaningful financial analysis and costing.

A detailed job manual of all personnel required to work with FCU and PIUs alongwith their functions, duties, responsibilities, and Tasks should be prepared with particular reference to the development nature of the project, the need to establish two-way communication channels, and the challenge to supply leadership and professional support to the field staff.

2. FRAGILE INFRASTRUCTURE IMPEDES PLANNING AND CAUSES DELAYS IN IMPLEMENTATION

There is an inherent conflict between the increasing centralization of decision making and management resulting from growing Federal Government concern with education and the increased need for decentralization of decision making and financial authority. The addition of Supervisors and Learning Coordinators is certainly a step in the right direction and widens the channels of communication down to the Union Council level. However, delegation of responsibility has not been accompanied by delegation of authority.

Many costly delays in implementation of PEPs I and II resulted from a lack of understanding of the roles of responsibility and authority accorded to the heavily layered system. Both vertical and horizontal procedures need to be clarified.

The basic PC-I for USAID assistance must be founded on local requirements and need. This document must pass through a series of Provincial and Federal office approvals not only in the Education section but in the Planning and Finance Ministries as well. Presumably, for reasons of accountability, protection of "Turf" and lack of clear lines of authority at lower levels, the final, Life-of-Project PC-1 is issued by the Federal ECNEC which is chaired by the Minister of Finance. By the time the PC-1 reaches ECNEC it has become a very rigid document. Modification to accommodate changing conditions and progress are, of course, possible but difficult to achieve. All amendments must pass through the lengthy "process" and through over-burdened staff whose main concentration is on the design and approval of new documents.

The NWFP PIU has requested that the length of certain training courses be extended but this would require a change in the PC-I. Their request was refused. The program is suffering. Reimbursements for monies spent prior to loan effectiveness are specifically permitted and funded in the PEP II Agreement. Technicalities caused by misunderstandings of IDA and GOP

procedures have held up these reimbursements for over two years. Most payments have not as yet been made. This "pitfall" must be avoided due to the size and complexity of the proposed USAID grant. Flexibility should be assured in all documents and authority to approve change as well as release of funds mechanisms should be spelled out and agreed upon. USAID as well as GOP procedures should be clearly understood by the Implementation Units.

One possible cause of the fragile infrastructure might be that officials below the top echelons are awarded their positions through seniority or patronage. Although their new job may be very different from past experience they seldom receive special training or orientation to their new responsibilities. Promotion does not necessarily depend upon proven competence, creativity and administrative ability. USAID obviously cannot reform the established GOP system but it can and should support the Academy for Educational Planning and Management efforts in training educational leadership and improving sector competence.

Fragile infrastructure is a special concern of the Secretary of Education who recently (3 February 1988) expressed to USAID the need for a management study to be made to improve his department's efficiency.

The IDA recently hired Price-Waterhouse to study the GOP administration management system in an effort to permit the decentralized tranche system to work. The Price Waterhouse report was submitted and filed. It apparently has never been discussed. It would seem essential that USAID comment on this report when preparing the PID and PP.

3. Under-utilization of Non-formal Education to Increase Functional Literacy as a Complement to Primary Education

A unique challenge to basic education is to provide as many people as possible with the opportunity to learn the fundamental reading, writing, numerical

memory and social skills necessary for everyday living, getting along and getting ahead in their environment. Realizing the overriding need for their citizens to acquire at least these basic skills at a functional level, the GOP supports both formal and non-formal systems of educational opportunity. Functional skill requirements of both systems are aimed at the levels of competency set forth in the curriculum for the successful completion of the fifth year of formal schooling. At this level a person should be functionally literate and possess the skills necessary to seek further knowledge even if he/she does not have the opportunity to continue through the formal system.

The formal system offers children the opportunity for systematic progression with the help of teachers, materials, books, a place to study and a curriculum based on both personal and societal developmental needs. The non-formal system is designed to offer older children and adults the opportunity to acquire the functional academic skills as well as vocational pursuits through a program geared to their more mature developmental needs and abilities.

The pitfall to be avoided by USAID in focusing on Primary education is that of designing a program aimed at only one of these systems. Functional literacy and numeracy of as many Pakistanis as possible should be a fundamental objective.

Problems immediately arise. The recurring costs of the vast formal education sector are the responsibility of Provincial governments while non-formal programs are Federally funded and operated in all Provinces outside of the Provincial educational system. Activities seldom overlap.

The PID design team should explore this possible pitfall further. The Allama Iqbal Open University (AIU) is a young but viable "distance education" organization. High level staff include many educators who have earned their Ph.D studying in this field. AIU has developed viable programs in Primary Teacher Education as well as their Integrated Functional Education (IFE) program for females and the Basic Fundamental Education Project (BFEP) aimed at illiterate or semi-literate rural youth.

Another Federal agency worthy of support is the Literacy and Mass Education Commission (LAMEC). They operate two worthwhile programs. The National Institute of Communications through Education (NICE) is an offshoot of a 1977 USAID project paper called Development Support Communication Centres for the coordinated use of mass media in support of development ministries' efforts in rural areas. CIDA and IDA plan to support this project in the Punjab during PEP III.

Nai Roshni or "Drop-In" schools, also sponsored by LAMEC, offer Primary education to those who have not been able to attend or complete the formal Primary school.

4. PITFALL OR OPPORTUNITY

The Organization of a New Additional Directorate for Public Instruction (ADPI) for the Primary Sub-sector.

Focusing on its fragile infrastructure the Seventh Five-year Plan for education calls for an Additional Directorate for Public Instruction - Primary (ADPI) to be added to both the Federal and Provincial secretariats. The traditional organizational pattern calls for the Director of Instruction or Schools to be responsible for both Primary and Secondary education. The unique problems of Primary schools have not received attention commensurate with their importance and pressing needs.

The IDA has made the appointment and staffing of this new Directorate a Condition Precedent to its PEP III in the Punjab. Organizational and Functional charts have been submitted for GOP/IDA approval but have not yet been finalized. It is clear, however that this new organization will have the major responsibility for implementing PEP III. Presumably USAID funded assistance to Primary education would also be under the ADPI's purview.

A major risk or possible Pitfall is that of entrusting such a major responsibility to fledgling Directorates. Approximately 40% of the staff would be transferred from the present DPI organization. The rest would be newly appointed. This provides a major opportunity for AEPAM training with USAID technical assistance. It also would offer an area for concentrated efforts of the AID/W sponsored 'BRIDGES' project.

"Change" in administration/management is often more viable when working with a new organization that is eager to prove its worth than with a traditional organization that may be threatened by a "Change" in its status.

The organization proposed by the Punjab includes Deputy Directors for Planning and Development, Training, Administration and Finance; Assistant Directors for Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation, Pre-service Training, In-service Training, Administration (Male), Administration (Female), Budget and Expenditure and Research; as well as Statistical Officer, Account Officer, Junior Assistant Director and Career Development. The organization is modified and repeated at the Divisional, District and Sub-Divisional levels. Clearly, assisting in the training and formalization of such comprehensive organizations could be either a major opportunity or a risk.

VII. OPPORTUNITIES FOR USAID SUPPORT TO PRIMARY EDUCATION

In order to establish the specific areas for which Pakistan would welcome USAID support to Primary education, queries were made of the Federal and Provincial Education Secretariates. All agreed that PEP I and PEP II have been largely successful and have established firm directions and programs worthy of dissemination. Implementation, although slow at times, has succeeded in greatly strengthening the Primary education infrastructure. A good beginning has been made in all Provinces under the IDA loans. Much more remains to be done as is witnessed by the requests from Federal and Provincial Secretariats shown below. Punjab was not queried as the present PEP III program is one of blanket assistance to the entire Province.

1. ASSUMPTIONS:

In attempting to identify specific areas for USAID assistance the following assumptions were made.

1. School construction: As one effort to assure a steady increase in the flow of GOP funds to Primary education the GOP will support the construction of 25,000 Mosque schools, 20,000 of which are already included in the Prime Minister's Program.

The World Bank has been instrumental in the construction field having built and remodeled thousands of schools under PEP I and II. They have also introduced innovations of pre-fab construction and the establishment of a functional Construction Engineering Cell (CEC) in the Punjab Education Department. It should be noted that the Sind already has an Education Engineering Works (EEW) with eight years of experience. It appears to be working quite well indeed. Establishment of similar cells in Baluchistan and the NWFP would seem to be a natural extension of the Bank's program. Money wise the responsibility should rest with the GOP and possibly IDA.

2. USAID should support the premise of the Seventh Plan that the enrollment age for class 1 should be raised to age 6. At the same time it should assist the GOP in developing special programs, housing and instructional materials for Katchi's (ages 3-5) that now clog the first grade.

3. Although a major USAID interest continues to be focused on Girls, Primary female education will be largely supported by the new \$75 million Asian Development Bank Program. USAID, might complement their construction of Elementary Colleges for Girls by upgrading or constructing Elementary Teacher Colleges for Boys in the same Districts. (Such integration should be discussed with the ADB/IDA and GOP).

4. To keep order and progress in foreign Donor efforts to support Primary education USAID will follow the IDA's lead and work to develop a coordinated program will allow research and experimentation but will largely build on and follow the systems and directions developed by the IDA over the last ten years. Valuable lessons have been learned, infrastructures refined and supported, and an impressive number of schools renovated and constructed. The additional needs for curriculum change with corresponding instructional materials development have been identified. Very promising improvements in supervision and in-service teacher training have been established through Learning Coordinators in all four Provinces. The Asian, Development Bank (ADB), the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and the European Economic Commission (EEC) are already negotiating Co-financed projects. The United Nations Development Program (UNDP) has also been involved. Rather than running the risk of splintering those assistance efforts USAID will explore the possibilities of Co-financing support to Pakistan's comprehensive efforts in both formal and non-formal education found in the Sixth and Seventh Education Plans.

5. USAID assistance will necessarily include congested urban and semi-urban Districts unless, as a Condition Precedent, these areas receive full counterpart attention from the GOP. Most of these Districts have been left out of PEP II projects. Here, site acquisition is expected to be a major problem. To find unoccupied land within the population area to be served may be difficult if not almost impossible. Urban land may have many owners and title search be expensive and time-consuming. Prices are high and the community may not be organized enough to pay for it.. Construction generally will be multi-storied which is costlier. Play grounds will be few. If a single individual owns the land negotiations may be quick. If the GOP has to condemn the land through the courts, negotiations may drag on for years. USAID/GOP assistance to urban and semi-urban public schools should include grants or loans for site acquisition and development through a duly authorized local school committee.

2. GOVERNMENT OF PAKISTAN REQUESTS

FEDERAL JOINT EDUCATION ADVISOR - MUNIR AHMED

Quality and Relevance should be stressed. Quality improvements will create a demand for access. The following areas are immediately open for foreign assistance in Primary education (under the Prime Minister's program).

1. Extend Primary (1-5) through middle schools in Union Councils construct 2881 Girls schools (supplement ADB or IDA programs).
2. Construct 4100 Model Primary schools for boys in Union Councils. (Prime Minister's Plan target for 1990).
3. Upgrade 80+ teacher training institutes into Elementary Colleges at District level. All to have Resource Centers, research capabilities and have 1,2,3 and five classroom Model schools for student teaching and staff involvement.
4. Refine/expand PEP II to all Provincial Districts.
5. Refine and extend elements of PEP III (Punjab) to other Provinces.-i.e: Additional Director of Schools- Primary, and relevant staff to the Tehsil (sub-divisional) level.

NOTE: Mosque school development to be left to the GOP --

The Secretariates of Education in the Sind, NWFP and Baluchistan all requested the above 5 areas independently when interviewed.

In addition, the following specific areas were mentioned:

Sind: Secretary of Education - Syed Abbas Hussain Shah

1. Special emphasis given to Urban and Quasi-urban Districts - greatest return on investment.
2. Curriculum development for relevance - focus on differences of Rural/Urban and Boy/Girls, especially in grades V and VIII.
3. Separate pre-school (Katchi). Provide curriculum, space and appropriate teachers.
4. Support Micro approach to Planning (school data collection).
5. Class room libraries - perhaps mobile-controlled by L.C. .
6. Stress multi - level teaching in teacher training.
7. Increase role of "not-for-profit" schools (tuition up to Rs.50 per month).
8. Experiment with meal supplement (1 glass of soy milk daily).
9. Devise incentives to improve attendance.
10. USAID supply "seed money" for special projects and research.

NWFP: Director of Education-Schools - Mohammad Idress Khan

1. Resource Centers in Sub-divisional education offices (Tehsils).
2. Central "Women in Development" or teacher hostels (development hostels in far flung areas-with ample transportation.
3. Computer service in all District Education Offices for reliable/correct data and communications. MIS data collection and school mapping.
4. Matching grants to community for drinking water, toilets, electricity, boundary walls, etc.
5. Additional room/teacher/curriculum and program for Katchi age groups.

BALUCHISTAN: Secretary of Education - Professor Anwar Kethran

1. Incentives for private (not-for-profit) schools, especially in rural areas. Tuition charges up to Rs.200 per month.
2. Class room and teacher for new Katchi curriculum in Urban schools.
3. NGO involvement in private schools - especially for girls.
4. Teacher hostels and transport within 10-15 mile radius especially for women.
5. Multi-level teaching emphasis including the necessary materials.

3. Projects Recommended for USAID Support

The program suggested below for USAID consideration is certainly not definitive. Establishing parameters would necessitate advice of the GOP, World Bank, ADB and CIDA as other major Donors whether or not the Co-financing mode of assistance is followed. The USAID funding level should also be established.

The focus is on Quality as the best route to Quantity. Emphasis is on strengthening and spreading the comprehensive Primary Education Project to the other Districts not covered under PEP II and in an orderly manner and in full cooperation with the IDA and other foreign Donors.

Major Objectives would Focus on the following imperatives

Teacher Improvement

1. Strengthen a certain number of Government Colleges for Teacher Education (GCTE) at the District level helping them to become more responsive to the needs of Primary education in their District. This might be done by establishing Learning Resource Centers in each institution. Such a Center would maintain data on school mapping and possible problems on a school-by-school basis. It would be fully equipped with audio-visual aids and have computer linkages with other GCTEs and the AIOU teacher training units. Each college would organize a special studies center for conducting research into local problems.

Model schools of two, three and four classrooms or larger and a Mosque Model school would serve for supervised practice teaching and students' action research projects. Appropriate buses or vans would be available or (rented) for field trips outside the District headquarters.

The GCTE curriculum would be completely revised to conform to nationally agreed upon standards. Local adaptations could be made as beneficial to the program.

Dormitory space would be available or arranged for in the community.

Special courses for supervisors and L.Cs would be developed with advice of the NBCT and AEPAM.

A special department for in-service training would be established with the assistance of Tehsil based supervisors and Union Council based Learning Coordinators.

Special training in the areas of multi-level instruction and the use of Modules, individualized instructional materials, text books and government pamphlets regarding health, agriculture etc. would be a major focus of the GCTE.

Programs for teaching the growing Katchi age-group would receive particular attention.

Construction and remodeling of physical facilities would be decided according to the needs of each institution.

To help assure the supply of candidates for teaching in Girls village schools the project would assist in up-grading Union Council Model Girls Schools through the Middle school level (class 1-8) Dormitories should be constructed and all village women invited to attend irregardless of age. Assistant teachers would be recruited from successful Middle school graduates. Both the ADB and IDB appear to have similar programs. The USAID effort would fill in possible gaps and assure each Union Council of a Model Middle school for Girls.

The project would be developed in collaboration with the ADB project on Girls education. It would be complementary to and might supplement the ADB funded GCTEs.

Per GCTE		Estimated Cost	\$
Construction/equipment	\$1,000,000	Construction/equipment	30,000,000
Recurring Costs -	<u>900,000</u>	Recurring Costs	27,000,000
assistance for 6 years	\$1,900,000	Girls Middle School	<u>9,400,000</u>
		Total	66,400,000

2. Curriculum and Evaluation

The project would support efforts to re-design the two-step core curriculum proposed by the Education Five-Year Plans. USAID would lend technical Assistance to this crucial area along with the IDA, ADB and UNESCO. The core curriculum, textbooks, learning modules and other instructional materials as well as suggested activities and content to be taught should reflect the Boy-Girl and Rural-Urban differences. The most important focus would be that of Relevance so school attendance becomes more meaningful not only to the pupils but to the parents as well.

The present system of evaluation by outside examiners would be abolished. It is divorced from what actually goes on in a classroom and serves to cause many students to drop-out. It seems absurd that less than 50% of class 5 pupils can "PASS" on to Middle school - especially when the "PASS" Grade may be only 33 out of 100 points. It seems prudent that the Curriculum departments should also manage the Evaluation system.

USAID would also support a study of a "Primitive" Montessori type curriculum for the Katchi class and the raising of the formal education entering age from 5 to 6. This is based on child growth and development patterns and the child's "readiness" to deal with the language abstractions which permeate the first three grades. Under the Nai Roshni schools a 10-16 year old is expected to complete the 5 years Primary program in 2 years "because he is more mature

and able to deal with abstractions". Raising the entering age to 6 should have a decided positive effect on attendance and dropouts as a child may be more satisfied with his own academic performance. Development of experimental model KATCHI programs and classes would be part of this objective.

Estimated cost \$5,000,000

3. Instructional Materials

The PEP teachers were not trained in the use of the instructional material kits they received. They were not involved in deciding the contents and did not know how to use them. Most kits have disappeared.

USAID would support materials to be used with Learning Modules as Modules are being prepared and introduced to teachers by GCETs and LCs.

USAID would also support an experiment with individualized learning materials and their use. Writers could be trained in the USA, Phillipines, Indonesia, Liberia and Canada. CIDA is also a strong supporter of individualized instruction.

Reading materials for Primary age children are published in Pakistan but do not often reach the schools. USAID might purchase saddle bags for the L.C.'s motorcycles and provide basic supplementary reading materials for classroom libraries on a rotating basis.

Paper costs are high. The project would support up to 80% of paper costs to reduce the price of textbooks, teachers guides, modules and library books to make them more affordable. It is expected that the GOP would pick up the subsidy costs on a declining basis.

Estimated Cost \$ 25,000,000

4. Construction and Equipping Model Schools for Boys at the Union Council Level -- about 1,000 schools in the Sind, NWFP and Baluchistan. The aim would be to reach as many Union Councils as possible considering constraints of funding and local conditions. Actual program magnitude to be negotiated.

This program supports the GOP objective of strengthening the Union Council as a viable administrative unit.

Each school would also be the headquarters for the MIS program and school mapping. It would provide a base for the L.C. who reports directly to a supervisor at the Tehsil level, and would complement the ADB project for Girls. Space for these varied Union Council functions should be carefully planned and provided. At one and the same time there would be introduced: (a) the concept of quality teaching centers both teaching their own students and helping the satellite schools around them to reach the same quality level; and (b) an administrative level to fill the wide void that now exists between the handful of education officers at the Tehsil level and the hundreds of village schools each is supposed to supervise. The Model schools proposed do not have to be built from scratch -- they can be based on existing schools so long as they contain, or are upgraded to contain, at least 5 classrooms, 5 teachers, a principal adequate furniture and on L.C. managed Resource Center.

Estimated Cost

Estimated cost of strengthen facilities -	\$28,000,000	and
for MIS and Supervision Programs	<u>\$10,000,000</u>	
Total	\$38,000,000	

5. Non-formal Education

The addition of Non-formal education provides a link from formal education to Pakistanis who were not able to attend school or continue once they had started. Providing some level of literacy training concomitantly with useful practical skills serves an important Pakistan need. Participation will help boys, girls and young adults contribute to their society. As these programs may not have the wide-based infrastructure of the formal system the level and kind of assistance provided must be tailored to the sponsoring organization's absorptive capacity.

A. Allama Iqbal Open University (AIU)

Teacher Education by Distance

AIU appears to have made substantial progress in developing its program of teacher education. It may provide a valuable service to GCETs and Resource Centers in providing timely materials that might not otherwise be available in the Union Councils. It can provide an important National Link to both pre-service and in-service training.

The Basic Functional Education Project (BFEP)

BFEP offers a successful model for delivering functional education to illiterate and semi-literate rural populations without reliance on literacy. The mode of instruction has consisted of a mix of audio-visual aids and face-to-face communication supplemented by occasional inputs from field staff of nation-building departments. AIU is capable of replicating the model throughout the country using its fourteen regional offices. Support should be given to allow expansion/replication of the BFEP model to test sites in all the Provinces as the program develops.

Integrated Functional Education (IFE)

The companion IFE project is intended to follow-up the BFEP program with literacy-based functional education for females. The project was launched on an experimental basis in 10 sites in the Rawalpindi District in 1986. It consists of a three part program of literacy, skill training, and functional knowledge. It is recommended that support be given to allow additional sites to be included.

Estimated AIOU costs \$ 10,000,000

B. Literacy and Mass Education Commission(LAMEC)

This commission is the single government institution with the authority to run a nationwide literacy program and provide support to other institutions and private organizations running programs of their own. One of its programs is "NICE".

National Institute of Communication through Education (NICE). This Institute has been created to bring the methods of modern communication to focus on the tasks of education and development. It would experiment with different combinations of audio-visual, mass media, print and face-to-face modes of communication to find the most effective mix for a given purpose. NICE is receiving support from CIDA and the IDA in PEP III. In the Punjab it is developing and implementing the communications/demand generation program which is aimed at enlisting community support for schools. LAMEC/NICE cooperation with the USAID project should be explored. The role they play is important to prolonged educational development. The program is new and the present absorptive capacity may be low. It promises to be a program well worth support, however, Nai Roshni "drop-in" schools might also be supported.

Estimated LAMEC costs \$ 10,000,000

6. Infrastructure Strengthening and Support

(Data Base, Policy/Planning, Management Training)

The Academy for Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM).

Lack of a solid data base presents a major block to intelligent planning and management. AEPAM is growing as a major research and training agency. Its studies are often the only recent ones on which planners can rely. The AID/W funded "BRIDGES" project run by Harvard University is already scheduled to assist AEPAM to develop and put in place a reliable and valid Management Information System (MIS). Part of that program will be not only data collection but the all important analysis of the data for intelligent policy planning and management.

A major deficiency throughout the complex education system is the lack of administrative skill training at all levels to fulfill the system's diverse requirements. Officers and staff are promoted to new positions wherein responsibilities and procedures may be quite different from those of their previous post. Promotion usually comes through seniority or length of service. The role anticipated for AEPAM is that of organizing pre-service and in-service training at various levels with the objective of strengthening management, streamlining procedures and imparting the required skills. The courses and seminars would not be one-shot affairs but will lend continuity and depth to the management process.

Estimated Cost \$ 20,000,000

7. Support of Private Not-for -Profit Schools

The definition of a Not-for-Profit school will have to be determined. During conversations in the Provinces the suggested monthly tuition rate ranged from Rs. 50 to Rs. 200 per month. Above that a private school would be considered a commercial venture and would not be eligible for project support.

The proposed project would make available:

Low-cost loans to privately owned schools. This aspect would be eventually self-sustaining, founded on a revolving fund base with loan terms in the neighborhood of 10 years at 10% with a two-year grace period.

Grants for non-profit organizations sponsoring schools, private schools etc.. Scholarships for well qualified students who can afford the low tuition.

Matching Grants Fund for Rural Education to be administered by an organization such as the All Pakistan Women's Association, working in cooperation with the Provincial Ministries of Education and their Departments of Education at the Division, District, Tehsil and Union Council levels. The fund would make grants to PVOs and NGOs to establish and operate primary and middle schools (Grades I-VIII in rural areas). Preference would be given to Girls schools and teachers training of women teachers for both girls and boys schools. Schools would be expected to become self-supporting during an external aid-grant period of 7-10 years.

Participants schools would have to be included in the Federal Ministry's education MIS system and be subject to educational and financial audit.

Income for the permanent life of the school would come from student fees and a growing annual donations program emphasizing a strong base of small donations, large donations from business and industry, and from large landholders.

A condition of this project would be provision by the GOP for making these schools tax -free.

In Pakistan's public Primary schools (1986) the average expenditures (cost of instruction) per student was Rs 30 per month. Of course the same figures for Municipal Corporations were Rs. 137-230. . Private rural schools would have to charge more in fees than Provincial (public) schools and therefore would be catering to the less poor as the private urban schools do. The problem of bright children who are too poor to afford private schooling can be dealt with by a built-in scholarship program.

Estimated costs for a pilot project aimed at creating 240 private Primary schools (approximately 3 in each of the country's Districts) over an initial 6 year period can only be a semi-educated guess. Assuming that the fund would grant one-half the capital costs and one-third of the recurring costs (including the scholarship costs) for 6 years, the estimated cost per school of 200 students would be as follows:

1/2 Capital cost per school	Rs. 235,000
1/3 Recurring costs (6 year period)	Rs. <u>165,000</u>
Total	Rs. 400,000
So, approximately 400,000x240 =	Rs. 96 million
(in dollars) =	\$ 5,600,000
Administrative costs at 10% =	560,000

Estimated Costs of the Program: \$ 5,560,000

(The scope of the program could, of course, be expanded or cut back at any

time at the rate of \$25,000 per school.)

Estimated Cost Revolving Loan Fund: Urban Schools	\$ 10 million
Estimated Cost of Grants to Non-Profit Organizations	\$ 10 million
Estimated cost of Special Private Rural Schools:	<u>\$5.6 million</u> →
Total:	25.6 million

ANNEXES

EXTERNAL DONORS FINANCING OF PAKISTAN EDUCATION SECTOR

			US Million
1975-84	UNDP	Administration, AICU, AEPAM, Womens Skill Development	5.0
	ILO	Vocational Training	
	UNICEF	Primary Education in Selected Districts.	
	ADB	Secondary Science Education Institute for the Promotion of Science Education.	
1979	ADB	Technical Teacher Training	21.0
1986	ADB	Science Education for Secondary Schools.	28.8
1988	ADB	Primary Education(Girls) Project	75.0
	Federal Republic of Germany	Vocational Education	2.0
	EEC/CIDA	Rural and Womens Vocational Training	

	Japan	Four University Machine Training Centres and National Institute of Modern Languages Laboratories.	
1964	IDA I	Faisalabad Agricultural University Equipment for Six Polytechnics.	8.5
1970	II	NED Government Engineering College, Karachi.	8.0
1977	III	Agricultural Sector University Extension Primary Teacher Training	15.0
*1979	IV	Primary Education I Selected Schools/ Districts - Experimental	10.0
1981	V	National Vocational Training Systems Apprenticeship and In-Plant.	19.7
1985	VI	Primary Education II Sind, NWFP, Baluchistan-All Schools in Selected Districts.	52.5
1986	VII	Vocational Education II - Rural Focus	36.6.
1988	VIII	Primary Education III Punjab --Support Provincial Education Investment Plan	140.0
1989	(Proposed)	Education Systems - Extend Institutional and Policy Improvements of Primary Education III to other three Provinces- also sector management, resource allocation, cost recovery and role of the private sector.	

PERSONS INTERVIEWED

ISLAMABAD

EDUCATION MINISTRY

Planning Wing

Joint Education Advisor - Planning	Munir Ahmad	821690
Deputy Education Advisor - Foreign Asst.	Mashadi	
Special Assistant - Foreign Assistance	Said Ghulam	

Primary and Non-formal Education Wing

Joint Education Advisor - Primary	Abdul Aziz Khan	
Director, Federal Coordination Unit Primary Education Program	M.H. Qureshi	824517

Academy of Education Planning and Management

World Bank

Resident Project Advisor	Bashir Parvez	824715
Assessment Leader	Julian Schweitzer	
Architect	Sverrier Sigurdson	
Educational Planner	Donald Foster	

PERSONS INTERVIEWED
NORTHWEST FRONTIER PROVINCE (NWFP)
EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

Directorate of Education (Schools)

Director, NWFP	Mohammad Idress Khan	74198
Deputy Director, NWFP	Sayed Sawar Shah	76595
Additional Directoress NWFP	Mrs. R.A.Bhatti	74058
District Ed. Officer, Swat	Mazrood Salam Shah	
District Ed. Officer, Dir	Sharoom Khan	
Deputy Director Planning	Malik Mohammad	

Primary Education Project (PEP I and PEP II)

Director	Prof. Abdul Salam	63680
Deputy Director, Training	Saeed Fazle Qadir	63680
Deputy Director, Operations	Mian Muzaffar Shah	63680

S I N D

EDUCATION AND CULTURE DEPARTMENT

Education Secretariat

Karachi

Secretary of Education	Syed Abbas Hussain Shah	512652
Addition Secretary, Planning and Development	Syed Anwar Uddin	
Assistant Director Implementation	Haji Sher Mohammad Soomro	214430

SIND (CONTINUED)

HYDERABAD

PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT (PEP I AND PEP II)

Director	Mrs. Razia Shah	23409
Dy. Dir., Field Operation	Ranjho Khan Zardari	
Associate Director	Ishraquddin Ahmad	

EDUCATION ENGINEERING WORKS

Director	Manzoor Ahmad Qureshi	81270
----------	-----------------------	-------

BALUCHISTAN

EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

EDUCATION SECRETARIAT

Secretary of Education	Prof. Anwar Kethran	73905
Deputy Dir. Planning	Malik Ahmad	78538

PRIMARY EDUCATION PROJECT (PEP I AND PEP II)

Director	Saleem ul Haq	
Deputy Dir. Admin	Mohammad Hassan	
Associate Dir. Training	Mobeen Ahmad Shah	
MPA	Ali Nisar	

NOTES FROM THE SIND

Dr. Syed Abbas Hussain Shah, Secretary of Education and Dr. Syed Anwar Uddin, Additional Secretary for Educational Planning and Development discussed the following as priority areas for USAID assistance to Primary education in the Sind.

1. Quality and Relevance should be emphasized rather than quantity at this point. Access should respond to demand of the community as the result of improved curriculum and teaching.
2. Prime Target Area for USAID assistance are the seven Districts not covered under PEP II. The IDA program is basically sound and forms a good foundation for thoughtful replication and refinement. In the Sind these seven Districts include the three large urban Districts: Hyderabad, Karachi and Sukkur.

Special emphasis should be given to these crowded urban and quasi-urban areas where the greatest return per dollar spent may be anticipated due to staff availability at all levels, proximity of teacher training resources, larger schools, lower per pupil cost, greater concentration of girls "available" for schooling, reduced transportation difficulties, fewer language barriers, proximity of schools and market place, etc.

3. Coordinated Inputs as proposed in the Sixth and Seventh Educational Plans the Prime Minister's program and by PEP I, II and III should be included. Of prime importance are the following:

- a) Curriculum Development should focus on change and relevance - not be satisfied with bit - by - bit or piece-meal improvements. Design of the two stage curriculum which has been delayed for so long must reflect the

real differences in rural and urban environment. Children and parents must be helped to adapt to and improve their own circumstances. Teacher Training and learning materials should respond to the above curricular realities.

4. The Katchi school population needs to be studied and new programs, facilities and training need to be developed for the KATCHI preschool group. Montessori Principles which are well established in some Pakistani private schools should be developed-not according to "western" eyes-but to be effective in the "primitive" environment of sparse rural areas and over-crowded urban situations. This is felt to be a major challenge and needs immediate study. Teachers could be drawn from retired teachers that are available in nearly all villages, young Nai Roshni students in the LEMAC "drop-in" schools, as well as local mother groups etc. This is an area to be explored with NGOs. Support should come from both Federal and Provincial organizations. Because of quite different emphasis and activities suitable for 3-5 year olds, physical facilities for the Katchi program might be in separate buildings not directly attached to the main school classrooms but constructed within the school compound.

5. Elementary Colleges for Teachers (Male and Female) at the District level should receive priority attention. There are 22 such colleges now. Eight more are needed. The teacher training faculty should receive special training and be involved in curriculum and materials of instruction development including text books, modules, and basic library collections. Model schools of various sizes (Mosque plus 1 room, Katchi, plus three rooms, full 5 classroom schools and a Model Girls (Boys) Middle school in a contiguous Union Council should be used not only for practice teaching but to give the college faculty first hand experience in working at the Primary school level. It was stressed that teachers must come from the community in which they will teach.

6. A MICRO-Approach to Planning should be undertaken by the Provincial Education Department. Approximately 100 Primary(Middle) schools of all types

and their communities at the Union Council level should be carefully and continuously studied and analyzed as a basis for planning and policy decisions. (Experience of the Harvard "BRIDGES" project might be applied here). "Instant feedbacks" should be sought in all project development. The Sind has approved the Sixth Plan recommendation of adding an Additional Directorate of Public Instruction - Primary to give special focus on Quality improvements in Primary Education. Details for the establishment of this Directorate within the hierarchy are now being worked out. Under this program teachers may be recruited at the Taluqa (Tehsil) level. (Selection and appointment of the ADPI-Primary is planned within the next few months).

7. "COMPOSITE" School Development is the term given by Secretary Abbas as the basis for "consolidating" school planning and operation. Every "composite" school classroom should have good chalkboards, a full year's supply of chalk, pencils, paper, bamboo pens, reading materials, instructional material kits, modules, library collection (of at least 30 small books annually), teacher's desk and chair, dual desks for students, large locked cupboard to store teaching materials etc. Water and Toilets would be provided as well as a residence for the teacher's family. The school would be used after school hours as a community resource activity center.

8. Multi-level teaching is required of most Primary teachers in all but the largest schools. Yet teachers feel that learning modules now being developed in PEP II do not facilitate the required flexibility. Nor do teachers receive training in multi-level teaching methods.

In the Mosque school, the IMAM teaches religion. The other teacher is responsible for teaching the rest of the subjects (language and math) to all the students in grades I, II and III. When an additional classroom is added for grades IV and V, only one more teacher is added to teach the expanded curriculum which includes reading and writing in the mother tongue and Urdu, social studies, math, science, Islamiat and physical education.

Rarely does a teacher have responsibility for only one grade level. Both Secretary Abbas and Director of Planning, Anwar expressed strong interest that programmed learning methods and materials be introduced in certain Elementary Colleges and schools.

9. Learning Coordinators are successful in PEP schools. Their role should be extended and refined throughout the regular system.

10. Model "Composite" schools for both boys and girls should be built in each of the 612 Union Councils. Co-education should be encouraged where appropriate to cultural norms. Where possible, these I-V schools should be extended to include Middle school grades VI-VIII for both boys and girls. These schools should be encouraged to offer vocational counselling during the last year according to local job market opportunities. Any simple vocational skill training such as typing, sewing, hand crafts or basic instruction in use of tools should be self-supporting through user fees. Local Technical school personnel might be used to provide counselling and appropriate instruction.

OTHER SUGGESTIONS

In addition to the above, the secretariat would like help to:

1. Increase the role of the private, "not-for-profit" sector through a series of initial grants for buildings, revolving loan funds and infra-structure support. A not-for-profit school was defined as one which charged no more than Rs. 45 or 50 per month.

2. Experiment with a program of meal supplements consisting of a minimum of one glass of soy-bean milk per day for each child in grades I-V. USAID and the World Food Organization might be approached for this.

3. Support compulsory education at the Taluqa level where adequate schools exist.
4. Devise incentives for school attendance which do not offer actual cash to the parents or child but reduce the opportunity costs of attendance in other ways. Meal supplements could be used. The Chief Minister's special fund might be used to furnish some 83,000 uniforms annually to those who maintain good attendance records. Experiment in 5 Districts whereby at least 10 teachers (50 in all) would not teach regular classes but would teach cub scout skills to the boys. Each boy would receive a completed scout uniform including whistle, knife and badges as earned.
5. Experiment with simple computers, where appropriate, at the Primary level. User fees would be charged.
6. USAID to provide a (\$200,000) seed money to support special research studies and develop revolving loans funds.

Mrs. Razia Shah, Director of PEP II and her PIU associates Ranjho Khan Zardari and Ishrafuddin Ahmad stressed the following areas of concern.

Training is behind schedule due to slow preparation of acceptable Modules, however, the second round of "A" level training (master-trainers) was completed in November 87. Level "B" (SDEO's and L.Cs) is scheduled for April and Level "C" (teachers) in May. More modules are expected in March 88.

"Assistant" teachers have been appointed and are working. Learning Coordinators, and Supervisors have been appointed but are only now receiving their vehicles. PEP II LC's receive a transportation allowance of Rs. 75 per day. Out of this they must pay for their motorcycles on a hire/purchase basis, and pay for gasoline and maintenance costs. The vehicle becomes their

property. There are no funds available to replace the PEP I motorcycles for which spare parts are not available. PEP I LC's are thus without transport. LC's report each school visit by filing a report and check list with their SDEO. A copy with SDEO comments is forwarded to the PIU. Male LC's still have up to 32 schools but the average is about 20-25. Female LC's may now begin to visit their 10-15 schools on a regular basis as soon as drivers are hired.

Teacher retirement age is 60. They often return to their village to live. They are possibly an "un-tapped" resource for substitute work or for the Katchi program.

The Sind provides a chowkidar (guard) for each school. They also pay Rs. 150 per month for a sweeper. PEP II schools have dual desks with an attached bench and back support. The average 14'x20' classroom accommodates 16 such benches which are movable and can be grouped for flexibility of instruction. The Sind PIU for PEP II also listed the following points for consideration:

1. The Provincial Education Department and the Project Implementation Unit should be involved in the preparation of the PC-I.
2. High priority should be given to relieving overcrowded conditions by adding classrooms and hiring more teachers.
3. The most senior or respected teacher in an area should be chosen to be the Learning Coordinator.
4. Textbooks should be free and available to all children.
5. "Poverty plagued" students should receive stipends to permit them to attend school.

6. A pool of female retired teachers should be formed to keep schools open when a teacher is on maternity leave or is sent for in-service or P.T.C. training. This input would include provision of transport.
7. Where possible a bus might bring girls to a Model school rather than transport teachers to the village.
8. Low qualified assistant teachers should receive separate in-service training. Both upper and lower age limits for recruitment should be relaxed when necessary.
9. Separate curricula for boys and girls in classes IV and V both rural and urban should be researched and submitted to experimentation.
10. There is no program of incentives to attract rural teachers. Rural/Urban are paid on the same basic scale but allowances (based on the lowest beginning level) are different. For instance: housing - Rural receive 30% and Urban 45%; urban has a transportation allowance but rural doesn't. Rs. 50 per month is paid for service in "unattractive" areas (desert). It is felt that even a bonus of Rs. 15 per month more than the Urban allowances would lure teachers to the rural area.
11. A system of positive incentives for all teachers for achieving certain objectives deserves consideration by the GOP and USAID. Possibilities include increase of class enrollment during the year from 30 to 50, reduced drop-outs, increased student attendance, little or no absence by the teacher, etc.

PRINCIPAL ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS USED

ADP	-	Annual Development Plan
ADPI	-	Additional Directorate of Public Instruction (Primary Education)
AIOU	-	Allama Iqbal Open University
AEO	-	Assistant Education Officer
AEPM	-	Academy for Educational Planning and Management
C&W	-	Communication and Works Department
CEC	-	Civil Engineering Cell (Punjab)
CIDA	-	Canadian International Development Agency
CE	-	Consulting Engineer
CDWP	-	Central Development Working Party
CRDC	-	Curriculum Research and Development Center
DEO	-	District Education Officer
DEEC	-	Division Education Extension Center
DPI	-	Directorate of Public Instruction
DOE	-	Department of Education
ECNEC	-	Executive Committee of the National Economic Council
FCU	-	Federal Coordinating Unit
GCET	-	Government College for Elementary Teachers
LAMEC	-	Literacy and Mass Education Commission
LC	-	Learning Coordinator
LGRD	-	Local Government & Rural Development Department
MOE	-	Ministry of Education
NICE	-	National Institute for Communication through Education
NBCT	-	National Bureau of Curriculum and Textbooks
PC-1	-	Planning Commission Form 1
PEEC	-	Provincial Education Extension Center (Punjab)
PDWP	-	Provincial Development Working Party
PNFW	-	Primary and Non-Formal Wing - Ministry of Education
PTC	-	Primary Teacher Certificate
RLC	-	Rapid Low Cost Study
SMC	-	School Management Committee
UC	-	Union Council
UCEC	-	Union Council Education Committee
UNDP	-	United Nations Development Program
UPE	-	Universal Primary Education